

Coyer, Megan Joann (2010) *The Ettrick Shepherd and the Modern Pythagorean: science and imagination in romantic Scotland*. PhD thesis.

<https://theses.gla.ac.uk/2097/>

Copyright and moral rights for this work are retained by the author

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge

This work cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the author

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given

Enlighten: Theses

<https://theses.gla.ac.uk/>
research-enlighten@glasgow.ac.uk

**The Ettrick Shepherd and the Modern Pythagorean: Science and Imagination in
Romantic Scotland**

Megan Joann Coyer

**Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of
Philosophy**

**Department of Scottish Literature
Faculty of Arts
University of Glasgow
August 2010**

Table of Contents

Abstract	i
Acknowledgments	iii
Introduction	1
Section 1: Journeys of the Embodied Soul	11
Chapter 1: Fairy Flights and Ugly Bards	14
Chapter 2: The Dreaming Shepherd and <i>The Pilgrims of the Sun</i>	38
Section 2: The Significant Flesh	74
Chapter 3: Phenomenology and Phrenology: 'A Modern Pythagorean' in <i>Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine</i>	76
Chapter 4: Dreaming, Drunkenness, and Damnation: The Influence of Hogg's <i>Confessions</i>	122
Section 3: Narratives of Science and Superstition	153
Chapter 5: Disembodied Souls and Exemplary Narratives	156
Chapter 6: A Psychological Curiosity	185
Epilogue: Imagination and Science	205
General Bibliography	214
Manuscript Bibliography	237
Chronological Bibliography of Periodicals and Annuals	See Inserted CD

Abstract

This thesis focuses on predisciplinary dialogue in the Romantic periodical press, and in particular, on the influence of medical thinking and the science of the mind on the writing of James Hogg (1770-1835).

The applicability of twentieth-century psychology to Hogg's masterpiece, *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1824), is largely responsible for Hogg's entrance into the modern world canon, and the tension between rational scientific and traditional supernatural explanations in Hogg's corpus is now a critical commonplace. However, critics have been hesitant to recognise Hogg's voice in the proto-psychological polemics of his era. The ongoing publication of the Stirling/South Carolina Research edition of the *Collected Works of James Hogg* has catalysed revisionist scholarship in Hogg studies and is leading to a growing recognition of his pervasive connections within the diverse intellectual culture of the era.

This thesis examines his connections to the little-known Glaswegian surgeon and writer, Robert Macnish (1802-1837). Like Hogg, Macnish was an active contributor of short prose fiction and poetry to the Romantic periodical press, and at the same time, he worked as a practicing surgeon in Glasgow, publishing three popular medical texts: *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), and *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836). These texts engage with popular debates in the periodical press, including the reciprocal relationship between the mind and body, particularly regarding altered-states of consciousness, as well as methodologies in the science of the mind. Macnish's literary contributions to *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* and *Fraser's Magazine for Town and Country* under his pseudonym, 'A Modern Pythagorean', deal with similar themes, and by examining Hogg's literary and biographical connections to Macnish, a clearer picture of Hogg's engagement with medical thinking and the science of the mind is created.

Macnish's dedication of a dream-poem to 'The Ettrick Shepherd' and the utilisation of an extract from Hogg's poem *The Pilgrims of the Sun* (1815) as a headpiece in *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830) are the starting points for the first section, while Karl Miller's assertion in *Cockburn's Millennium* (1975) that Hogg's *Confessions* may have influenced Macnish's Blackwoodian prose fiction is examined in the second section. The final section questions why Macnish chose to use 'James Hogg' as his *nom de guerre* for his short prose tale, 'A Psychological Curiosity', published in *The Scottish Annual* (1836), and examines Miller's

assertion that Macnish's Blackwoodian tale, 'The Metempsychosis' (1826), may have influenced Hogg's tales, 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' (1831) and 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' (1830), both published in *Fraser's*.

It is concluded that Hogg and Macnish shared numerous preoccupations and influenced one another's writings over the course of many years. The connection between moral virtue and health pervades both authors' corpuses, as the relationship between cause and effect is literalised through physically and therefore mentally transformational experiences. The engagement of both authors with the debate surrounding the explained supernatural has a profound impact on their writings, and both are preoccupied with the methodologies of the science of the mind, including the metaphysics of the common sense philosophers and the 'bump-reading' of the phrenologists. By the end of his career, Macnish fully ascribed to the explanatory power of phrenology. In contrast, Hogg remains resistant to place full faith in modern conceptualisations of natural law, while also forwarding an embodied theory of the imagination, the mind, and the soul. For Hogg, one comes closest to a divine understanding of the natural world through aesthetic experience and imaginative belief, which ready the mind and body for the joys of the world to come. Finally, Hogg, as an autodidactic peasant-poet, was himself an object of study in the science of the mind, but an examination of the relationship of his life and writing to that of Macnish reveals that he was both 'a psychological curiosity' and psychologically curious.

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank the trustees of the National Library of Scotland and the Alexander Turnbull Library, Wellington, and Special Collections at the Universities of Glasgow and Edinburgh for allowing me to quote from and cite manuscripts held in their collections. I am also grateful to Cambridge Scholars Publishing and Pickering & Chatto for allowing me to reproduce material published in the chapters I contributed to *The Apothecary's Chest: Magic, Art & Medication*, ed. by Konstantina Georganta, Fabienne Collignon, and Anne-Marie Millim (2009) and *Liberating Medicine, 1720-1835*, ed. by Tristanne Connolly and Steve Clark (2009).

This thesis would not have been possible without the funding I received from the Overseas Research Scheme and the Faculty of Arts at the University of Glasgow, and I would also like to thank the British Association for Romantic Studies for funding a period of my research at the National Library of Scotland through the Stephen Copley Postgraduate Research Award.

The Department of Scottish Literature has been my home away from home for nearly five years and has provided an incredibly supportive environment. In particular, my supervisors, Dr. Kirsteen McCue and Dr. Gerard Carruthers, have provided invaluable advice and guidance, as well as continual inspiration. I would also like to thank Mrs. Joyce Dietz for all her kind assistance. To those in the postgraduate research room, you all made it seem so much easier!

Finally, I would like to thank my family, and in particular my parents, Ronald and Rebecca Coyer, for their constant love and support. Any success of mine is really a success of yours.

Introduction

When I was a youth, I was engaged for many years in herding a large parcel of lambs, whose bleating brought the whole Sturdies of the neighbourhood to them, with which I was everlastingly plagued; but, as I was frequently weaving stockings, I fell upon the following plan: I caught every sturdied sheep that I could lay my hands on, and probed them up through the brain and nostrils with one of my wires, when I beheld with no small degree of pleasure, that, by this simple operation alone, I cured many a sheep to different owners; all which projects I kept to myself, having no authority to try my skill on any of them; and it was several years before I failed in one instance.¹

James Hogg, 'The Ettrick Shepherd', was undoubtedly a man of diverse literary talents, but in this passage, taken from *The Shepherd's Guide: Being a Practical Treatise on the Diseases of Sheep* (1807), he reveals his abilities as a veterinary brain surgeon – curing sheep of sturdy, also known as hydrocephalus or water on the brain, by draining excess fluid with his knitting needle. Hogg's treatise on sheep gained the attention of the Edinburgh physician, Dr. Andrew Duncan, jun. (1773-1832), through his involvement in the Highland Society of Scotland. The treatise was originally submitted to the Society in 1804 and was selected along with thirteen other entries to be published in the *Prize Essays and Transactions of the Highland Society of Scotland*.² Prior to its subsequent independent publication in London and Edinburgh in 1807, Duncan provided the Shepherd with more professional equipment for dealing with sturdy. Hogg explains that he would typically use 'an awl, or large corking pin' to pierce the skull in cases where the water 'concentrates in the very middle of the brain' or 'in the hinder parts'. However,

since writing the above, the author hath received a small silver trocar from Dr. Duncan, jun. Edinburgh, invented by him, for the purpose of draining off the fluid, in whatever part of the skull situated, and has little doubt of its final success.³

Duncan's father, Dr. Andrew Duncan, senior (1744-1828), was a member of the Edinburgh debating club, the Forum, in 1812-1813, when Hogg was the secretary, and Hogg's interest in abnormal psychology is often dated to this period.⁴ Karl Miller writes in *The Electric Shepherd: A Likeness of James Hogg* (2003):

¹ James Hogg, *The Shepherd's Guide: Being A Practical Treatise on the Diseases of Sheep, their Causes, and the Best Means of Preventing Them; with Observations on the Most Suitable Farm-Stocking for the Various Climates of this Country* (Edinburgh: Constable; London: Murray, 1807), pp. 59-60.

² Gillian Hughes, *James Hogg: A Life* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 61-62.

³ *The Shepherd's Guide*, pp. 55-57.

⁴ P. D. Garside, 'Introduction', in James Hogg, *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002), pp. xi-xcix, (p. liii).

The Forum did well, in 1812, to donate £20 to the Lunatic Asylum, which was about to replace the old City Bedlam, under the guidance of Dr. Andrew Duncan, whom Hogg met through the Forum, and who did much to humanise the treatment of the mentally ill. Madness was thereafter to be a concern of Hogg's writings.⁵

Allan Beveridge similarly references Hogg's acquaintance with Duncan in his articles on the psychopathology of Robert Wringhim and notes that Hogg's portrayal of Wringhim's mental state 'was far in advance of medical accounts' of insanity.⁶ While Beveridge's research is useful in its establishment that 'neither the papers of Duncan nor the archives of the Edinburgh Asylum make any mention of Hogg', his retrospective psychiatric diagnosis of Robert Wringhim adds little to our literary understanding of Hogg's masterpiece and rather serves to buttress the authority of current psychiatric medicine.⁷ The idea that Hogg was ahead of his time in his depiction of insanity is intriguing, but Beveridge's appraisal of the 'undeveloped medical thinking of the time' is unsubstantiated.⁸

The applicability of twentieth-century psychology to *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1824) is largely responsible for Hogg's entrance into the modern world canon. After over a century of mainstream critical neglect, André Gide, in his introduction to the pivotal Cresset edition (London, 1947), describes Robert Wringhim's devilish doppelgänger as 'the exteriorized development of our own desires, of our pride, of our most secret thoughts' and argues that 'except in the last pages', the fantastic aspects of *Confessions* are 'always psychologically explicable, without having recourse to the supernatural'.⁹ In more recent scholarship, the unaccountability of Robert Wringhim's experience by either rational scientific or traditional supernatural explanations is accepted as one of the most powerful aspects of Hogg's masterpiece, and critics have recognised that this technique pervades Hogg's corpus as a whole. Douglas Gifford, Douglas Mack, David Groves, Susan Manning, Karl Miller, and Ian Duncan, among others, have produced convincing readings of this technique in the context of Enlightenment philosophy, Calvinist theology, Gothic and Romantic literary conventions, psychoanalytical theory, and nationalist fiction.¹⁰

⁵ Karl Miller, *Electric Shepherd: A Likeness of James Hogg* (London: Faber and Faber, 2003), p. 89.

⁶ Allan Beveridge, 'The Confessions of a Justified Sinner and the Psychopathology of the Double', *Psychiatric Bulletin* 15 (1991), 344-45; 'James Hogg and Abnormal Psychology: Some Background Notes', *SHW*, 2 (1991), 91-94, (p. 93).

⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 92.

⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 91.

⁹ André Gide, 'Introduction', in James Hogg, *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (London: Cresset Press, 1947), pp. ix-xvi, (p. xv).

¹⁰ Douglas Gifford, 'The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner (1824)', in James Hogg

However, critics remain hesitant to recognise Hogg's voice in the proto-psychological polemics of his own time. Ian Duncan reads the materialist tropes in Hogg's corpus as ideologically and institutionally non-specific and argues that he 'uses the heat rather than light generated by the current scientific ferment for his own literary purpose of a revisionary disturbance of the genres of national fiction'.¹¹ The intricate connections between literature and science during this period question such a claim. These connections are increasingly gaining critical recognition with regard to the canonical English Romantics, and the centrality of Edinburgh to eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century philosophical and medical discourse in Britain suggests the fruitfulness of such studies in the context of our emerging understanding of Scottish Romanticism.¹²

In their introduction to *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism* (2001), Ian Duncan, Leith Davis, and Janet Sorenson work towards a definition of Scottish Romanticism as a false departure from the ideology of the Scottish Enlightenment, and Hume's sceptical philosophy and natural history, rather than Coleridge's eventual German Idealism, are seen as persistent influences on aesthetic culture.¹³ Thus, in contrast to the transcendental imagination traditionally associated with English Romanticism, the Scottish Romantic imagination remains grounded in associationist psychology and empiricist philosophy.¹⁴ Within this critical framework Hogg's corpus is examined as a force of resistance against the 'antiquarian grand narrative of sympathy, collection, analysis, and display' associated with Sir Walter Scott, and

(Edinburgh: The Ramsay Head Press, 1976), pp. 138-84; Douglas Mack, "'We too Might Have a Story to Tell': Competing Narratives and Imperial Power", in *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006), pp. 43-87; David Groves, 'Confessions of an Artist', in *James Hogg: The Growth of a Writer* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1988), pp. 115-32; Susan Manning, 'The Pursuit of the Double', in *The Puritan-Provincial Vision: Scottish and American Literature in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), pp. 70-105; Karl Miller, 'Flying Scotsmen', in *Doubles: Studies in Literary History* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985; paperback edn 1987), pp. 1-20; Ian Duncan, 'The Upright Corpse', in *Scott's Shadow: The Novel in Romantic Edinburgh* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007), pp. 183-214; Murray Pittock, 'Hogg, Maturin, and the Gothic National Tale', in *Scottish and Irish Romanticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), pp. 211-34.

¹¹ *Scott's Shadow*, p. 210.

¹² For example, see Alan Richardson, *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001); James Robert Allard, *Romanticism, Medicine, and the Poet's Body* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007); Noel Jackson, *Science and Sensation in Romantic Poetry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008); Michelle Faubert's recent, *Rhyming Reason: The Poetry of Romantic-Era Psychologists* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009), focuses on the roots of the modern discipline of psychology in Scottish Enlightenment thought and examines the role of Romantic-era psychologists' poetry in the systemisation of subjectivity. However, despite discussing several Scottish psychologists and poets, Faubert does not bring her study into dialogue with the emerging critical understanding of Scottish Romanticism.

¹³ Ian Duncan, with Leith Davis and Janet Sorenson, 'Introduction', in *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, ed. by Leith Davis, Ian Duncan, and Janet Sorensen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), pp. 1-19.

¹⁴ See particularly, Cairns Craig, 'Coleridge, Hume, and the Chains of the Romantic Imagination', in *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, pp. 20-37.

Hogg's familial knowledge of the ballads, songs, and supernatural tales of traditional oral culture is often cited as evidence for his living link with the culture that Enlightenment ideology conceptualised as surpassed by present literacy, rationality, and urbanity.¹⁵ For example, Ian Duncan, in his analysis of the 'upright corpse' in Hogg's texts, argues that Hogg disrupts the linear temporality of stage-wise progress that might presume the secure burial of the past and reads the image of the soulless body rising from the deathbed or the grave as representing the failed project of 'romance revival'.¹⁶ Penny Fielding applies a similar logic to Hogg's use of dreaming in the tale 'Cousin Mattie' and argues that the tale reveals that the 'subjective scale of temporality is always something that disrupts the progressive logic of history', and thus '[t]he modern mind is one that recognises itself not as the teleological product of progress, but as a space haunted by temporal complexities that lay imaginary forms of past, present and future over each other'.¹⁷

Both Duncan and Fielding base their arguments upon Hogg's use of contemporary scientific subject matter – anatomical bodies, resurrection men, and dreams – but, while providing useful scientific and philosophical contextualisation, read the texts primarily through the lens of psychoanalytical criticism. In contrast, Valentina Bold focuses exclusively upon the scientific subject matter in Hogg's texts in her article on 'The Magic Lantern: Hogg and Science', arguing that '[s]cience provided Hogg with a point of contact between factual experiences and the fantastic'.¹⁸ Her establishment of Hogg's frequent and accurate utilisation of scientific subject matter and his general fascination with the rational explanations of natural magic is convincing but also points towards the need for further enquiry, and similarly, Peter Garside's introduction to the Stirling/South Carolina edition of *Confessions* opens up possible connections with phrenology and, more generally, medical thinking at this time.¹⁹ Helen Sutherland's recent examination of Hogg's engagement with Enlightenment empiricism reveals the centrality of 'the relationship of body to mind' in Hogg's work and fruitfully compares this engagement to Sir Charles Bell's discovery of the separate sensory and motor nerves in the spinal cord and the physiognomy of Sir David Wilkie's portraits.²⁰ In particular, the role of the physical body in producing mental states is shown to be a shared preoccupation

¹⁵ Murray Pittock, *Scottish and Irish Romanticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), p. 225.

¹⁶ 'The Upright Corpse', in *Scott's Shadow*, pp. 183-214.

¹⁷ Penny Fielding, 'Burial Letters: Death and Dreaming in Hogg's 'Cousin Mattie'', *SHW*, 16 (2005), 5-19, (p. 16, p. 17).

¹⁸ Valentina Bold, 'The Magic Lantern: Hogg and Science', *SHW*, 7 (1996), 5-17, (p. 16).

¹⁹ Garside, 'Introduction', pp. 1-liv.

²⁰ Helen Sutherland, 'James Hogg: A Shepherd's Role in the Scottish Enlightenment', *SHW*, 19 (2008), 5-20, (p. 12).

of these diverse thinkers, and Sutherland goes so far as to speculate on the possibility that Bell may have been in some way influenced by Hogg's portrayal of Gil-Martin's 'cameleon art' in the *Confessions*. At the very least, such ideas were in the ether.

The ongoing publication of the Stirling/South Carolina Research edition of the *Collected Works of James Hogg* has catalysed revisionist scholarship in Hogg studies and is leading to a growing recognition of his pervasive connections within the diverse intellectual culture of the era. The publication of a recent critical biography and the *Collected Letters of James Hogg*, as well as the first collection of scholarly essays devoted exclusively to Hogg further hallmark this new critical attention.²¹ In his groundbreaking work on Scottish Romanticism, Ian Duncan references 'Hogg's connection with Robert Macnish, author and phrenologist' as examined by Karl Miller in *Cockburn's Millennium* (1975), to evidence that '[t]he Ettrick Shepherd turns out to be imaginatively more attuned to the intellectual currents of advanced modernity, including radical materialism, than any contemporary Scots author'.²² Miller's study of Robert Macnish (1802-1837) and Hogg is part of his overall argument, which is continued in *Doubles: Studies in Literary History* (1985), for the wide ranging and enduring human experience of the double life, and within this expansive context, his examination of the relationship between the writing of Hogg and Macnish is necessarily limited in its scope.

Macnish is a fruitful figure through which to examine the question: how is Hogg's writing related to the concurrent developments in medical thinking and the science of the mind? The current thesis did not begin with Macnish as a starting point, but rather came to him as a central figure through an examination of the popular debates on medicine and the science of the mind in the periodical press of the Romantic period. A survey of the *Quarterly Review*, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, *Fraser's Magazine for Town and Country*, and the *Phrenological Journal and Miscellany*, among others, revealed the threads of scientific dialogue to which Hogg presumably would have been exposed. In the periodicals examined, the popular debate on the physiological causes of the various phenomena of altered-states of consciousness, and, more generally, the reciprocal relationship between the mind and body, receives consistent coverage, and the appropriate methodological approach to study the illusive mind of the other is examined both in relation to the metaphysics of the common sense philosophers and the 'bump-reading' of the phrenologists. Like Hogg, Macnish was an active

²¹ *James Hogg: A Life; The Collected Letters of James Hogg*, ed. by Gillian Hughes, 3 vols (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004-2008); *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author*, ed. by Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (Surrey: Ashgate, 2009).

²² *Scott's Shadow*, p. 338, p. 210.

contributor of short prose fiction and poetry to the Romantic periodical press, and at the same time, he worked as a practicing surgeon in Glasgow, publishing three popular medical texts: *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), and *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836). These texts engage with the popular debates in the periodical press, and Macnish's literary contributions to *Blackwood's* and *Fraser's* under his pseudonym, 'A Modern Pythagorean', deal with similar themes. As a surgeon and writer, Macnish's corpus is undoubtedly linked to concurrent developments in medical thinking, and his popular medical texts are also studies in the science of the mind. Therefore, any points of connection between Hogg and Macnish's writing should help us work towards possible answers to the above question. It is particularly fruitful to examine Hogg and Macnish's poetry and prose fiction as it appeared embedded together in the complex web of the periodical press, and Mark Parker's call to examine periodicals, not as archival sources from which 'to draw evidence to use in other arguments', but rather as complex yet integral texts, worthy of independent examination, is embraced.²³

The current thesis gains its central structure from three major points of inter-connectivity between Hogg and Macnish that point towards a dual line of influence between the two authors throughout their lifetimes. Macnish's dedication of a dream-poem to 'The Ettrick Shepherd' and the utilisation of an extract from Hogg's poem *The Pilgrims of the Sun* (1815) as a headpiece in *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830) are the starting points for the first section, while Karl Miller's assertion that Hogg's *Confessions* may have influenced Macnish's Blackwoodian prose fiction is examined in the second section. The final section questions why Macnish chose to use 'James Hogg' as his *nom de guerre* for his short prose tale, 'A Psychological Curiosity', published in *The Scottish Annual* (1836), and Miller's assertion that Macnish's Blackwoodian tale, 'The Metempsychosis' (1826), may have influenced Hogg's tales, 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' (1831) and 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' (1830), both published in *Fraser's*, is also examined in this section. The structure is loosely chronological, but at some points, chronology is inverted in order to show potential influences and to provide a fresh reading of Hogg's texts through the lenses of his shared preoccupations with Macnish. The overall chronological structure, however, allows for the examination of the changing relationship between Macnish and Hogg through the course of their lives and in particular, as Macnish becomes increasingly devoted to phrenology.

²³ Mark Parker, *Literary Magazines and British Romanticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), p. 3.

The at times conflicting values of imagination and science for these two authors are a central concern of the thesis. In this context imagination is defined within the framework of associationist psychology and empiricist philosophy, and in particular through the philosophy of Dugald Stewart (1753-1828), ‘the most influential interpreter of Enlightenment thought for the new generation’.²⁴ In contrasting the powers of ‘Conception’ versus ‘Imagination’ in the first volume of his *Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind* (1792), Stewart writes,

The province of the former is to present us with an exact transcript of what we have formerly felt and perceived: that of the latter, to make a selection of qualities and circumstances, from a variety of different objects, and by combining and disposing these to form a new creation of its own.²⁵

While Hogg and Macnish may deviate from this definition at certain points, it is a useful basis from which to judge their variations. According to Stewart, the illusory creations of the imagination are kept in check by proper attention to the realities of external nature, and the imaginative soaring of dreaming and other similar altered-states of consciousness is in part due to the absence of the corrective perception of external reality. Both Macnish and Hogg explore the imaginative soaring of altered-states in their poetry and prose fiction, but, at the same time, they were also keen to explore the extent to which the powers of empirical science could be deployed in understanding the workings of the human mind. These pursuits were not necessarily opposed, as literature played a vital role in the science of the mind at this time. In particular, narratives of altered-states of consciousness were avidly collected and analysed as data in the science of the mind. Further, the signs of the corporeal body were read as potentially revealing the significance of the human mind, and perhaps the most extreme product of this fascination with the relationship of body to mind was phrenology – the science of reading mental character from the protrusions of the skull.

In examining the ideology and methodology of the phrenologists, Michel Foucault’s theory of the medical gaze, as delineated in *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception* (1963), provides a useful analytical framework. According to Foucault, in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, medical practitioners worked to develop techniques by which to read the signs of disease from the surface of the corporeal body. Similarly, the phrenologists worked to read the signs of the human mind from the surface of

²⁴ *Scott’s Shadow*, p. 26.

²⁵ Dugald Stewart, *Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind*, 3 vols (London: Strahan; Cadell; Edinburgh: Creech, 1792-1827), I, p. 475.

the skull, but rather than correlating these signs with the anatomical body through ‘*projective pathological anatomy*’, these signs were correlated with the innate character of the individual’s mind – an act which brought the phrenologists into the domain of literary practice.²⁶ In order to establish innate character, the phrenologists appealed to what may be termed ‘narrative evidence’, which consisted of testimonials from the subject or persons familiar with their character, letters and diaries of the subject, and in the case of literary men, the style and content of their literary productions. The mind was read through the signs of the body, but equally so, the body was read through the signs of the mind. However, the phrenologists continually insisted that their methodology represented the first truly empirical science of the mind. External reality – the bumps on the skull – corrected any imaginative deviations from objective truth.

The major point of conflict between science and imagination for Macnish and Hogg lies not in subject matter nor even necessarily in methodology, but rather in the degree to which one insists upon the ultimate explanatory power of science. Retrospective diagnosis is certainly not unique to the twentieth-century. In his treatise on sheep, after describing the causes and symptoms of the ‘head-ill’, Hogg writes:

But on the mountains around Cairn-Gorm and Lochavin, its attacks are so visible on those sheep that feed on the tops of the hills, that the natives, in their usual superstitious way, ascribe it to a praeternatural and very singular cause. They say, that a most deformed little monster inhabits the very tops of these mountains, whom they call *Phaam*: that it is very seldom seen; but whenever it is seen, it is early on the morning, immediately after the break of day; that his head is larger than his whole body; that his intents are evil and dangerous; that he is no earthly creature; and if any living man, or animal, come near the place where he has been, before the sun shine upon it, the head of that man, or animal, will immediately swell, and bring on its death in great pain.²⁷

He then suggests that eating a poisonous herb, which grows on the mountains, probably causes the ‘head-ill’. Rational and superstitious explanations are presented, and in this case he shows an explanatory preference for the rational explanation, most probably because he is writing a practical treatise. Critics have aptly noted Hogg’s varied responses to Enlightenment rationalism – his placement of the natural and the supernatural in direct competition in the duel between Friar Bacon and Michael Scott on Aikwood tower in *The Three Perils of Man* (1822), his complete rationalisation of the supernatural in the ending of *The Brownie of*

²⁶ Michel Foucault, *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception*, trans. by A.M. Sheridan (London: Routledge, 1989; repr. 2003), p. 200.

²⁷ *The Shepherd’s Guide*, p. 114-15.

Bodsbeck (1818), and the opacity of both natural and supernatural explanations in the *Confessions*.²⁸ However, these responses have yet to receive sufficient literary and scientific contextualisation. At this time the ‘explained supernatural’ was an active subject of literary debate. As E. J. Clergy explains, Ann Radcliffe’s use of this technique was a response to the unacceptability of encouraging superstitious beliefs in her readers and the presumed didacticism of female gothic writing, and despite Radcliffe’s initial critical success, Coleridge and Scott soon critiqued her ‘enlightenment endings’.²⁹ Scott’s primary critique of Radcliffe’s use of the explained supernatural was the ‘total and absolute disproportion between the cause and effect, which must disgust every reader much more than if he were left under the delusion of ascribing the whole to supernatural agency’.³⁰ The popular medical treatises of the physicians, John Ferriar (1761-1815), John Alderson (*bap.* 1757, *d.* 1829), and Samuel Hibbert (1742-1848), which work to provide physiological explanations of apparently supernatural experiences, appear to be, at least in part, responses to Scott’s critique. The second edition of Hibbert’s *Sketches of the Philosophy of Apparitions; or An Attempt to Trace such Illusions to their Physical Causes* (1825) is dedicated to Scott, and Ferriar brings *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions* (1813) into dialogue with literary criticism in the preface, in which he offers:

to the manufacturers of ghosts, the privilege of raising them, in as great numbers, and in as horrible a guise as they may think fit, without offending against true philosophy, and even without violating probability. The highest flights of imagination may now be indulged, on this subject, although no loop-hole should be left for mortifying explanations, and for those modifications of terror, which completely baulk the reader’s curiosity, and disgust him with a second reading.³¹

The explanatory power of corporeal disease and altered-states became central to the explained supernatural of the Romantic period, and Scott supports these physiological theories in his *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft* (1830).³² The emphasis on embodied individuality and ‘corporeal subjectivity’ at this time most probably favoured this development, and the phrenologists took a particularly strong line on the ability of their new science to divulge the

²⁸ Scott’s *Shadow*, pp. 187-214.

²⁹ E. J. Clergy, *The Rise of Supernatural Fiction, 1762-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995; repr. 1999), p. 108.

³⁰ Sir Walter Scott, ‘[Maturin], *Fatal Revenge; or, the Family of Montorio*’, *Quarterly Review*, 3 (May 1810), 339-47, (p. 344).

³¹ John Ferriar, *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions* (London: Cadell and Davies, 1813), p. vii.

³² Sir Walter Scott, *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft, Addressed to J. G. Lockhart, Esq.* (London: Murray, 1830), pp. 1-48.

mysteries of apparently supernatural experiences in physiological terms.³³ Macnish's imaginative literature and popular medical treatises engage with the dually literary and scientific debate regarding the explained supernatural, and his shifting allegiances to the values of science and imagination and shifting valuation of the Ettrick Shepherd make him a fruitful figure in examining the relationship of Hogg's writing and his critical reception to this debate.

The Ettrick Shepherd, the self-declared 'king o' the mountain an' fairy school of poetry', and the Modern Pythagorean, the Glaswegian surgeon and eventual phrenologist, share a striking number of preoccupations and appear to have had an active influence on one another's literary endeavours over the course of many years.³⁴ The current thesis represents a single case study of the interactive, predisciplinary culture that thrived in Romantic-era Scotland and gestures towards a much larger project. However, through this case study, Robert Macnish, a previously neglected literary and scientific figure, is recovered and a richer historiographical reading of Hogg's engagement with scientific themes is developed. Perhaps Hogg's participation in the predisciplinary dialogue from which the human sciences were eventually born goes some way to explaining his later recovery through twentieth-century psychology.

³³ Jonathon Crary, *Techniques of the Observer: On Vision and Modernity in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1990), p. 69.

³⁴ James Hogg, *Anecdotes of Scott*, ed. by Jill Rubenstein (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1999), p. 61.

Section 1: Journeys of the Embodied Soul

Introduction

Robert Macnish's poem, 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande, Onne Ane Famous Steed, Ycelpt the 'Nicht-Mare'', first published in the Glaswegian periodical, *The Emmet*, in September 1823, utilises the nightmare as a premise to explain a visitation to fairyland. The poem is dedicated to 'The Ettrick Shepherd', and as D. M. Moir points out in his 'Life' of Macnish:

Our author, after the manner of the Ettrick Shepherd, and other recognized authorities on the superstitions of the dark ages, has adopted something like the antique spelling to be found in the chartularies.¹

Macnish's utilisation of rhyming couplets and much of his spelling is reminiscent of Hogg's ballad, 'Kilmeny', the most celebrated section of *The Queen's Wake* (1813). The dedication of the poem to 'The Ettrick Shepherd' also gestures towards a probable connection with Hogg's poem, *The Pilgrims of the Sun* (1815), which was republished within *The Poetical Works of James Hogg* in 1822, one year prior to the publication of Macnish's poem.² Macnish's later utilisation of an extract from *The Pilgrims of the Sun* as a poetic headpiece to the chapter on 'Trance' in the first edition of *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830) further strengthens the probable connection.³

Macnish alludes to the physicality of the visitation to fairyland in the title of his poem through his equestrian pun, and the narrator's visionary experience fits his later definition of the nightmare in *The Philosophy of Sleep*. 'Kilmeny' and *The Pilgrims of the Sun* are based on traditional tales of fairy abduction encapsulated in the supernatural Border ballads, such as 'Tam Lin' and 'Thomas the Rhymer', and, in both poems, sleep functions as the liminal boundary between the natural and supernatural world.⁴ The utilisation of sleep is made explicit in 'Kilmeny', as she is said to have 'fell sunde alseipe' before being 'wekit by the hymis' of

¹ D. M. Moir, *The Modern Pythagorean; A Series of Tales, Essays, and Sketches, By the Late Robert Macnish, LL.D. With the Author's Life, By his Friend, D. M. Moir*, 2 vols (Edinburgh: Blackwood; London: Cadell, 1838), I, p. 206.

² James Hogg, *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, in *The Poetical Works of James Hogg*, 4 vols (Edinburgh: Constable; London: Hurst, Robison, & Co, 1822), II, pp. 1-114.

³ Robert Macnish, *The Philosophy of Sleep* (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1830), p. 222.

⁴ Liminal is an anthropological term derived from the Latin term *limen*, meaning threshold, and is defined as an 'ambivalent in-between state during a rite of passage when a person moves from one biological (as in puberty) or social situation to another' (Lizanne Henderson and Edward J. Cowan, *Scottish Fairy Belief: A History* (East Lothian: Tuckwell Press, 2001), p. 39).

the fairy kingdom.⁵ As is typical in traditional balladic narratives, her disenchantment necessitates a reversal of her original enchantment, and hence the fairies must ‘lullit Kilmeny sunde asleepe’ (l. 1591) to return her to the natural world. The functionality of sleep as a liminal boundary in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* is implicit in the text. Mary Lee is said to have ‘prayed and wept | Till daylight faded on the wold’ when Cela commands her to ‘cast off these earthly weeds’, thus indicating probable exhaustion and evoking the Romantic conception of dream state liberation.⁶ However, Hogg’s notes to the 1822 text makes his utilisation of sleep explicit, as he writes, ‘[t]he erratic pilgrimage is given merely as a dream or vision of a person in a long trance’.⁷

These poems may be identified with the tradition of Scottish fantastic poetry, perhaps most famously exemplified in the eighteenth century by Robert Burns’s ‘Tam o’ Shanter’, but stemming back through the canon to the poetry of James I and William Dunbar, in which the boundary between natural and supernatural worlds is crossed during the liminality of altered-states of consciousness – in drunkenness and dreams. Lizanne Henderson indicates the centrality of boundary crossing to the Scottish supernatural ballads, as ‘[l]ike a membranous film they separate and delineate one place or one state from another’.⁸ However, the ballads do not generally evoke the explanatory power of altered-states of consciousness, and this may be because ‘at the time these ballads were composed the supernatural was natural, was part of the everyday and an accepted explanation for a variety of events and happenings’.⁹ Hogg’s recourse to physiological explanation is a deviation from traditional ballad lore. However, this fluid incorporation of contemporary subject matter may be interpreted as Hogg’s continued adherence to the practices of oral tradition rather than as evidence of discomfort with the purely supernatural. Hogg may be attempting to suit the tastes of a new audience, but he is also harkening back to a much older tradition of dream poetry. Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep* was similarly marketed towards a post-Enlightenment audience with an unabated taste for the otherworldly, and the strange phenomena of sleep offer scope for imaginative flights of

⁵ James Hogg, ‘Kilmeny’, in *The Queen’s Wake: A Legendary Tale*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004; repr. 2005), pp. 92-100, l. 1406, l. 1408. All further line citations will be given in text.

⁶ James Hogg, *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, ed. by the late Jill Rubenstein and completed by Gillian Hughes and Meiko O’Halloran (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), pp. 3-50, Part First, ll. 57-58, l. 73. All further line citations will be given in text.

⁷ James Hogg, ‘Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun’, in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, pp. 148-52, (p. 148).

⁸ Lizanne Henderson, ‘The Road to Elfland: Fairy Belief and the Child Ballads’, in *The Ballad in Scottish History*, ed. by Edward J. Cowan (East Lothian: Tuckwell Press, 2000), pp. 54-72, (p. 60).

⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 55.

fancy within the context of rational discourse. Macnish's dedication of 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande' to 'The Ettrick Shepherd' may indicate his approval of and desire to imitate Hogg's utilisation of the dream as an imaginative premise to a supernatural journey. However, as 'Flicht' is indeed a nightmare, Macnish may also be alluding to the potentially damaging proto-psychological analysis of Hogg as naturally superstitious and prone to poetic flights of fancy – positioning 'The Ettrick Shepherd' himself astride 'the grimme Nicht Mare'.¹⁰

¹⁰ Robert Macnish, 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande, Onne Ane Famous Steed, Ycelpt the 'NichtMare'', *The Emmet*, 1 (20 September 1823), 291-93, (p. 293).

Chapter 1: Fairy Flights and Ugly Bards

‘Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande’ and the Physiology of Nightmare

In the first edition of *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), Macnish cites the three conditions of a nightmare to be as follows: (1) ‘An active state of memory, imagination &c.’ (2) ‘An impaired state of the respiratory functions’ (3) ‘A torpor in power of volition’, and ‘[t]he judgment is generally more or less awake’.¹ The opening of the poem emphasises the incompleteness of the narrator’s sleep and his ability to judge and reflect upon his situation:

I wals ne awake; I wals ne asleep,
But ynne ane confusion strange and deep:
I could ne telle, sae strange wals my hedde,
Quhether I wals alive or dedde;
Quhether this wals the realme of blysse,
Or the warlde of wretchedness:
Quhere could I be – alacke and welle
I thocht againe, but I could ne telle!²

Macnish describes the transition into nightmare from a near waking state in *The Philosophy of Sleep*, as the nightmare steals ‘upon us like a thief at a period when we are all but awake, and aware of its approach’.³ The continued awareness and ability to pass judgment on the experience differentiates the nightmare from a merely disagreeable dream and reveals the nightmare to be a ‘painful bodily affection’ rather than a mere vision of the mind.⁴ The oppression of the narrator’s volition is shown later in the poem as the fairies drag him ‘through the regionis of space’:

Some pulled mie before, some pushid mie behinde –
Some grippit my limbs quhile wythe shouts of lauchter
Thay movit mie on like ane lambe to the slauchter.⁵

This description resonates with Macnish’s description of the loss of volitional power in *The Philosophy of Sleep*, as ‘[t]he individual never feels himself a free agent; on the contrary, he is

¹ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 124.

² ‘Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande’, p. 291.

³ *The Philosophy of Sleep*, pp. 129-30.

⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 137.

⁵ ‘Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande’, p. 292.

spell-bound by some enchantment, and remains an unresisting victim for malice to work its will upon'.⁶ The impairment of respiratory function is emphasised at the close of the poem, when the narrator forces himself to awaken by kicking the 'gylded ayre':

At lengthe I fand my breathe departe,
Ane deep oppression cam owre my heart;
My brain grew dizzy – my eyne grewe dimme,
Ane sweat broke onne euiry limbe,
My bosomme heavit wythe deidlye dreade,
Vapouris floated arounde my hedde;⁷

In *The Philosophy of Sleep*, the imagination is said to be in an active state during the nightmare; and thus, the closing lines, 'And instead of rydyng the clouds of the ayre | I hadde onlie beene rydyng the grimme Nicht Mare', appropriately delineate the narrator as having been actively taken on a ride.⁸ This ride may have been caused by physiological disturbance, i.e. oppressed respiration, but this physicality in no way demotes the role of the imagination.⁹ In *The Philosophy of Sleep*, Macnish emphasises the connection between the physical suffering of the body and the imagery of dreams:

We have already seen that in ordinary sleep, particular states of the body are apt to induce visions [...] If causes comparatively so trivial, are capable of producing such trains of ideas, it is easily conceivable that a sense of suffocation, like that which occurs in night-mare, may give birth to all the horrid phantoms seen in that distressing affection. The physical suffering in such a case, exalts the imagination to its utmost pitch, fills it with spectres and chimeras, and plants an immoveable weight or malignant fiend upon our bosom to crash us into agony.¹⁰

Therefore, 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande' reveals that even at this early point in his career, Macnish grounds supernatural experience in the physical body, and it is in fact the imagination that connects the physical world to the seemly immaterial world of fairyland.

Biographical Sources and Early Years

Due to the critical unfamiliarity with Macnish, a brief biographical detour is necessary at this

⁶ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 127.

⁷ 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande', p. 293

⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 293.

⁹ For a similar argument regarding Coleridge, see Jennifer Ford, *Coleridge on Dreaming: Romanticism, Dreams and Medical Imagination* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), p. 198.

¹⁰ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 140.

point. A significant portion of the biographical information is derived from the first volume of D. M. Moir's, *The Modern Pythagorean* (1838), which is devoted to 'The Author's Life'.¹¹ Upon his untimely death from influenza and typhus fever at 34 years of age, John Macnish, Robert Macnish's father, wrote to Moir requesting advice regarding how he might publish the tales Robert had contributed to *Blackwood's* and *Fraser's Magazines*, as well as the poetic material found in his desk, as 'if this were practicable it might be means of realising a sum for his sisters – who are now deprived of his valuable existence'.¹² Moir himself agreed to take on the task of arranging the materials for both a 'Life' and a volume of tales. Perhaps this was influenced by the knowledge that during his lifetime, Macnish had expressed repeated desires and had made several attempts at publishing volumes of his tales and poetry.¹³ According to a letter from John Macnish to Moir dated 28 August 1837, *The Modern Pythagorean* was ready for publication just five months after Moir first agreed to take on the project, and an examination of the manuscript of the 'Life' reveals the relatively hurried preparation of the text.¹⁴ As such, chronological mistakes and bibliographical omissions do appear, and overall, Moir appears to have taken many editorial liberties with the correspondences. Where relevant, these mistakes and liberties will be made apparent in the present text.

John Macnish and Macnish's eldest sister, Frances, provided much valuable information regarding Robert's early years, and supplied Moir with bibliographical references, personal papers, and existent correspondences. A significant portion of the 'Life' is devoted to transcriptions from Moir and Macnish's extensive correspondence which stretched from August 1827 until his death, and his correspondences with the publisher, William Blackwood (1776-1834), and his close friend, John Leitch of Rothesay (1808-1880), are also drawn upon by Moir.¹⁵ Macnish's correspondence with the phrenologists, Robert Cox (1810-1872) and George Combe (1788-1858), were not made available to Moir; however, his letters to and from Combe are now available in the Combe Papers at the National Library of Scotland.

¹¹ Additionally, an anonymous biographical sketch of the author is prefaced to a new edition of *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1859).

¹² Letter of John Macnish to D. M. Moir, 9 February 1837, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 48.

¹³ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 1. An examination of Macnish's correspondence with Moir and William Blackwood reveals the tenacity with which he approached this scheme. See letters of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 9 October 1827, 1 November 1827, 22 October 1831, 9 November 1831, 2 October 1834, 28 October 1834, 4 April 1835, NLS Acc. 9856, Nos. 49-50; Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 27 July 1832, MS 4034, fol. 38.

¹⁴ NLS MS 3525.

¹⁵ For more information on Leitch's later literary endeavours, see Alison Kennedy, 'John Leitch, John Kenrick, history and myth: The textbook as a signpost of intellectual change', *Paradigm: The Journal of the Textbook Colloquium*, 2.4 (December 2001), 1-13 <http://faculty.ed.uiuc.edu/westbury/Paradigm/JOHN_LEI.PDF> [accessed 10 March 2010].

While the tales make up the second volume, the poetry is interspersed throughout the ‘Life’ in illustration of the bent of his mind at certain time periods. Macnish himself admitted to being an indifferent poet, and hence, the decision not to devote a separate volume to his poetry is most probably substantiated. However, as Moir’s usage indicates, his poetry does serve as a useful indicator of his aesthetic alignments and influences during periods of his life that have little other documentation.

Robert Macnish was born in Henderson’s Court, Jamaica Street, Glasgow on 15 February 1802 into a multi-generational family of medical practitioners. Both his father and his grandfather were licensed surgeons, and from the time of Robert’s birth until the death of his grandfather in 1822, they maintained a practice together in Glasgow. After receiving the rudiments of his education in Glasgow, Macnish was sent to Hamilton to study the classics at a boarding school run by Reverend Alexander Easton, whom he fancifully deemed ‘Homer’, due his ineradicable belief ‘that the immortal poet of the Iliad must have been exactly the personal prototype of the Rev. Easton’.¹⁶ His slow progress as a classical scholar during this time is later satirised by William Maginn (1794-1842) in the Fraserian ‘Gallery of Literary Characters’:

Here he pursued his infantile studies with such success, as to be looked upon as the greatest blockhead of his time; the lowest seat in the class being his by such prescriptive title, that if chance dethroned him from it by the substitution of another, the day of so marvellous an event was considered to be one of such wonder and rejoicing as to demand a holiday.¹⁷

Following his unsuccessful attempts at Greek and Latin, Macnish returned to Glasgow and devoted himself to the acquisition of the French language, and his father recounts that he also began studying medicine at the age of thirteen years by assisting his grandfather in his practice.¹⁸ The University of Glasgow matriculation records show that Macnish enrolled in 1819 and was successfully examined before the College of Surgeons for the degree of *Magister Chirurgiae* in 1820.¹⁹

Highland Hallucinations

¹⁶ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 4.

¹⁷ William Maginn, ‘Gallery of Literary Characters. No. LXVII. Robert Macnish, Esquire’, *Fraser’s*, 12 (December 1835), 650.

¹⁸ Letter of J. K. Macnish to D. M. Moir, 1 March 1837, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 48.

¹⁹ For background information on this degree, see Alexander Duncan, *Memorials of the Faculty of Physicians and Surgeons of Glasgow 1599-1850, with a Sketch of the Rise and Progress of the Glasgow Medical School and of the Medical Profession in the West of Scotland* (Glasgow: Maclehose, 1896), pp. 162-70.

Upon graduation Macnish traveled north to Caithness in the Orkney Islands to serve his apprenticeship under Dr. John Henderson, the author of *A General View of the Agriculture of the County of Caithness* (1812). Unfortunately, the letters between Macnish and his family during this period do not survive, and Moir is unable to provide substantial information regarding Macnish's experience. According to Moir, it was not a subject frequently referred to by his friend, and he believes this may be due to the unpleasant memories of the illness that necessitated his early return to Glasgow after eighteen months.²⁰ As such, Moir reads Macnish's experience through a selection of his early literary productions.

Moir presents this period as a time of imaginative awakening for Macnish and dates his earliest known literary productions to this period. The isolated situation of Caithness is drawn upon to explain the fanciful nature of Macnish's early poetry:

Sir Walter Scott's, in his "Legend of Montrose," Professor Wilson in that wildest and sweetest of his poems, "Edith and Nova," and James Hogg, in his story of the "Widow of Loch Kios," have all admirably succeeded in depicting, by scene and situation, the intense solitude pervading the more remote districts of the Scottish Highlands, and the subduing impressions on the mind, caused by the absence of everything appertaining to man and life. Several pieces by Mr Macnish, referable to his sojourn in Caithness, seem deeply impregnated with the same mystic feelings. In the progress of civilization, refinement, and knowledge, and long after superstition has fled from the cities of the plain, it will be found in every other country, as well as in our own, to linger amongst the mountain fastnesses. Nor is this difficult to be accounted for. The character of the scenery, its grandeur, its gloom, and consequent solemnity, together with its seclusion, naturally impart a colouring to the mind of the inhabitants, and give a prevailing tone to their character. This tone and bias is only to be got rid off by communication, – a thing nearly hopeless, when we consider the scattered population of really mountainous districts.²¹

Moir here follows the Enlightenment theory of natural history in the inevitable progress from the rural to the urban and the superstitious to the rational, and significantly echoes Dugald Stewart's evaluation of the primitive tone of mind persisting in those persons left on the fringes of modern civilization. In his chapter 'Of Imagination' in the first volume of the *Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind* (1792), Stewart theorises that, ideally, the vivacity of external perceptions serve to correct imaginative extravagancies, but writes of the possible reversion to imaginative delusions in isolated settings:

²⁰ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 11.

²¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 27-28.

Removed to a distance from society, and from the pursuits of life, when we have been long accustomed to converse with our own thoughts, and have found our activity gratified by intellectual exertions, which afford scope to all our power and affections, without exposing us to the inconveniences resulting from the bustle of the world, we are apt to contract an unnatural predilection for meditation, and to lose all interest in external occurrences. In such a situation too, the mind gradually loses that command which education, when properly conducted, gives it over the train of its ideas; till at length the most extravagant dreams of imagination acquire as powerful an influence in exciting all its passions, as if they were realities. A wild and mountainous country, which presents but a limited variety of objects, and these only of such a sort as “awake to solemn thought,” has a remarkable effect in cherishing this enthusiasm.²²

Moir provides extracts from ‘The Tale of Eivor, a Scandinavian Legend’ and ‘Extracts from Ima. An Unpublished Eastern Romance in Verse’, and full transcriptions of ‘The Vision of Iona’ and ‘The Harp of Salem’ as evidence of Macnish’s imaginative bend of mind at this period and also notes the clear influences of Thomas Moore, Thomas Campbell and Lord Byron, particularly with regard to the oriental imagery.²³ Moir’s justification of the ‘mystic feelings’ prevalent in Macnish’s literary endeavours at this time most probably has little to do with the fanciful poetry he produced during his time at Caithness, as a significant portion of this early poetry is later re-published in *Fraser’s Magazine*, by which point, Macnish’s publicly avowed sentiments were firmly on the side of the rational versus the supernatural in his work on *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830). However, it is notable that Moir associates Macnish’s poetic imagination with a legitimate belief in the supernatural, as Hogg’s supernatural poetry is read by his contemporaries in a similar light. The significant difference is that Macnish’s eventual disavowal of the supernatural is portrayed as a recapitulation of the enlightenment of the western world, while Hogg is read by his contemporaries as trapped in the primitive stage.

Moir’s differentiation between the ‘imaginative and susceptible’ young Macnish of Caithness and the later esteemed Glaswegian medical writer appears to be due to his literal reading of ‘The Bard’s Register. No. IV. Ghosts and Dreams’, an essay published in *The Emmet* in 1824. Moir believes that this essay was written ‘under the hallucination of these impressions’, and, after citing from the essay, emphasises that ‘the stern realities of life, notwithstanding the perennial buoyancy of his imagination, helped, year after year, only to

²² *Elements*, I, pp. 508-09.

²³ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 13-27.

disenchant the vision created by poetic feeling, and fostered by the musings of solitude'.²⁴ In the essay Macnish declares himself 'a firm believer in ghosts' on the grounds that '[t]he belief, indeed, is innate and inherent in human nature, whatever reasoning and philosophy may do to display it', and even goes so far as to relate a personal experience of an apparitional visitation which eerily corresponds to the death of a relative.²⁵ However, the cases included in the essay reveal an early formulation of the relationship between mental and physical health that is overlooked by Moir. While Macnish cites these cases as being 'in favor of the influence of supernatural agency', all but one of the ghostly visitants occur within dreams. The first case presented is particularly illustrative: a young lady bitterly lamenting the mortal dangers to which her military lover was exposed resultantly declines 'into all the appalling expression of a fatal illness'.²⁶ Macnish's description of the young lady's ghostly visitation emphasises its occurrence 'after falling asleep' and undermines the existence of the apparition beyond the young lady's mind by writing that 'she imaged she saw her lover, pale, bloody, and wounded in the breast, enter her apartment' and inform her of his late demise in battle.²⁷ The only potentially supernatural factor is the temporal collaboration of the lady's vision and her lover's death in the waking world. The lady places belief in the vision, however, and dies soonafter. Macnish will later use these same cases in the chapters on the 'Prophetic Power of Dreams', in both the 1830 and 1834 editions of *The Philosophy of Sleep* to illustrate the natural mental principles that lead to the deceptively visionary aspects of some dreams.²⁸

The Philosophy of Sleep (1830) appears to be the fruition of many years spent studying the phenomena of sleep. In a letter of 5th September 1828, Macnish writes to Moir, 'I have had it in contemplation for some time, to write a book on dreams, or rather on sleep, to be called the Philosophy of Sleep.'²⁹ This text follows on from the success of the 'medico-popular' text, *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), as Macnish was preparing the third edition of *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* at this time.³⁰ Macnish's popular medical literature was written to be both entertaining and informative to a general audience, and in both texts Enlightenment empiricism and the Romantic glorification of the subjective fuse. Singularly strange cases are

²⁴ Ibid., p. 29, p. 31.

²⁵ Robert Macnish, 'The Bard's Register. No. IV. Ghosts and Dreams', *The Emmet*, 2 (20 March 1824), 289-99, (p. 290, p. 295).

²⁶ Ibid., p. 296.

²⁷ Ibid., p. 296.

²⁸ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), pp. 101-23; *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), pp. 110-32.

²⁹ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 105. See also, letter dated 5 September 1828, NLS, Acc. 9856, No. 49.

³⁰ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 51-52; Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 9 December 1828, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49; Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 18 December 1828, NLS MS 4022, fol. 109.

presented in *The Philosophy of Sleep*, and the medical unaccountability of some, such as the apparent suspension of the heart and lungs in trance, only serves to heighten interest in the phenomena. However, within the context of a medical treatise, the post-Enlightenment reader could transgress through the murky realm of superstition and experience the thrill of the fantastic, while safely within the constraints of rationality. In short, Macnish's theory of sleep is based on the theory that the nervous system maintains a limited amount of sensorial power, which is exhausted in waking life and regenerated in sleep. The various phenomena of sleep, such as dreaming, somnambulism, sleep-talking, and waking-dreams, are explained by different faculties of the nervous system maintaining sensorial power whilst others slumber.

In his chapter on the 'Prophetic Power of Dreams' in *The Philosophy of Sleep*, Macnish prefaces his presentation of the cases with a disavowal of their supernatural character. He does not deny 'that there was a period when futurity was unfolded in visions' and 'God held communion with man'.³¹ However, 'such periods have departed for ever from the earth' and whomever now believes that the laws of nature may be so breached as to allow for spiritual communication during sleep 'may, with perfect consistency, believe that Mahomet flew to heaven on an ass – that the moon is made of green cheese – and that the Grand Seignior and the orb of day are first cousins'.³² In contrast, in the 'Ghosts and Dreams' essay of 1824 Macnish highlights the imaginative value of the supernatural:

It is cold and desolate to suppose the earth merely the habitation of material beings. It were more consonant to beauty and perfection to imagine it brightened over with the presence of thousand spirits, which float like sunshine over its bosom – those spirits of which poetry, from the earliest ages, has delighted to sing, and the very belief in whose existence flings, as it were, a halo of immortality over nature.³³

However, although the belief in the supernatural, according to Macnish, may be 'innate and inherent in human nature', it is this belief – this psychological factor – that veils nature in supernatural splendour, and the enlightened person must make a conscious choice to maintain this worldview for its aesthetic pleasures. Macnish was willing to make this choice in 1824, but it was hardly naïve.

Evidence of Macnish's experience in Caithness not examined by Moir reveals this period to be one of scientific inquiry as well as imaginative expansion. As Moir indicates, Macnish 'formed the plan of his essay on Drunkenness; and it was sketched out before his

³¹ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 102.

³² *Ibid.*, p. 102, p. 105.

³³ 'Ghosts and Dreams', p. 293.

return to the capital of the west', and this is corroborated by Macnish's father, John Macnish, in a correspondence sent to Moir during the preparation of the biography:

In 1825, he took his diploma from the Faculty, and presented as his admission Essay the 'Anatomy of Drunkenness' a paper, I have heard him say that had lain by him for years, being written at the age of nineteen.³⁴

Macnish's correspondence with Lieutenant William Gunn, a surgeon with whom he was acquainted in Caithness, reveals the importance of Macnish's apprenticeship in the Highlands as a period of imaginative expansion through experimentation with psycho-active substance as well as scientific inquiry, through ethically suspect, but inductively oriented, clinical practice:

I hope you do not get drunk above twice a week & that you do not, as I did, purchase [fauners] and god knows what during the delightful reveries of intoxication. I daresay your brother remembers the [fauners]. If you do not pick up a great fund of medical knowledge where you are it is your own fault. It was there I learned the Rudiments of any little knowledge I possess. If I were a year more in Caithness I calculate that I could glean a vast additional fund of information – for the people being poor a person can try the experimental effect of different medicines more easily than can be done in genteel practice.³⁵

Macnish's personal interactions in Caithness are described from a rather different perspective by Moir, who writes that 'his fancy and intellect here found scope, not only in the contemplation of nature in its most majestic features, but in the quiet, everyday observation of mankind'.³⁶ Rather than non-participatory Romantic contemplation, Macnish was in fact actively performing pharmaceutical experiments on members of the local community! An essay he contributed to the short-lived Glaswegian periodical, *The Literary Melange*, upon his return to Glasgow further indicates his experimental propensities.³⁷ In the 'The Camera Obscura. No. 3. From my Patch Book', he describes how he and his medical companion, Dr.

³⁴ Letter of J. K. Macnish to D. M. Moir, 1 March 1837, NLS, Acc. 9856, No. 48.

³⁵ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Gunn, 11 October 1825, University of Glasgow, Special Collections, MS Gen. 510/23.

³⁶ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 11.

³⁷ *The Literary Melange; or, Weekly Register of Literature and the Arts* was 'Printed, Published and Sold, Every Wednesday, by William Tait, & Co. Lyceum Court, Nelson Street' and, after the fourteenth number, 'by George Purvis & Co. Successors to W. Tait' (p. 16, p. 240). The first number was issued on 19th June 1822, and despite apparent success in the first numbers, the publication of the literary magazine abruptly halted without explanation after 29th January 1823. The opening number introduces the periodical as a novel outlet for 'the reading or lettered portion' of Glasgow, as shockingly, prior to their endeavours, no periodical devoted to taste and general literature was published in 'the second City in Great Britain'. The contents of *The Literary Melange* were to suit its title, as it was to function as both a review and literary magazine ('Prospectus', *The Literary Melange*, 1 (19 June 1822), p. 1).

Mackay Gordon (designated by the title S—), jovially tested the effects of ‘a composition of porter and sweet milk’ popular in some parts of America ‘as a bitter for removing ague and curing weakness of the stomach’ on the Reverend Mr. B—, a dull and heavy-headed minister, whose languid physiognomy had earned him the nickname of the ‘Boiled-Fowl’.³⁸ The role of temperament and constitution in determining a person’s response to alcohol, later discussed in *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, has its roots in his observations in the Highlands:

Mercy on us! what drinkers these Highlandmen are! Give them snuff and whiskey, and they will do any thing for you. They absolutely drink more spirits than any people in the nation, and are after all the soberest in it. [...] We never meet with any of these tun-bellied, blearing, fuming, bloated, disgusting objects which abound in towns – the monuments of dissipation. The spirit, in truth, is so good – the air so pure, and the constitutions of the people so light, that the whiskey flies off as soon as taken in.³⁹

Rather than a naïve youth, overcome by the vivacity of his imagination in the isolated setting, Macnish appears to be laying the foundation for his future scientific work. Further, the ‘From my Patch Book’ essay reveals a conscious self-differentiation from the superstitions of the Highlanders, as he writes of he and Mackay Gordon terrifying the countryside by ‘placing field turnips, hallowed out, and lighted with a candle, in sequestered parts of the road’ and stealing into the churchyard ‘dressed in white sheets’ to ‘walk like spectres among the grave stones’.⁴⁰ On one particularly memorable Halloween, Macnish claims to have ‘set off a balloon with a lighted candle attached to it’, and his musings on the local people’s ‘very curious’ speculations on the phenomena indicate his interest in the vast array of perceptual interpretations, both natural and supernatural, that a single phenomenon might elicit:

Some considered it a comet; others, a burning star – some imagined the world was near an end, and that this was one of the signs of the times; others, that it was the evil spirit, in a bodily shape, seeking whom he may devour.⁴¹

This essay appears as the third number of ‘The Camera Obscura’, a series of four short prose essays anonymously contributed by Macnish to *The Literary Melange* between August and October 1822.⁴²

³⁸ Robert Macnish, ‘The Camera Obscura. No. 3. From my Patch Book’, *The Literary Melange*, 1 (9 October 1822), 225-30, (p. 226).

³⁹ Ibid., p. 229.

⁴⁰ Ibid., p. 228.

⁴¹ Ibid., p. 228.

⁴² In a letter to Moir, Frances Macnish indicates that Dr. Mackay Gordon ‘is mentioned under the title of S’ in the third number of ‘The Camera Obscura’, thus the ‘From my Patch Book’ essay is definitely from Macnish’s

The Camera Obscura

Macnish's choice of series title evokes the image of the camera obscura: the optical instrument on which the seventeenth- and eighteenth-century understanding of vision was founded. The instrument, through its various forms, capitalised on the ancient knowledge that 'when light passes through a small hole into a dark, enclosed interior, an inverted image will appear on the wall opposite the hole'.⁴³ Lenses might be used to assure the projected image would not be inverted or to produce a more finely resolved image, but the basic concept remained constant. John Crary in his influential text, *Techniques of the Observer: On Vision and Modernity in the Nineteenth Century* (1990), posits the camera obscura as representative of the relationship between the internal viewing subject and the external world, mediated through sensory apparatus (be it the eye and retina of the human subject or the hole and wall of the camera obscura), as understood prior to the advent of the 'corporeal subjectivity' of the early nineteenth century.⁴⁴ For the viewer of the image of the camera obscura, reality and its projection will be one and the same. As a model of vision, this implied a rational and passive internal mind to which sensory apparatus accurately projected an image of the external world. However, Crary argues that in the nineteenth century, the theory of vision became more subject-centred as the human body was recognised to be 'the active producer of optical experience'.⁴⁵ Now optical devices such as the stereoscope, which produced one three-dimensional optical image from two slightly dissimilar two-dimensional images by appealing to the physiological principles of binocular vision, revealed to the viewer the active role of corporeal body in perception. As corporeal bodies could vary greatly between individuals, presumably so could perception. Corporeal subjectivity is a theme that runs throughout Macnish's literary corpus and is particularly prevalent in the essays of 'The Camera Obscura' series, and Macnish's series title appears to evoke the representative instrument of an outdated empirical model of vision only to reveal its shortcomings.

With the exception of the humorous and autobiographically oriented 'From my Patch Book', the essays of 'The Camera Obscura' series all examine the altered subjectivity resultant

pen. 'The Camera Obscura. No. 2. Julia de Roncevalles' and 'The Camera Obscura. No. 4. The Orphans' are later republished with alterations in *The Emmet* in 'The Bard's Register' series, the entirety of which is attributed to 'The Bard of the Ugly Club' in a footnote to the final number of the series (*The Emmet*, 2 (20th March 1824), p. 299). For further discussion of Macnish's identity as 'The Bard of the Ugly Club', see below, p. 31.

⁴³ Crary, p. 27.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 69.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 69.

upon the experience of tragic bereavement. As a medical practitioner, Macnish would have been well acquainted with death and the grieving processes of others, and the loss of his own mother when he was fifteen years of age and his beloved grandfather just five years later would have provided more personal insight. The opening number of the series is devoted to the topic of the psychological distress experienced by those who lose loved ones in shipwrecks. Both the suddenness and the gruesome imaginative associations of death at sea allow 'the worm of agony' to take firmer hold of the bereaved.⁴⁶ Notably, the image of the worm will again appear later in Macnish's writing to indicate congruent physiological and psychological degradation and will be shown to be a significant connective feature with Hogg's *Confessions*. In this essay Macnish locates 'the worm of agony' in the bosoms of the people of Iona after a 'melancholy and deplorable accident was occasioned by the Hercules steam-boat running against a wherry containing forty-six men and women, of these only three escaped'.⁴⁷ Using the same philosophical paradigm that Moir will later apply in the 'Life', Macnish describes how the timeless constancy of life on Iona will prevent the bereaved from casting off their grief. Those who live in populated cities may disperse thoughts 'at pleasure and enter into new associations' as 'every day – every hour brings us fresh faces and fresh enjoyments'. However, in Iona '[w]hat scenes existed yesterday are to-day and shall be to-morrow', and as such, '[t]he mind must recoil as it were upon itself, and look to its own resources for consolation'. In other words, the habituated homogeneity of external perceptions diminishes their vivacity and allows the imagination increased power. The description of the bereaved person's perceptions of his island underlines his altered and very individual subjectivity:

If he goes forth, what objects meet his eyes but the cottages of those whom he knew rising here and there like so many tombs around him. To him they are indeed tombs, for their owners are no more, and they are the only standing memorials that they existed. Perhaps his fancy in the hour of midnight may people the neighbourhood of these cottages with the spirits of the departed. Perhaps he may see them glancing on the mountain's brink or rising up from the sanctified cemetries of Scotch, Irish, and Norwegian Kings.⁴⁸

Similarly, Julia de Roncevalles, the title character of the second number of 'The Camera Obscura', views visions of her lost lover as she wanders in the valleys of the mountains of

⁴⁶ Robert Macnish, 'The Camera Obscura. No. I. Shipwreck', *The Literary Melange*, 1 (28 August 1822), p. 162.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 163.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 163.

Switzerland:

She lives in a world of fancy, where wild ideas supply the place of reality. Her greatest delight is to linger in the glen where Albert died – to talk about him – to weep when a transient ray of reason exhibits him dead, and to smile when in her imagination he is alive and happy. – Often in the moonlight she may be seen like a fairy form glancing down the valley, and singing wild love songs to herself.⁴⁹

The altered perception in this case is such as to indicate insanity, albeit of the most graceful type.

The final essay in ‘The Camera Obscura’ series captures the subjectivity of perception most fully. In the opening the narrator, a young man of an imaginative bent of mind, recounts a beautiful sunset witnessed by both himself and an elderly minister, ‘a man of many woes’, who will proceed to tell a tale of tragic bereavement to the younger man. The narrator does not find it at all surprising that ‘we surveyed the setting sun with different eyes’:

I gazed upon it with the maddening poetical enthusiasm of youth; I likened it to the glorious empire of romance. The cloud that rolled along, were so many shining chariots moving, through space, by some magician’s wand – the beings who basked in the celestial glow were the inhabitants of fairy land. I figured, in imagination, their vaulted bowers – their plains of burnished gossamer – their dance and melodious music in this strange region – and I wished I could transform myself to one of these light forms, and see the secrets of a place so wonderfully hid from human eyes. But the minister looked on with sublimer feelings. He saw nothing but an image of the Eternal above him.⁵⁰

The equation of sublime cosmology with heavenly spheres veiled from ordinary human eyes is a theme evoked by Hogg in *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, and, in this essay, Macnish also similarly portrays beautiful corporeality as indicative of moral beauty. Like the unearthly beauty of both Kilmeny and Mary Lee, Macnish’s orphan girl has a mind ‘even more beautiful than her body’, and as a woman excels all others, such that ‘she seemed a being from another sphere’.⁵¹ The elderly minister tells the young man of how he adopted the orphaned Margaret and raised her as his own along with his only surviving son, Henry. After a prolonged military assignment, Henry returns and marries Margaret to the minister’s great joy, but just three weeks after the marriage vows, a contagious fever robs him of the young couple. Margaret is returned to the heavenly sphere to which she is most suited, but the minister now regresses

⁴⁹ Robert Macnish, ‘The Camera Obscura. No. 3. Julia de Roncevalles’, *The Literary Melange*, 1 (11 September 1822), 193-99, (p. 199).

⁵⁰ Robert Macnish, ‘The Camera Obscura. No. 4. The Orphan’, *The Literary Melange*, 1 (16 October 1822), 241-44, (pp. 241-42).

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, p. 243, p. 244.

into a 'second childhood', in which imaginative visions tempt him to believe that the division between the heavenly and earthly sphere has dissolved, but he knows that 'the veil of the invisible world cannot be thrown aside to expose its mysteries to human eyes'.⁵²

While these essays evoke great pathos for the bereaved, their altered subjectivities are presented pathologically – their otherworldly visions as the products of disturbed imaginations. The veil over the eyes of man, resultant upon the Fall and the separation of divine from human consciousness, cannot be lifted during this life, as it is for both Kilmeny and Mary Lee. In this series, ironically named after the optical instrument that represented positive faith in the sensory apparatus's ability to reproduce an exact image of the external world, we see, not a profound scepticism, but rather a fascination with the corporealised subjectivity that was central to the embodied Romantic imagination and that would continue to inform Macnish's fictional and popular medical writing.

Katherine Inglis uses Cray's work as a model to examine Hogg's *Winter Evening Tales* (1820) and reveals that Hogg draws upon the perceptual scepticism of the embodied observer only to uncut this model, as in the tales sceptics 'are paralyzed by their inability to trust their senses'.⁵³ According to Inglis, agency is achieved through a model of vision rather based on the popular magic lantern shows, wherein spectators willingly 'suspend their disbelief in order to participate in the perceptual process'.⁵⁴ Such a model may apply to Macnish in his 'Ghosts and Dreams' essay, wherein he makes an aesthetic choice to believe in the prophetic power of dreams while evidencing awareness of their physiological mechanism, and his choice of title is highly evocative of Hogg's 'Country Dreams and Apparitions' series in *Winter Evening Tales*. Further, the 'Ghosts and Dreams' essay appears within 'The Bard's Register' series, which may have been modeled on Hogg's Blackwoodian series, 'The Shepherd's Calendar', the first number of which appeared in April 1819. Both series are named for an established literary persona (at least within the context of the periodical) who presents the reader with regional tales told from their own unique perspective. A unique perspective, however, necessitates a unique physical body.

⁵² Robert Macnish, 'The Camera Obscura. No. 4 – Continued. The Orphan', *The Literary Melange*, 1 (23 October 1822), 257-59, (p. 259).

⁵³ Katherine Inglis, "'My Ingenious Answer to the Most Exquisite Question': Perception and Testimony in *Winter Evening Tales*", *SHW*, 17 (2006), 81-95, (p. 93).

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 93.

The Ugly Club

In stark contrast to the beautiful physiognomies celebrated by Macnish in *The Literary Melange*, his next literary endeavour involved the celebration of the individuality and originality of dire ugliness. The vibrant periodical culture of nineteenth-century Edinburgh has received much critical commentary; however, the Glaswegian literary periodical scene of the Blackwoodian era is largely uncharted territory. Macnish was one of the prime contributors to *The Emmet; A Periodical Publication*, which appears to have been the livelier younger sister of *The Literary Melange*, the first number being published by Purvis & Aitken, also of Lyceum Court, Nelson Street, Glasgow, on the 5th April 1823, less than four months after the cessation of *The Literary Melange*. *The Emmet* continued to be published every Saturday until 27th March 1824, thus allowing for the eventual publication of two bound volumes containing twenty-six numbers each. The introductory observations similarly lament the dearth of literary periodicals in Glasgow, citing the sufficiency of resources in the city and asserting the failure to be found ‘not in the inability, but in the indifference of our citizens’.⁵⁵ ‘The Ugly Club’ took up the challenge in the following number with an article appearing by ‘Robert M’Mulligan, Esq. President of the Ugly Club’, and although not apparently involved in the editorship of the magazine, the Ugly Club would continue to be its prime support through the course of its publication. The editor explains the relationship between the magazine and the club:

No man, or set of men, have the least influence over us. The Club is not, in any way, connected with our work, further than by favouring it with frequent communications. It is composed of a set of gentlemen, unmatched in physiognomy – peerless for wit and humour – of unimpeachable honour and incorruptible integrity. We have obtained their services purely from their love of literary exertions, and from the intimate terms of personal friendship upon which we have stood with them. We are perfectly aware that they supported us more for the sake of supporting the literary character of their native town, than from a mere wish to buoy up the Emmet.⁵⁶

The unusual degree of pride taken in ugliness appears to be a response to the homogenising force of fashion. In his first contribution, President M’Mulligan chastises the ladies of Glasgow for the perversion of nature inherent in fashionable female education:

A young lady, when she enters her academy, must bid adieu to simplicity. *There* nature, in thought, word, or action is criminal; to do anything as *she* would dictate, is the height

⁵⁵ ‘Introductory Observations’, *The Emmet*, 1 (5 April 1823), 1-3, (p. 3).

⁵⁶ ‘The Emmet and the Ugly Club’, *The Emmet*, 2 (14 February 1824), 236-37, (p. 237).

of ill-manners: hence that affected giggling, that tittering and littleness of conduct, and that absurd and unnatural awkwardness in voice and gesture, which is considered the very quintessential of politeness. Not only is nature banished from the mind, in these seminaries, but even from the body; the very joints and sinews feel the despotic power of all-prevailing art.⁵⁷

The argument reaches its forte with his discussion of ‘The Pulpit of Eloquence’ – a device in which the young female’s body was strapped while she read aloud such that ‘her feet are twisted outward in a grove, her shoulders drawn back by a collar, and her head prevented from being elevated beyond a certain height, by the lowness of a moveable roof’.⁵⁸ After describing the horrors of corporeal homogenisation, he celebrates the uniqueness of his own ugly physiognomy – his ‘capacious mug’, ‘carbuncle nose’, and ‘squinting eye’ that have allowed him to maintain the presidency of the Ugly Club.⁵⁹ President M’Mulligan, in the following number, argues that the ugly countenance is, in fact, a more revealing window to the soul:

The *divine expression* of the countenance, so utterly wanting in your pretty fellows, here shines in perfection. My own face, although I have but one eye, is the most perfect specimen of humour – the *beau ideal* of drollery. The surly severity of the vice-president – the pious gaze of the chaplain – the good-natured simplicity of the clerk – the knowingness of the squinting treasurer – the bold fiery eye of the poet – and the various modifications of expression in the inferior members, are specimens which a Hogarth would delight to draw, and a Lavater to contemplate.⁶⁰

M’Mulligan’s assessments look forward to Dugald Stewart’s reiteration of the physiognomical preference for the aged countenance, the engrained lineaments of which better denote its owner’s habitual tone of mind:

It has frequently been observed by writers on Physiognomy, and also by those who have treated of the principles of painting, that every emotion, and every operation of the mind, has a corresponding expression of the countenance; and hence it is, that the passions which we habitually indulge, and also the intellectual pursuits which most frequently occupy our thoughts, by strengthening particular sets of muscles, leave tracings of their workings behind them, which may be perceived by an attentive observer. Hence, too, it is that a person’s countenance becomes more expressive and characteristic as he advances in life; and that the appearance of a young man or woman, though more *beautiful*, is not so *interesting*, nor, in general, so good a subject for a painter, of that of a

⁵⁷ [signed Robert M’Mulligan, P. U. C.], ‘On Boarding Schools, Female Education, and the Rise and Progress of Dandyism. Respectfully Dedicated to the Ladies of Glasgow. By Robert M’Mulligan, Esq. Present of the Ugly Club’, *The Emmet*, 1 (12 April 1823), 13-16, (p. 13).

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 15.

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 16.

⁶⁰ [signed Robert M’Mulligan, P. U. C.], ‘The History of the Ugly Club. By President M’Mulligan’, *The Emmet*, 1 (19 April 1823), 25-28, (p. 28).

person whose character has been longer confirmed by habit.⁶¹

Later in the same volume, Stewart discusses the ability of persons in civilised society to imitate the learned expressions of those around them and thus falsely acquire an intelligent countenance:

It is true that, in such a state of society as ours, a great proportion of the community are as incapable of reflection as savages; but the principle of imitation, which, in some measure, assimilates to each other all the members of the same group or circle, communicates the external aspect of intelligence and of refinement, to those who are least entitled to assume it: And it is thus we frequently see the most complete mental imbecility accompanied with what is called a *plausible or imposing appearance*; or, in other words, a countenance which has caught, from imitation, the expression of sagacity.⁶²

The periodical press was instrumental in dispersing a wide amount of superficial knowledge about all subjects to the growing reading public, and the resultant social imperative to be acquainted with all areas of knowledge fed into an increasing demand for such reviews and literary magazines. An anonymous contributor to *The Emmet* explains:

the necessity which exists for every man, who mixes in the society of the world, to be at least superficially acquainted with almost every branch of it, has produced the magazines, and reviews, and newspapers, of the present day. [...] they enable us, in a short time, and with comparatively slight labour, to gain that indispensable species of knowledge, which, without them, it would require almost ages of time, and lives of labour, to accomplish.⁶³

The Ugly Club's deprecation of fashionably homogenised bodies may be read as a commentary on the equally fashionable and superficial homogenisation of minds enabled by the periodical press – their corporeal ugliness indicating individuality, originality of genius, and genuinely rather than imitatively acquired bodies and minds. A celebration of the local – Glaswegian persons and places – by both the members of the Ugly Club and the magazine's editors also emphasises their unique point of view – even if that view is from the diminutive stature of an emmet.⁶⁴

⁶¹ *Elements*, III, pp. 4-5.

⁶² *Ibid.*, pp. 162-63.

⁶³ 'Speculations of a Rambler', *The Emmet*, 1 (31 May 1823), 97-99, (p. 99).

⁶⁴ For example Macnish's 'The Mas-Steak-Ation of Beef Steak. By the Bard of the Ugly Club' is permeated with local culture (*The Emmet*, 2 (11 October 1823), 17-21). In the second number of the 'Micromegal Lubrications' series the image of an emmet wandering the street of the Trongate, 'invisible and untangible', yet comically passing judgment on the Glasgow dandyism he observes, represents the point of view of the

As members of the club published under pseudonyms, identification of specific contributors is difficult. However, it is clear that Macnish played a central role. Several of the pieces that Macnish originally published in *The Literary Melange* were re-published in *The Emmet*, and many of his poetic contributions to *The Emmet* were then later re-published in *Fraser's Magazine* under his known pseudonym 'A Modern Pythagorean'. Macnish's propensity to re-publish material provides sufficient evidence to identify him as 'The Bard of the Ugly Club'. While Macnish also publishes material in *The Emmet* not signed by this pseudonym, the majority of his productions are identified by this title. The above discussed 'Ghosts and Dreams' essay, which Moir erroneously uses to situate Macnish within the realm of imaginative delusion, is published in *The Emmet* within 'The Bard's Register' series, all four numbers of which are attributed to 'The Bard of the Ugly Club', and 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande' is also 'By the Bard of the Ugly Club'. Within the context of the physiognomical assumptions of the Ugly Club, the connection between the physical body and the mind in Macnish's contributions is not an isolated interest, but rather represents his participation in a culture of resistance against the homogenising force of mass print culture.

In the last of a series of six 'Sketches of British Literature', 'The Bard of the Ugly Club' explains the innovative spirit of the present literary age: in contrast to the imitative tendencies of the past, following the French Revolutionary epoch, writers 'thought boldly for themselves – they surveyed nature with the ardent eyes of genius, and launched fearlessly out into the proudest deeps of poetry', and

[t]he energy of mind, which diffused itself over the nation, was exhibited nowhere more powerful than in periodical literature. Magazines were formerly the mere repositories of facts and fashions. Their prose as tame and spiritless – their poetry puling and affected. A trifling allegory, a moral lesson, a notice of some remarkable event, or a sketch of some character deceased, were the only things which adorned this species of composition. If the reader wishes to know what magazines were, let him turn to the Gentleman's which, by a sort of literary magic, has contrived to retain all the former dullness of its race, without one spark of that life which now enlivens the horizon of letters.⁶⁵

There is a degree of irony in this claim to originality by 'The Bard of the Ugly Club', as in a

magazine ('Micromegal Lubrications–No. II. Glasgow Dandyism', *The Emmet*, 1 (20 September 1823), 295-98, (p. 296)).

⁶⁵ Robert Macnish [signed The Bard of the Ugly Club], 'Sketches of British Literature. Sketch VI. The Era Including the Last Sixteen Years of George III. Down to the Present Time', *The Emmet*, 2 (3 January 1824), 157-62, (p. 160, p. 161).

previous sketch he refers to the ‘Club of Ugly Faces’ celebrated in *The Spectator*.⁶⁶ However, Macnish’s Ugly Club was indeed innovative. In *The Spectator* the importance of accepting one’s physical appearance in the name of good taste was emphasised, while in *The Emmet* ugliness became synonymous with a Romantic ideal of original genius.⁶⁷ The grotesque boar-like appearance of the Ettrick Shepherd – with his brown face and hands, coarse stringy hair, and ludicrously irregular teeth – presented in Lockhart’s *Peter’s Letters to his Kinsfolk* (1819) and subsequently reiterated by Wilson in his scathing Blackwoodian review of the ‘Memoir of the Life of James Hogg’ in 1821, may well have qualified Hogg for membership in the Ugly Club. However, Macnish’s dedication of a nightmare to Hogg may point towards the darker side of ugliness: while ugliness might symbolise originality it might also indicate an organic inability to sympathetically engage with contemporary society.⁶⁸

The Otherworldly Genius of ‘The Ettrick Shepherd’

Hogg’s close personal friend, literary confidant, and eventual brother-in-law, James Gray (1770-1830), published a series of three articles on ‘The Life and Writing of James Hogg’ in the *Edinburgh Magazine and Literary Miscellany* between January and March 1818, in which he proposes to ‘trace the progress of his genius in what we conceive to be the most favourable situation for its development’.⁶⁹ His first article opens with a deprecation of the homogenising force of fashionable education:

Nothing is so destructive of that spirit of adventure, which leads the mind into new and unexplored regions of intellect, as the pride of learning, which considers its own attainments as the limits of human knowledge, and looks down from its fancied elevation on all those who have not been taught to prate, in trim phrase, of the philosophical creed that happens to be in fashion, or of certain books written in languages that have ceased to be spoken for many centuries.⁷⁰

⁶⁶ Robert Macnish, ‘Sketches of British Literature. Sketch IV. The Era of Queen Anne’, *The Emmet*, 2 (20 December 1823), 133-38, (p. 135).

⁶⁷ *The Spectator*, ed. by Donald F. Bond, 5 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1965), I, pp. 74-78, 133-36, 204-08, 220-23, 334-37, 369-72.

⁶⁸ J. G. Lockhart, *Peter’s Letters to his Kinsfolk*, 3rd edn, 3 vols (Edinburgh, 1819), I, p. 143; John Wilson, ‘Familiar Epistles to Christopher North, from an Old Friend with a New Face. Letter I. On Hogg’s Memoirs’, *Blackwood’s*, 10 (August 1821, Part II), 43-52. For further discussion, see ‘Hogg’s Body’, in *Scott’s Shadow*, pp. 147-82.

⁶⁹ James Gray, ‘Life and Writings of James Hogg’, *Edinburgh Magazine, and Literary Miscellany*, 2 (January 1818), 35-40, (p. 36). On Gray, see ‘Notes on the Contributors’, in James Hogg, *The Spy: A Periodical Paper of Literary Amusement and Instruction: Published Weekly in 1810 and 1811*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000), pp. 562-63.

⁷⁰ ‘Life and Writings of James Hogg’, p. 35.

Gray's heartfelt lament for 'the poor child' who 'will soon be recalled from the dream of delight, in bitterness and tears, to the hated volume from which he is doomed to hear one dull sentence rung in his ears a hundred times' may well have been applied to Macnish as the unhappy young classics scholar.⁷¹ However, fortuitously for the development of his particular genius, the young James Hogg was 'nursed in the solitude of the deep glens' and 'left undisturbed to the wildness and the grandeur of his own imaginations'.⁷² The emphasis on the solitary glens and mountains of Yarrow and Ettrick looks forward to Moir's appeal to the isolated grandeur of the Highlands in his characterisation of the young Macnish's mind.⁷³ According to Gray, the richness of the impressions from his external environment were not lost on Hogg, as:

All his organs, indeed, are so acute, and all his perceptions of such uncommon vividness, and leave such complete pictures, that we believe were he to apply to art, his paintings in truth and originality of conception, at least, would be equal to his poetry.⁷⁴

Hogg's constitutional differentiation from the general population is not a trope unique to Gray's analysis. In line with the popular interest in phrenology and, more generally, the connection between corporeality and mentality in Edinburgh in the early 1820s, Thomas Doubleday (1790-1870), in his Blackwoodian critique on 'How far is Poetry an Art?', links both Hogg's natural propensity for poeticising and the influence of his upbringing to indicate that his brain is hard-wired to produce his particular type of poetry:

That thinking, whether simple perception or reflection, depends somehow or other upon the brain, seems to be clear – that the difference of fibre, in different men, must involve different states of the brain, seems unavoidable – that different states of the brain should not necessarily cause varieties in the strength of impressions and the vividness of ideas, is surely hard to be imagined. Be this as it may, whether early contingencies or original conformation be the cause, it is sufficient that the mind of a poet must of necessity have been, from the beginning, chiefly conversant with those ideas which constitute the basis of his poetry. [...] Mr. Hogg seems to have been a poet before he learned to write – nay to speak in decently grammatical, not to say polished language. Burns was something in the same way.⁷⁵

⁷¹ Ibid., pp. 35-36. For the Blackwoodian response to Gray, see John Wilson, 'Letter to Mr. James Hogg', *Blackwood's*, 2 (February 1818), 501-04.

⁷² 'Life and Writings of James Hogg', p. 36.

⁷³ For a similar appeal to landscape, see John Wilson, 'Some Observations on the Poetry of the Agricultural and that of the Pastoral Districts in Scotland, Illustrated by a Comparative View of the Genius of Burns and the Ettrick Shepherd', *Blackwood's*, 4 (February 1819), 521-29, (p. 527).

⁷⁴ 'Life and Writings of James Hogg', p. 39.

⁷⁵ Thomas Doubleday, 'How Far is Poetry an Art?', *Blackwood's*, 11 (February 1822), 153-59, (pp. 155-57).

There is a clear juxtaposition between the supposed boar-like body of the Ettrick Shepherd and the characterisation of his mind as naturally attuned to imaginative poetry. As Ian Duncan points out, the heroine of Sarah Green's *Scotch Novel Reading* (1824) is shocked and grieved by the incongruence of her imaginative vision of the Ettrick Shepherd from his writings as beautiful and his physical description in *Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk*.⁷⁶ However, even within Lockhart's grotesque physiognomy, Hogg's imaginative genius shines through, as his forehead is said to tower 'with a true poetic grandeur' above his less attractive features, while his eye 'illuminates their surface with the genuine lightnings of genius'.⁷⁷ According to Wilson, this dichotomy is reflected in the irregularity of his writings. In his scathing review of *The Three Perils of Woman* (1823) for *Blackwood's*, he writes of the 'rare union of high imagination and homely truth':

In one page, we listen to the song of the nightingale, and in another, to the grunt of the boar. Now the wood is vocal with the feathered choir; and then the sty bubbles and squeaks with a farm-sow, and a little of nineteen pigwiggins. Now "it is an angel's song, that bids the heavens be mute;" and then it is Jamie himself, routing "Love is like a dizziness; it will not let a pair bodie gang about his bizziness."⁷⁸

The evaluation of Hogg's genius is a significant feature in 'Maga' from its infancy, and within this high Tory context, his literary sphere is circumscribed to the primitivist categories of 'the traditional, the natural, and the supernatural', thus negating his ability to sympathetically engage with civilised society and therefore portray 'psychologically credible characters'.⁷⁹ Wilson makes this point explicit in his 1819 comparative article on the genius of Burns and Hogg:

He is certainly strongest in description of nature – in the imitation of the ancient ballads – and in that wild poetry which deals with imaginary beings. He has not great knowledge of human nature – nor has he any profound insight into its passions. Neither does he possess much ingenuity in the contrivance of incidents, or much plastic power in the formation of a story emblematic of any portion of human life.⁸⁰

⁷⁶ *Scott's Shadow*, p. 175. See also, David Groves, 'James Hogg as a Romantic Writer', in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference* (Edinburgh, 1985), ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1988), pp. 1-10, (pp. 1-2).

⁷⁷ *Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk*, I, p. 143.

⁷⁸ John Wilson, 'Hogg's Three Perils of Woman', *Blackwood's*, 14 (October 1823), 427-37, (p. 427).

⁷⁹ Silvia Mergenthal, 'Naturae Donum: Comments on Hogg's Self-Image and Image', *SHW*, 1 (1990), 71-79, (p. 77).

⁸⁰ John Wilson, 'Some Observations on the Poetry of the Agricultural and that of the Pastoral Districts in Scotland, Illustrated by a Comparative View of the Genius of Burns and the Ettrick Shepherd', p. 529.

An anonymous review of *The Three Perils of Woman*, published in *The Emmet* in October 1823, similarly criticises Hogg's delineation of characters:

We hold it that Mr. James Hogg is not able to give a fair and interesting picture of human manners. He possesses no consistent and philosophical views of human nature as a whole; and he has not a single shadow of that tact of mind that can follow the intricate maze of a long and intricate train of conduct, and follow it out to the opinions, feelings, and circumstances by which it is dictated, and in which it may arise.⁸¹

However, where he prevails is in 'his own sweet little land of poetry' away from 'the bodily animals of this sluggish earth', as when he comes in contact with them he is 'course' and 'vulgar' and only able to paint a 'daubish and distorted view'.⁸² Like the exiled Kilmeny, Hogg's connection to the fairy-world dooms him to a dwelling place in the land of thought. As an anonymous contributor to *The Literary Melange* explains, he is 'more conversant with the world of idea than of reality'.⁸³

Gray portrays Hogg's specific type of genius as an asset. Although he is inferior to his literary contemporaries '[i]n describing the vicissitudes of the more common forms of society' he is far superior to Byron, Scott, and even Shakespeare 'in the wildness of a fancy that holds little commerce with this world'.⁸⁴ Gray was apparently writing to raise the public opinion of Hogg's genius and moral constitution in order to promote the sale of subscription copies of *The Queen's Wake* and thereby raise Hogg to a degree of financial independence.⁸⁵ Francis Jeffrey's favorable review of *The Queen's Wake* (1813) in the *Edinburgh Review* had focused on 'Kilmeny' and its qualification as 'pure poetry'. As Jeffrey explains,

that is, poetry addressed almost exclusively to the imagination, and inspired rather by the recollection of its most fantastic and abstracted visions, than by any observation of the characters, the actions, or even the feelings of mortal men.⁸⁶

The parallel between the definition of 'pure poetry' and the contemporary view of dreaming is drawn upon by Gray in his exaltation of Hogg's imagination:

⁸¹ [signed I.], 'Review. Hogg's Three Perils of Woman', *The Emmet*, 2 (19 October 1823), 25-27, (p. 26).

⁸² *Ibid.*, p. 26.

⁸³ 'On the Language and Poetry of Scotland', *The Literary Melange*, 1 (27 November 1822), 337-40, (p. 339).

⁸⁴ James Gray, 'On the Life and Writings of James Hogg', *Edinburgh Magazine, and Literary Miscellany*, 2 (February 1818), 122-29, (p. 129).

⁸⁵ James Gray, 'On the Life and Writings of James Hogg', *Edinburgh Magazine, and Literary Miscellany*, 2 (March 1818), 215-23, (pp. 222-23).

⁸⁶ Francis Jeffrey, 'Hogg's *The Queen's Wake*', *Edinburgh Review*, 24 (November 1814), 157-74, (p. 163).

All the various shows of the visible universe, and all the doings of the elements were familiar to his imagination, which reflected on them its own lights, and called into existence a creation of its own, of such beauty and magnificence as never appeared but in the eye of inspiration. In such a situation, all his dreams were poetry.⁸⁷

In both dreaming and in ‘pure poetry’, the internal eye of the imagination dominates.

Hogg’s dream-state compositional methods are frequently portrayed in *Blackwood’s*. For example, Hogg’s composition of ‘The Royal Jubilee’ in honour of King George IV’s visit to Edinburgh in 1822 is described as follows:

He is evidently slightly insane through the whole poem, as in duty bound on such an occasion; for it would have been most monstrous and unnatural for a pastoral poet from Ettrick Forest to have kept his wits when writing a Scottish Masque, *on the spot*, to celebrate his King’s Visit to the metropolis of his native land. Accordingly, our Shepherd is like a man in a dream.⁸⁸

This portrayal serves to both compliment the Blackwoodian appraisal of Hogg’s texts and mock the psychological self-experimentation of the lake-school poets. Prior to the following extract, Hogg sings ‘When the kye comes hame’ from *The Three Perils of Man* (1822). Despite having supposedly reviewed the text (no review of *The Three Perils of Man* is printed in *Blackwood’s*), Sir Morgan Odoherty does not recognise the song:

Hogg. ‘I’se no deny that, – for to tell you the plain fact, Christopher, I had clean forgotten’t mysel’. – When the book was sent out a’ printed to Yarrowside, od! I just read the maist feck on’t as if I had never seen’t afore; and as for that sang in particular, I’ll gang before the Baillies the morn, and tak’ my affidavy that I had no more mind o’ *when* I wrote it, or *how* I wrote it, or onything whatever concerning it – no more than if it had been a screed of heathen Greek. I behoved to have written’t sometime, and someway, since it was there – but that’s a’ I kent. – I maun surely hae flung’t aff some night when I was a thought dazed, and just sent it in to the printer without looking at it in the morning. I declare I just had to learn the words or I could sing the sang, as if they had been Soothey’s, Tam Muir’s, or some other body’s, and no my ain.

Odoherty. Coleridge over again for all the world, and the Blackstone of Blarney, – “a psychological curiosity,” Hogg! – Take one hint however, and henceforth always write your songs when you are *dazed*, as you call it, – *Hibernice*, when you are in a state of civilization.⁸⁹

⁸⁷ ‘Life and Writings of James Hogg’, p. 38.

⁸⁸ ‘Hogg’s Royal Jubilee, &c.’, *Blackwood’s*, 12 (September 1822), 344-54, (p. 349).

⁸⁹ J. G. Lockhart, ‘Noctes Ambrosianae No. VIII’, *Blackwood’s*, 13 (May 1823), 592-611, (p. 599).

Unlike Coleridge, the naturally poetic mind of the Ettrick Shepherd does not require psychoactive substance to enter into dreaming consciousness. When the Shepherd experiments with the opium-induced confessional methodology of De Quincey, his natural genius is suppressed rather than inspired:

how could I CONFESS? for the sounds and the sights were baith shadows; and whare are the words for expressing the distractions o' the immaterial sowl drowning in matter, and warstling wi' unknown power to get ance mair a steady footing on the greenward o' the waking world?⁹⁰

As J. H. Alexander indicates, while Hogg is indeed often portrayed as a 'boozing buffoon' in the *Noctes*, he is also appropriated to represent the Romantic ideology of natural genius – an 'ultimately sane and healthy' imagination organically in touch with the otherworldly.⁹¹ However, the metaphor of sleep as a deadening of the rational faculties could also be used to critique Hogg's work. According to Gray, the poetic acclaim achieved through 'Kilmeny' created a false confidence in Hogg and '[w]orks produced in this sleep of the soul, are rather the grotesque images of the night-mare of a distempered fancy, than the fair visions of a sane imagination'.⁹² The 'night-mare' Gray is referring to is *The Pilgrims of the Sun*. One of the most scathing reviewers of the poem had written that Hogg is 'entirely a descriptive poet' but 'he does not paint nature, but aggravated nature; he embodies all the visions of an overheated mind, he gives the highest colouring that his fancy can suggest; but this is no difficult task; and, what is still worse, excites no sympathetic feelings in the reader's mind'.⁹³

The following chapter explores *The Pilgrims of the Sun* in closer detail. As will be seen, Hogg similarly links perception to the corporeal body, but while the poem engages with the contemporary understanding of dreaming as presented in *The Philosophy of Sleep*, Hogg subverts the progression from supernatural to rational belief explicitly forwarded by Macnish in the text. Rather than an aesthetic choice or evidence of a pathologically disturbed imagination, in Hogg's poem, viewing the supernatural in the natural world is presented as true enlightenment – as the progressive awakening of a divine consciousness.

⁹⁰ [John Wilson and perhaps J. G. Lockhart], 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XII', *Blackwood's*, 14 (October 1823), 484-503, (p. 486).

⁹¹ J. H. Alexander, 'Hogg in the *Noctes Ambrosianae*', *SHW*, 4 (1993), 37-47, (p. 42).

⁹² 'On the Life and Writings of James Hogg', p. 216.

⁹³ 'Literary Review. The Pilgrims of the Sun. By Hogg', *Theatrical Inquisitor, and Monthly Mirror*, 6 (February 1815), 130-38, (p. 137).

Chapter 2: The Dreaming Shepherd and *The Pilgrims of the Sun*

Introduction

In 1814 Hogg was encouraged by his friend, James Park of Greenock, to publish *The Pilgrims of the Sun* separately rather than as part of a volume of ‘romantic poems’ entitled *Midsummer Night Dreams*, which was intended to be ‘an extended exploration of other worlds and altered states of consciousness’.¹ Hogg asserts that Park’s enthusiasm for the poem was most probably derived from its similarity to the ballad ‘Kilmeny’, the most celebrated section of *The Queen’s Wake* (1813), which had recently brought Hogg poetic acclaim.² However, although the reception of *The Pilgrims of the Sun* in 1815 was not entirely negative, Hogg came to regret following his friend’s advice, writing in his memoir of 1821 that

Among other wild and visionary subjects, the Pilgrims of the Sun would have done very well, [...] but, as an entire poem by itself, it bears a trait of extravagance, and affords no relief from the story of a visionary existence.³

The editors of the Stirling/South Carolina edition of *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems* – the copy text for which is the second volume of *Poetical Works* (1822) – read the addition of ‘a few pages of curious notes’ as Hogg’s response to the contemporary misreading of *The Pilgrims of the Sun* (1815) as a truly disembodied experience:

When the poem was included in his 1822 *Poetical Works* Hogg was at pains to minimise this effect as far as possible, emphasising that Mary Lee’s journey should not be interpreted as a literal account of her adventures.⁴

The 1822 notes emphasise the embodied nature of Mary’s dream vision and Hogg’s ability to engage with contemporary philosophic discourse. Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830) is an attempt to provide ‘a complete account of sleep’ based on ‘his own observation’ and ‘the experience of other writers’ and does not present a new theory, but rather a compilation of the current philosophical ideas, including the work of Erasmus Darwin, Dugald Stewart, Mason

¹ James Hogg, ‘Memoir of the Life of James Hogg’, in *The Mountain Bard*, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 195–231, (p. 217); *James Hogg: A Life*, p. 121.

² ‘Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun’, p. 148.

³ ‘Memoir of the Life of James Hogg’, in *The Mountain Bard*, p. 218.

⁴ Gillian Hughes, ‘Essay on the Genesis of the Texts’, in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, pp. xiii–xlili, (p. xxviii).

Good, and the phrenologists, illustrated through collected case narratives and an appeal to his own colourful dream life.⁵ Thus, this text serves as an appropriate representation of contemporary dream theory, and the conformity of both 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande' and *The Pilgrims of the Sun* to this text supports the posited connectively between the poems.

Valentina Bold astutely indicates the eclectic range of scientific information and literary influences in *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, which evidences Hogg's ability to transcend his peasant-poet reputation; however, by disregarding the 1822 notes, she reads Mary Lee's experience as a journey of the bodyless soul. Hogg's 'recurrent image' of the bodyless soul is a central crux of her critical text, as she argues that this image represents Hogg's ambiguous status as a peasant-poet.⁶ While this image well illustrates her overall argument, Bold has arguably recapitulated the misreading of this particular poem by Hogg's contemporaries, who presumed that the superstitious Ettrick Shepherd must necessarily believe he is describing the journey of a disembodied soul, despite his poem's conduciveness to dream theory.⁷ Richard Jackson's recent article on *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and 'the Great Chain of Being' positions Hogg's poem within a Romantic tradition of striving towards divine consciousness through unworldliness of thought and tantalisingly hints at the potentially corporeal nature of Hogg's conception of the afterlife. An examination of the corporeal transformation achieved through Mary Lee's dream vision, as her body, and thus her perception, become more nearly celestial builds upon Jackson's argument and his discussion of the analogy between Mary Lee's visionary experience and Hogg's compositional act:

Hogg too was aware of the concept of a kind of high-level mental activity that is achievable perhaps by a limited number of people. Members of such an elite group are able to produce in their minds an act of transcendent imagination comparable in some degree to the divine creation of the universe. Hogg may have believed he was capable of exploring his potential in such a vein, so that this became part of the experimental nature of his poetic pilgrimage.⁸

Aesthetic experience brings one closer to the divine mind, and Hogg (to use Bold's turn of phrase) as 'a bard of nature's making', may be positioning himself as particularly adept at opening such channels to higher being. However, it is the analogy between the expansion of consciousness in both dreaming and poetry that ties together Mary Lee and Hogg's

⁵ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. vii.

⁶ Valentina Bold, *James Hogg: A Bard of Nature's Making* (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2007), p. 296.

⁷ 'Literary Review. The Pilgrims of the Sun. By Hogg', pp. 135-36. For discussion, see below, p. 44.

⁸ Richard D. Jackson, 'James Hogg's *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and the Great Chain of Being', *SHW*, 18 (2007), 65-76, (p. 74).

experiences. The following sections read Hogg's poem through the 1822 notes, in order to elucidate how the poem might be read as a physiological dream vision in relation to Macnish's work.

Embodied Dreaming

In the notes to the 1822 text of *Pilgrims*, Hogg writes that the poem is 'literally [...] the visions of one in a trance, or the wanderings of her disembodied spirit during that oblivious cessation of mortal life'.⁹ The 'disembodied spirit', however, does not wander far. Hogg's note continues:

[T]he soul's short oblivious state, as described in pp. 20-21, is supposed to correspond with the symptoms of reanimation, and the "gentle shivering of the chin," noted in the corse at Carelha'.¹⁰

The section to which Hogg refers is embedded within the most intensely cerebral action of the poem – the intensity of which overpowers 'Her every sense' (Part Second, l. 337) and causes her to lose consciousness, falling into what is apparently a trance within a trance. The cessation of dreaming consciousness leads to a reinforced connection to the corporeal frame. The maidens watching over her observe her chin to shiver, 'As the dawn arose on Carelha' (Part Fourth, l. 85). Within the dream vision, Mary Lee and Cela have reached the throne of heaven, located at the sun. In a universal act of synaesthesia, the tuneful strains of the angels' harps pours forth 'as if the sun itself | Welled forth the high and holy symphony!' (Part Second, ll. 326-27). These strains, the light of heavenly dawn, metaphorically evoking the physiological power of sublime poetics, cause her to lose consciousness in the dream and enhance the connectivity between her soul and material body.

One could view the dream vision as linked to the external sensation, in this particular case, the heat and light of the dawning sun in Carelha' striking and penetrating her material body. The philosophical discourse on dreaming, from its early classical roots through the early modern period, hinged on the determination of dreaming consciousness as being linked either to mundane psychological and physiological phenomena or divine transcendent intervention.¹¹

⁹ 'Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun', p. 148.

¹⁰ Ibid., p. 148.

¹¹ Steven F. Kruger, *Dreaming in the Middle Ages* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992; repr. 1993), p. 18; Anthony Collin Spearing, *Medieval Dream-Poetry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, Cambridge,

A literal reading of the Old Testament would necessitate the possibility of divine revelation through dream vision, at least in the pre-Apostolic era, and as Macnish indicates,

The whole book of Revelations is one magnificent dream – one gush of the Divine Spirit overflowing the mind of its author in sleep, and bringing the most distant ages in emblem before his eyes.¹²

However, by the early nineteenth century, the authoritative writers on dreaming did not factor dreams of divine origin into their mainstream theoretical systems, but rather noted the possibility of divine dreams in accordance with biblical authority.¹³ By this time the mundane/divine debate had manifested into an examination of dreaming phenomena as a test ground for empiricist philosophy and associationist psychology.¹⁴ While the fantastical nature of some dreams and the Romantic ideal of transcendent inspiration challenged the notion that all complex ideas were derived from experienced simple impressions, the active role of the corporeal body in processing physical sensation into vivid mental imagery provided an embodied individualisation of genius.

Macnish explains how in dreams ‘[s]tupendous events arise from the most insignificant causes – so completely does sleep magnify and distort every thing placed within its influence’.¹⁵ Simple impressions made on the external body, such as the feeling of our feet slipping off the side of the bed, perhaps lead us to ‘imagine ourselves standing upon the brink of a fearful precipice, and ready to tumble from its beetling summit into the abyss beneath’, or the sound of a flute playing might ‘evoke a thousand beautiful and delightful associations’, perhaps filling the air with ‘the tones of harps’ and visible performers.¹⁶ Such ‘intense exaggeration’ is the ‘province of dreams’ – ‘exaggeration beyond even the wildest conceptions of Oriental romance’.¹⁷ Impressions previously made on the mind are also believed to influence dreaming. Macnish writes of the baneful effects of Gothic novels in producing the images of nightmare:

If, for instance, we had been engaged in the perusal of such works as “The Monk,” “The

1976), pp. 8-11.

¹² *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 102.

¹³ James Beattie, ‘Of Dreaming’, in *Dissertations Moral and Critical* (London: Strahan; Cadell; Edinburgh: Creech, 1783), pp. 207-30; Erasmus Darwin, ‘Of Sleep’, in *Zoonomia; or, the Laws of Organic Life*, 2 vols (Dublin: Byrne and Jones, 1794-1796), I, pp. 214-38.

¹⁴ Ford, pp. 9-33.

¹⁵ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 60.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 58, p. 61.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 60. Beattie and Stewart similarly provide examples of external impressions on the body giving rise to dreams (*Dissertations Moral and Critical*, p. 217; *Elements*, I, p. 328).

Mysteries of Udolpho,” or “Satan’s Invisible World Discovered;” and if an attack of night-mare should supervene, it will be aggravated into sevenfold horror by the spectral phantoms with which our minds have been thereby filled. We will enter into all the fearful mysteries of these writings, which, instead of being mitigated by slumber, acquire an intensity which they never could have possessed in the waking state.¹⁸

Mary Lee’s religious contemplation and reading of ‘books of deep divinity’ (Part First, l. 34) are portrayed as obsessive, and as such, her heavenly journey might be read as an exaggeration of her previous mental exertion.

Macnish’s tale ‘The Dream Confirmed’, published in Constable’s *Edinburgh Magazine, and Literary Miscellany* in 1826, but according to Moir, most probably written much earlier, is informed entirely by the continued vigilance of the senses during sleep.¹⁹ However, Macnish deviates from his own philosophy of sleep in ‘Dramatic Sketch. An Angel of God, and a Spirit of the Just’, first published in *The Literary Melange*, and later re-worked in collaboration with Moir and published anonymously as a pamphlet titled ‘The Angel and the Spirit. A Mystery’. The Angel announces his presence to the Spirit in the opening:

I have come from heaven’s immortal sanctuary
To visit thee, fair Spirit, whom I oft
Have visited in dreams, while yet though wert
Imprisoned in thy tenement of earth.²⁰

Macnish is here appealing to the externalist theory of the Scottish natural philosopher and metaphysician, Andrew Baxter (1686/7-1750), which, in short, in a significant counter-argument to the mechanical view of dreaming in the eighteenth century, argued that immortal spirits take over the external sensory apparatus during sleep and stimulate them so as to generate motions of the nerves and the corresponding ideas, thus explaining the apparent novelty of the ideas generated during dreaming consciousness despite the apparent passivity of the dreamer.²¹ Lockean epistemology and divine revelation are both maintained, as the site of divine intervention descends to the anatomical origins of the simple impression. While in his ‘Ghosts and Dreams’ essay, Macnish defends the aesthetic appeal of Baxter’s theory, in *The Philosophy of Sleep*, Macnish presents his theory as ‘chimerical’ and ‘totally unsupported by

¹⁸ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 128.

¹⁹ *Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 38-39. Robert Macnish, ‘The Dream Confirmed’, *Edinburgh Magazine, and Literary Miscellany*, 18 (February 1826), 201-09.

²⁰ Robert Macnish, ‘Dramatic Sketch. An Angel of God, and a Spirit of the Just’, *The Literary Melange*, 2 (8 January 1823), 23-25, (p. 23).

²¹ Andrew Baxter, *An Enquiry into the Nature of the Human Soul; Wherein the Immateriality of the Soul is Evinc’d from the Principles of Reason and Philosophy*, 3rd edn, 2 vols (London: Millar, 1745).

evidence’.²² However, he also asserts the analogy between dreaming and artistic media, as both involve the suspension of disbelief:

The illusion of dreams is much more complete than that of the most exquisite plays. We pass, in a second of time, from one country to another; and persons who lived in the most different ages of the world are brought together in strange and incongruous confusion. It is not uncommon to see, at the same moment, Alexander the Great, Julius Caesar, and Marlborough in close conversation. Nothing, in short, however monstrous, incredible, or impossible, seems absurd.²³

Improbability, as such, is the province of dreams and imaginative poetry.

Hogg evokes Baxter’s externalist explanation in the prose tale, ‘A Singular Dream From a Correspondent’, as the correspondent alleges that ‘the dream was a whisper conveyed to my fancy by one of those guardian spirits that watch over the affairs of mortal men’.²⁴ This tale was first published in the 48th number of *The Spy* as ‘Evil Speaking Ridiculed by an Allegorical Dream, &c. – Its Injurious Tendency – Character of Adam Bryden’ on 27 July 1811, thus evidencing Hogg’s awareness of this theory prior to the publication of *The Pilgrims of the Sun*.²⁵ The presence of a heavenly-guide, and Mary Lee’s passivity on her journey, may indicate an influence of the externalist theory, and the ‘commissioned spirits’ of heaven who ‘renew | Their watch and guardianship in far distant lands’ (Part Second, ll. 305-06) may exert their influence in dreams.

Despite Macnish’s attribution of acceptable improbability to artistic media, he enhances the rational currency of Hogg’s text when it is used as a poetical headpiece in *The Philosophy of Sleep*. In the chapter on ‘Trance’, Macnish is at pains to emphasise the illusory nature of suspended animation:

The nature of this peculiar species of suspended animation, seems to be totally unknown, for there is such an apparent extinction of every faculty essential to life, that it is unconceivable how existence should go on during the continuance of the fit. There can be no doubt, however, that the suspension of the heart and lungs is more apparent than real.²⁶

The depiction of Mary Lee’s physical body during her trance in ‘Part Fourth’ is selected as the

²² *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 51.

²³ *Ibid.*, p. 82.

²⁴ James Hogg, ‘A Singular Dream From a Correspondent’, in *Winter Evening Tales*, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002; repr. 2004), pp. 159-65, (p. 164).

²⁵ *The Spy*, pp. 475-81.

²⁶ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 224.

headpiece for this chapter, most probably due to its physical descriptiveness of the phenomenon of suspended animation:

They saw her stretched on the sward alone,
Prostrate, without a word or motion,
As if in calm and deep devotion!
They laid their hands on her cheek composed;
But her cheek was cold, and her eye was closed.
They laid their hands upon her breast;
But her playful heart seemed sunk to rest.²⁷

The extract is, however, a partial and possibly deliberate misquotation of Hogg's poem. The final line should read 'But the playful heart had sunk to rest' (Part Fourth, l. 50). The replacement of 'had' with 'seemed' in the headpiece misconstrues the poem to support the illusory nature of suspended animation. Although Hogg works to emphasise Mary Lee's pilgrimage as a dream vision in the notes, the poetic text appears to disregard a vital link to the earthly sphere: the maintenance of animal life. As Moir helped with the selection of the poetic headpieces for the chapters, whether Moir or Macnish made this editorial adjustment is uncertain.²⁸ Regardless, this objection to the apparent literal death of Mary Lee is not singular.

In the first note Hogg appears to be responding directly to a scathing review published in the *Theatrical Inquisitor* in February 1815. The reviewer believes that Hogg is attempting to portray Mary Lee's pilgrimage as a truly disembodied experience yet reads Hogg's poem as evidence for contemporary dream theory. Referring to the description of Mary Lee's corpse (the same passage utilised by Macnish), the reviewer writes:

The lines which follow are eminently beautiful; it is impossible to read them without the liveliest conviction of their truth, yet they evince, and strongly, the justice of our doctrine; the mind of man cannot invent; it only combines and colours existing images; here, while the poet imagines he is describing a body from which the soul has fled, he is in fact describing it in a state of sleep; the case of the error may easily be seen; as he intended to renovate the earthy substance, it was necessary it should not die and undergo the usual changes; but what is death unless it be the separation of the body from the soul?²⁹

Hogg's reference to deeply embedded internal evidence for the embodied nature of the dream-vision (i.e. the shivering chin in the corpse at Carelha') emphasises that he had a sophisticated

²⁷ Ibid., p. 222.

²⁸ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 4 September 1830, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

²⁹ 'Literary Review. The Pilgrims of the Sun. By Hogg', pp. 135-36.

awareness of contemporary dream theory, and thus had the ability, like Macnish, to subscribe or deviate from that theory as poetic license warranted. However, it is probable that Hogg only intended to depict the attendants' perception of Mary Lee's physical body as truly deceased.

In their attempts to wake Mary Lee from her trance, the attendants apply intense physical stimuli to her body:

Between her breasts they dropped the lead,
And the cord in vain begirt her head; (Part Fourth, ll. 80-81)

Their attempts fit Macnish's recommendation to 'employ stimuli to arouse the person from his torpor, such as friction, the application of sternutatories and volatile agents to the nostrils, and electricity'.³⁰ However, Mary Lee will not awaken, as 'no life is there!' (Part Fourth, l. 79) Bold argues that the wound inflicted by the grave-robbing monk in 'Part Fourth' 'provides a semi-rational explanation for reanimation', which is uncut by the fact that 'Mary withstood hot lead'.³¹ However, the apparent incongruence of Mary Lee's response to the dawning sun at Carelha' and the grave-robbing monk, versus her lack of response to the hot lead, fits Macnish's description of persons' responses to stimuli in trance-state, as 'protracted trances [...] sometimes continue for days at a time, and become spontaneously broken, after resisting the influence of the most powerful stimuli'.³² Ultimately, if the dawning sun over Carelha' and the grave-robbing monk stimulate reanimation, it is because the divine creator, and his analogue, the artistic creator, choose to work through this natural means, as Mary Lee's body will not be artificially galvanised by the 'proud science' (Part Second, l. 260) '[o]f high presuming man' (Part Second, l. 115).

The Dreaming Poet and the Metaphorical Mind of God

Mary Lee's journey does not take place in the spatiotemporal continuum of reality, but rather within the numinous world of dreaming consciousness:

They journeyed on – not like the earthly pilgrim,
Fainting with hunger, thirst, and burning feet,
But, leaning forward on the liquid air,
[...]

³⁰ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 232.

³¹ *James Hogg: A Bard of Nature's Making*, p. 164.

³² *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 234.

After a thousand years' progression, they
Stepped on the confines of that land of life,
Of bliss unspeakable and evermore. (Part Second, ll. 176-78, ll. 199-201)

In the notes, Hogg writes that 'the throne of the Almighty being placed in the centre of the sun' should be viewed imaginatively rather than literally, 'infinitude and omnipresence being attributes too sacred and too boundless for admission into an enthusiast's dream'.³³ However, the ability of a dream to coalesce what in waking consciousness would compose a long train of ideas into compact representational imagery make the dream vision the ideal mode of depiction, indicating a potential tone of irony in Hogg's note. Only through the imagistic language of dreams could the ineffability of infinitude and omnipresence be transcended. Macnish discusses the non-spatiotemporal quality of dreaming consciousness:

Time, in fact, seems to be in great measure annihilated. An extensive period is reduced, as it were, to a single point, or rather a single point is made to embrace an extensive period. [...] The thoughts which arise in such situations are endless, and assume an infinite variety of aspects. The whole, indeed, constitutes one of the strangest phenomena of the human mind, and calls to recollection the story of the Eastern monarch, who, on dipping his head into the magician's water-pail, fancied he had travelled for years in various nations, although he was only immersed for a single instant.³⁴

In Hogg's 'land of life', the omnipresence of divine consciousness is metaphorically represented by 'Ten thousand thousand messengers' (Part Second, l. 298) who 'roam existence' (Part Second, l. 301). Each messenger goes off 'in directions opposite' (Part Second, l. 307) and collectively cover 'every point of heaven' (Part Second, l. 308). Omnipresence is conceptualised as a division of labour, thus evoking the faculty psychology of the common sense philosophers and phrenologists later utilised in *The Philosophy of Sleep*. Further, the divine's consciousness manifests the human mental quality of association of ideas, as the messengers:

[...] gave their report,
Not at the throne, but at the utmost seats
Of these long files of throned seraphim,
By whom the word was passed. (Part Second, ll. 301-04)

The seraphim 'sat with eyes turned to the inmost point | Leaning upon their harps' (Part

³³ 'Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun', p. 149.

³⁴ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), pp. 61-62.

Second, ll. 269-270), and the moment of divine omnipresence is realised when the seraphim strike a heavenly chord upon their harps in response to the command:

[...] that all tongues,
Kindreds, and tribes, should join, with one accord,
In hymn of adoration and acclaim (Part Second, ll. 312-14)

Mary Lee's sensory apparatus is still too 'linked to erring frail humanity' (Part Second, l. 375) to withstand the intensity of the divine choir, and the strains

[...] o'erpowered
Her every sense; and down she sunk entranced
By too supreme delight [...] (Part Second, ll. 336-38)

This loss of consciousness within the dream vision is a critical event in Mary Lee's pilgrimage and represents, on a microcosmic level, the didactic purpose of the overall dream vision for Mary Lee and of sublime poetics for the Romantic reader: sublimation of 'frame and vision' (Part Second, l. 169). Upon waking, she is able to hear the hymn of God's omnipresence, 'converse with the saints' (Part Second, l. 376), and then move 'straight across the regions of the blest' (Part Second, l. 382). A transformation has taken place in the trance within a trance, which as discussed above, is a point of enhanced connectivity to her material body.

Transformation is a key trope in the ballad tradition from which Hogg draws inspiration, and in both 'Kilmeny' and in 'Part First' of *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, Hogg utilises the balladic symbolism of water as a liminal boundary to portray sensorial attunement. Kilmeny's body is laid in the stream of life before she can 'see quhat mortyl nevir had seine' (l. 1495). In *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, '[w]hen first from out the sea she peeped' (Part First, l. 139), Mary Lee views the Queen of Night rise up to spread its light and set off a pattern of reflections illuminating the brilliancy of direct light over the '[t]rembling and pale' (Part First, l. 156) light of indirect perception available to those inhibited by mortal eyes. However, in 'Part Second' the ballad form is abandoned for Miltonic blank verse – the 'hill-harp' (Part First, l. 297) for the 'holy harp of Judah's land' (Part First, l. 301) – and the balladic symbolism of water for an embodied conception of sensorial attunement with explicit physiological references to 'vision' (Part Second, l. 33) and 'rays' (Part Second, l. 36). The optical system of the celestial beings who have achieved sensorial attunement with the deity have 'eyes that took no image on their spheres' (Part Second, l. 207), or, in other words, no

longer need the retina to act as ‘the sentinel which guards the pass between the worlds of matter and of spirit’, as in their purified frames, matter and spirit have become one.³⁵

When Mary Lee returns to the natural world, she begets ‘[f]ive gallant sons’ (Part Fourth, l. 430) with the bardic shepherd, Hugo of Norrway, the earthly manifestation of her heavenly guide, Cela. In ‘Part Third’ Cela glorifies motherhood as a necessary component in the pathway to perfection and as the biological link between immortal souls:

The tree was reared immortal fruit to bear;
And she, all selfish chusing to remain,
Nor share of love the pleasures and the pain,
Was made and cherished by her God in vain;
She sinks into the dust a nameless thing,
No son the requiem o’er her grave to sing.
While she who gives to human beings birth,
Immortal here, is living still on earth;
Still in her offspring lives, to fade and bloom,
Flourish and spread through ages long to come. (Part Third, ll. 104-13)

Mary Lee has progressed on her journey towards corporeal and mental perfection through the act of motherhood, and Hogg presents himself as one of her perfected prodigy as ‘[h]er blood yet runs in Minstrel veins’ (Part Fourth, l. 280). ‘Hogg’s MS Notes to *The Pilgrims of the Sun*’ include a sentence that is removed in the printed version of 1822, wherein Hogg expresses that his solar image of infinitude and omnipresence is ‘an idea of which I never can entirely <rid> *divest* myself in all my contemplations of the glories of nature’.³⁶ Hogg’s levels of confidence were clearly at a high when he composed *The Pilgrims of the Sun*.

Philosophical Incredulity

According to Note III, a poetical friend of Hogg’s ‘made particular objections’ to the following stanza:

When past the firmament of air,
Where no attractive influence came;
There was no up, there was no down,
But all was space, and all the same.³⁷

³⁵ Sir David Brewster, *Letters on Natural Magic, Addressed to Sir Walter Scott, Bart.*, 5th edn (London: Murray, 1842), p. 10.

³⁶ ‘Appendix 2: Hogg’s MS Notes to *The Pilgrims of the Sun*’, in *Midsummer Nights Dreams and Related Poems*, pp. 155-58, (p. 156).

³⁷ ‘Notes to *The Pilgrims of the Sun*’, p. 149.

Mary Lee and Cela leave the rational Newtonian world behind them as they enter into the numinous spatiotemporal realm of dreaming consciousness, in which, according to this stanza, the laws of gravitation no longer apply. Metaphorically, the suspension of ‘attractive influence’ may be equated with the suspension of the reasoning powers during dreaming consciousness. As Macnish indicates, ‘The mind is wholly subject to the sceptre of the imagination; and whatever sounds and sights this faculty evokes, seem to be real, for want of a controlling power to point out their true character.’³⁸ Like many of the contemporary reviewers, Hogg’s poetical friend appears to view Mary Lee and Cela’s journey as a literal journey through the astrological universe, rather than as a mental journey:

“For ye ken , Sir,” said he, “that wherever a man may be, or can possibly be, whether in a bodily or spiritual state, there maun aye be a firmament aboon his head, and something or other below his feet. In short, it is impossible for a being to be any where in the boundless universe in which he winna find baith an *up* and a *down*.”³⁹

Hogg writes that he was ‘obliged to give in’ to his friend’s argument, and was ‘so amused with the man’s stubborn incredulity’ that he introduced the objection into the last part of the poem.⁴⁰ However, the context in which the incredulity is introduced in ‘Part Fourth’ evidences censure rather than amusement.

The analogy between the pilgrim’s mental journey and the progressive and continuous development of mankind drives the visionary sections of the poem. The cosmological movement of all of mankind towards perfection involves mental attunement to the beauties and joys of God’s universe, as ‘Knowledge of all, avails the human kind, | For all beyond the grave are joys of mind’ (Part Third, ll. 175-76). In contrast, ‘the enlightened philosophic mind’ (Part Third, l. 165) is unable to progress towards true spiritual enlightenment, and their eternal stagnation is vividly portrayed in one hellish sphere:

Far in the gloom they found a world accursed,
Of all the globes the dreariest and the worst!
But there they could not sojourn, though they would,
For all the language was of mystic mood,
A jargon, nor conceived, nor understood;
It was of deeds, respondents, and replies,
Dark quibbles, forms, and condescendencies;

³⁸ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 80.

³⁹ ‘Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun’, p. 149.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 149.

And they would argue, with vociferous breath,
For months and days, as if the point were death;
And when at last enforced to agree,
'Twas only how the argument should be! (Part Third, ll. 353-63)

The pilgrims cannot enter into this world because their fluid mental associations and progression to perfection would be halted.

In 'Part Fourth' of the poem, after Mary awakes, an additional metaphorical layer comes to fruition, namely, the inability for oral tradition to continue to develop and thrive when incredulous commentators cut short the creative process by dismissing the tale as irrational and therefore of no didactic or imaginative value. The story of Mary's re-animation from death-like trance and the visionary journey that she experienced whilst in this state enters into the public domain of oral transmission; however, the rational discounting of the tale removes it from the communal consciousness:

'Twas trowed by every Border swain,
The vision would full credence gain.
Certes 'twas once by all believed,
Till one great point was misconceived;
For the mass-men said, with fret and frown,
That through all space it well was known,
By moon, or stars, the earth or sea,
An up and down there needs must be:
This error caught their minds in thrall;
'Twas dangerous and apocryphal!
And this nice fraud unhinged all.
So grievous is the dire mischance
Of priest-craft and of ignorance! (Part Fourth, ll. 262-74)

Like the enlightened philosophers of metaphysical hell, the mass-men quibbling over the tale's accordance with natural law leads to mental stagnation for them as individuals and stagnation in the tale's transmission as part of the communal consciousness. Like Hogg's poetical friend, the mass-men have misunderstood the nature of the tale with which they are dealing, and therefore apply an incompatible rule-based system of analysis. Hogg's note ridicules the inappropriate incredulity of many of his contemporaries in dealing with tales produced in contexts out with the rational Newtonian worldview of post-Enlightenment Scotland. The only 'unalterable law' is '[t]hat human life is but the infant stage | Of a progressive, endless pilgrimage' (Part Third, l. 406, ll. 407-08), and throughout the course of this pilgrimage, as

Mary's mental journey suggests, our perceptual interpretation of the astrological universe, may in fact, change.

At the time of the original publication of *The Pilgrims of the Sun* in 1815, John Ferriar's *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions* (1813) had recently promised to release 'the reader of history [...] from the embarrassment of rejecting evidence, in some of the plainest narratives'.⁴¹ Ferriar's text recounts numerous narratives – both ancient and modern – of apparitional visitations and demonic encounters, which the Humean sceptic would be forced to discount as breaches of the laws of nature.⁴² However, his corporealised theory of apparitions, based on the observation that 'impressions produced on some of the external senses, particularly the eye, are more durable than the application of the impressing cause' and the imagination's active ability to distort and magnify these previous impressions into diabolical forms, encouraged the acceptance of such narratives as valid reports of subjective experience, as 'to disqualify the senses, or the veracity of those who witness unusual appearances, is the utmost tyranny of prejudice'.⁴³ Hogg's utilisation of a dream vision to ground supernatural experience in the corporeal body brings Mary Lee's tale into the domain of such tales.

The Philosophy of Sleep includes some of the same narratives as Ferriar's earlier text, and both texts emphasise the psychological and potentially physical distress of believing apparitions to be real. Through his philosophical approach, Ferriar believes 'the terror of nocturnal illusions would thus be dissipated, to the infinite relief of many wretched creatures', and Macnish defines such 'wretched creatures' as those whose faculties are 'too weak to correct the sensorial impressions of dreams' and thus suffer 'painful illusions'.⁴⁴ As Valentina Bold has argued, Hogg was also 'fascinated by the psychologically destructive side of the supernatural', and she cites Hogg's utilisation of the phenomena of self-predicted death in *The Three Perils of Woman*, 'All Hallow's Eve', and 'George Dobson's Expedition to Hell' as evidence.⁴⁵ Belief leads to agency, even if it takes us to Hell. However, in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* it is Mary Lee's belief that Hugo of Norroway is the embodiment of her heavenly guide, Cela, which leads her to marry and beget the gallant sons that ensure the heavenly lineage of the Ettrick Shepherd.

⁴¹ *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions*, p. 139.

⁴² See, David Hume, 'Of Miracles', in *An Enquiry concerning Human Understanding*, ed. by Tom L. Beauchamp (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), pp. 169-86.

⁴³ *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions*, pp. 15-16, p. 137.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 138; *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 83.

⁴⁵ Valentina Bold, 'Traditional Narrative Elements in *The Three Perils of Woman*', *SHW*, 3 (1992), 42-56, (p. 51).

The Astrological Discourses of Thomas Chalmers

In the notes to the 1822 text, Hogg refers to the connection made by the reading public between the theology of *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and the ‘sublime astronomical sermons’ of ‘Dr. Chalmers’.⁴⁶ Hogg is here referring to the Reverend Thomas Chalmers (1780-1847), an evangelical minister of the Free Church of Scotland, whose *Discourses on the Christian Revelation, Viewed in Connection with the Modern Astronomy* (1817), a collection of sermons delivered from the pulpit of the Tron Church in Glasgow between November 1815 and October 1816, ‘went through nine editions and nearly twenty thousand copies inside the year’.⁴⁷ The *Astronomical Discourses* kept pace with the sale of Scott’s *Tales of my Landlord* (1817), and Chalmers’s son-in-law, Reverend William Hanna, asserts that it was ‘the first volume of Sermons which fairly broke the lines which had separated too long the literary from the religious public’.⁴⁸ Hogg composed *The Pilgrims of the Sun* in the summer of 1814, and the first published edition was available prior to the delivery of Chalmers’s first astrological sermon on 23 November 1815. Therefore, any possible line of influence, evidenced by Hogg’s note to the text and observed similarities between the respective texts, must run from Hogg to Chalmers. If this is indeed the case, the influence of *The Pilgrims of the Sun* on popular cultural discourse at this time is far wider than previously acknowledged by critics, and Hogg’s note to the text may indicate his desire to evidence this plausible influence to his contemporaries.

In his note Hogg extracts Mary Lee’s response to the shocking insignificance of the earth within the vastness of God’s universe in order to illustrate the plausibility of the perceived intertextuality between *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and Chalmers’s *Astronomical Discourses*:

“I see all these fair worlds inhabited
By beings of intelligence and mind.
O! Cela, tell me this – Have they all fallen,
And sinned like us? And has a living God
Bled in each one of all these peopled worlds!
Or only on yon dark and dismal spot

⁴⁶ ‘Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun’, p. 149.

⁴⁷ Boyd Hilton, *The Age of Atonement: The Influence of Evangelicalism on Social and Economic Thought, 1795-1865* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988), p. 56; Stewart J. Brown, *Thomas Chalmers and the Godly Commonwealth* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982), pp. 107-09.

⁴⁸ William Hanna, *Memoirs of Thomas Chalmers, D.D. LL.D.*, 2 vols (Edinburgh: Constable; London: Hamilton, Adams, and Co., 1857), I, p. 415.

Hath one Redeemer suffered for them all?”⁴⁹

Just prior to the extracted piece, the pilgrims look out over the heavens from a vast mountain, and Hogg evokes mechanistically specific, telescopic imagery in his description of the enhanced vision of the pilgrims:

[...] Raised as they were now
To the high fountain-head of light and vision,
Where'er they cast their eyes abroad, they found
The light behind, the object still before;
And on the rarefied and pristine rays
Of vision borne, their piercing sight passed on
Intense and all unbounded – Onward! – onward! (Part Second, ll. 32-38)

From this ‘elevated platform, from whence he may cast a surveying glance over the arena of innumerable worlds’, Mary Lee assumes that the earth must be ‘far more extensive’ and ‘fair | Than all the rest’ (Part Second, ll. 90-91).⁵⁰ However, Cela checks the boasts of ‘high presuming man’ (Part Second, l. 115) by identifying the earth as ‘a thing subordinate – a sphere | Unseemly and forbidding’ (Part Second, ll. 141-42) and asks,

What think'st thou now of thy Almighty maker,
And of this goodly universe of his? (Part Second, ll. 143-44)

The ‘dangerous doubt’ expressed by the virgin is the same doubt which Chalmers wishes to disperse with his *Astronomical Discourses*.⁵¹ In the preface to the printed collection, he writes,

There is an imposing splendour in the science of Astronomy; and it is not to be wondered at, if the light it throws, or appears to throw, over other tracks of speculation than those which are properly its own, should at times dazzle and mislead an inquirer [...] The assertion is, that Christianity is a religion which professes to be designed for the single benefit of our world; and the inference is, that God cannot be the author of this religion, for He would not lavish on so insignificant a field, such peculiar and such distinguishing attentions, as are ascribed to Him in the Old and New Testament.⁵²

The ultimate connectivity of the divine universal plan, the ‘viewless golden cord’ (Part

⁴⁹ ‘Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun’, p. 149.

⁵⁰ Thomas Chalmers, *Discourses on the Christian Revelation, Viewed in Connection with the Modern Astronomy. To which are added, Discourses Illustrative of the Connection between Theology and General Science* (Glasgow: Collins; London: Hamilton, Adams, & Co., [n.d.]), p. 91.

⁵¹ ‘Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun’, p. 149.

⁵² *Discourses on the Christian Revelation*, p. v, p. vi.

Second, l. 139) connecting all the heavens, and the resultant significance of the divine intervention on earth, is inductively argued by Chalmers and imaginatively portrayed by Hogg in order to accommodate the vastness of the astronomically revealed universe to the Christian salvation. James Beattie makes a similar argument in his treatise on the *Evidences of the Christian Religion* (1786), and as this objection was a popular issue, Hogg may have been influenced by any number of sources. The direct consequence of man's Fall from grace is the separation of human from divine consciousness and, resultantly, the inability of man to grasp the divine universal plan while on his earthly pilgrimage. However, according to Chalmers, prior to the Fall, the 'first parents [...] had frequent and familiar intercourse with God', and the Christian salvation shall return man to his prior intimacy with the deity.⁵³

The telescope expanded the distances at which man's visual system might functionally operate. However, according to Chalmers, scientific advancements do nothing to remove 'that unscaled barrier, beyond which no power, either of eye or of telescope, shall ever carry him', and similarly, Hogg emphasises that the vast time-scale of the progressive perfection of the human soul is beyond what 'thought can fathom, or proud science climb!' (Part Second, l. 260).⁵⁴ The barrier between man and divinity is manifested mentally in the trappings of subjective consciousness but is essentially rooted in the physical body. Man's ill-equipped sensory apparatus must physically change for men to enter into communion with divinity:

he must be provided with a new faculty – and, as before, a change behoved to be made upon the senses; so now, ere heaven can be heaven to its occupier, a change must be made upon his mind.⁵⁵

In the journey that follows Mary Lee's confused interpretation of astrologically revealed earthly insignificance, the impenetrable veil is progressively lifted, as her imperfect sensory apparatus is attuned to the divine mind. The spheres closest to the sun are inhabited by beings which '[n]eared to perfection' (Part Second, l. 248), and prior to Mary Lee's sensorial transformation, a veil stands between her and these inner realms:

Within the verge of that extended region
Our travellers stood. Farther they could not press,
For round the light and glory threw a pale,
Repellent, but to them invisible;

⁵³ Ibid., p. 96.

⁵⁴ Ibid., p. 91.

⁵⁵ Ibid., pp. 306-07.

Yet myriads were within of purer frame. (Part Second, ll. 293-97)

Similarly, the inhabitants of the celestial spheres in Chalmers discourses have not experienced the Fall from grace and therefore continue to sympathise with the divine mind, as '[t]he veil is from off their eyes; and they see the character of a presiding Divinity in every scene, and in every event to which the Divinity has given birth'.⁵⁶ However, in Hogg's poem, the veil can never be lifted in its entirety, as 'the mould of that mysterious chain | Which bound them to the sun – that God himself, | And he alone, could comprehend or wield' (Part Second, ll. 402-04).

In *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and the *Astronomical Discourses* the Old Testament view of the human person as entirely physical is advocated, rather than the Cartesian conceptualisation of a strict divide between the material body and the soul. Ted Peters, in an essay on the compatibility of modern neuroscience and Christianity, indicates that a belief in the separate existence of an immaterial soul is unnecessary and is, in fact, a false conflation of Christian theology and Cartesian dualism, as through the ages 'Christian teaching regarding the resurrection has consistently insisted on embodied salvation'.⁵⁷ In Hogg's poem Cela instructs Mary Lee on the embodied nature of resurrection after she mistakenly presumes that the 'purity of frame' (Part Third, l. 66) of those who reside on a sphere closer to the sun and therefore to divine existence, 'the land of lovers, known afar, | And named the Evening and the Morning star' (Part Third, ll. 147-48), is due to death while still in blooming youth (Part Third, ll. 68-71):

"Thou see'st them lovely – so they will remain;
For when the soul and body meet again,
No 'vantage will be held of age, or time,
United at their fairest fullest prime.
The form when purest, and the soul most sage,
Beauty with wisdom shall have heritage,
The form of comely youth, the experience of age. (Part Third, ll. 134-40)

This prefigures Hogg's later illustration of the 'advantage of an old and experienced soul getting possession of a young and healthy frame' in 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul'

⁵⁶ Ibid., p. 98.

⁵⁷ Ted Peters, 'Resurrection of the Very Embodied Soul?', in *Neuroscience and the Person: Scientific Perspectives on Divine Action*, ed. by Robert John Russell, Nancey Murphy, Theo C. Meyering, and Michael A. Arbib (Vatican City State: Vatican Observatory Publications; Berkeley, CA: Center for Theology and Natural Sciences, 1999), pp. 305-26, (p. 313). See also, Paul Badham, *Christian Beliefs About Life After Death* (London: The Macmillan Press, 1976), p. 47.

and points towards an ironical reading of this mock-philosophical essay.⁵⁸ As Richard Jackson has indicated, Andrew Baxter forwards an embodied conception of the afterlife, positing that ‘a small quantity of that bulk of matter that now composes them, will serve for corporeal systems in those *finer regions*’, and Joseph Priestley (1733-1804) and Thomas Forester (1789-1860) similarly appeal to an embodied conception of the afterlife in their defences of materialism.⁵⁹ In the *Discourses Illustrative of the Connection between Theology and General Science* attached to later editions of the *Astronomical Discourses*, Chalmers delineates his conceptualisation of the embodied salvation, as ‘[t]here is reason for believing, that some of the matter of our present bodies may exist in those more glorified and transformed bodies which we are afterwards to occupy’.⁶⁰ This is in apparent contrast to the ‘common imagination’ of paradise as ‘a lofty aërial region, where the inmates float in ether, or are mysteriously suspended upon nothing’.⁶¹ Hogg’s evocation of a literal conceptualisation of the resurrection places him within a line of writers working to mediate materialism and a truly supernatural Christianity.

In his short chapter on ‘Sleep of the Soul’, Macnish presents the two contending theories regarding ‘the state of the soul during that period which elapses between death and the resurrection’:

Some conceive that, on the decease of the body, it is at once transferred to the endless pain or bliss awarded towards it by the fiat of the Eternal. Others imagine that it continues in a state of sleep till the Day of Judgment; when it awakes from the torpor which enchained it in forgetfulness; and, from that moment, enters, at once, into everlasting punishment or everlasting felicity.⁶²

Macnish imaginatively evokes both theories in his poetic works. In ‘The Bard’s Register. No. II. The Tomb of Ellenore’ the later theory is evoked, as Ellenore is said to ‘sleep on thy couch of death’ and is addressed: ‘O! Ellenore, till the last hour of dread, | Sleep on – no spell can

⁵⁸ James Hogg, ‘On the Separate Existence of the Soul’, *Fraser’s*, 4 (December 1831), 529-37, (p. 537). See below, p. 179.

⁵⁹ Baxter, I, pp. 292-93, as quoted in ‘James Hogg’s *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and the Great Chain of Being’, p. 74; Joseph Priestley, ‘Introductory Essays. Essay I. A General View of the Doctrine of Vibrations’, in David Hartley, *Hartley’s Theory of the Human Mind, on the Principle of the Association of Ideas; with Essays Relating to the Subject of It. By Joseph Priestley, LL. D. F. R.S.*, 2nd edn (London: Johnson, 1790), pp. ix-xxiv, (pp xxiii-xxiv); Thomas Forester, *Somatopsychonologia: Showing that the Proofs of Body Life and Mind Considered as Distinct Essences Cannot be Deduced from Physiology but Depend on a Distinct Sort of Evidence Being an Examination of the Controversy Concerning Life Carried on by MM. Laurence, Abernethy, Rennell, & Others. By Philostratus* (London: Hunter, 1823), p. 101.

⁶⁰ *Discourses on the Christian Revelation*, p. 265.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, p. 283.

⁶² *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 235.

rouse thee from the dead.’⁶³ While in ‘Dramatic Sketch. An Angel of God, and a Spirit of the Just’, the disembodied spirit ascends to Heaven prior to the second coming and the final resurrection. However, in *The Philosophy of Sleep*, Macnish prefers neither theory, as

On a path where the views of the best and wisest of men are at variance, and where the lights to guide us are so faint and obscure, it is perhaps most prudent not to venture very far; for, where their intellectual vision has proved insufficient to pierce through the deep veil of mystery in which the way is shrouded, it is not likely that our far more limited faculties can succeed.⁶⁴

Similarly, Chalmers avoids speculation and instead carries his argument forward on the firm inductive ground of his own observations and those of other men.

Chalmers’s discourses combine the inductive methodology of Enlightenment philosophy with the Calvinistic disregard for speculation beyond the textual authority of the Bible. He attributes the recently attained advancement and general uniformity in the philosophy of matter to Baconian methodology; however, most probably in reference to the inductive philosophy of mind forwarded by the common sense philosophers, he writes that ‘[t]he Baconian method will not probably push forward her discoveries with such a rapidity, or to such an extent, as many of her sanguine disciples have anticipated’.⁶⁵ Relatedly, Chalmers notes the inability of man in his fallen state to directly observe the doings or purposes of the Deity:

I never heard of any moral telescope that can bring to my observation the doings or the deliberations which are taking place in the sanctuary of the Eternal. I may put into the registers of my belief, all that comes home to me through the sense of the outer man, or by the consciousness of the inner man. But neither the one or the other can tell me of the purposes of God.⁶⁶

The mind of God and the minds of other men are equally inaccessible to man in his fallen state, and therefore, in order to forward theology and the science of the mind on the firm ground of inductive reasoning, men must confine their attention ‘entirely to phenomena, which every individual has it in his power to examine for himself, who chooses to exercise his

⁶³ Robert Macnish, ‘The Bard’s Register. No. II. The Tomb of Ellenore’, *The Emmet*, 2 (31 January 1824), 212-14, (p. 214, p. 213).

⁶⁴ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 236.

⁶⁵ *Discourses on the Christian Revelation*, p. 135.

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 65-66.

powers of understanding'.⁶⁷ These phenomena include the inner conscious experience of man, the sensory data gathered from the external world, and authorised textual narrative (i.e. the Bible).

In his fourth discourse, Chalmers emphasises the perceptual, and therefore contemplative, limitations of fallen man in a passage well-worth quoting in full for its relevance to the current argument:

in proportion as he recedes from the centre of his own personal experience, there is a cloud of ignorance and secrecy which spreads, and thickens, and throws a deep and impenetrable veil over the intricacies of every one department of human contemplation; that of all around him, his knowledge is naked and superficial, and confined to a few of those more conspicuous lineaments which strike upon his senses; that the whole face, both of nature and society, presents him with questions which he cannot unriddle, and tells him that beneath the surface of all that the eye can rest upon, there lies the profoundness of a most unsearchable latency; and should he in some lofty enterprise of thought, leave this world, and shoot afar into those tracts of speculation which astronomy has opened, should he, baffled by the mysteries which beset his footsteps upon earth, attempt an ambitious flight towards the mysteries of heaven – let him go, but let the justness of a pious and philosophical modesty go along with him – let him forget not, that from the moment his mind has taken its ascending way for a few little miles above the world he treads upon, his every sense abandons him but one – that number, and motion, and magnitude, and figure, make up all the bareness of its elementary informations – that these orbs have sent him scarce another message than told by their feeble glimmering upon his eye, the simple fact of their existence – that he sees not the landscapes of other worlds – that he knows not the moral system of any one of them – nor athwart the long and trackless vacancy which lies between, does there fall upon his listening ear the hum of their mighty populations.⁶⁸

Hogg's poetic ear, however, is apparently in tune with the hum of the heavens, as planetary speculations abound in *The Pilgrims of the Sun*. As Bold has noted, Hogg accurately refers to the prolonged diurnal cycle and apparent increased magnitude of the sun to observers on Venus.⁶⁹ He appears to base his speculative portrayal of their daily and nightly habits upon this factual information:

In love's delights they bask without alloy –
The night their transport, and the day their joy.
The broadened sun, in chamber and alcove,
Shines daily on their morning coach of love (Part Third, ll. 43-46).

⁶⁷ Dugald Stewart, *Philosophical Essays* (Edinburgh: Creech; Constable; London: Cadell and Davies; Murray; Constable, Hunter, Park, and Hunter, 1810), p. viii.

⁶⁸ *Discourses on the Christian Revelation*, pp. 92-93.

⁶⁹ *James Hogg: A Bard of Nature's Making*, p. 162.

The specificity of Chalmers's example of the impious philosophical speculator, who 'may avail himself of some slender correspondence between the heat of the sun and the moral temperament of the people it shines upon', is strikingly reminiscent of Hogg's poem.⁷⁰

Chalmers and Hogg both strive to accommodate the sublime wonders of the physical universe to an embodied Christian salvation. However, they differ significantly in their methodological approaches, and in particular, with regard to the value they place on aesthetics. Hogg draws upon the physiological theory of dreaming, as delineated by contemporary Scottish philosophers, to show that poetry and dreaming, in their evocation of oneiric consciousness, are the closest earthly equivalents to sympathetic communion with the infinite and omnipresent mind of God. The joys of the expansion of consciousness through the arts are man's preparation for the joys of heaven. The natural, visceral joy that is derived from aesthesised experience, like the natural, visceral joy derived from virtuously succumbing to the passionate flesh, was granted by the Deity 'To draw his creatures, whom he loves, to goodness' (Part Second, l. 163). Experiencing that joy brings the physical body and immaterial mind into harmony, thus perfecting the condition of the body for its immortal state. Hogg's apparent valuation of sublime poetics accords with that of Addison, whom Beattie quotes in evidence of the moral and religious value of the sublime:

"The Supreme Being," says he, "has so formed the soul of man, that nothing but Himself can be its last, adequate, and proper happiness. Because therefore a great part of our happiness must arise from the contemplation of his being, that he might give our souls a just relish of such a contemplation, he has made them naturally delight in the apprehension of what is great and unlimited. Our admiration, which is a very pleasing emotion of the mind, immediately rises at the consideration of any object that takes up a great deal of room in the fancy; and, by consequence, will improve into the highest pitch of astonishment and devotion, when we contemplate his nature, who is neither circumscribed by time or place, nor to be comprehended by the largest capacity of a created being."⁷¹

In contrast, Chalmers views the sublime as unconnected with what he terms 'practical Christianity':

The sublime of Deity has wrought up his soul to a pitch of conscious and pleasing elevation – and yet this no more argues the will of Deity to have a practical authority

⁷⁰ *Discourses on the Christian Revelation*, p. 55.

⁷¹ *Dissertations Moral and Critical*, p. 655.

over him, than does that tone of elevation which is caught by looking at the sublime of a naked materialism.⁷²

Divine grace and the resulting moral obligation of the saved to perform godly works while on earth are the only pathway to salvation in both this life and the next, and the intensity of sensation involved in aesthesised religious worship is, according to Chalmers, unrelated to salvation. Chalmers's doubts with regard to the development of an inductive philosophy of mind may be related to his dismissal of the divine power of aesthetics. Reid's second class of natural sign (from which our innate knowledge of the existence of other minds is derived) is the 'foundation of the fine arts', as:

In the expressiveness of the arts we hear again the primordial language which we can all understand [...] The beauty and sublimity of nature is God's mind, so to speak, sensibly present.⁷³

However, Chalmers's devaluation of eloquent language and poetic imagery loses its potency coming from such an accomplished ministerial orator. In *Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk* (1819), Lockhart describes the sensorial effectiveness of Chalmers's delivery:

I have never heard, either in England, or Scotland, or in any other country, any preacher whose eloquence is capable of producing an effect so strong and irresistible as his. [...] I was proud to feel my hardened nerves creep and vibrate, and my blood freeze and boil while he spake – as they were wont to do in the early innocent years, when unquestioning enthusiasm had as yet caught no lessons of chillness from the jealousies of discernment, the delights of comparison, and the example of the unimaginative world. [...] I speak from my own experience of the difficulty there is in being able, amidst the human luxury such a sermon affords, to remember with sufficient earnestness the nature of its object – and the proper nature of its more lasting effects.⁷⁴

This extract evidences the contemporary perception of the physiological power of the sublime in overturning rational volition and returning the mind to its primitive condition.

Hogg's valuation of his poetic text as 'the most valuable lines I ever wrote' if, in fact, the 'dangerous doubt' impressed upon Mary Lee's mind upon viewing the sublime astronomical universe 'had even the smallest share in turning his capricious and fervent mind to that study', must be viewed ironically. If the *The Pilgrims of the Sun* 'proved a text to all Dr

⁷² *Discourses on the Christian Revelation*, p. 164.

⁷³ S. A. Grave, *The Scottish Philosophy of Common Sense* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1960), p. 154.

⁷⁴ *Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk*, III, pp. 273-74.

Chalmers' sublime astrological sermons', the devaluation of the didactic nature of sublime poetry in Chalmers' discourses is undercut, and the ability of the poetic text to turn the mind in new directions and guide the pilgrimage towards perfection is vindicated.⁷⁵

In his poem 'The Music of the Spheres', published in *Blackwood's* in August 1828, Macnish draws upon the ancient idea 'that the Celestial Bodies emitted melodious sounds on their passage through the Heavens – every Plant and Star, according to this strange fiction, being accompanied with Music of its own creating'. Although 'No human power your tones may catch', through his poetic fancy, the poetic voice is able 'To seize those notes which mortals deem | A fabulous unsubstantial dream':

But never, tuneful orbs, to me
Shall your strange music fable be.
I hear ye float on airy wing
Upon the genial breath of spring.
By you the pointed beams of light
Are wing'd with music on their flight.
On falling snow and cloudlet dim
Your spirit floats – a holy hymn.
Methinks the South wind bears your song,
Blended with rich perfumes, along:
Even Silence with his leaden ear
Your mystic strain is forced to hear,
And Nature, as ye sail around
Her viewless realm, is fill'd with sound.
Such the wild dreams of airy thought
By Fancy to the poet taught.⁷⁶

The permeation of the liminal boundary between the natural and the supernatural world through the aesthetic act of poetry and the appeal to the cosmic imagery of the music of the heavens is highly reminiscent of *The Pilgrims of the Sun*; however, Macnish's use of the term 'Fancy' rather than imagination emphasises the associationist undertone to the poem. In the *Biographia Literaria* (1817) Coleridge famously distinguishes between the 'primary imagination', which he defines as 'the living Power and prime Agent of all human Perception, and as a repetition in the finite mind of the eternal act of creation in the infinite I AM', and the 'secondary imagination', or the poetic imagination, which is 'an echo of the former', but with the power of the conscious will, 'dissolves, diffuses, dissipates, in order to re-create'. Both kinds of imagination are distinguished from 'fancy', which has not the power to create new

⁷⁵ 'Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun', pp. 149-50.

⁷⁶ Robert Macnish, 'The Music of the Spheres', *Blackwood's*, 24 (August 1828), 225.

ideas, but rather combines preexisting ideas in new ways, according to the laws of association.⁷⁷ The synaesthetic quality of Macnish's poem represents an extreme associationism, wherein viewing the visual beauties of nature brings forth the sensation of hearing what is deemed the music of the spheres.⁷⁸ As Cairns Craig argues, despite Coleridge's well-known dismissal of associationism for German Idealism, the Scottish romantic imagination continues to engage with associationist psychology, such that:

Romanticism in Scotland cannot be defined in terms of the development of the transcendental imagination to which Coleridge aspired: it must be understood in terms of the elaboration of the significance of associationist theories both of the mind and of art, theories which shape expectations of the reading experience, notions of the ends of art and of the genres by which such ends can be fulfilled.⁷⁹

The ability to read *The Pilgrims of the Sun* within the associationist framework of *The Philosophy of Sleep* indicates the poem may also be viewed as a flight of fancy, but Hogg's emphasis on the corporeal nature of the afterlife negates the dismissal of fancy as constrained within the gross earthly sphere of material existence. For Hogg, transcendence is in fact physiological.

Dream-state Composition

In Note V Hogg refers to 'several miscellaneous' works in which '[t]his whole account of the formation of a Comet, from p. 22 to p. 24', is quoted and 'loudly censured for its utter extravagance'.⁸⁰ As the editorial notes to the Stirling/South Carolina edition indicate, *The Eclectic Review* quotes this section in praise of Hogg's poem, and the *Salopian Magazine* similarly singles it out for praise. Hogg may also be referring to the third article in Gray's series on 'The Life and Writing of James Hogg'. After providing a narrative summary of the poem, Gray questions whether the critic should 'most censure the extravagance of its original conception, or commend the genius displayed in some of its passages'.⁸¹ Gray extracts '[t]he

⁷⁷ Samuel Taylor Coleridge, 'On the imagination, or esemplastic power', in *Biographia Literaria or Biographical Sketches of My Literary Life and Opinions*, in *The Collected Works of Samuel Taylor Coleridge*, ed. by James Engell and W. Jackson Bate, Bollingen Series: 75, 2 vols (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1983; repr. 1984), I, pp. 295-306, (pp. 304-05).

⁷⁸ As will be further discussed in the following chapter, Macnish was himself a synaesthete and reports comparing sounds and colours.

⁷⁹ Cairns Craig, 'Coleridge, Hume, and the Chains of the Romantic Imagination', in *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, pp. 20-37, (p. 31).

⁸⁰ 'Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun', p. 150.

⁸¹ 'On the Life and Writings of James Hogg', p. 218.

description of the destruction of a planet, and its reproduction as a comet', as a passage evidencing Hogg's genius breaking 'forth from the mists' of 'inattention' and 'bad taste', rather than as an example of his extravagance, which according to Gray, is rather manifested in his method of composition.⁸² Once again, Gray laments the ill-advised return to the subject-matter of *The Queen's Wake*; however, he undercuts the intensity of his critique by excusing the imperfections as at least partially attributable to the fact that the poem was 'written in a few weeks' and 'does not appear to have undergone any revision'.⁸³ Hogg's declaration of the 'supposition as perfectly ostensible' may indicate his awareness of Gray's covert promotion of his Romantic compositional techniques – Hogg's disingenuous note reflecting Gray's disingenuous censure.

Gray's praise for the descriptions of the formation of the comet may be due to its rational plausibility, and the importance of scientific accuracy to Gray's reading is evidenced by his indications of the 'grotesque contradictions' in Hogg's portrayal of the moon as crescent, full, and waning all within the course of five stanzas.⁸⁴ Although Gray reads the visionary journeys of both Kilmeny and Mary Lee as those of 'dreamers', he insists upon folkloric and scientific accuracy in Hogg's portrayal of the 'celestial pilgrimage' of the latter.⁸⁵ This is partially attributable to the abundance of minute detail in Hogg's descriptions, as clarity of conception was not generally praised as an intrinsic quality of the sublime poetic vision.⁸⁶ However, in this context Hogg's accusations that his critics 'knew not the nature of the work from which it was taken' may be read as a critique of Gray's application of the laws of the rational waking world to a poetic dream vision.⁸⁷

Dreaming consciousness is an altered-state of consciousness, and the pattern of associations, which define dreaming perception, is distinctly different from that of waking consciousness due to the dormancy of the rational faculties. In dreams '[w]e see circumstances at utter variance with the laws of nature, and yet their discordancy, impracticability, and oddness never strike us at all as out of the usual course of things'.⁸⁸ The resultant fluidity of associated ideas in dreaming consciousness analogically mirrors Hogg's methodological approach to the actual traditional narratives on which the tale is based. In the first note, he

⁸² Ibid., p. 218.

⁸³ Ibid., p. 218.

⁸⁴ Ibid., p. 217.

⁸⁵ Ibid., p. 216.

⁸⁶ Edmund Burke, *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*, ed. by Adam Phillips (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990; repr. 1998), pp. 55-59.

⁸⁷ 'Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun', p. 150.

⁸⁸ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 74.

indicates that, like many of his tales, *The Pilgrims of the Sun* is based ‘on a traditionary tale well known over all Scotland,’ and he believes that the tale has ‘some foundation in reality’ and is ‘exceedingly old.’⁸⁹ As Louis Simpson has noted, ‘when Hogg is writing of the life he knows, the Scottish peasants, their customs, beliefs and superstitions, his imagination is engaged.’⁹⁰ The liberation of the imagination in dreaming consciousness, within the constructs of the laws of association as defined by the mechanical philosophers, parallels Hogg’s utilisation of actual cultural artifacts, i.e. traditional and modern narratives, as inspirational points of associative departure. Bold draws attention to the incorporation of a vast range of information in the poem, including both traditional and scientific elements, and this supports the notion of fluid association.⁹¹ In his memoirs, Hogg emphasises the cerebral nature of his poetical methodology:

Let the piece be of what length it will, I compose and correct it wholly in my mind, ere ever I put pen to paper, when I write it down as fast as the A B C.⁹²

The validity of this statement is questionable since Hogg was attempting to develop his persona as a natural bard in this memoir; however, Hogg’s declared habits of composition reinforce the link between dreaming consciousness and his poetic composition. Mary’s nearly simultaneous viewing of the moon is all its different stages prefigures the portrayal of dreaming consciousness as bringing the mind of Fallen man closer to the infinitude and omnipresence of the divine mind. However, Gray, like the enlightened philosophers of metaphysical hell, is trapped in the earthly weeds of rational cognition.

In a letter to William Blackwood dated 24 October 1830, Macnish writes about his compositional habits, and in particular, his distinct methodological approaches to creative versus scientific composition:

You will I daresay think that as I was able to finish my work on *Sleep* I might also have written *Tales* in abundance, but the two cases are not parallel, for I finished *Sleep* by piecemeal – doing a little at a time, and relinquishing the task at pleasure: but in writing an article for *Maga* I cannot do any such thing. The article must be hit off instantly when I am in the mood, and if I dare to lay it aside for a day or two when half finished it is

⁸⁹ ‘Notes to *The Pilgrims of the Sun*’, p. 148. As the notes to the Stirling/South Carolina edition indicate, ‘the episode of cutting away of a ring-finger reawakening a supposed corpse appears to have a European currency’ (p. 191). See, Jan Bondeson, ‘The Lady with the Ring and the Lecherous Monk’, in *Buried Alive: The Terrifying History of Our Most Primal Fear* (London: Norton, 2001; repr. 2002), pp. 35-50.

⁹⁰ Louis Simpson, *James Hogg: A Critical Study* (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1962), p. 61.

⁹¹ *James Hogg: A Bard of Nature’s Making*, pp. 153-80.

⁹² ‘Memoirs of the Life of James Hogg’, in *The Mountain Bard*, pp. 12-13.

ruined completely.⁹³

Uninterrupted fluidity was apparently a necessity for Macnish's creative composition, and when interruptions did occur, fragmented writing could result.⁹⁴ The hectic lifestyle of a practicing surgeon in Glasgow necessitated composition at odd hours, and Macnish informed Blackwood that his tale 'The Battle of the Breeks' (the associative point of inspirational departure for which was Moir's *Mansie Wauch*) 'was wholly written between 9 o'clock on Saturday night and two on Sunday morning – to my shame be it spoken. But I was so full of it that I did not like to leave off in case of losing the leading train of thought'.⁹⁵ Such gruelling habits were not always conducive to good health, and according to the anonymous biographical sketch prefacing the 1859 edition of *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, following his late night composition of 'The Barber of Gottingen' he was 'attacked with a violent fever, which brought him to the very brink of the grave'.⁹⁶ However, Macnish's spontaneous bursts of inspiration are held up as a mark of 'original genius', and Macnish's repeated references to his composition techniques in his letters to Blackwood lead one to expect he took pride in his muse's erratic visitations.⁹⁷

The harp stands as a symbol for the material medium of inspired poetic composition for both Hogg and Macnish, and in the context of the current reading, this takes on physiological significance. In *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), Macnish compares the brain to a harp, as

When the strings of a harp or violin are touched in a particular manner we have music: when the brain is in certain states we have displays of the mental faculties.⁹⁸

Similarly, George Combe uses the strings of the Aeolian harp as a metaphor for the phrenological organs (the combinations of notes produced then representing associated ideas), and 'if harps *may* vary in structure, human beings do positively differ in the relative strength of their powers. Hence the same impressions must produce very different effects'.⁹⁹ These

⁹³ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 24 October 1830, NLS MS 4028, fols 27-28.

⁹⁴ For example, see Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 4 November 1830, NLS MS 4028, fols 29-30.

⁹⁵ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 30 April 1827, NLS MS 4019, fol. 286.

⁹⁶ 'Biographical Sketch of Robert Macnish, Esq., LL.D.' in Robert Macnish, *The Anatomy of Drunkenness. With a Sketch of the Author's Life*, new edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1859), pp. 9-28, (p. 16).

⁹⁷ Ibid., p. 16.

⁹⁸ *An Introduction to Phrenology, in the Form of Question and Answer, with an Appendix, and Copious Illustrative Notes* (Glasgow: Reid; Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, London: Whittaker, 1836), p. 1

⁹⁹ George Combe, *A System of Phrenology*, 3rd edn (Edinburgh: Anderson; London: Longman, 1830), p. 532.

analogies may be derived from David Hartley's *Observations on Man, his Frame, his Duty, and Expectations* (1749), which posited vibrations as the neurophysiological mechanism for the association of ideas.¹⁰⁰ In *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, the Minstrel exchanges the 'hill-harp' (Part First, l. 297) for the 'holy harp of Judah's land' (Part First, l. 301), 'For its wild warblings ill become | The scenes that oped to Mary Lee' (Part First, ll. 299-300). The instrument must be worthy to produce the music of the heavens, and the changing of harps parallels Mary Lee's corporeal transformation. In Macnish's 'Song of the Spirit of Zephyrs. A Fragment of a MS. Poem', first published in *The Emmet* in February 1824, the harp is silent until it is raised into a divine region of space:

And I raised my stubborn harp once more
To hail the bulbul's lovely strain,
But the strings were silent as before
While thus, the invisible sung again:
'Thy harp is subdued by the power of a spell,
From its quivering chords no murmur may swell
Until they are touch'd in a land more divine,
With the spirit of love and of music, than thine,
And there is a land more beautiful still
In the flowery lap of Jamautri's hill.'¹⁰¹

An altered-state of consciousness, and thus an altered brain state, is necessary to achieve poetic inspiration for Macnish. In the poem 'The Harp of Salem', published the following month also in *The Emmet*, Macnish evokes the harp to reawaken:

Awake, as in that early hour,
When nature own'd thy syren pow'r.
And shed upon the world again
One echo of thine ancient strain!¹⁰²

In this poem, inspiration is only achievable through an ultimately impossible return to a time when the minds of men and divinity held communion. Macnish's song is one of lament; however, in *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, Hogg's re-awoken 'harp of Salem' (Part Second, l. 9) reveals the power of aesthetic experience to return the sensorium to its originally divine state – divine consciousness itself being represented by a 'thousand harps, in unison complete,' which

¹⁰⁰ Shelley Trower, 'Nerves, Vibrations, and the Aeolian Harp', *Romanticism and Victorianism on the Net*, 54 (May 2009), <<http://id.erudit.org/iderudit/038761ar>> [accessed 15 March 2010].

¹⁰¹ Robert Macnish, 'Song of the Spirit of Zephyrs. A Fragment of a MS. Poem', *The Emmet*, 2 (21 February 1824), 244-46, (p. 245).

¹⁰² Robert Macnish, 'The Harp of Salem', *The Emmet*, 2 (13 March 1824), 283-85, (p. 285).

‘[w]ith one vibration sound Jehovah’s name’ (Part Second, ll. 173-74).

Resurrection

Hogg’s reference to an additional folkloric source for his poem in Note VI may be in response to critics who lamented his deviation from strictly traditional material. However, the Border tale that Hogg relates is not the source of *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, but would rather ‘make an excellent subject for a poem of a different description’.¹⁰³ Clearly the tale of the corpse re-animated by physical jarring is topically related to the re-animation of Mary Lee by the grave-robbing monk. Of greater relevance is Hogg’s covert comparison of Mary Lee’s mother’s hesitant yet full acceptance of her re-animated child with the laird who would rather his wife remain in her coffin. The fact that the lady was not ‘so much beloved’ after her uncanny re-animation from death-like trance ‘as she was during the first two or three months’ of her marriage to the laird evidences a discomfort with those who subvert the natural order.¹⁰⁴ Ian Duncan employs the Freudian uncanny to illustrate Hogg’s subversion of Scott’s project of ‘romance revival’ – the soulless bodies or ‘upright corpses’ representing a disruption of the linear model of Enlightenment natural history and the failed attempt to reanimate national culture.¹⁰⁵ The fully resurrected Mary Lee stands in contrast to the ‘upright corpses’, representing an idealised cultural organicism wherein the supernatural and natural worlds are recognised as one. Upon waking, the intensely beautiful Mary Lee now sees the numinous in the everyday:

For she saw that the flowerets of the glade
To him unconscious worship paid;
She saw them ope their breasts by day,
And follow his enlivening ray,
Then fold them up in grief by night,
Till the return of the blessed light.
When daylight in the west fell low,
She heard the woodland music flow,
Like farewell song, with sadness blent,
A soft and sorrowful lament:
But when the sun rose from the sea,
O! then the birds from every tree
Poured forth their hymn of holiest glee!
She knew that the wandering spirits of wrath

¹⁰³ ‘Notes to the Pilgrims of the Sun’, p. 150.

¹⁰⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 151.

¹⁰⁵ *Scott’s Shadow*, pp. 183-214.

Fled from his eye to their homes beneath,
But when the God of glory shone
On earth, from his resplendent throne,
In valley, mountain, or in grove,
Then all was life, and light, and love (Part Fourth, ll. 297-315).

The non-spatiotemporal world of dreaming consciousness is the pathway to this holistic worldview. In *The Philosophy of Sleep*, Macnish describes the power of dreams to resurrect long forgotten memories, as they ‘have the power of brightening up the dim regions of the past, and presenting them with a force which the mere efforts of unassisted remembrance could never have accomplished in our waking hours’.¹⁰⁶ Like the ‘upright corpse’, dreams disrupt linearity, and do so within the domains of both folkloric belief and rational science.

The Heavenly Mind and Body

In Note VII, Hogg explains his reference to the recent local sightings and the subsequent heavily lamented disappearance of an apparent reincarnation of the angelic Mary Lee, as relating ‘to the late Right Honourable Harriet, Duchess of Buccleuch and Queensberry’ who had been Hogg’s cherished patron and a gracious care-giver to ‘the poor and the fatherless’ (Part Fourth, l. 487).¹⁰⁷ By relating the godly works of an active public figure to Mary Lee’s post-dream vision appearance and actions, the connections between a beautiful physical countenance and purity of soul and mind is made tangible.

Writing against the ‘threadbare orthodoxy’ of the Antinomian doctrine of salvation by faith alone, Chalmers upholds the practical and inherent manifestation of godly works by those who have been touched by divine grace, as ‘[i]t is upon earth that he learns the rudiments of a celestial character, and first tastes of celestial enjoyments’.¹⁰⁸ The celestial perfection of the physical body is both a direct result of and necessary for the sensorial manifestation of heavenly bliss in the embodied Christian salvation, and even while on earth:

there is a health and harmony to the soul; a beauty of holiness, which, though it effloresces on the countenance and the manner and the outward path, is itself so thoroughly internal, as to make purity of heart the most distinctive evidence of a work of grace in time, the most distinct and decisive evidence of a character that is ripening and expanding for the glories of eternity.¹⁰⁹

¹⁰⁶ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 76.

¹⁰⁷ ‘Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun’, p. 151.

¹⁰⁸ *Discourses on the Christian Revelation*, p. 314.

¹⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 333-34.

The physical beauty of both Mary Lee and the late Duchess of Buccleuch evidences the working of divine grace in their minds and bodies. When Mary Lee awakens from the grave:

So dazzling bright her beauty burned,
The eye of man could scarcely brook
With steady gaze thereon to look:
Such was the glow of her cheek and eyes,
She bloomed like the rose of paradise! (Part Fourth, ll. 286-90)

Both Chalmers and Hogg appear to be drawing upon the connection between physical and moral beauty forwarded by Lavater in his *Essays on Physiognomy* (1789-98). Lavater emphasises both the predestined connection between physical and moral beauty, as the body will bear the impress of the immortal soul, and the power of virtue in beautifying the physical body. Looking forward to the Lamarckian theory of heritability popularised in the early nineteenth century, according to Lavater, beauty gained through virtue may be passed onto future generations.¹¹⁰ Macnish applies the Lamarckian theory of heritability in *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), as the sins of the parents are literally visited upon the child:

From the general defect of vital power in the system, the children of drunkards are neither numerous nor healthy. They are usually puny and emaciated, and liable to inherit all the diseases of their parents. Their intellect is also, in most cases, below the ordinary standard.¹¹¹

Similarly, the progressive pilgrimage up the great chain of being in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* is achieved through the act of motherhood.

‘Superstition’ and the Encroaching Veil of Reason

In the poem ‘Superstition’, which accompanied *The Pilgrims of the Sun* in its initial publication in 1815, there is an indication of physiological differentiation between those born under the ‘cold saturnine morn’ and those ruled by dame Superstition, as ‘Those were the

¹¹⁰ Johann Casper Lavater, *Essays on Physiognomy, Designed to Promote the Knowledge and the Love of Mankind*, trans by Henry Hunter, 3 vols (London: Murray; Hunter; Holloway, 1789-98), I, in *ECCO* <<http://find.galegroup.com/ecco/infomark.do?&contentSet=ECCOArticles&type=multipage&tabID=T001&prodId=ECCO&docId=CW114546968&source=gale&userGroupName=glasuni&version=1.0&docLevel=FAS CIMILE>> [accessed 26 February 2010].

¹¹¹ Robert Macnish, *The Anatomy of Drunkenness. An Inaugural Essay* (Glasgow: M’Phun, 1827), p. 39.

times for holiness of frame'.¹¹² Drawing a parallel between the evolution of the human species and the development of the human individual, this echoes Mary Lee's observation that the newborn infant's eye instinctively looks to the sun as the light divine:

Nor ever was that eye withdrawn
Till the mind thus carved began to dawn.
All Nature worshipped at one shrine,
Nor knew that the impulse was divine. (Part Fourth, ll. 318-21)

The 'sceptic leveller' with his 'eye of reason' extinguishes the belief in Providence 'And soon that heavenly ray must ever cease to shine'.¹¹³ Only the individual bardic figure can stand outside the march of reason, and Hogg's poetic voice embraces this identity with repeated evocation:

Be mine to sing of visions that have been,
And cherish hope of visions yet to be;
Of mountains clothed in everlasting green,
Of silver torrent and of shadowy tree,
Far in the ocean of eternity.
Be mine the faith that spurns the bourn of time;
The soul whose eye can future glories see;
The converse here with things of purer climb,
And hope above the stars that soars on wing sublime.¹¹⁴

However, the darker side of superstition is also present in the poem. The 'beldames [...] | Whom eild and poverty had sorely crazed' are clearly suffering from corporeal disease, as it is through 'their feeble senses' that they are 'abused | By gleesome demon in the church-aisle raised'.¹¹⁵ The reference to the devil's 'bagpipe's blare' is perhaps a tribute to Burns's 'Tam o' Shanter' as a potential drunken dream vision.¹¹⁶ Embracing the fine fairy visions, or, to borrow Macnish's turn of phrase, 'those spirits of which poetry, from the earliest ages, has delighted to sing, and the very belief in whose existence flings, as it were, a halo of immortality over nature', comes hand-in-hand with 'thy dread power, that could the wretches make | Believe these things real, and swear them at the stake'.¹¹⁷ As David Groves has convincingly argued, the nightmarish vision of 'Connel of Dee' is the natural companion piece to *The Pilgrims of*

¹¹² James Hogg, 'Superstition', in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, pp. 67-73, l. 99, l. 91.

¹¹³ *Ibid.*, l. 10, l. 179, l. 180.

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*, ll. 19-27.

¹¹⁵ *Ibid.*, ll. 145-48.

¹¹⁶ *Ibid.*, l. 150. The notes to text in the S/SC edition indicate the connection to 'Tam o' Shanter', see *Midsummer Nights Dreams*, pp. 199-200.

¹¹⁷ 'Ghosts and Dreams', p. 293; 'Superstition', ll. 152-53.

the Sun.¹¹⁸ In *The Philosophy of Sleep* Macnish attempts to counteract the negative potentials of superstitious belief through sceptical dismissal, and yet maintains the imaginative potential of the otherworldly through his poetic descriptions of the strange phenomena of sleep – the full explanations of which lay tantalisingly just beyond the cusp of scientific knowledge. His lament for the lost fairy visions is apparent in the ‘Ghosts and Dreams’ essay – as is his distaste for those who continue to believe in the prophetic power of dreams in *The Philosophy of Sleep*. As such, he might join in with Hogg declaring, ‘Be mine the faith diverging to extremes!’¹¹⁹

Section Conclusion

The reputation of the Ettrick Shepherd as the ‘king o’ the mountain an’ fairy school’ of poetry was well established by the time Macnish published his dedication of ‘Ane Flicht Through Fairy Lande’.¹²⁰ In April 1830 Macnish published his own ode to this reputation in his ‘Poetical Portraits’ in *Blackwood’s*:

Clothed in the rainbow’s beam,
 ’Mid strath and pastoral glen,
 He sees the fairies gleam,
 Far from the haunts of men.¹²¹

Hogg most certainly drew upon this reputation in *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, but, like Macnish, grounds his poetic vision in the physical body. One of the most significant differences between ‘Kilmeny’ and *The Pilgrims of the Sun* is that when Kilmeny returns from her otherworldly journey, she ‘is no longer at home in earthly human life,’ whereas Mary Lee ‘is a blessed virgin who *does* remain’.¹²² As can be seen from the inter-textual resonances with Macnish’s above quoted poetical portrait, Kilmeny’s wanderings in ‘the lenely glen’ (l. 1604) far ‘away fra the hauntis of men’ (l. 1605), and her ability to commune with the animal kingdom rather than the human ‘worild of sorrow and paine’ (l. 1643) informs the subsequent evaluation and utilisation of Hogg as the Ettrick Shepherd in Romantic periodical culture. As Ian Duncan indicates:

¹¹⁸ James Hogg: *The Growth of a Writer*, p. 65; “‘The rapt breathing of high poesy’”: James Hogg’s Midsummer Night Dreams and its “Romantic” Context’, *Scotia*, 16 (1992), 21-41, (in particular, pp. 31-32).

¹¹⁹ ‘Superstition’, l. 139.

¹²⁰ *Anecdotes of Scott*, p. 61.

¹²¹ Robert Macnish, ‘Poetical Portraits’, *Blackwood’s*, 27 (April 1830), 632-33, (p. 633).

¹²² Douglas Mack, ‘Hogg and the Blessed Virgin Mary’, *SHW*, 3 (1993), 68-75, (p. 70).

The affixing of a literary career to the bardic figure of the Ettrick Shepherd clarified the crux as one of cultural origins, already schematized in a historiography which at once valorized the poet as a voice of a primordial stage of society close to nature and deprecated him as an uncouth relic doomed to extinction by the logic of economic and cultural improvement.¹²³

In contrast to Macnish, whom Moir portrays as overcoming his youthful imaginative delusions, Hogg is viewed as stagnant in the primitive stage.

Macnish palpably imitates Hogg in his poem, 'The Holy Nun. – A Chaunt', published in November 1823 in *The Emmet* by 'The Bard of the Ugly Club'. Macnish's young Linda, like Kilmeny and Mary Lee, is selected by the heavens for her purity, as 'But, though come of a high degree | Who so pure and mild as she?'¹²⁴ 'An angel of heaven' comes down to earth to visit the 'holy maid' and transport her back to the heavenly spheres:

'Daughter of earth,' the angel said,
'I am a spirit, thou a maid,
I dwell within a land divine,
But not my thoughts more pure than thine:
Whilome by the command of heaven
To me they guardianship was given,
And if on earth thou couldst remain
Twice nine years without a stain –
Free from sin or sinful thought,
With a saint-like fervour fraught,
Thy inheritance should be
In the bowers of sanctitie,
Side by side forever with me.
Thou has been pure as the morning air,
Pure as downy gossamer;
Sinful thought had never part
In the chambers of thy heart –
Then thy mansion-house of clay,
Linda quit – and come away.'¹²⁵

When the nuns come to holy matins the following morning, they find the holy maid over whom 'Death had left his pallid trace', and the abbess declares:

¹²³ *Scott's Shadow*, p. 149.

¹²⁴ Robert Macnish, 'The Holy Nun. – A Chaunt. By the Bard of the Ugly Club', *The Emmet*, 2 (22 November 1823), 90-92, (p. 90). These lines are directly comparable to Hogg's line: 'For Kilmeny was pure as pure culde be.' (l. 1350).

¹²⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 90, pp. 91-92.

‘She hath pass’d away to the land of the good,
For though a maiden of mortal birth,
She was too spiritual for the earth.’¹²⁶

Linda is unique among Macnish’s visionary mortals in her lack of pathological abnormality and her genuine attunement to the otherworldly. However, this necessitates her departure from the earthy sphere. Hogg and his Mary Lee very much remain.

The ‘Notes to The Pilgrims of the Sun’ do not appear to have prevented the continued propagation of the criticism that the Ettrick Shepherd was out of sympathy with contemporary society. In *The Philosophy of Sleep*, Macnish compares the suffocating aspect of the nightmare as akin to burial alive, as ‘the wretched victim feels as if pent alive in his coffin, and overpowered by resistless and immitigable pressure’.¹²⁷ The images evoked in response to that pressure in ‘Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande’ are ones presumably engrained in the associative fabric of the Ettrick Shepherd’s mind: beauteous virgins, ‘Pewr as rainbow ower the flude’, and a Fairy Queen with the power to take the dreamer to

[...] realmis of yirth quhere ne mortall hath beene,
And climates ynnne heuin ne angel hath seene,
And bouiris of coralle beneath the blue sea
Quhere ne mermaide hath been, but quhere thou schalle be.’¹²⁸

While Mary Lee escapes the horrors of burial alive, Macnish’s implication may be that Hogg is suffocating under the pressure of his literary persona, or, if Macnish himself ascribed to the reality of the persona, suffocating under the pressure of a naturally altered-state of consciousness – the same corporeal otherness prized by ‘The Ugly Club’.

¹²⁶ Ibid., p. 92.

¹²⁷ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 125.

¹²⁸ ‘Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande’, p. 292.

Section 2: The Significant Flesh

Introduction

The association between signs and significance, between observable physical bodies and internal subjective states, was a major preoccupation of the eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Scottish philosophical tradition, and Hogg's *Confessions* and Macnish's fictional and popular medical texts participate in this philosophical ethos. Karl Miller utilises the inter-textual links between Macnish and Hogg to fortify the influences of German Romanticism and the Romantic pseudo-sciences, which he reads as epistemologically linked, on Hogg's *Confessions*. Macnish's texts, 'The Metempsychosis' and *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide* are interpreted as 'responding to Hogg's recently published *Confessions* and to the German subject-matter which it helped domicile in Scotland', and, reciprocally, Hogg's 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' and 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' are read as a re-hashing of the material of *Confessions* 'in the light of the subject-matter of doubleness as it had developed in the six years since that novel appeared, and, in particular, as it had figured in the work of someone who could almost be called his disciple'.¹ The Fraserian tales, 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' and 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul', are beyond the chronological scope of this section and will be discussed in Section 3, Chapter 5. The purpose of the current section is to expand upon Miller's argument surrounding Hogg's *Confessions* in light of a broader reading of Macnish's prose tales within their Blackwoodian context and his popular medical text, *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827).

Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine was founded in 1817 as a Tory rival to the 'neo-Enlightenment liberalism' of the Whig *Edinburgh Review* and through its 'innovative mixture of literary forms and discourses' constructed a Romantic ideology of 'cultural nationalism'.² At the same time, it germinated the modern gothic tale of terror in which extreme psychological and physiological states are described in clinical detail.³ Macnish's prose tales, along with the cases of strange subjective experiences included in his popular medical works, may be grouped with these tales of terror. Wringhim's confession also includes physiologically and psychologically acute descriptions, and Macnish's tales and popular medical writing form

¹ Karl Miller, *Cockburn's Millennium* (London: Duckworth, 1975), p. 206, p. 207.

² *Scott's Shadow*, p. 27.

³ Harvey Peter Sucksmith, 'The Secret of Immediacy: Dickens' Debt to the Tale of Terror in Blackwood's', *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, 26.2 (September 1971), 145-57. See also, *Tales of Terror in Blackwood's Magazine*, ed. by Robert Morrison and Chris Baldick (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995).

a contextually appropriate medium through which to read Wringhim's experience. This does not imply an attempt to privilege a rational reading of Hogg's profoundly ambiguous text, but rather to place the scientific themes within their historical context, which, in fact included a venomous debate surrounding the rationalisation of apparently supernatural experience. Due to the critical unfamiliarity with the life and works of Macnish in comparison to the rich critical knowledge of Hogg's *Confessions*, the stage will be set for the analysis in Chapter 3 by a biographically informed close reading of the relevant Macnish texts. The extent to which the themes derived from this reading can be viewed as a response to Hogg's *Confessions* will be evaluated in Chapter 4.

Chapter 3: Phenomenology and Phrenology: 'A Modern Pythagorean' in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*

A Sojourn to Paris and the Synaesthetic Mind of Macnish

In 1824, like many young men of his generation, Macnish travelled to Paris to finish his education, and in his case, the sojourn to the Continent was also expected to finally restore his damaged health. According to his eldest sister Frances, the letters between Macnish and his family during his ten months in Paris did not survive and were thus not available to Moir during his compilation of the 'Life'.¹ The information Moir provides appears to be based partially upon private conversations between the two friends and partially upon two tales published latterly by Macnish that were inspired by his experience in Paris: 'Autographology' and 'An Execution in Paris'. In regard to his scientific training, Moir writes:

With the medical predilections of Broussais, and the surgical ones of Dupuytren, he was much delighted; saw Cuvier; and formed an acquaintanceship with Gall – the germen of his future conversion to Phrenology.²

With the exception of Francois-Joseph-Victor Broussais (1772-1838), these names are all mentioned in the tale 'Autographology' as published in *The Scottish Annual* (1836). Moir notes that the details of 'Autographology' are 'probably fictitious, or at least coloured'.³ However, despite its more than probable blending of fact and fiction, this tale introduces two important and inter-related themes of the current chapter: first, the strong and pervasive impression phrenology made upon Macnish in the autumn of 1825; and second, the hyperbolic correlation between the signs of external appearances and their significance in revealing internal mental character that underlies both the humorous and the philosophical dimensions of Macnish's fiction.

Macnish's first encounter with the father of phrenology, Franz Joseph Gall (1758-1828), was an anecdote frequently recounted to family and friends. Gall's remark one day in class on 'the large organ of Comparison in his head' is the singular fact that Frances can recall regarding her brother's experience in Paris, and Moir recounts 'a circumstance that Macnish himself has related to me, of Dr. Gall, during one of his lectures, having pointed him out as

¹ Letter of Frances K. Macnish to D. M. Moir, 3 June 1837, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 48. For Moir's account of Macnish's time in Paris, see *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 32-35.

² *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 32.

³ *Ibid.*, p. 34.

possessing the organ of Comparison in a very marked degree'.⁴ In contrast to these two accounts, in the tale Gall points out the protagonist's large organ of Causality, and, further, in a letter accompanying Moir's copy of *The Scottish Annual*, Macnish identifies the Glaswegian publisher, John Reid, as the protagonist and explains his role in the quizzical affair surrounding the tale:

[H]e [the editor, William Weir] found John's paper to so preposterously stupid & nonsensical that he asked me to write another with the same name & of the same length, saying that if I did so he would cancel John's. Meanwhile Johnny goes to London & during his absence the dreadful deed was perpetrated & to make things worse Johnny himself constitutes the hero of the story. He is a tremendous Autograph man & has hundreds of specimens.⁵

In the tale the young gentleman with the large organ of Causality, now presumably John Reid, is invited to dine at Gall's house the following day where he meets many of the illustrious men of science currently in residence in Paris, including Dr. Spurzheim, Gall's disciple and the first significant propagator of phrenological doctrine in Britain, 'Baron Dupuytren, Surgeon to the King,' and 'Cuvier, the illustrious naturalist'.⁶ He there asks Gall if 'the character of a man's mind can be surmised by any other physical signs than those which Phrenology furnishes?'⁷ After explaining the good, but imperfect science of physiognomy, as put forth by Lavater, and the science of pathognomy, or natural language, the party of scientists reveal their joint sentiments for Autographology, 'or the art of divining characters from the hand-writing'.⁸ The existence of this 'whimsical' science is not without foundation in reality.⁹ An article on 'Autographs. The Connexion between Characters and Handwriting – Anecdotes' is published as the lead article in the *Edinburgh Literary Journal* in 1829.¹⁰ The quizzical aspect of the article is the comic juxtaposition of the reverence felt by the young student for the celebrated scientists with their descent into a passion for penmanship. However, choosing to follow in their footsteps, the student now 'devoted more time and money to the pursuit after autographs

⁴ Letter of Frances K. Macnish to D. M. Moir, 3 June 1837, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 48; *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 35.

⁵ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 9 December 1835, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50.

⁶ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 34.

⁷ Robert Macnish, 'Autographology', *The Scottish Annual* (Glasgow: Reid; Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1836), 79-86, (p. 81).

⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 82.

⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 82.

¹⁰ 'Autographs. The Connexion between Characters and Handwriting – Anecdotes', *Edinburgh Literary Journal*, 1 (23 May 1829), 389-92.

than I care to boast of'.¹¹ According to Macnish, the result of excessive activity in the organ of Causality is 'an excessive tendency to metaphysical speculation, to the neglect of the practical pursuits of life', and the implication may be that, compared to the collection of cranial samples necessary to forward the empirical claims of the 'science' of phrenology, the collecting of autographs is of negligible practical value.¹² However, with the detailed expositions of the autographical connections between, for example, 'great unmeaning dashes, and long tails to the g and y' with vanity and un-dotted i's and uncrossed t's with 'unwashed shirts and beards of a week's growth', Macnish's quiz on Reid dissolves into an exposition of his own very large organ of Comparison.¹³

As Macnish explains in *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), the organ of Comparison 'enables us to trace resemblances and perceive analogies' and 'prompts to the use of figurative language'.¹⁴ In a footnote to his delineation of individuals who exemplify a particularly large development of this organ, Macnish returns to the subject of the Parisian lecture room:

I know a gentleman in whom the activity of Comparison is so strong, that it prompts him to compare sounds with colours and names with physical objects. When a musical instrument is played, one tone seems to him to resemble blue, another green, another purple, and so on. The proper name, Combe, is associated in his mind with the figure of an urn, Simpson with an hour-glass, and Cox with a saw. When this individual was attending Dr. Gall's lectures in Paris, some years ago, the Doctor was so struck with the appearance of the organ of Comparison in his forehead, that he pointed it out to his class, as an instance of great development, having, at the moment, no knowledge whatever of the person, or the degree in which he was endowed with the faculty of Comparison.¹⁵

In the second edition of *An Introduction of Phrenology*, the relation of this gentleman's case in the 36th number of the *Phrenological Journal and Miscellany* is noted. The gentleman is, in fact, Robert Macnish.¹⁶ The journal article, 'Natural Dispositions and Talents Inferred from a Cast of a Head; with Subsequent Correspondence Relative to Some Peculiarities', consists of a series of letters from February and March 1833 in which the phrenological character of Macnish, disguised under the pseudonym 'Mr. B—', is determined independently by Robert Cox and James Simpson of the Edinburgh Phrenological Society and subsequently tested

¹¹ 'Autographology', p. 84.

¹² *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), p. 119.

¹³ 'Autographology', p. 85, p. 86.

¹⁴ *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), p. 115.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 116.

¹⁶ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 270, pp. 272-306.

against Mr. B—'s own account of his character.¹⁷ The only information provided to Cox and Simpson was that the owner of the cast was a well-educated gentleman of thirty years of age, and, according to Macnish, the experiment was a great success. He writes the following month to his friend, John Leitch:

I had a cast of my head taken and sent to Combe, without giving any hint of the individual. The character was drawn by Messrs Cox and Simpson, and their analyses, both moral and intellectual, are allowed by my friends to be wonderfully accurate. You shall see them the first time you are in town. People may argue as they please, but 'facts are stubborn chieles,' and phrenology must be true.¹⁸

Within Mr. B—'s response to Cox and Simpson on 13th March 1833, he discusses his 'singular tendency to compare one thing with another' for which, he can only account for as 'a strange activity in the faculty of Comparison'.¹⁹ As in the above quoted footnote, he refers to the comparison of musical notes with colours as well as words with shapes, with the additional detail that, inversely, shapes are associated with words, such that, for example, a horse's mouth is associated with the word 'smeer'.

Today, Macnish's experience would be referred to as synaesthesia. Derived from the Greek for 'together perception', this phenomenon is neurologically defined by cross-modal interaction between senses within the cortical circuitry, and some evidence supports a structural differentiation of synaesthetes from the general population. An estimated 4.4% of the population experience some form of synaesthesia as a normal part of daily perceptual experience, and only in recent decades has the existence of the condition received empirical support from the scientific community.²⁰ Macnish's organic justification of his condition is not entirely off-base according to modern standards, but he expresses understandable confusion over his unusual subjective experience, which 'has existed since ever I recollect, and has puzzled myself as, I believe, it will do every other person'.²¹ As is typical to phrenological evaluations, Macnish appeals to his writing style to evidence his particularly active faculty:

In writing and reasoning, I feel at once that Comparison is the strongest faculty I have,

¹⁷ Robert Macnish, James Simpson, and Robert Cox, 'Natural Dispositions and Talents Inferred from a Cast of a Head; with Subsequent Correspondence Relative to Some Peculiarities', *Phrenological Journal*, 8 (1832-1834), 206-231.

¹⁸ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 270.

¹⁹ 'Natural Dispositions and Talents Inferred from a Cast of a Head', p. 216.

²⁰ For an overview of the current literature, see Matej Hochel and Emilio G. Milán, 'Synaesthesia: The Existing State of Affairs', *Cognitive Neuropsychology*, 25.1 (2008), 93-117.

²¹ 'Natural Dispositions and Talents Inferred from a Cast of a Head', p. 216.

and I believe there is no person who makes a greater use of similes and illustrations.²²

Current work does indeed pose synaesthesia as evidence for a potential biological basis of figurative language, and speculations regarding an association between synaesthesia and a high level of creativity abound.²³ Macnish was not incorrect in his self-assessment. The tale 'Autographology' is by no means exceptional within his prose corpus in its ludicrously escalating list of comparisons, and his success in producing popular medical writing is largely derived from his ability to describe pathological experience through figurative language.

While his experience of synaesthesia most certainly coloured his perception of the world and his depiction of that world in writing, it also prompted a keen interest in the psychological mechanisms behind unusual subjective experiences. On the 5th of January 1828, he writes to Moir regarding the visual imagery prompted by contemplating literary figures:

Is it not singular that I can never think of Wilson without the idea of fresh mountain heath being presented to my mind; or of Barry Cornwall without thinking of a faded lily? When I think of you I have the image of a violet; and when of Hogg I cannot help seeing a huge boar, garlanded with roses, heather-bell, and wild thyme, rise up before me. After all the mind of man is a curious piece of workmanship which metaphysicians know no more about than I know of the interior of the moon. Will any one tell me how, before I saw you, or heard you personally described, I knew you were tallish and light-haired. The notion stole itself into my mind in the most recondite and mysterious manner; and had I found you a short, black-headed personage, not all the saints of the calender would have persuaded me that you were Delta. [...] It is needless to reason on such psychological facts. Philosophy will never explain them, but every person I think must feel their influence more or less.²⁴

The bemused acceptance of the uncertain mechanism of these psychological facts is in contrast to the explanatory power he will later invest in phrenology; however, the extreme confidence in an inherent identity between the sign and its significance accords well with the phrenological doctrine. As David Stack indicates in his recent biography of George Combe, the great populariser and practitioner of Spurzheim and Gall's phrenology in Scotland, with whom Macnish would later become acquainted:

Combe's phrenology leant heavily upon Reid's semiotic theory of perception for its understanding of human character. Phrenology, as we have seen, rested upon a series of natural signs – including the 'bumps' of the skull and an individual's temperament – for

²² Ibid., p. 216.

²³ Hochel and Milán, p. 113, p. 100.

²⁴ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 5 January 1828, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

its reading of character.²⁵

In this case the sign for Macnish is textual, and from the collection of authors listed, is possibly *Blackwood's Magazine*. The significance is within the mind's eye; however, according to the current cognitive research on synaesthesia, the 'huge boar, garlanded with roses' may in fact have been experienced as an object projected into the visual field.²⁶ The phrase 'rise up before me' indicates this may have been Macnish's perceptual experience. The visual imagery associated with the literary figures are poetically appropriate, and in the case of Moir, perceptually prophetic; however, the preferment placed upon the visual imagery over and above the conjecturally discordant physical body of Moir indicates a pervasive complication of such extreme confidence in one's ability to accurately read the sign: the subjective spectre overshadows the material world. Such hauntings were endemic in Romantic Scotland.

The Problematic Legacy of Enlightenment Sympathy

An insistence on the inherent connection between the sign in the external world and its significance within the human mind was a foundational element of the Scottish common sense school of philosophy. Thomas Reid's theory of perception distinguished between natural signs, the significance of which all persons innately recognised, and artificial signs, such as spoken and written language, the significance of which were culturally transmitted.²⁷ By 'a kind of natural magic' a person instinctively conceived the significance of these natural signs in the external world, and our eventual understanding of generalised artificial signs was based upon this instinctive knowledge.²⁸ Reid's theory was a reactionary attack on Hume's 'Ideal Theory', which relegated the connection between 'exterior and interior, appearance and essence, matter and spirit, effect and cause', as purely a function of acquired imaginative belief.²⁹ For Hume, the ontological categories of subjective and objective are creations of the mind, as unlike Reid and later Stewart, he does not take mankind's irresistible belief in the external world as a first

²⁵ David Stack, *Queen Victoria's Skull: George Combe and the Mid-Victorian Mind* (London: Hambledon Continuum, 2008), p. 45.

²⁶ Hochel and Milán, p. 99, p. 102.

²⁷ For a critical overview of Reid's definition of natural versus artificial signs, see Grave, 'The Language of Sensation', in *The Scottish Philosophy of Common Sense*, pp. 151-89.

²⁸ Keith Lehrer, 'Beyond Impressions and Ideas: Hume v. Reid', in *The 'Science of Man' in the Scottish Enlightenment: Hume, Reid, and their Contemporaries*, ed. by Peter Jones (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1989), pp. 108-23, (p. 119).

²⁹ *Scott's Shadow*, pp. 267-68.

principle.

Hume's sceptical conclusions stem from the 'attempt' announced in the subtitle of *A Treatise of Human Nature* (1739-40), 'to introduce the experimental Method of Reasoning into moral subjects', or in other words, to apply the inductive philosophic method of Newton and Bacon to the science of the mind.³⁰ Unlike the material universe, the human mind is not subject to public examination, and in the trappings of the body, one can never truly know the subjective experience of the other.³¹ Hume's attempt is to study the inscrutable mind of the other, and as crucial component of this attempt he develops his theory of sympathetic exchange. In the sympathetic exchange, the spectator views the signs of expressive feeling as exhibited by the other, and from these impressions, he forms ideas of the other's subjective experience.³² These ideas are compared with the spectator's vivid idea of selfhood, and

[t]he stronger the relation is betwixt ourselves and any object, the more easily does the imagination make the transition, and convey to the related idea the vivacity of conception, with which we always form the idea of our own person.³³

This self-comparative element results in the '[r]eembodiment of the idea of the other as an impression of our own'.³⁴ The formulation of reembodiment, however, logically invalidates the existence of the other beyond the mind of the spectator, as the other is defined only in relation to the self:

'Tis indeed evident, that when we sympathize with the passions and sentiments of others, these movements appear at first in *our* mind as mere ideas, and are conceiv'd to belong to another person, as we conceive any other matter of fact.³⁵

According to Ian Duncan, Adam Smith's theory of sympathy in *The Theory of Moral Sentiments* (1759) is a revision of the physiological immediacy of Hume's definition:

But where Hume emphasises the involuntary, contagious force of sympathy activated by physical sensation, Smith invests sympathy with a disciplinary will gained on abstracting passion and reason from their chaotic origins in the body.³⁶

³⁰ For a facsimile of the original title page, see David Hume, *A Treatise of Human Nature*, ed. by Ernest C. Mossner (Penguin Books, 1969; repr. 1985), p. 33.

³¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 45-46.

³² In Hume's theory, impressions and ideas differ only in 'the degrees of force and liveliness, with which they strike upon the mind, and make their way into our thought or consciousness' (*Ibid.*, p. 49).

³³ *Ibid.*, p. 368.

³⁴ *Scott's Shadow*, p. 268.

³⁵ *A Treatise of Human Nature*, p. 370.

³⁶ Ian Duncan, 'Hume and the Scottish Enlightenment', in *The Edinburgh History of Scottish Literature, Volume Two: Enlightenment Britain and Empire (1707-1918)*, ed. by Susan Manning, Ian Brown, Thomas Owen

Both formulations paradoxically stress the innate inability of man, with all his bias and preconception, to truly enter into the mind of the other, in other words, to become the idealised impartial spectator, whilst holding onto personal identity.³⁷ For Smith, the necessarily imaginative act of sympathetic engagement is further problematised by the fact that the enlightened individual would only project those emotions that are socially acceptable to the spectator. Self-awareness and the resultant self-control are based upon the attempt, in the words of Burns, ‘*To see ourselves as others see us!*’³⁸ The public persona – the mask of modernity – is a creation of this sympathetic abstraction.

As Duncan indicates, Reid’s successor, Dugald Stewart, returns to the physiological immediacy of Hume’s sympathetic engagement in his definition of sympathetic imitation.³⁹ Sympathetic imitation is the innate tendency in mankind to mimic the natural language – the expressions, gestures, and intonations of voice – of those around him and thus enter into phenomenological similitude. Stewart removes the self-comparative aspect of Hume’s definition, as he works against Hume’s dissolution of subjective/objective boundaries by ranking imitation as ‘among the original principles or ultimate facts in our constitution’ and thus ascribes physiological credence to the innate ability of social beings to interact through the use of meaningful signs.⁴⁰ Stewart refers to the involuntary nature of sympathetic imitation, but carefully amends that he does not mean involuntary in a literal sense, but rather as a ‘*proneness*’, which is capable of counteraction through ‘the exercise of cool reflection, accompanied with a persevering and unremitting purpose directed to a particular end’.⁴¹ However, as with Hume’s definition, Stewart’s sympathy elides individuality through its assimilatory powers.⁴² Duncan reads this reversion to physiological immediacy as a function of the French Revolutionary epoch and the associated ideas of the contagious nature of crowd psychology as exposed by Burke. Gil-Martin’s ‘cameleon art’ is subsequently read as a perversion of Smith’s abstracted sympathy of civilised exchange into a terrifying reign of

Clancy, Murray Pittock, Ksenija Horvat, and Ashley Hales (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 71-79, (p. 76).

³⁷ For further, see Benjamin Eric Daffron, *Romantic Doubles: Sex and Sympathy in British Gothic Literature 1790-1830* (New York: AMS Press, 2002); ‘Technologies of Self and Other’, in *Scott’s Shadow*, pp. 264-72.

³⁸ Robert Burns, ‘To a Louse, On Seeing one on a Lady’s Bonnet at Church’, in *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns*, ed. by James Kinsley, 3 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1968), I, pp. 193-94, (p. 194).

³⁹ *Scott’s Shadow*, p. 270.

⁴⁰ *Elements*, III, pp. 153-54.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, p. 170.

⁴² For example, see *Ibid.*, p. 158.

contagious psychological domination.⁴³

‘An Execution in Paris’: A Case of Sympathetic Spectatorship

Macnish’s tale, ‘An Execution in Paris’, supports Duncan’s reading of the philosophical climate and reveals Macnish’s awareness of the complex interrelations between the individual and society, the spectator and the other, and, in a more specialised fashion, the phrenological anatomist and the anatomical subject. Interestingly, the tale is composed and published in *Blackwood’s* in 1828, just one year after Stewart’s reiteration of embodied sympathy in the third volume of *Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind* (1827); however, the tale is based on his attendance at the execution of Louis Auguste Papavoine, child-murderer, in March 1825. The grotesquely minute details included would appeal to the Blackwoodian readership.⁴⁴

The narrator positions himself as a philosophical observer who is well aware of a certain voyeuristic barbarism accompanying the desire to witness a public execution, yet, nevertheless, is irresistibly drawn by an intense curiosity towards the uniquely French rendition of capital punishment:

To my shame be it spoken, I wished to see an execution by the guillotine. There was a sort of sanguinary spell attached to this instrument, which irresistibly impelled me to witness one of its horrible triumphs.⁴⁵

The term ‘sanguinary’ conjures the imagery of blood as poured forth by the guillotine’s victims and also underlines the physiological nature of the narrator’s irresistible attraction to the machine:

When I thought of it, the overwhelming tragedy of the Revolution was brought before my eyes – that Revolution which plunged Europe in seas of blood, and stamped an indelible impression upon the whole fabric of society.⁴⁶

The intensity of the visual imagery brought forth by the idea of the guillotine – the phrase

⁴³ *Scott’s Shadow*, pp. 269-72.

⁴⁴ Macnish was not singular in his descriptions of the macabre practice of public execution in *Blackwood’s*. For example, see William Godwin the Younger, ‘The Executioner’, in *Tales of Terror from Blackwood’s Magazine*, pp. 131-80, and the Shepherd relates a dream of public execution and provides vivid descriptions of his sensations on the scaffold in ‘Noctes Ambrosiane. No. XXVIII’, *Blackwood’s*, 20 (October 1826), 619-638, (pp. 619-24).

⁴⁵ Robert Macnish, ‘An Execution in Paris’, *Blackwood’s*, 24 (December 1828), 785-88 (p. 785).

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 785.

‘brought before my eyes’ indicating an experience analogous to the vivid synaesthetic perception – indicates the conversion of idea into impression. This ‘indelible impression’ is felt not only within the individual body of the narrator, but also within the metaphorical body of society, for which the crowd of ‘eighty thousand spectators’ stands as representative. The crowd of persons, ‘clumped into one dense aggregate of living matter’, covers every surface in Place de Grève, which is ‘literally paved with human beings’.⁴⁷ The mass rumbles with incipient energy, contained only at the boundaries immediately around the scaffold, where mounted gendarmerie beat back ‘its animated materials into the proscribed area’.⁴⁸ The open space immediately around the scaffold is a privileged place of spectatorship, reserved only for certain military men and their guests, and our philosophical observer is ‘led into the area, and placed in front of the guillotine, not ten feet away from its dreadful presence’.⁴⁹ The separation of the narrator’s body from the heaving living body of the crowd sets up a dialectic of resistance: a movement towards ‘the exercise of cool reflection’ exposed by Stewart as the antidote to sympathetic assimilation.⁵⁰ Within this privileged place of intimate spectatorship, he discovers that ‘this machine is by no means so appalling to look at as the gallows’:

The same feeling of horror does not attach to it; nor is the mind filled with the same blank dismay, or the same overpowering disgust, which are universally felt on beholding the gibbet, with its looped rope, its horrid beam, and its deceitful platform, which, slipped beneath the feet of its victim, leaves him dangling and gasping in the winds of heaven.⁵¹

The immediacy and relative humanity of the guillotine’s actions, along with the knowledge that the ‘noble and good have shed their blood in torrents beneath its edge’, removes the element of disgrace associated with the gallows. Without these associations of disgrace and the ‘sickening imagery’ of ‘prolonged physical suffering’, the fancy is free to speculate on the ‘noble and enduring agony of the spirit, previous to the fatal hour’.⁵² The disembodied death allows the spectator to participate in Smith’s version of abstracted sympathetic exchange with the intended victim of the guillotine, and the narrator’s descriptions of Papvoine, who enters with an old Catholic priest, bespeak this type of self-projective imaginative sympathy:

⁴⁷ Ibid., p. 785.

⁴⁸ Ibid., p. 785.

⁴⁹ Ibid., p. 786.

⁵⁰ *Elements*, III, p. 170. This resistance to homogenising forces echoes the ideology of ‘The Ugly Club’. See above, pp. 28-30.

⁵¹ ‘An Execution in Paris’, p. 786.

⁵² Ibid., p. 786.

Though pale and death-like, and seemingly impressed with the marks of sorrow and bad health, he exhibited no signs of terror or dismay. His demeanour was quiet and composed; and to the exhortations of his spiritual advisor he appeared to pay deep attention. [...] had he died in a better cause, it would have been impossible not to admire his steady heroism.⁵³

His calm delineation of the ‘signs’ of the prisoner’s natural language upon his entrance are in juxtaposition to the synchronised eruption of energy in the crowd:

No sooner had the wretch entered the area appropriated for his fate, than a shout of deafening execration arose from the hitherto silent multitude. No preparatory murmurs of hatred and revenge preceded this ebullition of feeling. It sprung up simultaneously, and as if those from whom it proceeded were animated with one soul, and felt one pervading vengeance thrilling through their hearts.⁵⁴

The act of child murder is an unnatural crime, and ‘one of all others the most heinous to a maternal heart’, and as such, ‘the natural fountains of woman’s tears were no longer free to flow their wonted channel’.⁵⁵ The prevention of this natural bodily reaction in the females leads to an intensified unity with the male animalistic desire for revenge, and the ‘bitter wrath’ of the crowd is in direct contrast to the narrator’s abstracted sympathy. However, at the critical point of the execution – the point at which Papvoine has ‘committed himself to the hands of the executioner’ – the crowd falls into a ‘universal silence’ of ‘breathless awe’, which ‘was sickening to the last degree’. Reacting to the ‘appalling’ spectacle, the narrator’s experience becomes intensely physical, and his temporarily abstracted sympathy is, in fact, reembodyed:

While gazing upon the victim, my respiration was almost totally suspended – my heart beat violently, and a feeling of intense anxiety and suffocation pervaded my frame.⁵⁶

Whether the narrator is engaging in embodied sympathetic exchange with the prisoner or with the crowd is uncertain. His physiological reaction descriptively parallels the breathlessness of the crowd, yet the ‘intense anxiety’ may be the result of Humean self-comparison with the soon to be executed prisoner. Yet, according to the narrator’s descriptions, the ‘steady heroism’ of the prisoner does not reveal any degree of anxiety. The anxiety is more probably the result of cognitive dissonance – his clear abhorrence of the crowd’s expectant silence and the knowledge that he himself is also under the ‘sanguinary spell’ of the guillotine. Regardless, his

⁵³ Ibid., p. 787.

⁵⁴ Ibid., p. 787.

⁵⁵ Ibid., p. 787.

⁵⁶ Ibid., p. 787.

willful abstraction from the physiological immediacy of the bodily reaction is defeated, and he is thus temporarily assimilated into the throngs of the masses. However, at the moment the head is severed from the trunk, his stance as philosophical observer receives a new vitality. He is now able to look ‘attentively to observe’ the intimate details of the executed body.⁵⁷ The self-projective sympathy that accompanied his examination of the natural signs of the living body dies as quickly as the severed corpse. To his surprise, the trunk does not convulse at the instant of decapitation, but rather

lay from the first perfectly motionless, nor exhibited the slightest shudder – the least quivering – or the faintest indication that, the moment before, it was part of a sentient being, instinct with all the energies of life.⁵⁸

The transition from ‘perfect life’ to ‘perfect annihilation’ is instantaneous, and the rapidity of this transition is reflected in the living crowd, which in ‘an instantaneous movement’ disperse after the fall of the blade.⁵⁹ The narrator, however, remains to view the transmutation of living flesh into scientific commodity – the head of Papavoine, after the blood is drained from the flesh, is sent to the Ecole de Medecine to be examined.

Macnish draws a specific parallel between the witnessing of the execution and the examination of the anatomical body, as it is the ‘same curiosity’ that draws the narrator to both spectacles. At the examination, the ‘celebrated Doctor Gall’ is present among the scientific men, as he ‘was employed in investigating the developments of the head, and pointing them out to several of his pupils’.⁶⁰ The methodology of the phrenological examination involved the reading of external signs, both the bumps of the skull and the natural language of the body, in order to indicate the internal character. The essential tenets of phrenology were: (1) The brain is the organ through which the mind is manifested during life; (2) The brain is not a singular organ, but rather consists of multiple organs with distinct functions; (3) All other factors being equal, the power of the organ can be estimated from its size. These factors included temperament and external circumstances, such as education; and finally, (4) The size of each organ can be ascertained by an examination of the skull. Thus, in contrast to the introspective methodologies of the metaphysicians, with phrenology, the human mind is rendered ‘as open, accessible and easy to read, as the ages of the earth for a geologist working with volcanic

⁵⁷ Ibid., p. 788.

⁵⁸ Ibid., p. 788.

⁵⁹ Ibid., p. 788.

⁶⁰ Ibid., p. 788.

rock’.⁶¹

Rather than comparing the readable signs of the other’s character to the self, either through involuntary re-embodiment or imaginative self-projection, these signs were compared to the protrusions of the cranium for meaningful interpretation. A fruitful and thematically appropriate example is located in the appendix to Macnish’s *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), under the title, ‘Phrenological Assessment of George Campbell, executed for murder.’ The ‘particularly atrocious’ aspects of Campbell’s crime and conduct lead Macnish to request a plaster cast of his skull post-execution in order to ‘ascertain how far the developments, in a phrenological point of view, harmonised with so strongly marked and singular a character’.⁶² Macnish is struck with the skull’s remarkable confirmation of phrenological doctrine, but worries that his previous knowledge of the individual has biased his observations. In an attempt to eliminate bias, Macnish carefully disguises the external marks on the neck that would indicate the cause of death and anonymously sends the cast to an ‘eminent Phrenologist in Edinburgh’ with only the basic information of ‘age, temperament, and education’ to inform his analysis.⁶³ The phrenologist’s postmortem phrenological analysis of his skull is shown to coalesce with the murderer’s character:

The great size of Combativeness and Destructiveness (both 20) uncontrolled by his Benevolence, (which ranks only as high as 11,) and called into fierce action by liquor, easily accounts for the murder. [...] His great Love of Approbation, and his large Order, sufficiently explain the foppish freak of arranging his hair in curls at such a time, as well as the marked neatness of his dress as he appeared upon the scaffold.⁶⁴

Macnish is unable to perform a valid phrenological analysis himself because he is subjectively tainted by his knowledge of the public narrative. Thus, his final combination of the public narrative with the blind phrenological analysis is his attempt to bypass the limitations of the biased spectator and confirm an ultimate faith in the visual signs of the skull. As will be further explored below, Hogg’s *Confessions* satirises such attempts to coalesce narrative and physical evidence.

Macnish attended Campbell’s execution in September 1835, and subsequently presented the cast to the Edinburgh Phrenological Society on the third of December 1835.⁶⁵

⁶¹ Stack, p. 46.

⁶² *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), p. 165.

⁶³ *Ibid.*, p. 165.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 171.

⁶⁵ Minute Book of the Phrenological Society to 2nd Sept 1841, Volume I, Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, Gen 608/2, fol. 221.

The minute details of the phrenological examination recorded in the appendix to *An Introduction to Phrenology* are in stark contrast to the single sentence devoted to Gall's phrenological evaluation of Papavoine in the tale published in 1828. While it is possible that Macnish simply no longer recalls the minute details of the evaluation or perhaps did not pay close attention at the time, this evasion may also be read as a negative commentary on phrenology. With the shocking rapidity of the decapitation in 'An Execution in Paris', the transition from a sentient being – capable of eliciting sympathy and wrath – to an insentient object – the description of which holds no significant indications of an internal life is instantaneous. This eludes the phrenologist, as the severed head in the hands of Gall, drained of all its blood, is examined in the same way the phrenologist might examine a living head, i.e. examination of the external developments of the skull. Prior to his conversion to the phrenological methodologies of spectatorship, Macnish instead emphasised the value of phenomenological narratives of living persons in revealing the significance of the other, and one of the primary purposes of his 'medico-popular' text, *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, was to provide such narratives.

The Anatomy of Drunkenness

In 1825, upon his return from Paris, Macnish presented his inaugural essay 'The Anatomy of Drunkenness', before the Faculty of Physicians and Surgeons of Glasgow, and thus became a certified practitioner of surgery. The title of the essay appears to be derived from Robert Burton's *The Anatomy of Melancholy* (1621), and according to Bamborough's introduction to the Clarendon Press edition of Burton's text, in the seventeenth century '[t]he name implied an attempt to get to the bottom of things and reveal everything fully and methodically'.⁶⁶ Macnish's text capitalises on a similarly polymathical approach, drawing upon scientific, literary, philosophical, and historical learning. According to Moir, the essay stood out from the 'mere crambè-recocta common places' typically presented before the Faculty, and the preface to the first published edition indicates that its appearance before the public was upon the 'suggestion of the publisher', William M'Phun, 'who conceived it might be adapted to the perusal of a wider circle than the one for which it was, originally, altogether intended'. Macnish however refrained from revising or extending the original essay, and the first

⁶⁶ J. B. Bamborough, 'Introduction', in Robert Burton, *The Anatomy of Melancholy*, ed. by Thomas C. Faulkner, Nicolas K. Kiessling, and Rhonda L. Blair, 6 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989), I, pp. xiii-xxxvi, (p. xxv).

published edition of the text is presumably identical to the essay presented before the faculty in 1825.⁶⁷ Macnish began drafting the essay during his apprenticeship in Caithness, and thus the published text in 1827 represents the fruition of much earlier work.⁶⁸

The Anatomy of Drunkenness (1827) met with popular approbation, and a second edition was called for the following year.⁶⁹ Macnish took this opportunity to greatly expand upon the original material, generally including more literary and medical illustrations as well as adding several new sections, including a survey of the history of drunkenness and a chapter on ‘The Spontaneous Combustion of Drunkards’. A third edition was published in 1829, and while the changes are less substantial in comparison, in the advertisement, Macnish writes that he has carefully revised the text, including new details suggested to the author since the last publication and trusts that the text will remain in this state. This was not to be the case, as a substantially revised fourth edition appeared in 1832 and a fifth in 1834.

The number of editions testifies to the unusual quality of this medical essay. Moir ascribes its original success to the fact that ‘the writer had evidently read with his own eyes, and thought with his own head’, and thus positions the essay within the medical movement away from orthodox knowledge.⁷⁰ However, the popularity of the text most probably had much to do with its high literary merits. Macnish, in correspondence with Moir regarding the second edition, declares the volume to be ‘much more literary than scientific’ and as such, justifies his dedication of the text to ‘Delta, Author of “The Legend of Genevieve”’ rather than to ‘David M. Moir, Esq. Surgeon Musselburgh’, as he will later in the third edition.⁷¹ Moir concurs with the literary merits of the work, writing that he has ‘managed to hit off the subject in such a medico-popular way, as to render it not only instructive to the disciples of Hippocrates, but to Coleridge’s “reading public” at large’.⁷²

Macnish spells out the novelty of his essay on drunkenness in the opening pages of the first edition. According to Macnish, the two major faults in past writings on drunkenness are, first, their faint and/or inaccurate descriptions of the phenomena of drunkenness, and, second,

⁶⁷ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 36, p. 37.

⁶⁸ See above, p. 22.

⁶⁹ For examples of the positive reception of the first edition, see ‘The Philosophy of Drunkenness’, *Monthly Magazine, or, British Register*, 3.18 (June 1827), 601-14; ‘Macnish’s *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*’, *Literary Chronicle*, 415 (April 1827), 262-64; ‘Macnish’s *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*’, *The Lancet*, 8 (5 May 1827), 149-55.

⁷⁰ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 36.

⁷¹ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 16 February 1828, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

⁷² *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 51-52. On the general popularization of medical knowledge in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, see Roy Porter, ‘The Spreading of Medical Enlightenment: The Popularization of Medicine in Georgian England, and its Paradoxes’, in *The Popularization of Medicine, 1650-1850*, ed. by Roy Porter (London: Routledge, 1992), pp. 215-31.

their neglect of the modification of drunkenness according to temperament and inebriating agent.⁷³ In the second edition, Macnish further enumerates the epistemological underpinnings of his text, as he describes ‘confounding dead animal matter with the living fibre’.⁷⁴

Pathological anatomy informed Macnish’s text, as the signs of the external body signified the disease beneath the flesh. However, his concern with phenomenology led him to emphasise the experiential signs of the living flesh, such as the sensations of the palpitating heart and the rush of blood and nervous energy to the brain.

The unique stimulating properties of alcohol, which are in some way qualitatively different than the powers of other stimulants, such as fever and exercise, form the basis of Macnish’s physiological reasoning.⁷⁵ The excitatory power of stimulants was a central trope of physiological reasoning in Scotland following the controversial work of John Brown (1735-1788). Brown’s system, deemed Brunonianism, defined all disease as either the result of excessive or insufficient stimulation, and as such, alcohol and opium were frequently appealed to as restoring an under-stimulated system to an ideal state of balance.⁷⁶ The physical signs of habitual drunkenness discussed by Macnish are linked to excessive stimulation. For example, the morning after an evening of excess, the eyes and the complexion reveal an exhausted system:

Then look at his eyes – how sickly, dull, and languid! The fire, which first lighted them up the evening before, is all gone. [...] The complexion sustains as great a change: it is no longer flushed with gaiety and excitation, but pale and wayworn, indicating a profound mental and bodily exhaustion.⁷⁷

While a moderate amount of stimulation is necessary and desirable, excessive stimulation leads to debilitation and a resultant need to again turn to stimulants to return the system to a functional level.⁷⁸ The level of excess necessary for functional derangement, however, is modified according to the bodily constitution, i.e. the temperament. Although he appeals to the humoral temperaments, Macnish goes no farther than to assert that ‘bodily and mental

⁷³ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), p. 1. Macnish may be responding in part to Thomas Trotter’s 1804 essay on drunkenness, see Thomas Trotter, *An Essay, Medical, Philosophical, and Chemical on Drunkenness and its Effects on the Human Body*, ed. by Roy Porter (London: Routledge, 1988).

⁷⁴ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 2nd edn (1828), p. 54.

⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 88-96.

⁷⁶ Michael Barfoot, ‘Brunonianism Under the Bed: An Alternative to University Medicine in Edinburgh in the 1780s’, in *Brunonianism in Britain and Europe*, ed. by W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter, *Medical History*, Supplement No. 8 (London: Wellcome Institute for the History of Medicine, 1988), pp. 22-45.

⁷⁷ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 2nd edn (1828), pp. 33-34.

⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 179.

constitution of every man is not alike, and that on these peculiarities depend certain differences during a paroxysm of drunkenness'.⁷⁹

Persons of different temperaments have different bodily constitutions and will thus experience the phenomena of drunkenness differently, and he provides descriptions of the phenomenological experience, appearance, and behaviour of sanguineous, melancholy, surly, phlegmatic, nervous, and choleric drunkards. Smollett's Roderick Random is cited as an example of the sanguineous, while Robert Burns is held up as exemplifying the melancholy drunkard.⁸⁰ Furthermore, according to Macnish, the inebriating agent, be it wine, ale, spirits, opium, or tobacco, alters the phenomenological experience, and with habitual use, the bodily constitution, and thus the physical appearance of the drunkard. Part of the entertainment value of the text was most probably in classifying both yourself and others according to Macnish's descriptions.

The florid descriptions of the phenomenological experience of drunkenness, from the first 'sensations of incipient drunkenness' to 'total insensibility', reflect an attempt to render an inherently subjective experience open to the reader. The initial stage of drunkenness is described as follows:

First, an unusual serenity prevails over the mind, and the soul of the votary is filled with a placid satisfaction. By degrees he is sensible of a soft and not unmusical humming in his ears, at every pause of the conversation. He seems, to himself, to wear his head lighter than usual upon his shoulders. Then a species of obscurity, thinner than the finest mist, passes before his eyes, and makes him see objects rather indistinctly. The lights begin to dance, and appear double. A gaiety and warmth are felt at the same time about the heart. The imagination is expanded, and filled with a thousand delightful images. He becomes loquacious, and pours forth, in enthusiastic language, the thoughts which are born, as it were, within him.⁸¹

The description moves from the purely subjective feeling of serenity to perceptual distortions of the external world (the soft humming and visual obscurity) to the objectively observable behavioural outcome of enthusiastic loquacity. This movement is fluidly portrayed through the transition between sensations of the body and of the mind, which are inextricably interwoven, as the brain 'acts in a double capacity upon the frame, being both the source of corporeal feelings, and of the mental manifestations'.⁸² Drunkenness, through its physiological actions on the body, changes the perception of both impressions from the external world (the apparent

⁷⁹ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), p. 14.

⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 13-17.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, p. 6.

⁸² *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 2nd edn (1828), p. 94.

doubling of the lights) and ideas from the internal world of the mind (the 'delightful images' of the imagination). Alcohol is shown to increase the vivacity of both ideas and impressions; however, much like the vivid synaesthetic perception, ideas may become so vivid as to be perceived as actual impressions from the external environment. After the drunkard is removed from the convivial location:

A dim recollection of his carousals, like a shadowy and indistinct dream, passes before the mind. He still hears, as in echo, the cries and laughter of his companions. Wild fantastic fancies accumulate thickly around the brain.⁸³

The term 'accumulate' indicates his debt to Erasmus Darwin, who 'was convinced that whenever we frame a new idea, the motions of sense by which it was acquired remain in our bodies thereafter' continuing to circulate as 'internal stimuli'.⁸⁴

The melting of the boundaries between the subjective and objective for the individual is further manifested in a 'spirit of universal contentment' with both himself and the world, which marks the 'acme of the fit'. This moment of universal sympathy is marked by dissolution of artificiality, as the true mental character is revealed:

About this time, the drunkard pours out all the secrets of his soul. His qualities, good or bad, come forth without reserve; and now, if at any time, the human heart may be seen into.⁸⁵

Rather than the collaborative vindication of signs that enabled the phrenologist to read deeper and thus distinguish the natural from the artificial mental character, Macnish appeals to drunkenness to reveal the genuine signs, as

The natural disposition may be better discovered in drunkenness than at any other time. In modern society, life is all a disguise. Every man walks in masquerade, and his most intimate friend very often does not know his real character. Many wear smiles constantly upon their cheeks whose hearts are unprincipled and treacherous. Many with violent tempers have all the external calm and softness of charity itself. Some speak always with sympathy, who, at soul, are full of gall and bitterness. Intoxication tears off the veil, and sets each in its true light, whatever that may be. The combative man will quarrel, the sensualist will love, the detractor will abuse his neighbour. I have known exceptions, but they are few in number. At one time they seemed more numerous, but closer observation convinced me that most of those whom I thought drunkenness had libelled, inherited, at

⁸³ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), p. 8.

⁸⁴ Neil Vickers, *Coleridge and the Doctors, 1795-1806* (Oxford: Clarendon Press; New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), p. 139; Erasmus Darwin, 'Of Drunkenness', in *Zoonomia; or, the Laws of Organic Life*, pp. 267-76.

⁸⁵ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), p. 6.

bottom, the genuine dispositions which it brought forth.⁸⁶

The weakening of the ‘power of volition, that faculty which keeps the will subordinate to the judgment’ underlies the person’s inability to maintain the veil of the social persona.⁸⁷ In the later stages of drunkenness, the external signs (for example, ‘His mouth is half open, and idiotic in the expression; while his eyes are glazed, wavering, and watery’) become increasingly physical in nature, as ‘[a]t first, the intoxication partakes of the sentiment, but, latterly, it becomes merely animal’.⁸⁸ When the individual is in these later stages, the external signs no longer reveal his natural mental character, as the physical body is rapidly progressing towards insensibility and thus unable to manifest any unique character beyond that of general temperament: finally, ‘he is said to be *dead drunk*’.⁸⁹ However, the liminal state ‘when a person is neither “drunken nor sober, but neighbour to both,”’ presents a moment of possible transgression into the depths of the human psyche, and such is the case in the tales, ‘The Man with the Nose’ and ‘Colonel O’Shaughnessy in India’.⁹⁰

‘The Man with the Nose’ presents a clear indication of a productive relationship between Macnish’s fictional and popular medical works. The ludicrous horror of the tale is derived from the impenetrability of the significance of the nose, as an unexpected guest startles a landlord and his guests with the great protuberance on his phiz. The party attempts to classify the nose, but ‘it was neither an aquiline nose, nor a Roman nose, nor a snub nose [...] all philosophy was at fault’.⁹¹ The landlord, eventually trapped alone with the man with the nose, falls into the nightmarish trance state – a half-waking and half-sleeping state, bereft of volitional power, which continually reappears in Macnish’s writing. The nose seems to grow to preposterous lengths – the impenetrability of its meaning exacerbating its horrific incongruity:

It was this that tormented the looker-on. It was this that stood perpetually before his eyes, and would not be denied. The longer he looked at it the greater it grew, and the more his desire to look increased. Every moment it stretched out, and was at last a foot in length.⁹²

Published in August 1826, the tale is presumably written after what would be published as the

⁸⁶ Ibid., p. 13.

⁸⁷ Ibid., p. 7.

⁸⁸ Ibid., p. 7.

⁸⁹ Ibid., p. 8.

⁹⁰ Ibid., p. 6. Macnish is quoting from Bishop Andrews’s ‘Ex-ale-tation of Ale’.

⁹¹ Robert Macnish, ‘The Man with the Nose’, *Blackwood’s*, 20 (August 1826), 159-63, (pp. 159-60).

⁹² Ibid., p. 162.

first edition of *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* in 1827 and prior to the second edition, published in February 1828. In the second edition, the section on tobacco within the chapter on 'Drunkenness as Modified by Inebriating Agent' is substantially expanded and now includes a description of the visions induced by smoking tobacco that appears to have been first developed in 'The Man with the Nose'. Drawing upon a literary analogy, these visions are said to 'stand in the same relation to those of opium and wine [...] as Washington Irving to Lord Byron' and are described as follows:

If his fancy be unusually brilliant, or somewhat heated by previous drinking, he may see thousands of strange forms floating in the tobacco smoke. He may people it, according to his temperament, with agreeable or revolting images – with flowers and gems springing up, as in dreams, before him – or with reptiles, serpents, and the whole host of *diablerie*, skimming, like motes in the sunshine, amid its curling wreaths.⁹³

The landlord in 'The Man with the Nose' is apparently of the later temperament, as his imagery is diabolical rather than agreeable:

[H]orrid forms were seen floating in the tobacco smoke – imps of darkness – snakes – crocodiles – toads – lizards, and all sorts of impure things. They leaped, and crawled, and flew with detestable hisses around – while the stranger grinned, and shook his head, and jabbered in an unearthly voice – his long nose, in the meantime, waving to and fro like a banner, while black demons, with tails and green eyes, sat astride upon it, screeching hideously. The spectacle was more than the landlord could endure, and he fell into a faint.⁹⁴

The man with the nose does not manifest any diabolical behaviour within the tale, other than perhaps refusing to offer up any explanation of his unusual anatomy and sitting up rather late smoking and drinking. In fact, the next morning, upon waking, the landlord finds that the man with the nose has 'handsomely discharged his bill, and slipped a half-crown into the hand of the pretty chambermaid, and another into that of the ostler who had the charge of his horse'.⁹⁵ The diabolical visions are derived from the actions of the tobacco fumes on the landlord's body and thus his mind.⁹⁶ His inability to control the visions of his fancy parallels his loss of voluntary movement, as 'To move, to speak, to utter even the merest groan of agony, was

⁹³ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 2nd edn (1828), p. 75.

⁹⁴ 'The Man with the Nose', pp. 162-63.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 163.

⁹⁶ Macnish also draws upon tobacco fume induced hallucination in the prose tale, 'Notes of a Journey from Paris to Ostend', *Fraser's*, 11 (January 1835), 33-49.

impossible'.⁹⁷ His experience represents a liminal state, between drunkenness and sobriety, and his perceptions are a combination of actual impressions from the external environment and vivid ideas projected into his visual field.⁹⁸ These images are read as signs of the other's diabolical nature, but are in actuality signs of his own bodily and mental state. The reptilian imagery is reminiscent of the opium-induced Oriental dreams of De Quincey's *Confessions of an English Opium Eater*, first serialised in the *London Magazine* in 1821, which Youngquist reads as indicative of 'lived intensity: the becoming reptile of De Quincey's stomach'.⁹⁹

Macnish was also personally familiar with the detrimental cognitive effects of particular bodily constitutions and the role of external stimuli in augmenting their influence. In the same letter to Moir in which he discusses the vivid mental imagery brought forth by thinking of various literary figures, he describes reptilian visions brought forth by the gloomy monotony of January weather in Glasgow:

Talking of blue devils are you ever annoyed with them? [...] Nothing but constant occupation of body and mind keeps me free from their accursed presence. The weather which prevails at present is enough to foster them into the most violent activity. I know not how the atmosphere stands with you just now, but in the West Country it is utterly insufferable. The sky seems to be covered with a wet blanket of a dirty, dun colour, through whose porous texture there is an incessant drivel of rain – sometimes a shower, but generally an insipid, unmeaning, spiritless drivel. If it were a good, hearty, soul-inspiring plump it would be nothing at all – but there is nought but a continued drop, drop, drop, as if the devil held some immense sponge, filled with water, overhead, and squeezed it gently, as if for the diabolical purpose of drowning the universe by degrees, instead of overwhelming it in one huge deluge. [...] At night it is not a bit better, for when I sit down alone, after all the folks have gone to roost, I can do nothing but gaze on the fire, and witness the pale wreaths go curling up the chimney – each wreath converted into a twisted snake, or a devil with green eyes, or a crocodile, or something equally horrible and hideous. I am sure you have frequently experienced these vile sensations. I never feel them but in such weather as this – and to get rid of them I could hang myself but for the fear of meeting ~~them~~-attendant devils in the other world, and of being annoyed by seeing them jabbering and grinning in my face during the agonies of strangulation, which I needs must encounter previous to my departure from this. So much for blue devils.¹⁰⁰

This letter is dated after the publication of 'The Man with the Nose', but indicates that his experience of the 'blue devils' is recurrent, and, while interpretable as stimulatory imbalance, alarmingly distressing. In describing phenomenological experience in both his fictional and

⁹⁷ 'The Man with the Nose', p. 162.

⁹⁸ Macnish classifies all substance-induced altered-states of consciousness as 'drunkenness'.

⁹⁹ Paul Youngquist, *Monstrosities: Bodies and British Romanticism* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2003), p. 121.

¹⁰⁰ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 5 January 1828, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

popular medical writing, Macnish, like many authors, draws upon his own lived experiences.

In the tale, 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy in India', published in *Blackwood's* in June 1827, O'Shaughnessy's experience is complicated by the fact that he not only occupies the liminal space between drunkenness and sobriety, but also doubts 'whether I was asleep or awake – whether I was dead or alive' and 'whether I was myself or another person'.¹⁰¹ He turns to brandy as a final attempt to extinguish his guilt for having played a role in the untimely demise of his nemesis, Colonel M'Mulligan, who was struck down by a *coup de soleil* as he took his position to duel against O'Shaughnessy. Others maintain that he died of an apoplectic fit, but O'Shaughnessy insists that it was a *coup de soleil* such that his own later infliction of squinting due to a *coup de soleil* can be viewed as retributive. O'Shaughnessy is haunted by 'the image of Colonel M'Mulligan', and he drinks to alleviate himself from the presence and to steady his thoughts.¹⁰² However, 'it was in vain' as 'every moment they became more mystified, – every glass that was poured down only rendered them more refractory'.¹⁰³ He claims that he cannot describe the phenomenological experience of that evening: 'I cannot tell the sights that I saw, or the sounds that I heard, or the feelings that I felt.'¹⁰⁴ However, he goes on to do just this – writing of the 'shades of night' thickening around him, the 'monstrous loudness' of the crickets, the strange jumble of fumes, and 'the ecstasy of delight' and 'pangs of remorse' that alternately strike him.¹⁰⁵ Rather than representing a complete deviation from the external world, the visions that he experiences are projected and assimilated into his perceptual field:

All the furniture was becoming instinct with life. My chairs, my time-piece, and my cloak, parted with their inanimate character, and assumed the voice and the form of M'Mulligan. To my complete confusion, when I was putting out my hand to lay hold of the brandy bottle, the latter suddenly stretched itself out, and became adorned with a human head and a human body. In a word, it turned an additional Colonel, and stood upon the table mocking maliciously at me.¹⁰⁶

His internal feelings of remorse are projected outwards and manifest in the form of M'Mulligan, and the stimulation of alcohol increases both the vivacity and the dimensions of the vision, as 'the little, fat, ruby-nosed Colonel M'Mulligan assumed the appearance of a

¹⁰¹ 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy in India', p. 657.

¹⁰² Ibid., p. 656.

¹⁰³ Ibid., p. 657.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid., p. 657.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid., p. 657.

¹⁰⁶ Ibid., p. 660.

monstrous giant – swelling out till he filled the whole room with his hideous dimensions’.¹⁰⁷ O’Shaughnessy attempts to respond to the phantom in the associatively charged language of Macbeth, but “Thou canst not say I did it” only trembles on his lips.¹⁰⁸ Unwilling to fully accept either guilt or innocence in the chain of events leading up to M’Mulligan’s death, O’Shaughnessy externalises his guilt in the form of M’Mulligan such that his two conflicting emotions can have full play. Both essentially belong to him, and neither can be denied.¹⁰⁹ O’Shaughnessy’s externalisation of mental conflict into vivid perceptual hallucinations is strikingly similar to Hogg’s portrayal of Robert Wringhim. Like Wringhim, O’Shaughnessy deals with the conflict by reading the visions into his sign-latent tale. A perceived similarity between his drunken dream vision and an event the following day is taken as ‘an evil omen’, and as such, he rides on horseback rather than upon an elephant in a tiger hunt, which in turn allows him to hotly pursue a tiger, during which he is struck by the *coup de soleil*, which renders him ‘The Squinting Colonel’.¹¹⁰

Retributive Causality

The physicality of causal relations underlies the didacticism of *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*. In the first edition the ‘Consequences of Drunkenness’ include: inflammation of the brain, stomach and liver, gout, tremors, palpitations of the heart, hysteria, epilepsy, emaciation, ulcers, melancholy, madness, and delirium tremens.¹¹¹ Premature old age, corpulence, compositional changes in the blood, breathe, and perspiration, pleurisy and rheumatism are added to the second edition.¹¹² In a healthy state vital power gradually diminishes with age, and the premature old age of the drunkard represents the hastening of this process through over stimulation of the system, as ‘[i]t causes time to pace on with giant strides – chases youth from the constitution of its victims – and clothes them prematurely with the gray garniture of years’.¹¹³ Death more rapidly encroaches on the living organism, but in quantitative rather than qualitative terms.

The transformation of the corporeal body, and thus the mind, is the retributive

¹⁰⁷ Ibid., p. 658.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid., p. 658.

¹⁰⁹ A similar example of externalisation of mental conflict can be found in *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, see below, pp. 101-03.

¹¹⁰ ‘Colonel O’Shaughnessy in India’, p. 660.

¹¹¹ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), pp. 32-41.

¹¹² *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 2nd edn (1828), pp. 106-32.

¹¹³ Ibid., p. 123.

consequence of habitual drunkenness. Macnish leaves the specifically moral consequences of habitual drunkenness to ‘the legislator or divine’, but physiology underlines morality.¹¹⁴ He interprets the Promethean legend as an allegorical depiction of Bacchanalian liver damage and the transformation of Ulysses’ companions into swine as ‘the bestial degradation which men bring themselves by coming under the dominion of so detestable a habit’.¹¹⁵ Congruent with his fictional predilections, Macnish focuses upon the transformation of the nose:

There is no organ which so rapidly betrays the Bacchanalian propensities of its owner as the nose. It not only becomes red and fiery, like that of Bardolph, but acquires a general increase of size – displaying upon its surface various small pimples, either wholly of a deep crimson hue, or tipped with yellow, in consequence of an accumulation of viscid matter within them.¹¹⁶

Similarly, snuffing tobacco leads to a ‘black loathsome discharge from the nose, and swelling and rubicundity of this organ’.¹¹⁷ Clearly the nose was latent with significance for Macnish, and in *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* systemic changes, particularly the quantity and quality of blood reaching the surface of the skin, account for the appearance of this organ.¹¹⁸ While some authors argued that alcohol was not absorbed into the system, Macnish observed that ‘[t]he blood, breath, and perspiration of a confirmed drunkard differ from those of a sober man’.¹¹⁹ Eventually, the habitual use of an unnatural stimulus leads to pervasive systematic changes, such that:

The system no longer acts with its original purity: it is operated upon by a fictitious excitement, and, in the course of time, assumes a state quite foreign to its original constitution – an action which, however unhealthy, becomes, ultimately, in some measure, natural.¹²⁰

Systemic changes are correlated with changes in the physical appearance, and in turn, changes in the mental powers, as:

The mind and body act reciprocally upon one another; and when the one is injured, the

¹¹⁴ For the link between health and morality in medical writing at this time, see Guenter B. Risse, ‘In the Name of Hygieia and Hippocrates: A Quest for Preservation of Health and Virtue’, in *New Medical Challenges During the Scottish Enlightenment* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2005), pp. 135-69.

¹¹⁵ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 2nd edn (1828), pp. 106-07.

¹¹⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 116-17.

¹¹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 74.

¹¹⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 114.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 86.

¹²⁰ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), p. 48.

other must suffer more or less. In intemperance, the structure of the brain is no longer the same as in health; and the mind, that immortal part of man, whose manifestations depend upon this organ, suffers a corresponding injury.¹²¹

For example, female drunkards were particularly sensitive to ‘hysterical affections’ due to a ‘susceptibility of mind’ and ‘delicacy of fibre’, but the true source of their affection might easily be detected by their physical appearance:

When a woman’s nose becomes crimsoned at the point, her eyes somewhat red, and more watery than before, and her lips fuller, and less firm and intellectual in their expression, we may suspect that something wrong is going on.¹²²

External signs are latent with significance because habitual actions change both the body and the mind.

Macnish’s natural causality participates in the religious and philosophical ethos of the period. In his seminal work on *The Age of Atonement: The Influence of Evangelicalism on Social and Economic Thought, 1795-1865* (1988), Boyd Hilton discusses the differentiation between extremist and moderate evangelical thinking in regard to the divine governance of the universe. While the extremist, pre-millennialists emphasised that ‘temporal misfortunes were always “special” or “particular” judgments on men and nations, inflicted for unspecified spiritual offenses, and requiring miraculous suspension of natural law’, the moderate post-millennialists ‘believed that ninety-nine out of a hundred events are predictable consequences of human behaviour.’¹²³ Thomas Chalmers’s natural theology is of central importance to Hilton’s argument. As a moderate evangelical Chalmers advocated that each action produced an inherent punishment or reward on this earthly sphere, therefore, similar to Macnish’s writing on drunkenness, bodily disease functions as an inherent punishment for intemperance.¹²⁴ Further, for Chalmers intemperate social relations led to a diseased mind which reciprocally affected the body. His theology promoted good works and benevolence, as man’s natural endowment with conscience lent pleasure to virtuous action and misery to vicious.¹²⁵ According to Chalmers, he who habitually denies the natural benevolence of his own mind and lives selfishly for immediate temporal gratification becomes exile from the preludes to divine consciousness in this life:

¹²¹ Ibid., p. 40.

¹²² Ibid., p. 38.

¹²³ Hilton, p. 14, p. 16.

¹²⁴ Ibid., p. 184.

¹²⁵ Ibid., pp. 185-86.

The owner of such a heart may live in society; but, cut off as he is by his own sordid nature from the reciprocities of honourable feeling and good faith, he may be said to live an exile in the midst of it. He is a stranger to the day-light of the moral world; and, instead of walking abroad on an open platform of free and fearless communion with his fellows, he spends a cold and heartless existence in the hiding-place of his own thoughts.¹²⁶

Macnish's depiction of the delirium tremens, perhaps the most horrific consequence of habitual drunkenness, mirrors Chalmers's focus on social alienation in his description of hell on earth:

It comes on with restlessness, and general depression of the mental powers, with forgetfulness and alienation of mind. The countenance is pale: there are tremors of the limbs, anxiety, loss of appetite, and a total disrelish for the common amusements of life. When the person sleeps, which is but seldom, he frequently starts in the utmost terror, having his imagination haunted by frightful dreams. He is hot, and the slightest agitation of body or mind sends out a profuse perspiration. The tongue is furred; the pulse weak and intermitting. Every object appears hideous and unnatural. There is a constant dread of being haunted by spectres. He conceives that vermin, and all sorts of impure things are crawling upon his body, and is constantly endeavouring to pick them off. His ideas are wholly confined to himself and his own affairs, of which he entertains the most disordered notions. He imagines he is away from home, forgets those who are around him, and is irritated beyond measure by the slightest contradiction.¹²⁷

When the accustomed excitatory stimulus of alcohol is removed, a nightmarish inversion of the 'spirit of universal contentment' felt at the initial stages of drunkenness, a constriction to and distorted amplification of ideas related exclusively to the self, results. The nightmarish conclusion of Robert Wringhim's confession here comes to mind. For both Chalmers and Macnish, judgment fluidly transgresses the boundary of death, and Hogg advocates a similar retributive causality in *Confessions*.

In Macnish's *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, published as an anonymous pamphlet in 1827, the spirit of the cruelly murdered Mary Elliston transgresses death in order to act as a check on the confessional narrator's dysfunctional conscience. The first circumstance to stir 'some sympathies with humanity' in the confessional narrator is the death of his sister, Eliza, from a broken heart, resultant upon his malevolent actions.¹²⁸ He spurned her affections whilst she lived, but now:

¹²⁶ *Discourses on the Christian Revelation*, p. 324.

¹²⁷ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), pp. 41-42.

¹²⁸ *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, 2nd edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1827), p. 20.

I felt desolate, companionless, and hated upon earth; and the fountains of sorrow now broke forth at this sad spectacle of the only one who loved me being so bitterly taken away.¹²⁹

At her funeral, he is ‘shunned like a scorpion, and returned alone and unpitied to my desolate mansion’.¹³⁰ Mary’s spirit first appears whilst he is mourning next to his sister’s corpse. At the hour of her murder, the narrator, ‘so full of sorrow and of crime’, sees ‘the pale and bleeding form of Mary’.¹³¹ As he watches ‘transfixed with fear and astonishment’ the spirit of Mary kisses and embraces his sister who is ‘re-animated’ and ‘flushed with primeval beauty’.¹³² However, when his joy breaks his trance and he rushes forward to clasp his sister, ‘horror-struck’, he finds he ‘had laid hold of her corpse’.¹³³ The narrator escapes the punishment of the law and is thus ‘unexecuted’, but twenty years after the crime, he is still haunted:

Yes, it is twenty years since I perpetrated that crime which has poisoned my existence, and thrown over it a cloud of unutterable sorrow. All other crimes may sleep, but iniquity like mine never can. The worm that dies not preys upon my heart: I am the victim of remorse.¹³⁴

The confessional narrator here depicts himself as rotting from within during life. The spirit of Mary continues to appear every night at ten o’clock, and, interesting, has a strange affective connection with the narrator. When he attempts to forget his crimes in mirthful society, the spirit appears more ‘sad and afflicted’ and urges him to “Repent!” in ‘more impassioned language’.¹³⁵ However, when he is full of remorse and his soul

calmly awaits the trial that attends upon it, her melancholy is tinged with a sort of placid delight – her black eye rolls more placidly upon me – she lingers but a moment – and the warning, as it flows from her lips, comes upon my ear like a strain of not unpleasant music!¹³⁶

When he finally feels the full weight of his crimes and pleas for the mercy of heaven, Mary appears in divine beauty:

¹²⁹ Ibid., p. 21.

¹³⁰ Ibid., p. 22.

¹³¹ Ibid., p. 21.

¹³² Ibid., p. 21.

¹³³ Ibid., p. 22.

¹³⁴ Ibid., p. 5.

¹³⁵ Ibid., p. 23.

¹³⁶ Ibid., p. 23.

I never saw her look so beautiful. She was melancholy; but a smile sat upon her lips, and she regarded me with a look of divine satisfaction. My heart leapt for joy, for I found that what I had done was good.¹³⁷

The narrator only awakens to the sympathy of humanity after the death of his sister, and by this point, society has abandoned him. The corpse he grasps at cannot alleviate his suffering. The spirit of Mary then appears and functions as a reflective medium of his own judgment of his actions. He reads the signs of her natural language and from them interprets the propriety of his behaviour, literally seeing himself through the eyes of the other, and this leads him to become ‘an altered man’.¹³⁸ The alteration is underpinned by a physical transformation of the material body. After describing his appearance in early youth – his countenance in which ‘all the evil passions were portrayed’ – he indicates congruent moral and physical transformation writing, ‘Such was my appearance in my younger days, and I am thus particular in mentioning it, as sorrow and years have effected no small change.’¹³⁹ Mary has kept the narrator’s ‘conscience awake’, and he now believes that ‘Heaven did not send her to be my punishment, but to be my guide’.¹⁴⁰ Similarly, the ‘evil consequences’ of intemperance are imagined as guiding spirits in *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*:

And if he refuses to lay aside the Circean cup, let him reflect that Disease waits upon his steps – that Dropsy, Palsy, Emaciation, Poverty, and Idiotism, followed by the pale phantom, Death, pursue him like attendant spirits and claim his as their prey.¹⁴¹

Death transcends himself to haunt the transgressor of natural law. Similarly, the confessional text, through its presentation as a found manuscript, speaks guidance to the reader from beyond the grave.

‘The Metempsychosis’: A Literary Experiment

In Macnish’s first and most successful Blackwoodian prose tale, ‘The Metempsychosis’, published in May 1826, the protagonist, Frederick Stadt, is himself resurrected from the grave in order to deliver his narrative, which is not written for ‘empty fame’ or ‘profit’, but rather to

¹³⁷ Ibid., p. 24.

¹³⁸ Ibid., p. 24.

¹³⁹ Ibid., p. 6.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid., p. 24.

¹⁴¹ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 2nd edn (1828), p. 161.

warn his ‘fellow-citizens’ to be ‘on their guard against the machinations of the old fellow with the snuff-coloured surtout, the scarlet waistcoat, and the wooden leg’.¹⁴² At the end of the tale, he declares ‘that a strong change has been wrought in my opinions’, as he is now a firm supporter of ‘the doctrines of the sage of Samos’, a believer in the Pythagorean transmigration of souls.¹⁴³ Such is the derivation of Macnish’s pseudonym ‘A Modern Pythagorean’. He wrote to Blackwood that his tale is ‘founded on an absurdity so perfectly glaring, that I am afraid no stretch of the imagination can ever be reconciled to it’; however, this absurdity enables an imaginative exploration of the problematic legacy of enlightenment sympathy.¹⁴⁴ In the trappings of the body, one can never know the subjective experience of the other, and therefore, can never truly apply inductive methodology to the science of the mind. The Pythagorean transmigration in ‘The Metempsychosis’ is a literary exploration that transcends the limits of scientific experimentation in order to address the ultimate philosophical and physiological question: Is the human mind dependent on the physical body? Sir Walter Scott, in his Blackwoodian review of Mary Shelley’s *Frankenstein, or The Modern Prometheus* (1818), describes:

A more philosophical and refined use of the supernatural [...] not for the purpose of pampering the imagination with wonders, but in order to shew the probable effect which the supposed miracles would produce on those who witnessed them.¹⁴⁵

Scott defines such an author’s purpose to be

to open new trains and channels of thought, by placing men in supposed situations of an extraordinary and preternatural character, and then describing the mode of feeling and conduct which they are most like to adopt.¹⁴⁶

Macnish’s tale most certainly departs ‘from sober truth’, but Stadt’s struggle to come to terms with being trapped inside the body of another man is ‘still to nature true’.¹⁴⁷

According to the ancient Pythagorean tradition, life was necessarily extinguished from the physical bodies prior to metempsychosis.¹⁴⁸ However, in Macnish’s story the devilish

¹⁴² Robert Macnish, ‘The Metempsychosis’, *Blackwood’s*, 19 (May 1826), 511-29, (p. 529).

¹⁴³ *Ibid.*, p. 529.

¹⁴⁴ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 40.

¹⁴⁵ Sir Walter Scott, ‘Remarks on Frankenstein, or the Modern Prometheus; A Novel’, *Blackwood’s*, 2 (March 1818), 613-20, (p. 613).

¹⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 614.

¹⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 613.

¹⁴⁸ Charles H. Kahn, ‘Pythagorean Heritage’, in *Pythagoras and the Pythagoreans: A Brief History* (Indianapolis:

instigator, ‘a little meagre, brown-faced, elderly gentleman, with hooked nose and chin, a long well-powdered *queue*, and a wooden leg’, takes this doctrine one step farther.¹⁴⁹ The elderly gentleman informs Stadt, a student of philosophy at the University of Gottingen, ‘that two living bodies may exchange souls with each other’.¹⁵⁰ Stadt, who would rather credit ‘Kenelm Digby’s sympathetic powder, the philosopher’s stone, the elixir vitae, animal magnetism, metallic tractors,’ and ‘judicial astrology’, is, ironically, at this point already labouring under a metempsychosis.¹⁵¹ During a paroxysm of drunkenness, the elderly gentleman has obtained a blood signature from Stadt, granting, for the sum of 50 guilders, a Mr. Albert Wolstang, ‘the use of my body, at any time he is disposed, provided that, for the time being, he gives me the use of his’.¹⁵² According to the conscious testimony of Stadt, the transmogrification is strictly limited to the physical body:

It was plain, that although I was Wolstang in body, I was only Stadt in mind; and I knew that in disposition I was as different as possible from Wolstang.¹⁵³

If one takes Stadt’s version of the events at face value, the answer would appear to be that the mind (or even perhaps the soul) and the body maintain an entirely separate existence. Dugald Stewart’s embodied sympathetic imitation appears to be denied currency, as the most complete form of imitation imaginable does not result in phenomenological similitude.¹⁵⁴ However, from within the transmogrification, the reader cannot be certain that the metempsychosis does not influence Stadt’s mental habits. We are entirely dependent on his report of the events. Unlike Hogg’s *Confessions*, there is no Editor to test the narrative from an alternative, albeit equally subjective, point of view.

Internal evidence indicates that the metempsychosis may influence Stadt’s behaviour. In an act of revenge upon Wolstang for stealing his body, he insults the Provost and Professor of Moral Philosophy, the aptly named Doctor Dedimus Dunderhead, to ensure that Wolstang be expelled from Gottingen. This conscious act, which of course backfires by blocking his own entry into the college whilst in Wolstang’s body, accords with a previous action, which in contrast, lacks conscious motivation. Following the moment of metempsychosis, marked by ‘a

Hackett Publishing, 2001), pp. 139-72.

¹⁴⁹ ‘The Metempsychosis’, p. 513.

¹⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 515.

¹⁵¹ *Ibid.*, p. 515.

¹⁵² *Ibid.*, p. 520.

¹⁵³ *Ibid.*, p. 519.

¹⁵⁴ For the converse situation, see Andrew Picken’s later tale, ‘The Confessions of a Metempsychosis’, *Fraser’s*, 12 (November 1835), 496-502.

slight shudder' and a feeling of being 'taller, and heavier, and altogether more vigorous than the instant before', Stadt neglects to doff his cap to Professor Dunderhead.¹⁵⁵ This is a compulsory action for all students upon meeting 'this illustrious personage' in the college, the neglect of which will result in expulsion.¹⁵⁶ Stadt's conscious realisation that he must indeed doff his cap and his physiological unresponsiveness emphasises a discord between his mind and his physical body:

It may be guessed then what was my degree of stupefaction when I saw Doctor Dunderhead approach – when I heard his baton striking upon the ground, responsive to his steps – when I saw his large eyes, reflected through the spectacles, looking intently upon me – I say my stupefaction may be guessed, when, even on this occasion, my hand did not make one single motion upward towards my cap.¹⁵⁷

A habitual action is disrupted – motor output does not respond to sensory input.¹⁵⁸ When Dunderhead challenges Stadt's breach of social decorum, Stadt simply muses that 'I never thought the Doctor so little, or myself so tall, as at this moment'.¹⁵⁹ Conscious reflection, clearly influenced by his new perception of corporeal height, appears to reinforce rather than correct the new pattern of behaviour. This behaviour, soon consciously perpetrated, better fits the profligate Wolstang than the respectable Stadt. Thus, although the mind and body are not identical, the physical body does seem to influence mental habits in this narrative. Macnish will later write in regard to mind/brain identity in *An Introduction to Phrenology* that, 'Of the mind as a separate entity, we can know nothing whatever, and we must judge of it in the only way in which it comes under our cognizance.'¹⁶⁰ Stadt's mind is manifested through its new instrument, and this appears to lead to behavioural changes. The only way in which we can judge of this transmogrification is exactly how it comes under our cognizance – as a literary narrative. 'The Metempsychosis' transcends scientific experimentation through the transmogrification of physical limitations into the interpretative uncertainties of narrative.

What Stadt does discover with a degree of certainty is that Wolstang, whom he 'had long thought rather highly of, was in reality a very bad character'.¹⁶¹ His entrance into the social relations of Wolstang, rather than his entrance into his conscious mind, enables this

¹⁵⁵ Ibid., p. 511.

¹⁵⁶ Ibid., p. 512.

¹⁵⁷ Ibid., p. 512.

¹⁵⁸ Sir Charles Bell first described the distinction between the motor from the sensory nerves in 1811. See, *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind*, p. 7.

¹⁵⁹ 'The Metempsychosis', p. 512.

¹⁶⁰ Ibid., p. 512.

¹⁶¹ Ibid., p. 522.

discovery of character:

Times without number I was accosted as an acquaintance by gamblers, pickpockets, usurers, and prostitutes; and through their means I unravelled a train of imposture, profligacy, and dissipation, in which he had been long deeply involved.¹⁶²

The motivation for Wolstang's transmigration into Stadt's body becomes evident when it is revealed that Wolstang has committed an immense forgery. Conviction and execution inevitably approach unless the body of Wolstang flees the country.

After a series of ludicrous interactions with Wolstang (including a temporary transmogrification back into his own body), Stadt finds himself in the curious circumstance of having to choose between signing away his soul to the devilish gentleman or transmigrating into his own dead body. He chooses the later, and in the climax of the tale, Macnish transmutes the expected horror of burial alive into a highly humorous situation. Rather than waking up in the grave, Stadt finds himself on the table of the university anatomy theatre. He has been 'resurrected' by the grave-robbing anatomists.¹⁶³ Wunderdudt, the professor of anatomy, eventually explains to the bewildered Stadt that he had 'informed the resurrectionists in the service of the university' that he was in need of a fresh, young subject, but, upon finding that they had disinterred his 'excellent friend, Mr Frederick Stadt', he requested that they return the body to its rightful resting place.¹⁶⁴ Stadt is at first angry at the resurrectionists for disinterring his body that was to remain in its resting place 'till the last trumpet shall awaken me from slumber, and gather me together from the jaws of the tomb', and then in turn angry at Wunderstadt, for insisting that they bury his body once more, as then he might indeed have been buried alive.¹⁶⁵

Rather than offering up the depths of his physical body, he offers up the depths of phenomenological experience through his narrative. Stadt does not reveal his entire narrative to the characters within the tale. He 'concealed everything connected with the Metempsychosis', but Dunderhead made him 'give a long account' of his sensations 'at the instant of coming alive.'¹⁶⁶ In the tale these sensations are described in acutely physiological terms:

¹⁶² Ibid., p. 522.

¹⁶³ In a later article for *Fraser's*, Macnish exposes upon 'The Philosophy of Burking', *Fraser's*, 5 (February 1832), 52-65. For general background on resurrection men, see Ruth Richardson, *Death, Dissection, and the Destitute* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1987).

¹⁶⁴ 'The Metempsychosis', p. 528.

¹⁶⁵ Ibid., p. 526.

¹⁶⁶ Ibid., p. 529.

At this moment I was sensible of an insufferable coldness. My heart fluttered, then it beat strong, and the blood passing as it were over my chilled frame, gave it warmth and animation. I also began by slow degrees to breathe. But though my bodily feelings were thus torpid, my mental ones were very different. They were on the rack; for I knew that I was now buried alive, and that the dreadful struggle was about to commence.¹⁶⁷

Dunderhead is 'highly delighted' with Stadt's account and suggests 'that a description of the whole should be inserted into the Annals of the University'.¹⁶⁸ The living, sentient person on the anatomy table describes his experience of reanimation, thus allowing Dunderhead, the professor of moral philosophy, to study mind/body identity. Macnish appears to be contrasting the disparate roles of anatomy in studying the physiology of the body versus the philosophy of the mind. Although he forwards an embodied theory of mind, methodologically, one cannot study the mind in the same way one studies the physical body.

The naked Stadt on the anatomy table is striking in his vulnerability – his near escape from the ultimate public exposure of dissection sits uneasily in the background. However, his rebirth brings with it new knowledge of the doubleness of human nature. To become a believer in Pythagorean metempsychosis is to accept that the external signs of the physical body may not reveal the significance of the person within the flesh. This is in stark contrast to the phrenological doctrines he will later promote.

The Phrenological Struggle

Macnish returns to the subject of his first encounter with Gall in the Preface to *An Introduction to Phrenology*:

My first ideas of Phrenology were obtained from Dr. Gall himself, whose lectures I attended in Paris during the year 1825. Before that time, I, in common with almost all who are ignorant of the subject, spoke of it with great contempt, and took every opportunity of turning it into ridicule. The discourses of this great man, and various private conversations which I had the honour of holding with him, produced a total change in my ideas, and convinced me, that the doctrines he taught, so far from deserving the absurd treatment which they then generally met with, were, in themselves, highly beautiful, as expositions of the human mind in its various phases, and every way worthy of attention. Much reflection, and many appeals to nature, since that period, have satisfied me of their perfect truth.¹⁶⁹

¹⁶⁷ Ibid., p. 526.

¹⁶⁸ Ibid., p. 529.

¹⁶⁹ *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), p. v.

During the early nineteenth century, crescendoing to a forte in the early 1820's, the phrenologists were repeatedly battered by the wits of the Edinburgh periodical press. The public debates between the phrenologists and their opponents in the medical community did not always come out in favour of the anti-phrenologists, and many respected medical thinkers studied phrenology with great interest at this time.¹⁷⁰ However, both the *Edinburgh Review* and *Blackwood's*, in a rare concurrence, systematically depicted the phrenological doctrines as ridiculous. John Strachan marks a satirical review of *The Craniad; or Spurzheim Illustrated. A Poem in Two Parts* (Edinburgh, 1817), attributed to Francis Jeffrey and John Gordon of the *Edinburgh Review*, as the 'moment Wilson or Lockhart wrests the anti-phrenological mantle from the *Edinburgh*':

It implies that Gordon and Jeffrey were little better than the phrenologists and that, before 1817, the phrenologists had only to face the lumpen and slow-witted abuse of the Edinburgh Reviewers; now they would understand what it was to feel the lash applied by genuine practitioners of the art.¹⁷¹

The lash apparently struck hard. The introduction to the first number of the *Phrenological Journal and Miscellany* openly declares war on the periodical press and singles out *Blackwood's* as 'the most persevering, and, of course, the most absurd of the assailants of phrenology, and enemies of phrenologists'.¹⁷² Following from Macnish's reverence for, at the very least, the beauties of the phrenological doctrines in 1825, one might find his eager contribution to *Blackwood's* between 1826 and 1830 to be a conflict of interests. Roger Cooter goes so far as to stipulate that Macnish 'annoyed the Edin phrenologists by his writing for the anti-phrenological Blackwood's Edin Mag' but offers no evidence to substantiate this claim.¹⁷³

The gestation period for Macnish's phrenological conversion was extended – from his first encounter with phrenology in 1825 until 1833, he grappled with the validity of the doctrine, as 'his mind was sometimes haunted by misgivings, particularly when objections

¹⁷⁰ Matthew H. Kaufman, *Edinburgh Phrenological Society: A History* (Edinburgh: William Ramsay Henderson Trust, 2005), pp. 1-16.

¹⁷¹ John Strachan, "'The mapp'd out skulls of Scotia': *Blackwood's* and the Scottish Phrenological Controversy", in *Print Culture and the Blackwood Tradition, 1805-1930*, ed. by David Finkelstein (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006), pp. 49-69, (p. 55).

¹⁷² 'Introductory Statement', *Phrenological Journal*, 1 (1823-1824), iii-xxxi, (pp. xvii-xviii).

¹⁷³ *Phrenology in the British Isles: An Annotated, Historical Bibliography and Index* (Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, 1989), p. 222.

were urged'.¹⁷⁴ In 1833 he resolved 'to adopt the most effectual mode of putting Phrenology to the test' by sending a cast of his own head for analysis by the Edinburgh Phrenological Society, and this experiment appears to have quelled all doubts.¹⁷⁵ In the second edition of *The Philosophy of Sleep*, published in 1834, Macnish emphasises the extended period of study that led to his eventual conversion, claiming that he had 'studied the science for several years with a mind rather hostile than otherwise to its doctrines' before 'adopting them as a matter of belief'.¹⁷⁶ During this period Macnish imaginatively explores the ramifications of both accepting and disavowing the logic of phrenology through his prose tales, and while an element of jovial experimentation pervades the search for an empirical methodology of spectatorship, his tales often also portray a certain anxiety. The potential physiological determinism and resultant undermining of freewill associated with phrenology is explored in *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, and the difficulties in determining mental character without phrenological methodology is a pervading theme in his Blackwoodian prose fiction. Trapped between his innate tendency to read the signs in his perceptual universe as latent with significance and his acute recognition of corporealised subjectivity, Macnish personally shouldered the problematic legacy of enlightenment sympathy. Eventually, the absolutist explanatory vocabulary of phrenology, with its supposed elimination of personal bias, appears to alleviate his anxiety; however, his most successful prose fiction was produced during this period of phrenological angst.

The fluid exchange between literary and scientific ideas in *Blackwood's* indicates that the act of creative writing may have been form of productive study for Macnish. Mark Parker discusses the fluid exchange of diverse ideas in *Blackwood's* within his examination of the first twenty installments of the *Noctes*:

Each topic in this allusive conversation has palpable connections with the articles that surround the "Noctes" in *Blackwood's*. Appreciations of popular spectacles, reports of advances in medical – or more particularly, coroner's – science, attacks on the inanities of phrenologists, and epigrammatic literary evaluation recall typical fare delivered elsewhere under the signatures of Tickler, Odoherty, and the Ettrick Shepherd. This exchange in the "Noctes" serves to put these articles into an intensely dialogic relation.¹⁷⁷

The *Noctes* are representative of the overall dialogic exchange, transcendent beyond the

¹⁷⁴ 'Biographical Sketch of Robert Macnish, Esq., LL.D.', p. 22.

¹⁷⁵ Ibid., p. 22.

¹⁷⁶ Ibid., p. ix.

¹⁷⁷ Parker, p. 112.

modern conception of disciplinarily, presented in this literary magazine. Macnish represents a particularly fruitful case study of this type of exchange, as he himself produced both scientific and literary texts. The dialogic exchange between *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* and Macnish's prose tales is evidenced above. This final section examines the dialogue between the anti-phrenological articles of *Blackwood's* and Macnish's prose tales and begins to open up the phrenological themes in Hogg's *Confessions*.

Anti-phrenological *Blackwood's*

The Blackwoodian attack on phrenology took place primarily prior to Macnish's first contribution to the magazine in May 1826. Following this date anti-phrenological references continue to appear in the *Noctes* and may appear in articles not examined by the present author, but no full-length anti-phrenological articles are published in *Blackwood's* after February 1826; therefore, in this case the dialogic relation is necessarily one-sided. The vein of humour that runs through Macnish's Blackwoodian prose contributions has much in common with the ludicrous anti-phrenological articles of *Blackwood's*, which, as Peter Garside indicates, reveal a 'certain fascination' with the science.¹⁷⁸ The parodic critiques draw upon and amplify to absurdity the gothic aspects of phrenology – its association with skulls, maniacal murderers, capital punishment, and resurrection men – aspects frequently appearing in Macnish's tales. Phrenology was certainly fertile ground for the literary imagination regardless of whether an author affirmed the doctrines, and as Strachan indicates, 'it is sometimes difficult to differentiate parody from formal model'.¹⁷⁹ According to Strachan, the Blackwoodian wits did not necessarily strongly object to phrenology on intellectual principles, but rather were participating in personal polemics directed against Combe, as part of their overall strategy to promote the magazine through scandal. This reading is supported by van Wyhe's interpretation of the Edinburgh phrenology debate as fuelled by deeply personal power struggles.¹⁸⁰ However, while personal polemics almost certainly played some role, particularly since, as Strachan indicates, Combe represented Cleghorn and Pringle against William Blackwood in the legal battle surrounding the transfer of editorship in 1817, there is also evidence to suggest an opposition between the Blackwoodian and the phrenological valuation of artificial and natural character and the ability to truly bring the soul home to a tangible

¹⁷⁸ Garside, 'Introduction', p. li.

¹⁷⁹ Strachan, p. 58.

¹⁸⁰ John van Wyhe, *Phrenology and the Origins of Victorian Scientific Naturalism* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004).

physical body.

The potentially sinister logic of phrenology is played to its extreme in the anonymous essay ‘Essays on Cranioscopy, Craniology, Phrenology, &c.’, which featured in *Blackwood’s* for August 1821. The headpiece for the ‘Essays on Cranioscopy’ is cited as the ‘*Justiciary Records for the year 1996*’ and projects the bump-reading rules as the court-evidence of the future. The ‘Counsel for the Prisoner’ versifies:

Look at the bump, my Lord, upon his head;
Pray feel its brother, on the other side;
And say if, in the range of possibilities,
This poor man here could either rob or steal,
And bear such striking marks of rigid virtue.¹⁸¹

The essay is written on the wake of the trial and subsequent execution of the murderer David Haggart. Prior to his execution Haggart produced a memoir of his life to be sold for the benefit of his surviving family and the public charity, and an appendix to the memoir contains a phrenological analysis of the prisoner by George Combe, in which he finds Haggart to possess ‘a greater development of the organs of benevolence and justice’ than he had expected.¹⁸² The anti-phrenologists took up the cry against this apparently ludicrous finding in the head of a confirmed murderer, and the author of the ‘Essays on Cranioscopy’ introduces the topic of Combe’s analysis as one that has been subsequently ‘illustrated in every company.’¹⁸³ Garside has noted the probable influence of *The Life of David Haggart* (1821) on Hogg’s *Confessions* and draws a convincing parallel between the Editor’s attitude towards Robert Wringhim and the phrenologists’ treatment of criminals as a ‘sub-species’ (Hogg’s Editor and the unsympathetic Gall of ‘An Execution in Paris’ are not entirely dissimilar).¹⁸⁴ Further, Karl Miller alludes to a commonality between the structure of Hogg’s *Confessions* and Combe’s editorial presentation of Haggart’s text.¹⁸⁵

Combe declares that his ‘Sketch of the Natural Character of David Haggart, as indicated by his Cerebral Organization’ is not motivated by ‘idle curiosity’, but is rather intended to

¹⁸¹ [Mr. Vary], ‘Essays on Cranioscopy, Craniology, Phrenology, &c. By Sir Toby Tickletohy, Bart.’, 10 (August 1821, Part II), 73-82, (p. 73).

¹⁸² David Haggart, *The Life of David Haggart, Alias John Wilson, Alias John Morison, Alias Barney M’Coul, Alias John M’Colgan, Alias Daniel O’Brien, Alias The Switcher. Written by Himself, While under the Sentence of Death* (Edinburgh: Ballantyne, 1821), p. vi, p. 158.

¹⁸³ ‘Essays on Cranioscopy, Craniology, Phrenology, &c.’, p. 73.

¹⁸⁴ Garside, ‘Introduction’, p. liii.

¹⁸⁵ *Doubles*, p. 4.

throw light upon the natural dispositions which particularly lead a young man into a sporting line of life, for the purpose of devising effectual means to reclaim young offenders at the outset of their career, by placing them in circumstances calculated to cultivate the good, and restrain the evil tendencies of their natural dispositions.¹⁸⁶

In *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide* (1827) Macnish examines the natural dispositions and circumstances that lead a specific young man to murder a woman carrying his illegitimate child. The confessional narrator declares himself to be a living contradiction of

those who say that man is the child of circumstances, and that the evil or good qualities he possesses are attributable to external events, and are not implanted into him by nature at his birth.¹⁸⁷

In other words, he believes his crimes are entirely attributable to his wicked natural disposition, and views his life as evidence against ‘those who impute all these things to education, and make the human mind an impassive machine, fit only for receiving impressions and having no positive agency of its own’.¹⁸⁸ The emphasis on an active rather than a passive mind is a direct critique of Lockean philosophy. While the common sense philosophers discussed the mind as an active processor, the phrenologists took the principle of innate disposition substantially further, while still acknowledging the influence of circumstance. The narrator’s complete disavowal of circumstance takes this principle to its extreme and advocates absolute physiological determinism. In his memoir Haggart presents himself as naturally disposed towards criminal activity, but, in contrast, also emphasises that he was a victim of circumstance: as a child, his natural disposition towards self-interest was enhanced by external events rather than amended, and the wickedness of his associates in adolescence hurried him down the pathway to a ‘sporting line of life’. However, natural physical attributes also function in his disposition towards crime, as ‘I had the ill-luck to be born left-handed, and with thieves’ fingers; for my forks are equally long, and they never failed me.’¹⁸⁹

The bump above the ear of Wringhim’s skull (observed by the Editor in the final exhumation scene) corresponds to a large organ of Destructiveness, and thus points towards the same determinism that is satirised in *Blackwood’s*.¹⁹⁰ Hogg may be pointing towards the parallel between Antinomianism predestination and the physiological determinism of

¹⁸⁶ *The Life of David Haggart*, p. 159.

¹⁸⁷ *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, p. 5.

¹⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 5.

¹⁸⁹ *The Life of David Haggart*, p. 121.

¹⁹⁰ For further discussion of the Editor’s phrenological reading, see below, pp. 137-39.

phrenology. As G. A. Starr indicates in a recent article, 'Each body of belief, Hogg may be implying, tends to relieve the individual of moral responsibility by accounting for behaviour in a rigidly deterministic manner.'¹⁹¹ Through his presentation of Haggart's case, Combe is in fact calling for early and individually tailored intervention, but much like the modern debate surrounding the practical utility of the human genome project, fatalistic fears are evoked. The Blackwoodian satirist, however, is not entirely off base. In 1836 Macnish writes in a letter addressed to 'The Right Honourable Lord Glenelg':

Having been applied to by Sir George MacKenzie to state my opinions with respect to the possibility of detecting the characters of convicts by an examination of their heads, on phrenological principles, I have no hesitation in declaring my perfect conviction that, in very many cases, the dispositions of the individuals may, by such a process, be discriminated with remarkable accuracy.

The form of head possessed by all dangerous & inveterate criminals is peculiar. There is an enormous mass of brain behind the ear, & a comparatively small portion in the frontal & coronal regions. Such a conformation always characterizes the worst class of malefactors; & whenever it exists we find an excessive tendency to crime. This fact I have had ample opportunities of verifying; &, indeed, no person who compares criminal heads with those of persons whose natural dispositions are towards virtue can entertain the slightest doubt upon the subject.¹⁹²

However, Macnish's earlier *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide* advocates complete physiological determinism only to reveal the importance of circumstances, or put in Enlightenment terminology, experience, in shaping moral character. The narrator undermines his declaration of the irrelevance of experience with his description of his extraordinary moral change following his sister's tragic death. Similarly, in Hogg's *Confessions* the progressive moral degradation of Wringhim is evidence of the interaction of experience and innate disposition.

Combe's reformist agenda is well documented by his commentators, and this early attempt to promote judiciary reform inspires the Blackwoodian satirist to formulate his own unique version of popular reform. The introductory essay to the first number of the *Phrenological Journal* labels the article a 'Wretched Joke' and summarises its argument as follows:

A proper application of steel-caps or helmets, so constructed as to restrain the growth of

¹⁹¹ 'The Bump Above Robert Wringhim's Ear: Phrenology in Hogg's *Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *SHW*, 19 (2008), 81-89, (p. 83).

¹⁹² Letter of Robert Macnish to Lord Glenelg, 1836, NLS 7240, fols 106-07.

the bad bumps, and favour the growth of the good, would make the whole human race perfectly virtuous and intellectual, – nothing but Socrateses, Newtons, and Howards in the world. For a full detail of this plan, *vide Blackwood's Magazine*, No liv. p. 74.¹⁹³

Combined with the 'well-known fact' of the malleability of the infant human skull, the Blackwoodian satirist proposes to sacrifice the existing men of talent, in particular the Duke of Wellington, Dugald Stewart and Walter Scott, in order to obtain accurate casts of the interior of their skulls, and in turn, fashion mental caps capable of producing genius in the masses.¹⁹⁴ Gathering the skulls of geniuses past is dismissed due to 'the confusion of skulls and bodies' in the cemeteries. The need for absolute accuracy of the interior convolutions of the skull necessitates and justifies the killing of living genius for the 'future and certain improvement of their native land'.¹⁹⁵ Further, once phrenologically identified, 'the grown up wicked people might be put to death without mercy, for the safety of the good'.¹⁹⁶ This is no far cry from the justified crimes of Hogg's sinner. Cool, logical reason, bereft of the sympathising power of passionate human emotion, becomes the source of horror. Similarly, Macnish's confessional narrator coldly rationalises the murder of Mary Elliston in the name of financial gain. The style is highly reminiscent of Swift's modest proposal, and looks forward to De Quincey's essay 'On Murder Considered as One of the Fine Arts', published in *Blackwood's* in March 1827, as well as Macnish's 'The Philosophy of Burking', published in *Fraser's* in February 1832.

The corporeal body in its entirety is subject to the relentless search for significance, and the satirical Blackwoodian author presents an alternative philosophical system that focuses on a rather different hemisphere. Dr. Edward Clyster, from 'repeated examination of the bottoms of nearly eight hundred boys, while the usher of the Grammar School of Kittleheart, and from facts communicated to him by the four masters of the High School of Gutterborough', is said to have determined that the 'prevailing mental character of the individual may be traced with equal certainty on another extremity of the human body'.¹⁹⁷ He also suggests that the 'intimate connection between the stomach and the brain' indicates that there is 'more mind in the belly than most people are aware of' and praises Lavater's 'more probable' theory, 'that the prevailing habits of thought give a characteristic tone to the whole

¹⁹³ 'Introductory Statement', p. xxvi.

¹⁹⁴ 'Essays on Cranioscopy, Craniology, Phrenology, &c.', p. 74, p. 78.

¹⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 78.

¹⁹⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 80.

¹⁹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 74.

physiognomy'.¹⁹⁸ These suggestions follow on from an earlier ludicrous anti-phrenological article, 'Noseology, a Dissertation on the Intellectual Faculties, as Manifested by the Various Configurations of the Nose' and look forward to 'Lectures on Prandiology. By Abraham Spoon, M.D. F.R.S. L. and Edin. Taken in Short-hand by a Gentleman of the Press. "Dinner, n.s. The Chief Meal."', in which a philosophical system of determining mental character from a person's dinner is developed.¹⁹⁹ The later article may additionally be satirising the prevalence of gustatory characterisations in the *Noctes* dialogues.

Like the satirical Blackwoodian author, Macnish is interested not only in innate mental character but also in those events and circumstances in the person's life that have changed the person's physical body and thus make biography visible. Perhaps his most memorable character, Colonel O'Shaughnessy, who has more than a little in common with Smollett's Lieutenant Lismahago, presents himself as physical representation of his unusual life.²⁰⁰ In the first of the two tales concerning Colonel O'Shaughnessy, published in *Blackwood's* in January and June 1827, his nephew describes him as follows:

Nothing in my uncle's character equalled the dexterity with which he accounted for defects. He squinted, because his eyes were struck by a *coup du soleil*. He was thin, because the fat of his body had evaporated from hard exercise under the burning sun of India. He lost his hair in a brain-fever, and got his yellow-brown complexion in consequence of liver-complaint. He had always a reason for everything: – he was, in fact, a philosopher.²⁰¹

In the second tale, 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy in India', Colonel O'Shaughnessy 'is supposed to relate these adventures to his friends, over a bottle a wine', and accordingly, the full story of his unusual physical appearance is revealed.²⁰² The implication is that his harrowing life can be read from the signs of his body, and the Colonel is clearly heavily invested in his public persona as 'The Squinting Colonel'.²⁰³ According to his nephew's observations in the first tale, 'He told the same story dozens of times over, and every time it was different.'²⁰⁴ His self-representation is thus dubious in its multiplication, and accordingly, within a series of drunken

¹⁹⁸ Ibid., p. 74.

¹⁹⁹ 'Noseology, a Dissertation on the Intellectual Faculties, as Manifested by the Various Configurations of the Nose', *Blackwood's*, 5 (May 1819), 157-60; 'Lectures on Prandiology. By Abraham Spoon, M.D. F.R.S. L. and Edin. Taken in Short-hand by a Gentleman of the Press. "Dinner, n.s. The Chief Meal."', *Blackwood's*, 19 (February 1826), 195-97.

²⁰⁰ Macnish lists Smollett as his favourite novelist (*The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 304).

²⁰¹ Robert Macnish, 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy', *Blackwood's*, 21 (January 1827), 32-39, (pp. 34-35).

²⁰² 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy in India', p. 653.

²⁰³ 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy', p. 34.

²⁰⁴ Ibid., p. 34.

dream visions, the Colonel experiences exponential ubiquity of self:

And one of these men was Colonel M'Mulligan, and the other was myself; and yet the other was not myself; for all the while I was conscious of sitting in my own dark chamber, drinking my own brandy. I cannot say how it was, for I was both here and there; but which of the two O'Shaughnessys was the real one, I could not have told you [...] I was conscious that there was not a soul in the chamber but myself, and yet it was full of people.²⁰⁵

In contrast, in the first tale his nephew presents his own life story to the reader as the genuine version and as incongruous with his public persona. He is heralded a war hero for his bravery in the Battle of Waterloo while in Colonel O'Shaughnessy's regiment; however, his story reveals that he believed he was taking flight from the enemy and leaving his own regiment and uncle behind when he charged head-forth into enemy lines. He does not correct the misperception, and thus is promoted, wins the hand of a lovely French girl, and receives a handsome inheritance from his uncle. The artificial and the genuine are inseparable without the confessional narrative, and what guarantee does the reader or the teller have of authenticity?

The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide is presented as "No Fiction" and begins with an 'Extract from the last Will and Testament of the late William M**r, Esq. of —, in the County of Stirling, Scotland.':

It is my express wish, that the MS. in the lower drawer of my escritoir, entitled, "THE CONFESSIONS OF AN UNEXECUTED FEMICIDE," be published to the world, within three months after my body is laid in the earth, to the effect that others may be deterred from the commission of a similar sin, by the thought, that if they escape the punishment of the law, they are sure to meet with that of a racked and harrowed conscious.²⁰⁶

The claim to authenticity extended beyond this extract. Within a copy of the second edition of the pamphlet, held by Glasgow University Library, Special Collections, an anonymous person has inscribed the following:

13 Sept 1827. I asked Mr. M'Phun who was the author of this narrative. He did not tell me and he assured me that it was founded in [cut off]²⁰⁷

²⁰⁵ 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy in India', p. 659.

²⁰⁶ *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, p. 3.

²⁰⁷ Ibid., p. 24. This copy is held under Special Collections Mu18-g.18.

An insistence on the authenticity of the found narrative is a consistent theme in Scottish Romantic literature, and the phrenologists concurrently sought to identify the genuine narrative through a concordance of signs. In his *Phrenological Observations on the Character of David Haggart*, Combe argues that phrenology reveals the genuine character that often evades the casual observer, and notes that *The Caledonian Mercury* of 14th June 1821 reported on Haggart's composure during his trial:

[W]hile his Lordship addressed him, he leaned back on the seat in a careless attitude, at the same time eating confection; but when called on to attend to the sentence, he stood erect, and heard it unmoved.²⁰⁸

However, in his memoir Haggart writes of his heart breaking when the guilty sentence was announced. Combe explains that the murderer conceals the dreadful struggle within out of 'pride, secretiveness, and firmness, and small love of approbation' and quotes Haggart: 'They say I looked careless, but they could not see *within* me.' The phrenological observer has a distinct advantage, as 'the real motives lay deeper than cursory readers are in the custom of penetrating'.²⁰⁹

Blackwood's, despite their tendencies towards 'personality', took an adamant stance against the naked confessional mode. Wilson harshly reviewed Coleridge's *Biographia Literaria*, comparing it to Rousseau's *Confessions*, whom, 'the romantics' accused 'of a lack of decorum and reserve', and he similarly challenged Hogg for his overly autobiographical tendencies.²¹⁰ In the venomous Blackwoodian response to the 'Memoir of the Life of James Hogg' prefixed to the third edition of *The Mountain Bard* (1821), disguised as an 'Old Friend with a New Face', Wilson declared '[t]his self-exposure is not altogether decent'.²¹¹ In a second anti-phrenological *Blackwood's* article, apparently by the same hand, published in December 1821, Haggart's confession is described as 'so much in the spirit of Rousseau', as his unrestrained descriptions of his criminal actions are deemed undesirable.²¹² The artificial

²⁰⁸ George Combe, *Phrenological Observations on the Cerebral Development of David Haggart, Who Was Lately Executed at Edinburgh for Murder, and Whose Life Has Since Been Published* (Edinburgh: Tait; London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown; Glasgow: Turnbull, 1821), p. 35.

²⁰⁹ Ibid., pp. 36-37, p. 37, p. 38.

²¹⁰ John Wilson, 'Some Observations on the "Biographia Literaria" of S. T. Coleridge, Esq. – 1817', *Blackwood's*, 2 (October 1817), 3-18; Susan M. Levin, *The Romantic Art of Confession: De Quincey, Musset, Sand, Lamb, Hogg, Frémy, Soulié, Janin* (Columbia, SC: Camden House, 1998), p. 6.

²¹¹ John Wilson, 'Familiar Epistles to Christopher North, from an Old Friend with a New Face. Letter I. On Hogg's Memoirs', *Blackwood's*, 10 (August 1821, Part II), 43-52, (p. 43).

²¹² [Mr. Vary], 'Essays on Phrenology, &c.', *Blackwood's*, 10 (December 1821, Part II), 682-91, (p. 685).

face of society is presented as, in fact, a desirable ideal by Wilson.²¹³

The constructed literary doppelgängers of the Blackwoodian authors, which appeared in the *Noctes* dialogues, are artificial in the true sense of the word. Even the multiplicitous Colonel O'Shaughnessy makes an appearance within 'A Christmas Carol. In Honour of Maga. Sung by the Contributors.'²¹⁴ In regard to the *Noctes*, Peter Murphy writes:

The *Blackwood's* experiments force us to acknowledge that the published self is a curiously unstable thing, almost impossible to control and almost impossible to bring home to some person with a body.²¹⁵

Haggart's confessional narrative, in contrast to the Romantic confessional narratives discussed by Susan Leven in *The Romantic Art of Confession: De Quincey, Musset, Sand, Lamb, Hogg, Frémy, Soulié, Janin* (1998), does not 'disguise and distance' the personal experience of the author, as his published self is literally brought home to his body through Combe's accompanying phrenological analysis.²¹⁶ Such congruence is portrayed as impossible by the Blackwoodian satirist. His mock-phrenological write-up capitalises on the plurality of Haggart's character as indicated by an un-nuanced reading of the phrenological analysis:

Now, let the reader combine these appearances, and suppose them, for a moment, united in one individual. What would he think, say, or do, if he were to meet in Mr Blackwood's or Mr Constable's shop, a gentleman carrying his head so high as to recline backwards, with a cold, repulsive air, haughty as a king, an emperor, or a transcendent genius, and yet with a sly look, a peculiar, sidelong, rolling cast of his eyes, and a stiffened approach of the shoulder to the head? What if he were told, that is Mr. Combe, the great phrenologist, or Christopher North, the Supreme Editor, or the Great Unknown? How Mr Haggart, having both organs in perfection, contrived to manage the matter, we do not know, nor, in a scientific point of view, do we care.²¹⁷

The satirist appeals to the natural language associated with a large organ of self-esteem and secretiveness respectively as described by Combe in his *Essays on Phrenology* (1819). His implication is that such incongruous characteristics cannot be displayed by one discrete fully integrated person, and further, the dual identities of many public figures of the day (Sir Walter

²¹³ This coalesces with his disavowal of *in vino veritas* in his Blackwoodian review of *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (John Wilson, 'Anatomy of Drunkenness', *Blackwood's*, 23 (April 1828), 481-97, (pp. 492-93).

²¹⁴ 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LIII', *Blackwood's*, 29 (January 1831), 1-36, (p. 11). Moir attributes 'A Christmas Carol' and 'The Five Champions of Maga' within this number of the *Noctes* to Macnish (*The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 180-84).

²¹⁵ Murphy, Peter T., 'Impersonation and Authorship in Romantic Britain', *English Literary History*, 59 (1992), 625-49, (p. 635).

²¹⁶ Leven, p. 7.

²¹⁷ 'Essays on Phrenology &c', p. 687.

Scott/The Great Unknown, Professor John Wilson/Christopher North, George Combe the Writer to the Signet/George Combe the great phrenologist) evidences the necessarily duplicitous nature of identity in the public sphere.

Conclusions

Macnish expresses concern over the possibility that his own literary doppelgänger might be brought home to his body, as he made a particular point of keeping his two lives separate in the public eye. He writes the following to William Blackwood in 1830 in regard to his concerns over his inclusion in the *Noctes*:

When I saw Professor Wilson in Edinburgh he spoke of introducing a new character into the *Noctes* viz. The Modern Pythagorean. Had I been a free agent in this matter I should have felt proud beyond measure in being placed there, but the people in this place are such an infernal set of apes that they look with an evil eye upon a medical man who has any thing to do with literature unless it be upon professional subjects.²¹⁸

However, this discrete categorisation of selves does not hold up to close scrutiny. As a medical writer, Macnish draws upon his knowledge and abilities as a literary man, and his fictional tales fruitfully engage with the science of the mind. Macnish's fictional persona did, however, allow him to transgress the boundaries of rational discourse, and explore philosophical questions not subject to empirical inquiry in the material world.

Mark Schoenfield has recently argued that, although the nineteenth-century periodical press promoted 'the proliferation of voices' for the individual author, the Ettrick Shepherd was systematically denied such multiplicity, as 'the editors of *Blackwood's* relegated him to historical object, subject to their interpretations'.²¹⁹ This interpretation depended heavily upon references to the Ettrick Shepherd's 'rustic body', which 'constructed Hogg as an emblem of primordial Scottish authenticity' incapable of 'assimilation within polite society'.²²⁰ According to Schoenfield the seemingly unproblematic coalescence of Hogg's body with his Blackwoodian identity is a product of Tory historiography, as Hogg becomes exemplary of the consistency of human nature. Thus, Wilson and Lockhart, in their depiction of the Ettrick Shepherd, are guilty of the same coalescence of text and body that gained the phrenologists

²¹⁸ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 10 July 1830, NLS MS 4028, fols 17-18.

²¹⁹ Mark Schoenfield, *British Periodicals and Romantic Identity: The "Literary Lower Empire"* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), p. 3, p. 203.

²²⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 204.

censure in the pages of *Blackwood's*. If Hogg's Editor in the *Confessions* may be equated with Wilson, as has been suggested by numerous critics, his claim to be 'no phrenologist', as Garside indicates, despite managing 'to sound like one', may point towards the irony of *Blackwood's*, which was clearly heavily invested in the power of physical signs, satirising phrenology.²²¹ As the following chapter explores, phrenology, along with the discourse on drunkenness, dreaming, apparitions, and natural theology, offers a rationalistic framework through which to read Wringhim's experience. However, the found confessional narrative, the public narrative as offered by the Editor, and the body/bodies in the suicide's grave cannot be collapsed into one cohesive assemblage of truth. Whether Hogg is in fact critiquing phrenological methodology or the Blackwoodian portrayal of the Ettrick Shepherd is uncertain. The most probable answer is that, to some extent, he is doing both, and like Macnish, draws upon certain aspects of phrenology and the Blackwoodian parodies without necessarily avowing or disavowing the 'science'.

²²¹ James Hogg, *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, ed. by P. D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2001; repr. 2002), p. 172, all subsequent citations refer to this edition; Garside, 'Introduction', p. lii.

Chapter 4: Dreaming, Drunkenness, and Damnation: The Influence of Hogg's *Confessions*

Introduction

Karl Miller accurately identifies a German dimension in Macnish's tales – the 'diablerie and double identity' of the *Allemagne* – and postulates a connection to Hogg's *Confessions* through the claim that *Confessions* helped to 'domicile' German subject-matter in Scotland.¹ The contemporary critical reception of Hogg's *Confessions* noted the German dimension, and in particular, a potential derivation from E. T. A. Hoffman's *The Devil's Elixir*, translated by Hogg's Blackwoodian associate, R. P. Gillies (1789-1858), just prior to the publication of Hogg's text in 1824, and modern critics confirm this influence.² In short, both Hoffman and Hogg utilise the demonic doppelgänger to portray the externalisation of a psychological conflict, and the apparent contradiction between deeply malevolent actions and urges and the character's perceived divine election is the source of the psychological conflict in both texts. However, Hogg is unique in his unwillingness to privilege rational or supernatural explanation. By the end of *The Devil's Elixir*, the reader is assured that Medardus's doppelgänger is in fact his mad half-brother, Count Victorin, while Gil-Martin appears to be both a product of Robert Wringhim's disturbed psyche and the devil himself. However, contemporary reviews of *Confessions* were generally negative and the sales insufficient during Hogg's lifetime to necessitate a printing beyond the original small edition of 1000 copies produced by Longman & Co.³ Thus, until its rediscovery and subsequent popularisation by André Gide in the Cresset edition of 1947, it is improbable that Hogg's *Confessions* helped domicile any literary subject matter in Scotland. Rather, *Blackwood's*, and in particular, the 'Horae Germanicae' series running to twenty-seven numbers between November 1819 and August 1828, 'played a significant role in introducing German literature to an English audience'.⁴

¹ Cockburn's *Millennium*, pp. 204-09.

² Williston Russell Benedict, 'A Study of the "Second Self" in James Hogg's Fiction, with Reference to Its Employment in German Romantic Literature' (unpublished doctoral thesis, Columbia University, 1973); Garside, 'Introduction', pp. xlvii-l; Reinhard Heinritz and Silvia Mergenthal, 'Hogg, Hoffman, and Their Diabolical Elixirs', *SHW*, 7 (1996), 47-58; John Herdman, *The Double in Nineteenth-Century Fiction* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 1990), pp. 69-87; Gillian Hughes, 'Hogg, Gillies, and German Romanticism', *SHW*, 14 (2003), 62-72.

³ Garside, 'Introduction', p. xi.

⁴ *British Literary Magazines: The Romantic Age, 1789-1836*, ed. by Alvin Sullivan (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1983), p. 47; Garside, 'Introduction', p. xlix.

Macnish may have had the Blackwoodian taste for German Romanticism in mind when he compared his first prospective contribution, 'The Metempsychosis', to Adelbert von Chamisso's *Peter Schlemihl's wundersame Geschichte* in his first letter to William Blackwood, and inter-textual similarities can indeed be traced.⁵ The lost shadow and lost body of Peter Schlemihl and Frederick Stadt respectively present a clear parallel, as in both instances the loss results in social ostracisation and the ultimately resisted temptation to sell one's soul in exchange for reintegration. Further, the mysteriously inexhaustible pocketbook, which Peter receives in exchange for his shadow from an elderly gentleman in a grey coat, is the probable source for the mysterious gentleman of Macnish's tale, who is able to produce an impressive series of phrenological busts on demand from his waistcoat. According to the 'Biographical Sketch of Robert Macnish', which prefaces the 1859 edition of *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, a reviewer for the *London Magazine* compared 'The Metempsychosis' to *The Devil's Elixir*; however, the anonymous author of the sketch insists that Macnish did not read Hoffman's work until after his composition of 'The Metempsychosis'. Regardless, he notes the similarity in subject matter and the stylistic contrasts:

Macnish far surpasses the German in humour, indeed, the latter possesses very little of that quality; but, on the other hand, he displays, perhaps, more skill in exciting supernatural terror, and sustaining it through his narratives, which are much more complicated than those of Macnish.⁶

Neither Macnish nor Hogg could read German, and therefore both authors were dependent on English translations of the German texts.⁷ Williston Russell Benedict, whose doctoral work represents the most complete study of the influence of German Romanticism on Hogg's corpus, argues that any inter-textual resonances between *Confessions* and *The Devil's Elixir* are most probably derived from Hogg's informal conversations with Gillies and also possibly Scott. Further, he argues that Hogg was most probably not influenced by Sir John Bowring's English translation of *Peter Schlemihl's wundersame Geschichte*, as Hogg did not know Bowring and the translation was available just weeks before Hogg's novel went to press.⁸ Thus, Hogg appears to be primarily influenced by *The Devil's Elixir*, while the influence of

⁵ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 41.

⁶ 'Biographical Sketch of Robert Macnish, Esq., LL.D', p. 15. The reviewer of *The Modern Pythagorean* (1838) for *Fraser's* similarly notes a similarity between 'The Metempsychosis' and 'Hoffman's diableries', and speculates that 'perhaps Macnish was a little indebted to him for his fantastical notions, and his manner of treating his subject' ('The Modern Pythagorean', *Fraser's*, 19 (June 1839), 685-93, (p. 686)).

⁷ See, Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 22 June 1836, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50.

⁸ Benedict, pp. 166-90.

Peter Schlemihl's wundersame Geschichte is unique to Macnish. The German legend of Dr. Faustus may be a mutual line of influence. David Groves has convincingly argued that allusions to the Faustian legend may be read in Hogg's *Confessions*, and Macnish directly references 'Dr. Faustus' in 'The Metempsychosis' and 'The Barber of Gottingen'.⁹

Macnish and Hogg's common engagement with the German Romantic literary tradition complicates rather than indicates a line of influence. However, poignant commonalities between the *Confessions* and Macnish's prose tales, published primarily in *Blackwood's* between 1824 and 1830, will be examined alongside an inter-textual examination of *Confessions* and Macnish's medico-popular literature. While Macnish was most certainly influenced by numerous sources, the blatant inability of Hogg's characters and readers to interpret the signs of the material world in any unitary manner, the phenomenology of the divided self (portrayed through both drunkenness and dream-visions), and the embodied damnation of Robert Wringhim would undoubtedly have fascinated him.

Ambiguity and Apparitions

Robert Wringhim's tendency to read external signs in relation to the self (and, in particular, his own election) stems from the Calvinist tradition of self-scrutiny.¹⁰ Once he is assured, albeit problematically, of his election by the Reverend Wringhim, all signs must be read in confirmation of his salvation.¹¹ For example, the dream visions of the golden weapons, prior to the murder of Blanchard, and the white lady, prior to the attempted murder of George Colwan on Arthur's Seat, may signify divine disapproval of Wringhim's murderous plots, but in both cases Gil-Martin encourages Wringhim to read the visions rather as divine sanction for God's champion of the covenant of faith.¹² The subjective spectre blocks out the light, and

⁹ David Groves, 'Allusions to *Dr Faustus* in James Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SSL*, 18 (1983), 157-65; 'The Metempsychosis', p. 521; Robert Macnish, 'The Barber of Gottingen', *Blackwood's*, 20 (October 1826), 604-10, (p. 607).

¹⁰ See, 'Calvin's Theology and the Puritan Mind', in *The Puritan-Provincial Vision*, pp. 1-25. While Hogg's text functions on one level as a critique on the psychologically destructive nature of religious fanaticism, a doctrinally specific religious context is lacking in Macnish's short prose tales, with the exception of 'The Covenanters. A Scottish Traditionary Tale', first published in *Friendship's Offering* for 1829. This tale, however, represents a rare departure from psychological themes for Macnish.

¹¹ Wringhim is denied the subjective experience of feeling his own election, as Reverend Wringhim rather informs him that 'He had wrestled with God [...] for days and years, and that bitterness and anguish of spirit, on my account; but that *he* had at last prevailed, and had now gained the long and earnestly desired assurance of my acceptance with the Almighty' (p. 79).

¹² *Confessions*, p. 95, p. 109. Jonathan Glance uses eighteenth and nineteenth-century scientific dream theory (including Macnish's *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830)) and supernatural texts written about dreaming to evidence another level of scientific/supernatural ambiguity in the text ('Ambiguity and the Dreams in James

Wringhim continues down his spiraling pathway to damnation. The appearance of Gil-Martin literalises Wringhim's self-projective tendency. Upon first meeting the 'stranger youth' he is shocked to find that, in appearance, 'he was the same being as myself!'¹³ The psychoanalytic reading first suggested by Gide views Gil-Martin as a projection of repressed aspects of Robert Wringhim's psyche, as 'the exteriorized development of our own desires, of our pride, of our most secret thoughts'.¹⁴ At this moment, Wringhim desires assurance of his elevated position among God's elect, and his conversation with Gil-Martin provides that assurance. However, Gil-Martin's appearance is transmuted into that of his brother, George Colwan, after Wringhim's commission of fratricide. If Gil-Martin is read as a palate for self-projection, it is now Wringhim's guilt that is exteriorised. Three months prior to the publication of the *Confessions*, Macnish's essay on 'Ghosts and Dreams' for *The Emmet* comments on the racked conscience of the murderer:

Where is the destroyer of life who ever felt the enjoyment of a pure conscience? When blood has been split, what fountain can wash it away from the murderer? It clings to him for ever. His crime is written on the tablet of memory, in characters which no time – no enjoyment – no repentance can efface. [...] For him is reserved the worm that gnaws unseen – the pang that never dies. Why is he afraid to sleep alone, or walk in the hours of darkness? Is it not the image of the victim that perpetually fills his idea – that follows him as his shadow, wherever he goes, and combines with his mind as one of its own elements? I do not mean to say that any such spectral apparitions haunt the murderer, but the very circumstance of his feeling this undefined terror is a powerful proof of their existence. Let him, even with all the aids of philosophy, endeavour to make him disbelieve, he feels it impossible. The innate conviction adheres to him in spite of every reflection to the contrary, and will not be denied.¹⁵

It is tempting to speculate on the potential influence of such a passage on Hogg's *Confessions*, particularly in regard to the midnight horrors and the image of the victim following 'him as his shadow' and combining 'with his mind as one of its own elements'. However, Hogg's text was with the printers by late February, and hence, an essay appearing the following month is an improbable source of influence.¹⁶ Macnish's essay is written in defence of the reality of apparitions, but the notion of reality is defined in terms of the beliefs and perceptions of the embodied beholder: the existence of the apparitional murder victim is confirmed only through the murderer's 'constant terror' and ineradicable belief. Reality is truly in the eye of the

Hogg's *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, SSL, 28 (1993), 165-77).

¹³ *Confessions*, p. 80.

¹⁴ Gide, 'Introduction', p. xv.

¹⁵ 'Ghosts and Dreams', p. 292.

¹⁶ Garside, 'Introduction', p. lxiii.

beholder. Similarly, Hogg's text undermines what Srdjan Smajic has termed the 'period's confidence in the readability of visual signifiers', as the inextricable link between existent belief structures and sensory experience is portrayed through his characters' inability to read the signs of the perceptual universe beyond the scope of their own subjectivities.¹⁷ The Editor and Wringhim present a narrative of events from such diverse perspectives that the existence of one cohesive reality, available for objective consumption, is called into question. As Bell Calvert so poignantly exclaims, 'We have nothing on earth but our senses to depend upon: if these deceive us, what are we to do.'¹⁸

The explanatory ambiguity of Hogg's text was recognised, albeit unappreciatively, by its earliest reviewers and is now a critical commonplace.¹⁹ However, some past readings have attempted to privilege a psychological reading of Wringhim's confessional narrative. Barbara Bloedé and Allan Beveridge have psychoanalysed and retrospectively psychiatrically diagnosed Wringhim according to the contemporary views of mental illness; however, such attempts carry on the legacy of Hogg's equally biased enlightened Editor by privileged explanations amenable to a rational worldview.²⁰ Similarly skewed is the assumption that the early nineteenth century lacked a scientific paradigm to support a psychologically viable Gil-Martin. Ian Campbell in his Afterword to the Stirling/South Carolina edition claims that, 'Obviously', reading Gil-Martin as 'a delusion of Wringhim's imagination [...] might involve a more extensive knowledge of the subconscious mind than could be expected of Hogg's own time.'²¹ This may be true in regard to the psychoanalytic understanding of the subconscious mind, but the scientific writing on apparitions, dreaming, and drunkenness in the early nineteenth century could provide a formulation for a purely hallucinatory experience deeply connected to the mind and body of the individual. The ability for persons beyond Wringhim to both see and interact with Gil-Martin is most probably a purposeful effort by Hogg to maintain both demonic and psychological readings in an age in which physicians, such as John Ferriar, systematically dismissed supernatural experience as 'a symptom of bodily distemper, and of

¹⁷ Srdjan Smajic, 'The Trouble with Ghost-Seeing: Vision, Ideology, and Genre in the Victorian Ghost Story', *English Literary History*, 70 (2003), 1107-1135, (p. 1109).

¹⁸ *Confessions*, p. 56.

¹⁹ See 'Hogg's *Confessions*', *Westminster Review*, 2.4 (October 1824), 560-62.

²⁰ Beveridge, 'The Confessions of a Justified Sinner and the Psychopathology of the Double', 'James Hogg and Abnormal Psychology: Some Background Notes'; Barbara Bloedé, 'The Confessions of a Justified Sinner: The Paranoiac Nucleus', in *Papers Given at the First James Hogg Society Conference (Stirling, 1983)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Stirling: The James Hogg Society, 1983), pp. 15-28.

²¹ Ian Campbell, 'Afterword: Literary Criticism and *Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', in *Confessions*, pp. 177-94, (pp. 185-86).

little more consequence than the head-ach and shivering attending a common catarrh'.²²

The continuing currency of Ferriar's *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions* (1813) is evidenced by two essays on the subject appearing in *Blackwood's* in 1818. In the second essay, John Herman Merivale (1779-1844), justifies his '*anti-ferriarism*' in the name of:

the thrilling delight of a ghost-story by a Christmas fire-side, – the more exalted sense which a lurking tendency to superstitious apprehension adds to our relish of the sublime in poetry, – nay, the very pleasure which in some unaccountable manner mingles itself with the real terrors which situations such as above described are calculated to engender.²³

The correlation between an enlightened acceptance of the innate and universal tendency to supernatural belief and enhanced aesthetic experience foreshadows Macnish's later essay on 'Ghosts and Dreams'. However, in typical contradictory Blackwoodian style, the first essay on the subject, by Hogg's close associate, William Laidlaw (*bap.* 1779, *d.* 1845), presents Dr. Ferriar's system in a more positive light, as a solution to the scepticism of the present generation:

There are few things so much affected by the change of manners and circumstances, as the quality and the effect of evidence. Facts which our fathers were prepared to receive upon very slender and hearsay testimony, we are sometimes disposed to deny positively, even when fortified by all that the laws of evidence can do for them, by the confession of the perpetrator of wickedness, by the evidence of its victims, by the eye-sight and oath of impartial witnesses, and by all which could, in an ordinary case, "make faith," to use a phrase of civilians, betwixt man and woman. [...] Dr. Ferriar of Manchester has invented a new mode of judging evidence with respect to those supernatural matters, in which, without impeaching the truth of the narrator, or even the veracity of the eyes to whose evidence he appeals, you may ascribe his supposed facts to the effects of preconceived ideas acting upon faulty or diseased organs.²⁴

These essays evidence a simultaneous attraction and resistance to the authenticating practices of Ferriar by Blackwoodian authors, which is dramatised in *Confessions*.

In *An Essay on Apparitions, in which their Appearance is Accounted for by Causes*

²² *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions*, p. 138. Just prior to the submission of my thesis, Dr. Michelle Faubert, very kindly provided me with a copy of her forthcoming chapter, 'John Ferriar's Psychology, James Hogg's *Justified Sinner*, and the Gay Science of Horror-Writing', which will appear in *Romanticism and Pleasure: Disciplined Delights in British Literary Culture, 1780-1830*, ed. by Michelle Faubert and Thomas Schmid (Palgrave). In her chapter Faubert reads Ferriar's *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions* (1813) as celebrating the aesthetic pleasures of unreason and argues for Hogg's engagement with Ferriar's theory regarding the psychology of horror-writing.

²³ John Herman Merivale, 'Phantasmagoriana; Tales of the Dead, Principally Translated from the French', *Blackwood's*, 3 (August 1818), 589-96, (p. 595, p. 590).

²⁴ William Laidlaw, 'Phantasmagoria', *Blackwood's*, 3 (May 1818), 211-15, (pp. 211-12).

Wholly Independent of Preternatural Agency (1823), John Alderson accuses Ferriar of plagiarising his theory of apparitions, first presented to the public in an essay published in the *Edinburgh Medical and Chirurgical Journal* in 1810, and, true to the genre, his claim for the superiority of his own work is buttressed by the authenticity of his cases:

In 1813, an eminent and learned physician at Manchester published as new the same theory, supported by ancient history and traditional stories, which, if not equivocal, could not be so well authenticated as those to be found in the following essay.²⁵

A new and enlarged edition of Alderson's text was published by Longman in 1823 (notably the same publisher of Hogg's *Confessions*), and in the winter of the same year, Samuel Hibbert read an 'Essay on Spectral Impressions' to the Royal Society of Edinburgh, the popularity of which led to the production of a full length volume published in 1824 and a second edition in 1825.²⁶ Carrying on from Ferriar's essay, which, according to Hibbert was more valuable for 'affording abundant evidence of the existence of morbid impressions of this nature, without any sensible external agency, than in establishing, as he proposed, a general law of the system, to which the origin of spectral impressions could be inferred', Hibbert defined apparitions as 'nothing more than ideas, or the recollected images of the mind, which have been rendered as vivid as actual impressions'.²⁷ The *Phrenological Journal* included a review of Hibbert's *Sketches of the Philosophy of Apparitions* (1824), which criticised his neglect of the phrenological principles that clarified the specificity of the delusion according to the plurality of organs:

The brain consists of a congeries of organs, each of which manifests a particular power of the mind. Among these organs one serves to perceive Form; another Colour; a third Size; while other and *distinct* faculties and organs experience emotions and reflect. Each faculty being active, produces the special kind of ideas which it is fitted to form; and each may become active by an internal stimulus of its organ. The organs may be excited by an unusual influx of blood into the vessels which supply them; by inflammation; or by nervous irritation.²⁸

A letter from Hibbert to Combe, dated 20 November 1819, indicates that Hibbert was asked to give a paper to the Royal Medical Society addressing the question: 'what light have the

²⁵ John Alderson, *An Essay on Apparitions, in which their Appearance is Accounted for by Causes Wholly Independent of Preternatural Agency*, new edn (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green, 1823), p. viii.

²⁶ Samuel Hibbert, *Sketches of the Philosophy of Apparitions; or, An Attempt to Trace such Illusions to their Physical Causes*, 2nd edn (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1825), p. v.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 242, p. 61.

²⁸ 'Dr Hibbert on the Philosophy of Apparitions', *Phrenological Journal*, 1 (1823-1824), 541-55, (p. 547).

opinions &c. of Gall and Spurzheim thrown on the Physiology of the Nervous System?’ The letter acknowledges his receipt of Combe’s ‘treatise on Phrenology’ (presumably his *Essays on Phrenology* (1819)), and while he congratulates ‘the exposers of the doctrines of Gall and Spurzheim upon the ability with which it is at length defended and for a candour which ought to serve as a model to their opponents’, he respectfully aligns himself with Combe’s opponents.²⁹ Hibbert later writes in a letter to Combe, dated 9 March 1824, that while he approves of the phrenological principle of innate faculties (in contrast to the *tabula rosa* of the ideal philosophers), he objects to the continually growing number of phrenological organs.³⁰ The letter is written to accompany a copy of Hibbert’s *Sketches of the Philosophy of Apparitions* (1824), to arrive shortly from the publishers. Combe responds graciously in a letter of 18 March 1824, writing of his admiration for a fellow philosopher and agreeing to disagree on the grounds that, ‘Phrenology itself teaches its disciples that we are variously constituted & hence cannot all see the same objects in exactly the same light.’³¹

While phrenologists promoted an extreme faith in visual signifiers through their mapping of personal character onto the skull, ironically, their focus upon physiologically rooted individual difference emphasised the subjectivity of perception. Similarly, Smajic aptly observes that Ferriar and Hibbert’s theories

undermined the Enlightenment imperative for absolute scientific objectivity by foregrounding the subjective nature of sensory perception, especially sight, and the ensuing uncertainties of all knowledge derived from empirical investigation.³²

The strong defence of the plurality of organs provided by the specificity of delusional experience appears to have outweighed the doubt cast on empiricism, as Combe writes to Hibbert that the subject of apparitions has ‘formed part of my lectures for the three last seasons’.³³

Scientific writing on apparitions was in vogue in Edinburgh during the composition of *Confessions*, and Hogg went to great lengths to evidence the authenticity of the found confessional manuscript. He sent a premeditated letter to *Blackwood’s* on the discovery of ‘A Scot’s Mummy’, which was published in August 1823, allegedly in response to Christopher North’s request for an essay on ‘the boundless phenomena of nature constantly before your

²⁹ NLS MS 7204, fols 100-01.

³⁰ NLS MS 7213, fols 56-57.

³¹ Letter of George Combe to Samuel Hibbert, 18 March 1824, NLS MS 7383, fol. 24.

³² Smajic, p. 1114.

³³ Letter of George Combe to Samuel Hibbert, 18 March 1824, NLS MS 7383, fol. 24.

eyes'.³⁴ If the Ettrick Shepherd was a man with an idiosyncratic corporeal subjectivity, a naturally altered-state of consciousness, and thus incapable of sympathetic engagement with modern society, the phenomena he presents reveal this to be the universal human condition. He also included a facsimile of the final entry from Wringhim's journal in the frontispiece of the text – dubiously authenticating the existence of the journal as well as teasingly providing the reader with direct visual signification of Wringhim's tumultuous internal state.³⁵ The science of 'Autographology' was also apparently in vogue. Macnish's *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide* participates in the same ethos of authenticity.³⁶ However, Macnish's narrative coalesces with his own writing on the guilt-racked conscience in 'Ghosts and Dreams' and also with his later writing on spectral illusions in *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1834), wherein he explains:

Indeed, any thing on which the mind dwells excessively may, by exciting the perceptive organs, give rise to spectral illusions. It is to this circumstance that the bereaved husband sees the image of a departed wife, to whom he was fondly attached – that the murderer is haunted by the apparition of his victim – and that the living with whom we are familiar seem to be presented before our eyes, although at a distance from us.³⁷

Unlike Hogg's text, Macnish's confessional narrative is amenable to rationalisation by the reader, and no characters beyond the confessional narrator see the apparitional Mary Elliston. In comparison to the meager sales of Hogg's *Confessions*, the pamphlet, *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, went through at least four editions in a few months, and Moir attributes this success to the 'tone of truth' sustained through the narrative.³⁸ Macnish, however, acquits himself of this 'trick' played on the public, claiming that he 'gave the manuscript to M'Phun to make a kirk and mill if he liked of it'.³⁹ The authenticity of Macnish's text was promoted by his Glaswegian publisher, whereas Hogg's ploy to pass off the publication as a work of a Glaswegian author was soon thwarted by critics who recognised his distinctive style.⁴⁰ The

³⁴ James Hogg, 'A Scots Mummy', in *Contributions to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, Volume 1: 1817-1828*, ed. by Thomas C. Richardson (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), pp. 139-43, (p. 139).

³⁵ As Garside indicates, *The Life of David Haggart* (1821) also includes facsimile handwriting in the frontispiece ('Introduction', p. li). The text of the facsimile is a direct statement of authenticity: 'This is a true account of my life partly written by myself and partly taken down from my own lips while under sentence of death. — David Haggart'.

³⁶ See above, p. 117.

³⁷ *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), pp. 250-51.

³⁸ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 51. The University of Glasgow Library holds a fourth edition of the pamphlet, dated 1828 (Special Collections Bh11-c.10).

³⁹ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 57.

⁴⁰ Garside notes that six out of the ten identified reviews of *Confessions* explicitly named Hogg ('Introduction', pp. lxvii-lxviii). In a letter to William Blackwood, Hogg requests Blackwoodian participation in his attempted

dismantled authenticity and ambiguity of explanation are most probably at least partially responsible for the dismal sales of Hogg's *Confessions*.

Michael York Mason concludes that 'Hogg has cast so much doubt on the authenticity of the events recorded in the first section that there is no longer any need to worry about how much reality should be attributed to Gil-Martin', and John Herdman similarly accepts Gil-Martin's dual register – our ability to read him 'as the evil within projected as an external figure, or the evil without interiorised as part of the self'.⁴¹ Gil-Martin might just be the devil, but if he is, he is the liminal 'Deil' of Burns's address:

Whyles, ranging like a roaring lion,
For prey, a' holes an' corners tryin;
Whyles, on the strong-wing'd Tempest flyin,
Tirlan the *kirks*;
Whyles, in the human bosom pryin,
Unseen thou lurks.⁴²

Both interpretations of Gil-Martin can be read as potential influences on Macnish. The elderly gentleman of 'The Metempsychosis' maintains demonic powers and a verifiable physical presence in the tale, yet the guilt-induced perceptual projections in Macnish's corpus – the confessional narrator's Mary Elliston and Colonel O'Shaughnessy's Colonel M'Mulligan – lack a tangible material dimension beyond the mind of the individual. Macnish maintains a distinct differentiation between his devils in the flesh and his subjective spectres, and thus, he does not provide the same poignant critique of the rationalising tendencies of the era.

The Devil in the Flesh

The elderly gentleman of 'The Metempsychosis', much like Gil-Martin, combines demonic powers with a tangible material presence. The university grave robbers and Frederick Wolstang's servants purportedly see and interact with the gentleman, and yet his uncanny abilities – including a propensity to manipulate the scales of physical empiricism – subvert a rational worldview. Upon first meeting Stadt, his conversation intuitively turns to the abstract philosophical systems of the Allemagne, which harmonise so fully with Stadt's as to lead to

hoax (*Collected Letters of James Hogg*, II, p. 202).

⁴¹ Michael York Mason, 'The Three Burials in Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SSL*, 13 (1978), 15-23, (p. 20); Herdman, p. 83.

⁴² Robert Burns, 'Address to the Deil', in *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns*, ed. by James Kinsley, 3 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1968), I, pp. 168-72, (p. 169).

him to forget all ‘previous irritation, and even the reasons which brought me there’.⁴³ Gil-Martin’s ability to divert Wringhim from his worshipful intensions are perhaps here reflected, but rather than demarcating the beginning of a downward spiral into duplicitous chaos, the elderly gentleman’s appearance here marks a pivotal moment of realisation in the midst of chaos already begun. The devious actions of the body, devoid of conscious reflection, have already been perpetrated: Stadt has drunkenly signed away his body to Wolstang, at the aptly named Devil’s-hoof Tavern, where the elderly gentleman, dressed as a clergyman, ‘had the pleasure of stanching the blood, a sufficient quantity of which was nevertheless collected to write the document’, and Wolstang has committed the licentious and fraudulent actions for which Stadt will now come to suffer retribution.⁴⁴ The chronology of Hogg’s *Confessions* is thus inverted, as Wringhim’s dream visions and drunkenness progressively build in intensity, to meet their final culmination in complete bodily amalgamation with the Devil. As will be discussed below, this amalgamation transcends possession, as Wringhim’s physicality and thus mentality is progressively degraded in correspondence to Gil-Martin’s ever increasing power over him. In Macnish’s tale, progressive chronology is replaced with immediate experimentalism – gradual transformation with instantaneous and complete transmogrification. In this comparison, Macnish’s text, in fact, surpasses Hogg’s in overt supernaturalism, but ironically does so in the name of scientific inquisitiveness. The influence of the physical body on the moral character of the individual is brought into focus, as Stadt is transmogrified inside the physical body of the degenerate Wolstang. It is a fellow human being, rather than the Devil, with whom Stadt becomes incorporated, and as such, the intricate physiological relationship between consciousness and the physical body can be explored without the confounding factor of the demonic flesh and its peculiar ‘cameleon art’. Macnish’s devil-figure stands outside the action, directing Stadt’s experience, clarifying rather than mystifying. The result is a humorous, rather than a terrifying tale, from which Macnish’s physiological preoccupations can be gleaned.

The devil quite literally shows his cloven foot in ‘Terence O’Flaherty’, first published in Ackermann’s *Forget Me Not* in 1829. In the tale the wife of a hen-pecked husband is danced away by the devil for the small fee of a pair of buckskin breeches. In a similar vein as Hogg’s *The Shepherd’s Calendar* series and *Winter Evening Tales*, Macnish asserts a conscientious orality, immediately instructing the reader to ‘just hold your tongue for a short space’ to hear

⁴³ ‘The Metempsychosis’, p. 514.

⁴⁴ Ibid., p. 520.

the tale of Terence O'Flaherty. In the end we find that local tradition and Terence's first-hand report are in conflict:

There is something else which I must mention; and that is a report of Judy O'Flaherty having been seen three months afterwards in company with a corporal of the Connaught Rangers, who was seen lurking about the house the very night she danced away with the ould gentleman. But I don't believe any of them things; and how, in the name of the Saints could I? seeing that Terence swore upon his Bible, that he saw her go off in the way I have here circumstantially related.⁴⁵

Hogg's haunting ambiguities are replaced with a vulgar transparency that threatens the imaginative currency, and *Blackwood's* rejection of 'Terence O'Flaherty' is unsurprising.⁴⁶ The tale also stylistically resembles Moir's *Life of Mansie Wauch*, which was serialised in *Blackwood's* between 1824 and 1827, as the narrator portrays a similarly humorous credulity as the rustic tailor, Mansie Wauch. The rejection of the tale may thus also be due to a lack of originality.

In contrast to the literal presence of the devil in 'The Metempsychosis', in 'The Barber of Gottingen', first published in *Blackwood's* in October 1826, Macnish grounds the supernatural experience in the phenomena of dreaming. In particular, the torpor in the powers of volition and the impaired state of respiratory functions specifically attributed to the nightmare in *The Philosophy of Sleep* are prevalent and work to characterise the powers of the demonic figure. In the tale the barber of Gottingen College is surprised late one evening by a 'short, burly, thickset man' with a beard of 'at least four days' growth'.⁴⁷ The rubicund man demands to be shaved, but the barber refuses on both the grounds of the late hour and the rules and regulations of the university which permitted him only to shave the students and professors of Gottingen. The man becomes enraged and declares 'that if you won't shave me, I shall shave you', and after a frightful sudsing, the barber agrees.⁴⁸ However, the man fears that the barber will do damage to his throat with the razor and sets a 'horseman's pistol' out and on the ready if the barber should make a false move.⁴⁹ The nervous barber spends an extended period of time sudsing the man, who begins to relish the brushing and provokingly calls out "Brush away". As the barber recovers his senses, he desires to stop sudsing, but

⁴⁵ Robert Macnish, 'Terence O'Flaherty', in *Forget Me Not; A Christmas and New Year's, and Birthday Present for 1829*, ed. by Frederic Shoberl (London: Ackerman, 1829), 69-83, (p. 69, p. 83).

⁴⁶ In a letter to Moir dated 5 January 1828, Macnish refers to *Blackwood's* rejection of the tale and offers the same to Moir for publication in one of the annuals (NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49).

⁴⁷ Robert Macnish, 'The Barber of Gottingen', *Blackwood's*, 20 (October 1826), 604-10, (p. 604).

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 605.

⁴⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 606.

He felt as if in the charmed ring of some enchanter, from whose precincts it was impossible to escape. He had no power of his own. His will was useless; every movement of his body was in direct opposition to its dictates. What could he do?⁵⁰

This situational opposition between the body and mind is soon literalised. When the barber complains of exhaustion the man forces him to drink the vitalising ‘Elixir Diaboli of Doctor Faustus’,

But although his body was strengthened, let it not be supposed that the least glimmer of satisfaction was communicated to his mind. On the contrary, he became every moment more overwhelmed with amazement and wretchedness. Body and mind seemed to have dissolved their natural connexion. The former was a mere puppet over which the latter had no control.⁵¹

Gil-Martin’s abilities to control Wringhim’s bodily actions during his non-conscious trance state reflect a similar a-volitional puppetry, and similar to Macnish’s tale, situational manipulations by Gil-Martin progressively build up to full physiological puppetry. The decreased volitional control associated with both dreaming and drunkenness influence Macnish and Hogg’s portrayals. The ‘Elixir Diaboli’ was, of course, wine.

As the night progresses, the barber’s dread of the strange man mounts, climaxing with the transformation of the man into his true form:

The barber started back a fathom with amazement; and well he might, for in the midst of the darkness he beheld two horrid luminous eyes glaring upon him. They were those of the fat man, and seemed lighted up with the hideous spectral glow which is to be seen floating in cemeteries and other places of corruption. The unnatural glare made his whole head visible. His face, so far as the soap permitted its tint to be seen, was flushed to the colour of deep crimson. His dark hair appeared converted into sable snakes; and when he laughed, the whole inside of his mouth and throat resembled red-hot iron, and looked like the entrance to a furnace within his entrails. Nor was the breath which emanated from this source endurable: it was hot, suffocating, and sulphureous, as if concocted in the bottom of hell. Such a hideous spectacle was more than the barber could endure. It gave speed to his feet; and, dashing down his brush and soap-box, he rushed out the door, exclaiming in agony and desperation, “O lord! O lord! I have shaved the devil!”⁵²

The demonic imagery of this passage is reminiscent of moments in Hogg’s *The Three Perils of*

⁵⁰ Ibid., p. 607.

⁵¹ Ibid., p. 607.

⁵² Ibid., pp. 608-09.

Man (1822); however, in contrast to the literal supernatural of this particular Hogg text, Macnish's devil soon disperses into the land of dreams.⁵³ After a dramatic chase scene through the churchyard and up the tower of the steeple, the devil throws the barber off and down into the abyss below, enacting a scene that is reminiscent of the next to final entry of Wringhim's confession, wherein he describes being 'hung by the locks over a yawning chasm' (the barber in contrast is briefly hung by his nose).⁵⁴ Macnish's minute description of the fall well befits the Blackwoodian tale of terror. As he nears the ground, 'His frame shuddered convulsively – his breath came fast – he felt almost suffocated, and drew himself into the smallest possible dimensions, like a snail within its shell.'⁵⁵ But soon, rather than crashing to the earth, he finds:

Some good angel had caught him in his fall, and instead of being shivered to atoms, he was borne, as on the wings of lights and music, to the ground. On turning round he felt some gentle one reposing beside him. It was his wife. Worthy couple! they were snug in bed together; and the barber found, to his inexpressible satisfaction, that he had been dreaming.⁵⁶

Although Gil-Martin's diabolical presence cannot so easily be dismissed, Macnish's physiologically rooted devil figure, in fact, shares more in common with Gil-Martin than his literal depictions in 'The Metempsychosis' and 'Terence O'Flaherty'.

Dreaming Bodies

Both Hogg and Macnish appeal to altered-states of consciousness to reveal the dubious division between subjective and objective worlds for the embodied subject. In 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy in India', O'Shaughnessy experiences a drunken dream vision that is highly reminiscent of Wringhim's strange distemper in Edinburgh:

And one of these men was Colonel M'Mulligan, and the other was myself; and yet the other was not myself; for all the while I was conscious of sitting in my own dark chamber, drinking my own brandy. I cannot say how it was, for I was both here and there; but which of the two O'Shaughnessys was the real one, I could not have told you [...] I was conscious that there was not a soul in the chamber but myself, and yet it was full of people⁵⁷

⁵³ James Hogg, *The Three Perils of Man*, ed. by Douglas Gifford (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press in conjunction with The Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1989), p. 285.

⁵⁴ *Confessions*, p. 165.

⁵⁵ 'The Barber of Gottingen', p. 610.

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 610.

⁵⁷ 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy in India', p. 659.

The phenomenological experience described by each includes the loss of a coherent sense of selfhood. While he lays in bed, Wringhim conceives himself ‘to be two people’:

I deemed there were two of us in it; when I sat up, I always beheld another person, and always in the same position from the place where I sat or stood, which was about three paces off me towards my left side. [...] The most perverse part of it was, that I rarely conceived *myself* to be any of the two persons. I thought for the most part that my companion was one of them, and my brother the other.⁵⁸

Wringhim’s loss of selfhood appears to be more pervasive than that of O’Shaughnessy, who rather maintains a consciousness of his waking self in the material world while simultaneously envisioning himself riding on an elephant with Colonel M’Mulligan. He is uncertain of ‘which of the two O’Shaughnessys was the real one’, and thus experiences a multiplicity rather than an ablation of selfhood. As discussed above, this corresponds to the multiplicitious tales that O’Shaughnessy tells to explain the significant text of his physical body – each tale presumably maps onto his body, leading to endless replications. Wringhim’s strange distemper in Edinburgh stands as one of the most overt incongruences of the Editor’s versus Wringhim’s narratives. Wringhim claims:

I say I was confined a month. I beg he that readeth to take note of this, that he may estimate how much the word, or even the oath, of a wicked man, is to depend on. For a month I saw no one but such as came into my room, and for all that, it will be seen, that there were plenty of the same set to attest upon oath that I saw my brother every day during that period; that I persecuted him with my presence day and night, while all the time I never saw his face, save in a delusive dream.⁵⁹

Wringhim’s belief that he is either his brother or his companion leads the reader to speculate if he, in a delusional state, did indeed haunt his brother’s steps, as his report that his second self is at this time always perceived to be ‘about three paces off me towards my left side’ collaborates with George’s insistence that ‘the fierce apparition of his brother’ appears always on his ‘right hand’ and at a ‘precise point of distance’.⁶⁰ Alternatively, Gil-Martin is acting as a centrifugal force between the two brother’s consciousnesses. In either reading, events occurring in the objective and subjective worlds are blurred. In the final section, the inability of the reader to map either of the physical descriptions of the corpse in the suicide’s grave to

⁵⁸ *Confessions*, p. 106.

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 106-07.

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 27.

Wringhim's narrative resonates with his own loss of selfhood in the strange distemper.⁶¹ In the Colonel O'Shaughnessy tales Macnish can be read as reassembling the incongruence of Hogg's *Confessions* in order to create an extreme congruence between bodies and narratives that leads to multiplication rather than ablation. However, of vital importance to the reassembly is the living voice of O'Shaughnessy. Like the resurrected Stadt, he is able to construct his own teleological narrative, while the resurrected Wringhim is 'merely the appearance of flesh without the substance'.⁶²

In the strange distemper in Edinburgh, however, it is important to observe that his sense of self is not yet completed ablated. Wringhim's observations on the 'most awkward business' of being 'obliged to speak and answer in the character of another man' rather foreshadows Stadt's blundering attempts to pass himself off as Wolstang in public life to avoid accusations of insanity – in both cases personal identity is not entirely lost.⁶³ Wringhim's consciousness is fragmented rather than completely ablated at this point, and accordingly some fragments of the corpses do map onto his narrative. In the editorial coda, L—W's exclamation that the corpse has remained 'preserved frae decay [...] for the preservation o' that little book' underlines the analogy between texts and bodies in the *Confessions*.⁶⁴ The significance of the text and the body is not unitary, but rather depends on the beliefs of the reader. Those who believed in phrenology would find some gratification in Wringhim's textual body.

The Editor, anxiously grasping after the skull in the final exhumation scene, declares that he is 'no phrenologist'. However, as Garside indicates, he 'nevertheless manages to sound like one' in his descriptions of the extraordinary smoothness and roundness of the skull and the 'little protuberance above the vent of the ear'.⁶⁵ While the physical descriptions of the corpse given in 'A Scots Mummy' and the Editor's coda do not match up to each other or to Wringhim's physical description during life, the Editor's phrenological observations do seem to map onto the narrative of Wringhim – providing a partial coalescence of sign sets. As Garside's notes to the Stirling/South Carolina edition indicate, the location of the protuberance corresponds to the phrenological organ of 'Destructiveness', which is found to be large in the

⁶¹ For further on the discordant bodies, see Michael York Mason, 'The Three Burials in Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SSL*, 13 (1978), 15-23.

⁶² *Confessions*, p. 172.

⁶³ *Ibid.*, p. 106.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 174.

⁶⁵ Garside, 'Introduction', p. lii; *Confessions*, p. 172.

heads of ‘cool and deliberate murderers’.⁶⁶ However, the observation on ‘the almost perfect rotundity’ has yet to receive critical commentary and intriguingly points towards a nineteenth-century conceptualisation of the double self.

Indicative of the continued currency of ‘the Great Chain of Being’ into the nineteenth century, the phrenological organs were divided into those faculties shared by both humans and lower animals and those unique to mankind. The propensities, such as ‘Amativeness’ (organ of sexual passion), ‘Acquisitiveness’, and ‘Destructiveness’, and the inferior sentiments, such as ‘Love of Approbation’ and ‘Self-Esteem’, were common to both man and beast, as were the intellectual faculties, which allowed for a functional relationship with the external environment. For example, in *An Introduction to Phrenology*, Macnish, notes that ‘Love of Approbation’ is ‘active in the monkey, which is fond of gaudy dresses’.⁶⁷ The superior sentiments distinguished man as a moral being, and included such faculties as ‘Benevolence’, ‘Veneration’, ‘Firmness’, ‘Conscientiousness’, and ‘Hope’. In some persons, the animal propensities and inferior sentiments might be so predominant as to render them innately unfit to function in civilised society. In contrast, the moral sentiments might predominate to the extent that a person could not help but live a righteous life. According to Spurzheim, such persons are truly ‘elect’:

A person endowed with the faculties proper to man in the highest degree, and with very small animal faculties, will act by nature conformably to the faculties which give the law when the animal faculties act with energy. He has no occasion for any law either for putting in action the superior faculties, or for preventing the abuses of his animal faculties, and is really elect. We also understand how a person may dislike and hate evil, and yet do it; how virtue is possible, and how merit and demerit take place.⁶⁸

However, the vast majority of persons fell into a third category, in that moral and animal faculties displayed a degree of balance and hence produced conflicting emotional responses. Such persons are characterised by Combe’s nephew, Robert Cox:

In the heat of passion they do acts which the higher powers afterwards loudly disapprove, and may truly be said to pass their days in alternate sinning and repenting.⁶⁹

⁶⁶ *Transactions of the Phrenological Society instituted 22d February 1820* (Edinburgh, 1824), as cited by Garside, ‘Notes’, p. 254.

⁶⁷ *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), p. 59.

⁶⁸ *The Physiognomical System of Drs. Gall and Spurzheim*, p. 500. For further discussion of phrenology and Calvinism, see Roger Cooter, ‘Secular Methodism’, in *The Cultural Meaning of Popular Science: Phrenology and the Organization of Consent in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984) (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984), pp. 169-98.

⁶⁹ Robert Cox, ‘An Essay on the Character and Cerebral Development of Robert Burns’, *Phrenological Journal*,

As Gil-Martin indicates, ‘We are all subjected to two distinct natures in the same person.’⁷⁰ A skull in which all organs were of a similar size would be round and smooth, and the implication of the Editor’s observation is that Wringhim’s animal and moral faculties are (with the exception of his large ‘Destructiveness’) balanced, indicating internal struggle. Wringhim writes of his youthful propensity towards sinfulness and attempts at repentance, and during his final days at Dalcastle he reports to be ‘at one time worshipping with great fervour of spirit, and at other times so wholly left to myself, as to work all manner of vices and follies with greediness’.⁷¹ In contrast to Wringhim’s perceived status as one of the Elect, the presence of an internal struggle emphasises the strong role of personal choice in determining the direction of his moral pathway. During the two periods of ablated consciousness at Dalcastle, this internal struggle appears to cease, and his violence, intemperance, gaudy dress, and licentiousness during these periods plausibly indicate a decided dominance of the animal faculties. This is not to argue that Hogg is in any way advocating phrenology, but rather that a sophisticated physiological paradigm for the double self was available in the early nineteenth century.

Double Consciousness

Barbara Bloedé has speculated that the case of Mary Reynolds, a so called ‘nineteenth-century case of double personality’, may have been a model for Wringhim’s dual states and notes that, like Mary Reynolds, whose alterations occur after a long period of sleep, ‘at least one of Robert’s returns to consciousness after a period of amnesia occurs after waking from a “profound and feverish sleep”’.⁷² Bloedé provides a convincing analysis of the commonalities between Reynolds’s and Wringhim’s conditions as well as the sources from which Hogg may have acquired information about this and other similar cases.⁷³ Ian Hacking’s work on the

9 (1834-1836), 52-74, (p. 57).

⁷⁰ *Confessions*, p. 132.

⁷¹ *Ibid.*, p. 133.

⁷² Barbara Bloedé, ‘A Nineteenth-Century Case of Double Personality: A Possible Source for *The Confessions*’, in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, in conjunction with The James Hogg Society, 1988), pp. 117-27, (p. 120).

⁷³ The Broadview edition, edited by Adrian Hunter, includes an appendix of the two probable sources identified by Bloedé for Hogg’s knowledge of double consciousness: S. L. Mitchell, ‘A Double Consciousness, or a Duality of Person in the same Individual’, *Edinburgh Weekly Journal*, 31 (1816), 252; H. Dewar, ‘Report on a Communication from Dr. Dyce of Aberdeen, to the Royal Society of Edinburgh, “On Uterine Irritation, and

history of what is today referred to as multiple personality disorder indicates that Mary Reynolds's case would have been classified as a form of somnambulism. Hacking goes on to discuss the importance of phrenology in informing nineteenth-century conceptualisations of the double brain and identifies Macnish's *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1834) as the most prominent source text for later discussions of Reynolds's case or 'la dame de Mac-Nish' as she would become known in France.⁷⁴ The phrenological account of somnambulism forwarded by Macnish in 1834 is not original and is based on Spurzheim's account of the various phenomena of sleep in *The Physiognomical System of Drs. Gall and Spurzheim* (1815) as follows:

it cannot happen that all faculties should be active at the same time. All organs being fatigued take rest, and this state of rest is sleep. But any particular organ, or even several organs, may be active while the other organs rest; then the peculiar sensations or ideas, which result from this particular activity, constitute that which is called *dreams*, which are more or less complicated according to the number of the active organs.⁷⁵

Macnish's later rival, Andrew Carmichael, president of the Dublin Phrenological Society, delineates the value of phrenology in building upon Dugald Stewart's theory of dreaming as imperfect sleep in *An Essay on Dreaming, Including Conjectures on the Proximate Cause of Sleep* (1818) and defines somnambulism as a state of imperfect sleep in which 'the brain is awake and in communication with the nerves of locomotion'.⁷⁶ The period of ablated consciousness at Dalcastle may then be read as a variation on somnambulism, in which the animal faculties, over-stimulated by Gil-Martin take control of Wringhim's actions. Macnish will later explain why over-stimulated faculties dominate a person's dreams:

A person's natural character, therefore, or his pursuits in life, by strengthening one faculty, make it less susceptible, than such as are weaker, of being overcome by complete sleep; or, if it be overcome, it awakes more rapidly from its dormant state, and exhibits its proper characteristics in dreams.⁷⁷

its Effects on the Female Constitution"', *Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh*, 9 (1823), 365-79.

Mitchell's case study is that of Mary Reynolds, while the only hint of a name for Dyce's case is from

Macnish's *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), in which he refers to Maria C—.

⁷⁴ Ian Hacking, 'Double Consciousness in Britain 1815-1875', *Dissociation*, 4 (1991), 134-46, (pp. 139-40).

Macnish includes Dr. Dyce's case in the main text and Dr. Mitchell's case as a footnote within the chapter on 'Sleep-Talking' in *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), pp. 183-86.

⁷⁵ J. G. Spurzheim, *The Physiognomical System of Drs. Gall and Spurzheim; Founded on an Anatomical and Physiological Examination of the Nervous System in General, and of the Brain in Particular; and Indicating the Dispositions and Manifestations of the Mind* (London: Baldwin, Cradock, and Joy; Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1815), p. 216.

⁷⁶ Andrew Carmichael, *An Essay on Dreaming, Including Conjectures on the Proximate Cause of Sleep* (Dublin: Cumming, 1818), p. 28.

⁷⁷ *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), p. 63.

Combe references both Dr. Mitchell and Dr. Dyce's reports in *A System of Phrenology* (1830) as cases that lead some persons to believe that the conscious, 'I', may be attributed to a singular organ, but, drawing upon the philosophy of Thomas Brown (1778-1820), he goes on to delineate the more probable theory that consciousness is rather an overarching mental state, to which particular faculties contribute. As such, the phenomenon of double consciousness remains 'inexplicable' in phrenological terms.⁷⁸ Macnish similarly writes that 'the particular state of the brain which induces such conditions will, I believe, ever remain a mystery', and, like Combe, also notes the analogy between the state of mind during double consciousness and that which occurs during 'magnetic sleep'.⁷⁹ In a later case, presented in a letter to the editor of the *Phrenological Journal*, Combe tentatively asserts that the condition is the result of the brain being in an overall different condition rather than the affection of a particular organ, but observes that in the diseased state, the organs of the propensities seem to be more active and the moral sentiments less active, in comparison to the normal condition.⁸⁰ Oddly, Combe does not appeal to the dual hemispheres of the brain in his explanation. According to Anne Harrington's work in *Medicine, Mind, and the Double Brain: A Study in Nineteenth-Century Thought* (1987), phrenological anatomy was vital to the nineteenth-century understanding of the double brain. Each phrenological organ had its own double in the opposite hemisphere, thus raising the possibility that a single side of the brain might be diseased. As such, in 1815 Spurzheim argued that 'it is not true that consciousness is always single' and evidences his assertion with the observation that '[a] great number of madmen hear angels sing, or the devil roar &c. only on one side'.⁸¹ The locational specificity of Wringhim's delusion during his strange distemper in Edinburgh may be based on this conceptualisation of the double brain. Hogg appears to be laying down markers for plausible physiological explanations, but, interestingly, may have modelled the periods of ablated consciousness on medical case studies that evade full explanation by even the most avowed rationalists. The complete change of conscious identity in such cases confounds Combe, but imaginatively lends itself to Pythagorean transmigration of souls and demonic possession.

Wringhim's uncharacteristic sensual behaviour at Dalcastle may, of course, also be

⁷⁸ *A System of Phrenology*, pp. 107-12, pp. 518-22.

⁷⁹ *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), pp. 184-85.

⁸⁰ George Combe, 'Case of Divided Consciousness', *Phrenological Journal*, 11 (1838), 404-07.

⁸¹ *The Physiognomical System of Drs. Gall and Spurzheim*, p. 220, p. 221; For further, see Anne Harrington, 'The Pre-1860 Legacy', in *Medicine, Mind, and the Double Brain: A Study in Nineteenth-Century Thought* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987), pp. 6-34.

read as a demonic possession; however, if so, Hogg's devil may act through natural means. In his 'Hymn to the Devil', first published within *The Three Perils of Man* (1822) and later inserted in the 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XIX' in March 1825, Hogg portrays a tangible devil, speeding through the night air, wreaking havoc by influencing the visions of the sleeping. Drawing upon the externalist theory of dreaming, as forwarded by Baxter, the devil is shown to control the sensory apparatus of the dreamer, framing 'images' (l. 33) and able to 'tickle' and 'tease' (l. 61) the passions.⁸² According to phrenological theory, the actions of Gil-Martin leading up to the periods of ablated consciousness would stimulate the faculties of 'Self-esteem', 'Love of Approbation', 'Acquisitiveness', and 'Destructiveness' and suppress the faculties of 'Benevolence' and 'Veneration'. While interrupting his prayers, Gil-Martin elevates Wringhim's 'spiritual pride' and presents the advantages to be gained from 'the estate and riches' of Dalcastle at the small cost of destroying sinners whose presence degrades the life of the elect.⁸³ Read in terms of the phrenological theory of apparitions, Gil-Martin is here a projection of ideas, associated with specifically diseased phrenological organs, vivified to the intensity of actual impressions. Taking a demonic reading into account, Gil-Martin's 'cameleon art' enables him to enter into Wringhim's mind and thus formulate his discourse to stimulate the animal organs in such a way as to increase his propensity towards evil behaviours, and conformable to Baxter's externalist theory, such stimulation is more easily achieved during sleep:

But the most singular instance of this wonderful man's power over my mind was, that he had as complete influence over me by night as by day. All my dreams corresponded exactly with his suggestions; and when he was absent from me, still his arguments sunk deeper in my heart than even when he was present.⁸⁴

The phrenological explanation of dreaming and somnambulism, in which only certain organs are active during sleep, also conforms well to the increased potency of Gil-Martin's

⁸² James Hogg, 'Hymn to the Devil', in *Contributions to Blackwood's*, pp. 159-62. In the 'Noctes', North responds to, what he refers to as the Shepherd's 'Ode to the Devil', by asking if he has seen 'Dr Hibbert's book on Apparitions?' The dialogue that follows provides the reader with the summation of Hibbert's arguments decorated with humorous interjections by the Shepherd, both insisting upon 'the existence o' ghosts and fairies' on account of having 'seen scores o' them, baith drunk and sober' and also admitting there is 'some sense' in Hibbert's theory that 'in well-authenticated ghost-stories, of a supposed supernatural character, the ideas which are rendered so unduly intense, as to induce spectral illusions, may be traced to such phantastical agents of prior belief, as are incorporated in the various systems of superstition, which for ages possessed the minds of the vulgar' (John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XIX', *Blackwood's*, 17 (March 1825), 366-84, (p. 370). On Baxter, see above, pp. 42-43.

⁸³ *Confessions*, p. 81, p. 100.

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 93.

arguments.

Some somnambulists do things of which they are not capable in a state of watching; and dreaming persons reason sometimes better than they do when awake. This phenomenon is not astonishing. If we wish to reflect upon any object, we avoid the noise of the world and all external impressions; we cover the eyes with our hands, and we put to rest a great number of organs in order to concentrate all vital power in one or in several. In the state of dreaming and in somnambulism, this naturally happens; consequently, the manifestations of the active organs are then often more perfect and more energetic; the sensations are more lively, and the reflections deeper, than in a state of watching. Without knowing their danger, such persons do things which are possible to be done, but which they would not do, being acquainted with the danger they run.⁸⁵

Demonic and psychological readings are here equally physiologically grounded. However, in waking life, the ‘natural, and amiable’ feeling against the socially destructive force of murder work against Gil-Martin, as ‘there are certain trains and classes of thoughts that have great power in enervating the mind’ and ‘[t]hese THOUGHTS are hard enemies wherewith to combat!’⁸⁶

Gil-Martin’s evil influence is inverted in Macnish’s portrayal of the apparitional Mary Elliston in *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*. While the ‘Ghosts and Dreams’ essay provides a clear formulation for the confessional narrator’s experience, the eerie connectivity between the narrator’s subjective state and the apparitional Mary Elliston’s countenance may represent a re-working of Gil-Martin’s ‘cameleon art’. As Ian Duncan points out, ‘Gil-Martin’s “cameleon art” conflates sympathy with physiognomy, the Enlightenment science of interpreting facial forms’:

If I contemplate a man’s features seriously, mine own gradually assume the very same appearance and character. And what is more, by contemplating a face minutely, I not only attain the same likeness, but, with the likeness, I attain the very same ideas as well as the same mode of arranging them.⁸⁷

The apparitional Mary Elliston does not mimic facial expressions – as an aspect of the confessional narrator’s mind she is presumably naturally connected to his innermost thoughts. Similarly, as the minds and bodies of Robert Wringhim and Gil-Martin become increasingly amalgamated, Gil-Martin no longer takes Wringhim’s shape to spy out his innermost thoughts; rather, he remains in the shape of George Colwan. Both Robert Wringhim and Macnish’s

⁸⁵ *The Physiognomical System of Drs. Gall and Spurzheim*, pp. 217-18.

⁸⁶ *Confessions*, p. 100, pp. 110-11.

⁸⁷ *Scott’s Shadow*, p. 267; *Confessions*, p. 86.

confessional narrator are haunted by the image of their victim; however, rather than tormenting to the point of suicide, the apparitional Mary Elliston acts as a healing agent. Rather than an exteriorisation of the evil within, Mary Elliston appears to radiate a spark of goodness. Whereas Gil-Martin pushes Robert Wringhim to further acts of malignity, she acts as an externalised conscience, counteracting rather than reinforcing his natural propensity towards sinful acts. Put in phrenological terms, the apparitional Mary Elliston seems to stimulate the social organ of ‘Benevolence’ in the confessional narrator, who, unlike Robert Wringhim, appears to have no superior sentiments until the appearance of the apparition: he needs no external stimulation to steady his hand in the act of feminicide. In contrast, Wringhim’s act of feminicide, which is also most probably a double murder, does not occur until his body and mind have been so amalgamated with Gil-Martin as to prevent internal conflict.

The Devil of the Flesh

In *The Confessions on an Unexecuted Femicide* the Biblical imagery of ‘the worm that dies not’ chosen by Macnish to portray the embodied damnation of the confessional narrator is the same as that used by Mrs. Calvert in her description of the physical degradation of Robert Wringhim at their final meeting:

“I never in my life saw any human being,” said Mrs. Calvert, “who I thought so like a fiend. If a demon could inherit flesh and blood, that youth is precisely such a being as I could conceive that demon to be. The depth and the malignity of his eye is hideous. His breath is like the airs from a charnel house, and his flesh seems fading from his bones, as if the worm that never dies were gnawing it away already.”⁸⁸

As the notes to the Stirling/South Carolina edition indicate, ‘the worm that never dies’ refers to Isaiah 66.24 and Mark 9.43-9.48, but both Macnish and Hogg deviate from the Biblical usage to portray the worm of Hell transgressing the grave to feast on the flesh of the living sinner. In both texts the progressive degradation of the physical body can be read as signifying moral decay.⁸⁹

The transformative power of the internal mind on the external body begins prior to

⁸⁸ *Confessions*, p. 62.

⁸⁹ For further discussion of Wringhim’s physical degradation, see Bloedé, ‘*The Confessions of a Justified Sinner: The Paranoid Nucleus*’, pp. 15-28; Warren Fox, ‘Violence and Victimization of Women: Engendering Sympathy for Hogg’s Justified Sinner’, *SSL*, 32 (2001), 164-79; Rebecca A. Pope, ‘Hogg, Wordsworth and Gothic Autobiography’, *SSL*, 27 (1992), 218-40.

Wringhim's birth. Although Reverend Wringhim's denial of Robert Wringhim's illegitimate parentage must be read with a degree of scepticism (it is plausible that he is in fact the father), his explanation of the usual resemblance between himself and Robert parallels Gil-Martin's later transformative powers:

"But, John, there are many natural reasons for such likenesses, besides that of consanguinity. They depend much on the thoughts and affections of the mother; and, it is probable, that the mother of this boy, being deserted by her worthless husband, having turned her thoughts on me, as likely to be her protector, may have caused this striking resemblance." [...] "I have known a lady, John, who was delivered of a blackamoor child, merely from the circumstance of having got a start by the sudden entrance of her negro servant, and not being able to forget him for several hours."⁹⁰

In both cases the power of 'constant thinking of an event changes every one of its features', as Gil-Martin's influence over Wringhim is dependent upon the habitual thought patterns he forces onto him even in his dreams.

Just prior to Wringhim's first meeting with Gil-Martin, he is in a state of religious ecstasy. Having finally learned of his assured position among the elect, his 'whole frame seemed to be renewed; every nerve was buoyant with new life'.⁹¹ Upon meeting Gil-Martin, the physicality of the moment intensifies as Wringhim declares, 'I can never describe the strange sensations that thrilled through my whole frame at that impressive moment'.⁹² This intensified nervous stimulation is maintained during their meeting, as Wringhim writes that his 'mind had all the while been kept in a state of agitation resembling the motion of a whirlpool'.⁹³ This appears to exhaust Wringhim's frame, as he departs 'not with the same buoyancy and lightness of heart'.⁹⁴ The physical transformation noted by his parents upon his arrival home must be attributed to this intense physiological experience. Reverend Wringhim confirms his mother's initial reaction:

He looked at me with a countenance of great alarm; mumbling some sentences to himself, and then taking me by the arm, as if to feel my pulse, he said, with a faltering voice, "Something has indeed befallen you, either in body or mind, boy, for you are transformed, since the morning, that I could not have known you for the same person.

⁹⁰ *Confessions*, p. 73. In *An Introduction to Phrenology*, 2nd edn (Glasgow: Symington; Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1837), Macnish provides a footnote confessing himself 'a participator in the vulgar belief that impressions made upon the mother's mind during pregnancy may affect the offspring' (pp. 167-68).

⁹¹ *Confessions*, p. 80.

⁹² *Ibid.*, p. 80.

⁹³ *Ibid.*, p. 81.

⁹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 82.

Have you met with any accident?’⁹⁵

Excitation followed by system exhaustion here portrays the embodied damnation of over-stimulation. Like Macnish’s habitual drunkard, Wringhim’s physical body presents the signs of excess. This reading is maintained through continual references to Wringhim’s ‘thirst’, his rapid inability to ‘live without him’, and a corresponding disdain for the comparatively mild stimulation of his mother and Reverend Wringhim’s religious bombast.⁹⁶ His thirst for the company of Gil-Martin is mirrored in his desire to kill George Colwan, as he writes, ‘I *had* a desire to slay him, it is true, and such a desire too as a thirsty man has to drink’.⁹⁷ His addiction to Gil-Martin is in fact an addiction to his stimulation of the animal faculties, in this case, potentially the organ of ‘Destructiveness’, which was associated with homicidal monomaniacs, who had uncontrollable appetites to destroy human life.⁹⁸

Eventually, Wringhim turns to the more traditional stimulating properties of alcohol. Gil-Martin and Mrs. Keeler both accuse him of ‘extreme inebriety’ upon his waking from the first period of ablated consciousness, and the second period is preceded by heavy drinking.⁹⁹ Initially, the expanded imagination and universal sympathy of the first stages of drunkenness, described by Macnish in *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), is experienced:

we drank and became merry, and I found that my miseries and over-powering calamities, passed away over my head like a shower that is driven by the wind. I became elevated and happy, and welcomed my guests an hundred times; and then I joined them in religious conversation, with a zeal and enthusiasm which I had not often experienced, and which made all their hearts rejoice, so that I said to myself, “Surely every gift of God is a blessing, and ought to be used with liberality and thankfulness.”¹⁰⁰

Richard Jackson has noted the similarities between Wringhim’s experience and the opium eating famously described in De Quincey’s *The Confessions of an English Opium-Eater*. He does not argue that Wringhim is in fact taking opium, but rather than Hogg was aware of its effects and is drawing upon this knowledge base in his portrayal of Wringhim’s experience.¹⁰¹ Macnish heavily draws upon De Quincey’s *Confessions* in the chapter on ‘Drunkenness

⁹⁵ Ibid., p. 83.

⁹⁶ Ibid., p. 107, p. 88.

⁹⁷ Ibid., p. 101.

⁹⁸ For example, see ‘Organ of the Propensity to Destroy, or of Destructiveness’, in *The Physiognomical System of Drs. Gall and Spurzheim*, pp. 377-90.

⁹⁹ *Confessions*, p. 121.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid., p. 127.

¹⁰¹ Richard D. Jackson, ‘The Devil, the Doppelgänger, and the *Confessions* of James Hogg and Thomas De Quincey’, *SHW*, 12 (2001), 90-103.

Modified by the Inebriating Agent' in *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827) and explains the difference between the drunkenness of opium and wine as follows:

There is more poetry in its visions, more mental aggrandisement, more range of imagination. Wine invigorates the animal powers and propensities chiefly, but opium strengthens those peculiar to man, and gives for a period, amounting to hours, a higher tone to the thinking faculties.¹⁰²

Hogg's choice of wine over opium for Wringhim's inebriation accords well with the stimulatory propensities of Gil-Martin. A shared line of influence appears to stem from De Quincey's *Confessions* to both Hogg and Macnish.¹⁰³ Another line may stem from the natural theology of moderate evangelicals such as Thomas Chalmers.

The imagery of embodied damnation used by both authors, 'the worm that dieth not', is similarly utilised by Chalmers in his discourses. In his sermon on 'Heaven a Character not a Locality', amended to some later editions of *Discourses on the Christian Revelation* (1817), Chalmers underlines the continuity of moral character between this life and the next, 'which even the death that intervenes does not violate', and his promotion of virtue as the pathway to heaven on earth provides a potent critique of Antinomianism:

If the moral character then of these future states of existence, were distinctly understood and consistently applied, it would serve directly and decisively to extinguish antinomianism. There is no sound and scriptural Christian, who ever thinks of virtue as the price of heaven. It is something a great deal higher, it is heaven itself – the very essence, as we have already said, of heaven's blessedness.¹⁰⁴

Chalmers appeals to 'the worm that dieth not' twice in this particular sermon. Hell and heaven are depicted as moral characters, rather than physical locations, and he analogises the material image of hell from the New Testament with the depravity of the distempered individual on earth:

Each is ripening for his own everlasting destiny; and whether in the depravities that deepen and accumulate on the character of the one, or in the graces that brighten and multiply upon the other – we see materials enough, either for the worm that dieth not, or for the pleasures that are for evermore.¹⁰⁵

¹⁰² *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), pp. 22-23.

¹⁰³ The reciprocal influence between De Quincey and Macnish with regard to *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830) is briefly discussed by Patrick Bridgwater, 'Dream Texts', in *De Quincey's Gothic Masquerade* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2004), pp. 80-93.

¹⁰⁴ *Discourses on the Christian Revelation*, p. 336.

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 323.

While in other discourses, Chalmers discusses heaven and hell in physical terms, emphasising the sensorial nature of damnation or salvation, he didactically shifts focus in this discourse to the immaterial aspects of the afterlife:

though a war of disembodied spirits – yet in the wild tempest of emotions alone – the hatred, the fury, the burning recollection of injured rights, and the brooding thoughts of yet unfulfilled retaliation – in these, and these alone, do we behold the materials enough of dire and dreadful pandemonium; and, apart from corporeal suffering altogether, may we behold in the full and final developments of character alone, enough for imparting all its corrosion to the worm that dieth not, enough for sustaining in all its fierceness the fire that is not quenched.¹⁰⁶

However, in a characteristic appeal to physiognomic principles, the physical appearance on earth signifies moral character:

The stoop, the downcast regards, the dark and sinister expression, of him who cannot lift up his head among his fellow men, or look his companions in the face, are the sensible proofs, that he who knows himself to be dishonest feels himself to be degraded; and the inward sense of dishonour which haunts and humbles him here, is but the commencement of that shame and everlasting contempt to which he shall awaken hereafter.¹⁰⁷

I have been unable to identify neither when nor where this discourse was first given nor when it first appeared in published form.¹⁰⁸ However, his utilisation of ‘the worm that dieth not’ in this discourse appears to represent an overarching motif in his sermons and discourses.¹⁰⁹ Macnish and Hogg both use this image of retributive causality in confessional texts in which guilt is expressed through the physical body; however, Hogg’s utilisation further serves as a

¹⁰⁶ Ibid., p. 326.

¹⁰⁷ Ibid., pp. 324-25.

¹⁰⁸ The GUL copy of *Discourses on the Christian Revelation, Viewed in Connection with the Modern Astronomy. To which are added, Discourses Illustrative of the Connection between Theology and General Science* (Glasgow: Collins; London: Hamilton, Adams, & Co., [n.d.]) is electronically listed as most probably published in 1818, but an examination of the text provides no evidence for this dating. A hand-written inscription in the front cover dates a specific ownership of the text to 1848, and a reference to the cholera epidemic within the preface reveals that some of the sermons were most probably written as late as 1832. *The Published Writings of Thomas Chalmers (1780-1847), A Descriptive List, compiled by the Rev Hugh Watt, D.D.* (Edinburgh: Clark, 1943) indicates that at least eleven editions of *Discourses on the Christian Revelation* were published, but does not indicate at which point the *Discourses Illustrative of the Connection between Theology and General Science* were amended to the text.

¹⁰⁹ For example, see Thomas Chalmers, *Sermons and Discourses by Thomas Chalmers, D.D., LL.D., Now Completed by the Introduction of his Posthumous Sermons*, 2 vols (New York: Carter, 1860), I, p. 127, pp. 142-43, p. 179, p. 234, pp. 363-64, p. 545, p. 601, in *Google Books* <<http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=6GwrAAAAYAAJ&printsec=frontcover&dq=editions:HARVARDAH4VS9#v=onepage&q&f=false>> [accessed 6 June 2010].

potent critique of the malevolent unworldliness of fanatical Calvinism.

A major factor in Wringhim's progressive demise is his continual failure to recognise the connection between the corporeal body and the immortal spirit – a failure symptomatic of his Antinomian faith.¹¹⁰ When Gil-Martin first suggests the murder of Mr. Blanchard (a man who shares the title of '[t]he most popular of all their preachers of morality' in Glasgow with the Reverend Thomas Chalmers), Wringhim's body reacts against the cold inhumanity of the murder:

I was so shocked, that my bosom became as it were a void, and the beatings of my heart sounded loud and hollow in it; my breath cut, and my tongue and palate became dry and speechless.¹¹¹

This description of an intense bodily reaction is similar to Macnish's clinically precise first-person phenomenological narratives and evidences a commonality of the *Confessions* with the Blackwoodian tale of terror, and the conflict between the body and the mind looks forward to Macnish's 'The Metempsychosis' and 'The Barber of Gottingen'. Wringhim is soon able to mentally rationalise the murder of Blanchard, and through the dually consolidating acts of dreaming and discoursing the mind and body come into harmony. However, the amalgamation is incomplete for when the time comes to act, his 'hand refused the office'.¹¹² Eventually the body, devoid of the conscious mind, acts to perpetrate matricide and feminicide, and like Frederick Stadt, Wringhim is forced to suffer retribution for crimes of which he has no knowledge. The amalgamation of the devil within the flesh by this point in the narration coalesces with the cessation of the 'natural, and amiable' bodily feelings.¹¹³ Hauntingly, Gil-Martin declares, 'Our beings are amalgamated, as it were, and consociated in one, and never shall I depart from this country until I can carry you in triumph with me.'¹¹⁴ While the insinuation that Wringhim was in fact inebriated during the months of conscious oblivion tempts the rationalising reader to ignore the diabolical dimension, Hogg's utilisation of a physiological phenomenon also serves to further demarcate the fleshly nature of evil. As Gil-Martin physically wanes away in tandem with Wringhim, he persistently disregards the moral significance of the flesh, encouraging him to throw 'off this frame of dross and corruption,

¹¹⁰ David Eggenschwiler, 'James Hogg's *Confessions* and the Fall into Division', *SSL*, 9 (1971), 26-39, (p. 27).

¹¹¹ *Confessions*, pp. 97-98, p. 92.

¹¹² *Ibid.*, p. 96.

¹¹³ *Ibid.*, p. 100.

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 130.

minge with the pure ethereal existence of existence, from which we derived our being'.¹¹⁵

Similarly, Wringhim longs for what will be revealed to be an ultimately unachievable purely ethereal existence:

when my flesh and my bones are decayed, and my soul has passed to its everlasting home, then shall the sons of men ponder on the events of my life; wonder and tremble, and tremble and wonder how such things should be.¹¹⁶

Wringhim begins to recognise the coalescence of matter and spirit as he nears the end of his pilgrimage, but he is resistant to this realisation:

I was become a terror to myself; or rather, my body and soul were become terrors to each other; and, had it been possible, I felt as if they would have gone to war. I dared not look at my face in a glass, for I shuddered at my own image and likeness.¹¹⁷

The terror of glimpsing Gil-Martin's hideous visage (which presumably mirrors Wringhim's degraded state), however, leads to hellish epiphany:

Involuntarily did I turn round at the request, and caught a half glance of his features. May no eye destined to reflect the beauties of the New Jerusalem inward upon the beatific soul, behold such a sight as mine then beheld! My immortal spirit, blood, and bones, were all withered at the blasting sight; and I arose and withdrew, with groanings which the pangs of death shall never wring from me.¹¹⁸

The fleshly eye and the heavenly eye are one and the same, and spirit withers with the body.

The physicality of Wringhim's sufferings comes to a fevered pitch in his second to last entry:

'My vitals have all been torn, and every faculty and feelings of my soul racked, and tormented into callous insensibility.'¹¹⁹ Wringhim's suicide is the ultimate culmination of his inability to

grasp the spiritual significance of corporeal life, and the uncanny preservation of his corpse underlines the embodied nature of his eternal damnation. His longings for '*utter oblivion*' and 'peace or rest' are never fulfilled, as the series of grave-disturbers continue the physical assault, fragmenting his body as Gil-Martin fragmented his consciousness.¹²⁰ While the mismatched descriptions of Wringhim's corpse are certainly part of the greater overall incongruity of the text, the shifting appearance also mirrors the scene in the weaver's cottage,

¹¹⁵ Ibid., p. 161.

¹¹⁶ Ibid., 80.

¹¹⁷ Ibid., pp. 156-57.

¹¹⁸ Ibid., p. 162.

¹¹⁹ Ibid., p. 165.

¹²⁰ Ibid., p. 126, p. 153.

wherein Wringhim's clothing is mysteriously changed in his sleep. The implication may be that Gil-Martin's power over Wringhim's body continues beyond the grave – the flesh remains demonically shiftable.

Section Conclusions

Confessions is particularly susceptible to the application of various scientific, Biblical, and folkloric paradigms – none of which are carried through to the exclusion of others. The scientific paradigms have been the focus of this chapter, as phrenology, physiognomy, dreaming, drunkenness, and double consciousness are also examined in Macnish's prose tales and medico-popular literature. There is no clear evidence to indicate that Macnish read or was even aware of Hogg's *Confessions*, and therefore the primary value of the identification of thematic commonalities is to illustrate that Hogg kept stride with a trained surgeon and medico-popular writer in his utilisation of scientific subject matter and had a sufficiently sophisticated understanding to turn that subject matter to his own purposes. Macnish is a particularly relevant figure through which to read the scientific themes in Hogg's writing, as he moved in the same literary circles and published medical texts designed for a popular readership.

The transformative nature of dreaming brings Mary Lee's mind and body closer to the divine in *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, but in *Confessions*, dreaming and drunkenness so transform Robert Wringhim as to bring damnation into the earthly sphere. His vision is not enlarged, but rather constricted, and the relationship between the corporeal body and the immaterial spirit is never realised. Macnish similarly appeals to retributive causality in *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* and *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, and a possible mutual line of influence is the didactic natural theology of the era. The corporealised subjectivity of Macnish's early periodical contributions is carried forward in his Blackwoodian prose tales; however, specific aspects of *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide* and his Blackwoodian prose tales may have been influenced by Hogg's portrayal of the Robert Wringhim's uncanny experience, and in particular, the strange affective relationship between the apparitional Mary Elliston and the confessional narrator and Colonel O'Shaughnessy's multiplitious dream vision are highly reminiscent of Hogg's text.

Macnish appeals to the phenomenological narrative as a method of spectatorship that evades both the self-effacing tendencies of enlightenment sympathy and the superficiality of

phrenological reductivism. Hogg's *Confessions* points to similar anxieties regarding spectatorship in modern society, and his utilisation of the phenomenological first-person narrative may also be an attempt to privilege the voice of the subaltern local and individual over that of the assimilating narrative of enlightenment. The explanatory ambiguity of the text similarly works against assimilation, as the characters' individual corporeal subjectivities are rendered in conflict but upon an equal plane of explanatory probability. In contrast, Macnish clearly differentiates between his subjective spectres and his devils in the flesh.

The Blackwoodian tale of terror, with its clinically precise descriptions of extreme psychological and physiological states, is a clear influence on both Hogg and Macnish, and the development of this narrative style may be related to the emphasis on inductive methodology at this time. In the early nineteenth century, moral philosophers, medical theorists, and phrenologists emphasised the importance of the narrative case study in forwarding both medical science and the science of the mind. The following section will more closely examine the role of the narrative case study in Hogg and Macnish's work and will draw upon more robust evidence of a dual line of influence between the Ettrick Shepherd and the Modern Pythagorean.

Section 3: Narratives of Science and Superstition

Introduction

In the summer of 1830, at the house of William Blackwood, Hogg and Macnish dined together, and according to a letter from Blackwood to his son, dated 18 June 1830, the conviviality was of Ambrosianae proportions:

The Professor and he [Hogg], with Mr Macnish from Glasgow (the author of the articles in 'Maga' signed "A Modern Pythagorean"), and Mr Aird (author of "Buy a Broom," &c.), dined with us on Thursday, and remained till near 2 o'clock in the morning. I never saw the Professor and Hogg in such force and spirits.¹

The 'Noctes' for August 1830 introduces the 'Modern Pythagorean', as well as 'Delta', and was possibly inspired by this dinner party. As discussed above, Macnish was wary of appearing as a character in the 'Noctes', since the people of Glasgow looked 'with an evil eye upon a medical man who has any thing to do with literature unless it be upon professional subjects'.² In the same letter dated 10 July 1830, Macnish tenuously grants Blackwood permission to print the 'Noctes' if they have already been written, 'for it would be out of the question that on my account the article should be spoilt', but expresses his desire that 'something could be said in the Noctes about the execrable absurdity of that doctrine, which supposes that a person cannot excel both in literature and professional subjects: the very idea is a disgrace to the intellect of the age'.³ Blackwood may not have been insensitive to his wishes, as an impassioned argument for the value of literary studies for the medical professional is presented in the 'Noctes':

North. Heavens! can any studies be idle in a physician – in a medical man – that inevitably lead to elevation of spirit, breathing into it tenderness and humanity? Will he be a less thoughtful visitant at the sick or dying bed, who from such studies has gathered knowledge of all the beatings of the human heart, all the workings of the human imagination, at such times so wild and so bewildering, aye, often even beyond the range of poetry, in those delirious dreams?

Shepherd. That's a truth. In the ancient warld, was na there but ae God for poetry, music, and medishin? and the ancients, tak ma word for't, saw far intill the mysterious

¹ Margaret Oliphant, *Annals of a Publishing House: William Blackwood and his Sons, Their Magazine and Friends*, 3 vols (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1897-1898), II, p. 98.

² Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 10 July 1830, NLS MS. 4028, fols 17-18.

³ Ibid.

connexions o' things in natur. Owre mony folk noo-a-days, forgets that the alliance atween sowle and body's stricker – though no unlike it – than that atween church and state. Let doctors learn a' they can o' baith – and hoo they are to do that without leeterature, philosophy, and poetry, as weel's as anatomy and mere medishin, surpasses my comprehenshun. Some doctors practeeze by a sort o' natural rumblegumshun, without ony knowledge either o' leeterature or ony thing else; and that accoonts for some itherwise unaccoontable kirkyards.⁴

These sentiments resonate loudly with the current scholarly movement towards narrative medicine, wherein physicians are encouraged to revalidate the subject in medical practice through careful attention to the narrative intricacies of each individual case: the idealisation of complete objectivity, begun with the Baconian revolution and fuelled by the seemingly infinite improvements in diagnostic technologies, tempered by a return to the ancient art of healing.⁵

In the context of early nineteenth-century Britain, the patient's narrative was vitally important to the diagnostic process, as evidence gathered from the patient's narrative was balanced with that gained from physical examination.⁶ As Julia Epstein argues in her survey of the history of the medical case study, while the patient's language was always important to physicians, 'not until the nineteenth century were these signs translated into particular techniques of notation and data organisation in patient histories'.⁷ Further, following the work of Thomas Laqueur, Epstein indicates that 'this increased focus on case history-writing coincided with a burgeoning of narrative forms in other cultural arenas; the eighteenth century in Europe witnessed in particular the birth of periodical journalism and of the novel'.⁸ Jason Tougaw takes up Epstein's argument in his study of the two-way influence between the medical case study and novelistic literary realism through the nineteenth and twentieth centuries; however, while the periodical press has been identified as a site for the diffusion of popular medical ideas, the relationship between the short fiction of the periodical press and the medical case study has yet to be fully explored.⁹ The first chapter of this section does not intend to fully examine this relationship, but rather opens up the line of enquiry in order to explore the potential influence of Macnish's popular medical works and fictional tales on

⁴ 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LI', *Blackwood's*, 28 (August 1830, Part II), 383-436, (pp. 418-19).

⁵ For a critical introduction to narrative medicine, see Rita Charon, *Narrative Medicine: Honoring the Stories of Illness* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006).

⁶ J. M. Caldwell, *Literature and Medicine in Nineteenth-Century Britain, From Mary Shelley to George Elliot* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), p. 8.

⁷ Julia Epstein, *Altered Conditions: Disease, Medicine, and Storytelling* (New York: Routledge, 1995), p. 36.

⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 59.

⁹ Jason Daniel Tougaw, *Strange Cases: The Medical Case History and the British Novel* (New York: Routledge, 2006); J. A. V. Chapple, *Science and Literature in the Nineteenth Century* (London: Macmillan, 1986), p. 5; Lawrence Rothfield, *Vital Signs: Medical Realism in Nineteenth Century Fiction* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992), p. 9.

Hogg's short prose tales, 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' and 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic'. In the course of this examination, the term 'exemplary narrative' will be used in reference to narratives by Hogg that have strong resonances with medical case studies. Hogg's exemplary narratives are explicitly used to illustrate, (and often covertly used to undermine), a philosophical position and include minute descriptions of physiological and psychological phenomena. In contrast to the preceding two sections, this section will follow a natural chronology, and chapter six will question why Macnish chose to use 'James Hogg' as a *nom de guerre* for his prose tale 'A Psychological Curiosity', published in *The Scottish Annual* (1836).

Chapter 5: Disembodied Souls and Exemplary Narratives

***Blackwood's* and the Narrative Case Study**

In August 1830 an editorial correspondent to *The Lancet* criticised a perceived breach of medical ethics in *Blackwood's*. Although the first chapter from the series, *Passages from the Diary of a late Physician* (1830-1837), is said to bear the 'indubitable marks of fiction', the correspondent feared that the disclosure of '*the sacred secrets which are communicated to us in perfect confidence by our patients*' to the general public might lead to the distrust of physicians.¹ Samuel Warren (1807-1877), the anonymous author of the series (and a lawyer rather than a physician by trade), responded by pointing out that *The Lancet* published narrative case studies with a similar level of detail and was often found in the hands of the interested lay-person.² The periodical press in the early nineteenth century was a site of dynamic exchange between men of science and men of letters, and *Blackwood's* was a particularly rich site of expression for medical ideas. Warren's series is introduced in the same number in which the 'Modern Pythagorean' makes his Ambrosianae debut, and the dialogue praising the pursuit of the literary arts by medical men is most probably also intended to bolster the ideology of Warren's series. The ability of Warren's late physician to treat his patients hinges on his ability to mediate complex social and domestic narratives and to understand the powerful role of the imagination in healing or harming the corporeal body. In his series Warren appeals to what Morrison and Baldick term, the 'unhealthy public curiosity provoked by the sequestration of madness, disease, and criminality into enclosed realms', as well as to the emphasis placed on narrative case studies in British medicine at this time.³ The collection of narrative case studies may be compared to the antiquarian collection of singular objects, and both are part of the Romantic ethos of *Blackwood's*.⁴ The early nineteenth century was the age of the case study, as the ideology of Enlightenment empiricism continued

¹ 'Blackwood's Magazine v. the Secrets of the Medical Profession', *The Lancet*, 14 (28 August 1830), 878-79, (p. 878).

² Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a late Physician. Chap. III. Note to the Editor, Intriguing and Madness, The Broken Heart', *Blackwood's*, 28 (October 1830), 608-23. Warren appears to have had some first-hand knowledge of medicine. See, C. R. B. Dunlop, 'Warren, Samuel (1807-1877)', in *DNB* <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/28792>> [accessed 1 March 2010].

³ Robert Morrison and Chris Baldick, 'Introduction', in *Tales of Terror from Blackwood's Magazine* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995; repr. 1999), p. xvi; Caldwell, pp. 1-8, pp. 143-55.

⁴ As Susan Manning explains, antiquarianism was both 'highly empirical and a counter-Enlightenment drive', see 'Antiquarianism, the Scottish Science of Man, and the emergence of modern disciplinarily', in *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, pp. 57-76, (p. 62).

alongside the development of a voyeuristic interest in unusual, and potentially irrational, subjective experiences, reminiscent of the primitive, supernatural past.

Dugald Stewart was instrumental in promoting the use of narrative cases in philosophical discourse. Following on from the work of Thomas Reid, Stewart encouraged the application of the inductive/*a posteriori* method, as outlined by Francis Bacon in his *Novum Organum* (1620) and used by Newton in his experiments on the physical world, to the science of the mind. Past systems that attempted to explain the essence of mind and its intercourse with the external world, such as the Cartesian theory of animal spirits and David Hartley's theory of brain particle vibration, were dismissed as speculative 'metaphysical romances'.⁵ In response to the charge that one cannot perform experiments in the science of the mind, Stewart appeals to narrative:

[T]he records of thought, preserved in those volumes which fill up our libraries; what are they but *experiments*, by which Nature illustrates, for our instruction, on her own grand scale, the varied range of Man's intellectual faculties, and the omnipotence of Education in fashioning his mind?⁶

Narratives are represented as externalised subjectivities, expanding the database of human experience from which general laws might be derived. The satirical comments addressed to Hogg in *Blackwood's* highlight the application of Baconian inductive methodology to complex human experience:

You, it seems, are "the new animal" which the gentleman singles out to lecture upon, – your inspiration is the gas which he is to analyse, – you, James, are the rough diamond whose angles he proposes to describe with mathematical exactness.⁷

Stewart was not naïve about the complexities of applying Baconian reasoning to the science of the mind or medicine. In drawing a comparison with the use of medical case narratives by physicians, he notes:

So deeply rooted in the constitution of the mind is that disposition on which philosophy is grafted, that the simplest narrative of the most illiterate observer involves more or less

⁵ *Philosophical Essays*, p. iv.

⁶ *Ibid.*, p. xlv. Stewart is responding to Francis Jeffrey's 1804 review of his *Account of the Life and Writing of Thomas Reid* (1802). For extracts from this debate, see Philip Flynn, *Enlightenment Scotland* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1992), pp. 76-88.

⁷ [John Wilson or J. G. Lockhart], 'Letters of Timothy Tickler to various Literary Characters. Letter II. – To the Ettrick Shepherd', *Blackwood's*, 2 (March 1818), 654-56, (p. 654).

of hypothesis⁸

In regard to the science of the mind, the comparison of knowledge gained through introspection to knowledge gained through the narratives of others is recommended as the only way to work towards general laws:

The truth is, that on this subject every writer, whose speculations are at all worthy of notice, must draw his chief materials from within; and that it is only by comparing to the conclusions of *different* writers, and subjecting all of them to the test of our personal experience, that we can hope to separate the essential principles of the human constitution from the unsuspected effects of education and of temperament; or to apply with advantage, to our particular circumstances, the combined results of our reading and of our reflections.⁹

In the preface to *The Philosophy of Sleep*, Macnish writes that he has appealed to ‘his own observation, and to the experience of other writers’ and alludes to the empirically based phrenological theory that underlies the text.¹⁰

The subject matter and style of *The Philosophy of Sleep* does justice to a member of the Blackwoodian coven. Macnish began contemplating his work on sleep in September 1828, and in June 1829 sent an early manuscript to William Blackwood:

As I am writing you at any rate, I take the opportunity of sending you [even] in their present very imperfect state my papers on sleep; you will see from the plan which accompanies them there are various subjects which yet require to be treated of. I am anxious to know how you like the way in which the thing is done – whether you think it sufficiently popular in its character. Probably the only parts you will care about reading are the sections on night-mare, on the phenomena of Dreaming and on the Prophetic power of Dreams. The section marked No. 2 must be re-written, and I daresay will be a good one. You can keep them for a month or six weeks and let me know your opinion of them. In sending you them in their present state I am hardly doing myself justice, but you will make allowances for an unfinished work.¹¹

As Macnish’s letter indicates, the phenomena of altered-states of consciousness were suited to Blackwood’s tastes and frequently featured in his magazine within the infamous tales of terror, the *Noctes* dialogues, and, at times, in stand alone narrative cases. For example, in the chapter ‘On the Prophetic Power of Dreaming’, Macnish cites a case first presented in *Blackwood’s* in

⁸ *Elements*, II, p. 443.

⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 485-86.

¹⁰ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), pp. vii-viii.

¹¹ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 5 September 1828, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49; Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 3 June 1829, NLS MS 4025, fols 124-25.

June 1826 as ‘Remarkable Dream’, addressed ‘To the Editor of Blackwood’s Magazine’. In the case, a young gentleman’s aunt wakes up in terror that a boat is sinking three times in one night, and thus forbids her nephew to attend a fishing party he had arranged for the following morning. True to the dream, a violent storm arises, and the boat and the fishing party within it are lost.¹² Macnish presents the case as one of great interest, but nevertheless, ‘like all other instances of this kind, this also must be referred to chance’.¹³

The inclusion of such cases in *Blackwood’s* is in the tradition of the first psychological magazine, initiated in 1783 by the German author and editor, Karl Philipp Moritz (1756-1793).¹⁴ Moritz’s *Gnothi Sauton, oder Magazin zur Erfahrungsseelenkunde für Gelehrte and Ungelernte*, i.e. *Know Thyself, or a Magazine for Empirical Psychology for Scholars and Laymen* disavowed theoretical systems and was devoted to the collection of narrative case reports. Contributors included ‘lawyers, teachers and clergymen as well as physicians, and their writings covered a broad spectrum of topics: case reports of abnormal or unusual behaviour, the structure of language, pedagogy, “actions without consciousness of motives, or the power of obscure ideas”, and the relationship between psychology and religion’.¹⁵ The magazine was founded upon the idea that ‘[a] theory of mind will only be available to us once a mass of data has been accumulated, in which human nature will be reflected’.¹⁶

Sir Alexander Crichton (1763-1856) was the first to provide English translations of many of Moritz’s cases in *An Inquiry into the Nature and Origin of Mental Derangement* (1798) – a text highly influenced by the common sense philosophers.¹⁷ In his chapter on trance, Macnish utilises a case from the “Psychological Magazine” (Crichton’s short-hand translation for Moritz’s magazine), which appears to have been extracted from Crichton’s text.¹⁸ In the case, following a ‘violent nervous disorder’, a young female exhibits the signs of corporeal demise and preparations are made for her burial. However, on the day of the funeral,

¹² ‘Remarkable Dream’, *Blackwood’s*, 19 (June 1826), 736; *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), pp. 109-11.

¹³ *Ibid.*, p. 111. The second edition of Macnish’s text includes a second case of extracted from *Blackwood’s*, as well as a case from *Fraser’s (The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), pp. 104-05, pp. 182-83).

¹⁴ Tougaw references *Blackwood’s* as a magazine that widely circulated case studies (*Strange Cases: The Medical Case History and the British Novel*, p. 51).

¹⁵ Michael Shepherd, ‘Psychiatric Journals and the Evolution of Psychological Medicine’, in *Medical Journals and Medical Knowledge*, ed. by W. F. Bynum, Stephen Lock and Roy Porter (London: Routledge, 1992), pp. 188-206, (p. 190).

¹⁶ Matthew Bell, *The German Tradition of Psychology in Literature and Thought, 1700-1840* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), p. 93.

¹⁷ Richard Hunter and Ida MacAlpine, *Three Hundred Years of Psychiatry, 1535-1860: A History Presented in Selected English Texts* (London: Oxford University Press, 1963), p. 559.

¹⁸ Alexander Crichton, *An Inquiry into the Nature and Origin of Mental Derangement. Comprehending a Concise System of the Physiology and Pathology of the Human Mind and a History of the Passions and their Effects*, 2 vols (London: Cadell and Davies, 1798), II, pp. 87-89; *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), pp. 228-30.

Just as the people were about to nail on the lid of the coffin, a kind of perspiration was observed to appear on the surface of her body. It grew greater every moment, and at last a kind of convulsive motion was observed in the hands and feet of the corpse. A few minutes after, during which time fresh signs of returning life appeared, she at once opened her eyes and uttered a most pitiable shriek.¹⁹

Similar to Dr. Dedimus Dunderhead's eager collection of Stadt's account of his sensations 'at the instant of coming alive' in 'The Metempsychosis', the young woman's account of her experience is considered 'extremely remarkable' and as 'a curious and authentic addition to psychology.'²⁰ The young woman claims to have remained conscious of her surroundings during the course of her trance-state, yet was unable to call her body into action:

She tried to cry, but her soul was without power, and could not act on her body. She had the contradictory feeling that she was in her body, and yet not in it, at one and the same time. It was equally impossible for her to stretch out her arm, or to open her eyes, or to cry, although she continually endeavoured to do so. The internal anguish of her mind, was however, at its utmost height when the funeral hymns began to be sung, and when the lid of the coffin was about to be nailed on. The thought that she was to be buried alive, was the one that gave activity to her soul, and caused it to operate on her corporeal frame.²¹

In Hogg's 'Some Terrible Letters from Scotland', published in *The Metropolitan* in April 1832, Andrew Ker experiences the horrors of near burial alive after apparent death from cholera. His description of the sensations he experienced while his coffin was being nailed shut is highly reminiscent of the above case report (and certainly fits the bill of the Blackwoodian tale of terror despite its publication elsewhere):

all the while I had a sort of half-consciousness of what was going on, yet had not power to move a muscle in my whole frame. I was certain that my soul had not departed quite away, although my body was seized with this sudden torpor, and refused to act. It was a sort of dream, out of which I was struggling to awake, but could not; and I felt as if a fall on the floor, or a sudden jerk of any kind, would once more set my blood a-flowing, and restore animation.²²

Eventually, the 'heart-rending shriek' of his sweetheart awakens him 'from the sleep of death',

¹⁹ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 229.

²⁰ 'The Metempsychosis', p. 529; *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 229.

²¹ *Ibid.*, p. 230.

²² James Hogg, 'Some Terrible Letters from Scotland', in *Tales of Love and Mystery*, ed. by David Groves (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1985), pp. 176-93, (p. 179).

and he attributes this to the ‘electrical sympathy’ between loved ones.²³ Two additional letters follow, each written by a different correspondent, and all three letters deal with very real contemporary issue of the spreading cholera epidemic in Scotland.²⁴ The ‘border tale’, related in Hogg’s notes to *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, in which a lady is re-animated from apparent death by the jarring of her coffin upon the branches of a tree, as well as Mary Lee’s re-animation within the main body of the poem, also resonate with the above case and thus illustrate the commonalities between Hogg’s traditional narratives and the case studies of altered-states of consciousness which circulated at this time.²⁵

Moir advised Macnish throughout his preparation of *The Philosophy of Sleep*, and in a letter dated 11 May 1829, suggests that he ‘give as many curious illustrations as possible, that being the way to make the book a popular one’. In particular, for the chapter on the prophetic power of dreaming, he recommends Sir Walter Scott’s ‘illustration of Grizzy Oldbuck’s dream’ in the notes to the new edition of *The Antiquary*, which was ‘now going the round of the Newspapers’, and he also recommends Dr. Hibbert and Dr. Alderson’s texts on the subject of apparitions.²⁶ Sir Walter Scott’s *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft*, published in the same year as *The Philosophy of Sleep*, was similarly devoted to presenting ‘narratives of remarkable cases’, and includes some of the same cases as Macnish’s text.²⁷ Both authors take a purely rationalistic view of apparently supernatural experience that is in stark contrast to Hogg’s treatment of the supernatural in *The Shepherd’s Calendar* series for *Blackwood’s Magazine*.²⁸ For example, ‘George Dobson’s Strange Expedition to Hell’, first published in

²³ Ibid., p. 180.

²⁴ On Hogg and cholera, see Joan McCausland, ‘James Hogg and the 1831-32 Cholera Epidemic’, *SHW*, 10 (1999), 40-47. Moir and Macnish were actively involved in the public debate regarding the contagious nature of cholera. Moir published a pamphlet, *Practical Observations on Malignant Cholera, as that Disease Is Now Exhibiting Itself in Scotland* (1832), which argued for the contagious nature of the disease, and Macnish supported his friend’s work through the provision of numerous case studies and the promotion of his work in Glasgow newspapers (Letters of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 15 February 1832, 21 February 1832, 6 March 1832, 29 March 1832, 4 April 1832, 8 April 1832, 10 April 1832, 13 April 1832, 18 January 1833, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50).

²⁵ As discussed in Chapter 1, *The Pilgrims of the Sun* was used as the poetic headpiece to Macnish’s chapter on trance. The case cited by Macnish of ‘the celebrated Lady Russel, who only escaped premature internment by the affectionate prudence of her husband’ also resonates with Hogg’s ‘border tale’ (*The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 224).

²⁶ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 136.

²⁷ For example, both Macnish and Scott present the narrative of Christoph Friedrich Nicolai, the Berlin publisher. Nicolai, first read his ‘Memoir on the Appearance of Spectres or Phantoms occasioned by Disease, with Psychological Remarks’ to the Royal Society of Berlin on the 28th of February 1799, and after a translation of this narrative was included in Ferriar’s *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions* (1813), it soon became a standard narrative case study for any person with a theory of apparitions to interpret and analyse (*The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 133; *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), pp. 241-75; *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft* (1830), pp. 21-22).

²⁸ Jill Rubenstein, ‘Varieties of Explanation in *The Shepherd’s Calendar*’, *SHW*, 4 (1993), 1-11.

Blackwood's in May 1827, reads like the remarkable case studies of prophetic self-predicted death that will be later included in *The Philosophy of Sleep*, but Hogg's tale allows for both primitive/supernatural and modern/rational readings while evidencing a keen knowledge of both realms of explanation.

The tale is prefaced with an introductory deprecation of philosophers who write about sleep and dreaming:

No, no; the philosopher knows nothing about either; and if he says he does, I entreat you not to believe him. He does not know what mind is; even his own mind, to which one would think he has the most direct access; far less can he estimate the operations and powers of that of any other intelligent being. He does not even know, with all his subtlety, whether it be a power distinct from his body, or essentially the same, and only incidentally and temporarily endowed with different qualities [...] He is baffled; for consciousness refuses the intelligence.²⁹

Metaphysical introspection is dismissed as ineffective for studying the 'origin, the manner of continuance, and the time and mode of breaking up of the union between soul and body' which are 'undiscoverable by our natural faculties'.³⁰ However, by contemplating 'not the theory of dreams, but the dreams themselves', even the 'unlettered' mind may effectively study these complex phenomena.³¹ Both 'a distinct existence of the soul' in sound sleep and death and the union between body and soul, matter and mind, during incomplete sleep and waking life are advocated.³² Hogg's narrator attributes mundane origin to dreams related to the 'occupation of men':

I account nothing of any dream that relates to the actions of the day; the person is not then sound asleep; there is no division between matter and mind, but they are mingled together in a sort of chaos – what a farmer would call compost – fermenting and disturbing one another.³³

However, the exemplary narrative related represents 'the most extraordinary professional dream on record', in which a coach driver, George Dobson, dreams about driving to hell. He is there forced to sign a contract to return the next day at noon.³⁴ Whether the reader should

²⁹ James Hogg, 'Dreams and Apparitions. Containing George Dobson's Expedition to Hell, and The Souters of Selkirk', in *The Shepherd's Calendar*, ed. by Douglas Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995; repr. 2002), pp. 118-41, (p. 118).

³⁰ Ibid., p. 118.

³¹ Ibid., pp. 118-19.

³² Ibid., p. 119.

³³ Ibid., p. 119.

³⁴ Ibid., p. 119.

‘account nothing’ of this dream is uncertain. When George awakes, his wife is unable to convince him that all that passed occurred:

while lying snug in his bed; while the tempest without was roaring with great violence, and which circumstance may perhaps account for the rushing and deafening sound which astounded him so much in hell.³⁵

The continued connection between George’s dreaming consciousness and the sensory impressions interacting with his corporeal body is emphasised, thus subverting the possibility that George’s soul literally travelled to hell. However, this rational explanation of his experience is then subverted by a series of events that appear highly improbable unless one allows for the supernatural communication of ideas not based in previous experience to have occurred in George’s dream. The persons populating George’s hell, unbeknownst to George in the waking world, have recently met their demise. The physical evidence is ambiguous. The ‘three red spots’ found on his throat upon waking appear to evidence the interaction between the hand of hell’s porter and his corporeal body.³⁶ He then dies ‘after a terrible struggle, precisely within a few minutes of twelve o’clock’.³⁷

The strict division between the mundane and transcendent, between primitive supernatural and modern rational explanation, is frustrated by the duplicity of the exemplary narrative. The superstitious viewed the fulfillment of prophetic dreams of self-predicted death as proof of the separate existence of the soul.³⁸ Medical writers examined the same phenomena as evidence for the power of the imagination on the corporeal body. The tale often recited in ‘the shepherd’s cot’ transmogrifies into the domain of the physician.³⁹ Macnish reasons that in cases of self-predicted death, ‘a visionary communication, by acting fatally upon the mind, might be the means of occasioning its own fulfillment’.⁴⁰ Similar to Dr. Wood’s actions in Hogg’s narrative, he recommends distracting the person’s attention until the fatal hour of predicted death is past. In his chapter on the ‘Prophetic Power of Dreams’, he declares the belief that dreams may give ‘insight into futurity’ to be ‘singularly

³⁵ Ibid., p. 124.

³⁶ Ibid., p. 125.

³⁷ Ibid., p. 126.

³⁸ For a discussion of the dual scientific and supernatural explanations of a similar case of self-predicted death, see [David Uwins], ‘*Insanity and Madhouses* [by Bakewell, Hill Sharpe, Tuke]’, 15 (July 1816), 387-418, (p. 398). Agatha Bell’s illness in Hogg’s *The Three Perils of Woman* (1823) is another example of self-predicted death, for which scientific and supernatural explanations have been proposed by modern critics.

³⁹ ‘George Dobson’s Expedition to Hell’, in *The Shepherd’s Calendar*, p. 119.

⁴⁰ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 115.

unphilosophical'.⁴¹ However, he previously used three of the cases cited in this chapter to exemplify 'the influence of supernatural agency' in his 'Ghosts and Dreams' essay for *The Emmet*.⁴² Duplicity was not unique to Hogg's fictional exemplary narratives. In their new rational framing, these cases are said to illustrate the pathological power of the belief and extraordinary temporal coincidence, rather than supernatural intervention.

Textual Transactions

Unsurprisingly, Macnish appears to have been aware of Hogg's interests in the phenomena of sleep and dreaming. In a letter to Blackwood dated 24 October 1830, Macnish requests that a parcel left at Blackwood's shop be delivered to 'the Shepherd by the first opportunity'.⁴³ *The Philosophy of Sleep* was in press by 2nd September 1830 and was available to the public by the beginning of October 1830, and according to this chronology, it is probable that the parcel was the first edition of the text.⁴⁴ Macnish's work on sleep may well have been a topic of conversation during the dinner party at Blackwood's in June 1830, as Macnish was moving towards the final stages of completing the manuscript at this time.⁴⁵ However, it is impossible to infer whether Hogg may have requested a copy of the text or if Macnish offered it as a present unprompted.

Further evidence to support the theory that Macnish sent Hogg a copy of his text may be found in Hogg's short prose tale, 'Aunt Susan', first published in *Fraser's Magazine* in July 1831. In the tale Hogg provides a verbatim citation of his phrenologically based explanation of sleep talking:

She was a great talker in her sleep, a singular propensity which I do not comprehend, but which the ingenious M'Nish would call a distribution of sensorial power to the organs of speech, by which means they do not sympathize in the general slumber, but remain in a state fit for being called into action by particular trains of ideas.⁴⁶

This extract shows that Hogg was familiar with and most probably had access to Macnish's

⁴¹ Ibid., p. 101.

⁴² 'Ghosts and Dreams', p. 297.

⁴³ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 24 October 1830, NLS, MS 4028, fols 27-28.

⁴⁴ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 2 September 1830, NLS MS 4028, fols 21-22; *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 178.

⁴⁵ Blackwood appears to have expressed interest in publishing *The Philosophy of Sleep* (Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, NLS MS 4028, fols 19-20).

⁴⁶ James Hogg, 'Aunt Susan', *Fraser's*, 3 (July 1831), 720-26, (pp. 723-24). For the source of this citation, see *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 168.

text at this time, and further, the tale illustrates how Hogg might utilise the phrenological theory of sleep in his fiction.

In the tale the Border beauty, Vear Burgess, sets out to prove to her father, John Burgess, that her much despised Aunt Susan murdered her own late husband (Vear's uncle by marriage). However, her progress is thwarted, as John is involved in a long-standing love affair with his sister-in-law, which has reached new heights with the deaths of their respective spouses. Aunt Susan's propensity to sleep talk enables Vear to uncover her probable involvement in the murder of her uncle, as she serendipitously discovers that the phrases that Aunt Susan repeatedly utters in her sleep are the same that the suspect woman was heard to utter on the night of the murder in Edinburgh. Interestingly, Vear appears to take on the role of Gil-Martin in the tale – not pushing Aunt Susan to murderous acts – but manipulating her guilt to unbearable levels. She finds that 'by whispering some of the words into her ear which her associate in murder was heard to utter', she could bring her 'to talk of the murder of the old man in her sleep'.⁴⁷ As Macnish indicates, this type of manipulation is not impossible, as '[s]ometimes the faculties are so far awake, that we can manage to carry on a conversation with the individual; and extract from him the most hidden secrets of his soul'.⁴⁸ Vear brings Aunt Susan's guilt to a fevered pitch in waking life by declaring that she has seen 'the ghost of a murdered man', and her description of his appearance (based of course on the appearance of her uncle after his murder), causes her aunt to fall into a fit.⁴⁹ John Burgess is witness to the scene, but takes no action, and it is evident to the reader, though not to Vear at this point, that her father was the accomplice in the murder. The guilt of both John and Susan is finally brought to an unbearable level as the apparition of Vear's mother comes to haunt the house. The apparition is in fact Vear herself, who bears a remarkable resemblance to her late mother, but the only requisite reality is the belief of murderers. Reminiscent of Wringhim's physical transformation upon meeting Gil-Martin, Susan and John are so affected by the first appearance of the apparition that '[t]heir countenances were so much altered the next day, that their own servants did not know them'.⁵⁰ Finally, in desperation they flee from the haunted house, returning to Edinburgh, only to be apprehended and executed for their murderous deeds. In describing their return to Edinburgh, the narrator explains, 'There is undoubtedly a strong propensity in some minds inducing their possessors to revisit scenes in which they were

⁴⁷ 'Aunt Susan', p. 725.

⁴⁸ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 169.

⁴⁹ 'Aunt Susan', p. 720.

⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 726.

involved in, or witnessed, the deepest horrors.’⁵¹ This geographical revisitation parallels Aunt Susan’s mental revisitation of the murder scene in her sleep, and Vear’s actions only catalyse the transformation of mentality into reality.

Sleep is a transformative state in Hogg’s corpus, but the transformation can take strikingly opposite forms. In *The Queen’s Wake* and *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, Kilmeny and Mary Lee’s dream visions allow for an expansion of consciousness, bringing them into closer sympathy with the divine omnipotence of God. In contrast, the phrenological theory of sleep, as overtly utilised in ‘Aunt Susan’ and arguably drawn upon in *Confessions*, provides a model of sleep that constricts consciousness. This constriction involves a narrowing of perception in waking life, which may metaphorically parallel the narrowing of perception resultant upon a purely rational worldview.

While the citation in ‘Aunt Susan’ is the only overt reference to Macnish in Hogg’s corpus, Karl Miller reads Hogg’s ‘Strange Letter of a Lunatic’ as a re-hashing of the material of *Confessions* ‘in the light of the subject-matter of doubleness as it had developed in the six years since that novel appeared, and, in particular, as it had figured in the work of someone who could almost be called his disciple’. His implication is that Hogg’s use of the double loses originality and become generically mechanical. Further, he conjectures that the transmogrifications of ‘On the Separate Existence of the Soul’ may have been ‘assisted by memories of Macnish’s ‘Metempsychosis’’.⁵² The following sections expand upon Miller’s precursory reading in light of a broader reading of Macnish’s biography and corpus. First, however, both authors’ metamorphoses from Blackwoodians into Fraserians will be examined.

The Advent of *Fraser’s Magazine*

Despite their apparently convivial meeting at Blackwood’s table in June of 1830, both Macnish and Hogg soon found reasons to redirect their loyalties. *Fraser’s Magazine for Town and Country* (1830-1882) entered the literary arena in February 1830 under the editorship of William Maginn (1794-1842) – a former Blackwoodian who, like Hogg and Macnish, found that his once hailed contributions were no longer deemed appropriate for inclusion in the pages of *Maga*.⁵³ The decidedly more flippant *Fraser’s* was published in London, but ‘set out

⁵¹ Ibid., p. 726.

⁵² *Cockburn’s Millennium*, p. 207, p. 208.

⁵³ For background, see Miriam M. H. Thrall, *Rebellious Fraser’s: Nol Yorke’s Magazine in the Days of Maginn, Thackeray, and Carlyle* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1934).

to rival *Blackwood's* and to have a Scottish flavour'.⁵⁴

Initially Macnish expressed his disapproval of *Fraser's* and was appalled that Moir intended to contribute. His disapproval appears to be fuelled by loyalty to *Blackwood's* as well as by a persistent fear of lowering his literary reputation by appearing in what he considered to be paltry publications.⁵⁵ As he explains to Moir in a letter of 24 January 1830,

It is my wish to appear nowhere but in Blackwood, and that only occasionally; and never, except when I can do so with some credit to myself. [...] A man's name is his own peculiar property, and ought to be as dear to him as the affections of his mistress, and cherished with equal solicitude and care.⁵⁶

By this time, both Henry Glassford Bell of the *Edinburgh Literary Journal* and David Blackie of the *Edinburgh Literary Gazette* and the *Edinburgh Evening Post* had angered Macnish in turn by presumptuously promoting his name as a contributor to their respective publications. In November 1828, just prior to the inaugural number of his journal, Bell approached Macnish through Thomas Atkinson (1799-1833), and although Macnish claims to have 'refused point blank' to contribute, three days after their meeting the *Scots Times* advertised him as a contributor along with several other individuals, 'most of them asses'.⁵⁷ Macnish was sufficiently upset to publish a contradiction in the *Glasgow Herald* and was then horrified to find that some of his fellow Blackwoodians, and in particular, Wilson and Hogg, deigned the *Edinburgh Literary Journal* worthy of their pens. On the 10th of December 1828, he wrote to Blackwood:

[W]hat was my horror and amazement at beholding a long poem by the professor in Bell's Journal, and a statement that he and Hogg were to furnish articles for the Christmas number, as Bell calls it, of the work! I know not what to make of the thing at all, and never in the whole course of my life did I feel so completely nonplussed and bamboozled. To me it is wholly inexplicable, your distinguished friend has doubtless reasons of his own for the proceedings.⁵⁸

As Gillian Hughes explains in her biography, the *Edinburgh Literary Journal* treated Hogg with a degree of respect that was often lacking in *Blackwood's* and eagerly courted him as a

⁵⁴ *James Hogg: A Life*, p. 233.

⁵⁵ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 18 January 1830, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

⁵⁶ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 24 January 1830, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49; *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 160.

⁵⁷ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 13 November 1828, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49; *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 115.

⁵⁸ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 10 December 1828, NLS MS 4022, fols 107-08; Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 2 December 1828, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

contributor. Hogg was ‘well aware that the new periodical was a thorn in Blackwood’s side’ and repaid Bell’s compliment by sending contributions despite lack of payment.⁵⁹ Macnish, however, appears to have maintained his personal grudge against Bell, and when an unfavorable review of *The Philosophy of Sleep* was later published in *The Spectator*, he presumed that it was scribed by a ‘malignant and revengeful’ Henry Bell.⁶⁰

Similar altercations later took place between Macnish and Blackie.⁶¹ Despite having given permission to Moir to send his poem, ‘A Hebrew Melody’, to Blackie for publication in the *Edinburgh Literary Gazette*, Macnish was enraged when Blackie advertised his name as a contributor in the newspapers in January 1830.⁶² Moir attributed Macnish’s rather illogical reaction to a current bout of illness, as ‘[s]ickness again appears to have produced its usually irritating effects on Macnish’s mind’.⁶³ Blackie, however, offended a second time later in the year, and Macnish reacted similarly. Following this dispute, Macnish commented on Moir’s decision to contribute to *Fraser’s* in a letter to Blackwood dated 26 March 1830:

I can see plainly that he is injuring his literary name greatly by this squandering away of his pieces in such a variety of sources; and I know well that if I submit to have myself puffed about in all the vile Journals & Gazettes of the day I must be dished in six months.⁶⁴

Two days later Macnish reiterated his concerns to Moir himself in correspondence.⁶⁵

While Macnish strove to maintain his status as a Blackwoodian contributor, Blackwood appears to have become increasingly unreceptive. From his first contribution in May 1826 until the beginning of 1829, ‘A Modern Pythagorean’ is signed on eleven prose tales and five poems within Maga’s pages. After this period of productivity, ill health prevented Macnish from writing for much of 1829, and any free time away from his professional duties the following year was primarily devoted to finishing *The Philosophy of*

⁵⁹ *James Hogg: A Life*, pp. 213-15, (p. 215).

⁶⁰ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 28 October 1830, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49. Similarly, Macnish writes to Blackwood on 24 October 1830 in regards to Bell and *The Spectator*: ‘It is amusing to hear such an ass braying about science; but his malice is something more than amusing, and to me is exceedingly disgusting’ (NLS MS 4028, fols 27-28).

⁶¹ For contextual information on David Blackie, see *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 153.

⁶² Letters of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 30 November 1829, 24 December 1829, 18 January 1830, 24 January 1830, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49; *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 148-62.

⁶³ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 158. Macnish was bedridden with a fever for the first months of 1829 and himself feared that ‘my bodily ailments have communicated a morbid irritability to my mind’ (Ibid. p. 130). In October Macnish was finally well enough to visit Moir in Musselburgh, but Moir was shocked at the effect of his illness on his appearance (Ibid., p. 147). In the first weeks of January 1830, Macnish again suffered from what was deemed an inflammatory fever.

⁶⁴ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 26 March 1830, NLS MS 4028, fols 15-16.

⁶⁵ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 28 March 1830, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

Sleep. The publication of his work on sleep on the 1st of October 1830 allowed him to once again turn his attention to short fiction, and on the 24th he sent Blackwood the tale ‘Punch and Judy’, the ‘first tale I have written for two years’.⁶⁶ As he indicates in his letter accompanying the tale, a ‘large nose’ again becomes the focus, but he insists that ‘it is quite different in conception and execution’ from ‘The Man with the Nose’. This claim to novelty is, however, largely unfounded, as once again, Macnish produces a first-person narrative of a curious reaction to a strange physiognomy, replete with figurative descriptions of long trains of associated mental imagery, the absurdities of which are enhanced by progressive drunkenness. The main narrative is framed by a stagecoach journey in which an amiable young man relates a tale of a ‘psychological curiosity’ to the narrator, but his tale is cut short when he alights from the coach. The abrupt ending, which cuts off at the point wherein the young man is attempting to explain the ‘psychological curiosity’, appears to be purposeful in this case and echoes his prior observation in the tale that, ‘[t]here is, in truth, my dear sir, no accounting for such metaphysical phenomenon’, and therefore, ‘[w]e must just take them as we find them, and be contented to know the effect while we remain in ignorance of the cause’.⁶⁷ However, the fragmentary nature of Macnish’s next tale, ‘Who Murdered Begbie?’, was not purposeful, but was rather the result of an inability to bring the narrative to completion. On 4 November 1830 Macnish wrote to Blackwood to request that he return ‘Punch and Judy’ to him, so that he might utilise the narrative framing of the stagecoach to preserve the unfinished tale:

On the event of my present tale foiling me I will make another passenger to enter the stage coach at Hamilton, and commence giving me a new story which shall be broken off just as the coach arrives at Glasgow – in the same way as the former passenger’s Tale was interrupted by his going out at Hamilton. I think you will agree with me that this is the best way of preserving the Fragment if I should be unable to finish it.⁶⁸

According to Macnish, Blackwood initially responded favorably to ‘Punch and Judy’, but the conjoined tales of ‘The Stage Coach’ (which included the fragment that would eventually be published separately in *Fraser’s* as ‘Who Murdered Begbie?’) was not published in *Blackwood’s*.

Macnish’s letters to Blackwood at this time have an air of mounting paranoia and agitation, and his letter of 24th January 1831 expresses his fear that his ‘papers are now not very acceptable’ and that he will be ‘set down as a confirmed mannerist who can only dance to

⁶⁶ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 24 October 1830, NLS MS 4028, fols 27-28.

⁶⁷ Robert Macnish, ‘Punch and Judy’, *Fraser’s*, 3 (April 1831), 350-54, (pp. 350-51).

⁶⁸ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 4 November 1830, NLS MS 4028, fols 29-32.

one tune'.⁶⁹ As such, he informs Blackwood that he has written a paper in an entirely different vein, and

If this paper does not suit Maga I am afraid I am good for nothing now as a writer, for I did it in a very happy mood and it must be taken as a favourable specimen of my present state of workmanship.⁷⁰

'A Singular Passage in my Own Life', much like *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide* (1827) and Hogg's *Confessions*, was intended to be read as an authentic first-hand narrative. Macnish's letter continues:

I have done every thing in my power to give it an air of rigid truth, and the circumstance of my having visited many of the places which it describes will make the ruse pass all the better. I am sure it will pass for an absolute detail of genuine facts even by those who know me best.⁷¹

The tale appears to be modelled after Warren's popular series, which had reached its sixth number by January 1831. In February Macnish requested that Blackwood send back the unpublished tales, as he intended to use one of the tales (presumably 'A Singular Passage in my Own Life') in a volume of four tales to be entitled 'Passages in the Life of a Surgeon'. The volume was to be ready for publication by M'Phun or an unnamed London publisher by March, and he intended to use the funds generated to finance a journey to the Continent in the autumn. Blackwood's response to this proposal can be inferred from Macnish's reply on the 27th of February 1831: Blackwood considered the title of the proposed volume improper, most probably due to its similarity to Warren's series title, and returned 'The Stage Coach' and 'A Singular Passage' as unacceptable. Macnish was vexed, not at being rejected, but because he believed Blackwood had acted inconsistently regarding 'The Stage Coach'. Further, his apparent inference that Macnish was writing in need of money was highly insulting to an author who prided himself on never writing for money, but rather out of 'hope for a little fame'.⁷²

On the 7th of April 1831, in a letter to Moir, Macnish declares the transfer of his loyalty to *Fraser's*:

You see I am now fairly committed with Fraser and I mean to stick by him. I am

⁶⁹ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 24 January 1831, NLS MS 4030, fols 123-24.

⁷⁰ Ibid.

⁷¹ Ibid.

⁷² Letters of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 4, 24, and 27 February 1831, NLS MS 4030, fols 127-32.

disgusted with Blackwood's usage of me and will have nothing more to say in that quarter. Fortunately for myself I stand in the proud situation of not being in the least indebted to him. I will defy him to say that he stands in such a position with regard to me.⁷³

'Punch and Judy', 'A Singular Passage in my Own Life', and 'Who Murdered Begbie?' were published in *Fraser's* in April, May, and October of 1831 – all signed 'A Modern Pythagorean'. When his customarily complimentary copies of *Blackwood's Magazine* did not arrive on time, Macnish presumed that he had offended Blackwood by contributing to *Fraser's* under his Blackwoodian pseudonym. He wrote to defend his actions, declaring, 'I stand in precisely the same position as some other of your contributors who appear in Fraser under the same name as in your Magazine. I need only instance Hogg.'⁷⁴ His fears, however, appear to have been unfounded, and his reaction based on personal paranoia and his own attitudes towards pseudonymity. In previous letters to Blackwood, he declared his Blackwoodian pseudonym to be 'in some measure your own property, with which I had no right to trifle' and at one point opted to sign his own name, rather than his magazine signature, to a poetical translation of Goethe submitted to the Glasgow University publication, *The Athenaeum*, despite fearing that as a result, 'my rhyming career is at an end'.⁷⁵ In a letter of 28th May 1831, Macnish admits that he was overhasty in his accusations, and once again, he declares his preference for *Blackwood's* above all other magazines.⁷⁶

Macnish continued to send contributions until as late as October 1834, but found *Blackwood's*, even after the passing of the original publisher, to be consistently unreceptive.⁷⁷ His last contributions to *Maga* appeared in January 1831. A short sentimental poem, 'Remembrance', is signed 'A Modern Pythagorean', and the songs, 'A Christmas Carol' and 'The Five Champions of *Maga*' within the 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LIII', are accurately attributed to Macnish by Strout.⁷⁸ From this point onwards, 'A Modern Pythagorean' was effectively a Fraserian, contributing eight prose articles and at least twenty poems between April 1831 and January 1835, and appearing in the infamous 'Gallery of Literary Characters'

⁷³ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 7 April 1831, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

⁷⁴ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 18 May 1831, NLS MS 4030, fols 133-34.

⁷⁵ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 26 March 1830, NLS 4028, fols 15-16; Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 1830, NLS 4028, fols 35-36.

⁷⁶ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 28 May 1831, NLS MS 4030, fols 135-36.

⁷⁷ See letters of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 31 October 1831, 12 November 1831, 25 March 1832, 7 June 1832, 6 September 1834, 29 September 1834, 2 October 1834, NLS MS 4030, fols 137-40; MS 4034, fols 34-40; MS 4039, fols 110-15.

⁷⁸ Robert Macnish, 'Remembrance', *Blackwood's*, 29 (January 1831), 131; Alan L. Strout, 'Concerning the *Noctes Ambrosianae*', *Modern Language Notes*, 51.8 (1936), 493-504, (p. 499).

in December 1835. Overall, Macnish's fall from grace with *Blackwood's* may be attributed to a progressive lack of originality in his tales at this time and the social tensions created by his overly impulsive responses to perceived insults. His absurd style and grotesque physiognomies, however, well suited the humour of Maginn's magazine, and Macnish maintained a close relationship with the editor himself.⁷⁹

In contrast to Macnish, Hogg's relationship with the Blackwood's publishing house has been well-documented in recent scholarship.⁸⁰ Like Macnish, Hogg turned to *Fraser's* as an alternative outlet for his work following a falling out with Blackwood, and in his later years, despite some personal abuse within its pages, Hogg expressed his preference for *Fraser's* over the *Quarterly Review* and *Blackwood's* and contributed at least fourteen prose tales and twenty poems.⁸¹ Both 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' and 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' were first rejected by *Blackwood's*, and then resubmitted to *Fraser's* and accepted for publication. The first for unknown reasons, and the second due to its unorthodox treatment of the soul. On 17 September 1831, Blackwood writes to Hogg that although it is one of his 'very cleverest things', 'I do not think it would do for me to publish it', as 'if I were to publish it, for to speak seriously which the good fellows would do, it is directly in the teeth of revelations to permit the soul to exist separately for one moment without at once having it's eternal state fixed'.⁸² Maginn appears to have lacked such Protestant qualms, but the version that appears in *Fraser's* is substantially different from the one that was most probably originally submitted to Blackwood.⁸³ Similarly, Hogg made substantial changes to the text of 'Strange Letter from a Lunatic' before submitting the tale to *Fraser's*.⁸⁴ In the present study, the Fraserian versions of the tales will be utilised, as these would have been the only versions accessible by Macnish. However, attention will be paid to several important alterations in the course of examining

⁷⁹ For Macnish's description of Maginn, see *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 240-44.

⁸⁰ Thomas C. Richardson, 'James Hogg and Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine: Buying and Selling the Ettrick Shepherd', in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author*, 185-99; Thomas C. Richardson, 'Introduction', in *Contributions to Blackwood's*, pp. xiii-lxxx; J. H. Alexander, 'Hogg in the *Noctes Ambrosianae*', *SHW*, 4 (1993), 37-47.

⁸¹ *James Hogg: A Life*, pp. 233-301, (p. 296). On Hogg's relationship with *Fraser's*, see Wendy Hunter, "'A Powerful Engine of Social Improvement': James Hogg and *Chambers' Edinburgh Journal*", in *The British Periodical Text: 1797-1835: A Collection of Essays Edited by Simon Hull* (Tirril: Humanities-Ebooks, 2008), pp. 91-120, (pp. 99-103).

⁸² Letter of William Blackwood to James Hogg, 17 September 1831, NLS MS 30312, fol. 225.

⁸³ A second version of the tale was published under the title, 'Robin Roole', in *Hogg's Weekly Instructor* for 17 May 1845, and the substantiality of the differences indicates that the tale was most probably printed from a different manuscript fair copy.

⁸⁴ The rejected Blackwoodian versions of 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' and 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' will be available in the forthcoming volume, James Hogg, *Contributions to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, Volume 2: 1829-1835*, ed. by Thomas C. Richardson (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, [2010]).

Miller's claim that these two Hogg tales evidence the influence of 'A Modern Pythagorean' on 'The Ettrick Shepherd'.

'Strange Letter of a Lunatic'

'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' was in Blackwood's hands by 12 February 1830, but was returned to Hogg as unacceptable for publication the following month.⁸⁵ The fair copy manuscript of the version of the tale most probably first offered to Blackwood is held by the Alexander Turnbull Library, Wellington.⁸⁶ This version is addressed to 'C. North Esq', the veiled editor of *Blackwood's*, while the version published in *Fraser's* in December 1830 is instead addressed to 'Mr. James Hogg, of Mount Benger'.⁸⁷ The supposedly authentic first-person accounts offered to each party is done so with the hope that the addressees might shed light on the unaccountable circumstances experienced by the unfortunate lunatic, James Beatman. In short, Beatman finds himself in the curious situation of being accompanied by his double, whom at times he sees and converses with, and at other times, is absent from his presence, apparently acting as though he is 'the *right* James Beatman'.⁸⁸ One of the most significant changes to the Fraserian version is an enhancement of the unaccountability of Beatman's experience: in typical Hogg fashion, neither natural nor supernatural explanation dominates. This is primarily achieved by the addition of a letter from Alexander Walker, a gentleman with whom Beatman spent his last few days prior to confinement in a lunatic asylum. Walker's letter collaborates the two key rationally unaccountable events in Beatman's narrative, which, accordingly, cannot be dismissed as the 'dreams of a lunatic' or 'the visions of a disordered imagination'.⁸⁹

Interestingly, Hogg's revisions took place over the period of the time during which he most probably received *The Philosophy of Sleep* from Macnish – who may be classified, along with Ferriar, Hibbert, Brewster, and Scott, as people who 'now-a-days are beginning broadly to insinuate that there are no such things as ghosts, or spiritual beings visible to mortal sight'.⁹⁰ Hogg's tale of 'The Mysterious Bride', from which this quote is taken, was also published in December 1830, and evidences that such rationalistic tendencies were troubling Hogg during

⁸⁵ *Collected Letters of James Hogg*, II, pp. 374-75, pp. 381-82.

⁸⁶ Alexander Turnbull Library, James Hogg Papers, 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', MS-Papers-0042-01.

⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, fol. 1; James Hogg, 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', *Fraser's*, 2 (December 1830), 526-32, (p. 526).

⁸⁸ 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', p. 526.

⁸⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 531.

⁹⁰ James Hogg, 'The Mysterious Bride', *Blackwood's*, 28 (December 1830), 943-55, (p. 943).

this time.⁹¹ The possibility that Macnish's text may have influenced Hogg's decision to enhance the explanatory ambiguity of 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' is supported by the inter-textual resonances with Macnish's corpus which, though present in both versions of the tale, are enhanced in the Fraserian.

Beatman's strange experiences may be explained by lunacy and drunkenness and/or by the demonic: the devil, in the guise of an old man with an 'elegant gold snuff box', may be taking on his corporeal form.⁹² Both explanations are very much within the realm of Macnish's writings. As Karl Miller indicates, Hogg's 'little crooked gentleman' is 'no very distant cousin to Macnish's tempter' from 'The Metempsychosis'.⁹³ Beyond the physical similarities of old age and a propensity for snuff, both characters are portrayed in a comic manner (particularly when compared to the terror evoked by Hogg's portrayal of Gil-Martin). In his thesis on Hogg and German Romanticism, Benedict notes that the comic undertone to 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' is relatively unique, as 'the "second-self" received little or no treatment of a comic or tragic nature in the first decades of the nineteenth century'. He goes on to conjecture that De Quincey's discussion of the doppelgänger in his review of 'Gillies's German Stories' for *Blackwood's* in December 1826 may have inspired Hogg's tale.⁹⁴ While this discussion, which places the literature of doppelgänger within the realm of 'medicine or police' rather than of criticism, may have influenced Hogg's choice of subject matter, Macnish's 'The Metempsychosis' is a more probable source of inspiration for his comic treatment of the double.⁹⁵

In the Blackwoodian version of 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', the encounter with the 'little crooked gentleman' is briefly referenced only twice throughout the tale. In the first instance, he is introduced following Beatman's confused dealings at the stagecoach office:

I took the money seeing there was no alternative but convinced that I was some way under the power of enchantment I began therefore to think over all that I had been engaged in, to see if I could recollect how I had been bewitched and turned into two people, but I could recollect nothing out of the ordinary course of events save that on the ~~evening~~ morning of the Sunday previous to that, which I was standing gazing on the Castlehill an old man of a singular figure and aspect came up to me with a gold snuff box set with jewels in his hand, and with great courtesy offered my a pinch, which I readily accepted, and then the old knave went away chuckling and laughing as if he had

⁹¹ Duncan reads 'The Mysterious Bride' as a response to Scott's *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft*. See, 'The Upright Corpse: Hogg, National Literature and the Uncanny', *SHW*, 5 (1994), 29-54, (pp. 29-30).

⁹² 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', p. 526.

⁹³ *Cockburn's Millennium*, p. 207.

⁹⁴ Benedict, pp. 54-67, (p. 66).

⁹⁵ Thomas De Quincey, 'Gillies's German Stories', *Blackwood's*, 20 (December 1826), 844-59, (p. 853).

caught a prize. I tried to reason myself out of the belief that there could be any thing supernatural communicated by such a simple incident, nevertheless the impression left on my mind would not be removed⁹⁶

In the second instance, Beatman dreams of the encounter on Castle hill after he is frustrated by Mr. Walker's insistence that it was indeed himself that came with him in the gig from Stirling:

Overpowered by these bewildering apprehensions I fell asleep and dreamed the whole night of the man and the gold box set with jewels whom I met on the Castle hill of Edin so that next morning when I awoke I was quite stupid and overcome with dismay [assured], that I laboured under the power of enchantment.⁹⁷

In contrast, the Fraserian version opens with a detailed account of their mysterious encounter that includes descriptions of his phenomenological experience of feeling 'very queer [...] like one who had been knocked on the head', following his acceptance of the snuff from the old man.⁹⁸ The encounter is then referenced five more times throughout the tale, including a significant expansion of the dream-state encounter.⁹⁹ The result is an increased readerly awareness of the supernatural explanation, which may have transmogrified from the writing of Macnish.

Drunkenness appears to be the more probable explanation of Beatman's strange experience in the Blackwoodian version. The tale opens with Beatman's descriptions of a scene of drunkenness rather than a supernatural encounter, and several of Beatman's references to drunkenness in this version are edited out in the Fraserian. For example, Beatman notes that he was 'half dizzy with the fumes of wine' on his way to the coach office, and immediately upon his embarking on the Morning Star, he seeks out ginger beer and brandy, as he is 'thirsty beyond sufferance'.¹⁰⁰ Further, whilst describing the conviviality on the Morning Star, he notes that it is 'a prevailing fault of mine that whenever I meet with many and happy companions it is not in my power to resist drinking with them'.¹⁰¹ In Macnish's tales the double or second-self is most often a product of drunkenness. In 'The Metempsychosis' the diabolical contract, which enables Wolfstang to take possession of Stadt's body, is signed while Stadt is intoxicated, and in 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy in India' the 'double self' of the Colonel is brought forth by brandy. However, Macnish's most overt

⁹⁶ 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', MS-Papers-0042-01, fol. 2.

⁹⁷ Ibid., fol. 5.

⁹⁸ 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', p. 526.

⁹⁹ Ibid., p. 527, p. 528, p. 529, p. 530.

¹⁰⁰ 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', MS-Papers-0042-01, fol. 2.

¹⁰¹ Ibid., fol. 3.

treatment of the second-self of drunkenness is of course found in *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), wherein he comes out as a staunch believer of *in vino veritas*. The second-self is, in fact, the true natural character of the individual, which is habitually shrouded by the veil of modernity. Beatman's double ascribes to the prototypical appetite driven behaviours of the drunken second-self in his supposed maltreatment of a young lady, but the other actions which are apparently carried out by Beatman's double (since he does not consciously remember having performed them himself), such as discharging large bills at taverns, booking coach tickets, and going hunting and fishing, hardly seem to qualify as lacking in social acceptability. However, his claim that his double 'never molested me unless I was quite sober', which is unique to the Fraserian version, leads to a second possible rationalistic interpretation. This double may also be read as a result of the amplified ideas of self and the hallucinations of delirium tremens, since this symptomology would only occur during periods of sobriety.¹⁰² The statement, however, also cues the reader to question the narrative testimony of Beatman. His second self is definitively present throughout a tavern scene, wherein the party 'drank long and deep'.¹⁰³ During his confinement in the lunatic asylum, Beatman considers his keeper's insinuation that he has 'droonken away' his 'seven senses' to be a 'vile hint', and in the Blackwoodian version, this hint results in a physical altercation.¹⁰⁴ The reader must thus question if the 'crooked little gentleman' and his mysterious enchantment may be the creations of a man who does not want to admit to habitual drunkenness.¹⁰⁵

Macnish, in common with the authoritative texts on insanity at this time, viewed habitual drunkenness as major cause of lunacy.¹⁰⁶ In the Blackwoodian version of the tale, Beatman insists that his mental derangement was a result of his enchantment, rather than drunkenness:

But in place of having been driven to it by drinking it was solely caused by my having been turned into two men, two distinct souls as well as bodies and these acting on various different and distinct principles yet still conscious of an idiocratical identity.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰² See above, p. 101.

¹⁰³ 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', p. 526.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid., p. 531.

¹⁰⁵ John Abercrombie notes the strong propensity of the insane to create supernatural explanations for the change in their mental processes (*Inquiries Concerning the Intellectual Powers and the Investigation of Truth* (Edinburgh: Waugh and Innes; Glasgow: Ogle; Dublin: Curry; London: Whittaker, Treacher & Arnot, 1830), pp. 318-21).

¹⁰⁶ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness* (1827), p. 40-41. John Haslam's *Observations on Madness and Melancholy: Including Practical Remarks on those Diseases; Together with Cases: and an Account of the Morbid Appearance on Dissection*, 2nd edn (London: Callow, 1809) lists 'repeated intoxication' as the number one physical cause of insanity (p. 209).

¹⁰⁷ 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', MS-Papers-0042-01, fol. 5.

In the Fraserian version, Beatman still insists that the derangement was a result of ‘having been turned into two men’, but the statement regarding his ‘two distinct souls’ is removed and earlier in the tale, he claims that ‘I had become, as it were, two bodies, with only one soul between them’.¹⁰⁸ This adjustment enhances the resonances between Beatman’s narrative and Macnish’s account of his own vivid dream of doubleness in *The Philosophy of Sleep*:

fancy so far travelled into the regions of absurdity, that I conceived myself riding upon my own back – one of the resemblances being mounted upon another, and both animated with the soul appertaining to myself, in such a manner that I knew not whether I was the *carrier* or the *carried*.¹⁰⁹

With the exception of the overt supernaturalism of ‘The Metempsychosis’, Macnish’s treatment of the double is firmly positioned within the rationalist framework of drunkenness and dreaming. The enhanced inter-textual resonances with Macnish’s corpus and the enhanced unaccountability of ‘Strange Letter of Lunatic’ in the Fraserian version enable a reading of the tale as a commentary on Macnish’s utilisation of similarly strange first-person narrative cases of unusual subjectivities in *The Philosophy of Sleep* to support a purely rationalistic world view. Further, Beatman’s frustrations at his treatment in the lunatic asylum, and in particular the unwillingness of his surgeons to engage with his irrational experience in the course of his treatment, point towards the unsatisfactory nature of the rationalisation of strange subjective experiences for some individuals. According to Beatman, the surgeons simply ‘preserve towards me looks of the most superb mystery, and often lay their fingers on their lips’.¹¹⁰

Karl Miller is not incorrect in his negative assessment of the tale. In contrast to the *Confessions*, this later tale of doubleness ‘has no real terrors’ and ‘the conventions and mechanics of the genre are left awkwardly exposed in the midst of a display of urbanity’.¹¹¹ The poor quality of the tale may in part be forgiven, however, if it is read as a parody rather than an imitation of Macnish’s frequently formulaic prose.

¹⁰⁸ ‘Strange Letter of a Lunatic’, p. 531, p. 530.

¹⁰⁹ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 87.

¹¹⁰ ‘Strange Letter of a Lunatic’, p. 531. This treatment accords with the guidelines for moral management at the time. Abercrombie notes that, ‘It will be generally admitted, that every attempt to reason with a maniac is not only fruitless, but rather tends to fix more deeply his erroneous impression. An important rule, in the moral management of the insane, will therefore probably be, to avoid every allusion to the subject of their hallucination, to remove from them everything calculated by association to lead to it, and to remove them from scenes and persons likely to recall or keep up the erroneous impression’ (*Inquiries Concerning the Intellectual Powers*, pp. 333-34).

¹¹¹ *Cockburn’s Millennium*, p. 207.

‘On the Separate Existence of the Soul’

In a letter to Moir in December 1831, Macnish writes regarding *Fraser’s*, ‘His last No was capital. I was much pleased with Hogg’s story, altho’ the idea is plainly taken from the Metempsychosis.’¹¹² Macnish is most probably referring to ‘On the Separate Existence of the Soul’, which was first published in *Fraser’s* the same month, and while, as Miller indicates, the transmigration of souls in Hogg’s tale is most probably taken from ‘The Metempsychosis’, the tale may also be read as a commentary on *The Philosophy of Sleep*. In this tale Hogg appeals to an exemplary narrative to purportedly evidence ‘the soul’s separate existence: not after death, for that I never presumed to call in question; but in deep sleep, in trances, and all the other standing-stills of the corporeal functions’.¹¹³ This use of an exemplary narrative is similar to that in ‘George Dobson’s Strange Expedition to Hell’, as ‘this pleasant and ludicrous instance of the truth of the above theory’ does not necessarily support the prepositions forwarded in the mock-philosophical introduction.¹¹⁴ In this tale the literal transmigration of souls between the old shepherd, Robin Robson, and a young laird’s physical bodies dramatises the physical power of belief, the supreme power of the divine over natural law, and the importance of embodiment, rather than the separate existence of the soul.

The enlightened young laird believes that Robin Robson is ‘a ninny and a fool, wedded to old and exploded customs, and beliefs that had so long degraded our native land by nourishing ignorance and superstition’.¹¹⁵ Hogg appears to humorously project his own attitudes through the old shepherd:

He steadily upheld the propriety of keeping by old-established customs, and of improving these leisurely and prudently; but deprecated all rash theories of throwing the experience of ages asides as useless and unprofitable lumber, as if the world were void of common sense and discernment, till it brought forth the present generation, the most enlightened of whom, in his own estimation, was the young laird of Gillian Brae.¹¹⁶

The young laird questions the narrative testimony of his ancestors, and thus establishes theoretical systems that are inevitably limited by the perceptive scope of his own generation’s experience. He neglects to realise that the customs and superstitious beliefs may be irrational

¹¹² In Moir’s biography this letter is incorrectly placed chronologically at the end of the correspondence for 1832. The manuscript letter is undated, but the contents indicate it was most probably written in December 1831.

¹¹³ James Hogg, ‘On the Separate Existence of the Soul’, *Fraser’s*, 4 (December 1831), 529-37, (p. 529).

¹¹⁴ See above, pp. 162-64.

¹¹⁵ ‘On the Separate Existence of the Soul’, p. 530.

¹¹⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 529-30; Hogg expresses similar sentiments in his article ‘On the Changes in the Habits, Amusements, and Condition of the Scottish Peasantry’, *The Quarterly Journal of Agriculture*, 3 (1831–1832), 256-63.

to him, but are nevertheless intricately woven into the superstructure of the current way of life, which is a product of generations of continuous human experience. The tale thus embodies the opinions of an anonymous commentator upon Hibbert's work:

We fancy ourselves so ENLIGHTENED, as to be without any parallel in discernment: we are amazed that our ancestors should so long have been deluded by absurdities; and we are very little aware how much some future age will pity and blame us for follies, of which we imagine ourselves perfectly clear.¹¹⁷

The transmigration of souls is the divine response to Robin's prayers that 'the Lord would not suffer his almighty power and government of the universe to be thus insulted and defied by a human worm'.¹¹⁸

The ludicrous materiality of the descriptions of the disembodied souls reinforces the necessity of conceptualising the soul in physical terms, both in literary and philosophical discourse. The disembodied Robin Robson suffers from 'vertigo' due to his 'unspeakable velocity' of movement and is said to enter the laird's body 'likely by the nostrils, as at that instant the corpse sneezed slightly; and the surgeon, the physician, and the apothecary, claimed each the merit of this marvellous restoration.'¹¹⁹ The only immaterial aspect of the disembodiment is the ghosts' inability to commune with the embodied world. As Ian Duncan indicates, 'it is material *embodiment*, after all, that commands the legal and economic relations of worldly identity'.¹²⁰ In the young laird's body, Robin Robson is able to restore productivity to the estate, and in his materialistically impoverished position, the young laird, eventually, reconciles himself to the omnipotent divine.

The 'advantage of an old and experienced soul getting possession of a young and healthy frame' is reminiscent of the vision of heavenly embodiment in *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, and in this context may be metaphorically evocative of the preservation of the didactic value of traditional tales within the new conceptual framework of 'medico-popular' literature.¹²¹ The power of the belief is evidenced in both contexts. However, in *The*

¹¹⁷ *Past Feelings Renovated; or Ideas, Occasioned by the Perusal of "Dr. Hibbert's "Philosophy of Apparitions." Written with the View of Counteracting any Sentiments Approaching Materialism, which that Work, However Unintentional on the Part of the Author, May Have a Tendency to Produce* (London: Whittaker, 1828), p. iv.

¹¹⁸ 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul', p. 531.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 532, p. 535. These passages are unique to the Fraserian version, and exemplify an overall increased use of philosophical and physiological language. For example, Hogg also adds a passage on the 'sheing and heing of the soul' by philosophers and a passage on the materialist tendencies of lawyers and women to the Fraserian version. Overall, these additions amplify the philosophically satirical nature of the tale and may be in response to Blackwood's literal reading of the tale's religious unorthodoxy (*Ibid.*, p. 532).

¹²⁰ 'The Upright Corpse: Hogg, National Literature and the Uncanny', p. 32.

¹²¹ 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul', p. 537. See above, pp. 55-56.

Philosophy of Sleep, the legitimacy of a belief in the supernatural is denied and recast as pathological vulnerability.¹²² ‘On the Separate Existence of the Soul’ presents an extreme example of the physical effectiveness of supernatural belief. Both supernatural and rational beliefs are essentially rooted in the physical body, and the physician’s dismissal of the potentially therapeutic value of the former may account ‘for some otherwise unaccountable kirkyards’.¹²³

Reception of *The Philosophy of Sleep*

Despite its overt rationalism, Macnish’s text is by no means free of ‘fine fairy visions’.¹²⁴ As a reviewer for *The Lancet* indicates, although Macnish denies the prophetic power of dreaming, ‘he has related some very singular cases (of one of which he was himself the subject) which would almost induce a belief that such was the case’.¹²⁵ Overall, the medical community saw little scientific value in Macnish’s text. Both *The Lancet* and the *London Medical Gazette* viewed the title of the text as misleading, the observations and theories as unoriginal and even plagiaristic, and the composition as over-hasty. The praise offered was mixed. While noting some potential usefulness to the general reader, *The Lancet* labelled it ‘rather an amusing than an instructive production’ and characterised its observations as ‘poetical’ rather than ‘philosophical’.¹²⁶ Similarly, the reviewer for the *London Medical Gazette* writes:

His attempts to combine physic, philosophy, and entertainment, have been in general successful; but it is to be confessed, at the same time, that both his physic and his philosophy have always been of that airy and popular kind which presents the most attractive front to the numerous and respectable class of light readers.¹²⁷

The reception from the lay community was comparable. While Bell’s *Edinburgh Literary Journal* praises Macnish’s investigation as both rousing to ‘the imagination of the poet’ and appealing ‘to the judgment of the philosopher’, they ‘do not regard this work as likely to raise his fame in the estimation of men of science’. However, the work is said to provide much to ‘amuse and instruct the general reader’.¹²⁸ *The Athenaeum* was resolutely harsh but noted the

¹²² See above, p. 20, p. 163.

¹²³ See above, p. 154.

¹²⁴ ‘On the Separate Existence of the Soul’, p. 529.

¹²⁵ ‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, *The Lancet*, 15 (19 February 1831), 673-79, (p. 675).

¹²⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 673.

¹²⁷ ‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, *London Medical Gazette*, 7 (20 November 1830), 246-49, (p. 247).

¹²⁸ ‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, *Edinburgh Literary Journal*, 2 (16 October 1830), 238-39.

value of the work in its collection together of numerous illustrative cases, and while the *Monthly Review* praised the work as ‘clever, instructive, and amusing’, they disapproved of the underlying phrenological theory.¹²⁹ Unsurprisingly, the primary problem Andrew Combe pointed out in his review for the *Phrenological Journal* was the lack of an explicit declaration of the utilisation of phrenological theory in the text.¹³⁰

The poetical character of the text was enhanced by Moir’s involvement in Macnish’s composition, which went unacknowledged at the time of publication. In August 1830 Macnish requested that Moir provide a ‘some light elegant introduction’ to the text, ‘literary and poetically written’, but desired to keep his involvement a secret to prevent censure from the ‘radicals about Glasgow’. Moir also aided Macnish in the selection of the literary mottos prefacing each chapter and provided editorial advice, particularly advising him to safeguard himself against possible charges of materialism.¹³¹ Macnish writes to Moir on the 16th of August 1830:

The part which you mentioned as laying me open to materialism I have softened down a little, so that I think this objection will now be quieted. I have represented the mind as immaterial, but as operating through the agency of a material organ, and that consequently when this organ falls asleep the mind as being manifested through it falls asleep also. This I know is carrying the point farther than you do, but it at least keeps me free of being thought heterodox in my Opinions, and will save me from being thought a materialist in the ~~strictest~~ general sense of the term. I mention this in case you should say anything in the Introduction which might clash with my doctrine.¹³²

According to Macnish’s letters to Moir and Blackwood, the work sold well in the first months, with half of the original print-run of 2000 selling in the first five months.¹³³ A second edition was not called for until the spring of 1833, and Macnish was eager for the opportunity to improve the new edition. He writes to Moir in April 1833:

All the cant and Scriptural quotations must be eradicated, to say nothing about the nonsense about “The Sleep of the Soul.” This eradication I shall much more than [supply] by valuable scientific matter and additional cases. As the Book stands I am somewhat ashamed it, and must do my best to make it do its author more credit.¹³⁴

¹²⁹ ‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, *The Athenaeum. London Literary and Critical Journal*, 167 (8 January 1831), 18-20; ‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, *Monthly Review*, 15.63 (November 1830), 359-68, (p. 367).

¹³⁰ Andrew Combe, ‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, *Phrenological Journal*, 6 (1829-1830), 576-82.

¹³¹ Letters of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 13 August, 16 August, 24 August, and 4 September 1830, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49; *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 167-77.

¹³² Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 16 August 1830, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

¹³³ Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 27 February 1831, NLS MS 4030, fols 131-32.

¹³⁴ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 9 April 1833, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50.

By this time Macnish had become a full convert to the doctrines of phrenology, and in the preface to the new edition, he openly declares his utilisation of phrenology and defends the doctrine as the only way to account for ‘dreaming, idiocy, spectral illusions, monomania, and partial genius’.¹³⁵ While in the first edition, he allowed that there was a time when ‘God held communion with man; and, breathing wisdom and foresight over his slumbering spirit, gave him a knowledge of circumstances which no human sagacity could have guarded against or foreseen’, in the second edition, he distances himself from this belief, merely stating that ‘[t]he Sacred Writings testify that miracles were common in former times’.¹³⁶ The ideological gap between ‘A Modern Pythagorean’ and ‘The Ettrick Shepherd’ appears to have widened.

While his descriptions of the various phenomenologies of altered-states of consciousness maintain their poetical character, the literary mottos are removed, these ‘being out of place in a scientific work’, and the empirical character of the text is enhanced by the addition of more narrative cases and phrenological explanations.¹³⁷ In a new chapter devoted to ‘Spectral Illusions’, the second-sight and fairy encounters are discounted and attributed to ‘ignorance’, ‘superstition’, and an ‘excited brain’, and Macnish utilises the same Enlightenment theory of societal progression from imagination to reason which Moir will later apply in his ‘Life’ of Macnish. The solitude and wildness of the Highland mountains are again said to preserve the primitive supremacy of imagination, as

The more completely the mind is abstracted from the bustle of life; the more solitary the district in which the individual resides; and the more romantic and awe-inspiring the scenes that pass before his eyes, the greater is his tendency to see visions, and to place faith in what he sees.¹³⁸

Macnish’s text delineates the various phenomena of dreaming and spectral illusion as a return to the primitive supremacy of imagination and associates this return with Romantic art, but ultimately this art is constrained within a rationalistic framework. One might experience the horrors of a Gothic romance in night-mare and, conversely, ‘even the most dull and passionless, while under the dreaming influence, frequently enjoy a temporary inspiration’, but if such visionary experiences transgress into the waking world and are accompanied by belief,

¹³⁵ *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), p. ix.

¹³⁶ *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1830), p. 102, *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), p. 111.

¹³⁷ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 3 February 1834, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50.

¹³⁸ *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (1834), pp. 258-59.

aesthetics transform into pathology.¹³⁹ Quoting Dr. Benjamin Rush, Macnish explains that ‘a dream may be considered as a transient paroxysm of delirium, and delirium as a permanent dream’.¹⁴⁰

A corrected version of the second edition of Macnish’s text was published by ‘Marsh, Capon, and Sym, of Boston’, and, overall, Macnish appears to have been well-respected in America.¹⁴¹ In October 1835 he writes to Moir, ‘I have been dubbed an LL.D. by Hamilton College, United States, America, and am in daily expectation of my degree.’¹⁴² M’Phun published a third edition in 1836 which does not differ substantially from the second, but includes more illustrative cases.¹⁴³ German and French translations of the text also appeared during Macnish’s lifetime.¹⁴⁴

Conclusions

By the early nineteenth century, the narratives of prophetic dreaming, apparitional encounters, and trance-state reveries, once recounted as evidence of the separate existence of the soul, transmogrified into the domain of ‘medico-popular’ literature, in which they were cited in support of an embodied theory of mind. These narratives served both to make the medical texts interesting to a popular audience and to accord with the move towards an inductive philosophy of mind. While Hogg endorses an embodied conceptualisation of mind in many of his texts, he voices disapproval of an absolute faith in the modern conceptualisation of natural law. *The Philosophy of Sleep* brings traditionally supernatural narratives safely into the rational discourse of post-Enlightenment Scotland and therefore preserves their didactic value. However, Macnish’s insistence on rational interpretation dismisses the inherent duplicity in these narratives – dismisses the imaginative value of the supernatural reading. Rather than merely an aesthetic lament, an embodied conceptualisation of the imagination makes this dismissal of relevance to the medical practitioner.

Macnish’s increasingly scientific attitude towards the phenomena of altered-states of consciousness most probably negatively affected his opinion of Hogg and his continued insistence on the value of supernatural belief in his writing. Macnish’s ‘Ane Flicht Through

¹³⁹ Ibid., p. 106.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid., p. 44.

¹⁴¹ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 341, p. 337.

¹⁴² Ibid., p. 354.

¹⁴³ Robert Macnish, *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 3rd edn (Glasgow: William M’Phun, 1836).

¹⁴⁴ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 374.

Faery Lande' was re-published with slight alterations in *Fraser's*, and whereas 'The Bard of the Ugly Club' dedicated this poem to 'The Ettrick Shepherd' in 1824, 'A Modern Pythagorean' made no such gesture in November 1831.¹⁴⁵ The following chapter examines Macnish's use of 'James Hogg' as a pseudonym for his tale, 'A Psychological Curiosity', and Macnish's virulent protectiveness of his own literary persona suggests that this utilisation was not complimentary. In the tale, Hogg's insistence on narrative inexplicability is ridiculed and his interests in the burgeoning mental sciences demeaned as misinformed imaginative delusions.

¹⁴⁵ Robert Macnish, 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande Onne ane Famous Steede Yclept the Nicht-Mare', *Fraser's*, 4 (November 1831), 401-02.

Chapter 6: A Psychological Curiosity

The Scottish Annual

On the 9th of December 1835, Macnish sent Moir a copy of *The Scottish Annual* for 1836 in thanks for his poetical contributions, and he writes in the accompanying letter:

I now send you the Scottish Annual, with Mr. Weir's best thanks for your valuable contributions. The vol. I think is highly credible to Glasgow. The paper to which Weir has been put the nom de guerre James Hogg is by me; also the Dalkeith Gander, which glories in the name of John M'Diarmid. I also wrote the paper called Autographology.¹

The paper to which Hogg's name was put is 'A Psychological Curiosity'. The true authorship of the tale was not revealed until the publication of Moir's 'Life' of Macnish, in which the above letter is quoted, and accordingly, a review of *The Scottish Annual* published in the *Athenaeum* announces the inclusion of prose by Hogg.² The Fraserian review of *The Modern Pythagorean* indicates the success of Macnish's hoax:

The tale we remember to have read many years ago, and received it with a proper degree of awe, as a real adventure which had befallen the honest Shepherd, and had been described by him. The style is his accurately, and the circumstance just such a one as would have impressed itself deeply on his mind, and provoked his reverence and wonder. If a successful hoax be a sign of talent, the author of this is an undoubted genius, and a hoax it is. Macnish, as we learn by his memoirs, was the author of the tale; and, hoax though it be, it *is* a psychological curiosity nevertheless – most curious, if one allows, as we do, that it inspires an extraordinary degree of interest, and examines the sources from which the interest is derived.³

The success of Macnish's hoax maintains its currency in modern scholarship. 'A Psychological Curiosity' was incorrectly attributed to Hogg by Janette Currie in an article published in *Studies in Hogg and in his World* during her compilation of the Stirling/South Carolina edition of Hogg's *Contributions to Annuals and Gift-Books*, and the misattribution is acknowledged in an appendix to the edition.⁴ In her article Currie examines the annual as a production of the Glasgow Dilettanti Club, conjecturing Hogg's plausible involvement as an

¹ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 9 December 1835, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50; See also, *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 351-52.

² 'The Scottish Annual', *The Athenaeum. London Literary and Critical Journal*, 431 (30 January 1836), 88.

³ 'The Modern Pythagorean', p. 691.

⁴ Janette Currie, 'A Listing of Hogg Texts in Annuals and Gift-Books', in James Hogg, *Contributions to Annuals and Gift-Books*, ed. by Janette Currie and Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006), pp. 275-81, (p. 281).

‘extraordinary member’ of the club and reading the annual as the possible result of a ‘short yet fierce pamphlet war between rival art critics in Glasgow in 1835’.⁵ While several of the persons involved in *The Scottish Annual* were associated with the Glasgow Dilettanti Club, an examination of the overall text provides little evidence for Currie’s reading. *The Scottish Annual* was, in fact, unique among annuals in its lack of elaborate engravings and includes only one landscape by Horatio McCulloch (1805-1867).⁶ In comparing *The Scottish Annual* to its English counterparts, a reviewer for the *Glasgow Courier* writes:

The sole remaining merit of the English works of the same class is their plates, which have increased in splendour of execution in the precise ratio, we think, in which their literary value has become deteriorated; and the most candid judgment we can pronounce upon them is, that they are the finest picture books which the art has produced. In the present instance, the Editor has received no assistance from the engraver – unless, indeed, the unpretending landscape frontispiece is to be taken into account; and thrown exclusively upon his literary resources, he has discharged his task in a manner which will, at all events, reflect no discredit on his literary reputation.⁷

Rather than commentary on the visual arts, it is autographology, ‘or the art of divining characters from the hand-writing’, that provides the annual with a degree of thematic unity.⁸ Character sketches of prominent individuals, including Sir Walter Scott, William Godwin, Robert Malthus, Thomas Chalmers, Washington Irving, and George Washington, are interspersed throughout the annual along with facsimile autographs, which are examined as physical evidences of character. As the reviewer for *Tait’s Edinburgh Magazine* aptly observes, ‘These specimens, like the caricatures in *Fraser’s Magazine*, serve as pegs for hanging up dashing and pungent sketches of character.’⁹ Macnish’s composition of the central tale entitled ‘Autographology’ indicates that he most probably had a prominent role in the genesis of the annual. In total his contributions outnumber those by any other single individual, and include one poem, three prose tales, and a series of maxims; however, Macnish’s free use of multiple pseudonyms was most probably not singular, thus making attributions uncertain.

Macnish was a regular contributor to Rudolph Ackermann’s London-based annual, *Forget Me Not*, edited by Frederick Shoberl, and he also contributed to *Friendship’s Offering* and *Winter’s Wreath* under his pseudonym, ‘A Modern Pythagorean’. *The Scottish Annual*,

⁵ Janette Currie, ‘James Hogg and the *Scottish Annual*’, *SHW*, 11 (2000), 77-83, (p. 81, p. 82).

⁶ George Fairfull Smith, ‘McCulloch, Horatio (1805–1867)’, in *DNB*
<<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/17410>> [accessed 8 March 2010].

⁷ ‘*The Scottish Annual*’, *Glasgow Courier*, 45 (22 December 1835).

⁸ See above, pp. 76-78.

⁹ ‘*The Scottish Annual*’, *Tait’s Edinburgh Magazine*, 3 (January 1836), 69.

however, was a distinctively Glaswegian production and was edited by the advocate, William Weir (1802-1858), the editor of the *Glasgow Argus*.¹⁰ The editorial preface announces, ‘The Scottish Annual is an experiment, made to determine whether such a Work can find patrons and supporters in Glasgow’, and the annual closes with ‘Let Glasgow Flourish! Being Ane Farewell Benison by the Editor’.¹¹ As such, *The Scottish Annual* carries on the previous attempts of *The Literary Melange* and *The Emmet* to establish a place for Glasgow in the literary marketplace.¹² *The Scottish Annual* was successful in its apparent inclusion of both prose and poetry by prominent literary figures, such as D. M. Moir, William Motherwell, John Galt, and Andrew Picken, but was not so successful as to become an annual publication. While Macnish was critical of Glasgow publishers – writing to Moir in October 1827 that ‘[t]here is something confoundedly vulgar in seeing the word Glasgow upon a title page, and I shall not if possible have it on mine’ – he worked with the Glaswegian publishers, William M’Phun and John Reid, throughout his lifetime and was active in the literary life of the second city.¹³

George Gilfillan (1813-1878) in his semi-autobiographical romance, *The History of a Man* (1856), refers to the ‘MacNish clique’, with whom a friend of his had become intimate whilst at Glasgow College.¹⁴ William Motherwell, Dugald Moore, William Kennedy, and Thomas Atkinson are listed as the Glasgow wits that frequented ‘MacNish’s hospitable board’, and the newspaper man, Samuel Hunter, along with William Malcolm and James Kerr (friends of Lockhart and ‘conductors of the *Scottish Times*’), Sheridan Knowles (‘the dramatist’), Northhouse and William Bennet (both editors of the *Free Press*), and John Leitch are also listed as more occasional associates.¹⁵ Macnish’s correspondences support the culturally convivial picture painted by Gilfillan. In a letter to Moir, dated 29 May 1830, Macnish refers to having ‘a very amusing party to dinner the other day, consisting of Tom Atkinson, Motherwell, Bennet, Dugald Moore, M’George, &c.’¹⁶ Motherwell and Moore were fellow contributors to *The Scottish Annual*, while William Bennet and John Leitch feature as characters within ‘A Psychological Curiosity’, along with ‘Mr. John Bland, a respectable merchant in Glasgow’, ‘Mr. Henderson, Portrait Painter, Mr. Robert Maxwell,’ and ‘Mr. Reid,

¹⁰ Kenneth J. Cameron, ‘Weir, William (1802–1858)’, in *DNB* <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/28975>> [accessed 4 March 2010].

¹¹ *The Scottish Annual*, ed. by William Weir (Glasgow: Reid; Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1836), p. iii, pp. 326-28.

¹² See above, p. 22, p. 28.

¹³ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 9 October 1827, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

¹⁴ George Gilfillan, *The History of a Man* (London: Hall, Virtue, & Co., 1856), p. 170.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 168-70.

¹⁶ NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49; *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 166.

Merchant'.¹⁷

The Tale, 'A Psychological Curiosity. By James Hogg'

The Fraserian reviewer of *The Modern Pythagorean* praises the references to known local characters within 'A Psychological Curiosity', exclaiming, 'How the familiar increases the supernatural!'¹⁸ Local references also support the supposed authenticity of the tale, which, like many of Hogg's own exemplary narratives, is declared to evidence the inscrutability of the workings of the human mind. The starting point for the tale is an article in *Blackwood's*, which, according to the narrator (aka. 'James Hogg'), 'psychologically speaking, is highly remarkable'.¹⁹ As he summarises, in the Blackwoodian article a party of individuals collectively forget the substance of an anecdote recounted the night before at dinner, and while he believes that some might disregard the veracity of the article, his own experience leads him to credulity:

I do not look upon the fact which it communicates as of so very unprecedented a nature as to be incredible; for a circumstance within my own knowledge, and in which I was one of the parties, is not a whit less strange, and yet, in every respect, equally incapable of explanation upon any known principle.²⁰

As Currie has noted, the Blackwoodian article is the anonymous 'A Story Without a Tail', published in April 1834.²¹ The collective failure of memory is here deemed a 'psychological curiosity', and similarly, in Macnish's tale, the 'psychological curiosity' is the collective inability of a party of friends to remember the name of a fellow dinner guest the following morning.²²

The relatively mundane plot gains narrative momentum from the progressively ludicrous quest by 'James Hogg' to discover the name of the acquaintance that sat next to him so convivially the night previous. Following breakfast, Mr. Maxwell (a fellow dinner guest) arrives at his door perplexed by the same dilemma, and upon meeting Mr. Bennet in the forenoon, he finds that he also is sure that he is well acquainted with the man, but cannot recall his name. Hogg then calls upon Reid only to find that both he and Henderson are also in the

¹⁷ Robert Macnish [signed James Hogg], 'A Psychological Curiosity', in *The Scottish Annual*, 25-33, (p. 26).

¹⁸ 'The Modern Pythagorean,' p. 691.

¹⁹ 'A Psychological Curiosity', p. 25.

²⁰ Ibid., p. 26.

²¹ Currie, 'James Hogg and the Scottish Annual', p. 83.

²² 'A Story without a Tail', *Blackwood's*, 35 (April 1834), 453-58, (p. 457).

same predicament. As such,

The interest of the case was now increased beyond measure. That one individual might forget the name of another, whom he notwithstanding knew well, was in itself possible enough: that two might do so was not incredible, but that the name should slip through the memories of five, seemed as unlikely and miraculous, as that a camel should pass through the eye of a needle. It struck us exceedingly: there was no way by which it could be rationally accounted for, and it was agitated by us all with a feeling of strange and painful anxiety.²³

The party then ‘sallied forth to the lodgings of Mr. Bland’ in quest of the name, but, to their astonishment, find that their host is in the same lamentable situation.²⁴ A glimpse of hope is offered by his retention of a card from the mysterious man, sent in acceptance of his invitation to dinner. However, the portion with the signature had been torn away ‘for the purpose of lighting his cigar’. Befitting the overall theme of autographology, ‘the hand-writing of the note was familiar to us all’.²⁵ The tale closes with Hogg’s musings on the inexplicability of the singular event:

How it is to be explained I know not; but it certainly affords a curious picture of the human mind, and is well worthy of being preserved, as perhaps the most remarkable psychological curiosity on record. Probably the reader may experience some difficulty in giving credit to so extraordinary and apparently absurd a narrative; and, to tell the truth, I should myself, did I encounter such a story in my reading, be strongly tempted to set it down as the idle fiction of some ingenious brain; but of its truth I can speak in the most positive terms, and the other gentlemen who were parties to the case are also willing to give their unequivocal testimony in its behalf. My own impression is, that there is yet much to learn in the philosophy of the mind – that we are only on the threshold of mental science, and that a time will yet arrive when the causes of such phenomena as the above will be made perfectly manifest. At present the public, finding it impossible to explain these phenomena, deny them altogether, for the same reason that Alexander cut asunder the gordian knot, the disentanglement of which baffled all his efforts. People have hitherto laughed at animal magnetism, metallic tractors, and homoeopathy in the face of facts brought forward and attested by some of the ablest scientific men in Europe. In the same way, the above statement will probably be ridiculed, and treated as a fiction; and not unlikely those who bear evidence of its truth be reviled as having palmed a preposterous fabrication upon the credulity of the public.²⁶

Hogg’s characteristic use of narrative inexplicability appears to have been sufficiently

²³ ‘A Psychological Curiosity’, p. 29.

²⁴ Ibid., pp. 29-30.

²⁵ Ibid., p. 31.

²⁶ Ibid., p. 32.

recognised during his lifetime to attract parody. As will be explored in the following sections, these words, transmogrified into the mouth of 'James Hogg' by Macnish, provide key insights into Macnish's attitudes towards Hogg and his writing at this time and thus the relationship between Hogg's literary imagination and the burgeoning mental sciences in the Romantic era.

The Term, 'a psychological curiosity'

Hogg's impassioned defence of the ability of the burgeoning mental sciences to one day rationally account for such phenomena contrasts with an early statement by Macnish. In writing to Moir about the vivid mental imagery he involuntarily associated with certain persons, he writes, 'It is needless to reason on such psychological facts. Philosophy will never explain them, but every person I think must feel their influence more or less.'²⁷ Similarly, in his tale 'Punch and Judy', the amiable young protagonist believes that we must 'be contented to know the effect while we remain in ignorance of the cause' of such metaphysical phenomena. Macnish's first reference to 'what my friend, Coleridge, would call a psychological curiosity' appears within this tale. In this case, it is in reference to persons' singularly intense aversions to particular physiognomies.²⁸ The tone of playful metaphysical mystery befits an author writing under the pseudonym of 'A Modern Pythagorean'; however, Macnish's later use of the term indicates that following his conversion to phrenology he did not deem phenomena typically labelled as such to be rationally inexplicable. Rather, his embodied conceptualisation of the mind provided an adequate explanatory framework.

Coleridge famously refers to 'Kubla Khan' as 'a psychological curiosity' in his preface to the poem published in 1816. In the second edition of *The Philosophy of Sleep* (1834), Macnish extracts Coleridge's preface to the poem in which he describes his dream-state composition. Coleridge's description of how 'the images rose up before him as *things*' resonates with Macnish's own description of his synaesthetic experience in his correspondence with Moir which was deemed inexplicable in 1828.²⁹ However, in 1834 Coleridge's experience is declared to illustrate the phrenological theory of dreaming: how one's 'pursuits in life, by strengthening one faculty, make it less susceptible, than such as are weaker, of being overcome by complete sleep'.³⁰ Therefore, in his dreams:

²⁷ Letter from Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 5 January 1828, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49. See above, p. 80.

²⁸ 'Punch and Judy', pp. 350-51, p. 350.

²⁹ *The Philosophy of Sleep*. 2nd edn (1834), p. 65.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 63.

a poet is occupied in writing verses, or in deliberating upon the strains of such bards as are most familiar to his spirit: it was thus in a dream that Mr. Coleridge composed his splendid fragment of Kubla Khan.³¹

As Alan Richardson indicates, the ‘psychological curiosity’ of ‘Kubla Khan’ was also used by Sir David Brewster to evidence a brain-based theory of mind in his review of John Abercrombie’s *Inquiries Concerning the Intellectual Powers and the Investigation of Truth* (1830) for the *Quarterly Review* in 1831, and Richardson convincingly argues that Coleridge’s reluctance to publish the poem may have been due to his own realisation of its refutation of his ‘unitary, transcendentalist conception of mind’. According to Richardson, read in the context of Romantic brain science, the poem

implies a mind divided into discrete powers and organs, a subject fractured into conscious and unconscious entities, the persistence of cognitive activity in the absence of conscious judgment and volition, the mind’s susceptibility to and perhaps ultimate dependence on material changes in the body. As a case history, it is a brain scientist’s dream.³²

This ‘psychological curiosity’ would not have been so very curious to Macnish.

In *The Book of Aphorisms* (1834), a witty collection of maxims which originated from a Fraserian article, Macnish dedicates ‘Aphorism Four Hundred and Ninety-Sixth’ to the explanation of the term:

A Psychological [sic] Curiosity. This phrase of Coleridge’s has done a great deal of mischief. If any metaphysical proposition is started, and cannot instantly be unriddled, people, instead of, as in days of old, pommelling their brains to solve it, get out of the difficulty at once by declaring, with imperturbable gravity, that it is a *psychological [sic] curiosity*.³³

The previous aphorism, however, does just this:

That corporate bodies, in their collective capacity, are tyrannical and exclusive, although perhaps every individual, taken separately, is quite the reverse. In like manner, mobs, considered in the aggregate, are brutal and cruel, when perhaps only a very small portion

³¹ Ibid., pp. 64-65.

³² ‘Coleridge and the new unconscious’, in *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind*, pp. 39-65, (p. 39, p. 51).

³³ Robert Macnish, *The Book of Aphorisms. By a Modern Pythagorean* (Glasgow: M’Phun, 1834), p. 166. The first maxims were published anonymously as, ‘The Book of Aphorisms. By an Oriental Author. With a running Commentary, by Sir Morgan O’Doherty, Bart. Book I. Containing the First Dozen Dozen’, *Fraser’s*, 6 (December 1832), 712-28.

of the individuals are so in reality. Vice seems to be infinitely more infectious than virtue. These facts I defy any person to account for: they are, as Coleridge says, “*psycological* [sic] *curiosities*.”³⁴

The tone of the self-contradiction is jocular and characteristic of *The Book of Aphorisms*, but in the wake of the French Revolutionary epoch, the phenomenon of infectious crowd psychology was a serious political and metaphysical concern. Beyond the explanatory currency he invested in phrenology, Macnish also utilised his fictional tales to explore the mental and bodily mechanisms that functioned together to produce such ‘psychological curiosities’. For example, a reading of ‘An Execution in Paris’ (1828) could elucidate the psychological and physiological underpinnings of the loss of individual autonomy within the contagious corporate body of the crowd.³⁵ The term ‘psychological curiosity’ appears twice more in *The Book of Aphorisms*, and in both cases the utilisation indicates reference to an object or an example to be further studied – as an expansion of the database of the science of the mind rather than a metaphysical dead-end.³⁶

In his ‘Notes on a Journey from Paris from Ostend’, published in *Fraser’s Magazine* in January 1835 and based on his Continental tour during the summer of 1834, Macnish again utilises the term ‘psychological curiosity’ in reference to collective group psychology.³⁷ His observations on the character of the Belgian people are based on the same logic as *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, i.e. habitual actions and conditions influence the bodily and thus the mental constitution. This logic is applicable to both the individual person and the collective body of a region or nation. In his introduction to the second edition of the text, the difference in constitution between Northern and Southern peoples is attributed to climate, which has led one to possess ‘the beauty of a flower-garden, the other the sternness of the rock, mixed with its severe and naked hardihood’.³⁸ In ‘Notes on a Journey from Paris from Ostend’ the constitution of the Belgian people is attributed to the effects of their tumultuous political situation:

National pride and national energy go hand in hand: destroy the first, by annihilating the independence of a country, and the last is sure to follow. I believe that the physical organization of men, and, as a natural result, their personal character, is modified, in the

³⁴ Ibid., p. 166.

³⁵ See above, pp. 84-89. The titles of his articles, ‘The Philosophy of Burking’ and ‘The Philosophy of Sneering’, published in *Fraser’s* in February 1832 and September 1833 respectively, highlight this methodology.

³⁶ *The Book of Aphorisms*, p. 144, p. 191.

³⁷ On Macnish’s Continental tour see, *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 326-27.

³⁸ *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 2nd edn (1828), p. 11.

course of time, by such circumstances as the Belgian has for ages been subjected to.³⁹

The lack of energy is manifested through the prevailing ‘lymphatic’ temperament of this decidedly unhandsome people, and this is particularly evidenced by their gustatory habits:

It was amusing to see them moving their dull inanimate eyes, lifting the fork with phlegmatic indifference to their mouths, and sipping the tasteless beer – fit emblem of themselves – with the cold relish befitting their dispositions. Belgian *tables d’hôte* are dull affairs – very different from the spirited vivacity of the French ones. But this specimen outdid every thing of the kind – it out-Heroded Herod; and, even for Flanders, was what Coleridge would have called *a psychological curiosity*.⁴⁰

This ‘psychological curiosity’ is explained by Macnish’s earlier observations, and thus, he appears to be using the term ironically. The phenomenon would be a metaphysical mystery only to those unwilling to accept an embodied concept of mind. The usage in the title of ‘A Psychological Curiosity’ is not dissimilar, as the mystery of the man without a name would be easily solvable to those familiar with the ‘MacNish clique’ and their quizzical theories of embodiment.⁴¹ However, the narrator’s usage of the term is genuine – ‘James Hogg’ is portrayed as one of the uninitiated.

Veracity and Ventriloquism

The key to the hoax is the realisation that the identity and powers of the man without a name are no mystery at all. Hogg notes, ‘[t]he only thing I can recollect about the mysterious character was, that he could grunt like a pig, and was a capital mimic and ventriloquist’, and an editorial footnote provides the final clue:

[We suspect our talented friend L. could put James in the way of finding out the *Man of many Faces*, by whom he and his companions in conviviality have been so mortally mystified.–Ed.]⁴²

As the Fraserian reviewer of *The Modern Pythagorean* indicates, Macnish close friend

Mr. Leitch, of Waterloo Place, is the individual – a man distinguished for his chest, his wine, his polyglott accomplishments, and his great colloquial and ventriloquial powers.

³⁹ ‘Notes on a Journey from Paris to Ostend’, p. 43.

⁴⁰ Ibid., pp. 48-49.

⁴¹ Gilfillan, p. 170.

⁴² ‘A Psychological Curiosity’, p. 33.

In the latter art (which we need not say he exercises only *en amateur*) he is unrivalled, and Alexandre the Great himself cannot produce so many changes of voice and feature as this modern Proteus.⁴³

The letters between Macnish and Leitch comprise a substantial portion of Moir's biography, and the two friends appear to have had a propensity for creating ludicrous systems of physiological determinism. The most prominent of these was the mystic science of 'Chestiology', which was based on the assumption that the breadth of a man's chest was indicative of his mental powers. Upon Leitch's relocation to London in 1833, Macnish writes:

Chestiology, Squeakology, Gruntology, Ventriloquology, 56-ology, Barkology, Crowology, Philology, Beeology, Brayology, Bublilockology, Cacklingology, Planeology, Drawing-of-Cork-ology, Holding-seventy-seven-pound-weight-above-the-head-or-little-finger-ology, &c. &c. &c. are at an end. You will astound the Cockneys in the Modern Babylon, and not less the fair sex, with your colossal powers of procreatingology.⁴⁴

Leitch's powers of mimicry provide the rational explanation for the party's collective inability to remember his name.

In a footnote to the section devoted to the organ of Imitation in *An Introduction to Phrenology*, Macnish describes Leitch's powers in detail. After noting the particular combination of phrenological organs that enable his powers of mimicry, Macnish notes that '[h]e is, moreover, an admirable ventriloquist; and his displays in this walk have a beauty and supernatural effect – the result of large Ideality and Wonder – which I have not heard equalled'.⁴⁵ Of particular relevance to his role in 'A Psychological Curiosity' is Leitch's ability to transmute his physiognomy into diverse characters:

In addition to his multifarious accomplishments as a mimic, he possesses incredible power over his face, which he can mould into a variety of different aspects, each accurately representing a real character; and so totally unlike are these from one another, that while some are striking likenesses of people twenty-five or thirty, others correctly resemble men of fourscore. These changes of face add immensely to the effect of his imitations, more especially as he gives, along with each particular physiognomy, the exact voice of the person whose face is represented. His power of transmuting himself, as it were, into other characters, is, indeed, altogether astonishing; and for brilliancy, variety, intensity, and sustained power, I never saw any one whose imitative talents could be put into competition with his.⁴⁶

⁴³ 'The Modern Pythagorean', *Fraser's*, p. 692.

⁴⁴ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 311-12.

⁴⁵ *An Introduction to Phrenology*, 2nd edn (1837), pp. 118-19.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 119.

Like Hogg's Gil-Martin, Leitch can so utterly transform himself as to appear to be another person.

The inability of 'James Hogg' to recognise the rational explanation behind the dinner party hoax is ironic in light of Hogg's frequent utilisation of mimicry and ventriloquism in his writing. The tale 'Scottish Haymakers', which accompanied an engraving of the same name by 'W. Kidd' in Ackermann's *Forget Me Not; A Christmas, New Year's, and Birthday Present, for 1834*, features the ventriloquist Monsieur Alexandre, and interestingly, Macnish's tale 'Death and the Fisherman' similarly features a ventriloquist and was published in the same annual just one year prior.⁴⁷ Further, Ian Duncan has noted the resonances between Burke's description of the physiognomical mimicry of the philosopher and theologian, Tommaso Campanella, and Gil-Martin's 'cameleon art', and the tales 'Some Passages in the Life of Colonel Cloud, in a Letter by the Ettrick Shepherd' and 'The Adventures of Captain John Lochy' contain characters with similar powers.⁴⁸

'Colonel Cloud' was published in *Blackwood's* in July 1825 and may have formed the basis for 'A Psychological Curiosity'. In opening the tale, the narrator cannot recall the name of a supposedly intimate acquaintance:

I was assured I knew him perfectly well, and, as I thought, for something very remarkable; but for all that I could toil in a confusion of reminiscences, I could not recollect his name, (indeed, I rarely ever recollect anybody's name at first,) so, for the present, I was obliged to defer addressing this intimate and interesting acquaintance.⁴⁹

The narrator asks 'several others, who was the gentleman in black, with the gold chain and quizzing-glass?' However,

All of them declared an acquaintance with his face – none with his name; and for several days and nights I could not forget the circumstances, but neither could I tell why I was so much interested in it.⁵⁰

⁴⁷ James Hogg, 'Scottish Haymakers', in *Contributions to Annuals and Gift-Books*, pp. 78-84; Robert Macnish, 'Death and the Fisherman', *Forget Me Not; A Christmas and New Year's, and Birthday Present for 1833*, ed. by Frederic Shoberl (London: Ackermann, 1833), pp. 245-66.

⁴⁸ *Scott's Shadow*, pp. 267-72; James Hogg, 'The Adventures of Captain John Lochy, written by himself', in James Hogg, *Altrive Tales: Collected among the Peasantry of Scotland and from Foreign Adventurers*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003; repr. 2005), pp. 79-159.

⁴⁹ James Hogg, 'Some Passages in the Life of Colonel Cloud', in *Contributions to Blackwood's*, pp. 166-80, (p. 166).

⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 167.

The substance of the narrative is devoted to the Ettrick Shepherd's humorous journey through the Highlands with Colonel Cloud, during which he discovers that the Colonel does not possess the grand aristocratic skills to which he lays claim. In the end it is revealed that the Colonel is in fact a common weaver whom the Shepherd was acquainted with previously merely as a tutor to an acquaintance's children. As David Groves indicates, throughout the tale, '[l]ike Gil-Martin, the "exalted" yet "dubious" colonel becomes a "singular apparition", appearing unexpectedly before the narrator in many disguises, and "so transformed, that a witch would not have known him"''.⁵¹ However, this power of transformation is not portrayed as supernatural, but is rather attributed to the Colonel's singularly fertile imagination.

'James Hogg' does not view the 'psychological curiosity' as supernatural, but rather as just outwith the threshold of the science of the mind. However, the mental sciences that he lists as progressively gaining currency – 'animal magnetism, metallic tractors, and homoeopathy' – are those that Macnish ridicules as figments of the imagination.⁵² In 1836 Macnish provided footnotes to the second edition of Amariah Brigham's *Remarks on the Influence of Mental Cultivation and Mental Excitement upon Health*. Here he notes that '[a]ny thing with respect to Animal Magnetism must be received with caution', and further elaborates that:

It is often highly injudicious in medical men to allow their patients to know the composition of the remedies which they prescribe for them. Whenever the imagination has anything to do with the case, let the patient remain in ignorance as to this point. Quacks show an admirable knowledge of human nature in concealing the composition of their medicines. Hence the influence of Solomon's Balm of Gilead, Morrison's Pills, and other panaceae of the same description, in soothing the weak nerves of the credulous and the hypochondriac. The egregious humbugs of homœopathy, metallic tractors, and animal magnetism, have their virtue, such as it is, in amusing the imaginations of people of this description.⁵³

Through his endorsement of such 'humbugs', 'James Hogg' is depicted as overly credulous and thus unable to intelligently harness the explanatory power of the burgeoning mental sciences. Truth eludes him as he revels in inexplicability – imagination overrules understanding.

⁵¹ David Groves, 'The Genesis of 'Gil-Martin': James Hogg, 'Colonel Cloud', and 'The Madman in the Mercury'', *Notes and Queries*, 52.4 (2005), 467-69, (p. 469).

⁵² 'A Psychological Curiosity', p. 32.

⁵³ Amariah Brigham, *Remarks on the Influence of Mental Cultivation and Mental Excitement upon Health*. With Notes by Robert Macnish (Glasgow: Reid; Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1836), p. 34, p. 119.

Fraserian Politics and a Quiz on the Ettrick Shepherd

In a letter to Moir dated 28 October 1834, Macnish writes:

Phrenology alone can account for such men as Hogg. ~~His~~ Certain of his organs are splendidly developed & others as miserably – this explains the fine imagination & miserable want of sense which this strange compound of genius & imbecility – of strength & weakness so oddly exhibits.⁵⁴

This analysis foreshadows the paradoxical nature of the reaction of ‘James Hogg’ to ‘A Psychological Curiosity’ – his imaginative fascination with causation and ridiculous inability to see the cause before him – and, as will be discussed below, also highlights the fact that Hogg himself was examined as ‘a psychological curiosity’. However, rather than providing an objective analysis of Hogg’s mind based on physical evidence, in this statement Macnish is venting his frustration at Hogg’s dealings with the editors of *Fraser’s Magazine* following the controversial publication of *The Domestic Manners and Private Life of Sir Walter Scott* (1834). In the manuscript letter, the analysis is immediately prefaced by the following:

You will observe a poem of Hogg’s in the last No of Fraser. What does the man mean by such conduct? He is abused like a pick pocket in one No & in the next he figures as a contributor. There is evidently a lamentable want of self-respect in Hogg. I believe after all that Fraser’s estimate of his Book on Scott was perfectly just: it is evidently a tissue of lies from beginning to end.⁵⁵

The poem that Macnish is referring to is most probably ‘Love’s Legacy. Canto I’, which appeared in *Fraser’s* in October 1834.⁵⁶ In August 1834 *Fraser’s* contained a review of *Domestic Manners* that was sufficiently virulent as to attract epistolary outcry. In ‘The Fraser Papers for September’, it is announced that:

We have a score of letters about Hogg, his sketch of Sir Walter Scott, and our notice of it in our last Number. Several people are inclined to think that we were too severe, and some have been so kind as to attribute our article to personal pique against the Shepherd. Heaven help the blockheads!⁵⁷

⁵⁴ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 28 October 1834, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50.

⁵⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁶ James Hogg, ‘Love’s Legacy. Canto First’, *Fraser’s*, 10 (October 1834), 403-08.

⁵⁷ ‘The Fraser Papers for September’, *Fraser’s*, 10 (September 1834), 365-78, (p. 378).

As Macnish was extremely prideful of maintaining his own literary reputation, he was greatly chagrined over Hogg's apparent ineptitude in dealing with the periodical press. As Moir notes in his 'Life' of Macnish, 'It was ever and anon, however, provoking to see the indiscretion of Hogg's friends, who insisted thrusting him forwards on many occasions only to shew his weakness.'⁵⁸ However, Macnish was not himself guiltless of quizzing the Ettrick Shepherd within the pages of *Fraser's*.

'The Fraser Papers for February' in 1833 contain what Moir refers to as 'a very good quiz on the universality of the genius of the Ettrick Shepherd' written by Macnish.⁵⁹ The 'short article of mixed prose and verse' entitled 'The Ettrick Shepherd and Stewart of Glenmoriston' was sent in to *Fraser's*, along with 'A Bacchanalian Song', in December 1832 and responds to a newspaper article reporting Hogg's grand performance in the St. Ronan's Border Club's archery contest in October 1832.⁶⁰ Hogg founded the St. Ronan's Border Club in Innerleithen in 1827 as an attempt to re-instill traditional, local rural culture and was an active and successful participant in its annual games.⁶¹ His success on a circumscribed level, however, is used by Macnish as a tool to check his vanity and critique his universality.

A tone of protective ownership is initiated from the outset with the opening, 'Dear to us, and to all who know him, is the Ettrick Shepherd', and this is reinforced by a pleasant albeit condescending statement of the Shepherd's worth – praising his 'genius', 'the goodness and simplicity of his character, and the wonderful variety and excellence of his writings'.⁶² The reference to 'the world' having 'lately gone ill with James' which follows, is most probably in reference to the spleen generated by his publication of a new version of his 'Memoirs' within *Altrive Tales* (1832), and the condemnation of the scurrilous use Hogg has received from 'some, who, considering the benefits they have received at his hands, should have treated him very differently' is ironic in light of the highly critical review of the 'Memoirs' in *Fraser's* in May 1832.⁶³ Overall, Macnish appears to be embracing the Fraserian (and also Blackwoodian) prerogative to abuse and disabuse the Shepherd at will.⁶⁴

⁵⁸ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 320.

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 317.

⁶⁰ Robert Macnish, 'The Ettrick Shepherd and Stewart of Glenmoriston', in 'The Fraser Papers for February', *Fraser's*, 7 (February 1833), 240-50, (p. 247); *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 254, p. 317.

⁶¹ For more background, see David Groves, *James Hogg and the St Ronan's Border Club* (Dollar: Douglas S. Mack, 1987); *James Hogg: A Life*, pp. 206-07.

⁶² 'The Ettrick Shepherd and Stewart of Glenmoriston', p. 247.

⁶³ *Ibid.*, p. 247; 'The Altrive Tales', *Fraser's*, 5 (May 1832), 482-89.

⁶⁴ On Hogg's treatment in *Fraser's*, see Gillian Hughes, 'Introduction', in James Hogg, *A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997), pp. xi-xxxiii, (pp. xi-xv).

The newspaper article that is said to have inspired Macnish's response is ludicrous in its own right. The accolades achieved by the aged Shepherd ring out progressively, painting Hogg as a very big fish in a very small sea. As Macnish summarises:

Here we have Hogg *gaining the prize-bow* – then *sweeping* away the sweepstakes – then *presiding at Cameron's Inn* over his vanished rivals – then *singing his own songs* – and, lastly, stepping forth at nine o'clock and *dancing with the bonnie Tweedside lassies till one in the morning*; and all this, be it remembered, at the good, ripe, joint-stiffening age of *sixty-two*.⁶⁵

'Such exploits are well worthy of being celebrated in prose and verse', Macnish (taking on the role of Fraserian editor), claims to have received numerous tributes, in which 'the authors strive to do all manner of homage to the victor, proving him to be the greatest archer since the days of Teucer or Paris'.⁶⁶ Macnish's own poem, which is presented as 'a single specimen from Kelso', plays on similarly absurd comparisons.⁶⁷ The match between the Ettrick Shepherd and Glenmoriston, is described as 'like a match 'twixt Friar Tuck and famous Robin Hood, | Or lion bold and unicorn, a-fighting for the crown'.⁶⁸ The vanity which characterised the Shepherd's persona is played upon in the second stanza:

For writing of a ditty, it is perfectly well known,
That our well-beloved Shepherd he standeth quite alone;
Scott, Moore, and Allan Cunningham, eke Burns and Byron too,
Have ne'er done aught like what he's done, and what he yet may do.⁶⁹

The only point of praise for his prose, however, is the amount that he has written, as 'if you except Galt, Cobbet, and Scott, and such | I'm certain there is not a scribe, written half as much'.⁷⁰ In his biography Moir is careful to inform the reader that 'Mr Macnish could intend nothing severe or satirical in this pleasant doggrel; and no one either estimated the Shepherd's powers more generously than he, or bore that remarkable man a heartier good will'.⁷¹ Interestingly, he here softens the quizzical tone of the article by eliminating the prose introduction.⁷² Similarly, he revises Macnish's accusation that Hogg's *Domestic Manners* 'is

⁶⁵ 'The Ettrick Shepherd and Stewart of Glenmoriston', p. 248.

⁶⁶ Ibid., p. 248.

⁶⁷ Ibid., p. 248.

⁶⁸ Ibid., p. 249.

⁶⁹ Ibid., p. 248.

⁷⁰ Ibid., p. 248.

⁷¹ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 320.

⁷² Ibid., pp. 317-20.

evidently a tissue of lies from beginning to end’ to ‘it is evidently a tissue of absurdity and invention from beginning to end’, and also adds a comment on the ‘truculent severity’ of the Fraserian review.⁷³ The result is that Macnish appears to hold Hogg in higher esteem than his correspondence indicates is the case. This is not to insinuate that Macnish did consider Hogg to be a genius – his genius, according to Macnish, was simply only partial.

The Ettrick Shepherd, a Psychological Curiosity

Underlying Macnish’s statement on the ‘strange compound of genius and imbecility’ exhibited by the Shepherd is a defence of phrenology. Hogg’s paradoxical imaginative genius and apparent lack of common sense are held up as evidence that the brain is not a single organ. As Macnish explains in *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836):

The perversion in madness, and the wakefulness in dreaming, of certain faculties, can be explained only by supposing that each of these faculties has a separate locality in the brain. It is only on the same principle that partial genius and partial idiocy can be accounted for.⁷⁴

Macnish’s commentary may be purely conjectural (and also given in an apparent heat of passion); however, there is clear evidence to indicate that a phrenological mask of Hogg was taken prior to Macnish’s epistolary expostulations in October 1834, and most probably prior to August 1833.⁷⁵ While there is no indication of the motivations behind Hogg’s decision to allow a mask to be taken and no record of an official phrenological analysis, the existence of the mask is indicative of the continued interest in Hogg’s psychology. Lockhart earlier references this interest in *Peter’s Letters to his Kinsfolk* (1819), when he humorously alleges that, ‘As for the Ettrick Shepherd, I am told that when Spurzheim was here, he never had his paws off him’.⁷⁶

Macnish’s statement is based, not on physical evidence, but on his reading of the narrative of Hogg’s life, and in particular, Hogg’s life as mediated through the periodical press. The first number of ‘Literary Characters. – By Pierce Pungent’, published in *Fraser’s* in April 1830, focuses on Hogg, and here his ‘condition of life’ is said to excite, ‘when his works are

⁷³ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 28 October 1834, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50. Moir selectively quotes from this letter in his ‘Life’ (*The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 329-30).

⁷⁴ *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), p. 4.

⁷⁵ Megan Coyer, ‘The Phrenological Mask of the Ettrick Shepherd’, *SHW*, 20 (2009), 90-95.

⁷⁶ *Peter’s Letters to his Kinsfolk*, II, p. 341.

spoken of, a curiosity regarding the early development of powers so little to be looked for from that condition, and so, insensibly, joins criticism with a sort of necessary biography'.⁷⁷ As in the earlier Blackwoodian account, his genius is presented as inherently limited and circumscribed to the traditional and supernatural: When his fancy is applied to his

favourite theme, the dreamy superstitions of his country, and the dim shapes and indefinite thoughts that steal through the fancies of ignorant minds, while secluded afar in the wild glens of the land of the mountain and the flood, James is confessedly inimitable, and will probably preserve his poetry long in the land of his fathers, notwithstanding the heavy drawbacks upon it as calculated for posterity in several other important respects.⁷⁸

In contrast to the universal genius of Burns, Hogg is purely a poet of the imagination, as '[h]e has no knowledge of mankind, no keen sensibility, except to the merely beautiful and imaginative'.⁷⁹ His imaginative poetry is even at times marred by his lack of judgment, '[a]nd then he sometimes drops the aerial form of his jaunty Muse, and comes upon us in the great dreadnought shaggy shape of the wild shepherd of the forest'.⁸⁰ The ultimate value of the Shepherd's verse (for his prose writings are derided altogether) is 'our amusement and our wonder, when we consider by whom it was produced'.⁸¹

The examination of Hogg's genius in *Fraser's* is continued posthumously. In October 1836 Hogg's last contribution to the magazine is prefaced with a tribute to his natural genius, and his 'excellence in passages of *pure poetry*' is attributed to

the condition of the circumstances under which he grew up to the stature of manhood. His own mind and nature were the two treasure-houses of his knowledge – nature not scientifically observed, but sensibly – and mind not sophistically perverted, but naturally developed. Both he contemplated, but scarcely as distinct; and always as existing in harmonious union. To this it is owing that his supernatural fictions may boast of being clear at once of improbability and mysticism.⁸²

In October 1839 R. P. Gillies returns to the subject of Hogg's genius, and once again his biography largely informs the evaluation of his corpus, which is considered primarily as a 'literary curiosity' – as striking evidence of the innate character of poetic genius, since

⁷⁷ 'Literary Characters. — By Pierce Pungent. No. I. James Hogg', p. 296.

⁷⁸ Ibid., p. 294.

⁷⁹ Ibid., p. 300.

⁸⁰ Ibid., p. 297.

⁸¹ Ibid., p. 300.

⁸² James Hogg, 'The Ettrick Shepherd's Last Tale, Helen Crocket, with an Introduction by Oliver Yorke', *Fraser's*, 14 (October 1836), 425-40, (p. 428).

Hogg's avidity for learning and imaginative power seem to have been quite as *innate* and primary in his mind, as those conceptions of time, space, quantity, quality, and relation, which, according to philosophers, *must* exist in every mind before it can form a distinct object.⁸³

He is further attributed a Wordsworthian sensibility to external nature, such that for him

the words of a favourite ballad, the notes of a popular air, the conceptions of romantic characters (either of old times, or purely invented), become associated with the rushing of the wind through the forest (leafless or verdant, as the case may be), with the dashing of the mountain-torrent, with the temperature of the air, with the rising and setting of the sun and moon, till all nature becomes pervaded with intellectual life.⁸⁴

The poet's perception of external nature is truly unique, as 'external phenomena are for the poet like a book of characters, which he alone can properly read; or which for his mind have a meaning that to ordinary mortals is denied'.⁸⁵ However, this unique perception comes at a cost, and Hogg's supposed ineptitude in farming, shepherding and managing his monetary affairs is presented as evidence for the dictum, 'He who is born a poet is fit for nothing else'.⁸⁶

As Suzanne Gilbert has argued, Hogg played an active role in the production of his literary persona through the continual writing and re-writing of his life, and in particular, by expanding upon the poverty and ill-education of his early years and his providential calling as the heir to the Burnsian legacy.⁸⁷ Like Macnish's Colonel O'Shaughnessy, Hogg was multiplitious in his narratives. However, through his phrenological reading, Macnish insists upon a singular objective truth, and he allows the periodical press to define both the mental and physical qualities of the Ettrick Shepherd. In *An Introduction to Phrenology*, Macnish states that he would *expect* the Ettrick Shepherd to have a largely developed organ of 'Wonder', the function of which is:

To inspire a love of the strange, the new, and the marvellous. It gives a fondness for supernatural stories, and a love of visiting mysterious and unfrequented places; and also disposes to the belief in witches, apparitions, and superstition in general.⁸⁸

⁸³ Robert Pearse Gillies, 'Some Recollections of James Hogg', *Fraser's*, 20 (October 1839), 414-30, (p. 416, p. 415). The term 'curiosity' is also used in reference to Hogg on p. 419.

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 415.

⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 415.

⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 414.

⁸⁷ See Suzanne Gilbert, 'Introduction', in *The Mountain Bard*, pp. xi-lxix, (pp. lx-lxii).

⁸⁸ *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), p. 79.

When this organ is too strong in an individual, it is said to lead to ‘fanaticism, superstition, and credulity with respect to the mysterious’. The enthusiastic credulity of ‘James Hogg’ in ‘A Psychological Curiosity’ may be a reflection of his supposed large organ of Wonder, as Macnish explains that ‘the more marvellous a story, the readier it is believed by him who is amply endowed with Wonder’. The strong sentiment of Wonder expressed in ‘Kilmeny’ is presented as the narrative sign of Hogg’s phrenological endowment, and Radcliffe’s *Mysteries of Udolpho* and Coleridge’s *Christabel* are utilised similarly.⁸⁹ The subjective spectre has become objective reality. No longer is that spectre ‘a huge boar, garlanded with roses, heather-bell, and wild thyme’, but rather a well-developed bump ‘on the side of the head, above the temples’, ‘immediately above Ideality.’⁹⁰

The lack of a recorded phrenological evaluation of Hogg is striking in light of the highly publicised nature of Combe’s evaluation of Robert Burns and the heated discussions regarding Scott’s phrenological endowment. Both Burns and Scott were declared to be confirmations of the truth of the science, and if Hogg’s bumps did match his mental character, as revealed through his numerous memoirs and his literary corpus, the phrenologists most probably would have been eager to publicise his evaluation.⁹¹ However, the lack of a recorded phrenological analysis based on physical evidence suggests that for Hogg, the physical and the narrative may not have entirely coalesced – an appropriate coincidence for the author of the *Confessions*.

Section Conclusions

Macnish’s parody of Hogg’s characteristic device of narrative inexplicability in ‘A Psychological Curiosity’ may have been fuelled by Hogg’s frequent application of this device to narratives that Macnish might have used to support his embodied theory of mind. Hogg clearly had a keen understanding of the interaction between the mind and body; however, his literary works continually emphasise the dependence of the natural world on the ultimately unknowable wisdom of the Deity. A narrative openness is created which conflicts with the explanatory tendencies of Macnish’s phrenology. Ironically, Macnish puts Hogg’s name to a tale which may be read as narrative evidence of Hogg’s phrenological endowment – his

⁸⁹ Ibid., p. 80.

⁹⁰ Ibid., p. 81, p. 79. See above, pp. 80-81.

⁹¹ See, Megan Coyer, ‘The Literary Empiricism of the Phrenologists: Reading the Burnsian Bumps’, *The Drouth*, 30 (Winter 2008), 69-77.

‘strange compound of genius and imbecility’ and his large organ of Wonder. The extreme explicability of Macnish’s phrenology is juxtaposed against the delusional inexplicability of Hogg’s writing.

Macnish’s protectiveness of his own literary persona adds virulence to his actions, and his decision to use ‘James Hogg’ rather than ‘The Ettrick Shepherd’ makes his attack all the more direct. Both Macnish and Moir utilise their pseudonyms, ‘A Modern Pythagorean’ and ‘Delta’ in *The Scottish Annual*, and thus the decision to use ‘James Hogg’ appears to be purposeful. Beyond the ideological differences, Macnish appears to have been consistently dissatisfied with Hogg’s literary conduct. His contribution to Bell’s *Edinburgh Literary Journal* and his decision to continue to contribute to *Fraser’s* following their harsh review of his *Domestic Manners of Sir Walter Scott* are derided in letters to Moir, and, in general, Macnish disapproved of Hogg’s need to write for financial gain. In a letter to Moir, dated 29 May 1830, Macnish writes:

Did you notice Hogg’s absurd “Blackings Lays” in the Edinburgh & Leith advertiser? What a piece of nonsensical foolery. I am really astonished at the Shepherd sinking himself in that manner. Poor fellow! he seems to have gone all wrong, if I may judge by the sale of his effects.⁹²

Macnish is referring to ‘A Grand New Blacking Sang’, which accompanied an advertisement for the shoe blacking of Kyles & Co in the *Edinburgh, Leith, Glasgow, and North British Advertiser* on 22 May 1830.⁹³ Unfortunately, in contrast to Macnish, Hogg’s non-literary profession did not sufficiently provide for both him and his young family, and Macnish’s derision certainly appears unkind in retrospect. However, Hogg’s failure to live up to Macnish’s literary standards most probably played some part in his willingness to take the liberty of using ‘James Hogg’ in *The Scottish Annual*. One hopes that Macnish was unaware of the seriousness of Hogg’s illness when he penned the tale and that perhaps *The Scottish Annual* had made its way to the printers prior to Hogg’s death at Altrive on 21st November 1835. If so, Macnish expresses no regrets in his letters to Moir, but does later inquire, ‘Has any thing of consequence been collected for Hogg’s family? I hope so, for it is painful to think on a widow & her children being left in such circumstances as his were represented to be in.’⁹⁴

⁹² Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 29 May 1830, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 49.

⁹³ James Hogg, ‘A Grand New Blacking Sang’, *Edinburgh, Leith, Glasgow, and North British Advertiser*, 22 May 1830. This poetic advertisement was also published in the *Edinburgh Literary Journal*, 15 May 1830, p. 290.

⁹⁴ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 22 June 1836, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50.

Epilogue: Imagination and Science

In contrast to Macnish's increasing devotion to the explanatory power of science, Hogg remained steadfast in his defence of both 'fine fairy visions' and supernatural Christianity, which were inextricably linked in the ideology of his overall corpus.¹ His final full-length publication, *A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding* (1834), includes notions of embodiment not dissimilar to Macnish's. He writes in his sermon 'To Young Men', that while he 'would trust more to Lavater than to Spurzheim', '[t]he tones of the voice are the best symptoms in the world whereby to form a true and immediate judgment of a character.'² This is not a far cry from the 'chrestology' of the 'Mac-Nish clique', and interestingly confirms that Hogg was aware of Spurzheim and his ideas. However, in his sermon on 'Reason and Instinct', 'the Sage of Ettrick' presents an embodied conception of the soul on earth while defending the 'true wisdom' of Christian belief.³

As Gillian Hughes indicates in her introduction to the Stirling/South Carolina edition, the narrative voice in 'Reason and Instinct' echoes that of 'George Dobson's Expedition to Hell' and 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul'.⁴ Once again, an overtly anti-materialist stance is undercut by an embodied conceptualisation of the soul. In the opening Hogg makes a distinction between the spirit and the soul. The spirit is defined as 'the principle of animal life inherent in every living creature, and resident in the blood and the nerves', while the soul is said to be 'that reasonable and immortal substance in the human race which distinguishes them from all other earthly creatures, and is the fountain of thought, reason, and conception'.⁵ As the working of the human soul appears to be 'above human comprehension', Hogg chooses to 'attend to those near resemblances to reason and intelligence which we find in brute creation, and consider whether our souls be different from theirs, or only superior to them'.⁶ According to his previous distinction between the material spirit of 'blood and nerves' common to both man and beast and the immaterial soul unique to man, Hogg is effectively questioning if man's soul is truly immaterial. Problematically, however, he appears to find much in common between man and beast.

¹ 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul', p. 529. Douglas Mack and Carolyn Weber forward similar arguments in: Douglas Mack, 'Hogg and Angels', *SHW*, 15 (2004), 90-98; Carolyn A. Weber, 'Delighting in the Indissoluble Mixture: The Motley Romanticism of James Hogg', *SHW*, 17 (2006), 49-62.

² *Lay Sermons*, p. 50.

³ Hughes, 'Introduction', p. xxii; *Lay Sermons*, p. 60.

⁴ Hughes, 'Introduction', p. xxiv.

⁵ *Lay Sermons*, p. 58.

⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 59.

Fundamentally, both men and animals receive impressions from the external environment, but while Hogg insists that he has ‘never yet been able certainly to discover any approach to amelioration, any increase of wisdom, or any addition made to the experience or instinct of any animal, in any considerable degree, when left solely to the exertion of its own powers and ingenuity’, he gives several examples of ‘something very like reflection and judgment, in some animals, and like memory, in many more’.⁷ While the limited ‘reason of brutes’ is distinguished from that of man and is deemed ‘instinct’, Hogg continues to provide examples that question this distinction.⁸ Earlier in his sermon on ‘Good Breeding’, the power of forming ideas and communicating those ideas via language is deemed ‘the noblest distinction between man and the brutes’, but in ‘Reason and Instinct’ he writes ‘[t]hat animals have each a language of their own to one another, there can be no doubt’.⁹ After providing examples of language in a variety of birds and in sheep, Hogg degrades animal language in a curious statement that indicates he may be drawing a satirical parallel between the hierarchical divide between man and beast and the divide between upper and lower class man:

There is no doubt, then, that most animals have a language by which they can express their wishes and their fears to one another; but what is it compared with the extent to which the use of speech gives us access in our communications with our own species, and in managing or teaching those of the lower classes?¹⁰

The next example provided is the reaction of dogs to punishment or reward: Hogg distinguishes their behaviour from the true ‘power of conscience in man’, as ‘[t]hey may be wrought upon by approbation or hope of reward from man, but in all their dealings with one another they are wholly selfish’.¹¹ This statement is, however, contradicted by his previous examples of animals warning others of the approach of danger. For example, ‘[t]he black-faced ewe, on the approach of a fox or a dog, utters a whistle through her nostrils which alarms all her comrades, and immediately puts them upon the look-out’.¹² Despite the similarities between man and beast, which Hogg ironically draws whilst exclaiming upon the difficulty of drawing such parallels, his belief in the immateriality of the soul is unthreatened. In the end it is revealed that his original question is, in effect, irrelevant:

⁷ Ibid., p. 59, p. 60.

⁸ Ibid., p. 61.

⁹ Ibid., p. 31, p. 62.

¹⁰ Ibid., p. 63.

¹¹ Ibid., p. 63, p. 64.

¹² Ibid., p. 63.

I should not hesitate concerning the immortality of my own soul, though it were revealed from Heaven that the reason of beasts is the effect of organisation; nor should I abandon my hopes of immortality, though I knew that their souls were immaterial.¹³

The question of materiality loses its relevance in light of mankind's innate belief in immortality and the Christian revelation.

The crucifixion and resurrection of Christ are presented as the key to immortality for mankind. Hogg writes, 'And I have always had an idea, though I am far from pressing it on the belief of any one, that until once death was overcome, the gates of heaven were never opened to the souls of men.'¹⁴ Christ's resurrection must be re-enacted for each individual soul, as Hogg here embraces an embodied and truly supernatural Christianity. The vision of heaven is reminiscent of embodied conceptualisation in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and necessitates the same progress to perfection and purity of frame. God is the 'food of the soul', and

it will require both time and close application of mind to recover it to such a frame as shall dispose it for the pure spiritualities of religion; but it is only when our bodily eyes are finally closed that the eyes of our souls begin to see.¹⁵

While the 'clay tabernacle' on earth may be a fetter to our heavenly vision, 'let us not ever suppose that the organs of our mortal bodies are the only openings through which we can view the wisdom and works of God.'¹⁶ Hogg is able to defend a belief in the embodied soul and the dependence of the natural world on the ultimate wisdom of the Deity, which is 'a mystery beyond the power of human reason to unfold'.¹⁷

Macnish, in contrast, devoted his final years to unfolding the mysteries of the human mind through the science of phrenology. His correspondence with Combe began in October 1832, and by March 1835 they were sufficiently familiar for Macnish to send his critique of the second edition of Combe's *The Constitution of Man* (1835). While he praises much of Combe's work, he is critical of his attempt to reconcile science with scripture. He writes:

In a work of science when an attempt is made to reconcile things with Scripture I fear

¹³ Ibid., p. 64.

¹⁴ Ibid., p. 64.

¹⁵ Ibid., p. 64, p. 65.

¹⁶ Ibid., p. 66.

¹⁷ Ibid., p. 110.

that even the greatest talent must be often unsuccessful. You try to get over the difficulty by supposing that where Revelation appears inconsistent with scientific facts it has been wrongly interpreted, but I fear this is not mending the matter. Many things, whose just interpretation cannot be denied, go woefully against what is indicated by science – such as the creation of the world in six days, the age of the antediluvians, the arrestment of the Sun by Joshua, &c. Your work, in my humble opinion, is faultless except where it hits upon this subject, & I almost regret that you touched upon it at all. I can conceive that something of the kind is necessary for the purpose of quieting the prejudices of the weak & ignorant, but the very necessity for such a proceeding is ~~disagreeable~~ lamentable, & shows that the public mind has many prejudices to get quit of.¹⁸

In a subsequent letter, he softens his critique, writing that ‘now I think it very good – just as good as it could be when we consider the reservation under which, as things are, a writer is placed in treating of such subjects’.¹⁹ In February 1836 Macnish requests that Combe give a lecture in Glasgow, as ‘[t]he feeling in favour of phrenology is very strong in Glasgow & is daily increasing’, and the lecture came to fruition in the spring.²⁰

Macnish’s final work, before his untimely death on the 16th of January 1837, was the second edition of *An Introduction to Phrenology*, and in his last letter to Moir, dated 6 December 1836, he distinguishes the text as ‘the best of my works’.²¹ According to Moir, up until his last few weeks, Macnish continued on with his duties as a surgeon, and his death was attributed to influenza rapidly progressing into typhus fever.²² A reviewer of *An Introduction to Phrenology* captures the suddenness of his departure:

This work appears breathing with life, spirit, and observation, as if its author were himself ushering it into the world. There is no indication within it, or announcement about it, that would lead the reader to believe that the mind which had conceived it had fled, and that the hand which had written it was cold in death; yet such are the facts!²³

The reviewer presents Macnish’s increasing devotion to phrenology in his later years as a necessary negation of his imaginative pursuits in the realm of creative literature:

He studied also with intense interest Mr Combe’s work on the Constitution of Man, and informed the writer of the present notice, that the book had opened up to his mind a new view of life and the world, and given to his thoughts and aspirations higher interests and aims than they had ever before possessed. His pursuits in the region of fancy then

¹⁸ Letter of Robert Macnish to George Combe, 27 March 1835, NLS MS 7235, fols 182-85.

¹⁹ Letter of Robert Macnish to George Combe, 24 April 1835, NLS MS 7235, fols 186-87.

²⁰ Letter of Robert Macnish to George Combe, 2 February 1836, NLS MS 7240, fols 94-95.

²¹ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 6 December 1836, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50.

²² *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, pp. 402-06.

²³ ‘Macnish’s *An Introduction to Phrenology*’, *Phrenological Journal*, 10 (1836-1837), 552-56, (p. 552).

appeared to him unprofitable, he felt the superiority of the principles of science, and stated that he was conscious of a revolution taking place in his whole mental condition.²⁴

Whether this disavowal of the realm of fancy would have proven true is of course unknowable, but interestingly presupposes the necessity of a decisive choice between science and imagination. Similarly, early in his literary career, in his 'Sketches of British Literature' for *The Literary Melange* and *The Emmet*, Macnish explains that scientific thinking in the eighteenth century decreased the power of imagination:

The ethereal touch, which coloured the imagination of man with the hues of heaven, and made him, as it were, a creature of the elements, operated no longer. The music from above ceased to fling its melody around him – he beheld no more, in vision, the glimpses of paradise: Earth became more remote from the skies. In a word, man was no longer the being of poetry. He was the votary of sense and science – a close observer of nature – a worshipper of matter of fact.²⁵

According to the same series of sketches, the present age represents a rebirth of originality and imaginative genius; however, this by no means implies that Enlightenment empiricism lost its sway.²⁶ Like Hogg and characteristic of the era, Macnish created his own unique balance of science and imagination in his writing.

Towards the end of 1835, 'a very handsome brochure, beautifully done up in a bright green cover, with resplendent gilt edges', entitled 'The Angel and the Spirit – A Mystery' was published anonymously in Glasgow by William M'Phun, and Moir indicates in his 'Life' that '[t]he authorship has been hitherto quite a secret; and I daresay, few or none have ever laid the imputation on Mr. Macnish'.²⁷ The poem consists of a dialogue between an angel and a spirit who has just departed from his earthly flesh and must be guided onward to his heavenly abode. An earlier version of the poem was published in *The Literary Melange* in January 1823, but in early 1835 Macnish sent the poem to Moir for advice on revising it for publication.²⁸ Moir generously provided a chorus and lengthy additions to the poem, which are indicated

²⁴ Ibid., p. 553.

²⁵ Robert Macnish, 'Sketches of British Literature. Sketch V. The Era Including the Reign of George II. and Part of that of George III', *The Emmet*, 2 (27 December 1823), 145-51, (p. 146).

²⁶ Robert Macnish [signed The Bard of the Ugly Club], 'Sketches of British Literature. Sketch VI. The Era Including the Last Sixteen Years of George III. Down to the Present Time', *The Emmet*, 2 (3 January 1824), 157-62.

²⁷ 'The Angel and the Spirit – A Mystery', *Glasgow Courier*, 45 (7 January 1836); *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 357. No physical copy of 'The Angel and the Spirit' has apparently survived, and thus Moir's reproduction of the text in his 'Life' and the physical description in the review are invaluable.

²⁸ *The Modern Pythagorean*, I, p. 340.

with quotation marks in the ‘Life’.²⁹ Macnish’s insistence on secrecy may reflect the poem’s contradictions with his statements on religion and ‘pursuits in the realm of fancy’ to his phrenological associates at this time. The poem has strong resonances with Hogg’s *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, including analogies between dreaming and heaven, God and the sun, as well as the need for physical transformation to withstand the sublime beauty of heaven. The Angel states: ‘I shall anoint thine eyeballs, that their strength | May look on angels. Canst thou see now?’³⁰ The additions made by Moir resonate with ‘On the Separate Existence of the Soul’, as the spirit longs to view the places and people he left behind before passing onward to heaven, satisfied ‘That all is vanity, save moral worth, | Sublimed by pure religion’.³¹ However, none of Hogg’s ironies are present in the text – despite the ludicrous reference to ‘eyeballs’ in a heavenly context. A reviewer for the *Glasgow Courier* criticises Macnish’s choice of subject matter, declaring:

Who but Milton, or Mr. John Bunyan, or, in later times, Mr. Robert Pollok, would ever have dreamed of penning a description of the departure and journey of the “immortal soul” from its frail tenement of clay to the portals of paradise.³²

Interestingly, the reviewer then goes on to insinuate that the spirit is dreaming rather than ascending to heaven – the same criticism that at least one reviewer applied to *The Pilgrims of the Sun*.³³ In contrast, Macnish’s spirit does not awaken, and there is no indication that this poem is in fact a dream vision. Despite Moir’s claim that Macnish awakened from the imaginative delusions of his youthful time in Caithness, Macnish clearly was still drawn to poetic flights of fancy at the end of his literary career. He simply indulged in his most extravagant flight anonymously. As with ‘The Angel and the Spirit’, many of the poetic pieces he published in *Fraser’s* and *The Scottish Annual* were previously published in *The Literary Melange*, and thus some credence may be given to Macnish’s claim that his poetic imagination was ‘obliterated by pursuits into which nothing but dry facts & drier reasoning finds an avenue’.³⁴ Although he derided the partial genius of the Ettrick Shepherd and ridiculed his device of narrative inexplicability, one wonders if there might also be some degree of jealousy of Hogg’s resplendent imagination.

²⁹ Ibid., pp. 357-69.

³⁰ Ibid., p. 364.

³¹ Ibid., p. 361.

³² ‘The Angel and the Spirit – A Mystery’, *Glasgow Courier*, 45 (7 January 1836).

³³ See above, p. 44.

³⁴ Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 22 June 1836, NLS Acc. 9856, No. 50.

At the outset of the current thesis, the question was posed: How is Hogg's writing related to medical thinking and the science of the mind? The examination of Hogg's relationship with Macnish and their many shared preoccupations has offered several possible answers. Firstly, the connection between moral virtue and health pervades both authors' corpuses, as the relationship between cause and effect is literalised through physically and therefore mentally transformational experiences. For Hogg this is portrayed most vividly in the contrasting yet complimentary experiences depicted in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and the *Confessions*: Mary Lee's physical body and thus her mind are progressively transformed to bring her closer to the divine mind, whereas in the *Confessions*, Robert Wringhim's progressive physical and mental degradation creates a hell on earth. Physicality underlines morality in a similar fashion in Macnish's prose tales, but the fullest delineation of this retributive causality is found in *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*. The didactic natural theology of the era, and particularly that of Thomas Chalmers, may have been a significant influence on this aspect of both Hogg and Macnish's writing.

Secondly, both Hogg and Macnish's engagement with the debate surrounding the explained supernatural has a profound impact on their writings. In the early nineteenth-century, medical thinkers, antiquarians, and philosophers applied physiological theories to traditionally supernatural narratives – fairy flights and apparitional encounters were interpreted as unusually vivid ideas, mistaken as actual physical impressions. While Macnish was hesitant to fully accept this approach early in his literary career on the grounds of the enhanced aesthetic experience associated with supernatural belief, by the end of his life, he was devoted to the explanatory power of phrenology. Hogg's reaction to these physiological theories is more nuanced, but does remain consistent throughout his literary career. His writings suggest that he understood and accepted an embodied theory of mind; however, he does not privilege the physiological over the traditional supernatural explanations. All subjectivities are placed on an equal plain of experiential and explanatory validity, as he works against the assimilatory narrative of enlightenment. This is exemplified most famously in the *Confessions*, wherein Hogg draws upon the contemporary discourses on drunkenness, dreaming, double consciousness, phrenology, and natural theology, while also insisting upon the existence of supernatural forces beyond the realm of current scientific theory. Not far beyond, however, as the natural and supernatural are revealed to be ultimately one and God may work through natural, physical means. The physiobiological theories themselves are not the target of Hogg's critique; it is rather persons who view materialistic theories as disproving

the existence of God, as well as the supernatural more generally. As such, Hogg's narrative inexplicability can be read as a defence of embodied theories of mind against the accusation that they necessarily lead to atheism. Macnish, however, who may perhaps be compared to the enlightened 'young laird of Gillian Brae', shows little humility in forwarding his embodied theory of mind and appears to have gone too far in ridiculing supernatural belief.³⁵ The extent to which Hogg may have reacted specifically against his phrenological theory of sleep is evidenced by an examination of the changes made to the second version of 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic' and also by reading 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' as a response to *The Philosophy of Sleep*. An embodied theory of mind grants physical power to all forms of belief, and Macnish's depiction of supernatural belief as pathological vulnerability in his popular medical writing appears one-sided when one examines the healing power of the imagination in Hogg's corpus. For Hogg, one comes closest to a divine understanding of the natural world through aesthetic experience and imaginative belief, which ready the mind and body for the joys of the world to come.

Perhaps the most crucial point of connection between Hogg and Macnish is their shared preoccupation with the methodologies of the science of the mind. The problematic legacy of enlightenment sympathy – the blurred distinction between self and other – the inability to read the signs of the external world beyond one's own subjectivity – haunts the literature of this period and materialises in the form of apparitional encounters and the double self. How does one ever know the mind of the other and thus apply Baconian inductive methodology in the science of the mind? Macnish's literary practice, and in particular, his utilisation of the phenomenological narrative, is a way to gain access to the mind of the other, and this is particularly effective during the revealing liminality of drunkenness and dreaming, as the mask of the public persona melts away. The hallucinatory experiences of many of Macnish's protagonists, such as Colonel O'Shaughnessy or the distressed innkeeper in 'The Man with Nose', resonate with Wringhim's uncanny experience, and both authors utilise perceptual hallucinations to emphasise the inability of the individual to read the signs of the world beyond their own corporealised subjectivity. For Macnish, phrenology would eventually become the ultimate answer, as the coalescence of narrative and physical signs verified the significance of each and removed the bias of the spectator. The contrast between the extreme explicability of phrenology and Hogg's device of narrative inexplicability is ridiculed by Macnish in 'A Psychological Curiosity', in a hoax which reads like a cruel hangover of the

³⁵ See above, p. 178.

Blackwoodian era. While Hogg presents narratives that might be used to forward an embodied theory of mind, he casts doubt on narrative-based inductive methodology by emphasising the duplicity of interpretation. This ideological difference, along with Macnish's disapproval of Hogg's management of his literary persona, go a long way in explaining Macnish's increasingly negative treatment of the Ettrick Shepherd.

Finally, Hogg, as an autodidactic peasant-poet, was himself an object of study in the science of the mind, and, in particular, 'Kilmeny' and *The Pilgrims of the Sun* were read as evidencing his primitive tone of mind – his privileging of the world of imagination over external reality, and thus his inability to sympathise with contemporary society. However, the notes later added to *The Pilgrims of the Sun* emphasise the very real physical power of the imagination and the portrayal of the Ettrick Shepherd as the inheritor of heavenly vision – as one who can see the supernatural in the natural world and has thus progressed towards true enlightenment – towards sympathetic attunement with the divine mind. An informed knowledge of the physiological theories of dreaming, phrenology, drunkenness, and the science of the mind more generally, can be seen in a number of Hogg's texts, and it is probable that the predisciplinary nature of the Romantic periodical press, which fostered writers such as the Modern Pythagorean, was a significant source of Hogg's scientific learning. Rather than merely 'a psychological curiosity', he was also, very clearly, psychologically curious, and, further, utilised his scientific knowledge to formulate an embodied theory of the imagination, the mind, and the soul, which both accommodated belief in the supernatural to an enlightened era and defended its ultimate reality.

Bibliographies

The 'Chronological Bibliography of Periodicals and Annuals' is included as a CD insert due to its expansive size. Please see this CD for primary material by Hogg and Macnish published in periodicals and annuals.

General Bibliography

Primary:

Abercrombie, John, *Inquiries Concerning the Intellectual Powers and the Investigation of Truth* (Edinburgh: Waugh and Innes; Glasgow: Ogle; Dublin: Curry; London: Whittaker, Treacher & Arnot, 1830)

Alderson, John, *An Essay on Apparitions, in which their Appearance is Accounted for by Causes Wholly Independent of Preternatural Agency*, new edn (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green, 1823)

Alexander, Disney, *A Lecture on Phrenology, as Illustrative of the Moral and Intellectual Capacities of Man* (London: Baldwin, Cradock and Joy; Edinburgh: Anderson; Wakefield: Stanfield, 1826)

Baxter, Andrew, *An Enquiry into the Nature of the Human Soul; Wherein the Immateriality of the Soul is Evinc'd from the Principles of Reason and Philosophy*, 3rd edn, 2 vols (London: Millar, 1745)

Beattie, James, *Dissertations Moral and Critical* (London: Strahan; Cadell; Edinburgh: Creech, 1783)

———., *Evidences of the Christian Religion; Briefly and Plainly Stated*, 2 vols (London: Strahan; Cadell; Edinburgh: Creech, 1786)

Brewster, Sir David, *Letters on Natural Magic, Addressed to Sir Walter Scott, Bart.*, 5th edn (London: Murray, 1842)

Brigham, Amariah, *Remarks on the Influence of Mental Cultivation and Mental Excitement upon Health. With Notes by Robert Macnish* (Glasgow: Reid; Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1836)

Brown, James, *The "Life" of the Ettrick Shepherd Anatomized; in a Series of Strictures on the Autobiography of James Hogg, Prefixed to the First Volume of the "Altrive Tales." By an Old Dissector* (Edinburgh: Hunter, 1832)

Burke, Edmund, *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*, ed. by Adam Phillips (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990; repr. 1998)

Burnet, Thomas, *The Sacred Theory of the Earth: Containing an Account of its Original*

Creation, All the General Changes Which It Hath Undergone, or Is to Undergo, Until the Consummation of All Things, 7th edn, 2 vols (London: Osborn, Hitch and Hawes; Whiston and White; Rivington, Rivington and Fletcher; Johnston, Wilson and Durham; Crowder, Woodgate and Brooks; Davey and Law; Field, Stuart, Caslon, 1759), in *ECCO*
<<http://find.galegroup.com/ecco/infomark.do?&contentSet=ECCOArticles&type=multipage&tabID=T001&prodId=ECCO&docId=CW120871036&source=gale&userGroupName=glasuni&version=1.0&docLevel=FASCIMILE>> [accessed 24 February 2010]

Burns, Robert, *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns*, ed. by James Kinsley, 3 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1968)

Carmichael, Andrew, *An Essay on Dreaming, Including Conjectures on the Proximate Cause of Sleep* (Dublin: Cumming, 1818)

Chalmers, Thomas, *Discourses on the Christian Revelation, Viewed in Connection with the Modern Astronomy. To Which Are Added, Discourses Illustrative of the Connection between Theology and General Science* (Glasgow: Collins; London: Hamilton, Adams, & Co., [n.d.])

———, *Sermons and Discourses by Thomas Chalmers, D.D., LL.D., Now Completed by the Introduction of his Posthumous Sermons*, 2 vols (New York: Carter, 1860), in *Google Books*
<<http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=6GwrAAAAYAAJ&printsec=frontcover&dq=editions:HARVARDAH4VS9#v=onepage&q&f=false>> [accessed 6 June 2010]

———, *Sermons, Preached in the Tron Church, Glasgow*, 2nd edn (Glasgow: Chalmers and Collins; Edinburgh: Waugh and Innes; London: Whittaker, 1821)

Chamisso, Adelbert von, *The Shadowless Man, Peter Schlemihl*, trans by Sir John Bowring and illustrated by Gordon Browne (London: Chatto & Windus, 1910)

Coleridge, Samuel Taylor, 'On the imagination, or esemplastic power', in *Biographia Literaria or Biographical Sketches of My Literary Life and Opinions*, in *The Collected Works of Samuel Taylor Coleridge*, ed. by James Engell and W. Jackson Bate, Bollingen Series: 75, 2 vols (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1983; repr. 1984), I, pp. 295-306

Combe, George, *The Constitution of Man Considered in Relation to External Objects*, 4th edn (Edinburgh: Chambers, 1836)

———, *Elements of Phrenology* (Edinburgh: Anderson; London: Simpkin & Marshall, 1824)

———, *Essays on Phrenology: or, An Inquiry into the Principles and Utility of the System of Drs Gall and Spurzheim, and into the Objections Made Against It* (Edinburgh: Bell & Bradfute; London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, & Brown, 1819)

———, *Phrenological Observations on the Cerebral Development of David Haggart, Who Was Lately Executed at Edinburgh for Murder, and Whose Life Has Since Been Published* (Edinburgh: Tait; London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown; Glasgow: Turnbull, 1821)

———, *A System of Phrenology*, 3rd edn (Edinburgh: Anderson; London: Longman, 1830)

Crichton, Alexander, *An Inquiry into the Nature and Origin of Mental Derangement. Comprehending a Concise System of the Physiology and Pathology of the Human Mind and a History of the Passions and their Effects*, 2 vols (London: Cadell and Davies, 1798)

A Criticism on the Pictures in the Glasgow Exhibition; with a Letter to the President and Members of the Dilettanti Society, Containing Strictures on a Pamphlet, Entitled, "A Glance at the Glasgow Dilettanti Society's Exhibition." (Glasgow: Duncan, 1835)

Darwin, Erasmus, *Zoonomia; or, the Laws of Organic Life*, 2 vols (Dublin: Byrne and Jones, 1794-1796)

Davy, Humphry, *Researches, Chemical and Philosophical; Chiefly Concerning Nitrous Oxide, or Dephlogisticated Nitrous Air, and its Respiration* (London: Johnson, 1800)

De Quincey, Thomas, *The Confessions of an English Opium-Eater* (London: Dent; New York: Dutton, 1960; repr. 1967)

Ferriar, John, *An Essay Towards a Theory of Apparitions* (London: Cadell and Davies, 1813)

———., *Medical Histories and Reflections*, 3 vols (London: Cadell and Davies, 1810)

Forester, Thomas, *Somatopsychonologia: Showing that the Proofs of Body Life and Mind Considered as Distinct Essences Cannot be Deduced from Physiology but Depend on a Distinct Sort of Evidence Being an Examination of the Controversy Concerning Life Carried on by MM. Laurence, Abernethy, Rennell, & Others. By Philostratus* (London: Hunter, 1823)

Gibbon, Charles, *The Life of George Combe, Author of "The Constitution of Man."*, 2 vols (London: Macmillan, 1878)

Gilfillan, George, *The History of a Man* (London: Hall, Virtue, & Co., 1856)

A Glance at the Glasgow Dilettanti Society's Exhibition – MDCCCXXXV. With a Dialogue Between the Present Secretary and a Deceased Member of the Society. Being a Complete Catalogue Raisonne of the Exhibition, with the Prices of the Pictures Annexed, 2nd edn (Glasgow: Reid; Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1835)

Haggart, David, *The Life of David Haggart, Alias John Wilson, Alias John Morison, Alias Barney M'Coul, Alias John M'Colgan, Alias Daniel O'Brien, Alias The Switcher. Written by Himself, While under the Sentence of Death* (Edinburgh: Ballantyne, 1821)

Hanna, William, *Memoirs of Thomas Chalmers, D.D. LL.D.*, 2 vols (Edinburgh: Constable; London: Hamilton, Adams, and Co., 1857)

Hartley, David, *Hartley's Theory of the Human Mind, on the Principle of the Association of Ideas; with Essays Relating to the Subject of It. By Joseph Priestley, LL. D. F. R. S.*, 2nd edn (London: Johnson, 1790)

Haslam, John, *Observations on Madness and Melancholy: Including Practical Remarks on*

those Diseases; Together with Cases: and an Account of the Morbid Appearance on Dissection, 2nd edn (London: Callow, 1809)

Hibbert, Samuel, *A Description of the Shetland Islands, Comprising an Account of their Geology, Scenery, Antiquities, and Superstitions* (Edinburgh: Constable; London: Hurst, Robinson, and Co., 1822)

———., *Sketches of the Philosophy of Apparitions; or, An Attempt to Trace such Illusions to their Physical Causes* (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1824)

———., *Sketches of the Philosophy of Apparitions; or, An Attempt to Trace such Illusions to their Physical Causes*, 2nd edn (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1825)

Hoffman, E.T.A., *The Devil's Elixir*, trans. by R. P. Gillies (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1824)

Hogg, James, *Altrive Tales: Collected among the Peasantry of Scotland and from Foreign Adventurers*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003; repr. 2005)

———., *Anecdotes of Scott*, ed. by Jill Rubenstein (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1999)

———., *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1976)

———., *Collected Letters of James Hogg*, ed. by Gillian Hughes, 3 vols (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004-2008)

———., *Contributions to Annuals and Gift-Books*, ed. by Janette Currie and Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006)

———., *Contributions to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, Volume 1: 1817-1828*, ed. by Thomas C. Richardson (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008)

———., *Mador of the Moor*, ed. by James Barcus (Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh Press, 2005)

———., *The Mountain Bard*, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007)

———., *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, ed. by the late Jill Rubenstein and completed by Gillian Hughes and Meiko O'Halloran (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008)

———., *The Pilgrims of the Sun: A Poem* (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1815)

———., *The Poetical Works of James Hogg*, 4 vols (Edinburgh: Constable; London: Hurst, Robinson, & Co., 1822)

———., *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, ed. by Adrian Hunter

(Peterborough, Ontario: Broadview Literary Texts, 2001)

———., *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, ed. by P. D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2001; repr. 2002)

———., *The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Tale*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004; repr. 2005)

———., *A Queer Book*, ed. by P. D. Garside, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995)

———., *A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh Press, 1997)

———., *The Shepherd's Calendar*, 2 vols (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1829)

———., *The Shepherd's Calendar*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995; repr. 2002)

———., *The Shepherd's Guide: Being A Practical Treatise on the Diseases of Sheep, their Causes, and the Best Means of Preventing Them; with Observations on the Most Suitable Farm-Stocking for the Various Climates of this Country* (Edinburgh: Constable; London: Murray, 1807)

———., *Songs, by the Ettrick Shepherd* (Edinburgh: Blackwood; London: Cadell, 1831)

———., *The Spy, A Periodical Paper of Literary Amusement and Instruction, Published Weekly in 1810 and 1811*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000)

———., *Tales of Love and Mystery*, ed. by David Groves (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1985)

———., *Tales of the Wars of Montrose*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1996)

———., *The Three Perils of Man: War, Women and Witchcraft*, ed. by Douglas Gifford (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press in conjunction with The Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1989)

———., *The Three Perils of Woman; or Love, Leasing, and Jealousy: a Series of Domestic Scottish Tales*, ed. by Anthony Hasler and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995; repr. 2002)

———., *Winter Evening Tales*, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002; repr. 2004)

Hume, David, *An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding*, ed. by Tom L. Beauchamp (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999)

———., *A Treatise of Human Nature*, ed. by Ernest G. Mossner (Penguin Books, 1969; repr.

1985)

Lamb, Charles, 'Confessions of a Drunkard', in *Charles Lamb: Selected Prose*, ed. by Adam Phillips (Penguin Books, 1985), pp. 155-61

Lavater, Johann Caspar, *Essays on Physiognomy, Designed to Promote the Knowledge and the Love of Mankind*, trans by Henry Hunter, 3 vols (London: Murray; Hunter; Holloway, 1789-98), in *ECCO*

<<http://find.galegroup.com/ecco/infomark.do?&contentSet=ECCOArticles&type=multipage&tabID=T001&prodId=ECCO&docId=CW114546968&source=gale&userGroupName=glasuni&version=1.0&docLevel=FASCIMILE>> [accessed 26 February 2010]

Lockhart, J. G., *Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk*, 3rd edn, 3 vols (Edinburgh: Blackwood; London: Cadell and Davies, 1819)

Macnish, Robert, *The Anatomy of Drunkenness. An Inaugural Essay* (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1827)

———., *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 2nd edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1828)

———., *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 3rd edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1829)

———., *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 4th edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1832)

———., *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*, 5th edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1834)

———., *The Anatomy of Drunkenness. With a Sketch of the Author's Life*, new edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1859)

———., *The Book of Aphorisms. By a Modern Pythagorean* (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1834)

———., *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, 2nd edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1827)

———., *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, 3rd edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1827)

———., *The Confessions of an Unexecuted Femicide*, 4th edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1828)

———., *An Introduction to Phrenology, in the Form of Question and Answer, with an Appendix, and Copious Illustrative Notes* (Glasgow: Reid; Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, London: Whittaker, 1836)

———., *An Introduction to Phrenology*, 2nd edn (Glasgow: Symington; Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1837)

———., *The Philosophy of Sleep* (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1830)

———., *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 2nd edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1834)

———., *The Philosophy of Sleep*, 3rd edn (Glasgow: M'Phun, 1836)

Moir, D. M., *The Life of Mansie Wauch, Tailor in Dalkeith, Written by Himself* (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1905)

———., *The Modern Pythagorean; A Series of Tales, Essays, and Sketches, By the Late Robert Macnish, LL.D. With the Author's Life, By his Friend, D. M. Moir*, 2 vols (Edinburgh: Blackwood; London: Cadell, 1838)

———., *Practical Observations on Malignant Cholera, as that Disease Is Now Exhibiting Itself in Scotland*, 2nd edn (Edinburgh: Blackwood; London: Cadell, 1832)

Oliphant, Margaret, *Annals of a Publishing House: William Blackwood and his Sons, Their Magazine and Friends*, 3 vols (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1897-1898)

Ollivier, John, *Phrenology in Relation to the Novel, the Criticism, and the Drama* (London: John Ollivier, [1848])

Past Feelings Renovated; or, Ideas Occasioned by the Perusal of "Dr. Hibbert's "Philosophy of Apparitions." Written with the View of Counteracting any Sentiments Approaching Materialism, which that Work, However Unintentional on the Part of the Author, May Have a Tendency to Produce (London: Whittaker, 1828)

Polidori, John, *The Vampyre and Other Tales of the Macabre*, ed. by Robert Morrison and Chris Baldick (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997)

Reid, Thomas, *An Inquiry into the Human Mind On the Principles of Common Sense: A Critical Edition*, ed. by Derek R. Brookes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997)

Scott, Sir Walter, *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft, Addressed to J.G. Lockhart, Esq.* (London: Murray, 1830)

———., *Sir Walter Scott's Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*, ed. by T. F. Henderson, 4 vols (Edinburgh: Blackwood; New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1902)

———., *The Miscellaneous Prose Works of Sir Walter Scott, Bart.*, 28 vols (Edinburgh: Cadell; London: Whittaker, 1832-1836), XVIII: *Periodical Criticism, Romance* (1835)

———., *Sir Walter Scott: On Novelists and Fiction*, ed. by Ioan William (New York: Barnes & Noble, 1968)

The Scottish Enlightenment: An Anthology, ed. by Alexander Broadie (Edinburgh: Canongate Classics, 1997)

The Spectator, ed. by Donald F. Bond, 5 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1965)

Spurzheim, J. G., *Observations on the Deranged Manifestations of the Mind, or Insanity* (London: Baldwin, Cradock, and Joy, 1817)

———., *The Physiognomical System of Drs. Gall and Spurzheim; Founded on*

an Anatomical and Physiological Examination of the Nervous System in General, and of the Brain in Particular; and Indicating the Dispositions and Manifestations of the Mind (London: Baldwin, Cradock, and Joy; Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1815)

Stewart, Dugald, *Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind*, 3 vols (London: Strahan; Cadell; Edinburgh: Creech, 1792-1827)

———, *Philosophical Essays* (Edinburgh: Creech; Constable; London: Cadell and Davies; Murray; Constable, Hunter, Park, and Hunter, 1810)

Tales of Terror from Blackwood's Magazine, ed. by Robert Morrison and Chris Baldick (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995; repr. 1999)

Trotter, Thomas, *An Essay, Medical, Philosophical, and Chemical on Drunkenness and its Effects on the Human Body*, ed. by Roy Porter (London: Routledge, 1988)

Secondary:

Abrams, M. H., *Natural Supernaturalism: Tradition and Revolution in Romantic Literature* (London: Oxford University Press, 1971)

Albury, W. R., 'Ideas of Life and Death', in *Companion Encyclopedia of the History of Medicine*, ed. by W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter, 2 vols (London: Routledge, 1993), I, pp. 249-80

Alexander, J. H., 'Hogg in the *Noctes Ambrosianae*', *SHW*, 4 (1994), 37-47

Allard, James Robert, *Romanticism, Medicine, and the Poet's Body* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007)

Badham, Paul, *Christian Beliefs About Life After Death* (London: The Macmillan Press, 1976)

Bamborough, J. B., 'Introduction', in Robert Burton, *The Anatomy of Melancholy*, ed. by Thomas C. Faulkner, Nicolas K. Kiessling, and Rhonda L. Blair, 6 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989), I, pp. xiii-xxxvi

Barfoot, Michael, 'Brunonianism Under the Bed: An Alternative to University Medicine in Edinburgh in the 1780s', in *Brunonianism in Britain and Europe*, ed. by W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter, *Medical History*, Supplement No. 8 (London: Wellcome Institute for the History of Medicine, 1988), pp. 22-45

Batho, Edith C., *The Ettrick Shepherd* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1927)

Bell, Matthew, *The German Tradition of Psychology in Literature and Thought, 1700-1840* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005)

Benedict, Williston Russell, 'A Study of the "Second Self" in James Hogg's Fiction, with Reference to Its Employment in German Romantic Literature' (unpublished doctoral thesis, Columbia University, 1973)

- Bevan, Michael, 'MacNish, Robert (1802–1837)', in *DNB*
 <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/17718>> [accessed 19 April 2010]
- Beveridge, Allan, 'The Confessions of a Justified Sinner and the Psychopathology of the Double', *Psychiatric Bulletin*, 15 (1991), 344-45
- ., 'James Hogg and Abnormal Psychology: Some Background Notes', *SHW*, 2 (1991), 91-94
- Birkhead, Edith, *The Tale of Terror: A Study of Gothic Romance* (London: Constable, 1921)
- Bloedé, Barbara, 'The Confessions of a Justified Sinner: The Paranoiac Nucleus', in *Papers Given at the First James Hogg Society Conference (Stirling, 1983)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Stirling: The James Hogg Society, 1983), pp. 15-28
- ., 'A Nineteenth-Century Case of Double Personality: A Possible Source for *The Confessions*', in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, in conjunction with The James Hogg Society, 1988), pp. 117-27
- ., 'The Three Perils of Woman and the Edinburgh Prostitution Scandal: A Reply to Dr Groves', *SHW*, 3 (1992), 88-94
- ., 'The Witchcraft Tradition in Hogg's Tales and Verse', *SHW*, 1 (1990), 91-102
- Bold, Valentina, 'The Magic Lantern: Hogg and Science', *SHW*, 7 (1996), 5-17
- ., *James Hogg: A Bard of Nature's Making* (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2007)
- ., 'Traditional Narrative Elements in *The Three Perils of Woman*', *SHW*, 3 (1992), 42-56
- Bondeson, Jan, *Buried Alive: The Terrifying History of Our Most Primal Fear* (London: Norton, 2001; repr. 2002)
- Bridgwater, Patrick, 'Dream Texts' in *De Quincey's Gothic Masquerade* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2004), pp. 80-93
- British Literary Magazines: The Romantic Age, 1789-1836*, ed. by Alvin Sullivan (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1983)
- Brown, Stewart J., *Thomas Chalmers and the Godly Commonwealth* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982)
- Buckle, Henry Thomas, 'An Examination of the Scotch Intellect during the Eighteenth Century', in *On Scotland and the Scotch Intellect*, ed. by H. J. Hanham (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970), pp. 235-404

Budge, Gavin, 'Introduction: Empiricism, Romanticism, and the Politics of Common Sense', in *Romantic Empiricism: Poetics and the Philosophy of Common Sense, 1780-1830*, ed. by Gavin Budge (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2007), pp. 11-39

———, 'The Hero as Seer: Character, Perception and Cultural Health in Carlyle', *Romanticism and Victorianism on the Net*, 52 (November 2008), <<http://id.erudit.org/iderudit/019805ar>> [accessed 15 March 2010]

Bynum, William F., 'Chronic Alcoholism in the First Half of the Nineteenth Century', *Bulletin of the History of Medicine*, 42.2 (March/April 1968), 160-85

———, *Science and the Practice of Medicine in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994)

Caldwell, Janis McLarren, *Literature and Medicine in Nineteenth-Century Britain, From Mary Shelley to George Elliot* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004)

Campbell, Ian, 'James Hogg and the Bible', *SLJ*, 10.1 (May 1983), 14-29

Cameron, Kenneth J., 'Weir, William (1802–1858)', in *DNB* <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/28975>> [accessed 4 March 2010]

Cantor, Geoffey, 'The Edinburgh Phrenology Debate: 1803-1828', *Annals of Science*, 32.3 (May 1975), 195-218

———, 'The Rhetoric of Experiment', in *The Uses of Experiment: Studies in the Natural Sciences*, ed. by David Gooding, Trevor Pinch, and Simon Schaffer (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989; repr. 1993), pp. 159-80

Chapple, J. A. V., *Science and Literature in the Nineteenth Century* (London: Macmillan, 1986)

Charon, Rita, *Narrative Medicine: Honoring the Stories of Illness* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006)

Chitnis, Anand C., *The Scottish Enlightenment & Early Victorian English Society* (London: Croom Helm, 1986)

Clergy, E. J., *The Rise of Supernatural Fiction, 1762-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995; repr. 1999)

Cooter, Roger, *Phrenology in the British Isles: An Annotated, Historical Biobibliography and Index* (Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, 1989)

———, *The Cultural Meaning of Popular Science: Phrenology and the Organization of Consent in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984)

Coyer, Megan, 'The Literary Empiricism of the Phrenologists: Reading the Burnsian Bumps', *The Drouth*, 30 (Winter 2008), 69-77

———., ‘The Phrenological Mask of the Ettrick Shepherd’, *SHW*, 20 (2009), 90-95

Craig, Cairns, ‘“Kant has not answered Hume”: Empiricism and Romantic Imagination’, in *Romantic Empiricism: Poetics and the Philosophy of Common Sense, 1780-1830*, ed. by Gavin Budge (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2007), pp. 40-63

Crary, Jonathan, *Techniques of the Observer: On Vision and Modernity in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1990)

Currie, Janette, ‘James Hogg and the *Scottish Annual*’, *SHW*, 11 (2000), 77-83

Cutmore, Jonathan, *Contributors to the Quarterly Review: A History, 1809-25*, 2 vols (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2008)

Daffron, Benjamin Eric, *Romantic Doubles: Sex and Sympathy in British Gothic Literature 1790-1830* (New York: AMS Press, 2002)

Daston, Lorraine and Peter Galison, *Objectivity* (New York: Zone Books, 2007)

de Giustino, David, *Conquest of Mind: Phrenology and Victorian Social Thought* (London: Croom Helm, 1975)

Duncan, Alexander, *Memorials of the Faculty of Physicians and Surgeons of Glasgow 1599-1850, with a Sketch of the Rise and Progress of the Glasgow Medical School and of the Medical Profession in the West of Scotland* (Glasgow: Maclehose, 1896)

Duncan, Ian, ‘Authenticity Effects: The Work of Fiction in Romantic Scotland’, *South Atlantic Quarterly*, 102.1 (2003), 93-116

———., ‘Blackwood’s and Romantic Nationalism’, in *Print Culture and the Blackwood Tradition, 1805-1930*, ed. by David Finkelstein (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006), pp. 70-89

———., ‘Edinburgh, Capital of the Nineteenth Century’, in *Romantic Metropolis: The Urban Scene of British Culture, 1780-1840*, ed. by James Chandler and Kelvin Gilmartin (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), pp. 45-64

———., ‘Hume and the Scottish Enlightenment’, in *The Edinburgh History of Scottish Literature, Volume Two: Enlightenment Britain and Empire (1707-1918)*, ed. by Susan Manning, Ian Brown, Thomas Owen Clancy, Murray Pittock, Ksenija Horvat, and Ashley Hales (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 71-79

———., *Scott’s Shadow: The Novel in Romantic Edinburgh* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007)

———., ‘The Upright Corpse: Hogg, National Literature and the Uncanny’, *SHW*, 5 (1994), 29-54

———., 'Walter Scott, James Hogg, and Scottish Gothic', in *A Companion to the Gothic*, ed. by David Punter (Oxford, Blackwell, 2000), pp. 70-80

Duncan, Ian and Douglas Mack, 'Hogg, Galt, Scott, and their Milieu', in *The Edinburgh History of Scottish Literature, Volume Two: Enlightenment, Britain and Empire (1707-1918)*, ed. by Susan Manning, Ian Brown, Thomas Owen Clancy, Murray Pittock, Ksenija Horvat, and Ashley Hales (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 211-20

Dunlop, C. R. B., 'Warren, Samuel (1807-1877)', in *DNB*
<<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/28792>> [accessed 1 March 2010]

Dwyer, John, *Virtuous Discourse: Sensibility and Community in Late Eighteenth-Century Scotland* (Edinburgh: Donald, 1987)

Eddy, M. D., 'The Medium of Signs: Nominalism, Language, and the Philosophy of Mind in the Early Thought of Dugald Stewart', *Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences*, 37 (2006), 373-93

Evans, Meredith, 'Persons Fall Apart: James Hogg's Transcendent Sinner', *Novel*, 36.2 (2003), 198-218

Eggenschwiler, David, 'James Hogg's *Confessions* and the Fall into Division', *SSL*, 9 (1971), 26-39

Epstein, Julia, *Altered Conditions: Disease, Medicine, and Storytelling* (New York: Routledge, 1995)

Faubert, Michelle, 'John Ferriar's Psychology, James Hogg's *Justified Sinner*, and the Gay Science of Horror-Writing', in *Romanticism and Pleasure: Disciplined Delights in British Literary Culture, 1780-1830*, ed. by Michelle Faubert and Thomas Schmid (Palgrave, forthcoming)

———., *Rhyming Reason: The Poetry of Romantic-Era Psychologists* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009)

Finkelstein, David, 'Introduction', in *Print Culture and the Blackwood Tradition, 1805-1930*, ed. by David Finkelstein (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006), pp. 3-17

Foucault, Michel, *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception*, trans. by A. M. Sheridan (London: Routledge, 1989; repr. 2003)

———., *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*, trans. by Alan Sheridan (Penguin: London, 1991)

———., *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason* (London: Routledge, 2001)

Fulford, Tim, 'General Introduction', in *Romanticism and Science, 1773-1833*, ed. by Tim Fulford, 5 vols (London: Routledge, 2002), I, pp. 1-49

Fang, Karen, 'A Printing Devil, a Scottish Mummy, and an Edinburgh Book of the Dead: James Hogg's Napoleonic Complex', *Studies in Romanticism*, 43.2 (2004), 161-85

Fenwick, Julie, 'Psychological and Narrative Determinism in James Hogg's *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *SLJ*, 15.1 (May 1988), 61-69

Fielding, Penny, 'Burial Letters: Death and Dreaming in Hogg's 'Cousin Mattie'', *SHW*, 16 (2005), 5-19

Flynn, Philip, 'Early Blackwood's and Scottish identities', *Studies in Romanticism*, 46.1 (Spring 2007), 43-56

———, *Enlightenment Scotland: A Study and Selection of Scottish Philosophical Prose from the Eighteenth- and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1992)

Ford, Jennifer, *Coleridge on Dreaming: Romanticism, Dreams and Medical Imagination* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998)

Fox, Warren, 'Violence and Victimization of Women: Engendering Sympathy for Hogg's Justified Sinner', *SSL*, 32 (2001), 164-79

French, R. K., *Robert Whytt, the Soul, and Medicine* (London: The Wellcome Institute of the History of Medicine, 1969)

Gide, André, 'Introduction', in James Hogg, *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (London: Cresset Press, 1947), pp. ix-xvi

Gifford, Douglas, *James Hogg* (Edinburgh: The Ramsay Head Press, 1976)

Gilbert, Suzanne, 'Hogg's 'Kilmeny' and the Ballad of Supernatural Abduction', *SHW*, 8 (1997), 42-55

Glance, Jonathan C., 'Ambiguity and Dreams in James Hogg's *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *SSL*, 28 (1993), 165-77

Grave, S. A., 'The Language of Sensation', in *The Scottish Philosophy of Commonsense* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1960), 159-81

Gribben, Crawford, 'The *Justified Sinner* (1824) and Scottish Presbyterian Demonology', *SHW*, 17 (2006), 127-30

Groves, David, 'Allusions to *Dr Faustus* in James Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SSL*, 18 (1983), 157-65

———, 'The Genesis of 'Gil-Martin': James Hogg, 'Colonel Cloud', and 'The Madman in the *Mercury*', *Notes and Queries*, 52.4 (2005), 467-69

———, *James Hogg: The Growth of a Writer* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1988)

- ., 'James Hogg's *Confessions*: New Information', *Review of English Studies*, 40 (May 1989), 240-42
- ., 'James Hogg's *Confessions* and the *Three Perils of Woman* and the Edinburgh Prostitution Scandal of 1823', *Wordsworth Circle*, 18.3 (1987), 127-31
- ., 'James Hogg's 'Singular Dream' and the *Confessions*', *SLJ*, 10.1 (May 1983), 54-66
- ., *James Hogg and the St Ronan's Border Club* (Dollar: Douglas S. Mack, 1987)
- ., 'James Hogg as a Romantic Writer', in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh, 1985)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1988), pp. 1-10
- ., 'Parallel Narratives in Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SLJ*, 9.2 (December 1982), 37-44
- ., "'The rapt breathing of high poesy': James Hogg's *Midsummer Night Dreams* and its 'Romantic' Context", *Scotia*, 16 (1992), 21-41
- ., '*The Three Perils of Woman* and the Edinburgh Prostitution Scandal of 1823', *SHW*, 2 (1991), 95-102
- Hacking, Ian, 'Double Consciousness in Britain 1815-1875', *Dissociation*, 4 (1991), 134-46
- Hall, Jason Y., 'Gall's Phrenology: A Romantic Psychology', in *Studies in Romanticism*, 16.3 (1977), 305-17
- Harries, Elizabeth W., 'Duplication and Duplicity: James Hogg's *Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Wordsworth Circle*, 10.2 (1979), 187-96
- Harris, Jason Marc, 'James Hogg's Use of Legend: Folk Metaphysics and Narrative Authority', in *Folklore and the Fantastic in Nineteenth-Century British fiction* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008), pp. 103-25
- Harrington, Anne, 'The Pre-1860 Legacy', in *Medicine, Mind, and the Double Brain: A Study in Nineteenth-Century Thought* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987), pp. 6-34
- Hartley, Lucy, *Physiognomy and the Meaning of Expression in Nineteenth-Century Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001)
- Heinritz, Reinhard and Silvia Mergenthal, 'Hogg, Hoffman, and Their Diabolical Elixirs', *SHW*, 7 (1996), 47-58
- Henderson, Lizanne and Edward J. Cowan, *Scottish Fairy Belief: A History* (East Lothian: Tuckwell Press, 2001)
- Henderson, Lizanne, 'The Road to Elfland: Fairy Belief and the Child Ballads', in *The Ballad in Scottish History*, ed. by Edward J. Cowan (East Lothian: Tuckwell Press, 2000), pp. 54-72

- Herdman, John, *The Double in Nineteenth-Century Fiction* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 1990)
- Higgins, David, *Romantic Genius and the Literary Magazine: Biography, Celebrity and Politics* (London: Routledge, 2005)
- Hilton, Boyd, *The Age of Atonement: The Influence of Evangelicalism on Social and Economic Thought, 1795-1865* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988)
- Hochel, Matej and Emilio G. Milán, 'Synaesthesia: The Existing State of Affairs', *Cognitive Neuropsychology*, 25.1 (2008), 93-117
- Hoover, Suzanne R., 'Samuel Taylor Coleridge, Humphry Davy, and Some Early Experiments with a Consciousness-altering Drug', *Bulletin of Research in the Humanities*, 81 (1978), 9-27
- Hughes, Gillian, *Hogg's Verse and Drama, A Chronological Listing* (Stirling: The James Hogg Society, 1990)
- , 'Hogg, Gillies, and German Romanticism', *SHW*, 14 (2003), 62-72
- , 'Hogg's Personal Library', *SHW*, 19 (2008), 32-65
- , *James Hogg: A Life* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007)
- Hunt, Verity, 'Raising a Modern Ghost: The Magic Lantern and the Persistence of Wonder in the Victorian Education of the Senses', *Romanticism and Victorianism on the Net*, 52 (November 2008), <<http://id.erudit.org/iderudit/019806ar>> [accessed 1 April 2009]
- Hunter, Richard and Ida MacAlpine, *Three Hundred Years of Psychiatry, 1535-1860: A History Presented in Selected English Texts* (London: Oxford University Press, 1963)
- Hunter, Wendy, "'A Powerful Engine of Social Improvement": James Hogg and *Chambers' Edinburgh Journal*', in *The British Periodical Text: 1797-1835: A Collection of Essays Edited by Simon Hull* (Tirril: Humanities-Ebooks, 2008), pp. 91-120.
- Inglis, Katherine Alia, 'The Incoherent Self and Materiality in Hogg, Brontë, and Dickens', (unpublished doctoral thesis, Birkbeck, University of London, 2009)
- , "'My Ingenious Answer to the Most Exquisite Question": Perception and Testimony in *Winter Evening Tales*', *SHW*, 17 (2006), 81-95
- Jackson, Noel, *Science and Sensation in Romantic Poetry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008)
- Jackson, Richard D., 'The Devil, the Doppelgänger, and the *Confessions* of James Hogg and Thomas De Quincey', *SHW*, 12 (2001), 90-103
- , 'Gatty Bell's Illness in James Hogg's *The Three Perils of Woman*', *SHW*, 14 (2003), 16-29

———., 'James Hogg's *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and the Great Chain of Being', *SHW*, 18 (2007), 65-76

James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author, ed. by Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (Surrey: Ashgate, 2009)

Jones, Douglas, 'Double Jeopardy and the Chameleon Art in James Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SSL*, 23 (1988), 164-85

Kahn, Charles H., *Pythagoras and the Pythagoreans: A Brief History* (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing, 2001)

Kaufman, Matthew H., *Edinburgh Phrenological Society: A History* (Edinburgh: William Ramsay Henderson Trust, 2005)

———., *Medical Teaching in Edinburgh during the 18th and 19th Centuries* (Edinburgh: Royal College of Surgeons, 2003)

Kaufman, Matthew H. and N. Bidsen, 'MARKED PHRENOLOGICAL HEADS: Their Evolution, with Particular Reference to the Influence of George Combe and the Phrenological Society of Edinburgh', *Journal of the History of Collections*, 9.1 (1997), 139-59

Kearns, Michael S., 'Intuition and Narration in James Hogg's *Confessions*', *SSL*, 13 (1978), 81-91

Kennedy, Alison, 'John Leitch, John Kenrick, History and Myth: The Textbook as a Signpost of Intellectual Change', *Paradigm: The Journal of the Textbook Colloquium*, 2.4 (December 2001), 1-13 <http://faculty.ed.uiuc.edu/westbury/Paradigm/JOHN_LEI.PDF> [accessed 10 March 2010]

Kennedy, Julie, *A Significant Medical History* (Glasgow: University of Glasgow Medical Faculty, 2007)

Kiely, Robert, *The Romantic Novel in England* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1972)

Killick, Tim, 'Regionalism and Folklore: Local Stories and Traditional Forms', in *British Short Fiction in the Early Nineteenth Century* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008), pp. 117-56

Kruger, Steven F., *Dreaming in the Middle Ages* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992; repr. 1993)

Kurshan, Ilana, 'Mind Reading: Literature in the Discourse of Early Victorian Phrenology and Mesmerism', in *Victorian Literary Mesmerism*, ed. by Martin Willis and Catherine Wynne (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 17-37

The Languages of Psyche: Mind and Body in Enlightenment Thought: Clark Library Lectures, 1985-1986, ed. by G. S. Rousseau (Berkley: University of California Press, 1990)

Leask, Nigel, “‘Murdering one’s double’: Thomas De Quincey and S. T. Coleridge. Autobiography, Opium and Empire in “Confessions of an English Opium Eater” and “Biographia Literaria””, in *British Romantic Writers and the East: Anxieties of Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), pp. 170-228

———., ‘Shelley’s “Magnetic Ladies”: Romantic Mesmerism and the Politics of the Body’, in *Beyond Romanticism: New approaches to texts and contexts 1780-1832*, ed. by Stephen Copley and John Whale (London: Routledge, 1992), pp. 53-78

Leary, Patrick, “‘Fraser’s Magazine’ and the Literary Life, 1830-1847’, *Victorian Periodicals Review*, 27 (1994), 105-26

Lee, L. L., ‘The Devil’s Figure: James Hogg’s *Justified Sinner*’, *SSL*, 3 (1966), 230-39

Lehrer, Keith, ‘Beyond Impressions and Ideas: Hume v. Reid’, in *The ‘Science of Man’ in the Scottish Enlightenment: Hume, Reid, and their Contemporaries*, ed. by Peter Jones (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1989), pp. 108-23

Levin, Susan M., *The Romantic Art of Confession: De Quincey, Musset, Sand, Lamb, Hogg, Frémy, Soulié, Janin* (Columbia, SC: Camden House, 1998)

Literary Reviews in British Periodicals 1821-1826 With a Supplementary List of General (Non-Reviews) Articles on Literary Subjects, compiled by William S. Ward (New York: Garland Publishing, 1977)

Livingston, Donald W., *Philosophical Melancholy and Delirium: Hume’s Pathology of Psychology* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1998)

Lynch, Kathryn L., *The High Medieval Dream Vision: Poetry, Philosophy, and Literary Form* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1988)

Macdonald, Kirsty A., ‘Spectral Ambiguities: The Tradition of Psychosomatic Supernaturalism in Scottish Fiction’ (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Glasgow, 2005)

MacDonald, Michael, *Mystical Bedlam: Madness, Anxiety, and Healing in Seventeenth-Century England* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981)

Mack, Douglas S., ‘The Body in the Open Grave: Robert Burns and Robert Wringhim’, *SHW*, 7 (1996), 70-79

———., ‘The Devil’s Pilgrim: a Note on Wringhim’s Private Memoirs in James Hogg’s *Confessions of a Justified Sinner*’, *SLJ*, 2.1 (July 1975), 36-40

———., ‘Gatty’s Illness in *The Three Perils of Women*’, *SHW*, 1 (1990), 133-35

———., ‘Hogg and Angels’, *SHW*, 15 (2004), 90-98

———., 'Hogg, Blackwood, and *The Shepherd's Calendar*', in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, in conjunction with The James Hogg Society, 1988), pp. 24-31

———., 'Hogg and the Blessed Virgin Mary', *SHW*, 3 (1993), 68-75

———., *Hogg's Prose an Annotated Listing* (Stirling: The James Hogg Society, 1985)

———., *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006)

Mandelbrote, Scott, 'Burnet, Thomas (c.1635–1715)', in *DNB*,
<<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/4067>> [accessed 24 February 2010]

Manning, Susan, *The Puritan-Provincial Vision: Scottish and American Literature in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990)

———., 'That Exhumation Scene Again: Transatlantic Hogg', *SHW*, 16 (2005), 86-111

Mason, Michael York, 'The Three Burials in Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SSL*, 13 (1978), 15-23

McAllister, David, "'Subject to the sceptre of imagination": Sleep, Dreams, and Unconsciousness in *Oliver Twist*', *Dickens Studies Annual*, 38 (2007), 1-17

McCausland, Joan, 'James Hogg and the 1831-32 Cholera Epidemic', *SHW*, 10 (1999), 40-47

Mergenthal, Silvia, 'James Hogg's *Lay Sermons* and the Essay Tradition', *SHW*, 2 (1991), 64-71

———., '*Naturae Donum*: Comments on Hogg's Self-Image and Image', *SHW*, 1 (1990), 71-79

Miller, Karl, *Cockburn's Millennium* (London: Duckworth, 1975)

———., *Doubles: Studies in Literary History* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985; paperback edn, 1987)

———., *Electric Shepherd: A Likeness of James Hogg* (London: Faber and Faber, 2003)

Morrison, Robert, 'Blackwood's under William Blackwood', *SLJ*, 22.1 (May 1995), 61-65

Mullan, John, *Sentiment and Sociability: The Language of Feeling in the Eighteenth Century* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988)

Murphy, Peter T., 'Impersonation and Authorship in Romantic Britain', *English Literary History*, 59 (1992), 625-49

Nicholls, James, 'Introduction', in *A Babel of Bottles: Drink, Drinkers & Drinking Places in*

Literature, ed. by James Nicholls & Susan J. Owen (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 2000), pp. 9-20

Nutton, Vivian, 'Humoralism', in *Companion Encyclopedia of the History of Medicine*, ed. by W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter, 2 vols (London: Routledge, 1993), I, pp. 281-91

Oakleaf, David, "'Not the Truth": The Doubteness of Hogg's *Confessions* and the Eighteenth-Century Tradition', *SSL*, 18 (1983), 59-74

Oost, Regina B., "'False Friends, Squeamish Readers, and Foolish Critics": The Subtext of Authorship in Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SSL*, 31 (1999), 86-106

The Origins and Nature of the Scottish Enlightenment, ed. by R. H. Campbell and Andrew S. Skinner (Edinburgh: Donald, 1982)

Pache, Walter, "'Der Ettrickschäfer Hoggs." A Scotman's Literary Reputation in Germany', *SSL*, 8.2 (1970), 109-17

Parker, Mark, *Literary Magazines and British Romanticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000)

Parsons, Coleman O., *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction: With Chapters on the Supernatural in Scottish Literature* (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1964)

Passmore, John, 'Enthusiasm, Fanaticism and David Hume', in *The 'Science of Man' in the Scottish Enlightenment: Hume, Reid, and their Contemporaries*, ed. by Peter Jones (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1989), pp. 85-107

Petrie, David, 'The Sinner versus the Scholar: Two Exemplary Models of Mis-re-membering and Mis-taking Signs in Relation to Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SHW*, 3 (1992) 57-67

Peters, Ted, 'Resurrection of the Very Embodied Soul?', in *Neuroscience and the Person: Scientific Perspectives on Divine Action*, ed. by Robert John Russell, Nancey Murphy, Theo C. Meyering, and Michael A. Arbib (Vatican City State: Vatican Observatory Publications; Berkeley, CA: Center for Theology and Natural Sciences, 1999), pp. 305-26

Pittock, Murray G. H., 'Hogg's Gothic and the Transformation of Genre: Towards a Scottish Romanticism', *SHW*, 15 (2004), 67-75

———, *Scottish and Irish Romanticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008)

Pope, Rebecca A., 'Hogg, Wordsworth and Gothic Autobiography', *SSL*, 27 (1992), 218-40

Porter, Roy, 'The Drinking Man's Disease: The "Prehistory" of Alcoholism in Georgian Britain', *British Journal of Addiction*, 80.4 (1985), 385-96

———, 'Spreading of Medical Enlightenment: The Popularization of Medicine in Georgian England, and its Paradoxes', in *The Popularization of Medicine, 1650-1850*, ed. by Roy Porter (London: Routledge, 1992), pp. 215-31

- ., 'Witchcraft and Magic in Enlightenment, Romantic, and Liberal Thought', in *Witchcraft and Magic in Europe*, 6 vols, ed. by Bengt Ankarloo and Stuart Clark (London: Athlone Press, 1999), V: *The Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries*, pp. 191-274
- Pottinger, George, *Heirs of the Enlightenment: Edinburgh Reviewers and Writers 1800-1830* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1992)
- The Published Writings of Thomas Chalmers (1780-1847), A Descriptive List, Compiled by the Rev Hugh Watt, D. D.* (Edinburgh: Clark, 1943)
- Punter, David, *The Literature of Terror: A HISTORY OF GOTHIC FICTIONS from 1765 to the present day*, 3 vols (London: Longman, 1996), I: *The Gothic Tradition*
- Redekop, Benjamin M., 'Thomas Reid and the Problem of Induction: From Common Experience to Common Sense', *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science*, 33 (2002), 35-57
- Redekop, Magdalene, 'Beyond Closure: Buried Alive with Hogg's Justified Sinner', *English Literary History*, 52.1 (1985), 159-84
- ., 'Trials, Dreams, and Endings in the Tales of James Hogg', in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, in conjunction with The James Hogg Society, 1988), pp. 32-41
- Richards, Graham, *Mental Machinery: The Origins and Consequences of Psychological Ideas, Part 1: 1600-1850* (London: Athlone Press, 1992)
- Richardson, Alan, *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001)
- Richardson, Ruth, *Death, Dissection, and the Destitute* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1987)
- Risse, Guenter B., 'In the Name of Hygieia and Hippocrates: A Quest for Preservation of Health and Virtue', in *New Medical Challenges During the Scottish Enlightenment* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2005), pp. 135-69
- Roth, Marty, *Drunk the Night Before: An Anatomy of Intoxication* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005)
- Rothfield, Lawrence, *Vital Signs: Medical Realism in Nineteenth-Century Fiction* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992)
- Rommel, Gabriele, 'Romanticism and Natural Science', in *The Literature of German Romanticism*, ed. by Dennis F. Mahoney (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2004), pp. 209-27
- Rousseau, G. S., 'Smollett's Wit and the Traditions of Learning in Medicine', in *Tobias*

Smollett: Essays of Two Decades (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1982), pp. 160-83

———, *Enlightenment Borders: Pre- and –post Modern Discourses: Medical, Scientific* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1991)

Rubenstein, Jill, 'The Anthropology of Pilgrimage and *Pilgrims in the Sun*', *SHW*, 11 (2000), 69-76

———, 'Varieties of Explanation in *The Shepherd's Calendar*', *SHW*, 4 (1993), 1-11

Sandner, David, 'Supernatural Modernity in Walter Scott's *Redgauntlet* and James Hogg's *Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Extrapolation*, 48.1 (2006), 73-83

Schreyer, Rüdiger, "'Pray what language did your wild couple speak, when they first met?'" – Language and the Science of Man in the Scottish Enlightenment', in *The 'Science of Man' in the Scottish Enlightenment: Hume, Reid and their Contemporaries*, ed. by Peter Jones (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1989), pp. 149-77

Scheck, Ulrich, 'Tales of Wonder and Terror: Short Prose of the German Romantics', in *The Literature of German Romanticism*, ed. by Dennis F. Mahoney (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2004), pp. 101-23

Schoenfield, Mark, *British Periodicals and Romantic Identity: The "Literary Lower Empire"* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009)

Schulz, Gerhard, 'From "Romantick" To "Romantic": The Genesis of German Romanticism in Late Eighteenth-Century Europe', in *The Literature of German Romanticism*, ed. by Dennis F. Mahoney (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2004), pp. 25-34

Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism, ed. by Leith Davis, Ian Duncan, and Janet Sorensen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004)

Siebers, Tobin, *The Romantic Fantastic* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1984)

Shepherd, Michael, 'Psychiatric Journals and the Evolution of Psychological Medicine', in *Medical Journals and Medical Knowledge*, ed. by W. F. Bynum, Stephen Lock and Roy Porter (London: Routledge, 1992), pp. 188-206

Simpson, Louis, *James Hogg: A Critical Study* (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1962)

Smajic, Srdjan, 'The Trouble with Ghost-Seeing: Vision, Ideology, and Genre in the Victorian Ghost Story', *English Literary History*, 70 (2003), 1107-1135

Smith, George Fairfull, 'McCulloch, Horatio (1805–1867)', in *DNB*
<<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/17410>> [accessed 8 March 2010]

Smith, Iain Crichton, 'A Work of Genius: James Hogg's *Justified Sinner*', *SSL*, 28 (1993), 1-11

Smith, Nelson C., *James Hogg* (Boston: Twayne, 1980)

- Spacks, Patricia Meyer, *The Insistence of Horror: Aspects of the Supernatural in Eighteenth-Century Poetry* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1962)
- Spearing, Anthony Collin, *Medieval Dream-Poetry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1976)
- Stack, David, *Queen Victoria's Skull: George Combe and the Mid-Victorian Mind* (London: Hambledon Continuum, 2008)
- Starr, G. A., 'The Bump Above Robert Wringhim's Ear: Phrenology in Hogg's *Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *SHW*, 19 (2008), 81-89
- Strachan, John, "'The mapp'd out skulls of Scotia': *Blackwood's* and the Scottish Phrenological Controversy", in *Print Culture and the Blackwood Tradition, 1805-1930*, ed. by David Finkelstein (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006), pp. 49-69
- Strout, Alan Lang, *A Bibliography of Articles in Blackwood's Magazine, Volumes I through XVIII, 1817-1825* (Lubbock, TX: Texas Tech Press, 1959)
- ., 'Concerning the *Noctes Ambrosianae*', *Modern Language Notes*, 51.8 (1936), 493-504
- ., *Writers on German Literature in Blackwood's Magazine* (London: The Bibliographic Society, 1954)
- Sucksmith, Harvey Peter, 'The Secret of Immediacy: Dickens' Debt to the Tale of Terror in *Blackwood's*', *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, 26.2 (September 1971), 145-57
- Sutherland, Abby Anne, 'Robert Burns and James Hogg: A Comparison' (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Pennsylvania, 1958)
- Sutherland, Helen, 'James Hogg: A Shepherd's Role in the Scottish Enlightenment', *SHW*, 19 (2008), 5-20
- ., 'Varieties of Protestant Experience: Religion and the Doppelgänger in Hogg, Brown, and Hawthorne', *SHW*, 16 (2005), 71-85
- Tierney, James H., *Early Glasgow Newspapers Periodicals and Directories* (Glasgow: Hedderwick & Sons, 1934)
- Thrall, Miriam M. H., *Rebellious Fraser's, Nol Yorke's Magazine in the Days of Maginn, Thackeray, and Carlyle* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1934)
- Tougaw, Jason Daniel, *Strange Cases: The Medical Case History and the British Novel* (New York: Routledge, 2006)
- Trumpener, Katie, *Bardic Nationalism: The Romantic Novel and the British Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997)

Trower, Shelley, 'Nerves, Vibrations, and the Aeolian Harp', *Romanticism and Victorianism on the Net*, 54 (May 2009), <<http://id.erudit.org/iderudit/038761ar>> [accessed 15 March 2010]

Tytler, Graeme, *Physiognomy in the European Novel: Faces and Fortunes* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982)

van Wyhe, John, *Phrenology and the Origins of Victorian Scientific Naturalism* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004)

Vallins, David, *Coleridge and the Psychology of Romanticism: Feeling and Thought* (Basingstoke: Macmillan Press; New York: St. Martin's Press, 2000)

Vickers, Neil, *Coleridge and the Doctors, 1795-1806* (Oxford: Clarendon Press; New York: Oxford University Press, 2004)

———, 'Coleridge, Moritz, and the "psychological" Case History', *Romanticism*, 13.3 (2007), pp. 271-80

———, 'Coleridge, Thomas Beddoes and Brunonian Medicine', *European Romantic Review*, 8.1 (1997), 47-94

Voges, Friedhelm, 'Chalmers' Thinking Habits: Some Lessons from his Theology', in *The Practical and the Pious: Essays on Thomas Chalmers (1780-1847)*, ed. by A. C. Cheyne (Edinburgh: Saint Andrews Press, 1985), pp. 157-65

Watson, J. R., *English Poetry of the Romantic Period 1789-1830*, 2nd edn (London: Longman, 1992)

Weber, Carolyn A., 'Delighting in the Indissoluble Mixture: The Motley Romanticism of James Hogg', *SHW*, 17 (2006), 49-62

Wokler, Robert, 'Apes and Races in the Scottish Enlightenment: Monboddo and Kames on the Nature of Man', in *Philosophy and Science in the Scottish Enlightenment*, ed. by Peter Jones (Edinburgh: Donald, 1988), pp. 145-68

Wright, John P., 'Metaphysics and Physiology: Mind, Body, and the Animal Economy in Eighteenth-Century Scotland', in *Studies in the Philosophy of the Scottish Enlightenment*, ed. by M. A. Stewart (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990), pp. 251-301

Youngquist, Paul, *Monstrosities: Bodies and British Romanticism* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2003)

Manuscript Bibliography

University of Edinburgh, Special Collections

Papers of the Phrenological Society of Edinburgh (Coll – 227)

Description of Henderson Trust Catalogues (1952) and Correspondences regarding gift of Papers from J. & F. Anderson to Edinburgh University, Gen. 608/1*

Letter Book of the Phrenological Society, 1820-1840, Gen. 608/1

Minute Book of the Phrenological Society to 2nd Sept 1841, Volume I, Gen. 608/2

Henderson Trust, Catalogue 1, Gen. 608/4

Henderson Trust, Catalogue 2 and Catalogue 3 (in four parts), watermark 1828, Gen. 608/5

Pamphlets of the Laws of the Phrenological Society, Gen. 608/6-7

Catalogue of the Collection that may be seen at 125 Canongate (Luke O'Neil & Sons), (Edinburgh: Johnston, 1823), Gen. 608/9

Pamphlet regarding the Late Sir George Mackenzie, Gen. 608/15

Cash Book, 1820-1870, Gen. 608/18

Press Cuttings, Volume I, Gen. 608*(i)

Names of the Members & Visitors, inspecting the Casts &c belonging to the Phrenological Society, 1822, Gen. 608*(iii)

Heads of the People, 1843, Gen. 608*(v)

Phrenological Lectures (List of Skulls &c. for), Gen. 608*(vii)

University of Glasgow, Special Collections

William Gunn Papers

Letters of Robert Macnish to William Gunn, 1825-1828, MS Gen. 510/23-25

Letter of George Macnish to William Gunn, 1835, MS Gen. 510/26

Mitchell Library (Glasgow, UK)

Robert Macnish's *An Introduction to Phrenology* (1836), Acc. No. 115690

National Library of Scotland (Edinburgh, UK)

Blackwood Papers

Poems of Robert Macnish, 1822-1825, MS 4847

Letters of D. M. Moir to William Blackwood, 1830, MS 4028, fols 52-85

Letters of George Combe to William Blackwood, 1817, MS 4002, fols 105-12

Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 28 April 1827, MS 30969, fols 60-61

Letters of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 1827, MS 4019, fols 284-97

Letters of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 1828, MS 4022, fols 103-13

Letters of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 1829, MS 4025, fols 120-30

Letters of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 1830, MS 4028, fols 13-36

Letters of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 1831, MS 4030, fols 123-40

Letters of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 1832, MS 4034, fols 34-40

Letters of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 1834, MS 4039, fols 110-15

Letter of Robert Macnish to William Blackwood, 1836, MS 4043, fol. 100

Letter of William Blackwood to James Hogg, 27 March 1830, MS 30311, fols 555-56

Letters of William Blackwood to Robert Macnish, 1827, MS 30310, fols 269-71, 275-76, 297-99, 341-43

Letter of William Blackwood to James Hogg, 17 September 1831, MS 30312, fol. 225

Letters of William Blackwood to Robert Macnish, 1830, MS 30312, fols 157, 176

Combe Papers

Diary of George Combe, 1857-58, MS 7432

Lecture Notes of George Combe, 1833-38, MS 7440-41

Letter of Anthony O'Neil to George Combe, 1824, MS 7213, fols 150-53

Letters of Anthony O'Neil to George Combe, 1835, MS 7236, fols 21-25

Letter of Anthony O'Neil to George Combe, 1837, MS 7243, fol. 122

Letter of Archbishop Whately to George Combe, 1837, MS 7244, fol. 85

Letters to George Combe, 1833, MS 7230-31

Letter of George Combe to Anthony O'Neil, 1838, MS 7388, fol. 26

Letters of George Combe to Archbishop Whately, 1834, MS 7386, fols 131-33, 420, 566

Letter of Disney Alexander to George Combe, 1826, MS 7217, fol. 5

Letters of Disney Alexander to George Combe, 1836, MS 7237, fols 9-11

Letter of George Combe to John McDiarmid, 1834, MS 7386, fol. 120

Letter of George Combe to Robert Macnish, 1835, MS 7386, fols 270, 483

Letter of George Combe to Robert Macnish, 1836-1837, MS 7387, fols 95, 236

Letter of George Combe to Samuel Hibbert-Ware, 1824, MS 7383, fol. 24

Letter of George Combe to William Blackwood, 1818, MS 7200, fol. 144

Letters of George Combe to William MacPhun, 1833, 1836, MS 7386, fols 27, 533

Letters of George Combe to William MacPhun, 1836, MS 7378, fols 25-27

Letters of John McDiarmid to George Combe, 1834, MS 7233, fols 1-4

Letter of Luke O'Neil to George Combe, 1820, MS 7205, fol. 128

Letter of Luke O'Neil to George Combe, 1822, MS 7209, fols 60-65

Letter of Luke O'Neil to George Combe, 1825, MS 7216, fol. 34

Letter of Luke O'Neil to George Combe, 1826, MS 7218, fol. 28

Letter of Luke O'Neil to George Combe, 1829, MS 7224, fol. 60

Letter of Robert Macnish to George Combe, 1832, MS 7229, fol. 57

Letter of Robert Macnish to George Combe, 1833, MS 7231, fol. 106

Letters of Robert Macnish to George Combe, 1835, MS 7235, fols 182-89

Letters of Robert Macnish to George Combe, 1836, MS 7240, fols 94-123

Letter of Robert Macnish to George Combe, 1837, MS 7243, fol. 87

Letter of Samuel Hibbert-Ware to George Combe, 1819, MS 7204, fols 100-01

Letter of Samuel Hibbert-Ware to George Combe, 1824, MS 7213, fols 56-57

Letter of William Blackwood to George Combe, 1824, MS 7212, fol. 31

Letters of William MacPhun to George Combe, 1833, MS 7231, fols 108-10

Letters of William MacPhun to George Combe, 1834, MS 7233, fol. 30

Letters of William MacPhun to George Combe, 1836, MS 7240, fols 124-37

Letterbook of George Combe, 1833-36, MS 7386

Miscellaneous Personal Papers of George Combe – Notes, memoranda, minutes, reports, quotations, etc., 1805-58, MS 7436-37

Miscellaneous Personal Papers of George Combe – Poetry, 1814-1856, MS 7435

Notebook of George Combe, 1826-36, MS 7409

Phrenological Reports of George Combe, 1819-1858, MS 7452-55

David Macbeth Moir (Delta) Papers

D. M. Moir's *Life of Robert Macnish*, 1838, MS 3525

Letters of Macnish Family to D. M. Moir, 1829-1838, Acc. 9856, No. 48

Letters of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 1827-1831, Acc. 9856, No. 49

Letters of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 1832-1836, Acc. 9856, No. 50

Letter of D. M. Moir to Robert Macnish, 11 May 1829, MS 3399

Letter of D. M. Moir to Robert Macnish, 1 October 1830, MS 3940

Watson Collection

Letters of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, with enclosed ballad, 13 August 1827, MS 583 (828), fols 234-35

Letter of Robert Macnish to D. M. Moir, 5 November 1828, MS 583 (760), fols 119-20

Alexander Turnbull Library, Wellington, New Zealand

James Hogg Papers

‘Strange Letter of a Lunatic’, MS-Papers-0042-01

Chronological Bibliography of Periodicals and Annuals

In the following bibliography, individual articles are listed chronologically under the subheading of the periodical or annual in which they were published in order to facilitate the examination of dialogic strands both within and between periodicals. The bibliography is the product of a formative exploratory exercise followed by a more focused examination of relevant material, and as such, the range and number of articles examined in specific periodicals varies. *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, *Fraser's Magazine for Town and Country*, the *Quarterly Review*, and the *Phrenological Journal and Miscellany* were examined first and thus some of the material included in their respective bibliographies is of less relevance to the thesis as a whole; however, all material examined is included in order to show the formative process as well as to aid future researchers. *The Emmet*, *The Literary Melange*, and *The Scottish Annual* are the most thoroughly itemised texts, as there is little or no secondary material pertaining to these works and Macnish was a substantial contributor.

The widespread anonymity of contributions to the Romantic periodical press has made general attributions problematic. However, several bibliographic resources have aided this process. Attribution of articles in *Blackwood's*, *Fraser's*, the *Quarterly Review*, and the *Phrenological Journal* was aided by: Alan Lang Strout, *A Bibliography of Articles in Blackwood's Magazine, Volumes I through XVIII: 1817-1825* (1959); Miriam M. H. Thrall, *Rebellious Fraser's: Nol Yorke's Magazine in the Days of Maginn, Thackeray, and Carlyle* (1934); Jonathan Cutmore, *Contributors to the Quarterly Review: A History, 1809-25* (2008); Roger Cooter, *Phrenology in the British Isles: An Annotated, Historical Biobibliography and Index* (1989). Square brackets indicate uncertain attributions, and when signatures or pseudonyms are included, they are differentiated from authorship by the preface 'signed'.

Douglas Mack and Gillian Hughes's bibliographies were used to identify Hogg's contributions, and the attribution of Hogg's Blackwoodian articles is according to Richardson's most recent compilation in *Contributions to Blackwood's Magazine, Volume 1: 1817-1828* (2008). The identification of Macnish's contributions was a major task of the current thesis, and the evidence for specific attributions is discussed in the main text. For the aid of the reader, Macnish's contributions are highlighted by blue text and Hogg's by red text.

The online databases, *British Periodicals Collection*, *Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals, 1824-1900*, and *ScienceDirect*, were also utilised, and many of the articles examined are available online via these databases.

The Athenaeum. London Literary and Critical Journal

‘Macnish’s *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*’, 28 (7 May 1828), 438

‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, 167 (8 January 1831), 18-20

‘*The Scottish Annual*’, 431 (30 January 1836), 88

Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine

James Hogg, ‘Tales and Anecdotes of the Pastoral Life. No. I’, 1 (April 1817), 22-25

‘The Craniological Controversy. Some Observations on the Late Pamphlets of Dr. Gordon and Dr. Spurzheim’, 1 (April 1817), 35-38

James Brewster, ‘Remarkable Case of Margaret Lyall, Who Continued in a State of Sleep Nearly Six Weeks’, 1 (April 1817), 61-64

James Hogg, ‘Verses, Recited by the Author, in a Party of his Countrymen, On the Day that the News Arrived of Our Final Victory Over the French’, 1 (April 1817), 72

James Hogg, ‘Tales and Anecdotes of the Pastoral Life. No. II’, 1 (May 1817), 143-47

James Hogg, ‘Shakspeare Club of Alloa’, 1 (May 1817), 152-54

James Hogg, ‘A Last Adieu’, 1 (May 1817), 169

James Hogg, ‘Tales and Anecdotes of the Pastoral Life. No. III’, 1 (June 1817), 247-50

‘Introduction to the Medical Report of Edinburgh’, 1 (June 1817), 266-70

[J. G. Lockhart or John Wilson], ‘The Craniad, or Spurzheim Illustrated; a Poem, in Two Parts’, 1 (June 1817), 288

[David Irving], ‘Observations on Original Genius’, 1 (July 1817), 347-48

‘Observations on the Remarks of A. M. on the Doctrines of Gall and Spurzheim’, 1 (July 1817), 365-67

[Robert Gordon], ‘Observations on Animal Magnetism’, 1 (September 1817), 563-67

John Wilson, ‘Some Observations on the “Biographia Literaria” of S. T. Coleridge, Esq. – 1817’, 2 (October 1817), 3-18

[Robert Gordon], ‘Present State of Animal Magnetism in Germany’, 2 (October 1817), 36-38

James Hogg, ‘Elegy’, 2 (October 1817), 47

'Medical Report of Edinburgh', 2 (October 1817), 48-52

William Pulteney Alison, 'Remarks on the Review of Mr. Stewart's Dissertation in the Quarterly Review', 2 (October 1817), 57-65

John Wilson, 'Vindication of Mr Wordsworth's Letter to Mr. Gray, on a New Edition of Burns', 2 (October 1817), 65-73

Sir Walter Scott, 'Alarming Increase of Depravity among Animals', 2 (October 1817), 82-86

James Hogg, [J. G. Lockhart, and John Wilson], 'Translation from an Ancient Chaldee Manuscript', 2 (October 1817), 89-96

J. G. Lockhart, 'On the Pulpit Eloquence of Scotland. No. I – Chalmers', 2 (November 1817), 131-40

William Pulteney Alison, 'Remarks on the Review of Mr. Stewart's Dissertation in the Quarterly Review (Concluded from page 65)', 2 (November 1817), 159-65

John Wilson, 'Waking Dreams. A Fragment', 2 (November 1817), 174-76

John Wilson, 'Letter Occasioned by N.'s Vindication of Mr. Wordsworth in Last Number', 2 (November 1817), 201-04

[John Smyth], 'To the Reviewer of Coleridge's Biographia Literaria, in Blackwood's Magazine for October', 2 (December 1817), 285-88

James Hogg, 'A Letter to Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe, Esq. On his Original Mode of Editing Church History', 2 (December 1817), 305-09

James Hogg, 'A Hebrew Melody', 2 (January 1818), 400

William Laidlaw and Sir Walter Scott, 'Sagacity of a Shepherd's Dog', (January 1818), 417-21

[Robert Gordon], 'The German Somnambulists and Miss M'Avoy', 2 (January 1818), 437-43

John Wilson, 'Letter to Mr. James Hogg', 2 (February 1818), 501-04

'Medical Report of Edinburgh', 2 (February 1818), 550-55

Sir Walter Scott, 'Remarks on Frankenstein, or the Modern Prometheus; a Novel', 2 (March 1818), 613-20

James Hogg, 'Further Anecdotes of the Shepherd's Dog', 2 (March 1818), 621-26

[John Wilson or J. G. Lockhart], 'Letters of Timothy Tickler to various Literary Characters. Letter II. – To the Ettrick Shepherd', 2 (March 1818), 654-56

Dick Lauder, 'Remarkable Instance of Second Sight', 3 (April 1818), 18-21

John Wilson, 'The Fairies. A Dream-like Remembrance of a Dream', 3 (April 1818), 30-32

James Hogg, 'Sonnet to John Carnegie, Esq.', 3 (April 1818), 58

James Hogg, 'On Carmel's Brow', 3 (April 1818), 90

'Dialogues on Natural Religion', 3 (April 1818), 90-94

[William Howison], 'The Craniologist's Review. No I. Napoleon's Head', 3 (May 1818), 146-48

'Dialogues on Natural and Revealed Religion. Dialogue II. – On Natural Religion', 3 (May 1818), 170-76

William Laidlaw, 'Phantasmagoria', 3 (May 1818), 211-15

[William Howison], 'The Craniologist's Review. No II. Greek Heads, No III. Oliver Cromwell, No IV. Franklin, No V. Voltaire', 3 (June 1818), 298-301

John Herman Merivale, 'Phantasmagoriana; Tales of the Dead, Principally Translated from the French', 3 (August 1818), 589-96

John Wilson, 'Some Remarks on the Use of the Preternatural in Works of Fiction', 3 (September 1818), 648-50

John Wilson, 'David Hume Charged by Mr. Coleridge with Plagiarism from St. Thomas Aquinas', 3 (September 1818), 653-57

Sir Walter Scott, 'Story of an Apparition', 3 (September 1818), 705-07

John Wilson, 'On National Character in Literature', 3 (September 1818), 707-09

James Hogg, 'Verses, Addressed to the Right Hon. Lady Anne Scott of Buccleuch', 4 (October 1818), 74-76

John Wilson, 'Of the Effects of Knowledge Upon Society', 4 (October 1818), 80-84

John Wilson, 'Inaccuracies of Poets in Natural History', 4 (November 1818), 159-61

William Howison, 'Comparison of the Beauty of Sounds with that of Colours', 4 (November 1818), 178-80

William Howison, 'Dr. Ulrick Sternstare's First Letter on the National Character of the Scots', 4 (December 1818), 328-30

William Howison, 'Dr. Sternstare's Letters. No II.', 4 (January 1819), 430-32

Mr. Mower, 'The Medical Schools of Dublin and Edinburgh', 4 (January 1819), 439-41

John Wilson, 'Some Observations on the Poetry of the Agricultural and that of the Pastoral Districts in Scotland, Illustrated by a Comparative View of the Genius of Burns and the Ettrick Shepherd', 4 (February 1819), 521-29

J. G. Lockhart and John Wilson, 'Observations on "Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk"', 4 (February 1819), 612-21

William Howison, 'Remarks on Keeping in Remembrance the Capacities of Human Nature', 4 (March 1819), 649-52

Mr. Russell, 'On the Decline of Taste for Metaphysics', 4 (March 1819), 682-87

Mr. Carlisle, 'On the Indestructibility of Mental Impressions', 4 (March 1819), 690-93

J. G. Lockhart, 'A Few Farther Strictures on "Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk," with Extracts from that Popular Work', 4 (March 1819), 745-52

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Storms', 5 (April 1819), 75-81

'Remarks on Darwin's Botanic Garden', 5 (May 1819), 153-55

'Noseology, a Dissertation on the Intellectual Faculties, as Manifested by the Various Configurations of the Nose', 5 (May 1819), 157-60

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Storms', 5 (May 1819), 210-16

J. G. Lockhart, 'Sermons Preached in the Tron Church, Glasgow, by Thomas Chalmers, D.D.', 5 (July 1819), 462-68

[J. G. Lockhart, John Wilson, and Thomas Hamilton], 'The True and Authentic Account of the Twelfth of August', 5 (August 1819), 597-613

John Wilson, 'Essays on the Lake School of Poetry. No. III. Coleridge', 6 (October 1819), 3-12

[J. G. Lockhart], 'The Christian and Civic Economy of Large Towns, by Thomas Chalmers, D.D.', 6 (October 1819), 18-24

'Some Effects of an Excessive Application to the Study of Physical Sciences Considered', 6 (October 1819), 35-39

'On the Impossibility of a Standard of Language in Metaphysics', 6 (October 1819), 39-42

[J. G. Lockhart], 'Remarks on Dr. Chalmers' New Work', 6 (November 1819), 177-83

'Defoe on Apparitions', 6 (November 1819), 201-07

Archibald Alison, 'On the Discovery of the Remains of Robert the Bruce', 6 (December

1819), 297-304

D. M. Moir, 'Letter Relative to Dr. Gordon', 6 (December 1819), 307-09

J. G. Lockhart, 'On the Nature of Imitative Principle, and Some Other Faculties, Pointed Out by Gall and Spurzheim. By Peter Morris, M.D.', 6 (December 1819), 309-14

'On the Analogy between the Growth of Individual and National Genius', 6 (January 1820), 375-81

J. G. Lockhart, 'Letter from the Ettrick Shepherd', 6 (January 1820), 390-93

[J. G. Lockhart], 'Sonnet, by the Ettrick Shepherd', 6 (January 1820), 464

'Barlow on Magnetic Attractions', 6 (February 1820), 507-12

James Hogg, 'Letter from the Ettrick Shepherd. Enclosing a Letter from James Laidlaw', 6 (March 1820), 630-32

'On the Science of Physiognomy', 6 (March 1820), 650-55

[John Wilson], 'Remarks on the Diversity of Genius', 6 (March 1820), 674-78

[John Wilson], 'Professor Brown's Outlines of the Philosophy of the Human Mind', 7 (April 1820), 62-71

[John Wilson], 'Hogg's Tales, &c.', 7 (May 1820), 148-54

Thomas Gillespie, 'Brougham and Chalmers. National Education', 7 (July 1820), 419-27

'On the Study of Natural History', 7 (September 1820), 618-21

J. G. Lockhart, 'Letter from James Hogg to his Reviewer', 8 (October 1820), 67-76

[J. G. Lockhart], 'Chalmers' Commercial Sermons', 8 (November 1820), 178-85

Richard Parkinson, 'On Poetic Inspiration', 8 (January 1821), 362-63

D. M. Moir, 'Why are Professional Men Indifferent Poets?', 8 (January 1821), 415-19

J. J. Halls, 'Brodie's Introductory Lecture', 8 (January 1821), 419-22

D. M. Moir, 'Friar Bacon', 9 (July 1821), 391

'Howison's Essay on the Sentiments of Attraction, Adaptation, and Variety', 9 (July 1821), 393-97

Eyre Evans Crowe, 'Philosophy of Self', 9 (July 1821), 397-99

James Hogg, 'Account of a Coronation-Dinner at Edinburgh, In a Letter from John M'Indoe, Esq. to William M'Ilhose, Esq. Manufacturer, Glasgow', 10 (August 1821, Part II), 26-33

John Wilson, 'Familiar Epistles to Christopher North, from an Old Friend with a New Face. Letter I. On Hogg's Memoirs', 20 (August 1821, Part II), 43-52

[Mr. Vary], 'Essays on Cranioscopy, Craniology, Phrenology, &c. By Sir Toby Tickletoby, Bart.', 10 (August 1821, Part II), 73-82

Thomas Doubleday, 'Why are Poets Indifferent Critics?', 10 (September 1821), 180-86

John Galt, 'The Buried Alive', 10 (October 1821), 262-64

R. F. St. Barbe, 'Meteorological Observations Extraordinary', 10 (October 1821), 267-70

William Maginn, 'The Man in the Bell', 10 (November 1821), 373-75

[D. M. Moir], 'Singular Recovery from Death', 10 (December 1821), 582-87

[Mr. Vary], 'Essays on Phrenology, &c.', 10 (December 1821, Part II), 682-91

Eyre Evan Crowe, 'On the Genius and Character of Rousseau', 11 (February 1822), 137-53

Thomas Doubleday, 'How Far is Poetry an Art?', 11 (February 1822), 153-59

William Howison, 'An Essay on the Arrangement of the Categories', 11 (March 1822), 308-16

'On the Deterioration of Man and Best', 11 (March 1822), 330

J. G. Lockhart, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. I', 11 (March 1822), 369-71

John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. II', 11 (April 1822), 475-89

Thomas Doubleday, 'On the Metaphysics of Music, and their Accordance with Modern Practice', 11 (May 1822), 529-38

J. G. Lockhart, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. III', 11 (May 1822), 601-17

John Howison, 'The Nocturnal Separation', 12 (July 1822), 17-25

William Maginn, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. IV', 12 (July 1822), 100-14

Charles Cherbery, 'The Pleasures of Sickness', 12 (August 1822), 199-205

[John Wilson], 'Hogg's Royal Jubilee, &c.', 12 (September 1822), 344-54

[John Wilson], 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. V', 12 (September 1822), 369-91

[William Maginn and others], 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. VI', 12 (December 1822), 693-709

Thomas Colley Grattan, 'Confessions of an English Glutton', 13 (January 1823), 86-93

Mr. Vary, 'Anti-Phrenologia; A Plain Statement of Objection Against the Systems of Drs Gall and Spurzheim', 13 (January 1823), 100-08

Mr. Starke, 'Vox Populi', 13 (January 1823), 125-38

James Hogg, 'The Honourable Captain Napier and Ettrick Forest', 13 (February 1823), 175-88

Mr. Vary, 'Anti-Phrenologia; A Plain Statement of the Objections Against the System of Drs Gall and Spurzheim', 13 (February 1823), 199-206

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class Second. Deaths, Judgments, and Providences', 13 (March 1823), 311-20

Mr. Gordon, 'Analysis of Tucker's Vision', 13 (March 1823), 331-37

Mr. Vary, 'Remarks on Mr Owen's Plan', 13 (March 1823), 338-42

J. G. Lockhart, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. VII', 13 (March 1823), 369-84

[Alexander Blair], 'Remarks on Mr Alison's Theory of Beauty, as Explained by Mr. Jeffrey', 13 (April 1823), 386-90

John Grieve, 'Letter from a Yarrow Shepherd', 13 (April 1823), 393-96

J. G. Lockhart, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. VIII', 13 (May 1823), 592-611

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class Second. Death, Judgments, and Providences', 13 (June 1823), 629-40

[David Campbell], 'Popular Superstitions &c. of the Highlanders of Scotland', 13 (June 1823), 702-05

William Maginn, 'Noctes Ambrosianae No. IX', 13 (June 1823), 716-23

William Maginn, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. X', 14 (July 1823), 100-06

James Hogg, 'A Scots Mummy', 14 (August 1823), 188-90

J. G. Lockhart, William Maginn, and John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XI', 14 (August 1823), 236-48

Thomas Doubleday, 'On the Sources of the Picturesque and Beautiful', 14 (September 1823), 249-54

J. G. Lockhart, 'Popular Tales of the Northern Nations', 14 (September 1823), 293-94

John Wilson, 'Hogg's Three Perils of Woman', 14 (October 1823), 427-37

[John Wilson and perhaps J. G. Lockhart], 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XII', 14 (October 1823), 484-503

[George Croly], 'Rules for Plain People Respecting the Evidence of Miracles', 14 (November 1823), 552-55

Henry Thomson, 'The Confessions of a Footman', 14 (November 1823), 590-600

Henry Thomson, 'A Chapter on Goblins', 14 (December 1823), 639-46

Caroline Bowles Southey, 'Beauty', 14 (December 1823), 672-75

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IV. Dogs', 15 (February 1824), 177-83

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class V. The Lasses', 15 (March 1824), 296-304

[William Maginn in collaboration], 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XIII', 15 (March 1824), 358-66

John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XIV', 15 (April 1824), 367-90

Thomas Doubleday, 'On the Metaphysics of Music. No. II. The Musical Temperament', 15 (May 1824), 587-92

[William Maginn perhaps assisted by J. G. Lockhart], 'Maxims of Mr. ODoherty', 15 (May 1824), 597-605

J. G. Lockhart, 'Goethe's Wilhelm Meister – Memoirs of Goethe', 15 (June 1824), 619-32

William Maginn and J. G. Lockhart, 'Maxims of Mr ODoherty. Part the Second', 15 (June 1824), 632-42

Caroline Bowles Southey, 'To the Author of "The Shepherd's Calendar"', 15 (June 1824), 655-58

J. G. Lockhart, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XV', 15 (June 1824), 706-24

Alexander Blair, 'Thoughts on Some Errors of Opinion in Respect to the Advancement and Diffusion of Knowledge', 16 (July 1824), 26-33

J. G. Lockhart, 'The Devil's Elixir', 16 (July 1824), 55-67

William Dunlop, 'To the Ettrick Shepherd', 16 (July 1824), 86-90

Henry Thomson, 'Memory – Suggestions Against the Encouragement of It', 16 (August 1824), 136-39

Eyre Evan Crowe, 'Magalotti on the Scotch School of Metaphysics', 16 (August 1824), 227-

J. G. Lockhart, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XVI', 16 (August 1824), 231-50

William Maginn, J. G. Lockhart, and William Hay Forbes, 'Maxims of Sir Morgan ODoherty, Bart. Part the Third', 16 (September 1824), 334-49

D. M. Moir, 'The Shepherd's Cot', 16 (October 1824), 385-86

John Neal, 'Men and Women; Brief Hypothesis concerning the Difference in their Genius', 16 (October 1824), 387-94

D. M. Moir, 'Wonderful Passage in the Life of Mansie Wauch, Tailor', 16 (October 1824), 456-59

Francis Bacon, 'The Confessions of a Contab', 16 (October 1824), 459-67

William Stevenson, 'On the Reciprocal Influence of the Periodical Publications, and the Intellectual Progress of this Country. No. I', 16 (November 1824), 518-28

James Hogg, 'The Left-Handed Fiddler', 16 (November 1824), 528-29

Francis Bacon, 'The Confessions of a Contab. No. II', (November 1824), 571-79

J. G. Lockhart, William Maginn, and John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XVII', 16 (November 1824), 585-601

James Hogg, 'Examination of the School of Southside', 16 (December 1824), 653-57

D. M. Moir, 'New Christmas Carol. By the Ettrick Shepherd', 16 (December 1824), 680

James Hogg, 'The Grousome Caryl. Ane Most Treuthful Ballant', 17 (January 1825), 78-85

William Maginn, 'Scotch Poets, Hogg and Campbell, Hynde and Theodric', 17 (January 1825), 109-13

[William Maginn with John Wilson or J. G. Lockhart in collaboration], 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XVIII', 17 (January 1825), 114-30

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar, Class V. The Lasses', 17 (February 1825), 180-86

'Beck and Dunlop on Medical Jurisprudence', 17 (March 1825), 351-52

John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XIX', 17 (March 1825), 366-84

R. F. St. Barbee, 'The Twin Sisters', 17 (May 1825), 532-33

John Wilson and William Maginn, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XX', 17 (May 1825), 610-23

D. M. Moir, 'Farther Portions of the Autobiography of Mansie Wauch, Tailor', 17 (June 1825), 667-72

James Hogg, 'Ringan and May. Ane Richtie Mournfulle Dittye', 17 (June 1825), 712-14

James Hogg, 'The Witch of the Gray Thorn', 17 (June 1825), 714-16

James Hogg, 'Some Passages in the Life of Colonel Cloud. In a Letter by the Ettrick Shepherd. To the Hon. Mrs A-r-y. Dated Edinburgh, August 11, 1816', 18 (July 1825), 32-40

G. R. Gleig, 'Dreams', 18 (July 1825), 64-65

John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXI', 18 (September 1825), 378-92

D. M. Moir, 'Still Farther Portions of the Autobiography of Mansie Wauch, Tailor', 18 (October 1825), 458-63

John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXII', 18 (October 1825), 500-08

John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXIII', 18 (December 1825), 751-65

'The Quarterly Review of Dr Marmichael on Contagion and the Plague', 19 (February 1826), 130-31

'Lectures on Prandiology. By Abraham Spoon, M.D. F.R.S. L. and Edin. Taken in Short-hand by a Gentleman of the Press. "Dinner, n.s. The Chief Meal."', 19 (February 1826), 195-97

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXIV', 19 (February 1826), 211-27

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXV', B19 (April 1826), 490-510

Robert Macnish, 'The Metempsychosis', 19 (May 1826), 511-29

'Remarkable Dream', 19 (June 1826), 736

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXVI', 19 (June 1826), 737-56

William Harness, 'Acted Charades. No. IV., Scene the Second – A Phrenologist's Study', 20 (July 1826), 42-43

Sir Walter Scott, 'The Omen', 20 (July 1826), 52-59

'Noctes Ambrosianae No. XXVII', 20 (July 1826), 90-109

'My Transmogrifications', 20 (August 1826), 152-54

'First Love', 20 (August 1826), 155-59

Robert Macnish, 'The Man with the Nose', 20 (August 1826), 159-63

'The Ghost', 20 (August 1826), 192-97

'Miscellanea Critica, &c.', 20 (September 1826), 487-93

Robert Macnish, 'The Barber of Gottingen', 20 (October 1826), 604-10

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXVIII', 20 (October 1826), 619-38

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXIX', 20 (November 1826), 770-92

Thomas De Quincey, 'Gillies's German Stories', 20 (December 1826), 844-58

Robert Macnish, 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy', 21 (January 1827), 32-39

D. M. Moir, 'From the Autobiography of Mansie Wauch', 21 (January 1827), 39-44

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXX', 21 (January 1827), 100-07

Thomas De Quincey, 'On Murder Considered as One of the Fine Arts', 21 (February 1827), 199-213

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXXI', 21 (March 1827), 344-60

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. General Anecdotes', 21 (April 1827), 434-48

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXXII', 21 (April 1827), 473-89

James Hogg, 'Ode for Music. On the Death of Lord Byron', 21 (May 1827), 520-21

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Dreams and Apparitions', 21 (May 1827), 549-62

Robert Macnish, 'Colonel O'Shaughnessy in India', 21 (June 1827), 653-64

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Dreams and Apparitions. Part II.', 21 (June 1827), 664-76

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXXIII', 21 (June 1827, Part II), 896-916

Robert Macnish, 'The Battle of the Brecks, and the Monkey. Two Passages in the Life of William M'Gee, Weaver in Hamilton', 22 (July 1827), 46-53

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Dreams and Apparitions. Containing Smith Cracks, &c. Part III', 22 (July 1827), 64-73

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXXIV', 22 (July 1827), 105-34

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Dreams and Apparitions. – Part IV', 22 (August 1827), 173-85

James Hogg, 'The Perilis of Wemyng. Ane Most Woeful Tragedye', 22 (August 1827), 214-21

James Hogg, 'The Marvellous Doctor', 22 (September 1827), 349-61

Robert Macnish, 'Who Can It Be?', 22 (October 1827), 432-37

Robert Macnish, 'To a Scene in Caithness', 22 (November 1827), 634

James Hogg, 'Ane Pastorale of the Rocke', 22 (December 1827), 675-84

'Day-Dreams', 22 (December 1827), 724-29

James Hogg, 'Trials of Temper', 23 (January 1828), 40-47

'Health and Longevity', 23 (January 1828), 96-111

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXXV', 23 (January 1828), 112-36

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IX. Fairies, Brownies, and Witches', 23 (February 1828), 214-27

John Wilson, 'Anatomy of Drunkenness', 23 (April 1828), 481-99

Robert Macnish, 'To a Child', 23 (April 1828), 499

James Hogg, 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IX. Fairies, Deils, and Witches', 23 (April 1828), 509-19

Robert Macnish, 'The Man with the Mouth', 23 (May 1828), 597-601

Robert Macnish, 'To the Rhine', 23 (May 1828, Part II), 715

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXXVI', 23 (May 1828, Part II), 779-802

James Hogg, 'A Strange Secret. Related in a Letter to the Ettrick Shepherd', 23 (June 1828), 822-26

Robert Macnish, 'The Wig', 23 (June 1828), 826-34

'Monkeyana', 24 (July 1828), 42-51

James Hogg, 'Ane Rychte Gude and Preytious Ballande', 24 (August 1828), 177-83

Robert Macnish, 'The Music of the Spheres', 24 (August 1828), 225

James Hogg, 'The Brownie of the Black Haggs', 24 (October 1828), 489-96

John Wilson, William Maginn, White, James Hogg, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXXVII. No.

XXXVIII', 24 (October 1828), 501-40

James Hogg, 'The Goode Manne of Allowa. Ane Most Strainge and Treuthfulle Ballande', 24 (November 1828), 561-69

Wilson, H. Coleridge, Johnston, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XXXIX', 24 (November 1828), 640-76

'Noctes Ambrosianae, No. XL', 24 (December 1828), 677-708

Robert Macnish, 'An Execution in Paris', 24 (December 1828), 785-88

Robert Macnish, 'On a Girl Sleeping', 24 (January 1829), 105

James Hogg, 'Jock Johnstone the Tinkler', 25 (February 1829), 173-78

Robert Macnish, 'The Man-Mountain', 25 (March 1829), 311-16

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XLI', 24 (March 1829), 371-400

James Hogg, 'Mary Melrose', 25 (April 1829), 411-20

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XLII', 25 (April 1829), 525-48

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XLIII', 25 (May 1829), 549-63

James Hogg, 'Sound Morality', 25 (June 1829), 741-47

James Hogg, 'Will and Sandy. A Scots Pastoral', 25 (June 1829), 748-51

J. G. Lockhart and William Maginn, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XLIV', 25 (June 1829), 787-803

James Hogg, 'A Tale of the Martyrs', 26 (July 1829), 48-50

J. G. Lockhart with William Maginn, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XLV', 26 (July 1829), 120-42

James Hogg, 'A Letter About Men and Women', 26 (August 1829), 245-50

James Hogg, 'Elen of Reigh', 26 (September 1829, Part I), 271-77

J. G. Lockhart, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XLVI', 26 (September 1829, Part I), 389-404

James Hogg, 'The p and the q; or, the Adventures of Jock M'Pherson', 26 (October 1829), 693-95

James Hogg, 'A Singular Letter from Southern Africa', 26 (November 1829), 809-16

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XLVII', 26 (December 1829), 845-78

James Hogg, 'The Last Stork', 27 (February 1830, Part I), 217-22

James Hogg, 'The Lairde of Lonne. Ane Rychte Breiffe and Wytte Ballande', 27 (April 1830), 571-77

Robert Macnish, 'Poetical Portraits', 27 (April 1830), 632-33

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XLVIII', 27 (April 1830), 659-94

James Hogg, 'A Greek Pastoral', 27 (May 1830), 766-69

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. XLIX', 27 (May 1830), 802-32

James Hogg, 'The First Sermon', 27 (June 1830), 879-80

James Hogg, 'Some Remarkable Passages in the Remarkable Life of the Baron St Gio', 27 (June 1830), 891-905

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. L', 27 (June 1830), 917-48

James Hogg, 'Story of Adam Scott', 28 (July 1830), 41-46

James Hogg, 'A Real Vision', 28 (July 1830), 63-65

James Hogg, 'The Origin of Fairies', 28 (August 1830, Part I), 209-17

Robert Macnish, 'The Tear', 28 (August 1830, Part I), 217-18

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Physician. Chap. I. Early Struggles', 28 (August 1830, Part II), 322-38

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LI', 28 (August 1830, Part II), 383-436

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. II. Cancer, The Dentist and the Comedian, The Scholar's Deathbed, Preparing for the House, Dueling', 28 (September 1830), 474-95

James Hogg, 'Jocke Taittis Expeditioun till Hell', 28 (September 1830), 512-17

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. III. Note to the Editor, Intriguing and Madness, The Broken Heart', 8 (October 1830), 608-23

James Hogg, 'A Horrible Instance of the Effects of Clanship', 28 (October 1830), 680-87

James Hogg, 'A Sunday Pastoral', 28 (November 1830), 737-41

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. IV. Consumption, The Spectral Dog, The Forger', 28 (November 1830), 770-93

'Noctes Ambrosianae, No. LII', 28 (November 1830), 831-55

James Hogg, 'The Raid of the Kers', 28 (December 1830), 895-99

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. V. A Man About Town, Death at the Toilet', 28 (December 1830), 921-40

James Hogg, 'The Mysterious Bride', 28 (December 1830), 943-50

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LIII', 29 (January 1831), 1-36

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. VI. The Turned Head, The Wife', 29 (January 1831), 105-27

Robert Macnish, 'Remembrance', 29 (January 1831), 131

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LIV', 29 (February 1831, Part I), 263-84

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. VII. The Spectre Smitten', 29 (February 1831, Part II), 361-75

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. VIII. The Martyr-Philosopher', 29 (March 1831), 485-508

John Wilson, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LV', 29 (March 1831), 535-71

James Hogg, 'A Story of Good Queen Bess', 29 (April 1831), 579-93

James Hogg, 'Johnne Graimis Eckspeditioun Till Heuin', 29 (April 1831), 641-44

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LVI', 29 (April 1831), 688-720

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. IX. The Statesmen', 29 (May 1831), 802-29

James Hogg, 'The Miser's Grave', 29 (June 1831), 915-18

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. X. A Slight Cold, Rich and Poor, Grave Doings', 29 (June 1831), 946-67

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. XI. The Ruined Merchant', 30 (July 1831), 60-81

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LVII', 30 (August 1831, Part II), 400-22

James Hogg, 'An Awfu' Leein'-like Story', 30 (September 1831), 448-56

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LVIII', 30 (September 1831), 531-64

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. XII. Mother and Son, A Word with the Reader at Parting', 30 (October 1831), 565-99

James Hogg, 'The Magic Mirror', 30 (October 1831), 650-54

James Hogg, 'Lyttill Pynkie', 30 (November 1831), 782-89

John Wilson and James Hogg, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LIX', 30 (November 1831), 802-46

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LX', 31 (February 1832, Part I), 255-88

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXI', 31 (April 1832), 693-720

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late-Physician, Chap. XIII. The Thunder-Struck. The Boxer', 32 (September 1832), 279-99

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXII', 32 (September 1832), 381-412

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXIII', 32 (October 1832, Part II), 693-726

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXIV', 32 (November 1832), 846-74

Samuel Warren, 'Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. XIV. The Magdalen', 32 (December 1832), 878-911

Samuel Warren, 'Some Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Chap. XV. The Baronet's Bride', 35 (January 1834), 81-121

'A Story without a Tail', 35 (April 1834), 453-58

John Wilson, James Hogg, William Maginn, and Bartholomew Simmons, 'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXV', 35 (May 1834, Part II), 852-82

James Hogg, 'Mora Campbell', 35 (June 1834), 947-54

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXVI', 36 (July 1834), 120-48

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXVII', 36 (August 1834), 258-88

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXVIII', 36 (November 1834), 573-97

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXIX', 36 (December 1834), 831-58

'Sketches by H.B. From the Portfolio of the Ettrick Shepherd', 37 (January 1835), 72-76

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXX', 37 (January 1835), 128-44

'Noctes Ambrosianae. No. LXXI', 37 (February, Part I), 256-86

‘Sketches by HB. From the Portfolio of the Ettrick Shepherd. No. II. L – D B – M to Joseph Grimaldi, Esq.’, 37 (February 1835, Part II), 410-12

James Hogg, ‘A Screed on Politics’, 37 (April 1835), 634-42

‘The Metaphysician. No. I. On the Philosophy of Locke’, 40 (June 1836), 798-806

Samuel Warren, ‘Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Ch. XVII. The Merchant’s Clerk’, 40 (July 1836), 1-32

‘The Metaphysician. No. II. Brown on Cause and Effect’, 41 (July 1836), 122-31

Samuel Warren, ‘Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. Ch. XVII. The Merchant’s Clerk’, 40 (August 1836), 181-207

Samuel Warren, ‘Passages from the Diary of a Late Physician. The Last Chapter. The Destroyer’, 42 (August 1837), 248-92

‘Animal Magnetism in London in 1837’, 42 (September 1837), 384-93

Chambers’ Edinburgh Magazine

‘The Cholera – Musselburgh’, 1 (25 February 1832), 29

‘Ghosts’, 1 (31 March 1832), 68

‘Progressive Condition of Man’, 1 (31 March 1832), 71

James Hogg, ‘Emigration’, 2 (18 May 1833), 124-25

James Hogg, ‘The Watchmaker’, 2 (15 June 1833), 153-54

James Hogg, ‘An Old Minister’s Tale’, 2 (29 June 1833), 173-74

James Hogg, ‘Nature’s Magic Lantern’, 2 (28 September 1833), 273-74

James Hogg, ‘Adventure of the Ettrick Shepherd’, 2 (19 October 1833), 298-99

James Hogg, ‘Letter from Canada to the Ettrick Shepherd’, 2 (28 December 1833), 383-84

‘The Philosophy of Dreams’, 3 (15 February 1834), 21-22

‘Case of Spectral Illusion’, 3 (8 March 1834), 48

James Hogg, ‘Anecdotes of Highlanders’, 3 (12 April 1834), 88

James Hogg, ‘A Story of the Forty-Six’, 3 (10 May 1834), 118

‘Night-mare’, 3 (7 June 1834), 151

‘Short Remarks on Men and Things (From Macnish’s “Book of Aphorisms,” 1834)’, 3 (27 September 1834), 280

‘Modification of Sleep’, 5 (26 March 1836), 72

Edinburgh, Leith, Glasgow, and North British Advertiser

James Hogg, ‘A Grand New Blacking Sang’ (22 May 1830)

The Edinburgh Literary Journal; or, Weekly Register of Criticism and Belles Lettres

James Hogg, ‘A Letter from Yarrow’, 1 (15 November 1828), 9-10

James Hogg, ‘A Pastoral Sang’, 1 (15 November 1828), 12

James Hogg, ‘Noctes Bengerianae’, 1 (27 December 1828), 87-90

James Hogg, ‘The Wanderer’s Tale’, 1 (3 January 1829), 109-10

James Hogg, ‘1828’, 1 (3 January 1829), 113-14

[William Weir], ‘Foreign Literature’, 1 (11 January 1829), 123-24

‘Something Concerning Grave-Diggers’, 1 (17 January 1829), 139-40

James Hogg, ‘A Scots Sang’, 1 (17 January 1829), 141

‘Dugald Stewart, Esq.’, 1 (31 January 1829), 158-61

‘Science: Phrenological Development of the Murderer Burke’, 1 (31 January 1829), 167-68

‘Moral and Miscellaneous Essays. No. 1. The Progress of Society – The Moral Character of the Lower Classes’, 1 (28 February 1829), 220-22

‘Hogg’s *The Shepherd’s Calendar*’, 1 (14 March 1829), 243-46

‘Moral and Miscellaneous Essays. No. 2. Catholic Emancipation. – A Vision’, 1 (14 March 1829), 249-50

James Hogg, ‘Noctes Bengerinae. No. II’, 1 (21 March 1829), 258-60

James Hogg, ‘An Eskdale Anecdote’, 1 (25 April 1829), 337-38

‘Stone’s *Observations on the Phrenological Development of Burke, Hare, and other atrocious*

Murderers', 1 (2 May 1829), 342-45

James Hogg, 'A Real Love Sang', 1 (2 May 1829), 352

'Moral & Miscellaneous Essays. No. 5. The Character of Robert Burns', 1 (9 May 1829), 361-64

'Autographs. The Connexion between Characters and Handwriting – Anecdotes', 1 (23 May 1829), 389-392

James Hogg, 'Epistle to Mr William Berwick', 1 (30 May 1829), 418-19

'Phrenology', 1 (30 May 1829), 420

James Hogg, 'A New Poetic Mirror. No. I. – Mr W. W. Ode to a Highland Bee', 2 (5 September 1829), 199

James Hogg, 'Wat the Prophet', 2 (12 September 1829), 207-10

'Ackermann's *Forget me not for 1830*', 2 (31 October 1829), 302

James Hogg, 'A Grand New Blacking Sang', 2 (15 May 1830), 290

'Macnish's *The Philosophy of Sleep*', 2 (16 October 1830), 238-39

The Edinburgh Magazine, and Literary Miscellany, being a new series of The Scots Magazine

James Gray 'Life and Writings of James Hogg', 2 (January 1818), 35-40

James Gray, 'On the Life and Writings of James Hogg', 2 (February 1818), 122-29

James Gray, 'On the Life and Writings of James Hogg', 2 (March 1818), 215-223

Robert Macnish, 'Macvurich, the Murderer', 10 (March 1822), 330-33

Robert Macnish, 'The Dream Confirmed', 18 (February 1826), 201-09

The Edinburgh Review

Thomas Brown, 'Villers on Gall's *New Theory of the Brain*', 1 (April 1803), 147-60

Francis Jeffrey, 'Stewart's *Account of the Life and Writing of Thomas Reid*', 3 (January 1804), 268-287

Francis Jeffrey, 'Stewart's *Philosophical Essays*', 17 (November 1810), 167-211

Francis Jeffrey, 'Hogg's *The Queen's Wake*', 24 (November 1814), 157-74

John Gordon, 'Home's *Observations on the Functions of the Brain*', 24 (February 1815), 439-52

John Gordon, 'Gall and Spurzheim's *Physiognomical System*', 25 (June 1815), 227-68

Francis Jeffrey, 'Combe's *A System of Phrenology*', 44 (September 1826), 253-318

Francis Jeffrey, 'Note to the Article on Phrenology in No. 88', 45 (December 1826), 248-53

The Emmet; A Periodical Publication

'Introductory Observations', 1 (5 April 1823), 1-3

'Anecdotes of Remarkable Characters', 1 (5 April 1823), 4-6

[signed An Observer], 'Manners. To the Editor of the Emmet', 1 (5 April 1823), 6-8

'Allan Vere; or, the Victim of Sensibility', 1 (5 April 1823), 9-12

[signed Robert M'Mulligan, P. U. C.], 'Essay: On Boarding Schools, Female Education, and the Rise and Progress of Dandyism. Respectfully Dedicated to the Ladies of Glasgow. By Robert M'Mulligan, Esq. President of the Ugly Club', 1 (12 April 1823), 13-16

'Eric the Murderer. – A Fragment', 1 (12 April 1823), 17-18

'The True Use of Riches', 1 (12 April 1823), 18-21

[Robert Macnish, 'The Vision of Iona', 1 \(12 April 1823\), 21-22](#)

'Swift's Last Lines &c.', 1 (12 April 1823), 22-24

[signed Robert M'Mulligan, P. U. C.], 'History of the Ugly Club. By President M'Mulligan', 1 (19 April 1823), 25-28

[Robert Macnish', 'Extracts from Ima, An Unpublished Eastern Romance – In Verse', 1 \(19 April 1823\), 28-30](#)

'The True Use of Riches', 1 (19 April 1823), 30-33

[signed An Observer], 'Manners. To the Editor of the Emmet', 1 (19 April 1823), 33-34

'Lucubrations of Jonathon Bloomfield, Gent.', 1 (26 April 1823), 37-40

'Cailleach Beinn Na Bric. A Fairy Song, from the Gaelic', 1 (26 April 1823), 40-41

[signed Renoclass], 'To the Editor of the Emmet', 1 (26 April 1823), 42-43

‘Johnny Grant in Hell’, 1 (26 April 1823), 43-44

‘The Old Wrecker – A Tale’, 1 (26 April 1823), 45-48

[signed Eben, Walkinshaw], ‘Eben. Walkinshaw’s Adventures, During a Voyage to Johnny Groat’s. In a Letter to the Editor’, 1 (3 May 1823), 49-53

[Robert Macnish, ‘Extracts from Ima. An Unpublished Eastern Romance – In Verse’, 1 \(3 May 1823\), 53-54](#)

‘Mr. Perkin’s Steam-Engine’, 1 (3 May 1823), 54-57

[signed R. M’Mulligan, P. U. C.], ‘A Letter to Mr. Haggart of the “Argyl Tavern and Hotel.” From Robert M’Mulligan, Esq. President of the Ugly Club’, 1 (3 May 1823), 58

‘Lucubrations of Jonathon Bloomfield, Gent.’, 1 (10 May 1823), 61-64

‘Selected Lucubrations of David Knowall. The Necessity of Forming Virtuous Principles at an Early Age’, 1 (10 May 1823), 65-66

[signed W.], ‘Sextuple Alliance’, 1 (10 May 1823), 66-69

[signed L. M’L.], ‘To the Editor of the Emmet’, 1 (10 May 1823), 69-70

[signed A Well-Doing Man], ‘The Grievances of a Well-Doing Man. To the Editor of the Emmet’, 1 (10 May 1823), 71-72

‘Advice to the Well-Doing Man, and the Would-Be-Gentry’, 1 (17 May 1823), 73-74

[signed An Observer], ‘Manners. To the Editor of the Emmet’, 1 (17 May 1823), 80-83

‘The Relative Advantages of Beauty and Accomplishments’, 1 (24 May 1823), 85-87

‘Speculations of a Rambler’, 1 (31 May 1823), 97-99

‘The Fatalist’, 1 (31 May 1823), 100-02

‘Condensations of the Gases into Liquids’, 1 (31 May 1823), 103-07

‘Author’s Affections’, 1 (7 June 1823), 109-11

‘The Victim of Revenge’, 1 (7 June 1823), 111-12

[Robert Macnish, ‘The Tale of Eivor. A Scandinavian Legend’, 1 \(7 June 1823\), 113-17](#)

[signed Y], ‘An Original Letter from St. Vincent, Written in the Year, 1802. To the Editor of the Emmet’, 1 (14 June 1823), 121-24

‘Origin of the Stocking Loom’, 1 (14 June 1823), 128-29

‘Original Anecdotes’, 1 (14 June 1823), 130-32

‘Sovereignty of Women’, 1 (21 June 1823), 133-36

[signed Candidus], ‘On the Death of Napoleon’, 1 (21 June 1823), 136-37

[signed A Friend to Fair Art, From the bottom of the Grampians], ‘To the Editor of the Emmet’, 1 (21 June 1823), 141-43

‘Craniology’, 1 (21 June 1823), 144

‘The Hermitage of Kandou. Translated from the Brahma Purana, a Sanscript Composition of the Highest Antiquity, with an Introduction by M. De Chezy’, 1 (28 June 1823), 145-47

[signed An Owl], ‘To a Very Sage and Sagacious Emmet an Owl Sendeth Greeting’, 1 (28 June 1823), 147-49

‘A Few Thoughts on the State of the Fine Arts in Great Britain’, 1 (5 July 1823), 157-61

[signed Philo Reginal], ‘Departure of Queen Caroline from St. Omers’, 1 (5 July 1823), 161-62

[signed Peter Ferret, V. P. U. C.], ‘On Pedestrianism. By the Vice President of the Ugly Club’, 1 (5 July 1823), 162-63

[signed Obadiah Meikleham, C. U. C.], ‘A Letter to the Editor Concerning Michael Moony’s Travels to Paisley. By the Clerk of the Ugly Club’, 1 (5 July 1823), 163-65

‘The Hermitage of Kandou (Continued from page 147.)’, 1 (5 July 1823), 165-68

‘The Mistaken Medicines’, 1 (12 July 1823), 174-77

‘The Hermitage of Kandou (Continued from page 168.)’, 1 (12 July 1823), 179-80

‘Remarks on the Rev. Edward Irving’s Orations, &c.’, 1 (19 July 1823), 199-200

‘The Two Brothers: An Anecdote from the German of Schiller’, 1 (2 August 1823), 210-12

‘Original Letter from a Goth’, 1 (2 August 1823), 212-15

‘Authorship’, 1 (9 August 1823), 217-18

[signed G.], ‘Thoughts on Immortality, and a Peep into a Country Church-yard’, 1 (9 August 1823), 219-21

‘Desultory Remarks on Haydon’s Picture of Christ’s Entry into Jerusalem’, 1 (9 August 1823), 222-25

[signed W.], 'On the Style of Addison and Johnson', 1 (16 August 1823), 229-32

'The Theatre. Miss Stephens, Mr. Horn, and Miss Kelly', 1 (16 August 1823), 233-36

[signed A. —], 'Remarks on the Edinburgh Review, No. 76', 1 (16 August 1823), 237-38

'Local Blunders', 1 (16 August 1823), 238-39

[signed Micromegas], 'Micromegal Lucubrations.— No. I', 1 (23 August 1823), 241-43

'Diving Bell', 1 (23 August 1823), 247-49

'Theatre. Miss Kelly, and Miss Tree', 1 (23 August 1823), 249-51

'Craniology', 1 (23 August 1823), 251

[signed A Lowlander], 'A Letter to the Editor from a Lowlander', 1 (30 August 1823), 257-60

'Mr. Irving's Portrait', 1 (6 September 1823), 269-70

'Theatre. — Mr. Macready', 1 (6 September 1823), 270-72

'Humanity of Napoleon', 1 (6 September 1823), 276

[signed C.], 'Delicacy of Passion and Taste', 1 (13 September 1823), 276-78

'On the Impenetrability of Matter', 1 (20 September 1823), 289-91

[Robert Macnish, 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande, Onne Ane Famous Steed, Yclept the 'Nicht Mare.' Dedicated to the Ettrick Shepherd. By the Bard of the Ugly Club', 1 \(20 September 1823\), 291-93](#)

[signed Micromegas], 'Micromegal Lucubrations—No. II. Glasgow Dandyism', 1 (20 September 1823), 295-98

[signed Celt], 'Letter from a Celt, in Reply to a Lowlander', 1 (20 September 1823), 298-300

[signed A Lowlander], 'Lowlands *versus* Highlands. Another Letter to the Editor from a Lowlander', 1 (27 September 1823), 301-05

'Our Balaam Box', 1 (27 September 1823), 305-09

'Critique on the Orlando Furioso of Aristo', 2 (4 October 1823), 1-3

[Robert Macnish, 'Verses to a Very Young Lady. By the Bard of the Ugly Club', 2 \(4 October 1823\), 7-8](#)

'Anecdotes of Provost Buchanan, The Squire Gawky of Smollett, &c.', 2 (4 October 1823), 9-10

‘Our Balaam Box’, 2 (4 October 1823), 10-12

[signed M.], ‘On Modern Criticism – No. I’, 2 (11 October 1823), 13-17

[Robert Macnish, ‘The Mas-Steak-Ation of Beef Steak. By the Bard of the Ugly Club’, 2 \(11 October 1823\), 17-21](#)

[signed Touthey], ‘Letter from the Author Reid to the Editor’, 2 (11 October 1823), 21-23

‘Our Balaam Box’, 2 (11 October 1823), 23-24

[signed I.], ‘Review. Hogg’s Three Perils of Woman’, 2 (18 October 1823), 25-27

[signed Micromegas], ‘Paisley Coaches. Micromegal Lubrications, No. III’, 2 (18 October 1823), 30-33

‘Our Verdict’, 2 (18 October 1823), 35-36

[signed R. M’Mulligan, Knt.], ‘Letter from Sir Robert M’Mulligan, Knt. President of the Ugly Club’, 2 (25 October 1823), 37-42

[Robert Macnish, ‘A Mysticism. – A Fragment. By the Bard of the Ugly Club’, 2 \(25 October 1823\), 42-44](#)

[signed M.], ‘Modern Criticism. No. II’, 2 (25 October 1823), 44-48

[signed Micromegas], ‘Micromegal Lucubrations. – No. IV. The Glasgow People’, 2 (1 November 1823), 49-52

‘Our Balaam Box’, 2 (1 November 1823), 59-60

[signed Peter Ferret, V. P. U. C.], ‘Mr. Ferret, Vice President of the Ugly Club, Versus Sir Robert M’Mulligan and the Bard. In a Letter to the Editor’, 2 (8 November 1823), 61-65

‘Micromegal Lucubrations. – No. V. The Glasgow People’, 2 (8 November 1823), 70-72

‘Remarks on the Rev. Dr. Chalmers. By Mr. Obadiah Meikleham, Clerk of the Ugly Club’, 2 (15 November 1823), 73-76

[Robert Macnish, ‘Verses. By the Bard of the Ugly Club’, 2 \(15 November 1823\), 77](#)

‘Review. A Popular Treatise on Accidents’, 2 (15 November 1823), 77-79

[signed Jem Twig], ‘An Evening at the Old Gentleman’s. By Jem Twig. In a Letter to the Editor’, 2 (22 November 1823), 85-89

Robert Macnish, ‘The Holy Nun. – A Chaunt. By the Bard of the Ugly Club’, 2 (22 November 1823), 90-92

[signed The Emmet], 'Our Emmetship', 2 (22 November 1823), 95-96

Robert Macnish, 'Sketches of British Literature. Sketch I. – Introduction', 2 (29 November 1823), 97-101

'Lines Inscribed to the Bard of the Ugly Club', 2 (29 November 1823), 101-02

[signed R. M'Mulligan, Knt.], 'Letter from Sir Robert M'Mulligan to the Editor', 2 (29 November 1823), 102-06

'Our Balaam Box', 2 (29 November 1823), 106-08

Robert Macnish, 'Sketches of British Literature. Sketch II. The Era of Queen Elizabeth', 2 (6 December 1823), 109-14

'Surgical Operation', 2 (6 December 1823), 120

Robert Macnish, 'Sketches of British Literature. Sketch III. The Era of King Charles II', 2 (13 December 1823), 121-26

Robert Macnish, 'The Song of Moina', 2 (13 December 1823), 126-27

Robert Macnish, 'Sketches of British Literature. Sketch IV. The Era of Queen Anne', 2 (20 December 1823), 133-38

'On the Moral and Physical Advantages of Smoking, For the Benefit of the Uninitiated. By Jeremy Twist, S. D.', 2 (20 December 1823), 138-41

Robert Macnish, 'To A Child Weeping. By the Bard of the Ugly Club', 2 (20 December 1823), 141

Robert Macnish, 'Sketches of British Literature. Sketch V. The Era Including the Reign of George II. and Part of that of George III', 2 (27 December 1823), 145-51

'On Benevolent Institutions and Imprisonment for Debt', 2 (27 December 1823), 151-56

Robert Macnish [signed The Bard of the Ugly Club], 'Sketches of British Literature. Sketch VI. The Era Including the Last Sixteen Years of George III. Down to the Present Time', 2 (3 January 1824), 157-62

'A Glasgow Epic', 2 (3 January 1824), 162-63

Robert Macnish, 'An Eastern Melody. By the Bard of the Ugly Club', 2 (3 January 1824), 164

'Our Balaam Box', 2 (3 January 1824), 166-68

'Glasgow Periodicalism, and a Critical Notice of the Western Luminary', 2 (10 January 1824), 169-72

Robert Macnish, 'A Fragment. By the Bard of the Ugly Club', 2 (10 January 1824), 175

'Plagiarisms of the Author of Waverly. By the Vice President of the Ugly Club', 2 (10 January 1824), 176-77

[signed Ebenezer Treddles], 'Letter from Mr. Ebenezer Treddles, Manufacturer, in Paisley. To the Editor', 2 (24 January 1824), 196-98

'Reply to the Writer of the Article on the "Plagiarisms of the Author of Waverly."', 2 (24 January 1824), 198-200

'Letter from the Ghost of Banquo. To the Editor', 2 (24 January 1824), 200-02

Robert Macnish, 'The Bard's Register. No. I. The Flower of Berne', 2 (31 January 1824), 205-12

Robert Macnish, 'The Bard's Register. No. II. The Tomb of Ellenore', 2 (31 January 1824), 212-14

[signed Obadiah Meikleham], 'Letter from Obadiah Meikleham, Clerk to the Ugly Club. To the Editor', 2 (31 January 1824), 214-16

Robert Macnish, 'The Bard's Register. No. III. The Orphan', 2 (14 February 1824), 229-35

'The Emmet and the Ugly Club', 2 (14 February 1824), 236-37

'Letter from Mr. Obadiah Meikleham. Clerk of the Ugly Club', 2 (14 February 1824), 238-40

'Modern Criticism. No. III', 2 (21 February 1824), 241-44

Robert Macnish, 'Song of the Spirit of Zephyrs. A Fragment of a MS. Poem', 2 (21 February 1824), 244-46

'Dinner of the Two Ugly Clubs', 2 (21 February 1824), 246-49

'National Progress of Art and Science', 2 (28 February 1824), 253-57

'The Speculative Society', 2 (28 February 1824), 262-64

'On the Ignorance of the Learned', 2 (13 March 1824), 277-83

Robert Macnish, 'The Harp of Salem. By the Bard of the Ugly Club', 2 (13 March 1824), 283-85

Robert Macnish, 'The Bard's Register. No. IV. Ghosts and Dreams', 2 (20 March 1824), 289-99

'The Valediction', 2 (27 March 1824), 301-04

Fraser's Magazine for Town and Country

John Abaham Heraud, 'On Poetic Genius, Considered as a Creative Power', 1 (February 1830), 56-63

'Remarkable Vision of Charles XI. of Sweden', 1 (February 1830), 120-25

[John Abaham Heraud and William Maginn], 'The Last of the Supernaturalists', 1 (March 1830), 217-35

[J. G. Lockhart and William Maginn], 'Literary Characters. – By Pierce Pungent. No. I. James Hogg', 1 (April 1830), 291-300

James Hogg, 'The Flower of Annisley', 1 (April 1830), 308-09

James Hogg, 'I Hae Naebody Now', 1 (May 1830), 398

D. M. Moir, 'The Wounded Spirit', 1 (May 1830), 417-26

'On Medical Quackery and Mr. St. John Long', 1 (May 1830), 451-56

James Hogg, 'The Lass o' Carlisle. An Excellent New Song', 1 (July 1830), 654

D. M. Moir, 'The Wounded Spirit [continued from page 426]', 1 (July 1830), 663-72

'Animal Magnetism', 1 (July 1830), 673-84

James Hogg, 'Lines for the Eye of the Beautiful Miss E. B.', 2 (August 1830), 31-32

'The Philosophy of Apparitions', 2 (August 1830), 33-41

James Hogg, 'The Unearthly Witness', 2 (September 1830), 171-78

'Medical Quackery and Mr. John St. John Long. No. II', 2 (October 1830), 264-65

D. M. Moir, 'The Wounded Spirit [continued from vol. i. p. 672]', 2 (November 1830), 397-411

'Scott's *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft*', 2 (December 1830), 507-19

'On Mr. Owen's System', 2 (December 1830), 520-25

James Hogg, 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic. To Mr. James Hogg, of Mount Benger', 2 (December 1830), 526-32

[William Maginn], 'Some Passages in the Diary of the late Mr. St. John Long', 2 (January 1831), 739-40

James Hogg, 'Geordie Scott, A Hamely Pastoral', 3 (February 1831), 39-43

James Hogg, 'The Barber of Duncow. A Real Ghost Story', 3 (March 1831), 174-80

'On Alchemy and the Alchemists', 3 (April 1831), 321-34

Robert Macnish, 'Punch and Judy', 3 (April 1831), 350-54

Robert Macnish, 'A Singular Passage in My Own Life', 3 (May 1831), 411-22

James Hogg, 'Disagreeables', 3 (June 1831), 567-69

Robert Macnish, 'The Black Rider. A Ballad', 3 (June 1831), 623-24

'Herschel's *Natural Philosophy*', 3 (July 1831), 698-702

James Hogg, 'Aunt Susan', 3 (July 1831), 720-26

Robert Macnish, 'Who Murdered Begbie? A Stage-Coach Romance', 4 (October 1831), 329-32

Robert Macnish, 'Ane Flicht Through Faery Lande Onne ane Famous Steede Yclept the Nicht-Mare', 4 (November 1831), 401-02

James Hogg, 'Crawford John', 4 (November 1831), 422-28

James Hogg, 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul', 4 (December 1831), 529-37

'The Asiatic Cholera', 4 (December 1831), 613-25

James Hogg, 'The Twa Burdies', 5 (February 1832), 20-22

Robert Macnish, 'The Philosophy of Burking', 5 (February 1832), 52-65

James Hogg, 'One Thousand Eight Hundred and Thirty-one', 5 (February 1832), 84

William Maginn, 'Gallery of Literary Characters. No. XXI. James Hogg', 5 (February 1832), 97

William Maginn, 'The Great and Celebrated Hogg Dinner', 5 (February 1832), 113-26

Robert Macnish, 'Address to Cupid', 5 (March 1832), 227-28

James Hogg, 'The Elder in Love', 5 (March 1832), 234-37

'The Altrive Tales', 5 (May 1832), 482-89

John Abaham Heraud, 'Some Account of Coleridge's Philosophy', 5 (June 1832), 585-97

Robert Macnish, 'Miss Pipson', 5 (July 1832), 708

'Meeting, at Oxford, of the British Association for the Advancement of Science', 5 (July 1832), 750-53

'Doctor O'Gorman', 6 (August 1832), 9-11

'On the Contagious Character of Cholera', 6 (August 1832), 119-23

Robert Macnish, 'Babylon is Fallen', 6 (September 1832), 160

James Hogg, 'The Mountain-dew Men', 6 (September 1832), 161-70

Robert Macnish, 'The Victims of Susceptibility', 6 (September 1832), 236-38

James Hogg, 'This World's an Unco Bonny Place', 6 (October 1832), 359-61

Robert Macnish, 'Song', 6 (October 1832), 376

William Maginn, 'The Death of Sir Walter Scott', 6 (October 1832), 380-82

James Hogg, 'Gallery of Literary Characters. No. XXX. Sir David Brewster', 6 (November 1832), 416

James Hogg, 'Ewan M'Gabhar', 6 (November 1832), 450-60

Robert Macnish, 'Night: A Fragment', 6 (November 1832, Part II), 575

Robert Macnish, 'Susan Sutton, On a Pimple, Ye Ladies Fair, Monsieur de Papillon, Epitaphs from Lerwick', in 'Our First Double Number, and the Reason Why', 6 (November 1832, Part II), 626-35

Robert Macnish, 'A Self-Laudatory Ode', 6 (November 1832, Part II), 636

'Physical Evidences of the Characters of Ancient Races Among the Moderns', 6 (December 1832), 673-79

Robert Macnish, 'The Spermicetti Candle', 6 (December 1832), 686-88

'The World of Dreams', 6 (December 1832), 700-03

Robert Macnish and William Maginn, 'The Book of Aphorisms. By an Oriental Author. With a running Commentary, by Sir Morgan O'Doherty, Bart. Book I. Containing the First Dozen Dozen', 6 (December 1832), 712-28

[James Hogg], 'Epistles to the Literati. No. VI. James Hogg, Esq. to Oliver Yorke, Esq.', 7 (January 1833), 16

James Hogg, 'An Auld Wife's Dream', 7 (January 1833), 68-72

'Magiana; or, the Mysteries of Natural and Artificial Magic', 7 (January 1833), 73-78

James Hogg, 'A Remarkable Egyptian Story. Written by Barek, a Learned Jew of Egypt, About the Latter End of the Reign of Cambyzes the Persian', 7 (February 1833), 147-58

Robert Macnish, 'The Harp of Salem', 7 (February 1833), 231-32

Robert Macnish, 'The Ettrick Shepherd and Stewart of Glenormiston' and 'Bacchanalian Song', in 'The Fraser Papers for February', 7 (February 1833), 240-50, (pp. 247-50).

'Magiana; or, the Mysteries of Natural and Artificial Magic', 7 (March 1833), 331-40

[William Maginn], 'The Shepherd's Noctes and the Reason Why They Do Not Appear in Fraser's Magazine', 8 (July 1833), 49-55

Robert Macnish, 'Stanzas', 8 (July 1833), 63

William Maginn, 'Gallery of Literary Characters. No. XL. Doctor Moir', 8 (September 1833), 290

Sir Samuel Egerton Brydges, 'On Intellectual Endowments', 8 (September 1833), 291-301

Robert Macnish, 'The Philosophy of Sneering', 8 (September 1833), 302-10

Robert Macnish, 'A Fragment', in 'The Fraser Papers for September', 8 (September 1833), 376-84, (p. 382)

'The Doctor Bewitched', 8 (November 1833), 530-35

James Hogg, 'The Miller Correspondence. XXVII. – James Hogg', 8 (November 1833), 635

'A Dream', 9 (January 1834), 26-29

James Hogg, 'Extraordinary History of a Border Beauty', 9 (January 1834), 97-110

James Hogg, 'The Frasers in the Correi', 9 (March 1834), 273-78

'Mares'-Nests. Found by the Materialists, the Owenites, and the Craniologists', 9 (April 1834), 424-34

Allan Cunningham, 'Lay Sermons: By the Ettrick Shepherd', 10 (July 1834), 1-10

Robert Macnish, 'The Nun of Landisfern', 10 (July 1834), 49-50

William Maginn, 'Domestic Manners of Sir Walter Scott. By James Hogg', 10 (August 1834), 125-56

'The Fraser Papers for September', 10 (September 1834), 365-78

James Hogg, 'Love's Legacy. Canto First', 10 (October 1834), 403-08

James Hogg, 'Love's Legacy, Canto Second', 10 (November 1834), 556-60

James Hogg, 'Love's Legacy, Canto Third', 10 (December 1834), 639-44

Robert Macnish, 'Notes on a Journey from Paris to Ostend', 11 (January 1835), 33-49

John Abaham Heraud, 'Coleridgeiana', 11 (January 1835), 50-58

James Hogg, 'Anecdotes of Ghosts and Apparitions', 11 (January 1835), 103-12

Thomas Wright, 'Popular Superstition of Modern Greece', 11 (February 1835), 218-25

James Hogg, 'A Very Ridiculous Sermon', 11 (February 1835), 226-31

James Hogg, 'The Hunter of Comar', 11 (March 1835), 357-59

James Hogg, 'A Dream', 11 (May 1835), 516-17

[Thackeray and Maginn], 'A Decade of Novels and Nouvellettes', 11 (May 1835), 586-609

James Hogg, 'The Three Sisters', 11 (June 1835), 666-79

James Hogg, 'The Chickens in the Corn', 12 (September 1835), 281-82

Rev. George Robert Gleig, 'Lord Brougham on Natural Theology', 12 (October 1835), 375-93

Andrew Picken, 'The Confessions of a Metempsychosis', 12 (November 1835), 496-501

Andrew Picken, 'The Baron of Courtstown', 12 (December 1835), 629-41

William Maginn, 'Gallery of Literary Characters. No. LXVII. Robert Macnish, Esquire', 12 (December 1835), 650

'Lord Bacon, his Character and Philosophy', 13 (February 1836), 143-53

James Hogg, 'The Turners', 13 (May 1836), 609-19

Sir Samuel Egerton Brydges, 'On the Charge that Men of Genius and High Talents Want Judgment and Practical Sense', 13 (June 1836), 673-82

'Immortality and Immateriality', 13 (June 1836), 694-707

James Hogg, 'The Ettrick Shepherd's Last Tale, Helen Crocket, with an Introduction by Oliver Yorke', 14 (October 1836), 425-40

Robert Pearse Gillies, 'Humours of the North. No. VIII. Recollections of Dugald Stewart', 19 (January 1839), 50-56

'The Modern Pythagorean', 19 (June 1839), 685-93

Robert Pearse Gillies, 'Some Recollections of James Hogg', 20 (October 1839), 414-30

Friendship's Offering: A Literary Album, and Christmas and New Year's Present for 1829 (London: Smith, Elder, and Co., 1829)

Robert Macnish, 'The Covenanters. A Scottish Traditionary Tale' (1829), 113-42

Forget Me Not; A Christmas and New Year's, and Birthday Present, ed. by Frederic Shoberl (London: Ackerman)

Robert Macnish, 'Terence O'Flaherty' (1829), 69-83

Robert Macnish, 'The Red Man' (1830), 49-65

Robert Macnish, 'A Vision of Robert the Bruce' (1832), 55-72

Robert Macnish, 'Song' (1832), 117

Robert Macnish, 'The Tear' (1832), 223-26

Robert Macnish, 'Death and the Fisherman' (1833), 245-66

Robert Macnish, 'A Night Near Monte Video' (1836), 121-34

Glasgow Courier

'*The Scottish Annual*', 45 (22 December 1835)

'The Angel and the Spirit – A Mystery', 45 (7 January 1836)

The Glasgow Medical Journal

'Macnish's *The Philosophy of Sleep*', 4 (1831), 265-70

Hogg's Weekly Instructor

James Hogg, 'Robin Roole', 1 (17 May 1845), 183-87

Imperial Magazine

‘Macnish’s *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*’, 2.15 (March 1832), 138-39

The Lancet

‘Macnish’s *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*’, 8 (5 May 1827), 149-55

‘Blackwood’s Magazine v. the Secrets of the Medical Profession’, 14 (28 August 1830), 878-79

‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, 15 (19 February 1831), 673-79

Literary Chronicle

‘Macnish’s *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*’, 415 (April 1827), 262-64

The Literary Melange; or Weekly Register of Literature and the Arts

‘Prospectus’, 1 (19 June 1822), 1

‘Paris. – A Sketch’, 1 (19 June 1822), 6-8

‘The Man of Letters’, 1 (19 June 1822), 8-10

‘The Present General Diffusion of Learning Among All Ranks of Persons’, 1 (19 June 1822), 10-12

‘Interesting Account of the Pretender, from the Political and Literary Anecdotes of his own Times, by Dr. William King’, 1 (19 June 1822), 12-13

‘Parliamentary Eloquence – Lord Chatham – Lord North – Mr. Fox – Mr Pitt – Mr Burke’, 1 (26 June 1822), 17-21

‘Dublin in 1822. (from the *New Monthly Magazine.*)’, 1 (26 June 1822), 21-28

‘Narrative of a Visit to Madame de Genlis’, 1 (26 June 1822), 28-30

‘General Epochs with the Last Fifty Years’, 1 (26 June 1822), 32

[signed W. M.], ‘Sketches. No. 1’, 1 (3 July 1822), 33-34

‘Parliamentary Eloquence. – Lord North – Mr. Fox – Mr. Pitt – Mr. Burke’, 1 (3 July 1822), 38-39

[signed The Hermit in the Country], ‘The Top of a Stage’, 1 (3 July 1822), 40-42

[signed The Hermit in the Country], 'The Navy Lieutenant', 1 (3 July 1822), 42-45

[signed Screvelius Radix], 'Vulgarity of Slang', 1 (3 July 1822), 45-47

'Sketches. No. 2', 1 (10 July 1822), 49-50

'Youth of Genius', 1 (17 July 1822), 65-69

'On People with One Idea', 1 (17 July 1822), 69-71

'Sketches. No. 3 'The Tiger'', 1 (24 July 1822), 81-83

'A View of Country Life During the Age of Shakespeare; – Its Manners and Custom. – Rural Characters', 1 (24 July 1822), 83-89

'Sketches. No. 4. The Courtship', 1 (31 July 1822), 97-99

'On the Modes of Living, the Manners and Customs, of the Inhabitants of the Metropolis, During the Age of Shakespeare', 1 (31 July 1822), 99-103

'The Bashful Man', 1 (31 July 1822), 103-06

'Sketches. No. 5. Patience', 1 (7 August 1822), 113-14

[Washington Irving], 'The Stout Gentleman. A Stage Coach Romance', 1 (7 August 1822), 114-20

Robert Macnish, 'On the Poetic Genius of the Middle Ages', 1 (14 August 1822), 129-31

Robert Macnish, 'The Camera Obscura. No. 1. Shipwreck', 1 (28 August 1822), 161-63

'A Medical Anecdote', 1 (28 August 1822), 176

'National Character', 1 (4 September 1822), 184-89

Robert Macnish, 'The Camera Obscura. No. 2. Julia de Roncevalles', 1 (11 September 1822), 193-99

'The Fatal Prayer', 1 (11 September 1822), 203-06

'The Sleep Walker; "Or, quick as thought."', 1 (18 September 1822), 211-13

Robert Macnish, 'The Camera Obscura. No. 3. From my Patch Book', 1 (9 October 1822), 225-30

Robert Macnish, 'The Camera Obscura. No. 4. The Orphan', 1 (16 October 1822), 241-44

Robert Macnish, 'The Camera Obscura. No. 4. – Continued. The Orphan', 1 (23 October

1822), 257-59

‘On the Language and Poetry of Scotland’, 1 (6 November 1822), 289-92

‘The Parricide; or, Retribution’, 1 (13 November 1822), 305-07

‘The Haunted House’, 1 (13 November 1822), 313-18

‘The Haunted House. Concluded’, 1 (20 November 1822), 328-33

‘On the Language and Poetry of Scotland. Concluded’, 1 (27 November 1822), 337-40

[signed Solomon Seekshadow], ‘To the Editor of the Melange’, 1 (27 November 1822), 345-48

‘Warehouse of Hits, or Intellect Ready Made’, 1 (18 December 1822), 397-99

‘Introductory Observations’, 2 (1 January 1823), 1-2

Robert Macnish, ‘Sketches of British Literature. No. I – Introduction’, 2 (1 January 1823), 2-6

‘The Effects of Vanity and Dissipation. To the Editor of the Literary Melange’, 2 (1 January 1823), 10-12

‘The Effects of Vanity and Dissipation. Concluded’, 2 (8 January 1823), 20-22

Robert Macnish, ‘Dramatic Sketch. An Angel of God, and a Spirit of the Just’, 2 (8 January 1823), 23-25

Robert Macnish, ‘Sketches of British Literature. No. II. The Era of Queen Anne’, 2 (15 January 1823), 33-37

Robert Macnish, ‘Sketches of British Literature. No. III. The Era of King Charles II’, 2 (29 January 1823), 65-70

London Medical Gazette: being a weekly journal of medicine and the collateral sciences

‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, 7 (20 November 1830), 246-49

McPhun’s Glasgow Magazine

‘Prefactory Remarks’, 1 (November 1824), 1-2

‘Literary Portraits. No. I. Dr Chalmers’, 1 (November 1824), 3-6

‘Phrenology. No. I’, 1 (November 1824), 11-14

‘Kitchener Out-Kitchened’, 1 (November 1824), 21-24

‘The Supper Table. No. I’, 1 (November 1824), 43-48

‘Our Success’, 1 (December 1824), 96

‘Poems by Delta’, 1 (January 1825), 105-10

‘Phrenology. No. II’, 1 (January 1825), 113-15

‘Passages from the Life of an Enthusiast’, 1 (February 1825), 158-62

‘Phrenology. No. III’, 1 (February 1825), 166-69

‘Words from behind the Curtain’, 1 (February 1825), 173-76

Metropolitan Magazine

‘Macnish’s *The Anatomy of Drunkenness*’, 3.10 (February 1832), 42-43

‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, 10.37 (May 1834), 14

Monthly Magazine, or, British Register

‘The Philosophy of Drunkenness’, 3.18 (June 1827), 601-14

Monthly Review

‘Macnish’s *The Philosophy of Sleep*’, 15.63 (November 1830), 359-68

Penny Magazine of the Society for the Diffusion of Useful Knowledge

‘Cure of Drunkenness’, 1.9 (May 1832), 80

‘Responsibility of Drunkards’, 1.12 (June 1832), 104

The Phrenological Journal and Miscellany

‘Introductory Statement’, 1 (1823-1824), iii-xxxi

George Combe, ‘Dialogue between a Philosopher of the Old School and a Phrenologist’, 1 (1823-1824), 65-72

‘The Enemies of Phrenology’, 1 (1823-1824), 80-86

‘Application of Phrenology to Criticism’, 1 (1823-1824), 92-116

‘On the Skulls of Three Murderers’, 1 (1823-1824), 116-19

‘Materialism and Scepticism’, 1 (1823-1824), 120-46

‘Transactions of the Phrenological Society’, 1 (1823-1824), 146-54

George Combe, ‘Dugald Stewart, Esq. on Milton’s Garden of Eden’, 1 (1823-1824), 195-200

George Combe, ‘Second Dialogue between a Philosopher of the Old School and a Phrenologist’, 1 (1823-1824), 200-17

‘Proceedings of the Phrenological Society’, 1 (1823-1824), 321-26

‘Remarks on the Cerebral Development and Disposition of John Thurtell’, 1 (1823-1824), 326-36

George Lyon, ‘Shakspeare’s Iago’, 1 (1823-1824), 402-22

Andrew Combe, ‘Report on the Cast of John Pallet, Executed at Colchester for the Murder of Mr James Mumford’, 1 (1823-1824), 425-36

‘St Ronan’s Well’, 1 (1823-1824), 442-54

James Simpson, ‘Phrenological Explanation of the Vocal Illusions Commonly Called Ventriloquism’, 1 (1823-1824), 466-86

‘Proceedings of the Phrenological Society’, 1 (1823-1824), 487-90

Rev. Robert Buchanon, ‘Othello’, 1 (1823-1824), 512-32

‘Redgauntlet’, 1 (1823-1824), 532-34

‘Dr Hibbert on the Philosophy of Apparitions’, 1 (1823-1824), 541-55

John Hamilton, ‘On the Accordance which Subsists between Phrenology and the Scripture Doctrines of Regeneration’, 1 (1823-1824), 555-70

‘Ambrosian Manuscript’, 1 (1823-1824), 571-78

‘Lord Byron’, 1 (1823-1824), 629-31

‘Phrenology Illustrated by Quotations from the Poets’, 1 (1823-1824), 636-41

‘Apparitions’, 2 (1824-1825), 111-13

‘On Materialism’, 2 (1824-1825), 147-51

- George Combe, 'Phrenology Applied to Criticism in the Fine Arts', 2 (1824-1825), 201-06
- James Simpson, 'Observations on Spectral Illusion, and other Illusive Perceptions of the Knowing Organs when in Morbid Excitement, Illustrated by a Recent Case', 2 (1824-1825), 290-307
- 'Welsh's *An Account of the Life and Writing of Thomas Brown*', 2 (1824-1825), 308-21
- 'On the Second Sight', 2 (1824-1825), 362-65
- 'On Hereditary Tendency to Crime', 2 (1824-1825), 465-67
- 'Ventriloquism – Juvenile Acting', 2 (1824-1825), 582-98
- Anderw Combe, 'On the Seat and Nature of Hypochondriasis as Illustrated by Phrenology', 3 (1825-1826), 51-76
- Andrew Combe, 'On the Talent for Recollecting Names', 3 (1825-1826), 120-25
- James Simpson, 'Some Observations on the Character of Cromwell, as Delineated in the Novel of Woodstock', 3 (1825-1826), 482-87
- 'Cruikshank's *Phrenological Illustrations*', 3 (1825-1826), 635-39
- George Combe, 'Letter from George Combe to Francis Jeffrey, Esq.', 4 (1826-1827), 1-82
- George Combe, 'Second Letter by George Combe to Francis Jeffrey, Esq., In Answer to his Note on Phrenology, in No 89 of the Edinburgh Review', 4 (1826-1827), 242-51
- John Alderson, 'Morbid Excitement of the Organ of Number', 4 (1826-1827), 558-59
- John Alderson, 'An Address to the Members of a Society for Phrenological Inquiry at Hull, on their first Meeting, April 5 1827', 4 (1826-1827), 566-73
- 'On Memory. – Functions of Upper and Lower Individuality', 4 (1826-1827), 581-90
- 'Case of Spectral Illusion', 5 (1828-1829), 210-13
- 'Additional Case of Spectral Illusion, with accompanying Pain in the Organs of Form, Size, Weight, Colouring, Order, Number, and Individuality', 5 (1828-1829), 319-20
- Henry Wight, 'Case of Partial Disease of the Brain, Accompanied with Partial Loss of Mental Power', 5 (1828-1829), 405-19
- 'Monomania', 5 (1828-1829), 419-22
- [John or Jacob Leslie Levison], 'Case of Spectral Illusion', 5 (1828-1829), 430-31

'Edinburgh Review and Phrenology', 5 (1828-1829), 460-64

Andrew Combe, 'Observations on Mental Derangement, and Some of its Causes', 5 (1828-1829), 483-516

William Scott, 'On Tragedy, with Some Remarks on the Character of Hamlet', 5 (1828-1829), 516-39

George Combe, 'Phrenological Observations on the Cerebral Development of William Burk, Executed for Murder at Edinburgh, on 28th January, 1829, and on the Development of William Hare, his Accomplice', 5 (1828-1829), 549-72

Andrew Combe, 'Exciting or Occasional Causes of Mental Derangement', 6 (1829-1830), 38-75, 259-77

Andrew Combe, 'Macnish's *The Philosophy of Sleep*', 6 (1829-1830), 576-82

Carl Otto, 'A Case of Sudden Propensity to Murder and Suicide', 6 (1829-1830), 611-12

James Simpson, 'Scott's *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft*', 7 (1831-1832), 1-14

Andrew Combe, 'Abercrombie's *Inquiries Concerning the Intellectual Powers, and the Investigation of Truth*', 7 (1831-1832), 46-63

'Combe's *Observations on Mental Derangement*', 7 (1831-1832), 67-78

'Proceedings of the Phrenological Society', 7 (1831-1832), 94-96

Forbes F. Favell, 'Case of Mental Derangement, Accompanied by Cerebral Disease', 7 (1831-1832), 103-05

Hewett Cottrell Watson, 'Case of Spectral Illusions', 7 (1831-1832), 162-65

'An Analysis of the Analysis of Dr Combe's "Observations on Mental Derangement," which appeared in the London Medical Gazette for January 16, 1831', 7 (1831-1832), 175-80

'Comparative Phrenology', 7 (1831-1832), 185-87

'Proceedings of the Phrenological Society', 7 (1831-1832), 187-88

'Transactions of the Glasgow Phrenological Society', 7 (1831-1832), 189-92

'Letter to the Conductors of the Periodical Press, on the Utility of Phrenology as a System of Moral Improvement', 7 (1831-1832), 193-97

Hewett Watson, 'Remarks on the Peculiarities of Memory', 7 (1831-1832), 212-24

Sir George Steuart Mackenzie, 'Correspondence between Sir G. S. Mackenzie, Bart. and the Late Dugald Stewart, Esq.', 7 (1831-1832), 303-09

'Dewhurst's *A Guide to Human and Comparative Phrenology; with Observations on the National Varieties of the Cranium*', 7 (1831-1832), 313-17

'Insanity of Sir Issac Newton', 7 (1831-1832), 335-43

'Drummond's *Letters to a Young Naturalist on the Study of Nature and Natural Theology*', 7 (1831-1832), 355-66

'Cases of Simultaneous Change of Character and Form of Head', 7 (1831-1832), 373-75

Andrew Combe, 'Cholera Morbus – Effects of Ignorance and Knowledge', 7 (1831-1832), 462-76

'On Superstition', 7 (1831-1832), 476-78

'On the Harmony between Philosophy and Religion', 7 (1831-1832), 481-93

'On Some of the Peculiarities of the Scottish Character – Donation of Old Skulls', 8 (1832-1834), 182-87

Robert Macnish, James Simpson, and Robert Cox, 'Natural Dispositions and Talents Inferred from a Cast of a Head; with Subsequent Correspondence Relative to Some Peculiarities', 8 (1832-1834), 206-31

'Notes, Chiefly Historical, on the Philosophy of Apparitions', 8 (1832-1834), 538-46

'Macnish's *The Philosophy of Sleep*', 8 (1832-1834), 560-66

George Combe, 'Observations on the Skull of Robert Burns', 8 (1832-1834), 657-62

'Chalmers's *On the Power, Wisdom, and Goodness of God, as Manifested in the Adaptation of External Nature to the Moral and Intellectual Constitution of Man*', 8 (1832-1834), 338-64

'A Modern Pythagorean's *The Book of Aphorisms*', 9 (1834-1836), 23-28

Robert Cox, 'An Essay on the Character and Cerebral Development of Robert Burns', 9 (1834-1836), 52-74

Andrew Carmichael and Robert Macnish, 'Proximate Cause of Sleep', 9 (1834-1836), 164-81

Andrew Combe, 'A Singular Dream', 9 (1834-1836), 278-80

Hewett Cottrell Watson, 'Browne's *Observations on Religious Fanaticism*', 9 (1834-1836), 289-302

James Foulis Duncan, 'Suggestions for Facilitating and Extending the Study of Mental Derangement, and Improving the Treatment of the Insane', 9 (1834-1836), 309-17

Andrew Carmichael, 'Mr. Carmichael's Examination of Mr Macnish's Objections to his Theory of Sleep, in the Phrenological Journal for December 1834', 9 (1834-1836), 318-28

Daniel Noble, 'An Essay on the Application of Phrenology to the Investigation of the Phenomena of Insanity', 9 (1834-1836), 447-59

'Dr Spurzheim and the Edinburgh Review', 9 (1834-1836), 526-31

Hewett Cottrell Watson, 'Browne's *Observations on Religious Fanaticism* (continued from p. 302)', 9 (1834-1836), 532-45

Hewett Cottrell Watson, 'Browne's *Observations on Religious Fanaticism* (continued from p. 545)', 9 (1834-1836), 577-603

Hewett Cottrell Watson, 'What is the Use of the Double Brain?', 9 (1834-1836), 608-11

'Macnish's *An Introduction to Phrenology*', 10 (1836-1837), 98-102

'Case of Spectral Illusions following an Injury Occasioned by a Blow on the Forehead', 10 (1836-1837), 217-18

'Phrenological Opinions of John Gibson Lockhart, Esq.', 10 (1836-1837), 428-35

'Macnish's *An Introduction to Phrenology*', 10 (1836-1837), 552-56

The Phrenological Journal and Magazine of Moral Science (being a continuation of The Phrenological Journal and Miscellany)

William Underwood Whitney, 'Case of Spectral Illusion', 11 (1838), 47

'Letter on the Double Consciousness During Sleep', 11 (1838), 75

[W. B. H.], 'Dreams', 11 (1838), 332

George Combe, 'Case of Divided Consciousness', 11 (1838), 404-07

George Combe, 'On the Size of Sir Walter Scott's Brain, and the Phrenological Development Indicated by his Bust', 12 (1839), 44-49

'Cast of Sir Walter Scott's Head', 13 (1840), 180-81

George Combe, 'On the Application of Phrenology to the Fine Arts', 17 (1844), 113-40, 225-46

E. J. Hytchie, 'On the Function and Nomenclature of the Organ called Wonder', 19 (1846), 14-28

Charles Brightly Prentice, 'On the Heads and Mental Qualities of Sir Walter Scott and Certain

Other Eminent Individuals, Particularly Novelists and Men of Science', 19 (1846), 218-22

The Quarterly Journal of Agriculture

James Hogg, 'On the Changes in the Habits, Amusements, and Condition of the Scottish Peasantry', 3 (1831-1832), 256-63

The Quarterly Review

Sir Walter Scott, 'Cromek's *Reliques of Robert Burns*', 1 (February 1809), 19-36

Thomas Young, 'Haslam, Arnold, &c. on *Insanity*', 2 (August 1809), 155-80

Sir Walter Scott, '[Maturin], *Fatal Revenge; or, the Family of Montorio*', 3 (May 1810), 339-47

Macvey Napier, 'Stewart's *Philosophical Essays*', 6 (August 1811), 1-37

William Stewart Rose, 'Ferriar on *Apparitions*', 9 (July 1813), 304-12

Thomas Young, 'Blackall on *Dropsies*', 9 (July 1813), 466-71

[Thomas Young], 'Dr. Young's *Introduction to Medical Literature*', 9 (March 1813), 117-25

Robert John Wilmot-Horton, 'Feinaigle's and Grey's *Artificial Memory*', 9 (March 1813), 125-39

William Rowe Lyall, 'Stewart's *Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind*', 12 (January 1815), 281-317

'Gall and Spurzheim's *Physiognomical System*', 13 (April 1815), 159-78

[David Uwins], '*Insanity and Madhouses* [by Bakewell, Hill Sharpe, Tuke]', 15 (July 1816), 387-418

John Wison, Croker, 'Hogg's *The Poetic Mirror*', 15 (July 1816), 468-75

George D'Oyly, 'Abernethy, Lawrence, Morgan, Rennell, on the *Theories of Life*', 22 (July 1819), 1-34

[David Uwins], 'Burrows – *Inquiries relative to Insanity*', 24 (October 1820), 169-95

[Robert Gooch], 'Reid – *On Nervous Affections*', 27 (April 1822), 110-23

[William Rowe Lyall], 'Stewart's *Second Dissertation*', 26 (January 1822), 474-514

Francis Cohen with William Gifford, '*Superstition and Knowledge*', 29 (July 1823), 440-75

John Philips Porter, 'Johnson – *Private Correspondence of Cowper*', 30 (October 1823), 185-99

'*Philosophical and Medical Education* [by Jardine, Thomson, Johnston, Thiersch, and Baungarten]', 36 (June 1827), 216-68

'*A Bill for Preventing the Unlawful Disinterment of Human Bodies, and for Regulating Schools of Anatomy*', 42 (January 1830), 1-18

'Burrows – *On Insanity*', 42 (March 1830), 350-77

Sir David Brewster, 'Abercrombie's *Inquiries Concerning the Intellectual Powers, and the Investigation of Truth*', 45 (July 1831), 341-58

'*Apparitions, Demonology, Witchcraft, and Natural Magic* [by Hibbert, Scott, and Brewster]', 48 (December 1832), 287-320

'Stevens – *On Blood*', 48 (October 1832), 375-91

'Halford's *Essays and Orations*', 49 (April 1833), 175-98

'Madden's *The Infirmities of Genius*', 50 (October 1833), 34-56

'Whewall's *Astronomy and General Physics Considered with Reference to Natural Theology*', 50 (January 1834), 1-3

***The Scottish Annual*, ed. by William Weir (Glasgow: Reid; Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd; London: Whittaker, 1836)**

'Maria Edgeworth', 1

'Letter from Miss Edgeworth to Sir Walter Scott', 2-8

[signed Andrew Picken], 'My Ain Countrie', 9-10

[signed William Weir], 'Confessions of a Novel Reader', 11-24

[Robert Macnish \[signed James Hogg\], 'A Psychological Curiosity', 25-33](#)

[signed John Galt], 'The Opening of the Sibylline Books', 34-36

[signed Felicien Abdon Wolski, A Polish Officer], 'The Kulig; or Sledge Party in Poland in 1830', 37-49

D. M. Moir [signed Delta], 'Specimens of Literal Translations from the Modern Prose Poets', 50-62

[signed A British Merchant, Resident in St. Petersburg], 'The Knout', 63-73

[signed Andrew Picken], 'The Lady – A Vision', 74-78

Robert Macnish, 'Autographology', 79-86

Robert Macnish [signed A Modern Pythagorean], 'To a very Young Lady', 87-89

'The Press-Gang', 90-96

[signed R. J. MacGeorge], 'The Pilgrimage of the Bird of Paradise', 97-101

'Sir Walter Scott', 102

[signed E. Pinkerton], 'Song', 103-04

[signed John Reid], 'The Stage-Coachman', 105-10

[signed W. S. Daniel], 'A Scene in Italy', 111-14

[signed A Rosicrucian], 'The Birth of Man', 115-18

[signed W. B. Scott], 'Ode.–To the Sickle', 119-24

'Tavern Haunters', 125-33

[signed W. A. C. Shand], 'To Walter Savage Landor, [Author of "Gebir," "Imaginary Conversations", Etc.]', 134-36

'William Godwin', 137-41

[signed E. Pinkerton], 'The Lovers', 142-45

[signed Muirierartach O'Sullivan], 'Father John, the Miracle-Worker', 146-57

[signed Alastor], 'To Egeria', 158-60

[signed William Motherwell], 'A Chapter from the Unpublished Romance of "The Strange and Delectable Story of the Lang-Bein Ritters, or the Doomed Nine."', 161-71

[signed Rev. W. Lindsay Alexander], 'A Parting Song', 172-73

'My Grand-Uncle's Bequest; or, the Fortunes of Andrew Ballingall', 174-96

[signed Iota], 'The Prophet of Granada', 197-202

'Robert Malthus', 203-05

[signed J. C. F.], 'Song of the Wood Spirits', 206-09

[signed Sir Thomas Dick Lauder], 'Extract from my Journal', 210-23

'Madame Vestris', 224

[signed W. S. Daniel], 'The Flight of Solitude and Silence', 225-32

'Robert Southey', 233-36

[signed Rev. Thomas Brydson], 'The Field of Langside', 237-39

[signed Henry Dircks], 'Wet Weather', 240-48

[signed Dugald Moore], 'The Chaunt of the Hindoo Widow at her Funeral Pile', 249-52

'Washington Irving', 253-57

Robert Macnish [signed A Modern Pythagorean], 'Maxims', 258-62

[signed J. C. F.], 'A Forest Scene', 263-67

'George Washington', 268-73

[signed An American], 'The St. George', 274-79

[signed Rev. Thomas Brydson], 'Four Sonnets', 280-82

'LaFayette', 283-85

Robert Macnish [signed John M'Diarmid], 'The Dalkeith Gander', 286-89

[signed W. S. Daniel], 'To Goëthe. (*Supposed to be written by a German*)', 290-91

'Thomas Chalmers', 292-96

[signed William Weir], 'The Tinker', 297-320

'Rammohun Roy', 321-24

[signed Dr. Bowring], 'August, 1835 – A Sonnet', 325

[signed Editor], 'Let Glasgow Flourish! Being Ane Farewell Benison by the Editor', 326-28

Tait's Edinburgh Magazine

'*The Scottish Annual*', 3 (January 1836), 69

Theatrical Inquisitor, and Monthly Mirror

‘Literary Review. The Pilgrims of the Sun. By Hogg’, 6 (February 1815), 130-38

The Westminster Review

‘Hogg’s *Confessions*’, 2.4 (October 1824), 560-66

***Winter’s Wreath for 1830, A Collection of Original Contributions in Prose and Verse*
(London: Whittaker, Treacher & Co.; Liverpool: George Smith)**

[Robert Macnish, ‘Canzonet’ \(1830\), 144](#)

[Robert Macnish, ‘The Loves of the Learned’ \(1830\), 165-73](#)