



University  
of Glasgow

Clark, Duane (2014) *A pious and sensible politeness: forgotten contributions of George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton to 19th Century American intellectual development*. PhD thesis.

<http://theses.gla.ac.uk/5670/>

Copyright and moral rights for this thesis are retained by the author

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge

This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the Author

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the Author

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given

**UNIVERSITY of GLASGOW**

**A Pious and Sensible Politeness:  
Forgotten Contributions of George Jardine and Sir  
William Hamilton to 19<sup>th</sup> Century American  
Intellectual Development**

**Duane E Clark  
MA, ABD**

**Submitted in Fulfillment of the Requirements for  
the Degree of PhD**

**DEPARTMENT OF SCOTTISH HISTORY  
DEPARTMENT OF SCOTTISH LITERATURE**

**July 2014**

## **Abstract:**

### **A Pious and Sensible Politeness: Forgotten Contributions of George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton to 19<sup>th</sup> Century American Intellectual Development**

In recent years there has been a renewed interest in Scottish contributions to the intellectual development in the early America. There has been a significant amount of work focused on Scottish luminaries such as Hutcheson, Hume and Smith and their influence on the eighteenth century American founding fathers. However, little attention has been directed at what we might call the later reception of the Scottish Enlightenment in the first half of the nineteenth century. This thesis presents an in-depth account of the intellectual and literary contributions of two relatively obscure philosophers of the nineteenth century: George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton. This study is framed by biographies of their lives as academics and then focuses on a detailed account of their work as represented in American books and periodicals. In addition, some attention will be given to their respected legacies, in regards to their students who immigrated to America.

This thesis is comprised of two sections. The first contains five chapters that lay out the details of the lives and legacies of Jardine and Hamilton. Chapter 1 looks at the literary and historical context of Scotland's contributions to early American academic development. Chapter 2 is a focused biography of the academic life of George Jardine. Though this biography centres on Jardine's life as an educator, it constitutes the most complete account of his life to date. Chapter 3 looks in depth at Jardine's academic and literary reception in America. This chapter chronicles the dissemination of Jardine's pedagogical strategies by former students who immigrated to America as well as how his ideas were presented in American books and journals. Chapter 4 returns to a biographical format focused on one of Jardine's most famous students – Sir William Hamilton. Like the biography on Jardine the emphasis of this chapter is on Hamilton's role as an educator. Chapter 5 looks at Sir William Hamilton's academic and literary reception in the United States. This chapter also presents material on Hamilton's personal connections to Americans that have been overlooked in transatlantic intellectual history.

Section two presents annotated catalogs of books and journals that exemplify the literary reception of Jardine and Hamilton in America. In the case of Jardine I include catalogs of two of his students who immigrated to America as a means to highlight Jardine's indirect impact on the American religious and educational literature. Whereas many have argued that the 19<sup>th</sup> century witnessed a decline in Scottish education and Philosophy this study shows that these ideas thrived in America and it is evident Scotland was still exporting useful knowledge to the United States well past the civil war.

## Table of Contents

<b>Chapter 1</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>Scottish American Studies</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>Colleges and Universities in the United States from 1800 - 1840</b> .....	<b>15</b>
<b>The Scottish Enlightenment</b> .....	<b>17</b>
<b>Structure of this study</b> .....	<b>34</b>
<b>Chapter 2</b> .....	<b>39</b>
<b>An Applied Biography of George Jardine</b> .....	<b>39</b>
<b>Biography; Jardine the young scholar</b> .....	<b>40</b>
<b>Jardine the tutor</b> .....	<b>45</b>
<b>Jardine the promising professor</b> .....	<b>48</b>
<b>Jardine’s teaching and learning</b> .....	<b>50</b>
<b>Jardine in context</b> .....	<b>52</b>
<b>The so-called “quiet reformer”</b> .....	<b>58</b>
<b>Jardine’s classroom pedagogy</b> .....	<b>62</b>
<b>Jardine and the <i>Outlines of a Philosophical Education</i></b> .....	<b>65</b>
<b>Chapter 3</b> .....	<b>81</b>
<b>Jardine and America</b> .....	<b>81</b>
<b><i>Outlines</i> in America</b> .....	<b>83</b>
<b>American magazines in the field of education</b> .....	<b>86</b>
<b>American journals: Importing a Scottish educational philosophy</b> .....	<b>89</b>
<b>Students, Friends and Acquaintances in America</b> .....	<b>94</b>
<b>The Campbell Men</b> .....	<b>95</b>
<b>Robert Owen (1771-1858)</b> .....	<b>101</b>
<b>William Russell (1798-1873)</b> .....	<b>102</b>
<b>George Ticknor (1791-1873)</b> .....	<b>104</b>
<b>Robert Crichton Wyllie (1798-1865)</b> .....	<b>105</b>
<b>Chapter 4</b> .....	<b>123</b>
<b>An Applied Biography of Sir William Hamilton</b> .....	<b>123</b>
<b>Hamilton the scholar</b> .....	<b>126</b>
<b>Hamilton search of a career</b> .....	<b>129</b>
<b>Chair of Metaphysics and Logic at the University of Edinburgh</b> .....	<b>140</b>
<b>In poor health</b> .....	<b>143</b>
<b>Chapter 5</b> .....	<b>150</b>
<b>Sir William Hamilton and the American literary stage</b> .....	<b>150</b>
<b>Hamilton’s American family ties</b> .....	<b>153</b>
<b>The purchasing power of Hamilton’s name and work in America</b> .....	<b>157</b>
<b>Francis Bowen and Harvard College</b> .....	<b>162</b>
<b>Harvard College and Hamiltonian ideas</b> .....	<b>165</b>

Yale and Hamiltonian ideas .....	167
Brown University and Hamiltonian ideas .....	169
American intellectual thought and Hamilton philosophy .....	170
Hamilton's students in America .....	173
American slavery and Sir William Hamilton .....	176
Religion in America.....	190
The breadth of Hamilton's legacy in America .....	194
<b>Section II .....</b>	<b>196</b>
Introduction .....	196
George Jardine in American Books.....	198
George Jardine in American Journals .....	201
Publications of Alexander Campbell .....	211
Publications of William Russell .....	242
Sir William Hamilton in American Books and Periodicals.....	247
Books:.....	247
Sir William Hamilton in American Journals .....	278
Biographical Material.....	278
Philosophy and Literature.....	293
Psychology and Philosophy of the Mind .....	310
American Encounters with Hamilton .....	327
Authority and Scholarship.....	328
Publications of James McCosh .....	331
<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>338</b>
<b>Selected Bibliography .....</b>	<b>348</b>

## **Acknowledgements**

First and foremost I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisors, Gerry Curruthers and Colin Kidd, whose direction and encyclopedic knowledge of Scottish literature and history made this thesis possible. *Mahalo nui* to Dr. Allison (Francis) Paynter at Chaminade University, Richard Hill and Josh Wyant at the University of Hawaii Maui for their on-going encouragement and editorial comments on my thesis.

A number of other individuals greatly contributed to the creation of this thesis; in particular, Janice Condron who opened her home to me during my time in Glasgow. A special thanks to Brian Halley and the entire crew at Slanj Kilts for the most unlikely employment for a visitor from Hawaii.

I would like to thank the University of Hawaii and Chancellor Clyde Sakamoto for granting me a timely sabbatical and leave of absence to go to Scotland and pursue this doctorate.

In addition, I would like to acknowledge the staff of the Glasgow University Library and Special Collections for the hours of assistance they provided me in archival research.

Last but not least I would like to thank my son Kieran for uprooting from his tropical home to live in Glasgow and to Jill Marzo for her constant encouragement and moral support.

## **Author's Declaration**

I declare that, except where explicit reference is made to the contribution of others, that this dissertation is the result of my own work and has not been submitted for any other degree at the University of Glasgow or any other institution.

**Signature** \_\_\_\_\_

**Printed Name**      Duane E. Clark





# Chapter 1

## Introduction

This thesis presents an in-depth account of the intellectual and literary contributions of the Scottish philosophers George Jardine (1742-1827) and Sir William Hamilton (1778 - 1856). This study is framed by applied biographies of both Jardine and Hamilton, then focuses on a detailed account of their work as represented in American books and periodicals.<sup>1</sup> In addition, some attention will be given to their respective academic and professional legacies in regards to their students who immigrated to America.

One of the first problems confronting this investigation centres on the value of studying such obscure but important figures. I believe, however, that by presenting long forgotten details of the contributions of these two men we begin to fill the void of some of the more general claims about the role of Scottish philosophy on the intellectual development in nineteenth-century America.

Gordon Graham poses the question, “if there is such a thing as Scottish philosophy when was its heyday?” His answer: “It was not the eighteenth century but the early nineteenth century, when Stewart and Hamilton taught at Edinburgh and dominated the intellectual culture of the times.”<sup>2</sup> In like manner, Cairns Craig states, “If there was a period in which

---

<sup>1</sup> I owe the term “applied biography” to Gerry Curruthers referring to a biography focused on a particular aspect or theme of a person’s life. In this case the biographies focus on the academic careers and literary exports of George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton.

<sup>2</sup> Graham, Gordon (2003), “The Nineteenth-Century Aftermath”, In: Broadie, Alexander *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 342.

Scotland did in truth ‘invent the modern world, our modern world, it was the period [...] when Thomas (Lord Kelvin) made long distance telegraphy possible, when Maxwell produced (in 1861) the first colour photograph, when Bell invented the telephone, and when Maxwell laid the groundwork for Einstein’s theory of relativity’.<sup>3</sup> Graham continues: “Though it’s not my purpose here to rescue Hamilton’s reputation it is important to observe that the nineteenth century had a quite different perception of Scottish philosophy than that which now prevails”.<sup>4</sup> In some sense then, this study is part of the rescue program for Sir William Hamilton, and even more so for his professor and friend, George Jardine.

### **Scottish American Studies**

There has been a growing interest in the connections between Scotland and the United States.<sup>5</sup> In general, recent advances in genomics and its application in tracing human migration has made it possible for many, especially in America, Canada and Australia, to

---

<sup>3</sup> Cairns Craig (2009), *Intending Scotland: Explorations in Scottish Culture since the Enlightenment*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 105.

<sup>4</sup> Graham, Gordon (2003), “The Nineteenth-Century Aftermath”, In: Broadie, Alexander *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 343.

<sup>5</sup> One indication of a growing interest in the connection between the United States and Scotland can be seen in recent popular literature that has been written for Amazon.com audiences and not necessarily academics. Authors like Duncan Bruce and his books, *Mark of the Scots: Their Astonishing Contributions to History Science, Democracy, Literature and the Arts* (2000) and *The Scottish 100: Portraits of History’s Most Influential Scots* (2000), can be found at Highland Games and Renaissance fairs across America. We can include Arthur Herman’s *How the Scots Invented the Modern World: The Story of How Western Europe’s Poorest Nation Created Our World and Everything in it* (2002) to the list as well as *Born Fighting: How the Scots-Irish Shaped America* (2005) by former United States Naval Secretary James Webb. Another indication can be seen in the rise in popularity of Scottish traditional music in America such as the nationally syndicated radio show *Thistle and Shamrock* on National Public Radio, or local radio shows such as *Sunday Solstice* that focuses on Scottish and Irish music in Hawaii.

search for their family origins. The rising trend of tracing one's roots through genetics can be witnessed by the popularity of endeavours such as the National Geographic DNA project and the many online family lineage databases. For thousands and thousands of Americans this search leads them to Scotland.<sup>6</sup>

In academia, Scottish-American Studies have been virtually non-existent until most recently.<sup>7</sup> Perhaps part of this elusiveness is that for most Americans "British" means "English". Hence, many of the cultural subtleties of Scottish contributions have often been simply washed out as English.<sup>8</sup> An illustration of this trend can be seen in the fact that most American college level introduction to philosophy courses never mention Scottish philosophy, or if one studies British philosophy they will study David Hume. However, Hume is taught as simply one of the "British Empiricists". Interestingly enough, of the three traditional British Empiricists, Locke, Berkeley and Hume, only Locke was English. In addition, there is never any mention of J.S. Mill's Scottish roots and most of the other major contributors to the Scottish Enlightenment are scarcely mentioned at all.<sup>9</sup> Neither is it uncommon for recent graduates in philosophy from an American college or university to have never heard of Thomas Reid. Even on the Scottish side of the Atlantic, there is a long

---

<sup>6</sup> In the 2009 US Community Census Survey, 6,850,000 Americans self-identified as having solely Scottish ancestry, 27.5 million Americans reported Scottish ancestry either alone or in combination with another nationality. It's interesting to note the 2011 census in Scotland have shown that the population of the country was 5,295,000.

<sup>7</sup> A few authors like Sir Duncan Rice, Andrew Hook and Douglas Sloan did publish on Scottish American connections in the 1970s, and before that, James McCosh in the 1870s, but overall the representation has been thin.

<sup>8</sup> "British" is a term that describes a political relationship and is perhaps not the best term to use when making reference to intellectual or cultural contributions.

<sup>9</sup> J.S. Mill's father, James Mill, studied at the University of Edinburgh under Dugald Stewart. The Mills relocated to London; however, John Stewart Mill was entirely educated at home and as such is a direct heir to the Scottish Enlightenment.

history of misrepresenting, or under-representing, Scottish philosophy. For example, the 1881 series “English Philosophers” begins with a book on Sir William Hamilton who, of course, was not English.<sup>10</sup>

In Scotland, interest in Scottish-American intellectual history is a fairly recent field of inquiry. Recently, Scottish historians have begun to produce a significant amount of work focused on the Scottish Enlightenment. Interest in the Scottish contributions to revolution-era America too has been well explored on both sides of the Atlantic. For instance, in 1964 Herbert Schneider laid claim to the Scottish influence on American thought in his book, *A History of American Philosophy*. He states that, “the Scottish enlightenment was probably the most potent single tradition in the American enlightenment”.<sup>11</sup> Pushing this idea a little harder, Gary Wills argued that the *Declaration of Independence* and the writings of Thomas Jefferson are best understood from a Hutchisonian, moral sense perspective.<sup>12</sup> Whereas some, like Samuel Fleischacker, Ronald Hamowy, George W. Cary and Gary Schmitt, to name a few, question Wills's historical accuracy and think he has overstated the importance of Hutchison's contributions to Jefferson, Wills has nonetheless opened the door to a new perspective on American intellectual development.<sup>13</sup>

---

<sup>10</sup> Monck, W. H. S. (1881). *Sir William Hamilton*. London: S. Low, Marston, Searle and Rivington.

<sup>11</sup> Schneider, Herbert. (1946). *A History of American Philosophy*. New York: Columbia University Press.

<sup>12</sup> Wills, Gary (1978). *Inventing America: Jefferson's Declaration of Independence*. Boston, New York: Houghton Mifflin Company.

<sup>13</sup> See Samuel Fleischacker (2003) *The Impact on America: Scottish philosophy and the American founding*. For a good discussion on the reception of Wills' claims, see Andrew Hook's introduction to his book (1999), *From Goose Creek to Gandercleugh*. East Linton: Tuckwell Press.

From the early-mid eighteenth century well into the nineteenth century, Scotland witnessed an explosion of intellectual innovators and achievements. The names of many of those luminaries are still well-remembered to this day: James Hutton, James Watt, Robert Stevenson, Robert Burns, David Hume, Walter Scott, and Lord Kelvin (William Thomson), to name but a few. Though these names out of the annals of Scottish history have stood the test of time, and their accomplishments are well-recognized throughout Europe and America, their names and accomplishments are not always associated with Scotland or the Scottish Enlightenment. Perhaps part of the disconnection between the accomplishments of Scottish luminaries and the context of those accomplishments lies in the concept of Scottish Enlightenment.

Alexander Broadie states that the term “Scottish Enlightenment” is useful in historical analysis because it describes a distinct historical moment, a moment when there was a “complex set of relations within a group of geniuses, and other immensely creative people, many linked by kinship, who were living out of each other’s intellectual pocket”.<sup>14</sup> Broadie concludes that the Scottish Enlightenment ends in roughly 1796 or 1797, with the deaths of Thomas Reid and James Hutton. He writes, “I have followed the common view that the Scottish Enlightenment, considered as a distinct historical epoch, came to an end with the end of that remarkable group of Scottish geniuses who dominated the European intellectual scene across the eighteenth century”.<sup>15</sup> Although for Broadie the Scottish Enlightenment ends at a fairly accepted cut-off date in the eighteenth century, Gordon Graham has claimed that the early nineteenth century was the heyday for Scottish

---

<sup>14</sup> Broadie, Alexander (2001). *The Scottish Enlightenment: The Historical Age of the Historical Nation*. Edinburgh: Birlinn; 19.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, 220.

philosophy. The two claims here are not necessarily contradictory. The end of the Enlightenment as a historical epoch does not mean that those ideas did not move forward into the next century. In fact, Roger Emerson has noted that by 1800 Scotland “could boast of an enlightenment to which belonged several of the century’s best philosophers, its most accomplished political economist and many notable social thinkers, important scientists and medical men, even rhetoricians and theologians”.<sup>16</sup> Thus were the literary accomplishments of the Scottish Enlightenment the foundation for an enthusiastic reception from a rapidly expanding readership such as America in the nineteenth century.

Andrew Hook’s observations about the similarities between Scotland and America outline reasons why Scottish ideas were embraced across the Atlantic. In his book, *Scotland and America: A Study of Cultural Relations 1750 - 1835* published in 1975, Hook presents a detailed look at the connection between the two sides of the Atlantic in the eighteenth century. He follows up that study with his 1999 publication *From Goosecreek to Gandercleugh*, exploring the cultural and literary connections between Scotland and America. Hook investigates the parallels between the literary cultures of Philadelphia and Edinburgh. He explains, “As part of an Atlantic community, an English-speaking world whose culture was inevitably dominated by metropolitan London, they were both in this context, peripheral cities. That may well be an important factor in helping explain why, like Scotland and America more generally perhaps, they were often prepared to listen to each other”.<sup>17</sup> Hook takes notice that:

---

<sup>16</sup> Emerson, Roger (2003). “The Context of the Scottish Enlightenment” in *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment*. Cambridge University Press, 25.

<sup>17</sup> Hook, Andrew (1999). *From Goose Creek to Gandercleugh*. East Linton: Tuckwell Press, 25.

Over the last forty years a handful of scholars, many of them American, have been busily exploring Scotland's contribution to the invention of the USA, but they have had little or no success in compelling general recognition of that contribution. The Scottish case has been put, but, as it were, to an empty courtroom. Thus American historians and American historiography have remained largely unaware of the Scottish dimension to the origins of their national identity and culture.<sup>18</sup>

However, with a fresh interest in American ancestral origins and a rise in acknowledging one's cultural heritage, there have been a cluster of fairly recent publications aimed at a general readership that do indeed focus on the Scottish contribution in the United States.<sup>19</sup> Because of this rising interest in the Scottish case, I believe the time may be right to seat the jury in Hook's courtroom.

The handful of scholars that Hook refers to tend to provide only a general overview of Scottish contributions to American intellectual development. Henry May, for instance, in his book *The Enlightenment in America*, broke down the American Enlightenment into four themes: the Moderate Enlightenment, the Sceptical Enlightenment, the Revolutionary Enlightenment and the Didactic Enlightenment. He placed Scottish contributions in the Didactic Enlightenment as focusing on the early portion of the nineteenth century. In addition, May has some valuable insights into the similarities between the Scottish Enlightenment and what was going on in America as well. Like Hook, May

---

<sup>18</sup> *Ibid.*, 10.

<sup>19</sup> For example, in 1996 *The Mark of the Scots* by Duncan Bruce, *The Emperor's new Kilt* by Jan-Andrew Henderson; in 2001 *How the Scots invented the Modern World* by Arthur Herman; and in 2004, *Born Fighting* by James Webb.

identifies the similarities between Boston and Philadelphia and Glasgow and Edinburgh in terms of their disdain for English attitudes, all the while their intellectual communities were gravitating towards English sensibilities. May also notes that, “the Scottish Enlightenment like the American flourished in an environment shaped by Calvinism, and divided by Calvinism”.<sup>20</sup> May’s identification of Scottish contributions is indeed helpful, but it is nonetheless quite general. Similarly, Robert Ferguson also identifies similar trends in America. In his book *The American Enlightenment 1750 – 1820*. Ferguson notes the Scottish influence on the American Enlightenment, and like May, places the Scottish influence on America as one of the last aspects of the enlightenment in America. Though Ferguson acknowledges the Scottish influence, he too does so only in general terms. This is why the focus of my study, while fitting well within May’s timeline and identification of a didactic character, will present more evidence and details that move beyond both May’s and Ferguson’s more general approaches.

An equally general yet less enthusiastic view of the Scottish contribution in the United States comes from Herbert Schneider. As mentioned above, Schneider acknowledges Scottish influence on American thought, and did so prior to May and Ferguson. Paving the way for the others, Schneider, in his 1946 text *A History of American Philosophy*, claims the Scottish influence carried into the nineteenth century. Though he professes the influence of Scottish realism in American philosophy, his work is tainted with a certain prejudice against the school and its representatives. In particular, Schneider scorns James McCosh, who was writing in the 1870s, for his positive views on the importance of Scottish thought and his call for an American philosophy that is “realistic” as opposed to idealistic. Schneider claims

---

<sup>20</sup> May, Henry (1976). *The Enlightenment in America*. New York: Oxford University Press; 342.

that it is a “serious mistake to regard the whole period of academic philosophy until James as under the dominance of the Scottish school and of orthodoxy”.<sup>21</sup> Schneider’s conclusion is that, “McCosh and his Scottish philosophy, failed in America insofar as he attempted to lay the foundations of realism”.<sup>22</sup> Schneider, however, seems to suggest that there was a consensus within a Scottish school.<sup>23</sup> Even the notion of orthodoxy may cause one to sidestep important distinctions within Scottish contributions. Indeed, David Hoeveler tells us that McCosh was driven from a young age to reconcile “opposing movements in Scottish culture”.<sup>24</sup> Like many of the Scottish thinkers before him, including Americans like Francis Bowen who incorporated Scottish methodologies in their own work, McCosh was concerned with the relationship between science and the Christian faith.

Hoeveler’s *James McCosh and The Scottish Intellectual Tradition* dedicates nearly a hundred pages to McCosh’s life and influence in the United States. He frames McCosh as the last champion of Scottish philosophy. Yet in Hoeveler’s view McCosh, “merged the Scottish system with the evangelical movement of the nineteenth century, and his synthesis

---

<sup>21</sup> Contrast that claim with the observations of Bruce Kuklick: “Until the time of the civil war, Scottish ideas were undisputed both at Harvard and the academic world at large” (*The rise of American Philosophy*, 19). There is a sense in which both of these claims can be reconciled. That is, Kuklick is correct – up to the Civil War which ravaged America from 1861 to 1865, the Scottish intellect dominated the American academic scene. And after the war this dominance began to fade. James McCosh was in Harvard Medical School until 1869, then began to teach psychology in 1875. One still sees ample references to the Scottish thinkers in the 1870s. McCosh himself was influenced by Scottish realism (see Kuklick 159-161).

<sup>22</sup> Schneider, Herbert (1946), *A History of American Philosophy*: New York: Columbia University Press, 220.

<sup>23</sup> Apparently for Schneider the Scottish contribution to 19<sup>th</sup> century idealism is not part of Scottish philosophical tradition.

<sup>24</sup> Hoeveler, David (1981). *James McCosh and the Scottish Intellectual Tradition*. Princeton: Princeton University Press; 31.

unquestionably forestalled a bitter conflict of religion and science”.<sup>25</sup> Of course that bitter conflict was already afoot in America a decade before McCosh crossed the Atlantic. By the 1850s American philosophers were scrambling to meet the challenges set out by Malthus, Spencer and Darwin. Not surprisingly then, McCosh’s debates with Charles Hodge brought the conflict between religion and science to the forefront of academic attention in the nineteenth century.<sup>26</sup>

Another early twentieth-century historian that chronicled the intellectual heritage of Scottish philosophers in nineteenth-century America was Bruce Kuklick in his 1977 publication, *The Rise of American Philosophy*. Kuklick states, “Until the time of the civil war, Scottish ideas were undisputed both at Harvard and the academic world at large”.<sup>27</sup> As I will point out in the chapter on Sir William Hamilton’s reception in America, Scottish ideas were entrenched in many leading colleges and universities not only in the *antebellum era*, but also well after the American Civil War.

More recently, Frank Shuffelton’s edition of *The American Enlightenment*, a collection of essays, from *The Journal of the History of Ideas*, provides a couple of articles that explore the Scottish-American connection with some detail. For example, Rob Branson’s essay *James Madison and The Scottish Enlightenment*, emphasises the importance of Scottish sociological history in Madison’s writings noting that Madison, like Millar and Adam Ferguson, described “social change in similarly evolutionary terms”.<sup>28</sup>

---

<sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*, 348.

<sup>26</sup> Gundlach, Bradley (1997). McCosh and Hodge on Evolution: A Combined Legacy. *Journal of Presbyterian History*; 75 (2); 85-102.

<sup>27</sup> Kuklick, Bruce (1977), *The Rise of American Philosophy: Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1860-1930* Mass.: Yale University Press, 19.

<sup>28</sup> Shuffelton, Frank (1993) *The American Enlightenment*. New York; University of Rochester Press; 271.

Another important work is *The Scottish Enlightenment and the American College Ideal* by David Sloan. Sloan, “studies the influences exerted by the universities of Scotland and the ideas of Scottish Intellectuals on eighteenth-century American higher education”.<sup>29</sup> He looks closely at the contributions of John Witherspoon and his successor at Princeton, Samuel Stanhope Smith, as well as the Scottish influences on the American thinker Benjamin Rush.<sup>30</sup> Sloan’s work sets the stage for the nineteenth-century reception of Scottish thinkers by demonstrating that there was already an academic tradition of the Scottish intellect in America.

Mark Spencer has published a detail account of David Hume’s impact on eighteenth-century intellectual scene in *David Hume and The Eighteenth Century*.<sup>31</sup> Prior to this publication, Spencer came out with a two volume set titled *Hume’s Reception in early America* (2004). Spencer primarily focuses on the literary reception of Hume’s ideas in American periodicals with a good portion of the references coming out of the nineteenth century up to 1850. Spencer investigates four major themes: “Early American Responses to Hume’s Essays, Moral, Political, and Literary”, “Early American Responses to Hume’s Philosophical Writings”, “Early American Responses to Hume’s History of England”, and “Early American Responses to Hume’s character and Death”. Spencer demonstrates that Hume’s work was relevant to a variety of topics in America in the nineteenth century.

---

<sup>29</sup> Sloan, Douglas (1971). *The Scottish Enlightenment and the American College Ideal*. Columbia: Teachers College Press; vii.

<sup>30</sup> Both Witherspoon and Rush are forever etched into American history as signers of the *Declaration of Independence*. Both men were educational leaders in the early United States. Witherspoon was the first President of College of New Jersey, later to become Princeton University, and Rush was the founder of Dickinson College Pennsylvania.

<sup>31</sup> Spencer, Mark (2010). *David Hume and Eighteenth-Century America*. Rochester: University of Rochester Press.

In Scotland many philosophers and literary types saw Thomas Reid as an answer to the perceived scepticism of Hume. Later, in continental Europe, the Prussian philosopher Immanuel Kant also presented an answer to Hume. However, in the nineteenth century it was a synthesis of Reid and Kant that sparked the interest of philosophers on both sides of the Atlantic. This synthesis was born in Scotland where Kant's ideas were presented through the work of Sir William Hamilton. Kant's philosophy did not take root in Scotland and to some extent the spread of Kantian principles in Scotland and the United States was propagated via Hamilton.

Another fairly recent work that centres on the Scottish literary reception in America in detail is Richard Sher's *The Enlightenment and the Book*. This book identifies American publishers and maps out their relationship to Scottish authors. Sher also provides a catalogue of the publications of Scottish authors from the eighteenth century. Sher's work adds strength to the claim of Scottish dominance in philosophy and education in the eighteenth century, and demonstrates the Scottish intellectual foundation in place leading into the nineteenth century. Sher notes that it was the Scottish, "flesh and blood booksellers who brought the ideas of Dugald Stewart and other Scots to North America, and did it by choosing to import, reprint and promote certain books rather than others".<sup>32</sup> One Scottish bookseller in particular, William Young, who studied at Glasgow University, "was instrumental in transforming Scottish common sense philosophy into a commodity that was not only purchased and used, but literally remade, in America".<sup>33</sup>

---

<sup>32</sup> Sher, Richard B. (2006), *The Enlightenment and the Book: Scottish Authors and Their Publishers in Eighteenth-Century Britain, Ireland and America*. Chicago: Chicago University Press, 567.

<sup>33</sup> *Ibid.*

There are a couple of general themes that arise from those who have written on Scotland and America. One theme is that there was a literary foundation for Scottish thought in America laid in the eighteenth century. Another is that the American response to the philosophy imported from Scotland flourished in the nineteenth century. I believe both these general claims are well-founded and can be supported by a closer look at George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton. In terms of philosophical name recognition, these two Scottish thinkers range from the relatively unknown, as with Hamilton, to the nearly obscure as in Jardine's case. In what little is mentioned about these two men in contemporary scholarship they have been perhaps most uniformly noted for their lack of originality and lack-lustre contributions. In addition, Jardine and Hamilton made their contributions at a time when many think that the Scottish Enlightenment had seen its end days. Indeed, for some, the nineteenth century seems to be the doldrums for Scottish philosophy. Victor Cousin writing in 1836, identified a void in Scottish philosophy: "The Scottish school of mental philosophy, at one period so much distinguished for caution, precision, and acute and discriminating enquiry, has now remained almost silent for a considerable time".<sup>34</sup> Where there may have been some lag-time for Scottish philosophy in Europe, things were different in America.

As we have seen, Andrew Hook states it is not until America is solidly in the nineteenth century that the impact of the Scottish Enlightenment hits with force. Herbert Schneider also acknowledges as much when he claims that not until the 1820s did Scottish philosophy really take hold in the United States. He states, "The Scottish Philosophy invaded the country and rapidly crowded out the older eighteenth-century texts. Thomas

---

<sup>34</sup> Cousin, Victor (1836). *Testimony in Favor of Sir William Hamilton*: Letter from Cousin to Professor Pillans, Paris Juin, 1836, 14.

Reid's *Intellectual and Active Powers* (1785) (as his two works were usually called for short) and Dugald Stewart's *Elements of Philosophy of the Human Mind* and *The Active and Moral Powers* (1792 for volume 1 and 1814 for Volume 2) the pattern for a new division of philosophy into mental and moral".<sup>35</sup> Likewise, David Allen states,

There is without question, reason enough to doubt the real extent of the putative decline in the influence of Scottish pedagogy during the nineteenth century. Scottish educational theory and practice still made their characteristic influence felt, at least, as Anand Chitnis has shown, in the English schools and academies. The same is true of the emerging colleges and universities of North America. There, not only Reid and Stewart but also Blair, Campbell, Witherspoon, and later James McCosh, long retained a vice like grip on the substance and delivery of academic provision".<sup>36</sup>

If we look at the rate of population growth in America as well as the tremendous speed at which colleges and universities were being formed we can see that the later philosophers of the Scottish Enlightenment and those early nineteenth century thinkers enjoyed a far bigger audience than their immediate predecessors. As the table below demonstrates, the 1800 census in America shows a population of 5.3 million people; by 1840 the population was more than 17 million.

---

<sup>35</sup> Schneider, Herbert. (1946) *A History of American Philosophy*: New York: Columbia University Press, 283.

<sup>36</sup> Allen, David (1993), *Virtue, Learning and the Scottish Enlightenment*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 235. Also see Chitnis, Anand C. (1986), *and The Scottish Enlightenment and Early Victorian English Society*. London: Croom Helm.

## Colleges and Universities in the United States from 1800 - 1840

**1800** 2nd Federal Census: 5,000,000 population; 22 colleges operating in the United States

Middlebury College, Vermont

**1801** South Carolina College, located in Charleston (later Columbia), renamed University of South Carolina in 1906.

**1802** The United States Military Academy founded by Congress at West Point, New York; first federally supported institution of higher education.

Ohio University

Washington & Jefferson College, Virginia

**1805** St. Mary's Seminary

**1806** Davidson College

**1809** Miami University, Ohio

**1810** Hamilton College, New York

**1815** Georgetown College, Maryland

**1816** University of Virginia

**1817** Allegheny College, Pennsylvania

**1819** Colgate College, New York

University of Pittsburgh

Cincinnati College

**1820** Third Federal Census: US population approaching 10,000,000.

University of Alabama

Indiana University

Colby College, Maine

**1821** Amherst College, Massachusetts.

**1822** Geneva College (later, Hobart) founded by Episcopalian laymen in New York.

**1824** Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, New York; first non-military technical institute in country.

**1826** Lafayette College, Pennsylvania.

**1829** Illinois College.

**1830** 4th Federal Census: 13,000,000 population; 56 colleges.

**1831** Wesleyan University, Connecticut, University of the City of New York (later New York University), founded by civic leaders dissatisfied with Columbia's classical curriculum and social exclusiveness.

**1832** Wabash College founded by Presbyterian ministers in Crawfordsville, Indiana.

**1833** Oberlin College, Ohio, by evangelical Congregationalists/ Presbyterians  
Haverford College founded in suburban Philadelphia; first Quaker-sponsored college in United States.

**1836** Mount Holyoke Female Seminary, Massachusetts; became Mount Holyoke College in 1888.

**1839** Georgia Female College chartered as first women's college in United States; opened in Macon.

**1837** Oberlin College enrolled four women students; inaugurates collegiate co-education in the United States.

**1838** Emory College, Georgia.

**1840** Fifth Federal Census: US population exceeds 17,000,000; Number of colleges approaches 100.

From 1591 to 1828 there were only seven universities in the British Isles. From 1750 to 1800 twenty-seven such institutions opened in America and by three quarters of the way through the nineteenth century there were two hundred and fifty colleges and universities in the United States. If we take a moment to reflect on what scholars have said about the definition and scope of this Enlightenment, we may see how these descriptions connect the intellectual activities of the later thinkers of the Scottish Enlightenment to America in the

nineteenth century. William Brock writes, “to a majority of educated Americans in the first half of the nineteenth century, ‘philosophy’ meant ‘Scottish philosophy’ and little else”.<sup>37</sup>

### **The Scottish Enlightenment**

So far I have been using the idea of a Scottish Enlightenment in a very general sense in order to examine some of the historical claims about connections between Scotland and America that are relevant to a study on George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton. However, the idea of Scottish Enlightenment has seen considerable attention. Alexander Broadie discusses the Scottish Enlightenment in terms of the literati of the age. He states that there was a “complex set of relations within a group of geniuses, and other immensely creative people, many linked by kinship, who were living out of each other’s intellectual pocket”.<sup>38</sup> In addition, Broadie gives two kinds of criteria in defining the Scottish Enlightenment as an epoch. The first is a broad distinction of two central characteristics:

its demand that we think for ourselves, and not allow ourselves to develop the intellectual vice of assenting to something simply because someone with authority has sanctioned it. Secondly, Enlightenment is characterized by the social virtue of tolerance, in that, in an enlightenment society, people are able to put their ideas into the public domain without fear of retribution from political, religious or other such authorities that have the power to punish those whose ideas they disapprove of”.<sup>39</sup>

Tolerance can certainly be a characteristic of enlightenment, but it would also appear to be a necessary condition for enlightenment. That is, tolerance, to some extent, must

---

<sup>37</sup> Brock, William (1982), *Scotus Americanus*. Edinburgh; University of Edinburgh Press, 93-94. Also see McCosh (1874), 184, and Sloan (1971), 145.

<sup>38</sup> Broadie, Alexander (2001), *The Scottish Enlightenment* Edinburgh, 19.

<sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*, 2.

precede enlightenment. Immanuel Kant expresses this idea in a letter 30 September 1784 addressing enlightenment wherein he states, “Nothing is required for this enlightenment, however, except freedom; and the freedom in question is the least harmful of all, namely, the freedom to use reason publicly in all matters”.<sup>40</sup> While thinking for one’s self and tolerance are reasonable features of an enlightenment, these virtues are not unique to Scotland.

The term “Scottish Enlightenment” is problematic in itself. It has been and is bound up in ambiguity, controversy and even denial.<sup>41</sup> J.G.A. Pocock advises we should avoid using the definite article to denote a particular enlightenment. He argues that ‘Enlightenment’ is a “word or signifier, and not a single or unifiable phenomenon which it consistently signifies. There is no single or unifiable phenomenon describable as ‘the Enlightenment,’ but it is the definite article rather than the noun which is to be avoided.”<sup>42</sup> Roger Emerson suggests we replace the noun: “Perhaps we should give up the notions of *enlightenment* and *enlightenments* since there is, and is likely to be, no agreement about what *enlightenment* denotes and hence no clear delineation of periods such as the *European* or the *Scottish Enlightenment*”.<sup>43</sup> Emerson’s substitute for “enlightenment” is

---

<sup>40</sup> Kant, I. (1784). *Kant*. Available:

<http://www.english.upenn.edu/~mgamer/Etexts/kant.html>. Last accessed Sept. 2011.

<sup>41</sup> See Roger Emerson (2011) “Enlightened ages, ages of improvement, and the Scottish Enlightenment”. I Castelli di Yale, XI (11), 21-45.

<sup>42</sup> See J. G. A. Pocock (2008). “Historiography and Enlightenment: A View of Their History”. *Modern Intellectual History*, 5, 83-96.

<sup>43</sup> Emerson, Roger (2011). “Enlightened ages, ages of improvement, and the Scottish Enlightenment”. I Castelli di Yale, XI (11), 21-45. (2011) “Enlightened ages, ages of improvement, and the Scottish Enlightenment”. I Castelli di Yale, XI (11), 21.

“improvement”.<sup>44</sup> Following Pocock and Nicolas Phillipson, Emerson finds this term more agreeable as it was utilized by some of the central figures of the age such as David Hume.

Rather than constructing a definition of the Enlightenment, some have sought to describe the nature of the Scottish Enlightenment. This approach too defies consensus. For example, John Robertson argues for the centrality of social science and political economy to the Scottish Enlightenment. Robertson states that preoccupations of Scottish thinkers focused on moral philosophy, the writing of history, and political economy. Similar to Emerson’s notion of improvement, Robertson finds that the philosophers of the Scottish Enlightenment were “unified by the commitment to human betterment in this world as the measure of progress, and to investigating the conditions of its achievement”.<sup>45</sup> Emerson, however, moves away from an emphasis on moral philosophy, history and political economy, and argues that science was a defining characteristic of the Scottish Enlightenment: “So how does one construct a *Scottish Enlightenment*? I see it as beginning with efforts of a handful of men to improve most things, a movement which rooted partly in natural philosophy or science and partly in other things like religion and economic distress. Science remained, I believe, the most important key to improvement”.<sup>46</sup> Emerson links advancement in “Science” with a bigger picture of social improvement. Echoing David

---

<sup>44</sup> It is worth noting that in a 1797 synopsis of the lectures of George Jardine, the three parts of his logic course were all headed by the word “improvement”: Part 1: The improvement of the powers or faculties of knowledge; Part 2: The improvement of the powers of tastes; and Part 3: The improvement of the powers of communication (GUL BG 44-i.10).

<sup>45</sup> Robertson, John (1997), “The Scottish Contribution to the Enlightenment”. Oxford: St Hugh's College, University of Oxford, 2.

<sup>46</sup> Emerson, Roger L. (2011), “Enlightened Ages, Ages of Improvement, and the Scottish Enlightenment”. *I Castelli di Yale*, XI (11), 21-45.

Hume, Emerson encourages a view of the Scottish Enlightenment that is holistic and not focused simply on ideas.<sup>47</sup>

Another important view on the nature of the Scottish Enlightenment comes via Sher. He recognises the significance of natural philosophy in 18<sup>th</sup> century Scotland, but does not give it the same central role as that of Emerson. Instead, Sher places his emphasis on publishing and the book trade. He claims that intellectual and scientific developments are best understood within broader context of Scottish culture, and supports this view with a detailed account of the development of scientific and medical publishing in the latter half of the eighteenth century. Sher's boldest claim is that the Scottish Enlightenment is "inconceivable without the publishing revolution".<sup>48</sup> Yet as Sher has pointed out, the publishing and book trade can be a necessary condition for the Scottish Enlightenment as it is intrinsically conjoined to the content that is being published. In other words, the Scottish Enlightenment may be inconceivable without the revolution in publishing, but also inconceivable without the advances in science and medicine and without the dialog on moral philosophy and without the analysis of political economy. Indeed, the set of possible conjunctions as consequent of a conditional claim about the Scottish Enlightenment would most likely defy consensus and run the risk of becoming meaninglessly open-ended.

For many scholars the distinctively Scottish character of the Enlightenment can be traced back to formable events that were unique to Scotland. For instance, Phillipson begins his account of the rise of the Scottish Enlightenment with the 1690s. The financial devastation of the Darien colony in Panama and "seven ill years" of famine contributed to

---

<sup>47</sup> See Emerson, Roger L. (2009) *Essays on David Hume, Medical Men and the Scottish Enlightenment: Industry, Knowledge, and Humanity*. Farmham: Ashgate Publishing Ltd.

<sup>48</sup> Sher, Richard B. (2006), *The Enlightenment and the Book: Scottish Authors and Their Publishers in 18th-Century Britain, Ireland and America*. Chicago, 609.

what Phillipson called, “one of the grimmest decades in modern Scottish history”.<sup>49</sup> For Phillipson, the economic problems of the 1690s led to an on-going, progressive and public dialog concerning political economy.

Roger Emerson pushed the timeline back a decade where natural philosophy, political turmoil and religion initiated institutional efforts in improvement: “The Scottish Enlightenment, as I see it, runs back into the 1680s when those ideas were accepted by some and new institutions to support them began to be discussed and created”.<sup>50</sup> He argues that,

Ages of improvement or Enlightenments should, I think, be dated from the time institutions were created to embody, pursue and promote those ideas over a wide range of concerns. I would trace the development of the Scottish Enlightenment through the creation of institutions to realize that improving agenda which I think was fully stated by c. 1700.<sup>51</sup>

Emerson recognises that the ideas of improvement had their roots in Humanistic Calvinism on one hand and, on the other, and the scientific questions and empirical methodologies of early modern thinkers. Not surprisingly, one of the most important institutions of improvement in Scotland was its educational system.

R. D. Anderson, focusing on education, pushes the date back even further, placing an emphasis on early development of the Scottish educational system: “The popular view that the Scottish educational tradition can be traced back to John Knox and the Reformers is not

---

<sup>49</sup> Phillipson, Nicholas (1975), “Culture and Society in the Eighteenth-Century Province: The Case of Edinburgh and the Scottish Enlightenment”, in L. Stone, ed., *The University in Society*, 2 vols. (Princeton, 1975), 2: 407–48.416. Also see Karen Cullen (2010), *Famine in Scotland - the 'Ill Years' of the 1690s*.

<sup>50</sup> Emerson, Roger L. (2011) “Enlightened ages, ages of improvement, and the Scottish Enlightenment”. *I Castelli di Yale*, XI (11), 36.

<sup>51</sup> *Ibid.*, 39.

incorrect”.<sup>52</sup> He claims, “In Scotland there was an advanced and distinctive educational tradition which could be traced back to the Reformation”.<sup>53</sup> For Anderson, the 1560 document, the *First Book of Discipline*, lays the conceptual foundation for a Scottish school system. He states, “ these efforts culminated in the Act of 1686”.<sup>54</sup> This Act with its subsequent amendments “remained the basis for Scottish educational legislation down to 1872”.<sup>55</sup> Anderson explains:

The concern for the church to bring religious instruction and literacy to the people had a natural social dimension, especially in the minds of the “Moderate” party who dominated the church from the 1750s. To spread national piety and reinforce orthodoxy against various forms of dissent was also to combat fanaticism, violence, intolerance, and superstition; to teach basic morality was also to promote obedience to parents and social authorities. Education was a modernizing, civilizing process which reinforced the social order, taught political loyalty, and created a workforce open to economic change.<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>52</sup> Anderson R.D. (1995), *Education and the Scottish People 1750 – 1918*. Oxford: Clarendon Press; 3.

<sup>53</sup> Anderson R.D. (1983), *Education and Opportunity in Victorian Scotland*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press; 1.

<sup>54</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>55</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>56</sup> Anderson R.D. (1995), *Education and the Scottish People 1750 – 1918*, 26.

So there is some consensus, or at least overlap, in establishing a genesis to the Scottish Enlightenment.<sup>57</sup> There is also a similar overlap in identifying the high water mark of the era.

Anand Chitnis equates the peak of the Scottish Enlightenment, the “high enlightenment,” roughly with the years of David Hume’s adult life, 1730-1776.<sup>58</sup> This designation works with Emerson’s account of the Scottish Enlightenment because of his emphasis on science and medicine. During Hume’s life there “were the distinguished natural philosophers and doctors in Scotland – Joseph Black, John Robison, James Hutton, John Playfair, and Sir John Leslie, but few moral philosophers of note other than Dugald Stewart and Thomas Brown”.<sup>59</sup> As Phillipson has noted, the Edinburgh of Hume’s era had become a genuine “republic of letters”.<sup>60</sup>

Along with Hume and eminent men of science, this golden age of the Scottish Enlightenment saw the emergence of the book trade. So what Emerson, Phillipson, and others understand to be more of a second phase of the Enlightenment, Sher, focusing on book authors, refers to as the “prime generation”.<sup>61</sup> Sher enumerated sixty-five Scottish authors during this time frame including David Hume, Thomas Reid, William Cullen and

---

<sup>57</sup> Early in the 20th century Laurie had identified the role of the Reformation as a key factor in the development of Scottish philosophy. See *Scottish Philosophy in its National Development*, 2.

<sup>58</sup> Chitnis, Anand (1976), *The Scottish Enlightenment. A Social History*, London-Totawa (N.J.), Helm, 13.

<sup>59</sup> Emerson, 41.

<sup>60</sup> Phillipson, Nicholas, “Culture and Society in the Eighteenth-Century Province: The Case of Edinburgh and the Scottish Enlightenment”, in L. Stone, ed., *The University in Society*, 2 vols. (Princeton, 1975), 2: 448.

<sup>61</sup> Sher, 98. Also his Table 2 in his appendix (P. 620 – 687) to *The Enlightenment and the Book* chronicles enlightenment book publications; the earliest volumes begin 1746. It would appear that the golden age of the Scottish enlightenment for Sher would begin mid 1770s – 1790s.

James Hutton, to name but a few. Consequently, with the passing of this generation, some scholars viewed this as the end of the Scottish Enlightenment. For example, Alexander Broadie claims that the Scottish Enlightenment ends in roughly 1796 or 1797, with the deaths of Thomas Reid and James Hutton. He writes, “I have followed the common view that the Scottish Enlightenment, considered as a distinct historical epoch, came to an end with the end of that remarkable group of Scottish geniuses who dominated the European intellectual scene across the eighteenth century”.<sup>62</sup> But for Phillipson, the beginning of the end is more conceptual. With this approach, the rise of Common Sense philosophy signalled the final phase of the Scottish Enlightenment. The principle of Common Sense attests that human beings are similarly constructed such that there are pre-critical judgments that we cannot help but believe. The principles of common sense constitute the foundations of rational thought and as such they are logically prior to, and a prerequisite for, philosophical investigation. The rise of Common Sense philosophy was a move away from the scepticism and materialism of Hume and Smith.<sup>63</sup>

As Emerson describes it, “The Scottish Enlightenment had matured and those making it became complacent as the country enjoyed greater prosperity. The old feeling of shame at their backwardness and the patriotic urge to catch up had been replaced by the confidence which came with knowing their universities were among the world’s best and that they had made astonishing economic progress.”<sup>64</sup> He continues: “By c. 1815 the Scottish Enlightenment had ended. The desires to systematically improve everything all at once had

---

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*, 220.

<sup>63</sup> Phillipson, Nicholas. “The Pursuit of Virtue in Scottish University Education: Dugald Stewart and Scottish Moral Philosophy in the Enlightenment”, in Phillipson, ed., *Universities, Society and the Future* (Edinburgh, 1983), 82–101.

<sup>64</sup> Emerson, Roger L. (2011) *Enlightened ages, ages of improvement, and the Scottish Enlightenment*. I Castelli di Yale, XI (11), 41.

changed into desires to do little for the poor and to avoid social change but to feel more deeply and to be more like the English.”<sup>65</sup>

Emerson’s identification of the decline in the desire for improvement, Phillipson’s timeline, and Broadie’s date for the end of the Scottish Enlightenment as well as Sher’s decline of the Scottish book trade after 1790, show some consensus, or at the very least, an overlap of opinion on the issue. What can be stated generally is that Scotland and its universities engaged in an on-going and vibrant intellectual discourse in the 18th century. This dialog was fuelled largely by concerns for improvement over a broad range of topics following the events of the previous two decades leading to the political union with England in 1707.

There is an aspect of the Scottish Enlightenment that is particularly relevant to this study of George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton and that is looking at the era as presenting an educational imperative. In his influential and controversial book, *The Democratic Intellect, Scotland and her Universities in the Nineteenth Century*, George Davie places George Jardine in a central role in expressing this imperative.<sup>66</sup> He tells us that Jardine was “one of the most significant figures – at any rate, from the purely pedagogical point of view – in this Scottish academical tradition, would seem to have been George

---

<sup>65</sup> *Ibid.*, 43.

<sup>66</sup> Paul Wood gives us an interesting description of Davie: “who can with some justice be regarded as the Dugald Stewart of our own day, for he has assumed Stewart’s mantle as the public guardian and expositor of Scotland’s national philosophical tradition. Echoing Stewarts emphasis on the “liberality” of Scottish universities... [he has] set out to identify the distinctive characteristics of the Scottish tradition during the turbulent years of the nineteenth century” (Wood, Paul (2000). “Introduction: Dugald Stewart and the Invention of the Scottish Enlightenment” in, *The Scottish Enlightenment Essays in Reinterpretations*, Rochester: University of Rochester Press), 12.

Jardine ...”.<sup>67</sup> Davie continues that Jardine “was not important merely as a living embodiment of the Scottish academical inheritance. He was the chief formulator of its educational ideals”.<sup>68</sup> Davie’s thoughts on Jardine do not make his arguments controversial.<sup>69</sup> It is rather his ideas on democratic intellectualism and the subversive force of the English education model on the Scottish institutions that draws fire from other scholars; most notably R.D. Anderson. I do not aim at constructing a defence of Davie’s historical account of the nineteenth century, but there are a few key features of his account of Scottish university education in the late eighteenth century that are informative.

Davie identifies the distinctive Scottish approach to education with, what he calls, the Presbyterian inheritance. Like Anderson, Davie puts an emphasis on reformation ideas on education that took hold in Scotland. This distinctly Scottish perspective on education became an aspect of national identity after the union with England. As Davie describes it, “At the Union of 1707, the Scots virtually gave up their political and economic independence, but retained the right to follow their national usage in religion, law and education”.<sup>70</sup> Christopher Berry has noted the same for the legal system and the church: “The salience of the lawyers generally was abetted by the fact that the Union had in a perverse way strengthened their role (along with the Kirk) as an embodiment of a distinctively Scottish way of doing things”.<sup>71</sup>

---

<sup>67</sup> Davie, George E. (1961), *The Democratic Intellect, Scotland and her Universities in the Nineteenth Century*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 9.

<sup>68</sup> Davie, 10.

<sup>69</sup> Perhaps Davie’s claims on Jardine are not controversial but it’s worth noting that Jardine is not mentioned in Anderson’s *Education and the Scottish People 1750 – 1919*.

<sup>70</sup> Davie, *Democratic Intellect*, 3.

<sup>71</sup> Berry, Christopher (1997), *Social Theory of the Scottish Enlightenment*; Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 9.

Davie points out two features of Scottish education that have been hotly contested: education in the university curriculum had philosophy at its core, and that philosophical approach was democratic in nature. Davie argues that these two features tied up with a sense of Scottish identity were under attack by the Royal Commission of 1826.<sup>72</sup> This attack was not strictly an outside assault. Many Scots were critical of the current curriculum and lobbied for change. Davie cites the views of Archdeacon Williams, who was Rector of the new Edinburgh academy, as an example of anti-philosophical pedagogy. As Davie sees it, “what the archdeacon had in mind for Scottish Universities was apparently a very drastic reform indeed, inspired by Oxonian ideas and aimed at altogether ousting philosophy from the curriculum, in order to make room for Greek”.<sup>73</sup>

These points have raised considerable counter-arguments from R.D. Anderson. Anderson claims, “in reality philosophy did not occupy as central a position in the debates on university reform as Davie suggests, nor indeed did the curriculum itself”.<sup>74</sup> Yet at Glasgow University students took two back-to-back philosophy courses: the first in logic and rhetoric followed up by a class in moral philosophy. So, philosophy did have a significant role in the curriculum. Also Davie identified a connection between philosophy, language, and science within the university curriculum.<sup>75</sup> This connection was evident in the assignments given by George Jardine in his course on logic and rhetoric.<sup>76</sup> For example,

---

Phillipson also identifies that Law, Religion and Education were distinctively Scottish. See Phillipson, “James Beattie and the Defense of Common Sense”, in B. Fabian, ed., *Festschrift für Rainer Gruenter* (Heidelberg, 1978), 145–54.

<sup>72</sup> Davie, *The Democratic Intellect*, 26.

<sup>73</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>74</sup> Anderson, *Education and Opportunity*, 359.

<sup>75</sup> Davie *The Democratic Intellect*, 17.

<sup>76</sup> Gaillet, Lynée Lewis (1998), Proclaims Jardine as the champion of the democratic intellect. See “George Jardine: Champion of the Scottish Philosophy of Democratic

Jardine stated his goals for one of his exercises is to, “form in the minds of the students, those processes of analysis and investigation, which are the great instruments of acquiring science”.<sup>77</sup> Jardine’s aim was not to teach students obscure philosophical facts, but to develop within them philosophical tools of analysis that they could employ across the curriculum. He states, “The efforts which the student is obliged to make in executing such exercises have a direct tendency to improve the powers of attention, discrimination, and investigation — to conduct the mind from phenomena to causes, from particular to general truths, and thus to produce habits of reasoning which may easily be applied to other subjects”.<sup>78</sup>

So, looking at a more broad sense of philosophy as Jardine suggests, the criticism that philosophy did not have a central role in the curriculum is perhaps to miss the big picture because to undermine philosophy in the curriculum was to disempower a student’s ability to think critically for themselves and be problem solvers. Consequently, the importance of the philosophical approach to education was institutional and not restricted to two courses. James McCosh, looking back from the 1870s, saw one of the distinctive qualities of Scottish philosophy as the “training all to a habit of skilful arrangement and exposition”.<sup>79</sup> Jardine’s second addition to his *Outlines* expanded his critical thinking pedagogy beyond his courses and philosophy to other disciplines. A philosophical

---

Intellect,” *Rhetoric Society Quarterly* Vol. 28, No. 2 (Spring, 1998), 37-53. This was published by Taylor & Francis, Ltd.

<sup>77</sup> Jardine, George (1818), *Outlines of Philosophical education, Illustrated by the Method of Teaching the Logic, or, First Class of Philosophy in the University of Glasgow*. Glasgow: Andrew and James Duncan, 318.

<sup>78</sup> *Ibid.*, 328.

<sup>79</sup> McCosh, 268.

education was not strictly an education in philosophy; it was an education in a critical method of inquiry that could be allied to a broad range human concerns.

For Davie the philosophical education of the Scottish universities was democratic. This claim seems at once to have obvious value as well as being problematic. According to Davie, a philosophical education, “bridged the gap between the disparate sections and sects of Scottish society, allowing the talented to rise without disloyalty to their origins or family convictions, creating in the process an intellectual culture of unusual balance”.<sup>80</sup>

Drummond and Bolloch echo this view:

The ‘lad o’ pairts’ who did well at school and university and so rose from small beginnings was a well-recognized and frequent fact in Scotland. Education, irrespective of a man’s social origins or income, obtained a respect in Scotland which was not present in England, and the democratic character of her schools and universities gave her society a different pattern from that of the south.<sup>81</sup>

R.D. Anderson has repeatedly argued against this view that he has coined as the “democratic myth”.<sup>82</sup> In Anderson’s words it is a “powerful historical myth, using the word to indicate not something false, but an idealization and distillation of a complex reality, belief which influences history by interacting with other forces and pressures, ruling out

---

<sup>80</sup> Davie, 293.

<sup>81</sup> Drummond and Bolloch (1975), *The Church in Victorian Scotland*, Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 85.

<sup>82</sup> See Anderson R D (1983), *Education and Opportunity in Victorian Scotland*, and *Studies in Economic and Social History: Universities and Elites in Britain since 1800*. London: Macmillan/ Economic History Society, as well as *Education and the Scottish People 1750 – 1918*, Oxford: Clarendon.

some developments as inconsistent with national tradition, and shaping the form in which the institutions inherited from the past are allowed to change”.<sup>83</sup> The phrase “democratic intellect” is used to refer to such democratic features as mass literacy and the ‘lad of parts’ phenomenon”.<sup>84</sup> Anderson puts pressure on the lad of parts legend as being uniquely Scottish by citing examples of university professors in England that had equally humble origins as those found in the north, as well as demonstrating that mass literacy in Scotland has been overstated. Anderson has also cited a study of university elites by Nicolas Hans that identified 130, of which only 15 were sons of farmers and 2 “sons of workers”.<sup>85</sup> In addition, the social mobility in Scotland took place within “a framework of patronage and sponsorship rather than competitive individualism”.<sup>86</sup>

The study of college elites in respect to the lad of parts phenomenon is informative but perhaps not comprehensive. For instance, there is room to look at those lads of parts who sought out their careers outside of Scotland. Therefore, in chapter three of this study I give an account of Robert Critchon Wyllie, who was educated in a parish school, attended Glasgow University, and eventually became Minister of Foreign Affairs for the Kingdom of Hawaii.<sup>87</sup> Wyllie’s contributions to maintain Hawaiian autonomy in the 1860s

---

<sup>83</sup> Anderson R. D. (1983), *Education and Opportunity in Victorian Scotland*, 1.

<sup>84</sup> Anderson R. D. (1995), *Education and the Scottish People 1750 – 1918*, Oxford: Clarendon, 21.

<sup>85</sup> Anderson R. D. (1995), *Education and the Scottish People*, 21.

<sup>86</sup> *Ibid.*, 22.

<sup>87</sup> There may be some interesting data on the lads of parts phenomenon by looking at more than one generation as well. For instance, Dr. John Rae author of *The Sociological Theory Of Capital* (1834) would be one such case. Rae’s father came from a poor family and was entirely self-made. Rae studied at the Marischal College at the University of Aberdeen. He left Scotland, eventually moving to Hawaii. There he became friends with fellow Scotsman Wyllie, and was appointed judge in Hana on the island of Maui. He wrote on a variety of topics and J S Mill cited aspects of his work in economics. Mill also

are still being used today to argue that the United States illegally occupies the Kingdom.<sup>88</sup> I see room to enlarge the scope of inquiry on the lads of parts phenomenon but, for the most, Anderson's criticism and evidence certainly take Davie's social view to task, but there is another sense of the democratic intellect within Davie's analysis. This view, though less explicit than his social and political claims, is more of a philosophical perspective.<sup>89</sup>

A liberal education focusing on the development of critical thinking skills empowers the individual. One may not rise out of their social or political context yet still be better off than they would have been without it. In this view, a philosophical education has qualitative value though perhaps not sociologically quantitative. This conceptual aspect of a liberal education, as already noted, was identified by McCosh, and as Davie highlights in his first chapter, found in Jardine's *Outlines*. If we can rightfully consider one of the general mantras of the enlightenment to be "think for yourself", we can already see a democratic intellectualism as a goal. Craig Beveridge and Ronnie Turnbull have lightly reworked the concept:

The Scottish tradition of democratic intellectualism, as we understand it, articulated a belief in the possibility and the necessity of communication between the world of learning and the wider reading and thinking public; a belief that philosophy, in a general sense, or the discussion of matters of

---

exchanged correspondence with him and thought highly of Rae's essays on Polynesian language.

<sup>88</sup> I examine Wyllie's role in contemporary Hawaiian politics in Chapter 3.

<sup>89</sup> Gordon Graham in his essay *Davie, Ferrier and Philosophy* states: "The alluring description of Scotland as home to 'the democratic intellect' suggests that philosophy reached quite deeply into Scottish society as a whole, and this can reasonably be disputed. Philosophy, inevitably, lay largely within the orbit of the educated classes"(7).

fundamental human import, cannot, except at a great cultural cost, be the preserve of an elite whose members commune with only themselves”.<sup>90</sup>

This more general view of a democratic intellect does not save Davie from Anderson’s criticisms on the historical facts, but it does keep the door open for further inquiry.

Another aspect of Davie’s work that is relevant to this study is his Anglicisation hypothesis. According to Davie, the national academic tradition of Scottish universities was subverted in the 19<sup>th</sup> century by a series of assaults to institute educational reforms to make the Scottish universities more like Oxford and Cambridge. These assaults led to the demise of a liberal, philosophical education and eventually squelched Scottish philosophy. One of the problems with this view is that it seems to close the door to the on-going contributions of Scottish thinkers. This study of Jardine and Hamilton demonstrates, in part, that Scottish philosophy thrived well into the closing decade of the 19<sup>th</sup> century - especially in North America.

Anderson tells us, “Anglicization was certainly an important element in the history of modern Scottish education, but British and Scottish dimensions co-existed in the minds of the Scottish educated class, and opinion rarely polarized on the issue”.<sup>91</sup> There was even interaction between Glasgow University and Oxford. For example, the Snell endowment sent Glasgow students to Balliol College Oxford with stipends. George Jardine’s son attended Oxford as well as Sir William Hamilton.

Emerson too recognized Anglicisation: “Sentimentalism, piety, and priggishness, so characteristic of the early nineteenth century, replaced the sceptical and cool rational

---

<sup>90</sup> Beveridge, Craig and Turnbull, Ronnie (1997), *Scotland After Enlightenment*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 14.

<sup>91</sup> Anderson, R. D. (1983). *Education & Opportunity in Victorian Scotland* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 25.

attitudes which had marked men like Hume and Smith whose own theories of the role of sentiments in moral philosophy were partly responsible for the change. Scots who had wanted to be North Britons were becoming Britons”.<sup>92</sup> A page later he states, “By c. 1815 the Scottish Enlightenment had ended. The desires to systematically improve everything all at once had changed into desires to do little for the poor and to avoid social change but to feel more deeply and to be more like the English”.<sup>93</sup>

Davie’s general claims that a philosophical education was a key feature of Scottish university education, that education had democratic features, and that approach stood in contrast to the universities in England, are all valuable and informative observations in framing a study of George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton. However, as Anderson has pointed out, some of Davie’s historical facts and subsequent conclusions about university curriculum and history can be contested. In addition, Davie argues that the Anglicisation of the Scottish curriculum spells the demise of the democratic intellect in Scotland, and in some sense, closes the door on the contributions made by Scottish thinkers following the demise. Yet the work of Hook, Spencer and Sher have demonstrated that there was a substantial Scottish literary foundation laid in the eighteenth century that was well represented in America. In addition, David Sloan has shown that the Scottish universities had significant influence on the eighteenth century American academies. It is reasonable to think that the rapidly emerging educational system in the United States provided a conduit for Scottish ideas and literature to flow easily to a rapidly expanding American audience. With this infrastructure in place, the stage was set for Scottish thought to move into the nineteenth century. Herbert Schneider,

---

<sup>92</sup> Emerson, 42.

<sup>93</sup> Emerson, 43.

Bruce Kuklick, Henry May and Andrew Hook and Gordon Graham have each in their own way laid claim to the first half of nineteenth century as the high water mark of Scottish influence in America. As these scholars have noted, Scottish ideas on education, religion, metaphysics, epistemology and psychology would continue to frame American intellectual development strongly through the antebellum era and, as I will demonstrate in this study, George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton were both significant contributors to that effect.

### **Structure of this study**

For the most part, this thesis chronicles the biographies, publications, and intellectual contributions of George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton in Scotland and America. However, there are some common philosophical threads that run through their respective contributions that are worth mentioning. The essential philosophical ideas of George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton that were foundational to their work, centred on a philosophical method grounded in the Common Sense philosophy of Thomas Reid. In the preface of his *Outlines of a Philosophical Education*, Jardine states that his course, “explained the first principles of the philosophy of the human mind,” and that the instructor has “uniformly accompanied these lectures with a system of active discipline on the part of his students, with a view to invigorate, and improve, the important habits of inquiry and of communication”. Jardine’s *Outlines* gave a detailed account on how to integrate this methodology into the college curriculum, and it was at the heart of Hamilton’s criticisms and the stimulus for his Philosophy of the Unconditioned as well. James McCosh states, “To Glasgow and to Reid he [Hamilton] owes his disposition to appeal, even in the midst of his most abstract disquisitions to consciousness and to

facts”.<sup>94</sup> Hamilton differed from Reid on some of the particulars of metaphysics and wove Kantian ideas into the tradition, but it was through Hamilton’s lectures and publications that the next generation of philosophers and intellectuals viewed Common Sense philosophy in the context of the 19<sup>th</sup> century.

So, this thesis has two main sections. Section I consists of four chapters that examine the academic lives of George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton and their literary presence in America. Chapter Two examines the academic life of the often-neglected Professor George Jardine. Utilizing correspondence between Jardine and his friend Robert Hunter, as well as letters between Jardine and his patron Baron Mure of Caldwell, this chapter outlines Jardine’s life as a Professor of Rhetoric and Logic at Glasgow University. Where this chapter focuses on Jardine academic career, it gives the most complete account of his life to date.

Following the biographical account of Jardine’s life, Chapter Three, “Jardine and America”, primarily examines his academic and literary presence in America. Although Professor Jardine was never personally in America, he did have a literary presence—primarily through periodicals concerning education. In addition, this chapter examines Jardine’s connection to America through some of his former students and friends. Innovators such as the social reformer Robert Owen, religious icons Thomas and Alexander Campbell, educational author and publisher William Russell and the high-ranking official in the Kingdom of Hawaii, Robert Crichton Wyllie, who shared and utilized aspects of Jardine’s views on education.

---

<sup>94</sup> McCosh, James (1875). *The Scottish Philosophy, from Hutchison to Hamilton*. New York: Robert Carter and Brothers.

Chapter Four returns to the biographical format, illuminating the academic career of one of George Jardine's most famous students of the time – Sir William Hamilton. For a good deal of his academic tenure, Hamilton enjoyed an unsurpassed reputation as an intellectual and a scholar. His reputation notwithstanding, this biography examines how Hamilton endured struggles and controversies throughout his career, with the most serious criticisms presented posthumously by John Stuart Mill.

In addition, Hamilton's reputation as an intellectual authority was embraced in America and the controversies and criticisms of his work also became part of an American narrative on religion, psychology, education, and philosophy. Therefore, Chapter Five examines Hamilton's considerable literary presence in America. Similar to his former professor from Glasgow, Hamilton had connexions to America through friends and former students. In addition, Hamilton received high-profile American visitors throughout his career at the University of Edinburgh, including Harriet Beecher Stowe, author of *Uncle Tom's Cabin*, and United States Senator, Charles Sumner, to name just two.

The second section of this thesis compliments, and to a degree quantifies, the narrative of Chapters Three and Five. Section II contains a series of catalogues of George Jardine's and Sir William Hamilton's American books and periodicals. Even though published material from Jardine is rather lean, he did have representation in America. Thus did I include bibliographical accounts of two of Jardine's students who immigrated to America: Alexander Campbell and William Russell.

One difficulty in researching material on Sir William Hamilton is that there are three notable Sir William Hamiltons who were discussed in American publications in the

nineteenth-century. There was Sir William Hamilton (1731 – 1803), who was a Scottish diplomat, and served as British Ambassador to the Kingdom of Naples from 1764 to 1800. The Irish physicist, astronomer, and mathematician Sir William Rowan Hamilton (1805 –1865), also received American literary attention. With all three of these Hamiltons, there are interesting overlaps in people, places and topics. Therefore, all the entries on Hamilton and Jardine in Section II are annotated as it helps avoid confusion and as well as creating a useful resource for these two philosophers.

The common philosophical bedrock for Jardine and Hamilton were the ideas of Thomas Reid. According to Reid, we as humans directly apprehend the material world. In his *Inquiry* Reid states:

It is a bold philosophy that unceremoniously rejects principles, which irresistibly govern the belief and the conduct of all mankind in the common affairs of life—principles to which the philosopher himself must surrender after he imagines he has refuted them. Such principles are older than philosophy, and have more authority than she does; she is based on them, not they on her.<sup>95</sup>

When a particular judgment is a dictate of common sense, that belief is a mandate of human nature, and as a consequence, our knowledge of the world is conditioned by the principle of common sense. As the principles of Common Sense are embedded in human nature, Reid argued that the pursuit of knowledge should begin with science of the mind.

This principle applies even to the arts and sciences that have least connection with the mind because even with them, we have to employ the faculties of the mind, so the

---

<sup>95</sup> Reid, Thomas (1764). *An Inquiry into the Human Mind on the Principles of Common Sense* Edinburgh, 8.

better we understand what they are and how they work, and what defects and disorders they are prone to, the more skillfully and successfully we shall apply them.<sup>96</sup> This approach to life, philosophy, and academia provided the foundation for the contributions of George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton.

---

<sup>96</sup> Reid, 1.

## Chapter 2

### An Applied Biography of George Jardine

George Jardine has been an obscure figure in the history of philosophy. Indeed, you could easily hold a doctorate in that discipline and have never heard of him at all. However, with a bit of research, you will find his name in association with the history of the University of Glasgow during the late eighteenth century and the early nineteenth century. He can also be found as an occasional footnote to the major philosophers of the Scottish Enlightenment such as Adam Smith and Thomas Reid. Fortunately, George Jardine garnered more scrutiny by 20<sup>th</sup> century scholars. For example, he has been recognised by a few historians of rhetoric like Winifred Horner who addresses the application of Jardine’s ideas laid out in his *Outlines* to contemporary literary criticism and composition theory.<sup>1</sup> And, in her essay “An Historical Perspective on Collaborative Learning”, Lynée Lewis Gaillet looks at Jardine’s classroom strategies and argues for their relevance in modern English Literature courses.<sup>2</sup> Evidently, Jardine’s life and philosophical contributions to the early nineteenth century are worthy of a closer look.

To this end, I will begin with an applied biography that outlines and illuminates George Jardine’s life as a professor and teacher at the University of Glasgow. In addition, this chapter will take note of biographical discrepancies concerning Jardine that

---

<sup>1</sup> Horner, Winifred (1993). *Nineteenth-Century Scottish Rhetoric: The American Connection*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press.

<sup>2</sup> GailleGaillet, Lynee Lewis (1994). An Historical Perspective on Collaborative Learning. *Journal of Advanced Composition*, v14 n1 p93-110. Also see her 1993 article, “A Legacy Of Basic Writing Instruction” *Journal of Basic Writing*, Vol. 12, No. 2.

appear in the sparse literature on the history of his life. This reflection on the life of George Jardine is followed by an overview of the content of his only publication, *Outlines of a Philosophical Education* (1818), and a consideration of the impact and reception of Jardine and the *Outlines* in America.

### **Biography; Jardine the young scholar**

George Jardine's life was, for the most, a straightforward academic one. It was not filled with the danger or drama of, say, an Adam Ferguson who as Chaplin for the Black Watch who witnessed heavy fighting in Austria in 1745 and later in life was part of the unsuccessful mediation team sent by Lord North to negotiate for Great Britain with the American colonies. The Jardine family, however, did have an interesting past that included some honour and title. In the late sixteenth century the barony of Wandal belonged to the Jardines of Applegirth.<sup>3</sup> There were Jardines who held baronetcies during George Jardine's lifetime, including Sir William Jardine of Applegirth, the seventh baronet (1800-1874). His father, Sir Alexander Jardine of Applegirth, was the sixth baronet (1771-1821). However, between the shifting sand of Scottish politics and the rising tide of the Douglas family, the Jardines were replaced in the baronetcy becoming tenants to the Douglas family. One might think that there is an inconsistency with the Jardines losing the baronetcy yet their heirs could remain landowners. Some of the confusion lies in the meaning and application of the title of "Baron". The feudal system allowed the baron to hold land as a tenant-in-chief of his "Prince". In the early

---

<sup>3</sup> *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, eds. H. C. G. Matthew and Brian Harrison, Vol 29, Oxford University Press 2004. In a letter to Robert Hunter (Ms.507/13) Jardine does mention an uncle whom he has never met. This uncle went by the English pronunciation of "Jordan". So, some relations may have also been going by a variation of the surname Jardine.

feudal times this was extended to allow the king's barons, his tenants-in-chief, to have their own barons through a process of subinfeudation, but the continuation of this practice was restricted in England when King Edward I recognised the danger it represented to his centralized power. In Scotland, where the geophysical factors and harsh weather created different political arrangements, the practice continued for longer. So the Jardines could be landowners through subinfeudation and not hold the baronetcy.

George Jardine was born in 1742 at Wandal, in the upper ward of Lanarkshire.<sup>4</sup> Young George received his elementary education at the local parish school, and at the age of eighteen entered Glasgow College in 1760.<sup>5</sup> At Glasgow College Jardine was best remembered as one of Adam Smith's favourite students.<sup>6</sup> Jardine also studied under Thomas Reid who had been elected Smith's successor as Professor of Moral Philosophy in 1764.<sup>7</sup> As a pupil Jardine was a student of "diligence and promise".<sup>8</sup> Attending the University of Glasgow in the latter half of the eighteenth century gave Jardine a front row seat to the Scottish Enlightenment. The image of a front row seat begs the question: was Jardine a participant in the Scottish Enlightenment, or merely a spectator? Indeed, he did not make any contribution that compares with Adam Smith or Thomas Reid. However, this biography will show Jardine to be a competent and respected man of his age.

Jardine's own presentation of logic and rhetoric agenda fit well in the scheme of the

---

<sup>4</sup> Jardine, George, P. 247, *Biographical Dictionary 1834 and Dictionary of Eminent Scotsmen*, 1868-70 ed., Chambers, Robert.

<sup>5</sup> Jardine, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, p.795.

<sup>6</sup> Ross, Ian. (1995), Adam Smith's "happiest" years as a Glasgow Professor. In: Andrew Hook and Richard B. Sher, *The Glasgow Enlightenment*. East Lothian: Tuckwell Press. 78.

<sup>7</sup> Jardine, George (1818), *Outlines*,152; and Coutts (1909), *A History of the University of Glasgow*, 313.

<sup>8</sup> Coutts, James (1909), *A history of the University of Glasgow: from its foundation in 1451 to 1909*. Glasgow: J. Maclehose and Sons. 312.

works of both Smith) and Reid. Even though Jardine's place in the big picture of the Scottish Enlightenment was not in the production of new and original ideas of logic and rhetoric, his interest and driving passion was in the application and transmission of the methodologies and ideas laid out by Smith and Reid.

In 1760, the year Jardine entered the University of Glasgow, the university was entering into thirty years of internal struggles.<sup>9</sup> James Coutts, in his *History of the University of Glasgow*, describes this time as, "a period of controversy and quarrelling".<sup>10</sup> According to Coutts the timeline of this troubled era carried well into Jardine's career as a professor at that university. And as we shall see, Jardine tackles these troubling issues at the university with tenacity. As for his years of study, Jardine moved through his course work without incident, and according to the Roll of Graduates of the University of Glasgow, he received his Masters of Arts in 1765.<sup>11</sup>

After receiving his degree Jardine studied theology under Dr. Trail, professor of Divinity at the University of Glasgow in 1761.<sup>12</sup> Even at this stage in Jardine's academic development, he was demonstrating a passion for learning and an affinity for empirical methodology. In a correspondence with a colleague, Robert Hunter, the young Jardine tells his friend that changes in Hunter's "situation", that is, changes in his location and new acquaintances, can be beneficial.<sup>13</sup> For these new circumstances give him,

---

<sup>9</sup> Jardine's name appears as #1969 in the *Matriculation Albums of the University of Glasgow 1728 – 1858*, transcribed by W. Innes Addison, Glasgow, James MacLehose and Sons (1913) p. 61.

<sup>10</sup> Coutts, 267.

<sup>11</sup> Addison, W.I. (1898). *Roll of Graduates of the University of Glasgow From 31 December 1727 to 31 December 1847*. Glasgow: James MacLehose and Sons.

<sup>12</sup> Trail died 19 October 1775. See Coutts 325.

<sup>13</sup> Lynée Lewis Gaillet states that Robert Hunter was a college classmate of Jardine. In Addison's *Roll of Graduates of the University of Glasgow From 31 December 1727 to 31*

“opportunity of observing their different characteristics and dispositions – The best way of studying human nature”.<sup>14</sup> In the same letter the new theology student continues to extoll the importance of a clergyman to converse “sensibly about the improvements of the age he lives in” and “the progress of arts & science & matters of taste”. At twenty-three years old Jardine was immediately applying the ideas he picked up at the University of Glasgow in his discourse, and he clearly was already a spokesman for enlightenment ideals. In 1770 Jardine finished his work with Trail and was licensed to preach in the Church of Scotland Presbytery at Linlithgow.<sup>15</sup> Although Jardine would not go on to make his living from behind a pulpit, he remained active in the Church of Scotland for

---

*December 1847* there are two Robert Hunters. Addison notes that they may be the same person. The first Robert Hunter mentioned graduates from Glasgow College with a MA in 1776 and the other with a DD in 1813. This second Robert Hunter was Rector Okeford Fitzpaine, Dorsetshire. He died in London on 17 December 1815 at the age of 70. The age of the second Hunter in 1815 of 70 seems close - in that year Jardine was 73. But the graduation date of the first Hunter puts him well beyond Jardine’s 1760 – 65 span as a student. In a correspondence between Jardine and Hunter (MS gen 507/1) the letters are addressed to Robert Hunter student at the Manse of Bolton near Hadington. In 1796 correspondence is addressed to Robert Hunter Rector of Burton near Dorset (507/101). Again in 30 October, 1810 letters are still addressed to the same title (507/138). Our records of the correspondence between Hunter from Jardine stop in 1810.

So who was Robert Hunter? If Robert Hunter was a college classmate of Jardine’s as Gaillet claims he cannot be Addison’s first Hunter, as the dates don’t line up. If we go by the titles, then Jardine’s friend appears to be the second of Addison’s Hunters. But this raises a question for Gaillet as Hunter’s name does not appear in the University of Glasgow Graduation rolls. There is of course the possibility that Addison’s second Hunter and Gaillet’s Hunter are the same if Robert Hunter attended the University of Glasgow, but did not graduate. After all Jardine is addressing him as a student at the Manse of Bolton near Hadington. One wonders as well at the age of Addison’s second Hunter in receiving the DD at the age of 68. If this is indeed Jardine’s friend then the DD comes at the end or possibly after his career as Rector.

<sup>14</sup> Jardine, George (1765), Special Collections, Ms Gen 507/1, University of Glasgow Library.

<sup>15</sup> However, in a letter to Hunter dated 1768 Jardine tells Hunter that he “cannot be a preacher until January or perhaps a little after it”. It is not clear if this means Jardine expected to be licenced sometime in early 1769, but if so it moves the date of his standing back a year from Chambers’ biography.

the rest of his life. Instead of the quiet yet respectable life of a churchman, Jardine was looking for other occupational possibilities. Consequently, he launched a “scheme” whereby he might go to America. This idea, however, was put on hold when he was offered a job as a tutor in France.<sup>16</sup>

### **Jardine the tutor**

The very next year, at the age of twenty-nine, Jardine was employed by Baron Mure of Caldwell to travel to France and oversee the education of his two sons.<sup>17</sup> This sort of academic employment was quite common in Jardine’s day and carried many benefits. One of the chief benefits was the social connections one made by being employed by such an important family, and of course, the opportunity to travel. Baron Mure of Caldwell was indeed well-connected and part of the literary scene in Edinburgh. “Baron Mure was an intimate associate of David Hume, and the author of two tracts on speculative points of political economy.”<sup>18</sup> Jardine would soon reap the benefits of his association with the baron and would remain a close friend of the family for the rest of

---

<sup>16</sup> Special Collections, Ms 4925 Correspondence of Mure of Caldwell, 144, 12 March 1772, University of Glasgow Library.

<sup>17</sup> *The Oxford Dictionary of Biography* states (795) that Jardine leaves for France in 1770. However, this date does not correspond to the archives we have on Jardine. In a letter from Jardine to Robert Hunter dated 30 July 1771 (Ms 507/25) we see that Jardine is in Edinburgh preparing to go to Caldwell the next day. Jardine tells Hunter that they plan to leave for France in September of that year. We see in the next correspondence, 12 September (Ms 507/26) that Jardine is at Caldwell and is preparing to leave for London. It is not until 26 October that we see Jardine is finally in Paris when he writes Hunter again. On 2 December (Ms 507/29) Jardine writes Hunter and complains he has not heard a reply from Hunter fourteen days after arriving in Paris,. If the letter Jardine refers to is indeed the correspondence from 26 October, then Jardine did not arrive in France until 12 October 1771. Therefore, our best general picture of Jardine’s trip to France begins fall of 1771 and not 1770.

<sup>18</sup> Irving, Joseph (1881), *The book of Eminent Scotsman*; Paisley: Alexander Gardner, 375.

his life. In addition to Mure's boys, Jardine also had taken on a third young man for the venture, the son of Sir James Campbell of Andhinglap.<sup>19</sup>

Once in France, Jardine was able to draw on Mure's connections. He writes the Baron requesting letters of introduction from Mure's literary friends, and in particular from David Hume.<sup>20</sup> With these letters of introduction Jardine enjoyed the company of some of the major literary figures of France, including Helvetius and D'Alembert.<sup>21</sup> In addition, Jardine associated much with Dr. Gemm, an eminent physician with a keen interest in philosophy. From this association Jardine received an insider's view of the political turmoil brewing in France: "Dr. Gemm was an ardent friend to liberty and at that time did not scruple to anticipate, to those with whom he was intimate, the fall of the French monarchy as an event at no great distance."<sup>22</sup>

Jardine took his job as tutor seriously and attended to every detail of his charges and their trip. He demonstrated an eye for accounting and detail, as well as accountability. He turned in detailed accounts of expenditures to Baron Mure, reported on the efficacy of various outings as well as the endeavor as a whole.<sup>23</sup> Jardine's eye for

---

<sup>19</sup> Special Collections, Ms Gen 507/26, University of Glasgow Library.

<sup>20</sup> Mure of Caldwell Correspondence, Edinburgh Ms 4946, 1-3. In a letter to Baron Mure of Caldwell January 1773 Jardine asks if he could get letters of introduction from Hume. There is record of Mure and Hume corresponding about introductions. These accounts are in The Family Papers preserved at Caldwell (115 -121). There is a possible discrepancy in the dates, however. These letters are dated from 7 July, 1767 to 18 July, 1767, with two of the associated letters left undated. Jardine's letters are dated January 1773. The 1767 letters are transcribed into a book, so the dates I use for Jardine's correspondence are those from the actual letter from Jardine held at the NLS.

<sup>21</sup> Coutts, p. 312 and Chambers (1897). *Biographical Dictionary* Edinburgh: W. & R. Chambers, Limited, 248.

<sup>22</sup> Chambers, 249.

<sup>23</sup> 10 February 1773. In his letter to Mure he gives an itemized account of expenditures broken down into months. It included listing ingredients like sugar and oranges – paper and pens as well as coach hires. National Library of Scotland MS 4946, 19-22, 59-62.

detail was also focused on the French education the boys were to receive, so he was rather critical of the Parisian methods of teaching, noting that they were not up to Scottish expectations.<sup>24</sup> The boys were enrolled in Bruneteau's Academy, a brand of private military academy that catered to the sons of nobility. Jardine tells Baron Mure, "The education in this house, tho' it may do very well for a Frenchman, would be thought to be excessively trifling with us". There were two former students of Bruneteau's school still lodging at the school that fueled Jardine's criticism. He observed that they had, "No taste for science – no spirit of enquiry – no habits of industry – nothing but the memory of a few facts and principles lying dead in their minds; and in the very words with which they received them".<sup>25</sup>

In his letters to Mure Jardine also exhibits a healthy sense of self-confidence because he writes to Mure with respect, yet voices his opinions concerning various affairs in a direct and authoritative manner. Jardine also spoke candidly about his pupils. For instance, in a letter dated 10 May 1773, Jardine tells Mure that his sons have done well and they are "most promising boys". Two months prior, Jardine had a less flattering report of James Campbell's son: "He acquires nothing solidly" - "he can speak French to be sure – but can neither write it nor English".<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>24</sup> Jardine and Baron Mure must have been under the impression that Bruneteau's Academy would provide a first rate education. A former student is quoted as saying, "The merits of M. Bruneteau's establishment had been investigated by Andrew Stuart, when resident in Paris some years before, and when it had been pointed out to him as the first of its class." (Alexander Gardner, *Selections of the Family Papers Preserved at Caldwell*, 279.)

<sup>25</sup> Gardner, Alexander (1885), *Selections of the Family Papers Preserved at Caldwell. Part II Vol. II*. Paisley: Edinburgh, P.298.

<sup>26</sup> Letters of Baron Mure of Caldwell, Ms 4946, 62; National Library of Scotland.

Notwithstanding his occasional critical assessments, Jardine had a strong devotion to his young pupils, going so far as to give them what we can only call parental advice. For example, Jardine tells the Baron that a year or two more in a family setting would be good for the boys and “after that period you would have nothing to fear”.<sup>27</sup> In another correspondence that exemplifies Jardine’s character as a tutor and a person he tells Baron Mure, “I love the boys. I respect their parents – and therefore will beg the liberty to speak with perfect freedom on every thing that concerns their education”.

Evidently, while overseeing the boy’s education in France, Jardine was seemingly never off duty. Everything he did with the boys was focused into a learning experience. Art, architecture, recreation, and social events were all supplements to the lectures and texts the boys were examining in their studies with their tutor. In Jardine’s letter to Mure on 20 May 1773, he informs his employer that outings with the boys were meant to be part of their education. Jardine says they “never go without some conversation about architecture or paintings” so “that their young principles of taste might be to their proper exercise”.<sup>28</sup> Jardine was employing an active engagement in an inductive method of enquiry that he would later refine in his only major publication, the *Outlines*, many years later. Clearly, Jardine’s ideas on active learning anticipate teaching and learning strategies of the late twentieth century. From his experience as a tutor it appears that Jardine had honed his skills as a teacher and had found his calling.

Jardine’s association with Baron Mure was fruitful in many ways. He obtained important teaching experience and gained the ear of a very influential figure in Scotland. In addition, it appears that Mure was a source of seasoned observations and ideas for

---

<sup>27</sup> Letters of Baron Mure of Caldwell, Ms 4946, 64; National Library of Scotland.

<sup>28</sup> Letters of Baron Mure of Caldwell, Ms 4946, 64; National Library of Scotland.

Jardine that would shape this young tutor's later career as an educator. In a letter to Mure 17 April 1772 Jardine acknowledges the Barons insights into educational practices, "I know that you have often observed that the established method of teaching philosophy in colleges is founded on the greatest ignorance of the natural character of youth..." Jardine reiterated Mure's insight on age appropriate instruction more than forty years later in his book on a philosophy education. He goes on to say that he knows from experience that a Logic class is the "most unfavourable climate in which a young mind can be placed".<sup>29</sup>

### **Jardine the promising professor**

By the end of 1773 Jardine was back in Scotland from his trip abroad. He was educated, travelled and had influential connections – he would appear to be a likely candidate for an eighteenth-century academic post. However, as Jardine would soon find out, such positions could be difficult to obtain.

As soon as Jardine returned from France the opportunity for a faculty position at the University of Glasgow presented itself as the Chair of Humanity at that university, Mr. Muirhead, passed away. Jardine was a top contender for the post. However, he was not the only candidate – there was a Mr. Richardson who also sought a faculty position at the university. During this time period, patrons significantly influenced faculty appointments at the university, so William Mure of Caldwell offered a solid endorsement for Jardine. Mure was a former MP and rector of Glasgow University from 1752-1754 and again from 1764-1766. Roger Emerson has noted of Caldwell that, "By the 1770s he was no longer involved with government patronage but many owed him favours and he

---

<sup>29</sup> Mure of Caldwell Correspondence Ms 4925; 27, April 1772; National Library of Scotland.

knew the college well”.<sup>30</sup> Despite Jardine’s well-positioned friends like William Mure of Caldwell, faculty members, and the strong endorsement from Fredric Campbell, the Lord Rector, it was not enough. The ultimate decision came out in favour of Richardson.

The next academic opportunity for Jardine was the contest for the Greek chair held by James Moor. Moor was an alcoholic and abusive to students. Even though he was unpopular with faculty and an embarrassment to the university, he was able to broker an arrangement to appoint John Young as his successor.<sup>31</sup> Since Young had already been successfully teaching classes for Moor for eight years, Jardine was again unsuccessful in his attempt at a faculty position.

The professor of Logic at this time was Mr. Clow, though he was a friend of Jardine, internal politics were such that Clow had been obligated to support Richardson in Jardine’s earlier contest.<sup>32</sup> However, in the wake of Jardine’s defeat, Clow attempted to cheer Jardine with the possibility of yet another job opportunity at the university. What Clow had in mind was ultimately his own position. On 3 June 1774 George Jardine wrote his friend Robert Hunter that, “his affair is happily finished”,<sup>33</sup> and “This day the faculty

---

<sup>30</sup> Emerson, Roger (2008). *Academic Patronage in the Scottish Enlightenment: Glasgow, Edinburgh, and St Andrews Universities*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 161.

<sup>31</sup> Moor agreed to step down without legal coercion if he could retain his salary, house and name John Young as his successor. Fortunately for Young, he was well-respected enough to seal the deal.

<sup>32</sup> In 1752 after just one session at the University of Glasgow Smith moved from Professor of Logic to the chair of Moral Philosophy. Smith’s good friend David Hume expressed a desire to fill the vacant logic position but the job went to Clow instead. (Coutts, 312).

<sup>33</sup> On the same day Jardine is made assistant to Clow, Young is made professor of Greek. In a lovely twist of fate, Jardine and Young become close friends and colleagues for the rest of their careers.

*The Dictionary of National Biography* entry on John Young claims he was installed as professor dated 9 June 1774, which is six days after Jardine had written Hunter of his appointment (p.1299).

confirmed Mr. Clow's desire and (appointed) me assistant and successor".<sup>34</sup> So Jardine entered the academic profession at the University of Glasgow, assuming the duties of teaching the logic course.<sup>35</sup> Though Clow professed old age as a reason to bring in Jardine, he remained Chair of Logic for another twenty-two years.<sup>36</sup> Professor Clow finally retired in 1787, and Jardine had his seat in the faculty.

### **Jardine's teaching and learning**

Jardine embraced his new job with the same enthusiasm and diligence he exhibited in tutoring Baron Mure's sons. Jardine was not alone in his efforts, though. He was part of a new wave of faculty at the University of Glasgow who had a keen interest in giving their students inspiration as well as information. These new teachers took a

---

<sup>34</sup> Special Collections, MS Gen 507/48; University of Glasgow.

<sup>35</sup> Winifred Horner (1997) makes the claim that "George Jardine was named professor of logic and rhetoric in 1774, a position he held for nearly forty years. He had formerly been a professor of Greek and moved with ease into the new chair." This claim seems highly unlikely given what we know about Jardine's life and the history of the University of Glasgow. Prior to 1774 Jardine had been in France starting in the Fall of 1771 overseeing Baron Mure's sons' education and Moor held the Greek Chair. Prior to his trip to France he was a theology student under Dr. Trail. Later, Horner gives a slightly different account than her first when on page 109, she states that, "Although John Clow was the official holder of the chair of logic and rhetoric at this time, Jardine had been appointed an assistant to the professor of logic in 1774". This claim is difficult to reconcile with her early account in which she had claimed Jardine had moved from professor of Greek to professor of logic in 1774, but she is correct insofar as Clow was the chair of logic and rhetoric. In her later version Jardine was apparently not the professor.

Horner's conflicting accounts do not synchronise with available records from the University of Glasgow. In fact, Horner's claim does not reconcile with Coutts' account given in *A History of the University of Glasgow*. Coutts (268, 311) records that Young was appointed professor of Greek and Jardine as Clow's assistant. In addition, Jardine's letter to Hunter 3 June 1774 makes no mention of a professorship in Greek; he only conveys that the faculty gave him an appointment in line with Clow's desire. The Glasgow University Calendar for 1844-5 (Gen Ref Historical UA 40 CAL) lists the succession of the professors of Greek as: 1704 Alexander Dunlap, 1746 James Moor, 1774 John Young. So, according to both Coutts' history of the university and the university calendar, Jardine never held a professorship in Greek.

<sup>36</sup> This was of course common practice at the university. Professors often lobbied for, and brought in an assistant who generally would also be successor.

special interest in teaching and learning. They were consciously looking to produce active and productive citizens to participate in society and not just scholars to be sequestered in study.

From a modern perspective the emphasis on teaching and learning is admirable but their strength here is also their weakness. With the increased workload that these professors took on we also see a decrease in the production of original work and research—a tension we still see in universities today.<sup>37</sup> However, R. D. Anderson claims, “Scottish professors in the early nineteenth century were expected to be men of literary or scientific eminence, but not necessarily to do original work. Their chief duty was to lecture and in return they collected student’s fees, in cash and in person at the beginning of each session.”<sup>38</sup>

Despite Jardine’s lack of prolific publications, his pedagogy and academic approach modeled his ideals of campus and community citizenship. For instance, he became one of the founders of the Royal Infirmary. The *Oxford Dictionary of Biography* states Jardine was appointed a manager of the Royal Infirmary in 1792. This means that although Jardine worked under Clow, he took on responsibilities as if he was a senior member of faculty.

A good example of Jardine’s commitment to University affairs can be seen in 1775 when he was authorized to negotiate for the college on a trip to Oxford. It is on this trip that he was reunited with Baron Mure’s sons who were now finishing their studies in

---

<sup>37</sup> The lack of publication and production of original work was seen as a shortcoming on the part of Jardine by Mure of Caldwell (See Correspondence, NLS MS 4946, 207). In addition, Coutts in his *History of the University of Glasgow* makes mention of Jardine’s lack of publication as did James McCosh.

<sup>38</sup> Anderson, R. D. “Scottish University Professors, 1800-1939: Profile Of An Elite”, *Scottish Economic and Social History*. Volume 7, Issue 1, 27.

England. Jardine's affection for the Mure family was strong, so he naturally looked into the boys' study habits and curriculum. On 11 August, then and again on 2 September, Jardine wrote to Baron Mure with up-dates and recommendations on the boy's education including reading recommendations to the boys.<sup>39</sup>

### **Jardine in context**

Jardine's new faculty position at the University of Glasgow and his lasting connection with Baron Mure opened the doors to the Scottish literary scene. Nevertheless, while it is well documented by historians that Jardine was connected with the philosophers of his day, there is one case that has been overstated Jardine's personal connection to David Hume. For example, in Barbra Bird's book *George Jardine's Investigative Rhetoric and Epistemic Writing Theory*, she claims that George Jardine was a frequent guest of David Hume. To support this connection Bird cites Alexander Carlyle and an article about his life in an 1860 *Blackwood's Magazine*.<sup>40</sup> The same quote appears in Carlyle's *Anecdotes and Characters* and his autobiography:

Despite his frugality, Hume was able to give 'little suppers' now & then to a few select friends, simple meals consisting of roasted hen, minced collops, and a bottle of punch...and ... best of all, he furnished the entertainment with the most instructive and pleasing conversation, for he assembled whosoever were most knowing and agreeable among either the laity or clergy. This he always did, but still more unsparingly when he became what he called rich. For innocent mirth and agreeable raillery I

---

<sup>39</sup> See Mure of Caldwell Correspondence, NLS MS 4946, p. 207

<sup>40</sup> Bird, Barbra (2005) *George Jardine's Investigative Rhetoric and Epistemic Writing Theory* Ball State University, 25.

never knew his match. Jardine (another of the moderate clergy), who sometimes bore hard upon him – for he had much drollery and wit, though but little learning – never could overturn his temper.<sup>41</sup>

However, in *Anecdotes and Characters* Carlyle dates this entry as 1753, which makes George Jardine eleven years old and an unlikely candidate for a heated dispute with Hume. The index reference for this passage is for Dr. John Jardine. This Jardine was a moderate clergyman and a relation of Carlyle.<sup>42</sup> Dr. Jardine, who would have been 37 years old and five years younger than Hume, has 12 references in Carlyle's autobiography, and was a well-known member of Hume's circle of literary friends. Another reason George Jardine does not feature prominently in Hume's circle was that Jardine lived in Glasgow and focused intently on the affairs of the university there. Despite any solid evidence that George Jardine had a personal connection with Hume, it appears he was influenced by Hume and other Poker Club members through his close association with Mure of Cladwell. These ideas can be traced through Mure and Hume's correspondence and in turn Mure's correspondence with Jardine.<sup>43</sup>

---

<sup>41</sup> Carlyle, Alexander, Ed. Hill, J. H. (1910). *Autobiography of Dr. Alexander Carlyle of Inveresk*. London: T. N. Foulis. 289. Also quoted in Mossner, Ernest Campbell (1954). *Life of David Hume*. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press.

<sup>42</sup> Jean Jardine of Applegirth was Alexander Carlyle's paternal grandmother. Dr. John Jardine was then a cousin of Alexander Carlyle. As noted earlier George Jardine was also descended from the Jardines of Applegirth line and as such would be a distant kin to Carlyle. However, he gets no mention in the *Autobiography of Alexander Carlyle*. Alexander Carlyle (1973). *Anecdotes and Characters*, Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press. 13.

<sup>43</sup> Others have confused the two Jardines as well. For instance, Eva Jean Wrather in her book on Alexander Campbell makes the same error. Speaking of Jardine she states: "To balance his intimacy with Thomas Reid, he also enjoyed the friendship of David Hume and sharpened his wits on many occasions in attempted refutation of his friend's brilliant logic." Wrather, Eva Jean (2005) *Adventurer in Freedom: a Literary Biography* (p.76)

After Mr. Clow resigned in 1787, Jardine brought his work ethic to the affairs of his new post, and Jardine became a premier faculty citizen. This meant, of course, that Jardine would sometimes figure prominently in controversial issues affecting the university. According to Bruce Lenman, “One of the problems facing medical education in Glasgow was the continuing conflict between the faculty of Physicians and Surgeons and the university”.<sup>44</sup> Jardine was at the centre of this conflict and put a tremendous amount of effort into the establishing of the Royal Infirmary, which turned out to be the solution to the quarrels at hand. Shortly after its founding, on 2 January 1792 Jardine served as secretary of the Royal Infirmary. He took on the management of affairs for that institution and did so for thirty plus years.<sup>45</sup> Once the Royal Infirmary was established, Jardine went on to represent the University of Glasgow in a series of meetings aimed at standardizing the graduation requirements for the M.D. from Scottish Universities. Due in part to Jardine’s efforts, Glasgow University became the second (after Edinburgh) most important medical institution in Britain.

Just a couple of years after assuming duties at the Royal Infirmary, Jardine began thirty years’ service as representative for the neighbourhood of Hamilton to the Presbyterian General Assembly. Chambers describes Jardine’s day-to-day activity like this:

The private life of Mr. Jardine did not present any great variety of incident. During the session he lived in college in terms of great friendship

---

<sup>44</sup> Lenman (1981), *Integration and Enlightenment: Scotland 1746 – 1832*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 91.

<sup>45</sup> The *Oxford Dictionary of Biography* gives a 1792 as the year Jardine was appointed a manager of the Royal Infirmary. However, Coutts’ *History of the University of Glasgow* gives a more detailed account and sets the date as 2, January 1793

with several of his colleagues, particularly with the late professors Millar and Young, whose views in college affairs generally coincided with his own; and in summer he resided at a small property which he purchased in the neighborhood of Hamilton, which he took great delight in adorning, and entered with much relish upon the employments of a country life, which formed an excellent relaxation after his winter labours.<sup>46</sup>

To a great extent these duties formed the steady course of Jardine's public and professional life. Although my biography of Jardine has focused on his education and professional life, he indeed had a private life, and I want to make note, albeit briefly, of his family. Jardine married a Janet Lindsay of Glasgow in XX, who died in 1815. Prior to her death, she and Jardine had a son, John, who later married into the Bruce of Kinnard family.

For Jardine, education was a family value. To that end, from 1789 to 1795, his son John studied at the University of Glasgow. John Jardine won many prizes at the university including awards in Greek and Latin and a Coulter prize for the best essay on syllogism and a first for best essay on Peripatetic Philosophy. In 1795 Jardine's son took the Snell Exhibition and attended Balliol College, Oxford.<sup>47</sup> He studied there for two

---

<sup>46</sup> Chambers, *Biographical Dictionary* p.250. Jardine's country house was called Hallside. Mrs. Gordon, John Wilson's daughter, gives a nice description in her *Memoirs of John Wilson*: "Hallside is a modern house, somewhat in the style of a Scottish manse. The grounds were about seventy acres in extent, gradually sloping to the east, and bounded in part by the river Calder. On the opposite bank stood the pretty cottage *Orne'e* of Mrs. Jardine's brother... Calder bank, Mr. Lyndsay's residence, commanded a fine view of Bothwell woods and castle, the gray towers of which contrasted well with the dark spreading trees that faced the ruins of Blantyre Priory, beautifying the banks of the Clyde (Gordon, 32).

<sup>47</sup> Under the Snell endowment, the University of Glasgow sends ten students to Balliol College, Oxford, giving four of them a stipend of £135 a year each, and to the remaining

years, resigning the exhibition by November 1797.<sup>48</sup> That same year Thomas Reid's successor, Archibald Arthur, passed away and John Jardine was presented as a possible candidate for the post, only to be vetoed by his father in favour of George Hamilton, minister of Gladsmuir.<sup>49</sup> In 1799 John Jardine was admitted Advocate and practiced in Edinburgh. Later he became sheriff of Ross and Cromarty and held that position from 1833 until the year he died in 1850.

There were other students in the Jardine household. Like many professors of his time, Jardine took in students who lived with his family during much of the academic year. From 1797 to 1803 the Jardines housed the future chair of moral philosophy at the University of Edinburgh, John Wilson. Wilson joined the Jardines immediately following the death of his father and his subsequent entrance into the University of Glasgow. Jardine states that, "He lived in my family during the whole course of his studies at this university, and the general superintendence of his education was committed to me".<sup>50</sup> It is of little surprise that when Wilson describes his relationship with Jardine, and Jardine's effect on other students, Wilson pictures Jardine as an intellectual father for indeed to a great extent that was Jardine's role. He was Wilson's teacher, mentor and life-long friend. In one of Wilson's numerous articles submitted to *Blackwood's Magazine*, Wilson he describes Jardine as:

---

six £120 a year each. He continues and tells us, "And for the credit of the University, the professors generally send to Oxford the best classical students who are willing to go". (513, *College Life at Glasgow*, A.K. Boyd, London, 1856).

<sup>47</sup> Addison, W.I. (1901). *The Snell Exhibitions 1679 – 1900*. Glasgow: James Maclehose and Sons. 73.

<sup>49</sup> For more on the politics of university appointments see Emerson *Academic Patronage in the Scottish Enlightenment: Glasgow, Edinburgh, St. Andrews Universities* Edinburgh University Press (p.193).

<sup>50</sup> Jardine, letter 27 April 1820, Glasgow University Library y4-h.27.

A person who, by the singular felicity of his tact in watching youthful minds, had done more good to a whole host of individuals, and gifted individuals too, than their utmost gratitude could ever adequately repay. They spoke of him as a kind of an intellectual father, to whom they were proud of acknowledging the eternal obligations of their intellectual being. He has created for himself a mighty family among whom his memory will long survive; by whom, all that he said and did – his words of kind praise and kind censure – his gravity and graciousness – will no doubt be dwelt upon with warm tender words and looks, long after his earthly labours shall have been brought to a close.<sup>51</sup>

Jardine's influence on Wilson undoubtedly was profound, so it is interesting to find that Wilson's legacy at Edinburgh includes a deviation of the moral philosophy class into a course in rhetoric and belles letters, the very subject he studied under the watchful eye of Jardine.<sup>52</sup>

During this same time Jardine also engaged in civic activities. In November 1802, a few gentlemen formed themselves into a Society the Glasgow Philosophical Society. The object of this new association was "the general diffusion of knowledge, and where its Members, by their frequent intercourse, would have an opportunity of discussing the merits of new suggestions, of reading essays on philosophical subjects, and

---

<sup>51</sup> Wilson, John. (1818). "Glasgow" *Blackwood's Magazine*. Wilson contributed an astonishing 300 articles to Blackwood.

<sup>52</sup> Grant, A. (1884). *The Story of the University of Edinburgh*. London: Longmans, Green, and Co. 345.

exhibiting models for the improvement of machinery.”<sup>53</sup> Jardine served as the societies second President and from 1809 to 1816 served as Secretary.

### **The so-called “quiet reformer”**

Notwithstanding Jardine’s accomplishments and Glasgow, and successes with students, the years between 1760 and 1800 were troubled times for the University of

Glasgow. The chief controversies concerned the “provinces and powers of the senate and faculty”.<sup>54</sup> To this cause Jardine, as James Tait (1771–1845) described in the *Dictionary of National Biography*, was “a quiet reformer and improver who succeeded in increasing the status of the University of Glasgow by persevering at regulating and improving the conditions for both staff and students.”<sup>55</sup> Surely, Jardine was a reformer and an improver, but I am not sure how quietly his changes came about. For example, let us turn to the Gavin Gibb controversy.

In 1814, the faculty was trying to appoint Gavin Gibb as Principal to the University of Glasgow. Gibb was a minister to St Andrew’s parish in Glasgow and had served for ten years as Dean of Faculties.<sup>56</sup> However, many faculty members feared opposition from Jardine.<sup>57</sup> Indeed, Jardine often took a very public stand on issues—especially those issues that concerned the governance of the university. He was, as J.D.

---

<sup>53</sup> Cleland, James (1816). *Annals of Glasgow - Volume 2 - Comprising an Account of the Public Buildings, Charities, and Rise and Progress of the City VOL. II*. Glasgow:Printed by James Hedderwick, 149.

<sup>54</sup> Coutts p. 267.

<sup>55</sup> Stephen, L Editor (1885). *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: George Smith,.795.

<sup>56</sup> Gibb was dean of Faculties from 1804 to 1814 with the exception of two years: 1807 and 1811.

<sup>57</sup> Coutts, 355.

Mackie has noted, a “constitutionally-minded” professor.<sup>58</sup> And, Jardine’s arguments would be delivered judiciously. The faculty of the University of Glasgow who supported Gavin Gibb knew all too well how Jardine would react to the appointment.

First, let us look at Jardine’s stance to prior appointments to the same position. In 1803 Jardine entered strong dissent to Reverend Dr. Taylor’s appointment as principal to the University because Dr. Taylor was minister of the High Church of Glasgow, and wanted to retain that position as well as that of principal. The *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* points out that Jardine was opposed to professors holding pluralities. However, we should be careful not to think this view was some version of a separation of church and state. Many, if not most, professors had a licence to preach, and Jardine himself was a licenced minister and a representative to the General Assembly. Nevertheless, it seems that Jardine was uncomfortable with academics holding multiple posts.

There is evidence of this line of thinking dating as far as 1771, when Jardine was tutoring the Mure boys in France. At that time, Jardine wrote to Baron Mure, stating the headmaster has “too many vocations”, which was affecting his ability to teach.<sup>59</sup> Jardine’s objections were based on his own philosophy of education and his commitment to improving the college through adherence to a set of regulations. He argued that the regulations of Glasgow University specifically prohibited the person holding the office of principal from also being an active minister of a church. To conform to the rules, Dr. Taylor would have to resign from his ministry.

---

<sup>58</sup> Mackie, J.D. (1954). *The University of Glasgow 1451 – 1951*. Glasgow: Jackson, Sons and Company. 274.

<sup>59</sup> Ms 4925 “Mure of Caldwell Correspondence” 1770-72, 127.

Taylor died on 29 March 1823, and once again the leading candidate for his replacement held an active ministry. Duncan Macfarlan, minister of Dryman, was appointed by the King's commission as principal of the University of Glasgow. Macfarlan was also appointed minister to the High Church of Glasgow.<sup>60</sup> There was of course precedent at the university that Macfarlan should hold both offices. Again Jardine objected, this time with the support of Mylne and Millar.<sup>61</sup> Once again, an appeal to Glasgow University regulations was not enough to restrict Macfarlan to a single post.

The objections made by Jardine at the University may have failed, but Macfarlan still had to be ratified by the General Assembly for his position at the High Church of Glasgow. By this time Jardine had been a representative of Hamilton at the General Assembly for nearly thirty years, so he was a known commodity. Not surprisingly then, The General Assembly of 1823 denied Macfarlan's appointment and the ruling was upheld by the Synod to the High Church. However, a year later the General Assembly of 1824 reversed the decision and Principal Macfarlan secured his clerical post.

As for Gibb's situation, he had agreed to step down from his ministry only after he received compensation. Jardine consented to this compromise. However, when the time came, Gibb did not give up his clerical post and Jardine pressed the issue. In the

---

<sup>60</sup> Coutts, 339-40.

<sup>61</sup> Alexander Broadie has noted that many of the participants of the Scottish Enlightenment actually lived in one another's homes and many were related. An example of this claim relevant to Jardine's biography is James Mylne. He was assistant and successor to Millar's and married his daughter, Coutts p. 349. Also Jardine's brother in law, Mr. Lyndsay was married to the niece of Thomas Reid. (Gordon, (1862) *Memoir of John Wilson*, Edinburgh,). Of course, as noted above John Wilson, the future Christopher North, lived in the Jardine home.

end, Jardine's demands that faculty be held accountable to the university's regulations were not up-held on this account and Gibb went on to have a full dual career.<sup>62</sup>

Jardine had fought three unsuccessful battles at the university against faculty holding pluralities, yet he never wavered from his conviction. And, these changes that Jardine fought against had further implications. Roger Emerson ties Jardine's loss to the bigger picture of the political elite and the Scottish Enlightenment,

the impetus to the enlightenment had run out in the political hysteria engendered by the French Revolution and the reactions it had provoked. The normal monopolising of the most machine politicians, most of whom had little concern for excellence, had sapped the vitality of the institutions and made it difficult for men like Jardine to keep up the tone of a college which they could no longer control and which was not protected from mediocrity and outsiders.<sup>63</sup>

Indeed, in his last public lecture before the General Assembly, Professor Jardine was still pressing his arguments, despite his poor health.

Another key public debate that Jardine engaged in centred on the controversial sale of the Patronage of Govan, property basically owned by Glasgow University at that time. In 1820 Jardine presented a paper addressing the University's right to sell the Patronage of Govan. His arguments were based on the historical propriety of the Patronage and the University's proper place in its management. Jardine's argument was

---

<sup>62</sup> The same year that Jardine passed away Gibb was actually even appointed vice rector of the university.

<sup>63</sup> Emerson, Roger L. (2008) *Academic Patronage in the Scottish Enlightenment: Glasgow, Edinburgh, St. Andrews Universities* Edinburgh University Press p.201.

judicious and the Patronage of Govan was duly sold.<sup>64</sup> Yet not all of Jardine's contributions as a faculty member were so combative. For instance, in 1822 Jardine was on the University of Glasgow committee assisting the Duke of Montrose for King George IV's famous visit to Edinburgh.<sup>65</sup>

### **Jardine's classroom pedagogy**

Thus, Jardine was truly a reformer and a thoughtful faculty citizen, but that only represents one aspect of his professional character and as a professor at the University of Glasgow. Indeed, his real passion lay with the students. In the classroom Jardine was known to scarcely have missed a day at work, and for his overall cheery disposition. He was a student-centred instructor who "disciplined the faculties of his students for active and decided usefulness, though he did not lead them far into the debatable land on which the Hegelians think they have since shed light".<sup>66</sup> In a letter to Henry Herbert, Adam Smith spoke of Jardine's abilities as a teacher:<sup>67</sup> "Jardine, is after Millar *Longo sed proximus intervallo*; I have not the least doubt but Mr. Herbert will be very happy and very well taken care of in his house. Millar is the best manager of young people I ever knew; and has the greatest talent of inspiring them with an ardour for the particular

---

<sup>64</sup> Coutts 361.

<sup>65</sup> Sir Walter Scott largely organized this gala event but one has to wonder what Jardine thought of the King of England's visit. It comes at a time when Jardine was fighting against foreign influences in and in some sense the Anglicization of the university. See Emerson *Academic Patronage in the Scottish Enlightenment: Glasgow, Edinburgh, St. Andrews Universities* Edinburgh University Press, 201.

<sup>66</sup> Coutts, 268.

<sup>67</sup> Henry Herbert (1741-1811) was a former student of Smith and a boarder in Smith's house during the 1762-3 term. He went on to become Baron Porchester and Earl of Carnarvon. See J. C. Bryce, *Introduction to Adam Smith, Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles Letters*. Clarendon Press Oxford 1983.

studies which he professes".<sup>68</sup> So, Smith assessed Jardine as the second best (at some distance) classroom manager at the University of Glasgow.<sup>69</sup> In the *Statistical Account of Scotland* Smith's successor Thomas Reid also writes that Jardine

dedicates the greater part of his time to an illustration of the various mental operations, as they are expressed by the several modifications of speech and writing; which leads him to deliver a system of lectures on general grammar, rhetoric and belles lettres. This course accompanied with suitable exercises and specimens, on the part of the students, is properly placed at the entrance to philosophy: no subjects are likely to be more interesting to young minds, at a time when their taste and feelings are beginning to open, and have naturally disposed them to the reading of such authors as are necessary to supply them with facts and materials for beginning and carrying on the important habits of reflection and investigation.<sup>70</sup>

James McCosh notes that as Jardine took the reins of the logic course at the University of Glasgow the typical student was a boy of only fifteen or sixteen years old. Most of these students were incapable of tackling the depth and rigor of the course as traditionally taught. These students, "longed for something more fascinating and less

---

<sup>68</sup> National Library of Scotland MS 14835, ff.70–1; 23 September 1788.

<sup>69</sup> Smith also sent his cousin David Douglas to Glasgow to attend Millar's classes (*Dictionary of National Biography Vol VIII*, 403). It is interesting to note that the very frugal David Hume paid the tuition for his nephew, also named David Hume, to go to the University of Glasgow to study under Millar. It is recorded that Hume took great pride in his nephew's progress with Millar. (*The Life of David Hume* by E.C. Mossner p. 574)

<sup>70</sup> Reid, T. (1799). "University of Glasgow". In: Sir John Sinclair, *Statistical Account of Scotland, Vol. 21*. Edinburgh: William Creech. 735.

arduous,” and it would be Jardine “who did the most to gratify this taste”.<sup>71</sup> Jardine understood his student population and worked hard to reorganize his classes to maximize student successes.

Certainly nowadays we encourage teachers to meet the students where they are and encourage age-appropriate teaching methodologies. However, for Jardine these innovations were something of a double-edged sword. On the positive side, Jardine increased student success. His pupils tuned in and focused better and felt better about the experience of learning. He excited an interest in students to apply the skills introduced in his course. An example of one of his students is Francis Jeffrey, who by the end of Jardine’s career was Rector at the University of Glasgow. Jeffrey recalls in his rectoral address on 28 December 1820,

I cannot resist congratulating myself and all this assembly that I still see beside me the one surviving instructor of my early youth – the most revered, the most justly valued of all my instructors – the individual of whom I must be allowed to say here, what I have never omitted to say in every other place, that it is to him and his most judicious instructions that I owe my taste for letters and any little literary distinction I may since have been enabled to attain”.<sup>72</sup>

The other side of this sword is that Jardine had to work harder, and, in some sense, not take the students as far into the depths of the subject as some academics may

---

<sup>71</sup> McCosh, J. (1875). *The Scottish Philosophy, from Hutchison to Hamilton*. New York: Robert Carter and Brothers, 289.

<sup>72</sup> Barras, John Hay (1839), *Inaugural Addresses by Lords Rectors of the University of Glasgow*. Glasgow: David Robert, 9.

have liked to see. Jardine spent his time developing the skills of his students and not in developing the “science” of logic. Unfortunately, taking the course in this direction hurt Jardine’s legacy. In the two short pages McCosh dedicates to Jardine he hammers home the fact that Jardine was not original and his course was not an in-depth study. The double-edged nature of Jardine’s reforms really comes out in McCosh’s summation of Francis Jeffrey’s aptitude: “Francis Jeffrey, who was fond of expressing his gratitude to him, may be taken as a representative pupil produced by him, capable of thinking and expressing himself clearly and ably on every subject, but not diving into the depths of any subject.” McCosh ends the segment on Jardine with the claim that, “It required all the ability and energy of Sir William Hamilton to bring back Scottish youths to the scientific study of logic”.<sup>73</sup> This is an interesting claim given Sir William Hamilton was a student of Jardine’s and attended the logic and rhetoric course just as Francis Jeffrey had when he was a student at Glasgow. Whereas Jardine’s students appreciated his efforts within the classroom, it appears that soon after his death his notoriety had begun fade.

### **Jardine and the *Outlines of a Philosophical Education***

Jardine’s only significant publication was his *Outlines of a Philosophical Education, Illustrated by the Method of Teaching The Logic, or The First Class of Philosophy in The University of Glasgow*. The *Outlines* was first published in 1818 in Glasgow, printed by A. & J. Duncan. Seven years later Jardine released his second, enlarged edition with the subtitle, *Together with Observations On The Expediency of Extending The Practical System To Other Academical Establishments, And On The Propriety Of Making Certain Additions To The Course Of Philosophical Education in*

---

<sup>73</sup> McCosh 317.

*Universities*. Jardine's title emphasized the institutional character of his book. He claimed that the pedagogical tradition at the University of Glasgow was distinct from the methods found at other institutions especially the English universities. It is this contrast that many, like George Davie, have seen as a nationalistic claim. Davie considered Jardine not "merely as a living embodiment of the Scottish academical inheritance" but also the "chief formulator of its educational ideals".<sup>74</sup>

The theoretical framework for Jardine's approach to education resided in Thomas Reid's Common Sense Philosophy. In the *Outlines* Jardine both utilized, codified and transmitted fundamental principles of the Common Sense school. For Reid, Common Sense is synonymous with principles of education. Reid held that: "The principles of common sense are fundamental to our accumulation of knowledge of both metaphysical and physical constructs".<sup>75</sup> In his *An Inquiry into the Human Mind on the Principles of Common Sense* Reid claims:

there is but one way to the knowledge of nature's works—the way of observation and experiment. By our constitution, we have a strong propensity to trace particular facts and observations to general rules, and to apply such general rules to account for other effects, or to direct us in the production of them. This procedure of the understanding is familiar to every human creature in the common affairs of life, and it is the only one by which any real discovery in philosophy can be made.<sup>76</sup>

---

<sup>74</sup> Davie, *The Democratic Intellect*, 10.

<sup>75</sup> Redekop, Benjamin (April 2004), "The Correspondence of Thomas Reid". *Canadian Journal of History* 39 (1): 212.

<sup>76</sup> Reid, Thomas (1764) *An Inquiry into the Human Mind*, 1.

In explaining his pedagogy of the *Outlines* Jardine often gave a thin paraphrase of his friend and mentor, Reid.

Resting solidly on Reid's Common Sense philosophy Jardine stressed the importance of a general education that set on a philosophical foundation of useful knowledge. He was adamant to point out that this approach was a departure from the specialized education of Cambridge and Oxford that emphasized classical languages. Jardine states:

In all our colleges, a considerable part of the under-graduate course is devoted to the study of Greek and Latin; but, in those of Scotland, the attention is not so exclusively confined to the learned languages, as in the universities of the south. We do not, in this part of the kingdom, attach to classical learning that high and almost exclusive degree of importance which is ascribed to it elsewhere; thinking it of greater consequence to the students, to receive instructions in the elements of science, both mental and physical, than to acquire even the most accurate knowledge of the ancient tongues...<sup>77</sup>

For Jardine philosophical education was to “secure a suitable education for young men destined to fill various and very different situations in life, the course of instruction ought not certainly to be limited to the narrow range of logic and metaphysics; but, on the contrary, should be made to comprehend the elements of those other branches of knowledge, upon which the investigation of science, and the successful dispatch of

---

<sup>77</sup> Jardine, *Outlines* 418.

business, are found chiefly to depend.”<sup>78</sup> Mastery of classical languages did not contribute to that goal. In one sense Jardine’s generalist approach to education served the growing merchant class in Glasgow. At the same time the rapidly changing methods of industry were moving towards specialization.

By the time Jardine published the second edition of the *Outlines* there were mounting pressures on the University of Glasgow. Jardine had been embroiled in controversies over University appointments that were threatening the educational tradition. Roger Emerson has noted, “the impetus to the enlightenment had run out in the political hysteria engendered by the French Revolution and the reactions it had provoked. The normal monopolising of the most machine politicians, most of whom had little concern for excellence, had sapped the vitality of the institutions and made it difficult for men like Jardine to keep up the tone of a college which they could no longer control and which was not protected from mediocrity and outsiders”.<sup>79</sup> Controversies like this one and others at Edinburgh between the University Professors and the town council led to the establishment of the Royal Commission on the Scottish Universities. It is this commission that launched what George Davie has called the “first assault” on the traditional philosophical education at the University of Glasgow. Jardine’s second addition of the *Outlines* was not only a publication of a successful professor’s strategy but also a defense of an educational tradition that Jardine had cultivated for more than forty years.

---

<sup>78</sup> Jardine, *Outlines* 31.

<sup>79</sup> Emerson, Roger L. (2008) *Academic Patronage in the Scottish Enlightenment: Glasgow, Edinburgh, St. Andrews Universities* Edinburgh University Press, 201.

For Jardine his academic tradition had always focused on the students needs. He states that “It was observed by those who interested themselves in this question, that the subjects introduced in the Logic class, even when perfectly understood, had little or no connexion with that species of knowledge which was necessary to prepare the student, either for the speculative pursuits of Science, or for the active business of life”.<sup>80</sup>

Jardine’s goal, reiterated over and over again throughout the *Outlines* was to present his students with a body of useful knowledge that would prepare them for whatever profession they may have wanted to choose. To this end Jardine described his class:

The system of instruction, now long established in the first class of Philosophy in this University, consists of two parts: the first, comprehending a course of lectures delivered daily, throughout the whole term, on such subjects as seem best suited to the Age, Habits, and actual Attainments of the students; the second comprising a daily examination of the young men, on the subjects discussed in the lectures, accompanied with prescribing, reading, and correcting a progressive course of Themes or Exercises, founded chiefly on the Lectures, and executed by every individual in the class.<sup>81</sup>

Jardine methods anticipated several modern teaching practices. His emphasis on active learning and dialogue for instance is similar to modern seminar style courses. Jardine employed a writing intensive pedagogy where students learned through writing exercises and in turn were learning to improve their writing. He states: “there is no part of the system pursued in this university, which is attended with more numerous and direct

---

<sup>80</sup> Jardine *Outlines* 27.

<sup>81</sup> *Ibid.*, 36.

advantages, than the practice of writing exercises on the subjects discussed by the professor”.<sup>82</sup> To supplement his writing assignment Jardine introduced students to a peer review process. On the whole Jardine’s course was similar to a contemporary writing intensive, critical thinking course.<sup>83</sup>

Jardine’s first course in philosophy was not aimed at introducing students to abstract theories of the ancient philosophers but was far more a skills course aimed focused on a method of inquiry. According to James McCosh one of the distinctively Scottish features of Scottish philosophy was its method. He states, “The Scottish Philosophy possesses a unity, not only in the circumstance that its expounders have been Scotchmen, but also and more specially in its method, its doctrines, and its spirit. It is distinguished by very marked and decided features, which we may represent as determined by the bones rather than the flesh or muscles”<sup>84</sup> McCosh gives three points that he held to be unique to Scottish philosophy, and all of which are explicit in Jardine’s *Outlines*. When comparing Jardine to McCosh it is easy to see why those like Davie saw Jardine as the chief formulator of the Scottish educational ideal.

The first unique aspect of the Scottish philosophical method focused on an observation of how the mind works. McCosh states: “the Scottish philosophers took a step in advance of any of their predecessors, inasmuch as they professed to draw all the laws of mental philosophy— indeed, their whole systems — from the observations of

---

<sup>82</sup> *Outlines*, 301

<sup>83</sup> Sir Daniel Sanford, Professor of Greek at the Glasgow University, criticized Jardine’s writing intensive pedagogy. Sanford argued to the Royal Commission that the Logic course was merely a course in composition. He complained Jardine writing assignments were too long and did not provide for the “cultivation of taste according to the pure models and critical principles of Greece”. See Davie, *The Democratic Intellect*, 28.

<sup>84</sup> McCosh, *The Scottish Philosophy* 3.

consciousness”<sup>85</sup> The observation of the mind is precisely where Jardine begins the first division of lectures titled ‘On The Science Of The Human Mind Considered As The Subject of Lectures In The first Class in Philosophy’. With this starting point Jardine was closely following in Reid who argued for the same point of departure in his *Inquiries*.

The next characteristic identified by McCosh was that Scottish philosophy employs self consciousness as the instrument of observation”. He goes on to say:

He who would obtain an adequate and comprehensive view of our complex mental nature must not be satisfied with occasional glances at the workings of his own soul: he must take a survey of the thoughts and feelings of others so far as he can gather them from their deeds and from their words; from the acts of mankind generally, and of individual men, women, and children; from universal language as the expression of human cogitation and sentiment; and from the commerce we hold with our fellow-men by conversation, by writing, or by books.<sup>86</sup>

This same point was laid out in the Outlines. Jardine writes: “To ascertain this point, as far as it is capable of being ascertained by young students, the Baconian prism, so to call it, must be employed; that is, a close and minute attention must be given to the subject, guided by a constant reference to observation, and reflection on the part of the inquirer.”<sup>87</sup> Like Jardine, and Reid before him, McCosh saw this aspect of Scottish philosophical methodology as rooted in Francis Bacon though he understood the Scottish school as moving the principle forward and beyond Bacon.

---

<sup>85</sup> McCosh, *The Scottish Philosophy*, 4.

<sup>86</sup> *Ibid.*, 6.

<sup>87</sup> *Outines*, 188.

McCosh's final defining characteristic of Scottish philosophy was that the observations of consciousness, principles are reached which are prior to and independent of experience. He goes on to explain that:

This is another grand characteristic of the school, distinguishing it, on the one hand, from empiricism and sensationalism; and, on the other hand, from the dogmatism and *a priori* speculation of all ages and countries. It agrees with the former in holding that we can construct a science of mind only by observation, and out of the facts of experience; but then it separates from them, inasmuch as it resolutely maintains that we can discover principles which are not the product of observation and experience, and which are in the very constitution of the mind, and have there the sanction of the Author of our nature.<sup>88</sup>

Again McCosh has identified a point stressed in Jardine's pedagogy of useful knowledge. Jardine wrote: "An induction, on the contrary, always implies the discovery of a principle, as well as the knowledge of particular facts; and every inference grounded upon an inductive process is, when technically expressed, the enunciation of a law of nature. It is, in short, a general truth, derived from the consideration of common properties in individual facts"<sup>89</sup> So over the course of a year, through a variety of lectures, discussions and a significant amount of writing, Jardine led his students through a philosophical method that would prepare them for "speculative pursuits of Science, or for the active business of life". Jardine's *Outlines* was iconic of a philosophical education cultivated through the Scottish enlightenment. It laid out the pedagogy employed at the

---

<sup>88</sup> McCosh, 7

<sup>89</sup> Jardine, *Outlines*, 144.

University of Glasgow to empower its students with the critical skills that McCosh believed to be unique to Scottish thinkers from Hutcheson to Sir William Hamilton.

Both the 1818 and the expanded 1825 editions of the *Outlines* were well received in Scotland and England alike.<sup>90</sup> Leading literary journals of the day ran lengthy, favorable reviews of Jardine's work. For example, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* offered a glowing review of the 1818 edition of *Outlines*:

This volume consists of two parts. The first exhibits a view of the lectures which are delivered to the students, in which are presented to them, in a simple and intelligible form, the elements of the science of mind, with an analysis of the different intellectual powers, in the order of their connexion and dependence, the theory of language, as illustrative of human thought, the principles of taste and criticism, and the means of improving the powers of communication by speech and writing, as exhibited in the best models of ancient and modern composition... It is, however, as the Professor says, in the second part, in which we are to look for his most useful labours, for there we are presented with a plain, simple, and unostentatious account of the practical system of discipline, to which the students of his class are regularly subjected, for the purpose of acquiring habits of inquiry and communication.

In addition, when we read the anonymous article in *Blackwood's Magazine* below, you can see the magazine working some damage control. In other words,

---

<sup>90</sup> Chapter 3 will look more closely at the reception of Jardine's work in America.

*Blackwood's* seemed to be reaching out to soften the tone of Jardine's work since Jardine was, like many of the Scottish professors, sharply critical of English pedagogy. The anonymous writer argues,

Professor Jardine's reputation as a teacher is not confined to Scotland. Many English youth annually repair to the University of Glasgow for the benefit of his instruction; and we have a pleasure and a pride in the thought, that our widely-circulated Miscellany may be the means of introducing, to many of our Southern Brethren, a knowledge of the principles of the system which he has so long and successfully pursued... He is unluckily altogether ignorant of the system of Oxford and Cambridge education, and it would not be difficult to refute everything he has said on that subject. But there are numerous persons in England, to whom, by various causes, an university education is forbidden; and in no other seminary of education in England, of which we know anything, is there a system of instruction pursued, at all comparable to that of which Professor Jardine has in this volume given us the outlines.<sup>91</sup>

---

<sup>91</sup> On the other hand, some English journals heard Jardine loud and clear and voiced their objections. For instance, in *The British Review* and *London Critical Journal Vol VII* 1818 (108), we read, "It is no doubt true that, in proportion as the college tutor enters into disquisition on matters suggested by his author, and furnishes his pupil with details as to the history of opinion on the principal topics which occur in the course of his reading, he adopts the very method recommended by Mr. Jardine; using the Greek or English volume which he may happen to have in his hand as a mere text-book, or synopsis of doctrines and positions. There is not, indeed, the same degree of drilling in our universities, in the way of essay-writing, as seems to make a part of the Glasgow system, and our daily examinations are of so familiar and domestic a nature, that they have more the appearance of a friendly chat than of a formal inquisition; but we can see no reason why a

The praise and reviews were echoed in London as well. For example, magazines like *The British Review and London Critical Journal* assessed the *Outlines* in a distinctive English tone:

THIS is a useful rather than an eloquent book; and the author has evidently sacrificed more to the desire of doing good than to the love of fame. The main object of the work seems to be an honest and avowed recommendation of the method of teaching pursued in Glasgow College, and which, of course, can only be directed to those who conduct philosophical education, by means of written lectures read from a professor's chair.<sup>92</sup>

This excerpt frames Jardine in a stereotype of the practical but less than eloquent Scotsman. Nonetheless, these journals quickly recognised the *Outlines* as a well-framed pedagogy of useful knowledge. The *Literary Chronicle and Weekly Review* stated, “Independent of the merits of this work as combining an excellent system of education, it includes some admirable and well-written essays on the science of the human mind, the origin and progress of written language, the improvement of the memory, the culture of

---

young man should not derive as much advantage from a conversation, in which, to use a vulgar phrase, he has all his senses about him, as when he stands up to answer interrogatories in the presence of 200 class-fellows.” So, the author in the *British Review* does not take issue with Jardine’s pedagogy, but rather with his description of the way classes are conducted in the English system.

<sup>92</sup> Anonymous (1818). “Jardine’s *Outlines of A Philosophical Education*” *The British Review and London Critical Journal* London: Printed For Baldwin, Cradock, And Joy, 47, Paternoster-How; And J. Hatchard, Piccadilly. 1818.

the imagination, the elements of taste, and a variety of other subjects.”<sup>93</sup> The praise we see in these literary journals of Jardine’s tenure as a professor and the well-researched and deftly executed pedagogy he published, demonstrate that during his lifetime, Professor George Jardine was a renowned man of letters in Scotland and England. Sadly, by 1824, at the age of eighty-two, it was time for Jardine to retire from his duties at the University of Glasgow.

His former students and colleagues rallied to honor George Jardine’s long career. His first student, and now long-time friend, Mure of Caldwell, chaired the retirement party at the City Halls in Glasgow. Nearly two hundred people attended. In fact, some reported to have traveled a great distance to attend, including the Marquis of Breadalbane.<sup>94</sup> In years to come, the Marquis would become Lord Rector of the University of Glasgow and his honors included a royal visitation to his home by Queen Victoria.<sup>95</sup>

In 1825, the same year the second edition of the *Outlines* was published, Jardine stepped down from his duties at the Royal Infirmary. He continued being active in the Church of Scotland, but old age was catching up with him. In 1826 Jardine fell ill. From what we know of his life this was virtually a first for him, as he had enjoyed a long life of

---

<sup>93</sup> Anonymous, (1825).”Outlines of a Philosophical Education”. *Literary Chronicle and Weekly Review London: Published By Davidson, Surrey Street, One Door From The Stand.* 212.

<sup>94</sup> Chambers, R. (1836). *Biographical Dictionary of Eminent Scotsman.* Glasgow: Blackie & Son. 251. It also appears in a revised edition continued by the Rev. Thomas Thomas Vol IV. London: Blackie and Sons, p. 389. Note that the Marquis of Breadalbane was in Jardine’s time the Earl of Ormelie.

<sup>95</sup> Wintersgill, Donald (2001). *Rectors of the University of Glasgow 1820-2000* Glasgow: University of Glasgow 35.

good health. However, in May of that year he was attending the General Assembly when he fell ill a liver problem and never fully recovered.

By 1826 the university system in Scotland fell under scrutiny of the Royal Commission. The philosophical education that so characterised Jardine's pedagogy was called into question. Even at his advanced age and in poor health, Jardine was intensely interested in the affairs of the university and kept abreast of the situation. According to Buchanan who replaced Jardine as professor of logic and rhetoric, Jardine's deathbed request was that his views be stated before the Commission. Professor Buchanan obliged by appearing before the Commission to carry out Jardine's last request.<sup>96</sup> Ever after, Buchanan's passing arguments were made in favour of a philosophical education invoked in the name of George Jardine.<sup>97</sup> Finally, on the 27 January, at the age of eighty-five, George Jardine died.

Jardine's death was mourned by generations of students who had passed through the University of Glasgow. For this reason, I present in this biography the extensive obituary that ran in the *Glasgow Herald* on Friday, 2 February 1827:

#### Professor Jardine

On the 28<sup>th</sup> of January, died at Glasgow College, George Jardine, Esq., professor in that university, in the 85<sup>th</sup> year of his age.

Of the many eminent men who have adorned the universities of Scotland, few have enjoyed so large a share of public respect and confidence. – Endowed with a vigorous and active mind, with great soundness of judgment, - possessing a deep sense of the importance of his office, and an ardent desire to promote the improvement of his students, he devoted himself to his public duties with a zeal, an activity, and a faithfulness,

---

<sup>96</sup> Scottish Universities Commission Report (1837) Glasgow p. 185.

<sup>97</sup> See Davie, George (2000). *The Democratic Intellect*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press for a more detailed account of the proposed reforms of 1826.

which have never been surpassed, and but rarely equaled. Directed by that discernment of what was most useful, and best suited to the circumstances of his pupils, for which through life, he was distinguished, he, soon after his appointment in 1774, introduced those changes in the mode of public teaching which rendered his class so long a model of academical instruction. Retaining what was most important in ancient Logic, and communicating a due knowledge of its particularities, he dismissed from his course of lectures all its unprofitable subtleties, directing the attention of the youth to such views of the human mind, its powers and operations, as might lead to their proper exercise, and furnish the best means to their improvement. But aware that truths might be heard without attention, or without awakening the powers of the understanding, and that the formation of the intellectual and moral habits is the first object of education, he delivered a practical system of examinations and exercises, which he gradually improved to an extent that has seldom been witnessed. By a discriminating selection of topics, he directed his students to the subjects most deserving their consideration, while he awakened their curiosity, sustained their attention, and exercised in due proportion every faculty of their minds. The youth were thus kept continually alive to the objects of study, and the subjects naturally dry and uninteresting were, from the manner in which they were illustrated, rendered attractive, and prosecuted with avidity and enthusiasm. Hence, the Logic Class of our University, though a class of labour, was always looked forward to with a feeling of elevated expectation, and the period of its attendance is generally recollected by the students as among the busiest but happiest years of his academical course.

Few classes have ever displayed such order and such attention to business, with so little exercise of severity. Strict discipline, but perfectly impartial, wise and affectionate in all that he required his students submitted with cheerfulness to his directions, and loved, while they revered, their instructor. Their welfare habitually occupied his thoughts; and to improve the means of education was the ruling passion of his life. Warmly attached to the interest of those entrusted to his charge, he embraced every opportunity of imparting to them the admonitions of a father; of cherishing religious principle, by reminding them of their higher duties, and guarding them against the dangers to which they were exposed. In the same spirit, he attended with them on the public services of religion, directed them to exercises suited to the evenings of the Sabbath, and enforced the sacred instructions which on that day they received.

Such a teacher, so conducting himself for the unusually long period of fifty years, could not fail to be the instrument of extensive usefulness, and to be remembered by his pupils with gratitude and reverence. Accordingly, his benevolent mind was gratified by seeing a very many of them rising to eminence, retaining for him the respect and affection of

their earlier days, and gratefully ascribing to the benefit of his instruction that distinction to which they had attained in the various departments of society.

The private life of this venerable man was distinguished by active and well-directed benevolence, - with great judgment, prudence, and perseverance, in all his undertakings. Affectionately tender in his family – susceptible of the strongest attachment – compassionate to the unfortunate - and ever exerting himself to promote the welfare of those around him, few men have possessed more warmly, or more extensively, the affections of his friends. Even to the last his mind retained a great portion of its usual elasticity and vigour. The academical society, which he had so long adorned, preserved to the end a firm hold of his regard; and, ever zealous for the welfare and honour of the University of Glasgow, it occupied a great portion of his thought, even in the latest days of his life.

Within its walls his character will forever be remembered with grateful reverence, and his name will descend to posterity as the name of one who, by his labours, has raised its reputation, and acquired a lasting title to the gratitude of his country.

There was a large and most respectable assemblage in the fore-hall of the college yesterday, to pay the last duties to the remains of the late and highly respected professor. After the company came down from the hall, they were joined by the students of the Divinity and Gown classes and proceeded to the high church in the following order:-

Four Officers of Police with Batons.

College Mace carried by a servant uncovered.

The Principal in Gown and Bands, and Professors in their Gowns, three and three.  
Rev. Professor MacGill in Gown and Bands, followed by the students of Divinity, three and three.

Professor Meikleham, followed by students of Natural Philosophy, three and three

Professor Mylne, followed by students of Ethics, three and three

Professor Sandford, followed by students of Greek, three and three

Professor Walker, followed by students of Humanity, three and three

The College Servents

Mutes and Ushers

Professor Buchanan, followed by students of Logic, three and three

Pall Bearers – THE BODY – Pall Bearers

Relatives of the deceased

The Company

When Professor MacGill and the students of Divinity arrived at the North Gate of the High Church burying ground, they filed off to the right two deep.

Professor Meikleham and students then moved up to the gate, and filed off to the left deep forming a passage about seven yards wide.

Professor Mylne and students moved up to Professor MacGill's class, and filed off to the right two deep.

Professor Sandford and students moved up to Professor Meikleham's class, and filed off to the left two deep.

Professor Walker and students moved up to Professor Mylne's class, and filed off to the right two deep

When the body passed, the whole students stood uncovered.

The Police Officers in advance – the Mace Bearer – the Principal and Professors – the Servants and Usher

Professor Buchanan and the Students of Logic – the Pall Bearers – and the company all moved to the grave.

After the interment the whole returned according to a prescribed order.

Captain Graham attended with all of the officers of Police, and directed the procession to and from the Church yard.

Every thing was conducted with the utmost order and propriety, and the number of spectators was very great.

Finally, just after his death, an elegy was published in his memory—it ran to at least two editions. Despite his dearth of publications, what Jardine did present to the public continues to influence applications of ideas in both the sciences and the humanities today. Truly, George Jardine was a venerable scholar, and one of those “Departed Sages of the Land among, Remembrance loves to tell how Wisdom grac'd - The Classic dignity he held so long.”<sup>98</sup>

---

<sup>98</sup> Harriston, William (1827). *Elegy to the Memory of George Jardine Esq. Late Professor of Logic in the University of Glasgow, Who Died There on the 28<sup>th</sup> of January 1827, in the 85<sup>th</sup> Year of His age*. Second edition, Glasgow: Jamaica Street. P.29.

This document is in the special collections at the Mitchell Library Glasgow it is in poor condition, almost unreadable. I have pointed out the condition to the staff 11/06 and it has been sent to restoration. I include my transcription of this document in Section II of this thesis.

## Chapter 3

### Jardine and America

Perhaps the best way to describe Professor George Jardine is as a teacher's teacher. He was not widely published nor did he engage in speculative philosophy which was not unusual for a professor in his time period.<sup>1</sup> Nor did Jardine's academic emphasis focus on creating a new philosophical theory. Rather, he developed an enduring pedagogy of useful knowledge. Though Jardine was a well-known figure in Scottish academic circles in early nineteenth-century, his lack of publication in general and specifically in philosophy greatly contributed to his obscurity. Scottish authors like James McCosh and later James Coutts, would eventually recognise Jardine as an outstanding teacher, yet they would criticize him as a philosopher. For instance, Coutts states Jardine "disciplined the faculties of his students for active and decided usefulness, though he did not lead them far into the debatable land on to which the Hegelians think they have since shed light."<sup>2</sup> Writing from America in 1875, Scottish thinker and President of Princeton University James McCosh, commented that Jardine was, "on criticism, showing no originality or grasp of intellect, but furnishing a course of great

---

<sup>1</sup> R. D. Anderson has noted that, "Scottish professors in the early nineteenth century were expected to be men of literary or scientific eminence, but not necessarily to do original work. Their chief duty was to lecture and in return they collected student's fees, in cash and in person at the beginning of each session." (Anderson, R.D. (1987), *Scottish Economic and Social History* Vol 7, 27).

<sup>2</sup> Coutts, James (1909), *A History of the University of Glasgow: from its foundation in 1451 to 1909*. Glasgow: J. Maclehose and Sons.

utility to young students, and felt to be interesting and stimulating”<sup>3</sup> This criticism is fair as far as it goes. However, it fails to recognize Jardine’s students as another means of transmitting his ideas beyond Glasgow University.

Jardine’s influence across the Atlantic was not evident strictly in terms of philosophical and literary accomplishments, but rather in the fruits of his labor: his esteemed students. This is a crucial point especially since some of his students who studied at the University of Glasgow during his long tenure made their way across the Atlantic employing Jardine’s pedagogical strategies in the developing system of education in early America. Robert Chambers noted that:

Few teachers have ever enjoyed so large a portion of the respect and affection of their pupils. This was owing not a little to the warm interest which they could not fail to perceive he took in their progress, - to his strict impartiality, which admitted of no preference or distinction of any sort that of talents and industry, - and to a kindly, and affectionate, and almost paternal regard, which marked the whole of his demeanor to his students – who, dispersed, as they afterwards came to be, to all the quarters of the globe, have very generally concurred in expression of corrigible [sic] esteem to their old preceptor.<sup>4</sup>

In this chapter, I will demonstrate that Jardine and his seminal text *Outlines of a Philosophical Education* had a significant influence in American education, religious affairs and even politics. This influence, as I have mentioned earlier, was transmitted largely by his former students from the University of Glasgow. Although Jardine only

---

<sup>3</sup> McCosh, James (1875), *The Scottish Philosophy, from Hutchison to Hamilton*. New York: Robert Carter and Brothers. p.314.

<sup>4</sup> Chambers, Robert (1836). *Biographical Dictionary of Eminent Scotsman*. Glasgow: Blackie & Son, 250.

published his one book, *Outlines of a Philosophical Education, Illustrated by the Method of Teaching Logic at the University of Glasgow* (1818), in Scotland, I will provide evidence that his writings also found an eager audience in the West. Jardine's literary reception in America is intertwined with the influence exerted by his students, especially in the field of education.

### ***Outlines in America***

A hundred and eighty-plus years after the publication of *Outlines*, George Jardine received some minor recognition as a scholar and a teacher. This recognition arises primarily from modern historians of rhetoric and writing theorists who have identified the methodologies of the Scottish Logic and Rhetoric courses of the Enlightenment as significant to the development of English Literature and Rhetoric in America. A notable account is found in Lynee Gaillet's 1991 dissertation on Jardine, *A Nineteenth-Century Scottish Rhetorician, George Jardine: Prefiguring Twentieth-Century Composition Theory*. Most recently, Barbra Bird published her dissertation as a book on Jardine, *George Jardine's Investigative Rhetoric and Epistemic Writing Theory* (year?).

Nevertheless, an investigation into the impact and reception of George Jardine in America can be framed by two seemingly incompatible claims about the nature and scope of his influence. Consider first the argument of Winifred Bryan Horner. In her 1993 publication *Nineteenth-Century Scottish Rhetoric: The American Connection*, she writes that, "during the nineteenth century, he [Jardine] had little influence beyond his own university," and "Jardine was largely ignored after his lifetime nor did the work of

Jardine influence American composition. Unfortunately, his work found no ear in the United States”.<sup>5</sup>

Gaillet and Horner have focused on the similarities between Jardine’s pedagogy and those of twentieth-century educators. They both praise Jardine for his classroom innovations and his “revolutionary practices”. Bird, on the other hand, seeks to extract a writing theory based on Jardine’s classroom practices and what she calls Scottish enlightenment epistemology. These contemporary investigations into Jardine’s *Outlines* have been focused through a lens of composition studies or rhetoric. And because of their approach, they tend to focus primarily on the second part of the Jardine’s work.

Horner’s views stand in stark contrast with those of Arthur Herman who makes the claim, “Jardine’s *Outlines of a Philosophical Education, Illustrated by the Method of Teaching Logic at the University of Glasgow* became one of the most popular textbooks in American higher education”.<sup>6</sup> Herman sees Jardine’s *Outlines of Philosophical Education* as a textbook. Thus, these competing claims cannot both be true, but they can both be false.

However, a look at the publication itself shows us a slightly different application. The *Outlines* was much more of a teaching manual crafted to provide insight for instructors rather than a textbook aimed at students. Jardine’s publication is based on his lectures in Logic at the University of Glasgow, so these lectures were indeed geared

---

<sup>5</sup> See Horner 177–179. The claim on Jardine’s American reception that “during the nineteenth century, he had little influence beyond his own university” will be challenged in this chapter, especially since further evidence to the contrary can be found in nineteenth-century periodicals in England. Firstly, academics in Europe and America were well aware of Scottish journals and educational literature, including the ideas of George Jardine.

<sup>6</sup> Herman 391.

specifically for students. However, Jardine's book leaves out details he would normally attend to in a lecture in favor of providing narration and explanation for instructors that would have otherwise been absent in his lectures. Consequently, looking at the *Outlines of Philosophical Education* as a teaching manual rather than as a textbook may change where one might look to see its sphere of influence. Herman contentiously, and without referencing a source, claims that Jardine's "ideas on what University education was supposed to offer, and how it was supposed to be taught, changed education not only in America but in Scotland as well".<sup>7</sup> However, his claim that *Outlines of Philosophical Education* became one of the most popular textbooks in American higher education has little merit since searches in databases for American textbooks yield few results for *Outlines*.

In his 2001 book, *The Scottish Connection: The Rise of English Literary Study in America*, Franklin Court claims Jardine's *Outlines* were "highly influential in North American universities in the nineteenth century".<sup>8</sup> Court identifies Jardine's *Outlines* with Adam Smith's legacy in the logic and rhetoric course he taught at Glasgow University in the 1760s. Court states: "Actual documentation of Smith's connection with American university studies, however, dates initially from the 1825 publication of George Jardine's *Outlines of a Philosophical education*".<sup>9</sup> Court's angle on the American reception of Jardine and his *Outlines* is better stated than Herman's; however, Court's claim that it was not until 1825 that Americans were introduced to Jardine and his

---

<sup>7</sup> Herman, 390-1.

<sup>8</sup> Court, Franklin (2001). *The Scottish Connection: The Rise of English Literary Study in America*. New York: Syracuse University Press, 14. Like Herman, Court does not offer any primary source material to support his claim.

<sup>9</sup> Court, *The Scottish Connection: The Rise of English Literary Study in America*.

*Outlines* can be refuted. In fact, American readers were exposed to the *Outlines of Philosophical Education* as early as 1818, but not by a wide spread distribution of Jardine's book; this reception occurred primarily through periodicals.

### **American magazines in the field of education**

From 1818 to 1820 *The Academician*, edited by Albert Picket and John W. Picket, devoted significant space to Jardine and serialized the *Outlines*. Albert Picket had been a pupil of Noah Webster, so he took a keen interest in educational reform. His target audience for *The Academician* was educators and academics. The journal was published out of New York and was the first successful magazine of its kind. In addition to Jardine, the magazine featured other internationally renowned educational reformers such as Pestalozzi, Lancaster and Philipp Emanuel von Fellenberg.

Interestingly enough, *The Academician* prefaced each edition with a tribute to Jardine:

As we have long been actively engaged in the scholastic profession, we may have formed some notions which are not altogether correct. There is one, however, which we have long entertained, and are glad to see confirmed in the writings of the celebrated Dr. Jardine. In introducing it, we shall use his own language, and we should certainly be much rejoiced to know that our instructors had conducted the studies of their pupils by the spirit of the observation, which is applicable not only to colleges but schools.<sup>10</sup>

The fact that Jardine was featured in such a way is both an intriguing and strong evidence of his significant impact in American educational literature. In fact, Davis Sheldon's study of *The Academician* states, "about one seventh of the volume is taken

---

<sup>10</sup> *The Academician* edited by Albert Picket and John W. Picket, 1818 to 1820.

from an educational treatise by Dr. Jardine, of the University of Glasgow”.<sup>11</sup> Though circulation of these early journals of education were often limited to school boards and teachers and educational specialists Jardine’s ideas were being read by those who wrote text books and created curriculum.<sup>12</sup>

The editor of the *Academician*, and author of several textbooks, Albert Pickett was responsible for inserting Jardine’s work into the journal. Pickett sets up the mission of the journal with a quote from Jardine:

In modern times, numerous treatises have been written, both in our own and in foreign languages, on the subject of education. No one of these works, however, able and judicious as some of them undoubtedly are, deserves to be implicitly followed a guide, in a matter confessedly so important; for no one of them comprehends, in its details, the various topics which ought to be introduced in a system, of philosophic education, nor sets forth these still more essential duties of the teacher, which consist in adapting his instruction to the opening capacity of his pupils; in supplying them with constant and suitable employment; and in conducting them gradually from things more easy to things more difficult, in the natural order of the sciences. The truth, indeed, seems to be, that a

---

<sup>11</sup> Davis, Sheldon E (1919), *Educational Periodicals During the Nineteenth Century*. Washington: Washington, Govt. Print. Office.

<sup>12</sup>According to Sheldon Davis’ report *Educational Periodicals During the Nineteenth Century*, “The principal source of information concerning circulation before 1870 is internal evidence in the form of editorial statements; publishers’ and editors’ reports presented to State teachers’ associations; official documents and State laws in the case of those supported or subsidized by the State; and occasional comments by persons variously responsible for financial matters connected with these periodicals.” (Department Of The Interior Bureau Of Education Bulletin, 1919, No. 28).

systematic exposition of the different methods of teaching, considered merely as ancient, rather than as a practical and progressive scheme, for directing the efforts of those who are just entering upon the study of the sciences, has occupied the attention, and exhausted the ingenuity, of the more eminent among the writers to whom we have now alluded. There appears to be still wanting a regular elementary system of scholastic or academical study; which, uniting speculation with practice, principles and rules with suitable illustrations and exercises, would embrace the means which seem best calculated to call forth and strengthen the intellectual powers of youth. It is of less moment, perhaps, from what branches of science or of art the materials, constituting such a system, should be drawn; provided they be carefully adapted to the actual state of information in which the pupils, generally speaking, are found, at the commencement of the course of instruction, and agreeing in their tendency to create habits of diligence, and of independent exertion. Were it, indeed, the main object of the teacher, in the first lessons of instruction, to expound the doctrines of any art or science<sup>13</sup>

So as that lengthy quote demonstrates, even during his lifetime, Jardine's first edition of the *Outlines of Philosophical Education* was not only being read in America, but was also in some sense a foundational pedagogy for American educators. Fortunately, *The*

---

<sup>13</sup> Jardine, George, Ed. Albert Picket, John W. Picket (1818), "Outlines of Philosophical Education" abstracted from Dr. Jardine of Glasgow University. *The Academician*. 1(6) p. 293. William Russell also cited this passage in the *American Journal of Education* Vol. I, 617.

*Academician* was not the only educational magazine to feature Jardine's work, but *The Academician* was perhaps the first successful educational magazine in America even though it only circulated from 1818 to 1820.

*The American Journal of Education* began its publication in 1826, the year Jardine's 2<sup>nd</sup> edition of the *Outlines* was released and the year of his death. Frank Luther Mott describes this periodical as the first really important American magazine in the field of education. One of the founders, and the first editor of the journal, was William Russell, a Scottish immigrant to America and a former student of Jardine at Glasgow University. It's in the person of Russell that we see an overlap between Jardine's literary reception in America and the influence of his students.

### **American journals: Importing a Scottish educational philosophy**

Russell had departed Glasgow to America seeking warmer weather to ease a pulmonary condition. His time under Jardine had both inspired him and adequately prepared him to address the educational needs of a rapidly expanding nation such as the United States. Henry Barnard, who would follow Russell as editor of the *American Journal of Education*, recognised the influence of Jardine on Russell and consequently on the formation of the publication:

The early direction given to Mr. Russell's studies and pursuits by the influence of Professor Jardine, led him to take a deep interest in the general subject of modes of education, in their adaptation to the development of mind and character. This circumstance subsequently proved a useful preparation for the business of conducting an

educational journal at a time when, as yet, no publication of that description existed in our own country or in England.<sup>14</sup>

Throughout Russell's tenure with the *American Journal of Education* he continued to draw from Jardine and the *Outlines*, as did others. Sheldon Davis, in his *Educational Periodicals During the Nineteenth Century*, also speaks to Jardine's literary role, "aside from the writers with an official status, such as Stowe, Cousin, and State superintendents, whose documents were largely republished, the most generally quoted important contributors before 1840 were James Carter, William Russell, W. C. Woodbridge; Jullian and Jardine, the first French the other Scotch".<sup>15</sup>

In the first Volume of the journal which ran for two issues, Russell wrote a detailed twenty-five-page review of Jardine's *Outlines*. Russell introduces his readers to Jardine stating:

Persons who take a deep interest in the subject of education, will find this volume the most interesting that for many years has issued from the press. Intellectual culture is in this work raised to that elevation to which it is entitled, from its dignity as a department of science, no less than of art, and from its important relation, to the business of life. The author of the *Outlines* - an eminent practical philosopher and a veteran in the service of education - takes the young instructor by the hand, and places him at the feet of a sound and enlightened philosophy, there to watch the development of the mind, and to ascertain that course of discipline, which

---

<sup>14</sup> Barnard, Henry (1857), William Russell. "American Journal of Education and College Review", 3 (139).

<sup>15</sup> Davis, Sheldon Emmor (1919), *Educational Periodicals During the Nineteenth Century*.

is best adapted to the constitution and the condition of man. The venerable professor ennobles the art of teaching by raising it above the mere process of mechanical routine and drudgery, and by infusing into its details the spirit of intellectual science. He carries the teacher to a point from which a commanding survey of the whole field of education may be taken, and enables him to enter on the duties of his station, with those comprehensive views and inspiring principles which give efficiency and dignity to instruction.<sup>16</sup>

Russell saw the practical value in Jardine's fifty years of experience for American instructors and understood the breadth of Jardine's interdisciplinary approach education. With Russell's influence Jardine is featured in no fewer than seven issues of the *American Journal of Education* between 1826 and 1827.<sup>17</sup>

To the extent that Professor Jardine influenced Russell, Jardine is doubly represented on the list of significant contributors to the *American Journal of Education*, so his name continues to pop up in reference to education and educators in the journal well into the mid-century. For example, Jardine is mentioned in March 1857, September 1864, and even as late as 1886.

In addition to the *Academician* and the *American Journal of Education* that addressed Jardine's work directly, he is also connected to great literary figures from Scotland in other publications. Magazines such as *The Living Age* ran a biography of

---

<sup>16</sup> Jardine, George. (1826). "Outlines of Philosophical Education, illustrated by the method of Teaching the Logic Class in the University of Glasgow; together with Observations on the expediency of extending the Practical System". *American Journal of Education* Vol 1No.2

542.

<sup>17</sup> See Section II of this thesis - Jardine and American Journals.

John Wilson, who wrote under the pen name of Christopher North, informing an American readership of Jardine's influence on Professor Wilson.<sup>18</sup> Jardine's influence on another former student, Alexander Campbell, is recalled in *The American Whig Review* Volume 0012, Issue 34 from October 1850. And, Jardine is connected once again to William Russell in *The American Journal of Education*, Volume 14, no. 11 issued in September of 1864. Jardine was also noted as Jeffrey's Professor in *The North American Review* Volume 0075, Issue 157. Finally, Jardine received passing references in articles that addressed education such as *Education in College and University Studies, Historical Development* by David Ross in *The American Journal of Education*, Vol. 31 in 1886, and *Memoirs of Teachers, Educators, Promoters and Benefactors of Education, Literature, and Science* in *The American Annals of Education* in 1859.<sup>19</sup>

During the early nineteenth century American readers were supplied with literature from abroad, and in the field of philosophy, many of the books either imported or reprinted in America were of Scottish origin. For example, *Christopher North, a Memoir of John Wilson, Late Professor of Moral Philosophy in the University of Edinburgh* by Wilson's daughter Mary Gordon, was republished in New York in 1863. This book included reminiscence of Professor Jardine and his influence on Wilson. Another example is *Lectures on Metaphysics and Logic* by Sir William Hamilton, edited by the Rev. Henry L. Mansel and John Veitch. Gould and Lincoln republished this text in Boston in 1859–1863. In the *Lectures*, Hamilton acknowledges Jardine's contributions to Scottish education and to educational philosophy.

---

<sup>18</sup> *The Living Age* Volume 0076 Issue 979, 7 March 1863.

<sup>19</sup> See Section II for more on these publications.

In addition to periodicals and books by Scottish authors, American books on education also gave tribute to Jardine and the *Outlines*. Encyclopedic volumes that examine education such as *A critical dictionary of English literature, and British and American authors, living and deceased, from the earliest accounts to the middle of the nineteenth century*, published in Philadelphia from 1858 to 1871, included entries for Jardine where he is remembered in America as a major contributor to Scottish educational philosophy. Moreover, Henry Barnard, the second editor of *The American Journal of Education*, published *Education, the School, and the Teacher in American Literature* in 1876. In that volume, Barnard credits Jardine as an innovator working on the “cultivation of the reflective faculties” of his students.<sup>20</sup> Barnard also was influenced by William Russell during their time together working on *The American Journal of Education*. For this reason, I will address Russell’s publications on education later in this chapter.

Now, what about Arthur Herman’s claim that Jardine’s *Outlines of a Philosophical Education, Illustrated by the Method of Teaching Logic at the University of Glasgow* became one of the most popular textbooks in American higher education? I have stated previously that little evidence has been found to give the *Outlines* such a lofty status; however, the *Outlines* did make it over to America in book form. For instance, a library catalog from *Books on Education in the Libraries of Columbia University* 1901 shows a holding of an 1818 edition of the *Outlines*. The *Catalogue of the New York State Library* 1850 also houses an 1818 edition of Jardine’s book. Again, in the *Catalogue of*

---

<sup>20</sup> Barnard, Henry (1876), *Education, the School, and the Teacher in American Literature*. Hartford : Brown & Gross, 133. Also see page 154 for more recommendations based on Jardine’s pedagogy.

*the Public Library of Cincinnati* from 1871, there exists an entry for an 1818 edition, and the *Catalogue of the Books Belonging to the Library Company of Philadelphia* 1835 has an unspecified edition of the *Outlines* in their holdings. In addition, a volume of the *Outlines* also appears in a bibliography prepared by Dr. Erika Lindemann, a professor of English at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, as a primary source reference to her collection of antebellum essays, *True and Candid Compositions* (2004).

Though the *Outlines on a Philosophical Education* was designed more as an instructor's manual, there is evidence that it was ordered specifically as a school text. In 1816 Thomas McCulloch founded Pictou Academy in Nova Scotia. McCulloch sought to establish a non-sectarian college that would train local ministers and offer a liberal scientific curriculum modeled on the University of Glasgow. Not surprisingly, "McCulloch's whole curriculum followed that of George Jardine, Professor of Logic at the University of Glasgow between 1774 and 1827, who may have taught McCulloch when he attended the university. Jardine signed McCulloch's petition on behalf of Pictou academy. Jardine's textbook, *Outlines of a Philosophical Education* (1818 and republished 1825), McCulloch later ordered for his classes."<sup>21</sup> McCulloch eventually became the first President of Dalhousie College, bringing Jardine's pedagogy to yet another institution in North America. Yet, Jardine had other friends and former students who made their way to America as well.

### **Students, Friends and Acquaintances in America**

---

<sup>21</sup> Wood, B. Anne. (1987). "Thomas McCulloch's Use of Science in Promoting a Liberal Education", *Acadiensis* 17 (No.1), 56-73.

In chapter 2 on Jardine's life, we see that he was devoted to his students and committed to the idea of an education that had application outside of academics. Jardine premised his *Outlines* with the claim that a philosophical education gives students a solid foundation for business and science. It is interesting then, that Jardine's pedagogy of useful knowledge was successful on two fronts. The first involved developing philosophical skills in his students that were indeed useful. The second was that his pedagogy of useful knowledge was itself immediately applicable. That is, Jardine's method of transmitting the philosophical skills was equally as useful as its content. Hence, we see that Jardine had students who took his knowledge base and employed it towards their critical skills in business, religion and politics. And, others carried on Jardine's educational practices themselves. While this claim of Jardine's success and influence is obviously true in the case of Scotland where Jardine's long tenure at the University of Glasgow produced rectors, principals, professors, publishers, MPs and prominent businessmen, what has not been known until now is that Jardine had a similar sphere of influence across the Atlantic in America.

### **The Campbell Men**

Jardine's theological influence was to some extent embedded in his philosophy of education. This concept of "useful knowledge" enhanced a pious and sensible politeness that was, of course, Christian. Not surprisingly, Jardine's educational philosophy was aimed at the moral development of students and ultimately, society. Jardine was an ordained minister and a long time representative in the General Assembly where he exerted influence on the affairs of the church for many years. Jardine's influence on

American religion however, was not in terms of Assembly decisions or theological ideas but rather in the work and contributions of his students.

Due to Jardine's very long tenure at the University of Glasgow he saw generations of students come and go, and two of them would have been a father and son, Thomas and Alexander Campbell. In a lovely testimony of Jardine's long tenure at Glasgow, twenty-five years before Alexander Campbell joined Jardine's Logic and Rhetoric course, his father Thomas Campbell, had done the same.<sup>22</sup> The Campbells were from Ireland but of Scottish descent. Thomas Campbell sailed for America in 1807 and his family was to follow the next year. By a quirk of fate the young Alexander Campbell was shipwrecked off Islay on his way to meet up with his father.<sup>23</sup> As a consequence he detoured to Glasgow where he enrolled in the University. Campbell studied under Jardine in 1808. Jardine was only Professor Clow's assistant during Thomas Campbell's school years (1783 – 1786); however, in terms of actual classroom instruction, Jardine was teaching the class. Consequently, armed with the analytical skills developed out of Jardine's University of Glasgow course on Logic and Rhetoric, Thomas Campbell and his son Alexander would exert a major influence on early American religion.

In America, Thomas Campbell published *Declaration and Address of the Christian Association of Washington* in 1809. This essay launched the Campbell

---

<sup>22</sup> At first glance it might be easy to confuse Thomas Campbell, the father of Alexander, with Thomas Campbell the Poet. Campbell the poet was from Scotland as opposed to the Thomas Campbell the minister and educator who was from Ireland. The poet was 14 years younger than Alexander's father. They both however, studied under Professor Jardine at the University of Glasgow. Campbell the poet refers to Jardine several times in his autobiography. He also served as Rector to Glasgow University from 1826 to 1829.

<sup>23</sup> See Robert Richardson's (1868) *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell Vol I*, 105.

movement in America.<sup>24</sup> The Campbells focused on the idea of “one Church of Christ upon earth.” They believed that followers of Christ should not be identified by sectarian names, but rather, the term “Disciples”. The Campbell movement saw individual congregations as the pinnacle of church expression. These local churches were to be autonomous organizations. In addition, the Campbells were advocates of the separation of church and state. In 1832 the Campbell movement joined up with the followers of Barton Warren Stone of Kentucky to become the Stone-Campbell movement.<sup>25</sup> As the Campbell movement developed, Thomas and his son Alexander became founders of the Disciples of Christ movement and major players in the Restoration movement of the second Great Awakening.<sup>26</sup>

Thomas Campbell also had a keen interest in education. In 1813, he opened a school in Cambridge, Ohio where he taught for two years. Campbell then moved to Pittsburg, Pennsylvania in 1815, and established a school with the help of Nathaniel Richardson.<sup>27</sup> From Pittsburg Campbell moved on to Newport, Kentucky and taught for some time in the Academy at Burlington.<sup>28</sup>

---

<sup>24</sup> This publication led the Presbyterian Synod to suspended Thomas Campbell’s ministerial credentials.

<sup>25</sup> Robert Richardson *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* Vol I, 504.

<sup>26</sup> The Second Great Awakening was a religious revival movement during the early 19th century in the United States. The movement stressed salvation through revivals. It enrolled millions of new members, and led to the formation of new denominations. Many of the zealous believed that the Awakening heralded a new millennial age. The Second Great Awakening stimulated the establishment of many reform movements that would pave the way for the Second Coming of Jesus Christ.

<sup>27</sup> Nathaniel Richardson was a wealthy Episcopalian interested in having his son Robert tutored by Thomas Campbell. He became a patron of the School in Pennsylvania. Robert Richardson would eventually be Alexander Campbell’s assistant and biographer.

<sup>28</sup> See Robert Richardson *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* Vol I, 464.

To some extent, Thomas Campbell's contributions to American religious reform and education are obscured by the fame of his son. Nonetheless, the elder Campbell was always working to support the family cause and continued to employ the skills they were taught in Jardine's Logic course. For example, when Alexander Campbell travelled, his father would take over as editor of *The Christian Baptist* and *The Millennial Harbinger* which were publications that collectively ran from 1823 to 1870.<sup>29</sup> Thomas Campbell also remained a valuable advisor to his son on all matters of ministry, including education.

Alexander Campbell established Bethany College in Virginia, which operates to this day. There are volumes of books and websites dedicated to Campbell's life and works that require no reiteration. However, buried deep in those accounts, we see Professor George Jardine had a significant influence on Campbell.<sup>30</sup> One of Alexander Campbell's biographers, Eva Jean Wrather, tells us Campbell "attended courses both public and private from Jardine and was 'greatly pleased' by their instruction".<sup>31</sup> Wrather further affirms that Campbell's "special friends and favorites" were George Jardine and

---

<sup>29</sup> Douglas A. Foster and Anthony L. Dunnivant (2004). *The Encyclopedia of the Stone-Campbell Movement: Christian Church (Disciples of Christ), Christian Churches/Churches of Christ, Churches of Christ*, Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing, 517-518.

<sup>30</sup> Eva Jean Wrather (2005) tells us: "Alexander's views on taste could scarcely escape the religious bent of his teaching. He found that bent encouraged by Professor Jardine, whose own theory of beauty was modeled after the sternly spiritual aesthetics propounded by his friend Thomas Reid. 'Good taste', he always lectured his young gentlemen, 'is closely connected with good Morals and Propriety of Conduct.' Alexander was virtually paraphrasing a part of that lecture when, in describing the primary purpose served by the sense of beauty, he wrote: "That as man is destined for the enjoyment of perfect beauty hereafter, it is wise and kind in the wise Author of nature to give him a taste for it and a sense to feel it." (81)

<sup>31</sup> Wrather, Eva Jean (2005). *Alexander Campbell*. Fort Worth, Texas: TCU Press. 131-132.

Professor Young. Alexander Campbell clearly recognised the importance and use value of Jardine's educational philosophy.

Jardine had a lasting influence on Alexander Campbell. Indeed, Campbell took care to keep his notebook from Jardine's Logic course and brought it with him to America.<sup>32</sup> While at Glasgow Campbell attended what he called "the most useful series of college lectures" entitled "the science and art of attention".<sup>33</sup> Indeed, Campbell was later remembered as having an exceptional ability to focus and recall details. He learned to command his attention so he could "recollect the materials of any lecture...without the loss of a prominent idea" and to this skill he gives credit to his father and George Jardine.<sup>34</sup> Alexander Campbell was well known for his ability to recall volumes of information in debates—a skill he put to use in several high profile debates. For example, Campbell debated with John Walker, a Seceder Presbyterian; W.W. McCalla; N.L. Rice, a minister from Paris; another from Kentucky, as well as with Robert Owen, who was considered a skeptic and socialist.

### **Robert Owen (1771-1858)**

In many ways Robert Owen and Alexander Campbell could not have been more different: Campbell was a staunch conservative Christian while Owen was an avowed agnostic and skeptic. In their 1829 debate, Robert Owen argued that all religion is false because different religions contradict each other. In addition, he contended that society rooted in atheism would promote the greater good. On the other hand, Campbell took the

---

<sup>32</sup> The special collections department of the Bethany College Library West Virginia still holds Campbell's notes.

<sup>33</sup> Wrather 77.

<sup>34</sup> *Ibid.*

position that the framework of society is built on religion, and that Christianity is demonstratively the true religion.

Yet for all their polar differences, the two men liked each other. And behind their opposing intellectual views there was more common ground – Professor George Jardine. As noted, Campbell was a student of Jardine, and Owen was a friend and associate of the Professor as well.

Robert Owen came to America from the British Isles to establish a utopian community in New Harmony, Indiana. Owen was a social, economic and educational reformer. Originally from Wales, Owen made his way in business in Manchester before moving north to Lanark on the Clyde. He was a self-made man and entrepreneur who tried to blend French and Scottish educational ideas into a wider social view of equality for the poor and working classes.<sup>35</sup>

During this same time period, Scottish educational ideas were being formulated in Jardine's pedagogical methodologies. In his autobiography, Owen mentions that he was on friendly terms with many of the professors of the Scottish universities of Edinburgh and Glasgow, particularly Professor Jardine and Professor Mylene. Owen notes that Jardine and Mylene were held in high public esteem and they supported Owen in his presentations to the Assembly.<sup>36</sup>

Campbell and Owen debated social and religious issues that were central to American interests in religion. Yet in as much as it was an American debate, it was a Scottish contest of Jardine's legacy. Campbell went on to publish the proceedings, the

---

<sup>35</sup> Owen, Robert (1857). *The Life of Robert Owen Written by Himself*; London: Effingham Wilson Royal Exchange.

<sup>36</sup> *Ibid.*, 107.

full title being *The Evidences of Christianity, a Debate between Robert Owen of New Lanark, Scotland, and Alexander Campbell, President of Bethany College, Va., containing an Examination of the "Social System" and all the Systems of Skepticism of Ancient and Modern Times, held in the City of Cincinnati, Ohio, in April, 1829.* It is unfortunate that Jardine had passed away before he could witness two people he knew well debating some of the most pressing issues of the time in front of an American audience.

George Jardine's legacy in America, in part, can be measured by the lasting effects his teachings had on exceptional students like Thomas and Alexander Campbell and personal friends like Robert Owen. The Campbell men and Owen perpetuated Jardine's concept of useful education in schools and the university. These former students would go on to found and participate in religious movements, periodicals, institutions and public debates wherein and whereat they employed the philosophical skills from the logic and rhetoric class in sermons, volumes of essays, books and published debates.

### **William Russell (1798-1873)**

Thomas and Alexander Campbell and Robert Owen were not the **only students** of Jardine to make major contributions in America. There was also William Russell. Russell was a native Glaswegian who had attended Glasgow University. According to the *American Journal of Education*,

During his [Russell] course of study in the latter of these institutions, the "First Philosophy Class," embracing the subjects of intellectual philosophy, logic and rhetoric, - was, fortunately for Mr. Russell, in his subsequent life as a teacher, under the care of

Professor George Jardine, author of the ‘Outlines of Philosophical Education’. That eminent and revered instructor, by his zeal and eloquence on his favorite theme, the philosophy of human culture, awakened a lively sympathy with his views, in the minds of his students.<sup>37</sup>

Without a doubt, the influence of Jardine was lasting because “After fifty years noble service, he (Jardine) still retained a warm feeling for whatever concerned the subject of education; as he manifested in his cordial expressions of pleasure on the establishment of the *American Journal of Education*, in the city of Boston, in the year 1826.”<sup>38</sup>

Henry Barnard, who assumed leadership of *American Journal of Education* after Russell noted:

The early direction given to Mr. Russell's studies and pursuits by the influence of Professor Jardine, led him to take a deep interest in the general subject of modes of education, in their adaptation to the development of mind and character. This circumstance subsequently proved a useful preparation for the business of conducting an educational journal at a time when, as yet, no publication of that description existed in our own country or in England; although the light shed on the whole subject of education by the labors of Pestalozzi, had excited, throughout Europe and America, a fresh interest on all the great questions involved in the various departments of physical, intellectual, and moral culture.<sup>39</sup>

---

<sup>37</sup> Barnard, Henry. (1857). William Russell, *The American Journal of Education*. 3 (No. 8) 146.

<sup>38</sup> Russell, William (1826). *American Journal of Education Vol. 1*, 547.

<sup>39</sup> Barnard, Henry. (1857), William Russell, *The American Journal of Education*. 3 (No. 8) 146.

Through Russell, an American audience viewed Jardine side by side with the most renowned educators of the day. Jardine's ideas were not only explicitly published in the journal, but also visible in Russell's own writings.

For example, Russell published several books on education such as *A Grammar of Composition, including a series of Lessons in Rhetorical Analysis, and six introductory courses of Composition* (1823). The first part of this work contains a review of those principles of rhetoric as they apply to composition. The second part employs explicitly a "plan of analysis adopted by Professor Jardine", including some exercises. Part three is a fuller development of the method observed in Walker's *Teacher's Assistant*.

Russell corresponded with his old professor and advertised Jardine's *Outlines of Philosophical Education* with the additional note:

From the second Glasgow Edition, with Additions and other Improvements by the Author. Extract from a recent letter of the author to the editor of the American Journal of Education, 'referring to the second edition of the above work' contains some additions and, I hope, improvements in particular, a suggestion of extending the academical [sic] course to several branches of knowledge, of great importance; but which are little attended to in the ordinary course of academical education.

Glasgow College, 12 May 1826. George Jardine.<sup>40</sup>

So through Russell, we see further evidence of Jardine's *Outlines* in America.

---

<sup>40</sup> Russell, William and William Bentley Fowle (1826) *Manuel of Mutual Instruction*, Boston: Wait, Greene, and Company, X.

## George Ticknor (1791-1873)

There were others associated with Russell and the *American Journal of Education* who were influenced by Jardine, notably George Ticknor who was a publisher and contributor to the journal during Russell's term as editor. One of Ticknor's important essays was "Remarks on Changes Lately Proposed or Adopted in Harvard University" (1825). In this work he argues for an elective system in university education and in doing so he cites Professor Jardine:

Professor Jardine of Glasgow, —who taught three hours a day till he was nearly ninety years old, and made a reform there, for which Mr. Campbell, in his late letter on the University of London, has paid him a beautiful tribute of well earned praise,— Professor Jardine says, after an experience of above half a century in different modes of instruction, that ' there certainly never was a wilder scheme devised by the perverted ingenuity of man, than that of attempting to improve the minds of youth, and create intellectual habits, by the sole means of reading a lecture, without farther intercourse between teacher and pupil.' We have no doubt the whole force of this remark applies to the Lectures, which are generally delivered to the undergraduates at our Colleges. They may be ever so able and well written; they may be ever so learned and eloquent; but, on the present system, they are a waste of the time both of the hearers and the instructors.<sup>41</sup>

Thomas Jefferson read the essay and was moved enough to write a response to Ticknor.<sup>42</sup> So via Ticknor, the former President of the United States and founder of the

---

<sup>41</sup> Ticknor, George (1825), *Remarks on changes lately proposed or adopted, in Harvard University*. Merchant Ball: Cummings, Hilliard & Co. True and Greene, Printers.

<sup>42</sup> See *Memoir of George Ticknor, Historian of Spanish Literature* by Charles Henry Hart, Philadelphia: Collins, Printer, Toe, Jayne Street 1811.

University of Virginia was also introduced to the educational philosophy of George Jardine.

The ideas of Jardine, indorsed by Ticknor and published by William Russell were thinly under the surface of the Yale Report of 1828. Jack C. Lane described the report as “one of the most influential documents in the history of American higher education...The report consisted of two parts: a general discussion of the nature of liberal education, and an argument for the retention of Greek and Latin literature in the college curriculum.”<sup>43</sup> The argument from the faculty at Yale stands in sharp contrast to Jardine’s views on a liberal education. And there is evidence that both Jardine’s and Russell’s were well known at Yale.

Jeremiah Day (1773-1867) was president of Yale College from 1817 to 1846.<sup>44</sup> His manuscript of the Yale Report contains written comments with specific references, including page numbers to Jardine’s second edition of the *Outlines* and its reproduction in the *American Journal of Education*.<sup>45</sup> Day’s comments are generally positive towards Jardine but tended to cite passages of general educational concerns and not much specific to the larger argument of the Report.<sup>46</sup> It is clear from Day’s citations that Jardine’s pedagogy was taken seriously at Yale even if the general direction of the college was moving away from a liberal education.

---

<sup>43</sup> Lane, Jack C. (1987). “The Yale Report of 1828 and Liberal Education: A Neorepublican Manifesto” *History of Education Quarterly* Vol. 27, No. 3 (Autumn, 1987); 325-338.

<sup>44</sup> Welch, Lewis Sheldon, Camp, Walter (1899). *Yale, her campus, classrooms, and athletics*. Boston: L.C.Page and Company, 431.

<sup>45</sup> Yale University Archives: Day Family Papers, MS 175, Series III, Box 29, folder 347.

<sup>46</sup> For more on Jeremiah Day and the Yale Report of 1826 see David B. Potts (2010) *Liberal Education for a Land of Colleges: Yale's "Reports" of 1828*; Palgrave Macmillan.

I have presented a body of evidence that supports the claim that George Jardine had a warm reception and significant influence in American education and religion. However, I want to conclude this chapter with a look at one of Jardine's students whose impact on global politics is still relevant, if not unique. That student was Robert Crichton Wyllie. In what follows, I will present highlights of Wyllie's accomplishments through a consideration of the four major themes presented in Jardine's *Outlines of a Philosophical Education*.

### **Robert Crichton Wyllie (1798-1865)**

From 1845 to 1865, Robert Crichton Wyllie served as Minister of Foreign Affairs for the Kingdom of Hawaii. He was a close friend and advisor to three successive Kings: Kamehameha III, IV and V. Wyllie's life in Hawaii is well documented and his name appears prominently in many accounts of the Kingdom during this time. But even though the last twenty years of his life are well-documented, little is known of the nearly half-century of his existence prior to coming to Hawaii. We know that Wyllie was a successful international businessman and world traveler, yet biographical accounts of his life scarcely go past the content of his obituary, and at times, tend to be less than accurate. One of the major problems in chronicling Wyllie's life centers on the disappearance of his journals and correspondence shortly after his death.<sup>47</sup>

James D. Raeside has described the fate of Wyllie's records in his 1984 essay, "The Journals and Letter Books of R.C. Wyllie: A Minor historical Mystery". From what is known of Wyllie's diaries and notebooks they were a "definitive record and cited

---

<sup>47</sup> Another problem in deciphering Wyllie's past is that his handwriting is nearly scribbled.

extracts to dispose conclusively of points in dispute”.<sup>48</sup> Though most of these documents have been lost, the relative size and number of volumes can be estimated from the numbering of remnants. Raeside cites five volumes of approximately 350 pages each, not to mention more than 31 volumes of letter books. Unfortunately, most of these volumes have been lost as well. In 1881, Walter Murry Gibson of the *Pacific Commercial Advertiser* wrote of the fate of Wyllie’s papers:

We are sorry you inform our Maui friend, that according to our information, all the MSS and diary of Mr. Wyllie were destroyed. Mr. Jarrett, for many years the faithful clerk of the Foreign Office, stated four days prior to his death, in conversation upon the subject, that the numerous papers of Mr. Wyllie had been purposely destroyed. He said that Mr. de Varigny, who succeeded Mr. Wyllie as Foreign Minister, was with the later at his death and took possession of his papers; and that he had strong reason for destroying the journal, which contained some very compromising records against him when he was Chancellor of the French Legation under Mr. Perrin. Colonel Charles H. Judd, son of G. P. Judd, who occupied the Rosebank premises subsequent upon the death of Mr. Wyllie, had large quantities of old letters and MSS of all kinds, thrown out of doors as rubbish; and the editor of this journal paid natives for picking up papers and scraps papers, relating to Mr. Wyllie which the weather had not destroyed, and which were strewn on the banks of the stream in the rear of the dwelling. And an effort will be made by and by

---

<sup>48</sup> Raeside, James. (1984). “The Journals and Letter Books of R.C. Wyllie: A Minor Historical Mystery” *The Hawaiian Journal of History*, 18, 87-96.

to make up a biographical sketch of Mr. Wyllie with what documentary relics are at hand.<sup>49</sup>

A similar story of the fate of Wyllie's papers appears in the journal of Lady Franklin, widow of the famous arctic explorer Sir John Franklin. Mr. Davies of Liverpool writes to Lady Franklin telling of his correspondence with a Mr. Damon from Hawaii stating, "Charles Judd has purchased Rose Bank – what a terrible finale to all Mr. Wyllie's ambitious notions! Not a year has passed away – his nephew dead- & cartloads of his books sold at auction – a cartload of his old papers I have seen in a shed!"<sup>50</sup> Almost needless to say, the missing journals and notebooks of Wyllie have left the majority of Wyllie's life, at least as he had intended it to be remembered, in the fog.<sup>51</sup>

Robert Crichton Wyllie was born at Hazelbank in the parish Dunlop, in Ayrshire Scotland on 13 October 1798.<sup>52</sup> Young Wyllie received his childhood academic instruction from the parish schools in his area. Scottish author Mark Boyd<sup>53</sup> in his *Reminiscences of Fifty Years*, described Wyllie's early education: "He received his first elements of education under the late Mr. Bryce, parish teacher, Dunlop, and afterward for

---

<sup>49</sup> *The Pacific Commercial Advertiser*. October 01, 1881.

<sup>50</sup> Lady Franklin collection: 1860-1881, 248/139. Also see Franklin, Jane Griffin, Ed. W.F. Rawnsley (1923), *The Life, Diaries and Correspondence of Jane Lady Franklin 1792–1875*.

<sup>51</sup> Or in Hawaii, we would say the "vog" which is a fog or haze created by volcanic activity.

<sup>52</sup> Some accounts of Wyllie's life state his family was landed gentry. According to the *New Statistical Account of Scotland Vol V* in 1845 there were 83 documented landowners in this parish. There is indeed an Alexander Wyllie (the name of Robert Crichton Wyllie's father) mentioned. This entry states an Alexander Wyllie of Auchintiber had owned land without entail since 1636. Auchintiber is approximately four or five miles as the crow flies from Hazelbank.

<sup>53</sup> Mark Boyd was a Scottish author and an activist with a special interest in Australia, where his brother Ben was well known. See *Southland Times*, Putanga 1892, (8 Paengawhāwhā 1874, 2) for a brief description of Boyd.

some time attended the late Dr. Barr, of Glasgow, while he taught a number of families in the district of Broadie, in this parish.”<sup>54</sup> Wyllie was an intelligent young man. Boyd recalled: “Those who knew him in boyhood can well remember that from his earliest years he gave every indication of being possessed of talents above mediocrity.”<sup>55</sup> As for the rest of Wyllie’s schooling, there are many accounts crediting him with ultimately obtaining a medical education from the University of Glasgow. For example, Garrit Judd, a descendent of Wyllie’s colleague Dr. Judd, describes him as, “A native of Scotland and educated as a physician”.<sup>56</sup> In like manner, Boyd states, “Mr. Wyllie left for Glasgow College, and received his medical diploma before he was twenty years of age”.<sup>57</sup> Manley Hopkins, consul general for Hawaii in London and frequent correspondent of Wyllie, wrote that, “Mr. Wyllie completed his education at the College in Glasgow by qualifying himself for the surgical profession”.<sup>58</sup> And, a more contemporary account by Edward Joesting states, “Robert Crichton Wyllie, of minor aristocracy of Scotland, had a partial medical education from Glasgow University.”<sup>59</sup> It would seem that a fair number of those who have addressed Wyllie’s early life credit him with a medical education.

Nevertheless, there is no evidence in the matriculation albums of the University of Glasgow that Wyllie ever took a course in medicine or anatomy or even biology. Wyllie

---

<sup>54</sup> Boyd, Mark (1871). *Reminiscences of Fifty Years*. New York: D. Appleton and Company, 358. Boyd is borrowing from an earlier article out of the *Ayr Advertiser* obituary of Wyllie. This article was also reprinted in *The Gentlemen’s Magazine* Vol. 220, Jan.– June 1866, 284.

<sup>55</sup> Boyd 358.

<sup>56</sup> Judd, Garrit (1960). *Dr. Judd, Hawaii’s Friend*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 129.

<sup>57</sup> Boyd 358.

<sup>58</sup> Hopkins, Gerard Manley (1862). *Hawaii: The Past, Present And Future of Its Island Kingdom*. London: Longman, Green, Longman, and Roberts. 498.

<sup>59</sup> Joesting, Edward (1988). *Kauai: The Separate Kingdom*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. 180.

did enter Glasgow College in 1810 at the tender age of twelve, young even by the standards of the day.<sup>60</sup> In the 1811-1812 school year, he was *classe Graeca* under the direction of John Young. The following year Wyllie attended *classe Ethica* taught by James Mylene, and Logic and Rhetoric from Professor George Jardine.<sup>61</sup> Whereas there is no evidence Wyllie received a medical education, or even took a class in medicine, he did attend courses at Glasgow College from three of the most renowned professors of the day.

Of all the courses Wyllie attended at the University of Glasgow it is perhaps Jardine's Logic and Rhetoric class that manifests the most throughout his life. Jardine's Logic class emphasized writing as a tool of learning and writing as an essential tool of communication. In contemporary terms, Jardine's class would be a writing intensive and critical thinking course. After 40 years at the University of Glasgow, Jardine's students convinced him to preserve his pedagogical contributions in a book. As already noted, it was titled *Outlines of a Philosophical Education*. From the *Outlines* and student notes from this era we can get a good picture of Wyllie's education under Jardine.

Apart from writing and critical thinking, Jardine's Logic and Rhetoric class emphasized aspects of learning that get little consideration in contemporary courses such as attention and memory. Jardine taught his students that the memory was a "faculty of the mind which preserves the former perceptions".<sup>62</sup> In addition, memory "extends not

---

<sup>60</sup> Addison, *The matriculation Albums of the University of Glasgow*, 1913.

<sup>61</sup> *Catalogus Togatorum in Academia glasguensi* – Glasgow University Archives Reference # R9/1/1.

<sup>62</sup> Jardine, George Lectures, Ms 166 Glasgow University Library Special Collections, 22-23.

only to objects themselves but to their connections and dependencies in order”,<sup>63</sup> and “in proportion to the intensity with which the power of notice is exerted, the strength and tenaciousness of the memory will be progressively increased”.<sup>64</sup> In a correspondence with Baron Mure of Caldwell, Jardine states that the “habit [of thinking] is to be acquired by giving regular attention to every object of study - by reading with attention and interest”.<sup>65</sup>

Wyllie was known for his keen memory. According to Gerard Hopkins, while in London, Wyllie was known as a man, “animated but rather tedious in conversation, and possessed of a remarkable retentive memory”.<sup>66</sup> In Hawaii, Wyllie also exhibited these same traits. Again Hopkins tells us: “He, indeed, brought to his task working powers of no ordinary capacity, and a memory tenacious in the extreme for facts and dates – at least for those in which he had himself been in some way concerned”.<sup>67</sup> Another student who found the lessons on attention and memory useful was Alexander Campbell who was just two years in front of Wyllie at Glasgow University. Campbell “learned to command his attention so he could ‘recollect the materials of any lecture...without loss of a prominent idea’ to this Skill he gives credit to the father and Jardine”.<sup>68</sup> Campbell’s biographer Wrather, tells us that the most useful series of lectures Campbell received at the University of Glasgow was given by Jardine entitled “The Science and Art of

---

<sup>63</sup> *Ibid.*, 166, 125.

<sup>64</sup> Jardine, George (1818), *Outlines of Philosophical Education Illustrated by the Method of Teaching the Logic Class in the University of Glasgow*. Glasgow: Andrew and James Duncan. P. 111.

<sup>65</sup> MS 4950 Correspondence with Mure 1811 Glasgow University Library Special Collections.

<sup>66</sup> Hopkins, 500.

<sup>67</sup> *Ibid.*, 504.

<sup>68</sup> Wrather, E and Cummins, D. (2005), *Alexander Campbell: Adventurer in Freedom: A Literary Biography*. Canada: The Disciples of Christ Historical Society. Vol.1.

Attention”.<sup>69</sup> Wyllie, like Campbell, may have naturally had a good memory, but these natural skills were cultivated by intentional lessons. Jardine saw memory and attention as fundamental to scholarship as well as communication.

Jardine’s lessons on attention and memory cultivated valuable skills to students of an emerging merchant class and these skills were central to Jardine’s philosophy of education. Jardine states,

The great end of philosophical education, however, is not to be attained by a mere theoretical acquaintance with the mental faculties, as explained in lectures, or even by the ablest writers in this department of knowledge. It consists rather in improved habits of directing their several energies; in thinking correctly, in reasoning closely, and in the acquired facility of conducting the various processes of generalization, invention, and communication, by speech or by writing. A well-educated man, accordingly, is not merely distinguished by his knowledge of particular theories, as to the arrangement and distribution of the powers of the mind, but by the command which he has acquired of his faculties, so as to apply them, as occasion may require, in the prosecution of science, of art, or of business.<sup>70</sup>

Jardine’s writing program aimed at cultivating skills that were useful in daily life. He moved his students towards a habit of writing, writing as an investigative tool, writing to communicate as well as writing to organize and archive.

---

<sup>69</sup> Wrather, 77.

<sup>70</sup> Jardine, *Outlines* 272.

Wyllie took Jardine's emphasis on writing to heart to such a large extent that he was somewhat infamous for his propensity to do so. In 1846, *The Sandwich Island News* noted that Wyllie wielded a pen of "forty scribbler power", and that Wyllie wrote because he could not help it... it was a disease of his organization.<sup>71</sup> Wyllie's disease was incubated by a series of writing assignments that Jardine called themes. Looking at these themes and examples of Wyllie's writing we can see how the student in Wyllie found useful application for these lessons in his professional life.

In Jardine's class the themes were given to the student in order of difficulty with the easiest coming first in the term. These early writing assignments were given daily and directed students to organize their notes and thoughts on the lecture of the day and write them out in an essay format. The goal was to "form clearer and more accurate notions of the subjects discussed in the lectures than can be acquired from merely hearing them delivered."<sup>72</sup> Jardine was teaching his students to use writing as an investigative tool. The students were also being directed into the habit of writing - a habit, as mentioned earlier, that Wyllie developed and employed extensively. Lady Franklin tells us Wyllie nearly bankrupted the Kingdom of Hawaii from printing his work. Likewise, Manley Hopkins noted the massive volume of Wyllie's writing: "Boxes of papers in my own archives witness his industry. In four years his letters to Sir John Bowring, principle concerning the treaty question, filled five large volumes".<sup>73</sup> Others like David Lawrence Gregg, the American Consul, expressed in his diary: "Engaged in writing. Mr. Wyllie

---

<sup>71</sup> Unknown (1846). "The Tongataboo Papers", *The Sandwich Island News*. November (1) 1846.

<sup>72</sup> Jardine, *Outlines* 297.

<sup>73</sup> Hopkins 503.

manages to keep me occupied most of the time”.<sup>74</sup> Clearly, Wyllie took to heart Jardine’s belief that developing the habit of writing was important; however, young men entering business and scientific careers would need skills beyond the ability of producing writing in sheer volume.

Jardine’s second theme sought to enhance the first and emphasized writing with an eye for classifications and relations. His goal with this exercise was to “cultivate the faculties, whose office it is to arrange and classify the subjects of our knowledge, according to their nature and relations”.<sup>75</sup> One example of this arranging and classifying of subjects in writing can be seen in Wyllie’s published letter to R. G. Robinson, ESQ. in 1840. Robinson was the Chairman of the Committee of Spanish American Bondholders in London. Wyllie’s letter gave a detailed account of the debt owed by Mexico. He addressed the economic particulars of Mexico, Chile, Peru, Buenos Aires Brazil, Equator, New Granada, Venezuela, and Guatemala. Wyllie also took into account the political and international standing of each country individually. He made an account for English debits owed by each nation, and the yearly financial revenues of the respective countries, as well as fiscal responsibility and the reliability of each nation. Wyllie’s ability to organize and itemize information made him an important contributor to the London firm which allowed Wyllie to be self-directed in his own investment strategies.

Again in 1845, Wyllie published a detailed book on economics, this time focused solely on conditions in Mexico.<sup>76</sup> Shortly after arriving in Hawaii, Wyllie

---

<sup>74</sup> Gregg, David L. Edited by Pauline King (1982), *The Diaries of David Lawrence Gregg 1853 – 1858*. Honolulu: Hawaiian Historical Society, 284.

<sup>75</sup> Jardine, *Outlines*, 303.

<sup>76</sup> *Mexico. Noticia sobre su hacienda bajo el gobierno espanol y despues de la independencencia... Calculos sobre la deuda publica interior y exterior. Presupuestos*

continued to utilize his old professor's methodology by publishing a series of articles on a wide variety of issues important to the community. In the political sphere Wyllie published volumes of reports that further demonstrated his ability to classify subjects of knowledge according to their nature and relations. Albert Pierce Taylor, Librarian, Archives of Hawaii claimed:

The Archives of Hawaii today are based almost entirely upon the vast, voluminous collections of letters and documents prepared and stored away by Wyllie which he so carefully 'backed' and segregated into their various departments - a correspondence that covered practically every channel of the Government's activities - a correspondence and series of documents and printed reports that may be styled the 'Government History of the Hawaiian Kingdom'.<sup>77</sup>

In fact, the Reverend Gustavus Hines actually credits the successful career Wyllie had with the Hawaiian government to his ability to write in such a way as to "arrange and classify the subjects of our knowledge, according to their nature and relations".<sup>78</sup> Hines states, "Probably Mr. Wyllie owes his promotion to his present distinguished office to the interesting 'Notes' on the population, religion, agriculture and commerce of the islands, which he published soon after his arrival. In these notes the missionaries are very highly

---

*aproximados de sus ingresos...tablas ilustrativas sobre sistema mercantile, manufacturer y prohibitive, y observaciones sobre la colonizacion...diridigo al caballero George B. robinson, president de la commission de tenadores de bonos espanoles y americanos... Library of Congress catalog record. LC control # 02004739.*

<sup>77</sup> Taylor, Albert Pierce (1929). *Intrigues, Conspiracies and Accomplishments in the Era of Kamehameha IV and V and Robert Crichton Wyllie*. Paper read by Albert Pierce Taylor, Librarian, Archives of Hawaii, before the Hawaiian Historical Society, Honolulu, October 15, 1929.

<sup>78</sup> Hines, Gustavus Rev. (1859), *Life on the Plains of the Pacific*. New York: Barker & Co.

commended, and some very wise suggestions are made concerning the future policy of the Sandwich Islands' government".<sup>79</sup> Wyllie's ability to write taking careful notice of classifications and relations served him well in the business world and later, as Minister of Foreign Affairs, the Kingdom of Hawaii. Examination and research are valuable tools because they provide well-organized raw data that empowers a student or businessperson to be an independent thinker.

One of the distinguishing marks of the Scottish Enlightenment was an emphasis on thinking for oneself. Jardine's third theme was aimed at actualizing that ideal. In the *Outlines* he writes, "The object of the exercises prescribed under the head upon which we have now entered, is to accustom the student to judge and reason for himself; and, consequently, to form in his mind those intellectual habits, which, at an earlier stage of his progress, had merely been the subject of examination and research".<sup>80</sup> Thinking for himself was not one of Wyllie's shortcomings (Wyllie was known for being opinionated and stubborn in equal measures). However, in terms of the Scottish Enlightenment, thinking for oneself meant thinking without an appeal to higher authorities like the church or the government. Wyllie was of course a government official, so he had pledged loyalty to the King. Of all the King's foreign advisors, Wyllie was one of the strongest supporter of the monarchy. Yet for all his allegiance, Wyllie did not appeal to the authority of the King to supply him ideas, but rather he employed his own faculties in support of the crown.

---

<sup>79</sup> *Ibid.*, 225. These observations of Hines shows Wyllie's ability to assess conditions impartially, for many of the times he was fiercely opposed to the missionaries and highly critical of their influence in the islands.

<sup>80</sup> Jardine, *Outlines* 312

Another controversial position Wyllie experienced in Hawaii involved religion. Wyllie often found himself at odds with the missionary authorities in the islands. He caused some stir with the missionaries by condoning the serving of wine at Royal events as well as by his own participation and promotion of dancing. In 1851, as Judge Lee was drafting a new Constitution for the Kingdom, Wyllie suggested excluding the clergy from the House of Representatives. Far from appealing to the authority of the church, Wyllie actually attempted to limit the reach of the missionaries.<sup>81</sup> Indeed, Wyllie was highly critical of the American missionaries. David Gregg took note of Wyllie's views on religious authority in a journal entry 18 January 1854. He tells us of Wyllie "Speaking of the rigid rules laid down by the missionaries, in regard to amusements, he condemned them in severe terms, and deprecated the evil tendency of such sternness." Wyllie condemned the missionaries for "such religion as compelled men to wear long faces when they were disposed to be merry, he could not regard with much complaisance. It promoted neither genuine happiness nor true piety. It was opposed to all rational ideas of Christianity and ought to be condemned by everyone who had the good of his fellow men at heart".<sup>82</sup> Despite these public protestations, Wyllie was not anti-religious, but he clearly opposed authoritative attitudes that discouraged people from thinking for

---

<sup>81</sup> Wyllie was neither anti-religious nor a non-Christian. He was however, aware of the power and ambitions the American missionaries possessed and often found himself at odds with them. Wyllie attended church on a regular basis, but it was not a missionary church. Later in life, Wyllie worked to secure an Anglican church on Oahu – a branch of Christendom that would tug at the authority of the American missionaries. Wyllie's colleague and fellow Scotsman John Rae supported Wyllie in his bouts with the missionaries and published harsh criticisms of missionary education in the Honolulu-based newspaper, *The Polynesian* (see 24, 31 May 1862 as well as 21 June).

<sup>82</sup> Gregg, David L. Edited by Pauline King (1982). *The Diaries of David Lawrence Gregg 1853-1858*. Honolulu: Hawaiian Historical Society.

themselves.<sup>83</sup> Where Wyllie was not arguing against religion he was perhaps anti-Presbyterian. In response to his friend John Rae's article in the *Polynesian* condemning the moral perspective of the missionaries Wyllie wrote: "You might have added with great truth, on the Authority of the Spalding Club, that under the preaching of John Knox and his brother Bigots the Number of Bastard children in Scotland, increased beyond all former precedent; and precisely the same moral phenomenon appeared in Geneva, under the teachings of Calvin."<sup>84</sup> A year later Wyllie writes Rae in regards to distributing Rae's essays on morality and his other work on language he states, "I intend to place a series of them all complete in the hands of the right Revd the Lord-Bishop of Honolulu. He and his 2 clergyman, are drawing crowded audiences here. They come to preach *Jesus and him crucified to us*, and not preach to us *Moses and the Prophets*, as I think too much the case with the disciples of Calvin and John Knox".<sup>85</sup> So it appears Wyllie was particularly rough on the Presbyterians and their theological relatives.

Getting back to Jardine, his fourth and final theme states, "The object of this last order of exercises is to improve those faculties of the mind which are employed in the higher processes of investigation, and which, when viewed under a certain light, may be said to constitute the envied endowment of genius".<sup>86</sup> This exercise should promote "the powers of attention, discrimination and investigation – to conduct the mind from phenomenon to causes, from particular to general truths, and thus to produce habits of

---

<sup>83</sup> Wyllie and Rae both had contempt for the moral impositions of the missionaries. They saw the mission view as unchristian and argued that it undermined Hawaiian culture.

<sup>84</sup> Archives of Hawaii, Foreign Office Letter Book, no. 28E, Vol II, Miscellaneous Internal Correspondence, p. 260: RC Wylie to John Rae, Feb 4, 1861.

<sup>85</sup> Archives of Hawaii, Foreign Office Letter Book, E, Vol. III, no 37, Miscellaneous Internal Correspondence, 182-5: RC Wylie to John Rae, 27 October, 1862.

<sup>86</sup> Jardine, *Outlines* 322.

reasoning which may be applied to other subjects”.<sup>87</sup> Or as we might say in our universities, the final exercise challenges students to apply critical thinking to situations beyond the classroom, looking at causal relations, implications and possible applications for their ideas.

One example of this skill set can be seen early on in Wyllie’s role as Minister of Foreign Affairs. In 1848 Wyllie sought to take what he knew about politics in the Kingdom of Hawaii and apply it to other island nations. Wyllie began to communicate with St Julian, an English trained French immigrant to Australia. Through Wyllie’s office St Julian became King Kamehameha III's commissioner to the independent states and tribes of Polynesia. His charge was to encourage the development of the governments of Polynesia on the constitutional pattern of Hawaii. Ultimately, the goal was to form a confederation under the auspices of the Kingdom of Hawaii. Wyllie’s quest to apply his knowledge from the particulars of Hawaii to Polynesia in general was in line with the training he received from Jardine.<sup>88</sup>

Jardine aimed to develop in his students an “intellectual process of investigation and reasoning of composition and communication, on which the pursuits of science and the active business of life chiefly depend”<sup>89</sup> Wyllie demonstrated the success of Jardine’s pedagogy. The skills he learned under Jardine at the University of Glasgow such as being attentive to details, his strength and precision of memory, and strong and diverse

---

<sup>87</sup> *Ibid.*, 328.

<sup>88</sup> Unfortunately, St. Julian lost interest and backed out of the plan. However, six years after Wyllie’s death, St Julian visited Fiji as a special commissioner of the Hawaiian government to investigate an alliance. He proposed a confederation between Fiji and Hawaii, but the idea was unpopular with the Fijians. In March 1872, St Julian became chief justice and chancellor of the kingdom of Fiji.

<sup>89</sup> Jardine, *Outlines* p.291.

writing skills became Wyllie's defining traits throughout his tenure as Minister of Foreign Affairs for the Kingdom of Hawaii.

Wyllie's work as Minister of Foreign Affairs has had a lasting influence both in the Hawaiian Islands and internationally. The treaties Wyllie brokered with various nations all over the world remain relevant in international politics in the twenty-first century. There has been a strong interest among many native Hawaiians to be recognised as a native people and to have legal standing in the United States equal to that of other native people on the mainland. In 2009, for example, the Akaka Bill went before the House of Representatives and cited Wyllie's international treaties as a means to establish former sovereignty and indigenous status.<sup>90</sup>

More recently, Professor David Keanu Sai from the University of Hawaii is making a case for Hawaiian Sovereignty based in part on the treaties Wyllie helped broker in the nineteenth century. These treaties anchor a historical and international recognition of the Kingdom of Hawaii as an autonomous and sovereign nation. In short, by looking at the division of powers in the governmental structure of the Kingdom of Hawaii and the binding international agreements that were in effect, Dr. Sai argues that Hawaii never relinquished sovereignty to the United States. Hawaii is an occupied country and has been since 1893. Professor Sai's case is currently being heard in front of the United Nations as well as being processed through the American legal system.

Hence, Robert Crichton Wyllie is a solid example of a student who applied the "useful knowledge" that was central to Professor Jardine's educational philosophy.

---

<sup>90</sup> The Akaka Bill failed to pass. Nonetheless, there is a growing sovereignty movement that still looks to the treaties brokered by Wyllie back in the nineteenth century to help support ongoing arguments for Hawaiian autonomy.

Jardine's lasting legacy in America may someday include the contributions of one of his students that may reduce the size of the United States via Hawaiian secession.

George Jardine's literary impact in the United States was not quantitatively large. Including historical and biographical material, he was in 20 American journals and roughly eight books in the 19<sup>th</sup> century which will be detailed in Section II. Fortunately for historians of Scottish Enlightenment, this lack of volume in Jardine's literary production does not mean he had an equally small qualitative contribution in America.



## Chapter 4

### An Applied Biography of Sir William Hamilton

The life of Sir William Hamilton has been given some consideration in the past. John Veitch (1829-1894), chronicles the details of Hamilton's life in his book *Memoir of Sir William Hamilton, Bart*, published in Scotland by Blackwood and Sons in 1869. Hamilton's biography was exported abroad, including the United States. In addition, portions of Veitch's text were serialized in periodicals such as the American journal *The Living Age*.<sup>1</sup> Veitch, an enthusiastic supporter of Hamilton, would go so far as to say that the name of Sir William Hamilton will not be forgotten in the history of philosophy; nonetheless, Hamilton's story has slid into obscurity and outside of a handful of specialists, few today know of him or his work.

One could say that William Hamilton was born to be an academic. His birth took place on 8 March 1788 at the College of Glasgow. His father, Dr. William Hamilton, was a Professor of Medicine and Chair of Anatomy and Botany at Glasgow from 1781 to 1790. He was a descendant of a very old branch of the house of Hamilton and his ancestors were lairds, knights and baronets.<sup>2</sup> The family held estates in Preston,

---

<sup>1</sup> *The Living Age* Vol 0102, Issue 1311 (July 17, 1869), 129-192.

<sup>2</sup> There is some reason to think that Sir William Hamilton and Alexander Hamilton, the American statesman and author of the Federalist papers, were distant relatives. Veitch in his *Memoirs of Sir William Hamilton* states: "They were descended from the family of Hamiltons of Preston, a very ancient branch of Duke Hamilton's family" (6). In Allan McLane Hamilton's book *The Intimate Life of Alexander Hamilton* we are told "The conclusions are that Alexander Hamilton was the son of James Hamilton, who was the fourth son of Alexander Hamilton, Laird of the Grange, in the Parish of Stevenston, Ayrshire, Scotland, and his wife, Elizabeth (eldest daughter of Sir Robert Pollock), who were married in the year 1730. The Hamiltons of Grange belonged to the Cambus- Keith branch of the house of Hamilton, and the founder of this branch, in the fourteenth century, was Walter de Hamilton, who was the common ancestor of the Dukes of

Fingalton and Airdrie. Hamilton's mother was Elizabeth Stirling, so she came from a noble line as well - the Stirlings of Cadder.<sup>3</sup> Despite his prestigious ancestors, it appears that by William Hamilton's day, his family branch was no longer on the high road, but rather living the less opulent life of an academic family.<sup>4</sup>

Nevertheless, Hamilton grew up in an atmosphere that was rich in ideas and invention and his intellectual pedigree is impressive. Since 1742 to the time of his father's death in 1790 there had been a Hamilton in the professorship of medicine at Glasgow.<sup>5</sup> The fact that his father was a professor of medicine in this era at the University of Glasgow placed Hamilton in a community that was at the cutting edge of science and reasoning. At this time, Scottish medical education was highly regarded

---

Hamilton" (8). So, according to Veitch and Allan Hamilton, both men have roots that go back to the Duke of Hamilton and as such are kin.

If this connection holds between the two Hamiltons then there is another interesting link between Sir William Hamilton and another famous American statesman: Abraham Lincoln. It has been argued that there is consanguinity between Alexander Hamilton and Abraham Lincoln (See famouskin.com). A genealogy of the two men can trace back a common ancestor seventeen generations to Edward the First, King of England and Eleanor of Castile; Alexander Hamilton descending down paternally and Lincoln maternally. If these hypotheses prove to be true, Alexander Hamilton and Abraham Lincoln were 17<sup>th</sup> cousins twice removed, and in as much as Sir William Hamilton would fit into Alexander Hamilton's genealogy, there too would be a distant kinship between the famous philosopher and the 16<sup>th</sup> President of the United States.

<sup>3</sup> In Addison's *The Snell Exhibitions 1678 – 1900* there is a more detailed account of the pedigree and political associations of the Hamiltons (p.83).

<sup>4</sup> Andrew L. Drummond and James Bulloch have noted "Hamilton's ancestors, the Hamiltons of Preston in East Lothian, had a minor place in Scottish history. They had consistently backed the wrong horse. For a half a century after 1560 they had been lukewarm towards the Reformation, and they supported the King and Bishop in the time of the Covenant, only to turn Presbyterian under Charles II and come to ruin when the head of the house led the losing cause at Brothwell Bridge in 1679." *The Church in Victorian Scotland 1843 – 1874*. P.277.

<sup>5</sup> *Dictionary of National Biography Vol. VIII*, Hamilton, Sir William (1788 - 1856), 1111. Also according to Addison's *Roll of Graduates of the University of Glasgow* William Hamilton graduated from the University of Glasgow with a BA in 1775 and a MA in 1776,249.

throughout Europe and universally embraced in America. Hamilton's father had studied anatomy under the most eminent scholars of his day: William Cullen, Joseph Black and William Hunter. From London, Hunter wrote Thomas Hamilton (Sir William's grandfather) congratulating him because

Your son [Hamilton's father] has been doing everything you can wish, and from his own behavior has profited more for the time than any young man I ever knew. From being a favorite with everybody, he has commanded every opportunity for improvement that this great town afforded during his stay here; for everybody has been eager to oblige and encourage him. I can depend so much on him, in every way, that if any opportunity should offer serving him, whatever may be in my power I shall consider as doing as a real pleasure to myself.<sup>6</sup>

The Hamilton family supported the University of Glasgow not only intellectually but also financially. Sir William Hamilton's uncle, Robert Hamilton, was a wealthy merchant, so upon his death, he left the bulk of his wealth to the University of Glasgow.

Though Sir William Hamilton's life was framed by the university culture, the direct influence of his father was short-lived. Indeed, Hamilton's father was taken ill at a rather young age: he was just thirty-two years old, and passed away on 13 March 1790.<sup>7</sup> William Hamilton's death came just five days after young Hamilton's second birthday.<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> *The Correspondence of Dr William Hunter*, Ed. Helen Brock; London: Pickering & Chatto Publishers.

<sup>7</sup> Geyer-Kordesch, Johanna and Macdonald Fiona (F. (Eds.)) (1999). *Physicians and Surgeons in Glasgow*. London: Hambledon; 224.

<sup>8</sup> *Dictionary of National Biography Vol. VIII*, Hamilton, William (1758 - 1790), 1107.

After the untimely death of his father, it was up to Hamilton's mother to raise William and his brother Thomas, and see to their education.<sup>9</sup>

### **Hamilton the scholar**

Though his father died young, there was no shortage of intellectual role models for the fatherless Hamilton at Glasgow. Thomas Reid, for instance, was still an icon of the university at this time. The same year as Hamilton's birth Reid published his essay *Active Powers*. According to John Veitch, Reid was a "familiar sight for more than a quarter of a century" at the college quadrangle, and it is there that the young Hamilton first met the famous philosopher.<sup>10</sup> However, Dr. Reid died 7 October 1796, so Hamilton could not have been more than eight years old when they actually met. A year later in 1797, Hamilton was sent to Glasgow grammar school by his mother to attend junior Greek and Latin classes at Glasgow College. In 1801, both William and his brother Thomas were sent to England to further their studies.<sup>11</sup>

While in England, Hamilton would come home to spend his summer months at the manse of Midcalder where he enjoyed swimming and sport. Even after he left the

---

<sup>9</sup> Letters from Hamilton to his mother shows he had a close relationship with her and would confide in her as one might with a close friend. He had lived with his mother in Edinburgh from 1815 to the time of her death in January 1827. From this event Hamilton fell into a depression that lasted for nearly two years, so his literary habits diminished. It was the introduction of another strong woman into his life that lifted the scholar back to his usual habits of study. In March 1829 Hamilton married his cousin, Miss Marshall.

<sup>10</sup> Veitch, John (1869), *Memoirs of Sir William Hamilton* Edinburgh: Blackwood and Sons, 4.

<sup>11</sup> Sir William Hamilton's brother Thomas had a good aptitude for literature as well. Thomas embarked on a military career with the 29<sup>th</sup> regiment. In the battle of Albuera he was shot in the thigh. Captain Hamilton also saw action in the war with the United States and France. (See Veitch's *Memoirs of Sir William Hamilton*). Upon retirement, Thomas Hamilton moved to the Edinburgh area, devoting his efforts to literature. In Mrs. Gordon's *Memoirs of Wilson* it is recalled that Captain Hamilton attended gatherings at John Wilson's house in Edinburgh along with his brother and other literary figures of the day.

manse for university and eventually Oxford, Hamilton would continue to return to Midcalder for long holidays. According to John Veitch Hamilton was remembered “as ‘a wild boy and fond of sport’ – quick tempered, yet warmly affectionate”.<sup>12</sup> These two traits, quick-tempered and warmly affectionate, are manifested in the letters Hamilton writes his mother, as well as in his heated exchanges with academics.

In 1803, at the age of fifteen, Hamilton entered the University of Glasgow as a student. At the university, he enrolled in George Jardine’s Logic and Rhetoric course and studied under James Mylne.<sup>13</sup> Hamilton, not surprisingly, distinguished himself at university. For example, in the 1803/04 session he won a prize for “the best specimens of composition on various subjects of Reasoning and Taste, prescribed and executed during the course of the present session, and for distinguished eminence and proficiency in the whole business of the class”.<sup>14</sup> John Sommers who was the Minister of Midcalder, was “entrusted with the superintendence of his education, both before and after he commenced his academical career in the University of Glasgow”.<sup>15</sup> Sommers recalled Hamilton’s academic strengths: “I could not fail to discover striking marks of an acute and vigorous understanding.” Having proven himself at the University of Glasgow, Sir William Hamilton left the institution and his name does not appear in Addison’s *Roll of Graduates of the University of Glasgow*.<sup>16</sup> However, like his father, grandfather and

---

<sup>12</sup> Veitch, *Memoirs of Sir William Hamilton*, 17.

<sup>13</sup> Hamilton would later acknowledge his great respect for Jardine in his lectures. Veitch, 339.

<sup>14</sup> Addison, W.I. (1902). *Prize lists of the University of Glasgow From session 1777/78 to session 1832/33*. Glasgow: Carter and Pratt, 103.

<sup>15</sup> Veitch, 22.

<sup>16</sup> During his college years Hamilton developed a passion for literature, and had begun to collect books. According to Veitch, Hamilton’s collection would grow into one of the best private libraries in Britain. See *Memoir of Sir William Hamilton*, 23-25.

uncle before him, Hamilton set out to study medicine, so by the winter of 1807, he was at the University of Edinburgh. The strong academic reputation Hamilton earned in his early years in the Scottish universities opened the door for further academic opportunities. Therefore, in the same year, 1807, he was awarded a Snell Exhibition to Oxford.<sup>17</sup>

At Balliol, Hamilton continued to display extraordinary rigor in his studies. The classical focus of the English system provided ample material for Hamilton's academic interests. However, the pedagogical approach of the Oxford colleges left much to be desired. Nonetheless Hamilton excelled. Writing to his mother, 13 May 1807, Hamilton states that he finds all his lectures "very easy to prepare, thanks to my studying Greek so hard in Scotland for these three years".<sup>18</sup>

During examinations at Oxford, Hamilton submitted himself to nearly four times the amount of texts as any other student at the university.<sup>19</sup> Reverend Richard Jenkyns, Master of Balliol College Oxford, assessed Hamilton's accomplishments stating, "Of this he gave the strongest proof in his public examination for his degree, when he was prepared in a *much greater* number of abstruse and difficult books than the usual case, and, by his knowledge of them, obtained the highest distinction the examiners could bestow."<sup>20</sup> He was awarded a first-class in *literae humaniores* and the *Matriculation*

---

<sup>17</sup>Addison, *The Snell Exhibitions 1678 -1900*, 83.

<sup>18</sup> Quoted in Vietch, 29.

<sup>19</sup> *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* Vol. 24, 938.

<sup>20</sup> Oxford, 28 April 1820.

*Albums of the University of Glasgow 1728 – 1858* lists Hamilton as receiving a BA Oxon. 1811 and a Masters Degree in 1814.<sup>21</sup>

Though Hamilton distinguished himself and received a first class degree, he was not elected to an Oxford fellowship. At this time, Oxford had more fellowships than they had qualified prospects, so not electing one of their brightest stars certainly raises some questions. Was Hamilton's denial a blatant expression of an anti-Scottish sentiment at Oxford, or were there other reasons? Hamilton has been described as being "aggressive and opinionated in discussion," and had "less of a literary flair than some of his contemporaries".<sup>22</sup> Perhaps that was enough to sway the votes, but for whatever reason, Hamilton was not elected to a fellowship; therefore, he left Oxford for Edinburgh.

### **Hamilton search of a career**

Hamilton had now studied medicine, the classics and humanities. Clearly, he had diverse interests, but his passion was for classical literature and philosophy. Even though Hamilton came from a family of physicians and he had worked in the medical field while at Oxford with the intention to follow in the steps of his father, Hamilton changes his course altogether by deciding to pursue a career in law. In 1813 Hamilton was admitted as an advocate at the Edinburgh bar.

Law was perhaps an odd career choice for Hamilton as it seems he did not have a passion for the practice of law, and he was not a particularly good public speaker.

Perhaps law also seemed a distant second choice because Hamilton had been denied at Oxford. Whatever the reasons for his choice, Hamilton's practice was not overly

---

<sup>21</sup> Addison, W.I. (1913). *Matriculation Albums of the University of Glasgow 1728 – 1858*, Glasgow: J. Maclehose, 194.

<sup>22</sup> *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Vol 24; 938.

successful. One of his biggest stumbling blocks was his politics – Hamilton was a Whig in an era of Tory domination. Though Hamilton was firm in his political opinion as a progressive, he was not an activist nor even very public in his support of the Whig party. Despite his politics, Hamilton did however, win one decisive legal battle on his own behalf before leaving the legal trade. He successfully argued that he “served heir-male in general to Sir Robert, second baronet of Preston”.<sup>23</sup> This victory gave him a title; he was now Sir William Hamilton of Preston and Fingalton.

During the course of his legal career Hamilton had the opportunity to go to Germany. He went first, in 1817, on behalf of the Faculty of Advocates, and then again three years later he would return on legal business. It is from these voyages that the seeds of his future contributions in philosophy were sown. After his trips, Sir William Hamilton learned to read German, and joined an Edinburgh society that subscribed to German periodicals. His growing interest in philosophy and literature distracted Hamilton from his already waning interest in law.

Although Hamilton was not gaining momentum as a lawyer, he was becoming known in the literary circles of Edinburgh. But even in these literary circles, Hamilton was not in step with the leading social forces. He was gaining recognition, but Hamilton did not have a connection to Francis Jeffrey and the Whig-supporting *Edinburgh Review* at this time, most likely because Hamilton had a somewhat awkward, antiquarian style. Nonetheless, Hamilton had become friends with many of the leading literary figures in Edinburgh. In 1817, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* began its publication. It was a

---

<sup>23</sup> Gardner, Alexander (1885). *Selections of the Family Papers Preserved at Caldwell, Part II Vol. II*. Paisley: Edinburgh, 202.

Tory leaning magazine with an edge. Some of the articles were biting criticisms, aimed at an assortment of literature and authors, and it appears that Hamilton had a behind-the-scenes participation in one of the articles. We are told by Mrs. Gordon in her *Memoir of John Wilson* that Sir William Hamilton “exercised his wit in writing a verse, and was so amused with his own performance he tumbled off his chair in a fit of laughter”.<sup>24</sup> Indeed, Hamilton was a close friend of John Wilson and met with many of the literary folk of Edinburgh at Wilson’s house. Wilson’s daughter described the circle thusly: “Many were the pleasant reunions that took place under Professor Wilson’s roof, there might be seen together Lockhart, Hogg, Galt, Sir William Hamilton, his brother, Captain Thomas Hamilton, Sir Adam Ferguson, Sir Henry Raeburn, Mr. Allen, and Watson Gordon”.<sup>25</sup> Of course, at this time Professor Wilson was not yet a professor, but the turn of events that would lead to his post would pit him against his new friend, Sir William Hamilton.

In 1820 the Professor of Moral Philosophy, Thomas Brown, passed away. During this time, the town council was responsible for deciding academic posts for the University of Edinburgh, so political affiliations were taken into consideration. In terms of preparation and passion, Hamilton was the best candidate for the vacant post. The magistrates of Edinburgh received several letters of recommendation from Balliol College where Hamilton took his degrees while on the Snell Exhibition. These testimonials included references from the Master of Balliol College Richard Jenkyns,

---

<sup>24</sup> Gordon, M. (1862). *Memoir of Wilson Vol. 1*. Oxford: Oxford University, 300.

<sup>25</sup> John Wilson and Hamilton were both called to the Bar around the same time (Gordon, 185). They both were University of Glasgow trained and both went on to study at Oxford. Both men had strong literary abilities and a disinterest in a legal career. The article on the *Chaldee Manuscript* was crafted at Wilson’s mother’s house at 53 Queen Street. (Gordon, M (1862). *Memoir of Wilson Volume 1*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 249).

William Villers A.M. of Balliol College, and Librarian Alexander Nicoll. Other letters from Oxford included James Yonge, who was a fellow at Exeter College, and Edward Hawkins a fellow and tutor at Oriel College. All the Oxford scholars praised Hamilton for the depth and breadth of his studies while at that university. This universal appraisal is well-captured in the words of William Villers from his letter to the magistrates 1820: “besides the honors of the university, he [Hamilton] received the thanks and public acknowledgement of the Examiners, that he had never been surpassed either in the *minute* or the *comprehensive* knowledge of the systems on which he had been examined.”<sup>26</sup>

With such strong support from Oxford, not to mention the support of some eminent Scots, like Dugald Stewart, Francis Jeffrey and James Wedderburn,<sup>27</sup> one would think Hamilton was easily elected to the Chair of Moral Philosophy. However, he was running against his close friend, John Wilson. Wilson was a tall, athletic man who was a constant visitor in the home of George Jardine. Both Wilson and Hamilton had attended Glasgow University and took many of the same courses from the same professors. Wilson, however, was primarily known as a writer and a poet, as opposed to a scholar. On 25 April 1820, Wilson made a special trip to Glasgow to solicit support from his former professors at University.<sup>28</sup> He received letters of reference from Mylne, Young, Jardine, Davidson and Principal Taylor. Wilson went to Oxford as well where he attended Magdalen College. Like Hamilton, Wilson received several testimonials on his

---

<sup>26</sup> So it seems that Oxford would not elect Hamilton as a fellow, but could give him strong support for the position at the University of Edinburgh.

<sup>27</sup> James Wedderburn was his Majesty’s Solicitor General and a relative of Sir William Hamilton.

<sup>28</sup> MS 30969; Blackwood writes 26 April 1820, “John Wilson went to Glasgow yesterday in order to see Professors Jardine, Young & from them has received helpful testimonies”, 10.

behalf from that institution as well. Though all his letters were favorable, they emphasized Wilson's literary ability as opposed to his philosophical depth.

Though the scale would seem to be tipped in favor of Hamilton, in the end Wilson ultimately had the requisite politics for the job, and in the final tally Wilson was appointed Professor of Moral Philosophy at the University of Edinburgh. Most biographies on Hamilton such as Chambers and the *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* claim that Hamilton lost to Wilson based almost purely on political considerations. This claim has merit since Hamilton was a Whig in a time of Tory power and might have been enough to keep him out of the university.<sup>29</sup>

Politics were indeed a part of a candidate's identity. Blackwood's view of the candidates was cast in terms of political affiliation. This characterization makes sense as *Blackwood's Magazine* was firmly in the Tory camp. In a letter to Crocker, 17 April 1820 Blackwood states, "He [Hamilton] has pushed forward with all of the usual noise and clamour of his party".<sup>30</sup> Hamilton's attempt at the chair was seen as a political move

---

<sup>29</sup> This is a bit of conjecture on my part. Where it seems clear politics played a big role in the appointments in Scottish universities, there may be other reasons for the magistrates and town council's decision. One reason could be that Edinburgh had a high literary reputation. Hamilton, at this time, had not published while Wilson, was a known literary contributor. A more favorable account of Wilson's appointment to the university is given by his daughter in *Memoir of Wilson*.

Also, it is fairly well known that Scottish academics were not overly impressed with the English system of education. The English stressed the classical texts and had a lackluster tutorial approach-- a criticism which Jardine makes in his *Outlines*. As such, perhaps another possible reason for Hamilton's defeat to Wilson for the Chair of Moral Philosophy was rooted in Wilson's strong support from Scottish academics of the University of Glasgow. Perhaps Hamilton was a star in what was considered an inferior program and the glowing letters from that institution did not carry the same weight as those letters from the more progressive professors from Glasgow. Perhaps then, through a Scottish lens of "useful knowledge," Hamilton was not the strongest candidate for the post after all, and obviously, his political views certainly did not help his cause.

<sup>30</sup> MS 30969; National Library of Scotland, 4.

from the Whigs. Indeed Blackwood's correspondence in April and May 1820, consistently addressed the politics of the professorship in worrisome tones from Paris. Innes Kennedy described the event thusly: "The contest was of course a political fix, as everyone knew, and it consigned Sir William Hamilton to the margins for years afterwards. The Scotsman covered the contest simultaneously with the notorious trials of Baird, Hardie, and Wilson, and declared it the worst abuse of patronage since Caligula appointed his horse as a Proconsul".<sup>31</sup>

Politics or not, this was now the second academic loss for Hamilton, the first occurring when he was overlooked for a fellowship at Oxford. Even though Hamilton was the strongest candidate for the post, he was denied on what we might call extra-curricular grounds. As something of a consolation, Hamilton was conferred an academic post the next year.

From 1821 to 1836, Hamilton served as Professor of Civil History at the University of Edinburgh. Alexander Grant gives us a description of Hamilton in his first academic post: "His great learning qualified him to make the teaching of his subject solid and profound, and he entered upon his duties with ardour; but his success was very limited."<sup>32</sup> The circumstances of his post, interestingly enough, were somewhat different from the other faculty positions because Hamilton received a mere £100 a year for his efforts. The class attendance started out strong, with Hamilton serving about thirty students, but it soon lost momentum. In 1824, Hamilton tried to attach his history course

---

<sup>31</sup> Kennedy, Innes (2006), "The Solution of the Enigma of the Universe: J.F. Ferrier on Heraclitus". *International Review of Scottish Studies*, Volume 31,71.

<sup>32</sup> Quoted in Veitch's *Memoir of Sir William Hamilton* 369. Grant also was editor on the memoir.

to graduation requirements in an effort to protect his chair. However, he received little support from the Arts faculty and in 1833 the city went bankrupt. The fallout of this insolvency was that Hamilton's salary was forfeited and he gave up his history lectures.

Hamilton then turned his attention to a growing phenomenon of scientific study in Europe--phrenology. In the early part of the century, Franz Joseph Gall introduced a method to determine the personality and development of mental and moral faculties on the basis of the external shape of the skull; he called it craniology. Gall's assistant, Johann Gaspard Spurzheim, became the chief proponent of craniology and travelled throughout Europe popularizing the methodology as phrenology. In 1816 Spurzheim travelled to Edinburgh giving lectures on the subject. There he met George Combe, a University of Edinburgh lawyer who became deeply impressed with Spurzheim and phrenology. Combe attended lectures with Spurzheim and became Edinburgh's leading proponent of the new science. By 1820 Combe began to lecture and publish on phrenology. In 1823 he founded the *Phrenology Journal* and in 1824 *The Elements of Phrenology* as well as starting the Edinburgh Phrenology Society.<sup>33</sup>

Hamilton disdained phrenology and in his fiery manner that later typified his academic controversies, set out to demolish the new science. In December 1825 and February 1826, Hamilton read papers before the Royal Society of Edinburgh on the "Practical Conclusions from Gall's Theory Regarding the Functions of the Brain". Hamilton concluded that phrenology was decidedly not a science. A report on Hamilton's paper in the Tory *Gentleman's Magazine* of January 1826 took the position that Hamilton "has showed that [phrenology's] doctrines lead inevitably to Fatalism, Materialism, and

---

<sup>33</sup> See Walsh, Anthony A. (1971). "George Combe, a portrait of a heretofore generally unknown behaviorist," *Journal of the Behavioral Sciences* 7, 269-278.

Atheism; and, in fact, reduce man to a mere state of moral brutalism."<sup>34</sup> Hamilton's closest followers may have declared a victory but others were not so sure. In 1826, William Hunter and James Duncan published *Sir William Hamilton and phrenology; an exposition of phrenology; shewing the complete inefficacy of the objections lately advanced in the Royal Society, and the real grounds on which the system ought to be assailed*. The public debates on the topic continued and Hamilton exchanged correspondence with both Spurzheim and Combe where they often criticized Hamilton for his temper.<sup>35</sup> These letters were published in 1828 in the *Phrenology Journal* and the *Caledonia Mercury*.<sup>36</sup>

Also, while in the middle years of serving as Chair of Civil History, Hamilton was introduced to Thomas Carlyle. As the notable Carlyle recalls, they met in 1824 or 1825. He described Hamilton as having "bright affable manners," "radiant with frank kindness, honest humility, and an intelligence ready to help."<sup>37</sup> On 27 January 1833 Carlyle writes his mother, Margaret A. Carlyle, from Edinburgh stating, "The best man I see here, indeed the only man I care much about is Sir William Hamilton; in whom alone of all these people I find an earnest soul, an openness for truth: I really think him a

---

<sup>34</sup> *Gentleman's Magazine*, "Domestic Occurrences: Intelligence from Various Parts of the Country", c.1 v.139 1826, 77.

<sup>35</sup> See *The Phrenological Journal and Miscellany, Volume 7*, Article III. "Cruelty To Animals Sir William Hamilton's Experiments" 427-433.

<sup>36</sup> Also see Hamilton's 1831 attacks on phrenology: *An account of experiments on the weight and relative proportions of the brain, cerebellum, and tuber annulare, in man and animals, under the various circumstances of age, sex, country, etc,' prefix to Alexander Monro, The Anatomy of the Brain, with Some Observations on its Functions*, Edinburgh; 4-8.

"Researches on the Frontal Sinuses, with Observations on their bearings on the dogmas of Phrenology", *Med Times*, 12 (1845): 159, 177, 371.

"Remarks on Dr. Morton's Tables on the Size of the Brain", *Edinburgh New Philosophical Journal*, 48, 1850, pp. 330-3.

<sup>37</sup> Mu 56-a.13, 1869; Scottish Biographies, Carlyle on Sir William Hamilton.

genuine kind of man. His learning is great; his talent considerable; we have long talks and walks together”.<sup>38</sup> Hamilton, for his part, seemed also to admire Carlyle’s talent. In an article on Thomas Carlyle in the American journal *The Living Age*, it is recalled that Sir William Hamilton set down to read Carlyle’s *History of the French Revolution* one afternoon at three o’clock, and he became so enthralled in the book that he read for thirteen hours straight finally putting the book down at four in the morning.<sup>39</sup> Carlyle who ultimately became critical of Scottish philosophy nevertheless kept Hamilton in high regards.<sup>40</sup>

---

<sup>38</sup> Carlyle, Thomas and Carlyle, Jane Welsh (1970). *The Collected Letters of Thomas and Jane Welsh Carlyle Vol 16, January - July 1843*. USA: Duke University Press. 6:311 and 6: 318; 387.

<sup>39</sup> Thomas Carlyle, *The Living Age* Volume 0009 Issue 110 (June 20, 1846) / Volume 9, Issue: 110, June 20, 1846, 585-593.

<sup>40</sup> In his essay *Signs of the Times* Carlyle criticizes Scottish philosophy as being permeated with utilitarianism. However, in distinction, Hamilton’s ideas were laced with a more Kantian tone. For example, in his educational philosophy, Hamilton reconfigures Kant’s categorical imperative into an educational imperative where the student has intrinsic value. So, perhaps Carlyle found Hamilton’s philosophy more to his liking. Here are a few more excerpts from Carlyle’s correspondence directed at Sir William Hamilton:

- “Thomas Carlyle on Sir Wm. Hamilton” May 15 1869 – Mu56-a.13  
Travelled to London together in April 1833 and “I think we never met again”....
- From London Carlyle to Hamilton 8 July 1834: “Literature seems to be dying of a thin diet and flatulence, but it is not quite so near dead as I had calculated. In all human things there is the strangest vitality.” Mu56-a.13.
- In Carlyle’s journal he states that “Sir W. Hamilton the one that approaches nearest to being earnest: he, too, does not obtain earnestness, and his faculty is not of the instructive kind.” (CL 327).
- On 10 February 1833 from Edinburgh to his brother John Carlyle he writes again: “Sir W. Hamilton is almost the only earnest character I find in this city; we take somewhat to each other; meet sometimes, with mutual satisfaction, always with good will. (CL 318).
- Reiterates the point in passing to his brother on 29 March 1833: “ Sir W. Hamilton I like best of any; but see little of him.” (cl 362).
- Carlyle to Macvey Napier 27 January 1830: “Sir W. Hamilton’s paper gave proof to much metaphysical reading: but I dare say your readers would complain of unintelligibility and so forth; indeed it is full of subtle schoolman logic, and on a

The approval of Carlyle aside, by 1828 Hamilton was the chair of a dying department. He was approaching his fortieth birthday, and had not yet published anything of significance.<sup>41</sup> Hamilton's literary reluctance had been noticed several years earlier when he was an applicant for the Moral Philosophy Chair. John Sommers noted, "I am fully aware that it has been objected to his literary pretensions at this time that he has not yet, by becoming an author, given the public or the electors any means of deciding his merit".<sup>42</sup> Professor John Veitch attributes Hamilton's lack of production to his exceedingly high standards: "Hamilton was never inclined to composition, and his ideal of literary work was so high as to repress his effort at completion".<sup>43</sup> It was perhaps his lack of literary achievement at this time and/or Hamilton's waning enthusiasm for the history course that fostered such lack-lust support in defense of his chair from the faculty, but change was in the air.

In 1829, Hamilton married his cousin, Miss Marshall, who had lived with him and his mother prior to his mother's death in 1827. Almost at once, Lady Hamilton gave focus to his literary and philosophical work, pushing him to the task at hand and keeping him from getting sidetracked.<sup>44</sup> Another significant event which occurred that year was the appointment of Macvey Napier as editor of the *Edinburgh Review*. Napier believed that Hamilton had a keen mind, and more importantly, Napier had the patience to deal with Hamilton's irregularities as a contributor. These factors led to Hamilton's first

---

subject difficult above all others to discuss for English minds." *The Collected Letters of Thomas and Jane Welsh Carlyle Durham*, Duke University Press, 1970. 5: 64).

<sup>41</sup> See Special Collections BC5-a.22 Glasgow University Library.

<sup>42</sup> Rev. John Sommers DD Minister of Midcalder, 3 June 1820.

<sup>43</sup> Veitch, John (1883). *Sir William Hamilton: the Man and His Philosophy*. Edinburgh: William Blackwood and sons.

<sup>44</sup> Veitch 21.

contribution to the *Edinburgh Review*: “The Writings of Cousin, and Philosophy of the Unconditioned” (1829), a publication that would launch his reputation in philosophy. But Hamilton was not just establishing his own reputation in philosophy; his work had, as George Davie put it, “suddenly restored Scotland’s intellectual reputation on the continent”.<sup>45</sup> Hamilton had hit his stride. Thomas Carlyle wrote in a memorial of Hamilton in May 1869, “everyone seemed to speak of him with favour, those of his immediate acquaintance uniformly with affectionate respect.”<sup>46</sup> By April 1836 Hamilton had his eye on another academic post at the University of Edinburgh – the Chair of Logic and Metaphysics. One might think that the same negativity that surrounded Hamilton as Chair of Civil History would carry over and affect his bid for the chair of Logic and Metaphysics. However, the positive changes in Hamilton’s life that began in 1829 apparently out-weighed the slow start he had manifested at the university.

Through Hamilton’s association with Napier he was able to publish fourteen articles in the *Edinburgh Review*. Many of these topics were central to the position of Chair of Logic and Metaphysics. For example, articles such as “The Philosophy of Perception” in 1830, and an article on logic in 1833, lent credibility to Hamilton’s application. In addition, he received letters of support from notable men of letters in France and Germany. Indeed, scholars around Europe were recognising his abilities and potential.

Another consideration was that the competition in this endeavor was not as steep as his 1820 contest with Wilson. For example, Hamilton’s nemesis in the phrenology

---

<sup>45</sup>Davie, George (2000), *The Democratic Intellect*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 273.

<sup>46</sup> See Special Collections MU 56-a.1, Glasgow University Library.

debate, George Combe, was hoping for the position.<sup>47</sup> Also William Spalding, an advocate, had entered his name into the race. However, Spalding did not have the literary reputation of Wilson, nor could he match the rising tide of philosophical contributions that Hamilton was making. Francis Jeffrey told Spalding as much in a letter of 23 May 1836: “But at present, and with regard to the place which is now vacant, I am bound to say, that the more mature age and singular attainments of Sir William Hamilton would determine me, if I had any influence, to give him preference.” Another candidate sought the post as well: Isaac Taylor who fared better than his skills warranted. Though Hamilton had the additional support of Cousin, Angrand, Professor Brandis, Horner, Henry, Alison, Napier, Moir, Sinclair, Williams and Professor John Wilson, his election was neither easy, nor a landslide. John Veitch described this contest as having “a considerable amount of trouble dealing with prejudices and obfuscations”. However, Hamilton beat Taylor by four votes, finally obtaining the academic post he desired. His victory was also a symbolic victory over the phrenologist, and added to Hamilton’s credibility as an intellectual because now he had become Chair of Metaphysics and Logic at the University of Edinburgh.

### **Chair of Metaphysics and Logic at the University of Edinburgh**

Hamilton secured the post at the university, and coupled with his publications, he was establishing himself as a leader of an intellectual revival both in Edinburgh and at the university there. George Davie gives us this description: “Edinburgh, in the decade after Walter Scott’s death, was thus far from sinking into provincial dullness. Thanks to Sir William Hamilton’s stimulus, there was ‘a re-enthronement in the world of speculation of

---

<sup>47</sup> Despite Hamilton’s misgivings, George Combe’s reputation was on the rise, and eventually his book on phrenology out sold Darwin’s books in America.

the good god difficulty”.<sup>48</sup> Again from Davie: “Hamilton’s circle was a seed-bed of cultural resurgence, and accounts are unanimous as to the atmosphere of intellectual excitement he shed around him”.<sup>49</sup>

In his new post and in contrast to his position as Chair of Civil History, Hamilton infused his lectures with the erudition of which he was becoming famous. As Laurie writes in his 1902 account of Scottish Philosophy: “In depth , if not in breadth, the influence which he exercised on his students – or at least on those who had any inclination or ability for speculative studies – was unequalled by that of any other academic teacher of philosophy who has appeared in Great Britain.”<sup>50</sup> Henry Laurie’s account states that Hamilton’s influence on his students was so overpowering that it was to “prevent the free development of their thought”.<sup>51</sup> Even those who opposed him politically recognised Hamilton’s classroom skills. In an anti-Whig article critical of John Veitch’s biographical sketch of Hamilton, and indeed posthumously critical of Hamilton himself, the author quotes an unnamed source reflecting on Hamilton’s affect on his students:

Such teaching naturally produced in the pupil the most vigorous and intense intellectual activity. A desire to pursue the new paths seized him with the force of a passion; and no effort that contributed to this end seemed wearisome. Books that might fairly be considered hard and dry, flavoured by the appetite brought were read with avidity and positive enjoyment. Preparation for the class examination seemed scarcely an

---

<sup>48</sup> Davie, 276.

<sup>49</sup> *Ibid.*, 261.

<sup>50</sup> Laurie, Henry (1902). *Scottish Philosophy In Its National Development*, Glasgow: James Maclehose and Sons. 253.

<sup>51</sup> *Ibid.*

effort. Conscious of new powers he delighted in their exercise; and learning the use of new weapons, it became a pleasure to test their value, and at the same time increase his own skill by constant practice. This naturally showed itself in a tendency to theorise and debate. He rapidly generalized the objects of his knowledge, gathered all new facts into principles, worked out provisional solutions of the problems that crossed his path, and most likely involved his friends and companions in perpetual discussions. Any outlet in fact, for the superfluous energy was welcome. It might perhaps be thought that devotion to metaphysical pursuits would estrange one from the healthy activities of life, and the self-introspection induced naturally creates a morbid state of mind. Not in the least. On the contrary, the vigorous exercise of the intellect produced a sympathetic activity through the whole of nature. All life became more brilliant, mysterious and intense. Even physical exertion acquired a new zest and relish.<sup>52</sup>

Hamilton was something of a renaissance man in his day. He was scholarly but also athletic. Like his friend John Wilson, Hamilton had a reputation as a runner and a swimmer and his instruction in philosophy often pointed students beyond the classroom. Hamilton's lecturing style reflected his athletic and competitive nature. Writing for the London-based *Cornhill Magazine*, Eneas Sweetland Dallas recalled that Hamilton encouraged the students to enter into "a regular tussle with his master about the action of the mind in sleep, and in a state of semi-consciousness".<sup>53</sup>

In James Veitch's account of Hamilton's life, he states that from "1836 until his death in May of 1856, at the age of 68, there is little record".<sup>54</sup> With that said we do,

---

<sup>52</sup> Glasgow University Library Special Collections: MU56-a.13.

<sup>53</sup> Dallas, E. (1883), *Cornhill Magazine*.

<sup>54</sup> Veitch, 25.

however, know something of Hamilton's life during this time period from various literary sources. We do know that in 1840 Hamilton received an honorary Doctorate of Divinity from Leyden University in the Netherlands.<sup>55</sup> Hamilton often received distinguished visitors from abroad and carried on correspondence with intellectual leaders from Europe and America. As an example of his international recognition, Hamilton was made honorary member of the Georgia Historical Society in October 1843.

He was in correspondence with many leading men of letters, including Victor Cousin, and Hamilton received a letter of introduction from Thomas Carlyle on behalf of Signor Ruffini, an Italian exile seeking an opportunity to teach Italian in Edinburgh.

Unfortunately, in 1842 Hamilton's brother Thomas suffered a stroke while travelling in Italy. After a short recovery, Thomas Hamilton passed away in Pisa. In addition to being Sir William's brother, Thomas Hamilton had been a part of Hamilton's circle of literary friends, so his brother's passing weighed on Sir William Hamilton's heart and mind.

### **In poor health**

By 1844, Hamilton fell ill with hemiplegia, which is basically a stroke that resulted in Hamilton experiencing ongoing health issues, including some paralysis.<sup>56</sup> With his failing health and his brother's death still heavy on his heart, Hamilton nonetheless continued his academic pursuits, and often contentious public debates.

---

<sup>55</sup> Addison, *Matriculation Album*.

<sup>56</sup>As an example in a letter of 12 October 1846, De Morgan replied to Hamilton, stating that he was previously unaware of Hamilton's health problems. (Hamilton, Sir William (1847), *A Letter to Augustus De Morgan, Esq. of Trinity College, Cambridge, Professor of Mathematics in University College, London on His Claim To an Independent Re-Discovery Of a New Principle in the Theory of Syllogism. From Sir William Hamilton, BART.* Longman, Brown, Green, and Longmans; MacLachlan, Stewart.)

We know that from September 1846 to May 1847, Hamilton had a rather heated exchange with Augustus De Morgan concerning some of De Morgan's claims about the syllogism.<sup>57</sup> Hamilton's chief problem with De Morgan was that De Morgan had published a claim that he made an original contribution to syllogistic logic. The principle that De Morgan advanced as his own, however, had been taught for years in Hamilton's course at the University of Edinburgh. Hamilton expressed his disagreement with De Morgan as follows:

But what is the claim, you maintain, and which I dispute? – It regards the principle of Syllogistic, afforded by quantification – the expressed quantity – of the predicate; (that of the subject, as old, and as common-place, and, to our point irrelevant, should be omitted). Now, it is not disputed, that the doctrine, founded on this principle, has, for many years been taught by me, at the University of Edinburgh. You, therefore, limiting your claim to a *personal originality* maintain: - *that, after, having finished a paper, (dated 3 Oct. ult.) for the Cambridge Philosophical Society, "On the Structure of the Syllogism" in conformity with the old exclusive theory of quantity; you thought and wrote out a second view of his Syllogism, founded on the new and non-exclusive principle of quantified predicate, and this before, receiving my answer (dated 7 Oct.) to your first letter to me (dated 30 December, erroneously for September) which thus written previously to your discovery [37,1,2] – On the contrary, I maintain: that this assertion is gratuitous, - opposed to all presumptions, - probability, - and proof; that your second*

---

<sup>57</sup> Augustus De Morgan was a professor of Mathematics in University College, London. De Morgan is best remembered now for his logic theorem that carries his name. In short, his theorem states a negation of the quantity of a conjunction is logically equivalent to the negation of the constituents in a disjunction. The theorem also works from disjunctions to conjunctions by the same principle.

*view is borrowed from me, and was not apprehended by you, previously to last November, nor until after the document containing had, at least, been for nearly a fortnight in your hands. (Italics are in the original text.)*<sup>58</sup>

This passage not only highlights the problem Hamilton had with De Morgan, but also shows one of Hamilton's more infamous qualities - his fiery temperament, especially when he was engaged in an argument.<sup>59</sup> Hamilton realized that he had not formally published his ideas, but he was adamant that it was public knowledge that he had discovered the principle in question and that his ideas had been published informally through lecture notes and the like. As for De Morgan, he seemed to take Hamilton's onslaught in stride.<sup>60</sup>

Hamilton's controversy with De Morgan was not his only public battle at this time. Hamilton was also something of a Luther scholar, and had produced essays on the subject. In 1847 his views on Martin Luther were criticized by Julius Charles Hare, who was a self-appointed defender of Luther. Hare had similar disagreements going with many other scholars such as Bossuet, Hallman, Newman and Ward. Hare collected his replies and published them in a book called *Vindication of Luther*. Sir William Hamilton not only found Hare's criticism of his work inadequate, but also thought Hallman and others were not adequately answered. However, there was not a universal consensus that Hamilton was right. For instance, in April 1856, just days before Hamilton passed away,

---

<sup>58</sup> Hamilton, Sir William (1847). *A letter to Augustus De Morgan, Esq.: on his claim to an independent re- discovery of a new principle in the theory of syllogism*. London and Edinburgh: Longman, Brown, Green and Longmans, 3.

<sup>59</sup> See Jessop, R. (2008) *The logic of Sir William Hamilton: tunnelling through sand to place the keystone in the Aristotelic Arch*. In: Gabbay, D.M. and Woods, J. (eds.) *British Logic in the Nineteenth Century. Handbook of the History of Logic 4*, Elsevier; 93-163.

<sup>60</sup> See Augustus De Morgan, *On the Syllogism, and Other Writings*, ed. Peter Heath. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1966, xvii – xviii.

*The Methodist Quarterly Review* ran an essay praising Hare's solid defeat of Sir William's labourious work. This response isn't surprising because many readers found Hamilton's literary style burdensome and suggestive of antiquated drollery. Nonetheless, Hamilton could also present his thoughts in a simple and straightforward manner as well. For instance, in his correspondence with others on social matters he was terse and eloquent.<sup>61</sup> Some of Hamilton's American followers thought his writings were not only clear but even a bench-mark in literature. For example, in *Harper's New Monthly Magazine*, an editor's review of *Christianity and Greek Philosophy* by a Professor Crocker gave compliments on the clarity of Crocker's writing and compared the author to the literary talents of Sir William Hamilton.<sup>62</sup>

Hamilton, however, was not always contentious in his public debates with worthy adversaries. In 1854, Henry Calderwood, Professor of Moral Philosophy at the University of Edinburgh, published a book, *The Philosophy of the Infinite; with special reference to the theories of Sir William Hamilton and M. Cousin* where he took on Hamilton's notion of the infinite and the absolute. In this case, although Hamilton disagreed with many of Calderwood's observations and objections, Hamilton's reply was polite. He answered Calderwood in a letter with itemized responses to key objections. The tone was much more collegial than Hamilton's earlier responses to De Morgan or Julius Charles Hare.<sup>63</sup> It is interesting to note that towards the end of his life, Sir William Hamilton was no longer the undisputed king of erudition. Academics and scholars were

---

<sup>61</sup> For an example see Hamilton's bereavement note to Francis Michel, National Library of Scotland, Acc 11313, or notes to De Quincy Ms.21239, 16 - 45. Also NLS Ms 6181, 333 is a fine example of clear business-like writing from Hamilton.

<sup>62</sup> Editor's Literary Record, *Harper's New Monthly Magazine* Volume 0041 Issue 243 (August 1870) / Volume 41, Issue: 243, August 1870, 458-464.

<sup>63</sup> ACC 6758 National Library of Scotland.

beginning to find fault with his reasoning and conclusions. The disagreements and criticisms of De Morgan, Hare, and Calderwood and *The Methodist Quarterly Review* was a preview during Hamilton's life for what was to come after his death.

Since 1844 the formerly athletic Hamilton had suffered the lingering effects of his stroke, and on 6 May 1856 his health issues finally caught up with him. Hamilton died in his house at 16 Great King Street, Edinburgh. He was buried in one of the vaults of St. John's Chapel in Edinburgh.<sup>64</sup> Though he had been embroiled in several contentious debates, Hamilton's home life had been warm and loving. At the time of his death he had many friends, a loving family and a solid following of devoted students. Word of his passing was international news with obituaries appearing in Scotland, England, the continent of Europe and America. One of the Europe's most famous scholars was gone.

The most devastating blow to Hamilton's literary reputation came posthumously in the form of John Stuart Mill's book *An Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy*. Mill seemed to exercise the same lack of restraint in his attacks of the late philosopher as Hamilton did on many of his opponents in life. But Mill's attack on Hamilton was not just an attack on his person; it was an attack on the institution of thought that Hamilton represented. As Mill himself states in the first lines of chapter one, "Among the philosophical writers of this present century in these islands, no one occupies a higher position than Sir William Hamilton",<sup>65</sup> Therefore, the successful demolition of Hamilton would undercut those devoted followers of the philosopher such as Henry Longueville Mansel. Mansel was a student of Hamilton and had become

---

<sup>64</sup> Addison, *The Snell Exhibitions 1678 – 1900*, 86.

<sup>65</sup> Mill, John Stewart (1865) *An Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy*, London : Longman, Green, Longman, Roberts & Green.

Professor of Moral Philosophy at Oxford. Mansel's work such as "Limits of Religious Thought" struck Mill as "detestable" and "loathsome".<sup>66</sup> A fellow Oxford professor and an academic rival of Mansel, Mark Pattison described the impact of Mill's attack on Hamilton:

The effect of Mr. Mill's review is the absolute annihilation of all Sir W. Hamilton's doctrines, opinions, of all he has written or taught. Nor of himself only, but of all of his followers, pupils, copyists, are involved in the common ruin. The whole fabric of Hamiltonian philosophy is not only demolished, but its very stones are ground [sic] to powder. Where once stood Sebastopol bidding proud defiance to rival systems is now a coast barren and blue: sandheaps behind and sandhills before".<sup>67</sup>

Pattison's hyperbolic and somewhat dramatic claims may be overstated, but the effect of Mill's attack on Hamilton did contribute to a changing of the philosophical guard in Western philosophy, and may have contributed in no small measure, to Hamilton's current obscurity.

A more positive description of the issues behind Mill's attack on Hamilton was published in the July 1886 issue of *The North American Review*:

An Examination of Mr. J. S. Mill's Philosophy, being a Defense of Fundamental Truth," which appeared in 1866. The title exactly designates the contents, which are searching criticisms of Mill's entire philosophy. The circumstances which gave rise to this controversial book were these. Hamilton died in 1856, leaving most of his mature thinking in fragmentary notes uncollected and unpublished, or else in the form of

---

<sup>66</sup> See Elliot in, *The Collected Works of John Stuart Mill, Volume XVI – The Later Letters 1849-1873 Part III (John Stuart Mill)*.

<sup>67</sup> Pattison, Mark. (1865). J.S. Mill on Hamilton. *The Reader*; 562.

lectures. In 1858 his lectures on metaphysics were published, as a posthumous work, and in the Bampton lectures for the same year "On the Limits of Religious Thought" Mansel applied the metaphysical agnosticism set forth in Hamilton's system to Christian dogmatics. Dr. Charles Hodge, and other theologians of less note, attacked the doctrine thus expounded, and there was wide-spread uneasiness in Great Britain and Ireland as to the influence of both Hamilton and Mansel, not merely among the Protestants, but among the Roman Catholics as well. Finally, in 1865, Mill published his "Examination of Sir W. Hamilton's philosophy," attacking it in every point except the condemnation of German transcendentalism, which Mill approved. Early in the following year Mansel published two articles in the "Contemporary Review," defending Hamilton, touching upon the philosophy of the conditioned, on the relativity of knowledge, on causation, and on the doctrine of immediate perception.<sup>68</sup>

Mill's attack on Hamilton's philosophy did indeed damage Hamilton's literary reputation and his academic following. However, these posthumous criticisms rallied Hamilton's defenders like John Veitch and Henry Mansel in to action. This debate was not just a British affair; Hamilton's ideas on metaphysics, psychology and education found a strong reception in America.

---

<sup>68</sup> *The North American Review* Volume 0103 Issue 212 (July 1866) / Volume 103, Issue: 212, July 1866; 241-250.

## Chapter 5

### Sir William Hamilton and the American literary stage

At the time of his death, Sir William Hamilton was the most renowned name in philosophy in the United Kingdom, if not the whole of Europe. On the continent, his reputation equaled those of Immanuel Kant and Victor Cousin. From the historical perspective of his time, we see Sir William Hamilton's name included in the annals of great thinkers since Plato. For example, Hamilton was featured in the series *Philosophical Classics* (1881), edited by William Knight, Professor of Moral Philosophy at St Andrews. W. H. S. Monck, Professor of Moral Philosophy at the University of Dublin stated, "Such has been the impulse which Hamilton has given to speculative thought in this country that to enumerate the various works in which some portions of his system have been vindicated or criticized – adopted or rejected – would require an erudition almost equal to his own."<sup>1</sup> Furthermore, it is perhaps a strange tribute to Hamilton's lofty stature as a philosopher, that John Stuart Mill launched a voluminous attack on his philosophical system. Such was Hamilton's renown reputation in the United Kingdom and Europe, but how did he fare in the United States?

The American stage was already set for Hamilton. Scottish philosophers like Thomas Reid, Dugald Stewart, and Adam Ferguson, provided Americans with powerful answers to the skeptical arguments of their fellow Scot, David Hume. Scottish realism had already been introduced at Princeton University before 1800 by John Witherspoon, with a follow up by Samuel Stanhope Smith. Princeton, then the College of

---

<sup>1</sup> Monck, W. H. S. (1881). *Sir William Hamilton*. New York: J.P. Putnum's Sons, 12.

New Jersey, held a prominent position in what was the fastest growing audience in the world for academic literature – the American College system. As Roger Geiger points out, by the end of the eighteenth-century there were eighteen colleges and universities in America. By the start of the nineteenth-century, more than 450 colleges and universities were in existence.<sup>2</sup> The number of academic institutes operating in America at this time period are crucial because they attest to the fact that Hamilton’s ideas would find an ear in America’s rapidly expanding academic environment. And Veitch noted: “the dominate philosophy in American colleges up to the 1830s had been imported from the United Kingdom.”<sup>3</sup> In more specific terms this observation is confirmed by one of Hamilton’s American contemporaries, Noah Porter, who writes that “Nearly up to the time when the writings of Hamilton began to be read, the English and Scottish writers had been our only teachers from abroad”.<sup>4</sup> But it was not just Sir William Hamilton’s metaphysics or logic that influenced thinkers in the States; Hamilton’s views on religion, education and psychology were also of value to the burgeoning American audience.

Hamilton’s writings were appearing in America in a time of this young country’s literary and educational transition. Immanuel Kant and German philosophy were being introduced to American philosophers, while French ideas such as those of Victor Cousin, were being translated into English and widely read in America as well. In addition, new American ideas were emerging such as those of Ralph Waldo Emerson and Henry David Thoreau. In this time of transition, there were also significant public debates raging

---

<sup>2</sup> See Geiger, Roger (2000). *The American College in the 19th Century*. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press.

<sup>3</sup> Veitch, John (1883). *Sir William Hamilton: the Man and His Philosophy*. Edinburgh: William Blackwood and sons, 425.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*, 425.

amongst religious denominations such as the debate that would split the Presbyterian organisation in two, as well as heated arguments on educational reforms.

America was ready for a new set of intellectual tools and an authoritative voice, so Sir William Hamilton's philosophy provided key elements that many American thinkers were seeking. However, before getting into the specifics of Hamilton's literary reception in America, it is helpful to look at some of his personal connections to the United States.

According to John Veitch, Sir William Hamilton had few direct academic heirs who had become influential in the United States. Veitch tells us: "The influence which Hamilton exercised in America has been almost exclusively by his writings. Very few, if any, native Americans are known to have been his pupils, certainly none who have been at all conspicuous as teachers or writers upon philosophical topics, or have been ardently devoted to the propagation of his opinions".<sup>5</sup> There were perhaps few of Hamilton's American born students who went on to become literary figures, however, some of Hamilton's Scottish-born students made their way to America to make significant contributions to the American dialog. For example, noted authors such as John Clark Murray and James McCosh (both scholars will be discussed later) were students at the University of Edinburgh during Hamilton's tenure. With that said, Sir William Hamilton did have other American connections that were not in the form of his own literature or his students – he had family.

---

<sup>5</sup> Veitch, John (1883). *Sir William Hamilton: the Man and His Philosophy*. Edinburgh: William Blackwood and sons, 425.

## Hamilton's American family ties

The first and the closest member of the family to spend time in America was Sir William Hamilton's younger brother, Thomas. Thomas Hamilton was in the United States from 1830 to 1831. He was there with the intention of researching and documenting the upstart nation. In Scotland, Thomas Hamilton had enjoyed many of the same literary connections as his brother. Their circle included luminaries such as John Lockhart, James Hogg, John Galt, Sir Adam Ferguson, Sir Henry Raeburn, Mr. Allen, and Watson Gordon; and later in life, Hamilton was a neighbor and friend of the poet, William Wadsworth. Thomas Hamilton had a literary reputation of his own having published his novel *Cyril Thornton* in *Blackwood's Magazine* in 1827, and his *Annals of the Peninsular War* in 1829. After his visit to America, Thomas Hamilton published a two-volume set of his observations entitled *Men and Manners in America*. The Philadelphia publishers of Carey, Lea and Blanchard published Hamilton's travel narrative in the United States in 1833. The Publisher's advertisement at the rear of volume two describes the books as, "A description of travels in the cities of the United States: New York, Boston, Philadelphia, Washington, New Orleans and Charleston; with the author's opinions on the people of the New Republic and their ways."<sup>6</sup>

*Men and Manners* is notable because its 1833 publication date sets it well before most of the other well-known travel narratives of early America. In fact, Hamilton's account appears two years before the famous work of Alexis Tocqueville. It is often grouped with the writing of other foreign visitors that had, as Robert Hubach put it, "an

---

<sup>6</sup> Hamilton, Thomas (1833), *Men and Manners in America* Edinburgh: W. Blackwood.

unfavorable opinion” of the United States.<sup>7</sup> Like his brother Sir William Hamilton had an eye for detail, taking note of the sociological and political structures of the day. Hamilton also paid close attention to American architecture, pointing out the origins of the various designs. However, the volumes are tainted with an on-going tone of irritation and competitive comparisons that undermined the monumental potential of the project.<sup>8</sup> Nevertheless, the books have a place in American literature among the early travel narratives by foreigners to America.<sup>9</sup>

One might wonder to what extent Sir William Hamilton’s philosophy influenced his brother, or was manifest in the writings of Thomas Hamilton on America. We do know that Thomas Hamilton took an interest in his brother’s work. For instance, when Thomas Hamilton writes to Janet Hamilton, Sir William Hamilton’s wife, on 5 September 1836, he comments on the style and progress of the Professor’s lectures. Running in the same circle of literary friends, certainly the brothers were well aware of, and interested in, each other’s work. We could also look at the role of influence in the other direction: to what extent were Sir William Hamilton’s views influenced by those of his brother? Also, we could ask whether the earlier and somewhat negative work of Thomas Hamilton had any effect on the reception of Sir William Hamilton’s publications in America? The answer appears to be that there was little to no effect because Thomas

---

<sup>7</sup> See Hubach, Robert (1961), *Early Midwestern Travel Narratives*, Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 62.

<sup>8</sup> Thomas Hamilton had been on the American side of the Atlantic prior to 1830 when he was with the 29<sup>th</sup> Regiment of the British army during the War of 1812. It appears that like his brother Sir William, Thomas Hamilton could come across in a somewhat pushy and aristocratic manner.

<sup>9</sup> In 1838 George Combe, Sir William Hamilton’s sparing partner in the phrenology debates, also wrote a travel narrative. See *Notes on the States of North America During a Phrenological*; Philadelphia: Carey & Hart.

Hamilton's other publications actually preceded his older brother's work as well, such as *Cyril Thornton* and his other publications which were distributed and read in America.

Sir William Hamilton had another family member with strong American ties. Hamilton's cousin, James Russell, and his son Archibald, immigrated to America and took up residence in New York in 1836.<sup>10</sup> The young Archibald Russell prospered in his in both fortune and moderate fame in the new country by becoming a successful businessman and philanthropist. In 1850, Russell helped establish and sustain Five Points House of Industries, a New York charity that saw to the feeding of the hungry and the education of children of the Five Points slum. Then in 1852, Archibald Russell was one of the organisers of the American Geographic Society. This organisation still exists and is the oldest, nationwide geographical organisation in the United States. Russell was also an active member and officer of the New York Historical Society, New York's first museum.<sup>11</sup> Like the American Geographic Society, the New York Historical Society is still an active cultural institution.

It is hard to say exactly what degree of influence Hamilton had on his nephew, but we do know they shared an interest in education. Both Russell's interest in education and

---

<sup>11</sup> Lamb, Martha J. 1829-1893. *History of the city of New York: its origin, rise, and progress*. New York: A.S. Barnes Co., 1877-1896. Lamb ties Russell to Hamilton and Scotland stating, "Archibald Russell (born in Edinburgh, Scotland, in 1811, died in New York City, 1871) graduated from Edinburgh University, studied law with Sir Fraser Tytler, and completed his education at Bonn, Germany. He was the son of James Russell, president of the Royal Society, Edinburgh, and cousin of the metaphysician, Sir William Hamilton. He was of the Kingseat and Slipperfield family of Russell (see Burke's Peerage) and cousin to Lord Sinclair and Sir Archibald Little. Through his mother he was descended from the Rutherfords of Edgerston, and his maternal great-grandmother was Eleanor Elliot, of the family of the Earl of Minto, who trace an unbroken succession from James II of Scotland, and is connected with the Dukes of Buccleugh and the Earls of Angus".(794).

his connection to his uncle is evident in the fact that he sent Hamilton a letter in 1847 that was later published as: “Account of Eleven Thousand Schools in New York: Being a letter to Sir William Hamilton”.<sup>12</sup> Russell starts his letter to Hamilton with an update on the temperance movement in New York, and waxes philosophical while explaining the role of religion in a democratic state emphasizing the importance of educating the poor and lower class children. Russell frames the events taking place in the New York school system in contrast to Edinburgh and fellow American Calvin Stowe’s report on education in Europe.

Archibald Russell maintained a life-long commitment to education and assisting the needy of New York. Twenty years after the launch of Five Points House of Industries, and just one year prior to his death, Russell was still playing a major role in the institution by serving as the president of the board. To the extent that we can connect the contributions of Archibald Russell to the ideas of Sir William Hamilton we can say that the Hamilton family had a significant influence on the lives of many Americans in the most real and tangible manner possible. From his brother who travelled and wrote about America, and his activist cousin in the United States to his American friends who would visit him in Scotland, we can see that Sir William Hamilton had a strong connection to the United States that has been overlooked or understated. However, as stated earlier, Sir William Hamilton’s most significant contribution to America was a literary one.

### **The purchasing power of Hamilton’s name and work in America**

---

<sup>12</sup> New York State Library (1850). *Catalogue of the New-York State library*. Albany: C. Van Benthuyzen, printer.

Sir William Hamilton published articles on a variety of philosophical topics including metaphysics, logic, history, religion, psychology and education, and not surprisingly, given the voracious appetite early American institutions had for Scottish philosophical thought, most of Hamilton's literary efforts made their way to America. As we have seen from Noah Porter's quote earlier, American scholars were reading the *Edinburgh Review* and other Scottish literary magazines, maintaining an intimate relationship with the academic literature coming out of Scotland. However, the scope of Hamilton's literary influence far surpasses the readership of a few intellectuals subscribing to foreign journals. Hamilton's ideas were integrated into many forms and formats of literature. In the United States, Sir William Hamilton was a literary icon, the symbol of erudition, and an authoritative reference that lent credibility to American scholars and authors. From the antebellum period well into the 1870s and even the early 1880s, Hamilton's name was commonplace in American literature.

For instance, dictionaries and encyclopedias in America reinforced the idea that Sir William Hamilton was an established intellectual authority. Hamilton's name was used in reference to a variety of topics, and scholarly biographies often made note if there was a connection to Hamilton. For example, *Globe Encyclopedia* has references to Sir William Hamilton under topics such as: causation, Victor Cousin, *Edinburgh Review*, Fallacies, Mill, Phrenology, Quantification, Stewart, Veitch, and John Wilson and, of course, an entry about Hamilton himself. In the ten volumes of *Chambers Encyclopedia*, Sir William Hamilton shows up in seven of them. In the infamous *Appleton's Cyclopedia of American Biography* Hamilton's name appears in connection with many of

the leading scholars in the States.<sup>13</sup> These cyclopedia and dictionary references to Hamilton introduced him in an authoritative manner to the non-specialized (those who were not professional academics) reading public and maintained his credibility as a scholar in the United States.

Even if you were not a professional philosopher or theologian, you still would be acquainted with Hamilton's works because Sir William Hamilton's writings were well advertised by the broad spectrum of American publishers. It is interesting to note the various genres in which these advertisements appeared. For instance, advertisements for Hamilton's work appeared in biographies such as Harper and Brothers publishers' *Life and Letters of Catharine M. Sedgwick*, Ed. By Mary E. Dewey.<sup>14</sup> Or again, by Harper, *The Rise and Fall of the Paris Commune in 1871; with a full account of the bombardment, capture, and burning of the city. Illustrated with a map of Paris and portraits from original photographs*,<sup>15</sup> a publication focused on current events and politics. Hamilton's work also was solicited in fiction exemplified by Lee and Shepard publisher's title *Neighbors' Wives*.<sup>16</sup> Even poetry publications carried Hamilton's name out past the walls of the university as seen in *City Poems* by Alexander Smith, a Ticknor and Fields release.<sup>17</sup> Religious texts also ran ads for Hamilton's work as well, like,

---

<sup>13</sup> I say infamous because of the warning from Barnhart that the *Cyclopedia* was riddled with errors and suffered from a lack of editing. Indeed, the volumes contain entries for two hundred fictitious people. See Barnhart, "Some fictitious botanists", *Journal of the New York Botanical Garden* (1919:171-81), 20.

<sup>14</sup> Sedgwick, Catharine Maria. (1871), *Life and letters of Catharine M. Sedgwick*. ed. by Mary E. Dewey. New York, Harper & Brothers, 1872.

<sup>15</sup> Fetridge, William Pembroke (1871). *The Rise and Fall of the Paris Commune in 1871; with a full account of the bombardment, capture, and burning of the city. Illustrated with a map of Paris and portraits from original photographs*. New York: Harper.

<sup>16</sup> Trowbridge, J. T. (1867), *Neighbors' Wives*, Boston: Lee and Shepard.

<sup>17</sup> Smith, Alexander (1857), *City Poems*, Boston: Ticknor and Fields.

*Theological Index: References to the Principle Works in Every Department of Religious Literature: embracing nearly seventy thousand citations, alphabetically arranged under two thousand heads.* In this 1868 Gould and Lincoln publication, the promotion was for Hamilton's *Lectures*.<sup>18</sup>

It appears that Hamilton's name and his work had purchase in America. Many books addressing philosophy in general, or books on a particular topic would include reference to Sir William Hamilton in the advertisement for that publication. In many texts it was not just that Hamilton's name was mentioned – it was featured. For instance, advertisements for David Masson's title *Recent British Philosophy: a review, with criticisms* carried a note that it featured an investigation into the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton.<sup>19</sup>

Not only were Hamilton's work advertised widely in America, his writing were being disseminated in American households. An interesting example of Hamilton's literary presence in American homes can be seen in the travel narrative of David Macrae (1837-1907), *The Americans at home: pen-and-ink sketches of American men, manners and institutions*.<sup>20</sup> In stark contrast to the observations of Thomas Hamilton or that of

---

<sup>18</sup> Malcom, Howard (1868), *Theological index: References to the Principle Works in Every Department of Religious Literature: embracing nearly seventy thousand citations, alphabetically arranged under two thousand heads*, Boston, Gould and Lincoln.

<sup>19</sup> Masson, David (1866). *Recent British Philosophy: a review, with criticisms*. New York: D. Appleton and company.

<sup>20</sup> David Macrae entered Edinburgh University in 1858. He was licensed by the United Presbyterian Church (UPC) as minister at Gourock where he was later expelled from the UPC for denying scriptural authority on the doctrine of eternal damnation. The Dundee congregation then withdrew from the UPC, appointing Macrae its nondenominational minister; he stayed until his retirement in 1897. See George Eyre-Todd, *Who's Who in Glasgow in 1909* (Glasgow, 1909) 135–37. Macrae was a correspondent with many leading literary figures of the 19<sup>th</sup> century including Thomas Carlyle and Charles Dickens.

Tocqueville, Macrae found Americans to have an appetite for philosophical literature: “Then metaphysics! In one family which I visited in the Connecticut valley, two of the girls were deep in the study of algebra and metaphysics, as a voluntary exercise, and shut themselves up for three hours a day with Colenso and Sir William Hamilton and Kant”.<sup>21</sup> In his narrative Macrae also made mention of one of his former classmate from the University of Edinburgh:

At Charleston, amongst the most prominent members of the Constitutional Convention assembled there, I was interested to find a coloured man who had been educated in Scotland, and whom I remembered as a fellow student in Edinburgh. The case of Francis L. Cardozo shows what culture can do for a coloured as well as for a white man. Cardozo was the child of free negroes, was taken to Scotland when a boy, attended school and college in Glasgow, went through a theological curriculum in the Hall of the United Presbyterian Church in Edinburgh, returned to America, became a teacher first in New York, and afterwards (when the war opened up the South) in Charleston; was elected a member of Convention, and now, at the present moment, under the new regime, holds the position of Secretary of State for South Carolina. Cardozo is a man of middle size, but of dignified appearance and refined manners. He is a well-read man, has a clear head, is an excellent argumentative speaker, and a first-rate organiser and man of business. I spent one or two evenings with him at his house, which was furnished with much elegance and taste. In his admirably

---

<sup>21</sup> Macrae, David (1870). *The Americans at home: pen-and-ink sketches of American men, manners and institutions*. Edinburgh: Edmonston and Douglas, 1870, 25.

selected library I saw well-thumbed copies of Sir William Hamilton's *Lectures*.<sup>22</sup>

Reflecting on the ideas of Tocqueville, Macrae's observations demonstrate a fairly rapid change in the American mind-set towards philosophy and an interesting demographic. Tocqueville, who was in the United States in 1830 noted that, "I think that in the civilized world there is no country less interested in philosophy than the United States. The Americans have no philosophic school of their own and are very little bothered by all those that divide Europe; they hardly know their names".<sup>23</sup> By the 1860s Macrae saw how the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton was being read in the homes of Americans outside the academic setting.<sup>24</sup> Macrae's observations help make sense of why publishers would advertise Hamilton's works outside of academic literature.<sup>25</sup>

Clearly, Hamilton's publications were both widely advertised and readily available. In addition to imported texts, there were also American versions of Hamilton's publications such as: *Discussions on Philosophy and Literature, Education and*

---

<sup>22</sup> Hamilton, William Bart. (1836), *Lectures On Metaphysics* Vol I London; William Blackwood And Sons, 301.

<sup>23</sup>Tocqueville, Alexis de. (1840), *Democracy in America*, Chicago: University of Chicago (2000), 493.

<sup>24</sup> Tocqueville also noted that Americans were primarily interested in useful knowledge and had philosophical tools of inquiry. However, there were no names or authors attached to the method. These observations were being made just prior to the introduction of Sir William Hamilton to the literary world outside of Scotland. However, the method and focus Tocqueville saw in America was in lock-step with Hamilton's teacher from the University of Glasgow, Professor George Jardine. As noted in chapter 3 on Jardine in America, Jardine's ideas were well-established in American education starting in the mid 1820s. So, my speculation is that what Tocqueville saw and criticized was an American version of a Scottish educational philosophy rooted in Jardine's *Outlines*. If this is the case, then the American audience would have a similar methodological foundation to Sir William Hamilton, so perhaps that foundation facilitated an easier transition for Americans to identify with the philosophy of Hamilton.

<sup>25</sup> Macrae also identified an interesting diversity of philosophical readers. The examples given were young women and an African American living in the South.

*University Reform Chiefly from the Edinburgh review*. This version of Hamilton's work was published in New York by Harper & Brothers in 1861, and included an introductory essay by Robert Turnbull. Hamilton's *Lectures on Metaphysics and Logic*, was published in Boston and New York by Gould and Lincoln, then Sheldon and Company from 1859 to 1860.<sup>26</sup> This volume was edited by the Reverend Henry L. Mansel and John Veitch, who were the same editors for the Scottish edition as well.

### **Francis Bowen and Harvard College**

Without a doubt, these American editions of Hamilton's work are indicators that Hamilton had developed a following of American educators. Hamilton's work was seen as a fresh influx of thought and not just a continuation of the old tradition of Scottish philosophy. In his *History of American Philosophy* Schneider states: "the writings of Sir William Hamilton, which gained enormous prestige, encouraged criticism of the earlier versions of Reid and Stewart. It is, therefore, a serious mistake to regard the whole period of academic philosophy until James as under the dominance of the Scottish school and of orthodoxy".<sup>27</sup> As one might expect, Sir William Hamilton's connection to American academic institutions is closely linked to his literary reception as these thinkers set the curriculum in colleges and universities, as well as edited textbooks and scholarly periodicals. By the 1850s, Hamilton's philosophy permeated the American colleges and universities. Consequently, the list of leading American institutions that leaned heavily on the ideas of Sir William Hamilton is nearly all-inclusive: Harvard, Yale, Princeton, and Brown, to note just a few of the top institutions. In addition, Hamilton was also

---

<sup>26</sup> For more references see the catalog provided in Section II.

<sup>27</sup> Schneider, Herbert. (1946) *A History of American Philosophy*: New York: Columbia University Press, 241.

studied in philosophy at Cornell University. He was “the standard by which new innovations are made”.<sup>28</sup> And, in a sketch of the foundation and aims of Vassar College, we are told, “For the sake of definiteness and precision, the Scottish school is selected for special study in both intellectual and moral philosophy”. Hamilton’s full works are “in the hands of the students”; and “Sir William Hamilton’s psychological system is studied in detail.”<sup>29</sup>

In fact, some American educators began to introduce abridged editions of Hamilton’s work into their classrooms. One example is the 1872 edition of *The Metaphysics of Sir William Hamilton collected, arranged, and abridged by Francis Bowen*. This abridgment was meant to answer J. S. Mill’s posthumous attack on Hamilton’s philosophy. Bowen’s *Outline of Sir William Hamilton’s Philosophy, a Textbook for Students* was published in Boston by Gould Publishers in 1870 and is another example of Hamilton’s ideas being reconfigured to fit the college curriculum. Other authors such as John Clark Murray, edited and arranged Hamilton’s work to fit the classroom.

The scope of Hamilton’s continued influence in American academies is evident in the curriculum of the leading universities in the United States and the scholars there, such as Harvard University and the scholar Francis Bowen. Bowen was born on 8 September 1811 at Charleston, Massachusetts. In 1833, he graduated from Harvard in the same

---

<sup>28</sup> Choate, W (1877). *Live questions in psychology and Metaphysics. Six lectures selected from those delivered to the classes in Cornell University, by Wilson, William Dexter, 1816-1900*. New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1.

<sup>29</sup> Raymond, John Howard (1873). *Vassar college: A college for women, in Poughkeepsie, N. Y. A sketch of its foundation, aims, and resources, and of the development of its scheme of instruction to the present time*. New York: S. W. Green, printer, 66.

class with many others who were later to become renowned educators such as Professor Lovering, Professor Torrey, Dr. M. Wyman, Professor J. Wyman, and Dr. George E. Ellis. After graduation, Bowen returned to Harvard as a teacher in intellectual philosophy and political economy. In 1843, he succeeded Dr. Palfrey as editor and proprietor of the *North American Review*—a publication which Bowen ran until 1854. The *North American Review* prospered under Bowen's leadership. The periodical's layout and typography were improved and the subscription list broadened during this time. In addition, Bowen authored a significant number of articles so it is safe to say the increased success of the journal was largely due to Bowen.

In 1850, during his tenure at the *North American Review*, Bowen was appointed Professor of History at Harvard. However, much like his intellectual mentor Sir William Hamilton, the board of overseers refused to confirm Bowen's appointment because of his politics. Although it took some time, three years later Bowen was unanimously confirmed as Alford Professor of Natural Religion.

During his inaugural year as the Alford Professor of Natural Religion, we can see Bowen's views on Hamilton in an article published in the *North American Review* in January 1853:

His gifts are, eminently, those of a critic; he either cannot, or will not, expound his own thought, except while commenting on the thoughts of others. As a critic and a controversialist however, he is, perhaps, the most formidable person in Europe. His erudition is so extensive and profound, as to be somewhat oppressive; but this load of learning, under which a common man would be extinguished as effectually as Goose

Gibbie was in the moss-trooper's helmet, seems only to add keenness and force to his offensive weapons.<sup>30</sup>

Bowen is clearly a fan of Hamilton, yet Bruce Kuklick states: "While Scottish realism and Hamiltonianism attracted his attention; he [Bowen] used rather than parroted them".<sup>31</sup> Nonetheless, Bowen included Hamiltonian philosophy in his curriculum, and as Kuklick explains, "two years after Mill had published his Examination, Bowen was offering a senior elective course on the book. Although the final examinations in the course asked students to refute many of Mill's points, at its best – before and after the economic constraints of 1855 – 1865 – the teaching of philosophy at Harvard was more than indoctrination".<sup>32</sup> Bowen's influence as a publisher and professor pushed the philosophy of Hamilton into American literary culture. Those students who attended Harvard during the Bowen years, then, were quite familiar with Hamilton and they too carried Hamiltonian ideas forward.

### **Harvard College and Hamiltonian ideas**

Chauncey Wright was one of those students at Harvard College. Wright was born in Northampton, Massachusetts, in 1830, where his family had lived since colonial times and where his father had been a merchant and deputy-sheriff of the county. In 1848, he entered Harvard College where he was first introduced to the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton. His education there also included two years of advanced study in natural sciences. Graduating in 1852, he missed Bowen's appointment by one year. Nonetheless,

---

<sup>30</sup> Bowen, F. (1853), "Sir William Hamilton on Philosophy and Education". *North American Review* 76 (152), 55-104.

<sup>31</sup> Kuklick, Bruce (1977), *The Rise of American Philosophy: Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1860-1930*. Mass.: Yale University Press, 32.

<sup>32</sup> *Ibid.*, 19.

the two men knew each other and early in Wright's career, they both shared admiration for Hamilton. "Chauncey's relation to Hamilton in those days was in a way like that of a devout Christian to his Bible".<sup>33</sup> However, Wright was strongly influenced by John Stuart Mill and Darwin, so his views on Hamilton shifted towards those of Mill. Wright was a gifted mathematician and would write Bowen in regards to theories in math where both men would diverge into a discussion of Mill and Hamilton.

Wright had a reputation of being a genius of sorts and was sort of a Socratic character around Harvard. He engaged in many literary and study groups such as the Metaphysical Club in Cambridge and influenced Charles S. Peirce, William James, and Oliver Wendell Holmes, Jr., among others. Though Wright left the Hamiltonian camp after Mill's "examination," he was, prior to that, an influential proponent of Sir William Hamilton.

Another philosopher, Harvard graduate and minister influenced by Sir William Hamilton was Francis Ellingwood Abbot. However, the influence of Hamilton on Abbot was to inspire him to argue against the philosophy of the conditioned and ultimately to advance his own ideas of philosophical objectivism. In 1864, Abbot published two articles in the *North American Review*: "The Philosophy of Space and Time" and "The Conditioned and Unconditioned". Abbot argued that space is an object of knowledge and by definition is infinite. Hence, Hamilton's claim that we cannot know the polar opposites of the absolute or the infinite is flawed.<sup>34</sup> Abbot's criticisms of Hamilton were rooted in his perception of the importance of Darwin's observations to the field of

---

<sup>33</sup> See Wright, Chauncey (1887). *Letters of Chauncey Wright* Ed. James Bradley Thayer. Cambridge: Press of J. Wilson and Son.

<sup>34</sup> See Blau, Joseph (1952), *Men and Movements in American Philosophy*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall. 175.

philosophy.<sup>35</sup> Abbot expanded his criticisms of Hamilton to the philosophy of Spencer and Kant as well. Clearly, Hamilton had a strong representation at Harvard starting in the 1850s, and graduates of Harvard were addressing Hamilton in their teachings, writings and sermons; and the same was true at another leading American university - Yale.

### **Yale and Hamiltonian ideas**

Noah Porter was a younger contemporary of Hamilton's in America. He was elected Professor of Moral Philosophy and Metaphysics at Yale in 1846, and served as that institution's President from 1871 to 1886. Porter wrote his account of Hamilton's literary contributions for James Veitch's *Memoirs of Sir William Hamilton* wherein he states:

Sir William Hamilton was first known in the United States by his articles in the *Edinburgh Review*, particularly by the two entitled "Philosophy of Perception" (October 1830), and "Logic" (April 1833). The article published previously on "The Philosophy of the Unconditioned, (October 1829), did not at first attract general attention, because the writers to which it refers were as yet scarcely known, even to our best scholars, and the subjects treated of were strange to our speculations—at least in the form and phraseology in which they are there presented. This article was afterwards often referred to and read with great interest. The two articles named were extensively read in this country, and were considered the most remarkable contributions to the history and criticism of metaphysical science which had appeared in the English language for that generation.

---

<sup>35</sup> Kant had argued in the *Critic of Pure Reason* (1781/1787) that space was an *apriori* intuition of the mind. It is a singular, immediate, representation, independent of our experience and the objects of perception. According to Kant, our representation of space is infinite. Abbot's criticisms of Hamilton are in line with an ongoing historical debate from the early modern thinkers about the role of space in cognition.

The astounding erudition, the vigorous thought, the masterly analysis, the acute criticism, and the self-relying independence by which they were distinguished, made a profound impression upon the many readers whom they at once excited and astonished. There were not a few of these many more than the writer himself would have suspected, or any person who was not intimately conversant with the tastes and tendencies of our thinking men, or had founded his conclusions upon the amount of philosophical learning possessed by those who gave instruction in philosophy, or upon the knowledge possessed by their most advanced pupils.<sup>36</sup>

Porter utilized Hamilton's work in his courses at Yale as recalled by one of his students George Duncan: "It was under this system that most of Professor Porter's teaching to undergraduates was given. We learned psychology and logic — if we could — from Sir William Hamilton's text-books, and Professor Porter examined us to find how much we knew." And, Porter himself acknowledged Hamilton's critical presence in his classroom:

I may add that I have used his [Hamilton's] 'Lectures on Metaphysics' ever since they were published, as a text-book for daily examination or recitation in my classes; and though I have not always been able to agree with him, and have greatly regretted that some of the more important topics for an elementary course of instruction were treated so briefly, yet I have preferred this to any other book for its stimulating and invigorating effect upon the minds of my pupils. Of more than 1000 pupils whom I have conducted through this course, many have failed to master all his doctrines or to appreciate all his thought; but I believe the number to be very small of those who, however stupid and

---

<sup>36</sup> Veitch, John (1869), *Memoirs of Sir William Hamilton*; Edinburgh: Blackwood and Sons, 421.

negligent, have not been impressed by his mental superiority. I am confident that the number is large of those who have been excited and instructed by his comprehension of the aims of philosophy, by his liberal culture, and by the strength and acuteness of his arguments and elucidations. His influence in all these respects will long live, as I trust. I am confident that no critic can weaken these impressions in the mind of any earnest student of Hamilton; and however successful any such critic may seem to be in setting aside any of his teachings, he will not add force to his own arguments by attempting to depreciate his surpassing excellence, or to lower the estimate of his distinguished services to philosophy and to man."<sup>37</sup>

Not surprisingly, given the universal appeal of Hamilton's work, the Hamiltonian legacy at Yale lived on years after Noah Porter's time. In fact, Woodbridge Riley, a Yale graduate, recalled: "the philosophy of Hamilton, purged of its Kantian elements, was declared by one of his pupils to be pre-eminently the American philosophy".<sup>38</sup>

### **Brown University and Hamiltonian ideas**

Another example of Hamilton's far-reaching influence on early American campuses was Francis Wayland. He was a graduate of Union College in Schenectady, New York. It was during his years at Union College that Wayland "learned the elements of Scottish 'common sense' philosophy".<sup>39</sup> By the age of thirty-one, Francis Wayland was President of Brown University. He later travelled to Scotland where he met Sir William Hamilton. In a memoir of his life, Wayland's sons recall: "When we arrived in

---

<sup>37</sup> Veitch, John (1869), *Memoirs of Sir William Hamilton*; Edinburgh: Blackwood and Sons, 421.

<sup>38</sup> Riley, Woodbridge (1907), *American Philosophy*. New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 19.

<sup>39</sup> Schneider, Herbert (1952), *Men and Movements in America*, New Jersey: Prentice Hall Publishers, Englewood Cliffs, 83.

Edinburgh, one of the first places which we visited was the university. Dr. Wayland was at once received with marked attention by Dr. Chalmers, Sir William Hamilton, Professor Wilson, Dr. Abercrombie, of the Royal Philosophical Society, Lord Murray, and other distinguished men. The officers of the university very courteously afforded him every facility for examining all its departments".<sup>40</sup> Fortunately, the American professor received positive attention from opposing political parties and religious camps in Scotland which most likely supported his high regard for Scottish philosophical thought. While serving as President at Brown University, Wayland published his *Elements of Moral Science*, and in 1854, he published *The Elements of Intellectual Philosophy*. In the latter text, Wayland explored Hamilton's distinctions on the qualities of matter.

Not only did Hamiltonian ideas and publications infiltrate American colleges and universities, but Hamilton's educational philosophies also impacted American intellectuals and their own work.

### **American intellectual thought and Hamilton philosophy**

In 1857, Joseph Haven, Professor of Intellectual and Moral Philosophy, authored *Mental Philosophy*, one of the finest textbooks on the subject taught in American higher education in the second half of the nineteenth century. It is important to note that Haven had taught Hamiltonian philosophy at Amherst College.<sup>41</sup> Haven's textbook was

---

<sup>40</sup> Wayland, Francis and Wayland H. L (1867). *A Memoir, Life and Labors Francis Wayland, D.D., L.L.D by his Sons*. New York: Sheldon and Company.

<sup>41</sup> Tyler, W. S. (1873). *History of Amherst College during its first half century. 1821-1871*. Springfield, Mass: C. W. Bryan & Co., 435.

instrumental in the intellectual development of no less a personage than America's great economist and social critic, Thorstein Veblen (1857-1929).<sup>42</sup>

Charles Fate Deems, Professor of Logic and Rhetoric at the University of North Carolina, was another American intellectual who laced his teachings with the ideas of Sir William Hamilton.<sup>43</sup> Deems was a highly influential author and activist, and one of the founders and president of the American Institute of Christian Philosophy (1881). For ten years, he was editor of its journal, *Christian Thought*. Deems was a strong advocate of temperance; as early as 1852 he worked (unsuccessfully) for a general prohibition law in North Carolina, and in his later years, he allied himself with the Prohibition Party. He was influential in securing from Vanderbilt the endowment of Vanderbilt University in Nashville, Tennessee. In his address at the dedication of Vanderbilt University, Deems praised Sir William Hamilton, stating he “is the only man in twenty-two centuries to add anything important to the imperial science of logic”.<sup>44</sup>

---

<sup>42</sup> Thorstein Veblen most famous work was *The Theory of the Leisure Class* (1899) where he combined a Darwinian evolutionary perspective with economic analysis.

<sup>43</sup> Deems was a man of rare personal and literary charm. He edited *The Southern Methodist Episcopal Pulpit* (1846-1852) and *The Annals of Southern Methodism* (1855-1857). He also compiled *Devotional Melodies* (1842), and, with the assistance of Phoebe Cary, one of his parishioners, *Hymns for all Christians* (1869; revised 1881); and he published many books, among which were: *The Life of Dr Adam Clarke* (1840); *The Triumph of Peace and other Poems* (1840); *The Home Altar* (1850); *Jesus* (1872), which ran through many editions and several revisions, the title being changed in 1880 to *The Light of the Nations*; *Sermons* (1885); *The Gospel of Common Sense* (1888); *The Gospel of Spiritual Insight* (1891) and *My Septuagint* (1892). The Charles F. Deems Lectureship in Philosophy was founded in his honor in 1895 at New York University by the American Institute of Christian Philosophy. In addition Deems signed the petition: *Presented to the President of the United States in favor of the restoration of Palestine to the Jews*.

<sup>44</sup> Deems, Charles Fate (1875). *Vanderbilt University, Dedication and inauguration of the Vanderbilt University*. Nashville, Tenn.: Publishing house of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. P. 41.

Another indication of the influential and authoritative stature Sir William Hamilton had in the United States was how his work was used in inaugural speeches at universities around the nation. For instance, William Betts in his speech to Columbia College frames his educational philosophy in a quote from Hamilton. He said liberal education was, “an education in which the individual is cultivated, not as an instrument towards some ulterior end, but as an end unto himself alone: in other words as an education, in which his absolute perfection as a man, and not merely his relative dexterity as a professional man, is the scope immediately in view”.<sup>45</sup> This quote shows an obvious influence from Kant’s moral philosophy of the *Groundwork for the Metaphysics of Morals*.<sup>46</sup> We see here how Hamilton massaged Kant’s categorical imperative into an educational imperative where, in the academic setting, the student is an end unto himself. Back in Scotland Hamilton had a reputation for his grasp of German philosophy and in so much as Hamilton had made some of Kant’s ideas his own, he was also introducing American readers to Kantian ideas.

The colleges and universities in the United States were widely teaching the ideas of Sir William Hamilton, creating new scholars who would analyze, criticize and write with their intellectual roots in his work. An 1860 article in *New Englander and Yale Review* on Sir William Hamilton praised his influence on American universities stating:

---

<sup>45</sup> Betts, William (1858). *Columbia University, Addresses of the newly-appointed professors of Columbia College*. New York: Board of Trustees Columbia College. 21.

<sup>46</sup> In Section Two of the *Groundwork for the Metaphysics of Morals* (1785) Kant states: “Now I say that a human being, and in general every rational being, exists as an end in itself, not merely as a means to the discretionary use of this or that will, but in all actions, those directed toward itself as well as those directed toward other rational beings, it must always at the same time be considered as an end.” Kant. I (2002). *Groundwork on the Metaphysics of Morals* Edited and Translated by Allen Wood. New Haven and London: Yale University Press. 45.

The Metaphysics of Hamilton is the crowning glory of Scotch philosophy. It fills up much that was wanting, and corrects much that was wrong; adorning it, moreover, with the refinements of scholarship. Nor do we regard this latter circumstance of small moment. Intimate acquaintance with the great masters of the world of thought, in case it does not over- power, polishes the mind, and imparts a certain grace of manner to all that it does. The precise influence of a university education upon the tone of thinking cannot be completely expressed, because language has not words to describe all the minute and insensible effects which come from the daily contact of many minds engaged in liberal studies; yet it exists, and its presence is everywhere felt.<sup>47</sup>

### **Hamilton's students in America**

In addition to the American advocates of Hamilton's philosophy, there were also some significant homegrown Scottish thinkers who were students of Sir William Hamilton who had immigrated to the States, ready to make their contributions to the dialogue. John Clark Murray was one of these students of Hamilton. He studied theology at Glasgow University and Edinburgh and in Heidelberg and Gottingen (Germany) in preparation for ministry in the Free Church of Scotland. Murray was put off by denominational politics and evangelical Calvinist theology, seeking a career instead in education rather than the ministry. He became Professor of Mental and Moral Philosophy at Queens College, Kingston, in Canada in 1862. In 1872 he moved to McGill College, Montreal. Murray held the John Frothingham Chair of Mental and Moral Philosophy from 1873 until his retirement in 1903. He also taught classes at the Glenmore Summer

---

<sup>47</sup> Unknown (1860). "Sir William Hamilton's Lectures on Metaphysics". *New Englander and Yale Review*. 0018 (Issue 69), 167-190.

School of Philosophy in New York State and the Cooper Union and the People's Institute in New York City. The *Dictionary of Canadian Biographies* described Murray's philosophy: "it was not speculative or novel, but typically sought mediation between established schools and inculcation of a way of life balancing reason and experience and characterized by a disciplined, critical intelligence. In metaphysics and epistemology, he initially pursued a mediation of common sense realism and Kantianism as envisioned by his Edinburgh mentor, Sir William Hamilton".<sup>48</sup> In 1870, Murray published a textbook *An Outline of Sir Wm. Hamilton's Philosophy*. Later, he would publish in the field of psychology as well as ethics.

The most famous of Hamilton's students to come to the United States was James McCosh. McCosh attended Edinburgh University during the period when Sir William Hamilton was chair of Civil History and later, while he was a divinity student at Edinburgh, he attended Hamilton's lecture. Recalling this time in his life, McCosh states in his autobiography, "But the most eminent man in philosophy, not only in Scotland, but throughout the world, was at that time in Edinburgh University. I allude to Sir William Hamilton, then professor of Civil History".<sup>49</sup> In addition to attending Hamilton's lectures, McCosh received personal encouragement from Hamilton to study and write on

---

<sup>48</sup> Murray became professor *emeritus*, 1903 and is the author of numerous contributions to the periodicals. He contributed a paper: *Can Canada be Coerced into the Union?* to Open Court, in 1895. Author: *Outline of Sir Wm. Hamilton's Philosophy*, a text-book (1870); *The Ballads and Songs of Scotland, in view of Their Influence on the Character of the People*" (1874) ; *Memoir of David Murray, late Provost of Paisley* (1881); *A Hand-book of Psychology* (1885); "Solomon Maimon," a translation (1888) ; *An Introduction to Ethics* (1891); *He that Received the Five Talents* (1904); *An Introduction to Psychology* (1904) and *A Handbook of Christian Ethics* (1908).

<sup>49</sup> *The Life of James McCosh, A Record chiefly Autobiographical*, edited by William Milligan Sloane, Edinburgh T and T Clark 1896, 40.

mental philosophy,<sup>50</sup> which may partially explain why McCosh was also a staunch defender of Hamilton publishing books on psychology, philosophy and logic. Later, in 1850 when McCosh published his book, *The Method of Devine Government, Physical and Moral*, Hamilton “announced his decision at once”: “Aloof from any difference of opinion, and though I have only read the work in part, it appears to me worthy of the highest encomium, not only for the excellence but for the ability with which it is written. It is refreshing to read a work so distinguished for originality and soundness of thinking, especially as coming from an author of our own country”.<sup>51</sup> McCosh was solidly in Hamilton’s philosophical corner, but like other eminent scholars in America, however, he viewed Hamilton’s more mature writings as fragmented. Hence Hamilton’s ideas were a platform for those like McCosh and Noah Porter and others to expound upon. This is why in most of McCosh’s writings and teachings, Hamilton was thinly under the surface.

In 1850 or 185, McCosh was appointed Professor of Logic and Metaphysics at Queen’s College, Belfast—a post he held for 16 years. While at Queen’s, McCosh established himself as a first-rate philosopher. In 1868, McCosh immigrated to the United States to become the eleventh president of Princeton University.<sup>52</sup> His biographer William Sloane, paints a rather positive picture of McCosh in his professional life:

---

<sup>50</sup> McCosh, James (1896). *The Life of James McCosh*. Ed Sloane, William, Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 41.

<sup>51</sup> *Ibid.*, 105.

<sup>52</sup> It is interesting to note that James McCosh became president of Princeton at the centennial mark of John Witherspoon’s presidency at the same institution. The similarities of the two men and even the circumstances in America at the time of their appointments are striking. Both men were from Scotland and both men attended the University of Edinburgh. They were similar in character, religious disposition, and both were ministers. Moreover, both presidents exhibited a strong devotion to the task of educating young men and promoted the philosophical ideas of their homeland. In America, Witherspoon’s Princeton (College of New Jersey) was recovering from the war

Dr. McCosh's daily life as a teacher, philanthropist, preacher, and public agitator, was simply the reflection of an intellectual activity so restless that sluggish minds can scarcely grasp it. Or rather, it was the complement of a restless thinking, both constructive and critical, which soon found expression in a third important work. In 1860 appeared "The Intuitions of the Mind", with natural affiliations to Reid and the Scottish school, he had been a pupil of Hamilton and a diligent student of Kant. Hegel he never understood, and the Idealists he underestimated. From Hamilton he accepted the philosophy of consciousness and the chief elements of his psychology, but, in opposition to the negative Hamiltonian metaphysic, he reasserted the positive principles of the Scottish school as represented by Reid. He was vastly superior to Reid in scholarship, his reasoning being more comprehensive and more convincing, the apprehension of his task clearer, and the mastery of his materials more complete.<sup>53</sup>

McCosh perpetuated the ideas of Scottish philosophy and in particular those of Sir William Hamilton well into the second half of the nineteenth century through his tenure at Princeton and his many publications.<sup>54</sup>

## **American slavery and Sir William Hamilton**

Sir William Hamilton received several American visitors as they passed through Edinburgh. One influential American visitor was Edward Everett, Minister to Great Britain from 1840 to 1845. Everett had been a professor at Harvard and served four

---

of independence, then McCosh's Princeton was recovering from the American Civil War. Finally, both men had a voice in the educational debates and reforms that were taking place in higher education.

<sup>53</sup> McCosh, James (1896). *The Life of James McCosh*. Ed Sloane, William, Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 16.

<sup>54</sup> I provide a chronology of McCosh's major publications in Section II.

times as a Representative from Massachusetts to the United States Congress from 1824 - 1835. In addition, Everett was Governor of Massachusetts from 1836 to 1838. A point of common interest the two men shared was in German philosophy and education. Hamilton was well read in Kant and had spent time in Germany prior to his service at the University of Edinburgh. Everett had become interested in the German model of education, which he tried to employ during his tenure at Harvard. Before long, after Everett's visit to Scotland, Hamilton's philosophy permeated the Harvard curriculum.

Another American Minister to England that visited Sir William Hamilton was George Bancroft. Like Everett, he was keenly interested in education and had studied in Germany. Bancroft ran for Everett's old position as Governor of Massachusetts in 1844, but was unsuccessful. The next year Bancroft was made Secretary of the Navy in President James Polk's administration. By 1846, Bancroft was appointed Minister to London, and held that post until the Presidential election of Zachary Taylor in 1848. It is during this time that Bancroft went north to visit Edinburgh. In a letter to William Prescott, dated 15, September 1848, Bancroft writes of visiting the "metaphysician Sir William Hamilton, now alas! tottering under the infirmities of palsy".<sup>55</sup> Because of Bancroft's political standing, Hamilton's association with Bancroft placed him one voice removed from the American President Abraham Lincoln. We know this to be true because of Lincoln's personal relationship with Bancroft. For instance, when Bancroft returned to the United States President Lincoln gave him a personal copy of the Gettysburg address. Moreover, after Lincoln's assassination, Bancroft was asked by the American Congress to give a special eulogy. We can see just by the visits of Edward

---

<sup>55</sup> Howe, M. A. DeWolfe (1908). *Life and Letters of George Bancroft Part II*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 35.

Everett and George Bancroft that Sir William Hamilton was held in high enough esteem by politically influential Americans to warrant visits; there were, however, many more visitors and correspondents.

Many of Sir William Hamilton's visitors and correspondents from America were engaged in the growing tensions over slavery. Yet even though Sir William Hamilton was certainly aware of the debate over slavery that was taking place in the United States, there is virtually no literature expounding his views on the topic. This lack of record is somewhat surprising because Hamilton was in communication with American pro-slavery advocates as well as very high profile anti-slavery activists. As close as Hamilton comes to the issue is an analysis of an argument for slavery out of antiquity where he acknowledges similarities between Aristotle's defense for the institution and those pro-slavery arguments made in the British parliament. In his *Logic*, Hamilton only addresses the form of an argument and his observations centre on the validity of the argument rather than the soundness of it. He states:

When, for example, it was argued that the Newtonian theory is false, which holds colors to be the result of a diversity of parts in light, on the ground, admitted by the ancients, that the celestial bodies, and, consequently, their emanations, consist of homogeneous elements; this reasoning was inept, for the principle of proof was not admitted by modern philosophers. Thus, when Aristotle defends the institution of slavery as a natural law, on the ground that the barbarians, as of inferior intellects, are the born bondsmen of the Greeks, and the Greeks, as of superior intellects, the born masters of the barbarians—(an argument

which has, likewise, been employed in modern times in the British Parliament, with the substitution of negroes for barbarians, and whites for Greeks)—this argument is invalid, as assuming what is not admitted by the opponents of slavery. It would be a *petitio principii* to prove to the Mohammedan the divinity of Christ from texts in the New Testament, for he does not admit the authority of the Bible; but it would be a valid *argumentum ad hominem* to prove to him from the Koran the prophetic mission of Jesus, for the authority of the Koran he acknowledges.<sup>56</sup>

So, Hamilton sees the argument for slavery as presented in antiquity as well as the exchange given in British Parliament as begging the question, but it is not clear that his criticism of the argument had political or moral implications.

Interestingly enough, as early as 1838 Hamilton met staunch anti-slavery Americans. A young Harvard Law School lecturer and future member of the United States Senate, Charles Sumner, passed through Edinburgh and had the opportunity to meet with Hamilton. Sumner's father had been an abolitionist and he had been explicitly raised with those values.<sup>57</sup>

Hamilton was well aware of the tensions over slavery in the United States. William Buell Sprague (1795-1876), a Presbyterian minister from New York, recounts that while in Edinburgh in the 1850s, he had breakfast with Hamilton and other leading

---

<sup>56</sup> Hamilton, Sir William (1863). *The Logic of Sir William Hamilton*, Cincinnati: Moore, Wilstach & Baldwin, 270.

<sup>57</sup> Sumner returned to Scotland a year after Hamilton's death and his own narrow escape from death when Preston Brooks beat him unconscious on the Senate floor. Brooks was enraged by Sumner's anti-slavery speech concerning the Kansas-Nebraska Act, and Sumner's personal attacks on the authors of the Act.

men of letters in Edinburgh. Sprague tells of having to address the issue of slavery with the others before he could move to the topic of Dugald Stewart with Hamilton.<sup>58</sup>

Another high profile American abolitionist to visit Hamilton was Harriet Beecher Stowe, the famous author of the 1852 anti-slavery novel, *Uncle Tom's Cabin*. In 1854, she published two volumes of her travel memoirs entitled *Sunny Memories of Foreign Lands*, where she chronicles a visit to Sir William Hamilton while travelling in Scotland. There is no way Hamilton could not know of Harriet Beecher Stowe's work. She was publishing on the topic prior to her travels to Scotland, and there was press in Britain about her work on abolition and the success of the novel that was to become the bestselling book of the nineteenth century. In America, *Uncle Tom's Cabin* sold 10,000 copies in the first week and 300,000 copies the first year.<sup>59</sup> Notwithstanding her staggering success in America, Stowe's largest audience was in the United Kingdom where 1.5 million copies of her book were sold in the first year.<sup>60</sup> Despite the enormity of the slavery issue in Stowe's life, her recollections of Hamilton focus on the philosophical discussions Hamilton carried on with Stowe husband without mention of slavery. She wrote, "Sir William still writes and lectures. He and Mr. S. were soon discoursing on German, English, Scotch, and American metaphysics, while I was talking with Lady Hamilton and her daughters. After we came away Mr. S. said, that no man living had so thoroughly understood and analyzed the German philosophy".<sup>61</sup>

---

<sup>58</sup> See Sprague, William Buell (1865). *Visits to European Celebrities*, New York: Gould and Lincoln. P. 280.

<sup>59</sup> Boynton, Cynthia Wolfe (2014). *Remarkable Women of Hartford*; Charleston: The History Press, 39.

<sup>60</sup> See the web site, [HarrietBeecherStoweCenter.org](http://HarrietBeecherStoweCenter.org).

<sup>61</sup> Stowe, Harriet Beecher (1854). *Sunny memories of foreign lands*, Volume 1; Boston: Phillips, Sampson, and Company, 174.

On the other side of the issue, Hamilton seemed to be on good terms with pro-slavery advocates as well. One example is James Henley Thornwell, a Presbyterian minister from Columbia, South Carolina. He was born in 1812 and graduated from South Carolina College, where he eventually served as professor and president before joining the faculty of the Presbyterian Theological Seminary in Columbia. As an advocate of slavery, Thornwell wrote in 1850:

The parties in this conflict [referring to the conflict over slavery] are not merely Abolitionists and slaveholders - they are atheists, socialists, communists, red republicans, Jacobins on one side, and the friends of order and regulated freedom on the other. In one word, the world is the battleground - Christianity and atheism the combatants; and the progress of humanity at stake.<sup>62</sup>

Thornwell saw the controversy over slavery through the dual lens of the religious and political. Slavery was about the tension between states rights and a strong central government as well as somehow embodying the debate concerning the existence of God. Even though Hamilton didn't appear to take a stance on American slavery, his philosophy was an important conceptual backdrop to Thornwell's "cause". Much of Thornwell's correspondence, especially that to George Holmes, addressed technical issues of Hamilton's work. Thornwell had an audience and a voice; he founded the *Southern Presbyterian Review* and edited the *Southern Quarterly* in which he published articles utilizing the philosophical ideas and authority of Sir William Hamilton.

---

<sup>62</sup> Thornwell, James Henley (1850). [\*The Rights and the Duties of Masters\*](#), Press of Walker & James 14. Also quoted in Boyer, Richard and Morais, Herbert M. (1955), *Labor's Untold Story*. New York: Cameron Associates.

In addition, Thornwell was in correspondence with Hamilton himself. On 23 July 1855, Hamilton writes:

Rev. Dr. Thornwell — Sir: I beg leave to return my warmest acknowledgments for your Discourses on Truth. I have read them with great interest and no less admiration. I was particularly pleased with the justice with which, it seems to me, you have spoken of the comparative merits of [Aristotle](#) as a moralist, and cordially coincide with your judgment upon Paley and other modern ethical writers. I need hardly say that I feel much flattered by the way in which you have been pleased to make reference to myself; and I remain, sir,

Your most obedient servant, W. Hamilton<sup>63</sup>

It's hard to imagine that someone like Sir William Hamilton who was aware of the social and moral issues of his day and had strong views on most aspects of civic discourse, would be in favor of the institution of slavery. Nonetheless, Hamilton is surprisingly quiet on the issue.

So why was Hamilton so quiet on the issue of American slavery? Duncan Rice has noted that “Eighteenth century Scotland is an extraordinary case of a small society that developed a heavy economic commitment to slavery at the very time its intelligentsia were vehemently against it”.<sup>64</sup> Hamilton was heir apparent to that intelligentsia. His old professor George Jardine had campaigned against slavery. In the General Assembly of

---

<sup>63</sup> Palmer, B. M. (1875). *The life and letters of James Henley Thornwell*. Richmond: Whittet & Shepperson, 379.

<sup>64</sup> Rice, Duncan (1981), *The Scots Abolitionists 1833 – 1861* Baton Rouge, LA, p.19.

1823, Professor Jardine brought a motion that the issue of slavery should be included in the traditional loyal address to the King. It took Jardine two attempts to get the measure passed, but the end result was the formation of a committee to address the issue, and a few days later, they arrived at an agreement on a cautious and guarded statement”.<sup>65</sup> In addition, at Glasgow University John Millar’s “lectures contained a strong critique of slavery”.<sup>66</sup> Consequently, Hamilton’s intellectual heritage and role in that society gives us good reason to consider him in opposition to slavery, but it does not account for his lack of engagement. If most academics and intellectuals opposed slavery, might there be other reasons for some to actively participate while others passively watch?

One answer might lie in church politics. Ian White stated, “As in England the 1820s and the 1830s saw a shift away from the prominence of the national church in petitioning on slavery, with secessionists and dissenting churches playing a much more significant part”.<sup>67</sup> White continues, “The Assembly was not to debate the issue again in that decade”.<sup>68</sup> The year 1843 saw the Disruption of the Church of Scotland. The evangelical branch of the church broke with the established church forming the Free Church of Scotland. Hamilton had argued against the split; in 1843 he made an effort to prevent the Disruption by launching a pamphlet, *Be not Schismatics, Be not Martyrs By Mistake*. However, the pamphlet was published after the split. Though published after the fact, the newly formed Free Church did respond to Hamilton’s pamphlet through William Cunningham’s *Animadversions Upon Sir William Hamilton’s Pamphlet*. But Hamilton’s

---

<sup>65</sup> *Scotsman* 26 and 28 May 1823.

<sup>66</sup> Whyte, Iain (2006), *Scotland and the Abolition of Black Slavery, 1756-1838*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 58.

<sup>67</sup> Whyte, Iain, 255.

<sup>68</sup> *Ibid.*, 189.

health would soon fade, limiting his ability to fully engage in the aftermath of the church Disruption.

The Free Church was led by Dr. Thomas Chalmers (1780-1847), and encompassed about a third of the Church of Scotland's membership. The established church retained its endowments and property, so the Free Church was forced to find their own funding to build churches, schools and fund missionaries. The Free Church solicited money from members as well as sympathetic ministries in the United States. American records from a few years later show that in 1861, there were 12 synods of the Old School Church, 1275 churches, and 96,550 communicants, south of Mason and Dixon line. This growing body of Presbyterians from a slave-holding culture was solicited to help finance the Free Church.<sup>69</sup> Consequently, the Free Church was heavily criticized from home and abroad. An example of the out-cry against accepting money from slaveholders is George Thompson and Henry C. Wright:

To justify yourselves in this confederacy with man-stealers, you say you have entered into it for THEIR good, and that you are induced to persevere in it for the purpose of showing them their guilt, and of bringing them to repentance. The plea is specious, but most impious and fallacious. This is not the way you treat other thieves. Do you admit horse-stealers to your communion and pulpits, as Christians and Christian ministers, in order to bring them to repentance? When you hear of a community of sheep-stealers calling themselves Christians, do you send your Cunninghams and Lewises to

---

<sup>69</sup>, Gross, Alexander; Scouller, James; Foster, R.V. and Johnson, T. C. (1894). *A history of the Methodist church, South; the United Presbyterian church; the Cumberland Presbyterian church and the Presbyterian church, South, in the United States (1894)*; New York: The Christian Literature Company, 322.

them as your deputations, and Emu an alliance with them, engage in to receive them as Christians, in order to reform them?<sup>70</sup>

In 1846 Thompson had joined the “Send the Money Back” campaign with the former American slave Frederick Douglass (1818–1895). Douglass heavily criticized Christian practice in America, and particularly in the southern states. Douglass concluded his first autobiography with a poem he felt accurately depicted the inconsistency of American religion and slavery:

They’ll church is you sip a dram,  
And damn you if you steal a lamb;  
Yet rob old Tony, Doll, and Sam,  
Of human rights, bread and ham;  
Kidnappers heavenly union  
‘Love not the world,’ the preacher said,  
And winked his eye, and shook his head;  
He seized on Tom, and Dick, and Ned,  
Cut short their meat, and clothes, and bread,  
Yet still loved heavenly union.<sup>71</sup>

Douglass attributes the poetry to an anonymous northern Methodist minister, “who, while residing at the south, had the opportunity to see slave holding morals, manners, and piety with his own eyes. The poem is a parody of a Christian hymn and

---

<sup>70</sup> See *The Free Church and Her Accusers, the Question at Issue: A Letter from George Thompson, Henry Clarke Wright*. By George Thompson, Henry Clarke Wright, 7.

<sup>71</sup> Douglass, Frederick (1845), *Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass, an American Slave* published by the Anti-Slavery Office, 103-105.

just a couple of stanzas of the thirteen are enough to see Douglass' view on American Christian practice.

So in two senses, the Free Church owned the dialog on slavery. As evangelicals with an interest in planting churches globally, they naturally had an interest in the moral issues beyond Scotland. As Drummond states, "Agitation against slavery does not seem to have extended far beyond the Evangelical wing in Scotland".<sup>72</sup> Their other sense of ownership is in regards to living down the consequences of their position on slavery.

Therefore, Hamilton's silence on Slavery, in part, could be connected to the Free Church's ownership of the dialog – letting the evangelicals bear the consequences of their partnerships with the slave trade. Hamilton had argued against the split in the church, but at the same time he had been the target of evangelicals as they campaigned against him in his bid for the Philosophy Chair at Edinburgh. Drummond and Bulloch state that Hamilton won the Chair "against strong Evangelical opposition, and "the hostility of the Evangelicals to Hamilton's teaching was among the reasons for the attempt to found a chair of Philosophy in New College".<sup>73</sup> From this perspective it would seem that Hamilton would find it easy to speak out against slavery. He would be taking the high moral ground against the evangelicals that had rallied against him. However, there were also those in the Free Church who were taking a stand (of sorts) against slavery.

For example, one of the leading voices of the Free Church against slavery was George Combe. Hamilton and Combe had been on opposite sides of issues for years.

---

<sup>72</sup> Drummond, 144.

<sup>73</sup> Andrew L. Drummond and James Bulloch. *The Church in Victorian Scotland 1843-1874*, .279. Also see R.H. story, *Life and Remains of Robert Lee*, 162-63.

Hamilton had successfully faced off with Combe in the contest for the Chair of Logic and Metaphysics. Combe, with the evangelicals, successfully split from the established church contrary to Hamilton's arguments.<sup>74</sup> In addition, earlier in his pursuit of an academic career, Hamilton had a very public exchange with Combe on phrenology.<sup>75</sup> Hamilton was on the right side of the issue and held victorious by his supporters, but the strength of Hamilton's pamphlet was not indicative of a clear and decisive victory. Further, compare Harriet Beecher Stowe's comments on Hamilton where is focus was on German philosophy, and this remark she made of her very next visit to George Combe.

Mr. Combe, though somewhat advanced, seems full of life and animation, and conversed with a great deal of warmth and interest on America, where he made a tour some years since. Like other men in Europe who sympathize in our progress, he was sanguine in the hope that the downfall of slavery must come at no distant date.<sup>76</sup>

Combe took an active interest in the slavery problem and took the time to talk about that rather than philosophy or even his own work in phrenology.

Combe's book, *The Constitution of Man*, was one of the best-selling books of the nineteenth century, so his popularity as an author and a lecturer gave him a huge audience. In an 1858 review of the 8<sup>th</sup> edition, the *Illustrated London News* wrote:

No book published within the memory of man, in the English or any other language, has effected so great a revolution in the previously received opinions of society... The influence of that unpretending treatise has extended to hundreds of thousands of minds which know not whence they derived the new light that has broken in

---

<sup>74</sup> Hamilton's criticism was actually published after the vote to split the church.

<sup>75</sup> A brief discussion of Hamilton and Combe occurs in Chapter Four.

<sup>76</sup> Stowe, Harriet Beecher (1854). *Sunny memories of foreign lands*, Volume 1; Boston: Phillips, Sampson, and Company, 174.

upon them, and percolated into thousands of circles that are scarcely conscious of knowing more about Mr. Combe than his name, and the fact that he was a phrenologist. - the appearance of which created a sensation unparalleled by any philosophical work ever published in the language.<sup>77</sup>

Combe's popularity took him to the United States where in addition to his lectures in phrenology, he spoke out against slavery. During the interval between the close of his first course of lectures and the beginning of the second, Combe made an excursion to Baltimore where he was pointedly asked about his position on the issue. Combe was direct in his answer:

I know that slavery was instituted here by the British, that the infant colonies passed laws abolishing it, which were annulled by the king in council; that abolition is attended with very great difficulties; and that the slaveholders are personally the victims rather than the authors of the system. But all these considerations cannot make wrong right. They cannot make benevolence and justice approve of the scenes indicated by these advertisements. Every apology may be framed, therefore, for slavery, which the ingenuity of angel, man, and devil can invent, but the discord between it and the dictates of man's highest and noblest faculties ever jars upon the soul, and ever will jar, until it be abolished. Those who apologise for it, without proposing any measures for its ultimate termination, do not see this great fact—that this discord exists, will exist, and will never allow peace to the highest class of minds until such outrages to humanity shall cease to pollute the earth. They do not perceive that a just God governs the world, and that the

---

<sup>77</sup> Anonymous, (1858). *The Illustrated London* 28 August 1858.

dictates of these sentiments are His voice thundering against slavery. They speak of slavery as an institution permitted by His providence, and say that in His own good time He will bring it to an end. They may as well say that piracy, murder, and fire-raising, are institutions of His providence. They and slavery proceed from abuses of man's animal propensities, and God has given man the power of abusing all his faculties; but He never approves of these abuses: through the dictates of the higher sentiments He denounces them as disgraceful iniquities. In His government of the world He takes care that those who sow the wind shall! reap the whirlwind; and so will it be with the slaveholders, if they leave it to God's providence to put an end to the institution without making any moral effort themselves to abolish it. He will abolish it; but it will be in tempest and storm, in blood and devastation, in cries and misery. He now calls on *them* to abolish it in mercy and peace.<sup>78</sup>

Combe's fame as a phrenologist in America put him in touch with many of the literary figures as well as anti-slavery activists including Frederick Douglass. In 1846, Douglass met Combe whom he called "the eminent mental philosopher". Douglass cited Combe in *The Claims of the Negro Ethnologically Considered* to show that people "instinctively can distinguish between men and brutes. Common sense itself is scarcely needed to recognize (manhood's) presence in them".<sup>79</sup> Maurice Lee has noted, "Combe was by no means free from racism, but his ideas were useful to Douglass".<sup>80</sup>

---

<sup>78</sup> Lee, Maurice S. (2005) *Slavery Philosophy and American Literature 1830 – 1860*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 106

<sup>79</sup> Douglass, Fredrick, *The Claims of the Negro, Ethnologically Considered, An Address Before the Literary Societies of Western Reserve College, at Commencement, July 12, 1854*. Rochester: Printed By Lee, Mann & CO., Daily American Office, Rochester. 1854.

<sup>80</sup> Lee, Maurice S. (2005) *Slavery Philosophy and American Literature 1830 – 1860*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 106.

There may be no way to know for sure the reasons for Hamilton's lack of comment on American slavery, but as we have seen, there seem to be several factors that could have contributed to his silence. First, the topic rested in the evangelical branch of the Disruption. Second, the timeline for much of this discussion on slavery starts a year prior to Hamilton's stroke. Recall that as early as 1848, Bancroft had observed Hamilton was suffering from the infirmities of palsy. Sprague's visit was in 1850, the Stowes in 1853, and Hamilton's correspondence with Thornwell was in 1855. So third, there was a good chance that Hamilton's health also contributed to his lack of engagement. With his fading health Hamilton would have been hard-pressed to take on the likes of George Combe nor might he be willing to add his voice to Combe's as it could be mistaken for an endorsement of phrenology and the Scottish evangelicals. In contrast, Combe's career and reputation was on the rise while Hamilton's health was in decline and his reputation at risk.<sup>81</sup>

### **Religion in America**

The "Send the Money Back" campaign on one hand and James Thornwell on the other demonstrates that for many, religion was at the centre of American culture.

Another interesting reaction and application of the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton was that he was seen as both a champion and foe to the Christian cause in the America.

On one hand, he was touted as the definitive answer to the Skepticism of David Hume.

---

<sup>81</sup> For example, consider the views of Taylor Innes (1833-1912) a former student of Hamilton: "His influence was stimulus rather than Pabulum; and before returning to his class for the second customary session I, not yet seventeen years old, had reasoned myself to the conviction (shared, I think by most of his best students, including even his biographer Veitch) that his own system, and in particular that central part of it which he handed on to Mansel of Oxford, was cracked from top to bottom". (A. Taylor Innes, *Chapters of Reminiscence*, 26-27)

From this perspective Sir William Hamilton's philosophy embodied the best of the two most famous thinkers to answer Hume: Thomas Reid and Immanuel Kant. In addition, Hamilton's philosophy of the conditioned was used to affirm the Christian faith in the face of scientific positivism. On the other hand, this same philosophy of the conditioned was seen to be a dangerous idea where its logical implications pointed away from Christianity towards agnosticism. An article in *The North American Review* framed the debate:

Yet that there is no little doubt as to its ultimate theological tendencies is evidenced by the conflicting appeals made to it by antagonistic schools of thought. Dogmatism is divided against itself as to the veritable drift of its tenets. One party declares that, since all speculative cognition of the Infinite and Absolute is proved impossible, man's carnal reason is humbled, deprived of all basis for heterodox conclusions, and compelled to acknowledge authority and faith as the final criteria of religious truth; while another party avers with equal emphasis that, by teaching the utter incomprehensibility of the Infinite, systematic theology throws suspicion on the capacity of man to receive a Divine revelation, and thereby invalidates its own revealed doctrines.<sup>82</sup>

So, arguments against Hamilton's philosophy of the condition emphasized the skeptical implications of the doctrine that undermined the reliability of Divine revelation. An 1865 article on faith and science in *The North American Review* claimed Hamilton to be a sponsor of the skeptical cause:

---

<sup>82</sup> Anonymous (1864). The Conditioned and the Unconditioned. *The North American Review*. 0099 (Issue: 205); 402-449.

The battle is now far more definitely urged than it has ever been before. Kant and Sir William Hamilton, having become the adopted philosophic sponsors of the sceptical cause, endow it with arms of superior temper to any it has yet wielded; while Cousin and his followers, who are now confessed champions of super-naturalism, impart to the opposite camp an unwonted intellectual grace and dignity. From having once recognized infinite and finite, God and man, as substantive cognitions, it now recognizes Nature alone; and does not hesitate to avow by the voice of her bolder disciples, M. Comte and Taine in France, Sir William Hamilton, Mr. Mansel, and Mr. Spencer in England, that neither infinite nor finite, neither absolute nor relative, have any reality to us, save as signs of our own mental imbecility; and hence that all legitimate inquiry restricts itself to the realm of Nature, the realm of the phenomenal or the indefinite.<sup>83</sup>

Where Christian philosophers saw these implications as deeply flawed, some secular thinkers like Thomas Huxley, found them to be compelling and logical. Huxley claimed, "In early life, as he told me, and has since told the world, he became captivated by the philosophical doctrines of the late Sir William Hamilton; and Hamilton and Mansel are mainly responsible for an agnosticism which is the logical outcome of their teaching and his mind was a very logical one".<sup>84</sup>

For Hamilton, both the Christian criticism and the secular notion of embracing the skepticism were incorrect. Hamilton's position was much closer to that of

---

<sup>83</sup> Anonymous (1865), Faith and Science. *The North American Review*. 0101 (Issue 209), 335-379.

<sup>84</sup> Huxley, Thomas (1898). "Thomas Huxley," *The Living Age*. 0216 (Issue 2794), 247.

Immanuel Kant where in the preface of the second addition of *The Critic of Pure Reason* Kant states that he wants to show the limits of reason to make room for faith. Like Kant, Hamilton understood that our sense of morality provides proof for the existence of God, and ultimately Hamilton denies speculative reason a role in faith. Josiah P. Cooke, Erving Professor of Chemistry and Mineralogy at Harvard University stated, “That intelligence stands first in the absolute order of existence, in other words, that final preceded efficient causes, and that the universe is governed by moral laws, are the two propositions, the proof of which, says Sir William Hamilton, is the proof of a God; and this proof establishes its foundation exclusively on the phenomena of mind.”<sup>85</sup>

Sixteen years later George Stevens, an American minister, saw the connection between the ideas of Kant and Sir William Hamilton. Writing in 1881 for the *New Englander and Yale Review*, Stevens states:

Kant in his Critique attributes to reason the power of acting in two directions or relations. In one case reason is conversant with what we know; in the other, with what we ought to do. To reason in these two separate functions Kant gives the names speculative and practical respectively. The speculative reason cannot attain to the knowledge of the Divine Being, but the practical reason brings in the idea of God as the postulate of moral action which thus becomes a regulative principle in human life. Similar to this view is the theory of Sir William Hamilton and Dr. Mansel. They say that since God is infinite, he cannot be known, and yet they insist upon the necessity of belief in him. Hamilton’s language on this point is: When I deny that the Infinite can by us be known, I am far from denying that by us it is, must, and ought to be believed. This theory as does also Kant’s

---

<sup>85</sup> Cooke, Josiah P. (1865). “Natural Theology as a Positive Science”; *The North American Review*. 0100 (Issue 206), 177.

which it resembles seems to divide the soul against itself. It asserts a moral basis for faith, but denies to it the authority of the speculative reason. Indeed the speculative reason would make shipwreck of faith altogether, did not the practical moral reason hasten to the rescue. The outcome of this doctrine is, that faith, however well founded, has itself only a regulative and practical, not a speculative and theoretical application".<sup>86</sup>

It was easier for later 19<sup>th</sup> century writers like Stevens to identify Hamilton with Kant as German philosophy had become commonplace in American colleges. In some sense, articles like this one by Stevens show a connection between the Scottish school of thought as it began to fade, and the German school of thought as it was on the rise. Sir William Hamilton's employment of Kantian principle in his own work was the means by which American academics were introduced to Kant. The Scottish school ushered in its own replacement through its last philosophical champion.

### **The breadth of Hamilton's legacy in America**

Sir William Hamilton's connection to the United States was substantial. He had a strong literary representation across several disciplines in America, including philosophy, education, psychology and religion. Hamilton had influential academic followers who pushed his ideas deep into the American university curriculum. Hamilton entertained major American political power brokers who travelled to Scotland. This connection to American dignitaries placed Hamilton in an information loop that was just one person removed from seven different American Presidents from Polk to Andrew Johnson even though I found no evidence that any of the American Presidents had conversations specifically about Hamilton with those who came to visit. However,

---

<sup>86</sup> Stevens, Geo. B., Rev.(1881). "The Authority of Faith". *New Englander and Yale Review* . 0040 (Issue 161), 432-445.

education was an important political topic. Those who did visit Hamilton did discuss education and in turn those people continued the dialogue back in the United States at the highest level. Therefore, the breadth of Sir William Hamilton's literary representation on the American Stage, through American books and journals, can be gleaned through the sampling given in the catalogue that follows in Section II.

## Section II

### Introduction

This section chronicles a strong sampling of books and journals by and about Professor George Jardine and Sir William Hamilton. I include articles that make use of or reference the ideas of these two thinkers as well as any of their publications found in America. These catalogues start in 1818 and run through to the end of the nineteenth century.

The first catalogue looks at books and journals with an interest in George Jardine. As already explained in Chapter 3 Jardine had a literary presence in the United States but it was not extensive. For instance, I have only found Jardine represented in seven books and in some of those Jardine is given minor attention. I have, however, made the case that Jardine's influence on the American intellect was in terms of his pedagogy and philosophy of education. Jardine's ideas were transmitted and utilized by some of his students who immigrated to the United States. As an example of this influence I have included catalogues of two of his students, Alexander Campbell and William Russell.

I included Campbell for two main reasons: first he acknowledges that Jardine played an important role in his own education as well as in the formation of his educational philosophy. In addition, Campbell was an important figure in American education as the founder Bethany College, a university still in existence today. An indication of Jardine's influence on Bethany College is evident in special collections holdings at the college library that contain Campbell's own note book from when he was a student in Jardine's class at the University of Glasgow. This notebook mirrors many of

the key points that Jardine published in his *Outlines*. Another reason to include Campbell in this section is that he was a prolific writer and published volumes of work. So whereas Jardine's own publication received a warm but limited reception in the United States, the pedagogical skills and methods he taught were widely circulated in Campbell's legacy.

William Russell is included under Jardine because he was intimately associated with American education. He was the first editor and primary contributor to the *American Journal of Education* as well as an author of several books on the topic and most biographical accounts of Russell acknowledge Jardine's influence.

Sir William Hamilton's representation in American publications is quite different than that of his old professor Jardine. Hamilton was an accepted intellectual authority in philosophy, education, religion and psychology. Americans were eager to bolster their own credibility by supporting their views with reference to his words. In addition there was interest in the examination and criticism of Europe's most famous scholar.

I use the same format for the books with an interest in Hamilton as I do with Jardine. However, in the case of the journals, I have organized them topically rather than just as an annotated list.

## George Jardine in American Books

**Title:** *History of the Peace: Being a History of England from 1816 to 1854*. With an Introduction 1800 to 1815

**Author:** Martineau, Harriet, 1802-1876.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Walker, Wise, and Company, 1865-66.

**Nature of Citation:** Jardine has one short segment that is biographical; Jardine is listed as one of the men of letters who died during this time period (page 208).

**Title:** *Christopher North*, a memoir of John Wilson, late professor of moral philosophy in the University of Edinburgh, compiled from family papers and other sources by his daughter, Mrs. Gordon, with an introduction by R. Shelton Mackenzie.

**Author:** Gordon, Mary (Wilson) Mrs.

**Publication Info:** New York: W. J. Widdleton, 1863.

**Nature of Citation:** This book is an American reprint of a book originally published in Scotland. Jardine is mentioned throughout the book generally portrayed as Wilson's professor, friend and advisor. Wilson lived with Jardine during his Glasgow years and Jardine remained a close friend for the remainder of his life.

**Title:** *The Poetical Works of Thomas Campbell With a Memoir*.

**Author:** Campbell, Thomas, 1777-1844.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Little, Brown, & co., 1866.

**Nature of Citation:** Cites Jardine as one of Thomas Campbell's professors and describes prizes Jardine awarded Campbell while he was a student at the University of Glasgow. This account of Jardine notes that he appointed Campbell as a student examiner in logic.

**Title:** *Lives of Boulton and Watt*.

**Author:** Smiles, Samuel, 1812-1904.

**Publication Info:** London: John Murray, 1865.

**Nature of Citation:** A passing mention that quotes Jardine's recollection of a conversation he had with James Watt about the nature of ideas and invention.

**Title:** *American Pedagogy. Education, the school, and the teacher in American literature*

**Author:** Barnard, Henry, ed. 1811-1900.

**Publication Info:** Hartford: Brown & Gross, 1876.

**Nature of Citation:** This book demonstrates that Jardine's ideas were known and appreciated in the United States. Barnard acknowledges Jardine's ideas concerning the "cultivation of the reflective faculties". Jardine is credited as an early innovator for his pedagogical strategies as laid out in his *Outlines*.

"It is true that, in some educational establishments, a more liberal view of logic is entertained, and that, in these seminaries, the science is regarded not merely as one which teaches the art of reasoning, but as that which investigates and enunciates the laws of thought, and involves, therefore, a knowledge of the elements of intellectual philosophy, together with the application of all the principles of mental science which affect the

exercise of any class of the various powers and faculties of the mind. An instructive exposition of this view of logic, as the first stage of purely intellectual discipline, is given in the "Outlines of Philosophic Education," by the late Professor Jardine, of Glasgow University, who, for fifty years, conducted, with distinguished success, his course of instruction, on the plan delineated in his work. That eminently skillful teacher, -for he regarded the duties of a professor in his department as consisting quite as much in conducting the practical processes of training exercises, as in the didactic routine of lecturing,-regarded the study of the Aristotelian logic but as a very limited part of intellectual discipline, and, while he allowed it its distinct place and full value, justly maintained that, for the purposes of modern education, which imply so wide and varied applications of thought,-in directions so different from those pursued in ancient times,-the sphere of study must be greatly enlarged beyond the narrow limits of the scholastic discipline, and a course of training prescribed which shall prepare the mind for the new demands made upon its powers, in the new modes of action with which modern science is conversant. This broader view of logical discipline is fortunately taken by several of our own recent writers on the subject; and the course of instruction is, accordingly, in some seminaries, enlarged so as to embrace the elements of intellectual philosophy, as indispensable to clear and satisfactory views of logic itself, and to the purposes for which the study of logic was originally constituted a department of education." 133.

**Title:** *A Critical Dictionary of English literature, and British and American authors, living and deceased, from the earliest accounts to the middle of the nineteenth century. Containing thirty thousand biographies and literary notices, with forty indexes of subjects.* By S. Austin Allibone.

**Author:** Allibone, Samuel Austin, 1816-1889.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & co. [etc.], 1859-71.

**Nature of Citation:** Dictionary style entry about Jardine including publications and praise from *Westminster Review* and *Blackwood's*.

**Title:** *Lectures on Metaphysics and Logic by Sir William Hamilton, bart.* Edited by the Rev. Henry L. Mansel and John Veitch.

**Author:** Hamilton, William, Sir, 1788-1856.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln, Sheldon and company: etc., etc., 1859-63.

**Nature of Citation:** Hamilton quotes Jardine on pedagogical strategies and praises him stating that Jardine had "done more for the intellectual improvement of his pupils than any other public instructor in this country within the memory of man".

There are other Scottish texts that reference Jardine that made their way to the United States. However, the dates of acquisition are not always available. For example, I have found copies of *Selections from the family papers preserved at Caldwell* in the Allen County Public Library Genealogy Center in Fort Wayne, Indiana. This book contains correspondence of Professor Jardine with Baron Mure. Correspondence and miscellaneous papers of William Mure, esq., 1777-1821. In addition, there are library

holdings of Jardine's *Outlines* at the University of Toronto and the Pollak Library of California State Fullerton but the acquisition dates are still a question. The *Outlines* (1818) are also listed in *A Catalogue of the Holdings Belonging to the Library Company of Philadelphia* (1835), 209. An 1825 edition of the *Outlines* is accounted for in *Catalogue of the Library, U.S. Military Academy, West Point, N.Y. 1873*.

From the survey of texts above, Jardine's representations in American books were usually biographical or anecdotal with the exception of the book on American pedagogy. Jardine had a much stronger presence in American educational journals.

## George Jardine in American Journals

Publication: *The Academician* edited by Albert Picket, John W. Picket Vol. 1 no.6, Tuesday May 19, 1818.

**Title:** Outlines of Philosophical Education abstracted from Dr. Jardine of Glasgow University.

**Nature of Citation:** This journal is dedicated to Jardine's *Outlines*: "As we have long been actively engaged in the scholastic profession, we may have formed some notions which are not altogether correct. There is one, however, which we have long entertained, and are glad to see confirmed in the writings of the celebrated Dr. Jardine. In introducing it, we shall use his own language, and we should certainly be much rejoiced to know that our instructors had conducted the studies of their pupils by the spirit of the observation, which is applicable not only to colleges but schools" (Preface).

"IN modern times, numerous treatises have been written, both in our own and in foreign languages, on the subject of education. No one of these works, however, able and judicious as some of them undoubtedly are, deserves to be implicitly followed by a guide, in a matter confessedly so important; for no one of them comprehends, in its details, the various topics which ought to be introduced in a system, of philosophic education, nor sets forth these still more essential duties of the teacher, which consist in adapting his instruction to the opening capacity of his pupils; in supplying them with constant and suitable employment; and in conducting them gradually from things more easy to things more difficult, in the natural order of the sciences. The truth, indeed, seems to be, that a systematic exposition of the different methods of teaching, considered merely as ancient, rather than as a practical and progressive scheme, for directing the efforts of those who are just entering upon the study of the sciences, has occupied the attention, and exhausted the ingenuity, of the more eminent among the writers to whom we have now alluded. There appears to be still wanting a regular elementary system of scholastic or academical study; which, uniting speculation with practice, principles and rules with suitable illustrations and exercises, would embrace the means which seem best calculated to call forth and strengthen the intellectual powers of youth. It is of less moment, perhaps, from what branches of science or of art the materials, constituting such a system, should be drawn; provided they be carefully adapted to the actual state of information in which the pupils, generally speaking, are found, at the commencement of the course of instruction, and agreeing in their tendency to create habits of diligence, and of independent exertion. Were it, indeed, the main object of the teacher, in the first lessons of instruction, to expound the doctrines of any art or science..." (293)

Publication: *The Academician* edited by Albert Picket, John W. Picket. Vol. 1 no.25, Tuesday Feb 7, 1820.

Title: Outlines of Philosophical Education abstracted from Dr. Jardine of Glasgow University.

Nature of Citation: In terms of Jardine this edition is a reprint of Vol 1 no. 6 as given above.

Publication: *American Journal of Education*, Vol. 1, no. 2 February 1826 edited by William Russell.

Title: "REVIEWS": Outlines of Philosophical Education, illustrated by the method of teaching the Logic Class in the University of Glasgow; together with Observations on the expediency of extending the Practical System to other Academical Establishments, and on the propriety of making certain additions to the Course of Philosophical Education in Universities. By George Jardine, A. M., F. R. S. E., Professor of Logic and Rhetoric in that University. Second edition, enlarged. Glasgow, 1825, 542.

**Nature of Citation:** "PERSONS who take a deep interest in the subject of education, will find this volume the most interesting that for many years has issued from the press. Intellectual culture is in this work raised to that elevation to which it is entitled, from its dignity as a department of science, no less than of art, and from its important relation, to the business of life. The author of the *Outlines*—an eminent practical philosopher and a veteran in the service of education— takes the young instructor by the hand, and places him at the feet of a sound and enlightened philosophy, there to watch the development of the mind, and to ascertain that course of discipline, which is best adapted to the constitution and the condition of man. The venerable professor ennobles the art of teaching by raising it above the mere process of mechanical routine and drudgery, and by infusing into its details the spirit of intellectual science. He carries the teacher to a point from which a commanding survey of the whole field of education may be taken, and enables him to enter on the duties of his station, with those comprehensive views and inspiring principles which give efficiency and dignity to instruction." (542).

**Publication:** *American Journal of Education* Vol. I, September 1826.

**Title:** Professional Education.

**Nature of Citation:** "It is under these impressions, and with an earnest desire to secure a more extensive and watchful attention to this important subject, that we have devoted so much space to Professor Jardine's history of improvement in the university, in which he so long discharged his laborious and respected office. Our extracts from the *Outlines* have served, we think, to show that public sentiment cannot ultimately be thwarted or baffled, that its demands must be complied with; that a prudent attention to the state of society will secure to literary institutions the respect and the attachment of the communities in which they are placed; and that a moderate but firm course of conduct, even in an individual, may accomplish results which shall entitle him to the gratitude of posterity. The limits of a review will not admit of a full statement of all the methods adopted by Professor Jardine in his course of instruction, nor even of all the departments in which he produced a reformation. The subjects of his lectures, as presented in the *Outlines*, are the following: the elements of intellectual science, treated in a plain, practical, and popular style, adapted to young students; the formation and progress of language; the elements of intellectual culture and improvement, applied to the various faculties of man, and embracing the formation and refinement of taste. From the remarks on the composition of lectures for a first class in philosophy we extract the following passage, as one which contains matter highly important to teachers in every department,

and glows, at the same time, with the simple and earnest eloquence of a mind sincerely and warmly devoted to the improvement of the young. 'Teachers of philosophy, generally speaking, address their pupils from written lectures or very copious notes. Experience, however, has convinced me, that a constant and slavish reading ought of all things to be avoided; and that a mode of delivery should be attempted, more or less approaching to extemporaneous speaking. There are no doubt many details, in a course of lectures, which may be read with advantage; but upon the more important and interesting parts of his subject, the professor should speak to his students from clear and just views of the matter in hand, and from the deep impression made on his own mind. The constant reader of written lectures is in the eye of youth, a sort of mechanical performer; and can seldom avoid becoming tiresome and monotonous in his delivery'. How well so ever he may read, he cannot give the proper advantage to the matter of his lectures, nor acquire that influence over the minds of his pupils which is placed within his reach. The frame of mind, too, in which the lectures may have been composed, the warmth and earnestness which may have been felt in the first train of thought, are usually found to evaporate in the formal reading of them, when that train is no longer kept up in the memory, so as to warm the imagination. The extempore method, also, brings the mind of the speaker into closer contact with that of the hearer; accommodates itself more easily to the wants of the latter; enables the teacher to repeat what has not been fully conceived, to change the mode of illustration, to relieve the attention, to excite the curiosity, and to direct, anticipate, and assist the students in a great variety of ways, which are in vain to be expected from the reader of a written lecture. The practice of reading has another bad effect, in as much as it precludes, almost entirely, the intercourse of looks and feeling which should subsist between the professor and his students, during the delivery of the lecture; for it would make but little difference, provided he were distinctly heard, if the reader were concealed altogether, and pronounced his discourse in a contiguous apartment. When, on the other hand, lectures are delivered extempore, as the expression comes warm from the active thought and animated feelings of the teacher, there is produced in the moment a species of sympathetic influence between him and his pupils, which it is not easy to describe, but of which the effects are well understood. He, too, who speaks extempore can look around with freedom, and form an estimate not only of the attention which is bestowed, but also of the interest with which the lecture is received. He perceives, from the expression of the countenance and the attitude of the body, whether the mind of the student is caught and carried along by the argument, or whether he is left behind and laboring to keep up with the progress of the discussion. The advantages arising from this intercourse between the mind and the eye, in a numerous class, composed principally of very young men, are neither few nor unimportant. They have been appreciated less or more by all teachers, and turned to a practical use by such as had sufficient skill to mark their tendency. I have heard, from the celebrated Adam Smith, who was long professor of moral philosophy in this university, that almost every session there were some of his students, from whose countenances and general behavior he was enabled to judge whether his lectures were fully understood. There was an intelligent and composed posture of the body which he could easily distinguish from that which denoted a doubtful or unsatisfied mind. "One session," said he, " I observed an intelligent student who generally sat in the same place, with his back to the wall. When he perfectly understood the lecture, he sat with his body bending forwards, in the attitude

of animated attention; but whenever he found me above his level, he threw his body back to the wall, and continued in a careless posture. That was a signal to me. I instantly retreated, took up the subject in another form; and never ceased my efforts till my marksman bent forward, and was restored to his attentive position. Then we went on harmoniously together."[sic]

The second part of Professor Jardine's work is devoted to a particular account of his method of conducting the business of his class; and to some valuable suggestions for improvement in this and other departments of university business. The leading peculiarity of the professor's method was a progressive series of compositions or themes on the subjects of his lectures. These afforded a useful exercise in recalling and considering the subjects which the professor investigated, and thus training the mind to the invaluable habits of attention and reflection. But this was not the only benefit of such exercises: they cultivated, at the same time, a facility and accuracy in writing, which was farther aided and improved by the collateral exercise of recapitulating, orally, the substance of each lecture—a practice which tended greatly to facilitate the habit of extemporaneous address. Another valuable exercise consisted in giving, in the presence of the professor and the class, an oral abstract of whatever author a student might happen to be reading at his leisure hours; another in giving full and accurate definitions on subjects proposed without premeditation; and another, in mutual instruction applied to composition and criticism. Professor Jardine's discipline and general management were peculiarly happy. An account of these may be found in the *United States Literary Gazette*, for December 1st, 1825. The character of Professor Jardine as an instructor cannot be more justly or more happily given, than by applying to himself a passage from his own work.

**Publication:** *American Journal of Education* No. X, Vol. I, Oct 1826.

**Title:** Professional Education.

**Nature of Citation:** A serialized excerpt reprinted from Jardine's *Outlines*.

**Publication:** *American Journal of Education* No. IX, Vol. I, Nov 1826.

**Title:** On the Systems of Education Established in the Universities, and on the Means to Improving Them.

**Nature of Citation:** A continuation of a serialized excerpt reprinted from Jardine's *Outlines*.

**Publication:** *American Journal of Education* No. VII, Vol. I, Dec 1826.

**Title:** Professional Education.

**Nature of Citation:** An excerpt reprinted from Jardine's *Outlines*.

**Publication:** *American Journal of Education* No. VII, Vol. II, Jan 1827.

**Title:** Professional Education.

**Nature of Citation:** An excerpt reprinted from Jardine's *Outlines*.

**Publication:** *American Journal of Education* No. VII, Vol. II, Feb 1826.

**Title:** Professional Education.

**Nature of Citation:** An excerpt reprinted from Jardine's *Outlines*.

**Publication:** *American Journal of Education* No. VII, Vol. I, Dec 1827.

**Title** George Jardine Obituary.

**Nature of Citation:** “While thus bearing our testimony to the Christian excellence of one of our instructors, we cannot forbear also recording our grateful recollections of another of our revered teachers, George Jardine, Esq., Professor of Logic in the University of Glasgow. Full of years and honors, this venerable man departed this life on the 23d January, aged 85. It is a scripture declaration, 'Thou shall rise up before the hoary head, and honor the face of the old man;' and we know no one, to whom those who have enjoyed the benefit of his instructions, have more gladly paid these marks of deference and respect. For ourselves, we remember with pleasure, the improvement we derived from the teachings of 'that old man eloquent,' and we are confident, that no one who marked his faithful discharge of the duties of his important station, the kindness which distinguished his behavior to his students, the deep interest he evinced in their improvement, and the benevolent joy which beamed on his countenance, at the efforts of opening intellect, can dwell upon his memory, without feelings of gratitude and veneration. We cannot form a better wish for his successor, than that the mantle of Elijah may fall upon Elisha. *Christian Pioneer.*” (748).

**Publication:** *American Journal of Education* No. XI, Vol. I, November 1826.

**Title:** The Systems of Education.

**Nature of Citation:** A serialized excerpt reprinted from Jardine’s *Outlines*.

**Publication:** *The American Journal of Education.* No. VIII. Mar, 1857.

**Title:** William Russell.

**Nature of Citation:** “THE following are a few particulars of the professional life of Mr. William Russell, the editor of the first periodical published in the English language, devoted exclusively to the advancement of Education, and for nearly forty years an active teacher and laborer in the educational field.”

“Mr. Russell was born in Glasgow, Scotland, and was educated at the Latin school, and the university of that city. During his course of study in the latter of these institutions, the "First Philosophy Class," embracing the subjects of intellectual philosophy, logic and rhetoric, was, fortunately for Mr. Russell, in his subsequent life as a teacher, under the care of Professor George Jardine, author of the "Outlines of Philosophical Education." That eminent and revered instructor, by his zeal and eloquence on his favorite theme, the philosophy of human culture, awakened a lively sympathy with his views, in the minds of his students. After fifty years noble service, he still retained a warm feeling for whatever concerned the subject of education; as he manifested in his cordial expressions of pleasure on the establishment of the American Journal of Education, in the city of Boston, in the year 1826.” (139).

**Publication:** *The American Journal of Education*, Vol. 14, no. 11, September 1864 edited by Henry Barnard.

**Title:** Introduction.

**Nature of Citation:** “WILLIAM RUSSELL, the early, constant, and able advocate of the professional organization and action of teachers, was born in Glasgow, Scotland, in 1798. Educated in the Latin School and University of his native city, and thoroughly imbued

with the spirit and philosophical views of Prof. George Jardine, (author of *"Philosophical Education"*) he came to this country in 1817, and commenced his life-long work of teacher and educator, in Georgia. In the very place and state where he has since lived, he has labored with pen, voice, and personal influence to bring teachers together for consultation and united action. By his *"Suggestions on Education,"* published in New Haven, in 1823, while he was Principal of the New Township Academy, and the Hopkins Grammar School; by his *"Manual of Mutual Instruction"* in 1826; by the *"American Journal of Education"* Boston, 1826-9, his advocacy of *"Teachers' Associations"* before a county convention of teachers at Dorchester, (Mass.,) in 1830, and of *"Infant and Primary Schools,"* in Boston, in the same year; by his *"Journal of Instruction,"* in 1831, the organ of the Philadelphia Association of Teachers, which he projected during his connection with a School for Young Ladies' in Germantown, and afterward in Philadelphia; by his *"Lectures on Normal Training,"* in his Normal School at Reed's Ferry, in New Hampshire, and at Lancaster, Mass., since published in Barnard's *"American Journal of Education ;"* by his *"Address on the Education of Females"* at Andover, Mass., in 1843; by his *"Suggestions on Teacher Institutes,"* first issued in 1846, and his annual labors and instructions in those eminently professional schools for twenty years past; by his published lectures on *"Duties of Teachers"* in 1850, on the *"Encouragements of Teachers"* in 1853, and on the *"Organization of Teachers as a Profession"* before the New Hampshire State Teachers' Association, in 1849, and the Massachusetts State Teachers' Association, in 1856, and the National Teachers' Convention, in 1857, Professor Russell has done noble service to the cause of American education, and earned the profound respect and gratitude of every American teacher. How touchingly does he allude to himself and his compeers, in the closing paragraph of his address at Philadelphia, in 1857." (5)

**Publication:** *The American Journal of Education*, Vol. 31, 1886.

**Title:** Education in College and University Studies, Historical Development by David Ross (Glasgow).

**Nature of Citation:** In 1774 George Jardine, a graduate of the university, who had become acquainted with the advanced views of education held by French writers on the subject during his residence in Paris, as private tutor of a son of Lord Bruce, from 1771 to 1773, was elected to the Chair of Logic and Rhetoric at Glasgow, and soon inaugurated a new method of treating the subjects of his professorship; and in the course of each year illustrated his views of education, both as a science and art, and thus in reality began university instruction in Pedagogics. In 1818 these lectures were published, with the title of *Outlines of a System of Philosophical Education*, which were characterized by *Blackwood's Magazine* of that year "as worthy of all praise." (563).

**Publication:** *The American Whig Review*, Vol. 0012, Issue 34 (Oct 1850) / Volume 12, Issue: 34, Oct 1850, pp. 405-429.

**Title:** Life and Correspondence of Campbell.

**Nature of Citation:** From the Life and Letters of Thomas Campbell edited by William Beatie. "At the university, as at school, Campbell maintained a high standing, and was commissioned by Professor Jardine to examine the exercises sent in by other students in the logic class." (407)

**Publication Info:** *The Atlantic Monthly* Volume 0011 Issue 65 (March 1863) / Volume 11, Issue: 65, March 1863, pp. 273-288.

**Title:** Christopher North by Howard, Joseph Dana.

**Nature of Citation:** In regards to Wilson, “he went, when twelve years of age, to Glasgow University. Professor Jardine, who then held the chair of Logic, was fully alive to the rare promise of his pupil, and said of him subsequently, He lived in my family during the whole course of his studies at Glasgow, and the general superintendence of his education was committed to me; and it is but justice to him to declare, that during my long experience I never had a pupil who discovered more genius, more ardor, or more active and persevering diligence. But his ardor was not limited to philosophy and the humanities: his powers required a larger field than the curriculum. He walked, ran, wrestled, boxed, boated, fished, wrote poetry, played the flute, danced, kept a careful diary, and read largely.” (275).

**Publication Info:** *The Living Age* Volume 0060 Issue 771 (March 5, 1859) / Volume 60, Issue: 771, March 5, 1859, pp. 578-641.

**Title:** Professor Wilson by Thomas De Quincey.

**Nature of Citation:** This article is a biographical piece on Wilson with a passing reference to Jardine. “Agreeably to this Scottish usage, Wilson was sent at a boyish age to the University of Glasgow, and for some years was placed under the care of Professor Jardine. From Glasgow, and we believe, in his eighteenth year he was transferred to Oxford.” (580).

**Publication:** *The Living Age* Volume 0076 Issue 979 (March 7, 1863) / Volume 76, Issue: 979, March 7, 1863, pp. 433-480.

**Title:** Christopher North from *The Quarterly Review* Christopher North: a Memoir of John Wilson by his Daughter Mrs. Gordon.

**Nature of Citation:** This article is a serialized reprint of Mrs. Gordon’s book previously published in Scotland: “at twelve years of age, he became a student at Glasgow College, and a boarder in the house of one of the best men and ablest teachers of whom Scotland could then boast the late Professor Jardine.” (436).

“From his twelfth to his eighteenth year Wilson continued to reside, during term time, in Professor Jardine’s family, and was an indefatigable student in his class. He attended likewise the prelections of John Young, the Professor of Greek, of whom, as well as of Professor Jardine, he often speaks in terms of the warmest commendation. Nor were these commendations undeserved, whether Young or Jardine chanced to be the subject of them. They were both men of extraordinary power as teachers. The former, small in person, with a keen black eye, seemed to catch the very spirit of each separate author as he spread out the page before him; and, himself laughing or weeping, he threw his pupils into fits, or brought tears from their eyes, according as he read aloud some passage from the *Clouds* of Aristophanes, or lingered over the parting scene between Hector and Andromache. Jardine, on the other hand, possessed, above all the teachers whom we have known or of whom we have read, the art of fostering and bringing into play the peculiar talent, whatever it might be, which belonged to his scholars individually.” (437).

**Publication Info:** *The North American Review* Volume 0027 Issue 60 (July 1828) / Volume 27, Issue: 60, July 1828, pp. 67-89

**Title:** Universities

**Nature of Citation:** The author of this article favours a continental education over those offered in the United Kingdom. The author seems to lump English and Scottish pedagogies into one: “The course of instruction, on the British system, is most thorough at Edinburgh, the first of the universities of Scotland, which are both schools and colleges, as the English universities formerly were. The college was founded in that city in 1681, and has been particularly famous, at all times, for distinguished professors in the medical department. A large building, for the use of the university, was commenced in 1789, but is not yet finished. The library contains about fifty thousand volumes, and the number of students is about one thousand seven hundred. The classical High School, in the same city, teaches the preliminary branches of knowledge requisite for admission into colleges. Great exertions have been recently made for the improvement of the system of education at Glasgow; and the late Professor Jardine describes its success, as chiefly owing to the beneficial influence, which public lectures derive from private tuition. But the general acquaintance possessed in this country of English institutions of every description, leads us to pass the more hastily over them all, and to proceed to the continent.”

**Publication:** *The North American Review* Volume 0075 Issue 157 (October 1852) / Volume 75, Issue: 157, October 1852, pp. 296-331.

**Title:** Jeffrey's Life and Letters.

**Nature of Citation:** “His few surviving class-fellows only recollect him as a little, clever, anxious boy, always near the top of the class, and who never lost a place without shedding tears. Glasgow College, to which he was transferred at the age of fourteen, was a better home for him; there he laid the foundation of the taste for metaphysical studies which he always retained. The improvements made by Professor Jardine in the mode of teaching Logic, clothing that arid study with the attractions of varied disquisition and criticism by the students themselves, formed an era in the history of collegiate instruction; and Jeffrey seems to have been one of his most successful pupils. Thirty-three years afterwards, in his Discourse at his own Inauguration as Rector of the College, he gracefully said of Jardine, who was there present, what I have never omitted to say in every other place, that it is to him and his most judicious instructions that I owe my taste for letters, and any little literary distinction I may since have been able to attain.” (302-3).

**Publication:** *American Annals of Education – A collection of American Journals on Education.*

**Title:** *American Journal of Education.* June-July 1830, the *American Journal of Education*, and *Monthly Lyceum.* Aug. 1830-Jan. 1, 1832, *American Annals of Education and Instruction*, and *Journal of Literary Institutions.* Jan. 15, 1832-Nov. 1837, *American Annals of Education and Instruction.* Dec. 1837-1839, *American Annals of Education.*

**Publication:** *Memoirs of Teachers, Educators, Promoters and Benefactors of Education, Literature, and Science*, Reprinted from the *American Journal of Education*. Edited by Henry Barnard, LL.D. Volume I. United States. New York: F. C. Brownell. 1859. Chancellor of the University of Wisconsin.

**Title:** Part I Teachers and Educators

**Nature of Citation:** This article with reference to Jardine is a reprint from the *American Journal of Education*. The focus of the writing is on William Russell. Jardine is referenced for his influence on Russell both during Russell's time at the University of Glasgow as well as in his work in the U.S.

**Title:** *The Living Age*.

**Publication Info:** New York [etc.]: The Living Age Co. Inc. [etc.]

**Nature of Citation:** Jardine has a single reference, noted as over-seeing John Wilson's education while in Glasgow.

**Publication:** *The Connecticut Common School Journal and Annals of Education*, Volumes 1-4, 1838-39.

**Nature of the Citation:** No natural talent will enable a man to gain the interest and respect of his pupils, so soon as such a knowledge of his profession as will enable him quickly to detect an inaccuracy, and to discuss and settle the various questions and difficulties which press upon the mind, and, naturally enough, seem all-important to the pupil. "It is worthy of remark," says Professor Jardine, "that whatever change for the better shall be made in our systems of education, it must begin with the teachers themselves. The art of teaching, like all other arts, is founded chiefly on experience. Improvements, therefore, are not to be expected from legislators and politicians, who have many other objects to engage their attention; nor even from men of science, unless they have had experience in the business of education. It therefore becomes the duty of every one engaged in teaching, to collect facts, to record observations, to watch the progress of the human faculties, as they expand under the influence of education, and thus to unite their efforts for the general improvement of our academical establishments." In the journals sampled above, Jardine continued to receive biographical attention as he did in American books. This attention was mostly in his role as professor to other eminent scholars like Wilson, Hamilton or Russell. However, we also see that Jardine's *Outlines* were serialized over the course of several editions and then reprinted for a second time. It seems however that these early educational journals had a limited readership. Sheldon Davis in his *Educational Periodicals During the Nineteenth Century* claims:

Summarizing the discussion, it may be said that the very limited circulation of the earlier school journals was almost entirely among school officers, ministers, persons prominent in various other professions, and among teachers holding the more important positions. The problem of providing material sufficiently general to appeal to the laity and of enough professional content to prove of practical value to teachers was gradually given up as impossible of solution and the appeal made more and more to the typical teacher, whose limitations in training, experience, and opportunities for the development of

initiative, resourcefulness, and taste have been the subject of careful studies as well as matters of common observation.

Limited circulation aside it seems these early journals influenced the next generation of periodicals and were often referenced. When Jardine is referred to his name is cited with familiarity. A 1919 Department of the Interior report reflected on these early periodicals stating:

The first important attempt in educational journalism in the United States was the "Academician," published semimonthly in New York (1818-1820) by Albert and John W. Pickett, president and secretary, respectively, of the Incorporated Society of New York Teachers, "containing the elements of scholastic science and the outlines of philosophic education predicated upon the analysis of the human mind and exhibiting the improved methods of instruction." The Picketts were proprietors of a school in New York City and the authors of textbooks; to both of these interests some space is given in their magazine. A wide range of educational subjects received attention in this volume. A fifth of the content is formed by a long series upon grammar and the English language, and there are long discussions of arithmetic and geography. Education in various States, monitorial schools, textbook reviews, and the qualifications of teachers were important subjects. An article by Le Olerc on the education of the deaf is quoted from the North American Review, and about one-seventh of the volume is taken from an educational treatise by Dr. Jardine, of the University of Glasgow. Twenty pages are devoted to the work of Pestalozzi. (Department Of The Interior Bureau Of Education Bulletin, 1919, No. 28)

According to this overview Jardine holds a place in the history of American education with his strong representation in *The Academician* and the subsequent educational journals that framed the pedagogical transitions of a rapidly growing system of education. To the extent that *The Academician* was influential in the United States Jardine was a major contributor. Whereas one seventh of the content was from Jardine it seems that Jardine's ideas framed the conceptual approach to education given that the subtitle of the journal mirrors Jardine's own publication

## **Publications of Alexander Campbell**

Actual references to Jardine in Campbell's writings are rare and are mostly an acknowledgement of Jardine's contributions to Campbell's education while at the University of Glasgow. Yet what Campbell acknowledges are the skills that are manifest in his works. The following is a list of Campbell's literary contributions in the United States. The volume of material speaks to the influence of Jardine in America in terms of the application of his teachings and the accomplishments of one of his students.

### **Separate Publications:**

*The Candidus Essays: First Published in The Reporter, Washington, Pa., 1820-1822.* Edited by Keith B. Huey, with Introduction, Notes, and Bibliography. Restoration Movement Pages, 2001.

The Living Oracles (First Edition). *The Sacred Writings of the Apostles and Evangelists of Jesus Christ, Commonly Styled the New Testament, Translated from the Original Greek by George Campbell, James Macknight, and Philip Doddridge, Doctors of the Church of Scotland.* Buffalo, VA: Alexander Campbell, 1826.

*The Evidences of Christianity: A Debate between Robert Owen, of New Lanark, Scotland and Alexander Campbell, President of Bethany College, Va. Containing an Examination of the "Social System" and all the Systems of Skepticism of Ancient and Modern Times, Held in the City of Cincinnati, Ohio, in April, 1829.* Nashville, TN: McQuiddy Printing Company, 1957.

*Delusions: An Analysis of the Book of Mormon with an Examination of Its Internal and External Evidences, and a Refutation of Its Pretences to Divine Authority.* Prefatory remarks by Joshua V. Himes. Boston: Benjamin H. Greene, 1832. First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (February 1831): 85–96.

The Living Oracles (Fourth Edition). *The Sacred Writings of the Apostles and Evangelists of Jesus Christ, Commonly Styled the New Testament, Translated from the Original Greek by George Campbell, James Macknight, and Philip Doddridge.* Bethany, VA: M'Vay and Ewing, 1835. First electronic edition.

*The Christian System, in Reference to the Union of Christians, and a Restoration of Primitive Christianity, as Plead in the Current Reformation.* 2nd ed. Pittsburg, PA: Forrester & Campbell, 1839.

*Introductory Addresses, Delivered at the Organization of Bethany College, November 2d, 1841. Published by Request of the Students, with an Appendix, Containing the By-Laws of the Institution.* Bethany, VA: A. Campbell, 1841.  
"Introductory Lecture," pp. 61–86; "Errata," p. 87; "By-Laws of Bethany College," pp. 88–92.

*Christian Baptism: With Its Antecedents and Consequents.* Bethany, VA: Alexander Campbell, 1851.

*Views of Mr. Alexander Concerning the Doctrines of Election and Reprobation as Embodied in the Circular Letter Addressed to the Churches in Connection with the Redstone Baptist Association, in 1817.* Fulton, MO: T. L. Stephens, 1856.

"Acts of the Apostles: Revised Version." *Acts of the Apostles, Translated from the Greek, on the Basis of the Common English Version, with Notes.* New York: American Bible Union, 1858, pp. 193–224.

*Memoirs of Elder Thomas Campbell, Together with a Brief Memoir of Mrs. Jane Campbell.* Cincinnati, OH: H. S. Bosworth, 1861.

*Life and Death.* With Preface by D. S. Burnet. Cincinnati: H. S. Bosworth, 1861. First published in *The Millennial Harbinger*, Extra, Vol. 15, December 1844, pp. 529–574.

*Popular Lectures and Addresses.* Philadelphia, PA: James Challen and Sons, 1866.  
*On Moral Societies.* The Religious Liberty Library, No. 53 (extra). Battle Creek, MI: The International Religious Liberty Association, 1898. Reprinting of excerpts from the Candidus essays (Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 8), first published in *The Reporter* (Washington, PA), 1820.

*The Christian System, in Reference to the Union of Christians, and a Restoration of Primitive Christianity, as Plead in the Current Reformation.* 5th ed. Cincinnati, OH: Standard Publishing Company, 1901.

*Address on War, Delivered at Wheeling, Va., in 1848, Printed in the Congressional Record of November 22, 1937, by Request of Hon. Joseph B. Shannon of Missouri.* Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1937.

Letters of Alexander Campbell to Selina Campbell (October 1829–January 1830). ALS. Center for Restoration Studies, Abilene Christian University, 1998.

#### **Works Edited:**

*The Christian Baptist*, ed. Alexander Campbell; rev. by D. S. Burnet. Seven volumes

in one. St. Louis, MO: Christian Publishing Company, [1889].  
*The Millennial Harbinger*. Vol. 1. Bethany, VA: A. Campbell, 1830.  
*The Millennial Harbinger*. Vol. 2. Bethany, VA: A. Campbell, 1831.  
*The Millennial Harbinger*. Vol. 3. Bethany, VA: A. Campbell, 1832.  
*The Millennial Harbinger*. Vol. 4. Bethany, VA: A. Campbell, 1833.

### **Contributions to Books:**

"Disciples of Christ." *Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge*, ed. J. Newton Brown. Brattleboro', VT: Brattleboro' Typographic Company, 1838. Pp. 462–464.

Remarks on Jacob Creath's "Obituary" of B. W. Stone. *Works of Elder B. W. Stone*, ed. James M. Mathes. Vol. 1. 2nd ed. Cincinnati, OH: Moore, Wiltstach, Keys & Co., 1859. Pp. 37, 38, 40. First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (December 1844): 621-622.

"On the Purposes Served in Our Constitution by the Reflex Sense of Beauty" (1809).

*Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 135–137.

Rules on Sermon Delivery (diary entry) (1809). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. P. 138.

Meditations on Scripture (diary entry) (1809). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 142–145.

On Bible Reading (diary entry) (1809). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. P. 145.

On Family Religion (diary entry) (1809). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. P. 146.

"On a beautiful vale adjacent to the seaport village where I often spent the evening hours" (poem) (1809). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 192–193.

"The Ocean" (poem) (1809). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 202–204.

"Original Essays, No. 1" (Clarinda Essays). First published in *The Reporter* (Washington, PA) (August 1810). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 283–287.

Sermon Outline on Revelation 20:11 (1810). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 319–320.

Sermon Outline on Genesis 5:22 (1810). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 320–321.

Extract from Address on Isaiah 57:14 and 62:10 (1810). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 335–346.

Memorandum on First Preaching Tour (1811). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 370–371.

Extract from Address on Matthew 11:27 (1811). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 374–376.

Extract from Address on Romans 10:4 (1811). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 376–377.

Extract from Address on Galatians 6:15, 16 (1811). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 377–378.

Resolutions for 1811. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 379–381.

Extract from Address on Titus 1:5 (1811). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 383.

"General Observations on Church Government, Derived from the Scriptures" (1811). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 384–386.

Extracts from the Correspondence between Philologus (Thomas Campbell) and Philomathes (Alexander Campbell) (1811-1812). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 413–425.

Extract from "Anecdotes, Incidents and Facts, Connected with the Origin and Progress of the Current Reformation, Some of Which Have Never Been before Published-- No. II.

First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (June 1848): 344–347 [344-349]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 438–441.

Extracts from the Correspondence between Philologus (Thomas Campbell) and Philomathes (Alexander Campbell) (1811–1812). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 447–454.

Letter to Uncle Archibald Campbell (1815). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 465–467.

Extracts from "The Sermon on the Law" (1816). First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1846): 493–521. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume I. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868. Pp. 472–479.

Extract from "Anecdotes, Incidents and Facts, Connected with the Origin and Progress of the Current Reformation, Some of Which Have Never Been before Published--No. III." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1848): 523–524 [522–524].

*Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 44–46.

Prospectus for *The Christian Baptist*. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 50.

Letter to W. L. McCalla (1823). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 52–53.

Letter to Margaret Campbell (October 11, 1823). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 71–72.

On Reading the Scriptures. Extract from "Address to Readers of the Christian Baptist--No. I." First published in *The Christian Baptist* 1 (December 1, 1823). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 96–98.

Extract from "Mr. Robert Owen's Challenge". First published in *The Christian Baptist* 5 (May 5, 1828). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 240-241.

Extract from Election-Day Speech (1828). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 308-309.

Extract of Speech before the Virginia House of Delegates (1828). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 311-312.

Journal Notes of Discourse on John iii. (1830). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 336-337.

Extract of Letter to Mrs. S. Jane Cohen (1860). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 354 (footnote).

On Emancipation of Slaves (1832). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 367-369.

Extract from "Turning out the Apostles." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (January 1834): 17 [17-20]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 391-392.

Letter to Selina Campbell (June 11, 1836). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 411-412.

Letter to Selina Campbell and Daughters (June 18, 1836). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 412-414.

Letter to Robert Richardson (June 21, 1836). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 414-415.

Letter to Selina Campbell (July 8, 1836). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 415-416.

Letter to Selina Campbell (July 23, 1836). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 416-418.

On the New England States (journal entry) (1836). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 418-419.

Word-painting of a Sunrise at Sea (journal entry) (1836). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 419-420.

Letter to Editors of the New Orleans *Commercial Bulletin* (March 14, 1839). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 441.

On Tour of Virginia (journal entry) (1838). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 446-447.

On Slavery (journal entry) (1838). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 450.

On the State of Southern Society (journal entry) (1838). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 450-451.

Letter to Robert Richardson (January 16, 1839). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 451-453.

Letter to R. L. Coleman (January 17, 1839). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 453-454.

Letter to Selina Campbell (January 23, 1839). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 454-457.

Letter to Selina Campbell (February 8, 1839). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 457-459.

Letter to Selina Campbell (March 12, 1839). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 460-461.

Letter to Andrew Broaddus (1840). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 477-479.

Extract from "To B. W. Stone." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1841): 399-401 [394-402]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 481-483.

Extract from "Note." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1841): 538-539. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 483-484.

Extract from "Mr. Campbell to Mr. Peck--No. V." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1842): 416-417 [414-417]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 488-489.

Extract from "Notes on a Late Tour--No. I." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1842): 451-452 [446-452]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 492-493.

Extract from "Reply to the Preceding Article." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1842): 548 [548-550]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 495.

Extract from "Our Position to American Slavery." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1845): 263 [257-264]; 236-237 [236-240]; 358 [355-358]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 531-534.

Extract from "Christian Union--No. X. Evangelical Alliance--No. V." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1846): 253-254 [253-255]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 541-542.

Extract from "Letters from Europe--No. XVI." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1847): 643, 648 [641-648]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 558-559, 564-565.

Extract from "Letters from Europe--No. XXXI." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1848): 518 [514-521]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 568.

Extract from "Letters from Europe--No. XXXVI." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1848): 677-679 [671-679]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 570-572.

Letter to R. L. Coleman (January 12, 1848). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 574-575.

Extract from "Conclusion of Volume V.--Series III." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1846): 716-717 [715-718]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 579.

Extract from "Tour of Forty Days in the States of Ohio, Kentucky, and Indiana." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1851): 82 [76-82]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 589-590.

Letter to R. L. Coleman (December 4, 1850). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 591-592.

Extract from "Memphis Convention." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1852): 293 [293-300]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 594.

Extract from "An Address to the Bible Union Convention, Held at Memphis, Tenn., April 2, 1852." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1852): 180 [180-215]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 594-595.

Extract from "Temperance and the Maine Law." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1853): 576, 578, 582 [575-582]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 600.

Extract from "Notes on a Tour to Illinois--No. I." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1853): 689 [689-693]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 601.

Extract from "Notes on a Tour to Illinois--No. II." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1853): 709 [707-711]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 602.

Letter to Francis D. Dungan (January 24, 1854). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 606.

Extract from Letter to Selina Campbell (1853). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 607-608.

Extract from "Our Visit to Nashville." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1855): 97 [96-107]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 611.

Eight Articles of Faith. First published in "The Evangelical Alliance--No. I." in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1846): 385 [382-386]; quoted in "Letter from Dr. Lynd" in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1855): 511-512 [511-514]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 616.

Letter to R. Y. Henley (May 30, 1855). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 621-622.

Extract from Remarks on "Letter from Brother R. C. R." (on death of John T. Johnson). First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1857): 110-111 [109-111]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 625.

Extract from "Notes on a Tour to the South--No. I." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1857): 309 [309-314]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 625-626.

Letter to Selina Campbell (March 18, 1857). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 626.

Letter to Selina Campbell (March 19, 1857). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 627.

Letter to Selina Campbell (March 30, 1857). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 627.

Notes on Discourse on Christian Baptism. Extract from "Notes on a Tour to the South--No. 2." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1857): 506 [502-508]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 629-630.

Extract from "Our Projected Tour for Bethany College." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1858): 47 [47-48]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 633.

Letter to Selina Campbell (February 20, 1858). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 634-635.

Letter to Selina Campbell (March 1, 1858). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 635-636.

Letter to Selina Campbell (March 27, 1858). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 636-638.

Letter to Selina Campbell (April 7, 1858). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 638.

Extract from "The Messiahship, of Great Demonstration." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1859): 468-469. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 641.

Extract from "Preface." First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (1863): 3 [3-4]. *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. P. 646.

Letter to J. W. Cox (March 21, 1864). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 648-649.

Letter to J. Judson and Decima Barclay (May 6, 1864). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 649-651.

Letter to Selina Campbell (February 24, 1841). *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* by Robert Richardson. Volume II. Philadelphia, PA: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1869. Pp. 651-653.

On the Death of Walter Scott. *Life of Elder Walter Scott: With Sketches of His Fellow-laborers, William Hayden, Adamson Bentley, John Henry, and Others* by William Baxter. Cincinnati, OH: Bosworth, Chase and Hall, 1874. Pp. 448-449. First published as "Elder Walter Scott's Demise." *The Millennial Harbinger*, (May 1861): 296-297.

Account of Interview with Adsom Bentley and Signey Rigdon (1816). *Early History of the Disciples in the Western Reserve, Ohio* by A. S. Hayden. Cincinnati, OH: Chase and Hall, 1875. Pp. 19-20.

"A Belief of the Wellsburg Church" (1824). *Early History of the Disciples in the Western Reserve, Ohio* by A. S. Hayden. Cincinnati, OH: Chase and Hall, 1875. Pp. 31-33.

Conclusion of Sermon on Malachi 4:2 (1826). *Early History of the Disciples in the Western Reserve, Ohio* by A. S. Hayden. Cincinnati, OH: Chase and Hall, 1875. Pp. 35-36.

Remarks on Doctrine of Election (1821). *Early History of the Disciples in the Western Reserve, Ohio* by A. S. Hayden. Cincinnati, OH: Chase and Hall, 1875. Pp. 39-40.

Excerpt from "Our Meetings in the Western Reserve". *Early History of the Disciples in the Western Reserve, Ohio* by A. S. Hayden. Cincinnati, OH: Chase and Hall, 1875. Pp. 413-414. First published in *The Millennial Harbinger* (October 1840): 478.

Excerpts from "Notes on a Tour to the North-east". *Early History of the Disciples in the Western Reserve, Ohio* by A. S. Hayden. Cincinnati, OH: Chase and Hall, 1875. Pp. 418-419. First published as "Notes on a Tour to the North-east--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1836): 418; "Notes on a Tour to the North-east--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* (August 1836): 341.

Letter of Introduction, for James Darsie (1844). *Churches of Christ: A Historical, Biographical, and Pictorial History of Churches of Christ in the United States, Australasia, England, and Canada*. Ed. John T. Brown. Louisville, KY: John P. Morton and Company, 1904. P. 434.

Contributions to *The Millennial Harbinger Abridged*, ed. Benjamin Lyon Smith. Vol. 1. Cincinnati, OH: Standard Publishing Company. 1902.

"Prospectus," pp. xv-xvi. Reprinted from "Prospectus." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (January 1830): 1-3.

"Prefatory Remarks--1830," pp. xvi-xxi. Extract reprinted from "Prefatory Remarks." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (January 1830): 3-8.

"Preface--1831," pp. xxii-xxvi. Extract reprinted from "Preface." *The Millennial Harbinger* 2 (January 1831): 1-5.

"Preface--1833," pp. xxvi-xxvii. Extract reprinted from "Preface." *The Millennial Harbinger* 4 (January 1833): 3-4.

"Preface--1835," pp. xxvii-xxviii. Extract reprinted from "Preface." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (January 1835): 3-4.

"From Preface--1838," p. xxviii. Extract reprinted from "Preface." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (January 1838): 3-4.

"From Preface--1840," pp. xxviii-xxix. Extract reprinted from "Preface." *The Millennial Harbinger* 11 (January 1840): 3.

"From Preface--1841," p. xxix. Extract reprinted from "Prefatory Remarks." *The Millennial Harbinger* 12 (January 1841): 4.

"From Preface--1843," p. xxix. Extract reprinted from "Preface." *The Millennial Harbinger* 14 (January 1843): 6-7.

"From Preface--1844," pp. xxix-xxx. Extract reprinted from "Introduction." *The Millennial Harbinger* 15 (January 1844): 3.

"From Preface--1848," p. xxx. Extract reprinted from "Preface." *The Millennial Harbinger* 19 (January 1848): 5.

"From Preface--1850," p. xxx. Extract reprinted from "Prefatory Remarks." *The Millennial Harbinger* 21 (January 1850): 5.

"Providence, General and Special," pp. 47-49. Extracts reprinted from "Providence, General and Special." *The Millennial Harbinger* 26 (November 1855): 601-604.

"The Claims of the Messiah," p. 61. Extracts reprinted from "The Claims of the Messiah." *The Millennial Harbinger* 34 (January 1863): 11.

"The Second Coming of Christ," pp. 64, 71-97. Extracts reprinted from Introductory Note to "Twelve Short and General Reasons." *The Millennial Harbinger* 3 (September 1832): 438; "The Millennium.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (February 1830): 53; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 12 (February 1841): 49-54; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* 12 (March 1841): 97-100; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. IV." *The Millennial Harbinger* 12 (March 1841): 100-103; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. IX." *The Millennial Harbinger* 12 (September 1841): 424-427; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. XII." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (February 1842): 56, 58; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. XVI." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (June 1842): 259-263; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. XVII." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (July 1842): 304-306; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. XVIII." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (August 1842): 334; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. XX." *The Millennial Harbinger* 14 (February 1843): 49-55; "Millennium: The Coming of the Lord.--No. XIX." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (October 1842): 464-465; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. XXI." *The Millennial Harbinger* 14 (February 1843): 74; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. XXIII." *The Millennial Harbinger* 14 (May 1843): 220-221; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. XXV." *The Millennial Harbinger* 14 (July 1843): 292; "The Coming of the Lord.--No. XXVI." *The Millennial Harbinger* 14 (October 1843): 445.

"The Relation of Jesus to God," pp. 99-105. Extracts reprinted from "To Brother Henry Grew." *The Millennial Harbinger* 4 (April 1833): 154-160.

"The Gift of the Holy Spirit," pp. 109-115. Extracts reprinted from "Reply" to Inquirer's "The Gift of the Holy Spirit." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (May 1834): 170-172; "The Gift of the Holy Spirit--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (May 1834): 217-220.

"Earnest of the Holy Spirit," pp. 115-136. Extract reprinted from "The Gift of the Holy Spirit--No. 3: Earnest of the Spirit" *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (June 1834): 277-280; "The Gift of the Holy Spirit--No. 4." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (July 1834): 299-303; "The Gift of the Holy Spirit--No. 5." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (August 1834): 365-368; "Gift of the Holy Spirit--No. 6." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (October 1834): 508-511. "Gift of the Holy Spirit--No. 7." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (November 1834): 566-570.

"The Bible," pp. 139-150. Reprinted from "Tracts for the People.--No. I.: The Bible." *The Millennial Harbinger* 16 (October 1845): 433-444.

"Principles of Interpretation," pp. 155-167. Reprinted from "Tracts for the People.--No. III.: The Bible--Principles of Interpretation." *The Millennial Harbinger* 17 (January 1846): 13-24.

"The Double Sense of Scripture," p. 167. Extract reprinted from "The Double Sense of Scripture." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (January 1830): 38; "On the Laws of Interpretation.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 2 (November 1831): 488.

"Bible Terminology," pp. 169-175. Extracts reprinted from "Bible Terminology.-- No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 27 (March 1856): 121-127.

"Bible Reading," pp. 175-179. Reprinted from "Bible Reading." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (January 1839): 35-38.

"The Bible Cause," pp. 179-181. Extract reprinted from "The Bible Cause." *The Millennial Harbinger* 18 (January 1847): 5-7.

"Questions about the Bible," pp. 182-190. Reprinted from Introductory Note to the Extra. *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 3 (August 1832): 337; "The Bible" *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 3 (August 1832): 337-343.

"Sin unto Death and Sin against Holy Spirit," pp. 206-207. Reprinted from "The Sin unto Death and the Sin against the Holy Spirit." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (April 1842): 181-182.

"Plan of the Apocalypse," pp. 207-218. Reprinted from "The Plan and Method of the Apocalypse." *The Millennial Harbinger* 16 (September 1845): 388-395;

"The Plan and Method of the Apocalypse.--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 16 (October 1845): 467-471.

"Patriarchal Age of the World," pp. 221-225. Reprinted from "Patriarchal Age of the World." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 387-391.

"Abraham," pp. 225-226. Reprinted from "Abraham." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 391-392.

"Two Promises," pp. 226-227. Reprinted from "Two Promises." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 392.

"Covenant of Circumcision," pp. 227-228. Reprinted from "Covenant of Circumcision." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 392-393.

"Sinaitic Covenant," p. 228. Reprinted from "Sinaitic Covenant." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 393-394.

"Two Seeds," pp. 228-229. Reprinted from "Two Seeds." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 394.

"The Blessing of Abraham," p. 229. Reprinted from "The Blessing of Abraham." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 394-395.

"The Jewish Institution," pp. 230-236. Reprinted from "The Jewish Institution." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 395-400.

"The Kingdom of Heaven," pp. 236-238. Reprinted from "The Kingdom of Heaven." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 400-403.

"The Elements of a Kingdom," pp. 238-239. Reprinted from "The Elements of a Kingdom." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 403-404.

"The Name," pp. 239-241. Reprinted from "The Name." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 404-405.

"Constitution," pp. 241-244. Reprinted from "Constitution." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 406-407.

"The King," p. 244. Reprinted from "The King." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 408.

"The Subjects of the Kingdom," pp. 245-246. Reprinted from "The Subjects of the Kingdom." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 5 (August 1834): 408-410.

"The Laws of the Kingdom," pp. 246-247. Reprinted from "The Laws of the

Kingdom." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 410-411.

"The Territory of the Kingdom," pp. 247-249. Reprinted from "The Territory." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 411-412.

"Manners and Customs," p. 249. Reprinted from "Manners and Customs." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 412.

"Induction into the Kingdom of Heaven," pp. 249-250. Reprinted from "Induction into the Kingdom of Heaven." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 412-413.

"The Coming of the Kingdom," pp. 250-257. Reprinted from "The Coming of the Kingdom." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 414-419.

"The Ascension of the Messiah," p. 257. Reprinted from "The Ascension of the Messiah." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 419-420.

"The Coronation of the Messiah," pp. 257-259. Reprinted from "Coronation of the Messiah." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 420-421.

"Present Administration of the Kingdom of Heaven," pp. 259-265. Reprinted from "Present Administration of the Kingdom of Heaven." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 421-427.

"Address to Citizens of the Kingdom," pp. 265-272. Reprinted from "Address to the Citizens of the Kingdom." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 427-433.

"A Word to Friendly Aliens," pp. 272-275. Reprinted from "A Word to Friendly Aliens." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 433-436.

"Address to the Belligerent Aliens," pp. 275-285. Reprinted from "Address to the Belligerent Aliens." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 5* (August 1834): 436-444.

"Religion," p. 289. Extract reprinted from "Religious Magazine." *The Millennial Harbinger 6* (April 1835): 154.

"Power of Religion," pp. 296-309. Extracts reprinted from "The Power of Religion.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger 8* (January 1837): 7-11; "The Power of Religion.--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger 8* (March 1837): 112-115; "The Power of Religion.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger 8* (April 1837): 158-164; "The Power of Religion.--No. IV." *The Millennial Harbinger 8* (May 1837): 205-208.

"Christianity Adapted to Man," pp. 310-315. Reprinted from "Christianity

Adapted to Man." *The Millennial Harbinger* 25 (March 1854): 121-127.

"The Christian," pp. 315-317. Reprinted from "The Christian." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 3 (August 1832): 349-351.

"A Synopsis of Christianity," pp. 317-318. Reprinted from "A Synopsis of Christianity." *The Millennial Harbinger* 15 (November 1844): 481.

"Evidences of Christianity," Campbell, Humphrey Marshal, pp. 329-351. Extracts reprinted from "Letters to Humphrey Marshal, Esq.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (November 1830): 513-517; "Letters to Humphrey Marshal, Esq.--Letter II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (December 1830): 529-532; "Letters to Humphrey Marshal, Esq.--Letter V." *The Millennial Harbinger* 2 (April 1831): 150-156; "Letters to Humphrey Marshal, Esq.--Letter VI." *The Millennial Harbinger* 2 (June 1831): 259-261; "Letters to Humphrey Marshal, Esq.--Letter VII." *The Millennial Harbinger* 2 (August 1831): 371-373; "Reason Examined by Interrogatories.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* 3 (March 1832): 97-100.

"The Foundations of Christianity," pp. 352-356. Extract reprinted from "To Charles Cassedy, Esq.--No. IV." *The Millennial Harbinger* 4 (May 1833): 193-197.

"Arguments for Christianity," pp. 356-375. Extract reprinted from "Notes on a Tour to New York--No. 5." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (January 1834): 39-40; "Notes on a Tour to New York--No. 6." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (February 1834): 76-80; "Evidences of the Gospel.--No. 1." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (May 1835): 197-201; "Evidences of the Gospel.--No. 2." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (July 1835): 317-322; "Evidences of the Gospel.--No. 3." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (October 1835): 470-472.

"Revelation Possible and Probable," pp. 375-376. Reprinted from Introductory Note to "Evidences of the Gospel.--No. 3: Revelation Possible and Probable." *The Millennial Harbinger* 7 (April 1836): 145-146.

"Tracts for the People; or, Evidence," pp. 380-391. Reprinted from "Tracts for the People.--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 16 (November 1845): 481-492.

"Evidences of Christianity," pp. 391-396. Extract reprinted from "Evidences of Christianity: A. Campbell's Introduction to the Last Edition of His Debate on the Evidences of Christianity." *The Millennial Harbinger* 23 (December 1852): 661-667.

"Its Credibility," pp. 403-409. Extracts reprinted from "The Confirmation of the Testimony." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (January 1830): 8-14.

"Sermon on the Law and the Gospel," pp. 409-435. Reprinted from "Sermon on the Law." *The Millennial Harbinger* 17 (September 1846): 493-521.

"Regeneration," pp. 439-442. Reprinted from "Regeneration." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 337-340.

"Fact," pp. 442-443. Reprinted from "Fact." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 340-341.

"Testimony," pp. 443-445. Reprinted from "Testimony." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 341-342.

"Faith," pp. 445-448. Reprinted from "Faith." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 342-345.

"Repentance," pp. 448-452. Reprinted from "Repentance." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 345-348.

"Reformation," pp. 452-455. Reprinted from "Reformation." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 349-351.

"Regeneration," pp. 455-456. Reprinted from "Regeneration." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 351-353.

"The Bath of Regeneration," pp. 456-458. Reprinted from "The Bath of Regeneration." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 353-355.

"New Birth," pp. 458-459. Reprinted from "New Birth." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 355-356.

"Renewing of the Holy Spirit," pp. 459-460. Reprinted from "Renewing of the Holy Spirit." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 356.

"The New Life," pp. 460-461. Reprinted from "The New Life." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 356-357.

"Physical Regeneration," pp. 462-463. Reprinted from "Physical Regeneration." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 358-359.

"The Use of the Theory of Regeneration," pp. 463-465. Reprinted from "The Use of the Theory of Regeneration." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 359-361.

"The Regeneration of the Church," pp. 465-482. Reprinted from "The Regeneration of the Church." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 4 (August 1833): 362-376.

"The Regeneration of the World," p. 482. Reprinted from "The Regeneration of the World." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 4* (August 1833): 376-377.

"Regeneration of the Heavens and the Earth," pp. 483-484. Reprinted from "Regeneration of the Heavens and the Earth." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 4* (August 1833): 377-378.

"A Word to the Moral Regenerators of the Age," pp. 484-491. Reprinted from "A Word to the Moral Regenerators of This Age." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 4* (August 1833): 378-384.

"The Means of Regeneration," p. 491. Extract reprinted from "Response" to "Means of Regeneration--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 27* (February 1856): 701.

"Regeneration, Justification, Sanctification," pp. 501-529. Reprinted from "Regeneration, Justification, Sanctification, Adoption." *The Millennial Harbinger 30* (February 1859): 61-64.

"Justification," pp. 503-510. Reprinted from "Justification." *The Millennial Harbinger 22* (June 1851): 318-325. From his *Christian Baptism: With Its Antecedents and Consequents*. Bethany, VA: Alexander Campbell, 1851. Pp. 277-285.

"Remission of Sins," pp. 510-529. Reprinted from "Remission of Sins." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 1* (July 1830): 1-18.

Criticism of Teaching, pp. 534-539. Reprinted from Reply to "Criticism Again." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 1* (July 1830): 22-27.

New Testament Use of Term Regeneration, pp. 539-571. Reprinted from "Remission of Sins" (Continued). *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 1* (July 1830): 27-54.

"Recapitulation," pp. 571-573. Reprinted from "Recapitulation." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 1* (July 1830): 54-55.

"Conclusion," pp. 573-579. Reprinted from "Conclusion." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra 1* (July 1830): 55-60.

Contributions to " *The Millennial Harbinger Abridged*, ed. Benjamin Lyon Smith. Vol. 2. Cincinnati, OH: Standard Publishing Company. 1902.

"Not Faith Alone," p. 1. Extract reprinted from "Remarks" (on "Faith Alone" by Publius). *The Millennial Harbinger 11* (November 1840): 492-493.

"Faith," pp. 1-12. Reprinted from "Tracts for the People.--No. IV. Faith." *The Millennial Harbinger* 17 (February 1846): 73-84.

"Repentance unto Life," pp. 18-28. Reprinted from "Tracts for the People.--No. Repentance unto Life." *The Millennial Harbinger* 17 (April 1846): 181-192.

"Repentance and Faith, or Faith and Repentance," pp. 29-32. Reprinted from "Repentance and Faith? Faith and Repentance?" *The Millennial Harbinger* 32 (January 1861): 14-18.

"Faith and the Faith," pp. 32-37. Reprinted from "Faith and the Faith." *The Millennial Harbinger* 31 (October 1860): 541-546.

"Faith vs. Opinion," pp. 37-40. Extracts reprinted from "Millennium. No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (April 1830): 145-150; "Opinions." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 3 (August 1832): 355-356.

"Prayer," pp. 57-61. Extracts reprinted from "Prayer, or Communion with God.-- No. V." *The Millennial Harbinger* 3 (March 1832): 123-124; "Short Sermons on Christian Practice: Sermons on Prayer.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (May 1839): 204-205.

"Occasions of Prayer," pp. 61-62. Extract reprinted from "Short Sermons on Christian Practice: Sermons on Prayer.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (July 1839): 336-337 [*i. e.*, pp. 326-327].

"Christian Culture," pp. 72-82. Extracts reprinted from "Reformation.--No. 5." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (April 1835): 182; "Morality of Christians.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (January 1838): 5-8; "Morality of Christians.--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (February 1838): 49-53; "Morality of Christians.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (March 1838): 98; "Morality of Christians.--No. IV." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (April 1838): 147; "Morality of Christians.--No. VI." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (June 1838): 241-242; "Morality of Christians.--No. VII." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (July 1838): 325; "Morality of Christians.--No. VI." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (June 1838): 243.

"An Appeal" [for Christian Culture], pp. 82-84. Extracts reprinted from "Address to the Brethren of the Reformation." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (February 1834): 86-87; "Morality of Christians.--No. XVI." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (August 1839): 339; "Morality of Christians.--No. IX." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (September 1838): 386; "Morality of Christians.--No. IX." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (September 1838): 388-389; "Morality of Christians.--No. XII." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (January 1839): 18.

Christian Character, pp. 84-88. Reprinted from "Personal Evidences." *The Millennial Harbinger* 4 (April 1833): 161-162; "'Wherein Do You Excel?'" *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (February 1834): 47-48.

"Liberality," pp. 88-93. Reprinted from "Reformation.--No. 7: Liberality." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (September 1835): 381-383; "Reformation.--No. 8: Liberality." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (October 1835): 472-475.

The Church, pp. 97-110. Reprinted from "The Church." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 3 (August 1832): 351-354.

"Order--As Respects the Church," pp. 110-112. Reprinted from "Order--As Respects the Church." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 491-493.

"Organization of a Church," pp. 112-115. Reprinted from "Organization of a Church." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 493-496.

"Order--As Respects the Ordination of Bishops," pp. 115-125. Extract reprinted from "Order--As Respects the Ordination of Bishops." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 496-504.

"The Duties of the Bishops," pp. 125-127. Reprinted from "The Duties of the Bishops." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 504-507.

"Deacon's Office," pp. 127-128. Reprinted from "Deacon's Office." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 507.

"Order--of the Church as Respects Worship," pp. 128-132. Reprinted from "Order of the Church as Respects Worship." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 507-511.

"Order--As Respects Voting in the Church," pp. 132-134. Reprinted from "Order--As Respects Voting in the Church." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 511-513.

"Order--As Respects Discipline," pp. 134-139. Reprinted from "Order--As Respects Discipline." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 513-518; "Note." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 528.

"Order--As Respects Sister Churches," pp. 140-141. Reprinted from "Order--As Respects Sister Churches." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 518-519.

"Order--As Respects Messengers," pp. 141-145. Reprinted from "Order--As

Respects Messengers." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 519-523.

"Order--As Respects the Labors of an Evangelist," pp. 146-148. Reprinted from "Order--As Respects the Labors of an Evangelist." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 523-525.

"Order--As Respects Baptism," pp. 148-149. Reprinted from "Order--As Respects Baptism." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 525-526.

"Order--As Respects the Labors of an Evangelist among the Baptized," pp. 149-150. Reprinted from "Order--As Respects the Labors of an Evangelist among the Baptized." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 6 (October 1835): 526-528.

The Lord's Day, pp. 151-155. Extracts reprinted from "Reformation.--No. XII. The Lord's Day." *The Millennial Harbinger* 7 (September 1836): 418-420; "The First Day of the Week Is Not the Seventh Day" (Reply to Letter from W. D. L.). *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (September 1834): 466; "The Sanctification of the Lord's Day." *The Millennial Harbinger* 12 (December 1841): 541.

"The Sanctification of the Lord's Day," p. 163. Extracts reprinted from "The Sanctification of the Lord's Day." *The Millennial Harbinger* 21 (October 1850): 541; "The Sanctification of the Lord's Day; or, 'The Pearl of Days.'" *The Millennial Harbinger* 21 (December 1850): 662.

"The Lord's Day," pp. 186-187. Reprinted from "The Lord's Day" (Response to "Prize Essay on the Sabbath, written by a journeyman printer of Scotland"). *The Millennial Harbinger* 25 (April 1854): 231.

"Musings on Lord's Day Morning," p. 187. Reprinted from "Musings on Lord's Day Morning" (Poem). *The Millennial Harbinger* 29 (May 1858): 271.

"The Breaking of the Loaf," pp. 188-219. Reprinted from "The Breaking of the Loaf." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra.--No. II.* 1 (December 1830): 61-88.

"Weekly Communion," pp. 219-220. Extract reprinted from "Notes on a Tour to New York--No. 5." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (January 1834): 37-38.

"Testimonials to Weekly Communion," pp. 225-229. Extracts reprinted from "Weekly Communion." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (January 1834): 12; "Weekly Communion." *The Millennial Harbinger* 28 (June 1857): 317-320.

"The Ministry," pp. 260-269. Extracts reprinted from "The Christian Preacher.-- No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 3 (March 1832): 114, 116-118; "The Christian Preacher.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* 3 (May 1832): 230-235; "Reformation.--No. VIII." *The Millennial Harbinger* 7 (January 1836): 43-45.

"Call to the Ministry," pp. 269-274. Extracts reprinted from "The Nature of the Christian Organization.--No. V." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (June 1842): 243-247; "The Nature of the Christian Organization.--No. VIII." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (October 1842): 445; "Reformation.--No. 4. Reformation of the Preachers of the Reformation." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (March 1835): 135.

"The Way to Obtain Preachers," pp. 279-281. Extract reprinted from "Support of the Christian Ministry.--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 22 (November 1851): 637-640.

"Irresponsible Preachers," pp. 281-283. Reprinted from "Irresponsible Preachers." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (December 1834): 614-617.

"The Eldership," pp. 284-294. Extracts reprinted from "The Senatorial Government of the Church." *The Millennial Harbinger* 9 (March 1838): 126, 128.

"Disciples of Christ, Christians, Reformers," p. 307. Extract reprinted from "Disciples of Christ, Christians, Reformers.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 25 (April 1854): 181.

"Disciples of Christ," pp. 360-365. Extract reprinted from "The Disciples of Christ of the 19th Century." *The Millennial Harbinger* 26 (April 1855): 207-211. First published as "Disciples of Christ," in *The Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge*, ed. J. Newton Brown (Boston: Shattuck and Company, 1835; Brattleboro', VT: Brattleboro' Typographic Company, 1838), pp. 462-464.

"Christian Union," pp. 365-368. Extracts reprinted from "Millennium.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (February 1830): 55, 56; "Union." *The Millennial Harbinger* 11 (November 1840): 481, 484-486.

"Anti-Campbellism," p. 369. Extract reprinted from "Anti-Campbellism." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (March 1830): 118.

"Disciples--Christians--Reformers--Campbellites," pp. 369-373, 375-378. Extracts reprinted from "Our Name: Disciples--Christians--Reformers--Campbellites." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (August 1839): 337-339; "Our Name." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (September 1839): 401-403; "Our

Name." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (October 1839): 478-479 "Remarks" on "Our Name." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (November 1839): 536; "And Our Name." *The Millennial Harbinger* 11 (January 1840): 24-27, 29.

Extended quotations in "Our Relation to Other Religious People," by W. K. Pendleton, pp. 379-385. Extracts reprinted from "Any Christians among Protestant Parties." *The Millennial Harbinger* 8 (September 1837): 411-414; 33 (March 1862): 132-135; "Christians among the Sects." *The Millennial Harbinger* 8 (September 1837): 507-508; 33 (March 1862): 135-136; *A Debate on the Roman Catholic Religion: Held in the Sycamore-Street Meeting House, Cincinnati, from the 13th to the 21st of January, 1837. Between Alexander Campbell, of Bethany, Va., and the Rt. Rev. John B. Purcell, Bp. of Cincinnati. Taken down by Reporters, and Revised by the Parties.* Cincinnati, OH: J. A. James, 1837. pp. 556, 559; *A Debate between Rev. A. Campbell and Rev. N. L. Rice, on the Action, Subject, Design and Administrator of Christian Baptism; also, on the Character of Spiritual Influence in Conversion and Sanctification, and on the Expediency and Tendency of Ecclesiastic Creeds, as Terms of Union and Communion; Held in Lexington, Ky., from the Fifteenth of November to the Second of December, 1843, a Period of Eighteen Days. Reported by Marcus T. C. Gould, Assisted by A. Euclid Drapier.* Lexington, KY: A. T. Skillman and Son, 1844. P. 785.

"Creeds," pp. 385-387. Extracts reprinted from "Creeds." *The Millennial Harbinger Extra* 3 (August 1832): 344-347; "Creeds versus the Bible." *The Millennial Harbinger* 17 (October 1846): 565-567.

"The Right of Co-operation," pp. 391-396. Extracts reprinted from "The Nature of the Christian Organization.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 12 (November 1841): 533-535; "The Nature of the Christian Organization.--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (February 1842): 59, 62; "The Nature of the Christian Organization.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (March 1842): 133; "Introductory Propositions." *The Millennial Harbinger* 16 (February 1845): 61-63.

"Convention of Christian Churches," pp. 391-402. Extracts reprinted from Remarks on "The Convention of Christian Churches." *The Millennial Harbinger* 20 (December 1849): 694-695.

"Humble Beginnings," pp. 416-426. Extracts reprinted from "Humble Beginnings." *The Millennial Harbinger* 13 (January 1842): 5-13; "Incidents on a Tour to Nashville, Tennessee.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (December 1830): 557-558.

"Sermons in November, 1830," pp. 426-434. Extracts reprinted from "Incidents on a Tour to Nashville, Tennessee.--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 2 (January 1831): 21; "Incidents on a Tour to Nashville, Tennessee.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* 2

(January 1831): 24, 27, 28; "Incidents on a Tour to Nashville, Tennessee.--No. V." *The Millennial Harbinger* 2 (February 1831): 61; "Incidents on a Tour to Nashville, Tennessee.--No. IV." *The Millennial Harbinger* 2 (February 1831): 56-60.

"Sermons in the Fall of 1833," pp. 434-435. Extracts reprinted from "Notes on a Tour to New York, via Eastern Virginia.--No. 1." *The Millennial Harbinger* 4 (November 1833): 564; "Notes on a Tour to New York.--No. 4." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (January 1834): 14; "Notes on a Tour to New York.--No. 6." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (February 1834): 76-77.

"Sermon before Congress in 1850," pp. 435-436. Extracts reprinted from "Excursion to Baltimore and Washington City." *The Millennial Harbinger* 21 (July 1850): 406.

"Sermons in New York," pp. 436-440. Extracts reprinted from "Notes on a Tour to New York.--No. 5." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (January 1834): 37-38; "Notes on a Tour to New York.--No. 6." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (February 1834): 75-76; "Notes on a Tour to New York.--No. 7." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (March 1834): 123-124; "Notes on a Tour to New York.--No. 7." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (March 1834): 125.

"Religious Controversy--The Debates," pp. 440-443. Extracts reprinted from "Religious Controversy." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (January 1830): 40-44.

"Anecdotes, Incidents and Facts, Connected with the History of the Current Reformation," pp. 444-448. Extract reprinted from "Anecdotes, Incidents, and Facts, Connected with the History of the Current Reformation.--No. V." *The Millennial Harbinger* 19 (November 1848): 614; "The Late Debate." *The Millennial Harbinger* 15 (January 1844): 9.

"Bethany College," pp. 451-453. Extract reprinted from "Incidents on a Tour to Nashville, Tennessee.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 1 (December 1830): 554-555.

"A New Institution," pp. 453-463. Extracts reprinted from "A New Institution." *The Millennial Harbinger* 10 (October 1839): 446-451; "Charter of the Bethany College." *The Millennial Harbinger* 11 (April 1840): 176; "The First Donation." *The Millennial Harbinger* 11 (April 1840): 179-180; "Bethany College." *The Millennial Harbinger* 15 (August 1844): 383-384.

"Corner-stone Address of Bethany College," pp. 463-469. Reprinted from "The Corner-Stone Address of Bethany College." *The Millennial Harbinger* 29 (July 1858): 361-367.

"A. Campbell's Last Harbinger Work," pp. 469-473. Reprinted from "A. Campbell to His Readers." *The Millennial Harbinger* 35 (January 1864): 43-44; "The Gospel." *The Millennial Harbinger* 36 (November 1865):

516-517.

"Materialism," pp. 477-486. Extracts reprinted from "Materialism--No. 3." *The Millennial Harbinger* 7 (November 1836): 520-524; "Materialism--No. 4." *The Millennial Harbinger* 7 (December 1836): 556-560; "The Soul and Spirit of Man." *The Millennial Harbinger* 32 (September 1861): 515.

"Infidelity," pp. 490-501. Extracts reprinted from "Demonology: An Address Delivered to the Popular Lecture Club, Nashville, Tennessee." *The Millennial Harbinger* 12 (October 1841): 452-480. Published as Address on Demonology," Delivered before the Popular Lecture Club, Nashville, Tennessee, March 10, 1841" in his *Popular Lectures and Addresses* (Philadelphia, PA: James Challen and Son, 1866), pp. 379-402; "Notes on a Tour to the North-east.--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* 7 (August 1836): 338-341; "Notes on a Tour to the North-east.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* 7 (September 1836): 411-418.

Annihilationism (Dr. John Thomas), pp. 515-532. Reprinted from "Extra No. I. --New Series." *The Millennial Harbinger* 8 (December 1837): 575-588.

"The Jesse B. Ferguson Case" (Post-mortem Gospel), pp. 532-537. Extracts reprinted from "Elder Jesse B. Ferguson's Extra." *The Millennial Harbinger* 24 (March 1853): 148-150; "Mr. Jesse B. Ferguson." *The Millennial Harbinger* 25 (April 1854): 222-223; "Jesse B. Ferguson." *The Millennial Harbinger* 25 (July 1854): 414; "The Fall of Mr. J. B. Ferguson." *The Millennial Harbinger* 26 (April 1855): 636-637.

"The Parable of Christian Experience," pp. 538-539. Extract reprinted from "Christian Experience.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 22 (July 1851): 373-374.

"Calmness under Threats," p. 540. Extract reprinted from "Abolitionism." *The Millennial Harbinger* 7 (June 1836): 282.

"Tired of Controversy," p. 540. Extract reprinted from "Reformation Periodicals." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (December 1835): 619.

"A Dozen Apologies in One," pp. 540-541. Reprinted from "A Dozen Apologies in One." *The Millennial Harbinger* 3 (March 1832): 144.

"Difficulties in Churches--Right of Appeal," pp. 541-545. Reprinted from "Difficulties in Churches.--No. VI.: Right of Appeal." *The Millennial Harbinger* 12 (February 1841): 54-59.

"A Single Hint to the Disciples," pp. 546-548. Reprinted from "A Single Hint to the Disciples." *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (June 1834): 287-288.

"Are We a Denomination?," p. 548. Extract reprinted from "The Editor's Response to Mr. Broaddus." *The Millennial Harbinger* 11 (December 1840): 556.

"Tribute to Walter Scott," pp. 548-549. Reprinted from "Elder Walter Scott's Demise." *The Millennial Harbinger* 32 (May 1861): 296-297.

"The Coming of Isaac Errett into the Editorship of the Harbinger," pp. 549. Extract reprinted from "To Our Readers." *The Millennial Harbinger* 31 (November 1860): 654.

"Standing between Extremes," pp. 550-552. Extract reprinted from "The Editor's Reply to Brother Garnett." *The Millennial Harbinger* 7 (June 1836): 242-244.

"Divorce," pp. 552-554. Extract reprinted from "Reply" (to G. T.'s "Divorces"). *The Millennial Harbinger* 5 (February 1834): 71-73.

"Choice Sentences," p. 554. Extracts reprinted from "Roman Catholic Discussion." *The Millennial Harbinger* 8 (July 1837): 324; "Poor Encouragement for Publishers." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (March 1835): 132; "Conclusion of Volume VI." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (December 1835): 622.

"Editors," pp. 554-555. Extracts reprinted from "The Crisis.--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* 15 (April 1844): 170, 171.

"Lost on an Illinois Prairie," pp. 555-556. Extract reprinted from "Notes of Incidents in a Tour through Illinois and Missouri.--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* 24 (January 1853): 7-8.

"List of Papers Published by Our People in 1835," p. 556. Extract reprinted from "Reformation Periodicals." *The Millennial Harbinger* 6 (December 1835): 618.

### **Contributions to Periodicals:**

"Scripture Quotations." *The Christian Baptist* 4 (August 1826): 265.

"Parable of the Iron Bedstead." *The Christian Baptist*, 4 (October 1826): 277-278.

"A Restoration of the Ancient Order of Things--No. XVII: Purity of Speech." *The Christian Baptist* 4 (March 1827): 312-314.<sup>1</sup>

"The Trinitarian System." *The Christian Baptist* 4 (May 1827): 333-335.<sup>1</sup>

"A Restoration of the Ancient Order of Things--No. XIX. The Deacon's Office." *The Christian Baptist* 4 (May 1827): 77-78.

- "To the Christian Messenger." *The Christian Baptist* 5 (October 1827): 379-381.
- Introductory Note to "Remarks on 'Aristides'" by Robert Richardson. *The Christian Baptist* 6 (November 1828): 83-85.
- Introductory Note to "Reply to the Above" by Robert Richardson. *The Christian Baptist* 7 (November 1829): 87.
- Note on "Letter II. to Bishop J." *The Christian Baptist* 7 (December 1829): 114.
- "Prospectus." *The Millennial Harbinger*, Series, 1 (January 1830): 1-3.
- "The Cherokee Indians." *The Millennial Harbinger*, (January 1830): 44-46.
- "Delusions." *The Millennial Harbinger* (February 1831): 85-96.
- "Progress of Reform." With letters of report by Aylett Raines and William Hayden. *The Millennial Harbinger* 3 (October 1832): 512-515.
- "Mark Them Who Cause Divisions." *The Millennial Harbinger* (December 1832): 604. "Sir Walter Scott." *The Millennial Harbinger* (January 1833): 24-26.
- "Mormonism Unveiled." *The Millennial Harbinger* (January 1835): 44-45.
- Introductory Note to Thomas Campbell's "Obituary" [of Jane Corneigle Campbell]. *The Millennial Harbinger* (June 1835): 284.
- Richmond Letter. "Re-immersion: Letter from a Correspondent in Eastern Virginia." *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1835): 418-420.
- Lunenburg Letter. "Any Christians among Protestant Parties." *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1837): 411-414. "Christians among the Sects." *The Millennial Harbinger* (November 1837): 506-508. "Any Christians among the Sects?" *The Millennial Harbinger* (December 1837): 561-567.
- "The Religion of Excitement, and the Excitement of Religion." *The Millennial Harbinger* (January 1839): 34-35.
- "Bible Reading." *The Millennial Harbinger* (January 1839): 35-38.
- "Short Sermons on Christian Practice: Sermons on Prayer--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* (May 1839): 204-207.
- Remarks on "The Mormon Bible." *The Millennial Harbinger* (June 1839): 265-268.

"Short Sermons on Christian Practice: Sermons on Prayer--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* (June 1839): 272-275.

"Short Sermons on Christian Practice: Sermons on Prayer--No. III." *The Millennial Harbinger* (July 1839): 326-328.

"Short Sermons on Christian Practice--No. IV: On Bible-Reading--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* (August 1839): 342-344.

"Our Name." *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1839): 401-403. Reprinted in *The Origin and Principles of the Christians* by J. F. Burnett. Booklet No. 1. Dayton, OH: The Christian Publishing Association, 1921. Pp. 22-25.

"Embryo Heresy." *The Millennial Harbinger* (February 1840): 68-69.

"Heretical Periodicals." *The Millennial Harbinger* (February 1840): 69-70.

"Definitions and Answers to Questions--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* (February 1840): 81-83.

"Atonement": An Exchange between Barton W. Stone and Alexander Campbell. *The Millennial Harbinger* (June 1840): 243-250; (July 1840): 289-298; (September 1840): 387-396; (October 1840): 464-473; (January 1841): 12-24; (February 1841): 59-69; (March 1841): 113-122; (April 1841): 156-163; (May 1841): 234-237; (June 1841): 248-258; (July 1841): 295-304; (August 1841): 369-373; (September 1841): 394-402.

"Bethany College." *The Millennial Harbinger* (November 1840): 508-510.

"Demonology: An Address Delivered to the Popular Lecture Club, Nashville, Tennessee, March 10, 1841." *The Millennial Harbinger* (October 1841): 457-480.

"Education." *The Millennial Harbinger* (October 1841): 480.

"Note" [on B. W. Stone's Note to My Patrons] *The Millennial Harbinger* (November 1841): 538-539.

"Reply to M. Winans" [No. 1, on "Demonology"]. *The Millennial Harbinger* (December 1841): 580-584.

"Remarks" to M. Winans [No. 2, on "Demonology"]. *The Millennial Harbinger* (February 1842): 65-69.

"Note to M. Winans [No. 3, on "Demonology"]. *The Millennial Harbinger* (February 1842): 95.

"Reply to M. Winans [No. 4, on "Demonology"]. *The Millennial Harbinger* (March 1842): 124-127.

"The Mormon Expose," ed. Alexander Campbell. *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1842): 418-421; (October 1842): 460-464; (November 1842): 497-502; (December 1842): 538-543; (January 1843): 23-28; (April 1843): 152-157; (July 1843): 296-299; (August 1843): 346-351. Serial publication of La Roy Sunderland's *Mormonism Exposed* (New York: New York Watchman, 1842).

"Remarks on the Mormon Expose." *The Millennial Harbinger* (August 1843): 351.

"Annual Meetings in Ohio." *Millennial Harbinger*, New Series, 7 (September 1843): 427. Excerpt reprinted as "Annual Meetings in Ohio, 1843." *Early History of the Disciples in the Western Reserve, Ohio* by A. S. Hayden. Cincinnati, OH: Chase and Hall, 1875. P. 451.

"Musings on Christmas Morning." *The Millennial Harbinger* (January 1844): 30-32.

"Mistakes Touching the Book of Mormon." *The Millennial Harbinger* (January 1844): 38-42.

"Tracts for the People--No. I: The Bible." *The Millennial Harbinger* (October 1845): 433-444.

"Tracts." *The Millennial Harbinger* (October 1845): 445.

"Tracts for the People--No. II." *The Millennial Harbinger* (November 1845): 481-492.

"Tracts for the People--No. III: The Bible--Principles of Interpretation." *The Millennial Harbinger* (January 1846): 13-24.

"Is Capital Punishment Sanctioned by Divine Authority?" *The Millennial Harbinger* (March 1846): 121-152. [See Tolbert Fanning's reply, "Capital Punishment--No. 2." *Christian Review*. 4 (June 1847): 181-189.]

"Poetry." *The Millennial Harbinger* (August 1846): 469.

"Sermon on the Law." *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1846): 493-521.

"Letters from Europe, Nos. I-XXXVI." *The Millennial Harbinger*, 4 (July 1847-December 1848).

"Tracts for the People--No. XXXI: Prayer." *The Millennial Harbinger* (January 1849): 3-12.

Introductory Note to William Baxter's "An Address" (poem). *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1849): 533-534.

"Instrumental Music." *The Millennial Harbinger* (October 1851): 581-582.

"Principles and Objects of the Reformation." *The Millennial Harbinger* (February 1853): 117.

Remark on Robert Richardson and W. K. Pendleton as Contributors. *The Millennial Harbinger* (May 1853): 297.

"Woman's Rights." *The Millennial Harbinger* (April 1854): 203-207.

Remarks on "News from Arkansas" by Robert Graham. *The Millennial Harbinger* (July 1855): 407-408.

"Notes of a Tour to Canada West--No. I." *The Millennial Harbinger* (September 1855): 529-537.

"The Baptists in Canada West." *The Millennial Harbinger* (October 1855): 581-583.

"Elder Walter Scott's Demise." *The Millennial Harbinger*, (May 1861): 296-297.

Alexander Campbell wrote extensively on a broad range of topics: theological, historical, musical, social, educational, moral and political. Clearly we must be measured in how much credit we assign Jardine for the success and influence of Campbell. However, in as much as Jardine was responsible for the cultivation of Campbell's talents in writing and left Campbell with the tools and pedagogical framework to be successful in the United States it is also important to recognize that connection between the two men.

## **Publications of William Russell**

*The American Journal of Education and College Review* featured an article on William Russell in the March 1857 edition. **Russell was remembered as the first editor of *The American Journal of Education*.** However, Russell was also recognized for his 40 years of work in the field of American education. He published several educational books. This article by Absalom Peters, Henry Barnard and Samuel Sidwell Randall provides an overview of Russell's professional endeavours and the following list of publications.

“A list of these and his other publications we have annexed to this sketch of his professional life. It is but justice, however, to Mr. R. to state, with reference to their large apparent number, that his works were not published for pecuniary purposes, but were mostly prepared at the solicitation of his numerous classes of teachers, for their immediate use. A few of them unexpectedly obtained a wide circulation; but most of them have been serviceable rather as pioneers than otherwise.”

### **TEXTBOOKS AND WORKS RELATING TO EDUCATION By William Russell.**

*Suggestions on Education*: relating particularly to the Method of Instruction commonly adopted in Geography, History, Grammar, Logic, and the Classics. New Haven: A. II. Maltby & Co. 1823.

*A Grammar of Composition*: including a practical review of the principles of Rhetoric, a series of exercises in Rhetorical Analysis, and six introductory courses of Composition. New Haven: A. H. Maltby & Co. 1823.

*Adam's Latin Grammar*, abridged and arranged in a course of Practical Lessons, adapted to the capacity of Young Learners. To which are added Rules of Pronunciation in reading Latin. New Haven: A. II. Maltby & Co. 1824.

*American Journal of Education*. Vols. I. II. III. Boston : 1826,-7,-8.

*A Manual of Mutual Instruction*: consisting of Mr. Fowle's Directions for introducing in common schools the improved system adopted in the Monitorial School, Boston. With an Appendix, containing some considerations in favor of the Monitorial Method, and a sketch of its progress, embracing a view of its adaptation to instruction in academies, preparatory seminaries, and colleges. Boston: Wait, Green & Co. 1820.

*The Library of Education*. Vol. I. "Some Thoughts concerning Education," by John Locke; and a "Treatise of Education," by John Milton; with an Appendix, containing Locke's Memoranda on Study. Boston: Gray & Bowen. 1830.

*Journal of Instruction*. [Semi-monthly periodical.] Philadelphia: 1831.

*Lessons in Enunciation*: comprising a course of Elementary Exercises, and a statement of Common Errors in Articulation, with the rules of correct usage in Pronouncing. To

which is added an Appendix, containing Rules and Exercises on the mode of Enunciation required for Public Reading and Speaking. Boston: Melvin Lord. 1830.

*Rudiments of Gesture*, comprising illustrations of common Faults in Attitude and Action. To which is added an Appendix, designed for practical exercises in Declamation, consisting of a Debate on the Character of Julius Caesar, by James Sheridan Knowles. Boston: G. W. Palmer & Co. 1838.

*Exercises in Elocution*, exemplifying the rules and principles of the art of Reading. Boston: Jenks and Palmer. 1841.

*The American Elocutionist*: comprising "Lessons in Enunciation," "Exercises in Elocution," and "Rudiments of Gesture." With a selection of New Pieces for practice in Reading and Declamation; and engraved Illustrations in Attitude and Action. Designed for Colleges, Professional Institutions, Academies, and Common Schools. Boston: Jenks, Palmer & Co. 1844.

*Primer, or First Steps in Spelling and Reading*. Designed as introductory to the Spelling Book, and forming Part I. of a series of Books for Elementary Schools. Boston: Tappan & Deunet. 1844.

*Spelling-Book, or, Second Course of Lessons in Spelling and Reading*. Designed as a sequel to the author's Primer, and an introduction to the other parts of his Elementary and Common School Series. Boston: Tappan & Dennet. 1844.

*Primary Reader*: a selection of easy Reading Lessons, with introductory exercises in Articulation, for Young Classes. Designed to follow the Spelling-book, and forming Part IV. of Russell's Elementary Series. Boston: Tappan & Whittemore. 1844.

*Sequel to the Primary Reader* of Russell's Elementary Series. Designed to precede Russell's and Goldsbury's Common-School Series. Boston: Tappan & Whitteirfore. 1844.

*Introduction to the Primary Reader* of Russell's Elementary Series. Designed to accompany the Spelling-book. Boston: Tappan, Whittemore and Mason. 1845.

*Introduction to the American Common School Reader and Speaker*; comprising Selections in Prose and Verse: with Elementary Rules and Exercises in Pronunciation. By William Russell and John Goldsbury, authors of the above-mentioned Reader. Boston: Chas. Tappan. 1845.

*The American Common School Reader and Speaker*: a Selection of Pieces in prose and verse, with Rules for Reading and Speaking. By John Goldsbury and William Russell. Boston: Tappan and Whittemore. 1845.

*Introduction to the Young Ladies' Elocutionary Reader*: containing a Selection of Reading Lessons, together with the Rudiments of Elocution, adapted to Female Readers.

By William and Anna U. Russell, authors of the above-mentioned Reader. Boston: James Munroe & Co. 1845.

*The Young Ladies' Elocutionary Reader: containing a Selection of Reading Lessons, by Anna U. Russell, with introductory Rules and Exercises in Elocution, adapted to Female Readers, by William Russell.* Boston: James Munroe & Co. 1845.

*Elements of Musical Articulation, by William Russell. With Illustrations in Vocal Music, by Lowell Mason, Prof. Boston Academy of Music.* Boston: Wilkins, Carter & Co. 1845.

*Lessons at Home in Spelling and Reading. Parts I. and II.* Boston: Wm. D. Ticknor & Co. 1846.

*Orthophony: or the Cultivation of the Voice in Elocution: A Manual of Elementary Exercises, adapted to Dr. Rush's "Philosophy of the Human Voice," and the system of vocal culture introduced by Mr. James E. Murdock. Designed as an introduction to Russell's "American Elocutionist." Compiled by William Russell. With a Supplement on Purity of Tone, by G. J. Webb, Prof. Boston Academy of Music.* Boston: Ticknor, Reed & Fields. 1845.

*Harper's New York Class-Book. Comprising Outlines of the Geography and History of New York; Biographical Notices of Eminent Individuals; Sketches of Scenery and Natural History; and Accounts of Public Institutions. Arranged as a Reading Book for Schools.* By William Russell. New York: Harper and Bros. 1847.

*New Spelling Book, or, Second Course of Lessons in Spelling and Reading.* Designed as a Sequel to the Author's Primer, and an Introduction to the other parts of his Elementary and Common School Series. Enlarged edition. Boston: Tappan and Whittemore. 1852.

*Pulpit Elocution: Comprising Remarks on the Effect of Manner in Public Discourse; the Elements of Elocution, applied to the Reading of the Scriptures, Hymns, and Sermons; with Observations, on the Principles of Gesture, and a Selection of Exercises in Reading and Speaking.* By William Russell. With an Introduction by Edwards A. Park, D. D., Prof. in Andover Theol. Sem'y; and Rev. Edward N. Kirk, Pastor of Mt. Vernon Church, Boston. Andover: W. F. Draper & Brother. 1852.

*The University Speaker: A Collection of Pieces designed for College Exercises in Declamation and Recitation. With Suggestions on the appropriate Elocution of particular passages.* Boston and Cambridge: James Munroe & Co. 1852.

*Suggestions on Teachers' Institutes.* Manchester, N. H.: William H. Fisk. 1852.

*A Manual of Instruction in Reading.* Prepared for the use of Teachers' Institutes. Andover, Mass.: Warren F. Draper. 1852.

*An Address on the Infant-School System of Education*, and the extent to which it may be advantageously applied to all Primary Schools. Delivered in the Representatives' Hall, Boston, Aug. 21, 1830, before the Convention which formed the Am. Ins. of Instruction.

*An Address on Associations of Teachers*. Delivered at a Meeting held in Dorchester, on Wednesday, 8th Sept., 1830, for the purpose of forming an Association of Teachers, for Norfolk County, Mass.

*A Lecture on Heading and Declamation*. Delivered before the American Institute of Instruction, at Worcester, Mass., Aug., 1837.

*A Lecture on Elocution*, introductory to a course of Readings and Recitations. Delivered at the Temple, Boston, 1838.

*A Lecture on the Education of Females*. Delivered at the close of the Autumn Term of Abbot Female Academy, Andover, Mass., Nov. 21, 1843.

*A Lecture on Female Education*. Delivered before the Am. Institute of Instruction, at Portland, Me., 2d Sept., 1844.

*Hints to Teachers on Instruction in Reading*. Educational Tract No. 5, in the series issued by Hon. Henry Barnard, State Commissioner of Schools, R. I., 1840.

*Duties of Teachers*. An Address before the Associate Alumni of Merrimack Normal Inst., at their First Annual Meeting, Sept. 4, 1850.

*Address at the Dedication and Opening of the New England Normal Institute*, Lancaster, Mass., Wednesday, May 11, 1853.

*Encouragements to Teachers*. An Address before the Associate Alumni of Merrimack Normal Institute, at the Fourth Anniversary of the Association, Wednesday, 31st Aug., 1853.

*Exercises on Words, Designed as a Course of Practice on the Rudiments of Grammar and Rhetoric*. Boston: Whittemore, Niles, & Hall. 1850.

### **Other Related Publication by William Russell**

*Grammar of Composition* (New Haven, 1823)

*Lessons in Enunciation* (Boston, 1830)

*Rudiments of Gesture* (1838)

*American Elocutionist* (1844)

*Orthophony, or Cultivation of the Voice* (1845)

*Elements of Musical Articulation* (1845)

*Pulpit Elocution* (Andover, 1846)

*Exercises in Words* (1856)

In addition to his work with the *American Journal of Education*, William Russell also edited numerous schoolbooks and several minor educational manuals

## **Sir William Hamilton in American Books and Periodicals**

In 1881 W. H. S. Monck, Professor of Moral Philosophy in the University of Dublin had this to say about Hamilton's literary influence: "Such has been the impulse which Hamilton has given to speculative thought in this country that to enumerate the various works in which some portions of his system have been vindicated or criticized – adopted or rejected – would require an erudition almost equal to his own." Noah Porter spoke to Hamilton's reputation in America for John Veitch's *Memoir of Sir William Hamilton*:

Henceforth Hamilton was regarded as the greatest writer and teacher among living Englishmen. It was not at all surprising that his reputation should be fixed at once with a people of so decided an interest in speculative studies, but of limited reading, whose teachers had been accustomed to look to Scotland and Edinburgh for their authorities in philosophy, and who had no local traditions or prejudices to prevent them from accepting, as the most worthy of their confidence, the writer who could best instruct them. Henceforward all the writings of Hamilton were eagerly sought for.

The sampling of publications that follow shows the breadth of Hamilton's literary representation as referred to by Monck and Porter.

### **Books:**

**Title:** *Discussions on Philosophy and Literature, Education and University Reform. Chiefly from The Edinburgh Review: cor., vindicated, enl., in notes and appendices.* By Sir William Hamilton bart. With an introductory essay by Robert Turnbull.

**Author:** Hamilton, William, Sir, 1788-1856.

**Publication Info:** New York: Harper & Brothers, publishers, 1861.

**Nature of Reference:** An American reprint of Hamilton's work.

**Title:** *Lectures on Metaphysics and Logic by Sir William Hamilton, bart.* ed. by the Rev. Henry L. Mansel ... and John Veitch.

**Author:** Hamilton, William, Sir, 1788-1856.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon and company: etc., 1859-63.

**Nature of Reference:** An American reprint of Hamilton's work.

**Title:** *Lectures on metaphysics and Logic by Sir William Hamilton, bart.* ed. by the Rev. Henry L. Mansel ... and John Veitch .

**Author:** Hamilton, William, Sir, 1788-1856.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon and company: etc., 1859-63.

**Nature of Reference:** An American reprint of Hamilton's work 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.

**Title:** *Lectures on Metaphysics and Logic by Sir William Hamilton Bart.* ed. by the Rev. Henry Longueville Mansel and John Veitch.

**Author:** Hamilton, William, Sir, 1788-1856.

**Publication Info:** New York: Sheldon and company, 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** An American reprint of Hamilton's work.

**Title:** *The Metaphysics of Sir William Hamilton Collected, Arranged, and Abridged by Francis Bowen.*

**Author:** Hamilton, William, Sir, 1788-1856.

**Publication Info:** Boston: J. Allyn, 1872.

**Nature of Reference:** Bowen's defense of Hamilton given Mill's attack.

**Title:** *An Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy and of the Principal Philosophical Questions Discussed in His Writings.*

**Author:** Mill, John Stuart, 1806-1873.

**Publication Info:** Boston: W. V. Spencer, 1865.

**Nature of the Reference:** An American edition of Mill's famous attack of Hamilton's philosophy.

**Title:** *Memoir of Sir William Hamilton, Bart.*

**Author:** Veitch, John

**Publication Info:** Edinburgh and London, William Blackwood and Sons 1869.

**Nature of the Reference:** A detailed account of Hamilton's life, including some correspondence and a philosophical defense of Hamilton's views.

**Title:** *Outline of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy*, a Textbook for Students

**Author:** Murray, John Clark.

**Publication Info:** Boston, Gould Publishers 1870.

**Nature of Reference:** Murry's adaptation of Hamilton's philosophy as a textbook.

**Title:** *Southland writers. Biographical and critical sketches of the living female writers of the South. With extracts from their writings.*

**Author:** Raymond, Ida.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: Claxton, Remsen & Haffelfinger, 1870.

**Nature of Reference:** Use of a phrase "such outness" attributed as a known Hamiltonian expression.

**Title:** *The works of Rufus Choate, with a memoir of his life.*

**Author:** Brown, Samuel Gilman, (Choate, Rufus, 1799-1859).

**Publication Info:** Boston: Little, Brown and company, 1862.

**Nature of Reference:** Choate was a lawyer, Mass. state Representative and a United States Congressman. Choate's memoirs show that he greatly admired and was well versed in Hamilton's work and reveled in the opportunity to read it.

**Title:** *The Life and Letters of Hugh Miller.*

**Author:** Bayne, Peter.

**Publication Info:** Boston : Gould & Lincoln, 1871.

**Nature of Reference:** Contains some recollections of McCosh concerning his first publication and Hamilton's response to it, and a reflection on Hamilton's influence as an instructor to Miller at the University of Edinburgh.

**Title:** *The life of Henry John Temple, Viscount Palmerston ... with selections from his diaries and correspondence.*

**Author:** Dalling and Bulwer, Henry Lytton Bulwer, Baron, 1801-1872.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & co., 1871.

**Nature of Reference:** Reference to Hamilton's research on Dugald Stewart.

**Title:** *Memorials of his Time.*

**Author:** Cockburn, Henry; Cockburn, Lord, 1779-1854.

**Publication Info:** New York,: D. Appleton & company, 1856.

**Nature of Reference:** Cockburn's recollection of the passing Professor Brown and the Edinburgh town councils political views on who should replace him. Hamilton's Whig politics put him at odds with the town council.

**Title:** *A Strange Story & The haunted & The Haunters.*

**Author:** Lytton, Edward Bulwer Lytton, Baron, 1803-1873.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & co., 1865.

**Nature of Reference:** Quotes Hamilton on Man, God and Nature.

**Title:** *Portrait gallery of Eminent Men and Women of Europe and America ... With biographies.* By Evert A. Duyckinck ... Illustrated with highly finished steel engravings from original portraits by the most celebrated artists .

**Author:** Duyckinck, Evert A. (Evert Augustus), 1816-1878.

**Publication Info:** New York: Johnson, Fry and company, [c1872-74].

**Nature of Reference:** Article on Lord Palmerston with reference to Hamilton consulting him on writing Dugald Stewart's life.

**Title:** *Visits to European Celebrities.*

**Author:** Sprague, William Buell, 1795-1876.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon, Lamport & Blakeman, 1855.

**Nature of Reference:** Sprague was an American Presbyterian minister. He recounts that while in Edinburgh he dined with Hamilton.

**Title:** *Spare Hours.*

**Author:** Brown, John, 1810-1882.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Ticknor and Fields, 1865-66.

**Nature of Reference:** Sings the praise of Hamilton as a philosopher – better than Leibniz and as great as Pascal.

**Title:** *Klosterheim; or, The Masque. By Thomas De Quincey; with a Biographical Preface by Dr. Shelton Mackenzie.*

**Author:** De Quincey, Thomas, 1785-1859.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Whittemore, Niles, and Hall; J. C. Derby; [etc., etc.], 1855.

**Nature of Reference:** DeQuincey met Hamilton and became friends.

**Title:** School funds & school laws of Michigan: with notes & forms. To which are added elements of school architecture, & thoughts on warming & ventilation, school furniture, apparatus, etc.

**Author:** Michigan Dept. of Public Instruction.

**Publication Info:** Lansing: Hosmer & Kerr, 1858.

**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton's work is listed as an appropriate philosophy text.

**Title:** *School Management.*

**Author:** Holbrook, Alfred, 1816-1909.

**Publication Info:** Lebanon, O.: J. Holbrook, 1871.

**Nature of Reference:** A discussion of great teachers – Socrates, Plato, Leibniz, and Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *Harvard Memorial Biographies.*

**Author:** Higginson, Thomas Wentworth, ed. 1823-1911.

**Publication Info:** Cambridge: Sever and Francis, 1866.

**Nature of Reference:** American scholarship on Hamilton - Charles Brown wrote his dissertation on Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *De Quincey's Writings.*

**Author:** De Quincey, Thomas, 1785-1859.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Ticknor, Reed, and Fields, 1851-70

**Nature of Reference:** De Quincey dedicates a whole chapter to his personal reflection of Sir William Hamilton. This account contains interesting details and perspectives that other accounts of Hamilton's life pass by.

**Title:** *Essays and Reviews*.

**Author:** Whipple, Edwin Percy, 1819-1886.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Ticknor, Reed, and Fields, 1851.

**Nature of Reference:** A general review of Hamilton's works – praises his scholarly approach and encourages American's to read Hamilton.

**Title:** *Noetes ambrosianae. By the Late Christopher North. (Prof. John Wilson.) Selected, edited & arranged by John Skelton.*

**Author:** Wilson, John, 1785-1854.

**Publication Info:** N.Y.: J. B. Alden, pref. 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** American reprint of a Scottish work. Hamilton is a footnote reference to his brother's literary contributions.

**Title:** *'Christopher North,' a memoir of John Wilson, late professor of moral philosophy in the University of Edinburgh, comp. from family papers and other sources by his daughter, Mrs. Gordon, with an introduction by R. Shelton Mackenzie.*

**Author:** Gordon, Mary (Wilson) Mrs.

**Publication Info:** New York: W. J. Widdleton, 1863.

**Nature of Reference:** Another Scottish text reprinted in America. This book contains many references to Hamilton in respect Professor John Wilson's daughter. Highlights include the nature of Hamilton and Wilson's friendship and insight into the character and demeanor of a young Hamilton.

**Title:** *The Americans at home: Pen-and-Ink sketches of American Men, Manners and Institutions.*

**Author:** Macrae, David, 1837-1907.

**Publication Info:** Edinburgh: Edmonston and Douglas, 1870.

**Nature of Reference:** A curious look at different Americans the author had encountered, reflecting on likes and dislikes habits education and pastimes. The author met a family in New England where the young girls studied Sir William Hamilton's metaphysics daily. In addition, he met an African American who had a well-worn edition of Hamilton's works.

**Title:** *Elements of art criticism; comprising a treatise on the principles of man's nature as addressed by art, together with a historic survey of the methods of art execution in the departments of drawing, sculpture, architecture, painting, landscape gardening, and the decorative arts. Designed as a text book for school and colleges and as a hand-book for amateurs and artists.*

**Author:** Samson, G. W. (George Whitefield), 1819-1896.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & Co., 1867.

**Nature of Reference:** Discussion of sense of touch in relation to art. Hamilton's attention to the works of Reid are held to show the importance of Reid's contributions. Also cites Hamilton in regards to Sir Joshua Reynolds.

**Title:** *Concord Days*.

**Author:** Alcott, Amos Bronson, 1799-1888.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Roberts Brothers, 1872.

**Nature of Reference:** Gives a mention to the philosophers studied at the St. Louis philosophical society: Kant, Hegel and Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *The Emotions and the Will*.

**Author:** Bain, Alexander, 1818-1903.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton & company, 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** Cites Hamilton's views on the transition from the emotional to the intellectual.

**Title:** *The Will, Divine and Human*.

**Author:** Solly, Thomas, 1816-1875.

**Publication Info:** Cambridge: Deighton, Bell and co.; [etc., etc.], 1856.

**Nature of Reference:** Quotes Hamilton on nature of the will and volition – includes a further citation in a footnote on the same topic.

**Title:** *Essays, Historical and Biographical, Political, Social, Literary, and Scientific*.  
*Hugh Miller. Ed., with a preface, by Peter Bayne.*

**Author:** Ed. Miller, Hugh, 1802-1856.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon and company; 1865.

**Nature of Reference:** A historical account stating the passing of Hamilton was the end of an era for Edinburgh. Scott, Chalmers, Wilson and Sir William Hamilton have all passed away.

**Title:** *The debatable Land Between this World and The Next, with illustrative narrations; by Robert Dale Owen.*

**Author:** Owen, Robert Dale, 1801-1877.

**Publication Info:** New York: G. W. Carleton & co., [etc., etc.], 1872.

**Nature of Reference:** Cites and reflects on Hamilton's historical views of the reformation.

**Title:** *A System of Intellectual Philosophy*.

**Author:** Mahan, Asa, 1799-1889.

**Publication Info:** New York, Cincinnati: A. S. Barnes; H. W. Derby, 1854.

**Nature of Reference:** This author dedicates a chapter to a negative criticism of Hamilton's definition of consciousness.

**Title:** *The Phenomena of Spiritualism Scientifically Explained and Exposed*.

**Author:** Mahan, Asa, 1799-1889.

**Publication Info:** New York: A. S. Barnes, 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** A strange reference to Hamilton – seems like just name dropping of a famous intellectual to help qualify a fringe position.

**Title:** *A Stellar Key To The Summer Land. Pt. 1. Illustrated with diagrams and engravings of celestial scenery.*

**Author:** Davis, Andrew Jackson, 1826-1910.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: W. White & company; Banner of light branch office, 1868.

**Nature of Reference:** In regards to music this source references Hamilton's views on perception and brain function as they are used to explain how a musical genius may function.

**Title:** *An Ancient Geography, Classical and Sacred.*

**Author:** Mitchell, S. Augustus (Samuel Augustus), 1792-1868.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: E. H. Butler, 1860.

**Nature of Reference:** Page 4 catalogue of standard publications – includes Hamilton's "Philosophy of the Active and Moral Powers of Man."

**Title:** *English Psychology, Tr. From the French of Th. Ribot. Hartley--James Mill--Herbert Spencer--A. Bain--G. H. Lewes--Samuel Bailey--John Stuart Mill.*

**Author:** Ribot, Th. (Théodule), 1839-1916.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1874.

**Nature of Reference:** In a chapter on John Stewart Mill the author credits Hamilton for being the first in Europe to hypothesize an active unconscious; an idea that caught on in England, France and Germany. A passage from Mill's critique of Hamilton is also explored.

**Title:** *Planchette; or, The Despair of Science. Being a full account of modern spiritualism, its phenomena, and the various theories regarding it. With a survey of French Spiritism.*

**Author:** Sargent, Epes, 1813-1880.

**Publication Info:** Boston, Roberts brothers, 1869.

**Nature of Reference:** Lists Hamilton with Mansel as subjective idealists who are currently in vogue. The chapter goes on to argue that Hamilton's philosophy is too narrow to accommodate spiritualisms like clairvoyance and communicating with the dead.

**Title:** *The Proof Palpable of Immortality; Being an Account of the Materialization Phenomena of Modern Spiritualism. With remarks on the relations of the facts to theology, morals, and religion.*

**Author:** Sargent, Epes, 1813-1880.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Colby and Rich, 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** Quotes a Socratic remark by Hamilton: "the highest reach of human science is the scientific recognition of human ignorance." This quote is used to frame a negative view of fideism.

**Title:** *Text-book of Intellectual Philosophy, for Schools and Colleges: Containing an Outline of the Science, with an Abstract of its History.*

**Author:** Champlin, James Tift, 1811-1882.

**Publication Info:** New York: Potter, Ainsworth and company, [c1874].

**Nature of Reference:** Due to Mill's examination of Hamilton's philosophy this author sees J. S. Mill as a materialistic nihilist.

**Title:** *The principles of Psychology.*

**Author:** Bascom, John, 1827-1911.

**Publication Info:** New York: G.P. Putnam and Son, 1869.

**Nature of Reference:** Several references to Hamilton's mental philosophy especially on consciousness. Bascom uses Hamilton as a standard and sound-board to investigate perception and consciousness.

**Title:** *Empirical Psychology; or, The human Mind as Given in Consciousness.: For the use of colleges and academies.*

**Author:** Hickok, Laurens P. (Laurens Perseus), 1798-1888.

**Publication Info:** Schenectady: G. Y. Van Debogert, 1855.

**Nature of Reference:** In regards to the faculty of reason, Hickok makes reference to Hamilton's claim that we can never know the unconditioned.

**Title:** *Elements of psychology.*

**Author:** Day, Henry Noble, 1808-1890.

**Publication Info:** New York: G. P. Putnam's sons, 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** Several references to Hamilton. Preface claims this book to be an introduction to metaphysics – a field dominated by Sir William Hamilton. Day gives a critical yet positive view of Hamilton.

**Title:** *Mental Science; a Compendium of Psychology, and the History of Philosophy, designed as a textbook for high-schools and colleges.*

**Author:** Bain, Alexander, 1818-1903.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1870.

**Nature of Reference:** Takes issue with Hamilton on several points of mental philosophy as well as Hamilton's employment of Aristotle to support Common Sense philosophy.

**Title:** *Psychology: or, The Science of Mind.*

**Author:** Munsell, Oliver Spencer, 1825-1905.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1871.

**Nature of Reference:** There are several references to Hamilton: on scientific method, on epistemology, on the classification of perception and intuition, primitive judgments, logic and reasoning.

**Title:** *Mental philosophy: including the intellect, sensibilities, and will.*

**Author:** Haven, Joseph, 1816-1874.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon and company; [etc., etc.], 1862.

**Nature of Reference:** Credits Hamilton with stating the method of psychology in its ultimate form. Haven also makes repeated citations to Hamilton's philosophy. When the author takes exception to Hamilton's view he still frames it in a positive manner.

**Title:** *Live questions in psychology and metaphysics: Six lectures selected from those delivered to the classes in Cornell university.*

**Author:** Wilson, William Dexter, 1816-1900.

**Publication Info:** New York, Ithaca: D. Appleton and company; Andrus, McChain & company, 1877.

**Nature of Reference:** Several mentions of Hamilton's mental philosophy used as the standard by which new innovations are made.

**Title:** *The Elements of Intellectual Philosophy.*

**Author:** Wayland, Francis, 1796-1865.

**Publication Info:** New York: Sheldon & company, 1868.

**Nature of Reference:** Wayland cites Hamilton on the classification of matter.

**Title:** *Methods of Instruction.*

**Author:** Wickersham, James Pyle, 1825-1893.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & co., [1865].

**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton's definition of logic is used to frame a discussion on education as well as his views on the importance of language in consciousness.

**Title:** *Sunny Memories of Foreign Lands. By Mrs. Harriet Beecher Stowe. Illustrated from designs by Hammett Billings.*

**Author:** Stowe, Harriet Beecher, 1811-1896.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Phillips, Sampson and company; J. C. Derby, 1854.

**Nature of Reference:** A travel memoir. The author reflects on her meeting with Sir William Hamilton in Scotland. She speaks of his reputation as the greatest metaphysician in Europe. Stowe also meets with George Combe the phrenologist.

**Title:** *English Literature, Considered as an Interpreter of English History Designed as a Manual of Instruction.*

**Author:** Coppée, Henry, 1821-1895.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: Claxton, Remson & Haffelfinger, 1873.

**Nature of Reference:** The reader is referred to Hamilton's metaphysics as a thorough discussion on Berkeley's Idealism. Also there is an interesting quote from Hamilton on Hume's skepticism. Here Hamilton sees Hume's skeptical philosophy as an important step in the progress of philosophy. Hamilton is also listed as a writer of philosophy and science.

**Title:** *First Steps in English Literature.*

**Author:** Gilman, Arthur, 1837-1909.

**Publication Info:** New York, Chicago: A. S. Barnes & co., 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** Lists Hamilton as an important philosopher and writer. The author does mistakenly refer to Hamilton as an English philosopher.

**Title:** *The culture demanded by modern life: a series of addresses and arguments on the claims of scientific education.*

**Author:** Youmans, Edward Livingston, ed. 1821-1887.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton & co., 1867.

**Nature of Reference:** Contains a quote from Hamilton on reason. He is mentioned with Plato as a metaphysician and used as an example in an argument that many great thinkers had deficiencies. For Hamilton, he had cultivated his history of philosophy at the expense of originality and organization.

**Title:** *Letters on International Copyright.*

**Author:** Carey, Henry Charles, 1793-1879.

**Publication Info:** New York: Hurd and Houghton, 1868.

**Nature of Reference:** In an overview of the recognition of the literary contributions of Scotland, Hamilton is listed as the last of the greats from Scotland. In previous times there were numerous authors, but by Hamilton's time there is only him.

**Title:** *A Catalogue of Books Belonging to the Lower Hall of the Central Department.*

**Author:** Boston Public Library.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Issued by the Library, 1873.

**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton is listed in an anthology as well as 2 cross-references from Cousins and Wilson.

**Title:** *A Classed Catalogue of the Library of the Cambridge High School.*

**Author:** Cambridge (Mass.) High school.

**Publication Info:** Cambridge: J. Bartlett, 1853.

**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton's edition of the works of Thomas Reid was listed as a holding.

**Title:** *Catalogue of the Public Library of Cincinnati.*

**Author:** Public Library of Cincinnati and Hamilton County.

**Publication Info:** Cincinnati: Press of Wilstach, Baldwin & co., 1871.

**Nature of Reference:** Collected works of Dugald Stewart ed. by Hamilton also Wight's book "The Philosophy of Sir William Hamilton."

**Title:** *Catalogue of the Books and Pamphlets in the Library of Columbia College, New York.*

**Author:** Columbia University. Libraries.

**Publication Info:** New York: J. W. Amerman, printer, 1874.

**Nature of Reference:** "Reid's Works" ed. by Hamilton, Hamilton's ed. of *The Collected Works of Dugald Stewart* and Veitch's *Memoir of Sir William Hamilton*.

**Title:** *Catalogue of The New York State Library: 1855. General Library.*

**Author:** New York State Library.

**Publication Info:** Albany,: C. Van Benthuyssen, printer, 1856.

**Nature of Reference:** Archibald Russell's "An account of Eleven thousand Schools in the State of New York: A Letter to sir William Hamilton", also Hamilton's editions of Reid's Works and Stewart's Works are cited.

**Title:** *Alphabetical Catalogue of the Library of Congress.*

**Author:** Library of Congress. Catalog, 1864.

**Publication Info:** Washington: Gov't print. off., 1864.

**Nature of Reference:** Henry Calderwood's *Philosophy of the infinite: in answer to Sir William Hamilton and Mr. Mansel, Hamilton's Lectures on Metaphysics and Logic, Discussions on Philosophy, Literature and Education and Universal Reform.*

**Title:** *Catalogue of Books added to the Library of Congress.*

**Author:** Library of Congress. Catalog, 1868.

**Publication Info:** Washington: Gov't print. off., 1868.

**Nature of Reference:** Mansel's "*Philosophy of the Conditioned*" an answer to Mill's *Examination of Hamilton* is cited.

**Title:** *Catalogue of the Vermont State Library, September 1, 1872.*

**Author:** Vermont. State Library, Montpelier.

**Publication Info:** Montpelier: J. & J. M. Poland, printers, 1872.

**Nature of Reference:** This collection includes, *Collected works of Dugald Stewart* ed. by Hamilton, Mill's *Examination*.

**Title:** *Catalogue of the Valuable Library of Henry B. Humphrey, esq.*

**Author:** Humphrey, Henry B.

**Publication Info:** Cambridge: Riverside press, 1871.

**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton's editions of the *Collected Works of Dugald Stewart* were in this library.

**Title:** *Books and Reading.*

**Author:** Atkinson, William P. (William Parsons), 1820-1890.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Crosby, Nichols, Lee, & co., 1860.

**Nature of Reference:** Two references to Hamilton in regards to the nature of Knowledge.

**Title:** *The Best Reading: Hints on the Selection of Books.*

**Publication Info:** New York: G. P. Putnam & sons, 1872.

**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton is listed with others, like Darwin and Dickens as "contemporary material for a reading course".

**Title:** *Catalogue of the Books, Manuscripts, and Engravings Belonging to William Menzies of New York--Another Issue.*

**Author:** Menzies, William.

**Publication Info:** New York, Albany: Press of J. Munsell, 1875.

**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton's edition of the *Collected Works of Dugald Stewart*.

**Title:** *Catalogue of the Library of The Boston Athenæum.*

**Author:** Boston Athenæum.

**Publication Info:** Boston: 1874-82.

**Nature of Reference:** Holds De Quincey's *Essays on Philosophical Writers and Other Men of Letters* Vol. 1; Hamilton is the 1<sup>st</sup> subject.

**Title:** *Books and Reading: or, What Books Shall I read and How shall I read Them?*  
**Author:** Porter, Noah, 1811-1892.  
**Publication Info:** New York: C. Scribner & co., 1871.  
**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton's Metaphysics and Literary essays are listed in books of "science and duty."

**Title:** *The Book Buyer's Manual.*  
**Author:** Putnam, Firm, Publishers.  
**Publication Info:** New York, G. P. Putnam, 1852.  
**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton's edition of *Reid's Collected Works* is in the manual.

**Title:** *Anecdote Biographies of Thackeray and Dickens.*  
**Publication Info:** New York: Scribner, Armstrong, 1874.  
**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton and Jeffrey are mentioned as donating a crown to buy an ink stand for Thackeray.

**Title:** *The Secrets of the Great City.*  
**Author:** McCabe, James Dabney, 1842-1883.  
**Publication Info:** Philadelphia, Chicago [etc.]: Jones brothers & co., [1868].  
**Nature of Reference:** An authoritarian reference to Hamilton on the distinction between probability and proof.

**Title:** History and progress of education, from the earliest times to the present.  
**Author:** Brockett, L. P. (Linus Pierpont), 1820-1893.  
**Publication Info:** New York: A. S. Barnes & Burr, 1860.  
**Nature of Reference:** In regards to philosophy... "from Aristotle to Sir William Hamilton". This reference places Hamilton with the great thinkers of antiquity.

**Title:** *How to Teach: A Graded Course of Instruction and Manual of Methods for the use of Teachers.*  
**Author:** Kiddle, Henry, 1824-1891.  
**Publication Info:** Cincinnati, New York: Van Antwerp. Bragg & co., [c1877].  
**Nature of Reference:** Introduction frames the book with a quote from Hamilton on education.

**Title:** *School Economy. A Treatise on the Preparation, Organization, Employments, Government, and Authorities of Schools.*  
**Author:** Wickersham, James Pyle, 1825-1893.  
**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & co., 1864.  
**Nature of Reference:** Takes notice that Hamilton "recently introduced a system of prizes" in the classroom. (Which, I might add, he picked up from his teacher George Jardine) Also quotes Hamilton on teaching and understanding.

**Title:** *Talks to Teachers on Psychology: and to Students on Some of Life's Ideals.*  
**Author:** James, William, 1842-1910.  
**Publication Info:** New York: H. Holt and company, 1906.

**Nature of Reference:** Contains a quote from the Glasgow Herald – James’ lectures have risen to the heights of Dugald Stewart and Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *The Growth of Cities.*

**Author:** Tappan, Henry Philip, 1805-1881.

**Publication Info:** New York: R. Craighead, printer, 1855.

**Nature of Reference:** In citing the charms of Edinburgh the author states one can see the home of Sir William Hamilton. Later in regards to German education this book looks to Cousin’s and Hamilton’s views on the subject. Finally the author sings the praises of Hamilton’s contributions to *The Edinburgh Review*.

**Title:** *The Theory of Human Progression, and Natural Probability of a Reign of Justice.*

**Author:** [Dove, Patrick Edward] 1815-1873.

**Publication Info:** Boston, Portland: Sanborn, Carter and Bazin; Sanborn & Carter, 1856.

**Nature of reference:** Contains a footnote that attributes the theory of comprehension and extension to Hamilton.

**Title:** *Choice Specimens of English Literature.*

**Author:** Shaw, Thomas B. comp. (Thomas Budd), 1813-1862.

**Publication Info:** New York: Sheldon and company, 1870.

**Nature of reference:** This volume includes an excerpt from Hamilton’s “Discussions on Philosophy” in particular a short article on “Mathematical Study an Insufficient Study.”

**Title:** *A Complete Manual of English Literature.*

**Author:** Shaw, Thomas B. (Thomas Budd), 1813-1862.

**Publication Info:** New York: Sheldon & Co., c1867.

**Nature of reference:** In the chapter on Prose Literature of the Nineteenth Century there is a short biography of Hamilton and a list of his chief works.

**Title:** *Outlines of Lectures on the History of Philosophy.*

**Author:** Elmendorf, John Jay, 1827-1896.

**Publication Info:** New York: G. P. Putnam's sons, 1876.

**Nature of reference:** Terms and definitions are credited to Hamilton.

**Title:** *A History of Philosophy.*

**Author:** Haven, Joseph, 1816-1874.

**Publication Info:** New York: Sheldon & company, 1876.

**Nature of reference:** A chapter on recent philosophy of Great Britain the author sets up Hamilton and Mill as the two opposing schools of the UK. This chapter includes a short complementary biography of Hamilton and his philosophy in context of the leading ideas of the day.

**Title:** *The biographical history of philosophy from its origin in Greece down to the present day.*

**Author:** Lewes, George Henry, 1817-1878.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1857.

**Nature of reference:** Makes reference to Hamilton's views on Aristotle's Metaphysics.

**Title:** *The Progress of Philosophy in the Past and in the Future.*

**Author:** Tyler, Samuel, 1809-1877.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & co.; [etc., etc.], 1868.

**Nature of reference:** The primary focus of the 2<sup>nd</sup> part of this history of philosophy is on the work of Sir William Hamilton. Tyler, who was a lawyer by trade, was in correspondence with Hamilton.

**Title:** *Philosophy as Absolute Science, Founded in the Universal Laws of Being, and Including Ontology, Theology, and Psychology made One, as Spirit, Soul, and Body.*

**Author:** Frothingham, Ephraim Langdon.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Walker, Wise and company, 1864.

**Nature of reference:** This work includes an extract from Sir William Hamilton on the relativity of knowledge.

**Title:** *Books and Reading: or, What books Shall I read and How shall I Read Them?*

**Author:** Porter, Noah, 1811-1892.

**Publication Info:** New York: Seribner, Armstrong & co., 1877.

**Nature of the Reference:** Lists Hamilton's Lectures on Metaphysics, Discussions on Philosophy and Literature and Mill's Examinations.

**Title:** *The Human Intellect: With an Introduction Upon Psychology and the Soul.*

**Author:** Porter, Noah, 1811-1892.

**Publication Info:** New York: Scribner, 1869 [c1868].

**Nature of reference:** Hamilton appears in chapters on Theories of Sense Perception, The Nature of the Concept, and Primary and Secondary Qualities of Matter.

**Title:** The elements of intellectual science.

**Author:** Porter, Noah, 1811-1892.

**Publication Info:** New York: C. Scribner & company, 1871.

**Nature of reference:** Hamilton is included in a chapter on Theories of Sense Perception.

**Title:** *The Sciences of Nature Versus the Science of Man: A plea for the Science of Man.*

**Author:** Porter, Noah, 1811-1892.

**Publication Info:** New York: Dodd & Mead, 1871.

**Nature of reference:** This book uses a quote from Mill's Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy.

**Title:** *A Memoir of the Life and Labors of Francis Wayland.*

**Author:** Wayland, Francis, 1826-1904.

**Publication Info:** New York: Sheldon and company, 1867.

**Nature of reference:** Wayland was president of Brown University from 1827 to 1855. He was known for his support of temperance and anti-slavery. In his autobiographical account, Wayland records that he met Sir William Hamilton during a visit to Edinburgh.

**Title:** *Essays on the Intellectual Powers of Man.*

**Author:** Reid, Thomas, 1710-1796.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Phillips, Sampson, and company, 1855.

**Nature of reference:** An American edition of Reid's work that includes the notes and comments of Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *Recent British Philosophy: a review, with criticisms.*

**Author:** Masson, David, 1822-1907.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1866.

**Nature of reference:** This American edition of Masson's work includes some comments on Mr. Mill's answer to Sir William Hamilton. The author, Masson, was a Scottish writer and a friend of Mill.

**Title:** *Prolegomena Logica: an inquiry into the psychological character of logical processes.*

**Author:** Mansel, Henry Longueville, 1820-1871.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon and company; [etc., etc.], 1860.

**Nature of reference:** An American edition of Hamilton's staunch defender Mansel - as such the book is Hamiltonian.

**Title:** *Elements of Logic.*

**Author:** Coppée, Henry, 1821-1895.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: E. H. Butler & co., 1858.

**Nature of reference:** References Hamilton's symbolism and makes note of his "new analytic."

**Title:** *An Elementary Treatise of Logic.*

**Author:** Wilson, William Dexter, 1816-1900.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company [etc., etc.], 1856.

**Nature of reference:** Praises Hamilton as one of the all time greats of philosophy. This edition makes many references to Hamilton's views on the syllogism and other principles of logic.

**Title:** *Metaphysics.*

**Author:** Miller, John, 1819-1895.

**Publication Info:** New York: Dodd & Mead, [c1875].

**Nature of reference:** Many references to Hamilton – often in contrast to other philosophers – Reid and Hamilton, Kant and Hamilton...

**Title:** *The Theistic Conception of the World: An Essay in Opposition to Certain Tendencies of Modern Thought.*

**Author:** Cocker, Benjamin Franklin, 1821-1883.

**Publication Info:** New York: Harper, 1875.

**Nature of reference:** Addresses Hamilton's notion of the relativity of knowledge and quotes him on free will and the moral law.

**Title:** *Know the Truth; A Critique on the Hamiltonian Theory of Limitation, Including Some those upon the Theories of Rev. Henry L. Mansel and Mr. Herbert Spencer.*

**Author:** Jones, Jesse Henry, 1836-1904.

**Publication Info:** New York, Boston: Hurd and Houghton; Nichols and Noyes, 1865.

**Nature of reference:** Takes Hamilton's views on the limitations of knowledge to task. Argues Hamilton is wrong.

**Title:** *The Origin and Development of Religious Belief.*

**Author:** Baring-Gould, S. (Sabine), 1834-1924.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1871.

**Nature of reference:** Uses Hamilton's distinction of consciousness into three faculties: cognition, feeling, and volition.

**Title:** *Lectures on the True, the Beautiful and the Good.*

**Author:** Cousin, Victor, 1792-1867.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1854.

**Nature of reference:** An American edition of this French thinker – references to Hamilton.

**Title:** *An Outline of the Necessary Laws of Thought: A Treatise on Pure and Applied Logic.*

**Author:** Thomson, William, 1819-1890.

**Publication Info:** New York, Boston: Sheldon and company; Gould & Lincoln, 1863.

**Nature of reference:** Written by the English Arch Bishop of York, this American edition is dedicated to Sir William Hamilton who advised Thomson on principle of logic.

**Title:** *The Science of Aesthetics: or, The Nature, Kinds, Laws, and Uses of Beauty.*

**Author:** Day, Henry Noble, 1808-1890.

**Publication Info:** New Haven, Conn.: C. C. Chatfield & co., 1872.

**Nature of reference:** Several references to Hamilton many in association with the philosophy of Kant. Utilizes quotes by Hamilton.

**Title:** *The Reformation.*

**Author:** Fisher, George Park, 1827-1909.

**Publication Info:** New York: Scribner, Armstrong, and co., 1873.

**Nature of reference:** Footnote references to Hamilton's Discussions on Philosophy.

**Title:** *Germany; Its Universities, Theology and Religion.*

**Author:** Schaff, Philip, 1819-1893.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia, New York: Lindsay and Blakiston; Sheldon, Balkeman & co., 1857.

**Nature of reference:** Chapter one has a section on the judgment of Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *Systematic Theology.*

**Author:** Hodge, Charles, 1797-1878.

**Publication Info:** New York: C. Scribner, Armstrong, and company; London and Edinburgh, T. Nelson and sons, 1873.

**Nature of reference:** Most of Chapter 4 is on Sir William Hamilton and his doctrines.

**Title:** *A Theodicy.*

**Author:** Bledsoe, Albert Taylor, 1809-1877.

**Publication Info:** New York: Carlton & Phillips, 1854.

**Nature of reference:** Contains a selection on Kant and Hamilton in relation to the antagonism between liberty and necessity.

**Title:** *Christ in History; or, The Central Power Among Men.*

**Author:** Turnbull, Robert, 1809-1877.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Phillips, Sampson, and company, 1854.

**Nature of reference:** Contains a footnote to Hamilton as an example of a modern philosopher.

**Title:** *The Principles of Metaphysical and Ethical Science Applied to the Evidences of Religion.*

**Author:** Bowen, Francis, 1811-1890.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Hickling, Swan and Brown, 1855.

**Nature of reference:** Bowen cites Hamilton as a source for his writings and uses quotes and Hamiltonian principle throughout the book.

**Title:** *The Ministry of the Word.*

**Author:** Taylor, William M. (William Mackergo), 1829-1895.

**Publication Info:** New York: A. D. F. Randolph & company, 1876.

**Nature of reference:** Contains a passing reference to Hamilton.

**Title:** *Ways of the Spirit, and Other Essays.*

**Author:** Hedge, Frederic Henry, 1805-1890.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Roberts, 1877.

**Nature of reference:** Quotes Hamilton on the notion of “ad infinitum” – an infinite non-commencement.

**Title:** *Contemporary Evolution: an Essay on Some Recent Social Changes.*

**Author:** Mivart, St. George Jackson, 1827-1900.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1876.

**Nature of reference:** Uses Hamilton as an example of a forward thinking philosopher.

**Title:** *Lectures on the evidences of Christianity in the nineteenth century: Delivered in the Mercer street church, New York, January 21 to February 21, 1867, on the "Ely foundation" of the Union theological seminary.*

**Author:** Barnes, Albert, 1798-1870.

**Publication Info:** New York: Harper & brothers, 1868.

**Nature of reference:** Makes reference to Mill, Kant and Hamilton as writers on mental philosophy.

**Title:** *Golden Sheaves Gathered from the Fields of Ancient and Modern Literature.*

**Author:** Cleveland, Horace A.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia, Pa., Cincinnati: Zeigler, McCurdy & co., Ohio; [etc., etc., 1869].

**Nature of reference:** Reference to a travel log that cites two girls in the Connecticut Valley as spending 3 hours a day in the study of Kant and Hamilton.

**Title:** *The Bible in the Public Schools: Arguments in the Case of John D. Minor et al. versus the Board of Education of the city of Cincinnati [et al.], Superior court of Cincinnati; with the opinions and decision of the court.*

**Author:** Minor, John D.

**Publication Info:** Cincinnati: R. Clarke, 1870.

**Nature of reference:** Judge Storer uses a quote from Sir William Hamilton in his ruling.

**Title:** *An Historical Sketch of Columbia College, in the city of New York, 1754-1876.*

**Author:** Columbia University.

**Publication Info:** [New York]: Printed for the College, 1876.

**Nature of reference:** States that the library features the works of Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** Addresses of the newly-appointed professors of Columbia College,

**Author:** Columbia University.

**Publication Info:** New York: By authority of the Trustees, 1858.

**Nature of reference:** In William Bett's address he uses Hamilton's definition of a liberal education to frame his own ideals on the subject.

**Title:** A Discourse: Delivered by Henry P. Tappan at Ann Arbor, Mich., on the occasion of his inauguration as chancellor of the University of Michigan, December 21, 1852.

**Author:** Tappan, Henry Philip, 1805-1881.

**Publication Info:** Detroit: Advertiser power presses, 1852.

**Nature of reference:** References Hamilton's views from *The Edinburgh Review* on the poor state of education in the English universities. In addition, makes use of Hamilton's account of German education from his review of Cousin.

**Title:** Addresses on the Occasion of the Inauguration of Rev. Charles Henry Fowler, D. D., as president of the Northwestern university, June 26, 1873:

**Author:** Northwestern University (Evanston, Ill.).

**Publication Info:** Chicago: R. R. McCabe & co., printers, 1874.

**Nature of reference:** Lists Sir William Hamilton amongst the great philosophers and as an example of the "culturing qualities of the classics."

**Title:** *The Life and Letters of James Henley Thornwell.*

**Author:** Palmer, B. M. (Benjamin Morgan), 1818-1902.

**Publication Info:** Richmond: Whittet & Shepperson, 1875.

**Nature of reference:** Hamilton is the active subject of many letters of Thorwell – especially to George Holmes. He was also in correspondence with Hamilton himself.

**Title:** Dedication and Inauguration of the Vanderbilt University:

**Author:** Vanderbilt University.

**Publication Info:** Nashville, Tenn.: Publishing house of the Methodist Episcopal church, South, 1875.

**Nature of reference:** The address by Charles Force Deems praises Hamilton highly for his contributions in logic.

**Title:** *The American Cyclopædia.*

**Publication Info:** New York [etc.]: D. Appleton and company, 1873-76.

**Nature of reference:** References to Sir William Hamilton appear in volumes I, II, II, V, VI, VIII, X, XIV, XV.

**Title:** *Proceedings.*

**Author:** National Baptist educational convention.

**Publication Info:** New York: [1870].

**Nature of reference:** A single reference to Hamilton on page 182

**Title:** *On the Genesis of Species.*

**Author:** Mivart, St. George Jackson, 1827-1900.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton, 1871.

**Nature of reference:** Quotes from Mill's Examination of Hamilton and cites Hamilton on knowing God. "Nature conceals God, and Man reveals Him."

**Title:** *What is Darwinism?*

**Author:** Hodge, Charles, 1797-1878.

**Publication Info:** New York: Scribner, Armstrong, and company, 1874.

**Nature of reference:** Refers to Hamilton and Mansel on Consciousness. States that Spencer makes abundant and approving use of Hamilton in his work.

**Title:** *Christian Believing and Living.*

**Author:** Huntington, F. D. (Frederic Dan), 1819-1904.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Nichols, and company, 1860.

**Nature of reference:** Footnote citation to Hamilton – general principle of human consciousness is unqualified.

**Title:** *The Church Polity of the Pilgrims.*

**Author:** Wellman, Joshua Wyman, 1821-1915.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Congregational board of publication, 1857.

**Nature of reference:** Quotes Hamilton – "a waking error is better than a sleeping truth."

**Title:** *The History of the Religious Movement of the Eighteenth Century, Called Methodism.*

**Author:** Stevens, Abel, 1815-1897.

**Publication Info:** New York, London: Carlton & Porter; A. Heylin, [1858-61].

**Nature of reference:** Footnote citation to Discussions on Philosophy.

**Title:** *A Compendious History of American Methodism.*

**Author:** Stevens, Abel, 1815-1897.

**Publication Info:** New York: Carlton & Porter, 1867 [i. e. 1868].

**Nature of reference:** Quotes Hamilton on Luther.

**Title:** *The Centenary of American Methodism.*

**Author:** Stevens, Abel, 1815-1897.

**Publication Info:** N.Y.: 1866.

**Nature of reference:** A quote from Hamilton – the same as found in A compendious history of American Methodism.

**Title:** *The Trial of the Rev. David Swing, Before the Presbytery of Chicago: edited by a committee of the Presbytery.*

**Author:** Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A. Presbytery of Chicago.

**Publication Info:** Chicago: Jansen, McClurg & co., 1874.

**Nature of reference:** Author shows how Hamilton's philosophy has been used by both Christians and atheists...a sword with two edges.

**Title:** *The Life of Joseph Addison Alexander.*

**Author:** Alexander, Henry Carrington, 1835-1894.

**Publication Info:** New York: C. Scribner, 1870.

**Nature of reference:** Subject was in possession of Hamilton's ideas. Hamilton is used as an example of a great instructor that motivated his pupils.

**Title:** *Appletons' Cyclopædia of American Biography.*

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1887-89.

**Nature of reference:** Over several volumes, various entries are shown to have connections to Sir William Hamilton: Francis Bowen, M'cosh, John Clark Murray, Robert Turnbull, Samuel Tyler, James Walker.

**Title:** *Hamilton Literary Magazine.*

**Publication Info:** Clinton, N.Y.: The Courier press; [etc., etc.], 186 -[1923].

**Nature of reference:** Publication of Hamilton College. Clark Prize's essay was on the philosophical contributions of Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *American Pedagogy. Education, the School, and the Teacher in American Literature.*

**Author:** Barnard, Henry, ed. 1811-1900.

**Publication Info:** Hartford: Brown & Gross, 1876.

**Nature of the Reference:** Cites Hamilton's negative views on the study of geometry as just logical drill as having a negative influence on American education. Also looks at Hamilton's opinions of the English universities.

**Title:** *True Student Life. Letters, Essays, and Thoughts on studies and Conduct; addressed to young persons by men eminent in literature and affairs.*

**Author:** Barnard, Henry, editor.

**Publication Info:** Hartford: American Journal of Education, 1873.

**Nature of the Reference:** Contains many quotes from Hamilton on the topic of education.

**Title:** *Miscellaneous Writings; addresses, Lectures, and Reviews.*

**Author:** Hoyt, Joseph Gibson, 1815-1862.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Crosby and Nichols, 1863.

**Nature of the Reference:** Hoyt quotes Hamilton and praises him in his inaugural address as Chancellor of Washington College...also states that Hamilton's lectures on Metaphysics are unintelligible.

**Title:** *Catalogue of the New York State Library. January 1, 1850.*

**Author:** New York State Library.

**Publication Info:** Albany: C. Van Benthuysen, printer, 1850.

**Nature of the Reference:** Lists Hamilton's edition of *Reid's Works* and Archibald Russell's *Account of eleven thousand Schools in New York: being a letter to Sir William Hamilton.*

**Title:** *A Catalogue of Books, In all Branches of Literature, Both Ancient & Modern.*

**Author:** Jeans, E., Norwich.

**Publication Info:** [Norwich]: 1860.

**Nature of the Reference:** Lists Mansel's edition of Hamilton's Lectures and Autograph note of Sir William Hamilton, from Huntfield House, Biggan, relative to his edition of Reid's Works.

**Title:** *A Critical Dictionary of English Literature, and British and American authors, Living and Deceased, from the Earliest Accounts to the Middle of the Nineteenth Century. Containing thirty thousand biographies and literary notices, with forty indexes of subjects.*

**Author:** Allibone, Samuel Austin, 1816-1889.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & co. [etc.], 1859-71.

**Nature of the Reference:** Overview of Hamilton's work with testimonials of eminent men of letters.

**Title:** *History of the city of New York: its Origin, Rise, and Progress.*

**Author:** Lamb, Martha J. (Martha Joanna), 1829-1893.

**Publication Info:** New York: A.S. Barnes Co., 1877-1896.

**Nature of the Reference:** Makes reference to Archibald Russell whose father was Hamilton's cousin.

**Title:** *History and Progress of Education, from the earliest times to the present.*

*Intended as a manual for teachers and students. With an Introduction by Henry Barnard.*

**Author:** Brockett, L. P. (Linus Pierpont), 1820-1893.

**Publication Info:** New York, and, Chicago: A.S. Barnes & company, [c1859].

**Nature of the Reference:** In reference to philosophy states, "from Aristotle to Sir William Hamilton" Hamilton as a bench-mark.

**Title:** *Essays: Moral, Political and Aesthetic.*

**Author:** Spencer, Herbert, 1820-1903.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1873

**Nature of the Reference:** This edition has a chapter on Mill versus Hamilton.

**Title:** *Miscellaneous Works of Henry C. Carey.*

**Author:** Carey, Henry Charles, 1793-1879.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: H. C. Baird, [1872?].

**Nature of the Reference:** Carey praises Hamilton – he stands alone in the ebb of Scottish Literature.

**Title:** *The New American Cyclopaedia: A Popular Dictionary of General Knowledge.*  
*Ed. by George Ripley and Charles A. Dana.*

**Publication Info:** New York [etc]: D. Appleton and company, 1859-1863.

**Nature of the Reference:** This series has entries for Sir William Hamilton in volumes VII, XV, XVI.

**Title:** *Chambers's Encyclopedia: A Dictionary of Universal Knowledge.*

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia, Edinburgh: J. B. Lippincott & co.; W. & R. Chambers, 1872-73.

**Nature of the Reference:** This collection has entries for Sir William Hamilton in volumes I, II, IV, V VII, IX, X.

**Title:** *The Globe Encyclopaedia of Universal Information. Edited by John M. Ross.*

**Publication Info:** Boston: Estes & Lauriat, 1876-79.

**Nature of the Reference:** Has entries for Sir William Hamilton in reference to many articles on men of letters and philosophy.

**Title:** *Johnson's New universal Cyclopaedia: a scientific and popular treasury of useful knowledge ... Editors-in-chief. Frederick A.P. Barnard ... [and] Arnold Guyot ... With numerous contributions from writers of distinguished eminence in every department of letters and science in the United States and in Europe.*

**Publication Info:** New York: A.J. Johnson & son; [etc., etc.], 1875-1878.

**Nature of the Reference:** References to Hamilton on logic. McCosh, Dugald Stewart, Tyler, perception, Robert Turnbull, Kant.

**Title:** *Zell's Popular Encyclopedia, a universal dictionary of English language, science, literature, and Art.*

**Author:** Colange, L.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: T. E. Zell, 1871.

**Nature of the Reference:** References to Hamilton on "metaphysics" and "object."

**Title:** *Chambers's Information for the People.*

**Author:** Ed. by William and Robert Chambers.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & co., 1867.

**Nature of the Reference:** Contains an article on Sir William Hamilton's logic.

**Title:** *A Manual of English Literature.*

**Author:** Arnold, Thomas, 1823-1900.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Ginn brothers, 1876.

**Nature of the Reference:** In looking at the main achievements in philosophy Sir William Hamilton is referenced

**Title:** *The Waverley Novels, by Sir Walter Scott, complete in 12 vol., printed from the latest English ed., embracing the author's last corrections, prefaces & notes.*

**Author:** Scott, Walter, Sir, 1771-1832.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: Lippincott, Grambo, 1855.

**Nature of the Reference:** Reference to the Hamiltons of Preston.

**Title:** *Tales and Sketches for the Fireside, by the best American authors. Selected from Putnam's magazine.*

**Publication Info:** N.Y.: A. Dowling, 1857.

**Nature of the Reference:** Quotes Hamilton on Dogma and lists him as new philosophy worth reading.

**Title:** *An Historical and Critical View of the Speculative Philosophy of Europe in the Nineteenth Century, By J. D. Morell, A. M. Complete in one volume. From the last London edition.*

**Author:** Morell, John Daniel, 1816-1891.

**Publication Info:** New York: R. Carter & Brothers, 1853.

**Nature of the Reference:** Makes reference to Hamilton on ideas and relative knowledge. It claims Hamilton must be included in histories of modern philosophy – even though he is a living author.

**Title:** *Mental Philosophy: Embracing the three departments of the intellect, sensibilities, and will. By Thomas C. Upham.*

**Author:** Upham, Thomas Cogswell, 1799-1872.

**Publication Info:** New York, : Harper & brothers, 1869.

**Nature of the Reference:** A philosophical reference to Hamilton's terminology.

**Title:** *Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind. By Dugald Stewart. Rev. and abridged, with critical and explanatory notes, for the use of colleges and schools. By Francis Bowen.*

**Author:** Stewart, Dugald, 1753-1828.

**Publication Info:** Boston, Cambridge: J. Munroe & co., 1859.

**Nature of the Reference:** An American edition of Stewarts work. It acknowledges Hamilton's edition and has footnote references to his commentary on Stewart.

**Title:** *A Treatise on Logic; or, The laws of pure thought; comprising both the Aristotelic and Hamiltonian analyses of logical forms, and some chapters of applied logic. By Francis Bowen.*

**Author:** Bowen, Francis, 1811-1890.

**Publication Info:** Cambridge [Mass.]: Sever and Francis, 1864.

**Nature of Reference:** In the preface Bowen acknowledges his debt to Hamilton. He states that Hamilton has done more for the science than anyone since Aristotle.

**Title:** *John Stuart Mill: His Life and Works. Twelve sketches by Herbert Spencer, Henry Fawcett, Frederic Harrison, and other distinguished authors.*

**Publication Info:** New York: Henry Holt and company, 1875.

**Nature of the Reference:** Multiple references to Mill's Examination of sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *Elements of Logic: Designed as a Manual of Instruction.*

**Author:** Coppée, Henry, 1821-1895.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: E. H. Butler & co., 1860.

**Nature of Reference:** Reference to Hamilton's logical notation and recognizes Hamilton along with DeMorgan as the founders of the New Analytic.

**Title:** *The Laws of Discursive Thought: Being a Textbook of formal Logic.*

**Author:** McCosh, James, 1811-1894.

**Publication Info:** New York: R. Carter & Brothers, 1873.

**Nature of Reference:** Acknowledgement in the preface of Hamilton's contributions as a reformer in the study of logic.

**Title:** *The Principles of Logic, for High Schools and Colleges.*

**Author:** Schuyler, Aaron, 1828-1913.

**Publication Info:** Cincinnati, New York: Van Antwerp, Bragg & co., [c1869].

**Nature of Reference:** A reference to Hamilton's ideas on predication.

**Title:** *Fundamental Philosophy. Tr. from the Spanish.*

**Author:** Brownson, Henry; Balmes, Jaime Luciano, 1810-1848.

**Publication Info:** New York, Boston [etc.]: D. & J. Sadlier & co., 1856.

**Nature of Reference:** Reid and Hamilton are the final word on perception.

**Title:** *The Intuitions of the Mind Inductively Investigated.*

**Author:** McCosh, James, 1811-1894.

**Publication Info:** New York: R. Carter and brothers, 1860.

**Nature of Reference:** Page 10, McCosh states, "acknowledge my obligations to the erudition, the unsurpassed logical power, the profound observations, of the late Sir William Hamilton."

**Title:** *Elements of Moral Philosophy: Analytical, Synthetical, and Practical.*

**Author:** Winslow, Hubbard, 1799-1864.

**Publication Info:** New York, London: D. Appleton and company, 1856.

**Nature of Reference:** "English and Scottish Philosophers – of whom Sir William Hamilton is perhaps at present the most able champion."

**Title:** *Lectures on moral Science: Delivered before the Lowell Institute, Boston.*

**Author:** Hopkins, Mark, 1802-1887.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon and company, [etc., etc.] 1863.

**Nature of Reference:** Recognition of Hamilton as a literary authority and mentions Hamilton's philosophical nomenclature and utilizes it.

**Title:** *Getting on in the World: or, Hints on Success in Life.*

**Author:** Mathews, William, 1818-1909.

**Publication Info:** Chicago: S. C. Griggs and company, 1874.

**Nature of Reference:** This book contains several references to Hamilton as a great man of letters – quotes Hamilton on Newton and the power of the mind.

**Title:** *The Philosophy of Natural Theology. An essay, in confutation of the skepticism of the present day, which obtained a prize at Oxford, Nov. 26th, 1872.*

**Author:** Jackson, William, 1817?-1891?

**Publication Info:** New York: A.D.F. Randolph & co., 1875.

**Nature of Reference:** Footnote to Hamilton on Locke's theory of personal identity.

**Title:** *A Treatise on Theism, and on the Modern Skeptical Theories.*

**Author:** Wharton, Francis, 1820-1889.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia, London: J. B. Lippincott & co.; Trübner & co., 1859.

**Nature of Reference:** Authoritative reference to Hamilton on relative knowledge.

**Title:** *The Mutual Relations of Natural Science and Theology. An oration pronounced before the Connecticut Beta of the Phi Beta Kappa society, in Christ church, Hartford, Conn., July 7th, 1868.*

**Author:** Rudder, William, b. 1820.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: H.B. Ashmead, 1869.

**Nature of Reference:** Rudder quotes Hamilton – "The highest reach of human science is the recognition of human ignorance."

**Title:** *History of Rationalism; embracing a survey of the present state of Protestant theology, by John Fletcher Hurst A. with appendix of literature.*

**Author:** Hurst, J. F. (John Fletcher), 1834-1903.

**Publication Info:** New York: Carlton & Porter, 1867.

**Nature of Reference:** Pierson is to Opzoomer as Mansel is to Hamilton.

**Title:** *The Duty and the Discipline of Extemporary Preaching.*

**Author:** Zincke, F. Barham (Foster Barham), 1817-1893.

**Publication Info:** New York: C. Scribner, 1867.

**Title:** *The Ingham lectures. A course of lectures on the evidences of natural and revealed religion. Delivered before the Ohio Wesleyan university, Delaware, Ohio.*

**Author:** [Williams, William George] ed. 1822-1902.

**Publication Info:** Cleveland, New York: Ingham, Clarke and company; Nelson & Phillips; [etc., etc.], 1873.

**Nature of Reference:** States that Hamilton has shown that teaching is the test of knowledge.

**Title:** *Aids to Faith; A Series of Theological Essays. By several writers. Being a reply to "Essays and reviews."*

**Author:** Ed. by Thomson, William, 1819-1890.

**Publication Info:** New York: D. Appleton and company, 1863.

**Nature of Reference:** Authoritative quote..."to use the words of Sir William Hamilton..."

**Title:** Discourses on Truth. Delivered in the chapel of the South Carolina College.

**Author:** Thornwell, James Henley, 1812-1862.

**Publication Info:** New York: R. Carter, 1855.

**Nature of Reference:** Quotes Hamilton on skepticism.

**Title:** *Modern Atheism Under its Forms of Pantheism, Materialism, Secularism, Development, and Natural Laws.*

**Author:** Buchanan, James, 1804-1870.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon, Blakeman & co.; [etc., etc.], 1857.

**Nature of Reference:** A footnote to Hamilton to mark the author's disagreement with him.

**Title:** *Essays on the Supernatural Origin of Christianity: with special reference to the theories of Renan, Strauss, and the Tübingen school.*

**Author:** Fisher, George Park, 1827-1909.

**Publication Info:** New York: C. Scribner & co., 1867.

**Nature of Reference:** Recognizes that much of the current talk in philosophy uses Hamilton's technical vocabulary; also references Hamilton on cause and effect.

**Title:** *Credo.*

**Author:** Townsend, Luther Tracy (1838-1922).

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Lee and Shepard; Lee, Shepard and Dillingham, 1872.

**Nature of Reference:** A quote from Hamilton on recollection.

**Title:** *The limits of Religious Thought Examined in Eight Lectures Delivered Before the University of Oxford, in the year MDCCCLVIII, on the Bampton foundation.*

**Author:** Mansel, Henry Longueville, 1820-1871.

**Publication Info:** Boston: Gould and Lincoln [etc., etc.], 1860.

**Nature of Reference:** Speaks to the relationship between Mansel and Hamilton – Mansel was Hamilton's student and apologist.

**Title:** *The True Path, or, The young man invited to the Savior. In a series of lectures.*

**Author:** Atkinson, Joseph Mayo, 1820-1891.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: Presbyterian board of publication, [1860].

**Nature of Reference:** A reference to Hamilton's Lectures on Metaphysics – on the topic of God and man – Man must be an end unto himself.

**Title:** *The Inspiration of the Scriptures.*

**Author:** Patton, Francis L. (Francis Landrey), 1843-1932.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: Presbyterian board of publication, [1869].

**Nature of Reference:** A reference to Hamilton on the duality of consciousness – and that Hamilton's work shows how philosophical questions of the day are connected to the fundamental doctrines of the Christian system.

**Title:** *The Early Years of Christianity.* Tr. by Annie Harwood ...

**Author:** Pressensé, Edmond de, 1824-1891.

**Publication Info:** New York: C. Scribner & co., 1870-71.

**Nature of Reference:** Advertisement for Cocker's Greek Philosophy and its Relation to Christianity. This book has a special reference to the theories of Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *The Testimony of the Rocks; or, Geology in its bearings on the two theologies, natural and revealed. By Hugh Miller ... with memorials of the death and character of the author.*

**Author:** Miller, Hugh, 1802-1856.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon and company; 1857.

**Nature of Reference:** An acknowledgment of the passing of Sir William Hamilton – the greatest living Scotsman and the prince of modern philosophy.

**Title:** *Voices of the Soul Answered in God.*

**Author:** Reid, John. Rev.

**Publication Info:** New York: R. Carter & brothers, 1865.

**Nature of Reference:** In regards to music this author cites Sir William Hamilton on hearing and cognition.

**Title:** *Watson's Theological Institutes Defended; the teachings of transcendental philosophy shown to be at variance with Scripture and matter of fact; and the Bible proved to be complete in itself, both in teaching and evidence.*

**Author:** Levington, John Rev.

**Publication Info:** Detroit, New York: T.K. Adams; Barnes & Burr, 1863.

**Nature of Reference:** Quotes Hamilton on perception and Mansel on intuition.

**Title:** *The method of the Divine Government, Physical and Moral.*

**Author:** McCosh, James, 1811-1894.

**Publication Info:** New York: R. Carter & brothers, 1851.

**Nature of Reference:** This author supports argumentation with footnote references to Hamilton's *Metaphysics*.

**Title:** *Immanuel; or, The life of Jesus Christ Our Lord, from His Incarnation to His ascension, with an introduction, by Richard S. Storrs, Jr., D. D.*

**Author:** Eddy, Zachary, 1815-1891.

**Publication Info:** Springfield, Mass.: W. J. Holland & co., 1871.

**Nature of Reference:** States that Hamilton was the most profound philosopher of the age.

**Title:** *The Crucible; or, Tests of a Regenerate state ... With an introduction by Rev. Edward N. Kirk.*

**Author:** Goodhue, J. A.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon and company; [etc. etc.], 1860.

**Nature of Reference:** A note to see Hamilton's work on consciousness for further detail on the matter.

**Title:** *Immortality of the Soul and Destiny of the Wicked: By the Rev. N. L. Rice ...*

**Author:** Rice, N. L. (Nathan Lewis), 1807-1877.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia.: Presbyterian board of publication, 1871.

**Nature of Reference:** Contains a lengthy quote by Hamilton on dreaming and recollection.

**Title:** *A Lecture on the Protestant Faith.*

**Author:** Olmstead, Dwight Hinckley, 1827?-1901.

**Publication Info:** New-York: 1874.

**Nature of Reference:** Olmstead quotes Hamilton on the nature of philosophical belief.

**Title:** *Discourses and Essays.*

**Author:** Shedd, William Greenough Thayer, 1820-1894.

**Publication Info:** Andover Mass.: W.F. Draper, 1870.

**Nature of Reference:** Advertisements in the front of the book for Hamilton's Lectures and a footnote to reference further information from the body of the text.

**Title:** *The life and Correspondence of Rev. William Sparrow, D.D.*

**Author:** Walker, Cornelius, 1819-1907.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. Hammond, 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** In an 1854 correspondence Sparrow states that Hamilton is a worthy read and that he was Great Britain's most learned scholar.

**Title:** *The Conservative Reformation and its Theology: as Represented in the Augsburg Confession, and in the history and literature of the Evangelical Lutheran church.*

**Author:** Krauth, Charles P. (Charles Porterfield), 1823-1883.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J.B. Lippincott & co., 1871.

**Nature of Reference:** Krauth states Hamilton has disgraced himself with his attack on Luther. Nonetheless, later he cites Hamilton on knowing God and consciousness.

**Title:** *The History of the Religious Movement of the Eighteenth Century, called Methodism.*

**Author:** Stevens, Abel, 1815-1897.

**Publication Info:** New York: Carlton & Porter, 1858-59.

**Nature of Reference:** Wesley's ideas are cross referenced to Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *History of the Methodist Episcopal church in the United States of America. By Abel Stevens.*

**Author:** Stevens, Abel, 1815-1897.

**Publication Info:** New York: Carlton & Porter, 1866-67.

**Nature of Reference:** Footnote reference to see Hamilton's Discussions for further information on the reformation.

**Title:** *Miscellaneous Essays and Reviews.*

**Author:** Barnes, Albert, 1798-1870.

**Publication Info:** Chicago, New York: S.C. Briggs & co.; Ivison & Phinney, 1855.

**Nature of Reference:** Author states he is using the terminology of Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *Annals of the persecution in Scotland from the restoration to the revolution. By James Aikman.*

**Author:** Aikman, James, 1779-1860.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: Presbyterian board of publication, [187-?].

**Nature of Reference:** A scathing view of Sir William Hamilton's character - "pious man of good intensions, but narrow of view and severe in his temper - obstinate and opinionative withal..."

**Title:** *Lectures on the History of the Church of Scotland, Delivered in Edinburgh in 1872.*

**Author:** Stanley, Arthur Penrhyn, 1815-1881.

**Publication Info:** New York: Scribner, Armstrong, and company, 1872.

**Nature of Reference:** American publication of Scottish lectures. This author claims eminent men like Sir William Hamilton supported the Church of Scotland.

**Title:** *Forty Years' Familiar Letters of James W. Alexander, D. D., constituting, with the notes, a memoir of his life. Edited by the surviving correspondent, John Hall.*

**Author:** Alexander, James W. (James Waddel), 1804-1859.

**Publication Info:** New York, London: C. Scribner; Sampson Low, son & company, 1860.

**Nature of Reference:** Makes reference to Sir William's philosophy of relative knowledge and references an article on Hamilton in the April 1859 edition of the "Repertory."

**Title:** *Orthodoxy: Its Truths and Errors.*

**Author:** Clarke, James Freeman, 1810-1888.

**Publication Info:** Boston: American Unitarian association, 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** This text has a chapter on the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *Universal Pronouncing Dictionary of Biography and Mythology.*

**Author:** Thomas, Joseph, 1811-1891.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & co., 1870.

**Nature of Reference:** Contains eleven entries for "Sir William Hamilton."

**Title:** *Religious Training of Children in the School, the Family, and the Church.*

**Author:** Beecher, Catharine E. (Catharine Esther), 1800-1878.

**Publication Info:** New York: Harper & brothers, 1864.

**Nature of Reference:** States Hamilton's work on mental philosophy is very abstruse and impractical.

**Title:** *History of Amherst College During its First Half Century. 1821-1871.*

**Author:** Tyler, W. S. (William Seymour), 1810-1897.

**Publication Info:** Springfield, Mass.: C. W. Bryan & Co., 1873.

**Nature of Reference:** Relates how Professor Haven taught Scottish Philosophy in his class and in particular the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton. (435)

**Title:** *The Corruption of Established Truth and Responsibility of Educated Men: An address before the alumni of the University of Michigan, June 27, 1856.*

**Author:** West, Nathaniel, 1826-1906.

**Publication Info:** Detroit: Free book press and job steam printing establishment, 1856.

**Nature of Reference:** Biblical truth has been corrupted by all metaphysical systems, "that of Sir William Hamilton, as far as it goes, not excepted."

**Title:** *Letter to the Honorable, the Board of Trustees of the University of Mississippi.*

**Author:** Barnard, Frederick A. P. (Frederick Augustus Porter), 1809-1889.

**Publication Info:** Oxford [Miss.]: University of Mississippi, 1858.

**Nature of Reference:** Quotes Hamilton's views on the English system of education.

**Title:** *Vassar College: A college for women, in Poughkeepsie, N. Y. A sketch of its foundation, aims, and resources, and of the development of its scheme of instruction to the present time.*

**Author:** [Raymond, John Howard] 1814-1878.

**Publication Info:** New York: S. W. Green, printer, 1873.

**Nature of Reference:** States, "For the sake of definiteness and precision, the Scottish school is selected for special study in both intellectual and moral philosophy." Hamilton's full works are "in the hands of the students." "Sir William Hamilton's psychological system is studied in detail..."(66)

**Title:** *Modern Scientific Investigation: Its methods and Tendencies. An address delivered before the American association for the advancement of science, August, 1867. By Prof. J.S. Newberry ... president ... Reprinted from the ninth number of the American naturalist.*

**Author:** Newberry, J. S. (John Strong), 1822-1892.

**Publication Info:** Salem, Mass.: Essex institute press, 1870.

**Nature of Reference:** Claims that Hamilton has demonstrated the inadequacies of mathematical processes as a guide to the mind.

**Title:** *Principles of Zoology: Touching the structure, development, distribution, and natural arrangement of the races of animals, living and extinct ... Pt. I. Comparative physiology. For the use of schools and colleges.*

**Author:** Agassiz, Louis, 1807-1873.

**Publication Info:** Boston, New York: Gould and Lincoln; Sheldon and company; [etc., etc.], 1860.

**Nature of Reference:** Hamilton is listed as suggested reading and there is an advertisement for his "Lectures."

**Title:** *The Depths of the Sea. An account of the general results of the dredging cruises of H. M. SS. 'Porcupine' and 'Lighting' during the summers of 1868, 1869, and 1870, under the scientific direction of Dr. Carpenter, F. R. S., J. Gwyn Jeffreys, F. R. S., and Dr. Wyville Thomson, F. R. S. By C. Wyville Thomson.*

**Author:** Thomson, C. Wyville Sir, (Charles Wyville), 1830-1882.

**Publication Info:** New York and, London: Macmillan and co., 1873.

**Nature of Reference:** Contains a "scientific catalog" which lists Masson's book "Recent British Philosophy" that explores Hamilton's philosophy and James McCosh's comments on Mill and Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *Primeval Man: An Examination of Some Recent Speculations, by the Duke of Argyll.*

**Author:** Argyll, George Douglas Campbell, Duke of, 1823-1900.

**Publication Info:** New York: G. Routledge & sons, 1874.

**Nature of Reference:** Advertisement for Mansel's "Philosophy of the Conditioned" with remarks on the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *Homoeopathy Fairly Represented. A reply to Professor Simpson's "Homoeopathy" Misrepresented.*

**Author:** Henderson, William, 1810-1872.

**Publication Info:** Philadelphia: Lindsay & Blakiston, 1854.

**Nature of Reference:** Supporting arguments against homoeopathy with quotes from Sir William Hamilton.

**Title:** *A Record of the Surgical Clinics of Wm. Tod Helmuth, M.D.: Held at the N.Y. Homoeopathic Medical College during the session of 1874-'75; to which is added a synopsis of the clinics of 1873-'74.*

**Author:** Stephens, Philetus J.

**Publication Info:** New York, 1875.

**Nature of Reference:** Tries to support Homoeopathy with reference to Hamilton's claim, "On earth there is nothing great but man, in man there is nothing great but mind."

**Title:** *The Mind: The Annual Address Delivered Before the Homoeopathic Medical Society of Pennsylvania, October 15th, 1875, at Library Hall.*

**Author:** McClelland, J. H. (James Henderson), 1845-1913.

**Publication Info:** Pittsburgh, 1876.

**Nature of Reference:** Utilizes quotes from Hamilton on Consciousness.

## **Sir William Hamilton in American Journals**

### **Biographical Material**

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0011 Issue 65 (March 1863) / Volume 11, Issue: 65, March 1863, pp. 273-288.

**Title:** Christopher North.

**Nature of reference:** This article tells how John Wilson beat Hamilton for the philosophy post at the University of Edinburgh – in good part because of Hamilton's Whigish politics. (284)

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0058 Issue 348 (October 1886) / Volume 58, Issue: 348, October 1886, pp. 456-462.

**Title:** A Literary Athlete by Hayward, Edward F.

**Nature of reference:** An article on John Wilson that mentions Hamilton both as an influence on Wilson as well as the one who, based on merit, should have won the professorship instead of Wilson. (461)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0008 Issue 47 (April 1854) / Volume 8, Issue: 47, April 1854, pp. 674-679.

**Title:** Christopher North.

**Nature of reference:** This article gives a passing quote from Hamilton's lectures at the University of Edinburgh about Wilson's ability to do metaphysics– "not the least wondrous of his wondrous powers." (678)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0009 Issue 110 (June 20, 1846) / Volume 9, Issue: 110, June 20, 1846, pp. 585-593.

**Title:** Thomas Carlyle.

This article includes a story of Sir William Hamilton sitting down to read Carlyle's *History of the French Revolution*. Hamilton started at three o'clock in the afternoon and was so enthralled he read for thirteen hours straight putting the book down finally at four in the morning.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0076 Issue 971 (January 10, 1863) / Volume 76, Issue: 971, January 10, 1863, pp. 49-96.

**Title:** Wilson.

**Nature of reference:** A serialized cut from the book 'Memoir of Wilson' written by Wilson's daughter Mrs. Gordon. The book was published in 1862 in Edinburgh. This portion of Wilson's biography connects Wilson and Hamilton as friends and even co-authors of an article.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0081 Issue 1035 (Apr 2, 1864) / Volume 81, Issue: 1035, Apr 2, 1864, pp. 1-48.

**Title:** Thackeray.

**Nature of reference:** This article is a reprint from the North British Review looking at the literary career of Mr. Thackeray. He was the renowned writer for *Vanity Fair* and other leading publications of the time. Hamilton is mentioned in a story about an effort to buy an ink well for Mr. Thackeray in which many literary types donated money, "Lord Jeffrey and Sir William Hamilton, who gave their half-crowns with the heartiest goodwill." (10)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0083 Issue 1061 (Oct 1, 1864) / Volume 83, Issue: 1061, Oct 1, 1864, pp. 1-48.

**Title:** Professor Ferrier.

**Nature of reference:** A short obituary of Professor Ferrier. In regards to Ferrier's last work Hamilton is referenced, "with much of the gayety of Professor Wilson, he combined a great deal of the philosophic learning of Sir William Hamilton. He died after a severe though not long illness, on the 11th of June." (47)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0087 Issue 1117 (October 28, 1865) / Volume 87, Issue: 1117, October 28, 1865, pp. 145-192

**Title:** Isaac Taylor

**Nature of reference:** Isaac Taylor was one of the contestants running for the chair of Logic at the University of Edinburgh. In retrospect of Taylor's death the author poses the question: "what effect would have been produced on Scotland and the world, by Isaac Taylor in place of Sir William Hamilton in the chair of Logic." (185).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0101 Issue 1296 (April 3, 1869) / Volume 101, Issue: 1296, April 3, 1869, pp. i-viii.

**Title:** Veitch's Life of Sir William Hamilton.

Serialized version of Veitch's short biography of Hamilton – part 1.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0102 Issue 1311 (July 17, 1869) / Volume 102, Issue: 1311, July 17, 1869, pp. 129-192.

**Title:** Veitch's Life of Sir William Hamilton.

**Nature of reference:** Serialized version of Veitch's short biography of Hamilton – part 2.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0103 Issue 1333 (December 18, 1869) / Volume 103, Issue: 1333, December 18, 1869, pp. 705-768.

**Title:** The Life of Sir William Hamilton.

**Nature of reference:** Another overview of Hamilton's life. This account highlights aspects of Hamilton's physicality and even experimentation with narcotics.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0107 Issue 1386 (December 24, 1870) / Volume 107, Issue: 1386, December 24, 1870, pp. 769-838.

**Title:** Lord Palmerston.

**Nature of reference:** Palmerston was a student of Dugald Stewart: "His lectures were to great measure extemporized; and when Sir William Hamilton undertook to publish them, the notes which proved most useful were those taken by Lord Palmerston." (774)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0158 Issue 2043 (August 18, 1883) / Volume 158, Issue: 2043, August 18, 1883, pp. 385-448.

**Title:** Half a Century of Literary Life (from the London Quarterly Review).

**Nature of reference:** This article claims that metaphysics had not advanced much in a half century (2<sup>nd</sup> half of the 19<sup>th</sup>) and could be divided into 2 categories. “The chief publications have been, on the one hand, the lectures of Sir William Hamilton, carefully edited by Mansell and Veitch, and, on the other, the various works of the acute but limited John Stuart Mill.” (401)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0155 Issue 1999 (October 14, 1882) / Volume 155, Issue: 1999, October 14, 1882, pp. 65-128.

**Title:** The Heros of “Noctes” from *Blackwoods Magazine*.

**Nature of reference:** In reference to Hogg and the Chaldee manuscript: “The rough draft came from his pen, and we cannot speak with certainty as to how it was subsequently manipulated. But there is every reason to believe that Wilson and Lockhart, probably assisted by Sir William Hamilton, went to work upon it, and so altered it that Hogg’s original offspring was changed out of all knowledge.” (77)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0164 Issue 2115 (January 3, 1885) / Volume 164, Issue: 2124, January 3, 1885, pp. 593.

**Title:** Veitch’s Memoir of Sir William Hamilton.

**Nature of reference:** A reprint of Veitch’s Memoir of Sir William Hamilton from *The Edinburgh Review*.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0170 Issue 2200 (August 21, 1886) / Volume 170, Issue: 2200, August 21, 1886, pp. 449-512.

**Title:** Christopher North (from *Macmillan’s Magazine*).

**Nature of reference:** A reprint of the Memoirs of John Wilson, which includes passing references to Hamilton.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0173 Issue 2237 (May 7, 1887) / Volume 173, Issue: 2237, May 7, 1887, pp. 321-384.

**Title:** An Evening with Carlyle (from *Fortnightly Review*).

**Nature of reference:** “Mr. Carlyle came over and joined me. He inquired in the kindest manner after Sir William Hamilton, whose assistant I then was. He gave me some interesting recollections of his intercourse with Sir William during the time he lived in Edinburgh, recalling the finished courtesy and dignity of his manner, his wide reading and solid erudition. He mentioned that in those days Sir William lived in rooms in a back street near the Register House, and added that, whenever he passed his windows at night, however late, his light was always burning, and that he believed he regularly spent the greater part of every night amongst his books.” (383)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0184 Issue 2380 (February 8, 1890) / Volume 184, Issue: 2380, February 8, 1890, pp. 321-384.

**Title:** Personal Recollections of Thomas Carlyle.

**Nature of reference:** “Lord Neaves was there one of the most pleasant personages I had ever met. He was charged with his own bright ditties, which he sang with infective animation. Some time previously John Stuart Mill had written his Examination of the Philosophy of Sir William Hamilton, wherein he had reduced the external world to a series of possibilities of sensation. Lord Neaves had thrown this theory into lyric rhyme. The refrain of his song was Stuart Mill on Mind and Matter. The whole table joined in the refrain, Carlyle, with voice-accompaniment, swaying his knife to and fro, like the baton of a conductor.” (330)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0207 Issue 2683 (December 7, 1895) / Volume 207, Issue: 2683, December 7, 1895, pp. 577-640.

**Title:** Professor Blackie (from *Blackwood's Magazine*).

**Nature of reference:** “Blackie’s high spirits, genial humor, and manifold accomplishments, made him a favored guest. Sir William Hamilton and Professor Wilson and the first William Blackwood were among the hosts at whose table he was welcomed” (617). “John Blackie and Eliza Wyld were happily united in Edinburgh on 19th April, 1842, among the notables present being Sir William Hamilton...” (619)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0208 Issue 2699 (Mar 28, 1896) / Volume 208, Issue: 2699, Mar 28, 1896, pp. 769-832

**Title:**

**Nature of reference:** “Yet Blackie did not take up the work unwarned. Miss Stoddart tells us that Sir William Hamilton, Professor Wilson, and the poet Delta took helpful interest in the work, and Blackie had the advantage of revising his translation and comparing it with those of his predecessors.” (776)

“Mr. Bannerman was an old friend of the Blackie family, and had kept up correspondence with John Stuart Blackie during all the devious career of that talented young man. He took up Blackie as his candidate, and as splendid testimonials were forthcoming from Sir William Hamilton, Professor Gerhard, and many other men of weight, Blackie was appointed as Regius professor of humanity at Marishal College in May, 1839.” (778)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0041 Issue 526 (June 17, 1854) / Volume 41, Issue: 526, June 17, 1854, pp. 529-576B.

**Title:** Professor Wilson – Christopher North.

**Nature of reference:** Who that ever heard it, can have forgotten his magnificent description of the *Stoic of the Woods* a passage which made even Sir William Hamilton, cool and unimpassioned as he was, start to his feet?

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0017 Issue 68 (November 1859) / Volume 17, Issue: 68, November 1859, pp. 1091-1093.

**Title:** Notices of Books: Hamilton. Life of James Wilson.

**Nature of reference:** “You would see that my brother John had resigned his chair. We all thought it the safest course, as intellectual labor fatigued him, and retarded his recovery. Now that he has nothing to do but take care of himself, I hope he will mend. He has the advantage of being with my brother Robert at Woodburn, a fine, large, airy

dwelling near Dalkeith, and walks about a good deal every day. My nephew, (James Ferrier, the late professor's son-in-law) who has for several years filled with great acceptance the Moral Philosophy chair in St Andrews, is a candidate for the vacant chair in Edinburgh. Dr. McCosh of Belfast, the author of a very excellent book of a more spiritual kind than is usual in metaphysics, is also a candidate. I cannot but wish him well, as I am sure he would do justice to the chair; but blood is thicker than water, and as my nephew is regarded by Sir William Hamilton, and other leaders in mental philosophy, as one of the most distinguished metaphysicians produced in these days, I don't think we shall be taking the wrong sow by the ear in doing what we can to serve him."(1093)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0096 Issue 198 (January 1863) / Volume 96, Issue: 198, January 1863, pp. 220-239.

**Title:** Professor Wilson.

**Nature of reference:** This article draws from *Christopher North. A Memoir of John Wilson, late Professor of Moral Philosophy in the University of Edinburgh*. Compiled from Family Papers and other Sources, by his Daughter, Mrs. Gordon. Edinburgh: Edmonston and Douglas. And from *The Works of professor Wilson*, of the University of Edinburgh. Edited by his Son-in-Law, Professor Ferrier. Edinburgh and London: William Blackwood and Sons.

"He had, moreover, great keenness of intellect, and his mind was stored with vast treasures of information on nearly every subject. His logical powers were not of a high order, and if political considerations had not been permitted to turn the scale, he never could have been a successful competitor with Sir William Hamilton for the chair of Moral Philosophy, which had been filled by such men as Dugald Stewart and Dr. Thomas Brown." (237)

**Publication Info:** Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science and Art Volume 0005 Issue 28 (April 1855) / Volume 5, Issue: 28, April 1855, pp. 439-444.

**Title:** Editorial Notes: Editorial Notes.

**Nature of reference:** "Who has read a fraction of what is already printed, and worth reading? Not the enormously omnivorous bookworm *Magliabecehi*; not the athletic scholarly strength of Sir William Hamilton; not the indefatigable explorer Thomas De Quincey." (442)

"Christopher North was one of the best wrestlers, boxers, runners and leapers in Great Britain. William Cobbett was as strong as a bull. Wordsworth was as good a walker as any man in England. Sir William Hamilton has been a man of most remarkable physical strength. Walter Scott was an uncommonly vigorous walker and rider." (443)

**Publication Info:** Scribner's Magazine Volume 0005 Issue 4 (April, 1889) / Volume 5, Issue: 4, April, 1889, pp. 453-476.

**Title:** A Second Shelf of Old Books - Edinburgh by Fields, James T., Mrs.

**Nature of reference:** This article is a reflection on books given to the author's family by Dr. Brown of Edinburgh.

"Sir William Hamilton said that Culverwel did not deserve the oblivion into which he had fallen." (460) There is also a comment on Hamilton as a thinker as well as an athletic person.

**Publication Info:** Scientific American Volume 0011 Issue 38 (May 31, 1856) / Volume 11, Issue: 38, May 31, 1856, pp. 297-304.

**Title:** Scientific American. / Volume 11, Issue 38.

**Nature of reference:** A Great Philosopher Dead. Sir William Hamilton died at Edinburgh on the 6th inst. He was generally considered the most profound philosopher in Europe. His reach of thought was vast, and his learning deep and extensive.

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0033 Issue 127 (April 1874) / Volume 33, Issue: 127, April 1874, pp. 414-416.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: On Self-Culture, Intellectual, Physical, and Moral. John Stuart Blackie.

**Nature of reference:** Quoting from McCosh: "Some years after this, Sir William Hamilton one day said to me quietly, Your friend, Dr. Guthrie, is the best preacher I ever heard. I answered, I did not wonder at the opinion, but I was surprised to hear it expressed by so great a logician of one not specially possessed of large logical power. He replied with great emphasis, Sir, he has the best of all logic; there is but one step between his premise and conclusion. I am not sure that the great Edinburgh metaphysician ever uttered a profounder saying than this." (415)

### **Announcements, Book Reviews**

**Publication Info:** The American Whig Review Volume 0005 Issue 6 (Jun 1847) / Volume 5, Issue: 6, Jun 1847, pp. 648-654.

**Nature of reference:** This periodical announces that Hamilton has published an edition of the Works of Thomas Reid. (649)

**Publication Info:** The American Whig Review Volume 0009 Issue 14 (Feb 1849) / Volume 9, Issue: 14, Feb 1849, pp. 148-173.

**Title:** Whipple's Reviews.

**Nature of reference:** Whipple writes a review / overview of Hamilton. This review is not in terms of philosophical content but rather on the depth and breadth of Hamilton's scholarship. Whipple does mention that "Hamilton's ideas have attracted but little attention on this side of the Atlantic; from the fact that they deal with subjects somewhat removed from popular taste and apprehension." (162)

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0003 Issue 20 (June 1859) / Volume 3, Issue: 20, June 1859, pp. 777-779.

**Title:** Bibliographical Guide to American Literature.

**Nature of reference:** An announcement of the American publication of Hamilton's Lectures on Metaphysics and Logic.

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0004 Issue 22 (August 1859) / Volume 4, Issue: 22, August 1859, pp. 267-A001.

List of books: mention of Hamilton's contribution to an appendix to the work of Thomas Carlyle. (268)

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0016 Issue 98 (December 1865) / Volume 16, Issue: 98, December 1865, pp. 762-763.

**Title:** Review – Mill's Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy.

**Nature of reference:** The unnamed author of this review was not one of Mill's admirers yet he had this to say about Mill's book: "His handling of Sir William is tolerably unflinching, when he settles to his work: and he will carry the sympathy of most readers in his criticisms, whatever they may think of his own particular views."

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0047 Issue 283 (May 1881) / Volume 47, Issue: 283, May 1881, pp. 734-736.

**Title:** Books of the Month.

**Nature of reference:** This article mentions several books on the topic of philosophy and religion including W.H.S. Monck's book on Hamilton - one in a series on British philosophy.

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0070 Issue 418 (August 1892) / Volume 70, Issue: 418, August 1892, pp. 279-283.

Comment on New Books.

**Nature of reference:** A review of Dr. Sneath's book *Modern Philosophers* Vol 1. Sneath's work points out Reid's relation to Dugald Stewart and Sir William Hamilton. The reviewer states the importance of this book in light of "the prominence of the Scotch school in academic philosophical studies in the middle of this century, under the guidance of Hopkins, Porter and McCosh, whose influence was communicated to the large number of Western colleges which sprang from the loins of New England." (282)

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0076 Issue 455 (September 1895) / Volume 76, Issue: 455, September 1895, pp. 397-414.

**Title:** Books Reviewed: Ernest Hartley Coleridge: Letters of Samuel Taylor Coleridge

**Nature of reference:** This reviewer quotes Hamilton where he calls Coleridge a literary pirate. In return the reviewer frames Hamilton as one, "who for a brief moment posed as some sort of oracle, on the ground of his supposed learning" (411)

**Publication Info:** The Galaxy Volume 0008 Issue 3 (Sept 1869) / Volume 8, Issue: 3, Sept 1869, pp. 427-435.

**Title:** Art and Literature.

**Nature of reference:** A review of new books. In discussing Bain's book *Mental Science* the reviewer claims Hamilton's work has stood the test of time. Forty years after Hamilton's work appeared in *The Edinburgh Review* it was still relevant. "No one did more to effect the change in the public appreciation of philosophy than Sir William Hamilton. He probably did not anticipate the interest that gathered around his own speculations, still less that by this time there would be a marked reaction in favor of a philosophy which requires some ingenuity of definition to save it from the reproach of materialism." (430)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0008 Issue 46 (March 1854) / Volume 8, Issue: 46, March 1854, pp. 570-573.

**Title:** Literary Notices.

**Nature of reference:** Notice of De Quincey's book *Essays on Philosophical Writers and Other Men of Letters* that covers Kant and Sir William Hamilton among others. (570)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0009 Issue 53 (October 1854) / Volume 9, Issue: 53, October 1854, pp. 709-714.

**Title:** Literary Notices.

**Nature of reference:** A harsh review of a translation of Comte's *Positive Philosophy* by Miss. Martineau that appeared in the North American Review which includes a comment that Hamilton has given a thorough and agnostic account of that philosophy. (711)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0014 Issue 83 (April 1857) / Volume 14, Issue: 83, April 1857, pp. 694-696.

**Title:** Literary Notices: Literary Notices.

**Nature of reference:** A review of *The Science of Logic* by Aha Mahan states: "In this view he (Mahan) is sustained by the eminent authority of Kant and Sir William Hamilton." (695)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0021 Issue 125 (October 1860) / Volume 21, Issue: 125, October 1860, pp. 695-697.

**Title:** Literary Notices: Literary Notices.

**Nature of reference:** A short announcement of Mansel's Logic book *Prolegomena Logica* - "Professor Mansel has evidently made a diligent, if not a profound, study of Kant, Cousin, and Sir William Hamilton, on whose writings he offers numerous suggestive comments." (696)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0063 Issue 374 (July 1881) / Volume 63, Issue: 374, July 1881, pp. 309-316.

**Title:** Editor's Literary Record: Editor's Literary Record.

**Nature of reference:** A literary overview of some of the book series being published in America. These different collections address various disciplines, condensing the ideas and providing the reader with a biographical sketch. Sir William Hamilton is the subject of one of these books in the series entitled 'English Philosophers.'

**Publication Info:** The International Magazine of Literature, Art, and Science Volume 0004 Issue 2 (September 1851) / Volume 4, Issue: 2, September 1851, pp. 268-279.

**Title:** Authors and Books.

**Nature of reference:** A simple announcement – Sir William Hamilton has recently published a book, *Critical Discussions in Philosophy, Literature, and Education with University Reform*.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0040 Issue 508 (February 11, 1854) / Volume 40, Issue: 508, February 11, 1854, pp. 289-336B.

**Title:** New Books.

**Nature of reference:** Announcing De Quincey's new book *Essays on Philosophical Writers and Other Men of Letters*, in two volumes. Ticknor, Reed & Field: Boston. Contents: Sir William Hamilton; Sir James Mackintosh; Kant; Herder; Richter; Lessing; Bentley; Parr.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0049 Issue 628 (June 7, 1856) / Volume 49, Issue: 628, June 7, 1856, pp. 577-640

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0057 Issue 732 (June 5, 1858) / Volume 57, Issue: 732, June 5, 1858, pp. 721-800.

**Title:** Dugald Stewart.

**Nature of reference:** Works cited for the article: The Collected Works of Dugald Stewart, Esq., F.R.S.S., ~c. Edited by Sir William Hamilton, Bart., Advocate, A. M. (Oxon ),& c. & c. Vol. X. Edinburgh: Constable. Biographical Memoirs of Adam Smith, LL.D.; William Robertson, D.D.; Thomas Reid, D.D. Edited by Sir William Hamilton, Bart. to which is prefixed a Memoir of Dugald Stewart, with Selections from ...

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0096 Issue 1233 (Jan 18, 1868) / Volume 96, Issue: 1233, Jan 18, 1868, pp. 129-192.

**Title:** Mr. Lowe on Education by Robert Lowe MP.

**Nature of reference:** In Lowe's address he argues for an inductive approach to reasoning rather than a deductive one. To support his position he cites Hamilton. "But this is wholly excluded from mathematics, which deal purely with necessary truth. Therefore, it has often been observed, and by no one more forcibly than your own Sir William Hamilton, that a mind formed upon this kind of study is apt to oscillate between the extreme of credulity and skepticism, and is little trained to take those sensible and practical views of the probabilities and possibilities affecting our daily life, upon which far more than abstract reasoning, the happiness of mankind depends." (132)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0077 Issue 161 (October 1853) / Volume 77, Issue: 161, October 1853, pp. 533-535.

**Title:** Critical Notices: New Publications Received.

**Nature of reference:** Announcement of an American edition of Hamilton's philosophy. *Philosophy of Sir William Hamilton, Bart., Professor of Logic and Metaphysics in Edinburgh University*. Arranged and Edited by O. W. Wight. For the use of Schools and Colleges. New York: D. Appleton & Co. 1853. Svo. pp. 530.

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0078 Issue 162 (January 1854) / Volume 78, Issue: 162, January 1854, pp. 261-264.

**Title:** New Publications Received.

**Nature of reference:** "Discussions on Philosophy and Literature, Education and University Reform. Chiefly from *The Edinburgh Review*: corrected, vindicated, enlarged, in Notes and Appendices. By Sir William Hamilton, Bart. With an Introductory Essay, by Robert Turnbull, D.D. New York: Harper & Brothers. 1853. Svo. pp. 764" (263).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0089 Issue 184 (July 1859) / Volume 89, Issue: 184, July 1859, pp. 281-288.

**Title:** New Publications Received.

**Nature of reference:** Lectures on Metaphysics and Logic, by Sir William Hamilton, Bart. Edited by the Rev. Henry L. Mansel, B. D., Oxford, and John Veitch, M.A., Edinburgh. In Two Volumes. Vol. 1. Metaphysics. Boston: Gould & Lincoln. 1859. 8vo. pp. 718.

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0092 Issue 190 (January 1861) / Volume 92, Issue: 190, January 1861, pp. 56-88.

**Title:** Sir William Hamilton's Metaphysics.

**Nature of reference:** "We rejoice in the republication of this volume so promptly in this country, and are glad to know that it has already been introduced as a textbook into many of our highest institutions. We trust that Hamilton will be thoroughly studied by all our thinking and professional men, and especially by those whose province it is to mould and guide the thoughts of others." (112)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0099 Issue 205 (October 1864) / Volume 99, Issue: 205, October 1864, pp. 592-605.

**Title:** Critical Notices: Francis Bowen's Treatise on Logic.

A review of *A Treatise on Logic, or the Laws of Pure Thought; comprising both the Aristotelic and Hamiltonian Analyses of Logical Forms, and some Chapters of Applied Logic*. By FRANCIS BOWEN, Alford Professor of Moral Philosophy in Harvard College. Cambridge: Sever and Francis. 1864. pp. xv., 450.

**Nature of reference:** "To secure the excellences of these Lectures, as well as of other modern treatises, and at the same time to present their materials in a more systematic form, and within a compass convenient for a textbook, appears to have been the aim of Professor Bowen in the preparation of his treatise. In performing this important service to the study of Logic, Professor Bowen has gone over the ground of the science as it now exists in the best modern treatises. In what is by far the most important and original feature of his book, the parallel presentations of the old and new analyses of the logical elements and forms, under each of the several divisions of the subject, our author exhibits the fruits of a diligent and careful study, and we owe him much for the lucid expositions he has given of this part of the science." (593)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0103 Issue 213 (October 1866) / Volume 103, Issue: 213, October 1866, pp. 634-637.

**Title:** List of Some Recent Publications.

**Nature of reference:** This list includes 13. Recent British Philosophy: a Review, with Criticisms; including some Comments on Mr. Mill's Answer to Sir William Hamilton. By David Masson. New York: D. Appleton & Co. 1866. 16 mo. pp. 335. Masson's book criticizes Mill for being too aggressive towards Hamilton while recognizing that many of the criticisms have merit. Masson feels Spenser has a more balanced approach to posthumous criticisms of Hamilton.

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0141 Issue 346 (September 1885) / Volume 141, Issue: 346, September 1885, pp. 251-267.

**Title:** The Great Physical Opportunity by Phelps, Elizabeth Stuart.

**Nature of reference:** "That was a timely incident recalled by one of the distinguished investigators in London, and attributed to Sir William Hamilton and Airey. It was Airey who, Sir William having alluded to some important mathematical fact answered: No, it cannot be. The great philosopher gently observed: I have been investigating it closely for the last five months, and cannot doubt its truth. But, said Airey, I've been at it for the last five minutes, and cannot see it at all!" (263)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0010 Issue 40 (November 1852) / Volume 10, Issue: 40, November 1852, pp. 660-661.

**Title:** Literary Notices: Cousin's Course of the History of Modern Philosophy.

**Nature of reference:** "The reader may not agree with Cousin; indeed, we think Sir William Hamilton has shaken the foundations of his system, in the objections which he advanced against his doctrine of the Absolute, in *The Edinburgh Review* for 1829; yet, he can nowhere get a more distinct view of the different systems of philosophy, especially of the German school of Rationalism, and the school of Locke, and he will be deeply interested in every page." (661)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0011 Issue 44 (November 1853) / Volume 11, Issue: 44, November 1853, pp. 606-642.

**Title:** Literary Notices: Literary Notices: Discussions on Philosophy and Literature, Education and University Reform.

**Nature of reference:** Discussions on Philosophy and Literature, Education and University Reform. Chiefly from *The Edinburgh Review*: corrected, vindicated, enlarged, in Notes and Appendices. By Sir William Hamilton, Bart. With an Introductory Essay by Robert Turnbull, ID. D. New York: Harper & Brothers, Publishers. 1853. pp. 764. We have placed these volumes together, though published by different houses, because they contain in part the same matter; and the reader will like to know how far they are the same. Sir William Hamilton's first publication in Metaphysics was a Review of Cousin's Cours de Philosophie, with especial reference to that philosopher's doctrine of the Infinite-Absolute, published in *The Edinburgh Review* in 1829; his next, a Review of Jonifroy's edition of Reid's Works, with reference to Brown's doctrine of Perception, published in the same Review, in 1830. We find no other publication on Metaphysical subjects until 1839, when an article appeared 1853. Literary Notices. 643 in the same Review on Idealism, with reference to the scheme of Arthur Collier. In 1846, Hamilton published an edition of Reid's Works, with numerous footnotes and several important dissertations. The printing however began as early as 1838 and the notes and dissertations were prepared at different times in the interval between 1838 and the date of publication. The edition, however, is still incomplete; indeed, it ends with a half-finished sentence in the dissertation on The Theory of Mental Reproduction, and, unless the author should do it, we know not who will be bold enough to finish the half told tale. In 1852, Hamilton published a collection of his writings in which, in philosophy, he has included only the articles from *The Edinburgh Review*, above mentioned, although he has added in an Appendix dissertations on the Conditions of the Thinkable, and on Learned Ignorance.

Appleton's edition contains all the notes and dissertations in Reid, and the reviews and the two appendices above mentioned which later, however, make up only about one fourth part of the volume. It contains only his Metaphysical writings. Harper's edition is a reprint of the Collected Works of Hamilton, as prepared by himself. It does not contain the Notes and Dissertations in Reid. The two editions, therefore, have only about one hundred pages in common. Hamilton has been the great name in English philosophy for about a quarter of a century, and it is quite amusing to observe what a large number of writers have suddenly awoke to a consciousness of his merit. We notice that Mr. Wibht speaks of Hamilton's defense of Reid's doctrine against Sir Thomas Brown as an oversight for Dr. Thomas Brown. We also correct a remarkable misprint on page 174, in the sentence, the words conception, concept, notion should not be limited to the thought of what cannot be represented in the Imagination, as the thought suggested by the general term. Reid should be limited." (642-3)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0013 Issue 49 (February 1855) / Volume 13, Issue: 49, February 1855, pp. 117-129.

**Title:** Recent Works on Psychology.

**Nature of reference:** "We are struck, at the outset, with the somewhat significant fact, that these three text-books are written in the spirit of three different schools of philosophy not narrowly nor confessedly, but still really and strikingly. Dr. Wayland represents the Scotch school of Reid, as modified by Sir William Hamilton, with a somewhat liberal indebtedness to Cousin." (129)

**Publication Info:** Scribner's Monthly, an illustrated magazine for the people Volume 0009 Issue 4 (February 1875) / Volume 9, Issue: 4, February 1875, pp. 508-514.

**Title:** Culture and Progress: Culture and Progress - The Scottish Philosophy.

**Nature of reference:** "PRESIDENT McCosh's History of the Scottish Philosophy supplies a want which has long been felt by the student of the Speculative Sciences, and furnishes much information which is interesting to the general reader. Being written by a Scotchman, who is also a metaphysician, it is not only a work of love, but it is a work of a master in his line. The term, Scottish Philosophy, is somewhat doubtful and elastic in its signification. It is more usually applied to a particular type of philosophy, viz.: that initiated and formulated by Dr. Thomas Reid, and conceived to have been developed, emended, and perfected by Sir William Hamilton. Though such a philosophy in the strict sense of the term, does not exist, except in the fancies of ill-informed critics, it is nevertheless true, that a certain mode of conducting speculative and psychological inquiries is common to those who are usually called Scottish Philosophers. These characteristics are enumerated and explained by Dr. McCosh in the beginning of the volume as being inductive in method, using consciousness as the instrument of observation, and accepting principles prior to and independent of experience. It would be an error to conclude that all the philosophers between Hutcheson and Hamilton, who are noticed in this elaborate work, have been distinguished pre-eminently by these features. Not a few are noticed who were Scottish Philosophers in no other sense than that they were born and bred in Scotland. We do not complain, \* The Scottish Philosophy, Biographical, Expository, Critical, from Hutcheson to Hamilton. By James McCosh, LL.D., D.D., President of the College of New Jersey. New York: Robert Carter &

Brothers. however, that the author has given himself a larger liberty than his title allowed. In so doing, he has made a book of wider and more varied interest, including sketches of many men and incidents which we should not ordinarily look for in a history of metaphysical opinions. Dr. McCosh, though often discursive, is never dull. His zeal in research has brought to light a great variety of matter hitherto inaccessible, not a little of which he has rescued from utter and inevitable oblivion in perishable manuscripts. The volume needs no recommendation of ours to those who are familiar with the writings of the distinguished author. Speculative and psychological criticism our readers will not care to receive. The literary excellences and defects of construction, diction, and illustration, are such as the other writings of Dr. McCosh have already made familiar to the public. Ten Days in Spain. It is not always possible to make a record of personal adventures and experiences of fascinating interest to the general reader.” (513)

**Publication Info:** Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science and Art Volume 0007 Issue 41 (May 1856) / Volume 7, Issue: 41, May 1856, pp. 546-547.

**Title:** Editorial Notes - Literature: Appleton's Cyclopaedia of Biography.

**Nature of reference:** “If anybody desired to enter into the former subject, he would go to more original sources. We have three solid columns of eulogy on Sir William Hamilton, without a single date, though Sir William, hem alive, is not entitled to mention at all, even if his merits, which, we confess, seem to us greatly exaggerated, had warranted so conspicuous a treatment of him.” (547)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0ind Issue 1 (1862) / Volume index, Issue: 1, 1862, pp. 52-151.

**Title:** Index of Books Noticed and Reviewed.

**Nature of reference:** Lectures on Metaphysics and Logic, by Sir William Hamilton, reviewed, by Win. A. Lamed, XVIII, 167.

**Publication Info:** Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science and Art Volume 0002 Issue 7 (July 1853) / Volume 2, Issue: 7, July 1853, pp. i-vi.

**Title:** Works of Sir William Hamilton

**Nature of reference:** An early article taking on Hamilton 12 years (it appears) before Mill's “Examination.” “SIR WILLIAM HAMILTON has been chiefly known hitherto by a couple of remarkable articles in The Edinburgh Review; one on the Philosophy of Cousin, and the other on the current Theories of Perception. Nothing can exceed the evidence of logical ability in these papers, nor the easy mastery they exhibit over all the erudition pertaining to their respective subjects. Yet we are inclined to think that these admirable qualities have passed with hasty or inconsiderate readers for more than their worth, serving, indeed, popularly to accredit Sir William with a philosophic prestige to which, as it appears to us, he is by no means indisputably entitled” (470).

.

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0040 Issue 161 (July 1881) / Volume 40, Issue: 161, July 1881, pp. 539-540.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: English Philosophers. Sir William Hamilton. W. H. S. Monk.

**Nature of reference:** “It gives a brief biography of Hamilton; a summary but clear statement of his philosophy; a Glossary of philosophical terms as used by him; and a bibliographical appendix of Hamiltonian literature. The work is well done and the reader has under his hand the philosophy and logic of Hamilton, as well as his life, in a form in which his doctrine on any subject which he has treated can be readily found.” (539)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0025 Issue 97 (October 1866) / Volume 25, Issue: 97, October 1866, pp. 759-762.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: New Publications.

**Nature of reference:** Recent British Philosophy: a Review, with criticisms; includes some comments on Mr. Mill's answer to Sir William Hamilton. By David Masson. New York: D. Appleton & Co. 1866.

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0026 Issue 98 (January 1867) / Volume 26, Issue: 98, January 1867, pp. 169-170.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: Recent British Philosophy by David Masson.

**Nature of reference:** “In other words Professor Masson falls into the practice adopted by too many critics and historians of philosophy of using high sounding, if not glittering generalities, for purposes of exposition and criticism.” (170)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0026 Issue 99 (April 1867) / Volume 26, Issue: 99, April 1867, pp. 360-361.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: Mansel's Philosophy Of The Conditioned.

**Nature of reference:** “The formal attack of Mr. John Stuart Mill upon Sir William Hamilton and his Philosophy might very naturally summon his chief theological disciple and exponent to the rescue and defense of the honor of his eminent teacher. Especially would this be required in view of the fact that Mr. Mill had made a special onset upon Mr. Mansel himself for the ethical inferences which he had sought to derive from the Philosophy of the Conditioned. The countercriticism of Mr. Mansel was first published in the Contemporary Review, and is now revised, and with some additions published in a very neat volume by Mr. A. Strahan. This statement and defense of the Manselian version of the Hamiltonian Philosophy has the very great advantage over any other which has proceeded from the author, in being more brief, more clear, and more to the point, as well as in being framed to meet many of the objections which are currently urged against it. We cannot say that the author has successfully answered these objections. They remain in our opinion in full force, but this is no fault of Mr. Mansel, but entirely that of the theory which he defends. We ought to say also that Mr. Mansel's expositions of Hamilton's philosophy are not always to be trusted as embodying the doctrines or reasons of his great master. He is not always so precise in the use of philosophical terms for himself, nor in the interpretation of those of his teacher, as we might fairly expect. Sometimes he foists in upon the original doctrine, a private interpretation or addition of his own, which adds neither to the strength or symmetry of the original structure. But the discussion as conducted by him has this special interest, that it applies the Philosophy of the Conditioned to theological questions in a direct and logical way, and does not leave the reader at all in doubt what views the author holds for himself, Mr. Mansel knows also

very well how to make the most of the inherent difficulties of the subject-matter, and to turn them dexterously to his own account in the argument.” (361-2)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0030 Issue 114 (January 1871) / Volume 30, Issue: 114, January 1871, pp. 162.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: Outline of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy. J. Clark Murray.

**Nature of reference:** Murray was educated at the University of Edinburgh under Sir William Hamilton. He later became Professor of Mental and Moral Philosophy in Canada.

“Professor Murray's Outline of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy consists of a selection of his doctrines upon every point in psychology and metaphysics expressed in his own language and arranged in a systematic form for the convenience of students. It is very concise and brief and has been executed with conscientious fidelity by one of Hamilton's pupils. It seems to be all that could be desired in a work of the kind, and it will serve an excellent purpose not only for the uses of teachers and students in philosophy, but for those who desire a convenient outline and reference book for their private reading. It will greatly facilitate the easy comprehension of the views of the eminent philosopher and the excellent man who has done so much for philosophy in the present century.” (162)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0035 Issue 135 (April 1876) / Volume 35, Issue: 135, April 1876, pp. 410-412.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: Moral Causation; or, Notes on Mr. Mill's Notes to the Nature of reference: Chapter on "Freedom," in the third edition of his "Examination of Sir W. Hamilton's Philosophy." Patrick Proctor Alexander.

“Mr. Patrick Proctor Alexander's very lively and readable treatise upon Moral Causation, has passed to a second edition. We cannot be surprised at this, for it is one of the most spirited metaphysical tractates to which this fruitful age has given birth. The immediate occasion of it was a still briefer essay entitled Mill and Carlyle, which contained a few brief comments of the author upon Mill's doctrine of Freedom, as expounded in his examination of the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton. Of the volume containing these comments, Mr. Mill vouchsafed a somewhat elaborate notice in the third edition of the Examination. This notice called forth the present volume in which Mr. Alexander devotes himself to a deliberate assault upon all Mr. Mill's utterances in respect to moral freedom and follows him up without mercy in a series of acute and humorous criticisms which are not easily outdone in any metaphysical discussion within our knowledge.” (412)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0028 Issue 109 (October 1869) / Volume 28, Issue: 109, October 1869, pp. 794-795.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: Memoir of Sir William Hamilton, Bart. Professor of Logic and Metaphysics in the University of Edinburgh. John Veitch.

**Nature of reference:** A review of Veitch - “Veitch's Memoir of Sir William Hamilton is a well-written life of one of the most remarkable English scholars and philosophers of the present century. It derives its chief interest, as every biography should, from the peculiar and striking characteristics of its subject; but it has the very great merit of setting forth these characteristics in a manner that is altogether suitable to the unique career of the

learned philosopher. It is in an eminent sense a literary life of a man whose career was almost exclusively limited to the world of letters; who derived his chief enjoyment from this world and achieved in it the only successes which he esteemed of importance.” (794)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0029 Issue 112 (July 1870) / Volume 29, Issue: 112, July 1870, pp. 511-531.

**Title:** President McCosh's Logic by Day, Henry N., Prof.

**Nature of reference:** Day provides a critical review of McCosh and recognizes the connection to Hamilton. Day quotes Hamilton on a couple of technical terms he wishes to scrutinize. (516)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0023 Issue 88 (July 1864) / Volume 23, Issue: 88, July 1864, pp. 555-556.

**Title:** Notices of Books: F. Bowen. Treatise on Logic.

**Nature of reference:** “We say such a treatise has hitherto been wanting in our language, notwithstanding the unsurpassed excellencies of some portions of the works of Archbishop Thomson, of Sir William Hamilton, and of Prof. Wilson in our country. But each of these treatises is, in some points, incomplete, and no one of them is fitted for the purposes of a College text-book, and of a manual for the advanced student. The plan of Professor Bowen is more comprehensive than that of any of the works which we have named.” (556)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0018 Issue 72 (November 1860) / Volume 18, Issue: 72, November 1860, pp. 1070-1072.

**Title:** Notices of Books: Mansel. Prolegomane Logica.

**Nature of reference:** “This work is by the author of *The Limits of Religious Thought*, who is also one of the editors of the works of Sir William Hamilton. This alone would be sufficient to call the attention of the public to the work, aside from the interest and importance of the subjects of which it treats.” (1070)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0017 Issue 67 (August 1859) / Volume 17, Issue: 67, August 1859, pp. 820-821.

**Title:** Notices of Books: Wight. Montaigne's Works.

**Nature of reference:** “Volume eight has Chevalier Bunsen’s life of Martin Luther, contributed by him to the *Encyclopedia Britannica*; followed by *An Estimate of Luther’s Character and Genius*, by Carlyle; and, in addition, what the editor calls *The Reverse-side of the Picture*; or a statement of the blemishes of Luther’s character, by Sir William Hamilton.” (820)

## Philosophy and Literature

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0004 Issue 22 (August 1859) / Volume 4, Issue: 22, August 1859, pp. 257-260.

**Nature of reference:** This piece contains a passing reference to the fact that Hamilton was one of the few British philosophers who understood Kant’s philosophy. (260)

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0039 Issue 235 (May 1877) / Volume 39, Issue: 235, May 1877, pp. 634-637.

**Title:** Recent Literature: Mahaffy's Rambles and Studies in Ancient Greece.

**Nature of reference:** States Herbert Spencer got his view about the unknowable infinite from Hamilton and its refutation from Mill.

**Publication Info:** The Continental Monthly: devoted to literature and national policy Volume 0005 Issue 6 (June 1864) / Volume 5, Issue: 6, June 1864, pp. 650-663.

**Title:** Thomas De Quincey and His Writings by Spring, L. W.

**Nature of reference:** A portion of the article compares and contrasts De Quincey's writing style to that of Hamilton. (651 - 661)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0007 Issue 42 (November 1853) / Volume 7, Issue: 42, November 1853, pp. 849-857

**Title:** Literary Notices

**Nature of reference:** The editor states Hamilton's works are more critical than systematic and more remarkable for erudition than method. (857)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0038 Issue 225 (February 1869) / Volume 38, Issue: 225, February 1869, pp. 420-427.

**Title:** Editor's Book Table.

**Nature of reference:** An editorial showing Hamilton's philosophy is somewhat unorthodox and outdated. The criticism is that Noah Porter, whose work lays out the accepted views of orthodox scholars on metaphysics, is a disciple of Sir William Hamilton. In further criticism of Porter's work on mental philosophy, the editorial states: "The inductive method has never been faithfully applied to it. It is true that Sir William Hamilton has interrogated consciousness a little. It is true that the phrenologists have examined the organs of thought in a crude and bungling way but both are partialists." (422).

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0097 Issue 582 (November, 1898) / Volume 97, Issue: 582, November, 1898, pp. 829-G128.

**Title:** Literary Notices.

**Nature of reference:** In an article about new literature the editor quotes Sir William Hamilton: "In the world there is nothing great but man; in Man there is nothing great but mind." This is a take-off point for the authors Bowne and Lotze in their book 'A Theory of Thought and Knowledge' (f008).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0021 Issue 264 (June 9, 1849) / Volume 21, Issue: 264, June 9, 1849, pp. 433-480.

**Nature of reference:** The author refers to Sir William Hamilton as one of the world's highest living authorities on epistemology. The article states that Hamilton's criticism of Boyle is enough as to not give Boyle a high and lasting place amongst the men of science. (458)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0035 Issue 437 (October 2, 1852) / Volume 35, Issue: 437, October 2, 1852, pp. 1-6.

**Title:** Life of Lord Jeffrey; with a Selection from his Correspondence. Lord Cockburn.

**Nature of reference:** An article about the Scottish influence in British Literature. What appears in this journal was a part of a larger article that appeared in the *North British Review*.

Sir William Hamilton is listed in the class of intellectuals including: Reid, Hume, Adam Smith, Dugald Stewart, Mackintosh, Mill, (Jhal- mere; in the other, Thomson, Smollett, Robertson, Fergusson, Burns, Scott, Jeffrey.

“If there is a man now alive conspicuous among his contemporaries for the exercise on the most magnificent scale of an intellect most pure and abstract that man is Sir William Hamilton; and yet not even when discussing the philosophy of the unconditioned or perfecting the theory of the syllogism which is universal does Sir William forget his Scottish lineage” (3).

“In men like Burns, Chalmers, or Irving, on the other hand, there was both emphasis and fervor; so also with Carlyle; and so, under a still more curious combination, with Sir William Hamilton. And as we distinguish emphasis from fervor, so would we distinguish it from perseverance” (4).

“From the time of those old Duncans, and Balfours, and Dalgarnos, mentioned by Sir William Hamilton, who discoursed on philosophy, and wrote dialectical treatises in Latin in all the cities of the continent... we can point to a succession of Scottish thinkers in whom the interest in metaphysical studies was kept alive, and by whose labours new contributions to mental science were continually made. It was by the Scottish mind in fact that modern philosophy was conducted to that point where Kant and the Germans took it up” (5).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0080 Issue 1033 (March 19, 1864) / Volume 80, Issue: 1033, March 19, 1864, pp. 529-576.

**Title:** *The Person of Christ* by Ernest Renan.

**Nature of reference:** Quotes Hamilton: “Sir William Hamilton is surely not guilty of an overstatement when, after urging the propriety and the need of doubt, within certain limits he adds: ‘Philosophical doubt is not an end but a means. We doubt in order that we might believe; we begin, that we might not end with doubt...’” (543)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0088 Issue 1138 (March 24, 1866) / Volume 88, Issue: 1138, March 24, 1866, pp. 801-864.

**Title:** Sir William Hamilton on Shakespeare.

**Nature of reference:** A short poem:

Who says that Shakespeare did not know his lot,  
But deem'd that in Time's manifold decay.  
His memory should die and pass away. (810)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0092 Issue 1189 (March 16, 1867) / Volume 92, Issue: 1189, March 16, 1867, pp. 641-704.

**Title:** Inaugural Address Of John Stuart Mill.

**Nature of reference:** Mill outlines a complete scientific education and states the following on Hamilton: "The value of mathematics in a logical point of view is an old topic with mathematicians and has even been insisted on so exclusively as to provoke a counter-exaggeration, of which a well-known essay by Sir William Hamilton is an example: but the logical value of experimental science is comparatively a new subject..."

The old school of philosophy, Hobbes, Locke, Hume etc. is not authoritative but rather...lying materials and incentives to thought. To come to our own cotemporaries, he who has mastered Sir William Hamilton and your own lamented Ferrier as distinguished representatives of one of the two great schools of philosophy..."

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0109 Issue 1400 (April 1, 1871) / Volume 109, Issue: 1400, April 1, 1871, pp. 1-64.

**Title:** Universal Knowledge (from The Saturday Review).

**Nature of reference:** In reference to Aristotle the author quotes Hamilton: "His seal, to use the words of Sir William Hamilton, is on all the sciences; and his speculations have mediately or immediately influenced those of all subsequent thinkers." (51)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0109 Issue 1403 (April 22, 1871) / Volume 109, Issue: 1403, April 22, 1871, pp. 193-256.

**Title:** Professor De Morgan (from The Spectator).

**Nature of reference:** In an essay on De Morgan the author quotes Hamilton: "The late Sir William Hamilton of Edinburgh, who had a sharp controversy with him on logical matters, and hardly understood his opponent once described him as, 'profound in mathematics, curious in logic, and wholly deficient in architectonic powers' – a description in which the only element of real truth was aimed at that somewhat awkward arrangement of his materials by which Professor De Morgan not infrequently disguised from the world the massiveness, precision and great depth of his own powers." (244)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0078 Issue 1003 (August 22, 1863) / Volume 78, Issue: 1003, August 22, 1863, pp. 337-384.

**Title:** A response to an article "Literary Piracy."

**Nature of reference:** This article is a response to a previously published article criticizing American publishers for unauthorized publications of British works. In defense of American publication houses the unnamed author states that "Gaskell, Miss Mulock, Stanley, Boyd, Lyell, Spurgeon, Mrs. Wood, Dr. Brown, the representative of Sir William Hamilton, the representative of Hugh Miller, and others, have all received compensation from their American publisher." (369).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0125 Issue 1614 (May 15, 1875) / Volume 125, Issue: 1614, May 15, 1875, pp. 385-448.

**Title:** Instinct and Reason (from The Contemporary Review).

**Nature of reference:** The intensification of sensation diminishes the power of intellectual action, while intense intellectual preoccupation deadens the sensitive faculties. Sir William Hamilton long ago called attention to this inverse relation but when two faculties tend to increase in an inverse ratio, it becomes unquestionable that the difference between them is one of a kind (398).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0148 Issue 1908 (January 8, 1881)/Volume 148, Issue: 1908, January 8, 1881, pp. 65-128.

**Title:** The Unity of Nature by The Duke of Argyll.

**Nature of reference:** This article in part deals with Kant's notion of the "thing in itself" and makes reference to Hamilton's application of the idea.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0161 Issue 1078 (Apr 19, 884)/Volume 161, Issue: 1078, Apr 19, 1884, pp. 129-192.

**Title:** The Axioms of Geometry (from Nature).

**Nature of reference:** This article discusses axioms of geometry and utilizes Hamilton's proofs for pedagogical exercises. "I select for discussion the quaternion proof given by Sir William Hamilton this being the easiest of the two. To show how erroneous this reasoning is - in spite of Sir William Hamilton and in spite of quaternions - I need only point out..." (129).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0161 Issue 1088 (June 28, 1884) / Volume 161, Issue: 1088, June 28, 1884, pp. 769-830.

**Title:** Frederick Denison Maurice (from the British Quarterly Review)

**Nature of reference:** "Of course we do not mean the laws of thought as thought to take the definition of logic which Maurice himself preferred (it is that of Sir William Hamilton) are applicable only on physical ground. But a complete moral truth never looks quite coherent from the outside" (784).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0170 Issue 2204 (September 18, 1886) / Volume 170, Issue: 2204, September 18, 1886, pp. 705-768.

**Title:** Some Unconscious Confessions of De Quincey (from The Gentleman's Magazine).

**Nature of reference:** After criticizing Whately and Mill for not using their terminology in a consistent way the author states: "Sir William Hamilton is regarded as being as true to his own terminology as any modern metaphysical." (711)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0182 Issue 2355 (August 17, 1889) / Volume 182, Issue: 2355, August 17, 1889, pp. 385-448.

**Title:** The Ethics Of Punishment.

**Nature of reference:** "For a statement of the creed of determinism we cannot do better than go to the late Mr. John Stuart Mill. In his criticism of Sir William Hamilton he pronounces it a truth of experience that volitions do in fact follow determined moral antecedents with the same uniformity and the same certainty as physical effects follow their physical causes."

**Publication Info:** The New England Magazine Volume 0005 Issue 30 (April 1887) / Volume 5, Issue: 30, April 1887, pp. 600-604.

**Title:** Literature and Art.

**Nature of reference:** "The Conception of the Infinite, by Geo. S. Fullerton, A.M., 13.D. is a metaphysical work which will command the respect of its readers, though it settles

not the point it discusses. Its Infinite, Sir William Hamilton would probably pronounce to be only the indefinite, which is all we can make it out to be. The never-ceasing continuance of a motion is surely only the indefinite. This is easily conceivable but it is not the conception of the infinite.” (602)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0066 Issue 138 (January 1848) / Volume 66, Issue: 138, January 1848, pp. 256-258.

**Title:** Critical Notices: New Publications Received.

**Nature of reference:** The Works of Thomas Reid, D. D., now fully collected, with Selections from his Unpublished Letters, Preface, Notes, and Supplementary Dissertations, by Sir William Hamilton.

Letter to Augustus De Morgan, Esq., of Trinity College, Cambridge, on his Claim to an Independent Rediscovery of a New Principle in the Theory of Syllogism; from Sir William Hamilton, Bart. Subjoined, the Whole Previous Correspondence, and a Postscript in Answer to Professor De Morgan’s Statement.

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0078 Issue 162 (January 1854) / Volume 78, Issue: 162, January 1854, pp. 82-105.

**Title:** J. S. Mill on the Theory of Causation.

**Nature of reference:** The Author uses Reid and Hamilton in his criticism of Mill. “In the second place, even if the assertion were true, it would be nugatory for the purposes of this argument. The more natural and obvious explanation of a phenomenon is just as likely to be the true one as that which is more recondite and far-fetched. Thus, Reid’s doctrine of perception, as improved by Sir William Hamilton, and now almost universally accepted by competent thinkers, is only a return to common sense...” (99)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0079 Issue 164 (July 1854) / Volume 79, Issue: 164, July 1854, pp. 137-158.

**Title:** The Use and Misuse of Words.

**Nature of reference:** “It is character that states and reasons, though character broadened into understanding, and seemingly as impersonal as the facts and principles it grasps and expounds. Dr. Samuel Clarke, John Stuart Mill, Sir William Hamilton, and Daniel Webster, are instances in point. In the language of these men we observe an austere conscientiousness of phrase, as if every word had been severely tested and kept subordinate to the thought which it is used to convey. The sober and solid tramp of their style reflects the movement of intellects that palpably respect the relations and dimensions of things, and to which exaggeration would be immorality. We should hesitate to call them creative thinkers, and equally to place them in point of greatness below any but creative thinkers of the first class. It is indeed with a sigh of regret, that a critic who has studied Sir William Hamilton is compelled to station him not even abreast of Hobbes and Locke.” (153)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0079 Issue 164 (July 1854) / Volume 79, Issue: 164, July 1854, pp. 200-229.

**Title:** Martineau's Translation of Comte's Philosophy.

**Nature of reference:** “The general scope of the Positive Philosophy is clearly enough indicated in the remark which Sir William Hamilton recently quoted from its author, M. Comte.” (205)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0083 Issue 173 (October 1856) / Volume 83, Issue: 173, October 1856, pp. 382-402.

**Title:** Wilson's Treatise on Logic.

**Nature of reference:** “Sir William Hamilton, a most competent judge, and one by no means inclined to think favorably of Whately's merits, says that by the publication of Whately's Elements a new life was suddenly communicated to the expiring study, and that the decade of years in which it first appeared had done more in Oxford for the cause of this science than the whole hundred and thirty years preceding.”

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0083 Issue 173 (October 1856) / Volume 83, Issue: 173, October 1856, pp. 476-503.

**Title:** Literature in France under the Empire.

**Nature of reference:** In a footnote on Cousin: “But, strange to say, a circumstance of quite recent occurrence may be interesting, inasmuch as it exemplifies the immense intellectual influence of M. Cousin, even in foreign countries. Some thirty years ago a Professor of Logic and Metaphysics was to be named by the University of Edinburgh, and Sir William Hamilton was one of the candidates. M. Cousin did not then know, but he knew of his talents, for he had read an essay of Sir Williams upon himself in *The Edinburgh Review*, in which he (Cousin) was attacked and refuted. The contest was going against Sir William, which, when Cousin heard, he seized his pen and wrote a letter to the Lord Provost of Edinburgh, saying that, if the Town Council did not nominate him, the school of philosophy in Scotland would be shorn of its honors, for that Sir William Hamilton was a thinker in a million. The letter had its effect, and Hamilton was nominated. A few months ago, Sir William having suddenly died, the same Professor's chair became again vacant, and great anxiety was manifested to know what candidate (Conin) was disposed to support. Professor Fraser, Sir William Hamilton's friend and pupil, was opposed by a strong party in favor of Mr. Ferrier, Professor Wilson's son-in-law; but, added to Professor Fraser's great capacity (he is the author of a collection of Philosophical Essays of high renown in the United Kingdom), it became well known that M. Cousin had said, if he were not chosen, Sir William's principles of teaching would be lost, and he accordingly was chosen, the Lord Provost in his public speech saying, as a conclusive argument, that Professor Fraser had upon his side the illustrious M. Cousin, the first authority in the science of mind in Europe.” (500)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0085 Issue 177 (October 1857) / Volume 85, Issue: 177, October 1857, pp. 571-572.

**Title:** Critical Notices: The Biographical History of Philosophy. George Henry Lewes.

**Nature of reference:** “Philosophy must die, and yield up the place it had assumed to Positive Science. That crisis is even now passed. Philosophy, born with Thales, received the honors of burial at the hands of Auguste Comte; and Mr. Lewes is her posthumous biographer. She certainly died hard, if Sir William Hamilton was energized by her death-throes, and if Ferrier's brilliant, vivacious Institutes of Metaphysic were her last words.

But our design is to indicate the scope of Mr. Lewes' book, not to affirm or confute its doctrines.”(571)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0086 Issue 179 (April 1858) / Volume 86, Issue: 179, April 1858, pp. 435-464.

**Title:** The Brahmanic and Buddhist Doctrine of a Future Life.

**Nature of reference:** “The memorable remark of Sir William Hamilton, that the capacity of thought is not to be constituted into the measure of existence, should show the error of those who so unjustifiably affirm that, since Nirvana is said to be neither corporeal nor incorporeal, nor at all describable, it is therefore absolutely nothing.”

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0093 Issue 193 (October 1861) / Volume 93, Issue: 193, October 1861, pp. 519-560.

**Title:** Buckle's History of Civilization in England.

**Nature of reference:** “Mr. Buckle attempts to impeach the credibility of this testimony, on the ground, first, that many philosophers have denied, and justly too, that there is any independent or special faculty of consciousness, asserting that what bears that name is merely a general state or condition of mind. But the objection only shows that he is incapable of understanding the doctrine that he cites, and that his acquaintance with psychology is extremely superficial. Sir William Hamilton censures Reid for degrading consciousness into a special faculty, rightly maintaining that it is an attribute of all our faculties, a general condition of the whole intellect. We cannot know, without knowing that we know; we cannot feel, without knowing that we feel; we cannot will, without knowing that we will; and this self-recognition, this knowledge that the mind possesses of its own phenomena, whereby we discriminate our own mental states and appropriate them as our own, is what we call consciousness.”(525)

“Mr. Buckle will hardly dignify these with the name of science. But why need we state the case in our own language, when we can borrow the weighty words of one who was the greatest scholar, and one of the greatest thinkers, of the present century? Every learner in science, says Sir William Hamilton, is now familiar with more truths than Aristotle or Plato ever dreamt of knowing; yet, compared with the Stagirite or the Athenian, how few, even of the masters of modern science, rank higher than intellectual barbarians!” (546)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0093 Issue 193 (October 1861) / Volume 93, Issue: 193, October 1861, pp. 579-580.

**Title:** Critical Notices: Bowen's Metaphysics of Sir William Hamilton.

**Nature of reference:** “WE have so recently reviewed Sir William Hamilton's Lectures on Metaphysics, as to leave no necessity for especial comment on the materials of this volume. These Lectures were hastily written some twenty-five years ago, were not to any considerable extent modified in accordance with the growth and change of the author's views, and appeared under the disadvantages of posthumous publication. Professor Bowen, taking the Lectures as the basis of his manual, has expunged such portions as were either redundant, superseded by later expressions of opinion, or irrelevant to the purpose of a text-book, and has inserted from the author's other works such collateral and

supplementary statements and arguments as were needed to do full justice to the successive subjects of discussion” (579).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0096 Issue 199 (April 1863) / Volume 96, Issue: 199, April 1863, pp. 380-407.

**Title:** Hopkins's Moral Science.

Lectures on Moral Science. Delivered before the Lowell Institute, Boston. By Mark Hopkins, B. D., LL. B., President of Williams College.

**Nature of reference:** Hopkins was also the author of Lectures on the Evidences of Christianity, etc. Boston: Gould and Lincoln. 1862.

“The great modern movement in speculative philosophy, inaugurated in Scotland by Reid, and producing there, as its best fruit, the vigorous, learned, and to a great extent original discussions of Sir William Hamilton, contemporaneously revealing itself in Germany by Kant, and culminating at length in Hegel and his disciples, including also the eclecticism of Victor Cousin, and the modified and fragmentary transcendental system of Coleridge, has affected the intimately related department of moral philosophy so far, at least, as to create a necessity for the reexamination of its old positions.”

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0099 Issue 204 (July 1864) / Volume 99, Issue: 204, July 1864, pp. 64-1.

**Title:** The Philosophy of Space and Time.

**Nature of reference:** “As to the question whether the perceptions of extension and color mutually involve each other, he professes himself unable to decide. Sir William Hamilton replies to all skepticism on this point by the argument that, inasmuch as we perceive two different colors in juxtaposition, and inasmuch as their mutual limitation affords a breadthless line of demarcation, the perception of linear extension is given in that of the colors. Against this argument, which we regard as conclusive, Mr. Spencer retorts as follows...” (77)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0100 Issue 207 (April 1865) / Volume 100, Issue: 207, April 1865, pp. 423-476.

**Title:** The Philosophy of Herbert Spencer.

An article that takes a critical look at Spencer’s philosophy noting how it differs from Hamilton’s.

**Nature of reference:** “In discussing this his criterion or universal postulate, Mr. Spencer encounters two of the acutest of modern thinkers, Mr. Mill and Sir William Hamilton, whose opinions he finds opposed to his own on opposite grounds. Here is a fine chance for eclecticism, to combine what is true in both these philosophies; but first he must refute what is false” (440).

“In reviewing the objections to the test of inconceivableness, Mr. Spencer again finds himself opposed to Sir. William Hamilton. The doughty knight is encased in a seemingly invulnerable logic, and impedes the progress of truth. After stating certain minor and indecisive objections to the doctrine of the conditioned, Mr. Spencer waives them. Granting all this, he says, Sir William Hamilton’s argument may still be met. He says that inconceivability is no criterion of impossibility. Why? Because of two propositions, one of which must be true; it proves both impossible, it proves that space cannot have a limit,

because a limit is inconceivable, and yet that it has a limit, because unlimited space is inconceivable; it proves, therefore, that space has a limit and has no limit, which is absurd. How absurd? Absurd because it is impossible for the same thing to be and not to be. But how do we know that it is impossible for the same thing to be and not to be? What is our criterion of this impossibility? Can Sir William Hamilton assign any other than this same inconceivability? If not, his argument is self-destructive; seeing that he assumes the validity of the test in proving its invalidity. This is the same shaft ad hominem, which Mr. Spencer leveled at Mill, and it glances for the same reason. He does not precisely apprehend the position of his antagonist. Hamilton's argument is not self-destructive, since it is only designed to prove the incompleteness of the test, which Mr. Spencer has adopted in its boldest and crudest form. What was an obvious *petitio principii* as applied to Mr. Mill, namely, ascribing to him the opinion that logical axioms rest ultimately on the test of the inconceivableness of their negations, is none the less really such as applied to Hamilton's doctrines. Hamilton can and does assign a different criterion. Mr. Mill appeals to particular experiences as the tests, in the proper sense of that word, of all axioms logical or mathematical; while Hamilton admits for them a psychological test, analogous to Mr. Spencer's, yet more complete. A proposition which can be conceived, but of which the negation cannot be conceived, is true, and its negation is false, is the complete formula"(445).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0102 Issue 210 (Jan 1866) / Volume 102, Issue: 210, Jan 1866, pp. 275-280.

**Title:** Critical Notices: Mill's Positive Philosophy of Auguste Comte.

**Nature of reference:** The author seems to side with Mill's views of Hamilton: "Brown's philosophy is entirely positivist, and no better introduction to positivism than the early part of his Lectures has yet been produced. While, curiously enough, Brown's most redoubtable opponent, Sir William Hamilton, has also verbally adopted this positive theorem, although his simultaneous assertion of the principles of Natural Dualism sufficiently shows that he never really understood it"(277).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0103 Issue 212 (July 1866) / Volume 103, Issue: 212, July 1866, pp. 241-250.

**Title:** Critical Notices. 1. An Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy, and of the principal Philosophical Questions discussed in his Writings. By John Stuart Mill.

The author recognizes the high standing of Hamilton as an intellect and academic and because of this high standing Mill's work is important.

**Nature of reference:** "The value of this most searching examination of Sir William Hamilton's writings, and its enduring interest as a contribution to philosophy, separating it widely from the short-lived publications of the season, are sufficient apologies for calling our readers' attention to it at this late day. In one respect, indeed, the work is a very timely publication, and in this it exhibits a literary skill of no ordinary merit. The position and present reputation both of the author and his subject are such, that the mere announcement of the work was sufficient to inspire with the liveliest curiosity every student of philosophy" (250).

The author concludes: "But this is not surprising, when we see how fundamentally their philosophies differ. What will surprise the reader most are the numerous contradictions

and inconsistencies in Hamilton's writings, which his critic has pointed out. The principal of these we have tried to explain as arising from misinterpretations of his doctrines. There are enough remaining, however, to greatly impair his reputation, before unchallenged, for profundity and accuracy, and even for scholarship." (260)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0108 Issue 222 (January 1869) / Volume 108, Issue: 222, January 1869, pp. 280-286.

**Title:** Critical Notices: Noah Porter's Human Intellect.

A review of Porter's book with a close look at some of the differences between his thoughts and Sir William Hamilton's.

**Nature of reference:** "Professor Porter writes in an independent spirit, and his system can be identified with that of no one of the leading names in metaphysical science. It is plain that he has given as attentive a hearing to the French and German philosophers as to Reid and his successors. But his treatise, both in its spirit and method, is more nearly allied to the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton, perhaps the ablest and certainly the most learned representative of the Scottish school, than to any other system. Still his divergences from Hamilton are neither few nor unimportant. We have noted a few of them, some being of more and some of less moment, he convicts Hamilton of inconsistency (p. 65) in conceding in various places that objects are known in sense and perception to exist in certain relations to other objects, while elsewhere the Elaborative Faculty is defined as the Faculty of Relations. Adopting the doctrine of Natural Realism, Professor Porter still finds not a little to criticise in the Scottish Professor's exposition of the subject. He dissents from Hamilton (p. 236, seq.) in holding that sensation involves in some degree knowledge as well as feeling; he thinks that Hamilton fails to define sharply the distinction between an act of perception and an act of thought, the real difference being, that the former apprehends and judges individual objects, the latter, objects which are general; he thinks Hamilton wrong in founding the perception of extra-corporeal things primarily on the resistance to our locomotive power in the form of muscular exertion, and would himself derive it from the presence and absence of certain muscular and tactual sense-perceptions (p. 183); he regards Hamilton as incorrect and inconsistent in teaching that qualities are apprehended as such in sense perception, another example of his failure to discriminate exactly between perception and thought; that he errs occasionally in confounding the conditions of perception with perception itself, as, for example, in applying the doctrine of latent modifications of the mind to the phenomena of vision and hearing; that he attaches too great importance to the idiopathic affections of the nervous system, which are excited by electrical action, indigestion, or a blow; that, being wrong in his metaphysical assumption that we know directly only phenomena, he is wrong in the inferred doctrine, that phenomena, as such, are the direct objects, and the only direct objects, in sense-perception, the truth being, that only objects, percepts, or beings are perceived, and the distinction of substance and attribute is the result of an after-thought or reflex process" (282-3).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0109 Issue 225 (October 1869) / Volume 109, Issue: 225, October 1869, pp. 367-391.

**Title:** The Writings of Mr. Rowland G. Hazard by Fisher, George P.

**Nature of reference:** “Respecting the origin of the notion of causation, which Mr. Hazard, with many other philosophers, attributes to our conscious voluntary efforts, producing muscular exertion, Mr. Mill brings forward the argument of Sir William Hamilton, that this cannot be the case, since between the volition, and the motion of the arm, or any other member, there intervene links of cause and effect of which the mind, in the act of will, can have no cognizance.” (383)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0117 Issue 241 (October 1873) / Volume 117, Issue: 241, October 1873, pp. 251-319.

**Title:** The Progress from Brute to Man by Fiske, John.

**Nature of reference:** “But before we can proceed directly upon the course thus marked out, it is necessary that we should determine what are meant by pleasures and pains. What are the common characteristics, on the one hand, of the states of consciousness which we call pleasures, and, on the other hand, of the states of consciousness which we call pains? According to Sir William Hamilton, pleasure is a reflex of the spontaneous and unimpeded exertion of a power of whose energy we are conscious; pain is a reflex of the overstrained or repressed exertion of such a power. That this theory, which is nearly identical with that of Aristotle, is inadequate to account for all the phenomena of pleasure and pain, has been, I think, conclusively proved by Mr. Mill” (286).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0117 Issue 241 (October 1873) / Volume 117, Issue: 241, October 1873, pp. 401-439.

**Title:** Taine's Philosophy by Bixby, James T.

**Nature of reference:** “The process of deduction may perhaps be explained by resolving the relations of content into those of extent, and taking as our guide the maxim, whatever is a part of a part is a part of the whole. Sir William Hamilton preceded M. Taine by many years in proposing this. But when it is sought to extend this method of proof to induction, it manifestly is unequal to sustaining the load laid upon it. Even deductive reasoning is not fully explained until the relations of quality and the distinctions of attribute and substance, cause and effect, are taken into consideration” (435).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0128 Issue 268 (March 1879) / Volume 128, Issue: 268, March 1879, pp. 284-304.

**Title:** The Philosophy of Jonathan Edwards by Fisher, George P., D. D.

“The Scottish philosophy of Sir William Hamilton solves the problem by affirming the inconceivability of both freedom and necessity, on the ground that the first implies a beginning of motion, and the other an infinite regress of effects; and it accepts the truth of free-will on the basis of our moral feelings, the feelings of self-approbation and remorse, praise and blame, which presuppose moral liberty.” (302)

**Publication Info:** Scribner's Monthly, an illustrated magazine for the people Volume 0015 Issue 1 (November 1877) / Volume 15, Issue: 1, November 1877, pp. 134-141.

**Title:** Culture and Progress.

**Nature of reference:** This article is a review of Bowen's *Modern Philosophy*. Francis Bowen was the Alford Professor of Natural Religion and Moral Philosophy in Harvard College, and the author of a volume on American Political Economy.

“Since the war this work has been republished with remarks on the management of the currency and finances since the outbreak of the war of the rebellion. He has also delivered various lectures on metaphysical subjects, written treatises of minor scope and edited works of standard importance. John Stuart Mill noticed his objections to theories of his own brought forward in a printed series of lectures on English philosophers from Bacon to Sir William Hamilton. Professor Bowen is about 65 years of age, and has been dealing with abstruse questions of metaphysics all his life; it will be readily seen therefore that he is particularly well fitted for examining the various claims of the philosophers of the 17th, 18th and present centuries.” (134)

**Publication Info:** Scribner's Monthly, an illustrated magazine for the people Volume 0007 Issue 4 (February 1874) / Volume 7, Issue: 4, February 1874, pp. 478-483.

**Title:** Dr. Blauvelt's "Novum Organum" by Atwater, Lyman H.

**Nature of reference:** “Overdoing what is good sometimes turns it into the worst of evils. Undue liberality and concessions to skepticism can only issue in compromising the defenders and defenses of Christianity itself. The like of this frequently occurs. Sir William Hamilton largely neutralized his own refutation of Kant’s system by the extravagant concessions he made to it.” (482)

**Publication Info:** Scribner's Monthly, an illustrated magazine for the people Volume 0007 Issue 4 (February 1874) / Volume 7, Issue: 4, February 1874, pp. 502-508.

**Title:** Culture and Progress.

**Nature of reference:** “What Sir William Hamilton was fond of calling the dirt-philosophy has found a new adherent in herr Strauss, whom we knew of old as the smooth advocate of a high-sounding idealism.” (506)

**Publication Info:** Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science and Art Volume 0007 Issue 40 (April 1856) / Volume 7, Issue: 40, April 1856, pp. 438-439.

**Title:** Editorial Notes - Literature: Mr. Tappan's Elements of Logic.

**Nature of reference:** “Every new writer seems to take a new view of it, or, at least, to controvert the views of all his predecessors. Is it, as Whately contends, to be restricted to the analysis and determination of the reasoning process only so far as it is a verbal operation? is it, as Sir William Hamilton maintains, the science of the formal laws of thought only? or does it, as Professor Tappan now declares more largely, comprise the laws which govern and determine all the activities of the reason. Reason itself being the sum of our intellectual faculties, or the total knowing substance?” (439)

**Publication Info:** Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science and Art Volume 0004 Issue 22 (October 1854) / Volume 4, Issue: 22, October 1854, pp. 389-397.

**Title:** Novels - Their Meaning and Mission.

**Nature of reference:** “The world's idea now is the true. This idea it is that is leading us back to the search after a more satisfactory solution of all the problems that affect human existence and its concerns; that makes physical science the offspring of the nineteenth century; that has turned criticism upside down; that has given us an Emerson and a Carlyle, a Schiller and a Goethe; and that has swept away the old drowsy shop of Aristotelian logic and ontology, and erected or, at least, laid the foundation of that

splendid fabric, of which some of the master-builders are Sir William Hamilton, and Kant, and Fichte, and Schelling, and the Schlegels, and Novalis, and Jean Paul Richter.” (395)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0045 Issue 195 (June 1886) / Volume 45, Issue: 195, June 1886, pp. 727-736.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: Spinoza and his Environment. Henry Smith.

**Nature of reference:** “The critical essay is for this reason a most inviting study to all interested in the advance of sound knowledge. The essay is well denominated by the author the environment of Spinoza. It is an historical presentation of the relations of Spinoza, or rather of the Spinozistic method, to the philosophical systems or methods of Bacon and Descartes, followed, after an intervening criticism of the method of Spinoza himself, by a view of the influence of the Spinozistic method on later speculation, as particularly on Kant, Coleridge, Sir William Hamilton of Edinburgh, and Emerson of our own land, and generally on the religious thought of England down to the present time.”

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0048 Issue 217 (April 1888) / Volume 48, Issue: 217, April 1888, pp. 283-285.

**Title:** The Philosophical Club.

**Nature of reference:** An article of the Philosophy club at Yale. In 1888 Yale was experiencing a surge in interest in the study of philosophy. A club was organized and in October a paper was given by a Mr. E. C. Sage on "The Realism of Sir William Hamilton." (886).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0054 Issue 250 (January 1891) / Volume 54, Issue: 250, January 1891, pp. 61-97.

**Title:** Coleridge as a Spiritual Philosopher by Goodwin, Henry M.

**Nature of reference:** “Thus, the idea of the Infinite, or Absolute, which is a positive idea of the Reason, can only be conceived as the Unconditioned, a mere negation of thought, according to Sir William Hamilton, who says, that to think is to condition. Or if infinite space be conceived positively, as a whole, made up of all finite spaces, or eternity as the sum of all successive moments, this is not only an inadequate conception, but a contradiction of the idea. Hence transcendental truths, or truths of the Reason, can only be expressed paradoxically, or as Coleridge puts it, in the disguise of two contradictory conceptions, each of which is partially true...”

“Thus Mr. Mansel, following Sir William Hamilton, declares the Absolute and the Infinite to be but names indicating not an object of thought or consciousness at all, but the mere absence of the conditions under which consciousness is possible.” (80)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0042 Issue 176 (September 1883) / Volume 42, Issue: 176, September 1883, pp. 608-626.

**Title:** Apriorisms as Ultimate Grounds of Knowledge Day, Henry N., Prof.

**Nature of reference:** Day makes several references to Hamilton’s notion of *a priori* knowledge and opens the article with a quote from Hamilton: “The history of opinions touching the acceptation or rejection of such native notions, says Sir William Hamilton, referring to what are variously called first principles, self-evident or intuitive truths, a

priori cognitions, etc., is, in a manner, the history of philosophy. In every line of thought the human mind has shown a kind of irresistible tendency to assume certain principles, certain axioms, certain propositions, as being self-evident and therefore unquestionable; as shining by their own light and so needing no other. Such are first, original, independent truths which admit of no demonstration or proof simply because they are first, original, depending on no others.”

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0041 Issue 169 (July 1882) / Volume 41, Issue: 169, July 1882, pp. 438-460.

**Title:** Modern Materialism by Gould, E. R. L.

**Nature of reference:** “It is a peculiar feature in the civilization of the western side of the Atlantic, that a much higher value is attached to the practical and the useful than to the ornamental and the beautiful. This is doubtless one reason why poetry, painting, and art have not here found as fostering a home and as genial a clime as elsewhere.”

“According to Sir William Hamilton, the too exclusive study of the physical sciences may exert an evil influence in two ways. First, it diverts from all notice of the phenomena of moral liberty which are revealed to us in the human mind alone. Second, by exhibiting merely the phenomena of matter and extension, it habituates us only to the contemplation of an order of things in which everything is determined by the laws of a blind or mechanical necessity, and leads us to think that the mechanism of nature can explain everything. If we hold such views as those last expressed, we have duly arrived at the materialistic goal.” (439)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0035 Issue 137 (October 1876) / Volume 35, Issue: 137, October 1876, pp. 708-733.

**Title:** Logos and Cosmos: Nature as Related to Language by Porter, Samuel, Prof.

**Nature of reference:** Necessary Truths and the Principle of Identity – “One of the vexations awaiting anybody who meddles with the controversy on Necessary Truth, is the double meaning of the phrase itself. What is Truth subjective or objective? What is Necessity - determination of the mind, or a determination of things with which the mind converses? We have seen Sir William Hamilton actually calling Descartes into court to testify to the Kantian criterion of innate knowledge; a *naivete* only to be capped by calling Kant to prove Reid's doctrine of the immediate perception of extension and motion. Hamilton abounds in these simplicities, but what shall we say of Mr. Lewes, who informs us that Descartes and Leibnitz, as also Kant and his followers insist, that the mind brings with it at birth a structure which renders certain conclusions necessary.” (733)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0036 Issue 140 (July 1877) / Volume 36, Issue: 140, July 1877, pp. 425-445.

**Title:** John Stuart Mill Adams, Lyell, Mr.

**Nature of reference:** “It is possible that we should never have heard of the doctrine at all if it had not slipped out in the heat of Mr. Mill's polemic on Sir William Hamilton. That we owe a disclosure of this kind to the mere contingencies of a debate is a misfortune every way; it is a special misfortune that Sir Wm. Hamilton should have been the man to create the contingency. For Hamilton was an eclectic who having conceived the scheme

of doctoring Scotch intuitions with the German criterion of certitude contrived to becloud the whole circuit of objective realities by referring our belief in them to subjective necessities. We wanted Mr. Mill's theory elaborately worked out as a substitute for the native errors of that." (438)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0033 Issue 129 (October 1874) / Volume 33, Issue: 129, October 1874, pp. 703-722.

**Title:** Of Self-Consciousness by Grinnell, C. E., Rev.

**Nature of reference:** "Opposed to the absolute knowledge of self just set forth is the doctrine of the relativity of all our knowledge, well known as advocated by Sir William Hamilton. All our knowledge is only relative, . . . he says, . . . Because existence is not cognizable absolutely and in itself; but only in special modes, etc. Again, in so far as mind is the common name for the states of knowing, feeling, desiring, etc., of which I am conscious, it is only the name for a certain series of connected phenomena or qualities, and consequently expresses only what is known. But in so far as it denotes that subject or substance in which the phenomena of knowing, willing, etc., inhere something behind or under these phenomena it expresses what, in itself; or in its absolute existence, is unknown. But what Hamilton calls the mind in itself is not merely unknown; it is an unnecessary creature of the imagination. By the phenomena of consciousness I know my mind as itself; I do not know all about it, but in so far as it is, or has being, and that being acts in the revelation of itself in self-consciousness, my knowledge of self is real and absolute." (710)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0034 Issue 133 (October 1875) / Volume 34, Issue: 133, October 1875, pp. 605-644.

**Title:** On the Value of Empirical Generalization by Adams, Lyell.

**Nature of reference:** "Mr. Spencer hesitates to define from no unworthy motive, but from this suspicion common to thinkers of all the schools, intuitional as well as Empirical, that after all the game is hardly worth the candle, that life is none the ampler or richer for the discovery of universal forms and ultimate truths, the universe no more intelligible, or if more intelligible then less impressive than it was before. The last worst calamity, says Sir William Hamilton, summing up the opinions of some of the greatest of his predecessors; the last worst calamity that could befall man as he is at present constituted, would be that full and final possession of speculative truth which he now vainly anticipates as the consummation of his intellectual happiness a startling confession if ever there was one. What is philosophy good for if this is the whole of the matter? Why should we philosophize, i.e., set off after truths whose possession is a last worst calamity? Because, says Sir William Hamilton, the pursuit itself is a delightful and wholesome exercise; and he seems to think that this is the justification which philosophers have always trusted to. The intellect, says Aristotle, is perfected not by knowledge but by activity the end of philosophy therefore is not knowledge but the energy conversant about knowledge; so Richter: It is not the goal, but the course, which makes us happy: and Burke: In this pursuit, whether we take or whether we lose our game, whether we discover the truth, or lose it, or take an error for the truth the chase is certainly of service" (630).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0027 Issue 103 (April 1868) / Volume 27, Issue: 103, April 1868, pp. 217-239.

**Title:** The Present State of Philosophy by Shields, Charles W., Professor, D.D.

**Nature of reference:** Shields is very pro-Hamilton. He begins his article: "NOT to despair of philosophy, said Sir William Hamilton, with one of his apt quotations, is a last infirmity of noble minds. And certainly if ever a noble mind succeeded in conquering that infirmity, it was his own. No philosopher in modern times has striven so hard to set bounds to the cognitive instinct, or brought to the task such, transcendent powers. Other thinkers may have had their moments of skepticism or misgiving as to the attainment of absolute truth, and some may even have abandoned the pursuit, after long research, as hopeless; but what was in him, from the first, a constitutional tendency had become also a philosophical theory, and at length a religious creed. The discipline which he inculcated was that of a prudent nescience his goal for the intellectual career would be a learned ignorance; and over the very portal of revelation he wrote, as a flaming menace, the inscription, To the unknown God. Even from Philosophy herself he sought to wring stultifying testimonies, displaying the chance confessions of her disciples, in learned array, as but so many faggots for her funeral pyre. If nothing is left her but to die, it must be confessed that in these charming disquisitions she can find what Coleridge terms her euthanasy and apotheosis. But let us not be misunderstood. We yield to none in a just appreciation of the great Edinburgh philosopher. As a psychological thinker and scholar, we believe him to be without peer or rival in England or any other country. He might be well styled the modern Aristotle, were it not that he comes to us enriched with the spoils of all later schools of philosophy. Such keen, analytic power, such sustained abstraction, such grasp of logic upon the reins of fancy, and such absolute mastery of details and principles, combined with such captivating stores of learning, and expressed in a style at once so lucid, nervous, and elegant, never before met in one person; and if our hopes of the nature of philosophy depended upon a recurrence of precisely the same combination of powers and attainments, we might look for it in vain in any living author. Nor do we forget the noble use which was made of these endowments. No one now thinks of denying that the Philosophy of the Conditioned, viewed as a check upon the Philosophy of the Absolute, has had, and is still having, a most wholesome influence." (218)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0035 Issue 136 (July 1876) / Volume 35, Issue: 136, July 1876, pp. 440-467.

**Title:** Condillac and the Principle of Identity by Adams, Lyell, Mr.

**Nature of reference:** A footnote criticism of Hamilton's reading of Descartes.

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0018 Issue 69 (February 1860) / Volume 18, Issue: 69, February 1860, pp. 167-190.

**Title:** Sir William Hamilton's Lectures on Metaphysics.

**Nature of reference:** An article reviewing an American edition of Sir William Hamilton's Lectures On Metaphysics. "The Metaphysics of Hamilton is the crowning glory of Scotch philosophy. It fills up much that was wanting, and corrects much that was wrong; adorning it, moreover, with the refinements of scholarship. Nor do we regard this latter circumstance of small moment. Intimate acquaintance with the great masters of the world of thought, in case it does not overpower, polishes the mind, and imparts a certain

grace of manner to all that it does. The precise influence of a university education upon the tone of thinking cannot be completely expressed, because language has not words to describe all the minute and insensible effects which come from the daily contact of many minds engaged in liberal studies; yet it exists, and its presence is everywhere felt" (167).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0016 Issue 63 (August 1858) / Volume 16, Issue: 63, August 1858, pp. 540-575.

**Title:** Lewes's Biographical History of Philosophy.

Lewes's history of philosophy was one of his earlier works – later he was editor for the Fortnightly Review from 1865-7

**Nature of reference:** "We have the following luminous resume of Reid's philosophy: Reid's philosophy made a great stir at first, but has for some years past been sinking into merited neglect. The appeal to common sense as arbiter in philosophy is now pretty well understood to be on a par with Dr. Johnson's kicking a stone as a refutation of Berkeley. (619.) Hamilton has shown in the first supplementary dissertation on Reid, in his edition of Reid's collected works, that the greatest thinkers of every age have, directly or indirectly, recognized and accepted the principles of common sense. 1-us list of witnesses including the greatest names amounts to one hundred and six. The question is between Sir William Hamilton and Mr. Lewes. One has extraordinary acuteness and erudition, the other has neither" (570).

**Publication Info:** Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science and Art Volume 0007 Issue 40 (April 1856) / Volume 7, Issue: 40, April 1856, pp. 438-439.

**Title:** Editorial Notes - Literature: Mr. Tappan's Elements of Logic.

**Nature of reference:** "Every new writer seems to take a new view of it, or, at least, to controvert the views of all his predecessors. Is it, as Whately contends, to be restricted to the analysis and determination of the reasoning process only so far as it is a verbal operation? is it, as Sir William Hamilton maintains, the science of the formal laws of thought only? or does it, as Professor Tappan now declares more largely, comprise the laws which govern and determine all the activities of the reason. Reason itself being the sum of our intellectual faculties, or the total knowing substance?" (439)

## **Psychology and Philosophy of the Mind**

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0005 Issue 31 (May 1860) / Volume 5, Issue: 31, May 1860, pp. 513-526.

**Title:** Instinct.

**Nature of reference:** Hamilton is used as an authority figure, e.g. page 513 – a quote by Hamilton on perception. "We have the authority of Sir William Hamilton for saying that the highest function of the mind is nothing higher than comparison." (523)

**Publication Info:** The Century; a popular quarterly Volume 0036 Issue 3 (July 1888) / Volume 36, Issue: 3, July 1888, pp. 443-457.

**Title:** Dreams, Nightmare, and Somnambulism by Buckley, J. M.

**Nature of reference:** Briefly gives an account of Hamilton's views on dreaming and relates them to Watt and Newton and Baxter.

**Publication Info:** The Century; a popular quarterly Volume 0037 Issue 1 (Nov 1888) / Volume 37, Issue: 1, Nov 1888, pp. 71-80.

**Title:** The New Reformation by Abbott, Lyman.

**Nature of reference:** Article on psychology credits Hamilton - "Sir William Hamilton set an example of direct study of consciousness that modern psychology is carrying forward with valuable results." (72)

**Publication Info:** The Continental Monthly: devoted to literature and national policy Volume 0005 Issue 6 (June 1864) / Volume 5, Issue: 6, June 1864, pp. 690-691.

**Title:** The Unkind World.

**Nature of reference:** An article of the philosophy of mind places Hamilton in the tradition of Kant on the topic. (691, 2)

**Publication Info:** The Galaxy Volume 0021 Issue 5 (May 1876) / Volume 21, Issue: 5, May 1876, pp. 667-675.

**Title:** Phenomena of Sleep by Browne, Junius Henri.

**Nature of reference:** Passing reference to Hamilton's views on dreaming likening them to Leibniz and Spencer. (671)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0015 Issue 89 (October 1857) / Volume 15, Issue: 89, October 1857, pp. 692-698.

**Title:** Editor's Table: Editor's Table.

**Nature of reference:** In an editorial piece on mental philosophy the author states, "Thus Sir William Hamilton, the acutest analyst of Aristotle's mental processes..."(693)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0039 Issue 234 (November 1869) / Volume 39, Issue: 234, November 1869, pp. 920-925.

**Title:** Editor's Book Table.

**Nature of reference:** A brief book review of *The Principles of Psychology* by John Bascom, a professor at Williams College. It is noted that Bascom is a follower of the Intuitive school of mental philosophy and he critiques Sir William Hamilton for giving too much to the materialists. (291)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0036 Issue 451 (January 8, 1853) / Volume 36, Issue: 451, January 8, 1853, pp. 49-96.

**Title:** Homicidal Monomania.

**Nature of reference:** The article criticizes recent publications that denied the existence of Monomania. Hamilton is cited in the refutation: "This is purely a psychological error; for, as Sir William Hamilton has remarked, it should ever be remembered that the various mental energies are only possible in and through each other; and our psychological analysis does not suppose any real distinction of the operations we discriminate by different names." (88)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0037 Issue 464 (April 9, 1853) / Volume 37, Issue: 464, April 9, 1853, pp. 65-128.

**Title:** Sunday in the Nineteenth Century.

**Nature of reference:** Hamilton is cited for his arguments against phrenology making a distinction between head and brain which has “been heaved as a conclusive battering-ram against phrenology, by no less great a philosopher than Sir William Hamilton.” (69)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age.

**Title:** Body and Mind.

**Nature of reference:** An article on mental physiology reflecting of the ideas of Mr. Carpenter who bounced his ideas off of Sir William Hamilton: “But, in fact, as has been pointed out by Sir William Hamilton, these observations and this doctrine had, to a great extent, been anticipated by Leibnitz ...” (582)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0063 Issue 811 (December 10, 1859) / Volume 63, Issue: 811, December 10, 1859, pp. 641-704.

**Title:** Blindness.

**Nature of reference:** This article addresses blindness reflecting on the work of Dr. Bull, who published a book on the subject. Sir William Hamilton views on perception are brought in to the discussion in an authoritative way. “His assertion is partially confirmed by the high philosophical authority of Sir William Hamilton, who says that the observations of Platner on a person born blind would prove that sight not touch is the sense by which we principally obtain our knowledge of figure and out empirical knowledge of space.” (702)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0067 Issue 861 (December 1, 1860) / Volume 67, Issue: 861, December 1, 1860, pp. 513-576.

**Title:** Brain Difficulties.

**Nature of reference:** An article on psychical chorea – makes reference to Hamilton: “In these cases insanity seems to depend on a disordered state of coordinating power (eliminated in all probability in the cerebrum) and paralysis of what may be designated the executive, or to adopt the phraseology of Sir William Hamilton, regulative, or legislative faculties of the mind.” (539)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0117 Issue 1513 (June 7, 1873) / Volume 117, Issue: 1513, June 7, 1873, pp. 577-640.

**Title:** Maury on Dreaming (from *The Edinburgh Review*).

**Nature of reference:** A brief contrast of ideas. Maury believes dreaming is fringe to sleep and Hamilton believes “that no condition of sleep exists without dreaming.” (582)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0140 Issue 1812 (March 8, 1879) / Volume 140, Issue: 1812, March 8, 1879, pp. 577-640.

**Title:** Mental Physiology (from *The Edinburgh Review*).

**Nature of reference:** This article addresses various contributions to mental physiology and recognizes that Hamilton was the only British thinker to have noticed unconscious cerebration.

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0116 Issue 239 (April 1873) / Volume 116, Issue: 239, April 1873, pp. 245-310.

**Title:** Evolution of Self-Consciousness by Wright, Chauncey.

**Nature of reference:** “Yet these terms so applied do not retain any meanings. Subject is applicable to denote the ego, rather than the non-ego, only because it is the positive or more prominent term of the antithesis in its grammatical application, like active and passive. Sir William Hamilton undertakes, however, to assign them meanings in psychology by representing the object as that which is thought about, and the subject as that which thinks, or acts, or that in which the thought or action inheres. But this definition is given from the active subject's point of view, and not from the whole scope of the subject-attributes.” (413)

**Publication Info:** Scribner's Monthly, an illustrated magazine for the people Volume 0002 Issue 2 (June 1871) / Volume 2, Issue: 2, June 1871, pp. 211-214.

**Title:** Culture and Progress Abroad.

**Nature of reference:** “THERE are very few questions of psychology that can be referred to scientific experiment. One of these was broached by Sir William Hamilton, and has lately been subjected to experiment by W. S. Jevons. The question is, How many separate objects can the mind grasp at once, so as to apprehend their number without counting them? Sir William Hamilton says that if marbles are grouped together on the floor, one can, at the first glance, correctly estimate their number up to six or seven. A Mr. Jevons, wishing to test this conclusion, spent a day or two tossing a handful of beans into a small and very shallow box. The instant they came to rest he estimated the number that had happened to fall into the box, and then deliberately counted them. With the numbers three and four he made no mistakes; but of 107 cases in which five had fallen in the box, 5 were estimated too high. Of the cases in which six had fallen in, 18 per cent, were wrong; of seven, 44 per cent, and so on with a steadily increasing error until the number thirteen was reached, when more than half of the throws were wrongly estimated. It seems, then, that the number five is beyond the limit of perfect discrimination, and this is curiously confirmed by the fact that the mind refuses in music to accept as rhythm a division of the bar into more than four equal parts.” (214)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0042 Issue 177 (November 1883) / Volume 42, Issue: 177, November 1883, pp. 768-778.

**Title:** A Study of Cognition by Luse, Laura A., Miss.

**Nature of reference:** “In making an examination of any mental phenomena we are dependent upon the revelations of consciousness; it is desirable, therefore, at the outset, to determine what consciousness is, and what is the object of its activity. Since consciousness is in no way dependent upon sensation and sense-perception, it is a power of immediate knowing; since there is no recognition of the act of consciousness, it is, necessarily, a faculty of unconscious knowing; since it is the condition of experience, it must itself transcend experience. Sir William Hamilton denies that consciousness is a

cognitive power, but he denies this solely because making it a cognitive faculty, is to suppose that there is knowledge of which we are unconscious; and while he denies, he finds himself always compelled to speak of consciousness in cognitive terms; and this for the reason, that having separated from consciousness the idea of cognition, he found himself unable to attach any idea whatever to the word, save as it relates to the object of the mental act and not to the act itself.” (768)

## Religion

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0012 Issue 69 (July 1863) / Volume 12, Issue: 69, July 1863, pp. 116-126.

**Title:** Reviews and Literary Notices.

**Nature of reference:** A Review of Henry James's essay “Substance and Shadow: or Morality and Religion in their Relation to Life. An Essay on the Physics of Creation.” The reviewer argues that James refutes German and Scottish philosophies. In particular, he argues against Hamilton’s notion that we cannot know the infinite. This reviewer sees Hamilton's, Kant's and Mansel's views as not being compatible to a Christian epistemology.

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0026 Issue 153 (July 1870) / Volume 26, Issue: 153, July 1870, pp. 11-23.

**Title:** A Woman's Pulpit by Phelps, Elizabeth Stuart.

**Nature of reference:** Passing reference that she quoted Sir William Hamilton in her sermons as a way of showing her depth and scholarship. (19)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0018 Issue 108 (May 1859) / Volume 18, Issue: 108, May 1859, pp. 839-843.

**Title:** Editor's Table.

**Nature of reference:** In an editorial piece on the role of preachers, the author states that ministers are not in the pulpit to display abstract powers of the intellect – leave that to Kant and Sir William Hamilton.

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0019 Issue 113 (October 1859) / Volume 19, Issue: 113, October 1859, pp. 644-652.

**Title:** The Blind Preacher.

**Nature of reference:** In a chapter reprinted from William Henry Milburn’s book *Ten Years of a Preacher's Life*. Milburn states: “when I reached the regions of the subjective and objective, the me and the not me, and no doubt Sir William Hamilton would have been charmed could he have listened to my subtle distinctions between the reason and the understanding.” (647)

**Publication Info:** Harper's New Monthly Magazine Volume 0041 Issue 243 (August 1870) / Volume 41, Issue: 243, August 1870, pp. 458-464.

**Title:** Editor's Literary Record.

**Nature of reference:** A book review of *Christianity and Greek Philosophy* by Professor Crocker. The author's clarity in writing is compared to that of Sir William Hamilton. In addition, the article points out a similarity between Crocker's thoughts on the importance of understanding Greek philosophy and that of Sir William Hamilton. Such knowledge, "quickens instead of impedes his own independent thought-power." (460)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0210 Issue 2722 (September 5, 1896) / Volume 210, Issue: 2722, September 5, 1896, pp. 577-640.

**Title:** Thomas Henry Huxley.

**Nature of reference:** "Those who called them in question were regarded as being outside the pale. It will seem inevitable that one who differed so widely from him should think him (as I did) more ready to see the weaker side of theological positions far apart from his own, than to enter into their real strength. I accept, however, from this remark the works of Bishop Butler and Sir William Hamilton, with whose method he had much in common, though he rejected many of their conclusions." (581)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0216 Issue 2794 (Jan 22, 1898) / Volume 216, Issue: 2794, Jan 22, 1898, pp. 217-280.

**Title:** Some Reminiscences of Thomas Henry Huxley by George Mivart (from 19<sup>th</sup> Century).

**Nature of reference:** "In early life, as he told me, and has since told the world, he became captivated by the philosophical doctrines of the late Sir William Hamilton; and Hamilton and Mansel are mainly responsible for an agnosticism which is the logical outcome of their teaching and his mind was a very logical one." (247)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0099 Issue 205 (October 1864) / Volume 99, Issue: 205, October 1864, pp. 402-449.

**Title:** The Conditioned and the Unconditioned.

**Nature of reference:** This article looks at theological implications of Hamilton's theory of the conditioned.

"Yet that there is no little doubt as to its ultimate theological tendencies is evidenced by the conflicting appeals made to it by antagonistic schools of thought. Dogmatism is divided against itself as to the veritable drift of its tenets. One party declares that, since all speculative cognition of the Infinite and Absolute is proved impossible, man's carnal reason is humbled, deprived of all basis for heterodox conclusions, and compelled to acknowledge authority and faith as the final criteria of religious truth; while another party avers with equal emphasis that, by teaching the utter incomprehensibility of the Infinite, systematic theology throws suspicion on the capacity of man to receive a Divine revelation, and thereby invalidates its own revealed doctrines. Scepticism, in its turn, retorts that the entire structure of dogmatism rests on a transcendental foundation, and that religious indifferentism is the only logical consequence of the novel philosophy; nay, further, she maintains that, since it supposes truth to lie either at one or the other of two inconceivable poles of thought, while all the conceivable lies between them and coincides with neither, all human knowledge whatever, whether experience, science, philosophy, or religion, is demonstrated to be sheer illusion. Of the three, scepticism is incontrovertibly right." (403)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0100 Issue 206 (January 1865) / Volume 100, Issue: 206, January 1865, pp. 177-186.

**Title:** Natural Theology as a Positive Science.

**Nature of reference:** "Religion and Chemistry: or, Proofs of God's Plan in the Atmosphere and its Elements." Ten Lectures delivered at the Brooklyn Institute, Brooklyn, N. Y., on the Graham Foundation. By Josiah P. Cooke, Jm, Erving Professor of Chemistry and Mineralogy in Harvard University. In search for a psychological foundation for the argument from design the author states, "That intelligence stands first in the absolute order of existence, in other words, that final preceded efficient causes, and that the universe is governed by moral laws, are the two propositions, the proof of which, says Sir William Hamilton, is the proof of a God; and this proof establishes its foundation exclusively on the phenomena of mind." (182)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0101 Issue 209 (October 1865) / Volume 101, Issue: 209, October 1865, pp. 335-379.

**Title:** Faith and Science.

**Nature of reference:** This article see Hamilton on the skeptical side of the faith argument with Spencer and Mill: "The battle is now far more definitely urged than it has ever been before. Kant and Sir William Hamilton, having become the adopted philosophic sponsors of the sceptical cause, endow it with arms of superior temper to any it has yet wielded; while Cousin and his followers, who are now confessed champions of super-naturalism, impart to the opposite camp an unwonted intellectual grace and dignity" (336).

"From having once recognized infinite and finite, God and man, as substantive cognitions, it now recognizes Nature alone; and does not hesitate to avow by the voice of her bolder disciples, MM. Comte and Taine in France, Sir William Hamilton, Mr. Mansel, and Mr. Spencer in England, that neither infinite nor finite, neither absolute nor relative, have any reality to us, save as signs of our own mental imbecility; and hence that all legitimate inquiry restricts itself to the realm of Nature, the realm of the phenomenal or the indefinite" (339).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0150 Issue 402 (May 1890) / Volume 150, Issue: 402, May 1890, pp. 594-609.

**Title:** A Few Words on Colonel Ingersoll by Farrar, Frederic William, D.D., F.R.S.

**Nature of reference:** "Colonel says: Can the human mind imagine a beginningless being? and proceeds to show, not the contradiction, but the purely *a priori* assumption of improbability which arises from such a conception. Does he believe that there is such a thing as space? He will hardly be guilty of the absurdity of denying that he does. Well, but space is quite as impossible to conceive as God. Considered in itself, says Sir William Hamilton, space is positively inconceivable, either as absolute or as infinite. It is inconceivable as a whole, either infinitely bounded, or absolutely unbounded; it is unthinkable as a part, either infinitely divisible, or absolutely indivisible." (603)

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0156 Issue 436 (March 1893) / Volume 156, Issue: 436, March 1893, pp. 377-384.

**Title:** Notes and Comments: A reply to Amelie Rives. Amelie Rives, in her article Innocence Versus Ignorance.

**Nature of reference:** Rives states that her views on this subject are given in the line of Robert Browning: "Ignorance is not innocence but sin." (377)

"If, as Sir William Hamilton says, a presentation or representation tends to exclude its opposite from consciousness, the old theory that a young girl be kept ignorant of the wickedness of the world is based on a psychological fact." (379)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0141 Issue 1820 (May 3, 1879) / Volume 141, Issue: 1820, May 3, 1879, pp. 257-32.

**Author:** Phelps, Elizabeth Stuart.

**Nature of reference:** The author gives a passing remark about philosophical theology like that of Sir William Hamilton.

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0156 Issue 438 (May 1893) / Volume 156, Issue: 438, May 1893, pp. 567-576.

**Title:** Immortality and Agnosticism. I. "The Gates Ajar" - Twenty-five Years After.

**Nature of reference:** "The familiar proposition of Sir William Hamilton that God is of practical interest to us only as He is the condition of our immortality, can never be too often brought to our remembrance in any fair dealing with religio-philosophical problems" (569).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0015 Issue 59 (August 1857) / Volume 15, Issue: 59, August 1857, pp. 366-398.

**Title:** The Congregational Ministry of the Future.

**Nature of reference:** "...on the other hand, they have found in the critical works of German philologists, commentators and church historians, the most valuable helps to the exposition and defense of Christian doctrine. At the present time, the scepticism which most endangers the interests of piety, proceeds from such writers as Auguste Comte, from the reproduced Buddhism of the East, as served up by the followers of Swedenborg, and the more esthetic school of Emerson, and from the Sciologists of modern science. While on the side of truth, are set over against these, such writers as Sir William Hamilton, James McCosh, Henry Rogers, Peter Bayne and William Lee, together with the Brewsters, the Millers, and the great body of the really eminent men in the scientific world" (375).

**Publication Info:** Scribner's Monthly, an illustrated magazine for the people Volume 0015 Issue 5 (March 1878) / Volume 15, Issue: 5, March 1878, pp. 741-747.

**Title:** Culture and Progress.

**Nature of reference:** "In Part II., which treats of The Philosophical Theory of the Harmony of Science and Religion, we gain the nearest approach to the constructive portion of the work. Without giving so complete an analysis of this as of the first part, suffice it to say that, after maintaining philosophy as the umpire between science and religion, and reviewing the unsolved problems of both the physical and psychical sciences, our author proceeds to give a searching criticism of the positive philosophy or theory of Nescience, and the absolute philosophy or theory of omniscience; as he

concludes that neither science nor religion can furnish the adequate solution, but philosophy only, so he decides that neither the positive nor absolute philosophy of themselves will suffice. Not the former, for it would ignore that whole metaphysical region which is largely occupied by revelation; not the latter, because it would supersede religion throughout that region. Neither can we, he thinks, remain satisfied with the Prudent Nescience of Sir William Hamilton; he requires a final philosophy which shall furnish the logical conciliation of both absolutism and positivism; for, while the positivist becomes atheistical in religion, the absolutist becomes mystical in science. Both, he claims, are essential elements in the reconciliation, because both are deeply rooted in the human mind; and because they have always acted and reacted on each other logically adjusted and combined, they check and complete each other. This combination is the task of the final philosophy." (745)

**Publication Info:** Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science and Art Volume 0006 Issue 36 (December 1855) / Volume 6, Issue: 36, December 1855, pp. 658-659.

**Title:** American Literature and Reprints: God Revealed.

**Nature of reference:** "A great defect throughout is in not distinguishing, with sufficient clearness, the province of knowledge from the province of faith or belief. Admitting with Sir William Hamilton, and, indeed, the majority of modern thinkers, the mere relativity of all immediate knowledge, it yet argues the possession of knowledge which is not relative." (659)

**Publication Info:** Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science and Art Volume 0004 Issue 23 (November 1854) / Volume 4, Issue: 23, November 1854, pp. 517-532.

**Title:** American Despotisms.

**Nature of reference:** "But does this view do justice to the sacred word? Granting that its leading principles may be easily discerned, a thing difficult to grant in the face of two hundred conflicting sects, each of which finds its support and nutriment in the same pages; for, as Sir William Hamilton is fond of quoting, 'This is the book where each his dogma seeks, And this the book where each his dogma finds, we must still suppose, that a revelation from the Infinite will contain infinite resources of truth.'" (526)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0042 Issue 177 (November 1883) / Volume 42, Issue: 177, November 1883, pp. 751-768.

**Title:** The Christian Consciousness by Hurd, Philo R., Rev.

**Nature of reference:** "Sir William Hamilton, has somewhat enlarged the scope of consciousness in this direction. When our mental operations stand connected with sensible perceptions, it is now conceded that consciousness gives us the knowledge, not only of the fact of these operations and their contents, but also of the reality of the objects themselves about which these perceptions are employed." (753)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0055 Issue 258 (October 1891) / Volume 55, Issue: 258, October 1891, pp. 334-351.

**Title:** Enthusiasm for the Ministry by Gordon, Geo. A.

**Nature of reference:** “Great producers are not as a rule, great readers, and conversely, omniverous readers are lacking in creative power. John Stuart Mill, in accounting for the philosophic failures of Sir William Hamilton remarks that Hamilton gave so much of the strength of his mind to mere acquisition, that only a fraction of his intellectual power was left over for original work. The intellectual limitations of the ministry are obvious.” (339)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0042 Issue 173 (March 1883) / Volume 42, Issue: 173, March 1883, pp. 230-252.

**Title:** Recent Infidelity: Its Extent and Remedies by Harris, D. F., Rev.

**Nature of reference:** “In the Philosophy of Herbert Spencer, the Goliath of modern Nescience, we find the doctrine of the Unknown carried to its most radical extent. Admire as we must his philosophical acumen, his power of wide generalization, and his marvelous perseverance, his system of thought is directly antagonistic to the Christian faith. Since 1850 his views have undergone a decided change. At that time he published Social Statics; or, The Conditions of Human Happiness Specified, in which he postulates God's will as the basis of the rights and liberty of man. But subsequently accepting the Antinomies of Kant as modified and formulated in Sir William Hamilton's doctrine of the Conditioned, Mr. Spencer has promulgated his system of the Unknown, the Unthinkable. Arguing against Hamilton and Mansel, Spencer maintains that while we know The Infinite to exist we cannot know what that Infinite is: he says, To say that we cannot know the Absolute is, by implication, to affirm that there is an Absolute. In the very denial of our power to know what the Absolute is, there lies hidden the assumption that it is. The little comfort which the Theist derived from this concession is quickly nullified by the following: Differing so widely as they seem to do, the atheistic, pantheistic, and theistic hypotheses contain the same ultimate element. It is impossible to avoid making the assumption of self-existence somewhere; and whether that assumption to make nakedly or under complicated disguises, it is equally vicious, equally unthinkable” (241).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0024 Issue 93 (October 1865) / Volume 24, Issue: 93, October 1865, pp. 778-786.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: John Stuart Mill. Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy.

**Nature of reference:** “We are not disciples of Mr. Mill. We dissent from almost every one of his distinctive doctrines. We are amazed at the superficialness of some of his principles, and totally reject, with a sufficient degree of warmth, almost every application which he makes of them to moral and theological philosophy. But for all this, we are none the less sensible of the great value of his metaphysical writings.”

“Sir William Hamilton, notwithstanding his immense erudition, his vigor of thought, and his general acuteness, is by no means an invulnerable antagonist to a sharp-eyed and dexterous assailant. Indeed we do not know the writer of such deserved preeminence who is at once so inconsistent himself, and so sharp a critic upon the inconsistencies of other writers, as is Hamilton. His doctrine of causation seems like a hasty thought, such as might occur to a very erudite historian of philosophy, if suddenly called to propound a theory of his own under the necessity of preparing a first course of lectures. His doctrine of the unconditioned can only be accounted for by his overwhelming admiration for Kant, and a failure in that readiness to revise and correct unadvised conjectures.” (786)

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0025 Issue 94 (January 1866) / Volume 25, Issue: 94, January 1866, pp. 164-166.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: W. Smith. Concise Dictionary of the Bible.

**Nature of reference:** “In our last number, we noticed the publication by Mr. Spencer of the critiques of the Philosophy of Sir William Hamilton, by Mr. Mill. We have since received a collection of his Dissertations and Discussions previously issued by the same publisher in a similar style. We cannot commend too highly the beauty of all these volumes, nor the value of their contents. We have already disavowed our discipleship to his views and our aversion to the direction of his philosophy. But a knowledge of his opinions and a familiarity with his writings are almost a necessity to every well educated man” (166).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0040 Issue 161 (July 1881) / Volume 40, Issue: 161, July 1881, pp. 432-445.

**Title:** The Authority of Faith by Stevens, Geo. B., Rev.

**Nature of reference:** “Kant in his Critique attributes to reason the power of acting in two directions or relations. In one case reason is conversant with what we know; in the other, with what we ought to do. To reason in these two separate functions Kant gives the names speculative and practical respectively. The speculative reason cannot attain to the knowledge of the Divine Being, but the practical reason brings in the idea of God as the postulate of moral action which thus becomes a regulative principle in human life. Similar to this view is the theory of Sir William Hamilton and Dr. Mansel. They say that since God is infinite, he cannot be known, and yet they insist upon the necessity of belief in him. Hamilton’s language on this point is: When I deny that the Infinite can by us be known, I am far from denying that by us it is, must, and ought to be believed. This theory, as does also Kant’s which it resembles, seems to divide the soul against itself. It asserts a moral basis for faith, but denies to it the authority of the speculative reason. Indeed the speculative reason would make shipwreck of faith altogether, did not the practical moral reason hasten to the rescue. The outcome of this doctrine is, that faith, however well founded, has itself only a regulative and practical, not a speculative and theoretical application” (438-9).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0017 Issue 67 (August 1859) / Volume 17, Issue: 67, August 1859, pp. 601-618.

**Title:** The Limits of Religious Thought.

**Nature of reference:** “The doctrine of the conditioned is also not opposed, but supplemented, by philosophers like Dr. Hickok, who believe in the existence of a higher faculty of Reason, which, by an immediate intuition of the absolute, accomplishes what the Understanding vainly strives to do. Such a perception, it is maintained by Sir William Hamilton and Mr. Mansel, is subversive of thought itself; and is refuted by the arguments which prove the limits of the Understanding” (605).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0022 Issue 85 (October 1863) / Volume 22, Issue: 85, October 1863, pp. 692-729.

**Title:** Herbert Spencer on Ultimate Religious Ideas by Barnes, J. E., Rev.

**Nature of reference:** “Mr. Spencer does not appear to notice the precise language of Sir William Hamilton, in this strange passage of the criticism on Cousin (Discussions, p. 34, Am. ed.), which has puzzled more than one reviewer. Fully interpreted, it seems to us to contain other errors, besides the one here pointed out” (704).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0022 Issue 85 (October 1863) / Volume 22, Issue: 85, October 1863, pp. 837-839.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: Substance and Shadow: or Morality and Religion in their

**Nature of reference:** Relation to Lift. An Essay upon the Physics of Creation. By Henry James.

“Only a small portion of the volume consists of the discussion of his professedly main topic. The discussion seems rather to be used as a vehicle and a pretext for all manner of violent criticism upon the current theology and religion, if it be not rather savage vituperation and broad caricature. Mixed with this, is a long-continued and reiterated fusillade upon Kant, Sir William Hamilton, and Mansel. Viewed as a Satire the book is very clever and powerful” (838).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0028 Issue 106 (January 1869) / Volume 28, Issue: 106, January 1869, pp. 185-187.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: Symbolism; or, Exposition of the Doctrinal Differences between Catholics and Protestants, as evidenced by their symbolical writings. John Adam Mohler. Translated by James Burton Robertson.

**Nature of reference:** A rather harsh review of the Catholic author. With regard to The Holy Communion he says: “If any of our readers are curious to know how a learned Catholic Divine would defend the doctrine of Transubstantiation by the aid of Thomas Aquinas, Sir William Hamilton, and Dr. Mansel, we advise them to read this volume. The perusal of it will give the reader a far more correct, perhaps a more charitable view of the better class of the Romish clergy than generally prevails, without increasing his respect for the Sacramentarian system, or the church of which this system, in the doctrine of the Mass, is the chief corner stone.” (187) A footnote gives the reference for the above: “The Holy Communion. Its Philosophy, Theology, and Practice. By JOHN BERNARD IDALGAIRNS, Priest of the Oratory of St. Philip Neri. Third Edition. New York: The Catholic Publication House. 1868.”

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0028 Issue 109 (October 1869) / Volume 28, Issue: 109, October 1869, pp. 639-674.

**Title:** Plato's Conception of a Supreme Being by Douglass, S. J., Rev.

**Nature of reference:** “Sir William Hamilton makes this the test of a true notion of a God: It is not until the two attributes of intelligence and virtue, or holiness, are brought in, that the belief in a primary and omnipotent cause becomes the belief in a veritable Divinity” (668).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0028 Issue 109 (October 1869) / Volume 28, Issue: 109, October 1869, pp. 789-790.

**Title:** Notices of New Books: Studies in Philosophy and Theology. Joseph Haven.

**Nature of reference:** “Professor Haven, of the Chicago Theological Seminary, has gratified his pupils as well as his many friends, both lay and clerical, by republishing in a handsome volume the Articles published by him on different occasions, from 1849 to 1868.

The subjects discussed are: PART I. Studies in Philosophy: 1. Philosophy of Sir William Hamilton; 2. Mill versus Hamilton; 3. The Moral Faculty; 4. The Province of Imagination in Sacred Oratory; 5. The Ideal and the Actual. PART II. Studies in Theology: 1. Natural Theology; 2. The Doctrine of the Trinity; 3. Theology as a Science its Dignity and Value; 4. Place and Value of Miracles in the Christian System; 5. Sin, as related to Human Nature and the Divine Mind; 6. Arianism the Natural Development of the Views held by the Early Church Fathers.” (790)

**Publication Info:** *New Englander and Yale Review* Volume 0016 Issue 62 (May 1858) / Volume 16, Issue: 62, May 1858, pp. 373-407.

**Title:** Dr. Taylor and his System.

**Nature of reference:** “Hence, to know God, man must know himself. We must know what spirit is, from the study of the human mind and its attributes, in order to form any conception of an Infinite Spirit. President Edwards says expressly, If any respect to the Divine Being is of importance, then speculative points are of importance; for the only way whereby we know what he is, is by speculation. Sir William Hamilton says, If men are really to know aught else, the human faculties, by which alone this knowledge may be realized, must be studied for themselves, in their extent and in their limitations.” (382)

### **General References and Passing Remarks**

**Publication Info:** *The Atlantic Monthly* Volume 0012 Issue 71 (September 1863) / Volume 12, Issue: 71, September 1863, pp. 345-369.

**Title:** “Thomas De Quincey” by Alden, Henry.

**Nature of reference:** A passing comment about Hamilton – the author is under the false impression that Hamilton received his title for his work in philosophy. (349)

**Publication Info:** *The Atlantic Monthly* Volume 0056 Issue 337 (November 1885) / Volume 56, Issue: 337, November 1885, pp. 665-676.

**Title:** Principles of Criticism by Sill, E. R.

**Nature of reference:** On the topic of beauty gives Hamilton’s view as well as Herbert Spencer.

**Publication Info:** *The Century*; a popular quarterly Volume 0033 Issue 2 (Dec 1886) / Volume 33, Issue: 2, Dec 1886, pp. 215-237.

**Title:** *The Hundredth Man* by Stockton, Frank R.

**Nature of reference:** In a description of Chelsea the author quotes Thomas Carlyle’s description of that part of town where Carlyle resided with a minor reference to Hamilton. (233)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0058 Issue 741 (August 7, 1858) / Volume 58, Issue: 741, August 7, 1858, pp. 401-480.

**Title:** Buckel's History of Civilization in England.

**Nature of reference:** A footnote on page 469 states of Buckel's History: "such an array of citations was, perhaps, never before displayed, not even in the crowded of rural districts, therefore, is driven to be pages of the late Sir William Hamilton. Prefixed to this volume is a list of some five hundred authors quoted."

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0079 Issue 1021 (December 26, 1863) / Volume 79, Issue: 1021, December 26, 1863, pp. 577-616.

**Title:** Nursery Rhymes.

**Nature of reference:** The author, looking at the grammatical construction of some nursery rhymes, makes mention of the use of the universal quantifier. He references Hamilton and De Morgan: "Sounds a little too like a puzzle proper to a generation which has received the doctrine of the quantification of the predicate from Sir William Hamilton and Mr. De Morgan" (588).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0133 Issue 1721 (June 9, 1877) / Volume 133, Issue: 1721, June 9, 1877, pp. 577-640.

**Title:** Relation of Mind and Body (from *The Church Quarterly Review*).

**Nature of reference:** In looking at the mind/body theory of Dr. Carpenter, Hamilton is referenced: "We would not be understood to say that his views are universally accepted, but they seem to be substantially in agreement with those of Leibnitz, Sir William Hamilton, and other metaphysicians of note, and are such at least as cannot be summarily put aside" (591).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age

**Title:** The unity of Structure of Sensiferous Organs by Professor Huxley.

**Nature of reference:** "Even Sir William Hamilton, learned historian and acute critic as he was, not only failed to apprehend the philosophical bearing of long-established physiological truths; but, when he affirmed that there was no reason to deny that the mind feels at the finger points, and none to assert that the brain is the sole organ of thought, he showed that he had not apprehended the significance of the revolution commenced, two hundred years before his time by Descartes" (300).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0142 Issue 1840 (September 20, 1879) / Volume 142, Issue: 1840, September 20, 1879, pp. 705-768.

**Title:** Justice to William (from *Cornhill Magazine*).

**Nature of reference:** A tribute to those literary and historical figures who have made the name William famous or infamous. The list includes: "Davenant, Collins, Falconer, Wycherley, Shenstone, Somerville, and Wordsworth. Sir William Hamilton vouches for its philosophical reputation" (761).

**Publication Info:** The Manufacturer and Builder Volume 0009 Issue 6 (June 1877) / Volume 9, Issue: 6, June 1877, pp. 133-134.

**Title:** Mortality in Different Occupations.

**Nature of reference:** A reference to Herbert Spencer that he has reasoned out Sir William Hamilton's metaphysics. (134).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0080 Issue 167 (April 1855) / Volume 80, Issue: 167, April 1855, pp. 343-373.

**Title:** The Science of Politics.

**Nature of reference:** "But what do we mean by a science? The beautiful definition of Sir William Hamilton is adopted by Mr. Dove, and we know of none better. A science is a complement of cognitions, having in point of form the character of logical perfection, and in point of matter the character of real truth" (345).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0081 Issue 168 (July 1855) / Volume 81, Issue: 168, July 1855, pp. 159-194.

**Title:** The Persistence of Physical Laws.

**Nature of reference:** "Although Dr. Wayland has evidently perused with great care the philosophical writings of Sir William Hamilton, and loses no opportunity of testifying the profoundest admiration for his genius, we find in the present work fewer traces of the peculiar views of the latter than might have been expected."

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0097 Issue 200 (July 1863) / Volume 97, Issue: 200, July 1863, pp. 155-180.

**Title:** Leigh Hunt.

**Nature of reference:** In a review of Leigh Hunt's autobiography Hamilton is quoted: "minuteness in the description of the most trivial incidents of his childhood and youth is almost always interesting, but occasionally becomes undignified and irksome. It must be confessed that in this respect he puts himself in danger of falling under that description of weakness which Sir William Hamilton, in his *Metaphysics*, predicates of a vulgar mind, which, he says, forgets and spares nothing, and is ignorant that all which does not concur to the effect destroys or weakens it" (156).

**Publication Info:** New Englander and Yale Review Volume 0021 Issue 79 (April 1862) / Volume 21, Issue: 79, April 1862, pp. 324-341.

**Title:** Sketch of the Life of Professor William A. Larned by Woolsey, T. D., Rev.

**Nature of reference:** Larned was editor of the *New Englander* from 1854-5. Hamilton's *Lectures on Metaphysics* was reviewed by Larned.

## Education

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0019 Issue 114 (April 1867) / Volume 19, Issue: 114, April 1867, pp. 451-465.

**Title:** Considerations on University Reform by Fiske, John.

**Nature of reference:** Fiske argues for a program in the history of philosophy that connects the various systems to each other in a historical context. If such a program is unavailable he states that the university has Hamilton's works, "with their profound historical consciousness, the best attainable substitute" (457).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0065 Issue 831 (May 5, 1860) / Volume 65, Issue: 831, May 5, 1860, pp. 257-320.

**Title:** Student Life in Scotland.

**Nature of reference:** This article was a reprint from *The Cornhill Magazine* (*The Cornhill Magazine* [v 1 #3, March 1860] (257-384pp) [PSP]), a London Literary journal. The article highlights Hamilton's pedagogy giving examples of how he would engage the class in an open dialogue of material covered in class.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0105 Issue 1350 (April 16, 1870) / Volume 105, Issue: 1350, April 16, 1870, pp. 129-192.

**Title:** Mathematicians Under a Cloud.

**Nature of reference:** "The manner in which M. Leverrier and the late Auguste Comte, and M. Michel Chasles have lately come before the public, has some bearing on a controversy which was waged rather fiercely, nearly five-and-thirty years ago between Sir William Hamilton and Dr. Whewell, and which has lately been renewed by Mr. Mill in his examination of the Scotch philosopher's writings."

"The proposition, if we recollect aright, is found in Dean Aldrich, that some good logicians are bad mathematicians, was practically converted by Sir William Hamilton into the assertion that no mathematician was good for anything else" (166).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0185 Issue 2393 (May 10, 1890) / Volume 185, Issue: 2393, May 10, 1890, pp. 321-384.

**Title:** Scientific Conservatism by Bryce, James.

**Nature of reference:** "Sir William Hamilton went so far as to hold that mathematical studies positively disable men for reasoning well in probable matters. And the strangest error among the many errors which some of our men of science make, is in supposing that the Conservatism they profess and which is in many points a legitimate and reasonable Conservatism is identical with the Toryism which they support by their votes" (382).

**Publication Info:** *The North American Review* Volume 0076 Issue 158 (January 1853) / Volume 76, Issue: 158, January 1853, pp. 55-104.

**Title:** Sir W. Hamilton on Philosophy and Education.

**Nature of reference:** This piece is a long article that opens with an overview of Hamilton as a literary figure and a scholar. The author notes some of his controversies with Hare and De Morgan. The author frames a debate on skepticism in the Scottish school with Hume on the skeptical side and Reid's common sense philosophy on the other. Hamilton is seen as a thinker who elaborates Reid's views: "The substance of the argument is Reid's; the limitations of it, the nice distinctions which it involves, and the carefully guarded and precise manner in which it is stated, are Hamilton's" (64).

Next the author gives another overview of Hamilton's mental philosophy and then on to his view of educational reform. "But we cannot follow any farther Sir William Hamilton's plan of University Reform, especially as it goes much into detail, and this article is already extended to an unreasonable length. It is a satisfaction to find, that, in some of its principal features, this plan is a near approximation to the system actually

pursued in our American Colleges. With the unfortunate exception, that studies here are almost universally estimated according to the usefulness of the information acquired in them, and to the directness of their bearing upon the students' future pursuits in life, it may be said that our Colleges already occupy the position which the English Universities are striving to attain"(103).

**Publication Info:** *The North American Review* Volume 0080 Issue 166 (January 1855) / Volume 80, Issue: 166, January 1855, pp. 117-153.

**Title:** European and American Universities.

**Nature of reference:** "Severe and protracted toil either of mind or body is, at first, always irksome; and, with the undisciplined, is apt to produce discontent. Whilst mental effort, says Sir William Hamilton, is the one condition of all mental improvement, yet this effort is at first, and for a time, painful, as it abstracts from other and positively pleasurable activities" (136).

**Publication Info:** *The North American Review* Volume 0076 Issue 158 (January 1853) / Volume 76, Issue: 158, January 1853, pp. 124-166.

**Title:** Weber's Universal History.

**Nature of reference:** "Sir William Hamilton, whose authority as a philosophical thinker would be very high on a point of this sort, even if he had not been for many years Professor of History in the University of Edinburgh, decides this question in the negative, and offers several weighty reasons for his opinion. He argues that any knowledge which can only be derived from books, and can be obtained from them by mere perusal, without any strenuous exercise of thought, is peculiarly inappropriate for academical discipline" (129).

**Publication Info:** *The North American Review* Volume 0101 Issue 209 (October 1865) / Volume 101, Issue: 209, October 1865, pp. 515-528.

**Title:** English University Education.

**Nature of reference:** Hamilton is credited in a footnote as suggested reading: "Essay by Sir William Hamilton, On the State of the English Universities; and the excellent paper in the *National Review* whose title we have placed at the head of our article" (518).

**Publication Info:** *The North American Review* Volume 0104 Issue 215 (April 1867) / Volume 104, Issue: 215, April 1867, pp. 512-531.

**Title:** Deaf-Mute Education.

**Nature of reference:** This article contains four references to Hamilton: "It will not be amiss, therefore, even at the risk of repeating what was said in 1834, to notice the origin and the progress of Deaf-Mute Education on both sides of the ocean, particularly in regard to the method of articulation. As Sir William Hamilton has truly said, in this matter theory did not merely follow practice, it long prevented its application; and the deaf and dumb had actually been taught the use of speech before the philosophers would admit their capacity of instruction."

**Publication Info:** *New Englander and Yale Review* Volume 0015 Issue 60 (November 1857) / Volume 15, Issue: 60, November 185, pp. 574-603.

**Title:** The American Student in Germany.

**Nature of reference:** This article gives a passing reference to the German influence on British thinkers like Hamilton.

**Publication Info:** Scribner's Monthly, an illustrated magazine for the people Volume 0002 Issue 4 (Aug 1871) / Volume 2, Issue: 4, Aug 1871, pp. 337-353.

**Title:** What are they Doing at Vassar?

**Author:** McFarland, H. H.

**Nature of reference:** "The President of the College is of course its chief executive officer. He fills also the chair of Mental and Moral Philosophy. His text-books are Sir William Hamilton and Wayland's Moral Science, with lectures; and his instruction falls within the Senior Year" (348).

## **American Encounters with Hamilton**

**Publication Info:** The Atlantic Monthly Volume 0077 Issue 460 (February 1896) / Volume 77, Issue: 460, February 1896, pp. 173-186.

**Title:** Some Memories of Hawthorne by Lathrop, Rose Hawthorne.

**Nature of reference:** A personal reminiscence of an American that traveled to Scotland and met Hamilton. She states that Hamilton told her that Hawthorne's "*House of the Seven Gables* was more powerful in description than *The Scarlet Letter*." (183).

**Publication Info:** The Century; a popular quarterly Volume 0033 Issue 4 (Feb 1887) / Volume 33, Issue: 4, Feb 1887, pp. 646-650.

**Title:** James McCosh, President of Princeton College by Van Cleve, John.

**Nature of reference:** This publication gives a story that recounts McCosh and Hamilton meeting in 1830 during Hamilton's time as professor of Civil History. Hamilton's praise for McCosh's writings was influential in McCosh's honorary Masters Degree from the University of Edinburgh.

**Publication Info:** The Galaxy Volume 0005 Issue 2 (Feb 1868) / Volume 5, Issue: 2, Feb 1868, pp. 180-188.

**Title:** Reminiscences of Dr. Wayland by Stone, W. L.

**Nature of reference:** Dr. Wayland traveled across the Atlantic to meet with some leading educators. Among those interviewed was Sir William Hamilton. Wayland's educational philosophy was "of an advanced and liberal character" (184).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0136 Issue 1760 (March 9, 1878) / Volume 136, Issue: 1760, March 9, 1878, pp. 577-640.

**Title:** Charles Sumner (from *The Westminster Review*).

**Nature of reference:** Sumner was a United States Senator from the state of Massachusetts and was chairman of the committee on foreign relations during Lincoln's presidency. Sumner had traveled to Edinburgh in 1857 and met many of the leading literary figures of the day including Sir William Hamilton. Sumner said that Sir William

Hamilton he thought quite learned, but brusque and gauche (gauche) in manner (i., pp. 359561) (600).

## Authority and Scholarship

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0057 Issue 723 (April 3, 1858) / Volume 57, Issue: 723, April 3, 1858, pp. 1-80.

**Title:** Works of Dugald Stewart.

**Nature of reference:** A reprint from the Literary Gazette, which in turn was an excerpt from John Veitch's *Memoirs of Dugald Stewart*. In the opening pages of the Memoir Veitch praises the scholarship of his friend Sir William Hamilton (68).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0069 Issue 881 (April 20, 1861) / Volume 69, Issue: 881, April 20, 1861, pp. 129-192.

**Title:** Froude's History of England.

**Nature of reference:** Sir William Hamilton is listed among the great men of history: "Pusey, in theology; in philosophy, Hamilton; in engineering, Stephenson; in science, Airey and Sir William Hamilton; in political economy, Mill and Ricardo; in military history, Outram and Clyde" (175).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0083 Issue 1067 (Nov 12, 1864) / Volume 83, Issue: 1067, Nov 12, 1864, pp. 321-432.

**Title:** The Memoirs of Richard Whately.

**Nature of reference:** In contrast to Whately the article references Hamilton's scholarship, "but he neither astonished his teachers, as the late Sir William Hamilton did, by the extent and accuracy of his scholarship..." (325).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0083 Issue 1070 (Dec 3, 1864) / Volume 83, Issue: 1070, Dec 3, 1864, pp. 481-528.

**Title:** Life of Lockhart.

**Nature of reference:** In contrast to Lockhart the author states: "We had only one learned man in our (in those days) small college: I mean the late Sir William Hamilton. He was already pursuing those studies which ultimately gave him a high place among those who dwell in the higher regions of learned speculation." (488)  
Lockhart developed an interest in hunting and Hamilton convinced him to give it up. "He hunted frequently, besides becoming a member of a boat club, a much less perilous amusement. Sir William Hamilton observed this with regret; and partly through his own judicious counsel, partly by communicating in a wise and friendly manner with the young man's father, he succeeded in diverting Lockhart from pursuits that might have spoiled such a nature as his" (488).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0084 Issue 1077 (January 21, 1865) / Volume 84, Issue: 1077, January 21, 1865, pp. 97-144.

**Title:** Reminiscence of Edinburgh University by David Masson (Editor of *McMillan's Magazine*).

Mason speaks of the admiration for Professor Wilson that he witnessed from Sir William Hamilton. Mason thinks this admiration from such a thinker as Hamilton demonstrates an academic genius on the part of Wilson that seems to take a back seat to his athleticism and poetry. For Mason, if Hamilton respected another, rather a colleague like Wilson or a student, it counted as the bench mark approval of that person's strengths in logic and scholarship.

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0087 Issue 1118 (November 4, 1865) / Volume 87, Issue: 1118, November 4, 1865, pp. 193-240.

**Title:** The Literary Life of Isaac Taylor by Professor Fraser, University of Edinburgh.

**Nature of reference:** In discussion of Taylor's literary pursuits Fraser compares and contrasts Hamilton and Taylor in terms of their qualifications for the Chair of Logic at the University of Edinburgh. Fraser states, Sir William Hamilton, the greatest living master of the philosophical literature of the world..." (200).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0089 Issue 1151 (June 23, 1866) / Volume 89, Issue: 1151, June 23, 1866, pp. 769-832.

**Title:** Louis David.

**Nature of reference:** Passing remark on the influence Sir William Hamilton had of the Frenchman Louis David: "... by their profound studies of antiquity, to the new impulse, which was extended by the labours and researches of Mengs, Sir William Hamilton, D'Agincourt, Gessner, Canova, and others."

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0090 Issue 1159 (August 18, 1866) / Volume 90, Issue: 1159, August 18, 1866, pp. 385-448.

**Title:** The Minister Painter by Smith, Alexander.

**Nature of reference:** A reprint of the essay from *Argosy Magazine* Christmas Volume 1866 Smith discusses the contributions and influence of Scottish literature and ideas. He states (in reference to Mansel) that, "An English professor is the most distinguished disciple of the Scottish Sir William Hamilton; and the representative of a metropolitan constituency a Scot at least by extraction." (434)

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0103 Issue 1325 (October 23, 1869) / Volume 103, Issue: 1325, October 23, 1869, pp. 193-256.

**Title:** The Life of a Scotch Metaphysician.

**Nature of reference:** A review of Veitch's *Life of Sir William Hamilton*. The author criticizes Veitch for a lack of artistry. However, this review holds Hamilton in the highest regard: "Sir William Hamilton was a man of whom Scotland has every reason to be justly proud. But for him, she and indeed Britain would have been barren of deep philosophical speculation, probably even of much philosophical interest at a time when on the Continent great and earnest men were actively engaged in its researches. Thus Sir William Hamilton was remarkable inasmuch as he revived the study of philosophy proper in these islands..." (222).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0130 Issue 1679 (August 12, 1876) / Volume 130, Issue: 1679, August 12, 1876, pp. 385-448.

**Title:** Adam Smith As A Person (From *The Fortnightly Review*).

**Nature of reference:** In speaking of Adam Smith's Education while at Oxford the author compares Smith and Hamilton. "Very likely his erudition would not bear much comparison with what is now carried away from Balliol. If we compare him with a more recent Snell exhibitioner, Sir William Hamilton, we shall see that Greek teaching has enormously advanced in the time between them..." (389).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0061 Issue 129 (October 1845) / Volume 61, Issue: 129, October 1845, pp. 468-498.

**Title:** The British Critics.

**Nature of reference:** An article in praise of Hamilton: "The various disquisitions of Sir William Hamilton seem to have attracted but little attention on this side of the Atlantic, from the fact that they deal with subjects somewhat removed from popular taste and popular apprehension; yet it would be difficult to name any contributions to a Review, which display such a despotic command of all the resources of logic and metaphysics, as his articles in The Edinburgh Review on Cousin, Dr. Brown, and Bishop Whately. Apart from their scientific value, they should be read as specimens of intellectual power. They evince more intense strength of understanding than any other writings of the age and in the blended merits of their logic, rhetoric, and learning, they may challenge comparison with the best works of any British metaphysicians. He seems to have read every writer, ancient and modern, on logic and metaphysics, and is conversant with every philosophical theory, from the lowest form of materialism to the most abstract development of idealism; and yet his learning is not so remarkable as the thorough manner in which he has digested it, and the perfect command he has of all its stores. Everything that he comprehends, no matter how abstruse, he comprehends with the utmost clearness, and employs with the most consummate skill. He is altogether the best-trained reasoner on abstract subjects of his time. He is a most terrible adversary, because his logic is unalloyed by an atom of passion or prejudice; and nothing is more merciless than the intellect. No fallacy, or sophism, or half-proof, can escape his analysis, and he is pitiless in its exposure. His method is to strike directly at his object, and he accomplishes it in a few stern, brief sentences. His path is over the wreck of opinions which he demolishes as he goes. After he has decided a question, it seems to be at rest forever, for his rigorous logic leaves no room for controversy. He will not allow his adversary a single loophole for escape. He forces him back from one position to another, or trips up his most ingenious reasonings, and leaves him at the end naked and defenseless, mournfully gathering up the scattered fragments of his once symmetrical system. The article on Cousin's Course of philosophy, and that on Reid and Brown, are grand examples of this gladiatorial exercise of intellectual power. Hamilton is not only a great logician, but a great rhetorician. His matter is arranged with the utmost art; his style is a model of philosophical clearness, conciseness, and energy..."

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0083 Issue 173 (October 1856) / Volume 83, Issue: 173, October 1856, pp. 402-422.

**Title:** The Character of Franklin.

**Nature of reference:** “For the most forcible and concise writers of the present day in Great Britain are Dr. Whately, Sir William Hamilton, and Professor De Morgan, all of whom are best known, in this country at least, by their contributions to logic” (401).

**Publication Info:** The North American Review Volume 0087 Issue 180 (July 1858) / Volume 87, Issue: 180, July 1858, pp. 274-275.

**Title:** Critical Notices: Bayne's Essays.

**Nature of reference:** “The closing paper is an able, elaborate, and successful defense of Hugh Miller's Testimony of the Rocks against the attack upon it in the *North British Review*. The Essays in the volume are eleven in number; all on subjects of enduring interest and no one of them can fail to add to the author's permanent reputation. We are glad to find a preliminary notice of the author's personal history, from which his mind was formed under the influence of Sir William Hamilton”(274).

**Publication Info:** The Living Age Volume 0095 Issue 1229 (December 21, 1867) / Volume 95, Issue: 1229, December 21, 1867, pp. 705-768.

**Title:** Satirist of the Reformation.

**Nature of reference:** **Nature of reference:** This article is a reprint of a work that was published by Teubner of Leipsic in 1858. It quotes Hamilton on three occasions: “The fate of this celebrated satire (the great national satire of Germany, as Sir William Hamilton has called it) in our own literature has been curious. Whenever it has not been overlooked.” “Our other English humorists seem generally to have passed them over; and it was reserved for Sir William Hamilton, whose mighty erudition embraced literature and philosophy play indifferently; to do them full justice in *The Edinburgh Review* for March 1831”.

“The controversy immediately assumed European importance. Not only in Germany, says Sir William Hamilton, but in Italy, France, and England, a confederation was organized between the friends of humane learning” (710).

## **Publications of James McCosh**

Because of the importance I attribute to James McCosh's literary production in Chapter Five, I offer the following annotated time line of publications.

*The Scottish philosophy, biographical, expository, critical, from Hutcheson to Hamilton* had 41 editions published between 1874 and 2009 in English, and were held by 629 libraries worldwide.

*The method of the divine government, physical and moral.* This publication ran 65 editions published between 1850 and 2009 in English, and are held by 391 libraries worldwide "This book explores the philosophical issue of the influence of the divine within the physical world. Presented in four books, the text presents God concepts, laws of nature and the relationship of humans to God, principles of the human mind through which God governs mankind, and religion." (PsycINFO Database Record (c) 2008).

*The intuitions of the mind inductively investigated* . There were 53 editions published between 1860 and 2006 in English, and are held by 391 libraries worldwide: "According

to one class of speculators, the mind derives all its knowledge, judgments, maxims, from observation and experience. According to another class of thinkers, there are ideas, truths, principles, which originate in the native power, and are seen in the inward light of the mind. These last have been called by a great number of names, such as innate ideas, intuitions, necessary judgments, fundamental laws of belief, principles of common sense, first or primitive truths; and diverse have been the accounts given of them, and the uses to which they have been turned. This is a controversy which has been from the beginning, and which is ever being renewed in one form or other. It appears to me that this contest is now, and has ever been, characterized by an immense complication of confusion; and confusion, as Bacon has remarked, is more difficult to rectify than open error. I am not, in this treatise, to plunge at once into a thicket, in which so many have lost themselves as they sought to find or cut a way through it. But my aim throughout is to ascertain what are the actual laws or principles in the mind denoted by these various phrases, what is their mode of operation, what the rule which they follow, and the purpose which they are competent to serve" (PsycINFO Database Record (c) 2010).

*The Religious Aspect of Evolution* ran twenty-one editions were published between 1888 and 1976 in English, and are held by 377 libraries worldwide.

*An Examination of Mr. J.S. Mill's Philosophy: Being a Defense of Fundamental Truth.* There were 31 editions published between 1866 and 1981 in English, and are held by 347 libraries worldwide. "The author's aim in this work is to defend a portion of primary truth which has been assailed by John Stuart Mill, an acute thinker who has extensive influence in England. The author attempts to expose the inconsistencies, the misunderstandings, and mistakes to be found in Mr. Mill's *Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy* or any of his other works. This author argues that Hamilton was the ablest and most learned defender of intuitive or a priori truth in our country in the past age. Mill, however, attacks this idea and advances deductive empiricism. In this book, the author provides a critique of Mill's philosophy and defends the idea of a fundamental, intuitive truth"--Introduction. (PsycINFO Database Record (c) 2010).

*The Supernatural in Relation to the Natural.* A total of 20 editions published between 1862 and 2009 in English, and are held by 335 libraries worldwide.

*Typical Forms and Special Ends in Creation* had 42 editions published between 1856 and 1881 in English, and are held by 322 libraries worldwide. "The principles now folly explained and illustrated in this work were first brought before the public in an article on Typical Forms by Dr. McCosh in the "North British Review" for August, 1851. The article in the "North British" on Typical Forms is a vigorous contribution to this middle department of theology, which, like a central area left unbuilt in a street after the completion of the erections on both sides, seems so necessary to the union of the contiguous fabrics, and to the design of the whole; and all that its perusal leaves us to regret is, that its accomplished author, in whom the reader will, we believe, recognize a most original thinker-a man already well known in the ethical field, both in our own country and America-should not have expanded it into a volume. But in the special field which he has chosen he need not greatly fear a competitor. The subject is one, too, on

which thought ripens slowly; for, like the agricultural produce of a new colony, it has all to be raised from the seed; and the deeply interesting, but comparatively brief article of the reviewer, will, we cannot doubt, be yet expanded into a separate treatise, which will prove none the less fresh, and all the more solid, from the circumstance that it should have appeared as an article first". (PsycINFO Database Record (c) 2010).

*Psychology: The Cognitive Powers* . Running into the 21<sup>st</sup> century there were 41 editions published between 1886 and 2009. This book "explores cognitive functions in psychology. The book is divided into 3 sections, each examining a different cognitive process. The first section examines simple cognitive or presentative powers. It is argued that these are so called because they give knowledge in its simplest form (in the singular and concrete) and because the objects are now present and presented. Sense perception and self consciousness are discussed. The second section refers to the reproductive or representative powers, which include retention, fantasy, and association of ideas, recognitive power, the power of composition, and the symbolic power. The last section involves comparative powers, defined as the mental power which notices the relations of objects and binds them in apprehension. Relations are classified (relation of identity and difference, whole and parts, resemblance, space, time, quantity, active power, and cause and effect), and discursive operations and intuition in the discovery of relations are discussed"--Publisher (PsycINFO Database Record (c) 2005).

*Realistic philosophy defended in a philosophic series*, for 24 editions published between 1887 and 1977 in English, and are held by 287 libraries worldwide

*Christianity and Positivism: a series of lectures to the times on natural theology and apologetics, delivered in New York, Jan. 16 to March 20, 1871, on the "Ely foundation" of the Union Theological Seminary.*

James McCosh was a prolific author during a very difficult time in American History. His guidance as a teacher and an administrator contributed to the reconstruction of a torn nation. McCosh's writings, grounded in the philosophy of Sir William Hamilton, help perpetuate a legacy of the Scottish enlightenment through the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century.

From the sampling of American books and periodicals above we see Sir William Hamilton enjoyed a warm and well-represented literary presence in nineteenth century American Literature. All of his major publications were either sold in America where he was represented by his agent Dr. Brown, or were reprinted by American publishers (see

*The Living Age* Volume 0078 Issue 1003 August 22, 1863). To some extent Hamilton's ideas sparked an entire industry in Hamiltonian philosophy where American philosophers such as Francis Bowen, Noah Porter and James McCosh framed their careers in making commentary on the famous thinker from Edinburgh.

During the mid-nineteenth century American periodicals were coming into their own and Hamilton was well represented in a wide variety of disciplines. In the previous catalogue on Sir William Hamilton and American periodicals I broke down Hamilton's representation into several categories. Initially I did this ordering to facilitate my research; however, on reflection, there are some interesting trends to note.

The first section is a collection of journals that were biographical material. Out of the 205 periodicals sampled 28 focused on biographical material that included Sir William Hamilton. Not all of the articles focused solely on Hamilton. Other members of the Edinburgh literary scene were of interest to the American audience. Noted professors and authors such as John Wilson and Thomas Carlyle were featured in these articles as well. So almost 14 percent of the articles surveyed were strongly biographical. So to some extent the American readership was not only interested in the ideas coming out of Scotland but also in the lives of those contributors.

Another category I chose collects literary announcements and reviews. Again out of the 205 journals surveyed 43 of them carried a literary announcement or book review that addressed the work of Sir William Hamilton. This number does not include advertisements for books but literary content that addressed new publications that were coming out. As mentioned in Chapter Five, advertisements for Hamilton's work or the work of others focused on Sir William Hamilton were abundant and can be found in a

wide array of publications – from fiction to adventure and travel books to religious works. Many of the book reviews are lengthy articles that go into technical aspects of philosophy or psychology.

By far the largest category of journal articles focus on philosophy and literature. Sir William Hamilton was noted for many things but first among them he was a renowned metaphysician. From the 1850s until the time of his death Sir William Hamilton was virtually an industry in American academies. In this sampling 60 out of the 205 journals carried articles that focused on Hamilton’s philosophy. However, most of the book reviews did as well and the distinction between philosophy and psychology was blurry at best. In addition, the attention Hamilton received from those interested in religion was not for his exegesis of the Bible but rather for his concern with his application of his philosophy in the metaphysics of Christianity. So where I have compartmentalized Hamilton’s reception in American journals we should not lose sight of the significance of Hamilton as a philosopher. It is also interesting to note the comparisons American authors were making in the field of philosophy. Hamilton was often compared and contrasted with Herbert Spencer and Immanuel Kant.

The nineteenth century saw psychology, as we know it, emerge out of philosophy and natural science. This is where one can really pinpoint a particular person or date when psychology became a distinct field of inquiry, as the use of the term “psychology” was becoming commonplace in scholarly works during Hamilton’s time. Hamilton’s interest in debunking phrenology, as well as ideas on memory, perception and consciousness had American scholars addressing his work within the emerging realm of psychology. Only seventeen of the two hundred and five journals surveyed were utilizing

Hamilton in the name of psychology which is only slightly more than seven percent. However, only one periodical was explicitly psychology based – *The Journal of Insanity*. What is interesting about the presence of Hamilton in American journal articles on psychology is that he is absent from most contemporary accounts of the history of psychology in America.

Sir William Hamilton's epistemology and metaphysics were of keen interest to nineteenth century American religious thinkers. There was a growing tug-of-war between religion and science, a cultural battle that would go on in the United States arguably until the mid-twentieth century. (It was not until the USSR launched Sputnik into space that American schools began to rethink their science programs. For example, the theory of evolution finally made its way into biology textbooks at that time.) Sir William Hamilton's standing as one of the most knowledgeable and authoritative academics in the world had both sides of this debate wanting to add credibility to their position by using his ideas to anchor their position. 30 articles in our sampling directly deal with Hamilton and the implications of his ideas to the Christian faith.

Sir William Hamilton was such an authoritative reference that I found 12 different articles that were on a variety of topics that made use of a quick quote from Hamilton. It almost appears that if one could quote Hamilton it was a sign of modernity and being well read. In like manner, roughly seven percent of the periodicals ran articles simply in praise of Hamilton's high esteem, thus reinforcing the idea that he was one of the most important and influential thinkers of the time. Perhaps due to Hamilton's academic celebrity status, high profile Americans travelling to the United Kingdom, such as Harriet Beecher Stowe, would visit the famous philosopher while in Edinburgh. Whereas Stowe

included her visit to Sir William Hamilton in a book she wrote, a few other accounts of these meetings were documented in American journals. The philosophy of Sir William Hamilton was the staple of the philosophy curriculum in many leading American universities and Hamilton's influence on leading faculties has been discussed in Chapter Five. In addition, Hamilton's educational philosophy concerning math, and even his ideas on the status of students as intrinsically valuable, were being discussed in periodicals of the time. In this sampling a little over five percent of the articles on Hamilton focused on general education.

## Conclusion

There are several different angles from which to look at this thesis – several different morals to the story so-to-speak. In one sense, this study offers another chapter for the annals of the University of Glasgow--a chapter where one of the institution's most gifted teachers, George Jardine, skillfully contributed to the grooming of what became one of the most famous scholars in the world, Sir William Hamilton.<sup>1</sup> Whereas Hamilton may be often associated with the University of Edinburgh, his academic roots are deep in the Glaswegian tradition. In addition, despite seeming to be under-represented in the history of ideas, the University of Glasgow has played a crucial role in the formation of American ideas on education, religion and philosophy throughout the nineteenth century.

In another sense, from a biographical angle, Chapter Two of this thesis offers up the most complete account of the life of George Jardine to date, and this biography lays the foundation for a more comprehensive look at Jardine's legacy in the future. As for Sir William Hamilton's biographical account, it was well known that he had a literary presence in the United States. However, what had been previously overlooked by other historians was the extent of Hamilton's connections to America through his family, and friends. Furthermore, I have shown that Hamilton formed important relationships and

---

<sup>1</sup> Phillipson makes the (infamous) claim that “there is an important sense in which the history of the Scottish Enlightenment is the history of Edinburgh”. Phillipson, Nicholas (1973) ‘Towards a Definition of the Scottish Enlightenment’, in *City and Society in the Eighteenth-century*, edited by Fritz and Williams, (Toronto: Hakkert, 1973), 147. For further reading on the Enlightenment in Glasgow and Aberdeen see Jennifer Carter and Joan Pittock (eds.), *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment*, Aberdeen University Press, 1992; Paul Wood, *The Aberdeen Enlightenment*, Aberdeen University Press, 1993; Andrew Hook and Richard Sher (eds.), *The Glasgow Enlightenment*, Edinburgh: Tuckwell Press, 1995.

liaisons with eminent Americans at a high level since he was just one voice removed from several American Presidents.

Another contribution of this thesis centres on the literary reception of Jardine and Hamilton in America, which is why I have compiled a catalogue of hundreds of books and periodicals that illustrate where and how these two thinkers were represented in American print. One of the outcomes of this cataloguing process is that the listings reveal that the contrary views of Winifred Bryan Horner and Arthur Herman on Jardine's literary reception in America have both missed the mark. For example, Horner stated "during the nineteenth century, he [Jardine] had little influence beyond his own university", and "Jardine was largely ignored after his lifetime. Horner continued, "nor did the work of Jardine influence American composition. Unfortunately, his work found no ear in the United States".<sup>2</sup> Arthur Herman made virtually the opposite claim: "Jardine's *Outlines of a Philosophical Education, Illustrated by the Method of Teaching Logic at the University of Glasgow* became one of the most popular textbooks in American higher education".<sup>3</sup> The evidence I present in the catalogues demonstrate that Jardine's *Outlines* was not one of the most popular textbooks in America, but selected chapters were serialized in *The Academician* and circulated to a limited, though perhaps passionate and influential, number of educational specialists. In addition, unlike Horner's claims, we see Jardine's work was represented and utilized in American pedagogy, even fifty years after his passing. Perhaps the most significant and lasting contributions of

---

<sup>2</sup> Horner, Winifred (1993). *Nineteenth-Century Scottish Rhetoric: The American Connection*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 179.

<sup>3</sup> Herman, Arthur (2001). *How the Scots Invented the Modern World: The True Story of How Western Europe's Poorest Nation Created Our World & Everything in It*. New York: Broadway; 391.

George Jardine are found in how his former students wove his ideas on education and critical thinking into American educational philosophy.<sup>4</sup>

The sampling of books and periodicals on Sir William Hamilton confirms the claim of Noah Porter, that Hamilton had a strong literary presence in the United States. What has emerged out of my study is the breadth of that reception. Sir William Hamilton was more than just a philosopher to Americans; he was a literary celebrity and an intellectual icon. Americans were interested in his life and associations. Hamilton was an authoritative voice for American authors to quote, and American audiences looked to him for innovations in psychology, education, philosophy and religion.

From a different perspective, this study provides a lens by which we might examine the details of an American angle on what some historians have seen as the demise of Scottish philosophy. An article in *The North American Review* framed the death of modern philosophy: “She certainly died hard, if Sir William Hamilton was energized by her death-throes, and if Ferrier’s brilliant, vivacious *Institutes of Metaphysics* were her last words”.<sup>5</sup> Clearly, Scottish thinkers had been very influential in

---

<sup>4</sup> For further discussion, see Chapter Three of this study. Looking beyond Scotland and America, there is evidence that Jardine’s students continued the Scottish educational tradition abroad. Linda Ferreira-Buckley’s research has shown that English Universities in the first half of the 19<sup>th</sup> century found “philosophical underpinnings of the curriculum and many of the concrete exercises” in the work of Jardine and other Scottish theorists. (Ferreira-Buckley, Linda (1997), “‘Scotch’ Knowledge and the Formation of Rhetorical Studies”. *Scottish Rhetoric and Its Influence*. Ed. Lynée Lewis Gaillet. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 174). Looking further south in the Empire, John Muir, a student of Jardine, became an educator in India. He employed Jardine’s pedagogical methods in his teaching of Sanskrit. Also in India, Alexander Duff, who established the Free Church in Calcutta, was influenced by Jardine. See Avril Ann Powell (2010), *Scottish Orientalists and India: The Muir Brothers, Religion, Education and Empire*. Boydell & Brewer, 2010.

<sup>5</sup> Bayne, Peter (1857). “Essays in Biography and Criticism”. *The North American Review*, Volume 0085 Issue 177 October 1857, 571.

America throughout the enlightenment period into the first half of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, then by many accounts, seemed to disappear as German philosophy grew in favour. For instance, an 1852 article in the American journal *The Living Age* noted: “It was by the Scottish mind in fact, that modern philosophy was conducted to that point where Kant and the Germans took it up”.<sup>6</sup> By the middle of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the American philosophical readership was well aware of the role and contribution of Scottish thinkers, yet they knew there was a paradigm shift taking place within philosophy.

The obvious champion of Scottish philosophy in antebellum America was Sir William Hamilton. During his lifetime he was the undisputed authority of metaphysics and epistemology. As discussed in Chapter Five, Hamilton was the mainstay of philosophy courses in the rapidly growing population of colleges and universities in the United States. Though Hamilton’s philosophy was the prominent school of thought in American colleges, he was also responsible for introducing the ideas of Immanuel Kant to that eager readership. That some American readers deemed Sir William Hamilton something of a Kantian thinker is evident in this quote from *Scribner’s Monthly*: “Sir William Hamilton largely neutralized his own refutation of Kant’s system by the extravagant concessions he made to it”.<sup>7</sup> From an American perspective then, Sir William Hamilton was the missing link in the evolution of modern philosophy. In an 1862 lecture at Williams College, Mark Hopkins described the connection: “The great modern movement in speculative philosophy, inaugurated in Scotland by Reid, and producing there, as its best fruit, the vigorous, learned, and to a great extent original discussions of

---

<sup>6</sup> Lord Cockburn (1852) “Life of Lord Jeffrey; with a Selection from his Correspondence”. *The Living Age*, Volume 0035 Issue 437; 2, October 1852, 5.

<sup>7</sup> Atwater, Lyman (1874). “Dr. Blauvelt's Novum Organum”. *Scribner’s Monthly*, Volume 0007 Issue 4 February 1874, 478-483.

Sir William Hamilton, contemporaneously revealing itself in Germany by Kant”<sup>8</sup> In America, the philosophy of Kant and subsequent German thinkers would become the next dominant school of philosophy after the Civil War. There were many contributing factors to a diminishing role of Scottish philosophy in the United States, such as the changing demographics with the influx of German immigration as well as educational reforms based on the German university structure. However, philosophically, it was the Scottish school via Sir William Hamilton that introduced its own replacement – but only partially so.

Inasmuch as Kant’s philosophy somewhat frames and initiates German philosophy, there is a strong sense in which Kant was entering a debate within Scottish philosophy. Kant was acquainted with Scottish thinkers and incorporated them into his lectures. Michael Rohlf states:

Kant used textbooks by Wolffian authors such as Alexander Gottlieb Baumgarten (1714–1762) and Georg Friedrich Meier (1718–1777), but he followed them loosely and used them to structure his own reflections, which drew on a wide range of ideas of contemporary interest. These ideas often stemmed from British sentimentalist philosophers such as David Hume (1711–1776) and Francis Hutcheson (1694–1747), some of whose texts were translated into German in the mid-1750’s<sup>9</sup>

Kant famously identified Hume’s role in shaping his philosophy: “I openly confess, the suggestion of David Hume was the very thing, which many years ago first interrupted my

---

<sup>8</sup> “Hopkins’s Moral Science,” *The North American Review* Vol 0096 Issue 199, April 1863, 380-407.

<sup>9</sup> Rohlf, Michael (2010), “Immanuel Kant”. *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

dogmatic slumber, and gave my investigations in the field of speculative philosophy quite a new direction”.<sup>10</sup> A page earlier in the *Prolegomena*, Kant expresses his dissatisfaction with Hume’s critics:

But Hume suffered the usual misfortune of metaphysicians, of not being understood. It is positively painful to see how utterly his opponents, Reid, Oswald, Beattie, and lastly Priestley, missed the point of the problem; for while they were ever taking for granted that which he doubted, and demonstrating with zeal and often with impudence that which he never thought of doubting, they so misconstrued his valuable suggestion that everything remained in its old condition, as if nothing had happened”.<sup>11</sup>

Kant and Reid had a shared goal in answering Hume’s skepticism.<sup>12</sup> They agreed on the problem, but differed on their respective solutions.<sup>13</sup> One main point of departure for Kant was that the Common Sense school missed the positive contributions made by Hume. Yet, there are similarities between Reid’s appeal to common sense against skepticism, and Kant’s transcendental deduction. T.J. Sutton has noted that Reid’s arguments for the necessity of first principles resembles Kant’s arguments for transcendental idealism.<sup>14</sup>

Sir William Hamilton saw enough affinity between Reid and Kant to weave the German thinker into his own philosophy. The idealism that followed out of Kant’s

---

<sup>10</sup> Kant, Immanuel (1911), *Prolegomena* the *Akademie* edition, vol. IV, Berlin, 160.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid.*, 159.

<sup>12</sup> Ameriks, Karl (2005). “A Commonsense Kant?” *Proceedings and Addresses of the American Philosophical Association* 79, no. 2, 19-45.

<sup>13</sup> See Ronald E. Beanblossom’s “Kant’s Quarrel with Reid: The Role of Metaphysics” *History of Philosophy Quarterly* Vol. 5, No. 1 (Jan., 1988), 53-62.

<sup>14</sup> See T. J. Sutton, “The Scottish Kant?” *The Philosophy of Thomas Reid Philosophical Studies Series*, Vol 42 (1989), 159-192.

philosophy also resided within Reid and Hamilton.<sup>15</sup> So, to some extent, the idea that German idealism replaced Scottish philosophy seems to skim over the top of the connections between Reid, Kant and Sir William Hamilton.<sup>16</sup> In addition, this perspective ignores ongoing Scottish contribution to idealism. Scottish idealists such as Edward Caird, William Ker, Andrew Seth Pringle-Pattison, Henry Jones, William Mitchell, David George Richie, and Richard Haldane, collectively made serious philosophical contributors through the Victorian era into the 20<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>17</sup> In addition, Sir William Hamilton's students and followers in the United States continued to hold important professorships and produce philosophical literature through out the 19<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>18</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> This point was missed by James McCosh. He was a staunch defender of Sir William Hamilton, but saw the Scottish idealist as breaking with their Scottish tradition. So for McCosh, the shift towards idealism made Hamilton, or himself, the last of its kind. See McCosh, James. (1875) *The Scottish Philosophy, Biographical, Expository, Critical, from Hutcheson to Hamilton*, MacMillan and Co., London. An anonymous reviewer of McCosh's book called his distinction of "The Scottish Philosophy into question. "The term, Scottish Philosophy, is somewhat doubtful and elastic in its signification. It is more usually applied to a particular type of philosophy, viz.: that initiated and formulated by Dr. Thomas Reid, and conceived to have been developed, emended, and perfected by Sir William Hamilton. Though such a philosophy in the strict sense of the term, does not exist, except in the fancies of ill-informed critics, it is nevertheless true, that a certain mode of conducting speculative and psychological inquiries is common to those who are usually called Scottish Philosophers". Anonymous (1875). Culture and Progress: Culture and Progress - The Scottish Philosophy. *Scribner's Monthly, an illustrated magazine for the people* Volume 0009 Issue 4 (February 1875) / Volume 9, Issue: 4; 508-514.

<sup>16</sup> Andrew Seth Pringle-Pattison had compared and contrasted the Scottish and German responses to Hume in the 1880s. Seth, Andrew (1885). *Scottish Philosophy: A Comparison of the Scottish and German Answers to Hume* (third edition), Blackwood, Edinburgh and London.

<sup>17</sup> See David Boucher (2004). *The Scottish Idealists Selected Philosophical Writings*. UK: Imprint Academic.

<sup>18</sup> In some sense, the demise of Scottish philosophy may be rooted more in a perspective, promoted by James McCosh that tends to see the Common Sense school as the only distinctively Scottish philosophy. However, the Common Sense school was reacting to the skepticism of Hume and the materialism of Smith. Hume and Scottish thinkers in that formative period of the Scottish Enlightenment, were in part, investigating and reacting to the idealism of George Berkeley as witnessed in very first sentence of Hume's *Treatise of*

George Jardine's legacy of students is highlighted especially when I review the accomplishments of Robert Crichton Wyllie in the Kingdom of Hawaii.<sup>19</sup> Wyllie was the second son of a farmer in Dunlop who attended a parish school, and was recognised as being particularly bright. Wyllie attended Glasgow University where he received a philosophical education and went on to become wealthy, and a high-ranking government official. Wyllie's story indicates the potential to increase our understanding of many of the claims made about nineteenth century Scottish education and social mobility. For instance, had Wyllie remained in Scotland and been as successful as he was abroad, he would be a classic example of a "lad-of-parts", as described by George Davie and others. Nicholas Han's study on the lads-of-parts phenomenon focused on prominent Scots, and as R.D. Anderson noted, the social mobility of these lads was modest.<sup>20</sup> Expanding the scope beyond prominent Scotts at home and looking at social mobility in expatriates, we may discover new applications of the "democratic intellect".

Furthermore, according to Davie, the lads-of-parts and their philosophical education promoted democratic tendencies and were tied to a sense of Scottish patriotism. Wyllie certainly moved up the social ladder following his path through the Scottish education system. Therefore, because Wyllie was involved in government, we get a unique insight into his views on democracy and Scottish patriotism. For instance, Wyllie was a staunch supporter of the Hawaiian monarchy. He was one of the architects

---

*Human Nature*. Scottish philosophy was never a singular unified school of thought but an ongoing dialog.

<sup>19</sup> See the last half of chapter three "Wyllie and America".

<sup>20</sup> Hans, Nicholas (1951), *New Trends in Education in the Eighteenth Century*. London: Routledge and K. Paul.

of a new constitution where he set out to enhance and protect the power of the King.<sup>21</sup> Wyllie even was responsible for incorporating the British flag into the design of the Hawaiian flag. So in some sense, Wyllie's philosophical education did not make his political views more democratic. But in terms of his patriotism, Wyllie was proud of his Scottish heritage, and even owned a kilt that he wore on special occasions.<sup>22</sup> Yet, he was also proudly British, as we have seen from his flag design. Therefore, Wyllie's Scottish patriotism did not preclude him from also embracing a British identity. So Wyllie, as an extended example of a lad-of-parts, affirmed Davie's notion of social mobility, but not at home.<sup>23</sup> Somewhat contrary to Davie, whatever democratic features were in Wyllie's education, they did not manifest in his professional life. But like many of Jardine's former students who went abroad, Wyllie employed the critical thinking skills taught in the logic and rhetoric class at the University of Glasgow.

By looking at the biographies, publications, and American reception of Jardine and Sir William Hamilton, I have demonstrated that a Scottish philosophical education empowered its recipients as critical thinkers and problem solvers, and birthed a legacy of students whose influential work continues to inspire modern historians and scholars of philosophy like myself. While Jardine and Hamilton may never be highly recognised

---

<sup>21</sup> Missionaries and merchants were attempting to use financial leverage and political pressures to annex the Kingdom of Hawaii to the United States. So, an aspect of Wyllie's seemingly antidemocratic legislation was an effort to protect Hawaiian autonomy. Nonetheless, Wyllie embraced the idea of a monarchy throughout his tenure in government.

<sup>22</sup> See Edward Joesting (1988), *Kauai: the separate Kingdom* "Wyllie gave a dress ball for the king and queen, at which he wore his Scottish kilt 'in the national color of buff turned up with red'" 181.

<sup>23</sup> Some estimates for the nineteenth century cite that almost three quarters of emigrant Scots (around 900,000 individuals) who crossed the Atlantic were bound for the United States. See Marjory Harper, University of Aberdeen. (<http://www.history.ac.uk/ihr/Focus/Migration/articles/harper.html>)

names in the history of Scottish philosophy, the research presented in my study provides evidence of the breadth and depth of their contributions to American intellectual development throughout the nineteenth century and beyond.

## **Selected Bibliography**

- Addison, W.I. (1898). *Roll of Graduates of the University of Glasgow From 31 December 1727 to 31 December 1847*. Glasgow: James MacLehose and Sons.
- Addison, W.I. (1901), *The Snell Exhibitions 1678 – 1900*. Glasgow: James MacLehose & Sons.
- Addison, W.I. (1902). *Prize lists of the University of Glasgow From Session 1777/78 to Session 1832/33*. Glasgow: Carter and Pratt. 103.
- Addison, W.I. (1913). *Matriculation Albums of the University of Glasgow 1728 – 1858*. Glasgow: J. Maclehorse.
- Allen, David (1993). *Virtue, Learning and the Scottish Enlightenment*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Ameriks, Karl. “A Commonsense Kant?” *Proceedings and Addresses of the American Philosophical Association* 79, no. 2 (2005): 19-45.
- Anderson, R. D. (1983) *Education & Opportunity in Victorian Scotland* Edinburgh Edinburgh University Press.
- Anderson, R. D. (1995) *Education and the Scottish People 1750-1918* Oxford Clarendon Press.
- Anderson, R. D. (1995), Economic History Society. *Universities and Elites in Britain since 1800*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Atwater, Lyman (1874), “Dr. Blauvelt's Novum Organum”. *Scribner's Monthly*, Volume 0007 Issue 4 February 1874, pp. 478-483.
- Barnard, Henry (1876), *Education, the School, and the Teacher in American Literature*. Hartford : Brown & Gross.

- Barras, John Hay (1839), *Inaugural Addresses by Lords Rectors of the University of Glasgow*. Glasgow: David Robert.
- Boynton, Cynthia Wolfe (2014). *Remarkable Women of Hartford*; Charleston: The History Press.
- Blau, Joseph (1952), *Men and Movements in American Philosophy*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Betts, William (1858), *Columbia University, Addresses of the newly-appointed professors of Columbia College*. New York: Board of Trustees Columbia College.
- Berry, Christopher (1997), *Social Theory of the Scottish Enlightenment*; Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Beveridge, Craig and Turnbull, Ronnie (1997), *Scotland After Enlightenment*, Edinburgh: Polygon.
- Bird, Barbra (2005), *George Jardine's Investigative Rhetoric and Epistemic Writing Theory* Ball State University.
- Blau, Joseph (1952). *Men and Movements in American Philosophy*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Boyd, Mark (1871). *Reminiscences of Fifty Years*. New York: D. Appleton and Company.
- Boyer, Richard and Morais, Herbert M. (1955). *Labor's Untold Story*. New York: Cameron Associates.
- Broadie, Alexander (2001). *The Scottish Enlightenment: The Historical Age of the Historical Nation*. Edinburgh: Birlinn.
- Bruce Duncan (1996). *The Mark of the Scots*. New York: Citadel Press.

- Brock, William, (1982): *Scotus Americanus*, Edinburgh; University of Edinburgh Press.
- Bryce, J. C. (1983), *Introduction to Adam Smith, Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles Letters*.  
Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Catalogus Togatorum in Academia glasguensi* – Glasgow University Archives Reference  
# R9/1/1.
- Caldwell, William (1772), “Correspondence of Mure of Caldwell”, Special Collections,  
Ms 4925, 144, 12 March 1772, University of Glasgow Library.
- Calderwood, Henry (1854), *The Philosophy of The Infinite; With Special Reference To  
The Theories of Sir William Hamilton and M. Cousin*. Edinburgh: T. Constable and  
Co.
- Carlyle, Alexander, Ed. Hill, J. H. (1910). *Autobiography of Dr. Alexander Carlyle of  
Inveresk*. London: T. N. Foulis.
- Carlyle, Alexander (1973). *Anecdotes and Characters*. Oxford, New York: Oxford  
University Press.
- Carlyle, Thomas, Carlyle, Jane Welsh (1970). *The Collected Letters of Thomas and Jane  
Welsh Carlyle Vol 16, January - July 1843*. USA: Duke University Press. 6:311 and  
6: 318; 387.
- Carter, Jennifer J. and Pittock, Joan H. (1992). *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment*,  
Aberdeen University Press.
- Chambers (1897). *Biographical Dictionary*. Edinburgh: W. & R. Chambers, Limited.
- Chambers, R (1836). *Biographical Dictionary of Eminent Scotsman*. Glasgow: Blackie &  
Son.

- Chitnis, Anand (1976) *The Scottish Enlightenment. A Social History*, London-Totawa (N.J.), Helm.
- Chitnis, Anand (1986), *The Scottish Enlightenment and Early Victorian English Society*. London: Croom Helm.
- Choate, W. (1877), *Live questions in psychology and Metaphysics. Six lectures selected from those delivered to the classes in Cornell University, by Wilson, William Dexter, 1816-1900*. New York: D. Appleton and Company.
- Cleland, James (1816). *Annals of Glasgow - Volume 2 - Comprising an Account of the Public Buildings, Charities, and Rise and Progress of the City VOL. II*. Glasgow:Printed by James Hedderwick, 149.
- Cooke, Josiah P. (1865), Natural Theology as a Positive Science. *The North American Review*, 0100 (Issue 206), 177.
- Combe, George (1838), *Notes on the States of North America During a Phrenological*; Philadelphia: Carey & Hart.
- Court, Franklin (2001), *The Scottish Connection the Rise of English Literary Study in America*. New York: Syracuse University.
- Cousin, Victor (1836), *Testimony in Favor of Sir William Hamilton*: Letter from Cousin to Professor Pillans, Paris Juin.
- Coutts, James (1909). *A history of the University of Glasgow: from its foundation in 1451 to 1909*. Glasgow: J. Maclehose and Sons. 315.
- Cairns Craig (2009), *Intending Scotland: Explorations in Scottish Culture since the Enlightenment*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Davie, George (2000). *The Democratic Intellect*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

- Davis, Sheldon E (1919). *Educational Periodicals During the Nineteenth Century*.  
Washington: Washington, Govt. Print. Office.
- Deems, Charles Fate (1875). *Vanderbilt University, "Dedication and inauguration of the Vanderbilt university*. Nashville, Tenn.: Publishing house of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South.
- De Morgan, Augustus, ed. Peter Heath (1966), *On the Syllogism, and Other Writings*.  
London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Douglas A. Foster and Anthony L. Dunnivant (2004). *The Encyclopedia of the Stone-Campbell Movement: Christian Church (Disciples of Christ), Christian Churches/Churches of Christ, Churches of Christ*, Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing.
- Drummond, Andrew & Bulloch, James (1973). *The Church in Victorian Scotland 1688-1843*. Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press.
- Drummond, Andrew & Bulloch, James (1975). *The Church in Victorian Scotland 1843-1874*. Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press.
- Emerson, Roger. (2008) *Academic Patronage in the Scottish Enlightenment: Glasgow, Edinburgh, and St Andrews Universities*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Emerson, Roger (2003) "The Context of the Scottish Enlightenment" *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment*, Cambridge University Press.
- Eyre-Todd, George (1909). *Who's who in Glasgow in 1909; a biographical dictionary of nearly five hundred living Glasgow citizens an of notable citizens who have died since 1st January, 1907*; Glasgow: Glasgow, Gowan & Gray.

- Fetridge, William Pembroke. *The Rise and Fall of the Paris Commune in 1871; with a full account of the bombardment, capture, and burning of the city. Illustrated with a map of Paris and portraits from original photographs.* New York,: Harper.
- Flieschacker, Samuel (2003). The impact on America: Scottish philosophy and the American Founding. In: Broadie, Alexander *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Foster, Douglas and Dunnivant, Anthony (2004). *The Encyclopedia of the Stone-Campbell Movement: Christian Church (Disciples of Christ), Christian Churches/Churches of Christ, Churches of Christ,* Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing.
- Franklin, Jane (1860), *Lady Franklin collection 1860-1881*, 248/139.
- Gardner, Alexander (1885). *Selections of the Family Papers Preserved at Caldwell. Part II Vol. II .* Paisley: Edinburgh. 298.
- Geiger, Roger (2000), *The American College in the 19th Century.* Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press.
- Geyer-Kordesch , Johanna and Macdonald Fiona (F. (Eds.)) (1999). *Physicians and Surgeons in Glasgow.* London: Hambledon.
- Graham, Gordon (2003), “The Nineteenth-Century Aftermath”, In: Broadie, Alexander *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Graham, Gordon (2012), *Davie, Ferrier and Philosophy;* Center for the Study of Scottish Philosophy Princeton Theological Seminary.
- Grant, A (1884). *The Story of the University of Edinburgh.* London: Longmans, Green, and Co.

- Gregg, David L. Edited by Pauline King (1982). *The Diaries of David Lawrence Gregg 1853 – 1858*. Honolulu: Hawaiian Historical Society.
- Gordon, M. (1862). *Memoir of Wilson Vol. 1*. Oxford: Oxford University.
- Gregg, David L. (1982), Pauline King, ed., *The Diaries of David Lawrence Gregg: An American Diplomat in Hawaii, 1853-1858*. Honolulu: Hawaiian Historical Society.
- Gross, Alexander; Scouller, James; Foster, R. V. and Johnson, T. C (1894). *A history of the Methodist church, South; the United Presbyterian church; the Cumberland Presbyterian church and the Presbyterian church, South, in the United States (1894)*; New York: The Christian Literature Company, 322.
- Gundlach, Bradley. (1997). McCosh and Hodge on Evolution: A Combined Legacy. *Journal of Presbyterian History*. 75 (2), 85-102.
- Hans, Nicholas (1951), *New Trends in Education in the Eighteenth Century*. London: Routledge and K. Paul.
- Hamilton, Thomas (1833), *Men and Manners in America in Two Volumes*; Edinburgh: W. Blackwood.
- Hamilton, Sir William (1831), *An account of experiments on the weight and relative proportions of the brain, cerebellum, and tuber annulare, in man and animals, under the various circumstances of age, sex, country, etc,' prefix to Alexander Monro, The Anatomy of the Brain, with Some Observations on its Functions*, Edinburgh.
- Hamilton, William Bart. (1836), *Lectures On Metaphysics Vol I* London; William Blackwood and Sons.
- Hamilton, Sir William (1847), *A Letter to Augustus De Morgan, Esq. of Trinity College, Cambridge, Professor of Mathematics in University College, London on His Claim*

*To an Independant Re-Discovery Of a New Pprinciple in the Theory of Syllogism.*

*From Sir William Hamilton, BART.* Longman, Brown, Green, and Longmans;

MacLachlan, Stewart.

Hamilton, Sir William (1861), *Discussions on Philosophy and Literature, Education and University Reform Chiefly from the Edinburgh review.* New York by Harper & Brothers.

Hamilton, Sir William (1863), *The Logic of Sir William Hamilton,* Cincinnati: Moore, Wilstach & Baldwin.

Hans, Nicholas (1951), *New Trends in Education in the Eighteenth Century.* London: Routledge and K. Paul.

Hart, Charles Henry (1811), *Memoir of George Ticknor, Historian of Spanish Literature,* Philadelphia: Collins, Printer, Toe, Jayne Street.

Harriston, William (1827). *Elegy to the Memory of George Jardine Esq. Late Professor of Logic in the University of Glasgow, Who Died There on the 28<sup>th</sup> of January 1827, in the 85<sup>th</sup> Year of His age.* Second edition, Glasgow: Jamaica Street.

Herman, Arthur (2001). *How the Scots Invented the Modern World: The True Story of How Western Europe's Poorest Nation Created Our World & Everything in It.* New York: Broadway.

Hines, Gustavus Rev. (1859). *Life on the Plains of the Pacific.* New York: Barker & Co.

Hoeveler, David. (1981) *James McCosh and the Scottish Intellectual Tradition:* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Hook, Andrew (1975). *Scotland and America: a study of cultural relations, 1750-1835.* London, Glasgow: Blackie.

- Hook, Andrew and Sher, Richard (eds.), (1995). *The Glasgow Enlightenment*, Edinburgh: Tuckwell Press.
- Hook, Andrew (1999). *From Goosecreek to Gandercleugh: Studies in Scottish American Literary and Cultural History*. Edinburgh: Birlinn Ltd.
- Hopkins, Gerard Manley (1862). *Hawaii The Past, Present And Future of Its Island Kingdom*. London: Longman, Green, Longman, and Roberts.
- Horner, Winifred (1993). *Nineteenth-Century Scottish Rhetoric: The American Connection*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press.
- Howe, M. A. DeWolfe (1908). *Life and Letters of George Bancroft Part II*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons.
- Hubach, Robert (1961), *Early Midwestern Travel Narratives*, Detroit: Wayne State University Press.
- Hunter, William (1718-83) *The Correspondence of Dr William Hunter*, Ed. Helen Brock; London: Pickering & Chatto Publishers.
- Innes, A. Taylor (1913) *Chapters of Reminiscence* London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Irving, Joseph (1881). *The Book of Eminent Scotsman*. Paisley: Alexander Gardner.
- Jardine, George, (1765), "Letter to Robert Hunter" Special Collections, Ms Gen 507/1, University of Glasgow Library.
- Jardine, George (1818). *Outlines of Philosophical Education Illustrated by the Method of Teaching the Logic Class in the University of Glasgow*. Glasgow: Andrew and James Duncan.

- Jardine, George, Ed. Albert Picket, John W. Picket. (1818). Outlines of Philosophical Education abstracted from Dr. Jardine, of Glasgow University. *The Academician*. 1 (6).
- Jardine, George (1797) "Synopsis of the Lectures of George Jardine" GUL BG 44-i.10.
- Jessop, R. (2008) "The logic of Sir William Hamilton: tunnelling through sand to place the keystone in the Aristotelic Arch". In: Gabbay, D.M. and Woods, J. (eds.) *British Logic in the Nineteenth Century. Handbook of the History of Logic*, 4, Elsevier, pp. 93-163
- Joesting, Edward (1988). *Kauai: The separate Kingdom*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Judd, Garrit (1960). *Dr. Judd, Hawaii's Friend*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. 129.
- Kant, Immanuel (1785). *Groundwork on the Metaphysics of Morals, Edited and Translated by Allen Wood*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Kant, Immanuel (1783), *Prolegomena* (the *Akademie* edition, vol. IV, Berlin, 1911).
- Kant, Immanuel (1784). *E-Texts Kant*. Available: <http://www.english.upenn.edu/~mgamer/Etexts/kant.html>. Last accessed Sept. 2011.
- Kuklick, Bruce (1977). *The Rise of American Philosophy: Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1860-1930*. Mass.: Yale University Press.
- Lamb, Martha J. 1829-1893. *History of the city of New York: its origin, rise, and progress*. New York: A.S. Barnes Co.
- Laurie, Henery (1902). *Scottish Philosophy In Its National Development*. Glasgow: James Maclehose and Sons.

- Lee, Maurice S. (2005) *Slavery Philosophy and American Literature 1830 – 1860*  
Cambridge University Press.
- Lenman (1981). *Integration and Enlightenment: Scotland 1746 – 1832*. Edinburgh:  
Edinburgh University Press. 91.
- Lockhart, John Gibson (1819). *Peter's Letters to His Kinsfolk*. Vol 3 Edinburgh: William  
Blackwood.
- Mackie, J.D. (1954). *The University of Glasgow 1451 – 1951* . Glasgow: Jackson, Sons  
and Company. 274.
- Macrae, David (1870). *The Americans at home: pen-and-ink sketches of American men,  
manners and institutions*. Edinburgh: Edmonston and Douglas.
- Malcom, Howard. (1868) *Theological index: references to the principal works in every  
department of religious Literature: embracing nearly seventy thousand citations,  
alphabetically arranged under two thousand heads*, **Boston**: Gould and Lincoln.
- MacDonald, Geyer-Kordesch (F. (Eds.)) (1999). *Physicians and Surgeons in Glasgow*.  
London: Hambledon.
- Masson, David (1866). *Recent British Philosophy: a review, with criticisms*. New York:  
D. Appleton and company.
- May, Henry (1976), *The Enlightenment in America* New York Oxford University Press.
- McCosh, James (1850), *The Method of Devine Government, Physical and Moral*,  
Edinburgh: Sutherland and Knox.
- McCosh, Janes (1875). *The Scottish Philosophy, from Hutchison to Hamilton*. New York:  
Robert Carter and Brothers.

McCosh, James (1896). *The Life of James McCosh*. Ed Sloane, William, Edinburgh:  
T&T Clark.

Mill, John Stewart (1865) *An Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy*,  
London : Longman, Green, Longman, Roberts & Green.

Mill, John Ed. by Mineka and Lindley (1972). *The Collected Works of John Stewart Mill*  
*XV The Later Letters 1849 – 1873* From John Stewart Mill to John William Parker,  
December 16, 1856. Toronto: University of Toronto Press. 519.

Monck, W. H. S. (1881). *Sir William Hamilton*. London: S. Low, Marston, Searle and  
Rivington.

Mossner, Ernest Campbell (1954). *Life of David Hume*. Oxford, New York: Oxford  
University Press.

*New Statistical Account of Scotland* (1845) By the ministers of the respective parishes,  
under the superintendence of a committee of the Society for the benefit of the sons  
and daughters of the clergy, Edinburgh and London: William Blackwood and Sons,  
MDCCCXLV.

New York State Library (1850). *Catalogue of the New-York State library*. Albany: C.  
Van Benthuysen, printer.

Owen, Robert (1857). *The Life of Robert Owen Written by Himself*. London: Effingham  
Wilson Royal Exchange. 107.

Palmer, B. M. (1875). *The life and letters of James Henley Thornwell*. Richmond: Whittet  
& Shepperson.

Pattison, Mark. (1865), "J.S. Mill on Hamilton". *The Reader*, May 1865.

- Phillipson, Nicholas (1973) 'Towards a Definition of the Scottish Enlightenment', in *City and Society in the Eighteenth-century*, edited by Fritz and Williams, (Toronto: Hakkert.
- Phillipson, Nicholas (1975), "Culture and Society in the Eighteenth-Century Province: The Case of Edinburgh and the Scottish Enlightenment", in L. Stone, ed., *The University in Society*, 2 vols. (Princeton, 1975), 2: 407–48.416.
- Phillipson, Nicholas, "James Beattie and the Defence of Common Sense", in B. Fabian, ed., *Festschrift für Rainer Gruenter* (Heidelberg, 1978), 145–54.
- Phillipson, Nicholas (1983), "The Pursuit of Virtue in Scottish University Education: Dugald Stewart and Scottish Moral Philosophy in the Enlightenment", in Phillipson, ed., *Universities, Society and the Future* (Edinburgh, 1983).
- David B. Potts (2010) *Liberal Education for a Land of Colleges: Yale's "Reports" of 1828*; London and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Powell, Avril Ann (2010), *Scottish Orientalists and India: The Muir Brothers, Religion, Education and Empire*. Boydell & Brewer, 2010.
- Raymond, John Howard (1873). *Vassar college: A college for women, in Poughkeepsie, N. Y. A sketch of its foundation, aims, and resources, and of the development of its scheme of instruction to the present time*. New York: S. W. Green, printer.
- Reid, Thomas (1764). *An Inquiry into the Human Mind on the Principles of Common Sense*. Edinburgh.
- Reid, Thomas (1799). University of Glasgow. In: Sir John Sinclair *Statistical Account of Scotland, Vol. 21*. Edinburgh: William Creech.
- Rice, Duncan (1981). *The Scots Abolitionists 1833 – 1861* Baton Rouge, LA

- Richarson, Robert (1868). *The Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* Vol. I, 1st ed.  
Philadelphia: J.B. Lippincott.
- Riley, Woodbridge (1907). *American Philosophy*. New York: Dodd, Mead and  
Company.
- Robertson, John (2012), “The Scottish Contribution to the Enlightenment” | Institute of  
Historical Research.  
[http://sasspace.sas.ac.uk/4408/1/The\\_Scottish\\_Contribution\\_to\\_the\\_Enlightenment\\_b  
y\\_John\\_Robertson\\_\\_\\_Institute\\_of\\_Historical\\_Research.pdf](http://sasspace.sas.ac.uk/4408/1/The_Scottish_Contribution_to_the_Enlightenment_by_John_Robertson___Institute_of_Historical_Research.pdf).
- Rohlf , Michael (2010), *Immanuel Kant*. Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy.  
<http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/kant/#LifWor>.
- Ross, Ian. (1995). Adam Smith’s “happiest” years as a Glasgow Professor. In: Andrew  
Hook and Richard B. Sher *The Glasgow Enlightenment*. East Lothian: Tuckwell  
Press.
- Russell, William and William Bentley Fowle (1826) *Manuel of Mutual Instruction*,  
Boston: Wait, Greene, and Company.
- Schneider, Herbert. (1946) *A History of American Philosophy*: New York: Columbia  
University Press.
- Sedgwick, Catharine Maria. *Life and letters of Catharine M. Sedgwick*. Ed. by Mary E.  
Dewey. New York,: Harper & Brothers, 1872.
- Seth, Andrew (1885). *Scottish Philosophy: A Comparison of the Scottish and German  
Answers to Hume* (third edition), Blackwood, Edinburgh and London.

- Sher, Richard B. (2006). *The Enlightenment and the Book: Scottish Authors and Their Publishers in Eighteenth-Century Britain, Ireland and America*. Chicago: Chicago University Press.
- Shuffelton, Frank (1993) *The American Enlightenment*. New York; University of Rochester Press.
- Sloan, Douglas (1971). *The Scottish Enlightenment and the American College Ideal*. Columbia: Teachers College Press.
- Smith, Alexander, (1857). *City Poems*, Boston,,: Ticknor and Fields.
- Spencer, Mark (2010), *David Hume and Eighteenth-Century America*. Rochester: University of Rochester Press.
- Sprague, William Buell (1865), *Visits to European Celebrities*. New York: Gould and Lincoln. 280.
- Stephen, L Editor (1885). *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: George Smith. 795.
- Stowe, Harriet Beecher (1854). *Sunny memories of foreign lands*, Volume 1; Boston: Phillips, Sampson, and Company.
- Thornwell, James Henley (1850). *The Rights and the Duties of Masters*; Press of Walker & James.
- Ticknor, George (1825). *Remarks on changes lately proposed or adopted, in Harvard University*. Merchant Ball: Cummings, Hilliard & Co True and Greene, Printers.
- Trowbridge, J. T. (1867) *Neighbors' Wives*, Boston: Lee and Shepard.
- Tocqueville, Alexis de. (1832) *Democracy in America*. Chicago: University of Chicago, 2000, 493

- Turnbull, George (1742). *Observations upon liberal Education, in All its Branches*.  
London: Millar, A. 3.
- Tyler, W. S. (1873). *History of Amherst College during its first half century. 1821-1871*.  
Springfield, Mass: C. W. Bryan & Co.
- Veitch, John (1869), *Memoirs of Sir William Hamilton* Edinburgh: Blackwood and Sons.
- Veitch, John (1883). *Sir William Hamilton: the Man and His Philosophy*. Edinburgh:  
William Blackwood and Sons.
- Wayland, Francis and Wayland H. L. (1867). *A Memoir, Life and Labors Francis  
Wayland, D.D., LL, D by his Sons*. New York: Sheldon and Company.
- Welch, Lewis Sheldon, Camp, Walter (1899). *Yale, her campus, class-rooms, and  
athletics* Boston: L.C. Page and Company.
- Whyte, Iain (2006) *Scotland And The Abolition Of Black Slavery, 1756-1838*. Edinburgh:  
Edinburgh University Press.
- Wills, Gary (2002). *Inventing America: Jefferson's Declaration of Independence*. Boston,  
New York: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Wilson, John. (1818), "Glasgow" *Blackwood Magazine*.
- Wintersgill, Donald (2001). *Rectors of the University of Glasgow 1820-2000* Glasgow:  
University of Glasgow.
- Wood, Paul (1993). *The Aberdeen enlightenment: the arts curriculum in the eighteenth  
century*, Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press.

- Wood, Paul (2000) "Introduction: Dugald Stewart and the Invention of the 'Scottish Enlightenment'", *The Scottish Enlightenment Essays in Reinterpretations*, Rochester: University of Rochester Press.
- Wrather, Eva Jean (2005), *Alexander Campbell*. Fort Worth, Texas: TCU Press.
- Wrather, Eva Jean (2005), *Adventurer in Freedom: a Literary Biography*, Texas Christian University Press.
- Wright, Chauncey (1887), *Letters of Chauncey Wright* Ed. James Bradley Thayer. Cambridge: Press of J. Wilson and Son.
- Wyllie, Robert (1845). *Mexico. Noticia sobre su hacienda bajo el gobierno espanol y despues de la independeneceia... Calculos sobre la deuda publica interior y exterior. Presupuestos aprocsimados de sus ingresos...tablas ilustrativas sobre sistema mercantile, manufacturer y prohibitive, y observaciones sobre la colonizacion...diridigo al caballero George B. robinson, president de la commission de tenadores de bonos espanoles y americanos...* Library of Congress catalog record. LC control # 02004739.

## **Journal Articles and Periodicals**

- Alden, Henry Mills (1870). Editor's Literary Record. *Harper's New Monthly Magazine* Volume 0041 Issue 243 (August 1870) / Volume 41, Issue: 243, August 1870; 458-464.
- Ameriks, Karl (2005). A Commonsense Kant?. *Proceedings and Addresses of the American Philosophical Association* 79, no. 2; 19-45.

Anderson, R. D. (1987). Scottish University Professors, 1800-1939: Profile Of An Elite.

*Scottish Economic and Social History*. Volume 7, Issue 1; 27.

Anonymous (1864). The Conditioned and the Unconditioned. *The North American*

*Review*. 0099 (Issue: 205); 402-449.

Anonymous (1865), Faith and Science. *The North American Review*. 0101 (Issue 209),

335-379.

Anonymous, (1825). Outlines of a Philosophical Education. *Literary Chronicle and*

*Weekly Review London: Published By Davidson, Surrey Street, One Door From The Stand*; 212.

Anonymous (1818). Art. V - Outlines of Philosophical Education; illustrated by the

Method of Teaching the Logic, or First Class of Philosophy in the University of Glasgow. By Geo. Jardine, A. M. Professor of Logic and Rhetoric in that University.

8to. Logman and Co. London, 1818. *The British Review and London Critical Journal Vol VII* 1818.

Anonymous (1826). Domestic Occurrences: Intelligence from Various Parts of the

Country. *Gentleman's Magazine* c.1 v.139 1826; 77.

Anonymous (Combe, George) (1832). Cruelty To Animals Sir William Hamilton's

Experiments. *The Phrenological Journal and Miscellany, Volume 7*, Edinburgh and London: John Anderson, Simpkin and Marshall; 427-433.

Anonymous (1827). Obituary of George Jardine. *Glasgow Herald* on Friday, 2 February

1827.

Anonymous (1846). The Tongataboo Papers. *The Sandwich Island News*. November (1)

1846.

- Anonymous (1866). The Right of Suffrage. *The North American Review* Volume 0103  
Issue 212; Volume 103, July 1866; 241-250.
- Anonymous (1863). Hopkins's Moral Science. *The North American Review* Volume 0096  
Issue 199 April 1863; 380-407.
- Anonymous (1860). Sir William Hamilton's Lectures on Metaphysics. *New Englander  
and Yale Review*. 0018 (Issue 69); 167-190.
- Anonymous (1875). Culture and Progress: Culture and Progress - The Scottish  
Philosophy. *Scribner's Monthly, an illustrated magazine for the people* Volume 0009  
Issue 4 (February 1875) / Volume 9, Issue: 4; 508-514.
- Atwater, Lyman (1874). Dr. Blauvelt's Novum Organum. *Scribner's Monthly*, Volume  
0007 Issue 4 February 1874; 478-483.
- Barnard, Henry (1857), William Russell. *American Journal of Education and College  
Review* 3; 139.
- Bayne, Peter (1857). Essays in Biography and Criticism. *The North American Review*,  
Volume 0085 Issue 177 October 1857; 571.
- Beanblossom, Ronald E. (1988). Kant's Quarrel with Reid: The Role of Metaphysics.  
*History of Philosophy Quarterly* Vol. 5, No. 1; 53-62.
- Bowen, F. (1853). Sir William Hamilton on Philosophy and Education. *North American  
Review*. 76 /152; 55-104.
- Carlyle, Thomas. *The Living Age* Volume 0009 Issue 110 (June 20, 1846) / Volume 9,  
Issue: 110, June 20, 1846; 585-593.
- Cockburn, Lord (1852). Life of Lord Jeffrey; with a Selection from his Correspondence.  
*The Living Age*, Volume 0035 Issue 437; 2, October 1852; 5.

- Emerson, Roger (2011). Enlightened ages, ages of Improvement, and the Scottish Enlightenment. *I Castelli di Yale*, XI; 11.
- Gibson, Walter Murry (1881). R.C. Wyllie's Papers. *Pacific Commercial Advertiser*, 1 October 1881.
- Gaillet, Lynée Lewis (1993). A Legacy Of Basic Writing Instruction. *Journal of Basic Writing*, Vol. 12, No. 2.
- Gaillet, Lynée Lewis (1998). George Jardine: Champion of the Scottish Philosophy of Democratic Intellect. *Rhetoric Society Quarterly* Vol. 28, No. 2 (Spring, 1998)  
Published by: Taylor & Francis, Ltd; 37-53.
- Gordon, M. (1863). Christopher North. *The Living Age* Volume 0076 Issue 979, 7 March 1863.
- Gundlach, Bradley (1997). "McCosh and Hodge on Evolution: A Combined Legacy". *Journal of Presbyterian History*; 75 (2); 85-102.
- Hamilton, Sir William (1831). An account of experiments on the weight and relative proportions of the brain, cerebellum, and tuber annulare, in man and animals, under the various circumstances of age, sex, country, etc,' prefix to Alexander Monro, The Anatomy of the Brain, with Some Observations on its Functions. Edinburgh, 4-8.
- Hamilton, Sir William (1845). Researches on the Frontal Sinuses, with Observations on their bearings on the dogmas of Phrenology. *Med Times*, 12 (1845); 159, 177, 371.
- Hamilton, sir William (1850). Remarks on Dr. Morton's Tables on the Size of the Brain. *Edinburgh New Philosophical Journal*, 48, 1850; 330-3.
- Hamilton, sir William *Correspondence relative to phrenology between Sir William Hamilton, bart., Dr. Spurzheim, and Mr. George Combe, in January, February, and March, 1828*. Edinburgh, John Anderson, 1828; 69.
- Hamilton, sir William "Cousin's *Course of Philosophy*," in *Edinburgh Review*, October 1829, vol. 50, 194-221.
- Hunter, William and Duncan, James (1826). *Sir William Hamilton and phrenology. An exposition of phrenology; shewing the complete inefficacy of the objections lately advanced in the Royal Society, and the real grounds on which the system ought to be assailed*. Edinburgh, London, 36.

- Huxley, Thomas. (1898). Thomas Huxley. *The Living Age*. 0216 Issue 2794; 247.
- Jardine, George, Ed. Albert Picket, John W. Picket (1818). Outlines of Philosophical Education abstracted from Dr. Jardine of Glasgow University. *The Academician*. 1(6); 293.
- Jardine, George. (1826). Outlines of Philosophical Education, illustrated by the method of Teaching the Logic Class in the University of Glasgow; together with Observations on the expediency of extending the Practical System. *American Journal of Education* Vol 1No.2.
- Kennedy, Innes (2006). The Solution of the Enigma of the Universe: J.F. Ferrier on Heraclitus. *International Review of Scottish Studies*, Volume 31.
- Judd, Garrit (1960). *Dr. Judd, Hawaii's Friend*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Lane, Jack C. (1987). The Yale Report of 1828 and Liberal Education: A Neorepublican Manifesto. *History of Education Quarterly* Vol. 27, No. 3 (Autumn, 1987); 325-338.
- Pocock, G. A. (2008). Historiography and Enlightenment: A View of Their History. *Modern Intellectual History*; 5.
- Rae, John (1862). Thoughts on The System of Legislature. *Polynesian* Honolulu: 24, 31 May 1862.
- Raeseide, James. (1984). The Journals and Letter Books of R.C. Wyllie: A Minor Historical Mystery. *The Hawaiian Journal of History*, 18.
- Redekop, Benjamin (April 2004), The Correspondence of Thomas Reid. *Canadian Journal of History* 39 (1); 212.
- Stevens, Geo. B., Rev.(1881). The Authority of Faith. *New Englander and Yale Review*. 0040 (Issue 161), 432-445.

Sutton, T. J. (1989). The Scottish Kant?. The Philosophy of Thomas Reid Philosophical Studies Series, Volume 42, 1989; 159-192.

Taylor, Albert Pierce (1929). *Intrigues, Conspiracies and Accomplishments in the Era of Kamehameha IV and V and Robert Crichton Wyllie*. Paper read by Librarian, Archives of Hawaii, before the Hawaiian Historical Society, Honolulu.

Veitch, James (1869). Veitch's Memoir Of Sir William Hamilton. *The Living Age* Volume 0102, Issue 1311 (July 17, 1869); 129-192.

Walsh, Anthony A. (1971). George Combe, a portrait of a heretofore generally unknown behaviorist. *Journal of the Behavioral Sciences* 7.

Wood, B. Anne. (1987). Thomas McCulloch's Use of Science in Promoting a Liberal Education. *Acadiensis*. 17 (No.1); 56-73.

## **Manuscripts and Special Collections**

### **National Library of Scotland**

Mure of Caldwell Correspondence Ms 4925; 27, April 1772

Mure of Caldwell Correspondence Ms 4925: 127. 1772.

Mure of Caldwell Correspondence Ms 4925: 144; 12 March 1772.

Letters of Baron Mure of Caldwell, Ms 4946: 1-3; 1773.

Letters of Baron Mure of Caldwell, Ms 4946: 19-22; 1773.

Letters of Baron Mure of Caldwell, Ms 4946: 59-62; 10 May 1773.

Letters of Baron Mure of Caldwell, Ms 4946: 64; 20 May 1773.

Letters of Baron Mure of Caldwell, Ms 4946: 207

Letter Adam Smith to Henry Herbert, MS 14835, ff.70–1; 23 September 1788.

Thomas Carlyle on Sir Wm. Hamilton, Mu56-a.13; 15 May 1869.

Letter Sir William Hamilton to Calderwood ACC 6758.

*Scottish Journal of Political Economy*, vol. 28 (1981) MS 14835, ff.70–1; 206–9.

## **University of Glasgow Library Special Collections**

Anonymous – Anti Hamilton article teaching - MU56-a.13.

*Catalogus Togatorum in Academia glasguensi* – Glasgow University Archives Reference # R9/1/1.

Carlyle letters Special Collections BC5-a.22.

Carlyle to Hamilton Coll MU 56-a.1, Glasgow University Library.

Jardine, George Ms. Gen 507/1; 1765.

Jardine letter to Robert Hunter, Ms.507/13.

Jardine letter to Robert Hunter, Ms. 507/ 25; July 1771.

Jardine letter to Robert Hunter, Ms. 507/ 26; September 1771.

Jardine letter to Robert Hunter, Ms. 507/ 29; December 1771.

Jardine letter to Robert Hunter, Ms. 507/ 48; 3 June 1774.

Jardine to Robert Hunter Rector of Burton near Dorset Ms.507/101. 1796.

Jardine to Robert Hunter Rector of Burton near Dorset Ms.507/138. 30 October 1810.

Jardine, George Lectures, Ms 166: 22-23.

Blackwood on John Wilson, MS 30969; 26 April 1820,

Carlyle on Sir William Hamilton, Mu 56-a.13, 1869.

Correspondence of Mure of Caldwell Ms 4925, 144, 12 March 1772.

Correspondence of Mure of Caldwell Ms 4950; 1811.

Cousin, Victor (1838). *Testimony in Favor of Sir William Hamilton*: Letter from Cousin to Professor Pillans, Paris Juin, 1836, 14.

### **Yale University Archives**

Day Family Papers, MS 175, Series III, Box 29, folder 347.

### **University of Hawaii Archives**

RC Wylie to John Rae, Archives of Hawaii, Foreign Office Letter Book, no. 28E, vol II, Miscellaneous Internal Correspondence, p. 260: Feb 4, 1861.

RC Wyllie to John Rae, Archives of Hawaii, Foreign Office Letter Book, E, vol III, no 37, Miscellaneous Internal Correspondence, 182-5: October 27, 1862.

Taylor, Albert Pierce (1929). *Intrigues, Conspiracies and Accomplishments in the Era of Kamehameha IV and V and Robert Crichton Wyllie*. Paper read by Albert Pierce Taylor, Librarian, Archives of Hawaii, before the Hawaiian Historical Society, Honolulu, October 15, 1929.





