Special Daughters of Rome:  
Glasgow and Its Roman Catholic Sisters,  
1847-1913.

Sara Karly Kehoe  
Submitted for the Degree of Ph.D  
Department of History  
Faculty of Arts  
University of Glasgow  
September 2004

© Karly Kehoe, 30 September 2004.
Abstract

The Roman Catholic Church, existing as it did in mid-to-late 1840s Glasgow without an established hierarchy or sufficient human resources to cope with mass Famine migration from Ireland, turned to congregations of women religious for help. In 1847, the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception arrived from Tourcoing, France, and two years later, in 1849, the Sisters of Mercy arrived from Limerick, Ireland. Both congregations were recruited to transform the Catholic population of Glasgow and elevate it to a level of respectability; the establishment of a Catholic education system was central to this process. The teaching endeavours of the Sisters were complicated by the endemic and epidemic diseases they encountered upon arrival as well as by serious conflicts with male clergy. The Sisters of Mercy proved especially vulnerable, losing Superiors in the process, and the low number of schools they could take on, when compared to the Franciscan Sisters, indicates that even by the end of the nineteenth century, they had not fully recovered from these early tribulations. Limited financial resources were a constant impediment, but further hardship for the Catholic education system came with the introduction of the Education (Scotland) Act in 1872. Although the Catholic schools opted out of the state system, equating it with a Protestant system, they were still required to adhere to the regulations of the Act. They were stringent, but necessary and made teacher provision and teaching qualifications a priority. The only way to meet these requirements was to establish a training college in Scotland and in 1894 the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur arrived from Liverpool to open a female teacher training college at Dowanhill, in Glasgow’s West End. The Dowanhill Training College was also representative of the Church’s desire for respectability and indicated how the Church had modernised.

This thesis argues that these three female congregations secured the survival of Catholicism in mid- to late-nineteenth-century Glasgow, a predominantly Protestant city where many of the inhabitants were conspicuously hostile. The Sisters formed the backbone of the Catholic education system in the city and, over time, improved the prospects of their pupils. Additionally, through their identity as women religious, they promoted a style of Catholicism that was both obedient and loyal; characteristics the Church was desperate to instill among its adherents.
Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Irene Maver, for her guidance and knowledge. We had an excellent working relationship and she gave me continual encouragement and support. Thanks also to Professor Ted Cowan for providing me with the opportunity to study at the University of Glasgow, as well as for his support of and enthusiasm for postgraduate research and development. A very sincere and special thank you to the late Sr. Dolores Cochrane, OSF, and to Sr. Loyola, OSF, Sr. Bernadette, OSF and Sr. Augustina, OSF, for their kindness and generosity. I am grateful to Sr. Annette, of the Sisters of Mercy in Glasgow and the late Sr. Anne of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, Liverpool. My gratitude also goes out to those Sisters who helped me during the course of my research in Dublin, Limerick, Rathfarnham, Liverpool and Edinburgh.

I would like to thank Dr. Mary McHugh, archivist for the Archdiocese of Glasgow, and Andrew Nichol, archivist for the Scottish Catholic Archives, for helping me uncover excellent primary material. I am also very appreciative of the challenging discussions and useful advice offered by Bernard Aspinwall on Catholicism in Scotland and elsewhere. In Canada, I would like to give special thanks to Professor Mark McGowan, Principal, St. Michael’s College, University of Toronto, for being so generous with his time and for his willingness to advise me on my Toronto chapter. Marc Lerman, archivist of the Archdiocese of Toronto, Linda Wicks, archivist of the Sisters of St. Joseph, and Sr. Juliana Dusel, archivist of the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary, must also be acknowledged for their extraordinary assistance.

I must also take time to acknowledge the role that Dr. Michael Vance and Dr. Michelle Daveluy have played in encouraging me to develop my interests and pursue my goals. They were my teachers at Saint Mary’s University, Halifax, and gave me incredible opportunities and support. More personally, thank you to the Ducks for providing me with a home away from home. To Ben Webster and Roman Bruchkowsky, a sincere thanks for helping me out so much during my year in Toronto. Finally and most importantly, to Myles, Elaine, Katie and Colin - my family - for being everything to me. I am so blessed to have each of you in my life.
# Table of Contents

Abbreviations and Special Notes

Introduction

I. The Nineteenth-Century Foundations of Glasgow's Irish Catholic Community

II. Sisters in the City: The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, the Sisters of Mercy and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur.

III. Building the Foundation: Sisters and Catholic Elementary Education

IV. Impact and Action: Sisters and the 1872 Education(Scotland) Act.


Conclusion

Appendices

Bibliography
Abbreviations and Special Notes

Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CDS</td>
<td>Catholic Directory for Scotland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GMJ</td>
<td>Glasgow Medical Journal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RRES</td>
<td>Report of the Religious Examination of Schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sr. M.</td>
<td>Sister Mary.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Abbreviations in footnotes only

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CSJA</td>
<td>Sisters of St. Joseph Archives, Toronto, Canada.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSICA</td>
<td>Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception Archives, Glasgow.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAA</td>
<td>Archdiocese of Glasgow Archives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBVM</td>
<td>Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary Archives, Toronto, Canada.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.B.V.M.</td>
<td>Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary Central Archives (Irish Branch), Rathfarnham, Ireland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MICA</td>
<td>Mercy International Centre Archives, Dublin.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCA</td>
<td>Scottish Catholic Archives, Edinburgh.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMCA</td>
<td>Sisters of Mercy Convent Archives (Glasgow, Limerick).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SND PAO</td>
<td>Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur Provincial Archives Office, Liverpool.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Special Notes

The term ‘Sister’ has been employed throughout this thesis, as opposed to nun. The three focus congregations were considered ‘active’, since their members took ‘simple vows’ of poverty, chastity and obedience and undertook works of charity outside of their convent. The term ‘nun’ is usually applied to members of a religious order, who live enclosed within their convent. The majority of the Sisters in these congregations were choir Sisters, educated women who joined with a dowry and undertook teaching or nursing work, as opposed to lay Sisters, who usually entered without a dowry and who were responsible for the convent’s domestic chores. The first letter of the word ‘Sister’, as it relates to women religious, has been capitalised to avoid confusion when discussing siblings.

The term ‘Mother’ has been used only for those Superiors who established communities and while there were other Mother Superiors, they have been referred to as ‘Sr. M. (Name)’. While the terms ‘congregation’ and ‘community’ have been used as opposed to ‘order’, ‘congregation’ has been generally used to refer to the wider membership, whereas ‘community’ generally refers to the local group. For example, the Mercy congregation refers to their membership worldwide, but
the Mercy community refers to a specific group in a given city or town.

Methodological Note

For Chapters Two and Five, five biographical databases were compiled for the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, the Sisters of Mercy, the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary (Loretto) and the Sisters of St. Joseph. Similar databases were not created for the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur because sufficient detail about individual Sisters was not made available. These databases, which included the categories of Religious Name, Name, Date of Birth, Date of Death, Place of Birth, Names of Parents, Date and Place of Profession and Important Notes, were used to determine the origin of the Sisters and to collate the available biographical details between the period of foundation and roughly 1894 to 1913. The databases for the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy include all Sisters who joined those communities, whereas in the case of the Sisters of St. Joseph and the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary, only those Sisters born in Ireland were included. In addition, because the details were available for the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary, an additional database including those Sisters whose parents were born in Ireland was also created; similar databases could not be created for the Glasgow communities because the birthplaces of parents were not recorded. These databases have been included as the Cd-ROM attachment to this thesis with the kind permission of each community.

On the Cd-Rom, the databases are identified as follows:

Database One: Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, Glasgow.

Database Two: Sisters of Mercy, Glasgow.

Database Three: Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary, Toronto (Sisters of Irish-birth).

Database Four: Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary, Toronto (Sisters with parents of Irish-birth).

Database Five: Sisters of St. Joseph of Toronto (Sisters of Irish-Birth).
Introduction

It is the Reformation we have to thank for the wealth of the nation, which had previously been drained by the rapacity of a foreign priesthood... In place of convents we now behold manufactories, in place of dissolve and ignorant monks, we behold a virtuous and enlightened clergy; in place of idle mendicants, dependant on monasteries, we behold industrious artisans, who would scorn subsistence but from their own labour.¹

So said the highly influential West Indies merchant James Ewing (1775-1853) on 22 September 1825, as the calls for Catholic Emancipation were reaching fever pitch.² A devout Church of Scotland Evangelical, Ewing celebrated the laying of the foundation stone for the Knox monument on the summit of Fir Park, which later became part of Glasgow's famous cemetery, the Necropolis. Dedicated to the sixteenth-century Scottish 'Reformer' John Knox, a staunch opponent of Roman Catholicism and an advocate of female 'submission and obedience';³ the monument's physical positioning was curious, but no doubt deliberate. Overlooking the magnificent Glasgow Cathedral, one of the few Catholic cathedrals to remain structurally intact and later converted into a place of worship for the Church of Scotland, Knox's statue casts a watchful eye over the reformed city. It was a symbolic message to the Church of Rome, as well as a reminder to Scots, that Catholicism was not welcome in this 'Protestant City', this city whose 'spirit of the Covenanters was so strong, where the arm of the Covenanters so firm'.⁴ Twenty-two years after Ewing's words thundered over the city, as Glasgow encountered unprecedented levels Irish Catholic migration, the first Roman Catholic religious congregation arrived in the city;

⁴J. C. Colquhoun, “Great Protestant Meeting held at Hope-Street Gaelic Church, Glasgow, on Thursday, September 17th, 1835” in Romanism as it Rules in Ireland: A Full and Authentic Report of the meetings held in various parts of England and Scotland in which the Theology secretly taught, the commentary on the Bible clandestinely circulated, the law of the Papal States surreptitiously set up to govern Ireland, and the secret Diocesan Statutes of the Province of Leinster, Vols. I and II. Mortimer O'Sullivan, ed. (London: R. B. Seeley, 1840), p. 292.
the Ursulines of Jesus, who settled in Edinburgh in 1834, had been first religious congregation to return to Scotland.5

This thesis examines the three congregations of women religious who were engaged with Catholic education in Glasgow between 1847 and 1913 and demonstrates that through their educational work with young girls and women, they were integral to the survival and development of Roman Catholicism in the city. The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception arrived on 18 June 1847 from Tourcoing, France, the Sisters of Mercy arrived on 25 August 1849 from Limerick, Ireland, and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur came from Liverpool, England, on 20 August 1894. Glasgow’s Presbyterian legacy, evidenced in part by the opening quote, was central to the experience of the Sisters and the work they undertook. In addition, the friction that existed between the native Scottish Catholics6 and the Irish Catholic migrants was also profoundly influential. The Sisters’ attention to the education of young girls and women would, it was hoped, tame the Catholic Irish and bring them more in line with quiet and conservative Scottish Catholicism. This thesis therefore situates an examination of women religious against a backdrop charged with anti-Catholicism and cultural friction.

Roman Catholicism had been expanding in Scotland since the late eighteenth-century and statistics reveal that in 1808, there were roughly 2,300 Catholics in Glasgow, and by 1830s the 65,000 Catholics represented approximately 13 per cent of the city’s population.7 Peter Anson’s valuable study of Catholicism in Scotland between 1622 and 1878, proposes that the erection of St. Andrew’s Church in Glasgow in 1816 was ‘visible proof’ that the Catholic community could

---

5Eleven Ursulines of Jesus, including two Scots, Sr. M. Agnes Xavier Trail and Sr. M. Margaret Teresa Clapperton, had come from Chavagnes, France in 1834 and established St. Margaret’s convent. Their chief work was education, though they occasionally carried out nursing work. Anonymous, Revival of Conventual Life in Scotland: History of St. Margaret’s Convent, Edinburgh, the first Religious House founded in Scotland since the so-called Reformation; and the autobiography of the first religious, Sister Agnes Xavier Trail. Edinburgh, 1886.

6In this thesis, the term Scottish Catholic is applied to those from pockets in the north east and in the south west only, it will not apply to Highland Catholics or the children of the Irish Catholic migrants born in Scotland.

mobilise. The city’s growing Catholic population was the result of south-bound movement from the Highlands and Irish migration. Although a significant worry for Presbyterian Scotland, whose own Church was experiencing internal divisions, this growth represented the opportunity and the means through which Scotland and the Catholic Church could be reacquainted. The practicality of re-acquaintance, however, was complicated by Scotland’s status as a mission territory; there was no Church hierarchy to take responsibility for organisation and delegation. The organisational dilemma within the Scottish mission was compounded by the impact of Ireland’s Famine. The statistics based on the census information provided in James Handley’s dated, though useful study of the Irish in modern Scotland, reveal that in 1841 there were 126,321 Irish-born in Scotland, out of a total population of 2,620,184. By 1851, in the immediate aftermath of the Famine, the number has risen to 207,367, out of a total Scottish population of 2,888,742. Ten years later, the Irish-born population had decreased slightly to 204,083, but it is important to remember that children born in Scotland to Irish-born parents were counted as native Scots. Charles Withers estimates the total number of Irish-born in Glasgow to be 59,801 in 1851, or 18.17 per cent of the city’s population, and roughly three quarters were Catholic. Irish migration had overwhelmed the material, human and spiritual resources of Glasgow’s existing Church, which only had four priests serving an estimated Catholic population of between 36,000 and 44,000 adherents in 1836.

---

8Peter F. Anson, Underground Catholicism in Scotland, 1622-1878. (Montrose: Standard Press, 1970), p. 230. John F. McCaffrey has shown that Catholic ‘clusters’ were to be found in traditional strongholds, the north-east, north-west, and the south-west (the profession lists from the focus congregations vouch for this), but also along the central, industrial belt and in Ayrshire. “Politics and the Catholic Community since 1878” in Innes Review, Vol. 29, No. 2 (Autumn, 1978), p. 143.

9The number of Scottish Highland Catholics was decreasing yearly on account of migration to ‘America (mainly northern Canada), Australia, New Zealand etc’. FSICA. Box marked “Letters from Rome (from 1850) on Rule and Constitutions” ref. # 031.1. Brown folder marked 1851-1875. Letter from Alexander Smith to Cardinal Fransoni, Prefect of the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda Fide, 18 March 1852.


Faced with a rapidly expanding population, the Church’s first priority was to secure Catholicism, though methods seem to have differed between the Eastern and Western Districts. The Eastern District’s Bishop, James Gillis (1802-1864), believed that the ‘re-conversion of Scotland’ would be achieved through the upper classes, so he focussed more on their needs. In the Western District, where Glasgow was located and where the Catholic population was numerically much higher but generally poorer, the focus was on retention rather than re-conversion; it was imperative that the migrants be kept Catholic. The second priority was to improve the situation of Glasgow’s Catholics by tending to their long-term needs. Instrumental in this process was the creation of a Catholic education system which would both elevate both the Catholic population and the Church to a level of respectability in Scottish and British society. Fundamental to the aspirations of respectability was the need to employ education as a tool to control the Irish Catholics and bring them more in line with the obedient and loyal brand of Scottish Catholicism. The recruitment of women, who were recognised as having an institutionalised link with the Church and who thus carried ‘religious’ authority, was initiated by Father Peter Forbes (1805-1872), the senior priest at St. Mary’s Parish, in an effort to secure and expand the influence of the Church over the Catholic population.

Teaching Sisters were integral to the survival of Roman Catholicism in Glasgow because their educational work enabled them to fulfil a dual role as community improvers and front-line propagators of a respectable brand of Catholicism. The result of their influence can be seen in growth of Catholic observance, and although Mass attendance was less than 10 per cent at mid-century, with only one benediction service in the Western District in 1860, by 1914, there were 70 weekly benedictions taking place in Glasgow alone. Similarly, on the eve of the First World War, there were an estimated 463 parochial organisations operating in the Glasgow Archdiocese; none had existed at the end of the 1830s. Across Scotland, between 1885 and 1920, Catholic marriages, baptisms and confirmations all increased which suggests a more devout following than that of fifty years earlier. This is not to suggest that Sister alone were responsible for this devotional transformation, but they certainly played a significant role, and one which many underestimate. Jo Ann Kay McNamara has proposed, rightly, in her study of the roles and impact

---

15 Anson, Underground Catholicism, p. 283.
of nuns through time, that Sisters were not 'simple do-gooders but determined missionaries'.

**Literature Review**

While there is useful scholarship about Roman Catholicism and the Irish in nineteenth-century Scotland, highlighted below, it proved to be severely limiting in its ability to inform a study concentrating exclusively on Sisters. Having said this, there are two scholars who have included Sisters in their consideration of Catholic education. T. A. Fitzpatrick’s *No Mean Service: Scottish Catholic Teacher Education 1895-1995* examines Catholic teachers, but he only looks at the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur and their Dowanhill teacher training college. While Francis J. O’Hagan is more expansive in considering the development of Catholic education in *Change, Challenge, and Achievement*, mentioning both the Sisters of Mercy and the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, little convent archival material is included. Both works, therefore, were limited in their ability to provide this study with a rounded context of the experience of women religious. By focussing exclusively on the educational work of three congregations of Sisters in Glasgow, this thesis illuminates a completely new dimension of Catholic Church history in the city, and in the process has had to break its own path. The reliance upon the primary material gleaned from the convent archives is evidence of this.

While Scottish historical scholarship has traditionally disregarded a number of themes, women’s history has suffered especial neglect. Scottish women in the modern period have been left dispossessed by traditional and patriarchal approaches and projects, though Lesley Orr MacDonald’s painstaking study on women and Presbyterianism in Scotland between 1830-1930 is a notable exception. Nevertheless, the history of religion in Scotland excludes women, and the scholarship focussing on Roman Catholicism in particular, confines the contribution and

---


experience of women to a sentence or footnote. Only in his more recent writings has the Church historian, Callum Brown, made an effort to reverse past trends of neglect. Yet while his inclusion of a small section about women in his *Religion and Society in Scotland Since 1707*, as well as his more gendered approach in *The Death of Christian Britain*, attempts to redress the deficiency, he fails to mention Catholic Sisters, despite commenting on the recruitment of priests in the second half of the nineteenth-century. This is a serious oversight considering their identity as women religious and their impact on Catholic education.

The reasons for overlooking women’s experience may boil down to an original lack of interest, but trepidation is also a likely cause. Therefore, in order to inform this thesis about Sisters, scholarship from Ireland and North America was consulted and four studies proved especially useful: Mary Peckham Magray’s *The Transforming Power of the Nuns: Women, Religion and Cultural Change in Ireland, 1750-1900*, Jo Ann Kay McNamara’s chapter “Culture Wars” in *Sisters in Arms: Catholic Nuns through two Millennia*, Catriona Clear’s *Nuns in Nineteenth-Century Ireland* and Marta Danylewytz’s ground-breaking study *Taking the Veil: An Alternative to Marriage, Motherhood and Spinsterhood in Quebec, 1840-1920*.

Of all the works consulted about women religious, Magray’s *The Transforming Power of the Nuns* is the most pertinent because it too argues that Sisters shaped Catholic culture. In this thesis, women religious have not been marginalised to the outskirts of Scottish Catholic history, but are shown as having had a more determined influence over the Catholic population and its subsequent development, which subscribes to Magray’s overall argument that Sisters facilitated change and

---

19 Alasdair Roberts’ article, “The Role of Women in Scottish Catholic Survival” in *Scottish Historical Review*, Vol. 70, No. 190 (October, 1991) is another exception, though it focusses on the early modern period.


transformation which ensured survival and development.\footnote{Mary Peckham Magray, \textit{The Transforming Power of the Nuns: Women, Religion and Cultural Change in Ireland, 1750-1900}. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998), p. 34.} This point is further qualified by Jacinta Prunty, whose valuable geographical study of the Dublin slums asserts that in many respects, women made more of an impact than men.\footnote{Jacinta Prunty, \textit{Dublin Slums 1800-1925: A Study in Urban Geography}. (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1999), p. 240.} While Magray shows that the impetus for convent establishment in Ireland came from the Sisters, the initial drive for their establishment in Glasgow came from the clergy. Rather than arguing that Sisters had virtual independence from male clerics, as Magray does, and as Cliona Murphy has criticised her for,\footnote{Cliona Murphy, review of \textit{The Transforming Power of the Nuns: Women, Religion and Cultural Change in Ireland, 1750-1900} by Mary Peckham Magray. \textit{American Historical Review}. Vol. 104, No. 5 (December, 1999), pp. 1761-1762.} this thesis proposes more of a partnership between Sisters and the clergy in shaping Catholicism in Glasgow after 1847, but maintains that Sisters secured its survival. It diverges from Magray’s theory that Sisters were integral to the ‘embourgeoisement’\footnote{Elizabeth Steiner-Scott, review of \textit{The Transforming Power of the Nuns: Women, Religion and Cultural Change in Ireland, 1750-1900} by Mary Peckham Magray. \textit{Journal of Modern History}. Vol. 72, No. 2 (June, 2000), p. 515.} that would cultivate the ‘new ruling elite’ because in Scotland, where Protestants were the majority, despite the best efforts of the Sisters to elevate the Catholic population to a level of respectability, Catholics in Scotland were never in a position to challenge Protestant ‘hegemony’.\footnote{McNamara, \textit{Sisters in Arms}, p. 584.}

McNamara’s “Culture Wars”, which addresses the struggle encountered by women religious in mission territories, inspired the consideration of ‘culture wars’ among the Sisters in both Glasgow and Toronto; a comparison of these two Protestant cities is the basis of the fifth chapter. Many of the issues she discusses, including the inability of formerly cloistered nuns to adapt to the rigours of mission life, the controversy surrounding the wearing of habits and the constant conflicts between old and new traditions, were evident in both cities. On a different level, McNamara examines the belief that Sisters were able to convert nations and ‘civilise’ non-white populations because they ‘reinforced the Vatican’s ultramontane policies by ignoring the nationalist claims, mixing personnel from several nations or sending congregations from one nation into territory administered by a different secular government’.\footnote{Magray, \textit{The Transforming Power}, p. 41.} This approach was important for the development of similar ideas in this thesis, though the uniqueness of Glasgow’s
situation inspired a different connection, essentially that Sisters worked to convert a 'nation' within a nation in the case of the migrant Irish in Scotland. Here it is argued that the 'culture war', as it existed between the Irish and Scottish Catholics in Glasgow, meant that Sisters were recruited to reform the Irish Catholics, who as well as being Catholic were also Celtic and thus perceived as racially inferior, and transform them into respectable and obedient Scottish and British Catholics.

Caitriona Clear's pioneering study on nuns in nineteenth-century Ireland was an important starting point. Her overall argument, that Sisters were 'powerless instruments' of clerical authority, however, is flawed and has been justly criticised by numerous scholars who have shown the tremendous personal and congregational agency that Sisters and nuns actually had. In contrast to Clear's approach, the Sisters in Glasgow are shown as intrepid missionaries and reformers. Her emphasis on the strength of familial bonds (siblings, nieces and cousins) and the impact these had on convent membership was useful for discerning reasons for the prevalence of Irish sibling sets in the communities under investigation here. While female 'advice, support and companionship' influenced one's decision to join, Clear highlights the 'long-lasting and intimate' familial bonds that had developed in the nineteenth century along with the social isolation experienced by many middle-class Irish women.

Like Clear, Marta Danylewycz was also a pioneer, though Taking the Veil: An Alternative to Marriage, Motherhood and Spinsterhood in Quebec, 1840-1920, testifies much more strongly to the personal agency of Sisters. While similarities exist, specifically the belief in an ultramontane push and the reliance upon women as well as the importance of blood relations within communities, this thesis goes in a different direction. Fundamental to this incongruity is the fact that Quebec was a predominantly Catholic province, whereas the Sisters in Glasgow and Toronto resided under the purview of Protestantism. While the final chapter aims to link Glasgow's Sisters into the broader experience of women religious in mission territories by considering Toronto, and although Danylewycz's study is close to Toronto in time and space, its Protestant character presents a crucial difference. Therefore, the work of Elizabeth Smyth, concentrating almost

---

28Ibid., p. 10.
exclusively on the Sisters of St. Joseph of Toronto (one of the focus congregations), was more beneficial. Danylewycz's demonstration that the Church in Quebec defined French nationalism and controlled intellectual liberalism as a means to secure its hegemony is important and although this thesis also considers national identity, it does so in terms of the friction that existed between the native and non-native Catholic groups. Consequently, in Glasgow, where Catholicism was fighting for survival rather than hegemony, the Church worked diligently to enable the Catholic community to gain acceptance by and to become a part of the Scottish nation.

The influence that these works had on this thesis is marked, yet not one mentioned Scotland. This is indicative of the fact that Scotland's Catholic past has remained cut-off from the mainstream historiography of women religious and it is also a reflection of Scottish Catholicism's tradition of isolationism. This thesis serves to connect the Scottish experience into the fast-developing field of historiography on women religious, which will hopefully lead to new, inclusive projects which consider the significance of these women in a broader nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century British context. The two scholars considered to be the experts on the history of Catholicism in Scotland are John McCaffrey and Bernard Aspinwall, and between them they have produced a significant amount of scholarship. In particular, McCaffrey's "Reactions in Scotland to the Famine", "Education and the National Identity: The Scoto-Irish Experience and Aspirations" and "Politics and the Catholic Community since 1878" have helped develop a context for the Irish and Catholicism in the west of Scotland. Aspinwall's scholarship, however, has been more influential because it constantly stresses a Catholic desire for respectability, though at times his


attempts to demonstrate that respectability are overstated and undermine the severity the poverty experienced by the majority of Scotland’s Catholics.

That the Irish were seen as ‘dilut[ing] the native traditions’ harden the resolve among Scottish Catholics to prevent the incomers from interfering with their desire to become an integral part of the Scottish nation within Britain. In *Apes and Angels: The Irishman in Victorian Caricature*, L. Perry Curtis was highly critical of scholars such as Sheridan Gilley, who dismiss the racial dimension of attitudes towards the Irish, and points to James E. Handley’s study of the Irish in modern Scotland as evidence of the existence of a ‘Hibernophobic’ attitude. Curtis is right to emphasise the importance of race in the development of anti-Irish attitudes in Britain, but he must be careful not to dismiss the centrality of religion. In Scotland there was a fundamental belief, exhibited in the opening quote, that the prosperity of the nation had been a consequence of the Reformation; the influx of Catholic migrants and the effort to consolidate Catholicism provoked fear that Scotland’s progress was under threat.

The Scottish Catholic resolve to prevent ‘dilution’ by sublimating the Irishness of the migrants was very much connected to the broader issues confronting Scottish identity between 1790 and 1860. Scotland’s desire for recognition as an equal partner in the union, a phase described as ‘Unionist-Nationalism’, sparked a reappraisal of its place in Britain. The Catholic Bishops, Andrew Scott, John Murdoch and Alexander Smith, all natives of the Enzie District in Banffshire, prioritised education as a means to secure the survival of their Catholic nation. Aspinwall’s unpublished manuscript, “Catholic Devotion in Victorian Scotland” demonstrates that the sheer number of Catholics, particularly in the Western District, necessitated discipline,
organisation and centralisation. After 1878 the extreme differences between the country’s three Catholic districts were strikingly apparent: ‘The north traditional and aloof from the tensions which developed elsewhere; the west anti-establishment and mainly Gaelic in origin, with strong Irish sympathies and large concentrations of Catholics of Irish origin, and the east with its Tory sympathies viewed in some other parts as alien and snobbish’. The consolidation of Catholicism in Scotland developed out of an ultramontane drive, especially in the case of the Western District, where it was considerably difficult to unite the Scottish and Irish Catholics, but where both did seem to bow, grudgingly, to the Pope. Aspinwall’s proposal, that the impetus to mould the Catholic population into respectable British Catholics came from the Scottish Catholic clergy, had a tremendous influence on this thesis’s central theme, that the recruitment of Sisters to Glasgow was done, in part, to reform the migrants and ‘dampen their Irish nationalist militancy’. However, an investigation of Sisters, and their role in this sublimating process represents a critical divergence from Aspinwall’s theories. Therefore, this thesis finds greater resonance with the work of Mary Peckham Magray, a scholar who argues that Sisters were the transformers of Catholic culture.

**Primary Sources**

Researching women religious in Scotland is complicated by issues connected with access and the limitations or scarcity of the evidence. The research undertaken for this project relied heavily upon the private convent archives of each community and a range of material, including annals, Rules and Constitutions, reception and profession lists, obituary lists and letters, was consulted. Although these archives yielded extremely valuable information about community foundation and

---

37 Aspinwall, “Catholic Devotion”. Created in 1827, the three Districts were: the Western District, which included Argyllshire, Ayrshire, Bute and Arran, Dumbartonshire, Lanarkshire, Renfrewshire, Wigtonshire, the Hebrides and the southern part of Inverness-shire; the Eastern District which included Stewartry, Dumfriesshire, Roxburghshire, Berwickshire, Selkirkshire, Peeblesshire, Edinburghshire, Linlithgowshire, Stirlingshire, Clackmannanshire, Kinross-shire, Fife, Perthshire, and Kincardineshire; and the Northern District which included Aberdeen, Banffshire, Murrays, Nairnshire, north Inverness-shire, Ross-shire, Cromartyshire, Sutherlandshire, Caithness-shire and Orkney and Shetland. CDS, 1831, pp. 61, 66 and 71.


40 Magray, *The Transforming Power*. 
organisation, Sister recruitment and their geographic origins as well as their negotiations with 
male clerics, evidence relating to their daily lives, usually referred to as ‘convent life’, was 
comparatively scant in the Glasgow communities especially. There were no diaries (except for 
one anonymous notebook), daily schedules, remnants of schools books or written comments 
about their experiences as teachers. Cross checking with other archives was therefore a necessity. 

Although there is a wealth of untapped primary material, certain impediments and limitations, 
unique to the religious congregations, exist and these relate to accessibility, the desire for privacy 
and the variation between the convent archives in terms of what records and material were kept. 
The convent archives consulted for this thesis are private and therefore access is not guaranteed 
and may be complicated by the fact that they are often housed in the same building as elderly 
Sisters, who may or may not be fit to receive visitors, especially academic researchers. It may 
also be the case that the number of Sisters in a particular community has dwindled to such an 
extent that those remaining might be unable to provide for research time because they are 
struggling to keep up with the work they already have; only did the Sisters of St. Joseph in 
Toronto employ an archivist, the rest were manned by Sisters. The desire to protect their privacy 
might also limit a researcher’s access to the financial records and personal information of Sisters, 
however, during the course of this research project, the congregations offered continued access 
and assistance. In particular, the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception and the Sisters 
of Mercy granted unlimited access, though it is important to emphasise that this privilege may not 
be extended to everyone. The variation between convent archives, in terms of what material was 
kept, presented a significant challenge, and again this was a particular issue with the Glasgow 
communities; the Sisters of Mercy suffered from an especial lack of material. This scarcity of 
material necessitated the identification of supplementary repositories such as the Glasgow 
Archdiocese Archives, the Scottish Catholic Archives in Edinburgh, Mercy International Centre 
in Dublin and the Sisters of Mercy convent archives in Limerick, though access to material in this 
last archive was severely restricted. 

These additional archives yielded many ‘missing links’ which enabled cross-referencing and 
verification. This was particularly the case when seeking to clarify the complicated and 
tumultuous relationship between the Franciscan Sisters, the Sisters of Mercy and Father Peter
Forbes, which required material from four Scottish and two Irish archives. It must also be noted that while the *Scottish Catholic Directory (CDS)* is useful for details regarding parish and school openings, convent school adverts, clergy death dates and obituaries, the volumes are riddled with inaccuracies and must be used with caution.

**Chapter Outlines**

Chapter One establishes a context for the Irish in Glasgow. It begins by considering Irish migration to the west of Scotland before and during the Famine and goes on to examine the experience of the Irish migrant in mid-nineteenth-century Glasgow. Irish migrants, both Protestant and Catholic, were attracted to Glasgow for a number of reasons, including education, job prospects, familiarity through kin ties and previously established seasonal migration patterns. In the case of the Famine migrants, Glasgow became a destination often out of sheer desperation. An estimated 75 per cent of these migrants were Roman Catholic and so caused tremendous population pressure with a significant impact on Catholic identity in the city. The second section of this chapter explores the Catholic identity of the migrants and the fear they provoked among Scots, non-Catholic and Catholic alike, as a way to demonstrate why Sisters were recruited in the first place.

Chapter Two provides an introduction to the three focus Glasgow communities, the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, the Sisters of Mercy and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur. Aside from detailing how the Sisters were brought to Glasgow, who the founding members were, where they lived and how they were supported, sections one and two make special use of the databases created for the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy. The databases, along with others, are included on the Cd-Rom attached to this thesis and reveal interesting information such as the national and regional origin of the Sisters as well as profession statistics and the prevalence of sibling sets. The third and fourth sections of this chapter consider the impact that disease, death and conflict had on non-perseverance and community stability. The early histories of the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy are interwoven, and while they eventually grew to complement each other, their early relationship suffered setbacks, but they were more seriously tested by the tension that existed between the Sisters, particularly the
Superiors, and the male clergy. The final section focusses on the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur and links their arrival to the modernisation of the Catholic education system. A database could not be created for this community, due to limited access, but enough material was provided to determine the number of Sisters who worked in Glasgow, as well as their nationalities.

Chapter Three first examines the progress made by the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy in elementary education before 1872. The foothold they achieved for Catholic education was rooted in the success of their parish, Sunday and convent schools, the latter gave them access to middle- and upper-class Catholics whose money not only funded the community, but helped with the costs of the poor schools, and whose daughters would make up their future membership. The second section examines the perception of Sisters and nuns, as part of the anti-Catholicism and anti-conventualism sentiments that were rampant in nineteenth-century Britain, to reveal the obstacles, and sometimes personal danger, these women faced.

Chapter Four considers Catholic education in Glasgow after 1872 when the Education (Scotland) Act was passed. While most of this chapter examines the development of the Catholic education system, its finances and difficulties, other issues, such as sectarianism and the tension that existed between the Scottish and Irish clergy, will also be examined. The title of this dissertation was, in part, inspired by these last two points. There was a desire to protect the uniquely Scottish brand of quiet Catholicism, but this left many Irish Catholics feeling excluded; some believe, rightly, that there was a ‘crackdown on anything which smacked of a political or national feeling’ among the Irish Catholics in Glasgow. As the Catholic education system expanded, Sisters remained key to fostering ‘grassroots’ loyalty to the Church, and while they did not work with men directly, their sphere of influence certainly extended to them indirectly. The Church was determined to ‘inculcate behaviour suitable for the Victorian drawing room’ and that resolve necessitated the continued influence of Sisters since they were dedicated to bringing about

---

6 Aspinwall, “Catholic Devotion”.
Chapter Five compares the recruitment and experience of Sisters in Glasgow and Toronto. It serves to integrate the Scottish dimension into the broader, international experience of women religious and thus represents a break-away from traditional and insular Scottish historiography. The preceding chapters' discussions on Irish migration, Sister recruitment, anti-conventualism and Catholic education all contain the theme of anti-Catholicism. Chapter Five begins by considering Toronto and Glasgow as Protestant cities, and although Toronto is not a Presbyterian city, its comparative value is reflected in its entrenched anti-Catholicism and experience with Irish Catholic migration. In 1847 the first religious congregation, the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary, arrived from Rathfarnham, Ireland, and shortly after they were joined by the Sisters of St. Joseph, who arrived from Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, in 1851. These congregations were not the same as those in Glasgow, but they are comparatively important because they undertook the same kind of work and had a strong presence of Irish Sisters. Both came in response to the growing number of Catholic Irish in Toronto and like their Glasgow counterparts, they were charged with providing for the educational needs of the migrants while simultaneously facilitating Church expansion. No evidence of overt nationalism was discovered in the archives of the three Scottish communities, but the same cannot be said for Toronto and this chapter concludes with a discussion about the prevalence of sibling sets of Irish birth and ancestry, based on databases created for this dissertation. An important conclusion drawn from this evidence is that in Toronto, Irish Sisters wielded considerable influence, whereas in Glasgow their impact was closely regulated.

Sisters were the universal ambassadors of a world Church, and this position carried great responsibility. Their recruitment to Glasgow was undertaken to improve the lot of Catholics and prevent proselytisation, but also to mould the Catholic population into respectable and loyal adherents. Far from being 'powerless instruments', Sisters in Glasgow were active agents in the process of transformation. This thesis demonstrates that through their educational work, women religious ensured the survival and development of Catholicism in Glasgow.

---

44 Large numbers of women from both Scotland and Ireland entered Glasgow convents and unlike Toronto, there was not one recorded incident of conflict on nationalist grounds.

45 Magray's criticism of Clear in The Transforming Power, p. 10.
I. The Nineteenth-Century Foundations of Glasgow’s Irish Catholic Community

Mass Irish migration, particularly during the mid-nineteenth century, initiated tremendous change in Glasgow, where the bulk of the Scottish-bound migrants settled. Part of this change was the determined effort to consolidate Catholicism in Scotland and elevate its followers to a level of respectability; the recruitment of Roman Catholic Sisters and the establishment of a Catholic education system was the immediate result. However, before this can be examined, it is first necessary to establish the foundations of Glasgow’s Irish Catholic community. This chapter, which is divided into two sections, considers nineteenth-century Irish migration patterns to the west of Scotland before examining Glasgow in the 1840s and early 1850s to highlight the plight of the Irish migrant.

The first section, which examines Irish migration before and during the Famine, has been informed by scholars such as L. M. Cullen, Sheridan Gilley, Roger Swift1 and James E. Handley,2 as well as the comparatively important North American perspectives of Hasia Diner, Kerby Miller and Donald H. Akenson. The identification of key themes such as permanent and seasonal migration, work patterns and mass Famine migration provides a context for the second section which considers how the migrants coped in mid-nineteenth-century Glasgow, the overwhelmingly Presbyterian second city of the Empire. Their experience was characterised by a continuation of the poverty they had experienced in Ireland, the diseases many acquired as a result and by the anti-Irish attitudes which abounded. The city that received them, and more significantly, the Church that had to serve them, faced unprecedented pressure which necessitated the recruitment of Sisters who could shape the values of the growing population.

---


2James E. Handley’s *The Irish in Modern Scotland* (Cork: Cork University Press, 1947) remains the steadfast source for the history of the Irish in modern Scotland.
The scholarship of Irene Maver, Hamish Fraser, Bernard Aspinwall and Tom Devine has been employed to provide a context for the Irish in mid-nineteenth-century Glasgow.

**Migration from Ireland**

The Napoleonic Wars brought prosperity to Ireland, but they also set in motion a string of events that would forever change it. Eighteenth-century and early- to mid-nineteenth century Ireland was overwhelmingly rural, with the majority of its inhabitants living subsistence-focused lives. Slow economic progress, the result of poor infrastructure, limited internal trade and the dependency of exports on outside forces, was curbed by the Napoleonic Wars, which injected life into its import and export trade, increased the income of farmers and got landowners thinking about improvement.

In L. M. Cullen’s economic study of Ireland since 1660, the period between 1793-1815 was described as a boom time for Ireland since the price and volume of Irish exports increased by 120 per cent and 40 per cent respectively, and because investment was visible in projects ranging from canal construction and factory additions to town growth and the expansion of banking. This facilitated trade and development, and farming prospered on account of wartime demand and inflation, but Kerby Miller, an authority on Irish emigration, points to the conflicts since 1750 and the natural population increase as having created a market for Irish grain, pork, beef and butter. Nevertheless, this was slight improvement and significant obstacles remained. The absentee landlords, who ‘invested neither capital nor time in their estates’, and Ireland’s limited

---


industrialisation, which was restricted to the textile centres of eastern Ulster, specifically Belfast, Ballymena and Lisburn, had initiated the establishment of migratory patterns to Scotland. Ulster and the west of Scotland had traditional links through the textile industry, and after 1815, when cotton production shifted from Belfast to Glasgow, Irish migration to Scotland increased.

Pre-Famine migration to Scotland was therefore largely Ulster-based, with Presbyterian dissenters desirous of a university education and/or religious toleration and unemployed textile workers being the majority. Yet although the Irish provided the cheap labour required for the survival of the Glasgow area mills and factories, it has been noted that as a consequence, those of the propertied classes in Glasgow did not readily assist with the emigration of paupers because the stream of Ulster weavers reversed any dent that might have been made in the existing poverty. The statistics provided by James Cleland, the nineteenth-century Glasgow statistician, were employed by Graham Walker who estimates that of the Irish in Glasgow in 1831, roughly 45 per cent were Protestant and 55 per cent were Catholic, the majority of whom were employed as weavers; though for the entire nineteenth century, the Protestant Irish represented roughly 25 per cent of the total Irish population in Scotland.

Seasonal migration, another important vein of the pre-Famine movement, originated mainly in

---


Connaught and west Ulster and had been common since the 1830s. Ruth Ann Harris, in her study of Irish seasonal migration to Britain before the Famine, argues that seasonal migrants came to Britain not as an escape, but rather to maintain their links with Ireland. Temporary migration was beneficial since it permitted the Irish to preserve 'valued aspects of their existing social system', it provided autonomy in the form of cash to cover their expenses in Ireland and it enabled them to retain kin ties. The Scottish farmers similarly benefited from the extra hands during the harvest, but also from the fact that afterwards, the Irish labourers left and required nothing further from their temporary employers.

Ireland’s reliance upon subsistence and market agriculture was marked by geographic specialisation. In Connaught and Ulster, where the soil was of poor quality, subsistence farming was widespread, whereas south east Leinster was the centre of commercial grain production and the mountainous regions of Munster, the Golden Vale and the Shannon Estuary, fostered dairy and pig farming. The shift towards pastoralism, coupled with partible inheritance patterns, particularly in Counties Mayo, Galway, Clare and Donegal, produced a redundant population who became accustomed to seasonal migration. Scotland and England, convenient migration options, came to expect the seasonal movement of Irish. Seasonal migrants travelled to Britain via eight Irish ports, seven of which had routes to Glasgow and only Liverpool received more Irish traffic, though it was also the main port of departure for North America. Derry, Belfast, Warrenpoint, Dundalk, Drogheda, Dublin and Cork all served Glasgow-bound ships, but the heaviest traffic went from Derry, Belfast, Drogheda and Dublin. Police counts, conducted at every port in 1841, reveal that Counties Mayo (10,430), Dublin (5,552) and Roscommon

---

11 Heather Holmes, *As Good As A Holiday*: *Potato Harvesting in the Lothians from 1870 to the Present*. (East Linton: Tuckwell Press Ltd., 2000), p. 188. Part five is dedicated to the Irish seasonal migrants. While much of her information concerns the period after 1900, it remains an invaluable source.

12 Ruth Ann M. Harris, *The Nearest Place That Wasn't Ireland: Early Nineteenth-Century Irish Labour Migration*. (Ames, Iowa: Iowa State University Press, 1994), pp. 9 and 27. A valuable contribution to Irish migration scholarship, but the title is problematic since Scotland, geographically closest, was virtually ignored.


15 Cullen, *An Economic History*, p. 112.


(5,422) saw the highest levels of seasonal migration to Britain, while the province of Connaught was highest overall with 25,686 migrants; Ulster (16,215), Leinster (10,259) and Munster (1,605) followed. During the mid-1840s, an estimate put the number of Irish arriving in Glasgow for the harvest at roughly 25,000; in 1846, during the Famine, the Glasgow Herald noted a reduced number of "those interesting and useful visitants".

Famine and agricultural change in Ireland precipitated a pattern of evictions, increased migration and emigration. Migration to Scotland peaked at mid-century, largely on account of the Famine, as sheer desperation saw the departure of many who had before remained at home. Distanced just 13 miles apart at the narrowest point, and with cheap passenger fares to match, Scotland was a natural option. During the Famine, and indeed afterwards, Britain and North America were the most popular destinations, and have thus received significant attention from emigration scholars, though literature on the North American dimension is particularly abundant. However, although the North America-centred literature is important for the overall context of Irish out-migration, it cannot explain the unique British or Scottish dimension, as will be highlighted below. Class was one important difference between North America-bound and Britain-bound migrants, and in 1849 The Illustrated London News observed that enterprising citizens went to America while poorer artisans went to Liverpool with the hopes of one day emigrating to America. Many of those who travelled to Glasgow, Liverpool and London had been unable to afford the passage to North America.

The Famine migration is a complicated subject for scholars because it is shrouded in academic
bickering on both sides of the Atlantic. In his article on the historiography of the Famine, Graham Davis considers the opposing theses of John Mitchel, a nineteenth-century journalist-historian who argued that the Famine had been a deliberate attempt by the British government to eliminate Ireland's problematic peasantry, and Kerby Miller, an Irish emigration specialist who argues that emigration was a consequence of 'push factors' from within Irish society, culture and economy. Regarding the Mitchel thesis, Davis points to the impact it has made on scholars such as Charles Gavan Duffy, an original Young Irelander, Cecil Woodham-Smith, Thomas Gallagher and Christine Kinealy as the most significant aspect. For example, while P. M. Austin Bourke’s study of the Irish grain trade is often used to dismiss Mitchel’s claims, Kinealy refutes Bourke’s assessment that starvation could not have been offset by prohibiting the export of grain arguing that the motives of farmers and merchants lay largely unexplored. Contemporaries such as the flamboyant nationalist poet, Lady Jane Francesca Wilde (1826-1896), who was described by Bram Stoker as a 'phenomenon', was also critical of the grain exports. Her poem, The Stricken Land, later renamed The Famine Year, was first published in the Nation, a nationalist paper co-founded by Duffy, on 23 January 1847, and exemplifies this

26Davis, “The Historiography of the Irish”, p. 32. Swift believes that emigration was an increasingly rational alternative and thus a mix of push and pull. “The Historiography”, pp. 53-54.
27Davis credits Kinealy’s The Great Calamity as a ‘professional and Scholarly work’, “The Historiography of the Irish”, p. 18.
Davis himself even questions what would have happened if the Famine had occurred in England, though such speculation is futile. The Highland famine, which occurred between 1846 and 1848, is perhaps the only situation that might be compared to Ireland, though there were substantial differences because the scale of the Irish crisis was much greater; deaths in Ireland were estimated at between 1,000,000-1,200,000, whereas no more than 150,000 were ever at risk in Scotland. Ireland’s population pressure, its minimal industry and its exclusion from imperial ventures contrasted significantly with the experience of Scotland and England demonstrate that the pre-conditions on mainland Britain were too different and reveal the flaw with Davis’ speculation.

In terms of the Miller thesis, while there was a ‘push’ from within Ireland, migrants and emigrants were also ‘pulled’ by the opportunities abroad which corresponds with Akenson’s opinion that there was a conscious decision and willingness to leave Ireland. Hasia Diner’s study of Irish female immigrants in the United States is a useful example of this. She weighed the benefits (social advancement, independence, employment and marriage opportunities) and dangers (unplanned pregnancy by employers, dangerous working conditions and prostitution) to show that emigration was a favourable option for Irish women. That there was a profound ‘female exodus’ since 1830 is demonstrated by the fact that in that year, women represented 35 per cent of all Irish immigrants, but by 1900, they represented 53.8 per cent. Diner’s study is therefore comparatively important when considering Irish migration to Britain, though crucial limitations exist.


Diner, Erin’s Daughters.

Ibid., p. 31.
She emphasises that initially, emigration was more familial, composed mostly of married couples and their children, but after the Famine, a trend of young, single women emerged; 66 per cent of emigrants between 1850 and 1887 were aged 15 to 35. She contrasted this to the overall familial migration pattern to Britain and while her statement about migration to mainland Britain is not incorrect, it is inaccurate because it is based on Maldwyn A. Jones' outdated and extremely general British emigration survey. M. A. G. Ó Tuathaigh's survey of the Irish in Britain noted the familial migration pattern before the Famine, especially to places like the west of Scotland's textile towns since there was employment for all family members, and although he indicates the shift towards the movement of young and single migrants after 1860, he does not suggest that the movement of this group was restricted to the post-Famine period.

Irish female migration accelerated with the changes that took place in Irish society, particularly in terms of the family, economy and religion. The main Irish Churches, Roman Catholic and Anglican, openly criticised women as inferior and corrupt. In an 1856 sermon delivered at Trinity Church, Rev'd John Gregg, who became the Anglican Bishop of Cork, Cloyne and Ross, castigated women as 'fallen creatures'. The Catholic Church became an instrument of social control in the late nineteenth century, limiting individuality and instilling an 'obedience syndrome' among its followers. Particularly after the Famine, Ireland was rapidly transformed into the world's most faithful and sexually controlled Catholic society. This reveals the flaw in Maldwyn Jones' argument that emigration from Europe, including Britain, was caused by the

---

3Ibid., p. 32-33.


4Miller, Emigrants and Exiles, p. 116. The Church subordinated the 'active virtues' of enterprise and initiative to secure an obedient flock. In an earlier article, Miller suggests that before the 1850s the Church 'lacked the means to fully order, less homogenize Irish Catholicism'; control came after the Famine.


single set of underlying forces' of population pressure and economic transformation. Emigration cannot be simplified into a basic equation since economics operated in conjunction with social upheaval, religion and persecution, natural disaster, personal choice and familial influence.

The lack of evidence has meant that little scholarship has been produced on the movement of non-married migrants, but one cannot ignore the fact that single men and women were very much a part of the Irish movement to Scotland, and indeed England and Wales. J. H. Treble makes a passing mention of the single young Irish women who migrated to Glasgow for full-time work between 1890-1914 and notes that in 1911 Irish women occupied 5.27 per cent of the female labour market; this is a useful statistic about young, single women since most women abandoned work upon marriage. Ruth-Ann Harris employs the 1841 census, which enumerated only those with 'relatively permanent settlement', to show that women tended to migrate to England on a more permanent basis. The ratio of male to female seasonal migrants was 6:1, but for every five or six seasonal male migrants who returned to Ireland, one stayed on in Britain and became a permanent resident. The difference between the Irish in Lancashire, for example, and the west of Scotland was the tendency for those in Scotland to be more permanently settled; handloom weaving promoted this because it provided employment for the entire family. For Scotland, more precise data comes from a study of Scottish population figures, which shows that

---

"Maldwyn A. Jones, "The Background to Emigration from Great Britain in the Nineteenth Century" in Perspectives in American History. Vol. 7 (1974), p. 3. Another problem was his incorrect assumption that the experience of handloom weavers has 'little relevance' in migration history. This group has had a tremendous impact on Scotland and to dismiss their migration as irrelevant is to deny the profound effect that Orangeism, and indeed radicalism, has had on the history of the west of Scotland, p. 43. See Elaine McFarland, Protestants First: Orangeism in 19th Century Scotland. (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990).


"Harris, The Nearest Place, p. 137.

Ibid., pp. 137, 185-186 and 192. Emigrants were 'failed migrants' because pre-Famine movement to Britain was mostly temporary. While she deals very well with the circumstances in Ireland as well as those post-migration in England, she neglects the return dimension. Could a migrant not end up in a perpetual state of seasonal employment if he or she were willing to go to where the work was in England and Scotland, as indeed the Irish proved themselves willing to do?

Ibid., 137, 152 and 154.
in 1841 the Irish-born sex ratio in Scotland was 111.2 males for every 100 females. If nothing else, this data confirms that single males, at least, were moving across to Scotland.

However, although difficult to patch together, other bits and pieces do exist that can provide a slightly wider scope for inquiry. For example, the provision of evening classes for factory girls is one such dimension; their numbers were numerous enough to demand evening classes from the Roman Catholic teaching Sisters. Although scattered and sometimes lacking concrete attendance numbers, recorded evening schools made their appearance in the CDS, starting in 1851, and although there were no attendance figures provided for this year, six of the seven parishes had evening schools for young women and at least four of the evening schools were run by either the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, or the Sisters of Mercy. Before the educational work of these congregations can be examined, it is important to shift the focus more directly to Glasgow and construct a context for the Irish in the city and why the need for Sisters arose. Indeed males dominated the movement to Scotland, but single women cannot be discounted since, as Ann Rossiter observes, in her article on Irish migrant women in nineteenth-century Britain, the history of Welsh and Scottish women is 'camouflaged in the British experience' and not given appropriate attention.

The City on the Clyde: Glasgow

The streets of Glasgow are at present literally swarming with vagrants from the sister country, and the misery which many of these poor creatures endure can scarcely be less than what they have fled or been driven from at home...In Buchan Street there

---

49Michael Flinn, ed., *Scottish Population History: From the 17th century to the 1930s*. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977), p. 456. Ó Tuathaigh believes that male migrants outnumbered female movement to British cities and towns until the 1890s, when women 'achieved a slight majority'. "The Irish in Nineteenth Century Britain", p. 55. Michael Barke's examination of census records for the Irish in Falkirk shows a higher number of Irish men than women, but the difference between the two is minimal, see "Census Enumeration Books and the Local Historian" in *The Local Historian*. Vol.10, No. 5 (February, 1973), pp. 260 and 263.

50CDS, 1851, p. 88. The young men's evening schools were taught by either clergy or lay men. It was not until 1857 that the Marist Brothers were recorded as working in parish schools and the first parish to list them was St. Mungo's. CDS, 1857, p. 99-105.

is an old granary and malt barn...which was standing unoccupied, and this having come under notice of some destitute Irish immigrants, they took possession of it and the colony has continued increasing till the beginning of this week, when the number of persons congregating there amounted to upwards of fifty. Fever having broken out in the place.  

"The Irish Invasion", printed in the *Glasgow Herald* on 11 June 1847, exposed the blackest year in the Famine's run. Less than one year earlier, the same newspaper warned that Glasgow was 'overrun with poor, and that...flocking hither in droves [only exposes them] to certain misery'. The Irish migrants, their arrival and settlement, were touchy subjects in Victorian Glasgow and while many Scots were sympathetic to their plight, some wished them back to the supposedly 'wretched' island from which they came. Anti-Irishness resonated throughout nineteenth-century British society and was exhibited in, though not limited to, the writings of prominent intellectuals such as Friedrich Engels (1820-1895), who declared them to be 'without civilisation' and a race that 'reached the lowest stage of humanity', and the Scottish-born Thomas Carlyle (1785-1881) who proclaimed them to be Britain's 'sorest evil'.

It is estimated that in 1831, Glasgow's population was 202,426, but by 1861 it had almost doubled to 395,503. Much of this growth was the result of in-migration, and it peaked at mid-century when the Irish represented 18.17 per cent (59,801) of Glasgow's population; in 1848 an estimated 1,000 Irish arrived in the city each week. Determining the denominational...

---

52The *Glasgow Herald*, 11 June 1847. The street is Buchan Street, not Buchanan Street. Peter F. Anson mentions an old barn in the Gorbals which held 50 Irish in 1847, perhaps this is the same one. *Underground Catholicism in Scotland, 1622-1878.* (Montrose: Standard Press, 1970), p. 274.

53The *Glasgow Herald*, 21 December 1846.


56Charles Withers, "The Demographic History of the City, 1831-1911" in *Glasgow Volume II*, pp. 141-143.

57Ibid., pp. 149-150. Northern migrants, including those from the far north, the Highland counties and the north east, were estimated to number 20,800. Many were temporary migrants who used Glasgow as a provisional stopover before emigration or they were seasonal migrants following traditional patterns. Robert J. Klaus' research at the Public Record Office in London revealed that in 1849, roughly 4,000 Irish migrated to England weekly. *The Pope, Protestants and the Irish: Papal Aggression and Anti-Catholicism in Nineteenth-Century England.* (New York: Garland Publishing Inc., 1987), p. 26.
breakdown is difficult, but, as has been indicated in the previous chapter, it is assumed that Irish Catholics represented approximately 75 per cent of Glasgow’s Irish population in the nineteenth century.\textsuperscript{58}

Many had been attracted by the industrial employment prospects, and research conducted on the labour force reveals that both male and female employment had been ‘swollen’ by the Irish migrants during the first half of the nineteenth century.\textsuperscript{59} The majority of women were employed in the industrial sector and mainly concentrated in the textile (cotton) and clothing trade;\textsuperscript{60} Irish female factory workers have received attention because they could not be ignored in appraisals of working-class history. In 1851, 16.3 per cent of women in Greenock were Irish and while some were hawkers or lodging-house keepers, the majority worked in the town’s mills and factories; 44.3 per cent of women working in the textile mills were Irish and an incredible 75.9 per cent of women working in paper mills were Irish.\textsuperscript{61} In 1841 female textile workers represented 64.6 per cent of Glasgow’s female labour force, and in 1851 the percentage had increased to 71.2; 60 per cent of the 43,000 female textile workers were single women under the age of twenty. The industrial sector also employed the majority of men, 73.9 per cent in 1841 and 77.5 per cent in 1851, though they tended to be concentrated in the engineering, tool-making, metalworking and building trades.\textsuperscript{62}

The industrial employment sector was insecure and the inadequate pay levels were symptomatic of the booms and busts that resulted from the free market economy to which Glasgow was inextricably linked; these factors combined to ensure poor living standards.\textsuperscript{63} Poverty and degeneration, the natural consequences of British imperial wealth and power, resulted in a

\textsuperscript{58}Graham Walker, “The Protestant Irish”, p. 49.
\textsuperscript{60}Rossiter points to Patricia Branca’s book, Silent Sisterhood: Middle Class Women in the Victorian Home. (London: Croom Helm, 1975). Regarding domestic service, R. D. Lobban has found that in Greenock, it was the Highland women who were more likely to be employed as domestic servants, while Irish women took to factory and mill work. “The Irish Community in Greenock in the Nineteenth Century” in Irish Geography. Vol. 6, No. 3 (1971), pp. 270-272. “The Irish Community in Greenock”, p. 272.
\textsuperscript{61}The Irish-born population of Greenock was also significant; in 1841, 4,307 or 11.7 per cent of its population was Irish-born and in 1881 the percentage peaked at 10,717 or 16.1 per cent. Lobban, “The Irish Community”, pp. 270-272.
sizeable number of 'unprotected non-citizens', many of whom were of Irish birth or descent since 'first and second generation immigrant families were consigned to lives of poverty and misery...[because they got] very uncertain work'. The acute vulnerability of this group became strikingly apparent after the Poor Law Amendment Act was passed for Scotland in 1845. Prior to this, Scotland’s poor were the responsibility of a local parish, but the cumulative effects of industrialisation, rapid urbanisation and the 1843 Disruption, which culminated in the birth of the Free Church and caused significant reductions in Church of Scotland ministerial and congregational membership, magnified the inadequacy of the existing arrangements. The new legislation did permit appeals against ‘inadequate relief’, but the residency requirement was increased from three to five years, which adversely affected the migrants and roughly 6,000 were sent back to Ireland annually towards the end of the 1840s.

In Patrick MacGill’s *The Rat Pit*, a narrative about the Irish migrant experience in Scotland, Glasgow was shown as two cities, the first ‘with all its churches, it halls, with its shipping and commerce, its wharves and factories, its richness and splendour [and the other with] its poor and unhappy, its oppressed and miserable’. The latter caused tremendous concern and in 1840 William Pulteney Alison (1790-1859) and Edwin Chadwick (1800-1890), two of the most

---

68Crowther, “Poverty, Health”, pp. 280-281. The residency requirement was reduced to three years in 1898. See also George A. Mackay, *The Practice of the Scottish Poor Law*. (Edinburgh: William Green & Sons, 1907), p. 74.
influential Victorian public health reformers, declared it 'the worst of any' British city. The dilapidated districts of Old Glasgow were the 'breeding-houses of infection' and particularly during and after the Famine, the Irish were blamed for the deteriorating health of the city. The Glasgow Herald was particularly unsympathetic and reported that most of the typhus cases came from the 'masses of diseased and famished Irish which have been thrown amongst us'. Typhus, a highly contagious disease transmitted by lice, had been a consequence of the poverty, starvation and overcrowding, and its outbreak in Glasgow was 'violent...[with] fearful mortality'. It festered in the congested districts of Glasgow's city centre, like those of 'Calton between the Gallowgate and London Street, the wynds and closes of the Trongate and the Saltmarket, and the closes east of High Street', where the majority of the Irish were concentrated. The severity of the situation is demonstrated by the city's epidemic statistics which reveal that typhus was particularly active in 1847, when 4,346 of the 11,425 typhus victims treated in hospital died, and again between 1863 and 1870, when roughly 7,000 died. Cholera was the other major epidemic to strike Glasgow in the late 1840s and although it could not be directly linked to the Irish, they were still blamed. The Illustrated London News featured a story on Glasgow in 1849 and declared it to be an 'admirable station for the tourist'. It reported that 'Old Glasgow, with all its dirt and discomfort, the swarming wretchedness and filth of the celebrated “Salt Market,” the “Goose Dubs,” the “Gallowgate,” and the “Cowcaddens”


73On-line medical dictionary published at the Department of Medical Oncology, University of Newcastle upon Tyne. http://cancerweb.ncl.ac.uk/cgi-bin/omd/Typhus+epidemic (viewed 20 March 2003).


75W. Hamish Fraser and Irene Mavcr, "The Social Problems of the City" in Glasgow Volume II, p. 414.

76Gibb, Glasgow, pp. 127 and 130.


78The Illustrated London News, 22 September 1849.
is well worthy of a visit', and noted that the majority of the inhabitants in these districts were Irish, but due to the cholera a lengthy visit was not recommended. Cholera, which was equally serious yet more feared than typhus, struck with a ‘short and sharp’ outbreak in 1848-49, in the midst of the Famine migration. John Glaister, a contemporary physician, resurrected the gloomy atmosphere that had engulfed the entire city, when he spoke of the ‘Cholera caravan...[that was] seen daily in all parts of the city...Horror prevailed everywhere’. Cholera’s irregular pattern provoked terror, and enabled the disease to infiltrate nineteenth-century popular culture. Constant references to the cholera creeping from ‘dark and foul recesses where his victims abound’, past ‘every door and window’ were frightening and provoked numerous illustrations, characters and poetry about the dreaded malady. Such personification has been demonstrated by a chilling Scottish poem entitled *The Mowers. An anticipation of the cholera, 1848*; stanzas 1, 2 and 6 have been included as Appendix 1:2.

Typhus and cholera, therefore, made settlement difficult, not simply because they claimed the lives of many migrants, but also because they served to further distance the already alien migrant population. The inadequate and squalid housing provided by the tenements, which sprawled throughout the congested districts, and was symptomatic of both the population explosion that occurred between 1811 and 1851, when Glasgow’s population more than tripled from 77,385 to 329,097, and the resultant ‘uncontrolled jerry-building’, worried city officials. Tenements acquired bad reputations as landlords attempted to maximise profits by renting out as many individual units as possible to the working classes of Glasgow who, like their counterparts in Liverpool, sought such accommodation because of its close proximity to industry and on

---

79Ibid.
83Buchanan, *The Waste Places*, p. 27.
85Withers, *The Demographic*, p. 142.
86Handley, *The Irish in Modern*, p. 150. The word *Tenement* is rooted in the medieval burgage plot which described a house built at the head of the plot, rising to several stories in order to maximize plot use. Gibb, *Glasgow*, p. 137.
account of its relative affordability. 87

Population density, and the accompanying unsanitary conditions, were prime factors in the spread of disease. Between 1831 and 1841, the population of Glasgow had increased by 33,000 and the average number of people per dwelling was 5.6 with the highest level of overcrowding in the areas of intense Irish concentration such as the Saltmarket, Bridgegate and the High Street. 88 Fraser and Maver have explained that improvement attempts, such as ticketing and clearances, exacerbated the problem of overcrowding since many of the cleared tenants sought refuge with their neighbours; in the 1860s some 20,000 people were displaced with the construction of St. Enoch station alone. 89 In 1861 roughly 100,000 people lived in one room dwellings with many families having a space no larger than ten feet by ten feet. 90 Endemic typhus and epidemic cholera forced a recognition of the wretchedness of the inner city in the 1860s and resulted in the Glasgow Improvement Acts after 1866 under the direction of John Blackie, Jr., Lord Provost from 1863 to 1866, and John Carrick, Chief Architect, who planned to demolish and re-construct the city’s Old Town. 91 Not coincidentally, this initiative corresponded with the immediate aftermath of Glasgow’s most serious typhus outbreak in 1863-1864. 92 Nevertheless, despite the urban clearances, the Irish continued to maintain a monopoly over what remained of the dilapidated structures after 1870 because it was cheap and they had no alternative, a point confirmed by Gibb who commented on the ‘magnetic influence’ that the ‘warrens of cheap housing in the central districts’ had on the Irish. 93 Thus, negative impressions

89Ibid., p. 365.
90Handley, The Irish in Modern, pp. 142-144. Commissioner noted that in one area of Cowcaddens, supporting 174 houses, there were only six privies and 3 small middens, p. 52. Fraser and Maver, “The Social Problems”, p. 370.
93Gibb, Glasgow, pp. 127 and 130.
of the Irish abounded, and their poverty attracted intense criticism, but added to this was their Catholicism, which was particularly concerning to those Scottish Catholic clerics who were desperate, for their own cultural and religious security, to sublimate the Irish Catholic culture of the migrants.

In particular, the Irish migrants who arrived in Glasgow before and during the Famine can be described as 'nominal' rather than devout Catholics. Mass attendance was therefore uncommon and Sheridan Gilley proposes that observant Irish Catholicism really began after the Famine and that by 1900, 'Irish Catholics had become...the most 'practising' Catholics in the world'. Roger Swift estimates that 'at least half the pre-Famine and Famine emigrants from Ireland were not churchgoers in their homeland'. Poverty was an important factor for low Mass attendance in Ireland and remained so among the Irish in Britain. For example, in Lancashire circumstances such as the necessity of earning a living and the segregation of the poor in the ‘conspicuous free seating in churches’, deterred the working classes from going to Church. In the early nineteenth-century, it was a similar situation in Glasgow, although there was actually a shortage of seating so the poor, which included both Irish and Highland migrants, had nowhere to sit. In 1836, it was estimated that only 28 per cent of the estimated 36,000 Catholics living in Glasgow attended church regularly, and in the winter months this figure dropped to 18 per cent.

The migrants’ immediate economic challenges, and the humiliation many experienced over having to attend the weekly ‘free service’ or sit in the ‘free area’ in ragged clothing, affected attendance, but the chronic shortage of clergy was also a factor; in 1835 there were only four

---


priests in Glasgow. In spite of this deficit, there existed a personal dimension of faith and this was represented by many private religious traditions, and the almost universal trend of the reception of the sacraments of baptism, marriage (if required) and last rites. Thus, even if many appeared ‘indifferent’ to their bishops’ and priests’ demands for Mass attendance, migrants ‘seldom lost their emotional loyalty’ to Catholicism. The recruitment of Sisters in the 1840s was done to consolidate and reform Catholic culture in Glasgow, primarily through their work with young children, girls and young women, since it was clear that the clergy had been unable to accomplish this on their own.

The anti-Catholic and anti-Irish climate meant that there was determined effort to secure Catholicism, by drawing upon that ‘emotional loyalty’ and linking it to the construction and maintenance of Catholic schools, Catholic Churches, convents and clubs. The amount of money needed to pursue such grand designs was extraordinary and while many historians focus on the poverty of the Catholic Irish migrants, attempts have been made to demonstrate that a significant number were not paupers, or indeed downtrodden. In an article on Irish Catholics and wealth in Glasgow, Bernard Aspinwall exposed the remarkable ability of Glasgow’s Catholics to ‘build institutions, churches, schools and an effective community’. Callum Brown also comments that the Catholic population was not ‘uniformly poor’ but importantly, he acknowledges the financial contributions of those Scottish Catholics of ‘aristocratic pedigree’. In Glasgow, it has been estimated that in 1840, there were only 200-300 non-working-class Catholic families, and although they made regular and generous donations through pew rents, bequests and private donations, the Church in Glasgow struggled with incessant poverty. At mid-century, and indeed for some decades afterwards, the majority of the Irish-born migrants and their descendants occupied the ‘lower echelons’ of the working class, but they possessed an identification with Catholicism, which required cultivation if it was to reach the desired level of respectability.
According to Swift, the Irish in Britain had to develop regular Mass attendance patterns ‘if they were going to remain good Catholics in England [and Scotland]’.\textsuperscript{106}

In Glasgow, the Catholic Church was in an awkward position because it was fighting for the right to exist in a Presbyterian city, but it was also struggling to maintain the ‘community toleration achieved by a policy of quiet living’\textsuperscript{107} which required the sublimation of Irish Catholic culture. As early as 1812, Bishop Scott reported disparities between the Irish and Scots when referring to the seat rents needed to cover chapel debts. He commented that since the ‘fertility of their genius [enabled the Irish to frame] plausible excuses for not doing what is disagreeable to their passions’, it was imperative that they be treated ‘in a different manner from our native Scots people, or they never can be helped on the way to salvation’.\textsuperscript{108} The intra-denominational strife, which existed between the Irish and Scottish clergy and their various supporters, combined with widespread anti-Catholicism, delayed the restoration of Scotland’s Roman Catholic hierarchy until 1878, some 28 years after England.

The fundamental argument of this thesis is that teaching Sisters were recruited to Glasgow to transform the Irish Catholic population and bring them more in line with the Scottish style of quiet and conservative Catholicism. This argument, though Glasgow-focussed, builds upon the precedent set by Mary Peckham Magray, who argues that in Ireland, ‘women religious, through their intimate and influential relationships with ordinary Irish Catholics and especially young female Catholics, successfully fostered an environment for a new style of religious devotion and social behaviour’.\textsuperscript{109} Magray’s suggestion that between 1800 and 1900 Catholic Ireland was in the process of cultural change (the impetus for which came from the upper echelons of Catholic society) which resulted in the ‘victory of one indigenous Catholic culture over another’\textsuperscript{110} is also significant when connected to the Irish migrants in Glasgow. Having been in the midst of transformation in Ireland, upon arrival in Glasgow, they faced the imposition of yet another,

\textsuperscript{106} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{109} Magray, The Transforming Power, p. 11.
\textsuperscript{110} Ibid., p. 74 and 88-89.
though determinedly Scottish and more conservative, set of Catholic values. Like Ireland, as Magray has shown, the teaching Sisters in Glasgow were in a position to mould girls and young women into the respectable guardians of the faith.

Conclusion

The first section of this chapter considered Irish migration to Scotland before and during the Famine. Pre-Famine patterns of permanent and seasonal migration between Ireland and the west of Scotland had helped to establish an Irish presence, but the mass Famine migration resulted in unprecedented population pressure and outright hostility towards the newcomers from both anti-Catholic Protestants and the native Scottish Catholics. The second section focussed specifically on Glasgow during the mid-nineteenth century and examined the destitution and disease many faced upon arrival. Limited religious observance, the overwhelmingly lower-class identity and the intra-denominational tension amidst a growing population threatened Church stability and necessitated the recruitment of women religious to ‘transform’ the culture of the migrants and bring them more in line with respectable and obedient Scottish Catholicism.

The following chapters examine the central role that Roman Catholic Sisters had in shaping Glasgow’s Catholic community, and it is important to understand that the first few generations of Sisters were, by and large, migrants themselves. Their stories are indeed individual and do not fit neatly within the familial, male, or Ulster Irish migrant story. They were single women who came from all over Ireland, north east and south west Scotland, and in the case of the first three Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, they came from France and could not even speak English. Where possible, these Sisters will be shown as individuals, women entitled to their own story, as is every other man, woman, and child, who stepped foot in Scotland.
II. Sisters in the City:
The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, Sisters of Mercy and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur.

Women religious arrived in Glasgow during 1847, almost three hundred years after the Reformation had virtually wiped out Roman Catholicism in Scotland. Recruited to provide a Catholic education system for Glasgow’s girls and young women, the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception and the Sisters of Mercy represented the front line of the Church’s effort to elevate the Catholic population in Glasgow to a level of respectability, whereas the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur consolidated Catholic education for women with the establishment of their Dowanhill Teacher Training College in 1894.

This chapter is divided into five sections and the first two focus on the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, who arrived in Glasgow in 1847, and the Sisters of Mercy, who arrived in 1849. They provide discussions about recruitment and membership, though details relating to the Sisters of Mercy are comparably scant on account of the limited archival/historical material that has been retained by the community. Statistical material, relating to the national and regional origins and profession dates of the Sisters compiled from reception, profession and obituary records, is also highlighted to provide a more detailed picture of who these women were. This section creates a foundation for the argument that the influence of Irish Sisters was tightly controlled. The third and fourth sections serve to integrate the two communities by examining disease, death and non-perseverance trends as well as the conflicts that arose within and between the communities. The tension between the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy, and the resultant conflicts with some of the male clergy during the formative period of foundation and establishment, demonstrates just how pivotal these issues were in undermining congregational stability and inhibiting their immediate progress with education. The final section deals exclusively with the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur and highlights the modernising role they played in Catholic education and the Church’s overall quest for respectability.
The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception

From the home of her sires she has wandered alone,
To the land of the Celt and the Saxon she's gone
The olive branch waves in her white gentle hand
And her accents of peace greet the cold frozen land.

Midst the foe, and the stranger she seeks not renown
She courts not their smiles, and she heeds not their frowns
Could she only impart unto childhood and youth
The science of God, of religion, and truth

See her stand in the midst of the listening young
While they hear the blessed words in a sweet foreign tongue
How they gaze with delight on the form that imparts
Their duties to God, to their innocent hearts.

The black cloud of ignorance now disappears
Where darkly it brooded for numberless years
Blind heresy weakened will also decay
As the light of instruction illumines the way.¹

Although unable to successfully recruit the Sisters of Mercy first, for some unknown reason, Father Peter Forbes, senior priest of the newly-constructed parish of St. Mary’s, Abercromby Street, extended his search for Sisters to the continent. In 1846 he travelled to Tourcoing, France, and visited the Franciscan Convent of Notre Dame des Anges to plead for Sisters to come to Glasgow. Forbes’ visit to the French convent profoundly influenced Adelaide Vaast, a Sister who had longed to work abroad, but up to that point had been unable to obtain permission from her community. It took over a year to secure approval from their French Superiors to go to Glasgow, but on 18 June 1847, Mother M. Adelaide Vaast, Mother M. Veronica Cordier and Miss Constance Marchand arrived.² The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception became the most influential force in Catholic female elementary education in nineteenth-century Glasgow.

In Tourcoing, Forbes had been given no formal commitment that any Sisters would go to

¹FSICA. Box Marked “Beginnings and Early History” ref. # 012.1. A Notre Mère, written by Bishop Smith in 1854, pp. 5-7. The poem is included in a large book with snake skin-like cover and black binding. On the inside cover, it reads: “Franciscan Convent of the Immaculate Conception Glasgow. The Establishment of our Foundation and the Subsequent History of our House”, c. 1880.
²FSICA. Box Marked “Beginnings and Early History” ref. # 012.1. Letter from Mother Veronica Cordier to Mother Mary of the Cross Black, Tourcoing, France, 28 December 1896.
Glasgow and claimed that he was ill-prepared when they sent word, in the late Spring of 1847, that they were in Liverpool and about to depart for Scotland. Initially, Forbes advised them to return to France, as nothing had been arranged for them, but their refusal forced him to organise immediate accommodation which delayed them in Liverpool for an additional two weeks. Although claiming that they were unexpected, it is probable that Forbes had an idea that they were coming, but perhaps had not secured the necessary permission from Bishop John Murdoch (1796-1865). An excerpt from a letter sent from Forbes in France to the languishing and retired Bishop Andrew Scott (1772-1846) suggests the likelihood of this scenario:

I have with me a letter from Dr. Murdoch, but unfortunately, it has no deal in it, & in consequence it has been objected to [by those in France]. Now, as Dr. Murdoch is from[?] home[?], and probably has not his seal with him would you be kind enough to send me a short letter, signed and sealed in the proper form?...It might perhaps be as well to mention that I have your authority to collect & c. for the faith, for chapels, college, convent &c. 4

Thus, it is highly probable that Murdoch, mainly via Bishop Alexander Smith (1813-1861), Coadjutor Bishop of the Western District, become involved after they arrived.5 The Sisters spent their first three months in Glasgow learning English at Mrs. MacDonald's Boarding School for Young Ladies, at 25 Monteith Row.6 The school's advert in the CDS displayed basic information about tuition and classes, which included English grammar, geography, arithmetic and needlework, but also emphasised that the Catholicism of the children would be dutifully promoted.7 When their English had reached a competent level, a small house was rented for them, presumably by Murdoch for £50, at 11 Monteith Row.

---

3John Murdoch was born in Banffshire, ordained 19 March 1821. He spent his entire priestly life in Glasgow. Conflict erupted between himself and some of the Irish migrants and for more, see Chapter 4 in Martin J. Mitchell's, The Irish in the West of Scotland 1797-1848: Trade Unions, Strikes, and Political Movements. (Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers Ltd., 1998), pp. 114-143.
CDS, 1850, p. 123. Appendix 2:1, Figure 1, displays an advert for the boarding school.
The finances of many congregations are either not well-documented or not generally made accessible to researchers, often because financial records were deemed unimportant and of little archival interest or seen to be ‘strictly confidential’. Financial details for the Franciscan Sisters is therefore scant, but some material is available and relates to their patrons and benefactors, and perhaps the most important among them was Constance Marchand. She had been a lady boarder in their convent in France and had accompanied Vaast and Cordier to Scotland to ‘defray the expenses of...a formidable journey’. Aside from Marchand, the identity of religious and non-religious patrons has been difficult to establish, but one source that has proven fruitful is the community’s *Obituary Book*. Bishop Smith, a tremendous support to the community whose ‘purse was even open to their wants’, and Bishop John Gray (1817-1872), a close friend of Smith and fellow Banffshire native, who became the community’s advisor when Smith died in 1861, were both given entries in the *Obituary Book*; Gray bequeathed his library and possessions to the community.

Non-religious patrons were also given entries in the *Obituary Book* and Miss Eliza Russel, a woman originally from Co. Kerry, Ireland, was identified as a ‘Special Benefactor’. A parlour boarder who wished to become a Sister, but whose delicate health did not permit it, had left ‘a considerable portion of her fortune to the community’ upon her death. Miss Mary Gatherer and her sister, Sr. M. Margaret (Margaret), who was professed on 15 August 1852, had come from either Banffshire or Perthshire as the community’s first parlour boarders and had helped, ‘with their ample means, the many necessities which the then struggling community had to endure’. Another supporter was Mr. Michael Jeffrey, who did much to support the community when it arrived in Glasgow, and while he likely offered financial assistance, details have not been found. He did, however, handle the purchase of the Charlotte Street property for the community in 1851, but whether or not he made any financial contribution to the deal is not known. In the *Obituary Book* he was affectionately described as a ‘protector’ who, during the early years of their teaching

---

9 *Scottish Catholic Monthly*, May 1894.
11 Ibid.
12 Ibid.
13 Ibid.
in the poor schools, followed the Sisters, ‘unobserved’, on their route to protect them from ‘much that was disagreeable in the streets’.\textsuperscript{14}

In common with most congregations, patronage was coupled with the diligence of the Sisters themselves in creating employment opportunities,\textsuperscript{15} and Vaast, unused to working outside of a convent, but conscious of the need to generate income and commence their educational mission, opened a small school in their private residence while Cordier, the younger of the two, took charge of the Abercromby Street orphanage. The orphanage was founded after the 1832 cholera epidemic to ‘provide for the maintenance, education, and religious instruction of destitute orphan children, left by the members of the Catholic Congregations of Glasgow’.\textsuperscript{16} It opened in January 1833 at Marshall’s Lane, Gallowgate, but was moved next to St. Mary’s Parish Church on Abercromby Street in 1848. The cholera and typhus outbreaks that had struck Glasgow between 1847 and 1849 had claimed more than 4,000 victims and left countless children orphaned; by 1849 the facility housed over 150 children.\textsuperscript{17}

The death of Adelaide Vaast in February 1849, a pivotal event that will be examined in greater detail below, threatened the small community’s survival until 1850 when the first three postulants were admitted. In the months following Vaast’s death, Bishop Smith embarked upon a recruitment drive in Ireland and successfully persuaded Sr. M. Hyacintha (Julia) Condon and Sr. M. Joseph (Joanna) Fitzgerald, both from Co. Cork, to come to Scotland.\textsuperscript{18} They, along with Sr. M. Francis (Constance) Marchand, were accepted into the community on 8 April 1850 and became the first three postulants to be received in Scotland since the Reformation.\textsuperscript{19} Information on who the Franciscan Sisters were can be gleaned from the community’s Profession and Reception Volumes which include useful, though analogous detail about the origins of Sisters between 1850 and 1913. As Figure 1 indicates, the 194 Sisters came from a variety of countries,

\textsuperscript{14}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{15}Walsh identified the ability of Sisters to earn money, dowries and benefactors/alm as the three main sources of income for congregations in England and Wales. Roman Catholic Nuns, p. 92.
\textsuperscript{16}FSICA. Box marked Early History, ref. # 012.2. “Third Order Regular of St. Francis in Scotland” in Scottish Catholic Monthly, May, 1894. CDS; 1849, pp. 110-111.
\textsuperscript{17}The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception: Celebrating 150 Years in Glasgow, 1847-1997. (Glasgow: The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, 1997), p. 16.
\textsuperscript{18}FSICA. Box marked “Historical Accounts” ref. # 013. The Franciscan Nuns in Scotland, 1847-1930, p. 6.
\textsuperscript{19}FSICA. List of Irish-born Religious in Scotland 1829-1999 and the Obituary Book.
but the majority, 104, were of Scottish-birth, 70 were of Irish-birth and 10 were of English-birth.

![Figure 1: Birthplaces (by country) of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, 1850-1913.](image_url)

Source: FSICA. Obituary List and Sister Professions & Receptions, Volumes I & II. Kept with the Superior.

It is not too surprising that the majority of Sisters came from Scotland, but the representation of Sisters from countries far afield reveals that, like congregations elsewhere, those in Scotland had an international dimension. Unfortunately, due to the lack of evidence, the circumstances under which these non-Scottish-born Sisters came to Glasgow and joined the community are not known. The scarcity of material was a significant limitation, but it was more marked in the case of the Sisters of Mercy. In terms of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, little personal detail about individual Sisters survives in the community’s archive, and in fact the only sources of any information come from the often synonymous entries in the Reception and Profession Volumes and Obituary List. Nevertheless, despite this paucity of additional biographical and autobiographical material, important detail has been harvested from what is available. The regional origins of the entrants is important for determining the extent to which the values of Scottish Catholicism were maintained, and indeed cultivated, within the communities. This issue, however, was more pressing with the Sisters of Mercy, an Irish congregation, than with the
Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, a congregation with French roots.

Figure 2: Scottish Birthplaces (by county and city) of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, 1850-1913.

![Pie chart](image)

**Source:** FSICA. *Obituary List and Sister Professions & Receptions.*

Figure 2 displays the regional breakdown of the Scottish-born Sisters and shows that the majority came from Glasgow, though it also reveals that a significant number came from Aberdeenshire and Banffshire. It is likely that many of the Glasgow-born Sisters were of Irish descent since an appraisal of the surnames is an important indicator, but making a concrete statement about this has not been possible because the parents' place of birth was not recorded. Overall, there were 11 Scottish-born sibling sets (23 women) which represented 22 per cent of the total number of Scottish-born Sisters. The first three Scottish sibling sets were all from the north east, a traditional Scottish Catholic stronghold: Sr. M. Agnes (Margaret) and Sr. M. Jane (Christina) Begg joined from Banffshire in 1854; Sr. M. Magdalen (Mary) and Sr. M. Bernadine (unknown) Bennett also joined from Banffshire in 1855 and 1856; Sr. M. Augustine (Margaret) and Sr. M. Auselen (Charlotte) Lamont entered from Aberdeenshire in 1862 and 1868. The Farnans, another

---

[20]FSICA. *Obituary List and Sister Professions & Receptions.*
sibling set, hailed from another regional bastion of Scottish Catholicism, Newton-Stewart in the south west: Sr. M. Benedicta (Hannah) joined in 1874 while her sisters, Sr. M. Angelina (Margaret) and Sr. M. Benedicta (Catherine) entered together in 1877.\textsuperscript{21}

Figure 3 displays the regional breakdown of the Irish-born Sisters and reveals that the Irish-born Sisters came from all across Ireland, but those from Cos. Dublin and Cork accounted for more than double the number of Sisters from elsewhere.\textsuperscript{22}

**Figure 3: Irish Birthplaces (by county) of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, 1850-1913.**

![Pie chart showing Irish birthplaces by county.](source)

The previous chapter established that traditionally, Irish migration to Scotland was strongest from Ulster and Figure 3 indicates that a significant number of Sisters came from there, but the majority of the Irish-born Franciscan Sisters had come from elsewhere in Ireland mainly because Roman

\textsuperscript{21}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{22}Since these women joined after migration, they were either single migrants or the daughters of a migrant family.
Catholicism was most prominent in all areas outside of the northern province. Munster was actually the most-common ‘home’ province with 22 Sisters, Leinster had 20 Sisters, Ulster had 18 and Connaught had 10; the comparatively low number of Sisters from Connaught is indicative of its impoverished state.

What is also interesting is that there were 10 sibling sets (21 women) which constituted 30 per cent of all Irish-born entrants. In one case, all five children from the Kerrigan family joined the religious life and three went to the Franciscan Sisters. Sr. M. Patricia (Anne), Sr. M. Seraphine (Elizabeth) and Sr. M. Perpetua (Marcella) from Co. Dublin were professed between 1869 and 1881 and became teachers for the Franciscan community; their two other sisters joined unknown communities elsewhere. Another influential sibling set were the McSwinneys: Sr. M. Angela (Hannah) and Sr. M. Catherine (Mary) from Co. Cork were professed together on 16 July 1851 and Sr. M. Angela went on to be Superior between 1857 and 1870. When the Irish-born sibling sets are compared to the Scottish-born ones, it is clear that the Irish sibling sets were more prominent and this is indicative of the broader trend among the Irish-born and descended Sisters in Glasgow and Toronto, which will be highlighted in some detail in the fifth chapter.

The Sisters of Mercy

The Sisters of Mercy were the second religious congregation to arrive in Glasgow after the Reformation, and like the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, their mission was to develop elementary education. Catherine McAuley (1787-1841) had founded the Sisters of Mercy in 1831 at Baggot Street in Dublin and had instilled a strong educational ethos in the congregation. This ethos was central to the work of the Sisters in Glasgow and underpinned their efforts to save the Catholic youth of the city. On 25 August 1849, five Sisters of Mercy arrived at Port Glasgow from Limerick, Ireland, and proceeded by train to Glasgow. Rev. Father Cody, a Co. Tipperary-born priest working in Dumbarton, had accompanied Mother M. Elizabeth Moore,24 the Limerick Superior, Sr. M. Clare (Mary) McNamara, Sr. M Catherine (Anne)

---

2FSICA. List of Irish-born, Obituary List and Sister Professions & Receptions.
24Elizabeth (Anne) Moore initially joined the Stanhope Street Sisters of Charity, but switched to the Sisters of Mercy on 8 October 1832 and was professed on 8 October 1834. Mary C. Sullivan, Catherine McAuley and the Tradition of Mercy. (Blackrock, Co. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1995), pp. 247-248.
McNamara, Sr. M. Joseph (Margaret) Butler and Sr. M. Clare (Helen) Kerrin from Limerick; though Moore and Sr. Clare McNamara only intended to stay with the new foundation until it found its feet. Elizabeth Moore had been appointed Superior of the Limerick convent by Catherine McAuley, who had made the necessary contacts with the local priests and facilitated the convent’s establishment. McAuley’s apprehension about leaving the Limerick community under her direction stemmed from Moore’s inexperience as a Superior and from her lack of confidence in dealings with priests. One of McAuley’s letters to Sr. M. Francis Ward in Carlow highlights Moore’s early shortfalls:

...I cannot go for a full month. No person of less experience could manage at present...As to Sister Elizabeth...we never sent forward such a faint-hearted soldier, now that she is in the field. She will do all interior and exterior work but to meet on business, confer with the Bishop, conclude with a sister, you might as well send a child that opens the door.  

During their time in Limerick, McAuley taught Moore to ‘respect local needs and preferences’, which suggests a possible weakness and might help to explain why there was so much tension when the Irish congregation first arrived in Glasgow. Nevertheless, Moore’s confidence developed with McAuley’s constant ‘encouragement’ and with the experience she acquired over time and was exhibited in the 12 new houses she and the Mercy congregation founded in the two decades after McAuley’s death. Two of these convents were in Scotland, Glasgow in 1849 and Edinburgh in 1858.

Evidence relating to the recruitment of the Sisters of Mercy to Glasgow is limited but what does exist suggests that negotiations to bring them to Glasgow took place between Moore and Father Peter Forbes. It is likely that Bishop Murdoch was also involved, but efforts to locate copies of correspondence or other evidence in Scotland from either Forbes or Murdoch to Irish clergymen

---

25MICA. Record Group 100-3.2. Xeroxed copies of Letters, set 2 of 2. Letter from Catherine McAuley to Sister Mary Francis Ward, St. Leo Convent, Carlow.  
26Sullivan, Catherine McAuley, p. 248.  
27Ibid., p. 249. McAuley offered Moore advice in the form of a poem which was meant to remind her to be patient, affectionate and encouraging. MICA. Record Group 100-3.2. Letter from Catherine McAuley to Elizabeth Moore, 9 December 1838.  
28Sullivan, Catherine McAuley, p. 251.
regarding the recruitment of the Irish congregation have been unsuccessful.29 The shortage of material relating to the Sisters of Mercy has dogged aspects of this thesis, but their centrality to Catholic education necessitates their inclusion. Although limited in comparison to the other congregations included in this thesis, enough material has been collected from a range of archives to support the conclusions presented about them and their work. However, one particular black hole relates to their financial situation and although it is clear where they first settled upon arrival, other details have proven elusive. When they arrived in Glasgow, the first took up residence in a house on Charlotte Street before moving to the space above the Abercromby Street Orphanage in 1849.30 This move caused tremendous tension between the Sisters of Mercy, Cordier, the lone Franciscan Sister, Forbes and Bishop Smith, but more detail will be provided below. Aspinwall has written that some of the female orders came to Glasgow with ‘sizeable lay support’, and it is likely that the Sisters of Mercy were given initial assistance.31 The identity of patrons and benefactors is not known and therefore a discussion here, similar to that provided for the Franciscan Sisters is impossible, but it is obvious that this community faced a continued struggle for financial survival.

Like the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, some background information on individual Sisters of Mercy exists and useful detail comes from a list compiled by the community of those who entered in Glasgow. Unfortunately, access to the reception, profession and obituary records was not permitted but the same basic information was included in the complied list and while it does not provide enough material to create biographical sketches, it does include the original and religious name, place of birth, date of birth and death, profession year and occasionally a cause of death. When collated into tables and charts, these details yield some interesting statistical data and as Figure 4 shows, 42 Sisters joined the Mercy community between 1849 and 1907, but unlike the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, a much larger community, they did not have the same international representation; their national origins were less varied.

29Anson wrote that Murdoch ‘arranged for some Sisters of Mercy at Limerick to come to Glasgow’ but he did not indicate his source. Underground Catholicism, p. 276.
30MICA. Statement of the Convent of Mercy.
31Bernard Aspinwall, “Catholic Devotion in Victorian Scotland”. Manuscript of paper delivered in May 2003 at the University of Aberdeen.
Figure 4: Birthplaces (by country) of the Sisters of Mercy, 1849-1907.

Source: SMCA, Glasgow. Names of Sisters who entered in Glasgow. Held in green plastic binder marked "Brief History of Glasgow Foundation" and "Hand-written Account of Foundation".

Figure 5: Scottish Birthplaces (by county and city) of the Sisters of Mercy, 1849-1907.

Source: SMCA, Glasgow. Names of Sisters who entered in Glasgow.

There were 23 Scottish-born Sisters and Figure 5 reveals that the majority came from
Kirkcudbrightshire and Glasgow.\textsuperscript{32} The high number from Kirkcudbrightshire, an old Scottish Catholic stronghold in the south west, is attributed to a couple of significant sibling sets; the Riggs and the Cavens, accounted for seven Sisters which represented 17 per cent of the Mercy community between 1849 and 1907.\textsuperscript{33} Sr. M. Magdelen (Margaret) Caven and Sr. M. Agatha (Mary) Caven and joined the community five years apart in 1853 and 1858. Their cousins, the Riggs, were Sr. M. Evangelista (Margaret), Sr. M. Aloysius (Teresa Mary), Sr. M. Vincent (Louisa), and Sr. M. Joseph (unknown) and they all joined within a year of each other, but Louisa and Teresa Mary entered together on 24 September 1853. These Rigg sisters and Caven sisters also had another cousin, Sr. M. Catherine (Ann) Rigg, who joined the Mercy community in 1857.

\textbf{Figure 6: Irish Birthplaces (by county) of the Sisters of Mercy, 1849-1907.}

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{birthplaces.png}
\caption{Regional breakdown for the Sisters of Irish-birth and reveals that the majority came from Cos. Dublin and Cork. Unlike the Franciscan Sisters, there were no Irish-born sibling sets in Mercy community. In contrast to the Franciscan Sisters, who received a high proportion of Irish-born women between 1851 and 1913, the same cannot be said for the Sisters of Mercy since only 9 of 42 Sisters professed between 1849 and 1907 were Irish-born, and this is perhaps}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{32}SMCA, Glasgow. \textit{Names of Sisters who entered in Glasgow.} Held in green plastic binder marked “Brief History of Glasgow Foundation” and “Hand-written Account of Foundation” \textit{Names of Sisters.}

\textsuperscript{33}There were no professions between 1907-1913.
indicative of the clerical desire to limit Irish influence. In Ireland there was a sharp increase in the number of Sisters during the nineteenth-century, from one for every 32,000 people in 1800 to one for every four hundred people by 1900. Societal changes, the desire to go abroad and the chance for a more elevated social position influenced the decision to enter a convent and reinforce Margaret MacCurtain’s point that the histories of women religious are about much more than simply religion or gender. Many entered because of the economic and social conditions in Ireland, but this was also the case in Scotland.

**Disease, Death and Non-Perseverance**

Endemic typhus, consumption and recurring cholera epidemics undermined congregational stability by claiming foundresses and future leaders, and by causing desertions. Both the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy were primarily focussed on education, but the nature of their vocation, and the fact that they were the only congregations in the entire city at mid-century, necessitated their plunge into nursing work during disease and illness peaks. Their identity, as women religious uniquely connected with God, gave them extraordinary access to the lives and homes of the poor, those whom the medical professionals were least able to reach. Their contact with this demographic was especially important during illness and death when the family and friends of the victims required the experience of respectful, Christian death rituals including the blessings and prayers of religious.

The *Obituary List* for the Franciscan Sisters reveals that of the 85 women who entered between 1849 and 1866, when cholera and typhus were particularly active, 16 Sisters (19 per cent) died, though it is likely that the number was higher because 10 Sisters did not have their date of death recorded. The majority were young women, aged between 18 and 29, and consumption was the

---

36 Suellen Hoy, “The Journey Out: The Recruitment and Emigration of Irish Religious Women to the United States 1812-1914” in *Journal of Women's History*. Vol. 6 No. 4 (Winter/Spring, 1995), p. 70. Her statistics are even more extraordinary when divided according to sex - roughly 1 nun to every 200 women. The Sisters of Mercy are the primary subjects, but other congregations are mentioned.


36FSICA. Box Marked “Beginnings and Early History” ref. # 012.1. Letter from Mother Veronica Cordier to Mother Mary of the Cross Black, Tourcoing, France, 28 December 1896.
most common cause. Tragedy struck almost immediately when Veronica Cordier contracted typhus in 1847, a consequence of her work with the sick poor, and mild cholera in 1848. More devastating was the loss of Vaast, who died of cholera on 17 February 1849, which almost destroyed the foundation by leaving just one professed Sister. The Mercy community faced similar instability because between 1849 and 1877, 21 Sisters died. The 1850s were particularly delicate years for the Mercy community and a number of novices and postulants were forced to return home on account of sickness. Numbers leaving for recuperative reasons were not extraordinarily high, but when compared to the total number of Sisters in the community, the results are significant indeed and in the space of ten years, between 1849 and 1859, five out of twenty-five novices were forced to leave due to bad health. Two other novices had left on account of illness, but eventually returned: Sr. M. Aloysius Rigg left on 30 July 1851 and re-entered on 8 September 1852 and Sr. M. Berchmans (Catherine) Conway left on 28 August 1863 and re-entered on 4 April 1864.

The Rule and Constitutions of most congregations required them to act compassionately to those in need. Aside from outlining their devotion to the education of young girls, the Rule and Constitutions of the Franciscan Sisters stated that ‘Besides the education of youth, the sisters will cheerfully undertake any work of charity in accordance with the spirit of their Rule and approved of by their Superiors’. The Rule that Vaast and Cordier had lived by in France was virtually the same as the one acquired in Scotland, and the 1852 Scottish version confirmed that their work must sometimes extend beyond teaching to include working with the sick, ‘to prepare them for

---

37FSICA. Obituary List.
38SMCA, Glasgow. History of the Sisters of Mercy, Glasgow. Re-written 12 December 1881 for the Jubilee of the Mercy Congregation. Small A5 sized hard-covered, light green book with intricately-designed gold trim, pp. 48-49. Three of these deaths were before profession.
39SMCA, Glasgow. List drawn up on December 12th 1881 of those who entered this community but did not persevere, 1849-1881. Green plastic binder with ‘Brief History of Glasgow Foundation’ and Hand-Written Account of Foundation’ on the cover.
41FSICA. Box Marked “Copies of Early Constitutions” ref. # 031.30. Large brown book with brown leather binding and corners. Rule of the Community of the Immaculate Conception of the Third Order of St. Francis Glasgow, 1885, p. 7.
42FSICA. Box Marked “Copies of Early Constitutions” ref. # 031.30. Brown paper-covered book marked Constitutions 1852 and Manuscript copy of the Constitutions, p. 52. A manuscript copy from 1852 explained that only ‘a few trifling additions and modifications to adapt it to the circumstances of this place’ were made.
the Holy Sacraments and for death, to console them in their afflictions...and to render them such necessary temporal relief and comfort on their sick bed, as circumstances will permit' wherever they might be. The Mercy Sisters had acquired reputations as good nurses due to their efforts to contain and treat the epidemics and sickness in Ireland, and while they too were predominantly engaged with education in Glasgow by 'instructing and saving...the souls of the children'; their Rule and Constitutions emphasised the necessity of visitations, stating that 'a most serious application of the instruction of poor girls, visitation of the sick, and protection of distressed women of good character' were the particular objects of the institute.

Religious life in the nineteenth century involved personal risk, including disease and even death among Sisters. Regular visitations to the sick and poor, plus the austere conditions of convent life, were not conducive to good health. In his memoirs, Rev. Michael Condon (1817-1902), who worked in Glasgow, Hamilton and Greenock, wrote of the burdens imposed upon priests who visited the sick in the 'church and barracks...the poorhouse, infirmary or jail; but more frequently in the court, close, stairfoot, and not rarely under the shelter of wall, tree or umbrella'. In 1847, Bishop Murdoch's health broke down during the typhus outbreak because of the amount of visitations he had been doing; an often excluded dimension of pastoral care is the visitations undertaken by Sisters who also suffered their share of casualties. While the nursing work of Sisters tended to revolve around private visitations, they also involved public places like hospitals and asylums. Visitations were an essential part of the reforming strategy because, as Mary Peckham Magray rightly asserts, they provided the opportunity to impart a 'new religious orthodoxy' that was integral to the transformation process. However, Sisters occasionally shirked

---

43Ibid., 2nd Rule, 3rd Constitution. The Rule and Constitutions for the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception in Glasgow were formally established in 1853, but printed 1855.
46GAA. W5/3 Condon Memoirs, p. 442. (Unsorted material). A 'close' is an entry to a tenement.
48John F. McCaffrey, "Roman Catholics in Scotland in the 19th and 20th Centuries" in *Records of the Scottish Church History Society*. Vol. 21 (1983), p. 286. His assessment is problematic because the work of Sisters was left out, despite his title implying a wider scope. After all, Sisters were recruited to deal with what the priests could not.
from these duties and so had to be reminded to ‘Generously overcome the repugnance you may
feel while going through the public streets, or into the hospitals [because] the sight of the poor
should fill you with tender compassion, they have a strong claim to it’. The illness and death
among adult women often entailed the dual responsibility of nursing and orphan care and between
1847 and 1849, as was previously explained, typhus and cholera claimed almost 4,000 victims and
left countless children orphaned.

Depending on the diligence of the record-keeping, a convent’s obituary book is a useful resource
for determining the death statistics of a given community and entries can vary from lengthy
tributes to uniform precis, and not all indicate a cause of death. As the available evidence
indicates both the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy experienced a number of typhus,
consumption and cholera deaths, and while neither community was in a prosperous economic
position, the Sisters of Mercy seemed to be particularly financially unstable. That there were only
42 professions between 1849 and 1907 suggests the likelihood of poverty because fewer entrants
meant fewer dowries. Disease was only part of the reason why the Sisters of Mercy were a
much smaller community. The explosive conflicts between the Superior and the male clergy also
had a tremendous impact, though this point will be expanded in the following section.

Of the 194 women who joined the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception between 1851
and 1910, 23 did not persevere (12 Irish, 8 Scottish, 2 French, 1 English) and explanations ranged
from women having no vocation or being declared unfit for the religious life by the Council to
being in poor health or transferring to another congregation. The predominant factor, which
affected 13 women, was being declared unfit for the religious life, but what is particularly
interesting is that the majority were Irish and six were released between 1851 and 1855; only one
Scottish-born woman was declared unfit during this time. More explicit explanations were not
recorded in the Profession and Reception Volumes, but these statistics, coupled with anecdotal

49 SMCA, Glasgow. Anonymous, “Spiritual Counsels written by hand”. Black, soft-covered (torn and
withered) book, no date but c. mid nineteenth-century, section on ‘Visiting the Sick’.
50The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, Celebrating 150 Years in Glasgow 1847-
51 SMCA, Glasgow. Names of Sisters and “Hand-written Account of Foundation” and FSICA. Sister
Professions & Receptions.
52 FSICA. Sister Professions & Receptions.
evidence, strongly suggest a determined effort during the community’s formative period to limit Irish influence. In 1857, after Cordier left the community, Sr. M. Angela McSwinney, a native of Co. Cork, was elected Superior and during her leadership, which lasted until 1870, no Irish-born women were rejected.\textsuperscript{53} That her election was sanctioned by Smith is indicative of the need for stability in difficult times and not of his acceptance of her Irishness, which remained a problem for him, as will be highlighted in the fourth chapter.

Figure 7 shows that the number of Sisters professed between 1851 and 1871 was fairly steady despite some struggles, and the only years without professions were 1855 and 1865. Importantly, by 1855 the community had experienced five years of solid and consistent leadership which provided insulation for the tumultuous times to come. The successful establishment of a community fundamentally rested on the shoulders of a competent Superior. The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception had this in Veronica Cordier, who had remained as Superior long enough to mould the community and instil competency and religious experience in her successors. Conversely, the Sisters of Mercy lacked the solid and consistent leadership necessary in the beginning, and their low profession numbers is a telling result.

\textbf{Figure 7: Annual Professions, Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, 1851-1871.}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{Figure7.png}
\caption{Annual Professions, Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, 1851-1871.}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{53}Ibid.
Non-perseverence among the Sisters of Mercy was staggering in the beginning and worthy of inquiry; the non-perseverance list reveals that between 1849 and 1867, 38 women left the community. The reasons are not immediately apparent but many of the departures correspond with significant illness peaks and leadership vacuums. It is important to highlight that four women between 1849 and 1854, rather than leaving the religious life, simply transferred to a Mercy community in either Limerick or Liverpool. However, 1850, 1851 and 1854 were the peak non-perseverance years, witnessing the desertion of 16 women; the Annals have described 1850 and 1854 as particularly challenging years in terms of sickness. In 1850 there were seven desertions, and one young Dublin-born postulant, Miss M. Star, contracted typhus shortly after she arrived and was forced to return home to recuperate. She did not re-enter the Glasgow foundation. In 1851, a year marked by illness and serious conflict between the Superior and clergy, six young women did not persevere, and in 1854, another four deserted. Conflict between the Superior and host priest flared up once again, but cholera also struck and claimed the life of Sr. M. Ignatius (Elizabeth) Gordon, a Banffshire native, on 10 April 1854. The previous chapter highlighted the public's ubiquitous fear of cholera and so her death probably instigated the departure of some of these women. The fear of sickness and death certainly impacted on desertion rates and it is likely that many were unaware of the reality of religious life. An anonymous Sister complained of how the fear of contracting disease caused some, probably the younger Sisters, to feign illness on occasion:

You would imagine from the excessive care they take to preserve life that in entering religion their sole object was to avoid dying. Remember my dear Sisters that you came here to die for Jesus Christ, and not to live at your ease. The devil will try to persuade you how much care should be taken of the health for the exact performance of the Rule, that many die without having kept it for a week, or even for a single day entirely.55

A Table of Population and Number of Deaths for Each Year from 1783 to 1883 shows that fever was particularly active in 1846-48, 1864-65 and 1869.56 The number of deaths in the Mercy

54 SMCA, Glasgow. History of the Sisters of Mercy, p. 5.
community during the early-to-mid 1860s prompted the annalist to label these years 'trials of sickness and death' since between February 1862 and January 1867 no fewer than six Sisters died. Two of these deaths have definitely been attributed to typhus, one was most likely typhus, another was either typhus or consumption and two were consumption: Sr. M. Vincent Rigg, aged 28, died 2 February 1862, of consumption; Sr. M. Evangelista Rigg, aged 31, died in 1862 from either typhus or consumption; Sr. M. Charlotte (Charlotte) Howie, a postulant aged 26, died 7 February 1863 of typhus; Sr. M. Walburga (Mary) McDonald, age 23, died 3 January 1864 most likely from typhus; Sr. M. Vincent Aloysius (Louisa) Forster, a novice, died 15 June 1866 of typhus. Sr. M. Aloysius Rigg had survived typhus in 1862 only to die of consumption on 2 January 1867 at the age of 42.

The hardship that was central to the female religious experience on account of their vows of poverty, chastity and obedience had obviously proved too much for some, as indicated by the anonymous brother of one of the Mercy Sisters, who wrote of Sr. M. Vincent Aloysius Forster, a young woman who died 27 days after profession: 'Poor thing, she had not a long religious life but one that has cost her much and consequently, I suppose, fitted her the sooner for Heaven'. Illness and death did not act alone in undermining community stability. Conflicts within and between the convents as well as the tension between the communities and male clerics seriously impeded growth and the purpose of the following section is to consider the importance of conflict as part of mission life.

Community Conflict

Conflict, be it internal or external, was a part of religious life and the disruptions caused by personality clashes within a convent, competition between congregations and the struggles with male clerics shaped mission experience. The early histories of both communities were marred by

---

58 Sr. M. Evangelista Rigg (month of death not recorded) most likely died of either typhus or consumption since both were active in the community that year date and one of her sisters, Sr. M. Vincent, died of consumption, while the other, Sr. M. Aloysius, contracted typhus during that year.
conflict, but the Sisters of Mercy had been unable to recover from these tribulations by the turn of the twentieth century. Conflict had fused the two communities in 1849 when Adelaide Vaast died and the Sisters of Mercy arrived. In a candid statement, Smith recounted the tumultuous relationship between himself, Cordier, Forbes and the Sisters of Mercy and was highly critical of both Forbes and the Mercy Sisters, whose actions ‘savoured much more of the world than of Heaven’. Smith testified that after Vaast’s death, he had encouraged Cordier to return to France or join another congregation, but that Forbes had actually initiated arrangements for her transfer to the Mercy Sisters without her knowledge or consent, ‘taking it for granted that she would not object to change her order nor the Sisters of Mercy to receive her’, this proposal was rejected by both Moore and Cordier. Alone and alienated from the clergy who recruited her, Smith agreed to take responsibility for Cordier and fundamentally secured the survival of the tiny community.

The stability provided by Smith could not, however, prevent the conflict that erupted between Cordier and the Sisters of Mercy since trepidation existed over the fact that they were working in the same parish and competing for limited resources. The orphanage, for example, was one source of tension because when the Sisters of Mercy arrived, Cordier, who had been working in the facility, was removed upon the request of the Mercy Superior. Obviously displeased, Smith wrote the following account:

...As soon as the Sisters of Mercy arrived, she was turned out and permitted to live in a house which she had rented in Bellgrove Street. She was teaching the orphans when the Sisters went to visit...but was not even noticed by them. In the course of a few days, finding the house destined for them too inconvenient and anxious to obtain the orphan asylum for a convent, Sister Moore petitioned and obtained from the Bishop leave to transplant the sisters thither and settled the community there.

Smith’s account has been corroborated by the personal notes of Cordier, who appears to have felt very much in a state of limbo:

At first, I continued to take fee paying pupils but when they took them from us, I took up the classes at the orphanage again. I lived at a good distance from the orphanage and they wished me to be nearer. But where could I go?...they wished me to go and live in
a block of buildings consisting of working men's houses. I did not accept...I did not despise the poor locality but being in a Protestant country, I wished to uphold the dignity of my vocation...I continued to go to my classes at the orphanage and the Sisters of Mercy began on their part to do their work...But a short time after, they took a dislike to the house. They asked and obtained the orphanage to make a convent of it. I was then obliged to withdraw...

The circumstances under which the Sisters of Mercy came to Glasgow were troubled. Forbes had been the leading figure behind their recruitment, and according to Bishop Smith, because the terms under which they were meant to come to Glasgow had not been properly considered or understood by either Forbes or the Mercy Superior since both were headstrong and had made diligent efforts to retain control over the negotiations. During the complicated negotiation process, Moore had forwarded her terms to the Glasgow clergy requesting signatures acknowledging their acceptance and stating that 'unless her conditions were complied with, the nuns would be withheld'. Bishop Murdoch signed the required papers, but Smith did not because he was frustrated by the way the situation had proceeded and this 'surprised, but did not dishearten' Moore. From this point forward Smith believed himself to be labelled an 'enemy of the Convent of Mercy'.

Problems often arose when new women entered communities and while the addition of new Sisters was necessary to maintain congregational growth, new blood often sparked conflict and this was precisely what occurred when Sr. M. Aloysius (Barbie) McIntosh entered the Franciscan Sisters on 9 July 1850. Born in Jamaica in 1830, McIntosh and her sister, Sr. M. Magdalena (Mary), had come to Scotland in 1837 and became the wards of Bishop Smith upon the death of their parents. They were professed on 16 July 1851 and 3 May 1852 respectively, but on 17 February 1853, Magdalena died at the age of 19, most likely of consumption. Her sister, Sr. M. Aloysius, made a more lasting and controversial impression which eventually led to the departure

63FSICA. Box marked Mother Adelaide and Mother Veronica, ref. # 011. Copy of manuscript sent from Tourcoing in 1930, pp. 55-57. Medium-sized red note book, Mother Adelaide and Mother Veronica 1936.
64MICA. Statement of the Convent of Mercy.
65Ibid.
of four professed Sisters, including the Foundress, in 1857. No doubt the relationship between
the community and Bishop Smith was initially strengthened when the McIntosh sisters joined the
community, but the end result was disruption and division.

The first problem developed because the Glasgow community had been using the Rule and
Constitutions brought over from France, but a new set that was tailored to complement
Glasgow's circumstances as well as the needs of a new congregation was desired. In 1851 a
disagreement arose during the revision process between McIntosh and Cordier over the issue of
lay Sisters and although it is not clear what it was, McIntosh took her concerns to Smith who
then decided to minimise Cordier's role in the process. Cordier responded with a long letter to
Smith explaining her side of the story, but it was clear that 'too much friction existed between the
two' for it to have had a positive impact. A second disagreement between Cordier, McIntosh
and Smith erupted on 23 July 1854 when the first General Chapter of the community was held.
The 20 professed Sisters present elected the community's first Council with Cordier as Prioress,
Aloysius as Sub-Prioress and Smith as the Chapter's president. For the position of Mistress of
the Novices, an office of great significance in terms of vocation formation, Cordier wished Sr. M.
Angela McSwinney, but Smith opposed her choice of the Irish Sister in favour of McIntosh;
although subject to the approval of the Bishop, this decision was normally left to the discretion
of the Superior and Smith's veto instigated a serious divide within the community. Sometime
later Cordier questioned McIntosh's ability as Mistress of the Novices and made 'some
observations about sundry acts of negligence' (it is not stated what they were) to the Novices.
McIntosh viewed it as a personal attack and complained to Smith, who then wrote to Cordier
requesting that she formally apologise to the Novices. This was an unprecedented request and
one that was completely humiliating for a Superior as well as for the other Sisters who were
'averse to the idea of their Superior kneeling down to apologise to the Novices'. In the end,
Cordier resigned as Superior in 1857 and wrote: 'My responsibility was too great and my

67For more on lay Sisters, see "Lay Sisters" in Maria Luddy's Women in Ireland: A Documentary
68FSICA. Copy of manuscript, p. 81.
69Ibid., pp. 85 and 87.
70FSICA. Cochrane, Unpublished Manuscript, p. 42.
conscience too hampered, to be Superior under these conditions'; McIntosh resigned as Sub-Prioress, but remained Mistress of the Novices.\textsuperscript{71}

In 1857, a petition came from a Jesuit priest in Jamaica asking for Sisters 'to help them in that distraught and arduous field of labour for the souls'\textsuperscript{72} and Cordier received permission from the Council to leave Glasgow and work abroad in Jamaica; three other Sisters, Sr. M. Paula (Laureute) Charlet, a former pupil of Tourcoing, Sr. M. de Sales (Catherine) O'Neill, originally from Inverary, Argyllshire, and Sr. M. Philomena (Julie Victoire) Dalle, originally from Lille, France, all in their early twenties, volunteered to go with her in October 1857.\textsuperscript{73} After Cordier's departure, Sr. M. Angela McSwinney became Superior while her sister, Sr. M. Catherine McSwinney, was elected as Sub-Prioress; both had been born in Ireland and were professed together on 16 July 1851. McIntosh, on the other hand, was taken to Italy in 1857 by Bishop Smith on account of her rumoured 'madness' though the \textit{Obituary List} simply noted that 'her health broke down'; she died in Rome on 18 December 1902, aged 72.\textsuperscript{74}

The voluntary relocation of these Sisters connects to Jo Ann Kay McNamara's observations about the difficulty that nuns faced in mission territories when trying to preserve the older traditions of religious life as new directions were being introduced. Struggles with those Sisters from the older European orders, who held tightly to their strict ways, often ensued when new cultures and recruits required alternate congregational directions.\textsuperscript{75} What may have plagued Cordier and her French compatriots was a kind of 'culture war' since she had been described by those of her own foundation as a 'typical French woman...brought up in the strict and even narrow traditions of

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{77}FSICA. Copy of manuscript, p. 87. Jo Ann Kay McNamara noted that clergymen were 'trained to regard nuns in their charge as childlike and deficient of judgment'. \textit{Sisters in Arms: Catholic Nuns through Two Millennia}. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996), p. 612. Smith had often refereed relations between the Sisters of Mercy, the Franciscan Sisters and Forbes.
\item \textsuperscript{72}FSICA. Cochrane, Unpublished Manuscript, p. 42.
\item \textsuperscript{73}FSICA. Box marked "Mother Adela" and Mother Veronica" ref. # 011. Medium-sized black book with 1846-1861 marked in red on the inside cover.
\item \textsuperscript{74}FSICA. \textit{Obituary List}. In 1862, Cordier returned to Tourcoing, France in poor health, but survived until 13 November 1913, aged 91.
\item \textsuperscript{75}Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{76}McNamara, \textit{Sisters in Arms}, pp. 581-82. Although highlighting segregation within convents in terms of race in the United States, she also explained that 'cultural differences' alienated Sisters, p. 597.
\end{itemize}
French spirituality'. Like so many traditional European nuns, who established foundations in mission territories, Cordier found that her ways were no longer compatible with those of her community and so left to start again.

A temporary digression is necessary to explore the pivotal role that Superiors occupied in convent life. A Superior was effectively the ‘master of her domain’, directing the spiritual life of the community, determining customs and practices and developing intimate, maternal relationships with the Sisters under her direction through the examination of conscience. Mary Peckham Magray describes them as spiritual mediators, but their spiritual authority was threatening to priests who regarded customs like the examination of conscience as elevating Superiors to positions akin to confessors; the practice was therefore banned in 1894. While women may have selected the religious life path as an avenue for opportunity, they were required to live each day according to rules and restrictions and the hierarchy within religious communities was inflexible because the obedience and submission of all Sisters to the Superior was a ‘fundamental principle of convent life’. However, the roles for men and women in the Church were clearly defined and despite the authority they wielded over convent affairs, Superiors were subordinate to male Ecclesiastical Advisors. What is clear from the narrative of Cordier’s departure is that although the Church desperately needed Sisters to develop and run the social services and institutions necessary for its survival in Glasgow, a hostile environment, Superiors who challenged clerical authority were not tolerated. When Smith requested that Cordier apologise, he was asserting his ecclesiastical authority, but it is important to recognise that his request had called into question the authority of the Superior, the backbone of the congregation.


From their novitiate, women religious would confer with the Superior about their lives, experiences, feelings and weaknesses, and this process was known as the examination of conscience. It reinforced the spiritual authority of Superiors. Mary Peckham Magray, The Transforming Power of the Nuns: Women Religion and Cultural Change in Ireland, 1750-1900. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998), pp. 47-48.

Ibid., pp. 48-49.


FSICA. Cochrane, Unpublished Manuscript, p. 40. O’Brien addresses this issue and writes that ‘cultural difference in the area of spirituality [was]...taxing for members at all levels in the congregation’.

“From their novitiate, women religious would confer with the Superior about their lives, experiences, feelings and weaknesses, and this process was known as the examination of conscience. It reinforced the spiritual authority of Superiors. Mary Peckham Magray, The Transforming Power of the Nuns: Women Religion and Cultural Change in Ireland, 1750-1900. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998), pp. 47-48.

Ibid., pp. 48-49.


FSICA. Box Marked “Copies of Early Constitutions” ref. #031.30, Chapter 2, Section 1 “Superiors”.
The Sisters of Mercy experienced equally severe, though more fractious conflicts with male clerics, and suffered from low reception rates for the rest of the nineteenth-century as a direct result. Although many congregations were actively recruited and lured into dioceses with incentives including rent- and tax-free accommodation, daily or regular mass within the convent and perhaps even the money from school fees and subscriptions, autonomy was only guaranteed if Superiors could ‘control or withhold’ services based on the observance of their Rule, or if in more extreme situations, they were willing to leave a diocese. In 1851, Elizabeth Moore proved she was willing to do just that, via the puppet Superior, Sr. M. Catherine McNamara. The trend of non-perseverance within the Mercy community was mentioned previously, but two of the years with the highest desertion rates, 1851 and 1854, aside from corresponding with illness peaks, coincided with serious conflicts between the Superiors in Limerick and Glasgow and Peter Forbes. Looking at 1851 in particular, there can be no doubt that the desertion of six young women was the result of the extraordinary struggle between Elizabeth Moore and Forbes. The relationship between the Limerick Superior and the Glasgow priests, particularly Bishop Murdoch and Forbes, was never very good and after Moore had accompanied the Sisters to Glasgow, she appointed McNamara Superior, though all of the available evidence suggests that in reality, Moore continued to run the community from Limerick.

The tension between the clergy and Sisters was very much connected to the anti-Irishness of many of the Scottish-born clergymen, and even Bishop Smith, an Enzie-born man himself, admitted that ‘a great deal of national feelings existed upon the Bishop’s part’ which complicated the already troubled situation. In May 1851, tempers rose when Moore, acting from Ireland via McNamara, aware that anti-Irish prejudice might be ‘guiding the bishop’ and some of his priests, had

---

87MICA. Statement of the Convent of Mercy.
88Ibid.
commenced efforts to bring the Irish Sisters who had been lent to the Glasgow foundation back to Limerick. Irritated by the lack of control he was able to exercise over this female community, who were referred to by other Glasgow priests as the ‘St. Mary’s Nuns’ because of Forbes’ efforts to keep them solely engaged in the work of his parish, Forbes attempted to put his foot down. However, not ‘relish[ing] the idea of being purely Mr. Forbes’ nuns...understand[ing] him to be [nothing] but Chaplain or Confessor’ McNamara sent two professed Sisters back to Limerick at Moore’s command. Forbes responded by suggesting that since she (McNamara) had ‘only been lent in like manner, she had better return with them, and thus prevent any further recurrence of the same manner’.89

This clash had catastrophic consequences for the stability of the community and resulted in the exodus of five professed Sisters, four postulants and two novices.90 The long term effects were detrimental since not only had the community lost an experienced Superior, but it had lost six future members through desertion; the perseverance of a religious vocation was difficult under the best circumstances, let alone when a community appeared to be falling apart. The egregious departure of 10 Sisters and six potential religious meant that just two professed Sisters, two postulants and three novices, all young and inexperienced, remained to do the work of an entire community and thus ‘struggled through their arduous duties’.91 Sr. M. Bernard Garden, recently recovered from typhus and a newly-professed Sister herself, was appointed Superior by Bishop Murdoch.

An Aberdeenshire native, Garden had been hand-picked for the Scottish mission and sent to Liverpool to be trained by the Sisters of Mercy so that she could return to Glasgow and run a community. Her Liverpool Superiors had sent her to Limerick in 1849 and evidence suggests a struggle erupted over Garden between the Sisters of Mercy, who were trying to assert control over one of their Sisters, and the Scottish Catholic clergy, who desired women steeped in Scottish Catholicism to spearhead the process of religious reform and cultural transformation among Scotland’s growing Catholic population. It is likely that Murdoch, a Bishop known to espouse

anti-Irish sentiments, had intended to appoint Garden Superior after she had obtained sufficient religious experience. Presumably, both Moore and the Liverpool Superior, Mother M. St. Vincent, were aware of this and acted to demonstrate their authority by sending her to Limerick and attempting to prevent her return to Scotland. Their combined efforts complicated Murdoch’s ambitions, forcing him to travel to Ireland and fetch the young woman. Clearly Moore’s resistance perplexed the Scottish Catholic clergy, as evidenced by a letter written to Murdoch by Bishop Kyle (1788-1869), Vicar-Apostolic of the Northern District:

I think those who opposed MMB’s coming to Glasgow were quite in the wrong... They might have thought that she was not ripe to become superior. In this I and you too would have joined them. It would have been highly desirable that she had some years before of religious profession over her head before she got that charge. It was I understand necessity... But to seek to prevent a Scotch woman from giving & her own poor country women who stood so much in need of religious instruction which they judged she was called by God to impart was I think unreasonable and contrary to all due order.  

Garden’s time as Superior did not last long and the increased workload took its toll. By the end of 1851, her ‘health completely gave way and two of the Sisters became very unwell’, because of her frail condition, she was subsequently transferred back to Liverpool.

In 1854, the third year with high non-perseverance rates, another conflict involving Forbes erupted. He had wanted ‘to have changes brought about for the extension of the Sisters labours’; but Sr. M. Aloysius (Mary Ann) Consitt, a Superior on loan from Liverpool to help the floundering community after Sr. M. Garden’s health failed, refused to agree to his demand and left on 8 November 1854. Glasgow’s position as a new foundation made it vulnerable to common obstacles, but because its stability was continually tested by the lack of consistence and strong leadership, successful growth was not achieved during the nineteenth century.

---

92On one occassion, Murdoch wished that the Young Irelonders would stop interfering with his clergy, writing that ‘It is really a pity that some of these stupid fools did not get a skinful of bullets ’, another time he wrote that he was ‘sadly annoyed by the unsteadiness of the Hibernian portion’ of his clergy’. SCA. BL6/587/4 and BL6/587/6. The Blairs Letters at the Scottish Catholic archives are a rich souce of fascinating reading. 93SCA. OL2/83/5. Letter from Bishop Kyle to Bishop Murdoch, 3 May 1852. 94Ibid. 95Ibid., p. 13. 96Ibid., pp. 17-18.
prospective Sisters had great difficulty without experienced Sisters available to help cultivate their vocation. Figure 8 shows how professions in the Mercy community dwindled after these conflicts and disruptions.

**Figure 8: Annual Professions, Sisters of Mercy, 1850-1870.**

![Graph showing annual professions, Sisters of Mercy, 1850-1870.]

*Source: SMCA, Glasgow. Names of Sisters who entered in Glasgow.*

The Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur

The Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, the third significant female teaching community, arrived in 1894 specifically to open a teacher training college that would enable young Catholic women to receive their teaching qualifications in Scotland. Their arrival was a landmark in the Catholic community's quest for respectability and was indicative of its changing profile, but it also represented a culmination of the efforts of both the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy. Aspinwall argues convincingly that the ultramontane policy adopted by the Church, after the restoration of the Scottish Catholic Hierarchy in 1878, sparked a Catholic revivalism which saw the native Scottish Catholics, the 'Irish faithful' and the wealthy converts 'merge into a cohesive community'. Despite Aspinwall's argument to the contrary, the old divisions were not fully

---

'resolved', but a shared sense of achievement had indeed developed out of decades of church and school building and Sisters, because of their work at grassroots levels, were more central to this process of change than many realise. That the Church was even in a position to recruit the Sisters of Notre Dame was the result of the groundwork of the other two teaching communities. The Sisters of Notre Dame were pivotal because they took the Church in Scotland closer to transformation and modernisation.

What set the Sisters of Notre Dame apart from both the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy was the organisation with which they came to Glasgow. They had ensured that adequate facilities existed for them prior to their arrival and were single-minded in their goal. They also had the luxury of communicating with and having the full support of the Archbishop, a figure who did not exist in Glasgow until 1878, and they seemed to be far more seasoned when it came to negotiating and setting up a new community than either of the previous communities. Having Archbishop Charles Eyre (1817-1902) oversee the situation was critical since he was looking out for the interests of an entire Archbishopric, rather than a specific parish, as Forbes had done. He had actively recruited the Sisters of Notre Dame as part of his own desire to consolidate Catholicism in Glasgow.

The congregation was founded in Namur, in today's Belgium, on 2 February 1804 by Julie Billiart (1751-1816) and Françoise Blin de Bourbon (1756-1838). Teacher training had a central presence in their doctrines, and in fact, it became the fourth vow 'in the early days of Notre Dame'. Billiart believed there to be two components in education, 'les petites sciences' (intellectual growth, social training and manual skill) and 'la grande science' (knowledge of God), and felt that together, these would help renew 'Christian family life by training the mothers of the next generation'. Prior to 1895, Scottish women wishing to train as teachers for the Catholic system had to travel to the Training College at Sacred Heart, which had been established at Wandsworth, London, in 1870, or to the Mount Pleasant Teacher Training College, established

---

98Ibid.
100Ibid., p. 65.
in 1856 by the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur in Liverpool. There were at least 54 young women from Glasgow who had studied at Mount Pleasant, but the decision to study in Liverpool was difficult and the expense itself was tremendous. This was understood by Archbishop Eyre, who remarked upon the great expense involved in being trained outside of Scotland, to Mother M. of St Philip, the Liverpool Superior:

Another college is evidently wanted and this diocese is the most suitable place...our Scotch girls cannot afford to go to London [or Liverpool], nor to pay for the residence.

The task of establishing a training college and recruiting properly qualified Sisters was complicated. Archbishop Eyre, Canon McIntosh and Canon Chisholm played pivotal roles in the process and spent over two years negotiating a suitable situation for the Sisters. In 1892, Sr. M. of St Philip (unknown) Lescher, Sr. Rose of St Joseph (unknown) McPherson, and Sr. M. of St Wilfrid (Adela) Lescher (the intended Superior) travelled to Scotland to scout locations, but it was not until 1893 that an acceptable site for the prospective college was found on a hill at Dowanside East and Dowanside West in the city’s West End. The records from the Notre Dame archives in Liverpool suggest that Dowanhill was chosen because of its closeness to the University and the Sisters were ‘determined that their student teachers should take full advantage of the opportunity’. Glasgow University only opened its doors to women in 1892, but Dowanhill students did not study there until 1897 and only started graduating from the University in 1907.

Government approval for the College came through on 22 December 1893, after much

---

103 SND, PAO. BH6 DH.h/6. Letter from Archbishop Eyre to Sister Mary of St Philip, 4 April 1893.
106 SND, PAO. BH6 DH.h/3. Dowanhill Training College, ‘Establishment and Recognition’ (no date given).
persuasion and pressure from Archbishop Eyre and the two Canons;\textsuperscript{107} Eyre's diary for 1893 states that on 11 December 1893, Canon Chisholm had travelled to London to 'urge the authorization of the Glasgow Catholic Training College for female teachers'.\textsuperscript{108} At the end of May, 1893, the 'Sisters of Notre Dame agreed, subject to consent and approval of their Superiors at Namur, to undertake the college'\textsuperscript{109} and on 20 August 1894, four Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur arrived in Glasgow and they were Sr. M. of St Wilfrid, the Superior, Sr. Phillipe of the Cross (Marguerite) Keating, Sr. Teresa of the Nativity (Dorothy) Cuddon and Sr. Julie de Ste. Thérèse (Mary) Gilby. The Liverpool Superior, Sr M. of St Philip, who had been up in Glasgow to select a site for the College, arrived four days later. On 25 August 1894, they were welcomed by a group of 54 former Mount Pleasant students and presented with an address and a statue of Our Lady of Victories. The following is an excerpt from the address:

And now dear Sister Superior, we the old Students of Liverpool ask you to accept from us this statue of our Lady of Victories as a small thanksgiving offering to our Lady for the victory she has won through you for the cause of Catholic education in Scotland...Also we ask you to accept it as a slight token of our undying affection towards your beloved Mistress, an affection which years has strengthened and deepened as with fuller experience we are able to realize more all we owe to your teaching.\textsuperscript{110}

The fact that this address was written by former Notre Dame students demonstrates their fondness and respect for the education they had received in Liverpool. Records left by the students of any institution are difficult to uncover, if they exist at all, and this piece of evidence is a candid glimpse of the relationship between the Sisters and their students. The personal and compassionate qualities of the address cannot be ignored because it was a show of great appreciation. A letter from Sr. M. of St Philip described the gathering in more detail:

You cannot think what a delightful gathering it was. It was got up chiefly by Margaret Maloney, Margaret Graham, and Agnes Duffy, to welcome the Sisters to Scotland...It was the most lovely summer afternoon...Soon after the half-hour, the old students

\textsuperscript{108}Ibid, entry for 11 December 1893.
\textsuperscript{109}GAA. CD6/1 Acta Capituli Glasguensis, entry for 22 June 1893. Report given to the Committee on the Training College for School Mistresses.
\textsuperscript{110}SND, PAO. MPTC 1. Shelf 1, Box 28, marked 'Miscellaneous'. Address presented to Sister Superior of the Liverpool Training College by the old Students resident in and around Glasgow on the opening of the Dowanhill Training College.
might have been seen coming up the two avenues and gathering together on the lawn. There were fifty-four present, and several others who were out of town sent letters and telegrams...three came into the middle; one with the address, the others carrying great ‘shower’ bouquets of white roses, white carnations, white sweet-peas and white heather. Margaret Maloney read the address...it was most touching in its out-spoken loyalty and love.111

The address must also be seen as evidence of the progress that Catholic education in Glasgow had made. Aspinwall argues that education was the vital element in reinforcing ‘stability, roots, self-discipline, capital and values...which would guarantee individual and collective progress’ and although by the late 1880s, the pupil population had increased 400 per cent, the retention of Catholics was still a concern.112 The Church recognised that Catholic population needed access to more resources that would provide opportunities for professional advancement and ‘enable [Catholics]...to compete with their Protestant brethren on equal terms without endangering their faith’.113 By the time the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur arrived, however, the Church was in a position to move beyond simply retaining Catholics and work to convert non-Catholics. Although evidence of the Church openly admitting the desire to convert non-Catholics before the 1880s has been hard to find, an 1852 letter from Bishop Smith to Propaganda in Rome, admitted the conversion of some, as well as the baptism of 171 children of Protestant parents.114 While there had always the desire for conversions, the Church in Glasgow had only barely been in a position to provide security for its own, but by 1886 the Church was secure enough to spotlight its ‘double duty’ of continuing to provide for the existing Catholic population and ‘facilitat[ing] the return to her bosom of those who do not know their mother’.115 When considering these points, the Address presented by the former Mount Pleasant students

---

112Aspinwall, “Catholic Devotion in Victorian Scotland”.
113SND, PAO. Address presented to Sister Superior of the Liverpool Training College.
114FSICA. Box marked “Letters from Rome (from 1850) on Rule and Constitution” ref # 031.1. Brown folder marked 1851-1875. Letter from Alexander Smith to Cardinal Fransoni, Prefect of the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda Fide, 18 March 1852. According to Smith, in the Western district, ‘nearly all the converts are poor people. The rich are too much attached to the riches of this world to become Catholic.’
115Sermon preached at the opening of the National Council of Scotland, 17 August 1886, by His Grace, the Archbishop of Glasgow. (Glasgow: Hugh Margey, 1886), p. 8. The third aim of the National Council, according to this sermon was to get the Scottish people to return to the Church with ‘its elasticity and adaptability to all persons, all times, and all circumstances’, p. 11. The Glasgow Observer printed an account of a speech delivered in 1890 about the ‘especial conversion of the Scotch people...’, 25 January 1890.
illuminates the institutionalised clash of faiths. It is likely that these former Mount Pleasant students were brought up with the belief that they needed to save and defend Catholicism, but in 1895 with the arrival of the Sisters of Notre Dame, Catholicism had begun to modernise with advanced institutions like the Dowanhill Teacher Training College, and could be linked, somewhat, to respectability. The location of the college, in the heart of the West End, where affluence was on constant show, is evidence of this and while encroachment from the ‘lower orders’ was getting more difficult to fend off and the area was losing some of its ‘exclusivity’, property at Dowanhill remained an impressive acquisition.

The Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur were far more financially stable than the two previous communities, but again, financial details are scant. The Archdiocese had committed substantial contributions in an effort to attract the congregation, including the property at Dowanhill, but the congregation also footed a significant portion of ‘initial financial liabilities connected with the foundation of the college’ and were in debt when they arrived. Aside from the money earned from their teaching, the Sisters received financial support from local supporters and in 1897, the community received a gift of £870 from unnamed patron, but Liverpool advised them that in spite of the generous gift, no more than £200 per year should be applied to their debt because people might start assuming that they were rich. Serious financial trouble hit when building work, commissioned between 1905 and 1907 to provide large lecture rooms, a drill hall, a science lab and a ‘spacious day school’ left the Glasgow community with a £20,000 debt. It is likely that the community had many patrons and benefactors, and although the archival material consulted did not produce any names or amounts, except the gift noted above, a bazaar which was organised by the community in 1908 to help clear this debt featured a music evening. Some of the 300 invited guests were dignitaries like Lord Lovat, the grand nephew of the Superior, Lady Ninian Crichton-Stuartone, the Countess of Louden and Lord Ralph Kerr, and at the close of the evening, the Superior was presented with a cheque for the proceeds which totalled

117Ibid. Appendix 2:2 are views of the front garden.
Apart from the financial side, the Sisters of Notre Dame benefited from the continued support of the clergy and the special backing they received from the Archbishop no doubt contributed to the success of both the community and the training college. Eyre firmly believed that 'Notre Dame in Scotland has a great work before it, and will accomplish equally happy results [compared with the work of the congregation in England]'. Similarly, Canon McIntosh, writing to Sr. M. of St Philip in Liverpool, expressed his confidence in Wilfrid's ability to instil the proper values in the Dowanhill students:

I might suggest 'Our Lady of Doves'. Dowanhill in Scotch I believe means the hill of Doves. And then is not the Dove the emblem of the spirit of innocence and intelligence? Qualities which I am sure the new principal will do her utmost to instil into the hearts and heads of her future chicks.

Clerical support ensured the immediate success of the training college and this success is reflected by the fact that between 1894 and 1913, the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur had a total of 110 Sisters in Glasgow. Early support clearly makes a difference because in the space of just 19 years, the Sisters of Notre Dame in Glasgow had almost triple the membership of the Sisters of Mercy and more than half the membership of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception. A database was not created for the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur because only limited material relating to the Sisters who worked on the Glasgow mission was made available. Information such as the death date, parents' names, place of profession and date of profession, which was used to construct the databases for the other communities was inaccessible. However, a list of all the Sisters who worked in the Glasgow mission, which was produced by the congregational archivist for this project, reveals that between 1894 and 1913, there were 110 Sisters.

Figure 9 reveals that the majority of the Sisters were of English-birth. No biographical details have been provided for any of the Sisters except the Superior in Liverpool (Sr. M. of St Philip)

---

and the first Superior in Glasgow (Sr. M. of St. Wilfrid). But because the place of birth was provided, it has been possible to create a visual breakdown of the Scottish-born Sisters.

**Figure 9:** Birthplaces (by country) of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, 1894-1913.

![Birthplaces Graph]

**Source:** SND, PAO. List of Sisters assigned to Dowanhill. Created from Congregational Database.

Figure 10 shows that the majority came from Glasgow and Lanarkshire. Figure 11 reveals that of the Irish-born Sisters, the majority came from Dublin, Cork, Sligo and Waterford, but it is not possible to know where they had migrated because the material containing the details of their place of profession was not provided. Another limitation concerns sibling sets and because the names of parents, profession dates and places were not divulged, there is no way to determine how many there were and what, if any, impact this had on the Glasgow community. The presence of Irish Sisters was not a concern for the Scottish Catholic hierarchy, as it had been with the other two communities, and this was due in part to the fact that the community was English-dominated, but also because by 1894, although the intra-denominational tension had not disappeared, it had lessened considerably.

---

123Although this will be more fully discussed in Chapter 4, Charles Eyre (an Englishman) was deliberately appointed Archbishop to bridge the gap between the Irish and Scottish Catholics. Bernard Aspinwall, “Anyone for Glasgow: The Strange Nomination of the Rt. Rev. Charles Eyre in 1868” in *Recusant History*. Vol. 23. No. 4 (1996-1997), pp. 585-598.
Figure 10: Scottish Birthplaces (by county and city) of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, 1894-1913.

[Diagram showing birthplace distribution]

Lanarkshire (18.18%)
Kirkcudbrightshire (4.55%)
Inverness-shire (13.64%)
Aberdeenshire (13.64%)
Dunbartonshire (4.55%)
Edinburgh (4.55%)
Glasgow (40.91%)

Source: SND, PAO. List of Sisters assigned to Dowanhill.

Figure 11: Irish Birthplaces (by county) of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, 1894-1913.

[Diagram showing birthplace distribution]

Tipperary (5.00%)
Kerry (5.00%)
Mayo (5.00%)
Clare (5.00%)
Tyrone (5.00%)
Roscommon (5.00%)
Sligo (10.00%)
Kilkenny (5.00%)
Waterford (10.00%)
King's (5.00%)
Kildare (5.00%)
Dublin (20.00%)

Source: SND, PAO. List of Sisters assigned to Dowanhill.
The large number of Sisters working in Glasgow meant that the community was able to make significant progress. Before the college officially opened, 41 students had enrolled in a preparatory class in 1894 and in 1895, the year that the College actually opened, 42 students were registered. Five years later student numbers reached 94 and by 1904, ten years after the congregation arrived, 119 students were registered. Hands-on instruction was an important component of the training and on 13 April 1896, the Sisters took charge of the Partick Girl’s school in St. Peter’s Parish and Sr. Margaret of St. Vincent (Laura) Pordage was the head Mistress. Three years later, on 7 March 1899, they started at the new schools in St. Charles’ Parish. Providing this kind of teaching experience was a significant attribute and the methods employed by the Sisters of Notre Dame were a vast improvement over the pupil-teacher system. This does not mean to suggest that as soon as Dowanhill opened the use of pupil-teachers disappeared, but the greater number of trained women made the ever-demanding state educational regulations easier to handle. Previously, young people who seemed bright enough developed into monitors and while their duty was to assist rather than teach, they were often given more responsibility than they were equipped to handle. The use of unqualified pupil-teachers was widespread in the Catholic education system, and this will be addressed further in the next chapter.

The Sisters of Notre Dame made it their goal to impart a rounded training programme to their students. Despite the College being a religious educational institution it did place significant emphasis upon the secular subjects and Sr. Monica Taylor, a Notre Dame-trained scientist, is a good example and her uncle, an industrial chemist, donated some of his equipment to Mount Pleasant in 1891. Nevertheless, religion had always been an important part of the Notre Dame de Namur curriculum and in his 1878 address to Mount Pleasant students, Mr. T. W. Allies, Secretary of the Catholic Poor School Committee between 1853-1890, drew attention to this.

---

124GAA. Box IP-E14. Eyre’s Diaries 1889-1895, 8 January and 3 September 1985.
125BH6/DH.h/1 Annals 1894-1906. Appendix 2:3 shows the enrolment numbers for the first ten years of the Training College and reveals that the numbers rose annually except in 1901, when it declined by one student.
126SND, PAO. BH6/DH.h/1. ‘History Dowanhill’, p. 16.
127SND, PAO. BH6/DH.h/5. The Monica Taylor Folder. “An Early Episode in the teaching of science in convent schools told by a pupil who entered the school in 1884.” Two-page typed account, no date. In 2001 her contributions to protozoology and her discovery of the Amoeba Taylori were remembered in Glasgow University’s alumni magazine. Avenue, June 2001.
The evidence available for the Glasgow community suggests that the Sisters did not try to overwhelm their students with Catholic principles and while there were great efforts to merge religion and the secular subjects, Catholicism was the omnipresent backdrop. A successful blend was an important principle held by the Sisters of Notre Dame before they arrived in Glasgow and in 1894, Canon Chisholm expressed to Sr. M. of St Philip that he understood the necessity of modernisation, and acknowledged that to ensure success, religion and education had to go 'hand in hand', with Dowanhill keeping in the 'vein of intellectual projects'.

Chisholm's statement highlights that the Catholic Church, towards the end of the nineteenth century, was coming under increasing, almost crippling, pressure to ensure that its schools met the educational requirements set out in the Education Acts, including properly trained and certificated teachers, which the Sisters helped to deliver. This issue will be more fully addressed in the fourth chapter.

In 1905, the Catholic Education Committee issued a statement, in response to demands from the Glasgow School Board with respect to education legislation, on the necessity of having trained teachers and this is where the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur became pivotal in the fight to keep the Catholic system afloat. Training Catholic teachers was not only its ethos but also its business and the Sisters took it very seriously since they knew that trained teachers were the life-blood of the system and, consequently, the faith. The Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur empowered Catholic women in Scotland, as skilled professionals, to help shape the future of the Catholic community.

---

Conclusion

The arrival of Sisters was a turning point for the Catholic Church in Glasgow. Although the early endeavours of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception and the Sisters of Mercy were complicated by illness, disease and conflict, both succeeded in attracting the new recruits who would carry on the work of the mission. The recruitment of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, which was spearheaded by the Archbishop after the Roman Catholic hierarchy was restored in 1878, was visible proof that the Church's ambitions to consolidate Catholicism and enhance its respectability were being realised. A highly professional teaching congregation, the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur came to Glasgow with the sole purpose of establishing a teacher training college for Catholic women in Scotland. The following chapter shows how, after initial stumbling blocks, the efforts of both the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception and the Sisters of Mercy met with success as new parish and convent schools were opened in response to growing pupil numbers. Without this foundation the Church would not have been in a position to recruit the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, a prestigious and highly respected congregation of teaching Sisters.
III. Building the Foundation: 
Sisters and Catholic Elementary Education.

This chapter explores the educational work of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception and the Sisters of Mercy before 1872, the year the Education (Scotland) Act was passed. Education, it was felt, would transform the Catholic community, the bulk of whom were Irish, into respectable, loyal and obedient Scottish and British citizens. Sisters had the ability to sublimate Irish Catholicism and bring the migrants, and the future generations, more in line with the ‘native’ brand of Catholicism, while at the same time elevating the population as a whole to a level of respectability. Not only were the Sisters skilled educators, drawing upon congregational specialty and experience, but they were trained religious who persevered in spreading the faith. Glasgow’s clergy had consciously tapped into their expertise.

This chapter argues that their educational efforts secured an important foothold for the Catholic Church in Glasgow, a predominantly Presbyterian and hostile city. The first section, therefore, explores the progress made by the Sisters in the provision of elementary education. The number of parishes they worked in, coupled with the increase in the number of schools they ran (convent, parish and Sunday schools) and the fact that they were being continually sought out by parish priests to run and staff new schools, illustrates the breadth of their influence. Increased membership naturally led to an expansion of their workload, though this was more so the case with the Franciscan Sisters since the previous chapter revealed that the Sisters of Mercy suffered from low overall membership on account of leadership vacuums and illness peaks. The increase in the number of Sisters in Glasgow provoked hostility, but this must be seen in the broader context of British anti-conventualism. Thus, the second section of this chapter considers the perception of Sisters and nuns in nineteenth-century Scotland and Britain to highlight that intense public fear imposed significant obstacles as they persevered with their vocation.

The Progress of Elementary Education

Defending the faith of Glasgow's Catholic children was the underlying premise of Sister recruitment into the city. Anti-Catholicism raged across Britain in the nineteenth century, but it
had been periodically intensified by key developments such as Catholic Emancipation in 1829, mass migration during the Famine and the restoration of England’s Roman Catholic Hierarchy in 1851. In many respects, Glasgow’s Protestant, though determinedly Presbyterian character, promoted anti-Catholic sentiments akin to those exhibited in the opening quote which referred to the laying of the foundation stone for the Knox monument. The proselytising efforts of various Protestant sects worried the Catholic clergy, who had been overrun with Famine Irish and who lacked the personnel and institutions to keep adequate track of their co-religionists.

Therefore, the Church’s recruitment of teaching congregations had been a strategic move to extend the authority of the Church. Sisters were determined missionaries who offset Protestant proselytisation efforts, but they also persevered to increase the morality and prosperity of the wider Catholic community. Women were key to maintaining the sacred Christian family and it was felt that those who came under the influence of Sisters would uphold this ideal. An anthropological study of women religious makes a similar point, arguing that Sisters and the Church saw the family as dependant upon the moral worth of the wife and mother which made the special education of girls fundamental.¹ In Glasgow, Roman Catholicism was not the only denomination to recognise the value of women in extending Church influence, and the Free Church missionary in Cowcaddens, Daniel R. Kilpatrick, remarked that when he visited families and held meetings for prayer and scripture, he did not forget to pay attention to the mothers:

Nor were the mothers neglected. For years I held a weekly meeting for mothers, which was moved from one land to another over all the district, and which was the principle means from which many a poor, wearied and anxious woman, burdened perhaps with a young family and a drunken husband, drew heavenly rest.²

Lesley Orr MacDonald’s study of women and Presbyterianism between 1830 and 1930 identifies women as aggressive proselytisers operating under male supervision and suggests that their work was considered ‘purposeful’.³ As well as middle-class involvement, MacDonald explained that

²Daniel R. Kilpatrick, The religious history of Cowcaddens and personal recollections of Christian work in the north west quarter of the city. (Glasgow: David Bryce and Co., 1867), p. 14. He was referring to the period between 1853 and publication. ‘Land’ in Scots means a building site or a tenement.
bible women, who were often working-class widows, were employed in proselytisation activities because they had greater access to and more influence with members of the working-classes. Nevertheless, these active Presbyterian women were ‘far removed from decision-making’. The similarities between Protestant women and Sisters are numerous, not least of which was their subjection to male authority, but Sisters did have more autonomy and freedom to choose what work they undertook and how they lived. Sisters were in a position to make the classroom, the hospital, the prison or the close their first priority and, as members of international congregations, Sisters achieved considerable leverage, despite the patriarchal character of Roman Catholicism.

The Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy offered Catholics in Glasgow the opportunity for social improvement through basic education, but they also enabled the Church to retain followers who might otherwise have been lost. School teaching, as Aspinwall suggests, was seen as a ‘community-building profession’ and women religious were the ones who were in a position to bring about ‘collective progress’ because of their contact with people at a grassroots level. The Objects of the Institution for the Franciscan Sisters stated that they were to be principally concerned with giving young women a ‘sound Christian Education...[receiving] them into their convent as borders...[making] it their chief concern to form their hearts for virtue’. The original Rule and Constitutions of the Sisters of Mercy expressed a similar emphasis, stating that ‘no work of charity, can be so productive of good to society or so conducive to the happiness of the poor as the careful instruction of women...the station they are destined to fill, their examples and advice will always possess influence’. The Mercy congregation wielded considerable authority over education and social care and as a result developed into one of the most influential religious institutions.

---


6 FISICA. Box marked “Copies of Early Constitutions” ref. #031.30. Rule of the Community of the Immaculate Conception of the Third Order of St. Francis Glasgow, 1855, p. 7. Large Brown book with dark brown leather binding and corners.

7 MICA. Record Group 100- 4. Manuscript Copy of the Constitutions written by Catherine McAuley, c. 1832. McAuley was pressured to start a religious congregation by Dublin’s Archbishop Murray. Originally written in 1832, the Mercy Rule was based on that of the Presentation Sisters since McAuley had made her novitiate with them. John Nicholas Murphy, *Terra Incognita or the Convents of the United Kingdom*. (London: Longman’s Green, and Co., 1873), pp. 164-165. Catriona Clear, “The Limits of Female Autonomy: Nuns in Nineteenth Century Ireland” in *Women Surviving: Studies in Irish Women’s History in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries*. Luddy, Maria and Murphy, Cliona, eds. (Dublin: Poolbeg Press Ltd., 1990), p. 30.
congregations of women religious in the world.\textsuperscript{4}

The ideals of the Foundress were just as important as the familial connections and personal circumstances which often drew women to the religious life. Ultimately, aspirants had to believe in the congregational ethos and many women were drawn to teaching because it was a respectable and nurturing profession. That the education of women and children was a priority for Catherine McAuley is demonstrated in the care she took to investigate a range of schools and methods, including George's Hill and Middle Abbey poor schools in Dublin, the Kildare Place Society and the poor schools in France.\textsuperscript{9} Limited resources, however, saw her congregation depend upon the Lancaster method, which worked on the premise that younger Sisters or pupil teachers were taught a lesson which they would then impart to small groups of younger pupils.\textsuperscript{10} This system complemented McAuley's simple, yet effective approach with children:

\begin{quote}
We cannot be too simple; far-fetched words, studied discourses should be unknown amongst us; - for such are entirely above the capacity of our young charges, and thus over time would be lost. Experience daily proves that the simplest instructions are the best and the most impressive. Little examples, which are striking, and familiar comparisons are most useful, and serve to gain the children's attention.\textsuperscript{11}
\end{quote}

Having undertaken educational work in Ireland, the first Sisters of Mercy who came to Glasgow from Limerick brought with them valuable skills and experience that would enable them to teach and manage large numbers of children. Vaast and Cordier, the foundresses of the Franciscan Sisters, had also come to Glasgow equipped with teaching skills and together, these communities played an integral role in the development of Catholic education. Despite this fact, their contributions have received scant attention from historians, though Bernard Aspinwall admits that the female teaching congregations were the first to 'provide any systematic education' towards

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{5}Ibid., p. 57.
\textsuperscript{6}The London-born Joseph Lancaster (1778-1838) developed a 'comprehensive system of education', wherein monitors taught groups of 10-12 children. He stressed economic viability, efficient instruction, discipline and 'motivation by competition'. Carl F. Kaestle, Joseph Lancaster and the Monitorial School Movement: A Documentary History. (New York: Teachers College Press, 1973), pp. 3-9. A sketch of the Sisters using this format was produced by Sr. M. Clare Agnew in 1840 and has been included as Appendix 3:1.
\textsuperscript{7}Ibid., p. 14-15.
\end{flushright}
the improvement of the city's educational standards.  

The previous chapter highlighted the early instability that was experienced by each community, but these factors did not prevent their progress with education in the city. One institution, which was maintained by Sisters from the moment they arrived, was the orphanage on Abercromby Street and although it was transferred back and forth between the two communities until the late 1860s, the fact that it was consistently run by Sisters indicates that the children housed in the facility were deemed to be vulnerable and most in need of religious instruction. That these children were at risk is further demonstrated by the interest that some members of the Protestant community took in the facility, who claimed that the orphanage did a disservice rather than a service. The Scottish Protestant, a highly confrontational weekly publication which ran between 1851 and 1852, when intense anti-Catholicism was the result of the restoration of England's Roman Catholic hierarchy, printed an article criticising conditions within the facility. It quoted a report that had been delivered to the Glasgow City Parochial Board in 1852 after allegations of improper care arose: 'in the dining room, called the refectory, they found the walls broken and dilapidated, the furniture and floor abominably dirty, and the place much too small for so many as 180 children'. The Parochial Board's Minute Book, however, recorded comments only in relation to the boys' section of the institution and despite the initial recommendation that the boys be removed to Poor House facilities, it was soon after decided that they should stay put as conditions in the Poor House were worse than in the orphanage.

Before parish schools were underway, Sunday schools, aimed at the factory children who were beyond the reach of the Church during the week at least, were run by Sisters and in many cases, these Sunday schools were the first point of contact since many children did not attend parish day even after 1872 when compulsory attendance was introduced. Magray emphasises that because of the their focus on the introduction of religion, Sunday schools were often established before

---


14 Glasgow City Archives, D-HEW 1.1.2. Glasgow Parochial Board Minute Book, 23 December 1851 to 1 February 1861. Entries for 6 January and 2 February 1852.
parish schools as a means to promote Catholicism. The Sunday schools attendance numbers, shown in the only available though often inaccurate source, were relatively high and in 1852, St. Mary's Parish alone had upwards of 600 girls at both the preparatory and advanced levels. Aside from St. Mary's Parish, ten years later in 1862, St. Mungo's Parish had an average Sunday School attendance of 500 girls. Since schooling was not yet mandatory, Sunday school attendance was often much higher than school attendance. Indoctrinating this many children in Catholicism necessitated a successful method of transmission and this is where the experience of the Mercy Sisters in the Lancaster method paid off.

As noted in the previous chapter, 1850 represented a turn-around year for the Franciscan community and the reception of eight postulants meant that there were more hands available for teaching and thus in 1850 the Sisters took charge of schools in the parishes of St. Andrew's, St. John's and St. Joseph's. The St. Andrew's and St. John's schools had been intended for the Sisters of Mercy and in fact the Sisters of Mercy were already teaching in the St. John's schools, when the Superior (McNamara), acting on the orders of Moore from Limerick, refused to allow her Sisters to work in the night schools set up for the factory girls because they assembled after seven o'clock. The Sisters had been willing to teach in the schools, but Moore's strict refusal brought the community and the 'Ecclesiastical Authorities into collision'. In lieu of this development, the parish priests turned to the Franciscan Sisters who agreed to take on the schools.

In contrast to the Franciscan Sisters, the Sisters of Mercy struggled in 1850, as indicated by the previous chapter which identified this year as one of three particularly difficult years in the 1850s. After the incident with the St. Andrew's and St. Joseph's evening schools, Bishop Smith felt that

---

16CDS, 1852, pp. 95-99.
17CDS, 1862, p. 94.
18The Ursulines of Jesus in Edinburgh also taught this way and Bishop James Gillis wrote that because of the large class sizes, monitors had been 'selected from the more advanced, and otherwise best qualified among the pupils - instructions communicated by the teacher, being thus made to permeate the entire school.' "Objects of St Catharine's Institute of Our Lady of Mercy, Lauriston Gardens, Edinburgh" in St. Catherine's Convent of Our Lady of Mercy, Edinburgh, 1861.
19FSICA. Obituary List and Sister Professions & Receptions, Volumes I & II. Kept with the Superior.
20MICA. *Statement of the Convent of Mercy. CDS*, 1851, p. 88 lists the Franciscans as the teaching congregation responsible for these three schools.
the Mercys were not ‘making adequate progress’ and therefore asked Cordier to return to
Charlotte Street (she had been removed from there when the Irish community arrived) and open
a convent school for day pupils and boarders. This directive was followed immediately and soon
after, fee-paying students were received. Cordier’s personal notes reflect a sense of
accomplishment and pride:

...our former pupils who had gone away with the others [Sisters of
Mercy] came back to us almost immediately, one after another. It
was curious to see these little girls coming back. It seemed that
they had gained their wishes.21

As the community grew and became more established in Glasgow, the pupil population in the
convent school increased. To house the growing community, which numbered roughly 16 in
1851, and a pupil population of approximately 70 day pupils and seven pupil boarders, a property
at 58 Charlotte Street was purchased in May 1851. Although the property was expanded soon
after it was purchased, by 1856 the facility was proving too small so the neighbouring house and
garden were bought and used for new pupil boarders.22 Continued pupil growth necessitated
further expansion with a new school house being constructed on the property’s garden.23 The
purchase of the original property (58 Charlotte Street) was controversial since Mr. Jeffrey,
identified in the previous chapter as a patron of the community, had secretly secured the Charlotte
Street property for their new convent, but neglected to inform the previous owner of the purpose
for which the property was being acquired. Furious to discover that the property was destined
to become a convent, the previous owner tried to have the sale reversed by taking the community
to court on 16 July 1851, but was unsuccessful.24

Parish school openings and convent school expansion represented the success of both Catholicism

---

21FSICA. Box marked Mother Adelaide and Mother Veronica, ref. # 011. Copy of manuscript, pp. 61
and 63.

22Glasgow Herald, 7 July 1851. FSICA. Obituary List and Sister Professions & Receptions and CDS,
1851, p. 119. Murdoch’s and Smith’s application to extend the Charlotte St. building for convent and school
was mentioned. Appendix 3:2 is a drawing of the convent school. FSICA. Box marked “Mother Adelaide and
Mother Veronica” ref. # 011. Medium-sized black book with 1846-1861 marked in red on the inside cover.

23FSICA. Box marked Early History, ref. # 012.2. “Third Order Regular of St. Francis in Scotland” in
Scottish Catholic Monthly, May, 1894, p. 182.

Conception. In the Beginning. Part One. (1986) Held by the Superior. Although Mr. Jeffrey handled the
transaction, it is not known where the money for this purchase came from.
in Glasgow as well as the growing influence of the Sisters. According to Magray, the education of children was the most important aspect of Sisters’ work because they could ‘reform and mould’ their young charges, something even parents and priests could not do.\textsuperscript{25} Sisters became authority figures to Catholic families which impacted devotional activities like Mass attendance, though Callum Brown points out that in the west of Scotland, Church attendance was linked to economic booms and busts.\textsuperscript{26} The growth of the convent school revealed that the middle- and upper-classes viewed the Sisters as competent educators, but it also demonstrates that these women, who promised to ‘impart a good religious and secular education to the children of such Catholic parents as are capable of affording their children that great blessing’,\textsuperscript{27} were making a significant impact because, like Ireland, the process of cultural change among Catholics in Scotland was led by the ‘wealthy and ambitious’.\textsuperscript{28}

The \textit{Catholic Times} reported that ‘a very large share’ of Catholic education was provided by the Franciscan Sisters and that education was ‘one of the strongest helps to her [Catholic Church] progress in this country’.\textsuperscript{29} The focus on the maintenance and education of women certainly existed to improve their condition, but the efforts of Sisters must also be seen as a deliberate attempt to ensure future generations of loyal and obedient Catholics. Thus, far from being powerless instruments, these Sisters showed themselves to be determined missionaries, a fact that did not escape the notice of their pupils. A card sent by the pupils of the Franciscan Sisters’ convent school in St. Lawrence’s Parish, Greenock, to the parish priest, reveals their awareness of the importance of their education:

\begin{quote}
We know the great interest you all take in us, and how very much you wish us to be good, and attentive to all our religious instructions and to all our lessons. The Sisters have told us so, and we are very sensible of it. We are very glad to be able to say to you to-day that we thank you for it, and that we will strive to be still better and more diligent.\textsuperscript{30}
\end{quote}

The Franciscan Sisters opened two more convent schools in the 1870s, one in Bothwell,

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{25}Magray, \textit{The Transforming Power}, p. 83 and 97. \\
\textsuperscript{27}CDS, 1850, p. 122. Appendix 2:1, Figure 2, shows the advert where the Sisters make this promise. \\
\textsuperscript{28}Magray, \textit{The Transforming Power}, pp. 88-89. \\
\textsuperscript{29}Catholic Times, 2 February 1877. \\
\textsuperscript{30}GAA. WD5 Condon Memoirs. Box unsorted, loose, white card inserted into notebook.
\end{flushright}
Lanarkshire, in 1873 and another at Bank House in Greenock in 1874. The Sisters of Mercy, however, were not able to open a convent school until 1867, and its first advertisement only appeared in the CDS in 1871; their financial survival was dependant upon begging, donations and baking altar breads.\(^{31}\) The delay in establishing a Mercy convent school suggests that limited numbers only permitted them to focus their energy on the parish schools. Although they had great autonomy over the running of their schools, when it came to outside funding, the Church ensured that the Sisters were at the mercy of the State. In 1856, a meeting was called to decide whether or not the Sisters should 'submit to an examination by a government inspector for the purpose of procuring a certificate qualifying them to undertake the training of pupil teachers'.\(^{32}\) The community’s Council decided against the idea, feeling that it would 'secularize such certificate mistresses and deprive the superiors of the full control over them'.\(^{33}\) However, the community received a Command Under Obedience from Bishop Murdoch ordering them to comply and allow four Choir Sisters to be examined by an inspector. Notwithstanding the prior conflicts that arose between the community and clergymen, this was a legitimate demand since government grants were subject to inspection and the Catholic education system could not afford to lose any funding.

Aside from providing the middle- and upper-class parents with a respectable alternative for their daughters’ education, convent schools were an indispensable source of revenue which helped to offset the cost of the poor parish schools. Economic necessity, therefore, required the provision of stratified institutions as a means of tapping into middle- and upper-class pockets; poverty was ubiquitous throughout the independent existence of Glasgow’s Catholic education system. The combination of both convent and parish school served three important purposes: firstly, it provided some degree of education for the children whose parents could not pay for schooling; secondly, and not necessarily the community’s aim, fee-charging schools maintained the class divisions which were often desired by those in a position to send their children to more upscale institutions; thirdly, a number of those young women educated in convent schools would form the


\(^{33}\)Ibid.
next generation of Sisters, which ensured community survival and served to cement the Church’s position in a hostile environment.

Membership with the Franciscan Sisters certainly increased after 1850 and between 1851 and 1859, 65 Sisters were professed. The growth in community numbers meant that their commitment to the parish schools could be expanded, and while the Franciscan Sisters were working in three parishes in 1850, they had expanded into five parishes and were teaching an estimated 3,570 pupils in 1860. In 1870, on the eve of the Education (Scotland) Act, 96 Sisters had been professed and approximately 68 were working in at least six parishes and teaching an estimated 4,680 children. In 1851, before the grand departure of 16 Sisters from the Mercy community, they had been in the parishes of St. Mary’s and St. Mungo’s, and although figures were recorded for St. Mungo’s, which only opened that year, roughly 400 pupils attended the St. Mary’s day and evening schools, and Sunday School attendance across the two parishes was about 1,000 children. After the loss of the majority of the community in 1851, the Sisters of Mercy struggled with the work of these parishes and their situation worsened when Sr. M. Bernard Garden, the young, Scottish-born Superior referred to in the previous chapter, was forced to return to Liverpool because her health had broken down.

Rebuilding after such an upheaval took time, but by early 1865, the Mercys were working in four parishes: St. Joseph’s, St. Mungo’s, St. Mary’s and St. Vincent of Paul’s. They taught roughly 945 pupils in their day and evening Schools and an additional 1,100 children in the Sunday

---

34FSICA. Sister Professions & Receptions.
35Appendix 3:3 displays the first teaching Sisters. CDS, 1860, pp. 81-84. These estimates are based on the statistics provided for each parish and it includes Sunday, Day and Evening schools, though for some of the schools, statistics were not provided. The parishes they taught in were: St. Andrew’s, St. Alphonsus’, St. Joseph’s, St. John’s and St. Patrick’s. Data on St. Patrick’s and St. John’s parishes come from FSICA. Unpublished Manuscript. Franciscan Sisters, pp. 38 and 40.
36CDS, 1870, pp. 91-97. They taught in St. Andrew’s, St. Alphonsus’, St. Mary’s, St. Mungo’s, St. Vincent of Paul’s and St. Francis’ parishes. FSICA. Sister Professions & Receptions. The estimate of Sisters is based on professions during or before 1870 and those not recorded as having died or left before 1870.
37CDS, 1851, pp. 88-89.
38Sisters of Mercy, Bermondsey, Mother Mary Bernard Garden. Paper produced for a congregational meeting, 15 November 2003. Her activities in Scotland did not stop here, before her death in 1893, she founded five Mercy houses in Scotland: Dornie (1870), Elgin (1871), Fort Augustus (1872), Keith (1873) and Tomintoul (1880).
Schools, they gave up St. Mary's later that year because the community had been struck by too many illnesses and deaths. In 1867 they opened a small middle-class day school at their new convent on Garnethill as well as a new poor school in St. Aloysius' Parish, where they had been invited by the Jesuits. In 1868, 14 Sisters ran the schools in St. Joseph's and St. Mungo's, but they had been replaced in St. Mary's and St. Vincent of Paul's by the Franciscan Sisters because they could not provide enough Sisters for these parishes. In 1870, on the eve of the Education (Scotland) Act, there were 13 Sisters working in the parishes of St. Joseph's, St. Mungo's and St. Aloysius' and they were teaching an estimated 1,560 children in day, evening and Sunday schools.

It is difficult to track exactly which schools were run by which community because schools were frequently swapped between them on account of a few reasons. Sisters may have been requested, by a priest or bishop, to run a school in another parish, there may have been a shortage of Sisters, on account of illness and death, which meant that they could not cope with the demand, or there could have been territorial disputes; all three of these factors were present among the communities in Glasgow. For example, when the Sisters of Mercy moved to Grafton Street to serve the St. Joseph's Parish schools in 1860, where the Mercy community was actually to find the most stability in Glasgow, a conflict arose because that parish was understood to have been Franciscan territory. Despite this prior 'claim', the Franciscan Sisters turned over their schools, but the fact that the Mercy decision to move into St. Joseph's parish was unpopular was noted because their
annalist recorded that they had made an ‘unpleasant impression’ on both the Franciscan Sisters and Bishop Smith, who had called their act ‘an ungracious one towards the Franciscan community’. The workload of the Franciscan Sisters was heavy, especially since they were also responsible for the Abercromby Street Orphanage during the early 1860s, but when they took over the St. Mary’s Industrial School (girls), they relinquished control of the orphanage to the Sisters of Mercy. Similarly, when the St. Mary’s Parish School (girls) grew too much for the Sisters of Mercy, on account of illness and the five deaths that occurred between 1862 and 1866, the facility was transferred to the Franciscan Sisters. The first instance of a school being transferred to secular teachers was in 1869 when the Franciscan Sisters resigned charge of the St. Vincent’s Parish School (girls).

The problem of simply not having enough hands to do the work was an important concern and a shortage of teaching Sisters could mean that others from distant communities were called on for help. In 1862, the Franciscan Sisters recalled some of their number from Inverness as the increase in pupil-borders was more than the existing Sisters could handle. A quick summary comes from the Council minutes:

...there was no great necessity for the Sisters in Inverness as the small numbers attending these schools could easily be taught by one secular teacher, while in Glasgow, the health of the best and most efficient Sisters was breaking down under the double amount of labour they were obliged to undertake.

Nevertheless, many women persevered and accepted it as part of their vocation. Often, communities recognised that they were viewed more as resources than as partners in the process of community reform and thus challenged those who attempted to take advantage. Sr. M. de Sales Dend, a Mercy Superior who provided stability during the 1860s, came up against Father Forbes, who had yet again attempted to push the Sisters too hard. Writing to Forbes, she explained that too much was being demanded of them:

---


FSICA. Box marked “Early History” ref. # 012.2. Minutes of Council, 1 March 1862, p. 38.
We are now so reduced in numbers, that we find ourselves quite unable for work of the 3 schools...having only eight working hands two of these sickly, we find it impossible to go on with all.48

Sectarianism, work-related pressures and illness took their toll on Glasgow's teaching communities and working under threat of illness or even death during disease peaks did discourage many from continuing with the religious life path, as evidenced by the previously identified desertion trend among Sisters of Mercy. Nevertheless, the Sisters continued with their mission and succeeded in creating a foundation for Catholic education in Glasgow.

Anti-Conventualism

Despite setbacks, both congregations had persevered and experienced growth between 1847 and 1872 which represented a success for women religious and Catholicism in Glasgow. The growth of Catholic education itself was a tender issue, but it was complicated by society's apprehension of the women who administered a large portion of it.49 Anti-Catholicism and anti-conventualism were widespread in nineteenth-century Britain; Sisters provoked fear not only because they were the Church's most successful missionaries, but also because they were women living beyond the reach of most men.

Many of Glasgow's citizens were hostile to the notion of Catholicism having the means and the manpower, or in this case, woman-power, to establish roots. In the nineteenth century, Presbyterianism and Catholicism were patriarchal, but those Presbyterian women, who desired a greater personal dedication to God, had to adjust their ambitions to complement the dictated familial ideal because institutions like religious congregations did not exist. Also, according to MacDonald, female ordination was avoided on a practical level because Scottish divinity faculties

48SMCA, Glasgow. Names of Sisters and Blue, hard-covered four-ringed binder containing correspondence. Letter from Mother M. de Sales Dend to Father Peter Forbes, 30 July 1864. Originally from Edinburgh, she was elected Superior in 1864, 1867, 1877 and finally in 1880. She died in 1897, aged 63 years.
49 Rene Kollar has linked much of the published criticism about convent schools in England to the French or continental roots of many of the congregations. French convent schools were portrayed as a threat to England's Protestant character because they undermined British patriotism during its great age of empire; the French, though no longer a military threat, remained an ideological enemy. “Foreign and Catholic: A Plea to Protestant Parents on the Dangers of Convent Education in Victorian England” in History of Education. Vol. 31, No. 4 (July, 2002), pp. 340 and 343-345.
were closed to women until 1898, but ideologically, female ministers would threaten to shatter the 'pater familias' image.\textsuperscript{50} It was believed that women would jeopardise their 'reputation[s] and respectability'\textsuperscript{51} if they were to join in with all the politics and debate involved with running a church. Indeed, many Roman Catholics subscribed to similar opinions, but for those Catholic women, who felt called to dedicate their lives to God without having to tend to a husband and children at the same time, the option was there in the form of religious congregations.

Upon their arrival in Scotland, both the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy were confronted by the harassment and bigotry which became inescapable facts of community life. In doing what they had been brought to Glasgow to accomplish, the Sisters made adjustments to suit their needs in a hostile environment. The 'street costume'\textsuperscript{52} adopted by the Franciscan Sisters was a straw bonnet and cloak to disguise the fact that they were Catholic nuns:

> To avoid Protestant hostility, it was thought advisable that the Sisters should disguise as far as may be, the religious dress, but they were easily recognized, struck at, mobbed, insulted, and [had] offensive things thrown at them and had their ears assailed by offensive epithets, as they went and came, to and from, their schools.\textsuperscript{53}

The practice of 'dressing down' was maintained until 1896, when it was decided at Chapter by 'a large majority' that the outside dress for choir Sisters should be changed to a 'long circular cloak and no bonnet'.\textsuperscript{54} The Sisters of Mercy 'had a good deal of that low bigotry to endure' when they went out on visitation and therefore were instructed to be sure of where they were going before they left and to go out only in pairs as 'the greatest caution and gravity shall be observed [when] passing through the streets'.\textsuperscript{55} At times, they were targeted by children who would shout: 'a rope, a rope to hang the Pope',\textsuperscript{56} but an incident in Lanark, which involved the Sisters of Charity, deserves a special mention because of its severity. On 13 November 1871,

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{50}Ibid., p. 172. \textit{Pater Familias} referred to him as the breadwinner and educated head of the household.
\textsuperscript{51}Ibid., p. 178. For information on nonconformist female preachers read pp. 178-187.
\textsuperscript{52}FSICA. Records of Chapter Gatherings, entry for 16 July 1896. Held by the Superior.
\textsuperscript{53}FSICA. Box marked "Beginnings and Early History" ref # 012.1. "Franciscan Convent of the Immaculate Conception Glasgow. The Establishment of our Foundation", p. 5.
\textsuperscript{54}FSICA. Records of Chapter Gatherings, entry for 16 July 1896.
\textsuperscript{55}SMCA, Glasgow. Rules and Constitutions of the Religious Called Sisters of Mercy Part 1\textsuperscript{st} Glasgow 1849. 3\textsuperscript{rd} Chapter "Of Visitation of the Sick", 6\textsuperscript{th} Rule.
\textsuperscript{56}MICA. \textit{Annals.} Sisters of Mercy, Limerick 1838-1859. Transcribed from the original hand-written Annals by Sr. Mary Attracta Gavan, 1994, p. 216.
\end{flushleft}
while two Sisters were out walking, the Wellgate Street baker, Mr. Robert Yuile, shot one of them and although the shooting was deemed accidental by police, questions were raised about his character since he was known as an ‘awful drunkard [who] was always miscalling the Sisters’. These incidents emphasise the danger that women religious faced as well as the intensity of anti-Catholic and anti-convantal feelings in nineteenth-century Scotland.

Probably due to the enclosure of the female contemplative orders, Sisters and nuns were often regarded as mysterious women and wild fantasies such as the Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk abounded. This lurid melodrama, which was published in 1836, fictionally detailed the lives of young, innocent women, sexually predatory priests and cruel Superiors in a Quebec convent, and was engineered for pornographic and anti-Catholic purposes. The Monk story was both erotic and bigoted, and combined tales of pregnancy, infanticide, greed and murder to create a delusive impression of convent life. In Glasgow, indiscreet priests were chastised and closely monitored by both Bishops and convent Superiors and in the late 1850s, Bishop Smith wrote a scathing report of his colleague, Dr. Charles Conway, who was a priest at St. Mungo’s Parish until 1861 when he disappeared from the pages of the CDS:

...full of vanity - extravagantly fond of females - This I have known for six months or more, some of his escapades having occurred before my charge [Smith described his harassment of parishioners and mill girls and continued]...He requires a sharp eye and tight rein. I regard him as at least one third idiotic. I have had repeated complaints from the convents (of which I have warned him) of the scandal his familiarity of speech and manner with nuns have given to the religious.

However, Monk’s story was anti-convantal propaganda, and though initially published in the United States, its popularity in Scotland led to the publication of numerous editions in Glasgow, Edinburgh and Paisley. William Makepeace Thackeray’s The Irish Sketch Book, first published

58 SCA, Oban Letters, OLA/6/1. Alexander Smith: Report on 'clergy and convents' in his mission. No date, probably between 1858-1860. Conway was ordained in 1857 and was probably very young. His absence from the Directory might suggest that he left the priesthood. His antics were directed primarily at the Sisters of Mercy, who worked in that parish. CDS, 1859, pp. 94 and 118.
59 The National Library of Scotland alone has nine copies from publishers in Glasgow, Edinburgh, Paisley and London.
in London in 1843, represents yet another piece of anti-convent propaganda. In the book, which contained an account of a visit to a Ursuline convent in Blackrock, Ireland, in the summer of 1842, he remarked that 'was not this a great privilege for a heretic?...to see the pious ladies in their own retreat was quite a novelty'. It is likely that Thackeray read Monk's book since the way in which he described the Sister who gave him the tour was strikingly similar:

Here I was, in a room with a real live nun, pretty and pale - I wonder has she any of her sisterhood immured inoubliettes down below, is her poor little weak, delicate body scarred all over with scourgings, iron-collars, hair-shirts? What has she done for her dinner today? 

He concluded by arguing that the whole idea of convents and nuns was wrong and compared the vows of a nun to sutteeism, an historic Hindu tradition wherein widows burned themselves with their dead husbands on funeral pyres. Some of his recollections, like his visit to the Sisters' cells seem questionable, but Sr. Ursula Clarke, archivist for the community, confirmed Thackeray's 1842 visit and had no doubt that he was given an extensive tour. She offered that his negative reflections were probably the result of his inability to 'understand their lifestyle' on account of his 'almost alien background'.

In 1852, Lewis Hippolytus Joseph Tonna, a naval schoolmaster and 'religious controversialist' advocated government inspection of convents to prevent young women from being lured behind convent walls. While he believed that any convent-inspection legislation must respect the 'rights of conscience' of those within, he favoured the precedents established for the inspection of lunatic asylums as a guide for convent inspections since he saw them as the most comparable

---

61Ibid., p. 316. For a brief description of the Blackrock convent see Murphy, Terra Incognita, pp. 32-38.
63Personal written communication between the researcher and Sr. Ursula Clark, Archivist, Ursuline Convent, Blackrock, Ireland, 27 November 2002.
64Ibid.
institutions:

In Lunatic Asylums persons are detained against their own will, and the law allows it for their own good; but careful means are provided to ascertain that no person has been placed there from improper motives, and that none who ought to leave them are detained at all.67

The late 1860s and 1870s was a period of 'unrelenting hostility to convents'68 across Britain. A chief instigator was Charles Newdegate (1816-1887), a Conservative MP for North Warwickshire, and while his actions were more obtrusive in England, his impact was felt in Scotland by both the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy. Newdegate is portrayed as a bigoted, tenacious, politician whose preoccupation with convents and the thought of young women taking 'irrevocable vows of obedience and [having] to immure their bodies within red-brick convent walls' had an immediate audience because of his wealthy background.69 He and others, such as William Murphy (1834-1872),70 were desperate for convent inspections. Murphy had declared convents to be 'societies of misery'71 and is described by one historian as a 'peripatetic ultra-Protestant zealot'72 as well as a 'rascally firebrand'.73 In 1870, Prime Minister William Gladstone (1809-1898) approved the creation of a House of Commons Select Committee on the Law Respecting Conventual and Monastic Institutions to examine the property and financial records of religious congregations across Britain. In Scotland, the North British Daily Mail reported that all property held by or in trust for the Franciscan Sisters and Sisters of Mercy in Glasgow, and the Ursulines of Jesus in Edinburgh, was subjected to examination, but in the

---

67Ibid.
68Murphy, Terra Incognita, p. 370.
70Gilbert A. Cahill, “Irish Catholicism and English Toryism” in The Review of Politics. Vol. 18 (1957), pp. 62-76. Murphy was successful in stoking convent fear, and used the press to aid his anti-Catholic campaign. The Times’ proprietor, between 1847 and 1894, was John Walter III, a major critic of the Roman Church, who used his position to become a vicious spin-doctor of anti-Catholic rhetoric. See Klaus, The Pope, the Protestants..., p. 221 and pp. 219-137 for a useful discussion about the press in the 1850s.
71Arnstein, Protestant Versus Catholic, p. 95.
72E. D. Steele, “The Irish Presence in the North of England, 1850-1914” in Northern History, Vol. 12 (1976), p. 232. Steele noted how he ‘alienated’ the middle-classes by the violence he often provoked. Murphy died as a result of injuries received from ‘infuriated Irishmen’.
73Quoted in Arnstein, Protestant Versus Catholic, p. 95. Roger Swift’s mention of Murphy’s visits to Wolverhampton (1867) and North Shields (1869) highlights the riotous commotion and violence his speeches were successful at provoking. Docs. 17.4 and 17.5 in Irish Migrants in Britain, 1815-1914: A Documentary History. (Cork: Cork University Press, 2002), pp. 136-138.
end, 'the unanimous committee report...had clearly presented the Roman Catholic religious orders as victims rather than villains'.

As well as convent inspections, Newdegate had proposed a government-funded emigration scheme for ex-nuns, claiming that ostracisation by families was likely for those who left the religious life. The instances of this happening, though probable for some, was unlikely on a large scale, but even so, why turn to parliamentary-assisted emigration? The humiliation would not have been so great as to convince former Sisters that emigration was the only option, and since choir Sisters in Britain almost always required a dowry to enter, that money would leave with them if they chose to withdraw, so financial hardship was also unlikely. Perhaps Newdegate was uncomfortable with women who deviated from the accepted, submissive role and attempted to use his position as an MP to control them. His personal motives, either for reasons of anti-Catholicism or misogyny, will probably never be understood, but they remain curious.

It seems that much of the debate surrounding convents was actually about who or what should have control over the lives of Sisters and nun. It seemed impossible for people like Tonna, Newdegate and Murphy to believe that young women had entered the religious life of their own free will. Britain's intense curiosity with convents is highlighted in Walter Arnstein's article, "The Great Victorian Convent Case", which focusses on the events in a Mercy Convent in Hull that attracted the nation's attention in 1869. It was alleged, by Sr. M. Scholastica (Saurin), that her Superior (Starr) had been 'wrongfully and maliciously conspiring' to push her from the convent by dispensing old clothes, assigning demeaning and labourious tasks and by giving her rancid food; the irony of this case is that Saurin had actually wanted to stay in the convent, not escape from it. Permitting a Superior, who had been elected by women, to exercise control seems to have been too uncomfortable for many. Reports of the Saurin v. Starr case emphasised the

---


75Murphy, Terra Incognita, p. 6.

76Tonna, Nuns and Nunneries, p. 308-309.

'cruel' Superior and papers like the *Times* worked diligently to provoke negative opinions of nuns and convents, even going so far as to warn young girls that the appearance of convent life as a 'splendid scheme' was nothing more than a farce, and *Vanity Fair* printed a drawing of Starr which depicted her as witch-like with a long, pointed nose and glaring eyes. Public interest in the case was intense as spectators packed the courtroom and foyer to 'cheer or hoot at trial participants'. *Punch*'s poem, *Chant of the Convent Bell*, similarly scornful, further enhanced negative interest in the case.

Widespread curiosity was thus prone to degeneration and one contemporary observer had remarked that 'If respectable Protestants want to know about Convents, let them enquire of their Catholic neighbours who were educated in Convents, and who send their children to be educated in those sacred Retreats'. A convent's physical structure and location was often imposing, with many being situated on hills surrounded by perimeter walls or iron gates; a deliberate attempt to express the power of Roman Catholicism and female celibacy. For many, convents were foreign concepts and threatened the subordinate femininity of Protestant women that had been viciously protected and manipulated. Susan Mumm, an expert on Anglican sisterhoods in England, explained that Bishops in the Church of England were troubled by Anglican sisterhoods because their elections, termed positions, self-financing and unofficial organisation contradicted the notion of Bishoprics, which were appointed, life tenure positions ruled by the Archbishop of Canterbury and Parliament. Mumm suggests that many bishops were critical because they were confused about how to govern these sisterhoods and did not know whether to see them as models of the family or models of the army, the latter was deemed inappropriate for women. Protestant women did undertake works similar to Sisters and a number of Protestant women's organisations

---

78Ibid., p. 48.
79Ibid., p. 47.
80Ibid., p. 48.
were involved with temperance, education and abstinence campaigns in Scotland between 1830 and 1930. The evangelical spirit of 'commitment and action', which had become dominant in Scotland by 1834, elevated the 'moral worth' of women and provided them with new outlets for involvement, though not outwith their 'ordained sphere'. The idea of women moving and working outside of the 'domestic' realm was still too intimidating for most men and women. This patriarchal comfort zone, which was well-established in Scotland, was felt to be endangered by Sisters who seemed far too independent and Catholic for many.

Jo Ann Kay McNamara makes the point in *Sisters in Arms* that the reception of novices were sometimes made public events as a way of soothing public fears of nuns and convents, and this was indeed the case in Glasgow since both the Sisters of Mercy and the Franciscan Sisters opened reception ceremonies to the public. Reporting on a ceremony for the Franciscan Sisters in 1850, the first to take place in Scotland since the Reformation, the *Glasgow Herald* adopted a tolerant stance:

> Our fathers would have looked upon the making of nuns in this city with perfect horror and we do not like it yet; but as crowds of Irish have settled amongst us during the last 40 years, and brought a devotion to the Roman Catholic faith along with them, no one is entitled to disturb them in the exercise of their religion so long as these are orderly and peaceful.

The following year, the *Herald* announced the profession of eight 'young ladies' and although describing the ceremony as 'one of a highly imposing character', the paper provided a detailed description of what everyone was wearing, how they walked down the aisle and who was in attendance. This ceremony opened the religious life, if only for a moment, to the public. The Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy endured the growing pains of establishing themselves

---

65 Ibid.
66 McNamara, *Sisters in Arms*, pp. 569.
67 *Glasgow Herald*, 12 April 1850. This ceremony was also described in M. V. K.'s (A Nun of the Third Order), *Seventh Centenaiy of the Franciscan Order in England*, 1224-1924. (London: St. Antony's Press, 1924), p. 23.
68 *Glasgow Herald*, 21 July 1851. Aside from the initial three women whose reception was announced in the 12 April 1850 issue, five others joined during the course of the year. These women were Sr. M. Isabella (Ellen) Barry from Cork, Sr. M. Hyacintha Condon from Cork, Sr. M. Joseph (Joanna) Fitzgerald from Co. Cork, Sr. M. Aloysius McIntosh from Jamaica, Sr. M. Angela (Hannah) and Sr. M. Catherine McSwinney from Ireland and Sr. M. Teresa (Mary) Robertson from Aberdeen.
in an impoverished, hostile community, and in many ways, they cleared a path for the third educational community in Glasgow, the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, who will be more fully examined in the following chapter.

Conclusion

The Sisters were dedicated to the moral and social condition of women, but they were also conscious of the need to expand and consolidate the status and power of the Church. Since most households during the mid-to-late nineteenth century were run by women, the objective of the Sisters was straightforward: if women were provided with an education, where the results were visible to themselves, they would be more likely to impart a healthy attitude towards schooling to their children.\(^9\) Certainly this evolution did not happen overnight, as will be seen in the following chapter with regard to the mandatory attendance policies, but there was improvement. John McCaffrey argues that the ‘lack of a tradition of formal school attendance and the numerous economic hardships’\(^9\) impeded the educational and social development of the Irish Catholic migrants. The focus on female education not only extended the authority of the Church, but it also succeeded in giving women more self-confidence; education was, and remains, an empowering process and those women who went on to become teachers and university graduates, and who will be mentioned in the following chapter, are excellent examples of this point.

---

\(^9\)Laura S. Strumingher’s study of French primary education between 1830 and 1880 also shows that ‘parents who had submitted to some process of disciplined and conscious learning were more likely respond to further training in later life for themselves and their children’. *What Were Little Girls and Boys Made Of?* (Albany: State University of New York, 1983), p. 19.

IV. Impact and Action: 
Sisters and the 1872 Education (Scotland) Act

While you would multiply the secular teachers, I would multiply the religious teachers; while you would train a large staff of pupil teachers, I would train a large staff of religious novices. While you would build training schools, I would build convents...The Catholics will get a more efficient education, a better education, both for this world and the next from my plan - and they will get it all at the same time, more, much more economically, more generally, more satisfactorily and absolutely independently!¹

This was one of Bishop Smith’s three draft attempts to fend off the suggestion by T. W. Allies, Secretary of the Catholic Poor School Committee,² that the State be given greater involvement in Catholic education. The period between 1847-1872 saw the Catholic Church struggle to survive and expand in a hostile nation; it was embattled in a war for souls. Expanding its support base and moulding it into an obedient following had been essential to the survival of Catholicism in Glasgow, and the employment of Sister-teachers was the best way to accomplish this. The provision of an independent education system was desired to serve the interests of the Church and to improve the lot of Glasgow’s Catholics. The second chapter provided an intimate introduction to three female congregations and outlined the expansion of Catholic education. The material presented on the relationships within and between the communities helped to place their early educational work into a wider context by illuminating the difficulties associated with establishing themselves and Catholic schools in Glasgow. Fundamentally, these congregations provided security for the Catholic education system so that it was in a better position to remain separate when the Education (Scotland) Act was passed in 1872.

This chapter will show that between 1872 and 1910, just as in the formative period of the mid-nineteenth century, the teaching Sisters were instrumental in securing the survival of Glasgow’s

¹SCA, OL2/86/10. Letter from Bishop Smith to Mr. T. W. Allies on the subject of education by Religious - with account of progress, 28 October 1856.
²Francis J. O’Hagan has a good description of the Catholic Poor School Committee in Change, Challenge and Achievement: A study of the development of Catholic education in Glasgow in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. (Glasgow: St. Andrew’s College, 1996), Chapter Two.
Catholic educational system as the century drew to a close. Hamish Fraser and Irene Maver have identified the 'dual threat of evangelicalism and secularism' as the reason behind the Catholic Church's decision to opt out of a State education system. Catholics were, however, involved with the Glasgow School Board since it had jurisdiction over their schools. The 1872 Education (Scotland) Act placed all educational matters under government regulation, and, as a matter of law, Catholic schools had to adhere to the Act despite their chosen independence.

The implications of the 1872 Act and how the Sisters worked within this legislation will be assessed. Special attention will also be paid to the clause which, when first introduced in 1873, attempted to make attendance mandatory for children between the ages of five and thirteen. Finally, the financial benefits associated with teaching congregations will be considered because although each community was offered some sort of financial assistance by the diocese, they often had their own resources and could put money back into the system, though the Sisters of Mercy tended to be plagued by financial hardship. Teaching Sisters were cheaper than lay teachers and often took care of their own recruitment and training; the Sisters of Notre Dame, while responsible for training their own Sisters, turned out trained and certificated lay Catholic teachers. Organising the chapter in this way highlights the implications of State educational regulation and demonstrates that these three congregations significantly aided Catholic education and community progression in Glasgow. At times, material from France, Canada and the United States will be incorporated to illustrate important cross-cultural similarities. Teaching congregations in those countries also struggled with what was perceived to be ever-increasing State interference.

At Long Last: Education Legislation for Scotland

Ireland had been well ahead of England, Wales and Scotland when the National System of Education was introduced there in 1831. Parliament only provided an Education Act for England and Wales nearly thirty years later in 1870. Two years later, the Education (Scotland) Act was passed, and it came into effect in March 1873. This new educational system was controlled by the Scotch Education Department, but its president, vice-president, and permanent secretary were

---

shared with England and Wales. This arrangement lasted until 1885, when Sir Henry Craik (1846-1927) was appointed Secretary of the Scotch Education Department, and at that point, according to Alexander Morgan’s account of Scottish educational history, Scotland was finally ‘free to pursue her own educational policy’.

In many ways, the Scottish Act closely resembled that of England and Wales, but there were two fundamental differences. Firstly, the concept of elementary education did not carry the same weight in Scotland as it did in England. Elementary education was an ‘alien’ notion in Scotland and the 1872 Act was seen very much as ‘education for the people’, offering a ‘commonality of experience’. Secondly, the Preamble to the Act, which concerned the ‘use and wont in the matter of religious instruction’, challenged the proposed idea of a non-denominational system of education; England’s Act carried no such provision.

Between 1872 and 1885 the Church of Scotland’s power and influence was dwindling because of four main reasons. Firstly, the Bothwell Case of 1793 saw a school master defeat the Church of Scotland in a court ruling which found that he could teach despite his inability to speak Latin, a skill the Church demanded. Secondly, the Religious Census of 1851 revealed that only 19.7 per cent of the 60.7 per cent of Church-goers attended Church of Scotland services. Thirdly, the 1861 Parochial and Burgh Schoolmasters (Scotland) Act permitted a schoolmaster to forego the previously required Confession of Faith. Finally, the 1843 Disruption shook the foundation of the established Presbyterian Church and produced the Free Church, under Thomas Chalmers (1780-1847). A published history of St. Margaret’s Convent, Edinburgh, mentioned the fragility of the General Assembly:

Oh! You have no idea how fast the whole church machinery is

---


Ibid., p. 170.


Ibid., pp. 44-47.
going to pieces here; the incoming General Assembly is expected to be a most stormy one. Dr. Inglis is dead, and Dr. Chalmers is done for; he had a stroke of palsy some time ago, from the effects of which he never will recover so as to be himself again. What do you think he did in one of his last theological lectures at the college here? After a great deal of violent declamation against the Catholics, he maintained that they did not believe in the divinity of Jesus Christ. A Catholic gentleman, a great admirer of his, and one of his particular friends... asked him... how a man of his sense could condone to repeat such "abominable nonsense,"... "My good friend," said Chalmers, "I have a difficult task to fulfil this morning; very few persons are now disposed to support our Establishment, and the fact is, people must sometimes do the best they can."

The Disruption of 1843 made educational matters even more complicated as competition between the Church of Scotland and the Free Church, over which one would wield greater control, impeded reform and development. The State was uncomfortable with 'encroach[ing] upon the Church's territory' and therefore sat on the fence about religious instruction. Many Scots favoured a system free of religious control and the Preamble, also known as the Gordon Amendment, had to be carried by English votes as the majority of Scottish members were against the amendment.

Looking beyond the Churches for a moment, the 1872 Act was an important watershed in the development of Scottish elementary education because it extended education to people of all classes and made it a 'commonality of experience'. It mandated the first in a series of compulsory regulations and criteria for all elementary schools, regardless of denomination. In

---

10 Revival of Conventual Life in Scotland. History of St. Margaret's Convent, Edinburgh, the first Religious House founded in Scotland since the so-called Reformation; and the autobiography of the first religious Sister Agnes Xavier Trail. (Edinburgh, 1880), pp. 26-27.


13 Roughly 70 per cent of the Act was concerned with financial and managerial concerns. Winters, The Empire of Learning, p. 62.

14 Ibid.

15 Ibid., p. 61. Also Andrew Douglas', Church and School, p. 88. He refers to the 1872 Act as the 'beginning of a new era'.
terms of Catholic education, the Act forced the decision of whether to join the State system or remain separate; no doubt a vacillating issue for Glasgow’s poorer Catholics, who were required to support, financially, this separate system. Unfortunately, no records or statements have been found which represent their opinions and it appears as though little public debate took place over the decision to join or opt out. The threat of proselytisation and the need to maintain influence over its followers prompted the clergy and community leaders to retain a separate system of Catholic education, in spite of the economic strain it would cause. The fear that discrimination and prejudice would be carried out within State schools was justified. Callum Brown, a scholar of church history in Scotland, explained that the State take-over of schools allowed evangelicals ‘to use the ballot paper as a sacred trust’ and that ‘teaching in state schools sustained a strongly religious character well into the twentieth century’.16 Although there was the suggestion that the state schools would be non-denominational in virtue, Brown has shown that this could not be guaranteed.

In 1873, when the Act took effect, the State’s responsibility for standards and requirements was funnelled through School Boards, which took over from the old parish and burgh schools. They were responsible for the overall governance of education within a particular boundary.17 James Roxburgh, educational historian, saw the new School Board as a positive improvement for education in the city because, prior to its establishment, Glasgow had the ‘worst social and educational standards anywhere in Scotland’.18

The School Board’s priority was to evaluate and improve the existing school-house facilities and introduce mandatory attendance for all children between five and thirteen.19 However, convincing poorer parents that schooling was more important than sending their children to work was difficult, especially since child labour contributed to family incomes. The mandatory attendance clause was also problematic because it conflicted with people’s everyday culture, contradicting

17There were 12 educational districts of Glasgow: Anderston, Milton, St. Rollox, Dennistoun, Blythswood, Central, Calton, Camlachie, Bridgeton, Tradeston, Gorbals and Hutchesontown. Winters, The Empire, Appendix 22, p. 351.
the traditional Scottish norm of keeping children at home until the age of six or seven; less than one half of five year-olds in Glasgow attended school and so mandatory attendance was problematic. It eventually 'passed into custom', 20 but it has been suggested that a later starting age would have encouraged children to remain in school longer because 'until 1901 the law allowed them to take up full-time work once a specified standard had been reached. 21

Roxburgh’s detailed study on attendance in Glasgow’s schools emphasised that the mandatory attendance policy alone did not solve the truancy problem. Modelled on England’s 1876 Day Industrial School initiative, authorities in Glasgow implemented a partnership between its School Board and Delinquency Board in 1878 which enabled the authorities and parents to commit children to the care of Day Industrial Schools, like the St. Mary’s Industrial Schools. The two advantages of these schools were that poor children received food and clothing and women were the primary employees. The latter was a deliberate policy since women were more successful at subduing rambunctious and difficult children. 22

While the post-1872 period was one of progress for Scottish education, Catholic schools were unable to experience it on the same level as the State-supported schools. The 1872 Act represented a threat to the stability of Catholic educational influence, and Church leaders feared not only proselytisation if children were educated in state schools, but they feared a loss of influence. Retaining control over education was a way to ensure influence over its people and support for its dogma. Catholicism had struggled to reestablish itself in Scotland, and this achievement was largely due to education. Charles Eyre, Bishop of Glasgow between 1869-1878 before being elevated to Archbishop in 1878 when Scotland’s Roman Catholic Hierarchy was restored, advocated a Catholic system, and his desire for a Teacher Training College and his efforts to recruit the Sisters of Notre Dame, made the Catholic system more legitimate. Through education, the Catholic Church was working to redress the dominance that Protestantism had exhibited in nineteenth-century Scotland, and in the centuries since the Reformation. This point was illustrated in an 1851 issue of the Catholic publication, Free Press, when the opening of St.

21 Ibid., p. 230.
Mungo’s Catholic School was used as an opportunity for Catholics to celebrate the reclamation of that sacred space, close to Glasgow Cathedral:

The Rev. Chairman congratulated the Catholics of the Townhead district ‘at great expense to themselves, they had erected [a building] for the noble purpose of education’...in the ‘bygone days it had belonged to the Catholics of Glasgow,’ thanking God that it belonged to them again...they had ‘proved to the world how much they valued education’...

Education was an important proselytisation tool for both denominations, but less so for the Catholic Church before the 1880s. Poorer Catholics were often targeted by missionaries, such as Rev. Dr. Robert Buchanan, a leading Free Church Evangelical and ‘protégé of Thomas Chalmers’. His belief that ‘disseminating the advantages of a scriptural education’ to the lower classes, was part of the broader movement to improve their morality and contribution to society. Buchanan’s principles echoed those of Chalmers’, which advocated Christian education as the cure for ‘destitution and demoralization’. Aggressive missionary activity was undertaken by other denominations as well, and Rev. John Maclaren (1826-1859) was the chief organiser of the United Presbyterian Mission Church in Cowcaddens. Educated at the University of Glasgow and Cambridge, he was described as a man with ‘decidedly...Calvinistic’ beliefs and whose work consisted of ‘daily visiting, in the lanes and closes and all kinds of holes and corners, persons who had to be pulled out of the stiff mire of their carelessness and sin’.

Peter Hillis’ article on education and evangelisation in Glasgow illuminates a Presbyterian
perspective. There was a genuine concern for spiritual well being and it was thought that the
'remedy for the problems of poverty, intemperance, disaffection and crime was to evangelise the
masses [therefore complying] with Christ's instruction to spread His word'. Hillis explains that
Presbyterians viewed Catholicism as one of Glasgow's five main social problems, and so launched
efforts to convert people from 'Romanism' primarily through education. Similarly, education
became the counter measure of Glasgow's Catholic Church as religious teaching congregations
were recruited to foster Catholic loyalty and 'reclaim [the] Irish immigrants...[who might
otherwise be] permanently lost to the Church'. After 1872, School Boards 'eventually
established a virtual monopoly of elementary education' and according to James Roxburgh, they
were dominated by ministers from the Church of Scotland and the Free Church. A Protestant
ethos was maintained and T. A. Fitzpatrick argues that while the School Board was free to
'approve of Catholic or Protestant instruction in the schools, in practice it was a Protestant system
that emerged'. Supporting primary evidence from the 1847 Wellington Street United
Presbyterian Church Missionary Report revealed that schooling was used to expose children to
Protestantism. A teacher had remarked:

The grand object contemplated in the instruction of the school...was not simply to teach neglected children to read, write,
sew, etc.; it does this only as a mean to an end. While the instruction usually communicated in an elementary school are duly
attended to, the knowledge of Jesus Christ, as the saviour and friend of sinners, is made the grand and constant theme.

31 Peter Hillis, "Education and Evangelisation, Presbyterian Missions in Mid-Nineteenth Century
Dublin slums is useful comparative material. Despite the small number of Protestants in Dublin, missionary
and charity work was widespread. Dublin Slums 1800-1925: A Study in Urban Geography. (Dublin: Irish

32 Ibid., pp. 51 and 54.

33 Sheridan Gilley, "The Roman Catholic Church and the Nineteenth-Century Irish Diaspora" in
which Catholic children were exposed in a Protestant country'. FSIC Archives, Glasgow. Box marked "Mother
Adelaide and Mother Veronica" ref. # 011. Medium-sized black book, 1846-1861 marked in red on the inside
cover.

34 Anderson, Education and the Scottish, p. 224.

35 Glasgow's first School Board had 15 members including two priests, six ministers, and an
Orangeman. The Episcopal Church also remained outside of the state system of education and provided its

36 T. A. Fitzpatrick, Catholic Secondary Education in South-West Scotland: Its contribution to the

37 Quoted in Hillis, "Education and Evangelisation", p. 54.
Although School Boards assumed control over educational matters, church interference could still be felt because the Boards were elected bodies, and many standing for election were ministers or priests; sectarianism had found a new venue. In Glasgow, while Catholics were given representation, it was not proportional and often priests were elected as the Catholic members. In 1873, three Catholic priests ran for and were elected to the School Board: Alexander Munro with 50,331 votes, Val Chisholm with 49,558 votes and Francis Kerr with 46,225 votes. The idea of Roman Catholics occupying roles in public administrative positions troubled many Protestants since in their eyes, as representatives of the Pope, the clergy stopped the Catholic people from having a voice.

Groups like the Knoxites, a Glaswegian band of ultra-Protestants, were particularly angered by Catholic clerical representation. The confraternity took their name from John Knox, father of Scotland’s Reformation, and declared themselves to be a ‘patriotic effort to place the dupes of the Sinful Man [Catholics] some grades nearer their deserved zero all over the land’. Their main objective was to eliminate Catholic representation on the School Board and place ‘three or five Protestants at the head of the Poll at the School Board election of 1882’. They relied upon anti-Irish sentiment, prominent at the time because of Home Rule activities in Ireland, to stimulate support for their cause. Such sentiments were expressed in a published history of Glasgow in 1882 which declared that ‘there can be no question that the great influx of Irish, who now form about a sixth of the entire population has had a deteriorating result upon the social and educational statistics of the population’. According to groups like the Knoxites, Catholic interference with education produced disastrous consequences:

They can and do, seriously interfere with our schools, whereas we cannot in any ways affect theirs save by sending thereto children found playing about streets and fields, which is done at great
yearly expense. In one of their schools children were trained to sing "God Save Ireland", a Fenian ditty... The British people paid for children being taught to hate the British Government. Papists have affairs so admirably managed that their schools are safe centres of sedition, and, best of all, they are subsidised for doing it.43

The Catholics needed to be involved with the School Board because education was moving forward in Scotland, with or without their input, so it was better if there was Catholic input. The compulsory clause is one example where the State needed Catholic involvement. The pursuit of Catholicism was achieved through education and established scholars argue that clerical authority 'coincided with the spread of the educational system',44 and the Church, through people like Catherine McAuley, found an effective way of reaching people.45 Thomas O'Donoghue's writing on Catholic schooling in Ireland after World War One suggests that Catholic education served two fundamental purposes: it generated a loyal middle-class, who would uphold its influence, and it provided a steady supply of young people, who would be the future priests, nuns and brothers.46 Education fostered replenishment.

In Glasgow, the Church deliberately used education to re-establish itself. The provision of parish schools, poor schools and convent schools enabled the Sisters and the Church to encourage and develop loyal and obedient Catholics. Criticism comes from T. A. Fitzpatrick who considers the scarce 'business class' employment opportunities available to Irish Catholics. While he acknowledges the role Protestant bigotry played in this, he argues that the period between 1872-1918 was a 'kind of educational wilderness'47 for Catholics because they had been cut off from

---

43Reasons for Organising, p. 3.
46O'Donoghue, "Catholicism and the Curriculum", p. 141
'the mainspring of educational development in the nation at large'. While the Church worked to promote obedience, the Catholic population remained or became uncritical and was thus unable or unwilling to take advantage of opportunities offered by the new State system. While not all historians agree with Fitzpatrick, his points and criticisms are valid. Sisters played their part in all of this by preparing girls and young women for the domestic sphere, as good pious mothers, for the classroom, as teachers, or for the cloister, as religious.

Forging connections with middle-class girls enabled congregations to sustain themselves financially, but more importantly, these connections secured their future since it was middle-class girls who provided the bulk of congregational membership. In terms of education, many girls were inspired by their Sister teachers, who opened up a new world to them. Scottish education history has traditionally neglected the 'lass o' pairts', though scholars who make this point do not mention the teaching Sisters who were arguably the most influential female educators in nineteenth-century Scotland. Helen Corr's point, that England's single-sex, middle-class schools had no equivalent in Scotland, fails to consider convent boarding schools. Lindy Moore's article on elementary education in Scotland has also ignored this element of Roman Catholic female education, but her research remains extremely valuable and represents a pioneering attempt to provide a more inclusive assessment of Scottish education. Moore's refusal to accept that Scotland's education system was rooted in a 'democratic tradition', because it excluded women, serves to illuminate some home truths. Her attack of Scotland's predominant patriarchal Presbyterian climate in the nineteenth century struck a long-desired blow for the countless women denied access to 'an intellectual climate' on account of the desire to keep women at home.

---

48Ibid.
49Ibid.
51Ibid., p. 298.
54Ibid., p. 298.
Archbishop Charles Eyre was ambitious and understood the necessity of teaching Sisters. An "ideal administrator, builder and disciplinarian for the Western District of Scotland," 4 Eyre placed a high value on what religious congregations could accomplish for a given parish, diocese, or, in the case of the Sisters of Notre Dame, country. Tension between the Irish and Scottish Catholics was "explosive" 55 and so constantly impeded Catholicism's development in Scotland. Eyre's appointment represented an ultramontane approach which centralised power in the hands of the Pope, via an English-born Bishop, so that Catholics in Scotland could have a restored hierarchy. The maintenance of a Catholic Church, without active and damaging internal factions, depended on selecting the right man for the job. The nineteenth-century Scottish clergy were reluctant to accept the involvement of Irish Catholics, those 'alien transients', 56 who were regarded as a debt-inducing, passing phase. The Irish were seen to be interfering with rather than positively working for Catholicism in Scotland, and this had a lot to do with the nationalistic and political baggage that many of the Irish clergy carried with them. David McRoberts, who examines the Restoration of the Roman Catholic Hierarchy, explains that many Irish clergy seemed unable to separate Catholicism from nationalist politics. 57 In Scotland, a tame brand of Scottish Catholicism was 'preferable to radicalism', 58 and exasperation was directed towards those young men, children of Irish migrants, who joined seminaries while retaining very anti-Scotch opinions. A letter from Bishop Smith to Bishop Kyle (1798-1869), Vicar Apostolic of the Northern District, highlights this:

"Of late years, since the students from the West were accustomed to be imbued with Anti-Scotch feelings by some wild young Irelanders among the clergy ...and I believe that every Rector and Professor in Blairs, Rome and Valladolid is under the same impression that every child of Irish parents, going from the West to College, brings with him a conviction that the country of his parents renders the Scotch more or less his natural enemies."

---

56 Bernard Aspinwall, "Catholic Devotion in Victorian Scotland", manuscript of paper delivered in May, 2003 at the University of Aberdeen.
58 Aspinwall, "Catholic Devotion"
As the Irish Catholics became more numerous in the west of Scotland, they launched calls to re-establish the Catholic hierarchy, but these were side-stepped by the Scottish clergy since ‘the crux of the quarrel [was] the survival of the historical identity of Scottish Catholicism’. The Scottish Reformation and its aftermath had made Catholicism noiseless in Scotland; quiet Catholicism enabled its survival where pockets of adherence existed. The situation was precarious for Scottish Catholics because while Scotland was far from religiously tolerant, Scottish Catholics had survived through their own initiative and with the help of many sympathetic non-Catholics. The quiet character that Scottish Catholicism had adopted was not ready for the shake-up proposed by the Irish and their clergy, and until the indigenous Church was strong enough, power-sharing within a restored hierarchy was not an option. These problems inevitably spilled over into the affairs of the convents, and though sparse, evidence exists for both the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy. In 1845, Sister M. Bernard Garden, previously introduced, had been hand-picked for the Scottish mission and sent to England, not Ireland, for her novitiate. The fact that she ended up in Ireland, and had to be brought back to Glasgow by Bishop Murdoch, is evidence of the tension. Yet although she did not arrive in Scotland until 1850, her purpose had been to ensure a Scottish influence in the work of the Mercy Sisters, and her success was marked by the five Mercy houses she founded in Aberdeenshire before her death in 1893. She wrote to Bishop Smith in 1851 asking him to send along young women who might be inclined for the religious life, and ended with a ‘ps’ that said ‘We could get as many Sisters as we wished from Ireland, but we want persons from the country if possible’. In a separate case, involving the Franciscan Sisters, sometime between 1858-1860, Bishop Smith had complained about the overwhelming Irishness of their new Superior, Angela McSwinney:

The Franciscans—don’t please me at all. There is nothing very far amiss— but the Prioress is intensely Irish— Irish in her feelings & prejudices, associations, want to order, want of cleanliness—manifesting her sympathies— this in respect to priests, nuns &

60Ibid., p. 12.
62E. D. Steele, “The Irish Presence in the North of England, 1850-1914” in Northern History, Vol. 12 (1976), p. 221. English Catholics also saw their Irish counterparts as problematic, but were more able to ensure English Catholic dominance in their Bishoprics.
63See Chapter 3, Footnote 38, for a list of houses and dates.
64SCA. BL6/615/1. Letter from Sr. M. Bernard Garden to Bishop Smith, 2 October 1851.
people and children.\

The tension between the Irish and Scottish clergy was certainly played out in the affairs of the convents, but once the congregations had comfortably established themselves with sufficient numbers, schools and other activities, they were not so easily drawn into the conflicts. In both communities the number of Scottish-born superiors outnumbered those of Irish birth, especially in the tumultuous period of the 1850s and 1860s when the growing pains were severe. Bishops had the final say on who would be Superior so the results are extremely telling: the Sisters of Mercy, founded from Ireland, had five superiors between 1851 and 1871, and while one was English, four were Scottish: Sr. M. Bernard Garden, Superior between 1851-1852, from Aberdeen, Sr. M. Aloysius Consitt, Superior between 1852-1854, from Durham, England, Sr. M. Aloysius Rigg, Superior between 1854-1864, from Kirkudbrightshire, Sr. M. de Sales Dend, Superior between 1864-1870 and 1877-1883, from Edinburgh and Sr. M. Ignatius (Jane Anne) Hope Johnston, Superior between 1870-1871, from Moffat. The first Irish superior was Sr. M. of Mercy (Ellen) Strachan, a migrant from Dublin, who held the post between 1871-1877 and 1883 until her death in 1896. In the Franciscan community, while the Irish-born Angela McSwinney held the position of Superior between 1857-1870, her successors were Sr. M. Gonzaga (Mary) Simm, Superior between 1870-1884, from Morayshire, Sr. M. of the Cross (Cecilia) Black, Superior between 1884-1896, from Glasgow, and Sr. M. Athanasius (Joanne) Maclean, Superior between 1896-1909, from Moidart.

Tom Gallagher believes that the separate development of the Catholic church in Scotland 'presented an alien face' to the Irish Catholics who saw a different church with distinct ideals and opinions, especially concerning politics. Arguably, those trying to push the Irish cause in Scotland were manipulating Catholicism into a religio-politico hybrid as a means to achieve self-determination. This was a consistent criticism of Irish Catholicism, not just in Scotland, but

---

65 SCA. OLA/6/1. Alexander Smith: Report on 'clergy and convents' in his mission. No date, but likely to have been between 1858-1860.
66 SMCA, Glasgow. Names of Sisters who entered in Glasgow. Held in green plastic binder marked "Brief History of Glasgow Foundation" and "Hand-written Account of Foundation".
67 FSICA. Sister Professions & Receptions, Vols. I & II. Held by the Superior. This goes some way towards addressing Susan O'Brien's call for scholars to examine how much authority Irishwomen had in communities as well as their impact on convent culture. "French Nuns in Nineteenth-Century England" in Past and Present, No. 54 (February, 1997), p. 156.
68 Gallagher, Glasgow The Uneasy Peace, p. 8.
wherever large Irish migrant or immigrant communities existed. This will be demonstrated in the following chapter, which concentrates on Toronto.

The title of this dissertation, *Special Daughters of Rome: Glasgow and its Roman Catholic Sisters, 1847-1910*, refers to Glasgow and the three main teaching congregations, but the term ‘Special Daughter of Rome’ has a lengthy and distinctive heritage. Well before the nineteenth century, the imperialist ambitions of English Catholicism had been a cause of great worry, especially in Glasgow. During the twelfth century, the Archbishopric of York, under Archbishop Thurstan, had been making a concerted effort to swallow up the see of Scotland’s western city. To prevent this, and provide Glasgow with a sense of security, Pope Alexander III, in 1175, Pope Celestine III, in 1192, and Pope Honorius, in 1218, are three of the eight Popes who confirmed the see of Glasgow as one of the Scottish bishoprics ‘subject to the apostolic see as a special daughter, with no intermediary’, and that Glasgow ‘attempt not to obey, as by metropolitan right, any but the Roman Pontiff’. Identity, was therefore a constant concern. T. A. Fitzpatrick provides a concise description of ecclesiastical re-organisation after the Reformation. In 1695, Scotland received a secretly-consecrated Vicar-Apostolic, Thomas Nicholson, and perhaps this was done with some foresight. The year 1695 was a dark one for Scotland as severe Famine raged and the Company of Scotland was empowered by an Act of the Scottish Parliament, which set in motion the ill-fated Darien scheme, both of which were contributing factors to the 1707 Treaty of Union, between the Scottish and English parliaments. Perhaps the Catholic Church in Scotland saw a more unified state between Scotland and England on the horizon and was attempting to protect its identity.

---


71 Quoted in Lauchlan MacLean, “The Scottish Church’s Struggle with England for Independence” in *Records of the Scottish Church History Society*, Vol. 5 (1935), p. 194. This article concludes with the point that the claims of York were actually the disguised claims of the English crown over Scotland.


Establishing that Scottish Catholicism had historically identified itself as distinct helps to show why Scots clergy would have had a problem with the Irish clergy, whose reforming zeal often lacked finesse. There was a feeling that the Irish were too willing to stir up conflict and radicalism. The Irish, desirous of a greater role in the organisation and development of Catholicism in Scotland, struggled with those Scots clergymen who felt that the Irish presence would ‘evaporate as quickly as it had grown’. In John McCaffrey’s opinion, the Scots ‘generally cracked down on anything which smacked of a political or national feeling in their new flocks’ because they did not want to jeopardise the degree of toleration they had received from a policy of quiet living. Ironically, just when the Irish Catholics seemed to be toning down their political activities, the issue of the disestablishment of the Church of Ireland sparked Orange activities in 1868, which increased sectarian hostility.

The Irish historian, R. F. Foster, stated that class and religion were more important ‘preoccupations in constructing an alien identity of the Irish’ than many might assume, probably because their perceived lower class status and Catholicism were viewed as corrupting agents. Support for Catholicism and Irish Catholics was a touchy subject in nineteenth-century Scotland, but particularly in Glasgow, where the roots of Presbyterianism ran deep. In 1835, just before Daniel O’Connell arrived in Glasgow, a fiery speech was delivered at the Hope-Street Gaelic Church, which thundered that he was not welcome in ‘this Protestant city - to this city of our fathers, which bore so much and braved so much for the faith which he now tramples upon - to their city, where the spirit of the Covenanters was so strong, where the arm of the Covenanters so firm...’ Exhibitions of hostility ranged from meetings and speeches to blatant violence and 

---

77Foster, Paddy and Mr Punch, p. 193.
78J. C. Colquhoun, Esq. of Killermont, “Great Protestant Meeting held at Hope-Street Gaelic Church, Glasgow, on Thursday, September 17th, 1835” in Mortimer O’Sullivan, ed., Romanism as it Rules in Ireland: A Full and Authentic Report of the meetings held in various parts of England and Scotland in which the Theology secretly taught, the commentary on the Bible clandestinely circulated, the law of the Papal States surreptitiously set up to govern Ireland, and the secret Diocesan Statutes of the Province of Leinster, Vols. I and II. (London: R. B. Seeley, 1840), p. 292. Aspinwall explains that the Scottish Catholic clergy were concerned that O’Connell’s influence in Glasgow would be disruptive. “The Formation of a British”, p. 271.
the intimidation of the Orange marches, which were often sparked by various activities in Ireland, such as the disestablishment of the Church of Ireland and Home Rule. In Glasgow Irish 'Home Rulers' were becoming more vocal with spokes-people like John Ferguson, but the Orange contingency were active in their own right and were 'ready to throw their weight behind whomever would guarantee the position of Ireland within the United Kingdom'. In Glasgow, a passionate battle to determine who would define 'what its future direction should be', took place and many were determined that its future would not be alongside Roman Catholics. It was this tense atmosphere, created by broader issues, which influenced the decision to keep the Catholic schools separate after the 1872 Act. Glasgow's political sphere was shaped more by 'cultural forces and ideologies' than class.

The School Board elections were ripe platforms for sectarianism and the churches used all of their available human resources to gain representation. Women were permitted to vote in School Board elections because they were seen to impact the wellbeing of children. The concession of women voting in these elections legitimated the ratepayers' franchise in 1881, though this was only implemented in 1882 provided they held the minimum £4 annual value property qualification. This, while providing the churches with a new pool of voters, was more important because it offered many women 'a new forum of public activity', though few actually voted. Nevertheless, women's votes in School Board elections was a step in the right direction, in spite of the failed attempt for female suffrage with the 1884 Reform Act. In the 1873 elections, there were 101,871 electors, but only 52,804 actually voted, and while there is no break down for male and female voters, 'at no future point in the nineteenth century did the citizens of Glasgow show such enthusiasm for their School Board'. Voter turn-out was attributed to the secret ballot, the female vote and the sectarian issue. The Catholic Church took advantage of the women's vote

80Ibid.
81Ibid., p. 207.
84Ibid.
85Winters, The Empire, p. 82. His Appendix 7 is a list of voter-turn-outs between 1873-1900.
86Ibid.
and circulated a flyer which reminded women who met the property requirements to vote. This appealed to their sense of duty to their children and their religion.\textsuperscript{87}

The mandatory attendance clause, for all children between five and thirteen,\textsuperscript{88} required the assistance of Roman Catholic School Board members, but even with their participation enforcement was very difficult. The \textit{Glasgow Herald} published an article about the issue of Catholic involvement which quoted Mr. William Kennedy, Clerk of School Board and former teacher, who spoke to the 1885 Select Committee on Voting in School Board Elections:

\begin{quote}
...in so delicate a matter as the compulsory clauses it would not be possible to work without some representation of the minorities. [Chair] You think that without some representation of minorities the compulsory clauses could not have been carried out with some thoroughness and absence of friction...[Mr. Kennedy] If the Roman Catholics had been left outside they would have formed quite a different idea of the working of the board from what they had done. \textsuperscript{89}
\end{quote}

The compulsory clause also helped the growth of Glasgow's Catholic education system since, in 1872, attendance was roughly 3,534, which represented just over one quarter of the Catholic children who were eligible for school.\textsuperscript{90} The 1881-1882 \textit{Report of Religious Examination of Schools} (RRES), commissioned by the Glasgow Archdiocese, also showed a deficiency in the number of pupils enrolled in schools during this time, but attributed this to the migratory character of the people.\textsuperscript{91} However, Catholic administrators acknowledged that 'the compulsory power of the education Act is doing much to force these waifs and strays into the schools'.\textsuperscript{92} Despite roughly 16,000 'defaulting parents' being tracked down by the Attendance Committee during the years immediately following the Act, by 1877 the Board was able to 'boast 84% attendance of children on the school roles'.\textsuperscript{93} This increase in pupil numbers necessitated more teachers and

\textsuperscript{87}GAA. WD5 Condon Memoirs. Flyer entitled \textit{Glasgow School Board Election}, Central Committee of the Catholic Association, 6 March 1873. Inserted loose into black diary - material unmarked and unsorted.

\textsuperscript{88}Anderson, \textit{Education and the Scottish People}, p. 230. The age of attendance was increased to fourteen in 1883.

\textsuperscript{89}\textit{Glasgow Herald}, 20 June 1885.


\textsuperscript{91}GAA, ED7. \textit{Report of the Religious Examination of Schools} (RRES), July 1881-1882.

\textsuperscript{92}\textit{ibid.}

\textsuperscript{93}Fraser and Maver, "Tackling the Problems", p. 117.
The number of Catholic Schools jumped from 65 in 1872 to 189 by 1900, an extraordinary increase considering the limited resources. The RRES for 1881-1882 revealed that in the fourteen Glasgow parishes, the Franciscan Sisters were the principal teachers in seven and the Sisters of Mercy the principal teachers in two, and the Franciscans took charge of six infant schools while the Mercy Sisters looked after one. Non-religious female teachers were active in eight parishes, their work was shared with the Sisters of Mercy in St. Joseph’s Parish and the Franciscan Sisters in Our Lady and St. Margaret’s Parish. It is also important to mention that the Franciscans, were active in two Greenock parishes, St. Mary’s and St. Lawrence’s, and taught in both the girls’ and infants’ schools. They had been asked out to Greenock in 1874, by Michael Condon (1817-1802), an influential Irish-born priest who had spent time all around the Western District. Nevertheless, ten years later in 1891-1892, the Franciscan Sisters were the principal teachers in thirteen schools, while the Sisters of Mercy had retained control of only the girls’ school in St. Joseph’s Parish; non-religious female teachers were active in eleven parishes, and they still shared work with the Franciscan Sisters in the Parish of Our Lady and St. Margaret’s. At the end of the century, the Franciscan Sisters were in charge of seven schools, the Sisters of Mercy retained control of St. Joseph’s girls’ school and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur were the principal teachers in the infants and girls’ schools of St. Peter’s Parish as well as in their own Training College. Secular principal teachers had extended into thirteen parishes. Although the Sisters had a tremendous impact on Catholic education in Glasgow, their efforts were rarely publicly recognised, though the Glasgow Observer did praise their efforts in 1895:

The merit of the work to which their saintly lives are devoted receives some slight acknowledgement from the outside world, and this recognition must impart to them a fresh encouragement and stimulus.

Most parishes had one school, with one girls’ department, but in some cases there were as many

---

94Anderson, Education and the Scottish, Table IV.  
95GAA, ED7. RRES, July 1881-1882.  
96Ibid. (1891-1892)  
97Ibid. (1898-1899)  
98Glasgow Observer, 29 June 1895.
as four. In 1881-1882, the average attendance for all of the schools where the Sisters taught was 3,060, but the number of pupils actually on the rolls was 4,792. In 1891-1892, the average attendance had reached 3,981, while the number on the rolls was 4,999. In 1898-1899, the average attendance, in those schools run by the Franciscans and the Sisters of Mercy, was 5,321 with 6,348 on the rolls, while the Sisters of Notre Dame had an average attendance of 609 pupils with 745 being listed on the rolls, and this is evidence that the authorities were making progress with truancy.

Although dedicated teachers, the Sisters’ first allegiance was to the observance of their Rule, though these were occasionally manipulated to accommodate their teaching load. Sarah Curtis has provided a useful discussion about nuns’ role as recruiters, a function that will be discussed later. The increased teaching load was the result of the 1872 Education (Scotland) Act and the regulations it imposed, those parishes without schools in 1872 soon got them. The educational work of the Sisters proved fruitful ground for recruiting young women into the community. The increase in pupil numbers is attributed to the crackdown on absentee as well as normal population growth. Teachers and school managers supported the Education Act, because among other reasons, it enforced attendance. The mandatory attendance clause necessitated the inclusion of Roman Catholics on the School Board, it brought more Catholic children under the influence of the Roman Catholic doctrine and, after fees were completely abolished in 1893, it made access to education truly democratic. It had not been so before, despite arguments to the contrary.

The Importance of the Teaching Sisters

The need to fulfil the regulations set down by the Acts put pressure on the Catholic system, which was forced to accumulate an excruciating financial burden, one that was felt most sharply by those least able to contribute. The condition of the labouring classes and migrants in Glasgow

---

100Ibid. (1881-1882)
101Ibid. (1891-1892)
102Ibid. (1898-1899)
104Winters, The Empire, p. 433.
was such that any request for financial contributions would be unjust. One scholar believes that ‘the social conditions which were most deleterious to education were also the conditions which immigrants were most likely to experience’. Acquiring sufficient financial resources while developing a more positive outlook towards education among the majority of the population was no easy task. The Sisters’ positions as teachers afforded the Church access to their pupils’ homes and families and gave the Church a constant presence in community life. Many Catholics had grown dependant upon the Church because it tried to take care of all of their wants, thus preempting their need to stray outside of its sphere of influence. Sisters were essentially missionaries who occupied strategic positions in society and so were those lay teachers, who were educated in Catholic schools and training colleges, and who became ‘mediators between the home and school’. Aside from making appearances at important school functions like prize-giving days and saying weekly Mass, many clergymen were often regarded from a distance and contact could be even more limited if Mass was not attended regularly, so in a sense, Sisters were the accessible religious. While Lay Sisters and perhaps Superiors, were more detached from the schools because of other responsibilities, the work that Sisters undertook exposed them to the public more regularly, be it through nursing or through education.

School offered an important separation from the home for many girls. Domestic labour was an assumed role for women, and from a young age, older sisters minded younger siblings which meant that ‘that working-class girls in particular [were] deprived of childhood’. The Factory and Workshops Act of 1867, which set initial controls over education and child employment, were aided by the Education Acts of 1878 and 1883. ‘Mese extended the power of the School Board to child labour and attendance issues, and even empowered truancy officers to look for children in ‘places of employment’. Attending school regularly enabled young girls and boys to acquire useful skills and participate in something that was just for them. The single-sex environment

---

provided by the Sisters showed many girls and young women that other avenues were open to them. Without trying to sound too utopian, schools for girls enabled many to expand beyond the domestic sphere.

Economically, the decision to keep the Catholic schools independent was difficult. The Hierarchy had successfully exploited the fear of proselytization and declared it a worse fate than poverty, a fate to which many were already accustomed. The fact that the Catholic system was not entitled to School Board rate money was the major obstacle, though Privy Council grants, which helped only with building costs, were available to schools which put themselves forward for annual inspections. These grants had been available as early as 1847, but only if the school was not used for Church purposes, a condition few Catholic schools could meet since dual-purpose buildings were cheaper. Everyone had to contribute to the education rates, which went to support Board Schools, and so the Catholic population essentially supported two systems.

Building provision, general maintenance and teachers' salaries were the major expenses so teaching congregations were invaluable. Not only did they provide skilled and educated teachers, but their salaries were comparably low. Also, as their salaries went into a central account, they could provide for themselves, though this depended on whether or not they got paid, and there were many instances when they did not receive adequate remuneration. In December 1873, the Franciscan Superior wrote to the priest at St. Vincent’s Parish indicating that they were owed money. She wrote that he had ‘always delayed to fix a sum’ so she had little choice but to apply a rate of £80 in total, exclusive of government allowances, for their annual Day and Night School teaching services. During the six years, they had ‘accumulated a deficiency which at July 1873 [was] £172 “12”5’, and she threatened him that ‘the people of [his] congregations, if they knew


it, would not allow the Sisters to be losers when at a time when notwithstanding the strictest economy, they cannot meet their demand".113

In 1874, during negotiations to establish Bank House in Greenock, the Franciscan Superior, Sr. M. Gonzaga, Rev. Michael Condon and Archbishop Eyre hammered out an agreement which detailed what their salaries would be that of four teaching Sisters, two of whom had to be certificated. For the day and evening schools, the community would receive £100 per annum.114 The Sisters were also responsible for the payment of the ‘tenants’ proportion of all taxes, poor rates and all other public Assessments115 on the house they permitted to use ‘rent free’,116 (see Appendix 4:1 for a photo of the convent). If they opened a middle school, furnishing it would be their responsibility, but all of the school fees would be theirs and these were paid quarterly and ranged from 7s and 6d to 31s and 6d.117

While evidence is limited, the Franciscan Sisters seem to have been in a better financial position than the Sisters of Mercy. This began with their journey from France in 1847, when most, if not all of their expenses had been defrayed by their young benefactress, Constance Marchand, who joined the community formally in 1850. Fundraising, bazaars and donations helped keep the congregations afloat, but they did receive help from the parishes upon arrival, though the exact amount of money raised is not known. Congregations tended to receive help when they arrived in a parish and when their debts got out of hand, however, situations varied and often depended upon the work that a particular community was willing to undertake. An interesting comparison comes from Hull, an industrial town in East Yorkshire. After 1840, the Irish population there had trebled, which put pressure on the local clergy to provide Roman Catholic schools and so teaching congregations were approached to fill the void. In 1857, the priest in charge, Father Micheal Trappes, approached the Sisters of Mercy in Clifford and promised them daily mass, rent and tax-
free accommodation, as well as all proceeds, such as grants and fees, arising from the schools. The Superior, Mother Starr, previously mentioned, and the Deputy Superior, Mother Kennedy, relocated to Hull to establish a new house.\footnote{Marie McClelland, “Catholic Education in Victorian Hull” in The Irish in Victorian Britain. The Local Dimension. Roger Swift and Sheridan Gilley, eds. (Dublin: Four Courts Press, Ltd., 1999), p. 105.}

Clearly, situations varied between cities and parishes and so too did the agreements between the various congregations and the clergy. The Sisters who came to Glasgow during the nineteenth-century relied heavily upon their own resources, but they also benefited from cheap or free accommodation, donations and weekly collections, and so complete financial independence was not achieved during the period under examination. Carol Coburn and Martha Smith’s study of nineteenth-century America Sisters made the important point that Sisters often needed the support of esteemed men, who could ensure the viability and success of their institutions. Indeed, ‘gendered attitudes’\footnote{Carol K. Coburn and Martha Smith, Spirited Lives. How Nuns Shaped Catholic Culture and American Life, 1838-1920. (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1999), p. 104.} were re-enforced and most Sisters worked within this social framework to achieve their ultimate goals.

Their aim of facilitating social improvement was often difficult and archival evidence from the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur in particular, reveals that in order to educate pupils, build schools and maintain the overall system, convents required financial support, especially for their poor schools. The dowries of deceased Sisters and their teaching salaries were essential economic resources. In 1887, Archbishop Eyre sent a letter to the Vicar General, John A. Maguire, about the Franciscan Sisters, which emphasised the importance of dowries:

\begin{quote}
...see that no choir postulant be received into the house, however desirable she may be, if she brings no dower(y) with her or has not already obtained a certificate for teaching in schools.\footnote{GAA. RO8/10 Letter from the Archbishop of Glasgow to the Vicar General, 15 April 1887.}
\end{quote}

Money was tight and everyone involved in the Catholic education system struggled to keep it afloat. It was in the best interests of the Archdiocese to have Sisters recruiting those aspirants who could contribute financially. It could not afford to maintain impoverished communities of Sisters. Convent schools, which catered to the more affluent pupils, also generated money and the fees paid by these pupils helped to maintain the Sisters and subsidise the poor schools. All
three congregations ran advertisements in the CDS which outlined the subjects on offer as well as the prices, which varied according to extras and the number of pupils from one family in attendance. Appendix 4:2 displays two of these adverts. The trend of using Sisters to supplement impoverished systems was a universal phenomenon within Catholic education systems and a study on education in France asserts that during the mid-nineteenth century, municipalities felt that they were saving money by giving schools over to the 'less-costly' religious congregations.  

The subjects offered in the regular and poor schools included reading, writing and arithmetic, and in the convent schools other subjects like history, natural philosophy, plain and ornamental needlework and French were on offer. In all schools religion was central but evidence as to how much religion was taught is conflicting. One scholar wrote that at St. Mungo's Girl's School, which was run by the Sisters of Mercy until 1868, 'great attention is evidently paid to the indoctrination of the pupils in the customs and ceremonies of the Roman Catholic Church'. On the other hand, after the 1872 Act, there seems to have been an attempt to downplay the degree of religious indoctrination, at least on an official level. A statement from the Archdiocese, quoted a report by EDM Middleton, and announced that secular instruction was a central element in the schools:

> No school managers can be more anxious than our Catholic Clergy are, that the children get as good a secular education as possible, and for a very good reason, that the poor Catholic child may be enabled to begin that battle of life from as good an educational platform as the poor protestant child does. They consider that sound secular education will help to make the child not only a better citizen but a better Catholic. In the Roman Catholic schools exactly the same kind of secular instruction goes on as in other schools.  

Catholic schools were managing to meet the evolving educational requirements to ensure their governmental funding, but religious indoctrination had not been abandoned. At times, four sets

---

112 CDS, 1870, p. 175. Smart noted that the girls' school, Our Lady and St Francis', which was attached to the Franciscan's Charlotte street convent, had a 'fine reputation' for teaching French. See *Villages of Glasgow. Volume I*. (Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers Ltd., 1988), pp. 74-75.
113 Handley, *The Irish in Modern*, p. 205.
of prayers were recited in the schools throughout the day.\textsuperscript{122} Sisters, as ambassadors of Catholicism and trained religious, taught children how to be obedient Catholics. Two letters, written by the Franciscan Superior, Sr. M. of the Cross Black, in 1889, explain that providing a Catholic education was the underlying reason for establishing new schools. Her first letter indicated that they wanted to set up a branch house in the city's south side because it was 'absolutely required in the interest of Education',\textsuperscript{126} but only in her second letter did she reveal why the matter was so pressing: 'we have heard that many Catholic children attend Protestant Schools, finding the distance too great either to Garnet Hill or to Charlotte Street'.\textsuperscript{127}

Often lay women taught alongside Sisters, either as pupil teachers or as assistants, depending on their certification, but it is likely that they merely carried out the wishes of the Sisters. Unfortunately, no evidence of the relationship between lay teachers and Sisters has been discovered in either the congregational archives or in the school log books. In those schools where the principal teachers were Sisters and the school managers were local priests, the religious influence would have been tremendous. Making children aware of their religion was fundamental, but there was also a genuine concern to provide children with basic education, including reading, writing and counting or arithmetic. If the Catholic community hoped to progress, Catholic children had to be brought up to the standard of their Protestant counterparts and the stress on religion, perhaps over secular learning, proved an impediment.

As the number of Board and Catholic schools grew, there was a greater need for systematic inspections to ensure a minimum standard of education quality. In 1896, the Archdiocese established its own Board of Education to 'advise with the Archbishop on matters connected with Education in the Archdiocese',\textsuperscript{128} which covered most of the over-riding concerns. Archbishop

\textsuperscript{122}\textit{FSICA. Form of Prayrs Used in Franciscan Schools in Scotland. A5-sized loose page. The morning prayers included Veni Creator, Sub tuum praesidium, Apostleship Offering, Pater, Ave, Credo, Aspiration, Confitor, Short Acts of Faith, Hope, Charity, Contrition, Prayers for Scotland, Prayer to our Lady of Good Success, Prayer to St. Roch, Our Guardian Angels, St. Joseph, Our Holy Father, St. Francis. There was a Dismissal (presumably before lunch), which included Angelus and Grace before Meals, an Afternoon Assembly, which included Grace after Meals and Offering of Actions, and finally a Dismissal, which included Memorare, 3 Aves, and Aspiration.}

\textsuperscript{126}\textit{GAA. R02/12. Letter from Sr. M. of the Cross Black to the Vicar General, 12 August 1889. Her sepia photograph is included as Appendix 4:3.}

\textsuperscript{127}\textit{GAA. R02/12. Letter from Sr. M. of the Cross Black to the Vicar General, 24 October 1889.}

\textsuperscript{128}\textit{GAA. ED2/10 Education Papers 1892-1909. Archdiocese of Glasgow. Board of Education, 21 February 1896.}
Eyre appointed twelve priests to sit on the Board with six elected senior priests, each representing two Deaneries.\textsuperscript{129} Prior to the establishment of this Board, the Deans held meetings to deal with education-related concerns, but as early as 1893 a more suitable alternative was desired.\textsuperscript{130} As school inspections became more regulated and teacher quality within Catholic schools faced increased scrutiny, the recruitment of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, to open a Catholic Teacher Training College, was prioritised. Generally, HMI reports were favourable and the following reports provide an idea of what was said about the Sister-run schools. At the Franciscan Sisters' Sacred Heart Girls' School, the Inspector seemed pleased and noted an improvement over the last inspection with some branches of the school touching excellence.\textsuperscript{131} That there was a been a good relationship between the inspectors and the Dowanhill Training College is indicative of the quality of the institution and in 1901, praise was given to the Practising School (photographs of which are provided in Appendices 4:6 and 4:7):

\begin{quote}
The school is supervised and taught with distinctly superior power and skill, and the high efficiency referred to in previous reports continues to be ably maintained. Thoroughness and intelligence characterize the teaching of every subject and the influence of the head-mistress [Sr. Mary of St. Wilfrid] is apparent in every detail of every class.\textsuperscript{132}
\end{quote}

Despite the solid reputation of the these congregations, there is evidence to suggest that other congregations did not always fit the bill as competent teachers. Desperate to ensure that the Privy Council funds would not be terminated on account of poor teaching standards, Catholic administrators quickly removed Sisters who posed a concern. In 1874 a series of correspondence highlighted why and how the Sisters of Charity were removed from St. Patrick's in Coatbridge. They were regarded as unfit teachers by school inspectors and the school manager, Rev. Michael O'Keefe, sent a disgruntled letter to Archbishop Eyre which exhibited his anxiety about their possible removal on account of reports of incompetence:

\begin{quote}
...the requirements of the Education Board are the principal reason for his [HMI Middleton] anxiety...without referring to what some members of the Board said some months ago, I wish merely to say that the only Catholic member of the Board told me within the last\textsuperscript{133}
\end{quote}

\begin{thebibliography}{13}
\bibitem{129}GAA. ED2/10 Education Papers 1892-1909. Statement from Charles Eyre, 6 October 1893.
\bibitem{130}GAA. ED16/1, 1896-1897, Sacred Heart, 26-27 November 1896.
\bibitem{131}SND, PAO. B116/D11h/2. Notes of the 1901 HMI Report on the Practising School, Dowanhill.
\end{thebibliography}
month that the Sisters [Sisters of Charity of St. Vincent de Paul] are incompetent teachers...The teaching Sisters are doing all that they can to give satisfaction.\(^\text{133}\)

Six days later, O'Keefe sent a second, more forceful letter, in an attempt to keep the Sisters there, arguing that all should not be removed on account of one problematic teacher. Inspector Middleton had identified Sister Josephine (details unknown) as inadequate and problematic, and suggested that she give up teaching:\(^\text{134}\)

> I am most anxious the Sisters should not be removed from Coatbridge...To remove all on account of one after extending £175 from first to last on the buildings, and for no reasonable cause is, to say the least, too bad.\(^\text{135}\)

O'Keefe's pleas were unsuccessful and the Sisters of Charity were recalled by Paris in late December of 1874.\(^\text{136}\) Their quick removal to Paris may have been an attempt to save face. It is likely that the French Superior General removed them before they were forced out in embarrassing circumstances. This incident confirms the desire for teacher quality as a means of ensuring the continuance of Privy Council grants.\(^\text{137}\) On the flip side, numerous examples of crowded classes taught by inexperienced pupil teachers reveal a severe inadequacy within the system. This begs the question of whether school managers made improvements by their own initiative, or simply waited until problems were brought to their attention by the Inspectors. Both suggestions were likely possibilities, but when money was at stake, the Inspectors' findings were taken very seriously.

A teacher's effectiveness had a lot to do with pupil numbers. The mandatory attendance issue has already been introduced as a necessary measure for improvement over the long-term, but it was problematic. Teachers felt incredible pressure from the steady increase in the number of pupils and estimates reveal that pupil increase was steady enough to cause both a space and staffing

\(^{133}\)GAA. ROI Sisters of Charity of St. Vincent de Paul. Letter from Rev. Michael O'Keefe (Coatbridge) to Archbishop Charles Eyre, 27 August 1874. They taught in three Day Schools, two Night Schools and three Sunday Schools. CDS, 1874, p. 92

\(^{134}\)GAA. ROI Letter from Rev. Michael O'Keefe to Eyre, 2 September 1874.

\(^{135}\)Ibid.


crisis. In 1880, the estimated population of the Archdiocese was 197,890, with approximately 32,981 school children. The Franciscan Sisters taught in seven parish day and Sunday schools, as well as their convent schools in Glasgow, Bothwell and Greenock, while the Sisters of Mercy taught day and Sunday schools in two parishes and gave private lessons in their convent. Diocesan Inspector Macintosh’s report shows that in just two years, the number of pupils examined rose by 1,532. Testimony of this pressure comes from a letter from Rev. Michael Condon to Archbishop Eyre in 1874, wherein he expressed concern about overcrowding in one of the Franciscan’s Greenock schools:

Our girls’ school is overcrowded. If St. Mary’s (Port Glasgow) schools are to be enlarged, my schools are to be somewhat relieved, though not altogether, if the children continue to come as they do.

The Franciscan Sisters’ Council Minutes also reveal an increase in pupil numbers. A new convent at Bothwell was suggested to accommodate new pupil boarders so that the Mother House might be ‘altered and improved’. Convent School populations also rose which necessitated the purchase of additional property. The RRES, for 1894-1895, provides this brief commentary:

The Franciscan Sisters have made an important purchase of property, in the immediate vicinity of their premises at Charlotte Street, which will add considerably to the comfort and accommodation of the community and the pupils attending the Convent Day School. They have also procured new and commodious premises for their Branch House and school at Crosshill.

In 1893, Sr. M. of the Cross Black, Franciscan Superior, wrote to Archbishop Eyre and revealed their struggle with pupil numbers by explaining that they had withdrawn Sisters from Edinburgh and Aberdeen ‘so as to have more assistance in carrying out the work of the archdiocese’. All of this is not meant to suggest that absenteeism was not a persistent problem. Truancy officials

---

138CDS, 1880, p. 140.
141FSICA. Large, black book, standing loose on shelf by the window. Council Meetings 1873-1974, 23 February 1878.
142GAA. ED7. RRES, 1894-1895.
143GAA. ROM/16. Letter from Sr. Mary of the Cross Black to Charles Eyre, 14 March 1893.
were still searching for children who failed to attend school and many schools awarded prizes for good attendance. Regular attendance was difficult to establish since many families needed the extra income children earned. Truancy, due to child labour, was not unique to Glasgow, or indeed Scotland. In France too, supporting the family economy remained the priority. Often, during the poorest years of a family's life, children were sent to work at the earliest age and urban children undertook hawking, general labour, or childcare while their mothers worked outside of the home.

At St. John's Primary Girl's School, Portugal Street, the log book entry for 28 May 1893 recorded that the poor attendance was because 'some of the children had been kept home to assist their parents'. Education did not instantly eliminate poverty and so the lack of immediate results kept many families reliant upon child labour. Education was not an established norm and in many cases, the parents themselves had not attended school and therefore could not see its benefits, and this was why attendance in Glasgow was still a problem twenty years after it had become mandatory. Poverty therefore, was the 'chief obstacle' for attendance in both Catholic and non-Catholic schools. In 1895 a Police Act was introduced to crack down on child labour and it determined that children under the age of eleven were forbidden to work and that boys under fourteen and girls under sixteen could not be employed after nine o'clock at night.

An 1895 article printed in the Daily Record identified wife-desertion and intemperance as the main reasons for truancy. If the father of a family deserted or died, the rest were left in a difficult situation:

Any of the family who is old enough to earn could do so. The surviving mother could go out to work, without depending on outside help if, provided at least one child was old enough to tend

---


145Ibid., p. 118 and 121.


148Daily Record, 19 November 1895.

149Ibid.
Poverty’s hegemony was noted by the education historian, J. H. Treble, who asserts that its stranglehold on educational endeavours was evident when parents chose to ‘transfer their children from the classroom to the labour market at the earliest opportunity’.  

**Finances, Recruitment and Training**

It is obvious from the evidence thus provided that throughout the entire period in which the Catholic Church controlled its education system, there was a constant struggle for economic survival. A statement in the minute book for the Church’s District Poor School Committee highlights the pressure on the public:

> The local effort must equal the amount of grant made to it. By local efforts are meant all collections and subscriptions received for the school...whether collected within the boundaries of the mission in which the school is situated or received from other sources, such as the ‘district fund’ etc.  

Many of those families asked to contribute to the cause of Catholic education had trouble providing for their own children, and the school log books for St. John’s Primary Girl’s School, Portugal Street and St. Alphonsus’ Girl’s School, Great Hamilton Street show that the head teachers gave boots, clothes and dinners to the poorer children. School fees existed until 1893, but HMI reports suggest that many fees had been variable. An 1883 HMI Report had recorded that the money for the maintenance of Holy Cross Roman Catholic School in Govan had come from fees, which amounted to £26, and from ‘voluntary contributions and church collections’. The Report also explained that the ‘rates of payment may vary according to the means of the parents, but the highest class should be accessible for a fee fairly within the means of a common

---

152 GAA. EDI/I Educational Minute Book, District Poor School Committee. 14 March 1872.  
153 GCA. School Log Books. St. John’s Primary (Girl’s) School, 16 February 1895, D-ED7/222/2/1 and St. Alphonsus’ (Girl’s) School, 31 January 1902, D-ED7/190/3. Prunty, while detailing the goods distributed by the Sisters of the Holy Faith in Dublin, made the important point that such schools could not be ‘distanced from [their] role[s] as a relief agency’. *Dublin Slums 1800-1925*, pp. 235, 238 and 240.  
154 The National Archives of Scotland. (NAS) ED18/3353 School Inspector’s Report, Holy Cross Roman Catholic School, Govan. 9 January 1883.
labourer in the neighbourhood'. There was a reluctance to turn away children unable to pay the fees since the whole idea was to educate them under a Catholic system and so they would not be lost to the Board schools.

Evidence reveals a sympathy for the Catholic schools because of their constant economic hardship. Comparisons between the Catholic and the Board schools were frequent, and Inspector Middleton observed, of the Lanark schools, that in general the difference in standards between the Board and the Catholic schools was not that great:

The managers of these schools were as anxious as any Protestant managers ever could be, or ever would be, to give their children a good education...they desired these children to have as good a start in life as Protestant children...These schools receiv[ed]...satisfactory grants upon precisely the same examinations as all the other schools of the city - for the examinations were not varied but uniform.156

While at times economically vulnerable, the female teaching congregations tended to be financially competent and independent. Often, if money was needed for building expansion, a simple renovation or the purchase of a new property, the particular community sought a loan in its name or provided its own resources to secure what was necessary for the accommodation of themselves and their pupils. The Sisters of Notre Dame owned the property at Dowanhill immediately upon their arrival to Glasgow. A report for the Committee on the Training College for School Mistresses in 1893 revealed their financial situation:

The Sisters require that when the initial financial liabilities connected with the foundation of the college are left upon them, the college property should remain the exclusive possession of the Order...should they be installed in the college property free of cost, the Order would claim compensation only for additional improvements previously sanctioned by the Archbishop.157

It is also important to consider the impact that teaching had on their lives as religious. Teaching required a large part of their day to be set aside for their schools and pupils. Documentation of

155Ibid.
157SND, PAO. BH6 DHLh/3 Report Presented to the Committee on the Training College for School Mistresses, 5 June 1893.
the amount of time Sisters devoted to teaching comes from the Franciscan Sisters’ Convent’s Council Minutes. The issue of their heavy workload was discussed and according to the Minutes, changes were made ‘in the daily exercises of the community in order to give the Sisters who teach in the parish schools, a longer time for their school work,’ and this enabled them to keep up with the ‘stringent measures’ imposed by the education legislation.

This suggests that their teaching responsibilities were placed on an almost equal footing with their reflective religious obligations, but it also demonstrates the diligence with which they approached teaching and the strain they endured as a result of the State’s increasing educational standards. Arguments in favour of Sister teachers was that teaching was their life’s work, whereas lay women often left after marriage. Women in Glasgow were most active in employment between the ages of 15-20, but after marriage most stopped working. However, while married women suffered ‘virtual exclusion’ from much of the economy, some did take casual employment in the textile and pottery trades. Perhaps a number of women, who joined the religious life, did so to fulfil their desire to be educators and perhaps the religious life simply guaranteed their teaching ambitions. This is a delicate topic with many present-day religious, some see the merit in this suggestion while others do not; it is the opinion of this dissertation, however, to side with the former.

Marriage impeded continuity within the teaching profession and the register from Liverpool’s Mount Pleasant Training College reveals that between 1856 and 1874, 53 of the 68 women recorded as having married, ceased teaching. If an educational institution employed Sisters as teachers, marriage would never be a concern. Bill Gatherer’s general article about teachers in Scotland pointed out that the later nineteenth century saw the ‘large-scale feminisation of the profession’. Although he virtually ignored the Catholic system, there is a wide-range of scholarship available to show that women, both secular and religious, formed the majority of the

---

158 FSICA. Large, black book, standing loose on shelf by the window. Council Meetings 1873-1974, 1 August 1887.
160 SND, PAO. MPTC 3 - Shelf 1 (1856-1862 Sr. Mary of St. Philip).
Catholic teaching staff during the mid- to late-nineteenth century. James Handley’s study of the Irish in Scotland has emphasised the organisational importance that teachers had in the wider Catholic community:

They were called upon to organize all sorts of parish activities, from winter concerts to midsummer excursions. Authority grew with service and their word was law in many a household. The esteem they created for themselves by their unselfish cooperation with all that was worthy had salutary reactions on their own lives and often made them exemplars for men and women of the community.162

Education occurred within a community and so personal connections between the community and teachers were forged, giving the teachers influence as well as a sense of self-worth and this must be seen as important in a woman’s life. After marriage, a woman’s position was defined by that of her husband, but this was not the case for Sisters who defined themselves by their vows and the work they did to fulfill those vows. They undertook vows for themselves and for God. Convent life had many benefits, not simply because it provided an elevated status within society. Maria Luddy’s suggestion that many women found convent life more satisfying because it could be seen as an escape from dependence and economic instability, is an interesting one indeed. Power was a possession many Catholic women never experienced, but the religious life-path, as a choir Sister, extended the opportunity to have and hold power over others, and it was even more pronounced for those who became Superior. Perhaps those women who saw teaching as their vocation looked to the religious life as means to obtain and extend their power. There was a large number of former Dowanhill and Mount Pleasant students, who selected the religious life in various congregations, perhaps some of them did so for these reasons.

Not only did the Sisterhood offer women another option, but its popularity resulted in recruits. Recruiting the next generation of Sisters was essential since the demand for them always outstripped the supply. In Glasgow, where the Church was desperate to reestablish itself, the need for Sisters increased as the number of schools grew. In France most of the congregations understood the need for more teachers and so recruited from their own schools. Young girls were identified as possible candidates while still in elementary school, their Sister-educators having

162 Handley, The Irish in Modern, pp. 226-227.
been ‘reminded by the Superiors to identify and nourish the vocations’. There is also evidence to suggest that many French congregations recruited lower-class women because dowries were not fixed, and in some cases, grants were used to support those who could not provide a dowry upon profession. However, as already noted, this was not the case in Glasgow.

The previous chapter mentioned that the private life of nuns has always been a curiosity for the lay community, probably because their world was so detached from regular society. The suggestion that some Sisters may have selected the religious life to improve their prospects, attracts criticism from some present-day religious. Oral testimony reveals a fundamental belief that those who became brides of Christ were answering a call from God to do His work. A Sister of Mercy believed that it was ‘a response to faith - a call from God’ and said that ‘the person finds herself compelled to follow this call to spread the message of the Gospel whilst living a vowed life within a Religious community’. She believes that only some women are called and this ‘is the mystery of faith’. In describing her time as a Sister of Mercy, she deemed it to be a ‘privileged commitment to my Sisters and to the people with whom I work’. Some Sisters, however, acknowledge other possibilities. A Franciscan Sister explained that although the clergy and Sisters were mutually dependant, women would not have looked to the religious orders as a means to ‘break away from the accepted, restrictive role of wife and mother, in order to achieve a more public role in society’, but she did say that a woman’s social and economic circumstances cannot be ignored. Confirmation of this point comes from a letter sent to Sr. M. Camilla (Johanna) Hamilton, a young Dumbarton woman, from the priest who had baptised her. He wrote: ‘I think you have chosen the better part in going to the convent. You may have some troubles there but you would have more in the world’.

Looking to Ireland, one is struck by the incredible number of women who became nuns and

---


164Personal communication with a Sister of Mercy, Dublin, 12 July 2001.

165Ibid.

166Personal communication with a Franciscan Sister of the Immaculate Conception, Glasgow. December 2001.

167FSICA. Sister Professions & Receptions, Vol. II. Letter from Rev’d John MacDonald to Johanna Hamilton, 29 July 1880. Inserted between her reception and profession page.
Sisters after the Famine; an eight-fold increase between 1841-1901, despite the overall drop in Ireland’s Catholic population. It is possible that many who flocked to the religious life did so because it offered them permanent security, an elevated social position and perhaps even the chance to emigrate in relatively secure circumstances. To dismiss these points would be irresponsible. Caitriona Clear addresses the issue of motives in her ground-breaking study on nuns in nineteenth-century Ireland and argues that while evangelical desire no doubt contributed to an 'enthusiasm for the religious life', other factors should be considered. Regarding the three common vows women religious take, Clear points out that most of Ireland's women were familiar with poverty, chastity and obedience before they entered a convent, and that the vows were in fact, 'concrete expressions of realities'. Clear also considers the prevalence of mental illness in Munster and Leinster, comparing it to the fact that these two provinces had the most convents in Ireland, and suggested that women had turned to the Church to combat the feeling of worthlessness. One must bear in mind however, that Ulster had a significant Protestant population, while Connaught's seasonably migratory population was probably too poor to turn out a sufficient number of dowry-endowed, educated women to cause a surge in convent numbers.

Returning to Scotland, and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, Francis O'Hagan believes that the Sisters of Notre Dame were ambitious, industrious and successfully provided young women with the opportunity to aspire to white collar professions. He asserts that they were the 'logical culmination' of the congregations before them and that they had 'been the icing on the multi-layered cake' that was the Catholic education system in Scotland. The following Scots vernacular poem is a colourful display of appreciation for Sister Mary of St. Wilfrid and the work she had been doing in Glasgow:

---

168 Clear referred to this increase as an 'extraordinary and unprecedented tendency' and calculated that in 1801 there were eleven convents and six congregations in Ireland, but by 1901 there were 368 convents and thirty-five religious congregations. Nuns in Nineteenth-Century, p. 36 and 136.
169 Ibid., p. 135.
170 Ibid., p. 137.
171 Ibid., p. 141.
O weel for thee in usquebaugh
To pledge you Dowanside,
And auld Mount Pleasant greeted sair
She wasna by thy side
But sin we canna gang to thee
We send this glass o’ wine
Wi wishes true and triple cheer
To ans wha for hersel is dear
And for the Auld lang syne.

---------------------
We hope indeed that a’ the nuns
That lo’ed thee mony years
May drink thy right guid health in tea
A sitting on their chairs
But sin the mither’s crossed the Tweed
They needs maun bide a wee
Yet still their hearts can rin awa
Wi wishes true frae ane and a’
And a glass o’ wine to thee.\(^{173}\)

The Mount Pleasant Training College was the English predecessor to Scotland’s Dowanhill. The distance to Liverpool was in itself an incentive for creating a similar training college in Scotland, but the growing demand for certificated teachers was impossible to ignore. The previous chapter described the origins of the Training College and so a similar discussion here would be repetitive, but it must be emphasised that the mere existence of Dowanhill indicated the high demand for women teachers. The dependence on women teachers was higher in the Catholic system than in Board Schools.\(^{174}\) Appendix 4:4, the 1899/1900 second year class, shows 37 young women ready to become teachers. Aside from the fact that Sisters were less expensive that lay teachers, there was a lack of alternative employment opportunities for Catholic women.

The \textit{Dowanhill Training College Magazine} dedicated a page to the accomplishments of former students and in every issue, the names (and occasional photographs) of women who went on to obtain university degrees were printed. The January 1909 issue of the magazine featured an ‘Our Past Student Graduates’ page which was beautifully illustrated with Scottish thistles and displayed

\(^{173}\)SND, PAO. DH.h/2. Card in a small white envelope entitled \textit{To dear Sister Mary of St. Wilfred from the Sisters of Mt. Pleasant}.

pictures of five women in their University robes. Those pictured were Isabella Roberts, M. A. 1906, from Aberdeen; Nora O’Sullivan M. A., 1906, from Glasgow, Kathleen Nolan, B. Sc., 1905, from Glasgow, Annie Bisset, M. A., 1906, from Glasgow and Annie Kelly, M. A., 1906, from Glasgow. The July 1909 issue featured a section entitled, ‘University Notes’, which made special reference to Eleanor Smith, who had become the first Dowanhill student to obtain a University degree whilst studying at the College:

Eleanor Smith, M. A., completed her degree this summer session, and so received her cap and gown on June 8, being the first student to receive this honour during her college course. The subjects of her degree are as follows: - Latin, Mathematics, Logic, English, Moral Philosophy, Education, and Political Economy.

Those women who had persevered academically were continually featured in subsequent issues of the magazine, which probably inspired many more to pursue further study. In January 1910, it was announced that Margaret M’Cusker had received her L. L. A. and First-Class Honours in Geography and Aesthetics from the University of Glasgow. These and similar achievements opened up the opportunity to explore prospects abroad; Fannie O’Doherty, for example, used her abilities and training in the United States:

Frannie O’Doherty, whose departure for America was chronicled in our January number, after giving a course of lectures in psychology to Nurses in training, has been engaged as lecturer in English at St. Francis Xavier’s Academy, Chicago.

The names of Janet Lomax, Maggie Dunn, Margaret Colvin, G. M’Cusker, Helen Gallagher, Ellen M’Ghee, and Agnes Kivlichan were also included in the 1910 issues for their academic achievements in University. Success in an academic environment required particular qualities and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur cultivated their students’ self esteem and tenacity as well as their teaching skills. The women just mentioned are evidence that the Sisters of Notre Dame not only trained teachers, but increased the confidence levels of many young Catholic women in Scotland. While the decision was still intimidating, those who chose to attend university were better prepared and more confident in their abilities because of their training at Dowanhill.

177Ibid., p. 37.
It is not known how many of these women were Sisters, since the school was not listed as being run by any particular congregation, but at least two were. It is likely that those lay women had been pupil teachers and probably felt that teaching was a better alternative than mill work, domestic service or the like. Pupil teaching offered many young men and women the chance to make a connection with the 'white-collar' world. It drew the more successful students into roles of responsibility within a school, and while they were meant as aids to teachers, pupil teachers, lacking proper training and sufficient education themselves, were often exploited. Catholic schools relied heavily upon these young instructors as a means of appeasing the pressure caused by a shortage of trained teachers. Appendix 4:5 is an advertisement of evening classes for pupil teachers, concentrating on the subjects of English, Mathematics and Reading. The classes were held at the Franciscan Convent on Charlotte Street as well as the Convent of Mercy at Garnet Hill. Saturday classes, which covered Drawing, French, Music and Physiography, were held at St. Andrew's in Ropework Lane and at St. Alphonsus' in Greendyke, though the latter was only open to male pupil teachers. It was a scheme 'for the better instruction of Pupil Teachers' and was organized by the Archdiocese as a way to improve the quality of teaching within the schools. In 1892, the Franciscan Sisters numbered roughly 98 whereas the Sisters of Mercy numbered only 13, so despite successful community growth among the Franciscan community, Sisters were not plentiful enough.

A large number of the women, who trained at Dowanhill, decided to join religious congregations. The Dowanhill Magazine confirms that between 1896-1914, 72 women chose the religious life and joined a number of congregations. It is not known who joined which congregation between 1896-1908, but between 1909-1914, at least 18 joined the Sisters of Notre Dame, two went to the Franciscan community and eight joined the Sisters of Mercy. This number is by no means definite, but it is indicative of a trend wherein students chose life-paths similar to their teachers.

\[176\] GAA. ED/10 Printed Material. General printed letter written by Thomas P. O'Reilly, 23 September 1892.

\[177\] FSICA. Sister Professions & Receptions, Vols. I & II. Held by the Superior. This estimate is based on those who were professed during or before 1892 and who were not recorded as having died or left before 1892. There were a number of Sisters who did not have their death dates recorded. SMCA, Glasgow. Names of Sisters who entered in Glasgow. Held in green plastic binder marked "Brief History of Glasgow Foundation" and "Hand-written Account of Foundation". The same formula used with the Franciscans was applied to the Sisters of Mercy.

\[180\] SND, PAO. Shelf Library. Dowanhill Training College Magazines, 1909-1914.
Deciding to become a Sister meant a life-long dedication to doing God's work, whether it be teaching, nursing or charity work, and all of these provided Sisters with the opportunity to play essential roles within a patriarchal society.

Seth Koven and Sonya Michel have published an interesting study on the welfare state in France, Britain, the United States and Germany during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Yet, although they point out that their study concentrates on the 'political initiatives of middle-class women who were free from domestic drudgery and had the educational and financial resources to campaign for social welfare programs and policies',¹ they have neglected Sisters, arguably the most prominent group of organized women working for social welfare. However, they did write that the women in France had been able to graft their close relationship with the Catholic Church in order to establish welfare organizations. Regarding religious orders and congregations, they simply assert that they were a traditional group of carers for women and children. Koven and Michel argue that the growth of 'welfare bureaucracies between 1880 and 1920 led to the expansion of care-taking professions dominated by women'.² What should have been recognized and included in this article is that congregations of Sisters had already been doing those jobs for decades and, in many cases, had already assumed a relationship with the State. Koven and Michel referred to Elizabeth Wilson's study on women and the welfare state and propose that her book equates women with passivity, nurturance and submission in relation to the welfare system since it described women 'as above all mother'.³ Rightly, though without a consideration of Sisters, they claim that this sort of opinion merely emphasizes feelings of loss and obscures their roles as 'autonomous actors and agents'.⁴ The positions of men and women must be reevaluated in terms of what society deemed appropriate at a particular time rather than obscuring achievements based on present arguments and popular concepts.

²Ibid.
³Ibid. p. 1083.
⁴Ibid.
Conclusion

This chapter had highlighted the importance of the teaching Sisters after the introduction of the 1872 Education (Scotland) Act. These women ensured the viability of the separate Catholic system through the variety of teaching, administration and economic services they provided. The Catholic education system could not have survived without them and this becomes apparent when one considers the increase in Sisters after 1847, when the first congregation arrived, to 1894, when the Sisters of Notre Dame started their Teacher Training College at Dowanhill. The fact that the roles of Sisters has been under-estimated by modern historians is apparent, especially when one considers the richness of the evidence thus far provided, much of which has never been previously introduced. Glasgow has offered an excellent opportunity to consider how the work of Sisters enabled the survival of a Catholic community and their role in this process must be included if an informed impression of the Catholic Church in Glasgow is to be created.

An important parallel to Glasgow lies across the Atlantic Ocean in Toronto, Canada. It was also caught unprepared by the mass immigration, that occurred as a result of the Famine in Ireland, and like Glasgow, Toronto’s Catholic clergy looked to female religious for their diligence and skills in the fields of teaching, nursing and broader charitable activities. The following chapter seeks to identify similarities and differences between the two cities by highlighting how Toronto coped with the Irish Catholic Famine victims as a Protestant-dominated, Upper Canadian city.
The previous chapters have explored and defined the position that women religious occupied in the development of the Catholic community in Glasgow, but it is also necessary to appreciate that Glasgow was not the only city to undergo such an experience. As noted in the first chapter, there is a wealth of British scholarship that has highlighted the predicament faced by urban centres like Glasgow, Liverpool and London, as each struggled to cope with the Irish 'invasion', but a comparison has not yet been drawn with any Canadian city. Similarly, scholarly attention has been paid to Irish immigration to Canada, but in this context as well, a link or comparison with a British centre is lacking. A micro-study of a Canadian city's attempt to deal with the mass of Irish immigrants during the nineteenth century is crucial for establishing a framework for future comparisons between Britain and Canada. Toronto is a useful choice for a number of reasons, not least of which is the researcher's familiarity with the city.

Canadian scholars should find the comparative dimensions to Glasgow unique and informative, especially in terms of women's history. Although Elizabeth Smyth admits the importance of Terrence Murphy's *Creed and Culture: The Place of English-speaking Catholics in Canadian Society*, she is critical of its failure to involve the history of Sisters and believes that women religious are underrepresented in Canadian historiography. She agrees with Ruth Compton Brouwer, who has suggested that Canadian historians have been intimidated by the topic of

---


women and religion. While her critique is certainly valid, a small wealth of material does exist in Canada which is a marked contrast to the situation in Scotland. Although it is Glasgow-centred, this thesis represents the first scholarly study dedicated to the history of Roman Catholic Sisters in nineteenth-century Scotland. Unlike Scotland, Canada has a number of established and well-respected academics who have explored the work and impact of Sisters: scholars such as Alison Prentice, an expert on education and gender; Marta Danylewycz, author of the seminal book *Taking the Veil: An Alternative to Marriage, Motherhood, and Spinsterhood in Quebec, 1840-1920*, which questions the traditionally-held beliefs about the religious life and female ambition; and Elizabeth Smyth, who has published numerous works concentrating on the Sisters of St. Joseph.

Toronto’s comparative importance is examined in two sections. The first section considers Toronto as predominantly a Protestant city. Sectarian strife figures prominently, serving to emphasise the overwhelming similarities between it and Glasgow. Both cities struggled to cope with the multitude of Irish fleeing the Famine and this section is a testimony to that experience. The second section contains the essence and substance of the chapter, functioning to provide a scope of the work undertaken by two female religious congregations, the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary, more commonly known as the Loretto Sisters, who were solely a teaching congregation, and the Sisters of St. Joseph, a congregation with broader influence. The research presented here yields many useful points of comparison and serves to integrate this chapter into the wider thesis.

Three main archives were consulted in order to obtain the primary evidence necessary for an accurate assessment. The private archives of both the Loretto Nuns and the archives of the Archdiocese of Toronto (ARCAT) were scoured extensively while the private archives of the

---


Sisters of St. Joseph were perused on a comparatively limited scale. Secondary literature from a variety of Canadian and British libraries was also consulted in order to provide a useful background for Toronto and English-speaking Canada during the nineteenth century.

Like those in Glasgow, these two congregations became highly adept educators and community-builders, while in the process, confronting typhus epidemics, a destitute immigrant population, continued opposition and sporadic violence from Toronto’s largely Protestant population. Again, similarly to Glasgow, they also experienced occasionally strained relations with male clerics. All of these trials were central towards establishing their ability to work within boundaries of the Catholic Church to establish a viable Catholic diocese that came into its own as a political powerhouse for non-French-speaking Catholics west of Quebec.

**Toronto: The Protestant City**

Protestantism reigns supreme in the Diocese of Toronto, powerful, rich, and zealous, it has at its beck and call landed property, business and labour and numerous clergy, well endowed, teaching in schools in every branch and degree, churches and magnificent schools in abundance, elections and all seats in parliament, almost all public employment, houses of charity, the press and secret societies.  

Toronto, the ‘infant capital’ of British North America, was a predominantly Protestant city; the close connections formed with the Protestant traditions in Britain during its early establishment ensured this identity. Toronto’s Protestant profile was rather mixed and although Anglicans (Church of England and Church of Ireland) were the majority sect, Methodists and Presbyterians were also prominent groups. However, as capitalism expanded and reshaped ‘almost every
BEST COPY

AVAILABLE

Variable print quality
aspect of Ontario life\(^9\), the character of Protestantism changed as well and a progressive culture of Protestantism developed, wherein it was believed that ‘Freedom and liberty [would grow] out of social order’.\(^10\) The world view of Ontario Protestants corresponded with the Enlightenment’s fundamental principles of order and reason and provoked a fresh appraisal of where the Anglican Church stood in Ontario. During the 1840s and 1850s, as the Church and state affinity fragmented, a new relationship between Ontario’s dominant Protestant sects developed, and prior to Confederation in 1867, an ‘ommibus Protestant denomination’\(^11\) emerged.

Anti-Catholicism was important in this new identification because it provided common ground and permitted institutions, like the Orange Order, to bring members from the various Protestant sects together.\(^12\) Glasgow also had an enduring Protestant legacy but the profile of its Protestantism was predominantly Presbyterian and tied tightly to its Enlightenment past. Glasgow’s coveted traditions of science, philosophy, ‘human intellect’\(^13\) and wealth were, it was believed, permitted by its Presbyterian ‘reforming’ character. The decadence of Scottish society was left back in the sixteenth century, along with Roman Catholicism.\(^14\)

Prior to being re-named Toronto in 1834, it was known throughout the country as York. Jack Burnsted has explained that during the War of 1812, the city of York suffered extensive damage from the explosions and fires that ensued after the Americans had invaded.\(^15\) Toronto was not, architecturally, well-established by mid-century, and in many ways, it was just beginning to find its feet and the turmoil it experienced was enough to check its progress and growth,\(^16\) so unlike


\(^10\)Ibid., p. 86.


Glasgow, Toronto was still very much a new and developing city in the late 1840s.

In the midst of this were the settlers. Men, women and children were beginning to populate the area and to many, religion remained central to their existence. The churches had a lengthy heritage in Canada, most having arrived with the imperial intention of converting the indigenous peoples, but they had also desired to be firmly established, essential institutions in the new society. While this is an extremely general description, it serves to reinforce that in mission territories, a struggle for supremacy between the various churches was inevitable. Britain’s imperial aspirations ensured that Toronto held Protestantism as one of its central qualities. However, unlike Britain, which was facing its own Irish Catholic migrant streams, British North America housed a vibrant, well-established French Catholic population.

In Canada, as the immigration levels from Ireland grew more steady and the concerns of French Catholic Quebec had to be considered and figured into a long-lasting arrangement, a whole new way of dealing with Catholicism needed to be adopted. The Irish and French Catholics did not have an easy relationship, but commonalities, such as their Catholicism and their reputation as invaders of Ontario, did exist. However, language and culture remained divisive factors, which left the Irish very much alone in Upper Canada but particularly in Toronto. The French feared the Irish Catholics, because their force and numbers demanded instantaneous recognition in Canadian Catholicism. French Catholics were leery of mixing with outside groups because they feared the loss of their culture and in his study on the various Catholic churches in Canada, J. A. Raftis suggests that “they [French Canadians] have sought a close identification of culture, language and religion simply because of a historical memory that political conquest and cultural domination meant loss of religion”. However, the issue was more complicated since it was the dual threat to Catholicism and their language that provoked anxiety among French Catholics.

---


These two factors combined to form the essence of who they were and what it meant to be Canadien. Considering the linguistic and cultural components of the Catholic Church, if French or English Catholics were forced to choose between their language and culture or their Catholicism, both would instinctively defend their language and culture. The Irish in North America faced more ‘organised hostility’ than the Irish in Scotland, but in North America, as new immigrant groups joined the population, tension seemed to be more focussed on ethnic background than religious persuasion. This seems to highlight exactly, the situation in Toronto as hostility was directed more towards the French Canadians, despite their historic legacy in and connection to Canadian society.

The Fourth Council of the ecclesiastical province of Quebec, held in 1868, decided that the Church in Canada would be sorted along ‘linguistic and cultural lines’ by bringing the diocese of Ottawa, which was on the Ontario and Quebec border, under the control of the English Catholics. This led many Protestants to believe that Canada would be taken over by ‘papists’ and one way to avert this perceived ideological take-over was to declare: ‘this [Canada] is a Protestant country. Ours is a Protestant Queen’. In actuality, anti-Catholicism was more ‘no popery’ than anything else, and was often influenced by outside events such as ‘Papal aggression’ with the reestablishment of England’s Roman Catholic hierarchy in 1850. The vicious attitude of London’s press towards Roman Catholicism no doubt found an audience in mid-nineteenth-century Toronto. In Britain, the only city with a press to match was Edinburgh, but the important difference here, and perhaps a difference between England and Scotland, was that

---


22 Choquette, “The Archdiocese of Toronto”, p. 301. Michael J. Cottrell argues that laymen, with political aspirations, stressed the legitimacy of pursuing an agenda that focused upon the group’s non-religious interests. “Political Leadership and Party Alliance Among Irish Catholics in Victorian Toronto” in Catholics at the “Gathering Place”, p. 58.


Edinburgh's fear lay more so with the incoming Irish rather than papal aggression. Nevertheless, regardless of what many wanted to believe, Canada was not a Protestant country and before Confederation in 1867, Catholics represented about one half of the white population, and they 'had participated in Canadian public life without bringing about the noticeable enslavement of the country to Rome'.

Nevertheless, Catholics in Toronto were treated as outsiders so their survival depended upon the Church's ability to firmly establish itself. There was no real area that could be labelled an Irish Catholic space, although many Torontonians have grown up believing that Cabbagetown was the centre of the Irish Catholic community. Even R. Neil Matheson, who published an article about early panoramic photography in Toronto, alluded to the Irish-Catholic identity of Cabbagetown; he would have been more correct had he dropped the word Catholic. The image of Cabbagetown has been exaggerated and Mark McGowan has deemed it 'more of a ghetto for working-class Irish and English Protestants than for Catholics'. Similarly, Cecil Houston and William Smyth's study of Orangeism in Canada notes that it was in Cabbagetown that Orangemen lived in their 'greatest density'.

The spatial geography of Toronto is important because it differs somewhat from the cities in Britain. Despite the damage received during the War of 1812, great progress had been made by 1850, and it was observed that:

Toronto had emerged from the comfortable dormancy of a town with an economy tailored to the demands of a small administrative establishment and wore the chevrons of a commercial capital serving a prospering region.

---

26 The term 'white' has been included because it is not certain whether or not the people of the First Nations were included in this number. Miller, "Anti-Catholic Thought", p. 478.
28 Cabbagetown is located in and around Parliament Street, Gerrard Street, and Queen Street East. It was the eastern most part of the original city and it extended to the Don River.
29 Mark G. McGowan, Waning of the Green: Catholics, the Irish, and Identity in Toronto, 1887-1922. (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1999), p. 21. Special thanks to Professor McGowan for his advice and time during the research and writing of this chapter.
30 Houston and Smyth, The Sash Canada Wore, p. 106.
A review of Peter Goheen’s geographical study of Victorian Toronto notes his point about the social classes being residentially mixed. According to Goheen, residential mixing occurred primarily because Toronto was a city with virtually no economical public transportation system, and so it was necessary for people to live close to where they worked. Toronto was not, therefore, teeming with egalitarian principles, since the lack of residential segregation between occupational groups was a result of the need to be close to one’s place of work.

In 1851, while Glasgow had a population of 329,000, Toronto’s total population was only 30,775 and Roman Catholics amounted to just under one-quarter, with 7,940 people, and the total Irish population was 11,305. Irish Catholics were distinct since ‘their cult and history varied considerably’ from the mainstream population. Anti-Catholic feelings and an ‘overwhelmingly Protestant’ appearance were strongly evident in Victorian Toronto and Orange Order membership was common. According to James McAuley, who considers emigration from Northern Ireland, Orange membership in Canada was so large because many of the Protestant Irish immigrants, who were the ‘largest single group coming to settle’, had been members before they had emigrated. It is estimated that in 1871 there were 1,494 members, but by 1894 that number had almost trebled to 4,000 members; many of whom came from the working-classes. However, Cecil Houston and William Smyth believe that Orange membership in Toronto was ‘representative’ of Toronto’s Protestant population, but they point out that Anglicans and Methodists were the majority while Presbyterians were ‘surprisingly underrepresented’. In Glasgow, Presbyterians made up the bulk of Orange membership and while there was ‘strong
representation...from the industrial working class', the petty bourgeois was also represented. 41

Although Toronto’s title of ‘the Belfast of Canada’ 42 is a recent phenomenon, 43 the city has a rich Orange past. McGowan’s detailed examination of the Irish Catholics in Toronto between 1887-1922 has challenged the ignominious ‘Belfast’ title, since as the nineteenth century progressed, Toronto experienced massive changes in its economy, population and political environment which made such a title ‘less relevant’. 44 However, McGowan does believe that during the mid-nineteenth century, its image as a ‘hotbed of sectarian bigotry’ 45 was deserved, and this is comparatively important to Glasgow, which had a similar reputation, perpetuated by its geographic proximity to Belfast. A study on industrial workers and their activities in nineteenth century Toronto includes a chapter about the Orange Order, which noted its appeal to ‘patriotic and Protestant-defenders’ 46 as well as those it sustained through the difficulties of working-class life. This sentiment is echoed by other scholars, such as James McAuley, Cecil Houston, William Smyth and Jack Bumsted, who have all identified the Orange Order as a central ‘forum for ethnic fusion’ 47 and an opportunity for social interaction on a local level. 48 Membership allowed many lower-class Protestants to feel some fraternity and achieve a sense of belonging in the process: ‘if many of them [Orangemen] were socially and economically on the same level as the Catholic Irish, at least that could demonstrate their loyalty to the Crown, as their ancestors had before them’. 49

Charles Dickens’ American Notes provides useful evidence of the Orange presence in Toronto.

---

42Kealey, Toronto Workers, p. 106.
43Moir, “Toronto’s Protestants”, p. 324.
44McGowan, The Waning of the Green, p. 5.
45Ibid., p. 3.
46Kealey, Toronto Workers, p. 112. Houston and Smyth criticise Kealey’s claim that Orange membership in Toronto was predominantly working-class, The Sash Canada Wore, pp. 102 and 104.
48Bumsted, A History of the Canadian, p. 205.
He wrote that 'it is a matter of deep, regret that political differences...led to the most discreditable and disgraceful results', and that following an election which saw two men shot, one of whom died as a result, 'the very flag which shielded his murderer (not only in the commission of his crime, but from its consequences)...was orange'. In Toronto, clashes between Catholics and Orangemen were marked by riots, fighting and parades, and in this way, it was not dissimilar to Belfast, but Toronto’s violence was more 'localised and slight' and the authorities were more careful to keep hostility to a minimum. It is difficult to determine which city experienced more violent sectarianism but in both Glasgow and Toronto, the situation has been exaggerated. However, acts of violence occurred in both cities, and the Catholic clerics and Sisters felt the effects of this. The Catholic clergy constantly called on the government of Ontario and the people of Toronto to quell the violence and end the recurring abuse that was being waged against the symbols of their faith. The Sisters and their convents were beacons for violence; standing apart from the regular landscape with their ornately designed exteriors, they symbolised the success and expansion of Catholicism in the city.

Particularly vexing to some was the notion that their former properties were going to be converted into convents and Sister-run boarding schools. An entry in the Loretto Annals reveals that this was the case for at least one of their convents:

The original possessors little imagined that their beautiful house & grounds would in time become a Catholic convent, most probably, they would not have relished such an idea.

Glasgow’s Franciscan Sisters experienced a similar situation with their convent at 58 Charlotte Street. As already mentioned in the third chapter, when it was discovered that this property was going to be a convent, the previous owner made immediate moves to have the purchase...
agreement nullified and took the case to court. His reaction is understandable, for those with anti-Catholic feelings could take little comfort in the fact that their former property was to become one of Catholicism’s most glaring symbols.

Many Protestants were also angry that convent boarding schools and the regular Catholic schools accepted and educated Protestant children. The existence and continuation of Catholic schools was protected under the British North America Act of 1867, which made the issue of closing them too difficult to attempt, but this did not stop people from trying to prevent Protestant children from attending Catholic schools. On 13 February 1867, a meeting was held in Toronto with the purpose of establishing a school to oppose the convent because it was believed that the institution posed a threat to the young Protestant women being educated there:

> Many were induced by this very expensiveness to send their children...to Roman Catholic schools. The teachers of these made...promises that the religion of the pupils would not be interfered with, and parents therefore said there was no peril. But they deceived themselves: there was peril and vast peril.

What is interesting is that despite the tensions, many non-Catholic parents were choosing to send their daughters to Catholic schools. There was also concern over the great numbers of Protestants attending the Ursuline convent school in Montreal and the Loretto convent school in Toronto. It was remarked: ‘What are the Romanists doing? A friend told me that of 500 pupils in the Ursuline Convents in Montreal fully one half were Protestant, and here I know the proportion is still greater’.

The Catholic Church and many Catholics also feared proselytisation and worked diligently to provide Catholic institutions for their populations. Certainly efforts were made to bring people,
from other denominations, into the Catholic fold and it would be erroneous to suggest that the Sisters took little pride in the fact that their schools were attracting Protestant as well as Catholic pupils. After all, the motives behind bringing women religious into mission territories were for the purposes of conversion and to ensure that the settlers remained loyal to their faith. The Catholic Church knew that if the women were kept true to the faith, the families would follow and convent schools were an excellent way of ensuring loyalty since they existed to produce 'devout, loyal Roman Catholics...[and] cultured gentlewomen'.

Toronto's second bishop, Armand Francois de Charbonnel (1802-1891), was responsible for recruiting Toronto's second female religious congregation, the Sisters of St. Joseph, in 1851. De Charbonnel, the 'French ultramontane', was desperate to provide a Catholic school system so that he might 'oppose the cruel persecution that devours our children'. Yet although the Sisters of St. Joseph came up from Philadelphia with the intention of administering an orphanage, de Charbonnel soon helped the Superior, Mother Delphine Fontbonne, re-word the community's constitution in such a way that would allow them to branch out into 'private education for girls'. Almost immediately, they attracted Protestant as well as Catholic pupils.

An article which explores the 'culture and curriculum' of St. Joseph's Academy roughly between 1854-1900 (Appendix 5: 1 is a photograph of the Academy and some of its students), considers the non-Catholic pupils. Smyth explains that they were not made to participate in 'all religious
ceremonies' but were 'required to conform to the general rules of the House'. While she omits the specific details relating to which religious ceremonies students could be exempt, she acknowledges that although the non-Catholics were free to practice their own faith, it was difficult to escape what was all around them. She illustrates her point by mentioning one of the dormitory games which involved the girls dressing up and acting the part of Sisters, novices and Bishops.

As servants to their faith, Sisters tended to view their 'teaching duties in religious terms' and could not cast aside their identity. In Eileen Brewer's study of the influence that nuns had over the intellectual, emotional and religious life of American Catholic women, she argues that although the presence of all pupils was required at every religious service and class, Sisters 'reassured the parents that the religious principles of their children would always be respected.'

It was not so straightforward. A former non-Catholic pupil of Sacred Heart Academy in St. Louis believes that it was impossible for the Sisters and the school not to have made an impact on non-Catholic pupils:

The tender little customs and practices of every hour, the beliefs of their comrades, the lives of the teachers revered and passionately loved, the whole atmosphere of a Religious House - all combine to form an indirect influence as impossible to guard against as difficult afterward to counteract.

The subliminal messages and public customs of the academies were difficult to ignore, especially for impressionable young women. A concern for many opponents of Catholicism was that it 'played upon Protestant susceptibilities to sensual attractions'. It was believed that the ritual and decoration associated with many of the Catholic traditions put young Protestant women in danger of moral corruption. When Smyth mentions the dormitory games, she said that the characters with the most decorative outfits were the most popular. Pretending to be a Sister was

---

67Quoted in Ibid., p. 273.
68Ibid.
72Miller, “Anti-Catholic Thought”, pp. 490-491.
more fun than being a novice because they got to wear veils made out of the bed clothes, but the role of Bishop was the most coveted because of the elaborate vestments, the Bishop got to pick the most colourful quilt of her choice! It is true that young women were influenced when it came to fashion and colour, but it is highly doubtful that decisions about religious wardrobe requirements hinged on whether or not they would appeal to young, impressionable Protestants.

The Sisters experienced the physical threat of violence in Toronto especially when Fenianism exacerbated tensions in the 1860s. It has been previously noted that while the Sisters were targeted, the abuse tended to be of a verbal and slanderous nature. Research in Toronto has revealed that there were more recorded occasions of overt violence aimed directly at the Sisters and this is an important difference with Glasgow. Though it might just be that incidents in Glasgow were often not reported. On 11 August 1857, there was an attempt to blow up the Sisters of St. Joseph's House of Providence. According to Smyth, while working with the sick and elderly, their efforts 'met with some resistance' in the form of a jar of gunpowder and 'Mayor John Hutchinson offer[ed] a reward of £100' in an effort to bring the culprits to justice. Another incident, on New Year's Day in 1866, involved the Loretto convent on Bond Street. Someone had thrown a mini fireball through the convent's window around midnight. It landed where a Sister had been standing moments before. Archbishop John Joseph Lynch (1816-1888), responded with a scathing letter to Toronto's Mayor, Francis H. Medcalf:

This is not the first attempt of the kind on the lives of the inmates of this institution. We ourselves and clergy are constantly insulted in the most frequented streets by well-dressed youths. I have been informed that the evil spirit of bigotry and intolerance is strongly fostered in the pulpits, teaching decks, and lodges of our city...is this the Spirit of Christianity?

---

74Gallman, Receiving Erin's Children, p. 209 and 220-221. Philadelphia experienced more 'street violence' than Liverpool because of 'Philadelphia's greater demographic diversity...social hierarchies and tensions.' Could the higher violence in North American cities be attributed to a turf-war mentality? After all, no entrenched ruling-culture or power structure was so soundly in place as to claim control. In Britain, however, social and political structures were deeply-entrenched and pre-determined.
76Ibid.
77For more information, see J. M. S. Careless, Toronto to 1918: An Illustrated History. (Toronto: James Lorimer and Company, 1984), p. 102. See Appendix 5:2 for a picture of Lynch.
Medcalf was highly connected with the Orange Order, and had even served as a Grand Master at one point, so Lynch’s letter probably fell upon deaf ears. Heated struggles between the Catholic and Protestant Churches in Ontario were common in the nineteenth century because there was no single church powerful enough to envelope the new society, in the way that Protestantism in Britain had. Quebec’s large population of French Catholics was the obvious reason.

As in Britain, the fear of Nuns and convents loomed large in the minds of many Canadians. One particular example concerned Sister M. Loyola (Mary) Hewitt and the attempted abduction of her from the Loretto Convent in Guelph by her two brothers. A letter from Mother M. Teresa (Ellen) Dease to Mother M. Teresa (Frances) Ball back in Rathfarnham, Ireland on 3 October 1859 described the entire event:

Sr. M. Loyola...a boarder in the Community for three years entered last August with the express consent of both her parents. On the 22nd of September her two brothers came to see her: one of them endeavored to engross Sr. St. Stanislaus’ attention while the other was speaking to his sister, M. Loyola and urging her to go home with him: she refused to do so: he said “You must.” Then she attempted to leave the room when her brother took hold of her dress, then seized her and carried her from the house by force whilst she screamed and struggled to escape.79

In the third chapter references were made to what has been labelled the Convent Case, to Thackeray’s visit to the Ursuline Convent in Blackrock, Ireland and to the Maria Monk story, which, on account of its Canadian setting, may have been influential in this situation. Linking that discussion to this excerpt, there is overwhelming evidence that, contrary to popular belief, it was not the nuns who were kidnapping recruits or feeling suffocated by convent life but rather, in the case of Sr. M. Loyola Hewitt at least, the Sister’s family. Another strange thing about this story is that Sr. M. Loyola, an English teacher, had been educated in the Loretto Academy in Guelph, obviously with the permission of her parents, since they would have been responsible for her fees. Unfortunately, little evidence has been recorded about the motives of her brothers, but it is known

79IBVM Archives, Toronto. Box Marked: Dease Correspondence. Letter from T. Dease to Mother Ball, Rathfarnham, 3 October 1859.
that they were taken to court and ‘dismissed without so much as a reprimand’. Separate schools were a source of hostility in Toronto, but tensions increased in 1886 when Premier Sir Oliver Mowat's government passed Amendments to Separate School Legislation which offered householders the choice to support Catholic schools with their taxes. George W. Ross, Minister of Education, felt that the Catholic Schools should be treated in the same manner as the public schools and given equal access to financial resources. The issue had many Conservative opponents, but Ross referred to the law and argued: ‘what is our duty? To tell them we cannot do it [provide financial assistance] because they are Roman Catholics?’

Franklin Walker, who examines religious education in Ontario, was idealistic in his assessment that ‘it was only sensible that the man who paid the rent, and therefore indirectly the taxes, should be able to say to which school his money should be applied’. When the situation in Ontario is compared to that of Glasgow, the differences are immediately apparent. In Glasgow, roughly around the same time, 1885-1891, while many had the opportunity to take part in School Board elections, people did not have the privilege of deciding how their rates would be used. Since Scotland lacked its own parliament, educational matters were determined by the central government in London, via the Scotch Education Department, which only received its own secretary in 1885, and the implementation of regulations became the responsibility of the locally-based School Boards. The fundamental difference between Glasgow and Toronto, as far as education legislation was concerned, was the amount of distance that existed between government and educational policies. After all, by 1887 the Catholic schools in Toronto were ‘Established in law, constitutionally protected and publicly funded’. The same could not be said for Glasgow.

---

80Ibid.
81Senior agrees and writes that ‘the questions of separate schools...would continue to arouse the Protestant sentiments of Orangemen’. Orangeism: The Canadian Phase, p. 56.
83Ibid., p. 114.
84Ibid.
86McGowan, The Waning of the Green, p. 120.
87This must also be linked to what Danyleywycz has said about education. She shows how the relationship between Church and State provided the Quebec Sisters with more room to manoeuvre, but in Glasgow, where no such relationship existed, the teaching Sisters actually found themselves under tighter restrictions. Taking the Veil, pp. 24-25.
In Toronto, many believed that Roman Catholics were being coerced by the Catholic hierarchy into supporting the separate schools, and that the clergy and Archdiocese were too involved in the political and financial lives of their parishioners. Miller, in his article which examined anti-Catholicism in Canada during the nineteenth century, made a similar point about some of the Catholic parishes in Quebec. He wrote that while 'most Quebec towns boasted a magnificent church, a fine house for the priest and a vast convent...the remainder of the place consisted generally of a collection of hovels'. Criticism of the Church in Toronto appears in the form of a poster entitled *Church Tyranny!*. While the poster was signed 'An Irishman and Father of a Family', no other name exists to identify the author, but in spite of this evidentiary glitch, it serves to present a less than flattering picture of the Catholic Church in Toronto, at least according to one person. The poster reflects the disapproval of the events which were taking place in St. Paul’s parish during the 1850s, and this excerpt suggests that like Glasgow, the Church in Toronto was asking an incredible amount from its parishioners:

> We believe it is a mortal sin not to hear mass on Sundays if possible, then will not the person who renders it impossible for us to hear mass without the three pence be guilty of this sin? The supporters of the system say no, for if you have not three pence we will give you a paupers ticket. But I say I am not a pauper. Yet, there are times when I have not three pence for one and all of my family; and I am not obliged to degrade myself and family to enter the Church on a pauper’s ticket.\(^9\)

The author continues in the same vein, speaking about the cruelty being exercised against the poor and workingmen, who were treated more like 'slaves'\(^9\) than honourable citizens. In the second last paragraph, an important reference was made to the contribution of women to the protest movement. This is fascinating since the activities of women, in relation to the Church, are rarely featured in such a provocative manner:

> ...independent and influential women, filled with ardent desire of their own freedom, and that of their poorer country people come to the church not only with an intention not to pay 3d. but with a determination of using all their influence to dissuade others from supporting the present tyranny'.\(^9\)

---

\(^8\)Quoted in Miller, "Anti-Catholic Thought", p. 480.

\(^9\)ARCAT. CAC02.31 *Church Tyranny!* 1857.

\(^9\)Ibid.

\(^9\)Ibid.
Not only were women active in this protest movement, but they had influence as well. Women were major contributors to the philanthropic movement that was very popular during the mid-to-late nineteenth century. Maria Luddy emphasises this and points out that many women spread themselves thin as they endeavoured to make life more comfortable for those less fortunate.92

Canadian Confederation occurred on 1 July 1867. During the pre-Confederation era, education came under the jurisdiction of the government of British North America, but post-Confederation saw decentralisation and the creation of provincial legislatures to deal with provincial issues. Referring to a point made earlier, perhaps this is one of the reasons why the sectarian issues in Toronto managed to resolve themselves. There was direct government involvement to alleviate the tensions, partly because the two main political parties, the Liberals and the Conservatives, recognised that anti-Catholic policies alienated potential voters. However, it took four successive Liberal Majority governments, 1871-1905, before the Conservatives recognized that a more tolerant tone was needed.

The work of Archbishop Lynch was also important in quelling the hostility, or at least making the issue more about language than religion,93 though some of his actions horrified clergymen back in Ireland. In many ways, a sectarian instigator to both Protestants and many Catholics,94 Lynch took the hard-lined approach when he submitted one of his famous letters to the Editors of the Public Press in Canada and Ireland in 1883. He did not blame the poor of Ireland for their sufferings but asked those in positions of power, clergy included, to press for innovations that would make Ireland less susceptible to its unfortunate climate.95 This provoked an angry response from those sympathetic to Irish nationalism and in December 1883, John Wilson Bengough, 'the father of Canadian political cartooning',96 criticised Lynch for his uncharitable statements in Grip.

92Maria Luddy, Women and Philanthropy in Nineteenth Century Ireland. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995) for a useful examination of the range of work women were involved with.
93Choquette describes Lynch as 'a monolingual Irishman [who was determined to] maintain the primacy of the English language... [in] Ontario'. "The Archdiocese of Toronto", p. 302.
95ARCAT. LAE06.28. Letter from His Grace the Archbishop of Toronto on the State of Ireland, 15 February 1883.
a Toronto weekly. His drawing, entitled *Heartless Desertion* (Appendix 5:3), depicts the figures of Lynch and Toronto (represented as a woman) with Irish paupers in their arms asking Britannia to look after her own poor instead of shipping them to Toronto. Although provocative, Lynch’s effort to prevent the further perpetuation of negative images of the Irish was certainly gutsy, and the Irish clergy were not accustomed to receiving criticism from one of their own.

Lynch’s political notions seemed to differ significantly from a number in the lay community and his support of the Conservative Party, which was led by the Glasgow-born John A. MacDonald (1815-1891), served as the wedge. Choquette believes that the Church leaders ‘must simultaneously represent the aspirations of their people before the majority and adapt these same aspirations to secure their acceptance by the majority population’ but that does not appear to have happened in Toronto. It became an issue of control between the Catholic ‘leading political laymen’. Perhaps Lynch’s problem was his assumption that his way was the right way, and eventually, people got tired of being excluded from the political realm.

Previously, in 1877, Lynch had chastised Irish clergymen for begging in his diocese. In a letter to Dr. Bultes, Bishop of Limerick, Lynch criticised Rev. Eugene Sheeby and advised that he leave Toronto and its Irish alone:

> Your Lordship is fully aware that the vast majority of our people are Irish driven from their homes by an oppression which cries to heaven for vengeance, but they carry with them the greatest of all treasures, their faith and a princely generosity...but your Lordship will concede with me that it is hard to push a people like this too much. There are times and seasons for all things. The best things may be carried to excess and become a nuisance.

Evidence presented by Michael Toner confirms Irish-Canadian generosity towards their brethren back in Ireland. In 1862, when famine threatened the west of Ireland, committees were formed to collect money in Quebec city, Montreal, and Kingston and although $13,818.83 was raised, most donations were under $1. Before the Irish in Canada would be able to help others, they

---

98Cotrell, “Political Leadership”, p. 58.
99Ibid., p. 59.
100ARCAT. B113, Box 3. General Correspondence 1855-1949. Letter from Lynch to Lord Bishop, Dr. Bultes, of Limerick, 19 December 1877.
had to obtain a sense of security for themselves. This leads into the second part of this chapter because it was in enabling the Irish of Toronto to get back on their feet and work towards a viable and stable Irish Catholic community, that the work of the Sisters was most apparent.

The Loretto Sisters and the Sisters of St. Joseph: Irish-Influenced Institutes

For very many years, we were known through the Dominion of Canada as an Irish Institute...we were proud of our calling ourselves an Irish community, add to this all the Irish priests to whose advice we depend for postulance. As long as Rome lasts we shall have Irish Bishops.102

The words are those of Sister Evangelista O'Sullivan (1846-1934), a Loretto who joined the Toronto community on 26 October 1865. In her day, O'Sullivan was a woman of considerable clout in Toronto's business world and through the Loretto Secretarial College, she 'prepar[ed] thousands of girls for the business world'.103 The above quote indicates that the Loretto Sisters clearly saw themselves, and were identified by those around them, as an Irish institute, the Irish presence was represented in the ranks of Toronto's Catholic clergy, and the Sisters were not unmoved by their nationalist sympathies. This final theme will be explored more fully later.

The Loretto Nuns arrived in Toronto on 16 September 1847. Over the course of their forty three-day journey, they touched four countries: Ireland, England, the United States and Canada. Accounts of how the Loretto Sisters came to Toronto are strikingly similar to the experiences of both the Franciscan Sisters and Sisters of Mercy on their journeys to Glasgow. Michael Power (1804-1847), born in Halifax, Nova Scotia to parents of Irish birth, was ordained as Toronto's first bishop on 8 May 1842.104 While Bishop, he had travelled to Europe to recruit Sisters. He met

104Appendix 5:4 is a picture of Bishop Michael Power.
with Mother M. Teresa Ball (1794-1860), foundress of the Loretos, and successfully secured a promise from Ball to send some of her Sisters to Toronto for the purposes of education.

On 5 August 1847, five Sisters left Rathfarnham, destined for their new home in Toronto. They were: Mother Ignatia (Anne) Hutchinson (1818-1851), named Superior for the new Canadian community, Sister Gertrude (Mary) Fleming (1821-1850), Mother Teresa (Ellen) Dease (1820-1889), who succeeded to Superior after Mother Hutchinson's death and went on to be a highly influential leader. There was also Sister Bonaventure (Mary Anne) Phelan (1817-1849), a victim of tuberculosis just twenty months after the group's arrival, and finally, there was Sister Berkmans (Valentina) Hutchinson (dates unknown), the younger sibling of Mother Ignatia who left Ireland as a postulant.

Initially, the group travelled to Liverpool, where they spent some time at a Mercy convent before departing the 'gloomy city' for New York on 11 August 1847. Their journey to America aboard the Garrick cost £25 per Sister and the Annals provide a glimpse of what could be considered an awkward predicament involving the Garrick's captain:

...a sailing vessel with good accommodations & a rough kind [of] captain, whose manner & conversation were far from congenial to the feelings of those who, being unused to such, shrank from the

---


108IBVM Archives, Toronto. Box Marked: Earliest Annals. Cream Folder: No. 1, no page numbers. Valentina Hutchinson had a difficult time in Canada. After the death of her sister, she became 'despondent' and was sent back to Ireland where she regained her health. She ventured to Canada again but was sent back to Ireland. Also Kerr, *Dictionary of Biography*, p. 78.


110ARCAT. B103, 1816-1849, General Correspondence. Letter from M. Teresa Ball to Bishop M. Power, 20 July 1847.
daily ordeal to which each meal exposed them.\textsuperscript{111}

The voyage to New York took just over five weeks and after docking they travelled to Albany and then on to Rochester, where they crossed Lake Ontario to arrive in Toronto on 16 September 1847. Their first impressions of Toronto and the Bishop’s Palace were not flattering:

On reaching the palace they were kindly but sadly received by the good prelate over whom the coming gloom had already cast its somber shadow [sic]. The place looked bare and oppressively lonely...everything seemed poor and as if the place were struggling into life.\textsuperscript{112}

Just two weeks after their arrival, Bishop Michael Power died of typhus, which was largely a consequence of his work with the Famine immigrants that year.\textsuperscript{113} O’Sullivan’s writing teems with exaggerated accounts so it must be put into an appropriate context. Her vivid picture of Toronto in the Autumn of 1847 looks like this:

The entire city might be called a vast plague spot. Typhus fever was raging in the Bishop’s house. One priest was lying delirious in his room, Archdeacon Hay, the Bishop’s secretary, seemed already advanced in consumption...[Dean Kirwan] was convalescing from the dread disease and the bishop sent him the next morning to recuperate at Niagara Falls. The Bishop was now alone, he made his visits to the sheds as usual. Dead bodies were being carted away hourly. When enquiries were made about the patients, he would say, ‘I have heard their confessions and anointed several today’...The Bishop is dead was the announcement October 1. Terrible was the blow to the nuns.\textsuperscript{114}

Power’s death was a blow to the Sisters, who unaccustomed to Toronto, were forced to watch its condition grow increasingly fragile. After 1820, general immigration from Ireland had increased the number of poor overall, but the problem was exacerbated by the Irish Famine. Irish immigration to Ontario between 1820 and 1890 was the ‘most significant single movement of

\textsuperscript{112}Ibid., p. 11-12.
\textsuperscript{113}E. Margaret Crawford provides a good discussion on disease and the immigrants in “Migrant Maladies: Unseen Lethal Baggage” in The Hungry Stream: Essays on Emigration and Famine. (Belfast: The Institute of Irish Studies, The Queen’s University of Belfast, 1987).
population in nineteenth-century Ontario. In 1848, the Irish population in Toronto was 1,695 but by 1851, it jumped to 11,305. The Famine immigration is considered ‘a late and most tragic spasm’ when compared to Irish immigration on the whole. Houston and Smyth sadly remark that of over 100,000 Famine immigrants who arrived in Canada, within a year one third of them were dead. Like Glasgow, Toronto was unprepared for the flood of Famine Irish and the diseases that followed. Fever sheds were constructed to ‘contain the infectious diseases the immigrants carried’ and those considered to be natives of the city ‘saw them as an alien group because of their diseases’.

The situation for the orphans is a particularly good example of the striking similarities that existed between Glasgow and Toronto since many of Toronto’s children also themselves orphaned by the typhus epidemic that had snatched their parents. The increase of ‘poor forlorn little ones’ in 1849 necessitated a call for Sisters to come from Montreal to help care for them. It was hoped that a couple of Sisters would be able to ‘make a trial of it for this one Winter’, but the recruitment of Sisters under such conditions was difficult.

After 1851, the Sisters of St. Joseph played a pivotal role in the facilitation of orphan care in Toronto. This congregation had been reestablished in France after the Revolution in 1808 and undertook activities ranging from hospital care to education and prison work. In 1835 the French Superior was asked to send some of her Sisters to North America by Bishop Joseph Rosati of St. Louis. After working in St. Louis, Mother M. Delphine and Sr. M. Martha Bunning, both of whom later moved on to Toronto, set up another community in Philadelphia to take charge of

116Cottrell, “Political Leadership”, p. 64.
117Houston and Smyth, Irish Emigration and Canadian Settlement, p. 8.
118Ibid., p. 3.
120Moir, Church and Society, p. 81.
121Ibid., p. 82.
122Smyth, “‘Developing the powers of the youthful mind’, p. 105.
the St. John’s Orphan Asylum. It was from Philadelphia that the Toronto foundation was established on 7 October 1851. Again, like Glasgow, the second congregation into the city took immediate charge of an orphanage. Not only were they responsible for care-giving, but they were also responsible for the financial commitments associated with maintaining the facility. Since most of the children were destitute, the Sisters bore a significant financial burden and embarked upon begging tours and held benefit concerts to generate more income.

In terms of illness and death among Sisters, more similarities between Glasgow and Toronto come into focus. As already highlighted, the Glasgow congregations lost many Sisters during their first few years in Glasgow. In the Loretto community, three of the first five Sisters were struck down by illness within the first four years. The Sisters of St. Joseph also suffered losses including their Superior, Mother M. Delphine Fontbonne, who died of typhus in 1856. One year earlier, on 23 October 1855, Sister Alphonsus (Mary) Margerum, had died of typhus at the age of just 20 years. The Loretto community lost Mother M. Ignatia Hutchinson on 9 March 1851 at the age of 33. Two years after she arrived in Toronto, she began to suffer from what is believed to have been consumption and died within a few months of diagnosis. After her death, de Charbonnel wrote that he had sent her sister, Valentina, back to Ireland ‘in order not to have to bury her like her sister, the Superior’. Sr. M. Bonaventure (Mary) Phelan contracted tuberculosis during her first Canadian winter but struggled with the illness until her death on 11 April 1849 at the age of 32. The third member to perish was Sr. M. Gertrude Fleming, who emulated the hardship endured by Toronto’s pioneering Sisters.

Records from the Loretto Archives provide a poignant account of her suffering. The winter of 1850 was so severe that during her walks to and from school, her right foot regularly froze until

---

123 Bouchard, “Pioneers Forever: The Sisters of St. Joseph”, p. 108. Gallman also mentions this and while spends little time on Sisters, he sees them as important, especially in relation to healthcare (St. Joseph’s Hospital). Receiving Erin’s Children, p. 104 and 157.
126 Ibid., p. 50.
128 Kerr, Dictionary of Biography, p. 78.
129 Ibid., p. 107.
130 Kerr, Dictionary of Biography, pp. 155-156.
gangrene set in. They had to amputate her foot, but her suffering continued as disease crept up her leg and into her knee. The remarkable aspect is that although she could no longer walk to St. Michael's, she continued to teach in a school near the convent, St. Francis Xavier, until finally, she was unable to get out of bed and died on Christmas Day 1850 at the age of 29. These accounts are significant because they expose what it took, on a human level, to create a viable education system for the Catholic children of Toronto, Glasgow, and elsewhere. While it is important to look at the legislators and the official policies, it is also essential to remember the people who did the work. The first Sisters to venture into new ‘mission’ territories were trailblazers and they set the examples by which the later members and recruits would live. This rings true in both cities, since both the Loretto and the Franciscans were the first religious congregations, male or female, to begin working in Toronto and Glasgow. In Scotland, almost three hundred years had passed since the Reformation had extinguished the monasteries before the presence of nuns could once again be felt. Canada was a new nation without the religious precedents of Europe, which was equally challenging for those new Sisters.

Another aspect central to the Canadian experience is the climate. Newcomers to Canada faced a difficult and treacherous time come winter, whereas in Scotland, the situation was less extreme. The *Statistical Account for Scotland* in 1845 explained that Glasgow’s inland location provided more shelter than north west England and Edinburgh, but described Glasgow as very rainy, with an average of 22.33 inches annually. So despite being periodically problematic and perpetually dreary, the weather in Scotland cannot be fairly compared to the weather in Canada. Unfortunately, this fact may not have been made clear to the Sisters or any of the other

---

131 A map shows that she would have had to walk ½ block west, 2 blocks north, 2 blocks west and then the equivalent of 2 blocks north. IBVM Archives, Toronto. Box Marked: Earliest Records. Cream Folder: *Early Education in the Institute*. Early map of their education district in Toronto. And Box Marked: Earliest Annals. Cream Folder: No. 1, p. 7.


133 Suellen Hoy stresses the fundamental role that the ‘first wave’ of Sisters who ventured out to missions had. She is one of the few scholars to acknowledge the importance of weather. “The Journey Out: The Recruitment and Emigration of Irish Religious Women to the United States 1812-1914” in *Journal of Women’s History*. Vol. 6 No. 4 (Winter/Spring, 1995), pp. 68-69.

prospective emigrants, for that matter. Contemporary emigration literature, which described the climate of Upper Canada [Ontario] as ‘considerably milder than that of the Lower province [Quebec] and the winter shorter in the same proportion’, was misleading. The *Emigrant’s Hand-Book* included a rather white-washed comparison between the British and Canadian climates:

> On a comparison with the climate of Great Britain, the heat in the summer months is somewhat greater, but never oppressive...there is less rain than in England, but it falls at more regular periods...the winter cold, though it exceeds that of the British Isles, it is less sensibly felt, in consequence of its dryness, and seldom continues in intensity for more than three days together.  

The *Hand-Book* also contained a quote from the *Colonial Magazine* wherein it was suggested that, when compared to Britain, ‘it is neither so much warmer in the summer nor so much colder in the winter, as to prove disagreeable’. Obviously, those painting the picture of Canada in the winter were looking at the conditions through rose-coloured spectacles, but it is doubtful that many emigrants would have been enticed by the truth. The information provided in *Chambers’s Information For The People* is similar but at least acknowledged the snow and, in a manner sounding very much like a seasonal carol, the reader seems led to believe that all concerns about the snow would drift away with a sleigh ride:

> While it [snow] remains upon the ground, the carriage called a *sleigh or cariole* is exclusively used and forms a delightful mode of conveyance, one pair of horses being able to draw several persons sixty or seventy miles in the course of a day, without much fatigue.  

In step with this lovely image, was the observation that the winter air, with its ‘bracing and exhilarating effects’ assisted one in learning to bear the cold without much bother. Impressions such as these were too quaint and if the Sisters were reading this type of emigration literature,

---

137 *Chambers’s Information for the People*. Conducted by William and Robert Chambers. No. I Emigration to Canada. Date unknown but assumed to be before 1834 since York is mentioned rather than Toronto, p. 5.  
they would not have been remotely prepared for what awaited them.

Judith Fingard’s valuable article considers the experience of the poor as they encountered the harsh climate of British North America between 1815-1860. Most European settlers would not have had the necessary exposure to long periods of extreme snow, cold and ice that would have prepared them for their new surroundings. Fingard quotes G. E. Fenety (1812-1899), a Halifax-born, New Brunswick newspaper owner as well as the Queen’s Printer for that province, who remarked that ‘winter is a terrible enemy to the destitute in this most rigorous climate’. Indeed, winter ‘deprived the poor of their employment...and endangered their health by aggravating the plight of the sick’. She establishes that without employment, one’s ability to secure sufficient firewood with which to keep warm and fed was severely hindered, and pushed many to opt for rum as a cheap alternative.

Those first Sisters in Toronto were indeed the ‘uninitiated’ since they had no way of knowing what they were in for and perhaps their recruiters made no real effort to inform them since it could jeopardize their decision to come. Evidence from both the Loretto and the Sisters of St. Joseph overwhelmingly suggest that they were completely unprepared for the ‘unaccustomed [to the] severity of the climate’. Insufficient clothing, footwear and heating spelled disaster. The following excerpt refers to Sr. M. Gertrude Fleming and comes from one of Mother M. Teresa Ball’s letters and it helps to explain their difficult circumstances:

...the 2 sisters who taught there [St. Michael’s] set out on foot every morning to plough their way back through thick snow, carrying a bundle of firewood under their shawls to make a fire in the school...as they were the first out in the morning, they beat a path for people coming after them. When they reached the school with their unsuitable clothing and footwear soaked through, there

---

141 Ibid., p. 250.
142 Ibid., pp. 252 and 260.
143 Ibid., p. 257.
No means of drying or changing their clothes, so they wore them all day long until five o’clock in the evening...It is no wonder that one of these heroic sisters soon developed gangrene in her foot, while the other got tuberculosis. 145

In 1850, Mother M. Ignatia Hutchinson, stressed that Irish Sisters en route to Canada must bring flannel with them since it would better prepare them ‘for their voyage and change of climate’. 146 The Sisters of St. Joseph have similar records which indicate the suffering endured on account of the harsh climate. Their Annals note that the niece of the Superior perished on 24 November 1877 because of her inability to cope with the cold:

Miss Katie Mackay, Reverend Mother’s niece died at 1:30 am. She had not left her home in England a year when she fell victim to disease caused by the change and severity in the climate. She had been 21 years old. 147

It was the same story at the Loretto convent at Niagara Falls and the Superior, Sr. M. Evangelista (Julia) O’Connor, had even written to Archbishop Lynch to inform him of the unfortunate situation in which the Sisters were living: ‘they are so cold, and tired and they come home [from teaching] - they have not the courage to set out in the morning’. 148 The post-script at the bottom added that ‘Since the opening of the school last July the nuns had to be changed three or four times - their health broken down’. 149 It was a serious situation, though not uncommon.

Since the Sisters spent time helping the sick and the dying during Toronto’s continual epidemics, many died as a result. Testimony in the Sisters of St. Joseph records show that Mother M. Delphine’s death was directly linked to her work with and exposure to typhus victims: ‘she contracted the disease after spending the night with a wretched woman in the poorer quarters of

---


148 ARCAT. Sisters of Loretto, General Correspondence, 1861-1879. Letter Sr. Mary Evangelista to Archbishop Lynch, 18 December 1876.

149 Ibid.
The year 1855 was horrible for typhus in Toronto and this took a serious toll on the Sisters as both the death and desertion rates rose as a result. Mother M. Delphine described the dire situation in a letter just 19 days before her death:

Since October we have always had 2 or 3 Sisters ill and we have lost 2: Sister Alphonsus who died in Hamilton and Sister Ignatius who died here at the novitiate. She was a novice but an excellent religious. In losing her, we have lost a pillar for the future organization...you can conclude that I have plenty to do, with only young Sisters around; and in the midst of all this trouble, 2 of the professed Sisters left the Congregation.\(^{151}\)

She also made the point of mentioning that for the younger Sisters, ‘the least wind of adversity overwhelms them and causes them to fall’.\(^{152}\) Previously, the second chapter revealed a similar, but more extreme pattern with the Sisters of Mercy, whose list of non-perseverence showed 38 women as having left the community in the space of 18 years,\(^{153}\) all of whom withdrew before profession. It is difficult to imagine inexperienced novices being prepared for the demands of their vocation. Perhaps the idea of becoming a Sister had been a little too romantic and the actual reality was far less appealing.

Often, only women in good physical condition were accepted into a novitiate, which is suggestive of the demanding work required of the Sisters and of the community’s desire for future stability. Being able to cope with the rigours of religious life was an important prerequisite. In her study of Sisters and Nuns in England and Wales, Barbara Walsh observes that two particular communities, the Sisters of St. Paul the Apostle and the Sisters Sacred Hearts of Jesus and Mary, sent many unsuccessful applicants home, ‘declared unfit for the religious life due to a lack of health’.\(^{154}\) She explains that ‘the process of slow and careful selection...ensured that only the fittest and most dedicated of girls made the grade to final profession of vows as a religious’.\(^{155}\)

---


\(^{151}\) CSJA. Mother Delphine. Personal File/Correspondence, 18 January 1856.

\(^{152}\) Ibid.

\(^{153}\) SMCA, Glasgow. List drawn up on December 12th 1881 of those who entered this community but did not persevere, 1849-1881. Green plastic binder with ‘Brief History of Glasgow Foundation’ and Hand-Written Account of Foundation’ on the cover.


\(^{155}\) Ibid.
Among the Franciscan Sisters, there were at least six occasions that the Council sent young aspirants home because of poor health, deemed to be 'unable to perform the required exercises of the community, and in consequence unfit for the Religious life'.  

Admitting a woman in good physical condition could never rule out future problems. This point was discussed in chapter three where it was acknowledged that the incredible work that was demanded of the Sisters by the elementary schools in Glasgow: 'the health of the best and most efficient Sisters was breaking down under the double amount of labour they were obliged to undertake'. Perhaps young women, eager to devote themselves to God did not stop to consider how incredible the pressure would be. The useful research conducted by Yvonne McKenna, which will be more fully examined later, demonstrates that the call to do God’s work was not the only consideration. A poem found at the Mercy Convent in Limerick convincingly establishes that working for the common good should always be the primary goal. Certainly the fact that the poem was written by the Mother Superior, whose job it was to inspire and remind Sisters of their duties, must be duly considered when reading it.

We all sat round our mother’s knee  
With hearts quite light and conscious free  
And then with all her wonted grace  
She looked at each child’s smiling face  
Asking with a roguish smile  
Free from all that could beguile  
If she were ready for her crown  
As cholera was come to town.

Oh! Could you then see all the eyes  
Sparkle disdain? with surprise  
How could you ask Mother dear  
What did we seek when we came here?  
Oh! Was it not with him to be  
Who died with us on Cavalry  
Yes! We are ready,  
Lead us on to work ere this our day is gone  
You now must pass two days from this

---

156 FSICA. Sister Professions & Receptions, Vols. I & II, held by the Superior.
To see a sight t'were wrought to miss\textsuperscript{158}

The poem supports the point that choosing the religious life was not an easy decision for a young woman, especially during periods of cholera and typhus, when it could be seen as life-threatening. When the reality of the decision actually set in, it probably provoked fear and panic in many, rather than joy and an increased sense of spirituality.

Clearly these were stumbling blocks and had to be overcome before they could fully focus on education, but the LorettoS quickly established a boarding academy.\textsuperscript{159} The \textit{Mirror}, a Toronto weekly, printed an article about the academy and listed the courses on offer. The Sisters hoped to 'receive between fifteen to twenty boarders'\textsuperscript{160} with the standard fee of £30 0 0 for boarders and £12 10 0 for day scholars, both on a per annum basis.\textsuperscript{161} This fee covered the instruction of reading, writing, elocution, arithmetic, English, French, history, geography and ornamental needlework; the fee varied according to how many extras (Italian, music, drawing, and painting) a student required.\textsuperscript{162} The Sisters of St. Joseph saw education as their 'second major endeavour'\textsuperscript{163} and their academy was very similar to the one operated by the LorettoS. It offered a range of subjects including arithmetic, geography, English, French, ornamental needlework and painting, and initially, they were suited to take fifteen to twenty borders at an annual fee of £25. Their convent academy was fully operational by 1854 and by 1892, they 'represented over 80 per cent of the teaching sisters in the Toronto separate schools'.\textsuperscript{164}

Like Glasgow, the Toronto congregations were overwhelmed by work. In both cities, evidence demonstrates that the Sisters were focussing so much energy towards the schools that their religious contemplation was being neglected, or set aside. Archbishop Lynch's letter to Mother M. Antoinette (most likely Henrietta McDonell), the St. Joseph Superior, reveals why he was sorry that the Sisters had taken over the Brockton School:

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{159}See Appendices 5:6 and 5:7, for photographs of Loretto Academy students.
\item \textsuperscript{160}The \textit{Mirror}, 24 September 1847.
\item \textsuperscript{161}Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{162}Ibid. Appendix 5:5 exhibits them giving an art class.
\item \textsuperscript{163}Smyth, "Christian Perfection and Service", p. 48.
\item \textsuperscript{164}Ibid., pp. 48-49.
\end{itemize}
...the Order can hardly supply the existing wants. There is another condition very injurious to the community; it is that the novices are so engaged in teaching and other works that there is very little time for recollection and religious exercises. And many are sickly from overwork and naturally break down under it.  

The LorettoS were part of the first wave of 'public' female elementary school teachers. Generally, women did not teach in 'large schools outside the home' until after mid-century. Upon their arrival in 1847, the Sisters placed themselves immediately in the public realm, opening both public poor schools and a boarding academy. The inclusion of women in elementary education at a public level was not completely due to the teaching Sisters, though their influence should not be underestimated. Alison Prentice identifies four main reasons for the 'feminization of teaching': firstly, the administrators and 'propagandists' started to accept women in the classroom; secondly, the administrators became more concerned with saving money as more and more public schools were required, thirdly, the women themselves began to accept the public role teaching offered and became more 'desirous' of it and fourthly, Sisters were role models and had significant influence over what many women decided to do with their lives.  

It has also been suggested that women made good teachers because they were able to control a class of children. Edmund Hillyer Duval, the principal of the Provincial Training School for Teachers for New Brunswick, felt that in terms of classroom discipline, women had something extra and maintained 'as efficient order' as men, though this was in spite of his belief that they were 'not so capable of maintaining government in schools'. Many congregations went into...

---

165 ARCAT. LB05.070 Letter from Archbishop Lynch to Mother M. Antoinette, 16 November 1886.  
166 Prentice, "The Feminization of Teaching", p. 375.  
167 Ibid., p. 376.  
168 Ibid., pp. 376-377.  
169 Ibid., p. 377.  
170 Ibid.
a diocese with the sole purpose of teaching the girls, but when circumstances were difficult and there was a shortage of teachers, Sisters often took on classes of boys. When European Sisters moved into a mission territory, they had to modify themselves and their traditions in order to make things work. A rather unique photograph (Appendix 5:7) shows Sr. M. Alberta (Caroline) Chilton with twenty young male pupils, and this bit of evidence helps to illustrate that when the European orders established themselves in countries like Canada and the United States, modifications were introduced. At times, conflicts surfaced between those Sisters in the mission territories, who saw what was needed, and those Superiors in the native country, who felt that the Rules and Constitutions would be compromised. Barbara J. Cooper's research is a useful appraisal of these issues, insofar as they relate to the Superiors.

Back in Ireland, Sisters could expect to receive Mass within the convent and take recreation within the convent grounds, but in Toronto and elsewhere in North America, the formal expectations had to be relaxed simply because the circumstances were often very different. For example, in Toronto it was normal for Sisters to teach boys, leave convent grounds to attend Mass and take their exercise off concert grounds when physical space was limited. Indeed, these public activities may have worked to their advantage because if people saw them making an effort to adapt to and address local needs, perhaps support, both financial and emotional, would be more forthcoming.

Getting back to the photograph of the boys' class, it was unusual to have a Sister in charge of a boys' school in Britain. Financial concerns were constant in Catholic education systems so the need for Sisters to expand their services and teach boys as well as girls, must be linked with this. Mother M. Teresa Dease wrote to Mother M. Teresa Ball in Rathfarnham and mentioned the positive influence the Sisters had on the boys.

171Christina LEi explains that Loretto convent design often resembled large homes and displayed a lot of Marian imagery. This fulfilled the Loretto aims of 'devotion to the Church and the perpetuation of the virtues of womanhood'. "The Material Culture of the Loretto School for Girls in Hamilton, Ontario, 1865-1971" in Canadian Catholic Historical Association Historical Studies. Vol. 66 (2000), pp. 99 and 106. Appendix 5:6 is a photo of the 'Old Abbey'.

172Her criticism of the 'tendency to focus on the accomplishments of the leadership seemed contradictory since her essay focussed entirely upon the activities and tribulations of the Superiors. Barbara J. Cooper, "Hagiology and History: A Re-Examination of the Early Years of the North American Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary" in Catholics at the "Gathering Place", p. 89.
In Toronto we have had a select school of boys for many years, but never a boys's separate school, this being taught by the Brothers of the Christian Schools. The impression is that the nuns have a refining and sanctifying influence over the boys, and another consideration is that the nuns are very moderately remunerated by the Trustees of the Separate School Board, therefore the Board can economize.¹⁷³

The letter excerpt reveals a reluctant desire on the part of the Toronto community to take up the cause of male education, but there, like Glasgow as the previous chapters revealed, there was a certain degree of competition between communities, as the following excerpt illustrates:

Will you...say what you think of our taking charge of the boys of the poorer class of society. The boys of the poorer classes are numerous, and will require three nuns at least...I fear the tax on the members and strength of the nuns...Great good can be done in a parish by teaching the boys, but it is, as it were, cutting down the tree for the sake of the fruit. If we decline taking the boys' Separate school, it will be offered to the Sisters of St. Joseph who will probably accept it. This would render us very unpopular.¹⁷⁴

These two selections beg the question of whether or not the Sisters were being asked to expand their roles simply because they were the cheaper option. The answer is partly yes, but their religious status and the fact that they could control a classroom full of boys, were also important considerations. Salaries remained a major concern and it has been shown that in Toronto in 1870, the salaries for female teachers were much lower than their male counterparts, with the average annual salaries running between $220-$400 for women and $600-$700 for men.¹⁷⁵ Opportunities for professional mobility among female teachers were limited and men climbed the professional ladder at a far greater speed. However, Sisters were an exception and faced fewer professional restrictions. The single sex environment offered in Roman Catholic schools ensured Sisters prominent positions and provided them with many advanced administrative or governing roles.¹⁷⁶

The biographic details for the Lorettoos reveal that many were either head of their area or indeed

¹⁷³ IBVM Archives, Toronto. Box Marked: Dease Correspondence. Black Binder #1, 1851-1876. Letter from T. Dease to Rathfarnham Superior, Xaveria Fallan, 11 July 1884.
¹⁷⁴Ibid.
¹⁷⁵Alison Prentice, et. al., eds., Canadian Women: A History. (Toronto: Harcourt Brace & Co. Canada, 1996), p. 135. It is noted that in rural areas, the salaries were even lower, standing at an average of $187.00 for women and $260.00 for men.
¹⁷⁶Ibid.
head of the school.

Their work was accompanied by important changes that were being introduced by government as a way to create a more educated society. In fact, it would appear that the governments of Upper and Lower Canada were well ahead of Britain when it came to education. There was a move towards determining its own future and advances, separate from Britain, by creating an education system. Concern about education existed during the 1820s and 1830s but, as Bruce Curtis, an educational historian, suggests, 'it did not fill an educational void'. 177 However, the Education Settlement of 1850 established state schooling 'in principle' 178 and after Confederation education became the responsibility of the provincial governments. The roots of every national or provincial system of education have been inspired by something and the early years of Catholic education in Toronto witnessed incredible input from Sisters. The Irish influence on the early educational endeavours of the LorettoS was considerable since many Sisters had been trained by and had taught in the Irish system. This must have been a comfort to some of their pupils, especially those born in Ireland and whose families maintained strong links to it because 'the books were familiar, the educational structure was understood'. 179 Egerton Ryerson, (1803-1882) who went on to become Upper Canada's Chief Superintendent of Education, visited Ireland in 1844 and had been 'impressed... with the activities of the Irish National Board of Education and with its books'. 180 His textbook policy, drafted in 1845-46, was 'used as a basis for the Education Act of 1846'. 181 Ryerson wanted to build a common school programme with a curriculum that was virtually identical to that of Ireland. 182

James Love reveals threads of an evolving Canadian national identity, especially after the 1837 Rebellion. He argues that the decision to use Irish books was largely a reaction against American social and cultural domination being asserted through the use of American texts. 183 The decision

---

178 Ibid., p. 17.
179 Gaffield, Language, Schooling, p. 15.
181 Ibid., p. 357.
182 Curtis, Building the Educational, p. 108.
to use Irish textbooks was not done in an effort to comfort the newly-arrived Irish, though the policy did provide pupils access to an Irish undercurrent. In the Loretto's first boarding school Mother M. Margarita (Mary Cecilia) O'Connor, indicated that there was a strong Irish influence evident in their teaching:

School was planned on the model the nuns had known and the Bishop had admired in Loretto Abbey, Rathfarnham, and textbooks were the Irish National School Books, for which the recommendation of the Provincial Board of Education had been secured.

Another interesting point about the Irish text books, which links directly to the Sisters, was their supposed non-denominational appeal. Although the texts were designed not to favour any particular Church and had been 'originally drafted and approved by a committee of religious leaders representing all major denominations', they did feature religious content. This religious content permitted individual interpretation, and no doubt the Sisters took advantage of this since 'neutral religious education remained an ideal rather than a reality'.

During the 1850s and 1860s, criticism erupted over the use of Irish texts because they did not fit with the developing Canadian character, and McGowan shows how, especially towards the end of the century, Catholic schools were fostering a Canadian Catholic identity, more so than an Irish Catholic one. What is perhaps most interesting, and indeed important in relation to Glasgow, is McGowan's comment that after 1887, Toronto's Catholic Schools, which had 90 per cent of its teaching staff come from the ranks of the clergy or religious congregations, were in the business of producing pious and patriotic young Canadians, Irishness was to be left behind. Desperate to make its own flock more obedient and British, the Catholic Church in Glasgow had

---

184 Love also noted that the Irish books 'contained no specific Irish references' to avoid Irish nationalism. "Cultural Survival and Social Control", p. 381.
187 Ibid.
188 Curtis, Building the Educational, p. 288.
190 Ibid., p. 132.
recruited women religious for the exact same purpose, though on account of points mentioned earlier, namely greater government involvement, Toronto’s success was more marked.

The full extent of Irish influence upon the Loretto community can be gleaned from the *Dictionary of Biography* for their institute in North America. It is a crucial resource listing all of the Sisters in Canada, who had lived and died between 1847 and 1983; it also recorded their place of birth, as well as the birthplaces of their parents. The Sisters of St. Joseph have a similar, unpublished, list which shows all their Irish-born Sisters. Three databases were created to provide a closer look at the Sisters and each one, along with those constructed for the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy, has been included on the Cd-Rom attached to this thesis. Database Three includes the names and details of 72 Irish-born Loretto sisters between 1847 and 1907. Database Four is significantly larger and includes the names of 162 Sisters whose parent(s) had been born in Ireland. Database Five lists the names and details of 83 Irish-born Sisters of St. Joseph between 1851-1894 (there were no Irish-born entrants listed between 1894-1907). 191 Regarding Database Four, it is worthwhile mentioning that only the father’s place of birth was recorded, which means that there may have been more women of Irish descent, who could not be included, because their mother’s place of birth was not recorded.

The information in Database Three reveals that there were six sibling sets, Database Four shows 23 sibling sets and the third holds ten sibling sets. In one particular family, all five daughters chose to join the Loretto community. Little detail exists about the Magann sisters, (Database Three) but it is known that they were teachers and originally came from Co. Dublin. Sr. M. Demetria (Lucy) and Sr. M. Nativity (Mary Josephine) were professed on the same day, 31 July 1875, and it would appear that their two older sisters, Mother M. Eucheria (Elizabeth) and Sr. M. Mount Carmel (Frances), professed in 1865 and 1870 respectively, had an incredible influence on the life path of their younger sisters. Elizabeth’s formidable position, coupled with her reputation as a ‘very successful teacher...and an outstanding religious’, 192 probably had much to do with her sisters’ decisions to join. A fifth sibling, Sr. M. Delphina (Grace) was professed on

---

2 February 1872, but she is listed under her married name O'Dea; her husband, a doctor, had died shortly after they married.

It was a similar situation for the O'Connor family (Database Four), since all four daughters selected the Loretto sisters. Sr. M. Angels (Agnes), Sr. M. Evangelista (Julia), Sr. M. Magdalena (Margaret), and Sr. M. Magdalen (Mary Anne) were born in Pickering, Ontario between 1846 and 1865 and became teaching Sisters; their father, Denis O'Connor, had come from Co. Cork. The Sisters of St. Joseph also had a sibling set of four join their ranks: the Lynch sisters, Sr. M. Bernadine (Margaret), Sr. M. Leonia (Mary), Sr. M. Hilda (Anne) and Sr. M. Casimir (Ellen), were the daughters of James Lynch and Anne Egan, who had immigrated from Co. Clare. There was also a set of twins, Sr. M. Ignatius (Ann) and Sr. M. Angela (Margaret) Flemming, had immigrated from Co. Kilkenny and joined the Sisters of St. Joseph within three days of each other in 1854, and remarkably, they died just over one month apart, aged 25. Ann died of consumption, but Margaret’s cause of death was not recorded, perhaps it was of a broken heart for her twin.193

The emotional bond between siblings must not be ignored when looking at why women from the same family joined a religious congregation. Chapter Two has already noted the prevalence of sibling sets among Sisters in Glasgow, but the Sisters of Mercy’s Mother House in Limerick recorded that between 1838-1900, 17 per cent of Sisters were blood-related siblings. Clear reveals one extraordinary case wherein nine out of twelve daughters, in one family, joined convents between 1887-1905, and one of the daughters, who married, had seven daughters and four of them became Sisters.194 It would be difficult to argue that this many women, from one family, joined the religious life simply because God called them to the religious life. Clear’s belief that ‘long-lasting and intimate’195 family relationships was a central component in keeping many siblings together, even in the religious life, is a valid one. She supports this by arguing that women from rural, middle-class Ireland maintained the strong bonds that were forged on account

---

194Caitriona Clear, *Nuns in Nineteenth-Century Ireland.* (Dublin: Gill and Macmillan Ltd, 1987), p. 144. Marta Danylewycz also noted the prominence of blood-relations in her study of Sisters in Quebec. In the Congregation of Notre Dame, 35 per cent of Sisters were related or had relatives in the religious life, and in the Sisters of Miséricorde, 35 per cent were related. *Taking the Veil*, pp. 112-113.
195Ibid., p. 146.
of their shared experienced of ‘social isolation’.  

A Loretto sibling set, which deserves attention, are the Meehans, (Database Three) who came to Toronto from County Leitrim shortly after 1862. These sisters, Sr. M. Macrina (Ellen), Sr. M. Marianna (Margaret) and Sr. M. of Calvary (Mary), stand out because they are recorded as having ‘helped with domestic duties’; they were lay sisters. While the term lay sister denotes an inferior position within a religious community, ‘religious servants’ the position opened up opportunities of enhanced respectability and social standing for many lower-class women, and the fact that these three sisters chose the same community, fully aware of Margaret’s experiences as a Lay Sister, is therefore important. The family itself was very religious and their fourth sister, Sr. Dorothy (unknown), was a Sister of St. Joseph and their brother, David, had been a chaplain in the American Civil War. The Mooney sisters, Sr. M. Zita (Annie) and Sr. M. Bonaventure (Harriet) (Database Five) were also lay Sisters and joined the Sisters of St. Joseph in 1874 and 1877 respectively; they had been immigrants from Co. Queen’s. Database Four also includes the Fosters, Glynns, Mahoneys and O’Briens, who were more Lay Sister sibling sets, so there was obvious appeal of joining a religious community as a Lay Sister. Many women might have viewed the religious life as a path to social improvement, regardless of their social positioning within a religious community, especially if their family situation held little for them. This links back to the point made earlier about the decision to join being influenced by one’s social and economic circumstances.  

Focussing on the bigger picture, something was drawing these women to the religious life. In addition to security, it offered an important opportunity for self-fulfilment, a chance to work for the greater good in a highly respectable manner. When the Hutchinson sisters are considered, another explanation might be introduced. Mother M. Ignatia Hutchinson, a professed sister when she arrived in Toronto, was followed by Valetina, her younger sister. After Ignatia had died, the situation in Toronto became too difficult for Valetina and she returned to Ireland. The emotional

---

196Ibid.  
199Kerr, Dictionary of Biography, p. 123.  
bond, which often exists between siblings, should not be forgotten. One must question whether or not siblings, who joined the same community, did so out of a desire to remain connected to each other.

Yvonne McKenna’s research helps to explain why Irish women became Sisters. She attempts to explain the circumstances behind 21 women’s decision to become Sisters. Although she acknowledges that her statistics do not consider those Irish women who joined convents abroad after emigration and that her research is situated in the period between 1931-1970, her findings are invaluable and can be applied to earlier periods in both North America and Britain. According to McKenna, many of the women interviewed had several reasons for entering the religious life. Their basic list, which should not be considered exhaustive, covered a broad range of reasons from the desire for perfection and purity, the sense of sacrifice and an answer to God’s calling, to the chance for professional advancement and adventure. The religious life offered an ‘attractive alternative’ to marriage and motherhood and several interesting quotes were provided to illustrate this point. One Sister claimed:

I felt that if I wanted to go back and look after all these babies and children, and wanted to travel and do all these different things, that if I was married, and had children of my own, that was the end of it, you know?202

Another Sister echoed these sentiments as she explained that children and marriage made personal aspirations difficult to realise:

If you do have children and you do have a husband, and you do have a home, although you might have a sense of stability and security, there’s a lot of doors closed to you...Whereas in religious life you can actually think ‘I might like to do that’...We can actually...negotiate to do things that are a lot more exciting than my sister, who’s stuck at home.203

These examples portray women who wanted more from life than children and a husband. In their estimation, joining a religious community was their best option. Another excerpt, which links

202 Ibid. Discussion handout produced by McKenna.
203 Ibid.
back to the mention of the dormitory games played by at Toronto's St. Joseph's Academy, shows just how impressionable a girl of fifteen really was and how an experience, however mundane it may appear, can shape a life path:

I think I must have been about fifteen [when I realized] I wanted to enter religious life... These nuns came [to visit our school]. A postulant and a sister... I liked the postulant's dress. I liked these white cuffs, you see? And the veil and the bit of white around it. And she was a nice girl and the nun had a nice habit too so, I don't know, that just attracted me.204

One thing that McKenna has not mentioned is whether or not her research considered sibling sets and whether or not this would have made a difference in a women's decision to join a religious community. Eileen Brewer argues that the 'difficulty of sustaining community life was complicated by the fact that the nuns were not related by blood, nor were they permitted close friendships'205 but the evidence presented here contradicts her statement. Many members were indeed blood-related and although the Rules and Constitutions may have warned against closer friendships, perhaps these could not always be avoided.

When conducting research in Liverpool for this project, it was curious to see two Sisters play an on-going board game each day after lunch. Not only had they gone to school together as children and been good friends there, but they had joined the same community and maintained their friendship over the course of their lives; it is difficult to imagine that similar situations did not exist in the nineteenth century. The religious life is still seen as mysterious, so perhaps people see Nuns as superhuman, when in fact, they are not. Strong personal bonds and strong personal dislikes were part of convent life, but the proper management of them was what was important. In the records of the Glasgow Mercy convent, a scribbler, entitled Commentaries on the Vows, included notes about how one should treat her fellow Sisters. It was written that:

There are two great rocks you must avoid, aversion and particular friendship; both are dangerous and destructive; the one your own conscious; the other to edification; both to devotion and perfection. An aversion to our neighbour is contrary to Christianity; and particular friendship destroys a religious

204 Ibid.
One Sister of Mercy wrote that the life of a religious meant that she was 'leaving the world and separating herself from her relations and friends [and by doing this, she]...takes the first step in the road of sacrifice and in order to perfect her offering her intercourse with them will always be limited by the customs and practices of her institute'. It was the ideal that Sisters bear no 'particular friendships' and be solely engaged with their religious duties, but this could not have happened in every instance, especially if siblings joined the same community. A very good example of this point comes from Quebec's Sisters of Charity which welcomed two blood sisters as their first postulants. Sr. St-Pierre (Célina) and Sr. Marie-de-Bon-Secours (Séraphine) Roy joined the congregation in 1849, and their widowed mother, Marie Fitzbach, went on to found the Servants of the Immaculate Heart of Mary (also known as the Good Shepherd Sisters), just months after her daughters had joined the Sisters of Charity. The strong bond in this family led the congregations to being declared 'cousins'. Twelve years after they had entered the religious life, the Quebec photographer, George Ellisson, had photographed this family together in 1861, with the mother seated in the middle and a daughter on either side; one year earlier, he had photographed the daughters together. As a gift, Fitzbach's community gave her the portrait of her daughters 'to ease...her distress when Célina, and later Séraphine, were posted in branch houses at a distance from Quebec.

Familial bonds ran deep in the Loretto community, especially when one looks at the Walsh sisters. Sr. M. Olivia (Maggie) was born in County Waterford but it is thought that her sister, Sr. M. Henriette (Cecilia) was born in Canada even though her birthplace was not recorded; she was born at least ten years after Maggie, during which time the family had probably immigrated to

---

207SMCA, Glasgow. Shelf Library. Blue scribbler with 'Counsels and Meditations on the Interior Life. Written by hand' on the top of the cover page. Blue jotter with 'To the use of Sister Margaret Mary' on inside front cover, p. 24. Probably Sister Margaret Mary Leary (1862-1911).
208They were educated in a convent boarding school and had a 'distinguished' status as the Quebec congregation's first postulants, which was 'elevated further' because their mother had been a foundress.
210Ibid., pp. 294 and 307.
211Ibid., p. 307.
Ontario. What is so intriguing about these two is that both women received permission from the Archbishop to leave the religious life on the same day, 10 November 1896; their reasons for leaving were not disclosed. Nevertheless, what Databases Three, Four and Five were intended to do was to highlight the number of Irish-born and first generation Irish entrants and sibling sets to illuminate the strong Irish influence in each congregation.

Certainly, their nationality would have coloured what they taught and how they taught it. An interesting example of what the Sisters were imparting to their pupils can be seen in an Address of Welcome to O’Connor Power, an MP from County Mayo, who had visited the pupils of St. Joseph’s on 28 March 1877. The first two stanzas of the Address have been included below to demonstrate the strong feelings of lament and anger for the suffering of the Irish people. Although it was intended to be an address from the pupils, it was written by Sr. M. Regina McLean, thus making public her feelings about the situation in Ireland:

On sadder days that are only seen through a mist of tears
Rise up between that past and now;
Dark days of woe when, driven to death by a ruthless foe,
Our Fathers have suffered, bled and died
For the faith, and the sake of the crucified
Homeless and friendless, of all bereft -
with not but their taintless virtue left;
Hunted to earth, and hiding away
In the mountain caves, from the light of day;
From many a cavern, damp and dim,
Has echoed their prayers or their low-sung hymn
And the blood shed forth by that martyr band.

Has hallowed the soil of this sacred land
Island of Saints! - Thy portion has been
Like to the law of thy Lord’s,
I wean - Sorrows and tears and the world’s cold frown,
The heavy cross and the thorny crown
Hush memory! Hush! Nor breath again
That story of Famine, and woe, and pain,
And sorrows the crowd and the countless host -
God loves the land he chastises most.212

211Kerr, Dictionary of Biography, p. 182.
212CSJA. Community Annals, p. 63. The poem was by Sr. M. Regina McLean. 28 March 1877.
When it comes to the Sisters publicly announcing their feelings about Ireland, the primary source material in Glasgow and Toronto differs considerably. In Glasgow, there have not yet been any sources discovered exhibiting the blatant anger which was so prominently expressed in the writing of the Sisters in Toronto. It is clear that the anger and sorrow present in North America did not die out with the first or second generation, but lasted into the twentieth century. This is not to say that the Irish Sisters, or those of Irish descent in the west of Scotland did not feel the same way, but if they did, they did not put it down on paper. The Franciscans essentially had their roots in the French tradition, the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, the Belgian and English traditions, so the sense of Irish nationalism was perhaps less strong than in Irish ones. Having said this, nothing was uncovered in the Sisters of Mercy archives to indicate any connection with Irish nationalism, but this should not be too surprising considering the great effort exerted by the Scottish Catholic clergy to subdue Irishness.

This section began with an excerpt from Sister Evangelista’s black scribbler and it truly is an extraordinary resource which exhibits one woman’s personal sense of nationalism. It is often assumed that Sisters put their worldly life behind them when they commit themselves to God, but in reality, they are as human as anyone with the same emotions and distractions. Her comments about Michael Power, his efforts with the impoverished Irish immigrants and his resultant death demonstrates her anger and resentment. She wrote, with an overwhelming degree personal enthusiasm, that ‘on reaching the free, pure air, he raised his eyes to heaven and in tremulous voice, uttered these words: ‘Oh my God, what crimes England has to answer for’. The Bishop is dead...’. The legitimacy of the actual statement itself is obviously questionable, and it is unlikely that Power said this, but its inclusion in her scribbler is significant because this kind of blatant Irish nationalism seems to be an underlying theme in much of the material uncovered in Toronto. The evidence uncovered in Toronto supports Sheridan Gilley’s claim that the ‘Irish clergy and a host of religious orders...fostered a distinctively ‘ethnic’ or Irish Catholic expatriate culture’.

---

213IBVM Archives, Mary Evangelista O’Sullivan’s Black Scribbler.
The situation in Scotland was markedly different than that in either Ireland or Canada. At this point, it is crucial to draw upon the reflections of a Franciscan Sister. During a conversation about this research, she spoke of Scotland as the 'special daughter of Rome'. While this term originated with the claims made by York over Glasgow, but in this case, her meaning was a little different because she was relating the term to the Irish. She explained that Scots Catholics felt that Rome had to take Scotland under its wing to protect it from those Irish Catholics who wanted a bigger stake in Catholicism in Scotland. There were great efforts behind the scenes in Scotland and England to control the Irish Catholic presence, but especially in the west of Scotland. After all, Scotland’s first Archbishop, after the restoration of hierarchy, was Charles Eyre, an Englishman, because the Scottish and Irish Catholics in Scotland refused to support someone from the opposing camp. Eyre was a good choice, not only for the educational inroads he made in Glasgow, but because he was the safest option. Again, with reference to the fourth chapter, it was apparent that many Scots Catholics were fearful of seeing Irish nationalists infiltrate and consume the Scottish Church hierarchy and the research thus far presented can argue that their fears were not unfounded. The situation was ripe for conflict, which made the necessity of obtaining an outsider for the post of Archbishop, all the more pressing. The character of the Scottish Catholics in relation to the Irish Catholics was distinctly different:

...Scottish Catholicism generally managed to contain its differences within the family circle without involving the outside world, so much so, that Pope Gregory XVI...declared that 'he had always regarded Scotland as the model of missionary countries'. That apparent quietness and peace would soon be shattered when the Irish immigrants arrived in their thousands and some self-appointed spokesmen from among them began to voice their grievances.

If the Scottish Catholic Church was to remain Scottish, it believed that it needed protection from outsiders; originally from the English Catholic Church through York and later from Irish

---

Catholicism via the migrants. The notion of Scotland being a ‘Special Daughter of Rome’ is not a new idea but when the phrase is given a double meaning by including Sisters, who were also daughters of Rome, a fresh and important development in Scottish religious historiography and gender takes place.

The Canadian situation was never this complicated, primarily because the French Catholics of Quebec were just as open about their faith as the Irish, and after 1867, with their own French Province and religion secured, they were in a more powerful position to protect it from intruders both from within and out with their faith.

Conclusion

This Chapter drew attention to the experiences of the Loretto Sisters and the Sisters of St. Joseph in nineteenth century Toronto and thus provided a comparative opportunity for Glasgow’s experience. The first section, which considered Toronto’s Protestant heritage, provided a useful backdrop from which to identify similarities between the two cities. Numerous examples were uncovered to establish that Glasgow was not alone in much of its experiences, especially regarding sectarianism. The second section was heavily dependant upon primary material and worked to paint a compelling picture of the two focus congregations, the Loretto and the Sisters of St. Joseph. This section was the most crucial since it dealt with the Sisters themselves. Aside from identifying parallels between those Sisters in Toronto and their counterparts in Glasgow, it provided more evidence for the argument that many nineteenth century women were able to achieve much more as Sisters than as wives and mothers. The discussion on sibling sets helped to shore up this argument and demonstrate that a call from God may not have been the sole purpose behind a woman choosing to enter the religious life.
Conclusion

The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, the Sisters of Mercy and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur made fundamental contributions to the development of Glasgow’s Roman Catholic community, principally through education. These Sisters nursed, taught and reformed generations of children and young women and instilled the virtues of respectable Catholicism in their young charges. The argument that Church authorities viewed Sisters as ‘mere foot-soldiery’ and that the ‘early manifestation of their professionalism was rarely recognised and acknowledged’ \(^1\) rang as true for Glasgow as it did for England and Wales. This thesis has demonstrated that the ‘scale and influence’ \(^2\) of these three congregations was far from marginal and in fact, they were instrumental in securing Catholicism in Glasgow, a Presbyterian city that was openly hostile to the Church of Rome.

The Roman Catholic population in the city was inflated by mass Irish migration to Scotland particularly during the mid-nineteenth century and while Highland Catholic migrants were also in Glasgow, this thesis has focussed almost exclusively on the Irish migrants. Archival material in part helped to determine this focus since the Sisters were recruited not simply to educate the multitudes of Catholics in the city, but rather to sublimate the Irish Catholicism of the migrants. Thus, it was important to begin this dissertation with a discussion on Irish migration to Scotland. The tumultuous social and economic situation that Ireland experienced in the early-to-mid nineteenth-century disabled its capacity to buffer the impact of the Famine of the late 1840s and early 1850s, which led to the expansion of a migration culture that lasted well into the twentieth century.

The established pattern of pre-Famine migration to the west of Scotland had made Glasgow both familiar and attractive and the arrival of so many Irish and Highland migrants during the Famine exhausted the city’s ability to cope with the unprecedented levels of destitution and disease which followed their arrival. Many of these Famine and post-Famine Irish were Roman Catholic, and

---


\(^2\) Ibid., p. 162.
while the explosion in the number of Irish Catholics caused great concern among those Protestants who viewed them as extensions of the Pope's authority in a reformed city, it also worried those local Catholics who lacked the resources to handle the spiritual and temporal needs of the newcomers. More importantly, however, was the fundamental fear that Scottish Catholicism would be undermined by the Irish Catholicism of the migrants. The dilemma of preserving their adherence to Catholicism while shaping them into respectable and obedient British Catholics necessitated the recruitment of congregations of women religious. 3

Although the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy were enlisted to set up and run Catholic schools, their educational work was initially impeded by illness and disease as well as by conflicts with each other and with male clerics. Congregational instability, caused by leadership crises, the fear held by many young Sisters that those they nursed and visited might very well infect them with a deadly disease and their vow of poverty impeded the early development of each community. The Franciscan Sisters quickly got these issues under control and went on to wield tremendous influence over Catholic elementary education in nineteenth-century Glasgow. By comparison, until the mid-1860s, the Sisters of Mercy seemed unable to prevent the constant leadership crises, deaths and desertions which thwarted their ability to exert the same degree of influence over elementary education as the Franciscan Sisters. In 1881-1882, the Franciscan Sisters were the principal teachers in seven of Glasgow's 14 parish schools, while the Sisters of Mercy were in just two parish schools. 4 Ten years later, when the Franciscan Sisters had expanded to become the principle teachers in 13 of Glasgow's 20 parish schools, the Sisters of Mercy remained as the principal teachers in just one school, St. Joseph's. 5 These brief statistics are clear evidence of the impact that the early hardships had on the community's development.

These congregations were not simply recruited to improve the lot of Glasgow's Catholics, with the provision of an education system that would be sensitive to their faith, but they were essential components in the plan to bring the Catholicism of the Irish migrants more in line with Scottish Catholicism. And while the communities themselves attracted many Irish-born Sisters, there was

---

4 GAA, ED7. RRES, July 1881-1882.
a real effort to control the ‘Irish’ influence. The position of Superior in the Sisters of Mercy, which was an Irish congregation, was held by four Scottish-born Sisters and one English-born Sister between 1851 and 1871. Indeed these non-Irish Superiors and the comments written by Sr. M. Bernard Garden to Bishop Smith, regarding the encouragement and introduction of new, preferably Scottish, aspirants, are indicative of the desire to limit the Irish influence. Garden herself can also be seen as evidence of this, since the Aberdeenshire native had been hand-picked for the Scottish mission by Bishop Murdoch, the Enzie-born cleric whose ‘sensitive temperament’ was no doubt provoked by those radical Irish who moved into Glasgow. Ironically, his plan to have her trained by Sisters of Mercy in Liverpool, England, was complicated when she was sent to Limerick by her Liverpool Superiors.

The 1872 Education (Scotland) Act necessitated serious decision-making for those responsible for the Catholic school system, but even before it was introduced there was real concern about managing the education of Glasgow’s Catholics, and the quote from 1856 which opened the fourth chapter revealed the Church’s desire to keep the issue of education firmly under its control. In a city dominated by Presbyterianism, the thought of exposing its vulnerable Catholic children to state authority was not an option. This insular and protectionist stance had negative consequences and created an ‘educational wilderness’ for Catholics, who existed in a system where educational development was much slower on account of financial hardship and Church control. Working within these constraints, the Franciscan Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy were the pillars of Catholic female education in Scotland, and built the foundation upon which the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur could establish their highly successful and reputable Teacher Training College at Dowanhill in the city’s West End. Together, their educational work not only facilitated gradual community development, but represented the transformation of Catholicism in Glasgow. The education provided by Sisters gave many women, in patriarchal, nineteenth-century Scotland, the opportunity to acquire useful skills and gain some self-confidence. While actual evidence of ‘self-confidence’ has been virtually impossible to recover, the Dowanhill Magazine, with its “Past Students Page”, displays with pride the names of many young women

---

6SCA. BL6/615/1. Letter to Bishop Smith from Sr. M. Bernard Garden, 2 October 1851.
7CDS, 1867, p. 141.
who went on to become Sisters, teachers, travellers and university graduates.

It is vital to place the experiences of the Glasgow Sisters into an international context and connect what was going on in Scotland to elsewhere because religious congregations extend far beyond national boundaries. Toronto offered an excellent comparative case-study because of its Protestant profile, and because its population of Irish Catholics, which grew considerably during and after the Famine, necessitated the recruitment of Sisters. In 1847, the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary (Loretto), like the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, were the first congregation, male or female, to arrive on the scene. In 1851, they were joined by the Sisters of St. Joseph. While the Loretos were founded from Rathfarnham, Ireland, the Sisters of St. Joseph had come from the United States, where they had been established from Lyon, France in 1836.9 Toronto’s Protestant character made it a ripe platform for sectarian tension and this had a tremendous influence on the experience and development of the two congregations. While the Loretos were predominantly a teaching community, like Glasgow’s Franciscan Sisters, the Sisters of St. Joseph were similar to Glasgow’s Mercy Sisters because their work was more broad. In Toronto, women religious had been recruited to retain Catholics and expand the influence of the Church, they had not been enlisted to secure the position of an indigenous brand of Catholicism, because outside of Quebec, one did not exist. Unlike Scotland, which did not have a sizeable Roman Catholic population, Quebec proved an early bastion of support for Toronto, though language and the French Catholic culture became increasingly divisive towards the end of the nineteenth century. In contrast to Scotland, little effort was made to control or limit the Irish influence in the Church, and interestingly, while the Irish influence in the Loretos remained constant, the French background of the Sisters of St. Joseph was usurped by a developing Irish character, as evidenced by the high number of Irish-born Sisters and sibling-sets in each community.

In 1992, Ian Donnachie and Christopher Whatley edited The Manufacture of Scottish History, a useful book that sought to look at Scottish history, its myths and traditionally held beliefs, and demonstrate that there was a lot of re-writing to do. Appropriately, Donnachie and Whatley

---

included a chapter dedicated to the absence of women in Scotland's reported past and the author of that chapter, Joy Hendry, was quick to point out that in a book of ten essays, only one focused on women.  

"Snug in the Asylum of Taciturnity: Women's History in Scotland" is an essay concerned with the absence of women in Scottish history. Rightly, she criticises the assumption that the public realm was the domain of men and the private realm was where women operated. Yet when looking at women religious, this is clearly not the case. Here is a group of women who, although having straddled the public and private domains, have worked in Scotland's so-called coveted 'democratic tradition' of education; though their work for Roman Catholic and female education was not what John Knox had in mind when he set out his 'grand scheme for Scottish education'. As well as throwing new light on an old topic, Roman Catholicism in Glasgow and Scotland, this thesis has made an important contribution to women's history in Scotland. It has brought the unique experiences of these women religious to light, in terms of their work and life in nineteenth-century Glasgow. It did not attempt to detach them, as women, from the broader Catholic experience, but rather it alters the assumptions that have been established without their inclusion. It is hoped that students and scholars of religion and women's history will draw upon this research for future projects. The illumination of the centrality of women religious in the provision of informal, and in some cases, formal nursing work as well as education, has offered a unique glimpse into the lives of women, who have been shrouded in ascribed mystery.

Curiosity about Sisters and nuns has been intense and often they have come under fire for their 'hidden' lifestyle, literally when considering the fireball that was sent through the window of the Loretto convent in Toronto. It was not uncommon for people with anti-Catholic and/or anti-female attitudes to be uncomfortable with the idea of women living beyond the control of men. This trepidation existed wherever Sisters and nuns went and the curiosity, resentment and paranoia was heightened by fictional convent tales, such as those written by Maria Monk and Rebecca Reed in the 1830s which sold a combined total of over half a million copies between

---


12 Ibid., p. 121.

13 The study of Roman Catholicism in Scotland has a distinguished past, as evidenced by the publication of the journal of the Scottish Catholic Historical Association, the Innes Review, which has been running since 1950.
1835 and 1860 alone. While Reed’s account was more about discouraging parents from sending their children to convents for schooling, Monk’s tale of priests having their way with young, defenseless women virtually became accessible pornography. On a deeper level, Nancy Lusignan Schultz, who is an authority on these convent tales, argues convincingly that the exposure of young women like Reed and Monk to convents undermined ‘traditional Protestant domesticity’ because female sexuality and reproduction was removed from the control of the Protestant patriarchy. No doubt thoughts of a similar nature existed in nineteenth-century Glasgow, especially as the number of religious congregations and nuns in the city rose.

Throughout the chapters there was an effort to convey the important role which mothers played in cultivating the religious beliefs and practices of their children. Rosemary Radford Ruether, a ‘pioneer Christian feminist theologian’ and professor of Theology, emphasises the fundamental point that ecumenical strength has been the preserve of women, who as mothers, defined their children’s spiritual taken-for-granteds. While she describes her own mother as a woman who was ‘intellectually sophisticated with spiritual authenticity’, her experience contrasts with that of the women and young girls in nineteenth-century Glasgow since it is likely that many of the Sisters who taught them, as well as the mothers who raised them, would not have been considered intellectually sophisticated. The influence most likely encountered by these young women and children was more akin to what Ruether has labelled ‘vulgar Catholicism’, which was particularly ‘dogmatic and narrow-minded’. The Catholic Church, which was desperately trying to re-establish itself in a hostile country, had little room for intellectual sophistication because in its formative years, absolute and unquestioning loyalty was required. Perhaps it is best to describe the Church’s educational and social initiatives as protectionist and limiting, the fundamental desire had been to establish the Church as an institution of influence. Certainly, there must have been some Sisters who embodied what Ruether defines as ‘intellectual sophistication’, living and working in nineteenth-century Glasgow, but it is likely that they came up against tremendous

15Ibid., p. xxi.
17Author’s own phrasing.
19Ibid., p. 255.
obstacles as the Church worked to extend its power-base in a mission territory.

Sisters, as this thesis has shown, took part in the two-pronged protectionist stance. They provided Catholic education for children and young women while working to instil a loyalty and obedience that would improve the reputation of Catholicism in Scotland, and indeed, Britain. Aside from the immediate concerns about Church stability, their positions as educators revealed a new set of options for many women, which was an important development in the patriarchal world of Scottish society and the Roman Catholic Church.
Ireland with Counties and Provinces

Appendix 1: 2


Dense on the stream the vapours lay,
Thick as wool on the cold highway;
Spongy and dim, each lonely lamp
Shone o'er the streets so dull and damp;
The moonbeam could not pierce the cloud
That swathed the city like a shroud.
There stood three Shapes on the bridge alone,
Three figures by the coping-stone;
Gaunt, and tall, and undefined.
Spectres built of mist and wind;
Changing ever in form and height,
But black and palpable to sight.

‘This is a city fair to see,’
Whisper’d one of the fearful three;
A might tribute it pays to me.
Into its rivers, winding slow,
Thick and foul from shore to shore,
The Vessels come, the vessels go,
And teeming lands their riches pour.
It spreads beneath the murky sky,
A wilderness of masonry;
Huge, unshapely, overgrown,
Dingy brick and blackened stone.
Mammon is its chief and lord,
Monarch slavishly adored;
Mammon sitting side by side
With Pomp, and Luxury, and Pride;
Who calls his large domain theirs,
Nor dream a portion in Despair’s.

(Skip stanzas 3, 4 and 5)

But great as we are, there cometh one
Greater than you - greater than I,
To aid the deeds that shall be done,
To end the work that we’ve begun,
And thin this thick humanity.
I see his footmarks east and west,
I hear his tread in the silent fall,
He shall not sleep, he shall not rest –
He comes to aid us one and all!
Were men as wise as men might be,
For him that cometh over the sea;
But they will not heed the warning voice.
The Cholera comes, rejoice! rejoice!
He shall be lord of the swarming town,
And mow them down, and mow them down!

Appendix 2: 1

Figure 1
Advertisement for Mrs. MacDonald’s boarding school, wherein Adelaide Vaast, Veronica Cordier, and Constance Marchand learned English when they first arrived in Glasgow. CDS, 1849, p. 136.

Figure 2
This is a scan of an advertisement for the Convent of the Immaculate Conception in 1850. CDS, 1850, p. 122.
These are views of the front garden of the Dowanhill Training College. Students are featured in the bottom photograph. Courtesy of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, Provincial Archives Office, Liverpool.
### Appendix 2:3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Sisters</th>
<th>Students in College</th>
<th>Candidate and Pupil-Teachers (Indoor)</th>
<th>Candidate and Pupil-Teachers (Outdoor)</th>
<th>Night School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1894</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>41 (preparatory class)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1895</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>44 (candidates)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>31 (candidates)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1897</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1898</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1899</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1902</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1903</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1904</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These statistics were pasted into the back of the Annals for the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur at Dowanhill, Glasgow. BH6/DH.h/1 Annals 1894-1906.
This illustration depicts the method used in the Mercy schools in Ireland and the one that was used by them when they arrived in Glasgow. *Illustrations of the Corporal and Spiritual Works of Mercy*. Drawing by a Sisters of the Religious Order of Our Lady of Mercy (Sister Clare Agnew). London, Charles Dolman, 1840. This picture was scanned with the permission of the Mercy International Centre Archives, Dublin.
Floor plan of the Charlotte Street convent, 1878. Courtesy of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception. Original held with the Superior.
Appendix 3:3

The Charlotte Street Sisters who staffed the first parish schools in Glasgow. Courtesy of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, Glasgow. Photographs of Historic Value, Ref.# 015, Envelope marked "Selection of Old Sepias".
## CONVENT SCHOOL.

**GARNET HILL, GLASGOW.**

The Sisters of Mercy have a Special Class for Day Scholars, who receive a good plain Education with Religious Instruction on the following terms:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pupils under 7,</th>
<th>£0 5 0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>between 7 and 10,</td>
<td>£0 7 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>about 10,</td>
<td>£0 10 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Payable in Advance.*


## FRANCISCAN CONVENT

**Of our Lady of the Immaculate Conception.**

58 CHARLOTTE STREET, GLASGOW.

Attached to this Convent is a Day School where a First-Class education is given.

For Terms and other information apply to the Superioress.

Advertisement for the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception Day School, Charlotte Street, Glasgow. *CDS, 1882, p. 212.*
This is the Sepia photograph of Sister Mary of The Cross. She had been Superior for twelve years. Courtesy of the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, Glasgow. Photographs of Historic Value, Ref. # 015, Envelope marked “Selection of Old Sepias”.

Appendix 4:3
An advertisement for Dowanhill Teacher Training College. CDS, 1896.

Appendix 4:4

The second year class from Dowanhill Training College in 1899/1900. Courtesy of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur Provincial Archives Office, Liverpool. Visuals - Scotland. Photograph parcel not yet listed.
Appendix 4:5

EVENING CLASSES
FOR PUPIL TEACHERS.

These Classes will be opened for the teaching of English, Mathematics, and Reading, Elocution, School-management, in the CONVENT, Charlotte Street, on MONDAY, 31st October, 1892, from 5 p.m. to 7 p.m.

ENGLISH will be taught by Alexander Muir, M.A.
MATHEMATICS by W. T. Crombie, M.A.
READING, Elocution, and School-management by J. T. Hassan.

TUESDAY, 1st Nov., in Convent of Mercy, Garnethill.
The same subjects will be taught by the same Masters.

THURSDAY, 3rd Nov., in St. Alphonsus' School.
The same subjects as above, by the same Masters.

N.B.—At the last named centre Boys only shall attend.

SATURDAY CLASSES.

These Classes will open in St. Andrew's School, Ropework Lane, and St. Alphonsus' School, Greendyke Street, on SATURDAY 5th November, at 10 a.m. to 1 p.m.

ST. ANDREW'S—

PHYSIOGRAPHY will be taught by A. Muir, M.A.
FRENCH by James Struthers, High School, Glasgow.
DRAWING by W. M. Petrie, Gorbals Public School.
MUSIC by J. T. Hassan, St. Francis'.

ST. ALPHONSUS—

PHYSIOGRAPHY will be taught by W. T. Crombie, M.A.
FRENCH by the Marist Brothers.
DRAWING by Mr. J. M'Kerrow, Paisley.
MUSIC by J. T. Hassan, St. Francis'.

Books and Stationery to be Supplied by Pupil Teachers.

Appendix 4:6

This photograph was taken from one of the Dowanhill Training College classrooms. Courtesy of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur Provincial Archives Office, Liverpool. Album DH.h/9.
This photograph was taken from one of the Dowanhill Training College classrooms. The room appears to have been very pleasant and well lit, thus conducive to teaching and learning. Courtesy of the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur Provincial Archives Office, Liverpool. *Album DH.h/9.*
Appendix 5:1

Photograph of the Sisters of St. Joseph Convent, Wellesley Street, Toronto, c. 1870s. Courtesy of ARCAT, PH 993.285/11P.
Appendix 5:2

Appendix 5:3

Cartoon from *Grip*, 1 December 1883. This cartoon was in response to Archbishop Lynch's letter, written to the Editors of the *Public Press* on 15 February 1883 when he called for Ireland to stop sending its destitute to Toronto. Special thanks to the J. W. Bengough Papers, William Ready Division of Archives and Research Collections, McMaster University, Hamilton, Canada.
Appendix 5:4

Bishop Michael Power (1804-1847). Courtesy of ARCAT, PH 992.01/01 CP.
Appendix 5:5

Photograph of Loretto Art Class at the 'Old Abbey', Wellington Street, Toronto. Circa 1890. Courtesy of IBVM Archives, Box Marked Pictures, Cream Folder: Loretto Abbey, 403 Wellington Street, Toronto 1867-1930.

Photograph of (L-R) Mother Pulcheria Farrelly, Mother Canisia Twomey, Mother Benedict Labré Podger and Mother Hilda Trembly during a game of croquet at the Loretto Covent, Bond Street, Toronto, 1900. Courtesy of IBVM Archives, Photo collection, Bond Street Convent File.
Appendix 5:7

Photograph of Mother Alberta and her boy's class at the Wellesley convent, Toronto in 1903. Courtesy of IBVM Archives, Photo Collection, Wellesley Convent File.
Repositories

Archdiocese of Glasgow Archives, Glasgow, Scotland.


ED1/1. Educational Minute Book, District Poor School Committee, 14 March 1872.


RO2/12. Letter from Sr. M. of the Cross Black to the Vicar General, 12 August 1889.

RO2/12. Letter from Sr. M. of the Cross to the Vicar General, 24 October 1889.


RO8/10. Letter from the Archbishop of Glasgow to the Vicar General, 15 April 1887.

RO8/16. Letter from Sr. Mary of the Cross Black to Charles Eyre, 14 March 1893.


WD5 Condon Memoirs. Flyer entitled Glasgow School Board Election, Central Committee of the Catholic Association, 6 March 1873. Inserted loose into black diary - material unmarked and unsorted.

WD5 Condon Memoirs. Box unsorted, loose, white card inserted into notebook.

Archives of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Toronto, Toronto, Canada.

B103, 1816-1849, General Correspondence. Letter from M. Teresa Ball to Bishop M. Power, 20 July 1847.

B113, Box 3. General Correspondence 1855-1949. Letter from Archbishop Lynch to Lord Bishop, Dr. Bultes, of Limerick, 19 December 1877.

CAC02.31 Church Tyranny! 1857.

LAD 0130. Letter from Bishop of Kingston to Rev. Mother Teresa Dease, 6 February 1863.
LAE06.28. Letter from His Grace the Archbishop of Toronto on the State of Ireland, 15 February 1883.
LB05.070 Letter from Archbishop Lynch to Mother M. Antoinette, 16 November 1886.
Sisters of Loretto, General Correspondence 1861-1879. Letter from Archbishop Lynch to the Mayor of Toronto, 3 January 1866.
Sisters of Loretto, General Correspondence, 1861-1879. Letter from Sr. Mary Evangelista to Archbishop Lynch, 18 December 1876.

Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception Archives, Glasgow, Scotland.

Box marked “Mother Adelaide and Mother Veronica” ref. # 011. Medium-sized black book with 1846-1861 marked in red on the inside cover.
Box marked Mother Adelaide and Mother Veronica, ref. # 011. Copy of manuscript sent from Tourcoing in 1930. Medium-sized red note book, Mother Adelaide and Mother Veronica 1936.
Box Marked “Beginnings and Early History” ref. # 012.1. A Notre Mère, poem written by Bishop Smith, Coadjutor Bishop in 1854. Large book with snake skin-like cover and black binding, “Franciscan Convent of the Immaculate Conception Glasgow. The Establishment of our Foundation and the Subsequent History of our House” is written on the inside cover, c. 1880.
Box Marked “Beginnings and Early History” ref. # 012.1. Letter from Mother Veronica Cordier to Mother Mary of the Cross Black, Tourcoing, France, 28 December 1896.
Box marked Early History, ref. # 012.2. “Third Order Regular of St. Francis in Scotland” in Scottish Catholic Monthly, June, 1894.
Box marked “Historical Accounts! ref #0 13. The Franciscan Nuns in Scotland, 1847-1930.
Box Marked “Copies of Early Constitutions” ref. #031.30. Brown paper-covered book titled Constitutions 1852 and Manuscript copy of the Constitutions, Chapter 2, Section 1 “Superiors”.
Box marked “Copies of Early Constitutions” ref. #031.30. Rule of the Community of the Immaculate Conception of the Third Order of St. Francis Glasgow, 1855, p. 7. Large Brown book with dark brown leather binding and corners.
Records of the Chapter, 1896. Photocopy of minutes only, original book kept with the Superior.
Sister Professions & Receptions, Volume I. Large black book kept with the Superior.
Sister Professions & Receptions, Volume II. Large black book kept with the Superior.

Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception Obituary Book. Kept with the Superior.
Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception Obituary List. Kept with the Superior.

Form of Prayers Used in Franciscan Schools in Scotland. A5-sized loose page.

Shelf Library
Large Black Book labeled Council Meetings 1873-1974.

Glasgow City Archives, Mitchell Library, Glasgow, Scotland.

D-HEW 1.1.2. Glasgow Parochial Board Minute Book, 23 December 1851 to 1 February 1861.

Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary Archives, Toronto, Canada.

Box Marked Dease Correspondence. Letter from T. Dease to Mother Ball, Rathfarnham, 3 October 1859.
Box Marked Dease Correspondence. Black Binder #1, 1851-1876. Letter from T. Dease to Rathfarnham Superior, Xaveria Fallon, 11 July 1884.
Box Marked Earliest Annals. Cream Folder: Account of the Meeting of Protestant clergymen to establish a school to oppose the Convent. Wednesday, 13 February 1867.
Box Marked Earliest Records. Cream Folder: Early Education in Ontario. "Mother Mary Magarita's Account. Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary (Ladies of Loretto) in Canada and the U.S.A. from 1847".

Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary Central Archives, Irish Branch, Rathfarnham, Ireland.

B2/3.4. Letter from Mother Ignatia Hutchinson to Mother M. Teresa Ball, 6 June 1850.

Mercy International Centre Archives, Baggot Street, Dublin, Ireland.

Record Group 100-3.2. Xeroxed copies of Letters, set 2 of 2.
Record Group 100- 4. Manuscript Copy of the Constitutions written by Catherine McAuley, c. 1832.

Shelf Library

National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh, Scotland.

ED16/1. 1896-1897, Sacred Heart, 26-27 November 1896.

National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh, Scotland.

Gillis, Bishop James, A Pastoral Letter in behalf of the British Sick and Wounded in the East, and Asking Prayers for the Soldiers of the Allied Armies, Fallen in Battle during the course of the Present Year. Delivered at Edinburgh, 1855.

Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons Library, Glasgow, Scotland.

Hospital. Vol. V, No. XVIII (May, 1832).


*Glasgow Medical Journal.* Fergus, Andrew, M.D., “Preventability of Cholera, with remarks on Dr. Johnson’s of the disease”. No. V (September, 1866).


*Glasgow Pamphlets VI.* Yellowlees, D., M.D., “An Address Delivered to the Nurses of the Glasgow Royal Infirmary, on New Year’s Day, 1886”.

*Glasgow Pamphlets VI.* Anonymous, “Syllabus of the Sixth Annual Course of Lectures to the Nurses in the Glasgow Western Infirmary”. No date, c. 1880.


Scottish Catholic Archives, Columba House, Edinburgh, Scotland.


OL2/83/5. Letter from Bishop Kyle to Bishop Murdoch, 3 May 1853

OL2/86/10. Letter from Bishop Smith to Mr. T. W. Allies on the subject of education by Religious - with account of progress, 28 October 1856.


OL3/2/9. Letter from Sr. M. de Sales Dend to the Parish Priest at St. Mungo’s, Glasgow, c. 1860.


Sisters of Mercy Convent Archives, Garnet Hill, Glasgow, Scotland.

Annals (typed version). ‘Brief History of Glasgow Foundation’ and ‘Hand-Written Account of Foundation’ on front cover on a green binder, no further classification details.


*Names of Sisters who entered in Glasgow.* Held in green plastic binder marked “Brief History of Glasgow Foundation” and “Hand-written Account of Foundation”.

Letter to a Sister of Mercy from her brother Michael in 1866. Third letter from the back in plastic slip. Held in green plastic binder marked “Brief History of Glasgow Foundation” and “Hand-written Account of Foundation”.

Letter from Mother M. de Sales Dend to Father Peter Forbes, 30 July 1864. Correspondence
Binder, blue, hard-covered four-ringed.
Letter - no names but written shortly after 1865. Correspondence Binder, second letter in plastic cover Blue, hard-covered, four-ringed binder with a plain sheet of A4 paper on front cover (no writing).

List drawn up on December 12th 1881 of those who entered this community but did not persevere, 1849-1881. Green plastic binder with 'Brief History of Glasgow Foundation' and Hand-Written Account of Foundation' on the cover.

Shelf Library
Leary, Sr. Margaret Mary, 'Counsels and Meditations on the Interior Life. Written by hand' on the top of the cover page. Blue jotter with ‘To the use of Sister Margaret Mary’ on inside front cover.


Sisters of Mercy Convent Archives, Limerick, Ireland.

BH6/DH.h/1. ‘History Dowanhill”; notebook entitled History of Notre Dame Convent Glasgow 1894-1928, c. 1928.
BH6 DH.h/3. Dowanhill Training College, 'Establishment and Recognition'. No Date.
BH6 DH.h/3. Report Presented to the Committee on the Training College for School Mistresses, 5 June 1893.
BH6/DH.h/5. The Monica Taylor Folder. “An Early Episode in the teaching of science in convent schools told by a pupil who entered the school in 1884.”
BH6 DH.h/6. Letter from Archbishop Eyre to Sister Mary of St Philip, 4 April 1893.

DH.h/2. Card in a small white envelope entitled To dear Sister Mary of St. Wilfred from the Sisters of Mt. Pleasant.

MPTC. Shelf 1, Box 28. Circular No. 3, Catholic Education Committee Statement.

MPTC 1. Shelf 1, Box 28, marked ‘Miscellaneous’. Address presented to Sister Superior of the Liverpool Training College by the old Students resident in and around Glasgow on the opening of the Dowanhill Training College.


Shelf Library


Sisters of St. Joseph Archives, Toronto, Canada.


Mother Delphine. Personal File/Correspondence, 18 January 1856.
Sisters of St. Joseph Printed Obituary List. Held with the Archivist.
Sisters of St. Joseph Reception Book (typed version). Held with the Archivist.
Newspapers and Magazines

Britain

*Avenue* (University of Glasgow) (2001)

*Catholic Times* (1877)

*Daily Record* (1895)

*Free Press* (1851)

*Glasgow Herald* (1846-1885)

*Glasgow Observer* (1890-1897)

*Oxfordshire Local History News* (2002)

*Punch* (1845)

*Scotsman* (1832)

*The Catholic Directory for Scotland* (1831-1897)

*The Illustrated London News* (1849)

Canada

*The Mirror* (1847)
Primary Printed Sources
(Nineteenth Century Printed Works)


Brown, Alexander, Midnight Scenes and Social Photographs being sketches of life in the streets, wynds, and dens of the city. Glasgow, Thomas Murray and Son, 1858.


Buchanan, Robert Rev. Dr., The Waste Places of our Great Cities; or the voice of God in the Cholera, with remarks upon the recent letter upon that subject of the Right Hon. the Lord Palmerston. Glasgow, Blackie & Son, 1853.


Colquhoun, J. C., "Great Protestant Meeting held at Hope-Street Gaelic Church, Glasgow, on Thursday, September 17th, 1835" in Romanism as it Rules in Ireland: A Full and Authentic Report of the meetings held in various parts of England and Scotland in which the Theology secretly taught, the commentary on the Bible clandestinely circulated, the law of the Papal States surreptitiously set up to govern Ireland, and the secret Diocesan Statutes of the Province of Leinster, Vols. I and II. Mortimer O'Sullivan, Ed. London, R. B. Seeley, 1840.


Free Church Elders Association, *The Position of the Free Church of Scotland in Glasgow and Suburbs, from a commercial and practical point of view. A paper read at a meeting of the Free Church Elders' Association, on Monday 29th January 1877.* Glasgow: David Bryce and Son, 1877.

Gairdner, W. T., *The Physician as Naturalist: Addresses and memoirs bearing on the history and progress of medicine chiefly during the last hundred years.* Glasgow, James Maclehose & Sons, 1889.


Hodgins, J. George, *Documentary History in Education in Upper Canada from the passing of the Constitutional Act of 1791 to the close of Rev. Dr. Ryerson's Administration of the Education Department in 1876.* Toronto, Warwick Bros & Rutter, 1894.

Hogarth's *Works Complete with complete sets of over 100 plates and full letterpress descriptions.* Edinburgh, Riverside Press, W. H. White & Co., 1897.


M'Dermid, Duncan, *Reasons for Organising a Protestant Confraternity to be called the Knoxites.* Glasgow, 15 February 1881.


Monk, Maria, *The Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk, as exhibited in a narrative of her suffering*
during a residence of five years as a novice and two years as a black nun in the Hotel Dien Nunnery at Montreal. Edinburgh, A. M'Kerracher, 1836.

Monk, Maria, Escape of Maria Monk, from the Hotel Dieu Nunnery, Montreal, also a reply to John Bremner, R. C. Clergyman's awful exposure of the awful disclosures of Rebecca Reed and Maria Monk. Glasgow, H. Robinson, 1836.

Murphy, Dominick, Sketches of Irish Nunneries. Dublin, 1865.

Murphy, John Nicholas, Terra Incognita or the Convents of the United Kingdom. London, Longmans, Green, and Co., 1873.


O'Sullivan, Mortimer, Romanism as it Rules Ireland: A Full and Authentic report of the meetings held in various parts of the England and Scotland in which the theology secretly taught, the commentary on the Bible clandestinely circulated, the law of Papal States surreptitiously set up to govern Ireland, and the secret Diocesan Statutes of the Province of Leinster, Vols. 1 & III. London, R. B. Seeley, 1840.

Public Characters: Biographical and characteristic sketches, with portraits of the most distinguished personages of the present age. Vol. II. London, Printed for Knight and Lacey, 1828.

Readings and Recitations from the Best Authors. Glasgow, David Jack and Son, 1855.

Anonymous, Revival of Conventual Life in Scotland: History of St. Margaret's Convent, Edinburgh, the first Religious House founded in Scotland since the so-called Reformation; and the autobiography of the first religious, Sister Agnes Xavier Trail. Edinburgh, 1886.


Seale, Rev. Canon, “Protestants and the Protégés”. Pamphlet of lecture delivered on 17 November 1889 at the Church of St. Augustine, Turbridge Wells.

Sermon preached at the opening of the National Council of Scotland, 17 August 1886, by His Grace, the Archbishop of Glasgow. Glasgow, Hugh Margey, 1886.


Journal Articles and Book Chapters


Barke, Michael, “Census Enumeration Books and the Local Historian” in The Local Historian.


Brown, Callum, "Faith in the City" in History Today. Vol. 40 (May, 1990), pp. 41-47.


Clarke, Brian P., "Lay Nationalism in Victorian Toronto" in Catholics are the “Gathering Place”: Historical Essays on the Archdiocese of Toronto 1841-1991. McGowan, Mark G. and
Clarke, Brian P., eds. Toronto, The Canadian Catholic Historical Association, 1993, pp. 41-52.


Gallagher, Tom, “The Catholic Irish in Scotland: in Search of Identity” in *Irish Immigrants and


Grant, Susan Mary, “New Light on the Lady with the Lamp” in History Today. Vol. 52, No. 2 (September, 2002), pp. 11-17.


Parson, Steven, “George III” in *History Today*. Vol. 52, No. 6 (June, 2002), pp. 36-43.


Pilbeam, Pamela, “Pink Lemonade Socialists” in *History Today*. Vol. 51, No. 8 (August, 2001),
pp. 46-51.


Rafferty, Oliver, "Fenianism in North America in the 1860s: The Problems of Church and State" in History. Vol. 84, No. 274 (April, 1999), pp. 257-277.


Ryder, Sean, "Reading Lessons: Famine and the Nation, 1845-1949" in Fearful Realities: New Perspectives of the Famine. Morash, Chrish and Hayes, Richard, eds., Blackrock, Co. Dublin,


Books


Carney, Margaret, *The First Franciscan Woman: Clare of Assisi and Her Form of Life*. Quincy, Illinois, Franciscan Press, Quincy University, 1993.


Clark, S. D., *Church and Sect in Canada*. Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 1948.

Clarke, Carolyn W., *Evacuation 114: As seen from within*. Boston, Hudson Printing Company, 1919.


Thau, 1956.


Gaffield, Chad, *Language, Schooling, and Cultural Conflict: The origins of the French language...*


Grant, John Webster, The Churches and the Canadian Experience. Toronto, The Ryerson Press,
1963.


Kerr, Mary Aloysius, *Dictionary of Biography of the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary in


Luddy, Maria and Murphy, Cliona, eds., Women Surviving. Swords, Co. Dublin, Poolbeg, 1989.


Marwick, James D., *Glasgow: The Water Supply of the City from the earliest period of record with notes on various developments of the city till the close of 1900*. Glasgow, Robert Anderson, 1901.


O’Ryan, Mary Ann, John Carroll, First Bishop of Baltimore and his views on women. Charles and Margaret Cushwa Centre for the study of American Catholicism, University of Notre Dame. Working Papers Series #23 (Spring, 1991).


Conference Papers and Unpublished Theses

Conference Papers

Aspinwall, Bernard, “Catholic Devotion in Victorian Scotland”. Manuscript of paper delivered in May 2003 at the University of Aberdeen.


Unpublished Theses


On-line Sources

Archdiocese of Glasgow.
www.rcap.org.uk/Archive/H4.htm

Canadian Cartoonists Club Directory.
http://www.pccomix.com/CanadianCartoonistsClub/_directory/BengoughJW.html

Dictionary of Canadian Biography. Accessed via the National Archives of Canada.
http://www.biographi.ca/EN/ShowBio.asp?BioId=40147
http://www.biographi.ca/EN/ShowBio.asp?BioId=39591
http://www.biographi.ca/EN/ShowBio.asp?BioId=38037

Department of Medical Oncology, University of Newcastle upon Tyne.
http://cancerweb.nci.ac.uk/cgi-bin/omd/Typhus+epidemic
http://cancerweb.nci.ac.uk/cgi-bin/omd?query=cholera

Pacific School of Theology, Faculty Profiles.
http://www.psr.edu/page.cfm?i=135

Sisters of Mercy, Ireland.
http://www.sistersofmercy.ie/where/western/i_elphin.html

Statistical Account for Scotland, 1845.
http://stat-acc-scot.edina.ac.uk/stat-acc-scot/images/pages/600wide/2nd_Account_G1

The Glasgow Story.

Tufts University (Medford, MA) Perseus Digital Library.
http://www.perseus.tufts.edu