
http://theses.gla.ac.uk/7351/

Copyright and moral rights for this thesis are retained by the author

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge

This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the Author

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the Author

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given.
The Flute in Musical Life
in Eighteenth-century Scotland

Elizabeth Cary Ford

BA (West Virginia Wesleyan College)

MM (Peabody Conservatory of the Johns Hopkins University)

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Music

School of Culture and Creative Arts, College of Arts

University of Glasgow

May 2016
Abstract

All history of the flute in Scotland begins with William Tytler’s 1792 assertion that the flute was unknown in Scotland prior to 1725. Other generally accepted beliefs about the flute in Scotland are that it was only played by wealthy male amateurs and had no role in traditional music. Upon examination, all of these beliefs are false. This thesis explores the role of the flute in eighteenth-century Scottish musical life, including players, repertoire, manuscripts, and instruments. Evidence for ladies having played flute is also examined, as are possible connections between flute playing and bagpipe playing. What emerges is a more complete picture of the flute’s role in eighteenth-century Scottish musical life.
# Contents

Abstract 1

Contents 2

List of Tables 3

List of Figures 4

Library Sigla 6

Acknowledgements 7

Author’s declaration 8

1. Introduction 9

2. Gentlemen amateurs 31

3. Lower-class male amateurs 55

4. Ladies 65

5. Professional musicians 84

6. Repertoire 116

7. Scottish music manuscripts from the eighteenth century dedicated to the flute 153

8. Instruments 175

9. Conclusions 193

Appendix A: Images 197

Bibliography 210
List of Tables

Table 1. McGibbon’s Flute Transpositions 131
List of Figures

Figure 1: John Gunn, The School of the German Flute, page 7  99
Figure 2: John Gunn, The School of the German Flute, page 10  100
Figure 3: John Gunn, The School of the German Flute, page 10  100
Figure 4: John Gunn, The School of the German Flute, page 15  102
Figure 5: Donald MacDonald, A Collection of the Ancient Martial Music of Caledonia, “Failte Phronsa,” page 1  135
Figure 6: Francesco Barsanti, Clout the Cauldron  137
Figure 7: John Reid, Opening of Solo V, 1796  139
Figure 8: John Reid, Opening of Solo V, 1756  140
Figure 9: Pietro Urbani, Bush Aboon Traquair  148
Figure 10: Pietro Urbani, “Maid of Selma,” primo part, A Favorite Selection of Scots Tunes properly arranged as Duettos for Two German Flutes or Two Violins  149
Figure 11: Sonata 1ma, flauto primo, MMC 491  161
Figure 12: Satyr with a flute, fountain, Linlithgow Palace  197
Figure 13: Ceiling of the Muses’ Chamber, Crathes Castle  197
Figure 14: Reconstructed Crathes Castle Flute  198
Figure 15: Pages one and two of Alexander Bruce’s manuscript  198
Figure 16: Hotteterre’s fingering chart  199
Figure 17: Cosmo, 3rd Duke of Gordon, by Philippe Mercier  199
Figure 18: Sir Gilbert Elliot of Minto by William Aikman  200
Figure 19: Lieutenant John Reid, unknown artist  201
Figure 20: John Reid, unknown artist  202
Figure 21: Medallion of John Reid, by James Tassie  203
Figure 22: General John Reid, unknown artist 204
Figure 23: General John Reid, Kirby’s Wonderful and Eccentric Museum 204
Figure 24: William Tytler, by John Jones after Henry Raeburn 205
Figure 25: Susanna, Lady Eglinton, by William Aikman 205
Figure 26: Robert Tannahill 206
Figure 27: “The Green Woods of Trough”, MS Robertson 1 207
Figure 28: Flute possibly having belonged to William Nicholson 207
Figure 29: Flute player from The Caledonian Pocket Companion 208
Figure 30: Flute by Urquhart 209
Figure 31: “Eiserne Zeit” by Mathaeus Merian 209
Library Sigla

MMC: The Montagu Music Collection, Boughton House, Kettering, Northamptonshire


GB-En: The National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh

GB-Ap: Aberdeen Public Library, Aberdeen

GB-Enr: National Records of Scotland, Edinburgh

GB-Gm: Mitchell Library, Glasgow

GB-Er: University of Edinburgh Library, Edinburgh

GB-Gu: University of Glasgow Library, Glasgow
Acknowledgements

This thesis would have been impossible without the financial support of the University of Glasgow Kenneth Elliott Scholarship for Postgraduate Research in Music and the St Andrews Society of Washington, D. C., Scholarship, as well as numerous funding awards from the University of Glasgow College of Arts and School of Culture and Creative Arts.

It would have been equally impossible without the generosity, support, guidance, and patience of the following people and organizations: Linda Sabak, Larry and Kaaren Ford, David McGuinness, Colin St Martin, Wendell Dobbs, the students of the 2007 Timber Flute Festival, Chris Norman, the participants of Boxwood 2014, Ted Duncan, Elizabeth Miller, John Ford, Jenny Moore, Alex Ford, Karen Winter, Aaron McGregor, John Purser, James Beaton, Hugh Cheape, Keith Sanger, Rob McKillop, Martin Johnson, the staff of the Wighton Collection, Gillebrìde MacMillan, the staff at the A. K. Bell Library, Lord and Lady Balfour of Burleigh, Allan Wright, Pam Jackson, Gareth Fitzpatrick, His Grace the Duke of Buccleuch and Queensberry, Karen McAulay, Jo Clements, Uncle Barack, Susan Weiss, Warwick Edwards, Alison McGillivray, Graham Hair, the Musica Scotica Trust, John Gallagher, Bill Harris, Martin Wenner, Nancy Hadden, Jed Wentz, Anne Smith, Janice Dockendorff Boland, Laurel Swindon, Kim Pineda, Tom Cady, Adrienne Greenbaum, Kenny Hadden, Hamish Napier, Rod Cameron, Jenny Nex, the Friends of St Cecilia’s Hall, Almut Boehme, Ronnie Gibson, Emma Lloyd, Sherezade Garcia-Rangel, Gordon Turnbull, John Butt, Eva Moreda Rodriguez, Amanda Smith Biela, Harry Campbell, Morag Greig, Andrew Woolley, Andy Greenwood, Richard Sher, Robert Ford, Ruth Perry, Stuart Edyman, Deborah Kemper, Paul Boucher, Jeremy Barlow, Albert Hutchings, John Bates, Robert Head, Sylvester, Stephen Jackson, Robert Bigio, Rosalind Halton, Christopher D. S. Field, Elaine White, David Clements, and, especially, Hamish.
Author’s declaration

Name: Elizabeth Cary Ford

Student number: 1100935F

Course name: Ph.D. in music

Assignment: Ph.D. thesis

I confirm that this assignment is my own work and that I have:

Read and understood the guidance on plagiarism in the Student Handbook, including the University of Glasgow Statement on Plagiarism

Clearly referenced, in both the text and the bibliography or references, all sources used in the work

Fully referenced (including page numbers) and used inverted commas for all text quoted from books, journals, web etc.

Provided the sources for all tables, figures, data etc. that are not my own work

Not made use of the work of any other student(s) past or present without acknowledgement. This includes any of my own work, that has been previously, or concurrently, submitted for assessment either at this or any other educational institution, including school

Not sought or used the services of any professional agencies to produce this work

In addition, I understand that any false claim in respect of this work will result in disciplinary action in accordance with University regulations

DECLARATION

I am aware of and understand the University’s policy on plagiarism and I certify that this assignment is my own work, except where indicated by referencing, and that I have followed the good academic practices noted above.

Signed:

Date:
1. Introduction

1.1 William Tytler’s origin myth for the flute in Scotland

I have heard, that Sir Gilbert Elliot, afterwards Lord Justice Clerk, who had been taught the German flute in France, and was a fine performer, first introduced that instrument into Scotland about the year 1725.\(^1\)

The antiquarian, solicitor, and flute player William Tytler of Woodhouselee (1711–1792) wrote this in his 1792 essay on a St Cecilia’s Day concert in Edinburgh, and it has served as the origin myth of the history of the transverse flute in Scotland ever since.

The evidence, however, shows that Tytler’s statement is inaccurate. Travel between Britain and continental Europe brought flutes to Scotland much earlier than 1725. Letters and manuscripts from Scotland show that the German flute was known there by 1702 at least,\(^2\) and Pierre Bressan was making flutes in London by 1691.\(^3\) The first Irish music published in Ireland was for flute, in 1724. There is no reason to suppose Scotland lagged behind Europe in terms of flute-related activities. This evidence for flute-related activities in Scotland prior to 1725 will be examined in detail throughout this thesis.

The transverse flute, or German flute, was one of the most popular instruments in the eighteenth century, yet it is noticeably absent from studies of Scottish music. References to the transverse flute and flute-players are present, but fleeting; all are based on the assumption that the instrument was simply not known prior to the first quarter of the century. That flute sonatas were written and published in Scotland and that most publications of Scottish tunes with variations listed flute on the title page is ignored,\(^4\) without considering the question of why one would bother going to the trouble of marketing music to flute players when there were not very many flute players around to

---

2 See Chapter 2, ‘Gentlemen amateurs.’
4 The first sonatas published in Scotland by a Scottish composer were for the flute: the sixth sonata of William McGibbon’s 1729 trio sonatas is specified for German flute and violin. See Chapter 6, ‘Repertoire.’
play it. Books devoted to the history of the flute also ignore Scotland and Scottish flute players. This marginalization of the flute is the consequence of a vocal music or fiddle- and bagpipe-centric view of Scottish music; this is very much alive today even among flute players who want to play Scottish repertoire, many scholars, as well as the general public. A RILM search shows that of the many publications in the last fifteen years about some aspect of Scottish music, two have been about the flute.

The flute’s role in Scottish music is something many amateur flute players are desperate to understand, and they in large part have adopted the music and traditions of Ireland for their own use, attempting, in the words of one participant at the Second Annual Scottish Flute Day in May 2015, to ‘make it sound meaningfully Scottish because we don’t have anything.’ Present-day folk musicians who play traditional Scottish flute repertoire, such as Kenny Hadden, Gordon Turnbull, and Hamish Napier, are attempting to give the flute a place in traditional Scottish music, but even they feel overshadowed by Ireland. Turnbull speculates that the flute was not considered ‘Scottish enough’ for the nineteenth-century antiquarians such as Sir Walter Scott, and was quietly banished. Another possible explanation is that the flute was more prominently a concert instrument, and it has

---

5 Approximately twenty sets of flute sonatas were produced in Scotland or by Scottish composers living elsewhere, and many volumes of Scottish tunes either had German flute listed as a possible instrument on the title page or included specific flute arrangements. See Chapter 6, ‘Repertoire’, for an exploration of Scottish eighteenth-century flute literature.


7 Many publications have been devoted to the fiddle and bagpipe, and when casually mentioned to most people that my research concerns the flute in Scotland, I am told that ‘that’s an Irish thing’, that the flute never existed in Scotland.


9 When I discussed Scottish flute music with Hamish Napier, all the references and suggested texts he gave me were Irish.

10 Gordon Turnbull and Flute Day participants, private communication with author.
been assumed that it did not enjoy the dual existence in the concert hall and at the pub or country dance that the violin had.

This thesis seeks to explore what the role of the flute was in Scottish musical life in the eighteenth century, to rectify misconceptions, and restore it to its place in literature and practice on the subject. It seeks to address the questions of who played the flute, what the repertoire was, and what instruments were in use.

1.2 What is a flute?11

As is perhaps obvious from the opening section, by flute I mean the transverse flute. In modern usage, flute is generally assumed to refer to the transverse instrument in some form or another, modern or historical. In the eighteenth century, in Scotland and elsewhere, this was not the case, as discussed below in section 1.6 and Chapter 8 ‘Instruments’. In eighteenth-century Scotland, ‘flute’ could mean recorder, transverse flute, or possibly another instrument such as the voice flute, the Scots flute, or a fife. Because of this variety of terms and the potential resulting confusion, I have used the following criteria to better determine which instrument is meant:

1. Context of the usage. If it seems new and cutting-edge, I assume transverse flute.

2. Date. Earlier in the century, without the designation of ‘German’, I assume recorder.

3. Key signature and range of music. Because of the differences in shape and design, the transverse flute favours sharp key signatures. The one-keyed flute has a range from d` to a``;\textsuperscript{12} the alto recorder has a range from f` to g``.

The flute and the recorder are both woodwind instruments that sound without the use of a reed. The concert flute falls under the Horenbostel-Sachs classification of 421.121.2, a side-blown flute with a stopped end and fingerholes; the recorder falls under 421.211.11, a duct flute with fingerholes.\textsuperscript{13} The primary differences in the instruments are the way they are held and the way the sound is produced: for a transverse flute air vibrates across the opposite wall of the embouchure hole which is blown across by the player, whereas air is blown into a recorder. Use of the flute and the recorder overlapped in the eighteenth century, with the transverse instrument gaining popularity over the recorder in the first quarter of the eighteenth century.\textsuperscript{14}

Unfortunately not everyone made the distinction between transverse flute and recorder; some used the word ‘flute’ more or less interchangeably. It is sometimes possible to tell which instrument was meant by a composer by simply looking at the music. Music meant for transverse flute was usually written in sharp keys; flat key signatures are difficult to play in tune and have a weaker sound due to cross-fingered notes.\textsuperscript{15} The recorder was known as the flute, the English flute, the common flute, or the flute à bec, and these terminology problems sometimes lead to confusion when studying the flute in the eighteenth century. For the sake of clarity, flute when used in this thesis refers to the transverse instrument.\textsuperscript{16} Other members of the flute family found in Scotland in the

\textsuperscript{12} Although Alexander Bruce’s 1717 manuscript shows fingerings going to b-flat`. See Chapter 7, ‘Manuscripts’.
\textsuperscript{15} The recorder favours flat key signatures for similar reasons.
\textsuperscript{16} Sir John Graham Dalyell was aware of the possible terminology issues, and notes that the flute was sometimes called the flute-recorder. John Graham Dalyell, \textit{Musical Memoirs of Scotland} (Edinburgh: Thomas G. Stevenson, 1849), 152–156.
eighteenth century were fifes, which always have a military connotation, and there is one tantalizing reference to something called a ‘Scots flute’, for which no evidence or further explanation survives.\textsuperscript{17} The octavo flute, described by James Scott Skinner as part of the dance band line-up of his childhood in the 1850s,\textsuperscript{18} is almost certainly a piccolo.\textsuperscript{19}

1.3 Literature review

Scholarly studies on music in eighteenth-century Scotland generally devote very little attention to the flute, and what information is given invariably starts with Tytler’s date of 1725, so all received history of the flute in eighteenth-century Scotland is based on inaccurate information. Works devoted to music in eighteenth-century Britain leave Scotland out,\textsuperscript{20} and the contribution of Scottish musicians to the development of flute pedagogy in the eighteenth century are ignored in writings on the history of the flute. Clearly, the relationship between Scotland and the flute is badly served by literature.

There are certain supposed truths regarding the flute in the eighteenth century, particularly in Scotland, accepted and sometimes generated by the scholarly literature:

1. The flute was unknown in Scotland prior to 1725;  

2. The flute was only played by wealthy male amateurs;

\footnote{17 Isaac Cooper of Banff offered lessons on the elusive ‘Scots flute’. This is discussed further in Chapter 5, ‘Professional musicians’. Mary Anne Alburger, \textit{Scottish Fiddlers and their Music} (Edinburgh: The Hardie Press, 1996), 89.  
3. The flute was not nearly as popular as the violin/fiddle or the bagpipe;

4. The flute was only a concert instrument and had no place in traditional music.

David Johnson’s three books, *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*, *Scottish Fiddle Music in the Eighteenth Century*, and *Chamber Music of Eighteenth-Century Scotland*, are the starting point for much of the secondary literature on eighteenth-century Scottish music. John Purser’s encyclopedic *Scotland’s Music* also provides context and background, but lacks detail. Henry Farmer’s *History of Music in Scotland* is dated, and information in it has been superseded by Johnson, but his lesser-known *Music Making in the Olden Days* fills in many gaps about the Aberdeen Musical Society (active 1748-1805).21 The PhD theses of Helen Goodwill, Sonia Tinagli Baxter, John Cranmer, and Jennifer McLeod provide more detail on specific issues with a little focus on the flute. Mary Anne Alburger’s *Scottish Fiddlers and their Music* surprisingly provides some information about flute teachers. These secondary sources provide a picture of the cultural climate, society, and music education in eighteenth-century Scotland, with some fleeting mentions of the flute’s place.

Of the authors of general histories of Scottish music, Farmer devotes the most space to the flute, saying that it ‘ran the violin very close in popularity…’ though he stresses that the instrument could be either the recorder or the transverse flute, showing sensitivity to the terminology problem.22 Farmer was more sympathetic to the flute than later scholars such as Johnson and Purser, and treated the compositions of William McGibbon and John Reid with greater respect, although he described McGibbon’s flute duets as ‘formal and stilted’, but then blamed the instrument rather than the composer.23 Farmer’s work likely reflects the stylistic preferences and biases of the 1940s and 1950s.

---


23 Ibid, 332.
In his shorter volume devoted to the Aberdeen Musical Society, the flute is shown to have had an active role in Aberdeen’s cultural life. Several members of the society are listed as having played flute, and the society owned flutes and flute music.\(^{24}\)

Modern scholarship on eighteenth-century Scottish music owes much to David Johnson, whose contributions to the field were larger than anyone else’s at the time he was working. His *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*\(^{25}\) is, however, riddled with bias against the flute, and, at times, apologetic for its subject. Johnson suggests that the flute was only played by gentlemen amateurs and not present until 1725,\(^ {26}\) and that General John Reid’s flute sonatas may not have entirely been his own work.\(^ {27}\) Johnson’s work is strong for how he delineates and specifies nationalistic tendencies (although he claimed it might not be the best book for a hardcore Scottish nationalist to read)\(^ {28}\) but the tendency to categorise music as specifically either folk or classical is problematic, and perpetuated in his other writing. In *Scottish Fiddle Music in the Eighteenth Century* he re-assigned a sonata by John Reid that was written for the flute for the violin,\(^ {29}\) which is remarkable given that in his earlier book Johnson speculated that Reid had had help with his compositions. In the companion volume, *Chamber Music of Eighteenth-Century Scotland*,\(^ {30}\) Johnson again re-assigned music for the flute for other instruments.\(^ {31}\) The picture of the flute that emerges from Johnson’s three works is shady,

\(^{24}\) Some of this information is corroborated by the Aberdeen Musical Society records, and some is not, though other primary source material indicates the flute was popular in north-east Scotland. Henry George Farmer, *Music Making in the Olden Days* (London: Peters–Hinrichsen Edition Ltd., 1950).


\(^{26}\) Ibid, 23–24.

\(^{27}\) Ibid, 60.

\(^{28}\) Ibid, 199–200.


\(^{31}\) See Chapter 6, ‘Repertoire’. In his own edition of the sixth trio sonata from McGibbon’s 1729 set, which is specified for German flute and violin, Johnson argues that ‘practical experiment’ shows it is not ‘ideally suited’ to the Baroque flute. Johnson, *Chamber Music of Eighteenth-century Scotland*, 189. In *Scottish Fiddle Music in the Eighteenth Century*, he discusses sonatas at length, and then chooses a flute sonata by John Reid as his only musical example, arguing it is an example of a fine Scottish violin composition, when it is in fact nothing of the sort. Johnson, *Scottish Fiddle Music in the Eighteenth Century*, 192–211.
and coloured by his own obvious preference for the violin. The flute makes no appearance in his lengthy folk music sections, but given that he started from the assumption that only wealthy men played it, and that the only types of music that existed in Scotland were classical and folk, this is perhaps not surprising. Johnson’s work has been influential largely because he was, for many years, the only scholar working in eighteenth-century Scottish music and therefore he became by default the authority.

John Purser takes his cues from Johnson, and while he is certainly not guilty of apologizing for or dismissing any part of his subject, he is guilty of ignoring evidence of the flute’s active role in Scottish musical life. Scotland’s Music provides a general overview of Scottish music history, in which the flute plays an unsurprisingly minor part in the eighteenth century. He repeats that it was unknown prior to 1725, popular after that, and quotes the literary society hostess Mrs Cockburn’s description of amateur flute-playing composer General Reid’s performance, which will be discussed later. Flint and bone flutes, and the bell-ended flute painted on the ceiling of the sixteenth-century Crathes Castle, as well as later notable instances of Scottish flute playing are given some attention elsewhere in the book, so Purser cannot be described as anti-flute; the scope of his work is such that no topic is treated with any great detail.

The flute is entirely absent from Francis Collinson’s The Traditional and National Music of Scotland, giving support to the notion that there is no tradition of flute playing in

---

32 Purser’s work is a very general history, and he gives more space to General Reid than other authors do, though he also persists in claiming there was no flute in Scotland prior to 1725. John Purser, Scotland’s Music, 2nd edn (Edinburgh: Mainstream Publishing, 2007), 226. The evidence of a flute in Scotland in 1717 in the form of a photocopy of Alexander Bruce’s manuscript, given to Purser by Lord Balfour of Burleigh, was found on Purser’s bookshelf. The evidence was under his nose all along. When confronted, he had the decency to blush.

33 Purser provides no evidence for the flute’s popularity.


35 Purser, Scotland’s Music, 21, 141.

36 Purser admits he should have paid more attention to the flute, especially considering how many unknown flute sources were found by me in his library. John Purser, private communication with author.
Scotland in any setting outside the concert hall. However, when compared to the double life of the violin/fiddle, this is surprising. This is perhaps because the flute, as a newly fashionable instrument in the eighteenth century, was associated with concert music and genteel society, and that assumption underlies the research. Collinson ignores the presence of the flute in most printed collections of Scottish tunes, which indicate a market for traditional music printed for flute players. By comparison, Mary Anne Alburger provides much more information about the flute, by discussing dancing teachers and music teachers, as well as printed music collections.

Helen Goodwill assesses the musical activities of the landed classes of Scotland through evidence of their patronage, music collections, and music education. She portrays the Scottish upper class as key to the development and preservation of music in eighteenth-century Scotland. The flute, by her account, was moderately popular: music for flute appears in some of the families’ music collections, and some families (notably the Baillies of Mellerstain, who will be discussed later in greater detail) provided flute lessons to their children. She also notes the place and role of the music teacher in this society, especially the flute teacher Mr McGibbon. The picture that emerges of the flute is that it was one of the instruments favoured by the upper classes, alongside the harpsichord, violin, and viol.

Sonia Tinagli Baxter’s study of the role of Italian musicians in Scottish musical life shows the contributions immigrants made to music in Scotland, and by extension, to the flute. While none of the Italian musicians she studied was a dedicated flute player, and only two of them published flute music while in Scotland, the contributions of Lorenzo

40 The dates for this activity are well before Tytler’s no-flute-prior-to-1725.
Bocchi, Francesco Barsanti, Pietro Urbani, and Domenico Corri, all of whom composed for flute, were significant to the musical environment in Scotland in the eighteenth century. Jennifer MacLeod’s thesis on the Edinburgh Musical Society shows the role of the flute in the Society’s orchestra and concert series. She shows that it was most often played by amateurs, though a couple of flute players were employed by the Society.

John Cranmer’s thesis looks at music in Edinburgh in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. He suggests some reasons for the nineteenth-century prohibition against women playing the flute, though he avoids speculation on how widespread flute playing actually was among Scottish women, and determines that by the time of his study (1780–1830) the flute was taught by generalist music teachers, not specialists, and that the flute was featured in concerts, sometimes by visiting musicians.

An image reproduced in Claire Nelson’s thesis may shed light on why the flute has not been considered Scottish enough. It was first printed in 1763 and shows a woman seated on a throne playing a flute next to a man playing the bagpipes. The figures are supposed to represent the Dowager Queen, who was German, with her German flute, and the Earl of Bute. The bagpipes were used to represent the threat to the German-born British monarchy post-Jacobite rebellion. An association with the Hanoverian monarchy

---

42 Baxter mentions a number of Italian composers living in Scotland who composed for the transverse flute, but much of the music was published outside of Scotland. The flute in the Bocchi sonatas could be transverse or recorder. Peter Holman suggests that Bocchi’s flute writing was influenced by his time in Scotland. Peter Holman, “A Little Light on Lorenzo Bocchi: An Italian in Edinburgh and Dublin,” in *Music in the British Provinces, 1690–1914*, ed. Rachel Cowgill and Peter Holman (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007), 61-86.


46 Ibid, 37.
could well explain why the flute, simply by virtue of the designation ‘German’, was not Scottish enough for Scotland.

The secondary literature on Scottish music, as it relates to the flute in the eighteenth century, is rooted in the same assumptions regarding dates, players, social station, and repertoire, which do not stand up under scrutiny, as will be demonstrated through this thesis. Upon a closer study, both of the secondary literature and primary sources, the accepted truths listed above are seen to be demonstrably untrue. Tytler’s origin myth has already been debunked, and one of the female flute players frequently mentioned in writings on Scottish music received a flute as a gift prior to 1725. Many eighteenth-century publications of traditional Scottish music had specific arrangements for the flute, and there is evidence of the instrument’s popularity in the lower classes of society. I will explore and highlight these contradictions throughout this thesis.

1.4 What this thesis tries to do and why we should care

Scottish flute music has gained some attention via performers, bringing this all but unknown repertoire to an audience, but this is the first attempt at a scholarly study to back up this work. There is one doctoral thesis on eighteenth-century Scottish flute repertoire, but its focus is limited to repertoire and the idea of traditional performance within an eighteenth-century style and does not fully embrace the now-accepted concept

---

47 Chris Norman leads the way in recordings devoted to or featuring flute music from eighteenth-century Scotland, and through his Boxwood workshops can be credited with reviving the repertoire. Chris Norman, Let Me In This Ae Night, Boxwood Media, 2011; Concerto Caledonia, Lion, Boxwood Media, 2007; Chris Norman with Byron Schenkman, Wind & Wire, Boxwood Media, 2003; Chris Norman Ensemble, The Caledonian Flute, Boxwood Media, 2002; Concerto Caledonia, Mungrel Stuff, Linn Records, 2001; Chatham Baroque, Reel of Tulloch, Dorian Recordings, 2000; Concerto Caledonia, Colin’s Kisses, Linn Records, 1999. Alison Melville has one recording devoted to Scottish music for flute or recorder: She’s Sweetest When She’s Naked, EMCCD, 2005. The Broadside Band has released a recording of James Oswald’s Airs for the Seasons (Dorian, 1998), with the flute featured in many of the airs.

that in the eighteenth century the lines now drawn between the traditional and art music idioms did not exist.\textsuperscript{49}

Matthew Gelbart’s opening premise that the Lully air “Sommes-nous pas trop heureux” would have been as well known as “John Anderson My Jo” in eighteenth-century Scotland is borne out by manuscript sources for flute,\textsuperscript{50} as well as earlier printed sources of flute repertoire, such as Munro’s *Recueil des meilleurs airs ecossois pour la flûte traversière et la basse avec plusieurs divisions et variations* which consists of Scottish tunes arranged in French-style suites.\textsuperscript{51} While other writers, such as Johnson and Swinden, categorise music based on origin, he argues that the function of the music is what is important, and that the significance of the music’s origin came with the later eighteenth century, and the nineteenth. Gelbart’s focus is the culture and context, not the specific history of music in eighteenth-century Scotland, so aside from the relative Scottishness of the bagpipes and fiddle, instruments play a minor role.\textsuperscript{52} Gelbart does, however, provide a framework within which to consider the music of eighteenth-century Scotland.

Histories of eighteenth-century music largely ignore Scotland, apparently with the assumption that either Scotland was a cultural backwater, which has no grounds given the ideological and cultural climate of Scotland in the eighteenth century due to the Enlightenment and the political upheavals of the Act of Union and the Jacobite Rebellions; or that what was true in England must also have been true in Scotland, as they are two small countries with a shared government on the same landmass. Other general histories of Scottish music simply ignore the flute; the omissions of Johnson and Purser have been

\textsuperscript{49} This is explored in detail by Matthew Gelbart in *The Invention of ‘Folk Music’ and ‘Art Music’: Emerging Categories from Ossian to Wagner* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), and to a lesser extent by Roger Fiske in *Scotland in Music: A European Enthusiasm* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983).

\textsuperscript{50} Gelbart, *The Invention of ‘Folk Music’ and ‘Art Music’*, 1, 14-20; As will be discussed further, Scottish manuscripts from the eighteenth century contain ‘traditional’ music alongside ‘art’ music. See Chapter 7, ‘Manuscripts’.


\textsuperscript{52} Gelbart, *The Invention of ‘Folk Music’ and ‘Art Music’*, 2.
noted above, and other contemporary writers on Scottish music focus exclusively on Gaelic song, fiddle music, or the bagpipes, areas in which it is assumed the flute played no part. While there is no evidence for the flute in Gaelic-speaking Scotland, there is some very little evidence of the flute having the same double life in the concert hall and country dance as did the violin, and there is equally little but tantalizing evidence of overlaps between the flute and the bagpipes. This does then hint that perhaps, as suggested by Gordon Turnbull, the flute is insufficiently Scottish for most people working in Scottish music and related scholarship.

This thesis seeks to address the following questions: how widespread was flute playing, both geographically and socially? When did the German flute begin to appear in Scotland? What do manuscript sources of flute music indicate about flute playing? Were there well-known flute players aside from General Reid and Susanna Kennedy? How common was it for girls or ladies to learn flute? In what contexts did flute playing happen: concert halls, dances, at home, military bands or civic organizations? What instruments were available and were these made in Scotland? What music was played, and how much of it was of Scottish origin? Was Scottish musical life in the eighteenth century as fiddle-centric as most authors believe? Answers to these questions should result in a better understanding of the place of the flute in musical life in Scotland in the eighteenth century, as well as the place of the flute in Scotland in the overall picture of music in the eighteenth century, and change the picture of music in Scotland as a whole.

A complete picture of the flute in Scottish musical life is important because scholarship on the flute in Scotland has for far too long relied on a basic error, and ensuing misconceptions; it is high time to restore the instrument to its proper place in the history of Scottish music. Without such a study, a balanced picture of the history of the music of eighteenth-century Scotland is impossible.

---

53 My study of flute playing in Highland Scotland is limited by my rudimentary Gaelic.
1.5 Methodology

This thesis relies heavily on archival research, particularly papers held in the National Records Office of Scotland, the National Library of Scotland, the Montagu Music Collection, the Edinburgh University Library, the National Museum of Scotland, and the papers of Lord Balfour of Burleigh. These documents, often found by simply searching ‘flute’ or ‘German flute’ with a date range of 1690-1820 in online catalogues, include contemporary letters and receipts, mentions in poems, novels, and dedications which give a picture of the world in which the flute was played. Discussions with musicians and instrument makers have helped to define what questions I might not have thought of, and how practical some of the answers I have generated, especially as regards wood turning, are. To determine if the repertoire fits on the one-keyed flute, or was perhaps better suited to the recorder or violin, I took the practical approach of playing through it all myself. Surviving flutes have been studied in person when possible, with reference to The New Langwill Index for information on makers and dates, as well as consultation with flute makers working today. Manuscripts were located and studied using David Johnson’s list in the final pages of Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century as a starting point, and from there suggestions from colleagues and other manuscripts in other libraries and private collections Johnson did not list. Regarding lady flute players, I started with the notion that it was unusual, and decided to see if that was in fact the case historically by reading letters and conduct books from the eighteenth century to gain a better sense of women’s education. Combined, these methods result in what is hoped to be a more complete picture of the flute in musical life in eighteenth-century Scotland.

54 And, in the case of William McGibbon’s sonatas, with violinists Aaron McGregor and Emma Lloyd, harpsichordist Allan Wright, and flute player Deborah Kemper.
56 Including Rod Cameron, John Gallagher, Chris Norman, and Martin Wenner.
57 Johnson, Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century, 209-211.
1.6 Brief history of the flute up to the eighteenth century

The flute of the eighteenth century underwent vast technological improvements over earlier versions of the instrument, which were little more than hollow tubes, stopped at one end, in one or two pieces, with holes for the fingers and the mouth. These early flutes are the simplest of instruments: sound is produced by blowing across the tube, and the fingers alter the length of the air column and produce different notes. Flutes until the middle of the seventeenth century were consort instruments in a variety of sizes for playing in different tonalities.  

The instrument evolved again substantially sometime before 1692. The frontispiece of Marin Marais’s 1692 *Pièces en trio pour les flûtes, violon, et dessus de viole,* clearly shows a viol, a bassoon, recorders, and two flutes both with elaborate ferrules and a little key on the end, arranged around the title. At this time in France, the flute would have been presumed to have meant the recorder; in French the transverse instrument was known as the flûte traversière or the flûte d’Allemagne, but Marais was clearly marketing to the new world of transverse flute players. The addition of the key on the end of the flute revolutionized flute playing, as did the other changes in design of this new instrument. The key made the instrument fully chromatic, and the design of a bore that tapered towards the bottom changed the sound from somewhat shrill and weak to low and mellow, a sound favoured in France. The flute was now in three pieces—the head joint, the long middle section with the finger holes, and the foot joint with the key—which made the basic practicalities of storage and cleaning the instrument fairly simple.

---

58 Anne Smith provides a list of all the sources that give specific information on the Renaissance flute. Anne Smith, ‘The Renaissance Flute,’ in *The Early Flute* by John Solum (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992), 16–19.

Most flute historians agree that a member of the Hotteterre family was responsible for this redesign of the flute. The Hotteterres were instrument makers and musicians at the French court, and a member of the family had earlier added keys to the oboe. The most famous member of the family, Jacques ‘le Romain’ (1674–1763), wrote the first method book for the one-keyed instrument, *Principes de la Flute*, as well as a number of suites and other pedagogical works.

In the 1730s, the flute’s design changed again, into four pieces. The long middle joint of the French-style was divided in two with the top section having the option of swapping for sections of different lengths, called a *corps de réchange*, which made playing at the non-universal pitch standards of the eighteenth century much simpler. This one-keyed four-piece instrument was the primary flute of the eighteenth century. Additional keys began to be added in the 1780s, and by the middle of the nineteenth century the flute underwent another massive redesign.

The flute, perhaps unlike other instruments, faces something of a terminology problem, especially eighteenth-century references in English-speaking countries. ‘Flute’, when used in modern parlance, exclusively refers to the transverse flute. In the eighteenth century, it generally meant the recorder, the instrument it eventually superseded. The transverse flute was usually referred to as the German flute, but not always; it sometimes was simply the ‘flute’, or helpfully the ‘transverse flute’. The recorder lost popularity as the transverse flute caught on because the new instrument was capable of greater subtlety and nuance, and with the rise of opera, better matched the timbre of the human voice.61

---

The redesigned flute rapidly became one of the most popular instruments, for professional musicians as well as amateurs. Virtuoso players in France such as Descoutteaux, Hotteterre, Buffardin, and Blavet popularized the instrument, and one of the most distinguished flute players of the middle of the eighteenth century was Frederick II of Prussia, whose teacher, Johann Joachim Quantz, wrote one of the longest treatises on the instrument and on performance style and general musicianship. The flute became the popular and fashionable instrument for wealthy amateur musicians: it was of the moment, and required leisure time to practise because it is not a simple instrument to play well. In Scotland, this was clearly the case: the majority of known flute players were wealthy men.

The flute has long had associations with war, pastoral life, and sex. These associations, generally through art and mythology, inform contexts in which the flute is found and perceived socially, as well as modern views of the history of the instrument. The mythological invention of the flute by the god Pan was itself connected with a thwarted rape. Overcome by desire for the nymph Syrinx, he gave chase. Syrinx ran, and as Pan closed in on her, her father, a river god, turned her into a bunch of reeds. Pan cut them, and turned them into the first flute. Pan was also the god of shepherds, which possibly is how the flute gained its pastoral associations as the shepherd’s pipe, and one of his god-like attributes was his sexual prowess and virility.

The flute gained military associations through its military cousin, the fife, as well as a possible dual use in military and chamber settings prior to the sixteenth century. In the nineteenth century, these were seen as highly masculine affiliations, and between that
and what was perceived as the somewhat ungraceful playing position required for the flute, the instrument was deemed unsuitable for ladies. The nineteenth century prohibition has been allowed to colour present-day understandings of the flute in earlier centuries, creating an assumption that ‘nice girls didn’t play flute’. Actually, there is much evidence that women played the flute all over Europe in the eighteenth century and earlier, Scotland included. The only explicit eighteenth-century prohibition against ladies playing flute comes from an English conduct book published in 1722. As Alden Cavanaugh notes, reasons for avoiding certain instruments were usually assumed in the eighteenth century, rather than explicitly stated.

1.7 The flute in Scotland

Iconographical evidence for the transverse flute in Scotland goes back to at least the sixteenth century. The fountain at Linlithgow Palace, one of James V’s additions to the courtyard, dates from 1538, and among the carved creatures depicted on the fountain is a satyr playing a transverse flute. The flute is an accurate representation of the one-piece instruments of the sixteenth century. While this sculpture does not suggest that the flute was played in Scotland, it does suggest that it was, at least, known.

The earliest picture of a flute in a Scottish source is painted on the ceiling at Crathes Castle, Banchory, Aberdeenshire, and dates from 1599. The ceiling in the

---

68 It is not known how influential Essex’s work was; he was a dancing master by profession. John Essex, *The Young Ladies Conduct* (London: 1722), 84–85.
70 This suggests that the pastoral and sexual connotations of the instrument were known in Scotland.
71 An inventory of Holyroodhouse Palace during the reign of James VI contained a consort of flutes. Chris Norman, personal communication with author. No trace of the inventory or the instruments now exists.
Debra Clarke, Curator, Holyroodhouse Palace, personal communication with author.
72 With its mix of humans and mythological characters no part of the fountain should be taken as representative of the state of affairs in Scotland c. 1538.
73 Built by the Burnet of Leys family in 1596, Crathes Castle is now in the care of the National Trust for Scotland.
Muses’ Chamber depicts seven of the nine muses arranged playing instruments;\(^7^4\) Euterpe holds a flute in playing position.\(^7^5\) The inscription on the ceiling near her describes it as a ‘quhissile,’ but the instrument is definitely a transverse flute.\(^7^6\) What makes this flute interesting is that it is unique in the Western world: the end flares into a bell. No evidence that this flute had a model in real life exists; all indications are that this was probably a case of artistic license.\(^7^7\) While the hand position of the player is well-observed, the embouchure is terrible: her cheeks are puffed out, which makes producing an airstream to blow across the instrument impossible. The artist who painted the ceiling at Crathes must have been aware of the various attributes of the muses: Euterpe is the muse of lyric poetry, joy, pleasure, and flute players.\(^7^8\)

Dalyell wrote in 1849 that there was confusion about various instruments known in Scotland, the flute included:

> The pipe, whistle, flute, shalms, hautbois, double-curtel or bassoon, the horn and trumpet, are all distinctly specified, and some of them delineated among the instruments known in Scotland. But their names when employed by the illiterate often appear generic rather than specific.\(^7^9\)

Dalyell continued looking into the terminology issues surrounding the flute, and mentions that in the sixteenth century each town in Scotland employed either a piper or a fifer; he goes on to observe that the flute is rarely mentioned in Scottish music history,\(^8^0\) and although he was writing in the middle of the nineteenth century, that certainly remains true.

\(^7^4\) Polyhymnia plays a keyboard instrument, probably a virginal, Calliope has a harp, Erato a cittern, Thalia has a treble viol, Melpomene plays bass viol, and Terpsichore has a lute. They are joined by the Seven Virtues and the other two muses.
\(^7^5\) The instruments on the ceiling have many inaccuracies, contrary to John Purser’s belief that they are well-observed. John Purser, ‘Crathes: Source of Heavenly Harmony,’ Leopard Magazine (September 2009): 10–13.
\(^7^6\) It reads in full: Euterpe, I am this arte did found / To playe on quihissile first devysit. / All melodie and plesand sound, / Be me they be better prysit.’ Reprinted in leaflet on the Crathes painted ceilings, National Trust for Scotland, 10.
\(^7^7\) A reconstruction of the Crathes Castle flute has been made by flute maker Rod Cameron in an attempt to determine what effect the bell would have on the instrument’s sound. Research and experimentation are ongoing.
\(^7^8\) “The 9 Muses: Their Realms and Their Attributes,” University of Arkansas, accessed 16 March, 2016, http://www.uark.edu/campus-resources/dlevine/Muses.html
\(^7^9\) John Graham Dalyell, Musical Memoirs of Scotland, 152.
\(^8^0\) Ibid, 154–155.
One interpretation of this apparent difference in popularity could be that the flute disappeared from Scottish music; another, more likely, is that it was simply ignored in favour of more stereotypically Scottish instruments, namely the bagpipe and the fiddle.

Some references to the flute in Scotland in the eighteenth come from non-musical sources, which show that the instrument was indeed known and enjoyed in Scottish cultural life. The 1723 poem ‘Edina’s Glory’ shows that not only was the flute popular in Scottish life before 1725, it was played by ladies. James Freebairn, in his 1727 *L’Eloge d’Ecosse et des Dames Ecossoises* lists ladies who played flute, and specified that it was transverse. Tobias Smollet, in his 1771 novel *The Expedition of Humphrey Clinker* said that ‘The Scots are all musicians—Ever man you meet plays on the flute, the violin, or the violoncello…’ Since music history has failed the flute in Scotland, literary sources can be used fill in some of the gaps to ascertain at least that the flute had equal footing with the violin in Scottish cultural life.

1.8 Scotland in the eighteenth century

Scotland in the eighteenth century was a hotbed of political, philosophical, and cultural life. The cultural climate was influenced by the Act of Union of 1707, which tied

---

81 ‘Edina’s Glory, or the Fair Assembly, a poem in defense of musick, wit and gallantry, as it prevails ’mongst the polite in their weekly sessions, holden at the metropolis of Scotland. By a Scottish gentleman.’ Printed and sold by Alexander Davidson, 1723. The section in question reads: ‘…’Till now when was Edina’s daughters known / To have their Fame to foreign Climates blown: / To fad a Billet doux and breath a Flute, / Make pastry Pyramids and Candy fruit, / Ombre a common Ball, Tea Table Chat, / Was all the Education which they got.’

82 This is discussed further in Chapter 4, ‘Ladies’. James Freebairn, *L’Eloge d’Ecosse et des Dames Ecossoises* (Edinburgh, 1727), 42.


Scotland to England, the Jacobite rebellions, ending in 1746 with Prince Charles Edward Stuart’s crushing defeat at Culloden, and the Enlightenment. Life was predominantly rural, though cities began to prosper during the century. The divisions between wealthy and poor were vast, as were the divisions between urban and rural populations.

1.9 Scottish music outside of Scotland as it relates to the flute

A romanticized notion of Scotland took hold of London in the early eighteenth century although Scottish music was already in fashion there some decades earlier. The first edition of John Playford’s The English Dancing Master (1651) had 105 tunes, many of which were of Scottish origin. Scotland was perceived as a mysterious place and this idea captured the popular imagination. In 1700 Henry Playford published the Collection of Original Scots Tunes (full of Highland Humours) for the Violin, Being the First of this Kind yet Printed; Several being within the Compass of the Flute. This was the first dedicated collection of Scottish music published in England, and many more followed.

The song collection Orpheus Caledonius was born out of the popularity of Scottish music in London, and the desire for a recognizably British culture. In the first edition of 1725, all fifty of the melodies were arranged for solo flute. The number was cut to twenty-five in the second edition of 1733, though the number of songs increased by another fifty. Farmer suggests that the ones arranged for flute were the most popular, and therefore had the flute option to appeal to a larger market. These arrangements do not appear alongside the songs in either edition; all have been transposed from their original keys into keys easy for the less-experienced transverse flute player. Orpheus Caledonius was published

---

87 Ibid, 10–12.
88 Henry George Farmer, introduction to Orpheus Caledonius, (Hatboro: Folklore Associates, 1962), III.
89 The flute arrangements take up a few pages at the back of the books.
in London, so it may not be an indication of what was being played in Scotland, but it acts as a marker of the allure of Scots tunes in London and as an indicator of Scottish tunes in flute repertoire.

1.10 Summary of investigations to come

The evidence for the flute in eighteenth-century Scotland will be considered and examined through people known to have played flute, including gentlemen amateurs, professional musicians, lower-class amateurs, and ladies; repertoire, both Scottish and popular in Scotland; manuscript evidence; and instruments. The picture that emerges is varied and complex, and shows that the flute played a major role in Scottish musical life from at least the beginning of the eighteenth century to well into the nineteenth.
2. Gentlemen amateurs

2.1 Introduction

The majority of known flute players in eighteenth-century Scotland can be classified as gentlemen amateurs: men with the financial stability and leisure time to devote to practising an instrument.1 “Gentleman” was and is a broad term, used here to refer to a man who had an education and income; if he had a profession, it was not one devoted to trade or manual labour, but rather to those such as law, the church, or medicine.2

The German flute, as a relatively new instrument, was the most fashionable, and its associations with war,3 seduction,4 and masculine power5 made it especially appealing to gentlemen. After it was redesigned with the addition of the key late in the seventeenth century, it surpassed the violin as the most popular instrument for amateur musicians, particularly in France and England.6 With the availability of printed music, music lessons, printed music, music lessons,

1 Powell writes that as the flute’s redesign caught on, and the way people purchased and studied music changed, solo playing for leisure took the place of consort playing. The transverse flute became the popular instrument of choice among the middle and upper classes in northern Europe at the expense of the recorder, lute, and viol. Ardal Powell, *The Flute* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002), 68.
3 The flute’s close relation, the fife, has had a military connotation since the fifteenth century. The fife corps became a special and highly paid group within the English army. Powell, *The Flute*, 27, 60. Perhaps the most famous warrior-flute player is Frederick II of Prussia, (1712–1786) who employed Johann Joachim Quantz as his flute teacher and personal composer.
4 Seduction especially in the pastoral associations from Classical myth, such as the story of Pan and Syrinx. Syrinx was a nymph who was changed into a bundle of reeds to escape rape by Pan, who then turned the reeds into the first flute. Leppert suggests that the flute’s popularity in the first half of the eighteenth century had much to do with the wide-spread obsession with Arcadia. See Richard Leppert, *Art and the Committed Eye* (Boulder: Westview Press, 1996), 225–227. For the story of Pan and Syrinx see Ovid, *Metamorphoses*, trans. A. D. Melville (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986), 21–22.
5 The flute is one of the great phallic symbols. Richard Leppert explores this idea in portraits of gentlemen with instruments in some detail, concluding that the cello, theorbo, flute, and drums symbolize power and control, whereas the harpsichord was decidedly feminine. He cites many examples of flutes in portraits of English aristocrats to show the vitality of the family’s heir. Richard Leppert, *Music and Image: Domesticity, Ideology and Socio-Cultural Formation in Eighteenth-Century England* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 120–125.
6 The flute was played by amateurs and professionals in France, Germany, Italy, and England, but in England it was most popular among amateur musicians. The new design put the formerly limited instrument on equal footing with the violin and oboe in terms of possibilities, and composers and players took full advantage of this. Powell, *The Flute*, 69, 74–75. See also Janice Dockendorff Boland, “A guide to the best eighteenth-century tutors for the one-keyed flute,” in *Fluting and Dancing: Articles and Reminiscences for Betty Bang Mather on her 65th Birthday*, ed. David Lasocki (New York: McGinnish & Marx, 1992), 1–13.
and instruments, it was quite easy for gentlemen to keep up with the latest fashion. Music was an integral part of upper class education for both sexes, and while proficiency was valued, gentlemen were not expected to be virtuoso performers.

In his 1792 article “On the Fashionable Amusements and Entertainments in Edinburgh in the last Century,” William Tytler wrote that the German flute was not known in Scotland until 1725, when it was introduced to the country by Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto, who had learned it in France. The evidence, however, left by the flute players themselves shows otherwise. With international trade and travel becoming easier, and with the social and political changes following the Act of Union, it is foolish to continue to hold on to the notion of Scotland’s cultural development lagging behind the rest of Europe. The German flute was played in Scotland by 1717 at least, as the evidence below demonstrates, and played by a variety of men who may not have travelled to the continent. Several of the flute players were well-travelled noblemen who did study in Europe, but others were students, physicians, writers, lawyers, and soldiers. Some of these men, such as John Reid, William Tytler, and Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto are well-known for their various contributions to Scottish social and political life, whereas others, such as Captain Dalrymple and the Marquess of Montrose’s correspondent, are glimpsed only through lists and receipts. The tastes and preferences of these flute players, if not their abilities, can be determined from their surviving music books, letters, and receipts.

---

7 Powell believes that the affordable publications of John Walsh and Estienne Roger helped to spur the amateur market. Powell, *The Flute*, 70–71.
10 Admittedly this is later than the rest of Europe, but it is so far the earliest date to come to light. I suspect that the flute was played in Scotland before 1717; it was popular in England by 1706 and in France by the 1680s. Powell, *The Flute*, 70–80.
2.2 Anonymous friend of James, 4th Marquess of Montrose, 1685–1744

The Marquess of Montrose and one of his friends were aware of the German flute by 1702, though it is uncertain whether the writer of the letter was Scottish or planning to take his newly acquired instrument to Scotland at any point, so the letter cannot help in physically placing the flute in Scotland that early in the eighteenth century, though it does show that the flute was known there. An unsigned letter dated 25 April 1702 to James, 1st Duke of Montrose, then Marquess of Montrose, describes events in London surrounding the coronation of Queen Anne. In addition to having heard John Abell sing and attending a play, he writes, “I am learning to play upon a German flute which you’ll be deab’d [deafened] with against our parl. [parliament] I shall bring sume new tuns to Mcgibbon.”

The duke and his friend had apparently discussed the instrument at some point, and had heard it played. The first documented performance of a German flute in London was in 1706, but clearly it was known there some time before then. If the marquess’s correspondent was residing in London temporarily, the instrument presumably would have gone home with him, or travelled with him when he went north to visit his friend, as he indicates he will soon do: “Wee will be comming down soon, as I believe I deliverd your Lops [Lordship’s] commissions and believe[s] that sume of your friends has been more punctuall in their duties than me.” Alternatively, the duke would have had to visit his friend in London in order to be deafened by his playing. The marquess may have spent more time in London than his contemporaries and therefore been exposed to new and

11 The Dukedom of Montrose was created by Queen Anne in 1707. The 1st Duke of Montrose is best known for his involvement with Rob Roy. Sir James Balfour, Scots Peerage, VI (Edinburgh: David Douglas, 1909), 261–265.
13 This is a confusing point. John Eccles’s masque The Judgment of Paris includes an air for “Flute D. Almagne” entitled “Hither turn thee, gentle swain,” and was published in 1701, and presumably performed around the same time. Powell writes that the first advertised performance of a German flute in London was in 1706 by Peter la Tour. Perhaps la Tour’s performance was the first solo performance in London. Powell, The Flute, 70.
14 GD220/5/24A.
different music and instruments earlier than most Scots, but the letter shows an awareness of and familiarity with the German flute amongst Scots very early in the eighteenth century.

2.3 Alexander Bruce, 1717

The best evidence that the German flute was known in Scotland prior to 1725 comes from Alexander Bruce’s manuscript of 1717. Details of its contents and unique fingering chart—going above the range of the one-keyed flute of the time—follow in Chapter 7, ‘Scottish music manuscripts from the eighteenth century dedicated to the flute’. The manuscript is owned by Lord Balfour of Burleigh, and was created by or for one of his ancestors, Brigadier General Alexander Bruce (d. 1747).15

2.4 Humphrey Grant and Lewis Colquhoun, 172316

Listed among the 1723 school expenses for brothers Humphrey Grant and Lewis Colquhoun is an entry that reads “A snuff mill to Mr Grant, & a flute to Mr Colquhoun.”17 Later in the list of expenses is an entry for mending the flute. Other expenses include saddles, laundry, tea, sugar, and books. The evidence from the Grant of Grant family papers does not specify that it is a German flute the boys had with them at school, but it is possible; “German flute” was not universally used in English for transverse flute, though it

---

16 Mr Colquhoun is Lewis Colquhoun, Humphrey Grant’s brother. A later entry in the NAS catalogue notes that Humphrey Grant and Lewis Colquhoun were the sons of James Grant of Grant.
17 National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Ogilivy family, the Earls of Seafield, GD248/23/1/3X. The receipts are between the boys’ “governor”, Francis Patterson, and Marjorie Ouchterlony, with whom they lodged.
was gaining popularity, especially in England and France, as an instrument for gentlemen such as the Grant brothers in the 1720s.\(^\text{18}\)

After leaving school, Humphrey went to France and Holland while Lewis studied law. Humphrey incurred his father’s displeasure by going into debt through drinking, gambling, and whoring while travelling, which in due course led to illness. His much put-upon father sent a series of letters to Humphrey in 1726 demanding he leave Paris and go to Liège. Humphrey, and an A. Alexander who apparently disbursed Humphrey’s allowance, responded, Humphrey to protest that his money only went towards food and a new suit, and Mr Alexander to say that Humphrey was beyond hope.\(^\text{19}\)

James Grant was convinced that Humphrey had fallen in with the wrong sort of people, and ordered him on a number of occasions to mend his ways and return home. One of Humphrey’s more contrite letters, written after he finally arrived in Liège, says:

Sir—I received yours last week and shall according to your orders inform you every week what I am doing, since I came here I apply myself to the french, fencing, and flute, which I shall continue untill I leave the place, Since I begun this letter I receivd yours of the 10 September which I am verry sorry, I should have receved, but since it is so I demand only as much monney as will buy a commission in some foreign Regiment for in anny Regiment in Brittain I will never serve after what has passed, as for being miserable that I never fear as long as I continue in health and strength but still shall remain

Sir, Your affectionate Son & Most humble Servant

Hum. Grant

Mr Bruncort offers his humble service to you\(^\text{20}\)

His father did not comment on these activities, though it can be imagined they were more suitable than his usual pursuits of drinking, playing cards, and womanising.\(^\text{21}\) By this date, in northern Europe, flute would almost certainly refer to the transverse flute. By 1730, the transverse flute had become the most fashionable instrument for male amateurs of almost

\(^\text{18}\) It is therefore possible that Humphrey Grant was studying the recorder.
\(^\text{19}\) National Archives of Scotland, Seafield papers, Grant of Grant correspondence, GD248/47/2.
\(^\text{20}\) National Archives of Scotland, Seafield papers, Grant of Grant correspondence, GD248/47/2/15x, dated 10 October 1726.
\(^\text{21}\) Though possibly, from his father’s perspective, just as expensive.
all social ranks in France and Holland. Judging by the letters between father, son, and businessman, it would have been very typical of Humphrey to want to learn the latest, most fashionable instrument.

### 2.5 John McAlla, 1724

In September 1724 John McAlla wrote to a merchant, Robert Harris, asking him to purchase a flute on his behalf in London. It can be assumed Harris regularly purchased instruments for his customers, although German flutes were available locally from Mr Lilie, the maker McAlla mentions in his letter, and from Gavin Godsman in Edinburgh, who ran an advertisement in the *Caledonian Mercury* in the summer of 1720 stating “[t]hat there are all Kinds of bias’d Bouls, Consort Flutes and small Flutes of several Sorts and Sizes, Hautbois and German Flutes…”

McAlla provides detailed guidance to Harris to select an instrument with “bold” low notes and “shrill and sweet” high notes, indicating he was a fairly experienced and discerning player. His familiarity with the flutes of Schuchart and Bressan suggests that these were the instruments most often imported to Scotland from London, or that McAlla had himself encountered them. McAlla’s mention of “Mr Lilie” as an inferior maker in his letter to Robert Harris raises a question of identity. This could be the same Lily who was a turner and instrument maker working in Edinburgh in 1708, in which case transverse flutes were available in Scotland well before the 1720s.

The letter in full reads:

---

23 *Caledonian Mercury*, 24 May 1720, repeated 30 May 1720; 4 June 1720; 14 July 1720; 21 July 1720; 4 August 1720.
From Glasgow, 25 September, 172425

Mr Robert Harris, Sir

I received yours & Observe there’s none of the Turky26 hair to be had with you. You say you can furnish me with it from London. I’ll want half a pound at the price you spoke of as Soon as you can get it. I Desire you’ll be so kind as to buy for me out of some of your Shops one of Schuhard27 or Bressan’s28 German flutes. You’ll call at some man who teaches & has skill of the German flute & desire him to chuse one that is easily & boldly sounded in the low notes, & Sweet & Shril in the high notes. I want none of Mr Lilie’s make for they are neither profitable nor true. So if you cannot get one either of Bressan or Schuaharts make who both live in London, I want none at all. You need grudge no expence to get it good. Advise me first if there’s any of that Sort with you. I am

Your most Humble servant

John McAlla

I have seen some of Schuharts make, screw of in 4 pieces, very good.

2.6 Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto, 1693–1766

Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto was credited by William Tytler29 with introducing the German flute to Scotland in 1725, having learned it in France. Tytler’s pronouncement has been accepted and repeated by musicologists ever since its initial publication, though evidence of its veracity is weak.30 Elliott was a lawyer, Member of Parliament for Roxburghshire, a Lord of Justiciary, Keeper of the Signet, and eventually Lord Justice

25 National Archives of Scotland, RH15/73/1.
26 NRAS has it as “Turkey goats hair.” This likely refers a bundle of wool from an angora goat. The angora goat may have originated in Turkey. No other papers in the bundle relate to Mr McAlla, though the family appears in legal documents through the nineteenth century. Robert Harris was a merchant in Edinburgh.
27 Schuhard could be Schuchart. John Just Schuhart, d. 1759, was making instruments, including flutes, in London by 1720. He may have been an apprentice to Bressan. Waterhouse, The New Langwill Index, 363-364.
Clerk. He was also a classical scholar, antiquary, and a leading figure in the development of the New Town area of Edinburgh.\textsuperscript{31}

Jane Blackie, in her Oxford Dictionary of National Biography article, writes that Elliott was regarded as an authority on the German flute, and played in the Edinburgh Musical Society orchestra, but references to flute playing and music in general do not abound in Elliott’s papers. Amongst the volumes of letters received by Elliott—now held at the National Library of Scotland—one letter from 1736 indicates he had knowledge of the flute. The writer says “Please receive your book, that old scores may be cleared before I begin a new one. You have another collection of Quantz’s, If it’s at hand it will satisfy me.”\textsuperscript{32} Knowledge of Quantz’s music strongly suggests Elliott played transverse flute, though Quantz also wrote for recorder and oboe.\textsuperscript{33} Familiarity with Quantz also suggests a fairly high level of ability. His compositions are difficult, marked by many flat key signatures, cross-fingered notes, challenging articulations, rapid passages in the fast movements, and highly ornamented slow movements. A book of Quantz, however, is hardly enough evidence to continue to support an argument that Elliott was the first player of the German flute in Scotland.

\textsuperscript{32} National Library of Scotland, Minto papes, MS 11003 letter 2, letter to Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto, unsigned, 11 June 1736.
\textsuperscript{33} The bulk of Quantz’s music from the 1730s consisted of flute sonatas, flute duets, and trio sonatas for flutes.
2.7 William Tytler, 1711–1792

William Tytler, the source of the accepted date of the arrival of the transverse flute in Scotland, was himself a flute player.\(^{34}\) H. Mackenzie, in his obituary notice for Tytler in the Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh, wrote that:

In music as a science he was uncommonly skilled. It was his favourite amusement; and with that natural partiality which all entertain for their favourite objects, he was apt to assign to it a degree of moral importance which some might deem a little whimsical. He has often been heard to say, that he never knew a good taste in music associated with a malevolent heart; and being asked, what prescription he would recommend for attaining an old age as healthful and as happy as his own? “My prescription, said he, is simple: short but cheerful meals, music, and a good conscience.” In his younger days, he had been a good performer on the harpsichord; but his chief instrument was the German-flute, which he thought particularly adapted to the expression of those natural and simple melodies in which he most delighted, the Scottish airs.\(^{35}\)

Tytler wrote two accounts of Scottish music history: “Dissertation on the Scottish Music”\(^{36}\) and “On the Fashionable Amusements and Entertainments in Edinburgh in the last Century, with a Plan of a grand Concert of Music on St Cecilia’s Day, 1695.”\(^{37}\) Very little is known of Tytler’s sources, and Peter Holman has determined that the date of the St Cecilia’s day concert in 1695 was actually closer to 1710.\(^{38}\) Tytler was a solicitor and historian,\(^{39}\) and a founding member of the Edinburgh Musical Society.\(^{40}\) His obituary in the July 1793 issue of The Scots Magazine describes him as someone who “[d]uring the hasty impressions of the moment, he might have appeared to be unwise; but no person could accuse him of ever having been unjust.”\(^{41}\) Some time before his death Tytler apparently suffered a stroke, which luckily did not impair his mental faculties, but did result in a slight


\(^{36}\) Hugo Arnot, appendix to History of Edinburgh from the Earliest Accounts to the Present Time, (Edinburgh: Creech, 1788).

\(^{37}\) Transactions of the Society of the Antiquaries of Scotland vol 1: 469–98.


\(^{39}\) Clearly being good with dates was not considered a requirement for a career as a historian.

\(^{40}\) Mackay, “Tytler, William.”

speech impediment, “extremely different from a flutter. It was a kind of stop, which, when connected with the animation of his manner, seemed to proceed from an excess of eagerness, which, to his friends, gave rather an energy and emphasis to his utterance than any uneasy sensation.”

He is described as having “an upright and affection disposition, to which was conjoined a decided predilection for poetry, music, & the belles lettres…” He devoted all his leisure hours to these interests, and consequently this “will serve as a clue to account for every peculiarity that occurred in his progress through life…” As for his writings on music, the author is very pleased with Tytler’s “Dissertation,” writing that “[i]t is unnecessary to dwell on the light that such dissertations as these, when judiciously executed, throw upon the history of civil society and the progress of manners today.”

2.8 Lord Robert Kerr, 1719–1746

Manuscript parts to four flute concertos, including one by Vivaldi presumed lost until it was rediscovered in 2007 in the papers of the Marquess of Lothian, may have been copied in Italy during a grand tour. Lord Robert Kerr, the younger son of the 3rd Marquess of Lothian, travelled to Italy in the 1730s, and was killed fighting Jacobites at Culloden. He studied music as part of his education with Colin Maclaurin, who notes expenses for a flute and a music book in 1731 and 1732.

The four concertos are by Babel, Braune, and Vivaldi, as well as an anonymous concerto for flute and two violins. The Vivaldi concerto is *Il Gran Mogol*, mentioned in a

42 Ibid, 316.  
43 Ibid, 314.  
44 Ibid, 316.  
47 This is in a separate folder, GD40/15/55. It has parts for flute, two violins, and continuo.
Dutch sale catalogue from 1759 but missing since. The parts are incomplete; the Vivaldi is missing the second violin part and the Braune consists only of the first violin part. The books are clean and neatly bound, and the Vivaldi is labelled with composer and title. *Il Gran Mogol* consists of separate parts in a book, some of which are sketched to follow other parts, or labelled “solo” and “tutti.” The anonymous concerto for flute and two violins gives the impression of a working copy: it is not as neat, and has false starts on a few pages. The music suggests that Kerr was, or at least believed himself to be, an accomplished flute player.

2.9 Cosmo Gordon, 3rd Duke of Gordon, 1720–1752

Cosmo Gordon is an excellent example of a well-travelled nobleman who picked up the latest fashionable instrument during a grand tour. While staying in Amsterdam, he studied German flute with a music master named B. G. Mulder, who also sold and repaired flutes and sold music. The bills from Mulder lack dates, but appear to be spread out over a year or more. The first in the bundle at the National Archives of Scotland shows expenses for a month’s worth of lessons and a book. The next is for two more months of instruction, followed by a bill with charges for a month’s worth of flute lessons, an

---

48 *Il Gran Mogol* would have formed a portion of a set of national concertos. The sale catalogue of Nicolaas Selthof’s possessions shows he owned a full set in 1759. Andrew Woolley has determined that this copy is the only surviving source of the concerto. Woolley, “An Unknown Flute Concerto,” 4.

49 As opposed to a score.

50 I have seen GD40/15/54/2 and GD40/15/55. The other two concertos were not available to me due to location restrictions.


54 GD44/51/465/3/10.
instrument, and an unspecified piece, perhaps a corps de réchange.\textsuperscript{55} The last shows expenses for instruments, lessons, and presumably flute parts:\textsuperscript{56}

Discharge Acct. B.G. Mulder German flute master
J’avour d’avoir recu de Monsieur le duc le Suivante somme
Pour les Flutes traversieres francois
De Mr. Seltzer a Pistoleet 37-16
Pour 2 mois 10-10
Pour 2 lavers 1-4
Pour 2 flute forme 6
La Somme £63-19
Je vous remercie tres humblement pour le payment\textsuperscript{57}

In December 1737 the Duke of Gordon transacted business with John Walsh. The bill reads:

Bill and receipt from John Walsh of London for £5-7-0Str.
His Grace The Duke of Gordon
Bought of Jn. Walsh Dembr. 6th 1737
3 Volumes of Opera Airs 3-3-0
British Musical Miscellany vol 6th 0-6-6
Select Duets and Festings Airs 0-5-0
11 Monthly Masks 0-5-6
A German Flute 1-3-0
An Ivory piece to a German Flute 0-4-0

16 Dec. 1737 Rec’d of his Grace the Duke of Gordon the Contents of this bill and all Demands, John Walsh\textsuperscript{58}

Although it is not known for certain when the duke began to study flute, it seems likely he took it up while in Holland, and continued to play after returning home. The bill from Walsh could suggest that flutes were not available in Scotland, or those available were not of a quality comparable to those purchased in Holland or London.\textsuperscript{59}

\textsuperscript{55} GD44/51/465/3/11.
\textsuperscript{56} Laver and pistoleet must have had a special meaning in the eighteenth century in order to be used by a music teacher. The Dictionnaire d’autrefois shows both words have had their modern meanings of “to wash” and “pistol” from at least 1606. “Dictionnaires d’autrefois,” Project for American and French Research on the Treasury of the French Language, \url{http://artfl-project.uchicago.edu/content/dictionnaires-dautrefois}.
\textsuperscript{57} GD44/51/465/3/19.
\textsuperscript{58} GD44/51/465/3/56.
\textsuperscript{59} It is uncertain from the bills from both Mulder and Walsh who made the flutes they were selling. The makers Pierre Bressan (1663–1730), and Thomas Stanesby, Jr. (1692–1754) both had shops in London by 1720, and their instruments are still regarded as among the finest of the eighteenth century.
2.10 Captain Dalrymple, 1744

Little is known of Captain Dalrymple aside from what he owned in 1744, but he did own, and presumably play, a flute. Captain Dalrymple’s possessions were inventoried in May 1744, for what purpose it is unclear, though the paper is marked as “Inventory of Capt. Dalrymples Furniture unsold” and is bundled with the receipts of Alan Whiteford, a merchant. Given the nature of some of the items included in the inventory—yards of fabric, books, broken tea tongs—he had either died or gone into serious debt.

The inventory is included with the papers of George Innes in the papers of the Edinburgh Musical Society; Captain Dalrymple may have been a friend of Innes or affiliated with the Edinburgh Musical Society. The 1759 list of members of the Edinburgh Musical Society includes four Dalrymples: Sir David, Esq., Advocate, was a director, in addition to another David Dalrymple and two John Dalrymples, one of whom was also an advocate and one of whom was a merchant. Captain Dalrymple was likely a relative of those men.

2.11 Thomas Blacklock, 1721–1791

Thomas Blacklock was the son of a bricklayer from Annan. He had smallpox as an infant and consequently lost his vision. Through the help of benefactors and his father’s foresight, Blacklock was educated and eventually ordained. He was appointed to a parish in Kirkcudbright, but the congregation objected to a blind minister, and a legal battle

---

60 National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Edinburgh Musical Society, papers of George Innes of Stow GD113/3/990. Subsequent papers in the bundle include letters from Whiteford to the Sheriff of Dumbartonshire asking for help and encouragement on collecting a debt.
61 A List of the Members of the Musical Society at Edinburgh (1759).
ensued. Blacklock and his wife relocated to Edinburgh and ran a boarding house for students, where he was in part financially supported by David Hume and James Beattie.62

Blacklock devoted his time to study, writing poetry and essays, and music; his Essay on Universal Etymology, written in verse, was published in 1756 and the two-volume Collection of Original Poems followed in 1760 and 1762. Many other writings followed, including a translation of a French essay on teaching the blind.63 He was impressed by Robert Burns and discouraged him from going to Jamaica, introducing Burns to influential people in Edinburgh society instead.64

Blacklock was described in an early biography as “a tolerable performer on several instruments, particularly on the flute.” As a result of a dream in which a shepherd played a flageolet on an idyllic hillside, Blacklock almost always carried a flageolet in his pocket, and he “was not displeased when asked in company to play or sing them; a natural feeling for a blind man, who thus adds a scene to the drama of his society.”65 He may have considered music as a profession; he “played well on the violin and flute, and even composed pieces with taste…”66 Some of his songs were included in The Scots Musical Museum67 and his “Discourse on national music” appeared in the October 1779 issue of


63 Blacklock’s translation of M. Hauy’s An Essay on the Education of the Blind is appended to the 1793 edition of his Poems and music is advocated as a key element of the education of the blind. The author describes a type of raised print that blind students can use to learn music, rather than being dependent upon learning by ear, which is most likely how Blacklock learned. Thomas Blacklock, Poems by the late Rev. Dr. Thomas Blacklock; together with an essay on the education of the blind. To which is prefixed a new account of the life and the works of the author (Edinburgh: Alexander Chapman and Company, 1793), accessed 3 May 2013, http://find.galegroup.com/ecco/infomark.do?source=gale&prodId=ECCO&userGroupName=glasuni&tabID=T001&docId=CW3312859164&type=multipage&contentSet=ECCOArticles&version=1.0&docLevel=FASCIMILE, 226–247.


65 Blacklock, Poems by the Late Rev. Dr. Thomas Blacklock, xii.

66 Thomas Thomson, Eminent Scotsmen, originally edited by Robert Chambers, with a supplement continuing the biographies to the present time, half-vol. 1 (London: Blackie and Son, 1875), 137.

Although the contemporary evidence does not explicitly state that Blacklock played the German flute, and although the flageolet more closely resembles the recorder, by this time in the eighteenth century the recorder was very old-fashioned, and flute was almost universally understood to refer to the German flute.

2.12 General John Reid, 1722–1807

General John Reid was an exceptionally well-connected, well-travelled man who took his flute playing very seriously and was a composer of flute sonatas and military music. Reid likely began studying flute while a law student in Edinburgh. His long and distinguished military career began in 1745 when he suppressed Jacobites at Prestonpans, and took him to the West Indies, Ireland, and North America, where he intended to retire but for the American Revolution. His first published tune, “The Highland March by Cpt. Reid,” now known as “In the Garb of Old Gaul,” appeared in Robert Bremner’s 1756 Collection of Airs and Marches. His first set of flute sonatas, Six Solos for a German Flute or Violin with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord, was published in London by James Oswald in 1756 and was followed by a second volume in 1762. On the title page he is listed as “I. R. Esq. A Member of the Temple of Apollo,” Oswald’s London-based Scottish musical organization. Reid’s other known compositions include minuets and

70 Ibid.
73 John Reid, A Second Sett of Six Solos for a German Flute or Violin with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord (London: James Oswald, 1762). For Reid’s involvement with the Temple of Apollo, see Frank Kidson, “James Oswald, Dr. Burney, and the ‘Temple of Apollo,’” Musical Antiquary, II (1910): 34–41, and Purser, Scotland’s Music, 262.
marches, in a simple style similar to the slow movements of his flute sonatas. Farmer describes Reid as “a composer of no mean order” but laments that to “modern ears, Reid’s music may appear ‘a wee bit shilpit,’” but we must remember that the flute of those days was practically non-chromatic. As I have frequently said, when I have given these solos, [i]f we compare these works, even with those written by the great Bach and Handel, the cleverness of old John Reid still deserves to be openly admitted.” Overlooking Farmer’s ignorance regarding the capabilities of the eighteenth-century flute, Reid’s sonatas are uneven compositions, but typical of the mid-eighteenth century style of composition for flute and likely very appealing to other amateur musicians.

Reid was considered a talented musician. Mrs Delany, in a letter of 14 March 1752, reports of a concert given by gentlemen performers for the benefit of the poor in Dublin on a Wednesday morning. Some of the performers were far better than others; Mr Brownlow’s organ playing was especially lacking. One of the better musicians was “a Capt. Read, who plays on the German flute to great perfection…” In 1822, Major General David Stewart of Garth wrote that “Major Reid was one of the most accomplished

74 David Johnson suggests James Oswald was the composer, or at least responsible for the harmony, of Reid’s sonatas. There is, however, little evidence to support that idea. David Johnson, Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century, 2nd edn (Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 2003), 60. By the time of his Scottish Fiddle Music in the 18th Century, Johnson had reconsidered the question of Reid’s authorship and concluded that the music is not characteristic of Oswald. The theory originated not with Johnson, but with Friedrick Niecks, the sixth Reid Professor of Music. David Johnson, Scottish Fiddle Music in the 18th Century, 3rd edn (Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 2005), 198–199. Concerns regarding Reid’s study of harmony are ascribed to a Professor Niecks by the Marchioness of Tullibardine. The Marchioness writes that Niecks believed that Reid sketched the melodies, and that the harmony was supplied by trained musicians. The Marchioness of Tullibardine, A Military History of Perthshire, 1660–1902 (Perth: R. A. & J. Hay, 1908), 391.
75 Shilpit is a Scots word meaning puny, pale, weak, sickly, or shrunken. Online Scots Dictionary, accessed 13 May 2013, http://www.scots-online.org/dictionary/search_scots.asp
76 Henry Farmer, 18th Century Scottish Music, University of Glasgow Special Collections, MS Farmer 195/6.
77 Had Farmer devoted any time to the study of the flute writing (solo and ensemble) of Bach and Handel, he would have been forced to shift his paradigm regarding the one-keyed flute.
78 The sixth sonatas in both sets stand out.
79 Mary Delany, The Autobiography and Correspondence of Mary Granville, Mrs Delany, ed. Lady Llanover (London: Richard Bentley, 1861), 3:96; Brian Boydell, A Dublin Musical Calendar (Bury St Edmunds: Irish Academic Press, 1988), 288. It is assumed that this flute playing Captain Read is the same John Reid. He was in Ireland between deployments to Flanders and North America in the 1750s.
flute players of the age…” and that “[t]he soldiers were much attached to Colonel Reid for his poetry, his music, and his bravery as a soldier.” The poetry is sadly lost.

Around 1770, after hearing Reid play in Edinburgh, Allison Cockburn wrote a rather sexually charged account of his performance to her friend Miss Cummings, in which Mrs Cockburn sounds more like a teenaged girl swooning after the latest boy band than a respected society lady describing a flute recital:

Of all the sounds I ever heard (and my soul has soared to heaven before now), Colonel Reed’s flute well, it is amazing the powers of it. It thrills to your very heart. He plays in any taste you please, and composes what he plays. You know my taste is for the penseroso, and so it is his. He played me five acts of a tragedy that went to my heart, and I spoke in to myself all the words of it. I would not let him speak the epilogue….He is a gentle, melancholy, tall, well-bred, lean man; and, for his flute, it speaks all languages. But those sounds that come from the heart to the heart—I never could have conceived it. It had a dying fall—I was afraid I could not bear it when I heard it perfectly. I can think of nothing but that flute…

In his later years, Reid suffered a hearing loss, and became a rather melancholy fixture in London. He would walk, daily, the same route in Hyde Park, dressed in shabby clothes with one hand tucked inside his coat, causing many in London to think him impoverished.

Reid left the bulk of his estate, following the life interest of his daughter, to the University of Edinburgh to fund a chair in music, and his personal music library was the start of the University of Edinburgh’s music collection. His collection was not large, but it provides an interesting perspective on the tastes and preferences of the best-known Scottish flute player of the eighteenth century.

Three manuscript part books labelled “flauto primo”, “flauto secondo”, and “violoncello” contain chamber music transcribed in various hands, some of which is Reid’s
writing. Reid’s collection was inventoried by Christopher D. S. Field, who says that while the paper is eighteenth-century Italian, the bindings are nineteenth century. The books strongly suggest Reid preferred to play music by contemporary Italian and German composers, especially Quantz.

Another volume that belonged to Reid is comprised of manuscripts of eighteenth-century vocal and instrumental music in various hands, some of which Field believes to be unpublished music by Reid, as well as two printed works. This book again shows a strong preference for Italianate music, especially Handel and Galuppi. The book also contains a number of marches and minuets that appear in slightly different form in Reid’s published works, and tunes published by Oswald.

Another volume consists of flute concertos and quartets by J. C. Fischer, Ignazio Raimondi, J. C. Bach, and other composers contemporary with Reid in printed editions and manuscript. It also contains several fragments that Field believes were Reid’s sketches for sonatas he never wrote.

The final volume, which may have once belonged to Reid, held the 1796 edition of his *Six Solos for a German Flute*, which Field believes to be the only copy that survived from Reid’s collection. The volume also contains printed editions of sonatas by Foulis, Vinci, and Sammartini, duets by Holmes, and arrangements of arias by Gluck, J. C. Bach, and Hasse.

Given the paucity of music books owned by other eighteenth-century Scottish flute players, Reid’s manuscript books are potentially the best examples available of the types of

84 Edinburgh University Library Special Collections, Reid Music Library D.52–54; Christopher D. S. Field, “General John Reid (1722–1807) and his Music Collection” (paper and handout of inventory, Musica Scotica conference, May 2012).
85 Field, “General John Reid,” 8.
86 Edinburgh University Library Special Collections, Reid Music Library E.165.
87 Edinburgh University Library Special Collections, Reid Music Library R788.5 REI.
88 Field, “General John Reid,” 16.
89 Edinburgh University Library Special Collections, Reid Music Library, C.220.
90 Field, “General John Reid,” 18. The flute sonatas have been removed and are held in a separate folder.
music that appealed to gentleman flute players. How representative they actually are is another question, given that Reid was well-connected and better travelled than most of his contemporaries.

2.13 John Campbell, 4th Earl and 1st Marquis of Breadalbane, 1762–1834

On 31 January 1781, Colin Campbell, who was in Lausanne, wrote to his mother in London. He was primarily concerned with the future of his military career, and whether or not the post had been delayed, but he and his brother also had a few things they wanted when she next went shopping:

My brother will be obliged to you if you will send him a flute made by Potter, of the new fashion with all its keys, & a pair of razors, by the first opportunity.  

The Campbell brothers were well-travelled young men, who would have been interested in acquiring the latest, most state-of-the art items, such as a keyed flute. Richard Potter was a flute maker in London whose flutes were among the first to have had more than one key, which by the date of the request would have been the cutting edge in flute design. A flute in this style would have been a luxury item; evidently John had high-end tastes. The brothers were soldiers; Colin was stationed on the continent, and John, who succeeded to the Earldom of Breadalbane and Holland in 1782, served in North America under General Cornwallis.

---

91 National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Campbell family, the Earls of Breadalbane, GD112/16/2/9.
92 Richard Potter was in business in London by 1745. Waterhouse, The New Langwill Index, 308-309.
93 In 1805, John Campbell received a gold medal from the Society of Arts for planting 44 acres worth of trees in Kenmore. Balfour, Scots Peerage, 2:209–211.
2.14 Sir John Menzies of Pitfoddles, 1780s

Some flute players purchased their instruments not from music shops, but from general stores. Between 1784 and 1786, John Menzies of Pitfoddles purchased four books for the flute, including one pocket-book, one tutor, and two unspecified books, in addition to a backgammon table, a telescope, gold shirt pins, buckles, a walking stick, and a snuff mill. All of these items were sold by John Ewen of Aberdeen, which might suggest there were no dedicated music shops in Aberdeen, although, considering the presence and activities of the Aberdeen Musical Society, this seems implausible. Menzies was an early member of the Aberdeen Musical Society, first appearing on membership rosters in October 1755, and continued to pay his dues until 1787.

2.15 Sir Andrew Dick Lauder, 1743–1820

Sir Andrew Dick Lauder, 6th Baronet, purchased his instruments from London rather than locally. On 20 January 1786, Sir Andrew Lauder wrote to Gilbert Innes with family news, his views on doctors, apothecaries, and homeopathic remedies (and the various costs

95 The Aberdeen Musical Society owned two flutes d’amour according to their inventory of 28 July 1752, and on 7 November 1777 Sir William Forbes gave two German flutes to the Society. Whether the instruments were locally purchased is not clear from the records. Minute Books of the Aberdeen Musical Society, Aberdeen Public Library.
96 Minute Books of the Aberdeen Musical Society. James Beattie may have been another Aberdeen-based flute player. Henry George Farmer, in Music Making in the Olden Days, lists Beattie, as well as Alexander Donald, as one of the performing members of the Aberdeen Musical Society, on violin, flute, and cello. Beattie’s own papers and account books make many references to the cello, but none to flute, and while the Minute Books of the Aberdeen Musical Society show Beattie was an active member, no mention is made of what (if anything) he performed. It would not have been unusual for a gentleman to play more than one instrument, but Beattie’s own silence concerning the flute and violin suggests he was exclusively a cellist. Henry George Farmer, Music Making in the Olden Days (London: Peters-Hinrichsen Edition, Ltd., 1950), 39; Ralph S. Walker, ed., James Beattie’s day-book, 1773–1798 (Aberdeen: Third Spaulding Club, 1948).
98 Gilbert Innes of Stow was elected to the Edinburgh Musical Society in December 1771 as a “most useful member” rather than a performer. He did, however, sometimes fulfil the role of a chorister. W. Forbes Gray, The Musical Society of Edinburgh and St. Cecilia’s Hall (December 1933), 202, 237.
associated with each), and a request that Innes do some shopping for him on his upcoming
trip to London, provided Innes could get good prices:

I did not expect such a Watch as I wanted could be got for the money you
mention. Be so good however when you go up to London as price them & let
me know as it is a Purchase I have so much at heart that I will be very unwilling
to lose so good an opportunity of making it & will certainly do my best to find
the ways & means. In case a good Bargain of a Fiddle not exceeding ten to
Fifteen Guineas should fall in your way I should be not sorry if you picked it up
for me as tho I play ill it is a great source of Amusement to me & the additional
cost would not be very much as I could dispose of one or both of them I have—
I want also a good German Flute—Is your stay in the great City to be for any
time…"99

Innes handled the financial business of the Edinburgh Musical Society; other letters
among his papers are requests for payment from Domenico Corri and Nathaniel Gow, as
well as from concert subscribers regarding their tickets. Lauder’s request suggests that by
1786 German flutes were no longer available in Scottish shops, or if they were, the
instruments were not as desirable or perhaps as affordable as instruments available in
London.

2.16 Jonathan Troup, 1764–1799

Jonathan Troup, like Elliott, Tytler, and Blacklock, was of the professional class
that could be considered gentlemen, with the leisure time and the money for the study of
music. He was a physician from Aberdeen who went to Dominica to make his fortune. He
did not find life in a slave-trading society palatable, and returned to Scotland in 1791. His
journal of July 1791 includes entries on whether or not he should leave Aberdeen or return
to the West Indies, the patients he had recently treated, the weather, translating French and
Italian verse, and a visit from a local clergyman, Mr Thomson, who was considering
relocating to the West Indies and wanted Dr Troup’s opinion. Troup said, “Mr Thomson

99 National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Edinburgh Musical Society, Innes Family papers,
has left off his thoughts of going abroad at present and I advised him from it. Supped with him and gave him his flute on loan."  


Amongst the Earl of Dalkeith’s papers is a bill dated May 1799 from John Cramer, instrument maker, for an octave flute. This instrument was popular in Scottish dance bands about fifty years later, with the fiddle and cello. Octave flute almost certainly refers to a type of piccolo. If someone in the earl’s family played this member of the flute family, it is safe to assume he also played the German flute.

2.18 John Richardson, 1780–1864

In 1805 John Richardson, a solicitor from Midlothian who spent most of his career in London, acquired a flute made by C. A. Grenser. Richardson was active in the intellectual life of London and Edinburgh, and was a close friend of Sir Walter Scott as


103 National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Earls of Dalkeith, GD224/15/24.


well as being a poet himself. Richardson was so inspired by his new flute that he wrote a poem about it:

Thy sound is ceased: now let my grateful song
The soothing influence of thy charms prolong
O could I by my willing strain repay
The thousand blessings of thy gentle sway
Could my soul kindle with the poets fire
Thy name should live renown’d as Orpheus lyre
It stay’d the torrents’ course or still’d the wind
Thou calm’st a harder task the human mind…..

Carl August Grenser (1720–1807) of Dresden was one of the greatest flute makers of the mid- to late eighteenth century. Richardson must have acquired one of the last flutes he made, unless it was a used instrument. In 1977, Richardson’s flute was sold at auction to the American flute player Robert Willoughby.

2.19 Conclusion

The known or suspected gentlemen amateur flute players offer glimpses of music-making in eighteenth-century society, and contradict long-held beliefs regarding the history of the flute in Scotland, particularly that concerning the date the instrument was first played in Scotland. The Marquess of Montrose’s friend’s letter, Alexander Bruce’s manuscript, the Grant brothers’ list of school supplies, and John McAlla’s letter show that the transverse flute was well-known and played in Scotland prior to 1725. The travels of Lord Robert Kerr and the Duke of Gordon show how well-travelled Scots learned and acquired music abroad. The letters and receipts of McAlla, the Campbell brothers, Lauder,

---

108 Grenser’s surviving flutes are among the most frequently copied by modern makers and played by traverso players, prized for their richness and flexibility. Waterhouse, *The New Langwill Index*, 146.
109 Elaine Willoughby was the widow of Robert Willoughby, and was with him when he first played Richardson’s Grenser. Willoughby, “A Grenser Flute,” 47.
and Menzies show that while Scottish-made instruments were available, instruments imported from London or abroad were vastly preferred. General Reid, as a soldier, composer, and talented player, is perhaps the embodiment of the flute’s association with the masculine arts of war and seduction. The other men, both of the nobility and of the very lowest tiers of the upper class, such as Jonathan Troup and Thomas Blacklock, show that the flute was popular across the entire upper stratum of Scottish society for the entire eighteenth century. Flute playing in Scotland, especially in the amateur market, was equal with the rest of Europe.
3. Lower-class male amateurs

3.1 Introduction

The flute has been associated with shepherds since its alleged invention by the god Pan.¹ This affiliation continued into the eighteenth century, when the pastoral craze for nymphs, shepherds, Arcadia, and the return to nature took hold, along with Rousseau’s idea of the state of nature, where man existed uncorrupted by society.² In pastoral operas of the eighteenth century, shepherds sang simple tunes based on bagpipe tunes, and found true love.³ In art, shepherds had to play either the flute or the bagpipe.⁴

The flute may have been as popular among the emerging working class as it was among the gentry, but due to our lack of information about people in the lower tiers of eighteenth-century society,⁵ only two men of the lower classes are known to have played flute, both of them at the cusp of the nineteenth century. These men, Robert Tannahill and William Nicholson,⁶ may be representative of a larger flute playing trend amongst the lower classes, however, information about their lives only survives because both were poets whose work is still in print.

Histories of Scottish music generally make the assumption that the only instruments used in traditional music in the eighteenth century were bagpipe, fiddle, and harp.⁷ The violin, however, had a double life as the fiddle, so why could the flute not also

---

¹ Powell notes that many pictures of flute players are in mythical settings. Powell, The Flute, 11.
⁶ Nicholson may not have played flute. See below.
⁷ See, for example: Mary Anne Alburger, Scottish Fiddlers and their music (London: Gollancz, 1983); David Johnson, Scottish Fiddle Music in the Eighteenth Century (Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 2005); John
have moonlighted in pubs and at country dances?\textsuperscript{8} The evidence of Tannahill’s flute playing suggests that traditional music in Scotland was not as fiddle-centric as commonly believed.\textsuperscript{9} The flute now said to have belonged to Nicholson may not in actuality have been his, but that he should have been said to have played flute reflects the pastoral ideals of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, in which a poorly educated countryman who wrote verse and played music had to have been touched by natural genius.\textsuperscript{10}

3.2 Robert Tannahill, 1774–1810

That weaver, poet, and songwriter Robert Tannahill played flute is agreed upon by all of his biographers, at least two of whom knew him.\textsuperscript{11} As he does not mention the flute in his surviving letters,\textsuperscript{12} their accounts are the only evidence for his flute playing. Philip Ramsay says that Tannahill was “possessed of a correct musical ear, and played well on the German flute.”\textsuperscript{13} David Semple writes that “The songs of the bards were his delight, and his favourite musical instrument a German flute.”\textsuperscript{14} R. A. Smith, writing in William Motherwell’s \textit{The Harp of Renfrewshire}, says this about Tannahill’s flute playing:

He was possessed of a correct ear, and had acquired as much knowledge of music as enabled him to learn any simple melody if written in an easy key for the German Flute; an old one, cracked in half a dozen places, and bound up

---

\textsuperscript{8} Most repertoire for the violin published in the eighteenth century was also sold for and can be played on flute. That the flute and the fiddle also shared repertoire in less genteel society is only logical.

\textsuperscript{9} It is by no means unreasonable to assume that the flute had no place in traditional music. It wasn’t common in Irish traditional music until the nineteenth century. Desi Wilkinson, “Flute”, in \textit{The Companion to Irish Traditional Music}, 2nd edn, ed. Fintan Vallely (Cork: Cork University Press, 2011), 272–278.

\textsuperscript{10} Matthew Gelbart, \textit{The Invention of “Folk Music” and “Art Music”} (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), 42–49.

\textsuperscript{11} William Motherwell, \textit{The Harp of Renfrewshire} (Paisley: Alex. Gardner, 1873). A long section of the chapter on Tannahill is by his friend R. A. Smith, who collaborated with Tannahill on finding tunes for his songs.

\textsuperscript{12} At least, he does not in the letters contained in MS Robertson 1, University of Glasgow Special Collections, and his most recent biographer, Jim Ferguson, says that references to Tannahill’s flute playing are “sketchy” at best. James Ferguson, personal communication with author, 21 June 2012.

\textsuperscript{13} Philip Ramsay, \textit{The Poetical Works of Robert Tannahill with life of the Author, and a memoir of Robert A. Smith} (London: A. Fullarton and Co., 1853), xv.

\textsuperscript{14} David Semple, ed., \textit{The Poems and Songs of Robert Tannahill} (Paisley: Alexander Gardner, 1900), xli.
with waxed cord, he always kept beside his loom, and latterly he could commit any air to paper which he had caught by ear—an earthen ink bottle usually hung on his loom post, and I believe that the greater number of his songs were composed whilst he was steadily occupied at his business.  

Tannahill left school at the age of 12 to be apprenticed to his father as a cotton-weaver, likely leaving little time for music lessons, which were a luxury for the middle and upper classes. It can therefore be inferred that he was a self-taught musician. Smith’s description of Tannahill’s flute suggests it was a handed-down instrument, not newly purchased. If it was indeed cracked in six places and held together with a cord, it is rather surprising he managed to coax any sound out of it at all.

The Smith/Motherwell account of Tannahill’s flute playing is highly romanticized, as is the notion that he wrote the bulk of his poetry seated at his loom. Semple describes a set-up which enabled Tannahill “[t]o catch every fugitive thought, he hung an inkbottle to his loompost, and fixed up a coarse shelf which served as a desk that he might jot down his ideas without rising from his seat tree.” It is possible that this is how he wrote and worked, but it seems an idealized account by friends who were perhaps reinventing Tannahill after his death; presumably Tannahill was coordinated enough not to spill ink on his weaving.

No music books of Tannahill’s survive. It is possible, if he had any, that they were included in the papers he burned before committing suicide. Mary Ellen Brown writes that he liked to play Scottish tunes, and that he attended concerts arranged by R. A. Smith, but Tannahill’s letters indicate a preference for Irish tunes. He aspired to be a

15 Motherwell, *The Harp of Renfrewshire*, XXXI.
17 Semple, *The Poems and Songs of Robert Tannahill*, xii.
18 Donaldson, “Tannahill, Robert (1774–1810).”
20 Tannahill was not of Irish descent. The name can be traced as far back as 1547 in Ayrshire. Semple, *The Poems and Songs of Robert Tannahill*, xvii.
contributor to George Thomson’s collections of national airs, but Thomson rejected his submissions. Tannahill sent Thomson at least two letters in 1808 and 1809 containing Irish tunes he had collected from his friend James Clark, who was a bandsman in the Argyllshire Militia. Tunes labelled “The Green Woods of Treugh”, and “Nancy Verny” were sent on 6 June 1808; “Paddy O’Rafferty”, “The Lass That Wears Green”, “Gamby Ora”, and “There Was About the Lady”, all labelled “Irish”, were sent on July 3, 1809. One undated page has five additional melodies on it in Tannahill’s writing: “Now the cold winter days are drawing on”, “Up among the green woods”, “On my Rambles I was bound”, “Kitty O’Carrol”, and one labelled as “Irish song air, page 14”, which was presumably copied from page 14 of a book. David Semple believes that:

However much Tannahill may have known regarding Scottish airs, it was quite a different matter to enter upon Irish tunes, when he neither sufficiently understood the subject of the ancient song nor the old air to which it should be sung… It was quite out of the question to suppose that a sedate Scotsman like Tannahill was capable of writing verses to suit the wild airs of Hibernia.

Semple’s observation is intriguing. The Irish tunes Tannahill sent to Thomson are not radically different from Scottish tunes of the same style to which he was capable of

22 Tannahill’s spelling. Tannahill’s correspondence with Clark between 1805 to 1809 is devoted, aside from local news, to Irish tunes and what words might suit the tunes Clark has sent. He asks for ones that Clark believes have not been published. He was interested in O’Carolan, having read a translation of one of his poems in a magazine. Tannahill thought Clark might know Irish tunes used as military retreats, or from his “Hibernian friend”. Robert Tannahill, letter to James Clark, 2 November 1807, MS Robertson 1.
23 MS Robertson 1/18. The tunes are given the titles “Adieu! ye cheerful native plains, with air,” “Ah! Sheelah thou’rt my darling, with air”, and “Responsive ye woods wing your echoes along” in the University of Glasgow Special Collections Manuscript catalogue, accessed 1 December 2012, http://special.lib.gla.ac.uk/manuscripts/search/detail_c.cfm?ID=8565.
25 MS Robertson 1/26. The tunes are titled “Peggy O’Rafferty, with air”, “One night in my youth, with air”, and “Ye golden stars that rule the night (afterwards known as “Kathleen owns she loves me”), with air” in the University of Glasgow Special Collections Manuscript catalogue, accessed 1 December 2012, http://special.lib.gla.ac.uk/manuscripts/search/detail_c.cfm?ID=8573.
26 MS Robertson 1/45. This mystery tune is not found in Aloys Fleischmann, Sources of Irish Traditional Music, 1600–1855 (New York: Garland Publishing Inc., 1998).
27 Semple, The Poems and Songs of Robert Tannahill, lxii.
writing successful lyrics. Thomson’s lack of interest in Tannahill has a number of potential causes: he may not have yet been considering an Irish collection; he may not have liked them for reasons other than Tannahill’s Scottishness. That he too thought a “sedate Scotsman” should avoid Irish music altogether is not likely, given that Thomson did eventually produce an Irish collection which had several Scottish contributors.28

The tunes show that Tannahill was musically literate, articulate in his preferences, and knowledgeable about national tunes.29 This is not surprising: Tannahill came from a town that had enough poets in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries to merit a two-volume book of their works.30 Paisley’s population tripled in the late eighteenth century as the weaving industry brought in many new families from other areas, and the working class was well educated.31 Tannahill’s parents had what is described by Semple as a “liberal” education, and they aspired for their children to have the same.32 Tannahill was sent to an “English school”33 at the age of six, and left at twelve to commence his apprenticeship, which was the usual pattern for boys whose parents were weavers. There was, perhaps, something in the water that led to poetry.34

Nothing in Tannahill’s letters describes his flute playing, though one of his poems may allude to it. The song “The Five Frien’s” is considered autobiographical, describing the poet and three of his friends, plus Apollo, playing music at a pub.35 Tannahill said the

28 Such as Sir Walter Scott and Joanna Baillie. Tannahill, in his letter to Thomson of 3 July 1809, noted that the Scots Scott and Campbell were working on Thomson’s Welch collection, and asked if it would be possible for him to look over the work before it was published. Robert Tannahill, letter to George Thomson, 3 July 1809, MS Robertson 1.
29 He urged Clark to send tunes that were unpublished, and wrote to Thomson that many of the ones he had set new words to had been written down from singing. Letters to James Clark and George Thomson, MS Robertson 1.
30 Robert Brown, Paisley Poets, with brief memoirs of them, and selections from their poetry (Paisley: J. & J. Cook, 1890).
32 Semple, The Poems and Songs of Robert Tannahill, xxxv.
33 Grammar school.
34 The weaving community in Paisley tended to be educated and engaged with the events of the day. In the 1790s, all work at the looms stopped when the newspapers arrived. T.C. Smout, A History of the Scottish People, 1560–1830, 2nd edn (London: Collins, 1970), 423.
35 Fred Freeman, telephone conversation, July 2012; Mary Ellen Brown, “Robert Tannahill as a Local Poet,” 32. Ramsay and Semple also agree that the poem is autobiographical.
poem was a non-musical tribute to R. A. Smith. The character named Rab in verse five could be Tannahill himself:

There is Rab, frae the south, wi his fiddle an his flute;  
I could list tae his strains till the starns fa out.  
An we’re a noddin, nid nid noddin,  
We’re a noddin fu at e’en.  

The other characters in the song have been identified as acquaintances of Tannahill, and the location as the Sun Tavern in Paisley, where the Burns club Tannahill founded in 1805 met. Philip Ramsay identifies the friends as James Clark, William Stuart, James Barr, Smith, and Tannahill. Only four of these are mentioned by name in the poem; “Rab” only once, the fifth friend being Apollo. The flute-playing Rab could be Tannahill or Smith, the other Robert could be represented by Apollo. Smith said that the poem is accurate but for the presence of instruments and drunkenness:

The little Bacchanalian Rant you are so anxious to know the history of was written in commemoration of a very happy evening spent by the poet, with four of his musical friends. At that meeting he was in high spirits, and his conversation became more than usually animated; many songs were sung, and we had some glee singing, but neither fiddle nor flute made its appearance in company, nor were any of us “nid, nid, noddin”…

Having been there, Smith would presumably have known if instruments were played, or if Tannahill was indulging in poetic licence. If the poem is indeed autobiographical, it is Tannahill’s only known reference to his flute playing, and suggests that the flute existed as part of a traditional music culture in Scotland in the late eighteenth and very early nineteenth centuries.

37 Semple, The Poems and Songs of Robert Tannahill, 240.  
38 Semple, The Poems and Songs of Robert Tannahill, 239.  
40 Smith in Motherwell, The Harp of Renfrewshire, xxxvii.  
41 Aside from playing at a pub, and his interest in national tunes, there is no indication that Tannahill only played traditional music. Fiddle tune collections show an Italian influence, and Niel Gow enjoyed playing Corelli’s sonatas. David Johnson, Scottish Fiddle Music in the Eighteenth Century (Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 2005), 4–6. In fact, the notion of musical exclusivity is just wrong when considering eighteenth-century Scotland. Johnson, Scottish Fiddle Music in the Eighteenth Century, 1–6; Gelbart, The Invention of “Folk Music” and “Art Music,” 1–8.
3.3 William Nicholson, 1783–1844

William Nicholson was a poet and pedlar from Borgue, Kirkcudbrightshire. His formal education was minimal, halting not because of lack of ability or financial concerns, but because his poor eyesight was a hindrance. At the age of fourteen he went into the peddling business. He required a scribe for his poems, which he performed as he travelled southwest Scotland selling various goods. He lost his money in 1812 attempting to buy a horse to make his business practices a bit easier. After a volume of his poetry was published in 1814, Nicholson was able to return to the peddling business, selling his book along with his other wares, from the back of his horse. His return to business was not a financial success, and he began to drink heavily and, perhaps as a result, have visions. The visions were accompanied by voices, and became so insistent that in 1826 Nicholson travelled to London to see the king about the concerns the voices had regarding the Greeks and Catholicism. Nicholson was unable to get past the palace guards, even after offering them books of his poetry. He returned to Galloway and his itinerant lifestyle, supported largely by his friends.

The engraving of Nicholson made for the frontispiece of his poems shows him holding a set of small bagpipes. He is always described as musical and as a piper; Harper

---


writes that he played Irish pipes, which he played as he travelled the countryside, attracting customers and luring young people to dance in the fields while he played.\textsuperscript{47} Bayne writes that Nicholson purchased a set of pipes at the age of 20, after he had been in the peddling business for six years.\textsuperscript{48} Despite the compelling evidence that Nicholson was a piper, the Stewartry Museum in Kirkcudbright\textsuperscript{49} has a flute said to have belonged to William Nicholson.\textsuperscript{50} The flute was left to the Stewartry Museum in 1949 by a distant relative of Nicholson’s, A. N. Stone.\textsuperscript{51}

The existence of a flute with Nicholson’s name attached to it strongly suggests he played flute, but the lack of mention of it by his biographers and editors, several of whom knew him, suggests he did not.\textsuperscript{52} He was known to sing and play pipes as he travelled, sometimes providing music for weddings and parties in exchange for food and lodging, and is said to have accompanied his singing on pipes.\textsuperscript{53} This evidence, from sources who knew Nicholson, indicates that he was exclusively a piper, that the way he played and sang as he travelled was one of the primary reasons he was a memorable and distinctive character.\textsuperscript{54} Had he played flute, the same sources surely would have mentioned it.\textsuperscript{55} As for the instrument affiliated with him, it is almost certainly the result of a mistake. In the hundred years between Nicholson’s and Stone’s deaths, many family traditions could have developed in the Nicholson family around their eccentric ancestor. A distinct possibility is

\textsuperscript{47} Harper, \textit{The Poetical Works of William Nicholson}, 6–8. He also sang his songs as he travelled.
\textsuperscript{49} A visit to the Stewartry Museum ended in disappointment. The flute was not on display, and the lady working at the desk said she had been working there for 34 years and was not aware that they had a flute.
\textsuperscript{50} Stewartry Museum Accession number STEWM:7382, Digital Number: SWMU001n. See: http://futuremuseum.co.uk/collections/people/key-people/writers-poets/william-nicholson/william-nicholsons-wooden-flute.aspx.
\textsuperscript{51} Stewartry Museum Accession Register No. 4077.
\textsuperscript{52} The entry “Wull Nicholson” in \textit{The Scottish Gallovidian Encyclopedia} is about William Nicholson, and describes him as a piper. It was first published in 1824, and it is clear from the entry that he was a well-known local character. John MacTaggart, \textit{The Scottish Gallovidian Encyclopedia}, 2nd edn (London: Hamilton, Adams, and Co., 1876), 486–487.
\textsuperscript{54} Of course he could have acquired a flute in his travels and not played it, or he could have had it for sale amongst his pins and cloth.
\textsuperscript{55} There may once have been compelling evidence that he played flute.
that a flute was lying about in the old family possessions, and no one could remember whose it had been. Nicolson was known to have been musical, especially in an idealized pastoral manner, and so the flute became his.  

Contemporary descriptions of Nicholson are so sentimentalized that it is difficult to determine where and when truth and embellishment diverge. While he is described as barely literate, there are also descriptions of him as a voracious reader with a book to his face. He required a scribe for his poems, but there are coherent, legible letters from him to his sister preserved in libraries. His most recent biographer, John Hudson, believes Nicholson’s contemporaries would have him be the archetypical rustic-genius-musician, and as such, he had to be barely literate and had to play bagpipes, the flute, or the fiddle. As a stock character from a pastoral, the actual instrument he may have played is of little consequence.

3.4 Conclusion

The flute playing of Tannahill and the association of a flute with Nicholson shows that the flute existed as an instrument for traditional music making in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, and that flute playing was not the exclusive province of the upper classes. While evidence exists of only one flute player among the lower strata of society, the attribution of a flute to Nicholson may not have been unreasonable. Given the

56 David Devereux asked me if the instrument was really a flute, implying that perhaps it was a pipe chanter. Devereux, email to author, 11 January 2013.
60 Smith, “Peddling Poetry”.
61 Hudson says nothing regarding Nicholson’s musical pursuits, but does emphasize the lack of reliable information about him. He speculates that Nicholson’s better-off contemporaries could not explain how such a man could write such good verse, and so made his story more rustic than it actually was. Though Nicholson lacked formal education, his poetry shows an awareness and use of carefully constructed literary devices. Smith, “Peddling Poetry”; Hudson, The Collected Poems of William Nicholson, 8–9.
62 That he wrote verse was just a bonus.
dearth of information about the musical activities of the lower classes, whether or not flute playing was common is impossible to know, but the flute playing of Tannahill, and the affiliation of a flute with Nicholson, suggests that there were other flute players in the lower classes who, unlike these poets, were not memorable or remarkable outside their families.
4. Ladies

4.1 Introduction

Conventional wisdom has it that in the eighteenth century, women did not play the flute.¹ Very little evidence of women playing the flute survives, but that which does survive shows that some women did play flute in the eighteenth century, in Scotland as well as England, France, and Germany, and that the instrument was played by both professionals and aristocratic amateurs. The accounts of flute-playing ladies do not present their musical activities as anything out of the ordinary; it can be safely said then that while keyboard instruments, the harp, and singing were more popular and more common, that women in the eighteenth century did play flute, without causing scandal.

Women, in art at least, had been flute players for centuries.² Many sixteenth-century paintings depict women playing flutes, including Allegory of Music, by Dirk de Quade van Ravesteyn,³ and Consort of Women, by the Master of Female Half-Lengths,⁴ as well as a woodcut from 1578 by Tobias Stimmer, accompanied by verses by Johann Fischart.⁵ The sixteenth-century painted ceiling in the Muses’ Room at Crathes Castle,

---

¹ This idea is deeply ingrained in the psyches of musicians who attempt historically informed performance practice, but it seems to stem only from a lack of evidence to the contrary. In the eighteenth century section of his extremely thorough history of the flute, Ardal Powell only names one female flute player, the Englishwoman Marianne Davies, whose performances on flute were “highly radical,” though he gives no reason why. Powell maintains she further breached the bounds of respectability by advertising as a teacher of flute and glass armonica. Evidently these are activities Powell believes nice girls just did not do. Powell does not mention women as flute players again until the twentieth century, when he remarks on women in general gaining acceptance into orchestras, and in particular the evolution of women holding flute positions in orchestras in the second half of the twentieth century. Ardal Powell, The Flute (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002), 110–111, 281. For how conventional wisdom on women in the eighteenth century has been created and influenced by the nineteenth century, see the chapter on “Propriety,” Amanda Vickey, The Gentleman’s Daughter (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1999), 225–284.

² Powell, The Flute, 44.


⁴ This painting depicts a group of women at music, one of whom is playing a flute. It is held at the State Hermitage Museum, St Petersburg, Russia. “Consort of Women,” Web Gallery of Art, accessed 31 August 2013, http://www.wga.hu/frames-e.html?html/m/master/female/

⁵ The accompanying verse details Minerva’s displeasure at how the flute distorted her face, and indeed the woman in the woodcut has a rather beak-like embouchure. Powell, The Flute, 3.
Banchory, Aberdeenshire, shows the muse Euterpe playing a flute. These paintings are, for the most part, symbolic, but evidently the flute was long associated with women. At some point, the paradigm of thinking about flute players shifted, since we now think that the past thought that women who played the flute were somehow scandalous, when really, women have always played flute without causing so much as a raised eyebrow.

Indeed, a prohibition on flute playing makes a certain amount of sense in a society that placed a high value on a woman’s beauty, demureness, and perceived virtue: the flute requires that the body be contorted into an awkward and unattractive posture obscuring the view of the elegant lines of torso and face. The flute was long associated with phallic imagery, masculinity, and war, topics deemed unsuitable for the delicate sensibilities of ladies, and presumably learning to play a flute would lead to corruption. Music, however, was a necessary part of a girl’s education if she was to be thought accomplished. In 1675, Hannah Woolley advised:

The Recreations most proper unto Ladies are three, Musick, Limning, and Dancing…Musick is no doubt an excellent quality; some of the ancient Philosophers have held, that Souls were made of Harmony, such an operation hath Musick that it hath struck Civility and candour into the most barbarous minds, and without this quality, a Lady can hardly be said to be accomplished.

---

6 The Crathes Castle painted ceiling dates from 1599. This is an oddly-shaped flute, of which I know no other examples. It is held transverse, but the end is bell-shaped, like a recorder. The verse accompanying the painting calls it a “quhissile”. I suspect that the odd shaped of the instrument has more to do with the artist’s imagination than it does any example he worked from. Several of the other instruments are inexact as well.

7 Euterpe was depicted with a flute from ancient times, possibly the earliest being an Athenian tile work from the fifth century BCE. Theoi, accessed 31 August 2013, http://www.theoi.com/Gallery/K20.10B.html.


Woolley cautioned, however, against making one’s musical abilities known, lest the
tendency to show off talents led to pride and, consequently censure. Richard Allestree
included music as an “ornamental improvement” similar to writing or needlework: not
necessary by any means, but potentially useful. Other writers on female education agreed
that music was important to the well-educated young lady, but that over-emphasising it to
the point of performance would be detrimental to the formation of character. Miss Hatfield
wrote that:

Although music assists to ameliorate and harmonize the human mind, it is
necessary to restrain its use within the limits of temperance. When music is
suffered to be indulged with passion, it becomes a fascinating encroacher: by
degrees it delights, and at length, like an enchantress, it seizes upon the nobler
faculties of the soul, to the exclusion of every rival consideration.

Most writers assumed that ladies would only be interested in learning to sing or
accompany, and when music is mentioned at all, those are the only aspects they discuss.
Roger North advised ladies to play the harpsichord rather than the lute simply because it
was better for their posture. He claimed to have thoughts for and against other
instruments, but was planning to write about them in more detail elsewhere. Charles
Allen wrote that while music was:

…not the most useful, is certainly one of the most genteel qualifications which
a young lady can possess… As most young ladies are taught to play on the
harpsichord, the spinet, and guitar, I expect you will learn to perform on all
these instruments, especially on the first, which has a greater variety of notes,
and a larger compass than either of the other two. But still I would have you to
apply your chief attention to vocal music, because, in its perfection, it is of a far
more excellent nature than that which is merely instrumental; the merit of the
latter being always determined by its approach to the former…

---

12 Ibid, 260.
14 S. Hatfield, Letters on the Importance of the Female Sex, reprinted in Conduct Literature for Young
15 Sadly he never got around to it. Roger North, Roger North on Music: Being a Selection from his Essays
16 Charles Allen, The Polite Lady; or, a course of Female Education in a Series of Letters, From a Mother
Of the thirty-two works of educational literature published prior to 1810 surveyed for this study, wind instruments are mentioned only once, strongly suggesting that not only did most women not study them, but if they were interested in doing so that interest was stamped out as unladylike. Only John Essex makes the reasons against the flute explicit:

The Harpsichord, Spinet, Lute and Base Violin, are Instruments most agreeable to the Ladies; There are some others that really are unbecoming to the Fair Sex; as the Flute, Violin, and Hautboy; the last of which is too Manlike, and would look indecent in a Woman’s Mouth; and the Flute is very improper, as taking away too much of the Juices, which are otherwise more necessary employ’d, to promote the Appetite, and assist Digestion.

The primary objection to women and winds was the distortion of the face and potential for stimulating lustful thoughts, with the story of Minerva used to justify discouraging girls from studying the flute well into the nineteenth century.

---

17 Works such as the following are numerous. My criteria for selection was whether or not the author wrote about music in education, what other aspects of education were included, the date of publication and intended audience. Some are for married ladies, some for young mothers, some for parents, some for adolescent girls, and some are for men offering guidance on how to best manage their wives. The cut-off date of 1810 shows the change in attitude towards women wind instrument players in the nineteenth century. So far as I know, no study exists on the success rates of conduct literature. Theophilus Dorrington, The Excellent Woman, Part I (1692); Eugenius Theodidactus, Advice to a Daughter (1658); George Savile Lord Halifax, The Lady’s New-Year’s Gift: Or, Advice to a Daughter (1700); Mary Astell, Reflections upon Marriage (1706); Richard Allestree, The Ladies Calling (1677); William Darrell, The Gentleman Instructed (1755); Hannah Woolley, The Gentlewomen’s Companion (1675); François Fénelon, Instructions for the Education of a Daughter, trans. George Hickes (1708), all reprinted in William St Clair and Irmgard Maassen, eds, Conduct Literature for Women 1640–1710, volumes 1–6 (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2002). Woman Triumphant: Or, the Excellency of the Female Sex (1721); John Essex, The Young Ladies Conduct: or, Rules for Education (1722); George Lyttelton, Advice to a Lady (1733); Advice to the Fair: an Epistolary Essay (1738); A Letter to a Lady. In Praise of Female Learning (1739); Alexander Monro, The Professor’s Daughter. An Essay on Female Conduct (1739–45); The Lady’s Preceptor. Or, a Letter to a Young Lady of Distinction upon Politeness (1743); David Fordyce, Dialogues concerning Education (1745); The Art of Governing a Wife; with Rules for Bachelors (1747); The Young Gentleman and Lady Instructed (1747); A Letter to a Lady, Concerning the Education of Female Youth (1749); Thomas Marriott, Female Conduct: being an Essay on the Art of Pleasing (1759); Sarah Pennington, An Unfortunate Mother’s Advice to her Absent Daughters, 3rd edition (1761); Charles Allen, The Polite Lady: or, A Course of Female Education (1760), all reprinted in Pam Morris, ed., Conduct Literature for Women 1720–1770, volumes 1–6 (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2004); Mrs H. Cartwright, Letters on Female Education, addressed to a Married Lady (1777); John Moir, Female Tution: or, An Address to Mothers, on the Education of Daughters, 2nd edition (1786); John Bennett, Letters to a Young Lady, on a variety of Useful and Interesting Subjects calculated to improve the heart, to form the manners, and enlighten the understanding (1789). Discourses on Different Subjects, 2nd edition (1791); Miss S. Hatfield, Letters on the Importance of the Female Sex: with Observations on their Manners, and on Education (1803); Lucy Aikin, Epistles on Women, Exemplifying their Character and Condition in various Ages and Nations (1810); Thomas Broadhurst, Advice to Young Ladies on the Improvement of the Mind and the Conduct of Life, 2nd edition (1810), all reprinted in Pam Morris, ed., Conduct Literature for Women 1770–1830, volumes 1–6 (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2005).
18 Presumably in themselves and in others.
19 In the myth, an assortment of goddesses were playing music, Minerva’s instrument of choice being the flute. The others laughed at her, and she was not sure if the cause was her playing or something else. She happened to see her reflection in some water, and saw how the instrument distorted her lips, and immediately...
Own Paper argued that while girls in Germany were taught woodwind and brass instruments, “whether it would be decorous [was] rather doubtful.”\textsuperscript{21} In an article published in 1887, Frederick Crowset wrote that “distended cheeks and swollen lips are not marks of beauty… the flute and other wind-instruments are unlike to come into fashion,” even though Greek women had played flute.\textsuperscript{22} By 1892, women were playing flute and clarinet at a concert at the Royal Academy of Music. An audience member wrote to The Magazine of Music expressing his distaste. The response to his letter in the magazine noted that women in antiquity had played flute, but that it was best avoided because a “[l]ovely woman inevitably ceases to be lovely when she tackles a wind instrument.”\textsuperscript{23}

These objections should be seen as reflections of nineteenth-century men’s focus on femininity, and contemporary musicians’ continued perception of these views as truths relevant to all of the past.\textsuperscript{24} These nineteenth-century voices are significantly louder than

---


\textsuperscript{23} The author of the letter argued that women should be legally banned from playing wind instruments. The Magazine had the good taste to disagree with him, if only because the author of the response believed that women would eventually give up any activity that sacrificed beauty. The Magazine of Music, September 1892, 180. Quoted in Gillett, Musical Women in England, 194.

\textsuperscript{24} For an exploration of contemporary musicians’ over-reliance on the nineteenth century, see Bruce Haynes, The End of Early Music, (Oxford University Press, 2007).
the lone eighteenth-century explicit prohibition, and are therefore easier to hear when considering earlier notions of decency.\textsuperscript{25}

Edward Topham, writing from Edinburgh in 1774 observed that “Many of them (ladies) play on the harpsichord and the guittar, and some have music in their voices: though they rather prefer to hear others perform than play themselves…”\textsuperscript{26} What Topham reported may have been generally true by that point in the century, but earlier in the eighteenth century the stricture against women playing the flute (in Scotland, at least) was not as firmly in place. The poem “Edina’s Glory”, printed in 1723, suggests that it was quite common for the ladies of Edinburgh to study the flute:

’Till now when was Edina’s daughters known
To have their Fame to foreign Climates blown:
To feed a Billet doux and breath a Flute,
Make pastry Pyramids and Candy fruit,
Ombre a common Ball, Tea Table Chat,  
Was all the Education which they got.\textsuperscript{27}

Flute in this context could mean recorder or transverse flute, but considering how extraordinary either would be for a lady to play, I will not attempt to distinguish the possible candidates for type of flute.

By 1727, however, it was common for Scottish ladies to play the transverse flute, at least according to the writing of James Freebairn.\textsuperscript{28} He says that fathers hired the best and most expensive music and dancing masters, usually Italian and French respectively, for

\textsuperscript{25} Amanda Vickery blames historians for not having minds open enough to consider the fairly wide bounds of propriety. On this and the topic of women’s declining options from the seventeenth to nineteenth centuries, see Amanda Vickery, \textit{The Gentleman’s Daughter} (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1999), 2–12.


\textsuperscript{27} “Edina’s Glory, or the Fair Assembly, a poem in defense of musick, wit and gallantry, as it prevails ‘mongst the polite in their weekly sessions, holden at the metropolis of Scotland. By a Scottish gentleman.” Printed and sold by Alexander Davidson, 1723.

their daughters, and provides a list of ladies who were able to move listeners’ souls to ecstasy by their playing of the harpsichord or transverse flute:

Fathers also full of generosity do not spare any expense for the perfecting of all the exercises suitable to their sex, such as music and dance, also we see arriving here every day the best Italian music masters, and the most famous dancing masters that France can boast to teach, attracted by the advantages that their great appointments give them. And who has not had their ears tickled and their soul ravished in listening to My Lady Weird, Miss Maitland, Mill Pringle, Miss Erskine, Miss Campbell, Mrs Hamilton, or Miss Dalzell play the harpsichord or the transverse flute.  

Other ladies studied other traditionally masculine instruments: Lady Sophia Hope and Elizabeth Rose of Kilravock both played violin.

In 1770, Nelly Spottiswood was invited to a house party where the primary activities for the young people were dancing, card playing, and playing the flute. She wrote to her friend Jane Innes about it, and her tone suggests disapproval, or at least knowledge that she should disapprove:

Dont blame me nor condem me before I gett one word in self defense. Let me first inform you that your humble servt & some of my sisters was invited to a Gentlemans House some few miles distant to spend the Christmas Holly days where we went & racketed it away for near a fortnight dancing cards singing & Playing on the German flute was the constant entertainment each night dont mistake me & think that I ether sung or Play’d no sober I contented my self with a minuet or two country dances & sometimes would seat my self at the card table at a tedious game at whisk & now for my appologie first all the time I was from home no intercourse being betwixt this House and the one I was in made me not gett yours till I came home & I am sure I have taken the first

---

29 My translation; original French text: “Les Peres aussie pleins de bonte, n’epargnent aucune depense, pour les perfectionner eu tous les exercises convenables a leur sexe, comme la musique et la danse, aussi nous voyons arrive ici, tous les jours, les plus habiles maîtres Italians pour la musique, et les plus celebrellas maîtres de danse dont la france se peut vanter, pour enseigner, attirez par le profit qui leur reveient des grands appointments qu’on leur donne. Et qui n’avoit pas les oreilles chatouillées et l’ame ravie, d’entendre My Lady Weird, Mademoiselle Maitland, Mlle Pringle, Mlle Erskine, Mlle Campbell, M [Mme?] Hamilton, ou Mlle Dalzell jouer du clavesin ou de la flute a traverse…” Regrettably Freebairn does not specifically mention which of these ladies played flute. James Freebairn, L’Eloge d’Ecosse et des dames ecossaises (Edinburgh: 1727), 42.


31 Forty-three letters from Nelly Spottiswood to Jane Innes, niece of Gilbert Innes of Stowe, are in the Innes Papers at the National Archives of Scotland. The letters were exchanged between 1769 and 1775, and are in general full of gossip and family news as well as reproaches to Jane for not being a good or prompt correspondent. Nelly describes herself in the first letter, 6 November 1769, as a “country lass” dependent on the Edinburgh-dwelling Jane for interesting news.
opportunity to answere it as it was but last night I receiv’d that Dear kind complaint….

The implication is that the ladies were participating in the flute playing with the men, activities Spottiswood wants to make it clear she took no part in, lest she be thought to be lacking in virtue. She does, however, seem to think that the others were having more fun than she was playing cards.

A practical, rather than aesthetic, consideration that may explain why ladies traditionally did not study solo instruments such as flute or violin is that those instruments usually required accompaniment, meant to be provided by the lady. A keyboard instrument, or learning to sing and accompany oneself, made a lady self-sufficient musically and therefore able to entertain herself, as well as provide entertainment or accompany as needed. Helen Goodwill’s study of music in Scottish country houses shows that a great deal more money was spent on music lessons for girls, possibly as a means of providing them with a way to occupy their time. Women’s lives were monotonous, and music lessons and chances to play music with and for friends provided social outlets. Goodwill challenges the assumption that musical ability was at all important in determining a girl’s marriage prospects.

In at least one case, a lady’s music ability was a determining factor in a man’s interest in her. John Courtney (1734–1806), a gentleman from Yorkshire who lived with

---

32 All of Nelly’s letters to her friend Jane or Jean Innes are just as badly spelled and lacking in punctuation as this one. Nelly Spottiswood to Jane Innes, January 13, 1770. National Archives of Scotland, Innes Papers, GD113/5/63/6.
33 John Cranmer believes that the piano sonata played by a lady, accompanied by a gentleman on flute, was a socially accepted way for unmarried people to interact. John Cranmer, “Concert Life and the Musical Trade in Edinburgh, c.1780–c.1830” (PhD thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1991), 182.
34 In London, a female singer’s appearance was considered part of what she had to offer to a performance. The most fashionable ladies’ instruments—the harp, guitar, keyboard instruments, and glass armonica—were designed for solitary playing. Women who played traditionally masculine instruments such as the flute or violin were subject to censure from the press for usurping male roles of leadership and dominance. Simon McVeigh, Concert Life in London from Mozart to Haydn (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 86–87.
35 As Goodwill points out, men’s priorities were more likely a girl’s dowry and her ability to manage a household and produce an heir. In her study of nine families, the girls received music instruction in six of the families while boys received music lessons in only three. Goodwill, “The Musical Involvement of the Landed Classes in Eastern Scotland”, 148–149.
his mother, decided in 1759 that it was time for him to marry. His activities to this point in
his life had been dancing, racing, cantata and country dance writing, and he believed that
these skills would make him an attractive suitor to most young ladies. He was sadly
mistaken, spending ten years of life pursuing various women, facing eight rejections. His
courtships were usually fairly brief. Courtney’s first, in February 1759, was of a Miss
Newsome. He heard her singing, took her a gift of music, plied her with sweets, danced
with her, helped her out of her carriage, and was allowed a private conversation with her
on 26 February. Her family sent him away on March 1 after they sang a final duet. All of
Courtney’s attempts at romance followed the same pattern, and all ended the same way
until June 1768 when he married Mary Smelt. She played harpsichord. She even played
for the servants’ dancing during their wedding tea. It is easy to imagine that music was the
only thing Courtney and the women he pursued had in common, considering his high
failure rate.  

John Courtney cannot be the only example of a man who courted women
because they were musical.  

Three ladies of the Scottish aristocracy are known to have played flute in the early
eighteenth century: Susannah, Lady Eglinton; Rachel, Lady Binning; and Catherine, Lady
Gairlies. In the cases of these ladies, which member of the flute family they played cannot
be determined with certainty; the evidence can point towards transverse flute or recorder
for the first two, and Lady Gairlies definitely played recorder. The precise instrument that
each lady played is, however, less important than the fact that ladies were known as wind
instrument players in early eighteenth-century Scotland.

---

36 Amanda Vickery, *Behind Closed Doors: At home in Georgian England* (New Haven: Yale University
4.2 Susanna Montgomerie, Lady Eglinton 1690–1780

The Countess of Eglinton\textsuperscript{37} was a well-known literary patron, beauty, and hostess. She was the daughter of Sir Archibald Kennedy of Culzean, and became the third wife of Alexander Montgomerie, the 9\textsuperscript{th} Earl of Eglinton, in 1709.\textsuperscript{38} She was popular in Edinburgh for her wit, height, grace, and beauty: Harry Graham writes that she created such a stir on first entering Edinburgh society that men fought duels over her, and composed sonnets in honour of her eyebrows.\textsuperscript{39} Robert Chambers describes her as having had a face of “bewitching loveliness” and standing over six feet tall.\textsuperscript{40} Before marrying the arl, Susanna was pursued by Sir John Clerk of Penicuik,\textsuperscript{41} who, knowing she played the flute,\textsuperscript{42} sent her one. When she attempted to play the instrument, no sound was produced, which led her to investigate the reason. She found a poem rolled inside the instrument, in which Clerk suggests he wishes he could trade places with the flute and be pressed to her lips:

\begin{quote}
Harmonious pipe, I languish for thy bliss,
When pressed to Silvia’s lips with gentle kiss!
And when her tender fingers round thee move
In soft embrace, I listen and approve
Those melting notes which soothe my soul in love.
Embalmed with odours from her breath that flow,
You yield your music when she’s pleased to blow;
And thus at once the charming lovely fair
Delights with sounds, with sweets perfumes the air.
Go, happy pipe, and ever mindful be
To court bewitching Silvia for me;
Tell all I feel—you cannot tell too much—
Repeat my love at each soft melting touch—
Since I to her my liberty resign,
Take thou the care to tune her heart to mine.\textsuperscript{43}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{37} Spellings of her name vary and include Susannah, Susanna, Montgomery, Montgomerie, Eglinton, Eglintoune, and Eglintoun. I have opted to use the version found in the \textit{Oxford Dictionary of National Biography}.
\textsuperscript{39} Harry Graham, \textit{A Group of Scottish Women} (London: Methuen & Co., 1908), 165–166.
\textsuperscript{40} Robert Chambers, \textit{Traditions of Edinburgh} (Edinburgh: W. & R. Chambers, 1868), 212.
\textsuperscript{41} Graham, \textit{A Group of Scottish Women},166–168.
\textsuperscript{42} This could be a transverse flute or recorder.
\textsuperscript{43} Chambers, \textit{Traditions of Edinburgh}, 213.
It is not known for certain if Susanna played the transverse flute or the recorder; the date would suggest recorder, as the transverse flute was not as prevalent that early in the century, as does an air in Clerk’s hand in the Penicuik papers which, based on the key signature, is likely for recorder.\textsuperscript{44} The case for the transverse flute is somewhat stronger. Clerk desires to be “pressed” to her lips, which is how the transverse flute is played,\textsuperscript{45} and the dedication of William McGibbon’s 1734 \textit{Sonatas for Two German Flutes or Two Violins and a Bass}\textsuperscript{46} is to Susanna, suggesting that McGibbon knew she played German flute and would therefore play his sonatas and that she was more than simply an aristocratic dedicatee. As observed above, ultimately which member of the flute family Susanna played is immaterial compared to the significance of a high-ranking female wind instrument player in the eighteenth century.

Susanna wanted to accept Clerk, but her father knew that his old friend Lord Eglinton intended to propose as soon as his ailing wife died, and insisted his daughter wait for that inevitability.\textsuperscript{47} Some believed Susanna was destined to be the Countess of Eglinton. In her childhood, as she played in the garden at Culzean, a hawk landed on her shoulder with Lord Eglinton’s name on its bell.\textsuperscript{48}

Once married, Lady Eglinton’s occupations may have turned from flute-playing to the more serious concern of producing an heir. Although he had been married twice prior to Susanna, Lord Eglinton lacked a son. Susanna’s first seven children were daughters, and when her husband offered to divorce her so he could try again with someone else, she said only if in addition to her dowry he would also retain her beauty, youth, and virginity.

\textsuperscript{44} Penicuik Papers, National Records of Scotland, GD18/4538/9.
\textsuperscript{45} Although Clerk could have been avoiding the obvious gross impropriety of saying he wanted to be pressed between her lips.
\textsuperscript{46} William McGibbon, \textit{Six Sonatas for Two German Flutes or Two Violins, and a Bass} (Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1734). See Chapter 6, ‘Repertoire’, for discussion of McGibbon’s contributions to flute repertoire, including this, his second set of trio sonatas for two flutes or violins and bass.
\textsuperscript{48} Chambers, \textit{Traditions of Edinburgh}, 212.
Within a year, an heir was born. Lady Eglinton became a widow in 1729 at the age of 40, and devoted her life to educating her children and supervising her son’s estate until he became of age. Lady Eglinton became the patron of the poets Allan Ramsay and William Hamilton of Bangour. She was dedicatee of Ramsay’s *The Gentle Shepherd* and of William McGibbon’s *Six Sonatas for Two Violins or German Flutes and Bass*. Her daughters took after their mother in being known for their beauty; their deportment was known as the Eglinton air. Whether or not Lady Eglinton continued to play flute is not known, but she did tame rats and teach them to dance.

4.3 Rachel, Lady Binning, 1696–1773

Lady Binning was the second daughter of Lady Grisell and George Baillie. Lady Grisell Baillie (1665–1746) is one of the more remarkable characters in Scottish history. Her father, Sir Patrick Home, 1st Earl of Marchmont, was on the run following the Rye House Plot in 1683, and for a time hid in the family’s vault at Polwarth church, where Grisell smuggled him food each night. She was the only one of his many children he trusted with his whereabouts before the family escaped to Holland. Grisell grew up to marry George Baillie, whose father, Robert Baillie of Jerviswood, had been a friend of her father. Grisell’s father entrusted her with the task of smuggling letters in and out of Baillie’s prison cell in 1676, which is where she most likely first met George. Her account books from her marriage are detailed records of household management in early eighteenth-century Scotland, especially regarding servants, travel, and the education of her

---

two daughters, Rachel and Grisell. Their mother’s detailed account books show payments for music lessons for Rachel and her older sister Grisell. Grisell had lessons in thorough bass, bass viol, harpsichord, and singing. Rachel had lessons in flute, spinet, and virginal, and a flute was purchased for her from Mr Crumbin in November 1702. The household book shows payments to Crumbden, Kemberg, Sainte-Colome, Steall, and McGibbon for various lessons. Helen Goodwill writes that the flute lessons at least were given by a Mr McGibbon, a relative of the violinist and composer William McGibbon (1690–1756).

Flute playing was in the family. While in exile in Utrecht, Lady Binning’s grandfather Lord Patrick Hume wrote that “[i]f I were among them, I would help their mirth by a tune on the flute, which I am learning of, and pretty good at”. No records of payments for music for Lady Binning after her 1717 marriage to Charles Binning, the Earl of Haddington’s son, survive, though the music library at Mellerstain contained a copy of William McGibbon’s 1745 *Six Sonatas for Two German Flutes and Bass*, as well as duets by J. Real, the 1726 edition of William Thomson’s *Orpheus Caledonius*, which included a part for German flute, and music for violins which would be playable on flute, in addition

---

56 There is some confusion over the identity of William McGibbon’s father. He was either an oboist, Malcolm, who died in 1722 in Edinburgh, or a violinist, Duncan, from Glasgow. William McGibbon was born in Glasgow and played violin, which makes Duncan a slightly stronger candidate for his father. Malcolm, possibly William’s uncle, is likely the identity of the Mr McGibbon in question, due to geographic location and instrument choice. Oboe and flute were frequently played by the same person. David Johnson, “McGibbon, William,” *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online* (Oxford University Press), accessed 11 February 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/17326.
57 Goodwill identifies this Mr McGibbon as William’s father. Actually it was more likely William McGibbon’s uncle. Goodwill, “ The Musical Involvement of the Landed Classes in Eastern Scotland,” 117; David Johnson, unpublished notes on McGibbon.
58 Letter, 1686, from Sir Patrick Hume to his family in Lady Murray of Stanhope, *Memoirs of the Lives and Characters of the Right Honourable George Baillie of Jerviswood, and of Lady Grisell Baillie* (Edinburgh: J. Pillans, 1824), 129. This flute could also have been either the recorder or the transverse flute. The transverse flute was the latest fad in the late seventeenth century, though the Netherlands produced many well-known recorder players.
59 Only two copies of the first part exist in library collections, and are labeled ‘traverso primo’.
to a great deal of Italian vocal music. The music for flute was published after her marriage, and is either specifically for German flute or would be better suited for that instrument than the recorder, suggesting both that she did not give up music on her marriage and that she played transverse flute.

Lady Binning’s sister Grisell, Lady Murray, continued her musical study after her marriage. She left her husband and returned to her parents’ home and financial support; several of the entries in her mother’s accounts are on Lady Murray’s behalf while she was travelling with her parents in Italy, studying music. The editor of her mother’s household book wrote that she was well-known in Edinburgh and in London for her singing of Scottish airs and ballads, sometimes able to “draw tears from the eyes of her audience.” A portrait of Lady Murray from the 1730s by Maria Verelst shows her with an open volume of music. The companion portrait of her sister does not.

---

61 Grisell pleaded with her father to allow her marry Alexander Murray, the son of Sir David Murray of Stanhope, Baronet. Her father should have trusted his judgement; Murray almost immediately proved to be unbalanced at best. The problems began during the ball following their wedding, when the groom decided his bride was in love with his best friend, and ordered the friend out of the house. An unspecified event the next morning caused true alarm, and Sir George Baillie began to look into the legal separation process almost immediately. Grisell wanted to remain with her husband, and did so until he read a newspaper article about the murder of an unfaithful wife by her husband in a threatening manner. Soon after that, he became violent. Luckily they resided with her parents, who immediately became involved. The Decree of Separation was passed on 5 March 1714. By the time Alexander’s father died, he had spent most of his inheritance. He and his wife never met again, though when her portrait was being painted in London he would visit the studio and stare at it, alarming the artist, who did not know who he was. Lady Murray of Stanhope, appendix v to Memoirs, 146–162.
62 Entries of various dates after her separation from her husband in 1714 in her mother’s records show she was travelling with her family, who had gone to Naples for the sake of her brother-in-law, Lord Binning’s, health. Many of the entries are for music copying and singing lessons.
4.4 Catherine, Lady Gairlies, d. 1786

In December 1735 Alexander Baillie published *Airs for the Flute with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord*, dedicated to Lady Gairlies. His dedication indicates she had been studying recorder for some time:

> The following Airs have been composed by a Gentleman for your Ladyship’s Use when you began to practice the Flute a Beque; I thought I could not chuse a better Subject for my First Essay as an Engraver of Musick than these Airs; as well because they were made for Beginners on the Flute & Harpsichord, as that they were composed by a Gentleman who first put a Pencil in my Hand and then an Engraver. But chiefly because they were originally made for your Ladyship’s Use which gives me so fair a Handle to send them into the World under the Protection of your Ladyship’s Name.

They are very simple dance tunes, and the identity of the composer has not been determined.

Lady Gairlies was the daughter of John Cochrane, the 4th Earl of Dundonald. She married Alexander, Lord Gairlies, son of the 5th Earl of Galloway, in either 1728 or 1729. She was considered one of the great beauties of Edinburgh in the middle of the eighteenth century. William Hamilton of Bangour, who made career out of praising the beautiful ladies of Edinburgh, included her and her two sisters in a long poem written on the

---

63 *Airs for the flute, with a thorough bass for the harpsichord* (Edinburgh: Alexander Baillie, 1735).
64 Baillie, *Airs for the flute*, dedication page.
65 The art historian Ailsa Tanner believed they were the work of Sir John Clerk of Penicuik, but the evidence for this is not strong, and Purser does not share her opinion. Ailsa Tanner and John Purser, correspondence. Farmer believed they may have been the work of Lord Colville of Ochiltree, primarily because he had studied composition in Italy, and Tytler said Lord Colville understood counterpoint. Henry George Farmer, *A History of Music in Scotland* (London: Hinrichsen, 1947), 330. Helen Goodwill believes that it is quite clear from the wording of the dedication that Baillie is not the composer, though he is listed as such in RISM. Goodwill, “The Musical Involvement of the Landed Classes in Eastern Scotland,” 220. The answer to the composer’s identity is likely to be found by investigating Baillie’s background and career, not Lady Gairlies’s musical friends.
66 Notes on the family tree from Ailsa Tanner. Tanner did not give clear references to where she obtained her information.
67 The 1825 edition of *Traditions of Edinburgh* gives slightly more detail on Lady Galloway’s family and home than the later edition, which is substantially different book. Chambers confirms that Lady Galloway was tall and beautiful, and the youngest of three daughters of the Earl of Dundonald. Robert Chambers, *The Traditions of Edinburgh*, vol 2 (Edinburgh: W. & C. Tait, 1825), 34. Tanner also says she was mentioned in Freebairn’s *L’Éloge d’Écosse et des dames écossaises*, but the reference is to either her mother or stepmother, the Countess of Dundonald.
marriage of Lady Mary Montgomery to Sir David Cuninghame of Milncaig. About Catherine, he says:

The third, a blameless form remains;
O’er all the blooming victor reigns;
Where’er she gracious deigns to move,
The public praise—the public love!  

Robert Chambers wrote that when Lady Galloway, as she became after her father-in-law’s death and her husband’s acquisition of the earldom, travelled to pay calls in Edinburgh with a coach and six, the front horses were sometimes already at the door of the house she was visiting as she left her own house. The Baillie publication is the only mention of her musical activities.

4.5 Female flute players elsewhere in Europe

At least five female flute players are known outside Scotland in the eighteenth century: two aristocratic amateurs, Princess Anna Amalia of Prussia and Alicia Astley, later Lady Tankerville; and three professionals, Marianne Davies, Mademoiselle Taillard, and Mademoiselle Mudrich, the last two of whom performed at the Concert Spirituel. These other flute-playing ladies show that the perceived prohibition on women and wind instruments was not prevalent in the eighteenth century, and that it was not at all uncommon for women to play flutes.

Princess Anna Amalia of Prussia, (1723–1787), the youngest sister of the enthusiastic flute player Frederick the Great, shared a music exercise book with her brother

---

68 William Hamilton of Bangour, *The poems and songs of William Hamilton of Bangour; collated with the MS. volume of his poems, and containing several pieces hitherto unpublished; with illustrative notes, and an account of the life of the author*, ed. James Paterson (Edinburgh, 1850), 72. Lady Mary Montgomery was the daughter of the 9th Earl of Eglinton and his second wife, Anne, and the stepdaughter of Susanna.
69 Chambers, *The Traditions of Edinburgh*, 244.
71 At least not in Prussia, England, or France.
in which she sought his advice. She studied organ, lute, composition, stringed instruments, and the flute. Her letters suggest her strength and her interest were in the organ and composition; perhaps learning the flute was so her brother would have a duet partner other than his valet, Michael Gabriel Fredersdorf, and his teacher, Johann Joachim Quantz.

Alicia Astley, Lady Tankerville (1718–1791), was an acquaintance of Charles Burney in Shrewsbury in 1742. About Lady Tankerville’s musical studies, Burney wrote that

[s]he manifested a passion for Music very early in practicing on the German Flute which was then little known in the country. Sir Wm Fowler Bar’ of Shrewsbury & this lady were the only performers on that instrument then that obtained or deserved the least notice. But Miss Ashley practiced the Harp likewise and took lessons of my Brother the Shrewsbury Org’ She used to have little Matteis, the language master & 1st Violin of the place to accompany her.

Burney and Lady Tankerville met again in London in the early 1760s. Her husband was suffering from gout, and she had learned to accompany on harpsichord and was continuing to play the flute. Burney writes that she was a “good” performer, which leads to the question of what Burney means by performance: he could mean that she was a good player, or he could also mean that she performed in public. The former seems more likely.

75 Burney spells the name Ashley, but Alicia was the daughter of Sir John Astley.
76 Burney, Memoirs of Dr. Charles Burney, 1726–1769, ed. Slava Klima, Gary Bowers, and Kerry S. Grant (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988), 35. In a footnote, the editors comment that the German flute first appeared in London around 1705, thanks to Jean-Baptiste Loeillet. The other Shrewsbury flute player, Sir William Fowler, was lost at sea en route to India in 1746.
77 I believe the fragment from which this entry in his memoirs originates lacks a clear date.
78 Burney, Memoirs, 137–138
Burney lost track of her after this second meeting, but writes that she moved to Prussia and became a lady in waiting to Princess Amalia.\(^79\) Perhaps they played duets.

Marianne Davies (1743/4–1818) was best known as one of the first glass harmonica virtuosi, but she also played flute and harpsichord. Her parents and her sister were musicians, and Marianne began performing in 1751 in London, where she played two flute concertos, one of which she may have composed, and a harpsichord concerto by Handel. She was best known as a flute player until 1762, when she became possibly the first person in Europe to play Benjamin Franklin’s latest invention, the glass harmonica. Following her début on the new instrument, her glass harmonica performances became the family’s primary means of support.\(^80\)

A different environment with different standards existed in France, where women could more commonly be professional musicians. Two women played flute in Paris at the Concert Spirituel over a fifty-year span. On 1 November 1735 Mademoiselle Taillard performed a flute sonata at the Concert Spirituel. The program included a suite of symphonies by Aubert, *Quemadmodum* by Lalande and *De profundis*, by Destouches.\(^81\)

Mademoiselle Mudrich performed twice at the Concert Spirituel. Her first appearance was on 24 December 1779 when she performed a flute concerto by Stamitz. Other works on the program included a symphony by Sterkel, a motet by Gossec, a piano concerto by Schroetter performed by Mademoiselle Cécile, airs by Sarti, a horn concerto by Punto performed by Mademoiselle Pokorny, noels with variations for violins, and *La Nativité* by Gossec. Mademoiselle Mudrich’s second performance was on 2 February

\(^79\) Ibid., 138
1780 when she performed an unspecified flute concerto. Other pieces included a symphony and a motet by Gossec and airs by Sacchini.82

4.6 Conclusion

Conventional wisdom among contemporary musicians is that ladies never played wind instruments. This can be determined to be false, and a result of carrying over prevalent and vocal nineteenth-century views. While flute-playing may have been an uncommon musical pursuit for ladies in the eighteenth century, it was by no means scandalous or prohibited. Only a few accounts of female flute players from the eighteenth century survive; there certainly were many more who are not remembered because they were either not members of the aristocracy or not professional musicians. Receipts and bills in a man’s name could obscure who the musician in the household was. For reasons such as these, the prevalence of flute playing amongst ladies in the eighteenth century cannot be determined, but it can be determined that many women did play the flute without damage to their reputations.83

83 Whether or not their digestion was affected, as John Essex cautioned, cannot be determined. Such things would have been spoken of in eighteenth-century letters but suppressed in the nineteenth.
5. Professional musicians

5.1 Introduction

Professional flute players active in Scotland in the eighteenth century tended to be generalists, rather than specialists, unlike professional flute players in France and Germany, who were nearly always specialists on the instrument.¹ David Johnson classified the flute, and the recorder, as amateur instruments,² but that was not so much the case. The professional musicians known to have played flute can be broken into two primary categories: teachers and performers. Other than the few travelling virtuosos who passed through Scotland, the flute in the concert halls of the Edinburgh and Aberdeen Musical Societies was almost always the territory of either local amateur musicians or non-specialists.

Regionally, most professional flute players were based in greater Edinburgh,³ with Aberdeen and Glasgow having smaller numbers of flute teachers and concerts featuring the flute.

5.2 Teachers

5.2.1 Mr McGibbon

In 1711 and 1712, Lady Grisell Baillie,⁴ wife of George Baillie of Mellerstain House in the Scottish Borders, employed a music teacher variously called Mr Mcgibbon or

---

¹ Michel Blavet, the most famous flute player of the eighteenth century, only played flute. Johann Joachim Quantz began his career playing oboe, and rapidly switched to flute exclusively. Jacques Hotteterre played flute, oboe, recorder, and musette, but he began his career playing bassoon and viola da gamba in the Grande Ecurie du Roy.
³ This is to be expected as Edinburgh had the largest population and was the focal point of cultural life.
⁴ See Chapter 4, ‘Ladies,’ for more about Lady Grisell Baillie and her children.
Mr Mcgibber to teach her daughter Rachel the flute. This was almost certainly Malcolm McGibbon the Edinburgh-based relative of the composer William McGibbon. Malcolm McGibbon was a prominent musician in Edinburgh: he was the oboist who performed in the St Cecilia’s Day concert described by William Tytler in his essay in the Transactions of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland; on 17 April 1696 he received permission from the city of Edinburgh to run his own music school, and on 4 December of the same year he was admitted as a burgess. He and John Munroe were described as “compleat masters of playing upon the French hautboyes and double curtle”.

In order to run a successful music school, McGibbon would have had to have been proficient on a variety of instruments. While there are many obvious differences between the flute and the oboe, especially relating to the embouchure and sound production, they are much more closely related than some of the other instruments flute teachers offered later in the century. This suggests that early in the century specialized teachers could survive in a market that had less competition, but as instruments became cheaper and more readily available, and as more music teachers went into business, it became necessary for them to offer a variety of instruments and skills in order to survive.

Whether or not McGibbon routinely offered private lessons outside his school is uncertain, but young ladies of the aristocracy would not have been expected to attend

---

7 David Johnson, unpublished notes on William McGibbon’s biography.
9 It was common, even expected, for oboe players to also play flute, especially late in the seventeenth century and early in the eighteenth when the flute was becoming the flashier, more fashionable instrument. Hotteterre’s 1707 Principes de la Flûte Traversière, ou Flûte d’Allemagne, de la Flûte à Bec, ou Flûte Douce, et du Haut-Bois, Diviséz par Traités suggests that students of one instrument would anticipate learning the others included in the method. Johann Joachim Quantz began his musical career playing oboe and flute in the Dresden town band. “The Life of Herr Johann Joachim Quantz as sketched by himself,” in Forgotten Musicians, ed. Paul Nettl (New York: Philosophical Library, 1951): 280–319.
10 Flute teachers in Edinburgh later in the eighteenth century offered a spectrum of instruments from harpsichord, to guitar, to flute and thorough bass. See discussion below.
general classes at a school in a city, so for the appropriate fee, a respected teacher would have been happy to offer private lessons in the student’s home. Only one of Lady Grisell Baillie’s entries in her household book for Rachel’s flute lessons explicitly says it took place at Mellerstain; but when not at their estate they resided in Edinburgh, and the indication is that McGibbon came to them wherever they were, rather than the other way around.

5.2.2 Generalist teachers in Edinburgh, Glasgow, and Aberdeen

Later in the eighteenth century, music teachers offering a variety of lessons began to advertise in the newspapers. It is possible that in an urban market music teachers needed to be able to teach many instruments rather than specializing, although given the dearth of information regarding specialist or generalist music teachers earlier in the century, and without surviving records of students and payments, this can remain little more than speculation. Of the many generalist teachers who worked in Edinburgh and Glasgow, little is known of them and their contribution to flute playing in Scotland. The teachers represented here are by no means the only flute teachers who advertised in the cities, but they have been selected because they advertised regularly offering a variety of music lessons.

---

11 In 1711 Mr Mcgiven received two payments: £1-02 for two months of lessons and a music book, and another of £1 for two more months of lessons. In 1712 Mr Mcgibber received £1-10 for giving three months of lessons. Helen Goodwill converted this to approximately 6d (Scots dollars in Sterling) per lesson. Goodwill, “The Musical Involvement of the Landed Classes in Eastern Scotland”, 121–123.

12 Entries for lessons from other masters are labelled the same way: if the instruction took place at Mellerstain, it is noted as such. Otherwise the location is not mentioned. Presumably this related to how Lady Grisell managed her accounts. See chart of music lessons paid for by Lady Grisell Baillie, Goodwill, “The Musical Involvement of the Landed Classes in Eastern Scotland”, 113.

13 Advertisements for the teachers discussed in this section appeared consistently in Edinburgh and Glasgow newspapers, as opposed to a very few other teachers who advertised once or twice during the eighteenth century. Advertisements for flute teachers were not common at any time in the eighteenth century, and research into music teachers in Glasgow is especially challenging as the city did not have its own newspaper until 1783 when the Glasgow Advertiser was first published.
5.2.2.1 Edinburgh

James Hamilton, William Cranmer, and William Williamson were harpsichord teachers in Edinburgh between 1770 and 1797 who taught other instruments, including flute. John Cranmer has argued that rather than offering only one type of lesson, teachers would offer a variety in order to attract more students, but that the teachers who advertised were not as prestigious as those who did not. Most advertisements for teaching appeared in Edinburgh newspapers in November, so that students could study through the winter season.

James Hamilton advertised between 1770 and 1797, offering, in addition to harpsichord, church music, songs, flute, guitar, and instrument tuning. He was trained at the Collegiate Church in Ripon. A potentially savvy marketer, one of his advertisements is aimed at women who lived in the country:

J. HAMILTON … continues to teach the Harpsichord &c. as formerly, on the most reasonable terms. He will wait on Ladies and Gentlemen at their own lodgings if desired on the most early notice, and such as chuse to attend at his own house at the Head of Patterson’s Court, Lawn-market, he purposes teaching 3 in one hour upon the same terms … And to render the Harpsichord and Spinnet more extenuously useful, particularly to those Ladies who reside a distance from the Capital, J. H. purposes teaching them to tune these instruments after a very easy and expeditious method.

William Cranmer was active between 1774 and 1785, and offered lessons in church music, songs, guitar, and flute, in addition to harpsichord. He studied organ at St Paul’s London before relocating to Edinburgh.

William Williamson, who gave lessons in guitar, flute, harpsichord, and thorough bass between 1781 and 1785, studied organ at York Minster. His advertisement is

---

17 The Edinburgh Evening Courant, 20 December 1775.
remarkably similar to Hamilton’s, except that he makes specific gender distinctions in his lessons:

William Williamson, Musician … presents his respects to the Ladies and Gentlemen of this City, and begs leave to inform them, That he proposes teaching, in Edinburgh, the Thorough Bass on the Harpsichord and Piano-forte and also the Guitar;—and teaches Ladies to sing along with these instruments.\(^{20}\) Likewise teaches Gentlemen the Violin and German Flute …\(^{21}\)

Flute or violin lessons were available at the rate of sixteen for one guinea, while lessons on keyboard instruments were twelve for one guinea. Williamson taught at his home, or would travel to the student.\(^{22}\) He was still offering lessons, with appropriate gender divisions, in 1783, and had also produced a book of lessons and minuets for violin, harpsichord, and flute.\(^{23}\) It is notable that while Scottish ladies did play (and were even reputed for playing) the flute in the first half of the century, by the end of the eighteenth century, gender roles for instruments were prescribed in print by teachers.

5.2.2.2 Glasgow

James Campbell and William Goold were music teachers in Glasgow, who, like their contemporaries in Edinburgh, advertised lessons for a variety of instruments. Unlike the teachers in Edinburgh, the Glasgow teachers contributed to the greater cultural life of the city, which could reflect the overall cultural environments and differences between the two places.

---

20 Whether Mr Williamson was teaching ladies to sing as well as play, or to accompany themselves while singing, is unclear, though possibly both were options.
21 *Caledonian Mercury*, 21 November 1781.
22 Ibid.
23 *Caledonian Mercury*, 8 January 1783.
James Campbell was a violinist who offered lessons on violin as well as flute. In the winter of 1780, he hosted a concert at the Glasgow Assembly Hall.

At the Assembly-Hall On Thursday the 13th of January will be performed James Campbell’s concert of Vocal and Instrumental music

The vocal parts by Messrs, Wilson, Abbey, etc
Act 1: Overture, Scotch Song by Mr Wilson, Harpsichord lesson by Mr Reinagle, Cantata Mr Wilson and Abbey, Solo Clarinet Mr Wilson; Act 2: Overture, Hunting Song Mr Abbey, Concerto Violin J Campbell, A New Song Mr Wilson, Concerto Flute, Overture, three celebrated Catches, lately sung at Vauxhall, and never performed here.
After the Concert a Ball Tickets price 2/6 each, to be had at Messr Dundl and Wilson’s, booksellers; Mr Aird’s music shop; and J Campbell at his lodgings, first land below the College.

William Goold advertised in the Glasgow Mercury in 1780 that he was “beginning his ordinary course of instruction to Ladies and Gentlemen on the spinet, guitar, German flute, etc.” He hosted a concert on 26 February 1781, which featured a flute solo and a flute quartet featuring “local professionals” playing the instrumental music. This is presumably a similar performance to one that took place in February 1780 at the Assembly Hall, which included a flute concerto:

At the Assembly Hall. On Thursday the 17th instant will be performed, W. Goold’s concert of Vocal and Instrumental music.
The Vocal part, by Mr Wilson, who has been reputedly educated at the Cathedral in Durham. The Instrumental part, by the Performers in this city.
Act 1: Overture—Song, Shepherd I hae lost my love; Harpsichord lesson—Solo concerto, German flute
Act 2: Overture—Song, Tweedside—Harpsichord piece—Miscellaneous quartetto, the subjects taken from familiar airs—a clarinet piece—overture. Between the acts Mr Wilson will sing a favorite Italian air
NB Tickets to be had at Messrs Dun..and Wilson’s, and of W Goold, second store above Mr McDonald, vinter, near the cross, Price 2/6.

---

27 Glasgow Mercury, 6 January 1780.
28 Glasgow Mercury, 12 October 1780.
29 No names were given. Glasgow Mercury, 15 February 1781.
30 Glasgow Mercury, 3 February 1780.
The flute teachers in Glasgow made more contributions to the cultural life of the city, but in a city without an organization such as the Edinburgh Musical Society to sponsor concerts, perhaps without the community interest, and without the large market of genteel and aristocratic students, the need to put on concerts may have served several purposes: financial rewards, advertising and recruitment, and contributing to the musical life of the city. By the time of publication of the street directories of 1787 and 1789, only William Goold was still in business as a teacher of instrumental music, and was residing on the north side of Glasgow’s Princes Street, facing Watson’s Rum Cellar.31

5.2.2.3 Aberdeen

Mr Roche of London was hired by the Aberdeen Musical Society in 1758 as Leader of the Concerts. He advertised teaching in violin, flute, oboe, bassoon, violoncello, French horn, and guitar, as well as singing, but was not permitted to teach harpsichord. It was perhaps unusual to hire a general music teacher to lead a concert series; but perhaps Roche’s price was right for the Aberdeen Musical Society’s budget.32

Roche seems to have been somewhat difficult: someone complained about his playing, and he complained to the directors of the society that he was treated disrespectfully. The directors responded by telling him, essentially, to mind his place and do his job, which was to lead the music selected by them. His response was to play more

31 Nathaniel Jones, Jones’s Directory; or Useful Pocket Companion: containing an alphabetical list of the names and places of abode of the Merchants, Manufacturers, Traders and Shop-keepers, in and about the City of Glasgow (Glasgow: John Mennons, 1787), 20; 1789, n.p.
32 Mr Roche is the only employed leader of the Aberdeen Musical Society on record. His predecessors were either gentlemen members or possibly a touring virtuoso, Mr Helm, who informally led a few concerts. The name of Roche’s successor is unknown. Henry George Farmer, Music Making in the Olden Days (Leipzig: Peters-Hinrichsen Edition, Ltd., 1950), 43–45.
ornaments than was perhaps in good taste on his violin, bassoon, and oboe. Roche was dismissed in 1759 and bought out of his contract.\textsuperscript{35}

Isaac Cooper was a music teacher and dancing master from Banff in Aberdeenshire.\textsuperscript{34} His first collection of dance music was published in 1783, \textit{Thirty New Strathspey Reels for the Violin or Harpsichord},\textsuperscript{35} which was followed by a similar collection including national airs with variations by Cooper.\textsuperscript{36} Although Cooper claimed to have newly composed the bulk of the tunes, Baptie, in his entry on Cooper in \textit{Musical Scotland}, says that he had written only twenty-five of them.\textsuperscript{37} Cooper resided for a while in Edinburgh, where he was in high demand as a teacher of dancing and “almost every instrument then known”, though he died in poverty.\textsuperscript{38}

Of music teachers who taught a number of instruments, Cooper taught possibly the highest number of different and unrelated instruments. An advertisement from 31 March 1783 reads:

Isaac Cooper, musician in Banff, returns his most grateful thanks to those who have employed him in the musical way, and begs leave to inform them that he still continues to teach the following instruments, viz. The Harpsichord. The Violin. The Violincella. The Psaltery. The Clarionet. The Pipe and Taberer. The German Flute. The Scots Flute. The Fife in the regimental Stile. The Hautboy. The Irish Organ Pipe,\textsuperscript{39} how to make flats and sharps, and how to make the proper chords with the brass keys. And the Guitar, after a new method of fingerling (never taught in this country before), which facilitates the most

\textsuperscript{33} Farmer, \textit{Music Making}, 44–45.
\textsuperscript{36} This collection is undated, but because the piano is suggested rather than the harpsichord it most likely came after 1783. Isaac Cooper, \textit{A Collection of Strathspeys, Reels and Irish Jigs, for the Piano-Forte & Violin to which are added Scots, Irish & Welch Airs Composed and Selected by I. Cooper at Banff, London, Edinburgh &c.}
\textsuperscript{37} He provides no evidence, though he mentions a Mr Troup of Ballater in his entry as his source for Cooper’s death date and opinion on his music. Mr Troup apparently had a great deal of trouble in finding much about Cooper. Baptie, \textit{Musical Scotland}, 33.
\textsuperscript{38} Baptie, \textit{Musical Scotland}, 33.
\textsuperscript{39} The Irish Organ Pipe could be the uilleann pipes.
intricate passages. He likewise begs leave to inform all who have a taste for Highland Reels, that he has just now composed thirty strathspey reels for the Violin or Harpsichord, with agreeable and easy basses, all in the true Strathspey stile. His motive for publishing these was his observing the public so much imposed upon by people who have published reels, and called them new, and at the same time were only old reels with new names, and most of them end on the wrong key, than which nothing can be more disagreeable to a delicate ear. His reels are to be sold at the following places…

Cooper’s ambitious list of instruments raises two questions: how well did he teach any of them, and what is the Scots flute? The recorder, or Common or English flute is not included in the list, which could possibly be a contender for Scots flute, but it seems unlikely that Cooper would use a new name for an instrument that was already known by two other names, especially at a time when it was almost entirely obsolete. The first question can perhaps be answered more easily. Cooper was best known in his lifetime and immediately following as a dancing master and writer of dance music although Glen speculates that he “possessed considerable ability and enterprise” for undertaking to instruct so many different topics.

In March 1784, Cooper again advertised, thanking the public for the support he had so far received, and announcing the opening of his dance school. While he does not mention offering music lessons, he does announce that he has in his possession the latest songs, harpsichord, guitar, and piano music from London. Possibly Cooper had realised that attempting to teach eleven instruments was not the savviest of business plans.

40 I have been unsuccessful (so far) in finding the source of this advertisement. It is quoted in full in John Glen, The Glen Collection of Scottish Dance Music, book 2 (Edinburgh: John Glen, 1895), vii–viii. Glen also wrote that Cooper was an especially difficult subject as much of his music was lost or had vague dates, and that previous writers had not actually seen any of it. Glen, Collection of Scottish Dance Music, iii–iv.

41 All attempts to determine what a Scots flute might be have taken me to modern sectarian flute bands, which play a sort of fife–piccolo hybrid. Possibly Cooper meant this instrument, but as he was also offering to teach military fife, it also seems an unlikely contender for what he meant by a Scots flute.

42 “Miss Forbes’s Farewell to Banff” is singled out by Cramond and Glen as an outstanding piece.


5.2.3 John Gunn, 1765–1824

Although John Gunn did not return to Edinburgh until 1802, his contributions to flute playing and to music education were vast, and so as a flute-playing Scot, he must be included here even if his return to Scotland falls just outside the eighteenth century of which he was a product. His writings on the flute are among the most comprehensive and forward-looking of the late eighteenth century.

Gunn studied cello with Reinagle before attending Cambridge University, and then moving to London in 1790, where he taught cello and flute before returning to Edinburgh in 1802. Baptie describes Gunn as a “Professor” of cello and flute, and the implication is that he taught both instruments in Scotland, but the flute teaching is not corroborated. His wife, Anne Young, was a pianist and teacher, as well as being the author of An Introduction to Music: in which the elementary parts of the science, and the principles of thorough bass and modulation, as illustrated by the Musical Games and Apparatus, are fully and familiarly explained. She has the distinction of being the first recipient of a British patent for an educational game, in 1801.

---

45 Dalyell believed that Gunn was a native of the Highlands, and had left Scotland early in his life. Sir John Graham Dalyell, Musical Memoirs of Scotland (Edinburgh: T. Constable, 1849), 235–6.
49 John Cranmer speculates that romance between Anne Young and John Gunn blossomed after Gunn discovered and endorsed her Game. Cranmer, “Concert Life and the Musical Trade,” 151.
50 Anne Gunn, An Introduction to Music: in which the elementary parts of the science, and the principles of thorough bass and modulation, as illustrated by the Musical Games and Apparatus, are fully and familiarly explained… (Edinburgh: C. Stewart and Co. 1803).
51 At least three survive, one in the National Library of Ireland, one at the Winterthur Museum, and another in a private collection, from 1801, which sold on 30 January 2013 for £1,500. The auction catalogue describes it as a mahogany box, measuring 17.3 × 10.5 × 4.4ins. (44 × 27 × 11cm) and including dice and counters. The game board could have been used for six different games to teach intervals and thorough bass. Auction Listing, Bonhams, consulted 2 April 2014.
John Gunn’s own writings were extensive. Between 1789 and 1807, he published six books on music,\textsuperscript{52} five of which were methods, two for the flute: \textit{The Art of Playing the German-Flute on New Principles} (1793), and \textit{The School of the German-Flute} (1795). \textit{The Art of Playing the German Flute} is the third and the most comprehensive flute method containing original material to appear in English up to that point.\textsuperscript{53}

In \textit{The Art of Playing the German Flute}, Gunn responds to the differing philosophies regarding the transverse flute that were current in the late eighteenth century. These controversies included the flute’s capacity for expression, intonation, the best way to play it, and its rank amongst the instruments.\textsuperscript{54} He takes especial issue with those who declare that the flute is monotonous, saying:

If such monotony were inseparably attached to the instrument, little could be urged in its behalf; as every thing that is inflexibly uniform and monotonous, must fail of pleasing, will infallibly tire, and in the end disgust, from its want of variety and contrast. But this is a fault equally imputable, with very few exceptions, to performers on every other instrument…\textsuperscript{55}

\textsuperscript{52} Several of the books had multiple editions. \textit{The Theory and Practice of Fingering the Violoncello, with Dissertation on the Origin of the Violoncello, and on the Invention and Improvements of Stringed Instruments} (London, 1789, suppl. 2/1815); \textit{Forty Favourite Scotch Airs, adapted for a Violin, German Flute or Violoncello} (1789); \textit{The Art of Playing the German-Flute on New Principles} (London, 1793/1992); \textit{The School of the German-Flute} (London, c.1795); \textit{An Essay … towards a more Easy and Scientific Method of … the Study of the Piano Forte} (London, c.1795, 2/1811); \textit{An Essay … on the Application of the Principles of Harmony, Thorough Bass and Modulation to the Violoncello} (London, 1802); \textit{An Historical Enquiry respecting the Performance on the Harp in the Highlands of Scotland} (Edinburgh, 1807). His translation of Antonio Borghese’s work, \textit{A New and General System of Music}, was published in 1790. No copies of this work in the original Italian are known. The supplement to the 1789 tutor for the violoncello has the fingerings marked for every tune, as well as appropriate phrasing. Dalyell remarks that Gunn’s books were scarce when he was writing, about twenty years after Gunn’s death, and that he had written a book on stringed instruments. However, Dalyell had not actually seen that book and so was unable to comment on it. Dalyell, \textit{A Musical Memoir}, 235.

\textsuperscript{53} Previous English-language flute books were translations, usually of Hotteterre. Janice Dockendorff Boland, introduction to \textit{The Art of Playing the German-Flute}, by John Gunn (Iowa, 1992), i. Ardal Powell ranks Gunn’s methods along the better-known methods of Devienne (1794) and Vanderhagen (1788). Powell, \textit{The Flute}, 211. Much of the same information from Boland’s preface to \textit{The Art of Playing on the German-Flute} is also covered in the chapter on the “Top 13” eighteenth-century flute methods in her manual for Boehm-system flute players to learn one-keyed flute. She places Gunn within the context of earlier writers and his contemporaries, and concludes that his method is “invaluable” for understanding the transition between the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries in flute playing, and Classical style in England. Janice Dockendorff Boland, \textit{Method for the One-Keyed Flute} (Berkley: University of California Press, 1998), 208.

\textsuperscript{54} Gunn, \textit{The Art of Playing the German-Flute}, i.

\textsuperscript{55} Gunn, \textit{The Art of Playing the German-Flute}, n.p. This stated aim earned Gunn a highly favourable review in \textit{The Critical Review, or, Annals of Literature}, xi (September 1793), 236–40. The review, possibly
The work is especially important for how it reflects the change in flute playing from the eighteenth into the nineteenth century. Gunn provides fingering charts for the one-keyed flute as well as the six-keyed flute, and he devotes text to the style of ornamentation popular in the middle of the eighteenth century, reprinting the ornamented Adagio from Quantz’s 1752 *Essay on a method of Playing the Transverse Flute*, but devotes much more space to the newer, popular, simple themes and variations.

*The Art of Playing the German-Flute* is much more than a method for playing the flute: it is a guide to musicianship in the late eighteenth century, much as Quantz’s book is less a flute method and more a guide to musicianship in the middle of the eighteenth century. In the text, and in the musical examples, Gunn references the past and the current styles of playing. Only the first four chapters are flute-specific, dealing with producing sound on the flute, tone production and embouchure, fingering, and articulation. The remaining six chapters are concerned with keeping time, ornaments, how to practise, expression, modulation, and variations. All of the musical examples follow the text, with new pagination, which makes the book not the most user-friendly, as the student must flip between the text and the music to find the numbered examples. Dalyell noted that Pleyel was disproportionately represented in the musical examples, especially considering how Pleyel’s status as a composer had declined.

---

56 Boland says that the English were among the first to adapt the new fashion in multiple-keyed flutes. Boland, introduction, *The Art of Playing the German-Flute*, i.


58 Only example numbers are provided; not page numbers.

59 Ignaz Pleyel died in 1831, and Dalyell was writing in 1849. It is difficult to determine if Dalyell was referring to Pleyel’s reputation when he was writing, or if he meant that Pleyel’s reputation was already on the decline when Gunn was writing. Neither option makes much sense, especially as Dalyell goes on to say that the Gunn chose the tunes for their ‘softness.’ Dalyell, *Musical Memoirs*, 235–6.
The sections devoted to the flute are detailed and specific, showing that Gunn was an experienced flute player and teacher. Rather than simply describe, perhaps with an illustration, how the flute should be held and sound produced, he gives guidance based on physiology and acoustics, relating the size of the aperture to the velocity of the air, which assumes a basic understanding of physics:

The learner’s attention is more especially entreated to this reasoning, as upon the application to be made of these principles will depend all the best effects of musical sounds, as power and accuracy cannot otherwise be attained: and without proceeding any further, it may be perceived, what attention it will require, to manage these two different powers of increase and decrease of sound, and uniformity of velocity; for, to the natural difficulty of impelling a very small portion of air, with considerable velocity, and to keep continually adding to that portion, without adding also to the force impelling it, and after increasing it to its largest dimensions, gradually to diminish it, without at the same time diminishing the velocity, is owing the shocking error that most people fall into, who attempt anything of that nature; namely, that their very soft tones are too flat, and the loud, too sharp.

In the second chapter, called “Of Tone, or the Embouchure”, Gunn goes on to detail the exact position of the teeth relative to the lips, air stream, angle of the head, and flute needed in order to produce a strong tone. Whether or not this information would be helpful for a student working without a teacher is doubtful. Statements such as “[a]nother very essential point will be gained, by thus endeavouring to blow perpendicularly into the flute; namely, laying a proper foundation for playing accurately in tune, by having the lower notes not too sharp for their octaves” are not helpful without reference to what sharp or flat means, especially in relation to the flute, the beginner flute player would be not able to succeed. It is possible that the book was intended for more experienced musicians who did not play flute; knowledge of music is assumed, and Gunn devotes almost no space to reading music.

60 The book is very unusual in that it has no illustrations.
61 Gunn, The Art of Playing the German-Flute, 5–6.
62 Gunn, The Art of Playing the German-Flute, 8–9.
63 It is unclear from the text whether or not Gunn intended for the book to be used on its own, or with the guidance of a teacher. Simpler method books, such as Hotteterre’s, take the place of a teacher, whereas more detailed books, such as Quantz’s, assume knowledge of music, but could be used with or without professional help.
64 Gunn, The Art of Playing the German-Flute, 9.
Gunn’s treatment of articulation is significant for introducing a new method for double tonguing. He references Quantz’s preferred system of using “tiri” and the French syllables “tu-ru”, and explores the newer taste for slurring more than two or three notes at a time as well as double tonguing. The many combinations of “tu” and “ru” had long been out of fashion by the time Gunn was writing, giving way to simpler patterns and double tonguing. Gunn discusses three types of tonguing: the single tongue, using “t” or “d” to start the note; the traditional double tongue, using “diddle” or “tootle”; and a new double tonguing option he calls “staccato tonguing” using “teddy” or “tiddy”, which he claims to have learned from an amateur flute player in continental Europe. He believes it was based on Quantz’s method of accenting long notes that follow short notes. As to why this method of tonguing is superior, Gunn says:

It is not liable to the objection made to the common double tonguing, that the reaction is not equally perfect with the action; for it is impossible to distinguish any difference in the effect. The two syllables that are by one action and reaction to articulate two notes, are teddy or tiddy, which, when pronounced for some time very distinctly, and afterwards softening the consonants as much as possible, will acquire a volubility as great as the other double tongue, but infinitely more articulate and distinct.

Practical experimentation shows that Gunn’s method is indeed clearer than using “diddle”, and very much resembles the modern “tu-ku” syllables used for double tonguing.

Gunn’s second book on the flute, The School of the German Flute, is an unusual sequel in that the material in the book should be mastered before the The Art of Playing the German Flute is even relevant. Gunn addresses this in the introduction:

---

65 Slurring multiple notes becomes a more satisfactory option on an instrument with more than one key.
66 Boland sees The Art of Playing the German-Flute as a pivotal work in flute treatises, and indispensable for modern flute players. Boland, introduction, The Art of Playing the German-Flute, ii, viii.
67 Boland, introduction, The Art of Playing the German-Flute, iii.
68 Gunn, The Art of Playing the German-Flute, 13-14.
69 Although Gunn found the more standard double-tonguing pattern to be inadequate, he still included it in his method, perhaps to show students the variety of options for articulating and to allow for personal taste, and also highlight how new and cutting-edge his method was. Gunn, The Art of Playing the German-Flute, 14.
literature, I feel additional and more forcible motives to merit that favour, by endeavouring to render these works more worthy of the public attention.\textsuperscript{70}

He goes on to say that the purpose of \textit{The Art of Playing the German Flute} was to teach tone, and:

to show how a few simple sounds might be gradually combined and connected with others, so as to lead to a general command of the instrument in all keys, in the shortest space of time possible, by means of a comparatively small number of examples of good taste.\textsuperscript{71}

He concedes that that might not have been successful for beginner flute players, who may have no concept of good taste, and hopes that the new book will address the rudiments of how to play the flute, rather than how to perform more artistically on the flute.\textsuperscript{72} The respective titles of the books are, in this case, extremely appropriate: \textit{The Art of Playing on the German Flute} teaches musicianship and style; \textit{The School of the German Flute} teaches basic music and mechanics.\textsuperscript{73}

\textit{The School of the German Flute} consists of fourteen pages of detailed instructions on how to hold and produce sound on the flute, basic articulation, rhythm and metre, and tone exercises. The scales are shown with the fingerings, only for a one-keyed flute, below the notes. He gives fairly intricate guidance on air pressure and speed,\textsuperscript{74} which may be wasted on a beginner, though not one who was familiar with the earlier book. Similarly, in his guidance on tone and intonation, Gunn provides exercises for breath control and dynamics, and while the explanations are detailed, it is difficult to assess how useful they would be to a beginner. For example, this warning about the perils of over-blowing suffers by reading more like a physics lesson than a music lesson:

\textsuperscript{70} John Gunn, \textit{The School of the German Flute}, (London: 1795), 1.
\textsuperscript{71} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{72} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{73} However, it is still curious that the books were written in this seemingly reverse order. Perhaps the level of flute-playing in London was so high late in the eighteenth century that Gunn felt that the more basic book was not needed, or that the rather elevated subject matter would earn him greater prestige before publishing the more basic book. Gunn goes on at some length about the importance of cultivating good taste, and how it can be achieved through careful consideration of the musical examples he provides, and ultimately concludes that the second book is the perfect supplement to the first. Gunn, \textit{The School of the German Flute}, 2.
\textsuperscript{74} Gunn, \textit{The School of the German Flute}, 5.
because the increasing quantity of breath is generally accompanied by an increased force impelling it, which has a tendency (tho’ not necessary or unavoidable) to raise the column of air more horizontally, as a diminished quantity is attended with a decreasing force whereby it drops into the opposite direction, unless prevented with great care.  

To translate, Gunn means that as the speed and pressure of the breath increases, the air column may strike higher against the opposite wall of the embouchure hole, and when it decreases, the air may fall into the flute. Both have adverse effects on intonation and tone.

The section on time combines counting and rhythm with intonation exercises, showing the D-major scale in semibreves with each chord outlined below broken into crotchets:

Figure 1: John Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, page 7, The British Library

Gunn does not provide a similar exercise for the other rhythms, nor does he illustrate the various metres, opting instead to describe them in the text. Later there is a breakdown of other rhythms and metres, with the counts beneath the notes, but he only provides one part for each two-bar example, so there is no way to see how the metres and rhythms are subdivided. Curiously, he suggests counting 2/4 time with four beats to the bar, and 3/4 is shown as having six beats or two beats to the bar, but never three. Dotted rhythms are

---

75 Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, 6.
76 Sound on a flute is produced by the air column vibrating against the wall of the embouchure hole, not by air going into the instrument.
77 Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, 7.
78 The brief space given to tempo is equally confusing. Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, p. 14.
illustrated with grace notes. This is especially notable, as short notes in the eighteenth century invited a variety of interpretations.\textsuperscript{79}

*Figure 2: John Gunn, The School of the German Flute, page 10*

As well as with alternative approaches.\textsuperscript{80}

*Figure 3: John Gunn, The School of the German Flute, page 10*

Gunn then focuses on intervals and intonation in the keys of G and A, with emphasis on how to avoid intonation difficulties, before moving on to the instructions for C, F, B-flat, and E-flat.\textsuperscript{81}

The remainder of the book is divided into two chapters or “classes”: both of which consist of progressive duets arranged from popular songs, opera, and theatre music.\textsuperscript{82} The rationale for the division of Class I and Class II seems to be that the duets in Class II have slightly more complex second parts. Breath marks are given in most of the duets, for the top line only, showing the student how to phrase. This section is what Gunn intended as the real substance of the book, having set out on the title page to “form[ing] a good taste by

\textsuperscript{79} The section on time suffers from over-explanation. The dotted rhythms are particularly confusing. Although almost all method books have a section on keeping time, most rely on illustrations rather than text. Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, 10.

\textsuperscript{80} Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, 10.

\textsuperscript{81} Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, 11–13.

\textsuperscript{82} Composers represented include Pleyel, Handel, Gretry, Purcell, and Mozart, among others.
a study of the best Compositions given in regular and progressive arrangement”. This then explains why the first half of the book is so uneven in its approach: the purpose of it is to teach good taste. Hotteterre provided similar guidance in his 1707 *Principes de la flute traversiere*. He recommended practising airs with the ornaments already added so that the student could better learn how and where to place which ones within the line.

Gunn’s treatment of ornamentation in both of his flute books shows the changing tastes of the eighteenth century. His lesson on ornaments in *The School of the German Flute* takes half a page, showing how much the taste for ornamentation had changed from the florid, free Italianate ornamentation and the highly structured and codified French style of the early and middle of the century, to a much simpler taste, and it only shows appoggiaturas and trills:

---

83 Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, title page.
84 Jacques Hotteterre, *Principes de la Flute Traversiere* (Paris: Ballard, 1707). All flute method books between 1707 and about 1740 were based on Hotteterre.
86 Fingerings are provided for a few trills. Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, 14.
The implication is that student musicians were no longer expected to learn how to improvise ornaments, but rather correctly execute the few ornaments added by the composer. Authors of method books earlier in the century emphasize elaborate ornamentation above all other skills in music making, but tastes and style changed rapidly in the second half of the century, and that style of playing may have been old-fashioned by the time Gunn was writing. However, in the chapter “Of Variations or Embellishments” in *The Art of Playing on the German Flute*, Gunn writes that ornaments “are supposed to be the momentary effusions of a performer’s fancy, in rendering dry and uninteresting passages, more flowing, elegant, and graceful”.\(^87\) Gunn refers the reader to Quantz, whose ornamented adagio he has reprinted, but then goes on to say that

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{it is more easy to acquire a facility in making embellishment, than a correct taste to direct their application, which ought, therefore, to be the first cultivated; for the too easy practice of these variations is apt to degenerate into a licentious abuse of them, and so to corrupt the taste, that it will scarcely relish any thing, however refined in its expression, or pathetic in its effect, that is not highly ornamented: the noblest objects of the art, are thus lost sight of…}\end{align*}
\]

\(^87\) Gunn, *The Art of Playing the German-Flute*, 31.
\(^88\) Gunn, *The Art of Playing the German-Flute*, 32.
This provides another reason for why Gunn gives so little attention to embellishments in *The School of the German Flute*: it is impossible for beginners to really understand how to do it well. He writes earlier in the work that the shake, the turn, and the appoggiatura are the most commonly used ornaments, and that “embellishments” are variations of the melody, a style that he considered of the “old school.”

Taken together, Gunn’s flute methods provide a comprehensive and detailed approach to the flute, and musicianship, comparable to Quantz’s work. Gunn’s writings are especially valuable for the information they provide on the aesthetics of flute playing and music in the late eighteenth century, especially regarding tone, musical literature, and expression. His books should be seen, as Boland writes in her introduction, as a transitional method between the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, for their coverage of florid ornamentation as well as simple embellishments, and for providing fingering charts and exercises for the one- and six-keyed flutes. Both Gunn and Quantz emphasize style, taste, and musicianship over the mechanics of flute playing, and as such are far more valuable for their contributions to understanding of performance practice and aesthetics in mid-eighteenth century Germany and late eighteenth-century Britain than they are as manuals on how to play the flute. Gunn’s references to Quantz show that the style of playing Quantz describes was prevalent outside Germany, and that Gunn describes it as somewhat old-fashioned shows how rapidly performance practice changed in the forty years between their writings. Both Gunn and Quantz provide detailed instructions on how to be an effective musician within their respective stylistic parameters, and consequently both are immensely valuable as flute-oriented, if not actually flute-specific, guides to performance practice.

---

89 Gunn, *The Art of Playing the German-Flute*, 18.
90 Boland, introduction, *The Art of Playing the German-Flute*, i–viii.
5.3 Performers

5.3.1 Francesco Barsanti, 1690–1772

The Italian flute player and composer Francesco Barsanti lived in Edinburgh for eight years, from the end of 1735 until 1743, when he relocated to London. He had first travelled to London from his native Lucca with Francesco Geminiani in 1714. Once there, he played flute and oboe in an Italian opera orchestra. He returned to London for unknown reasons in 1743, where he was no longer in demand as a wind player, and instead played viola in an orchestra, and died in poverty.91

Barsanti is first mentioned in the records of the Edinburgh Musical Society on 5 June 1735 as being employed by the Society to give singing lessons to a Miss Udall, and had permission to travel when he liked. His other duties for the Society are not specified.92 Sonia Tinagli Baxter speculates that Barsanti took the time to travel to country houses for more lucrative teaching opportunities, as did other immigrant musicians in Edinburgh.93 No records of his teaching or travel survive. Barsanti’s employment by the Society also included repairing musical instruments and “writing” music,94 which Baxter takes to mean copying, rather than composing.95 He drew a salary until 1743, having made a few attempts to have it augmented. Curiously, flute playing is not mentioned in the Edinburgh

---

92 Minutes of the Edinburgh Musical Society, 5 June 1735.
Musical Society records, though performance of an unspecified variety was a part of his job duties.

Although Barsanti’s time in Scotland was comparatively brief, it had an influence on his work. Some of his compositions published after his return to London were dedicated to members of the Scottish aristocracy, which Johnson takes as a longing for Scotland. Unlike some non-native musicians who published collections of Scottish tunes, Barsanti, in his 1742 *A Collection of Old Scots Tunes*, made no attempt to correct the harmonies in tunes that neither begin nor end on the tonic. Barsanti’s music for the flute is discussed in the Repertoire chapter.

### 5.3.2 Joseph Tacet, active 1760–1790

The English virtuoso Joseph Tacet performed in Edinburgh in 1771. John Hunter wrote to Gilbert Innes expressing his dismay at being stuck in Port Glasgow and being unable to attend the performance:

> I much envy you the pleasure you are to enjoy this evening in hearing Tacet on the flute—This is at present one of the dullest places ever I was in—no publick places—no not even a Puppet show nor a set of Tumblers—Do you know I have made a most Sagacious discovery since I heard of Tacet’s being in Edinburgh—You will observe in all the flute parts of Overtures the Andante is 

---

96 It is also not mentioned by Baxter, who presents his activities in Edinburgh musical life as extremely varied, but not related to performance. Baxter, “Italian Music and Musicians in Edinburgh,” 39–55.
98 Johnson, “Barsanti, Francesco.”
100 Andrew Fairley noted that Tacet’s birth and death dates were not known. Andrew Fairley, *Flutes, Flautists, and Makers (active or born before 1900)* (London: Pan Educational Music, 1982), 121–122. H. Macaulay Fitzgibbon noted that not much was known of Tacet’s life. H. Macaulay Fitzgibbon, *The Story of the Flute* (London: The Walter Scott Publishing Co., Ltd., 1914), 207.
101 Hunter wrote to Gilbert Innes while travelling England, Scotland, France, Spain, and Holland. His letters contain very little aside from complaints and observations on how pretty (or not) the girls are in a given place. His letters from London are the only ones which reveal his interests, especially in science and music. Port Glasgow must have been especially grim for a young man of his interests. National Archives of Scotland, GD113/5/366.
seldom wrote—But at the end of the first movement is marked Tacet Andante—What is the meaning of this? You answer—There is no flute part for that Movement. Quite mistaken I assure you—it means that the flute part of the Andante is so hard and requires so much taste and all that—that only Tacet ought to play it. There now—Would you ever have thought of this?

Joseph Tacet was credited with inventing the four-keyed flute by many of his contemporaries, though the evidence is that he made them popular in continental Europe rather than contributing to their design. Ardal Powell explains that because Tacet favoured the English-made four-keyed flute over the one-keyed flute, his name became associated with the style and especially with the pewter plugs invented by Richard Potter. A number of flute tutors published from around 1765 through the 1770s credit Tacet and Florio with having invented the keyed flute, and advertise their methods for playing it, although the books are all copies of the same source, and neither Tacet nor Florio is likely to have had anything to do with the publications in the first place.

Tacet’s concert in Edinburgh was not advertised in Edinburgh newspapers, nor was it reviewed. It was perhaps a private event, not sponsored by the Edinburgh Musical Society. Possibly Gilbert Innes arranged the performance; earlier in the year Thomas Cumming, Innes’s cousin, heard Tacet play a “charming” flute solo in London. It is somewhat surprising that other mentions of Tacet’s Edinburgh concert have not survived;

102 Letter from John Hunter to Gilbert Innes, 15 October 1771, National Records of Scotland, GD113/5/366.
103 He may also have experimented with larger tone holes. Fairley, *Flutes, Flautists, and Makers*, 121.
105 Powell argues that Thomas Cahusac was one of the earliest makers of keyed flutes in London, and that the first tutor with Tacet and Florio’s appeared in 1765. Powell, *The Flute*, 111–112. Reprints, and books which clearly descend from the same source, include publications by Thomson and Muir & Wood. Side by side comparison of the editions held in the Wighton Collection show all are anonymous, and while the instructional content is the same, the musical content differs. A COPAC search shows 12 tutors referencing Tacet and Florio including: New Instructions for the German Flute and the method of Double Tonguing with proper Examples (London: Preston & Son, 1790?); The Compleat Tutor for the German Flute containing the easiest and most modern Methods for Learners to Play, to which is added A favorite Collection of Scots Airs, Reels, Strathspeys &c. Also the Method of Double Tonguing, and a Concise Scale & description of a new invented German Flute with additional Keys, such as play’d on by the two Celebrated Masters, Tacet and Florio, (Edinburgh: Muir and Wood, 1811?); The Compleat Tutor for the German Flute containing the easiest & most modern Methods for Learners to play. To which is added a favorite Collection of Song Tunes, Minuets, Marches, Duets, &c. Also the method of double Tongueing, and a Concise Scale & description of a new invented German Flute with additional Keys made by T. Cahusac, such as play’d on by the two celebrated Masters, Tacet and Florio. (London: T. Cahusac, 1766?).
106 Or it may have been cancelled.
107 Thomas Cumming to Gilbert Innes, 12 February 1771, National Archives of Scotland, GD113/5/365A.
his performance, presumably on the keyed flute, would have brought cutting-edge flute technology to Scotland. That many tutors with the Tacet and Florio method survive in Scottish collections, especially the Wighton Collection and the A. K. Bell Library, suggests that the system could have been popular in Scotland. Tacet’s influence on flute technique was not, overall, very significant or lasting, but he was very influential during the late eighteenth century. That many tutors referencing the Tacet and Florio system survive suggest that it could have been popular in Scotland.

5.3.3 Carl Schetky, 1772

Correspondence between the Edinburgh Musical Society’s agent in London, Robert Bremner, and John Welsh regarding the engagement of a cello player for a concert at the Edinburgh Musical Society reveals that the cellist, J. G. C. Schetky, was travelling with his brother, who played the German flute:

Being wrote to by Mr Douglas last summer to engage a violoncello Performer for the concerts … I have by the advice of Mr Abel engaged a Mr Schetky for Fifty Guineas a year and a Concert for one year only, he not choosing to have it for more, but he now insists on his travelling charges together with that of a Brother of his who always goes with him, and is a German Flute player, which by the Fly will be at least 15 guineas. I offered to pay their charges by sea but he will not go by water.

---

108 Tacet, along with Florio and Groef, was regarded as the best of “Old School” flute players by W. N. James in 1826. W. N. James, *A Word or Two on the Flute* (Edinburgh: Charles Smith & Co., 1826), 85–86.
109 Johann Georg Christoph Schetky (1737–1824) was engaged by the Edinburgh Musical Society as its principal cellist in 1772, while he was in London on a concert tour. Originally from Hesse-Darmstadt, he came from a family of court musicians. Johann Georg Christoph had a position in the Darmstadt orchestra from 1758, and later received permission from the family’s employer to travel and give freelance concerts. Bremner’s letters do not give the first names of either brother, and all further mention of Mr Schetky in Edinburgh are assumed to refer to Christoph, who married Maria Reinagle and remained in Edinburgh for the rest of his life. He seems to have only had one brother, Georg Carl Jacob. David Johnson and Roger Larsson, “Schetky, Johann Georg Christoph,” *Grove Music Online*, *Oxford Music Online* (Oxford University Press), accessed 2 May 2014, [http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/24830](http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/24830).
110 This is presumably a type of expensive ground transportation, such as the express stagecoach.
111 Letter, 7 February 1772, Robert Bremner to John Welsh, National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Innes family of Stowe, GD113/5/210/6, letter 3.
The addition of the nameless flute-playing brother may have been a bargain, although Bremner and Welsh make no mention of engaging him to perform in Edinburgh.\footnote{112} Bremner wrote again on 28 February informing Welsh that the brothers had accepted the terms, and had been advanced 20 guineas.\footnote{113} The following day, Welsh drafted a letter to Bremner, writing that the Schetky brothers had arrived and were expected to please.\footnote{114}

Details regarding Georg Carl Jacob Schetky’s life are lacking.\footnote{115} In 1763, the entire family, including parents and all four children went to Hamburg to give concerts. They were a hit, and the family patriarch, Ernst Gottlieb Schetky, wrote for permission from the court at Darmstadt to remain in Hamburg, which was denied.\footnote{116} Two other pieces of manuscript evidence point to Georg Carl Jacob’s flute playing. A manuscript of a trio sonata for two flutes by Graun held in the Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek Darmstadt shows the signature Georg Carl Jacob Schetky and the date 17 Oct 1765.\footnote{117} David Johnson speculates that a flute trio attributed to Johann Georg Christoph Schetky was actually composed by Georg Carl Jacob, but there is little evidence to support this.\footnote{118} In fact, there is no evidence that Johann Georg Christoph Schetky composed anything for flute other than orchestral parts and a set of duets, published in 1776.\footnote{119} What Johnson was most likely referring to is another manuscript, also in Darmstadt, of a trio for flute, violin, and

\footnote{112} Unfortunately there is no evidence that the flute-playing Schetky gave or was intended to give a performance in Edinburgh, but considering that the brothers were on leave from Darmstadt to perform in other places, it seems unlikely that he would travel to Scotland and that the Edinburgh Musical Society would finance his travel with some agreement, perhaps verbal, that he would be playing.

\footnote{113} Although he does not say it directly, Bremner was very glad to see the Schetky brothers on their way north. His tone indicates that they had caused him a great deal of bother. ‘I shall not at present mention the troubles I have had with matters…’ Letter, 28 February 1772, Robert Bremner to John Welsh, National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Innes family of Stowe, GD113/5/210/6, letter 4.

\footnote{114} Letter, 29 February 1772, John Welsh to Robert Bremner, National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Innes family of Stowe, GD113/5/210/6, letter 5.


\footnote{116} Ibid.


\footnote{118} Johnson, “Schetky, Johann Georg Christoph,”

\footnote{119} Ibid.
bass. This manuscript is catalogued as being the work of Johann Georg Christoph Schetky, however, there is a note that the composer could be Carl Schetky, in 1765.\(^{120}\)

Georg Carl Jacob’s involvement in Edinburgh musical life was either so overshadowed by that of his brother or of so brief duration very little is known of it. References to “Schetky” on programmes and receipt books which could refer to either brother have universally been taken to refer to Johann Georg Christoph,\(^{121}\) though Georg Carl gave at least two performances in Edinburgh. An advertisement in the Caledonian Mercury in March 1772 announces a concert featuring the Schetky brothers—senior on cello, junior on flute—performing with Mr and Mrs Corri at St Cecilia’s Hall.\(^{122}\) A similar performance took place in December 1772 when Mr Schetky junior performed a flute concerto in a program that included an overture by the Earl of Kelly and vocal performances by Mrs Corri and Miss Gilson.\(^{123}\)

Another hint at Carl Schetky as a composer appears in John Gunn’s *The School of the German Flute*. One of the duets included in the progressive music section is attributed to “C. Schetky”.\(^{124}\) Although Carl Schetky is not known to have published any music, two pieces for flute in manuscript are attributed to him, which strongly suggests that he was known to have composed for flute. There is a possibility that the *Six Duets for Two German Flutes*,\(^{125}\) by his brother, Johann Georg Christoph Schetky, were actually the work of Carl, or that the duet Gunn included was the work of J. G. C. Schetky, and the answer to the question of which Schetky brother wrote for flute is a case of misattribution. That is, however, probably not the case. If he returned to London after his presumably brief stay in


\(^{122}\) *Caledonian Mercury*, 9 March 1772.

\(^{123}\) *Caledonian Mercury*, 16 December 1772.

\(^{124}\) Gunn, *The School of the German Flute*, 19.

\(^{125}\) Johann Georg Christoph Schetky, *Six Duets for Two German Flutes* (London: Robert Bremner, 1776).
Edinburgh, he could have still been living there twenty years later when John Gunn was writing, and given him this duet for his book.

5.3.4 Thomas Macpherson

An elusive character in the history of the flute in eighteenth-century Scotland, Farmer writes that Macpherson was the “most outstanding Scottish flautist in the second half of the century.” His name is also associated by Farmer with a Sneltzer organ, similar to one ordered by the Aberdeen Musical Society. Farmer describes him as a “well-known flautist at the Edinburgh Concerts in the ‘Fifties’, and gives his address. Although Farmer twice described Macpherson as an excellent flute player, he seemed curiously interested in his organ. Other information about him is, however, sadly lacking. Farmer is the only source for his first name, as references in the Edinburgh Musical Society records mention only a “Mr McPherson,” in a variety of spellings, who played flute in the 1760s and paid dues in the 1770s and 1780s.

Between June 1763 and 1764, “McPherson” was paid for performing Wagenseil’s Concerto. The 1765 index of music owned by the Edinburgh Musical Society shows a concerto for German flute and violins by Wagenseil. The date of “McPherson’s” performance of Wagenseil is not recorded; though two performances in February 1768 featured a flute concerto by an unnamed flute player. It is tempting to conclude that

130 Georg Christoph Wagenseil (1715–1777) composed five flute concertos, in addition to a number of sonatas for flute and continuo. Franz Vester, Flute Music of the 18th Century (Monteux: Musica Rara, 1985), 515.
131 Index of Music belonging to the Edinburgh Musical Society, Edinburgh University Library, 1765 La.III.761.
these were repeat performances of “McPherson” playing Wagenseil, although even if they were not, it does show that flute performances were popular in Edinburgh in the 1760s.

Dalyell mentions Macpherson twice. The first time is to bemoan that not very much is known about him. The second time, Dalyell mentions Macpherson as having played a concerto at a concert for Pasquali on 17 January 1755. He may have also performed at a series of benefits for Pasquali a year earlier, in January 1754. The concert on 17 January was advertised to feature “McPherson” in a flute concerto, and the setting of “Tweedside” in “the Italian style” was to have flute and string accompaniment.

A notice in the Caledonian Mercury on 16 February 1774 announces that Macpherson will be performing a concert at St Cecilia’s Hall on February 22, but no reviews or mentions of the repertoire or other performers survive. Records from 1752 and 1770 indicate that McPherson was paid a salary by the Edinburgh Musical Society. Mr and Mrs Corri, the first and second “fiddle” players, McPherson, and the harpsichord player, were given free use of St Cecilia’s Hall in the 1770s.

5.4 Other professionals

5.4.1 John Thornton, 1788

In September 1788, James Ogilivy, the 7th Earl of Findlater and 4th Earl of Seafield, was in need of a new valet. One applicant for the post, John Thornton, wrote that he believed himself to be especially qualified because of his musical abilities. He wrote:

132 Dalyell, Musical Memoirs, 158.
133 Dalyell, Musical Memoirs, 287.
134 Caledonian Mercury, 3 January 1754, 10 January 1754.
135 Caledonian Mercury, 14 January 1754.
136 Caledonian Mercury, 16 February 1774.
139 Ibid, 94, n.d.
I think myself qualified for your Service as a Valet, having served in that Character several Years. I have also Traveled in France with a musical Gentleman from whom I have an undeniable character and can have the same from my present master that I have lived with near four years at Ch. Ch. College. I have been informed that its your Lordship’s wish to have Musical Servants to form a Band, I think it absolutely necessary to acquaint you with the Instruments I have been used to viz. the Trumpet, Horn, Clarinet, and Flute, have also played in a Band…

He added that he was twenty-five, married, and said to be good-looking. Whether or not his application was successful is unknown.

Thornton fits easily into the mould of musicians playing a variety of unrelated instruments in an effort to be more marketable. While playing a variety of instruments would have no bearing how well Thornton shaved his master or brushed his suits, it also shows that there was a market for servants who could fill a variety of roles within an establishment, and that members of the servant class knew this and gained the necessary skills. An earlier example of a flute playing servant is Frederick II of Prussia’s valet, Michael Gabriel Fredersdorf (1708–1758), who was Frederick’s duet partner, rose to a court position, and was possibly the king’s lover. Thornton’s contemporary, the fiddle composer William Marshall (1748–1833) entered the service of the Duke of Gordon at the age of twelve, eventually becoming the duke’s butler and factor.

Another point of interest in Thornton’s letter is that the earl wanted musical servants to form a “band”. Private orchestras have been assumed to have been unknown in Scotland, but Thornton’s letter indicates that Lord Findlater, at least, either had an orchestra made up of staff members or intended to set up one, perhaps in the model of

---

140 Letter 8 September 1788 from John Thornton to James, Earl of Findlater and Seafield, Seafield Papers, National Records of Scotland, GD248/588/14.
141 J. S. Bach’s E major sonata, BWV 1035, was written for Fredersdorf. Powell, The Flute, 99.
142 “This soldier, who was young, well made, handsome, and played upon the flute, had more than one way of amusing the royal prisoner. So many fine qualities have made his fortune; and I have since known him Valet de Chambre and first Minister, with all the insolence which two such posts may be supposed to inspire.” Voltaire, Memoirs of the Life of Voltaire, trans. from the French, (London: G. Robinson: 1784), 25–26.
144 Private orchestras are ignored in all histories of Scottish music; all music from country house collections is assumed to have been used by the families occupying the houses, not the staff.
household orchestras among the continental aristocracy. Musicians who were employed by courts in Europe do not seem to have had duties outside of performing, but a large establishment, such as Esterházy, would have had the resources to employ a specialist servant for each task needed, whereas a smaller or fledging orchestra such as Lord Findlater’s, may not have had that luxury. ¹⁴⁵

5.5 Conclusion

Although very few professional musicians devoted themselves solely to the flute, it was a popular instrument among professional musicians in Scotland. Lack of specialization is almost certainly due to business concerns of teaching amateurs in a relatively small and competitive market. Teachers had to be savvy businessmen in order to survive, and consequently had to offer lessons on a variety of instruments. Teachers were always in an urban centre, but, like Malcolm McGibbon, needed to be able to travel to their pupils. The market was both small and saturated, as can be seen from the Edinburgh- and Glasgow-based generalist teachers later in the century.

John Gunn’s contributions to our knowledge of flute playing and performance practice are far-reaching, and he was a major character in British musical life. His two flute methods are much more than that: they teach musicianship and try to form taste, while showing the changing aesthetics from the middle to late parts of the eighteenth century. He is remarkable for giving a very scientifically informed approach to flute playing, no matter how confusing it may have been for the student who just wanted to learn to play the flute. Gunn’s contributions show that Scottish flute players and teachers

¹⁴⁵ Lord Findlater may not have established his band. He was exiled from Scotland around 1790 because of his homosexuality, and spent the remainder of his life in Germany. Sigfried Thiele, trans. John Findlater, “The Earls of Findlater,” accessed 23 May 2014, http://www.findlater.org.uk/Earls.htm
were at the cutting edge of technique and musical style, and go far beyond the scope of the flute in Scottish musical life.

Much less is known about flute soloists in Scotland. Francesco Barsanti’s time in Edinburgh does not seem to have been the most flute-centric part of his career, but it is difficult to tell from the surviving records how much of his life was centred on performance and how much on teaching, and on which instruments. His contributions to Scottish musical life were significant, but in areas other than flute playing. Carl Schetky gave at least two performances in Edinburgh, but the duration of his stay and the extent of his activities while there cannot be determined. The same is true of the travelling virtuoso Joseph Tacet: aside from John Hunter’s letter, nothing is known of his performance in Edinburgh. The method associated with Tacet seems to have been more influential in Scotland than his performance was memorable.

Of the flute soloists performing in Scotland, Thomas Macpherson was the most active, due to his employment by the Edinburgh Musical Society. The employment of a wind player by this civic organization challenges and contradicts David Johnson’s assertion that the flute was an instrument only for amateurs, and that amateurs played the wind parts in Edinburgh Musical Society concerts.  

John Thornton represents a special case, and hints at the continental concept of aristocratically-sponsored private orchestras. Unfortunately there is no evidence for this in Scotland, but his letter to the Earl of Findlater shows that it was common knowledge that the earl wanted to start an orchestra, and quite possibly would have, had circumstances not forced him to leave Scotland.

Lack of consistent records from places outside Edinburgh makes it extremely difficult to determine and comment upon the extent of professional flute playing in Scotland.

Scotland in the eighteenth century. What can be determined is that the flute was a component of professional musical activities, and was frequently heard in performance. Whereas amateur musicians had the leisure time to devote to playing only the flute, professional musicians in the Scottish market had to develop skills on several instruments. Because the vast majority of flute players were amateur musicians, the market demand for flute teachers was much higher than it was for soloists. The vibrant concert life of Edinburgh did attract touring soloists, but not nearly as many as a larger city would have. Without the full-time, professional, opera-affiliated orchestras of London, there were fewer opportunities for specialised flute players.
6. Repertoire

6.1 Introduction

This chapter will summarize what is known of the musical preferences of flute players in Scotland and will examine the flute music found in eighteenth-century library collections together with the output of composers in Scotland who wrote for flute. First, the known continental repertoire played in Scotland will be examined, followed by music written by Scottish composers or by composers in Scotland. As has been seen from the musical activities of the gentlemen amateur musicians, travel and commerce between Scotland and the rest of Europe was frequent, and consequently it is impossible to present a complete picture of all flute repertoire encountered or known.

6.2 Repertoire in two private music collections and musical society libraries

6.2.1 Private music collections

Manuscript evidence shows that the music of Antonio Vivaldi and Robert Valentine was known in Scotland and by Scottish flute players. Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto owned music by Johann Joachim Quantz. Given the popularity of Handel and Corelli at the Edinburgh Musical Society, it might be reasonable to assume that Handel’s flute sonatas and arrangements of Corelli’s sonatas were played by Scottish flute players, although there is no evidence of this in surviving collections. Travel and commerce between Scotland, London, and Italy are the most likely explanation for this trend in flute repertoire, as well as the cultural links with Germany established by the royal family.

Music from France was less likely to make it to Britain, perhaps due to the general anti-

---

1 See Chapter 2, ‘Gentlemen Amateurs’, sections 2.3 and 2.7, and Chapter 7, ‘Manuscripts’, sections 7.2 and 7.5, for discussions of Alexander Bruce’s manuscript of Valentine duets and Lord Robert Kerr’s manuscript of Vivaldi’s flute concerto ‘Il gran mogol’.

2 See Chapter 2.
French sentiment, and was not typically reissued by John Walsh, as much of the Italian repertoire was.

General John Reid’s music collection provides possibly the fullest insight into the tastes of a single flute player, given the dearth of other intact collections belonging to flute players. As an extremely cosmopolitan man who spent very little of his adult life in Scotland, his musical tastes may not necessarily reflect what was popular in Scotland, but as a Scottish musician whose music library survives essentially intact, it is a valuable resource for determining the repertoire of the one of the best-known Scottish flute players. His collection, now at the University of Edinburgh, includes manuscript part-books of trio sonatas by Giovanni Androux, Alessandro Besozzi, Johann Michael Breunich, Massa, Johann Joachim Quantz, and many others, in different hands. Another volume includes manuscript vocal and instrumental music by Baldassare Galuppi, James Oswald, Christopher D. S. Field made a detailed study and catalogue of the music that belonged to General Reid and formed the basis of the Reid Music Library at the University of Edinburgh. Christopher D. S. Field. “General John Reid (1722–1807) and his Music Collection,” unpublished catalogue, Musica Scocita Conference, University of Glasgow, 28 April 2012.

Field lists eight trio sonatas by Giovanni Giacomo Androux in Reid’s manuscript book, but no dates, and no biographical information about Androux has survived. Field notes that the first three sonatas in Reid’s manuscript are identical to Six Trios for Two German Flutes or Two Violins with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord (London: George Terry, 1760). Field, “General John Reid,” 1–2.


Massa’s identity is a mystery. Field believes he may have been either Pietro Alessandro Gugliemli (1729–1804), who was from the city of Massa and worked in London, or Stefano Massa of Pesaro, who was employed in Roccacconrada in 1741. Neither of them is known to have published trio sonatas. Field, “General John Reid,” 2.

Johann Joachim Quantz (1697–1773) was a highly influential composer, performer, and pedagogue, best remembered for his long-term position as flute teacher and composer to Frederick II of Prussia, and as the author of the 1752 tome Versuch Einer Anweisung die Flöte Traversiere zu Spielen, a book as much about performance style and musicianship as it is about flute playing.

Edinburgh University Library Special Collections, Reid Music Library D.52–54; Field, “General John Reid,” 1–7 for detailed contents.

Niccolò Jommelli, and Johann Hasse, as well as a printed copy of the second volume of Handel’s *Suites de Pieces pour le Clavecin* and a printed copy of Samuel Arnold’s opera *Gretna Green*. This book also includes many of Reid’s own minuets and marches.

Another volume contains a copy of Reid’s own sonatas, with a translation of Fux’s *Gradus ad Parnassum*, David Foulis’s violin sonatas, flute sonatas by Leonardo Vinci and Giovanni Battista Sammartini, flute duets by Sammartini, Domenico Mancinelli, Charles Frederick Weideman, and Valentine Arnold Holmes, and finally, *A Valuable Collection of the most Favourite Songs Selected from the latest Italian Opera’s*.

---


14 London: Walsh, 1733.


16 Edinburgh University Library Special Collections, Reid Music Library E.165; Field, “General John Reid,” 8–14 for detailed contents; some of the tunes match Reid’s published works.

17 Edinburgh University Library Special Collections, Reid Music Library C.220; Field, “General John Reid,” 14–20 for detailed contents.


23 Carl Frederick Weideman (1705–1782) was a German flute player and composer who lived in London, first performing at Haymarket in Handel’s *Tamerlano* in 1725. He was one of the best-known flute players in England, and helped to found what became the Royal Society of Musicians. Pippa Drummond,
Reid’s personal preference was evidently for Italian composers. Many of the composers represented in his collection are now all but completely unknown, but may reflect contemporary popularity in Scotland or England, or possibly evidence music Reid encountered on his travels. It cannot, however, be taken as representative the tastes of all flute players in Scotland.

No residents of Castle Fraser in the eighteenth century are known to have played flute, but the music collection of the spinsters Elyza Fraser, the lady laird (1734–1814) and her companion Mary Bristow (d. 1805), both of whom played violin and harpsichord, shows that flute music was present even in non-flute-playing households, and also shows a music library that is more general than General Reid’s flute-focused collection. Music owned by Elyza Fraser and Mary Bristow includes works by Pietro Urbani, Domenico Corri, J. G. C. Schetky, W. A. Mozart, Arcangelo Corelli, J. C. Bach, Giovanni Battista Martini, William Boyce, and Ignace Pleyel, some of which is for the flute, and shows wear on the flute parts, suggesting they were part of a larger group of chamber music players in north-east Scotland. Even without the presence of a known flute player in the house, the Castle Fraser collection shows that musicians in Scotland could have flute repertoire in their music collections.

24 No biographical information about Holmes is known; this may have been published in 1763. Field, “General John Reid,” 19.
27 Ignaz Pleyel, Six Sonatas for the fortepiano and German flute (London, 1790); Steibelt, Three Sonatas for the pianoforte in which are introduced some Admired Airs with an accompaniment for the German flute; Krumpholtz, Six easy sonatas for the Harp with an accompaniment for the violin or German flute; Giornovichi, Concerto composed expressly for the opera (1796); Schetky, Concerto for two violins, two flutes, and a bass; Muschat, Six solos for German flute (1805).
28 Whether or not all the flute music was owned by Elyza Fraser and Mary Bristow is unclear based on the catalogue. Roger B. Williams, Catalogue of the Castle Fraser Music Collection (Aberdeen University Library Publishing, 1994), xi–xii.
6.2.2 Repertoire in music society catalogues

The Aberdeen Musical Society owned Hasse’s eighteen flute concertos and Oswald’s *Airs for the Seasons* in addition to works by Handel, Corelli, Barsanti, Geminiani, Martini, and others.\(^{29}\) Their records list primarily orchestral works, some of which include flute parts. In 1752 the Society owned a copy of Festing’s flute concerto, as well as two flutes d’amour.\(^{30}\) What repertoire those instruments were used for is unclear.\(^{31}\) At a meeting in 1760 to discuss programming, the directors decided on a performance of an overture and a flute concerto, the concerto being left to the performer to select.\(^{32}\)

The Edinburgh Musical Society had a larger collection of music, and consequently a larger proportion of flute music. Most of the music is orchestral, especially Handel, Haydn, Jomelli, Boccherini. Only two items in the catalogue of music are specific to the flute: Wagenseil’s concertos, and a set of airs from Handel’s operas arranged for the flute.\(^{33}\) In April of 1782 the Edinburgh Musical Society hosted performance of a “Concertante of Bach with flauto obligato”.\(^{34}\) Presumably this was by J. C. Bach;\(^{35}\) three of his sinfonia concertantes are for flute and strings.\(^{36}\)

Another musical society existed within a few miles of the Edinburgh Musical Society: the Leith Concerts. Nothing is known to survive from the Leith Concerts, aside from some of their orchestral music, now part of the Montagu Music Collection. The surviving music includes flute parts, suggesting that flutes played a role in the orchestra in Leith. The surviving music includes *The Periodical Overtures*, nos. 1–9, 11, 13, 16, 17,

---


\(^{30}\) Not quite an alto flute, the flute d’amour is pitched in A-flat. Examples in ivory survive by Johannes Scherer.

\(^{31}\) Minutes of Aberdeen Musical Society, 28 July 1752.

\(^{32}\) Minutes of Aberdeen Musical Society, 19 March 1760.

\(^{33}\) Index of music belonging to the Edinburgh Musical Society, 1765.

\(^{34}\) Edinburgh Musical Society Plan Books, 12 April 1782.

\(^{35}\) Bach in Britain usually meant J. C. Bach, the “London Bach”. By this date, J. S. Bach’s music would have been very old-fashioned.


6.3 Music by composers based in Scotland

Music for flute by Scottish composers falls into two main categories: sonatas in a continental style and Scottish tunes, sometimes with variations. David Johnson paradoxically categorized these two styles as the ‘Scots drawing room’ style, and the second as Corelli-inspired variation sonatas, presuming that the work of Scottish composers could be described as a specifically Scottish idiom. Johnson argued that something he calls the ‘Scots drawing room’ style was an artistic response to the Act of Union of 1707 in which Scottish composers attempted to unite Scottish music with more mainstream continental styles. This idea of an artistic reaction to a political event is not, however, completely convincing, in large part because it suggests that Scottish composers could only write in a reactionary manner, and also that the publication of Scottish music was only politically motivated. John Reid is the only one of the native Scottish composers

---

37 The volumes were once owned by Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe. Montagu Music Collection, 144–158.  
38 These categories are similar to publications of flute music in France, which tended to be either sonatas or suites, or traditional airs with variations. Laurel Swinden accepts David Johnson’s labels, and expands them to the over-arching ‘low’ and ‘high’ genres or forms. Low forms embrace traditional music, and high forms do not. Laurel Swinden, “‘Sophisticated Laddie,’” 64–67, 106–107.  
40 Though it is indisputable that Scottish composers united Scottish tunes with Italianate ornamentation and form with varying degrees of success, Johnson’s argument is not altogether convincing. Johnson, *Scottish Fiddle Music*, 34.
surveyed here to have avoided a self-consciously Scottish style,\(^{41}\) though Scottish elements, such as the short–long rhythmic pattern and gapped scales, are evident in his music.\(^{42}\)

Johnson’s two categories leave little room for sonatas, which make up a large part of Scottish flute repertoire. He writes that since “[t]hey were impossible to play without an advanced technique; impossible to write without a high level of formal music education … it is hardly surprising that the Scottish composers who attempted sonatas were few”.\(^{43}\) In fact, Scottish composers made sizeable contributions to eighteenth-century flute repertoire, as I will show, and they in no way limited themselves to variations on, or harmonizations of, traditional tunes.

Not all composers based in Scotland were, of course, Scottish. Edinburgh was host to many foreign musicians in the eighteenth century, usually having been engaged by the Edinburgh Musical Society. Some settled in Edinburgh, and others used it as a stopping point between London and Dublin. Although not all of the foreign musicians were Italian, they formed a majority: Italian culture had an exotic allure to many Scots, and musicians who stopped in Edinburgh found many opportunities.\(^{44}\) The foreign musicians and composers who settled in Scotland made some contributions to flute repertoire, but none as significant as those made by native composers. The composers are listed in an order based on the dates of their Scottish flute-related activity.

\(^{41}\) However, the other native composers all worked in both Scottish and continental styles.
\(^{42}\) Sometimes Reid’s music just sounds Scottish, but without obviously quoting Scottish tunes. For a general and cogent explanation of what it means to sound Scottish, see Francis Collinson, *The Traditional and National Music of Scotland* (London: Routledge and Paul Kegan, 1966), 4–31.
\(^{43}\) Johnson, *Scottish Fiddle Music*, 192.
6.3.1 Lorenzo Bocchi, 1720s

The cellist and composer Lorenzo Bocchi spent a few years in Edinburgh before moving to Dublin in 1723 or 1724.\(^{45}\) His *Musicall Entertainment for a Chamber*\(^ {46}\) was published in London in 1725 and Dublin in 1726, but it is included here because it contains one sonata suitable for the flute, which Peter Holman argues was inspired by an amateur flute player Bocchi encountered during his time in Edinburgh.\(^ {47}\) The flute of the title refers to recorder; three of the total of his four flute sonatas are better suited to that instrument than to the transverse flute because of the range of the music and the key signatures. This does not preclude performance on the transverse flute, but these considerations pose serious technical challenges.\(^ {48}\)

6.3.2 Munro, active 1732–1740 (?)

Mr Munro has not been conclusively identified, though David Johnson makes a case for him having been one and the same as Alexander Monro,\(^ {49}\) the first professor of anatomy at the University of Edinburgh, on the basis of Monro’s known Parisian connections and Munro’s only publication having been published in Paris.\(^ {50}\) The evidence


\(^{47}\) Holman, “A Little Light on Lorenzo Bocchi,” 79.

\(^{48}\) Playing the sonatas also shows that they do not feel right on the flute.


\(^{50}\) Johnson, *Scottish Fiddle Music*, 162. This Alexander Monro (1698-1767), with his daughter Margaret, wrote *On the Education of Girls* in 1739 as a series of letters. The overall theme of the text is that fun should be avoided at all costs, though music is permitted for its instructive and improving merits. “Musick is not only an innocent Amusement to one’s self and an agreeable Entertainment to Acquaintances, in both which ways one wou’d sometimes chuse to be employed but musical performances improve the Ear and the Voice by which People acquire sooner the proper Accent of Languages and the Tone of Voice fitted to the different Subjects of Conversation. … A good Ear must, ’tis true be born with one; but very indifferent one may be
is not altogether convincing, and Aaron McGregor makes a somewhat stronger case for Alexander Munro having been a music master in the north-east of Scotland.\textsuperscript{51} The Munro who wrote these sonatas is almost certainly the same Mr Munro whose songs appear in the 1739 collection \textit{Calliope}.\textsuperscript{52}

Munro’s \textit{Recueil des meilleurs airs ecossois pour la flûte traversiere et la basse avec plusieurs divisions et variations} was published in 1732, engraved by Dumont in Paris.\textsuperscript{53} It consists of twelve tunes, some arranged as sonatas, some as suites, some as theme and variations, with an attempt at French-style ornamentation.\textsuperscript{54} The idea is clever, but the writing is often clumsy, and the sonatas are very uneven in quality, though they do show some influence of the goûts-réunis style of French music of the first half of the eighteenth century.\textsuperscript{55} Each sonata, following the presentation of the tune, continues in a series of either variations with ornamentation, or short dance-inspired movements with Italian tempo indications. “Tweed Side” is unique for commencing with a prelude; “Mary Scot” comprises one movement, while “Corn Riggs” has seven. Most of the sonatas, however, are in two movements: the tune with variations and a faster “double”, marked or unmarked as such. Some of the longer sonatas, such as “Nansie’s to the Greenwood Gone” and “Fy Gar Rub Her” combine dance movements with more Italianate ones that are not related to any dance in particular. This was exactly the style of composition current

\textsuperscript{52} Purser makes this connection, and there is little reason to challenge it. Purser, \textit{Scotland’s Music}, 203. Several songs by Mr Munro appear in the collection. \textit{Calliope}, or \textit{English harmony}, a collection of the most celebrated English and Scots songs, neatly engrav’d and embelish’d with designs adapted to the subject of each song taken from the compositions of the best masters, in the most correct manner with the thorough bass and transpositions for the flute (proper for all teachers, scholars, and lovers of musick; printed on a fine paper, on each side which renders the undertaking more compleat than any thing of the kind ever publish’d (London: H. Roberts, 1739).
\textsuperscript{53} Johnson credits Munro with having invented what he calls the “variation sonata”. Johnson, \textit{Scottish Fiddle Music}, 162–163.
\textsuperscript{54} The music suffers from Munro’s placement of ornaments. If he was indeed resident in Paris, he would have done well to have stopped by Hotteterre’s lodgings for a lesson.
\textsuperscript{55} Purser believes the sonatas work “beautifully”, and the positioning of a Scottish tune in “foreign” forms was an evolution from the tradition of improvising variations on Scottish tunes. Purser, \textit{Scotland’s Music}, 202.
in France, the goûts-réunis, exemplifying the Corellian sonata da camera combined with the French dance suite.\(^{56}\)

Publishing in Paris in 1732, Munro would have struck upon an enormous market of flute players. This was the height of the flute’s popularity in France, largely due to the writings of Jacques Hottetterre and the playing of Michel Blavet.\(^{57}\) Curiously for a French publication, all the names on the subscribers list are Scottish,\(^{58}\) suggesting that if Munro lived in Paris he maintained active ties with Scotland, or that no one in Scotland was willing to publish the volume, forcing Munro to publish abroad.

6.3.3. Charles McLean, 1712–1772

Charles McLean’s published compositional output was small; although he wrote twelve sonatas, like John Reid, only four of them are suitable for the flute.\(^{59}\) McLean was a music teacher in Aberdeen until moving to Edinburgh in 1738 to hold a position as a violinist in the Edinburgh Musical Society orchestra for about two years, before settling in London.\(^{60}\) His one surviving publication of sonatas, *Twelve Solo’s or Sonata’s for a Violin and Violoncello with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord*,\(^{61}\) was published in 1737 and dedicated to the director and members of the Edinburgh Musical Society. McLean avoided

---

\(^{56}\) Johnson argues that Munro’s only influence was Corelli’s Opus V violin sonatas, which seems unlikely considering Munro was presumably living in Paris. Johnson, *Scottish Fiddle Music*, 163.

\(^{57}\) Michel Blavet (1700–1768) was the greatest flute player of the eighteenth century. Following his début at the Concert Spirituel in 1726, he held several court positions and published two books of sonatas for flute and continuo in the newly fashionable Italian style, flute duets, arrangements of French tunes, and a flute concerto. He played in the premier of Telemann’s “Paris” quartets, and was Frederick II’s first choice as flute teacher. Neal Zaslaw, “Blavet, Michel,” *Grove Music Online*, *Oxford Music Online* (Oxford University Press), accessed 7 August 2014, [http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/03262](http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/03262).

\(^{58}\) The list includes Lord Gairlies, whose wife was the dedicatee of Baillie’s 1735 *Airs*, and le Chevalier de Ramsay, who was resident in France and had been a tutor to Charles Edward Stuart. A Jacobite connection may be instrumental to solving the mystery of Munro’s identity.


\(^{60}\) Johnson, “McLean, Charles.”

\(^{61}\) Charles Maklean, *Twelve Solo’s or Sonata’s for a Violin and Violoncello with a thorough bass for the Harpsichord* (Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1737).
the standard practice of letting the musicians figure out whether or not the solo part was suitable for flute or violin, by specifying that the first eight in his one set of sonatas were for the violin, and that the last four were for flute. They are not, in any way, interchangeable between the two instruments:62 The violin sonatas explore the full range of the instrument and have many double stops as well as leaps that the one-keyed flute cannot do. The flute sonatas are less virtuosic, while being more technically challenging than both the contemporary works of McLean’s colleague McGibbon,63 and the later works of John Reid.

McLean’s four flute sonatas are in the flute-friendly keys of D major, G major, E minor, and B minor, and explore the full range of the one-keyed flute. The writing is elegant, stylistically assured, with well-developed melodies and polished, intuitive harmonies. Of the contemporary sonatas for flute, McLean’s closely resemble those of Handel and Loeillet, and of the professional musicians in Scotland writing for the flute, his sonatas are the strongest and most interesting.

6.3.4 William McGibbon, 1696-1756

William McGibbon was a leader in musical life in Scottish society in the mid-eighteenth century, yet he is remembered now primarily for his three collections of Scottish tunes with variations. Copies of his other compositions are deteriorating and practically inaccessible, and this has prevented a proper study of his music. His work is of particular interest to flute players because his first set of trio sonatas, Six Sonatas for Two

62 Johnson claims that the writing indicates that McLean was a talented violinist, and that it shows influences of Handel as well as viol fantasias. Johnson, “McLean, Charles.” He believed that the sonatas were a product of McLean’s “lively mind”. David Johnson, Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century (Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 2003), 61.
63 William McGibbon was a subscriber to McLean’s sonatas.
German Flutes, or Two Violins, and a Bass, published in 1729, was the first publication of Italian-style music by a Scottish composer printed in Scotland.  

McGibbon’s compositions resemble Italianate early eighteenth-century music. He knew and admired the music of Corelli, creating embellishments to Corelli’s violin sonatas and subtitling one trio sonata (1734/5) “In imitation of Corelli.” Unlike the later compositions of John Reid and James Oswald, McGibbon’s sonatas do not have any overtly Scottish elements. Although McGibbon is said to have been an excellent violinist, his music does not necessarily give this away, except for the violin part of the sixth sonata of the 1729 set, which is athletic, and possibly an example of how McGibbon played; this sonata is the only one that does not seem to have been written for the amateur market. In the notes to the trio sonata from the 1729 set that he edited, included in Chamber Music of Eighteenth-Century Scotland, Johnson says that even though McGibbon labelled the top part for German flute, his intention was that it be played on recorder, as the high notes on an eighteenth-century flute are “pinched and strained.” The upper register of the one-keyed flute can be challenging, but competent musicians with decent instruments are able to overcome most of the instrument’s idiosyncrasies. Both the top and bottom ranges of the instrument are fraught with challenges to tone and intonation, yet Johnson uses the lack of notes below a’ to support his claim that McGibbon intended the part for recorder. The top part of the sonata in question is, in actuality, perfectly suited for

---

64 William McGibbon, Six Sonatas for Two German Flutes, or two Violins, and a Bass (Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1729); David Johnson, Musica Scotica III: Chamber Music of Eighteenth-century Scotland (Glasgow: University of Glasgow Music Department Publications, 2000), 189. The Musica Scotia edition includes a selection of McGibbon’s sonatas, including the sixth sonata from the 1729 publication.

65 McGibbon’s embellishments for Corelli’s music is discussed and included in the new edition of Corelli edited by Christopher Hogwood. Arcangelo Corelli, Sonatas for violin and continuo, op. 5, with contemporary embellishments and a keyboard realization by Antonio Tonelli, ed. Christopher Hogwood (Basel: Bärenreiter, 2013).

66 The desire by Scottish composers to write Italianate music in a Scottish style as a sort of Scottish goûts-réunis was a later trend. McGibbon kept his Italianate music separate from his Scottish-style music.

67 Johnson, Chamber Music of Eighteenth Century Scotland, 189.

the one-keyed flute: the key of D major is the instrument’s natural key, the range is not extreme and does not require any awkward cross-fingered notes (the usual source of intonation problems), and the writing is generally idiomatic for the flute. It is not nearly as virtuosic as the violin part, and would be very playable by the gentlemen amateur musicians among whom the flute was fashionable and popular, and who most likely were McGibbon’s primary market.

David Johnson portrayed McGibbon as a composer who excelled more at arranging Scottish tunes than composing Italian-style sonatas. Johnson’s original depiction of McGibbon as barely competent, lazy, and unoriginal has prevailed because of a lack of alternative perspectives. Johnson later changed his mind about McGibbon, and described him as a “major-sized composer, whose music has not only variety and range, but a distinct and compelling personality,” but the damage and condescension sticks, especially as Johnson did not edit his original text, which reads:

> What is known of his music is disappointing; he seems incapable of writing counterpoint which is also good harmony, and vice-versa, and one’s overall impression is of a talent undeveloped through simply not having done the requisite amount of hard work.

Indeed, even after his 2003 recantation, Johnson continued to damn McGibbon’s sonatas. In *Scottish Fiddle Music in the Eighteenth Century*, which explores Scottish tunes written or arranged in the eighteenth century and their place in chamber music, Johnson

---

69 Johnson seems to have felt this way about all eighteenth-century Scottish composers. In *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*, he characterizes Scottish composers as “woefully inadequate” at anything other than Scottish fiddle tunes. In reference to McGibbon, Johnson argues that he did not do the necessary “hard work” required for good counterpoint, and used his colleague Adam Craig’s collection of Scottish tunes as the basis for his own three collections. Johnson is less derogatory in his later work, *Chamber Music of Eighteenth Century Scotland*, yet there is still the sense that he found his subject quaint and more of a musical curiosity than something worthy of serious study. Johnson, *Music and Society*, 59, 61, 155; Johnson, *Chamber Music of Eighteenth Century Scotland*.

70 Johnson contends that McGibbon’s Scottish tune settings were based on and deeply indebted to the work of his slightly older contemporaries. Johnson, *Scottish Fiddle Music*, 37.

71 Many of the sonatas were still missing or unknown when Johnson wrote *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century* in 1970. Johnson, *Music and Society*, xv, 61.


describes him as a “second-rate composer of Italian music,” but concedes that his Scottish tune settings are “the crowning achievement of the period,”74 the attitude seeming to be that Scottish composers should only write in a traditional Scottish style and not attempt anything else. Peter Holman, in the preface to his edition of three of McGibbon’s trio sonatas, is more guarded in his assessment, saying:

McGibbon could not always handle the harmonic patterns of the Italian style with assurance, and on occasion the part-writing is sometimes weakened by a use of consecutive fifths and octaves. Yet his sonatas are often surprisingly forward-looking for the 1730s, and contain much fresh and inventive melodic writing.75

John Purser is unusually vague in his assessment of McGibbon, describing his style as “fluent rather than characteristic.”76 Purser sadly does not elaborate on what this means, though it suggests that while the writing is solid, it does not stand out in any particular way from contemporary compositions and composers.

A reappraisal of his sonatas and trio sonatas establishes that McGibbon was comfortable with more than one style of composition, not the mediocre composer struggling to work in forms that were beyond his comprehension as has been previously held. Now that all the extant sources have been reunited, a thorough study of his music can be attempted, and a sizeable portion of Scottish chamber music has been preserved.

McGibbon’s sonatas form a significant portion of the repertoire for the flute in eighteenth-century Scotland. Like most chamber music designed for the burgeoning amateur market, the sonatas are relatively easy to play well, and while they follow the typical eighteenth-century pattern of being marketed for German flute and/or violin, most of them are better suited to the flute than the violin, and are clearly not an interchangeable

74 Johnson, Scottish Fiddle Music, 37.
75 Peter Holman, William McGibbon: Three Sonatas for two flutes or violins and continuo (Edinburgh, The Hardie Press, 1991), vi.
76 Purser, Scotland’s Music, 204.
“one size fits all treble instruments” top part. The high number of known flute players on the subscribers’ lists suggests that the music was popular with flute players, and that they believed McGibbon could write well for their instrument.

Perhaps more significantly, for an instrument generally and almost universally believed to have been unknown in Scotland until 1725, the first chamber music published in Scotland by a Scottish composer was for the German flute only four years later in 1729. Rather, flute playing was popular in Scotland well before 1725, and McGibbon’s first set of trio sonatas hit the market during a surge of popularity in flute playing among the Scottish upper classes.

McGibbon’s sonatas include eighteen trio sonatas, six solo sonatas, and six flute duets. Practical consideration of this music shows that it was written predominantly for the flute.

McGibbon’s three volumes of Scottish tunes, published in 1742, 1746, and 1755, were also important for the flute. In each volume of A Collection of Scots Tunes,

---

77 Peter Holman describes the scoring of McGibbon’s 1734 trios as “up to the minute” and in response to the fall of the recorder and rise of the transverse flute in the amateur music market. He argues that the contrasting parts of vocal melodies and active passages are especially suited to the combination of flute and violin. Holman, William McGibbon: Three Sonatas, vi.
78 Not all of the subscribers’ lists to McGibbon’s publications survive, but the list to the 1740 solos sonatas includes the flute-playing Francesco Barsanti and Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto, as well as James Oswald, who may have played flute. The flute players on the subscribers’ list to the 1734 trio sonatas include Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto, and the volume is dedicated to a flute player, Susanna, Countess of Eglinton. On the Staatsbibliothek copy of the 1740 sonatas, someone has written in the name of the flute player Lord Robert Kerr.
79 The lack of surviving copies suggests that the music sold very well and nothing survives because of use, abuse, and wear on the parts.
80 Known flute players in Scotland in the first quarter of the eighteenth century include the brothers Humphrey Grant and Lewis Colquhoun, Alexander Bruce, John McAlla, Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto, Susanna Kennedy, later Lady Eglinton, Rachel Baillie, later Lady Binning, as well as a friend of the 4th Marquess of Montrose.
81 William McGibbon, Six Sonatas for Two Germans Flutes or two Violin, and a Bass (Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1729); Six Sonatas for two German Flutes or two Violins and Bass (Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1734); Six Sonatas for Two German Flutes or Two Violins with a Thorough Bass for Harpsichord (London: David Rutherford, n.d.). Only the first part of the last set survives. The 1734 trio sonatas are dedicated to the flute-playing Countess of Eglinton (see Chapter 3, ‘Ladies’).
82 William McGibbon, Six Sonatas or Solos for a German Flute or a Violin and a Bass (Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1740).
84 Violinist Aaron McGregor and I, with harpsichordist Allan Wright, played each sonata to determine its suitability for flute or violin. Deborah Kemper and I did the same for the flute duets.
McGibbon provided specific flute arrangements of the tunes in which the violin version went beyond the range of the flute, or was in a potentially problematic key:

Table 1. McGibbon’s Flute Transpositions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Book/year</th>
<th>Title of tune</th>
<th>Page numbers</th>
<th>Violin key</th>
<th>Flute key</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I, 1742</td>
<td>I love My Love in Secret</td>
<td>2–5</td>
<td>B-flat</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II, 1746</td>
<td>Bonnocks of Beer Meal</td>
<td>8–11</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III, 1759*</td>
<td>For the Lack of Gold She Left Me</td>
<td>2–5</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III, 1759</td>
<td>Gillicrankie</td>
<td>18–19</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III, 1759</td>
<td>Cock Up your Beaver</td>
<td>20–21</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III, 1759</td>
<td>Be kind to the Young Thing</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III, 1759</td>
<td>The Bonnie Black Eagle</td>
<td>26–27</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>B minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III, 1759</td>
<td>Moorland Willie</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>G minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III, 1759</td>
<td>The Tindars Occupation</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td>E minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III, 1759</td>
<td>Fy Let’s A’ to the Wedding</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>E minor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As the flute-specific nature of his music shows, McGibbon was responding to a consumer demand for flute music. With so much of the music now lost or ignored, knowledge of flute repertoire in Scotland has been limited.

85  William McGibbon, *A Collection of Scots Tunes, some with Variations for a Violin, Hautboy, or German Flute*, 2 vols (Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1742, 1746), and vol 3 (Edinburgh: Robert Bremner 1755). Later editions published by Bremner and Neil Stewart are somewhat different from the ones published during McGibbon’s life.
86  Robert Bremner purchased the engraved plates of McGibbon’s music following his death in 1756, and his three volumes of Scottish tunes went through many editions as a result. Johnson, unpublished notes. Bremner’s 1759 editions of Books I and II are reprints of Cooper’s editions of 1742 and 1746; it is assumed that his edition of the third book is also a reprint of the 1755 edition, though later editions of McGibbon’s Scots tunes are not reprints of the first editions. William McGibbon, *A Collection of Scots Tunes some with Variations for a Violin, Hautboy or German Flute with a bass for a violoncello or Harpsichord* (Edinburgh: Robert Bremner, 1759).
6.3.5 Collections of Scottish tunes\textsuperscript{87} including piobaireachd\textsuperscript{88}

McGibbon was not the only composer or arranger of Scottish tunes to provide flute-specific versions. John Riddell,\textsuperscript{89} and Daniel Dow,\textsuperscript{90} among others,\textsuperscript{91} provided special flute versions of tunes in their collections. Riddell offered transposed versions of a few of the tunes in his collection, without bass lines and usually several pages away from the first version of the tune. The second edition was “greatly improved”\textsuperscript{92} by the addition of more tunes with flute versions: In the 1766 edition, only “Finlaystone House” has a flute arrangement, whereas the 1782 edition also has flute arrangements for “Lady Eglintoune’s Reel”, “Lord Eglintoune’s Reel”, “Katy Maxwell’s Reel”, “McQuier’s Reel”, and “The Countess of Dumfries Junrs. Reel”. Unlike McGibbon, however, Riddell did not provide arrangements of every tune that goes beyond the range of the flute, only a selected few.

The increase in number of flute arrangements in the sixteen years between the two editions suggests an increase in flute players who wanted to play dance tunes. As the amateur

\textsuperscript{87} Swinden provides lists of tune collections by Scottish composers and tune collections by Scottish composers still in Scotland. Her criteria for inclusion is that the publications have “German flute” somewhere on the title page, with little regard for how suitable the music actually is for the flute. Laurel Swinden, “‘Sophisticated Laddie’: Scottish Flute Music (1720–80) on a Stylistic Continuum” (DMA thesis, University of Toronto, 2014), 26–32. I have chosen to focus only on a few collections with flute-specific arrangements.

\textsuperscript{88} In Gaelic, piobaireachd refers to piping as well as a type of music. Pipe music is divided into two categories: \textit{ceòl beag}, or “small music”, which includes marches, dances, and airs, and \textit{ceòl mòr}, “big music” or pibroch, the highly structured formal music of bagpipes.

\textsuperscript{89} John Riddell, \textit{A Collection of Scots Reels, Minuets, & C. for the Violin, Harpsichord, or German Flute}, 2nd edn (Glasgow: James Aird, 1782).

\textsuperscript{90} Daniel Dow, \textit{A Collection of Ancient Scots Music for the Violin, Harpsichord, or German Flute, Never Before Printed, Consisting of Ports, Salutations, Marches, or Pibrachs} (Edinburgh); \textit{Reells & Strathspeys for the Violin, Harpsichord, Pianoforte or German Flute} (Edinburgh: J. Brysson, n.d.); \textit{Twenty Minuets and Sixteen Reels or Country Dances for the Violin, Harpsichord or German Flute} (Edinburgh: for the author, n.d.).

\textsuperscript{91} Joshua Campbell, a guitar player, did not actually provide any separate versions for the flute, but almost all of the tunes and variations are within the range of the flute, or could be if out of range notes are played an octave higher. A Collection of Favourite Tunes, with New Variations, Adapted for the Violin and German Flute, With a Bass for the Violoncello and Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord (Glasgow: James Aird, 1778). His A Collection of New Reels & Highland Strathspeys with a Bass for the Violoncello or Harpsichord (Edinburgh: Urbani and Liston, n.d.) also has no flute versions, and most of the tunes are out of range.

\textsuperscript{92} Riddell, \textit{A Collection of Scots Reels}, title page.
market grew and flutes became more readily available, flute players may have preferred to play popular dances or tunes they knew rather than take the time to learn a flute sonata.  

Daniel Dow did not provide any specific flute versions of pieces in his *Thirty Seven New Reels & Strathspeys*, though he did in his collections *Fourteen New Reells & Strathspeys* and *Twenty Minuets and Sixteen Reels or Country Dances*. Both of these volumes contain some tunes transposed to a more flute appropriate key, and some tunes for the flute only, with no bassline.

Dow’s most interesting contribution to flute repertoire is *A Collection of Ancient Scots Music for the Violin, Harpsichord or German-flute Never Before Printed Consisting of Ports, Salutations, Marches or Pibrachs*. On the title page he remarks that “[w]here the Notes are below the Compass of the German Flute the Octave above may be Played”. Dow’s suggestion was undoubtedly a marketing ploy to flute players; in most instances playing an occasional out-of-range note up an octave would destroy the sense of the music. This was one of the earliest collections of Gaelic music, before the work of Donald and Patrick MacDonald. The authenticity of the pibroch is open to debate, but the music is in the form of pibroch, with unfigured basslines, which could be

---

93 Dance tunes may also have been more versatile in a social setting than a sonata or trio sonata: relatively simple lines that could provide entertainment, dancing, and general merry-making amongst friends of mixed company.
94 German Flute, however, is the most prominent part of the title page. Daniel Dow, *Thirty Seven New Reels & Strathspeys for the Violin, Harpsichord, Piano Forte or German Flute* (Edinburgh: J. Brysson, n.d.).
96 This volume shares much of its contents with the above-listed book. Daniel Dow, *Twenty Minuets and Sixteen Reels or Country Dances for the Violin, Harpsichord, or German Flute* (Edinburgh: the author, 1773).
97 Daniel Dow, *A Collection of Ancient Scots Music for the Violin, Harpsichord or German-flute never before printed consisting of Ports, Salutations, Marches or Pibrachs* (Edinburgh, 1776).
98 Clearly Dow did not give much consideration to how suitable this would be musically for flute players, but it may have sold more copies.
99 See discussion of Donald MacDonald’s *Ancient Martial Music of Caledonia* below.
101 Some of the pibrochs in Dow’s collection have Gaelic sources, other do not, which does not imply that he wrote them. James Beaton speculates that they originated in Gaelic song. Dow’s source is a curious mystery: if he was not a Gaelic speaker, he would have had a very difficult time gathering his sources or even having access to pibroch, especially following the post-1745 ban on Highland culture, and before Donald MacDonald’s publication. James Beaton, private communication.
interpreted as a drone, especially if played on the cello.\textsuperscript{102} The collection shows that pibroch, or pieces in the style of pibroch, formed a part of the flute repertoire.

There is little evidence aside from Dow that Scottish flute players in the eighteenth century played pibroch, but the possibility that pibroch was part of the repertoire must be considered.\textsuperscript{103} Although little is known about Highland piping in the eighteenth century, the presence of transcriptions of pibroch in eighteenth-century fiddle manuscripts shows that the music was passed to other instruments.\textsuperscript{104} While no pibroch transcriptions have yet been identified in any Scottish flute manuscripts, it is reasonable to suppose that if pibroch was played on violin it was also played on flute.\textsuperscript{105} Pipe music is easily within the range of the flute,\textsuperscript{106} and the intricate ornaments that form an integral part of pibroch are simple to manage on the one-keyed flute,\textsuperscript{107} especially for a player accustomed to eighteenth-century ornamentation.

Transcribing pibroch is difficult, and transcriptions of pibroch made by non-pipers are usually inaccurate, though they may be playable on flute. In writing of early attempts at transcribing pibroch, Peter Cooke observed that the first people to attempt to do so “transcribed a small number of pibrochs in a form that would enable them to be played on the piano, flute or violin; accordingly they did little more than suggest impressionistically the complicated cuttings and graces that the pipers played”.\textsuperscript{108} Much of Elizabeth Ross’s

\textsuperscript{102} Dow may have had exposure to some Gaelic culture in his native Perthshire. Keith Sanger, email to Barnaby Brown, 10 September 2008.

\textsuperscript{103} However the Piobaireachd Society claims that “the Great Highland Bagpipe is the only instrument which can reproduce piobaireachd satisfactorily to the ear of the devotee”. The Piobaireachd Society, accessed 27 May 2015, http://www.piobaireachd.co.uk/what-is-piobaireachd.

\textsuperscript{104} Johnson contradicts himself more than usual on the question of pibroch. He writes first that it was only ever played on the Highland pipe, and then goes on to give examples of pibroch from the oral tradition transcribed in manuscripts. Johnson, Scottish Fiddle Music, 122–126.

\textsuperscript{105} The history of shared repertoire between the two instruments makes this very likely, as does the shared context and society in which violin players and flute players lived and made music.

\textsuperscript{106} Pipe music is almost always in D major, B minor, or A mixolydian, although the range is not nearly as wide as the flute’s.

\textsuperscript{107} Additionally, the pipe chanter closely resembles the body of the flute, but for the key.

\textsuperscript{108} Cooke also notes that these early transcriptions are essentially useless to anyone actually trying to play pibroch. Peter Cooke, “Problems of Notating Pibroch: A Study of ‘Maol Donn’” in The Highland Bagpipe: Music, History, Tradition, ed. Joshua Dickson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), 5–24.
1812 manuscript of pibroch is playable on the flute but lacks the ornamentation of pibroch; it is indeed only a vague impression of what it would sound like on bagpipes.\textsuperscript{109} This, however, may miss the point: musicians other than pipers may not have desired for the music to sound exactly the way it sounds on pipes.

Donald MacDonald’s stated intention in the preface to \textit{A Collection of the Ancient Martial Music of Caledonia} was to “facilitate the attempts of Students upon the Great Highland Bag-Pipe, and to accommodate its Music to almost all other instruments, such as the Organ, Piano-Forte, Violin, and Flute”.\textsuperscript{110} MacDonald’s attempt is successful: his edition preserves the format and ornamentation of pibroch, particularly the binary form and sense of balanced oppositions in the \textit{ùrlar},\textsuperscript{111} and the basslines he provides give an impression of the drone of the pipes:\textsuperscript{112}

\textit{Figure 5}: Donald MacDonald, \textit{A Collection of the Ancient Martial Music of Caledonia}, “\textit{Failte Phronsa},” page 1

While technically challenging, this is by no means unplayable on either the one-keyed or multi-keyed flute.\textsuperscript{113} MacDonald’s work indicates an interest and demand among flute players for pibroch, presented and arranged in a way more suited to the instrument than Dow’s collection.

\textsuperscript{109} The final two pages of Ross’s manuscript are the flute part of Joseph Mazzinghi’s “Huntsman Rest.” Cooke writes in his introduction to the manuscript that there is no evidence for a flute at Raasay House. \textit{The Elizabeth Ross Manuscript: Original Highland Airs Collected at Raasay in 1812}, ed. Peter Cooke, Morag MacLeod, and Colm Ó Baioll (Edinburgh: School of Scottish Studies Online Publication Series, 2011), 79, http://www.ed.ac.uk/polopoly_fs/1.100544!/fileManager/RossMS.pdf; Elizabeth Jane Ross, \textit{Original Highland Airs}, facsimile edition (MS. 3, School of Scottish Studies), http://www.ed.ac.uk/polopoly_fs/1.100545!/fileManager/ERossfacsimilems.pdf

\textsuperscript{110} Donald MacDonald, \textit{A Collection of the Ancient Martial Music of Caledonia, called Piobaireachd}, 3rd edn (Edinburgh: Robertson, 1825), 3.

\textsuperscript{111} Pibroch consists of an ùrlar, or ground, with variations.

\textsuperscript{112} John McIntyre, “\textit{Failte Phronsa: The Prince’s Salute},” in \textit{A Collection of the Ancient Martial Music of Caledonia, called Piobaireachd}, ed. Donald MacDonald, 3rd edn (Edinburgh: Robertson, 1825), 1.

\textsuperscript{113} Keys could make some of the ornaments slightly easier to manage, but considering that the pipe chanter has no keys, they are not necessary for accurate performance of the ornaments.
6.3.6 Francesco Barsanti, 1690–1772

Surprisingly for a flute-playing composer, only one of Barsanti’s publications was for his instrument. VI Sonate per la Traversiera, o German Flute, con Basso per Violone o Cembalo was published in 1728. These sonatas are typical of flute sonatas of the first part of the eighteenth century: except for Sonata IV, each has four movements in the slow–fast–slow–fast pattern. The writing avoids problem areas for the one-keyed flute, but requires technical agility.

Unusually for the time and genre, Barsanti’s collection of Scottish tunes is not explicitly designated for the usual combination of violin or flute with bass, but it is written in keys easily playable on either instrument. No treble instruments are suggested, though the bass is figured, implying a solo instrument with continuo. Many of the tunes, however, go below the range of the one-keyed flute. Barsanti’s settings are elegant, featuring Italianate ornamentation and complex bass lines. Each tune is marked “slow”, which is unusual and not characteristic of many of the tunes. Some tunes, such as “Clout the Cauldron”, are almost unrecognizable if played slowly.

---

114 Please also see Chapter 5, ‘Professional musicians’, for more on Francesco Barsanti.
115 The possibility that Barsanti played recorder, rather than flute, must be considered. John Hawkins, in his A General History of the Science and Practice of Music, originally published in 1776, writes that Barsanti “was a good performer on the hautboy, and also on the flute”, which in contemporary terms could have meant either the recorder or transverse flute, although the flute was overshadowing the recorder in terms of popularity by the time of Barsanti’s arrival in London. Modern scholars have universally used “flute” in reference in Barsanti, which shows a rather curious assumption that it was indeed the transverse flute that Barsanti played. Sadly no conclusive contemporary evidence survives. John Hawkins, A General History of the Science and Practice of Music, a New Edition with the Author’s Posthumous Notes (London: Novello, 1853), 896.
116 For a detailed discussion of Barsanti’s compositions, see Baxter, “Italian music and musicians in Edinburgh,” 39–55.
117 Francesco Barsanti, VI Sonate per la Traversiera, o German Flute, con Basso per Violone o Cembalo, opera seconda (London: Cooke, 1728). This was reprinted by Walsh in 1732 as opus 3.
Perhaps Barsanti was attempting to change the tempo and create more elegant tunes to show off the number of appoggiaturas and trills he added to the melodies. This was an approach different from that of native composers such as McGibbon and McLean who presented the tunes with bass lines and variations, but without ornaments or tempo indications, implying that the musicians would know where to play an ornament and how fast to play.

6.3.7 General John Reid, 1721–1807

The only amateur musician among the composers presented here, John Reid, composed two sets of six sonatas for flute and continuo: *Six Solos for a German Flute, Hautboy, or Violin, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord* in 1756, and *A Second Sett of Six Solos for a German Flute or Violin with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord* in 1762, both published by James Oswald in London while Reid was serving in North America.\(^{120}\) The sonatas are consistently three- to four-movement Italianate sonatas,

\(^{120}\) Please see Chapter 2 for another discussion of the Reid–Oswald authorship issue.
having, as David Johnson writes, “a strong Scottish flavour”.¹²¹ While they do not quote traditional Scottish tunes, the sonatas do have rhythmic figures and melodic and harmonic elements suggestive of Scottish traditional music, such as the short–long rhythmic pattern and the gapped scale.

The title page of Oswald’s editions of Reid’s sonatas is essentially an advertisement for Oswald’s music shop: A lady seated at harpsichord looks up to see a viola da gamba, a flute, an oboe, a lute, a cittern, a harp, drums, an angel with a trumpet, and a hunting horn, among other instruments, floating above her head. Opposite the seated lady is a fortepiano, with ‘Oswald’s Airs’ clearly written on the music sitting on the music desk.¹²²

¹²² Johnson writes that a reprint of the 1762 sonatas is attributed to Oswald. Johnson, *Scottish Fiddle Music*, 198. Franz Vester notes that the title page of a 1770 edition of the 1756 sonatas has a comment that they were the work of “the late Mr Oswald, who for certain reasons could not openly claim them during his life”. Vester, *Flute Music of the 18th Century*, 419.
Christopher D. S. Field, in his catalogue of General Reid’s music collection, provides some insight into the different printings of Reid’s sonatas. William Randall took over Oswald’s business following his death, and Randall re-issued Reid’s sonatas, the second set under Oswald’s name, presumably because he believed they would sell better under a better-known composer’s name. Randall’s business was then taken over by Hermond Wright, who published the second edition of the 1756 sonatas in 1796. The Wright edition has some minor mistakes in comparison with the Oswald edition: the slurs in Oswald’s edition of the Largo affettuoso of Solo IV are present in both the A and B sections of the movement, whereas they are only given in the B section in Wright’s edition. The opening rhythm of Solo V in the Wright edition is a dotted quaver–semiquaver:

Figure 7: John Reid, Opening of Solo V, 1796, University of Edinburgh

123 Reid’s sonatas, however, bear absolutely no resemblance to Oswald’s compositions. Reid’s compositions are all in the same style, with functional harmonies, whereas Oswald was capable of great variety and had a command of many styles.
125 John Reid, Six Solos for a German Flute, Hautboy or Violin, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord, 2nd edn (London: Wright, 1796), 12.
rather than the dotted semiquaver–demisemiquaver in Oswald’s edition.\textsuperscript{126}

\textit{Figure 8:} John Reid, \textit{Opening of Solo V, 1756}, University of Edinburgh

![Musical notation]

and the Da Capo is missing from the Allegro of Solo VI. Both inconsistencies are clearly printing errors.

The sixth sonata in both sets stands out from the preceding ones, most of which are fairly sedate.\textsuperscript{127} Solo VI in the 1756 set has more complex and more technical writing for the flute, and the Allegro movement, unusually for Reid, goes into the minor. Solo VI from the 1762 set owes much to Quantz, especially in the opening, highly ornamented, Largo. The sonata concludes with a long minuet with variations, which is unlike anything in Reid’s other sonatas.

6.3.8 James Oswald, 1710–1769

James Oswald’s contributions to eighteenth-century Scottish flute repertoire include sonatas, divertimenti, solo arrangements of operas, and many settings of Scottish tunes. Purser describes Oswald as “one of the most remarkable and unsung heroes of

\textsuperscript{126} John Reid, \textit{Six Solos for a German Flute or a Violin with a thorough bass for the Harpsichord} (London: Oswald, 1756), 13.

\textsuperscript{127} David Johnson argues that Solo II from the 1762 set is the best. It is a strong composition, and has many overtly Scottish characteristics, especially the final Giga movement, which is likely why Johnson selected it as the best. \textit{Johnson, Scottish Fiddle Music}, 198.
Scottish music” who has been “unjustly forgotten”.\textsuperscript{128} Oswald left Scotland for London in 1741, and it was there that he spent the rest of his life, attracting wealthy patrons including George III, and marrying into the gentry.\textsuperscript{129}

Oswald’s collections of Scottish tunes—\textit{A Curious Collection of Scots Tunes},\textsuperscript{130} \textit{A Collection of Curious Scots Tunes},\textsuperscript{131} \textit{A Collection of Scotch Tunes with Variations},\textsuperscript{132} and the twelve-volume \textit{Caledonian Pocket Companion}—include Scottish tunes, music from popular operas of the time, and music composed by Oswald but attributed to an alias, such as David Rizzio.\textsuperscript{133} Oswald, from his premises in London, was promoting the myth of Scottish music history to his customers. His tune collections, like those of McGibbon and others, include specific versions suitable for the flute.

\textit{The Caledonian Pocket Companion} is Oswald’s greatest legacy, and not only for flute repertoire. Between 1745 and 1760,\textsuperscript{134} twelve small volumes marketed as Scottish tunes, all without basslines, were published. The purpose is found in the title: the books were meant to fit inside a coat pocket, and then be the perfect music book for impromptu musical gatherings. Books I\textsuperscript{135} and II\textsuperscript{136} were published only for the German flute; violin

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{128} Purser, \textit{Scotland’s Music}, 205. Whereas Johnson argued that Oswald was rather limited, and changed his style to better appeal to the London market. Johnson, \textit{Scottish Fiddle Music}, 62.
\item \textsuperscript{130} James Oswald, \textit{A Curious Collection of Scots Tunes} (Edinburgh, 1740).
\item \textsuperscript{131} James Oswald, \textit{A Collection of Curious Scots Tunes}, 2 vols (London: J. Simpson, 1742–1743).
\item \textsuperscript{132} James Oswald, \textit{A Collection of Scotch Tunes with variations} (London: J. Oswald, 1765).
\item \textsuperscript{133} The myth of David Rizzio (1533–1566), Mary Queen of Scots’ Italian secretary-musician who was murdered on suspicion of being her lover, as a composer of ancient Scottish music began with William Thomson’s song collection \textit{Orpheus Caledonius} in 1725, though he dropped the attributions to Rizzio in the second edition of 1733. Francesco Geminiani, Francis Peacock, and John Gregory accepted the myth, while James Beattie worked to debunk it. Oswald’s use of Rizzio’s name was most likely a marketing ploy rather than an actual attribution. Matthew Gelbart, \textit{The Invention of “Folk Music” and “Art Music”: Emerging Categories from Ossian to Wagner} (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 34-9, 49-51, 89-90; Karen McAulay, \textit{Our Ancient National Airs: Scottish Song Collecting from the Enlightenment to the Romantic Era} (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013), 156–7.
\item \textsuperscript{134} \textit{The Caledonian Pocket Companion} was published in twelve separate books, then two volumes comprising books 1–6 and 7–12. The exact dates of publication are uncertain. John Purser, introduction to James Oswald, \textit{The Caledonian Pocket Companion} (CD-ROM, 2006), 4.
\item \textsuperscript{135} \textit{The Caledonian Pocket Companion, Containing Fifty of the Most Favourite Scotch Tunes Several of Them with Variations, All Set for the German Flute by Mr Oswald} (London: J. Simpson).
\item \textsuperscript{136} \textit{The Caledonian Pocket Companion, Containing Fifty of the most Favourite Scotch Tunes Several of them with Variations, All Set for the German Flute by Mr Oswald. Book the Second} (London: J. Simpson).
\end{itemize}
did not appear on the title page until Book III. The publication of the third book also marked the switch from Oswald using John Simpson as a publisher to publishing from his own music shop.  

At first glance, the contents are little different from the many other collections of Scottish tunes with variations for a treble instrument, but the contents are wide-ranging and unique. The bulk of the contents are Scottish tunes with variations, some standard and some newly composed by Oswald. The variations and ornamentation he provides are elegant and not as dependent on the Scottish fiddle tradition as similar publications. The contents also includes many tunes newly composed by Oswald for the theatre—such as the music from *Macbeth* in Book II—or in a Scottish traditional style, as well as tunes from *The Gentle Shepherd* and *The Beggar’s Opera*. More significantly, it includes some of the earliest publications of music from the Highlands. Some of the tunes stem from the clarsach tradition and repertoire, and some from pipe repertoire. The first transcription of a waulking song, “Hi Ri Ri Ri Ho”, in book XII, has not been traced to a source but shows that if Oswald himself composed it, he understood where the vocables (“hi ri ri ri ho”) should be placed within the tune. The inclusion of Gaelic tunes and styles make *The Caledonian Pocket Companion* a unique collection, and show that Oswald could appeal to a genteel interest in the wilds of Scotland.

Oswald’s best-known works, *Airs for the Seasons*, were published in two sets in 1755 and 1761. Each short sonata is named for a different plant, and arranged, with some

---

137 *The Caledonian Pocket Companion, containing a Favourite Collection of Scotch Tunes with Variations for the German Flute or Violin, Book III* (London: James Oswald).
138 Some are the same as McGibbon’s variations. Purser, *The Caledonian Pocket Companion*, 11.
140 Some tunes, suitable only for violin, call for scordatura.
142 Much of the contents of the *Caledonian Pocket Companion* are not Scottish, including several unattributed works by Purcell.
artistic licence, by growing season. John Purser argues for an Aristotelian, or rational, rather than scientific organization of the sonatas, which would explain the presence of some plants in the incorrect season. The first set was published for violin or flute and continue; an optional second part for violin for all of the sonatas in the first set was published in 1756, turning the music from solo sonatas into trio sonatas, an option not provided for in the second set. The *Airs for the Seasons* are a mixture of Italian and Scottish compositional styles. They range from one to five movements, but never take up more than one page. The ninety-six sonatas encompass a variety of styles including dances, Italianate movements, and very short slow movements that demand ornamentation. Some have overtly Scottish elements, such as “The Thistle”, which includes the reels “The Brechin Lilt” and “Jenny’s Lilt”. The jig that ends “The Narcissus” has no known source, but could come directly from the traditional fiddle repertoire. “The Hawthorn” is a union of traditional and formal compositional styles, having a canon based on a gapped scale. The sonatas show great variety, and are almost all very playable on the flute.

In addition to the ninety-six short sonatas comprising the *Airs for the Seasons*, Oswald also composed three volumes of flute sonatas: *Six Solos for a German Flute or Violin, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord*; *Six Solos for a German Flute and Violoncello, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord, Book the Second* and A Second

---

144 Purser, *Scotland’s Music*, 209–210. He also suggested that the growing seasons in the eighteenth century were different than they are now. Oswald was under the patronage of the 3rd Earl of Bute when the *Airs for the Seasons* were written, and the Earl was involved in the founding of Kew Gardens. Purser believes there could be a connection between the glasshouses at the gardens, the Earl, and the *Airs*. John Purser, private communication with author.
146 *Airs for the Seasons, Spring*, (1755).
147 *Airs for the Seasons, Winter*, (1761).
148 The existence and identity of this volume are under some question. The Library of Congress catalogue lists it, but the volume listed under the call number is actually John Reid’s first book of sonatas, published by Oswald. James Oswald, *Six solos for a German flute or violin, with a thorough bass for the harpsichord* (London: James Oswald).
149 James Oswald, *Six solos for a German flute and violoncello, with a thorough bass for the harpsichord, book the second* (London: James Oswald).
Set of Six Solos for a German Flute or Violin, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord.\textsuperscript{150} The titles suggest that either one book of sonatas is missing, or that one of the book twos is a reprint.\textsuperscript{151} These sonatas were ignored by Johnson in his article on Oswald in Grove,\textsuperscript{152} but are listed in both RISM\textsuperscript{153} and Vester.\textsuperscript{154} Why Johnson chose to ignore them is likely to remain a mystery, but possibly has a great deal to do with a bias against the flute.\textsuperscript{155} The sonatas in Book the Second are each in four movements, opening with recitative-like slow movements before progressing to a fast movement and a slow movement, and ending with either a minuet or a gigue. Sonatas I–III are characteristic of Oswald’s typical style: figurative writing and momentum with well-developed melodies and harmonies. Sonatas IV and V rely on simple melodies and lack interest. Sonata VI stands out as being very Scottish in style; the first and third movements in particular could be based on traditional Scottish airs, with a slow harmonic movement and melodies based on a pentatonic scale. The sonatas avoid technically awkward areas for the one-keyed flute, but are challenging, and show that Oswald was very comfortable writing specifically for the flute.\textsuperscript{156}

Oswald made further contributions to flute literature under his aliases, the Temple of Apollo and Dottel Figlio.\textsuperscript{157} Nicolas Dôthel, sometimes known as il figlio (1721–1810),

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item[150] James Oswald, A Second Set of Six Solos for a German flute or violin, with a thorough bass for the harpsichord (London: James Oswald, 1772).
\item[151] I have not yet been able to see all of Oswald’s flute sonatas to verify whether or not one of the volumes is a reprint or second edition. The entry in RISM indicates that the Second Set was published in a later edition by Randall. Répertoire International des Sources Musicales, A/I/5 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1975), 356.
\item[152] Johnson and Melvill, "Oswald, James."
\item[153] Oswald’s flute sonatas may well suffer from the same library cataloguing problems as faced McGibbon’s, but are unfortunately even less accessible than McGibbon’s. Another source of confusion with Oswald is the variety of aliases he used, especially with his flute music, such as Dothel Figlio, who was a real person. It is easy to see how Reid’s sonatas came to be attributed to Oswald.
\item[155] It is rather surprising that he chose not to re-assign them for violin exclusively.
\item[156] Swinden asserts that of the composers writing flute sonatas in eighteenth century Scotland, Oswald was the weakest. She however may not have had access to his flute sonatas. Swinden, “‘Sophisticated Laddie,’” 124.
\item[157] Frank Kidson believed that Dottel Figlio was an alter ego of Oswald and his very talented young student, Benjamin Hallet. “James Oswald, Dr Burney, and ‘The Temple of Apollo’.” The Musical Antiquary, ii (1910–1911), 31–41, 40. Kidson’s article, now over one hundred years old, gives the most information on the Temple of Apollo of any publication about Oswald, suggesting no other information about it is known and that it is not a research priority for scholars studying Oswald.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
was a French flute player and composer, active in Italy, who wrote an enormous quantity of flute music and flute exercises. He is not known to have travelled to London, but Charles Burney knew of him, which is possibly how Oswald became aware of him. Oswald used the name Dottel Figlio to publish some of his own flute compositions, perhaps because attaching the name of an illustrious flute player increased his sales. Because of the similarities of name, and given that the music written by Dôthel and published by Oswald under the name Dottel was for flute, it is nearly impossible to know which music was composed by whom: Dôthel or Oswald under his pseudonym. Oswald published *Six Devertimenti’s or Solo’s for a German Flute or Violin & Violoncello with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord* as Dottel Figlio’s Opus 2. Vester attributes the work to the real Dôthel in 1754, but in the 1750s Oswald published much chamber music under the Dottel alias, and Johnson observes that this music was reissued in 1770 attributed to Oswald. The compositional style resembles Oswald, and there is no clear reason why a musician based in Italy would use a publisher in London for some of his work.

The Temple of Apollo was an organization led by Oswald that published music. Johnson wrote that its activities were “shrouded in mystery”, but it seems to have been a loosely affiliated group of composers whose work Oswald published, including John Reid, Giuseppe Sammartini, and Charles Burney. It was first mentioned in a copyright grant to Oswald of 23 October 1747, and works printed for the society are frequently advertised on

---

159 Dottel Figlio, *Six Devertimenti’s or Solo’s for a German Flute or Violin & Violoncello with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord* (London: J. Oswald).
161 Johnson, “Oswald, James.”
162 The reattribution would have been the work of Randall, who, as observed above, reattributed all work published by Oswald to Oswald when he took over Oswald’s business. Johnson, “Oswald, James.”
163 Swinden speculates Oswald also published under the name Giuseppe St. Martini. Swinden, “‘Sophisticated Laddie,’” 120. Giuseppe Sammartini (1695–1750) was affiliated with the Temple of Apollo.
164 Johnson and Melvill, “Oswald, James.”
Oswald’s publications. The music published by or for the Temple of Apollo is not by Oswald; it tends to be either sonatas by other people, such as John Reid, or arrangements of theatre music for chamber ensemble. Two collections published by Oswald are of particular interest to the flute: *Apollo’s Collection, Being XII Duettos for Two German Flute or Two Violins* was published in 1750, followed by *Apollo’s Collection being Six Sonatas or Duets for Two German Flute or Two Violins* in 1752. The “Masters” listed on the title page of the first collection are Geminiani, St Martini, Jommelli, Rameau, Blavet, and Oswald, and the music was “Corrected and approv’d of by the Society”; the second collection has Tartini in place of Geminiani but otherwise presents the same composers. These composers did not write flute duets specifically for the collections; the music consists of arrangements of their works, possibly by Oswald. In the first collection, much of the Rameau is taken from *Les Indes Galantes*; the Blavet selections come from his flute sonatas, Op. 2 and 3. The duets are arranged in two movements, but in many cases the movements are not the work of the same composer. The second collection consists of four-movement sonatas, and the composers and sources are harder to identify than in the first collection as they are all in a similar style.

Of the Scottish musicians who wrote for flute, Oswald stands out easily as the most prolific, and also as the strongest composer with the best understanding of how to write for the instrument. All of his compositions for the flute, from the tunes in *The Caledonian Pocket Companion* and *The Curious Collection of Scots Tunes*, to the sonatas in the *Airs*.
for the Seasons, and the sets of flute sonatas, fit the instrument well.\textsuperscript{172} The music is fluid, and fits well on the instrument and under the fingers. While Oswald’s music is far from simple or easy, it avoids technically awkward writing, unlike the sonatas of McGibbon and Munro, and showcases the flute’s strengths by focusing on sharp key signatures and melodic passages, and avoiding the extreme ends of the flute’s range, especially in leaping sections. Oswald’s flute music ranks with the sonatas of Handel and Blavet for music that is challenging, polished, and extraordinarily satisfying to play.

\textbf{6.3.9 Pietro Urbani, 1749–1816}

Pietro Urbani arrived in Edinburgh in 1784 from Milan, by way of London, Dublin and Glasgow. In Edinburgh, he was active singing at the Edinburgh Musical Society and as a music publisher.\textsuperscript{173} Urbani was a major figure in the arranging and publishing of Scottish songs, the bulk of his published work having been devoted to Scottish music. His song settings are considerably different from contemporary publications such as \textit{The Scots Musical Museum},\textsuperscript{174} in that he provided opening and closing instrumental sections and ornamentation, likely to reflect the way Urbani himself performed the songs.\textsuperscript{175}

Many of Urbani’s compositions are presumed to be lost,\textsuperscript{176} but one of interest to the flute survives: \textit{A Favorite Selection of Scots Tunes properly arranged as Duettos for Two German Flutes or Two Violins}.\textsuperscript{177} This was published in three volumes of two partbooks each. Unlike the similar collections of Oswald and McGibbon, in which the tune is presented with variations, Urbani’s duets are very short and lack variations. They do,

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item A significant portion of the research in this chapter has been to play all of the music.
\item Baxter, “Italian Music and Musicians,” 258.
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
however, have a great deal of ornamentation, in a style suggestive of vocal music,\textsuperscript{178} possibly influenced by Urbani’s own singing style;\textsuperscript{179}

\textit{Figure 9:} Pietro Urbani, “Bush Aboon Traquair,” primo part, \textit{A Favorite Selection of Scots Tunes properly arranged as Duettos for Two German Flutes or Two Violins}, Wighton Heritage Centre, Dundee Central Library

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure9.png}
\caption{Music notation for “Bush Aboon Traquair” from Pietro Urbani's collection.}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{176} Johnson, “Urbani, Peter.”
\textsuperscript{177} Pietro Urbani, \textit{A Favorite Selection of Scots Tunes properly arranged as Duettos for Two German Flutes or Two Violins} (Edinburgh: Urbani & Liston, 1798).
\textsuperscript{178} Flute duets arranged from vocal music or popular songs with vocal-style ornamentation were very popular in France. Michel Blavet published three volumes of airs for two flutes, and Hotteterre’s \textit{Airs et brunetess} provided highly ornamented trios, duets, and solos for flute. These were among many other similar publications. Jacques Hotteterre, \textit{Airs et brunettes à deux et trois dessus} (Paris: Ballard, 1721); Michel Blavet, \textit{Recueils de pieces} (Paris: Bayard et Le Clerc, c.1755).
\textsuperscript{179} Urbani, “Bush aboon Traquair,” 3.
Some of these are abundantly ornamented, but in neither an Italian nor French style, suggesting that Urbani transcribed from a piper or a fiddler. The ornamentation of the “Maid of Selma” is especially indicative of pipe music, especially in the placement of the appoggiaturas between notes of the same pitch, which are easily accomplished by a slapping motion over the tone hole, similar to piping technique:\(^{180}\)

*Figure 10:* Pietro Urbani, “Maid of Selma,” primo part, *A Favorite Selection of Scots Tunes properly arranged as Duettos for Two German Flutes or Two Violins*

---

6.3.10 J. G. C. Schetky, 1740–1824

The cellist J. G. C. Schetky composed a set of six flute duets, published by Robert Bremner in 1775.\(^{181}\) They may have been written for or inspired by the playing of his

---

\(^{180}\) Urbani, “Maid of Selma,” 23.

brother Carl, or for the rich market of flute players in Scotland. The parts are imitative, and equal: these are not duets for student and teacher. The writing is very typical of German music of the mid-eighteenth century in its elegant, simple lines and long scalar passages. The last two duets are in potentially awkward keys for the one-keyed flute, E-flat major and B-flat major, but Schetky handles the resulting technical concerns well.

6.3.11 Domenico Corri, 1746–1825

Following a favourable mention by Charles Burney, the Edinburgh Museical Society invited Domenico Corri to direct their concerts. He became a prominent figure in Edinburgh musical life, teaching violin, singing, and harpsichord, directing concerts and staging operas, and running a music publishing company. While most of his compositions were for voice, Corri published two sets of sonatas for harpsichord with accompaniment for either flute, violin, or cello: *A First Sett of Six Sonatas for the Harpsichord with an Accompaniment for the Flute Violin and Violoncello* followed by *A Second Sett of Six Sonatas for the Harpsichord or Piano-forte with an Accompaniment for the Flute Violin and Violoncello*. The precise date of publication is unknown for both sets of sonatas, but both most likely date from Corri’s time in Edinburgh, given their associations with the city: the first set is dedicated to the Earl of Haddington, the Earl of Kelly, and the ‘Gentlemen of the Musical Society’; and the second was published by an Edinburgh-based publisher.

---

182 Please see Chapter 5, ‘Professional musicians,’ for details on Carl Schetky, and for the Schetky brothers’ relationship with Bremner.
184 Domenico Corri, *A First Sett of Six Sonatas for the Harpsichord with an accompaniment for the Flute Violin and Violoncello* (Edinburgh, s.n.).
185 Domenico Corri, *A Second Sett of Six Sonatas for the Harpsichord or piano-forte with an accompaniment for the Flute Violin and Violoncello* (Edinburgh: J. Johnson, s.n.).
The music is very unsuited to the flute. Each sonata of the first set goes well outside the range of the flute, one-keyed or four-keyed, and has many double stops. Additionally, while most of the technical passages are playable on the flute, they are not characteristic of flute music, but rather of violin music. Corri’s inclusion of flute as a possible instrument was evidently a marketing technique, with no attention to whether or not flute players would take the trouble to actually play his music, which would have required them to make their own adaptations of the musical text.

6.4 Conclusion

While a comprehensive picture of the flute repertoire played in eighteenth-century Scotland is elusive, what can be surmised from surviving music collections is that Italian, German, and Scottish composers were popular with Scottish flute players. French music is curiously absent. More can be surmised from the music for flute written either in Scotland or by Scottish composers. Scottish flute repertoire is characterized by a mix of continental and Scottish elements in varying degrees. The flute repertoire of eighteenth-century Scotland is rich and varied, especially as regards the sonatas of Reid, McLean, Oswald, and McGibbon. Reid and Oswald incorporated Scottish elements into their sonatas, while McLean and McGibbon did not. McGibbon, Munro, and Oswald made further contributions to flute repertoire through their collections of Scottish tunes, especially with specific flute transpositions. Munro’s Receuil, while somewhat awkward to play, shows the possibility of using a Scottish tune as the basis for extended theme and variations. Italian musicians who arranged Scottish music, such as Barsanti and Urbani, took different approaches than their native colleagues, showing greater influence of vocal music and pipe music in their settings.
Collections of Scottish tunes for violin or flute that include flute transpositions show an awareness of the flute’s popularity, and that some composers or arrangers knew exactly how they best worked and played. While there is no direct evidence of flute players having played pibroch, this practice is suggested by Dow’s and MacDonald’s collections. Music owned by music societies shows that the flute had an active role in concert life, through participation in orchestral playing or playing flute concertos.

Flute repertoire in Scotland in the eighteenth century was varied, but could have a strong sense of national identity, such as collections of Scottish tunes or pibroch; this could be understood as a reaction to the political situations in which it was written, as well as a savvy marketing response to an increase in interest in all things Scottish from outside Scotland.\textsuperscript{186}

Three main conclusions can be drawn about Scottish flute repertoire: Composers working in Scotland were aware of the flute’s popularity, and consequently knew that in providing specific flute transpositions their collections were more likely to appeal to a larger audience and earn more money; while Scottish music could be influenced by German or Italian or Scottish styles, French music and style was not popular, either in compositions produced in Scotland or in music in surviving library collections, which is somewhat surprising given the wealth of flute music written in France in the eighteenth century, as well as travel between France and Scotland, but could be explained by a general anti-French feeling later in the century; Scottish elements in compositions range from transpositions of tunes in collections to pibroch, the extreme end of the Scottish spectrum.

\textsuperscript{186} Many collections of French tunes arranged for flutes with ornaments exist in French flute repertoire from the early part of the eighteenth century, but whether a similar sense of national identity existed in France is uncertain.
7. Scottish music manuscripts from the eighteenth century dedicated to the flute

7.1 Introduction

Music manuscripts with origins in eighteenth-century Scotland provide insight into the musical tastes, pedagogy, ability levels, and transmission of music among amateur flute players. Although the precise origins of the manuscripts surveyed here are unknown, all have ties to Scotland.¹ The list below provides a general survey of music manuscripts that were the personal possessions of flute players in eighteenth-century Scotland, comparable to contemporary manuscripts for violin.²

Several manuscripts previously identified as being for the flute can now be re-identified as having been intended for either the recorder or another instrument entirely. Some of these are victims of the flute/recorder terminology problem, such as two manuscripts in the Montagu Music Collection³ which could be for flute or recorder and may or may not be of Scottish origin, although a connection to Scotland is likely because they were once the property of the Scottish antiquarian Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe. For example, MMC MS 8, “Hundriwood”, dates from the first half of the eighteenth century.⁴

---

¹ Attempting a comprehensive picture of flute manuscripts from eighteenth-century Scotland is impossible, given the volume of private collections that may have relevant items, potential cataloguing errors in libraries, and otherwise inaccessible or unknown materials. The manuscripts discussed here are from collections to which I have had access, such as the Montagu Music Collection and Lord Balfour of Burleigh’s papers, as well as easily accessed libraries which have catalogued the manuscripts, such as the Aberdeen Public Library, the Mitchell Library, and the National Library of Scotland. David Johnson’s list of manuscripts containing Scottish tunes was a helpful starting point. David Johnson, *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century* (Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 2003), 209–211.

² According to David Johnson’s account, manuscripts were made for personal use, with a range of types of music for different occasions or purposes, and sometimes became family heirlooms. David Johnson, *Scottish Fiddle Music in the 18th Century* (Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 2005), 7–8.

³ The Montagu Music Collection, in the possession of the Duke of Buccleuch and Queensberry, is comprised of volumes from all of the Duke of Buccleuch’s ancestral properties. Consequently it can be difficult to determine if the volumes in question originated in his family or were purchased later. The three volumes in question here, 8, 127, and 353, were all once owned by Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe, who collected Scottish music, strongly suggesting a Scottish origin, although not necessarily with part of the Buccleuch family.

⁴ “Hundriwood” is written inside the front flyleaf of this manuscript. It may refer to Hundry Wood, part of the Buriton Estate in Hampshire, owned by the Bonham-Carter family.
The contents range from a transcription of a flute solo version of *The Beggar’s Opera* to minuets by McGibbon, along with Scottish tunes and sonatas by Corelli and Robert Valentine. While playable on either flute or recorder, the key signatures—especially for the transpositions of the Corelli and Valentine—indicate recorder. MMC MS 353 is an earlier volume, most likely dating from the 1710s. The contents are predominantly Scottish, along with transcriptions of English songs and works by Jean-Baptiste Lully, Jeremiah Clarke and Henry Purcell. The music is, however, for recorder.

Other manuscripts, including GB-Lbl Add. MSS 22098, folio 15, 34204 folio 1.b, and 34204 folio 4, contain individual Scottish tunes in otherwise English sources with no known ties to Scotland. These are likely of late-seventeenth-century English origin, when “Scotch” music was in vogue in the London theatre, and capitalized upon in publications by Walsh and Playford. Based on the flat key signatures of the music, and the likely dates of origin in the late seventeenth and/or early eighteenth centuries, these manuscripts are for the recorder.

David Johnson identified a number of manuscripts as having been created for the flute. Upon closer study, two of the manuscripts he labelled for flute in the National Library of Scotland are possibly for recorder, flageolet, voice flute, or violin, but not for

---

5 The references to English places inscribed inside both MMC MSS 8 and 353 could suggest an English origin for the manuscripts, but the writing could be in a different hand than the music, and the known ownership history of both volumes makes a stronger case for a Scottish origin.

6 The contents of this manuscript in particular highlight Gelbart’s premise that the barriers now drawn between ‘types’ of music were not active or useful in the eighteenth century. Matthew Gelbart, *The Invention of “Folk Music” and “Art Music”: Emerging Categories from Ossian to Wagner* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 1, 14-20.

7 “A Scotch hornepipe by Edward Sadler Sept. 93”; Scotch tune for two flutes, 1697 (?) This page consists of two duets in G minor with the parts facing each other across the page. The parts are labelled treble and 2nd treble.

8 A Scots Tune; “Twas within a forlong” etc.; unnamed tune. All three tunes are on the same page. The manuscript has the date of 1708 (?) in University of Glasgow library catalogue. Accessed 19 January 2015, http://encore.lib.gla.ac.uk/iii/encore/record/C__Rb2067401?lang=eng .

9 A Scotch Tune; A Scotch Tune by Mr Finger; unnamed tune

10 Johnson’s criterion for inclusion in his list of manuscript sources is that the manuscript contains Scottish material. David Johnson, *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century* (Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 2003), 209–211.
flute. Johnson identified GB-En Adv. MS. 5.2.22 as for either recorder or flute, but it contains a reference to a thumb hole in the fingering chart drawn in the first few pages, and the music descends to middle C, so one-keyed flute is an improbable candidate for the intended instrument, and while keys made lower notes possible on the flute, the keyed flute had not yet been invented. More likely candidates are either the flageolet or the voice flute. Flageolets in the mid-eighteenth century could have one or two thumb holes, with a range of two octaves, as is indicated by the fingering chart in the manuscript. The instrument had lost popularity by the second half of the eighteenth century, but was neither unknown nor unplayed, especially by ladies. The signature on the front flyleaf is of Joan Hill, suggesting ownership by a lady. If Joan Hill owned the manuscript, flageolet is a much stronger candidate than recorder or flute as flageolet was a popular instrument for ladies in the eighteenth century, with a similar range to that shown in the manuscript. Another strong candidate for the intended instrument is the voice flute, a recorder that plays a third below the range of the treble recorder, giving it the same range as the transverse flute, and making it suited to the same repertoire. The music in the manuscript is predominantly in sharp keys, rather than the flat key signatures associated with the recorder, which suggests that players of the tenor, alto, or soprano recorders are not likely to have used this manuscript. The voice flute, however, has a greater range than the fingering chart in the manuscript, extending to b‴. The contents of the book are

11 Johnson does indicate some doubt as to the likelihood of recorder, and assigns a date of 1740. Johnson, *Music and Society*, 210.
12 The fingering chart goes from c′ to d♯‴, which is not the range of the flute. Flutes lacked thumb holes until the late eighteenth century. A keyed flute with a thumb hole would have a wider range than shown on the fingering chart. GB-En Adv. MS 5.2.22.
predominantly Scottish tunes. Another sequence of music starts on the reverse of the manuscript, in different hand, but it is also unsuited to the one-keyed flute.16

Johnson proposed that GB-En Adv. MS. 2833 was for recorder or violin, but upon inspection the manuscript contains material for a wind instrument and the violin, as well as the viol.17 The music is in at least two hands, which accounts for the variety of instruments as well as the different types of repertoire: Scottish tunes appear, as well as viol and violin exercises and airs.18 The fingering chart in the first few pages of the manuscript starts on the F-sharp above middle C in the treble staff and goes to G above the staff, which suggests either alto or tenor recorder, as does a duet for first and second “tribble” instruments, unlike the duets later in the book specifically labelled for the violin. The contents in first part of the book are predominantly Scottish. The writing and contents change mid-way through the volume to include “Flourishes in all Keys by Tho. Dean”, which looks to be for an instrument with a larger range and the capability of playing in more tonalities than the wind instrument indicated earlier. This is possibly the violin because the treble clef does not change. The remaining contents are minuets and other dances, more Scottish tunes, as well as duets labelled for the violin and airs for the viol.

With the above manuscripts re-identified as originating for instruments other than the flute, the manuscripts from eighteenth-century Scotland that are for flute may be discussed. Included in addition to these are four later manuscripts showing that the one-keyed flute was still played in Scotland well into the nineteenth century, which is surprising given the rapid acceptance and development of the multi-keyed instrument

16 The booklet accompanying the microfilm version of the manuscript describes it as “Music for flute, late 18th century: Music book containing pipe music, minuets, a setting for strings and flutes, and other tunes, mostly Scottish. 18th century”. “Pipe music” must be assumed to mean marches; there are no instances of specifically pipe music, such as pibroch. Early Music Part 2: Music Manuscripts, 1500–1793, in the National Library of Scotland (Marlborough: Adam Matthews Publications, 2004), 27.
18 The notes on the microfilm describe the manuscript as “Book of English and Scottish tunes, 1702 and notes. Book of English and Scottish tunes, composed by known and unknown authors and traditional. It contains the names of James Thomson, 1702, and John Daniel. For some of the tunes this appears to be the earliest manuscript.” 35; Two names are inscribed in the book: James Thomson, 25 November 1702 on the first flyleaf, and Jo. Daniel on the second.
among flute players and makers. The manuscripts are presented in chronological order, so that the development of musical contents and, when indicated, type of flute used, can be better understood.

7.2 Alexander Bruce Manuscript, private collection of Lord Balfour of Burleigh

This is the oldest known manuscript for the one-keyed flute in Scotland, as well as the earliest piece of evidence for the flute’s presence in Scotland and one of the most unusual documents in flute history. The best evidence that the German flute was known in Scotland prior to 1725 comes from Alexander Bruce’s manuscript, owned by Lord Balfour of Burleigh.\(^\text{19}\) The manuscript is labelled “VIII Sonata del Signor Robert Valentine a due flauto/flauto secunda/Alxder Bruce” and is dated 5 January 1717.

Pasted inside the front cover of the manuscript\(^\text{20}\) is a page labeled “A Scale for the German flute,” showing a chromatic fingering chart from the instrument’s bottom note, \(d’\), to \(b''\) flat. The usual top note of the eighteenth-century flute is \(a'''\), and it rarely appears, and only in music from later in the century. A high B-flat is exceptional.\(^\text{21}\) It would be interesting to know where Bruce obtained his fingering chart: whether from a teacher or from a publication or, more likely, a lost manuscript source. It certainly suggests that he

\(^{19}\) The manuscript is in the possession of Lord Balfour of Burleigh. The National Library of Scotland has a copy on microfilm, MF.MSS.556, and John Purser has a copy. I am grateful to Dr Purser for use of his copy and to Lord Balfour of Burleigh for allowing me to examine the original and reproduce images from it. There is no trace of another volume that might contain the first part of the duets or shed light on the origin of the fingering chart. I suspect Bruce’s duet partner kept it.

\(^{20}\) The present owner of the manuscript, the 8th Lord Balfour of Burleigh, had the manuscript bound.

\(^{21}\) J. S. Bach, Partita in a minor for solo flute, BWV 1013, was written after 1723. The final note of the Allemande is the high A. Christoph Wolff, et al., “Bach,” Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online (Oxford University Press), accessed 10 April 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/40023pg10. Jean-Jacques Rousseau’s “Le Printemps de Vivaldi,” a transcription of the Spring concerto from the Four Seasons, includes a high A in the first movement. The date of its publication is not known, but it was likely after 1730, which was Rousseau’s first music publication. Catherine Kintzler, “Rousseau, Jean-Jacques,” Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online (Oxford University Press), accessed 10 April 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/23968. Instruments available in the mid-to late eighteenth century were designed to have high registers that were better in tune; instruments from early in the century favoured the lower register. I was unable to achieve the note using this fingering chart on copies of German instruments from 1720 and 1750, but otherwise Bruce’s chart is useable.
was able to play that high, and expected other flute players to do so as well. The first method for the one-keyed flute, *Principes de la flûte*, by Jacques Hotteterre, was published in Paris in 1707.\(^{22}\) Hotteterre’s fingering chart goes to the high G, although he suggests that one never play above the high E.\(^{23}\) No method for the German flute was published in English until Peter Prelleur’s *Modern Musick-Master* of 1730, which is an unattributed translation of Hotteterre.\(^{24}\) Toussaint Bordet’s *Méthode Raisonnée*, published in 1755, has fingerings up to the D six ledger lines above the staff, but he cautions that these notes are not commonly used and are very unequal on most instruments, though may be easier to achieve on a flûte d’amour or a bass flute.\(^{25}\)

The music is a hand-written copy of the second flute part\(^{26}\) of eight of Robert Valentine’s duets. Valentine (1674–1735/40) composed several sets of sonatas for two recorders, flutes, or violins, as well as concertos and trio sonatas. Valentine was English, but spent most of his career in Naples and Rome. His early works were published in Rome and Amsterdam; the first of his works to be published in England was Opus 7, *Six Sonatas for Two Recorders or Violins* in 1720, which was an arrangement of Opus 4 from 1715. None were published in a set of eight, so it is most likely that Bruce copied selected sonatas into his book. The primary source for Bruce’s manuscript is *Six sonatas for two recorders*, published in 1716 as Opus 5 in Amsterdam, and in 1718 as Opus 6, and by John

---

23 He also leaves out the third-octave F, saying that it “can almost never be done…” Hotteterre, *Principes de la Flûte*, 45–46. Quantz repeats this advice in 1752, by which point flute design had made higher notes easier to achieve and composers were beginning to explore the flute’s higher range. Johann Joachim Quantz, *Versuch Einer Anweisung die Flöte Traversiere zu Spielen* (Berlin: Johann Friedrich Voss, 1752), 2nd edn translated by Edward R. Reilly (New York: Schrimer Books, 1985).
24 Dayton C. Miller, *Catalogue of Books and Literary Material Relating to the Flute and Other Musical Instruments with Annotations* (Cleveland, 1935), 78–79. Michel de la Barre, in the *Avertissement* to his 1710 suites, offers instructions on how play middle c, which is not given on Hotteterre’s fingering chart, but he does not provide guidance on any high notes. Michel de La Barre, *Premier Livre de Pieces pour la FluteTraversiere avec la Basse-Continue* (Paris: L’auteur, 1710), n.p.
26 The second page of music is of the first flute part to the first duet in the manuscript. As I have not seen the original manuscript, I cannot say how the book is laid out.
Walsh in 1715 as *Six Sonatas for Two Violins*.\(^{27}\) The first three second parts, and the only first part, in the manuscript, are transpositions of the first three duets from the 1715 Walsh publication.\(^{28}\) The fourth duet part in Bruce’s manuscript has a different source, as does the sixth. The seventh and eighth duet parts are the fifth and sixth sonatas from the Walsh publication.\(^{29}\) In a few places paper has been glued over the page, with the music written in the same hand, but slightly smaller, suggesting a correction to the copy.

Bruce’s manuscript suggests manuscript transmission of Valentine’s music in Scotland, and is the only record indicating that a one-keyed flute could play higher than a high G, which is rather amazing for the time and the nature of the instrument. That the source is Scottish makes it clear that the flute was well-known and well-established in Scotland before 1725.

7.3 MMC 491

A copy of Adam Craig’s *A Collection of the Choicest of the Scots Tunes*\(^{30}\) in the Montagu Music Collection contains several pages of manuscript in the back pages of the book. The music is the first flute part to what appear to be trio sonatas by a Mr McGiven.

---

\(^{27}\) There is confusion over Valentine’s opus numbers. The same music was published with different opus numbers in Amsterdam and London, which can make identification difficult. The same music was published by Walsh for two violins as opus four. Martin Medforth, “Valentine, Robert,” Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online (Oxford University Press), accessed 11 April 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/44256.

\(^{28}\) I have only seen the Walsh publication, held at St Andrews University library, shelfmark Fin M286.V2. Bruce may have had the Roger edition, which could differ, or have had a manuscript source. The sonatas in Walsh’s editions are in flute-appropriate keys, so the transposition suggests he had a different source with different keys.

\(^{29}\) David Lasocki speculates that Valentine may have had a special publishing agreement with Walsh, which only increases the confusion over his opus numbers. Walsh published three sets of music by Valentine that were not published by Valentine’s other publishers, and also arranged some of his earlier sonatas for recorders for transverse flutes under different opus numbers. David Lasocki, “The London publisher John Walsh (1665 or 1666–1736) and the Recorder,” In *Sine musica nulla vita: Festschrift Hermann Moeck zum 75. Geburtstag am 16. September 1997*, ed. Nicholaus Delius (Celle: Moeck, 1997), 343–74, 351.

\(^{30}\) Adam Craig, A Collection of the Choicest of the Scots Tunes (Edinburgh, 1727).
as well as additional Scottish tunes, not for flute. The volume, now a part of the Montagu Music Collection, was once owned by Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe, who added a note that the Craig book was rare. The bookplate and signature of John Harvey of Edinburgh, 1730, presumably the original owner, are also present, with a handwritten index of the Craig book. The pages are numbered by hand, and the manuscript starts on slightly smaller paper on page 47, after the last of the printed music. The contents are as follows:

47: Flauto primo: Giga Allegro in Mr McGiven’s 6 Sonatas
48–49: Sonata 1ma Flauto primo Mr McGiven Andante, Gigga Allegro, Gavot Allegro
50–51: Sonata 5 Mr McGiven Flauto Primo. Adagio, Allegro, Allegro
52: Gigg
53: Yellow haird Ladie
54–55: Peaties Mill
56–57: The Yellowed hard Ladie
58–59: The Irish Cry/the following Jigg

The Scottish tunes are possibly in a different hand from the sonata parts: the clefs are drawn in the same idiosyncratic manner, but the music is much less clean. The final pages are missing from the book, and may have been removed.

The most obvious question this manuscript raises pertains to the identity of Mr McGiven. It is tempting to identify him as William McGibbon, due to the similarity of their names, the presumed Edinburgh origin of the book, the presumed date of the manuscript (assuming that John Harvey was its source), and the coincidence of its being in

---

31 The music descends too far below the staff.
32 From p. 52 on, each staff is numbered. This is possibly in a different hand. The gigga is partially crossed out.
33 This has been crossed out, but could have been an exercise in theme and variations.
34 This has variations and a gigga.
35 This has numbered staves and variations. The music sometimes goes below the staff to B, so flute is not a likely instrument.
36 There is a false start in D major, then it actually is in G.
37 There is reason to identify the name McGiven with McGibbon: Lady Grissel Baillie records to payment to a Mr McGiven for music lessons for her daughters. This was most likely William McGibbon’s Edinburgh-based uncle, Matthew. The music in this manuscript is too late to be the work of Matthew McGibbon, but it may not have been unusual to misrepresent the name McGibbon as McGiven. Household Book of Lady Grisell Baillie, 1692–1718, National Museum of Scotland; Helen Goodwill, “Musical Involvement of the Landed Classes in Eastern Scotland, 1685–1760” (PhD thesis, University of Edinburgh, 2000), 113.
a book by McGibbon’s colleague Adam Craig. The music does not match any of
McGibbon’s published works, though it is very much in his style:

Figure 11: Sonata 1ma, flauto primo, MMC 491

Much of McGibbon’s music is known only in manuscript sources, so it is not improbable
that McGiven is a misspelling of McGibbon, in which case this manuscript contains partial
unknown sonatas by William McGibbon. 38

7.4 GB-Ap MS 23775

David Johnson gave this manuscript a date of about 1740, 39 with an origin of
Aberdeen, but the note from one of the previous owners, Alfred Moffat, observed that:

This M.S. must have been written between the years 1730 & 1735 (the later
handwriting at the end of the volume probably about 1745–50). The air “Stand
bilean the way” was printed in the “Provoked Husband” 1728. There are
several handwritings in the book; the titles have been, for the most part, added
by a later & uneducated hand. The M.S. has been compiled by a flute-player,
probably somewhere in the west of Scotland; that the tunes were written for the
Flute, is proved by the keys of ‘G’ and ‘D’ being, with few exceptions, used
throughout. The versions of the airs are evidently traditional, & differ from
printed versions. For instance, the tune on p. 83 known as “what’ll I do gin my
haggie dee,”* was first printed in McGlashan’s Collections of Scots Measures
in 1781. The titles supplied in pencil have been added by myself, from the
index & from other sources. Alfred Moffat, June 1896 (further titles and notes

38 Searches in RISM and BUCEM for McGiven proved fruitless. Please see Chapter 6 and Appendix A for
a complete discussion and edition of McGibbon’s sonatas.
added by Jm\(^{40}\) Henderson) * also recorded by Robert Burns. See Stenhouse p. 126.\(^{41}\)

Inspection of the manuscript confirms Moffat’s view that it is the product of several hands, although his suggested date range of 1730–1750 is more difficult to confirm. As Moffat observed, one of the tunes was not published until 1781, but it could have been in manuscript circulation for years before its publication. The volume passed from Moffat to Alexander Walker in 1897, who gave it to the Aberdeen Public Library, but there is no reason to ascribe its origins to Greater Aberdeen as Johnson proposed, or to the west of Scotland as suggested by Moffat.

The book is very small, and has 292 pages numbered in an eighteenth century hand and later renumbered by Moffat. It is labelled “Scottish Songs in MSS for flute” with an inaccurate drawing of what is supposed to be a flute,\(^{42}\) followed by a print of Apollo and his lyre. The manuscript appears to be a fair copy, with a few blank pages, and few crossed-out sections. The contents are predominantly Scottish tunes, with minuets and song tunes. A handwritten index, by one of the later copyists, occupies the last few pages.\(^{43}\) The book is in such good condition it seems barely used. The contents offer no clues as to the ability of the player or of the flute played; it is a very long, undistinguished manuscript.

---

\(^{40}\) John Murdoch Henderson, 1902–1970, was a fiddler, composer, and mathematics teacher from Aberdeen.


\(^{42}\) The shape is incorrect and the hole placement is so wrong that it would be impossible to play.

\(^{43}\) Moffat seems to have done a great deal of work on this manuscript, including a correlation between the manuscript’s rather inaccurate index and what the tunes actually are, with annotations as needed on the pages of the manuscript itself.
7.5 GB-Enr GD40/15/54/1–3; GD40/15/55

Lord Robert Kerr’s manuscript books of flute concertos, including the only surviving source of Vivaldi’s flute concerto “Il Gran Mogol”, are discussed in Chapter 2, “Gentlemen Amateurs”.

7.6 GB-Gm MS M18106

This manuscript has over four hundred tunes for flute in possibly four different hands. It seems to have been the work of several years and people, possibly for the same player. A note in the manuscript added by Frank Kidson says it was owned by F. Colquhon in 1752, which is based on a trace of a note and date of 1752 which are no longer visible. The book starts with a useless index of only two hundred of the tunes; it was made by one of the earlier hands, and was not updated by the later copyists. The bulk of the book is a fair copy without empty lines; each tune has a Roman numeral, title above the staff and the tune’s origin, if given, below. The contents for the first hundred pages consist predominantly of tunes attributed to Oswald, other Scottish tunes, tunes by O’Carolan, and arrangements of songs by Hasse.

On p. 100, the writing changes, and the numbering system changes from Roman numerals to Arabic numerals. The notation is sloppier, with some unfinished tunes and empty spaces, though the trill signs are the same as in the earlier pages, suggesting this could be a working version of the original hand. The music changes from the shorter tunes and dances of the first part of the book to longer song transcriptions by Handel and Arne, as well as an entire sonata by Corelli, and an unattributed cantata.

44 Only one name is associated with the book, but owning to the variety of handwriting present, it could also have been passed from user to user, with each making his own additions.
45 The manuscript is a part of the Mitchell Library’s Kidson Collection.
46 The ownership marks are now missing, or possibly beneath the Mitchell Library bookplate, but based on Kidson’s note, a date and signature were present when Moffat owned the book.
The last few pages have music labelled specifically for the German flute in what may be two additional hands. Without the original signature and date, publication information of the published tunes would have to be investigated, but there is no reason to distrust Kidson’s note, especially if he did see the original signature. That the manuscript is for flute is certain: the tunes are all in flute-appropriate keys and ranges, and the indication for German flute on one of the later pages confirms it. This long volume shows that repertoire for presumably amateur flute players in mid-eighteenth century Scotland ranged from Scottish tunes, to transcriptions of songs, and arrangements of larger-scale works.

7.7 GB-En Adv. MS. 5.2.20

This manuscript, primarily for the flute, has a few indications of use by a variety of wind instruments. The writing is very shaky, the music has many passages marked out, and the page numbers are not sequential, so it is unlikely to have been the work of a professional copyist. The contents range from Scottish tunes, song transcriptions, arrangements of Handel and Blavet, and a flute concerto by Locatelli.47 David Johnson gave the manuscript a date of 1760,48 though there is no date indication on the volume itself.49

The first tune in the book is marked for “hautboy”, implying that there may have been some usage by an oboe player. The reference does not appear again. At least two of

the tunes come from Munro’s 1732 *Recueil des meilleurs airs ecossois ... avec plusieurs divisions et variations*; this publication, as discussed previously, was for the flute. These tunes, which are not attributed to Munro in the manuscript, as well as the pieces by Blavet and Locatelli, suggest use by and creation for a flute player, but there is also one indication of use by a piper: “Miss McDonald’s Reel” on page 12 of the book has a note saying to play “a note lower for Great Pipe”. While there are hints that pipers and flute players shared repertoire, this is the only indication that pipers may have played flute, and vice versa. This reel is in D major, so a note lower would be C major. “Flauto”, which usually meant recorder, is used twice in the manuscript, and must be taken to mean transverse flute, based on the key signatures and represented composers.

This manuscript shows a range of repertoire not unusual for Scottish eighteenth-century flute manuscripts, except for the inclusion of Blavet and the indication for pipes. French music is practically unknown in surviving eighteenth-century Scottish libraries and manuscripts, and a work by Blavet, who only wrote for flute, indicates that the player who made this manuscript was familiar with a variety of flute literature. The lone mention of pipe is a tantalizing hint that not only did flute players and pipers share some repertoire, but that some flute players also played pipes. The indication in this manuscript is that some flute players also played pipes; as ever, more research is needed into the overlap between flute players and pipers.

---

50 Please see Chapter 6.
51 Please see discussion of pibroch and Daniel Dow, Chapter 6.
52 If some flute players played pipes, it would follow that some pipers played flute, but the evidence is lacking.
Although the date indications in the manuscript are 1750 and 1780, Johnson assigned it a date of 1765.\textsuperscript{53} The music is for a solo treble instrument, most likely the flute based on the key signatures. A single sheet labelled “Scotch Airs from an old manuscript”, not bound with the book, acts as an inaccurate index.\textsuperscript{54} The book is relatively long, with ninety-six pages of contents including dances, Scottish tunes, a sonata by Corelli, and song transcriptions. The hand is not professional, and is sometimes messy.\textsuperscript{55} A previous owner added corrections to some of the tunes using a pencil; this later hand also added titles to the index sheet and attempted to locate the sources to a few of the tunes. Below tune 15, on page 11, “The Retrait”, is written “same as Fife Intro c.1780”. Another note on page 12, above tune 16 “March”, gives the source of the tune as “The Complete Tutor for Fife about 1750”.\textsuperscript{56} Notes regarding the title of the tunes appear on several other pages. Two duets, the parts on facing pages, labelled “Flauto primo” and “Flauto 2do”,\textsuperscript{57} suggest recorder as the instrument, but given that many of the tunes come from a book for the fife and that the music is predominantly in flute-oriented sharp keys, flauto likely means transverse flute in this instance, as in MMC MS 491 and GB-En Adv. MS 5.2.20.

On the bottom of page 3, beneath “Menuet in Ariadne”, is a sum that could indicate payment for flute lessons.\textsuperscript{58} £207 16s 7d subtracted from £218 8s 8½d is shown to come to 10s 11½ d, which most likely represented the price of some flute lessons. Without other pertinent information, it is impossible to conclude anything regarding lesson frequency.

\textsuperscript{54} The tunes as listed on the index are not in the same order as in the book itself.
\textsuperscript{55} The writing near the end of the book may be different from that of the beginning of the book. It is slightly messier, but not to the point that it can be determined to be that of another person.
\textsuperscript{56} The title of the source of the tune is given, but the writing is indecipherable.
\textsuperscript{57} The duets are “Nicolas sur sa musette”, “A Swedish March”, “Deseau’s March”, and “Caprice”. Pages 36–39; “The Old Butts New March”, 42–3.
\textsuperscript{58} If that is even what the sum is meant to represent, but it seems implausible that anything else would be in a flute manuscript.
7.9 GB-Er MSS E.165; C.220; D.52-54

General John Reid’s music manuscripts are the most complete music collection of any single flute player in eighteenth-century Scotland. For a discussion of their contents see Chapters 2 and 6. It is worth adding here that these manuscripts are unusual compared to the others surveyed in this chapter in their total lack of Scottish tunes. Reid, as a world-traveller and composer, was involved in many spheres of musical life around the world, and his manuscript books reflect that.

7.10 GB-Gm MS M17371

A manuscript inscribed “Le livre de John Doig”, presumably by the original owner, contains Scottish tunes possibly for a keyed flute, as well as indications of flute lesson payments. The name inscription is followed by the same in Greek with what may be a Greek date. This verse is written on the first flyleaf:

He who steals my purse steals trash
Twas something, Nothing twas mine
Tis his, and has been slave to thousands
But he who filches from me my good name
Rob me of that which not enriches him
But makes me poor indeed

---

59 A small ledger in the margin of the front flyleaf shows a total of 8s 7 ½d (something like £6.88 in modern terms), suggesting this is a balance due or paid for flute lessons, though there are no dates or any other indications on the page, and without dates, it is impossible to speculate how frequently lessons occurred and what the charge may have been.

60 Many thanks to Ioulia Kolovou for verifying that the lettering is indeed Greek, and translating it for me. She said the translation is not exact due to some minor grammar issues, but his meaning is clear. She believes that the four letters under the phrase in Greek is the date 1675, which suggests Doig made a mistake with his Greek numbers and intended to write the much more likely date 1775.

61 Doig misquotes somewhat:

Good name in man and woman, dear my lord,
Is the immediate jewel of their souls.
Who steals my purse steals trash; 'tis something, nothing;
'Twas mine, 'tis his, and has been slave to thousands;
But he that filches from me my good name
Rob me of that which not enriches him,
And makes me poor indeed.

The Mitchell Library’s bookplate is pasted over some writing inside the front cover, rendering it unreadable. Presumably this covers further writings by Doig, or marks from subsequent owners.

This manuscript is very small, and fragile, the front cover having become detached. The key signatures are sometimes on the incorrect lines or spaces, suggesting that this was not the work of a professional copyist. There are, however, no corrections or obvious mistakes, suggesting that this is a fair copy. Some of the pages have additional staves drawn in between or above the larger one, especially when a tune continues longer than the page and would necessitate a page turn. A few tunes are duets, and the second parts are usually on the facing page, sometimes on a smaller piece of paper sewn into the manuscript. Given the figures for payment of flute lessons and the duets, this was quite possibly a practical book for use with a teacher. This manuscript may be related to Mitchell Library manuscript 788.51521 GOL (2), as discussed below.

The contents consist of Scottish tunes, marches, and dances, many of which are labelled for German flute. Excepting the possible date of 1775 in Greek, there is no definite date on the manuscript, so the date of 1780 suggested by Johnson may not be far off, given that some of the music descends to middle C, which was becoming more and more common in flute music later in the eighteenth century as flutes acquired keys making the note possible. Multiple keyed flutes were first known in England in the 1780s, popularized by the maker John Potter, and this early evidence for such a flute in Scotland suggests that Doig must have been relatively wealthy to have such an up to date instrument. Whether or not he was talented is more difficult to determine from this little book of fairly standard Scottish tunes and dances, but based on other evidence from

---

62 For example, F-sharp is almost always in the top space of the treble clef, not the top line.
63 This manuscript is shelved with the printed music books, not the manuscripts, in a different area of the Mitchell Library.
64 Johnson, *Music and Society*, 211.
contemporary flute players in Scotland,\textsuperscript{65} Doig was ahead in (presumably) owning a multiple-keyed instrument,\textsuperscript{66} though (based on this manuscript alone) average in his musical tastes and abilities.

**7.11 GB-Gm 788.51521 GOL (2)**

This is a manuscript copy of an unknown flute method: *A Complete Pocket Book for the German Flute Containing Necessary directions And Remarks on that Instrument To which is added an agreeable variety of Celebrated Marches, Airs, Duets, and Songs, Judiciously Transposed And Collected from the favourite & most admired Authors by Goldie* 1781.\textsuperscript{67}

Instructions, including the fingering chart, take up three pages of the manuscript.

The instructions are brief, to the point that how to actually produce sound on the instrument is barely covered:

The German Flute among other excellencies hath that of being most like the human voice, and in this is allowed to excel as well as for its power of Expression, its address to the Heart, and that singular elegance of diminishing the Tone, with all its other Beauties, cannot fail to Render its study pleasing and its effects delightfull.

The most graceful Attitude to hold the flute is near to an Horizontal position, the left hand uppermost, the Face rather turned Towards the shoulder, and the Instrument resting between the Joint of the Thumb and that which unites the hand to the first finger. First learn to make the flute sound clear and distinct, to do which your lips shou’d be close except a small opening in the center for the wind, contracted smooth and easy.\textsuperscript{68}

\textsuperscript{65} See Chap. 2, Gentlemen Amateurs.
\textsuperscript{66} For more on the rise of the multi-keyed flute in the late eighteenth century, see 2.12.
\textsuperscript{67} I have not yet been able to trace the source of this book.
\textsuperscript{68} GML 788.51521 GOL (2), 3.
All but the most gifted of flute players would find this inadequate guidance. The text then moves on to explain the fingerings and how they relate to the notes. The finger chart disagrees with all other sources in using the key for low D as well as most other notes.\(^\text{69}\)

Following the instructions are several blank pages, then, in a different hand, music. The music consists predominantly of Scottish tunes and song transcriptions presumably from theatrical performances. “A Favourite Scotch Song” sung by Mrs Weichsell in 1779 gives another clue as to the manuscript’s date. The last pages of the book appear to be a register of lessons and payment. This manuscript may have been a collaboration between teacher and student, the teacher having written the instruction section of the book and perhaps some of the tunes, with the student having added the bulk of the music, which would explain why there are no records of its having been published.

It is possibly related to the John Doig manuscript (GB-Gm MS M17371), but the books are held in different collections at the Mitchell Library, and restrictions make it practically impossible to compare the volumes, especially the handwriting. The Mitchell Library’s bookplate is pasted over commentary inside the front cover, again making it challenging to ascertain what the writing says. The books are of similar size, shape, and binding, and the handwriting, especially of the musical contents, is very similar, strongly suggesting that the two books originated with the same person. The Doig manuscript, as discussed above, may also show evidence of payments for flute lessons.

7.12 Scottish flute manuscripts from the nineteenth century

Flute manuscripts from the middle of the nineteenth century show that Scottish tunes and chamber music remained the preferred repertoire collected by flute players, with

---

\(^{69}\) The key is only used for specific notes on the one-keyed flute, unlike on the modern flute when it is depressed for nearly every note. It is not used for low D on either flute.
an emphasis on dances and marches. Details of instruments gleaned from these later manuscripts suggest that the one-keyed flute was played into the nineteenth century; the one-keyed flute was not immediately unpopular with flute players once the multi-keyed flute was developed, and some players undoubtedly clung to their old instruments for financial or sentimental reasons.\(^{70}\)

A set of manuscripts owned by James Simpson of Dundee dated from 1828 to 1830 were discovered at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland in 2002.\(^{71}\) The contents of the three volumes include church music, Scottish tunes, chamber music, and song transcriptions. Much of the music comes from *Wragg’s Improved Flute Preceptor*,\(^{72}\) which has instructions for the keyed flute. Simpson’s manuscript has a partial fingering chart beginning with C-sharp above the staff and continuing to the B-flat five ledger lines above the staff, with a variety of fingering options for each note.\(^{73}\) Bizarrely, there is no chart for the first octave and a half; it possibly fell out of the book, but the fingering chart is on the last endpaper of the book, pasted onto the back cover, facing the page containing Simpson’s signature, and no pages seem to be missing.\(^{74}\) Because of the variety of fingerings possible for any note on any type of flute, it is impossible to determine from Simpson’s manuscripts what sort of flute he played.

A manuscript owned by Andrew Small, originally a draper from Angus who worked and lived in Carrickfergus, County Antrim, dated 1835 is housed at the National Library of Scotland (GB-En MS 21738). This manuscript consists predominantly of Irish tunes, and while it may have been compiled while Small was living in Ireland, he moved back and forth between Scotland and Ireland between the 1830s and 1850s, before

---

70 Keys make technical music in keys with a great deal of flats and sharps easier to manage, but offer no advantage in the simple tunes found in the manuscripts discussed here.  
72 McAulay, “Nineteenth-Century Dundonian Flute Manuscripts,” 104.  
73 This is copied from Wragg. Jacob Wragg, *Wragg’s Improved Flute Preceptor*, London, 1806, 5.  
74 Many thanks to Dr Karen McAulay, who examined the manuscript on my behalf.
emigrating to the United States, so there is a definite Scottish connection to the manuscript. The Irish music could be a consequence of Small’s residence in Ireland, but Irish tunes are also common in other Scottish manuscripts of the period.\textsuperscript{75} The music is within the range and scope of the one-keyed flute.

GB-Gu MS Farmer 193 is a manuscript tutor for the flute, from Glasgow, dating from 1838 or 1839. Following instructions for a one-keyed flute, the music consists of marches, dances, song transcriptions, and Scottish tunes. It is almost identical to earlier manuscripts in including a fingering chart and dance music and Scottish music, rather than transcriptions of contemporary sonatas, indicating that repertoire changed little for flute players well into the nineteenth century, and that the one-keyed flute was played in Scotland well after it had been almost completely abandoned by the rest of Europe.\textsuperscript{76} These later manuscripts suggest that there was no great change in flute playing or repertoire in Scotland by the 1830s.

7.13 Conclusion

Manuscripts can provide insight into repertoire, ability levels, pedagogy, and instruments of flute players in Scotland across the eighteenth century. Alexander Bruce’s manuscript of Valentine duets—the earliest known manuscript for the transverse flute in Scotland as well the earliest evidence for the instrument in Scotland\textsuperscript{77}—shows that the repertoire in the early part of the eighteenth century included sonatas, and that Bruce at

\textsuperscript{75}  Stuart Eydmann, \textit{From Glen to Glen: Musical Resonance Between Antrim and Argyll}, unpublished typescript (Ulster Historical Foundation: Belfast, 2015).

\textsuperscript{76}  Following the addition of keys by Potter around 1780, other makers began changing the design of the flute, and a variety of styles of flute co-existed until Boehm’s design, the basis of the modern concert flute, was universally adopted in the early twentieth century. Boehm’s flute was first known around 1847. Powell calls this period of invention and instability in the flute making world “the flute mania period”. Ardal Powell, \textit{The Flute} (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002), 160–161.

\textsuperscript{77}  Aside from mentions in letters. See Chapters 1 and 2.
least could play very high, but shows nothing else about the flute and flute repertoire in the first quarter of the eighteenth century in Scotland.

Manuscripts tell a slightly more conservative story than printed music: their repertoire shows the prevalence of a taste for Scottish tunes as well as popular song transcriptions as repertoire for amateur flute players, with notably fewer examples of sonatas or non-Scottish repertoire. Barring a nationalistic tendency, this could have something to do with ability levels of flute players, most of whom were amateurs, and the context in which the flute was played: Scottish tunes are less technically challenging than most sonatas, and provide better unaccompanied music for amateur musicians to play, especially in social settings. Accompanied sonatas more likely existed in music collections in their published editions rather than in manuscript books. The two people known to have had predominantly Italianate music in their manuscript books were both gentlemen players, whereas nothing is known about the owners of the other manuscripts. Although this might suggest that people who played Italianate sonatas had money and leisure time and those who preferred Scottish tunes and transcriptions of Handel arias did not, the evidence for this is very shaky.  

No other manuscripts owned by Alexander Bruce are known, but the music collection at Brucefield is vast and may yet yield more discoveries; the manuscripts preserved in Scottish libraries may have components in other places showing other repertoire. Reid’s manuscript collection is intact, and unique amongst the manuscripts studied here for its lack of Scottish repertoire, but Reid and his music collection may not be representative of Scottish flute players at large. A possible conclusion is that the more up-to-date repertoire was circulated in print.

The pedagogical implications of the manuscripts are equally vague. Only two show potential indications of lesson fees and payments, and those only once each and

78 Countryfolk such as William Nicholson played flute and Niel Gow played Corelli; Scottish tunes are preserved in the manuscripts of wealthy country house libraries.
without details, and they could be scribbles unrelated to the music. The variety of handwriting in the Mitchell Library’s flute tutor, GB-Gm 788.51521 (2), as well the terribly vague instructions leads one to hope that the student who used the manuscript had a teacher of some sort for practical guidance.

Surprisingly, the manuscripts examined do not show the expected change in flute design across the century. The one-keyed flute is generally considered to have become obsolete by 1800, yet the evidence shows that in Scotland it continued to be played well into the nineteenth century. The limitations of this survey, however, could mean that manuscripts showing more advancement in flute technology may have been excluded.

The evidence of flute players also playing pipes from GB-En Adv. MS. 5.2.20 expands on what is known of flute players and pipers sharing repertoire, to show that the worlds of flute playing and piping were not necessarily separate and that musicians played both instruments. Much more information needs to be discovered to develop a full picture of the overlaps between flute playing and piping in eighteenth-century Scotland.

Even considering the possible exclusions and limitations, this survey of eighteenth-century manuscripts for flute from Scotland shows that there were very few changes in the musical taste of flute players that can be discerned from manuscripts across the century. The decline of the recorder, the presence of either of the flageolet or the voice flute, as well as the continued use of the one-keyed flute well into the nineteenth-century show which instruments may have been in use in Scotland in amateur music-making in the eighteenth century.
8. Instruments

8.1 Introduction

Instruments in use in eighteenth-century Scotland included the recorder, the fife, something called the Scots flute,¹ and the transverse flute, commonly called the flute, German flute, one-keyed flute, or, in modern terminology, the traverso.² These instruments fall under the Hornbostel-Sachs classification number 421.121.12, side-blown flutes with fingerholes.³ Although “flute” in the eighteenth century could also refer to the recorder, in this chapter, because the terminology of museum records now exclusively uses flute to refer to the transverse instruments including fifes and piccolos, flute will be understood in that sense. Additionally, consultation of makers’ surviving recorders in *The New Langwill Index* shows the makers below to have been active as transverse flute makers.⁴

This chapter will explore eighteenth-century transverse flutes in museum collections in Scotland, flutes purchased by Scottish players in London and Scotland, flutes available in Scottish shops, and Scottish flute makers, including potential overlap with bagpipe makers. Flutes reached Scotland in the eighteenth century in a variety of ways, including imports from mainland Europe, purchase in London either by the players themselves or on their behalf by music dealers, and purchase in Scottish shops.

---

1 See Chapter 5, ‘Professional musicians’, for further discussion of the elusive Scots flute, mentioned only once in references to the flute in eighteenth-century Scotland.
2 This is possibly more so the case in the United States.
8.2 Flutes in Scottish Museum Collections

Several eighteenth-century flutes now reside in museums in Scotland, but the records of how they came to be in Scotland are generally vague. Most of these instruments were components of larger gifts to the various museums; it is not always possible to determine where and when they were originally acquired, and by whom. I will consider the possibility that they were in Scotland by the eighteenth century, and will list and discuss the ones I have been able to access.

8.2.1 Hawick Museum, Scottish Borders

Two instruments stamped “Cahusac” listed as flutes in the Hawick Museum, are, upon investigation, a fife and a piccolo.\(^5\) The fife is wood and brass, dated 1750–1820, and was, according to local tradition, played in 1804 when the townspeople mistakenly believed the French had invaded. This would mean it was made well before 1820. The piccolo is in ivory with one key, and has the number 8 stamped on it, in addition to the maker’s mark. Both instruments were acquired by the museum in 1919, though the history of the fife suggests that it at least was in the area well before it became part of the museum’s collection.\(^6\)

8.2.2 University of Edinburgh Reid Collection, Edinburgh

The Reid Collection contains 214 transverse flutes primarily of European make. Most of the instruments were purchased from collectors or are on permanent loan. The collection houses some flutes that are by makers referenced in eighteenth-century Scottish

\(^5\) The London-based Cahusac dynasty of flute makers consisted of Thomas the elder (1755–1798), and his sons, Thomas Junior and William Maurice. Waterhouse, *The New Langwill Index*, 55.

\(^6\) Information provided by David Hill, Hawick Museum. He is in the process of changing the labels on the instruments to clarify that they are not flutes.
sources (Proser, Schuhart, Potter) which are discussed here, as well as two Scottish-made instruments by Urquhart and John Mitchell Rose which are discussed below in section 8.5, Scottish Makers.

8.2.2.1 Accession number 1733, Proser

This one-keyed flute is dated 1795. It is stained boxwood with ivory and very warped in the head joint, resulting in a severe curve. The late date of this flute is important, demonstrating the ongoing popularity of the one-keyed instrument after the development of flutes with multiple keys. A similar instrument is said to have been owned and played by William Nicholson.

8.2.2.2 Accession number 14, Schuhart

John McAlla wanted a flute by Schuhart rather than something made locally, and if this flute resembles the one he hoped for, he was likely a wealthy man. The flute is made of ivory, with silver rings, and the key is engraved with the initials JB. According to the catalogue, this instrument is of a somewhat later make than when McAlla was writing; the design is consequently simpler than a flute from the 1720s would have been.

---

8 Please see below the section on Nicholson’s flute, as well as Chapter 3.
9 See below section on McAlla’s flute shopping, as well as Chapter 2 for more on McAlla.
8.2.2.3 Potter

The Reid Collection has 34 instruments made by Richard Potter and his son, William Henry, either of whom could have been the Potter referenced by Colin Campbell in his letter to his mother. His brother, John, wanted a “flute made by Potter, of the new fashion with all its keys.” The date of the letter, January 1781, makes Richard Potter a slightly stronger candidate for the maker, as William Henry was not active as a maker until the early nineteenth century. Accession numbers 977, 5406, 5407, 2445, and 1573 are especially strong contenders for the type of instrument John Campbell wanted his mother to purchase.

8.2.3 National Museum of Scotland, Edinburgh

Two instruments labelled flutes in the National Museum of Scotland are associated with the Rose of Kilravock family orchestra. These instruments have no keys, and upon closer examination, they must be re-identified as fifes. They could have had no orchestral use. One instrument is a one-piece fife in B-flat, by G. C. Payne, the other is a two-piece fife in G by Astor. Flutes, however, were played at Kilravock Castle as indicated by the presence of flute parts in the family music manuscripts, and a damaged flute by Cahusac was included in the inventory of instruments of the castle, but its currents whereabouts are unknown. Fifes always have a military connotation; they possibly arrived at the castle via military musicians stationed at nearby Fort George.

---

11 Historic Musical Instruments in the Edinburgh University Collection, print catalogue, 3rd edn, 145.
12 See Chapter 2.
13 National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Campbell family, the Earls of Breadalbane, GD112/16/2/9.
14 Waterhouse, The New Langwill Index, 308-309.
16 There were three London instrument making firms associated with members of the Astor family between 1778 and 1831. Waterhouse, The New Langwill Index, 12.
8.2.4 Stewarty Museum, Kirkcudbright, Dumfries and Galloway

A one-keyed flute made by Proser in the Stewarty Museum may have belonged to the poet William Nicholson.\(^{18}\) Although there is no contemporary evidence that Nicholson played flute, this instrument was left to the museum in 1949 by a distant relative, and so a physical piece of evidence has come to be associated with his musical activities.\(^{19}\) Proser was a London-based maker, so we might presume that the instrument came to Scotland via a trip to London. Nicholson travelled south in 1826 to see the king about the concerns the voices in his head had expressed regarding the Greeks; possibly he was able to purchase the flute then.\(^{20}\) Alternatively, given that Nicholson was a peddler by trade, the flute may have come to him by some means on his business travels.

8.2.5 Glasgow Museums

Two flutes made by Jean Jacques Rippert\(^{21}\) are now in the care of Glasgow Museums. Both are in three sections, wood and ivory, with one silver key. One instrument is dated 1690 (A.1942.68.ak), the other 1710 (A.1963.10). No ownership records survive, although A.1942.68.ak is part of the Glen and Ross Collection of Musical Instruments.\(^{22}\) This collection started as the collection of instrument maker Thomas McBean Glen in 1826. He may first have sold second-hand instruments before moving on to making his own; it is therefore possible that the Rippert flute in the collection was


\(^{19}\) Please see Chapter 3, for further detail on William Nicholson and the controversy surrounding what he played.


\(^{21}\) Rippert was active in Paris by 1696. Waterhouse, *The New Langwill Index*, 329.

\(^{22}\) Heather Robertson, Glasgow Museums, private communication with author.
unsold merchandise or that it was kept as an example of one of the earliest one-keyed flutes. The flutes themselves were most likely acquired by a Scottish gentleman on the Grand Tour.

8.2.6 Hunterian Museum, University of Glasgow

Several eighteenth century flutes are held by the University of Glasgow’s Hunterian Museum. These instruments formed part of the private collection of Professor Bernard Hague (1893–1960), a James Watt Professor of Electrical Engineering and amateur oboist. All of the eighteenth-century flutes in the collection were made in London by the makers Metzler, Christopher Gerock, Astor, and Golding, all of whom were active in the later part of the eighteenth century and the early part of the nineteenth. The history of the instruments before their acquisition by the museum is not known.

8.2.6.1 GLAHM 112011

This is a one-keyed flute in wood, ivory, and brass made by Metzler, after 1788, according to the museum’s records.

25 Valentin Metzler arrived in London from Germany in 1790 and founded a dynasty of instrument makers and music dealers. He most likely made the one-keyed instrument, as by the time his sons were in the business the instrument would have been obsolete. Waterhouse, *The New Langwill Index*, 261-262.
26 Gerock was in business in London by 1804. He eventually formed a partnership with Astor. Waterhouse, *The New Langwill Index*, 133.
27 Langwill suggests that the instrument in the Hague Collection, which forms part of the University of Glasgow’s instrument collection, is the only surviving example of a flute by Golding. Langwill may not have been aware that the collection has two instruments marked Golding, albeit with different spellings. Lyndesay G. Langwill, *An Index of Musical Wind-Instrument Makers*, 4th edn (Edinburgh: Lyndesay Langwill, 1974), 63. The information in Waterhouse’s updated Langwill is somewhat different, suggesting the Golding is a counterfeit for Goulding. Waterhouse, *The New Langwill Index*, 140-142.
8.2.6.2 GLAHM 112012

This is a one-keyed flute in four sections by an unknown maker from the early nineteenth century, according to the museum’s records. The date is a possibly a mistake; one-keyed flutes were rapidly superseded by keyed instruments in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, and while existing one-keyed instruments were still played, new ones were not usually made.

8.2.6.3 GLAHM 112013

This flute, in boxwood and ivory with one key, was made by C. Gerock of London.

8.2.6.4 GLAHM 112014 and GLAHM 112015

These flutes were made by Golding, and are the same type of instrument, though 112014 has the Prince of Wales’s feathers in the maker’s stamp, and Golding is spelled Goulding.

This flute was made by Astor. It is in boxwood, ivory, and silver with one key.

**8.2.7 Private Collections**

An ivory and silver flute said to have belonged to Prince Charles Edward Stuart was scheduled to be sold at auction on 13 May 2015. The flute is in four pieces, the key is missing, and there is a crack running the length of the headjoint. It was the property of Mrs Gordon of Hallhead, and was left at her family home in Aberdeenshire by a Major-General Henry Hawley in 1746, who had taken it as a relic. Like Nicholson, the prince was not known as a flute player in his lifetime, though he was musical and played violin and cello, and it would not be unlikely that he also played flute. This instrument associated with him could be the result of a misremembered family myth, or it could have belonged to someone else in his party and became associated with him when taken as a Jacobite relic. The prince spent an evening at Kilravock Castle en route to Culloden and was entertained by the lord playing violin; possibly they played together with the prince on violin, cello, or this flute. A flute of this type would have been a status symbol for a wealthy gentleman; the association with the prince is not improbable given his lifestyle, aims, and musical abilities.

---


8.3 Flutes purchased in the eighteenth century by Scottish players

8.3.1 John McAlla

In his letter of 25 September 1724 to Robert Harris, John McAlla asked Harris to purchase him a “good” flute with “bold” low notes and “[s]weet & [s]hrill” high notes. He was willing to pay any price for an instrument by Bressan or Schuhart, or have none at all. Flutes were available made locally by Mr Lilie, but these were—McAlla claimed—not worth having. We can infer from this that while flutes were available locally, they were also of local make and considered, at least by one player, inferior to those made in London. This trend seems to have continued with other known Scottish flute players who were known to have purchased instruments: London instruments were deemed superior and preferable to Scottish instruments.

8.3.2 Cosmo Gordon, 3rd Duke of Gordon

In December 1737 the 3rd Duke of Gordon transacted business with the London-based music seller and publisher John Walsh. In addition to several volumes of music, he purchased a flute as well as a piece for a flute made of ivory, likely a corps de réchange. These two items totalled £1.7.0. There is no record of who made the flute Walsh sold. A few interpretations of this sale are possible: quality flutes were not available in Scotland when the duke was ready to make a purchase; he already had business with Walsh to order music so it made economic sense also to purchase an instrument; or he was in London more than Scotland so ordering from a London shop was easier than from one in Scotland.

37 See Chapter 2 for additional discussion of Mr McAlla and his flute preferences.
38 National Archives of Scotland, RH15/73/1.
39 See Chapter 2 for more on Cosmo Gordon and his flute playing habits.
40 National Archives of Scotland, GD44/51/465/3/56.
8.3.3 Sir Andrew Dick-Lauder\textsuperscript{41}

Sir Andrew Dick-Lauder also chose to purchase a flute from London, rather than locally in Scotland. His letter to Gilbert Innes of 20 January 1786 asked for a “good” German flute, as well as a fiddle.\textsuperscript{42} This suggests that flutes were not readily available in Scottish shops, or, that as the businessman for the Edinburgh Musical Society, Innes could obtain a better price for a flute in London than Dick-Lauder would find in Scotland.

8.3.4 John Richardson\textsuperscript{43}

John Richardson (1780–1864) was a friend and neighbour of Sir Walter Scott. He acquired a one-keyed flute in boxwood and ivory made by C. A. Grenser around 1805.\textsuperscript{44} Very little information about Richardson or his flute playing is available, but the flute was purchased by the American flute player Robert Willoughby in 1977. Following the purchase, Willoughby and his wife became friendly with Major-General Frank Richardson, a descendant of John Richardson, who shared a poem and some other of Richardson’s writings with the Willoughbys. Whether Richardson purchased the flute in Germany, London, or Scotland is not known, though it shows that foreign-made flutes remained preferable to Scottish-made flutes even as late as 1805.

\textsuperscript{41} See Chapter 2 further discussion of Sir Andrew Dick-Lauder’s flute playing.
\textsuperscript{42} National Archives of Scotland, papers of the Edinburgh Musical Society, Innes Family papers, GD113/4/157/451.
\textsuperscript{43} For more on Richardson, see Chapter 2, ‘Gentlemen Amateurs’.
\textsuperscript{44} Grenser died in 1807, and by then the one-keyed flute was out of fashion and likely not continuing to be made. However, when Richardson acquired the flute is not known, and the poem it inspired dates from 1805. Carl August Grenser of Dresden (1720–1807) was one of the most celebrated flute makers of the eighteenth century, and his instruments are widely copied. Waterhouse, \textit{The New Langwill Index}, 145-146.
### 8.4 Flutes available in Scottish shops

This advertisement ran in the Caledonian Mercury several times in the summer of 1720:

```
ADVERTISEMENT, / THAT there are all Kinds of bias’d Bouls, Consort Flutes and small Flutes of several Sorts and Sizes, Hautbois and German Flutes, fine Handles for Tea and Milk Pots, Snuff-mills, oval or round, in Parcels or Retail, either Ivory, Ebony, Cocoa-nut, or any Sort of fine Woods, double or single, hinged or unhinged: As also, Heads and Crampets for Canes, Billiard-balls, Table and Chess men, all made, and Sold at reasonable Rates by Gavin Godsman the first Stair and Door above the Red Lion, over against the Luckenbooths in Edinburgh, where ye may have any other Work turn’d either in Bone, Wood or Metal.45
```

Gavin Godsman was presumably a wood turner, who sold a variety of items he had made, as well as possibly items made by others. While there is no other evidence that Godsman made flutes himself, one interpretation of the advertisement is that he did, or at least did the turning for another maker.46 The advertisement also reveals that in 1720 a variety of flutes were in use in Scotland, including consort instruments, which owing to the different definitions of flute, could also be recorders. Consort flutes would be the one-piece instruments in different keys used before the development of the one-keyed three-piece flute, and would have been virtually obsolete in most places in Europe by 1720.47 The advertisement also suggests a domestic or social context for flute playing in early eighteenth-century Scotland.

The majority of flutes appear to have been purchased outside of Scotland, though it is likely that other shops, such as Godsman’s, sold instruments. Dedicated music shops

---

45 Caledonian Mercury, 24 May 1720, repeated: 30 May 1720; 4 June 1720; 14 July 1720; 21 July 1720; 4 August 1720; see Chapter 2, ‘Gentlemen Amateurs’, for further discussion of this advertisement and the evidence it provides of flutes for sale in Scotland before 1725.

46 It is not unusual for someone else, perhaps an apprentice, to turn the instrument, leaving the voicing and tuning to the maker. John Gallagher, private communication with author.

47 Flute consort music was out of style by the beginning of the seventeenth century, with very few exceptions. Mixed consorts usually included a flute of some type. Ardal Powell, *The Flute* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002), 49–50. Michael Praetorius gave details of the various sizes of flutes in the appendix to *Syntagma Musicum* (Wolfenbüttel, 1619).
were not prevalent in Scotland until much later in the century, and even then, instruments tended to be purchased outside of Scotland.\footnote{Music shops were not common in Scotland until much later in the century. Neil Stewart opened his in 1759 in Edinburgh, and may have been the first. John Leonard Cranmer, “Concert Life and the Music Trade in Edinburgh, c. 1780–c.1830” (PhD thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1991), 205–209.}

8.5 Scottish makers

8.5.1 Lily

No flutes by James Lily of Con’s Close, Edinburgh, are known to survive. If he is identified with the Mr Lilie mentioned by Robert McAlla in the above-quoted letter, his instruments were of low quality. Lily is listed in Langwill as a “turner of flutes and oboes in ivory and hard wood” and was working in 1708.\footnote{Waterhouse, The New Langwill Index, 236} Even if he was not a good maker, it is notable that there was enough of a market in Edinburgh to support a woodwind instrument maker that early in the eighteenth century.\footnote{Dalyell only remarked upon Lilly’s activities as an oboe-maker, either assuming that the flute had to refer to the recorder (a terminological issue he found troubling), or ignoring it altogether. John Graham Dayrell, Musical Memoirs of Scotland (Edinburgh: Thomas Stevenson, 1849), 163.}

8.5.2 Urquhart

Urquhart is identified as a Scottish maker largely based on his mark of a thistle. One one-keyed flute survives, as well as at least two recorders.\footnote{Waterhouse, The New Langwill Index, 409.} No other information about him survives. The flute is part of the Glen Collection and is housed at the Reid Museum of Instruments at the University of Edinburgh.\footnote{Accession number 3370.} Because he also made recorders,
he probably worked in the early part of the eighteenth century before the recorder fell out of use.\textsuperscript{53}

The flute is in stained boxwood with a silver key and large ivory ferrules, suggesting that it dates from the earlier part of the eighteenth century, as does the detailed turning on the joints.\textsuperscript{54} Later instruments tend to be plainer than instruments made in the early part of the century, when the sections were joined by elaborate ferrules in ivory and sometimes silver, and the instruments themselves were sometimes also carved or engraved. This level of decoration is almost totally absent from instruments made after 1750.

A clue to Urquhart’s identity comes from the c.1726 \textit{Aria di Camera: being A Choice Collection of Scotch, Irish & Welsh Air’s for the Violin and German Flute}.\textsuperscript{55} Alexander Urquahart of Edinburgh is listed as one of the three compilers. The book begins with an essay entitled “The Newest Instructions for the German Flute”, which pre-dates the first English translation of Hotteterre by three years.\textsuperscript{56} Since Urquhart made flutes, and the name is Urquahart is included on the \textit{Aria di Camera}, it is likely that he was the author of the flute method, and that they were the same person. Further research is required on this topic.

\textsuperscript{53} One of Urquhart’s surviving recorders is held at Oxford. Waterhouse, \textit{The New Langwill Index}, 409.
\textsuperscript{54} Historical Musical Instruments in the Edinburgh University Collection, online catalogue, accessed 6 May 2015, \url{http://collections.ed.ac.uk/mimed/record/16088?highlight=urquhart}.
\textsuperscript{55} Alexander Urquahart, Dermot O’Connar, Hugh Edwards, \textit{Aria di Camera: Being a Choice Collection of Scotch, Irish & Welsh Air’s for the Violin and German Flute} (London: Dan Wright). The date c.1726 is handwritten on the National Library of Scotland’s copy.
\textsuperscript{56} Peter Prelleur’s \textit{The Newest Method for Learners on the German Flute}, the third volume of \textit{The Modern Musick-Master}, is an unattributed edition of an English translation of Hotteterre’s \textit{Principes de la flûte} that appeared in 1729. The opening text of the \textit{Aria di Camera} instructions and \textit{Modern Musick Master} flute instructions are identical; if the \textit{Aria di Camera} is indeed the earlier publication, it could be the source of the 1729 Hotteterre translation. Janice Dockendorff Boland, \textit{Method for the One-Keyed Flute} (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998), 197; Peter Prelleur, \textit{The Modern Musick-Master, or, The Universal Musician} (London: Peter Prelleur, 1730).
8.5.3 Bagpipe makers and flute makers

There is no direct evidence of any overlap between bagpipe makers and flute makers in eighteenth-century Scotland, but the possibility must be considered. The evidence of shared repertoire, as well as the manuscript evidence of flute players also playing pipes, strengthens the possibility that instrument makers also made both instruments, as do the shared tools and skill sets: pipes, pipe chanters, and flutes are turned on lathes and bored in the same manner. Evidence from elsewhere in Europe in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries shows that the same craftsmen made both flutes and bagpipes, and this is known to be true in Scotland in the nineteenth century, but there is no evidence as yet of it having been the case in Scotland in the eighteenth century.

Hugh Cheape speculates that John Simpson, a publisher in London who sold bagpipes, could have also made and sold flutes. Barry W. Shears’s essay “Wood, Horn and Bone: A Survey of Immigrant Bagpipes and Regional Pipe-making in Nova Scotia, 1820–1920” includes a picture showing a keyed fife laid out with bagpipe parts made in 1776. The implication is that the fife was made at the same time and by the same maker as the pipes, but Shears does not give the maker’s name of either instrument or explain why the fife is present in the picture. Fifes almost never have keys; this could be a piccolo mislabelled as a fife.

---

57 Philip Bate provides an overview of flute-making in seventeenth and eighteenth-century France, with an emphasis on how the flute, recorder, and musette may be related. *The Flute* (London: Ernest Benn Ltd., 1969), 78–89.
58 Hugh Cheape, private communication (10 November 2011).
8.5.3.1 John Mitchell Rose and Thomas McBean Glen

John Mitchell Rose (1793/4–1866) founded one of the greatest firms of flute makers, Rudall & Rose. He was Scottish, and relocated to London in 1821 after meeting his business partner to be, George Rudall. Very little is known of his life and his training; he may have trained as a turner in soft woods for a piano or organ company. Robert Bigio speculates that he may have had a connection with a bagpipe maker in Edinburgh, where he would have learned to make keys and turn hard woods. No evidence, however, supports this, but Rose’s contemporary, Thomas McBean Glen, was first listed in the Edinburgh City Directory as a maker of pipes and flutes in 1833, so the same craftsman making both instruments was possible, and there were business advantages to be had in making both instruments.

One of three surviving flutes made by John Mitchell Rose before he left Edinburgh for London is in the Reid Collection. It is made of rosewood in three pieces with a conical bore and eight silver keys. This instrument is of the type that became most popular through the Rudall & Rose empire, until the Boehm system flute gained precedence and universal acceptance among flute players.

8.5.3.2 Bagpipe makers and flute makers elsewhere in Europe

An overlap between bagpipe makers and flute makers existed in continental Europe from at least the seventeenth century. Martin Wenner, a renowned maker of historical

---

60 Rudall & Rose, eventually Rudall, Rose & Carte, remains one of the most celebrated firms of English flute makers. Because the company was English and founded in 1822, it falls outside the scope of this study.
63 Accession number 3533.
64 Historical Musical Instruments in the Edinburgh University Collection, online catalogue, accessed 6 May 2015, [http://collections.ed.ac.uk/mimed/record/15523?highlight=john+mitchell+rose](http://collections.ed.ac.uk/mimed/record/15523?highlight=john+mitchell+rose); print catalogue 82.
woodwinds, has in his private collection two engravings of instrument makers’ workshops showing a variety of wind instruments, including recorders, flutes, and bagpipes. The engraving “Eiserne Zeit” by Mathaeus Merian clearly shows an instrument maker at work on bagpipes as well as flutes. Wenner said that while he had never made a bagpipe, he was sure he would be able to do so, and given the economic conditions of instrument makers and sales in the eighteenth century, it made very good business sense. Other present-day makers agree: John Gallagher, a flute maker who specializes in eighteenth and nineteenth-century instruments, recently made a chanter for a set of uilleann pipes. The only part he found challenging was the placement of the reed, and he intends to continue to experiment with pipe making. David Quinn, a pipe maker, has on occasion made flutes, and notes that a flute and a pipe chanter are mechanically similar and that the process of drilling the bore is virtually identical, especially as regards creating the specific reamers to drill the correct size of the tapering bore.

The Hotteterre family, the most celebrated wind instrument makers in France in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, made oboes, bassoons, and flutes, as well as musettes. The family patriarch, Loys de Haulteterre (d. 1628) was described as a “tourneur de bois” in Normandy. His sons moved to Paris and established the famed woodwind making empire and married into other instrument-making families. The 1711 inventory of Martin Hotteterre’s workshop shows flutes, recorders, oboes, and musettes, indicating that he or a member of his workshop made all of these instruments. Although this is the only known example of the descendants of a wood-turner becoming instrument makers, it demonstrates the family’s expertise in wood-turning and their ability to adapt to the changing demands of the market.

---

65 Martin Wenner, private communication with author.
66 John Gallagher, private communication with author.
67 David Quinn, private communication with author.
68 The musette, a small bellows-blown bagpipe, was extremely popular in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century France, especially with the craze for all things pastoral among the nobility.
69 Wood-turner (my translation).
makers, it is reasonable to assume that because of the shared tools, shared skill set, and marketing concerns, there were other overlaps between wood-turning and instrument making, as well as other overlaps between makers of bagpipes and makers of flutes. Continued research in this area is required.

8.6 Conclusion

This survey of museum collections and letters leads to the conclusion that, while there were at least two flute makers active in Scotland in the early part of the eighteenth century, instruments from London or abroad were preferred. In the case of John McAlla and John Campbell, this was because they desired a particular make of flute not available in Scotland. If flutes were available in Scottish shops other than Gavin Godsman’s, records do not survive to tell us what make they were. Flutes were luxury items, and those with the means or connections to shop in London would have had the top of the line makers, whereas those with less financial freedom could purchase a lesser instrument locally.

Since no records of the maker Lily survive, and only one flute by Urquhart, little can be concluded about these Scottish flute makers. Contemporary evidence says that Lily was not a good maker, and the flute by Urquhart is no longer playable, so his skill as a maker can be judged only by the exterior of the instrument, which is well-turned and attractive. But this has no bearing at all on how it may have played.

There is no evidence until 1833 that Scottish bagpipe makers also made flutes, or vice versa, but evidence from other countries where the two skills did overlap shows that it

72 Jacques Hotteterre (1673–1763) not only played both musette and flute, he also wrote tutors for both instruments: Principes de la Flûte Traversière, ou Flûte d’Allemagne, de la Flûte à Bec, ou Flûte Douce, et du Haut-Bois, Divisé par Traitéz op.1 (Paris, 1707), and Méthode Pour la Musette, Contenant des Principes, par le Moyen Desquels on Peut Apprendre à Joüer de Cet Instrument, de Soy-Même au Défaut de Maître. Avec un nouveau plan pour la conduite du souflet, & plusieurs instructions pour le toucher, &c. Plus un recueil d’airs, & quelques préludes, dans les tons les plus convenables op. 10 (Paris, 1737).
was very possible. It is highly likely that there was some overlap in Scotland, as is
substantiated by the known cases in the early nineteenth century. As with flute purchasing,
finances were a driving factor behind instrument making, and making as many instruments
as possible would be good business practice. More research is required to determine if the
overlap in instrument making occurred earlier.
9. Conclusions

This thesis set out to explore the role of the flute in musical life in eighteenth-century Scotland, and to restore its place in Scottish music history, by first dispensing with William Tytler’s origin myth regarding the flute in Scotland, and then re-examining the evidence from the primary sources, revealing that Scotland did not lag behind the rest of Europe in flute-related activities. Having considered surviving records of flute players, repertoire, manuscripts, and instruments, a fuller picture of the flute’s role can be seen.

The four common assumptions underlying the secondary literature relating to the flute in eighteenth-century Scotland were shown to be false. It is clear that the flute was current in Scotland as early as 1703, when the Marquis of Montrose’s friend wrote to him about studying it. The earliest surviving tangible evidence of the flute in Scotland in the eighteenth century, Alexander Bruce’s manuscript, dates from 1717, and shows that at least one player of the time had established how to play notes well outside the flute’s accepted range. Shops were selling flutes by 1724, and literature from the early part of the century shows that not only was the flute popular, but that it was frequently played by ladies.

This leads to the second false assumption: that the flute was only played by wealthy male amateurs. One of the best-known flute players from eighteenth-century Scotland, Susanna Montgomery, Lady Eglinton, received a flute as a gift from John Clerk of Penicuik when he was pursuing her prior to her marriage in 1709—well before 1725. Lady Eglinton, as well as Rachel Baillie, Lady Gairlies, and other flute-playing women included in James Freebairn’s poem, undermine the assumption that the flute was the exclusive province of men. That the only contemporary English-language prohibition against ladies playing wind instruments is John Essex’s conduct book, suggests that the greater currency
of the notion that it was unseemly for ladies to do so is a later concept, resulting from an
over-reliance on nineteenth-century propriety. Additionally, there is evidence of the flute
having been played by lower class male amateurs as well as professional musicians.

The assumption that the flute was not nearly as popular as the violin/fiddle or the
bagpipes is difficult to dispense with entirely, as far more information survives regarding
the other two instruments. However, from the flute’s inclusion on title pages of music
published in Scotland and by Scottish composers, from its appearances on concert
programmes and from flute repertoire in private music libraries and music society
catalogues, from the many manuscripts for flute, and by the number of people known to
have played it, it is clear that the flute was extremely popular in eighteenth-century
Scotland.

The idea that the flute was only a concert instrument and had no place in traditional
music comes directly from the assumption that it was only played by rich men. Players
such as Robert Tannahill and William Nicholson played Scottish traditional music on the
flute. Many publications of traditional Scottish music included special arrangements for
the flute, demonstrating that it was common for it to be played in this repertoire.

Flute playing was widespread across Scotland, with the bulk of flute-related
activities happening around the urban centres of Edinburgh, Glasgow, and Aberdeen, in
that order of prominence. Notably the only evidence of flute playing from the Dumfries
and Galloway area comes in the form of the pedlar-poet William Nicholson.

Repertoire known in Scotland in the eighteenth century was predominantly Italian,
Scottish, and German, with surprisingly little French music. This was possibly a reflection
of music made popular through concerts sponsored by the Edinburgh and Aberdeen
Musical Societies, and music learned in continental Europe during the Grand Tour, as well
as a growing interest in presenting Scottish music with contemporary harmonies and
ornaments. Another possible explanation of the dearth of French repertoire is the presence of the German royal family. Important discoveries in flute repertoire are the instances of flute players playing piobaireachd, both those composed for bagpipes and subsequently arranged for flute, as well as those specifically composed for flute or violin.

Most flutes in Scotland were purchased in London, though there is evidence of two flute makers active in Scotland: James Lily and Alexander Urquhart, both dating from early in the eighteenth century. Lily’s instruments were not well-regarded by at least one flute player, but Urquhart’s surviving flute is typical of instruments from early in the period. He was one of the three contributors to *Aria di Camera*, and most likely the author responsible for the flute instructions at the beginning of the book, which were the first to be published in English, a major contribution to flute playing in Britain in the eighteenth century.

Other important figures in Scottish flute playing were John Gunn, whose writings on the flute highlight performance practice issues of the latter part of the eighteenth century; William McGibbon, who composed the first sonatas for the flute published in Scotland; and James Oswald, whose many publications enhanced the flute’s repertoire. John Reid and Susanna Montgomery were significant characters in the history of flute players in Scotland, but they were far from the only ones. The range of other more minor characters in Scottish flute history, such as the physician Jonathan Troup, the 3rd Duke of Gordon, Lord Robert Kerr, William Tytler himself, and the craftsman and poet Robert Tannahill show that the flute was popular across social classes and economic boundaries.

The picture that emerges of the flute’s role in musical life in eighteenth-century Scotland is that it was significant and popular. The tendency to ignore the flute in favour of the fiddle or the bagpipes when studying Scottish music has led to scholarly neglect. The information presented in this thesis brings new light to the history of the flute in
Scotland, and in broader eighteenth-century culture. The possible connections highlighted between flute players and bagpipers require further research, as does the flute’s role in Scotland prior to the eighteenth century. While McGibbon’s sonatas have now been rescued from obscurity and his reputation can now be reconsidered, the same needs to happen for other Scottish composers for flute such as John Reid, Charles McLean, Alexander Munro, and James Oswald. Most significantly, the flute’s role in eighteenth-century Scottish musical life has been shown to have been prominent, and much more expansive than previously thought.

---

1 The continuing research into the unique bell-ended flute depicted on the ceiling at Crathes Castle should reveal a great deal about the early history of the flute in Scotland.
Appendix A: Images

Figure 12: Satyr with a flute, fountain, Linlithgow Palace, Author’s photo

Figure 13: Ceiling of the Muses’ Chamber, Crathes Castle, The National Trust for Scotland
Figure 14: Reconstructed Crathes Castle Flute, Photo by Rod Cameron

Figure 15: Pages one and two of Alexander Bruce’s manuscript, Private Collection of Lord Balfour of Burleigh
Figure 16: Hotteterre’s fingering chart, 1707

Figure 17: Cosmo, 3rd Duke of Gordon, by Philippe Mercier
Figure 18: Sir Gilbert Elliot of Minto by William Aikman
Figure 19: Lieutenant John Reid, unknown artist
Figure 21: Medallion of John Reid, by James Tassie, Hunterian Museum, University of Glasgow
Figure 22: General John Reid, unknown artist

Figure 23: General John Reid, Kirby’s Wonderful and Eccentric Museum
Figure 24: William Tytler, by John Jones after Henry Raeburn

Figure 25: Susanna, Lady Eglinton, by William Aikman
Figure 26: Robert Tannahill
Figure 27: “The Green Woods of Trough”, MS Robertson 1, University of Glasgow Special Collections

Figure 28: Flute possibly having belonged to William Nicholson, Stewarty Museum, Kirkcudbright
Figure 29: Flute player from The Caledonian Pocket Companion, Wighton Heritage Centre, Dundee Central Library
Figure 30: *Flute by Urquhart*, University of Edinburgh, Reid Collection

Figure 31: “Eiserne Zeit” by Mathaeus Merian, private collection of Martin Wenner
Bibliography

Manuscript sources


Colquhon, F. “Manuscript Book for Flute.” 1752. GB-Gm M18106.

“Concerto for Transverse Flute, Two Violins, and Basso Continuo.” n.d. GB-Enas GD40/15/55.

“Correspondence of James, 1st Duke of Montrose: Anonymous Letter.” April 25, 1702. GB-Enas GD220/5/24A.


Grant, Humphrey, A. Alexander, and James Grant. “Grant of Grant Correspondence.” 1729 1726. GB-Enas GD248/47/2.


“Inventory of Captain Dalrymple’s Furniture.” May 24, 1744. GB-Enas GD113/3/990.


“Letter to Sir Gilbert Elliott of Minto.” June 11, 1736. GB-En MS 11003.


“Manuscript Book for a Wind Instrument.” 1750s–1780s. GB-En MS 3327/Inglis 12.

“Manuscript copy of: A Complete Pocket Book for the German Flute Containing Necessary directions And Remarks on that Instrument To which is added an agreeable variety of Celebrated Marches, Airs, Duets, and Songs, Judiciously Transposed And Collected from the favourite & most admired Authors by Goldie followed by Scottish tunes.” n.d. GB-Gm 788.51521 GOL (2).

“Manuscript for Wind Instruments.” 1760s. GB-En Adv. MS. 5.2.20.


Purser, John, and Ailsa Tanner. “Correspondence on Scottish Recorder Music.”” 1980s. Courtesy of John Purser.


http://www.ed.ac.uk/polopoly_fs/1.100545!/fileManager/ERossfacsimiles.pdf.


“A Scots Tune; ’Twas within a Forlong Etc.; Unnamed Tune; A Scotch Tune; A Scotch Tune by Mr Finger; Unnamed Tune.” 1690s–1700s. GB-Lbl Add. MSS 34204.

Small, Andrew. “Manuscript of Scottish Tunes for the Flute.” Carrickfergus, 1735. GB-En MS21738.


“Tunes for a Flute in Manuscript.” 1720s. Montagu Music Collection 353.


“Works Including Alessandro Scarlatti, Four Quartets with Continuo, Bound with Primo and Basso Parts to William McGibbon’s 1729 Sonatas for Two German Flutes or Two Violins and a Bass.” n.d. US-Wc M.317.M15 op. 1 Primo & Basso.


Books


A Scottish gentleman. Edina’s Glory, or the Fair Assembly, a Poem in Defense of Musick, Wit and Gallantry, as It Prevails ’mongst the Polite in Their Weekly Sessions, Holden at the Metropolis of Scotland. Alexander Davidson, 1723.


*D The Compleat Tutor for the German Flute Containing the Easiest & Most Modern Methods for Learners to Play. To Which Is Added a Favorite Collection of Song Tunes, Minuets, Marches, Duets, &c. Also The Method of Double Tonguing, and a Concise Scale & Description of a New Invented German Flute with Additional Keys Made by T. Cahusac, such as Play’d on by the Two Celebrated Masters, Tacet and Florio. London: T. Cahusac, n.d.*


James, W. N. *A Word or Two on the Flute*. Edinburgh: Charles Smith and Company, 1826.


Jones, Nathaniel. *Jones’s Directory: or Useful Pocket Companion: Containing an Alphabetical List of the Names and Places of Abode of the Merchants, Manufacturers, Traders and Shopkeepers, in and about the City of Glasgow*. Glasgow: John Mennons, 1787.


**Doctoral theses**


**Journal articles**


“How to Take Care of a Violin.” *The Girl’s Own Paper*, February 1887.


Catalogues and Indexes


Electronic sources


Musical Sources


Apollo's Collection Being Six Sonatas or Duets for Two German Flutes or Two Violins. London: James Oswald, 1725.

Apollo’s Collection, Being XII Duettos for Two German Flutes or Two Violins. London: James Oswald, 1750.


———. VI Sonate per La Traversiera, O German Flute, Con Basso per Violone O Cembalo. Opera seconda. London: Cooke, 1728.


Calliope, or English Harmony, a Collection of the Most Celebrated English and Scots Songs, Neatly Engrav’d and Embelish’d with Designs Adapted to the Subject of Each Song Taken from the Compositions of the Best Masters, in the Most Correct Manner with the Thorough Bass and Transpositions for the Flute (proper for All Teachers, Scholars, and Lovers of Musick) Printed on a Fine Paper, on Each Side Which Renders the Undertaking More Compleat than Any Thing of the Kind Ever Publish’d. London: H. Roberts, 1739.


———. Thirty New Strathspey Reels for the Violin or Harpsichord. Banff: James Inlach, 1783.


Craig, Adam. A Collection of the Choicest Scots Tunes Adapted for the Harpsichord or Spinnet and within the Compass of the Voice Violin and Violoncello. Edinburgh, 1730.


Deliciae Musicae: Being a Collection of the Newest and Best Songs. London: Playford, 1696.


———. Twenty Minuets and Sixteen Reels or Country Dances for the Violin, Harpsichord, or German Flute. Edinburgh, 1773.

Eccles, John. A Collection of Songs for One Two and Three Voices Together with Such Symphonys as for Violins or Flutes As Were by the Author Design’d for Any of Them; and a Thorough-Bass to Each Song Figur’d for an Organ Harpsichord or Theorbo-Lute. London: Walsh, 1704.


Figlio, Dottel. *Six Divertimenti’s or Solo’s for a German Flute or Violin & Violoncello with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord*. London: James Oswald, n.d.


Maklean, Charles. *Twelve Solo’s or Sonata’s for a Violin and Violoncello with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord*. Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1737.


———. *A Collection of Scots Tunes, Some with Variations for a Violin, Hautboy, or German Flute*. Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1746.

———. *A Collection of Scots Tunes, Some with Variations for a Violin, Hautboy, or German Flute*. Edinburgh: Robert Bremner, 1755.

———. *A Collection of Scots Tunes Some with Variations for a Violin Hautboy or German Flute with a Bass for a Violincello or Harpsichord*. Edinburgh: Robert Bremner, 1759.


———. *Six Sonatas for Two German Flutes, or Two Violins, and a Bass*. Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1729.

———. *Six Sonatas for Two German Flutes, or Two Violins and a Bass*. Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1734.

———. *Six Sonatas for Two German Flutes or Two Violins, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord*. London: David Rutherford, n.d.

———. *Six Sonatas or Solos for a German Flute or Violin and a Bass*. Edinburgh: Richard Cooper, 1740.

———. *Sonata for Two Violins (or Flutes), Cello, and Harpsichord (or Piano) in B Minor*. Edited by Kenneth Elliott. Glasgow: Scottish Music Centre, n.d.


Six Solos for a German Flute and Violoncello, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord, Book the Second. London: James Oswald, 1772.

Six Solos for a German Flute or Violin, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord. London, n.d.


Reid, John. A Second Sett of Six Solos for a German Flute or Violin, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord. London: James Oswald, 1762.

Six Solos for a German Flute, Hautboy or Violin, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord. 2nd edn. London: Wright, 1796.

Six Solos for a German Flute, Hautboy, or Violin, with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord. London: James Oswald, 1756.


Urbani, Pietro. A Favorite Selection of Scots Tunes Properly Arranged as Duettos for Two German Flutes or Two Violins. Edinburgh: Urbani and Liston, 1798.

Valentine, Robert. Six Sonatas for Two Recorders, Opus 5. Amsterdam, 1716.


Newspapers


Recordings


Melville, Alison. *She’s Sweetest When She’s Naked*. Compact disc. EMCCD, 2005.


