University of Glasgow

Drummond, Urvi (2015) *Music education in South African Schools after apartheid: teacher perceptions of Western and African Music.*
Ed.D thesis.

http://theses.gla.ac.uk/6298/

Music education in South African schools after apartheid: teacher perceptions of Western and African Music

Urvi Drummond

LTCL (London), GTCL (Hons)(London), PGCE (Sunderland) & M Ed (Wits)

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the
Degree of Doctor of Education (Ed D)

Under the supervision of Professor Penny Enslin and Dr Fiona Patrick

School of Education

College of Social Sciences

University of Glasgow

November 2014

Abstract

The South African classroom music curriculum has changed in the twenty years since the transition from apartheid to democracy in 1994. The broad imperative for the main music education policy shifts is a political agenda of social transformation and reconciliation. Policy aims are to include many more learners in the music classroom by promoting the study of diverse musics that were previously marginalised and by providing a framework for music education that allows learners to progress at their own pace. This research study investigated to what extent music teachers are able and likely to fulfil the requirements of the new, post-apartheid curriculum, with particular reference to the National Curriculum Statement music policies (NCS). Specifically, it considered whether teachers have a particular allegiance to Western and/or African music. Twelve South African music teachers were interviewed for this purpose.

The latest music curriculum revision in the form of the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS, 2011) has modified knowledge content by streaming music into three distinct but parallel genres. In addition to Western music, the curriculum incorporates Indigenous African music and Jazz as representative of the diverse cultural interests of South Africans. An analysis of post-apartheid music policy documents draws on post-colonial thought to frame the affirmation of African music by giving it a prominent place in the curriculum. In order to appreciate the role different musics are expected to play in the curriculum, the work of prominent ethnomusicologists provides a means to conceptualise the range of emerging musics, including World Music, Global Music and Cosmopolitan Music, and their differences.

For teachers to comply with the policy directive to teach different musics to diverse learners, they are required to expand their knowledge and adapt their teaching styles to achieve these aims. This study highlights a lack of resources and of structured teaching support through continuing professional development as well as a need for policy to give clearer direction in the way it instructs teachers to execute the changes demanded of them in the curriculum. An investigation of teachers' own musical education and their views of the new curriculum reveals that they are willing to teach a variety of musics. Their perceptions of the differences between Western and African music illustrate a reflective understanding of the challenges they face in this undertaking.

Contents

List of tables

Acknowledgements

I am most grateful to my husband David who has supported me throughout my doctoral endeavours. This dissertation would not have been possible without him.

The support of my supervisors, Professor Penny Enslin and Dr Fiona Patrick, is acknowledged with thanks. Penny Enslin first introduced me to the idea of doing a doctorate. Her exceptional qualities as a teacher have given me the confidence to complete both my Master's degree at the University of the Witwatersrand in South Africa and the doctoral degree at the University of Glasgow. Her honesty, patience, guidance and encouragement have sustained me through the more difficult moments of my doctoral journey. Dr Nicki Hedge kindly assisted me during the very early stages of my research for which I am most grateful. Dr Fiona Patrick's enthusiasm and intuitive understanding of my work has been an invaluable asset and her feedback has enriched our meetings and many Skype conversations over the years.

To Dawie Malan, librarian at the University of South Africa – I am immensely grateful to you for your substantial help in accessing newspaper and journal articles pertaining to my research interests.

To the 12 teachers in my research cohort – your willingness to participate and reflect deeply on the questions I posed to you in my interviews provided the richest material I could have hoped for. I would like to thank you most sincerely for all your input.

To my family members and friends – I thank you for your endless generosity in making time for listening, discussing and at times arguing most effectively your different points of view on my research. Your contributions challenged me to think in alternative ways and for this I am indebted to you.

My own piano students and their parents have shown a great deal of interest in my 'book'! They have happily tolerated the times when I could not teach them due to doctoral commitments and have been a constant source of inspiration in this major undertaking. Their support and understanding has undoubtedly contributed to my passion and sustained enthusiasm for this project.

Urvi Drummond, Johannesburg, South Africa, November 2014

Author's declaration

I declare that, except where explicit reference is made to the contribution of others, this dissertation is the result of my own work and has not been submitted for any other degree at the University of Glasgow or any other institution.

Signature:

Printed name: Urvi Drummond

Abbreviations

ABRSM	Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music
BA Ed	Bachelor of Art, Education
BA Mus	Bachelor of Art, Music
B Mus	Bachelor of Music
B Mus PA	Bachelor of Music, Performing Arts
C2005	Curriculum 2005
CAPS	The Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (2011)
GCE	General Certificate of Education
DoE	Department of Education
Ed D	Doctor of Education
FAK	FAK *sangbundel* (Afrikaans song book)
FET	Further Education and Training
GTCL	Graduate Trinity College London
IAM	Indigenous African Music
IKS	Indigenous Knowledge Systems
LSM	Learning Support Materials
LTCL	Licentiate Trinity College London
NCS	National Curriculum Statement
NEA	National Eisteddfod Academy
NQF	National Qualifications Framework
OBE	Outcomes-Based Education
OBET	Outcomes-Based Education and Training
PATS	Performance Assessment Tasks
PDI	Previously Disadvantaged Individuals

PGCE	Postgraduate Certificate in Education
RNCS	Revised National Curriculum Statement
SACE	South African Council for Education
SAQA	South African Qualifications Authority
UCT	University of Cape Town
UP	University of Pretoria
UNISA	University of South Africa
WAM	Western Art Music
WITS	University of Witwatersrand

Chapter One

Introduction

Reflections of a diasporic music teacher

The interests that led to this study of 12 South African music teachers' perceptions of Western and African music in the South African classroom were stimulated by my childhood and early adult experiences and my negotiation of two quite different cultural identities in the form of classical Western music and Sri Lankan dancing. More recently, the motivation to understand teacher perceptions of Western and African Music in South African schools was instigated by my move to Johannesburg in 2004 and the many informal discussions I had with music teaching colleagues about the range of types of music they were now being required to teach in the school environment. I observed that the post-apartheid mood in education at this time was a mixture of different imperatives: hope for the future, enthusiasm for change as well as policy fatigue and perplexity about what teachers thought was expected of them in the climate of significant curriculum changes. I understood their mélange of feelings and the disorder and disruption caused by the national policy move to incorporate diverse musics in a bid to assimilate a range of learners in the classroom. Their state of flux in part reflected my own jumbled reactions to the way I had been taught music in a childhood that was marked by varied life experiences that could best be described as a diasporic adventure. In common, we shared the desire for understanding the different conditions we found ourselves in.

I was excited to engage with the moral impetus for transformation that signalled the transition between the injustices of the past and the developments of the future within the unique social setting of South Africa. My story situates my

research interest within the context of my life as a music student and teacher in this study.

I am a music teacher with a strong background in Western music and training as a classical pianist. I come from Sri Lanka and have some familiarity with Asian music – particularly Kandyan Dance in which I was trained during my childhood. My family background was both Asian and British with attendant colonial influences. I would describe myself as having a strong professional music affiliation and loyalty to Western music, to its notation and to its traditional methods of music training. I come from a music conservatoire background and studied in a variety of Western music conservatoires and schools from the age of four until the age of 22. My English undergraduate music degree comes from a very old, influential and traditional music college. My working life is occupied with teaching the piano and classroom music to children and adults at both school and university.

My early adult life was spent teaching music as well as experimenting with a number of other non-music related professions in London. I got married in my late 20's and began a new expatriate life that took my husband and me to France, Bahrain, Dubai and South Africa. During this time I got back to teaching music fulltime in quite different contexts. In my late 30's I undertook a Postgraduate Certificate in Education (PGCE) from an external campus of the University of Sunderland, UK, in Dubai. After we moved to South Africa, I embarked on my Master's Degree (M Ed) at the University of the Witwatersrand (WITS) and then enrolled on the Doctorate in Education programme (Ed D) at the University of Glasgow, UK.

I came to South Africa in 2004 and commenced my Master of Education studies which led to teaching opportunities on an undergraduate teaching programme that included classroom music for trainee-teachers. My teaching experiences and my

postgraduate student experiences were characterised by discussions about major changes in education policy in South Africa that accompanied and followed the country's transition to democracy in 1994. The curriculum documents being reflected on were: Curriculum 2005 published in 1997 (C2005), the Manifesto on Values, Education and Democracy (special school supplement) published in 2001 and the Revised National Curriculum Statement published in 2002 to which I will return later in this chapter. Many of my preconceptions were challenged. Principally challenged was my loyalty to traditional Western theory of music teaching. This made me think deeply about my own training and musical identity.

The Master's programme was a watershed moment for me. It is at this point that my loyalty to the way I was trained in music was challenged and my professional mindset slowly transformed. It was no longer sufficient for me to frame understandings exclusively in terms of Western music history, theory, counterpoint, piano repertoire and traditional aural training[1]. The curriculum studies I was engaged in were lively and thought-provoking because of the political climate of reconciliation and transformation in post-apartheid South Africa. I began to consider alternative views about music training and education which included accepting the importance of indigenous music in the trainee-teachers' curriculum. My Master's research was about fast-tracking trainee-teachers to become competent classroom music teachers without a long history of specialist knowledge. This topic led me to explore issues of diversity and inclusion within the context of the keyboard curriculum I had designed and was teaching to my fast-trackers. My interest developed further during the doctoral programme in education at Glasgow University, UK, which allowed me to further explore alternative ways of thinking about music education.

---

[1] Aural training concerns the training of the ear with exercises set to develop listening skills to a very high level.

As a child, I never questioned the different cultural domains that came my way. My father was a member of the diplomatic corps and my brother and I were expected by my parents to 'carry the national flag'. This rendered the need to speak and write Singhalese, to eat and learn to cook and appreciate Sri Lankan food, to become proficient in Sri Lankan culture and to be a practicing Buddhist with a strong knowledge of the many cultural customs and rituals that publicly defined who we were as a Sri Lankan family. Further, it was also expected by the wider diplomatic community that we lived in to adopt some of the habits of the host countries we were in and to show genuine interest in their politics, traditions and customs. It was normal for us to spend an average of three years in different countries and as a family we became adept at quickly assimilating different lifestyles. Underpinning my childhood was a static modus operandi of extracurricular activities. I went for piano lessons, expanding a Western classical repertoire of piano music and I was given instruction on traditional Sri Lankan (Kandyan) dancing[2].

My early music education was shaped by the postings allocated to my father. Although of Sri Lankan nationality, I was born in Bombay (now Mumbai, India) in 1962. The first 13 years of my life were spent in Moscow (ex- USSR), Bonn (former West Germany), Kobe (Japan), Rome (Italy) and London (United Kingdom). My paternal grandmother was of mixed race – Dutch and Singhalese – and she was a well-known piano and music teacher who started the first Kindermusik School in Colombo (Sri Lanka). She helped me to overcome some of the difficulties I encountered in the learning of the rudiments of Western theory of music in a number of different languages – Russian, German, Japanese and Italian. I have vivid memories of her sending me blue aerogramme letters explaining basic concepts such as key signatures and chord structures[3]. I also remember how we spent many

---

[2] Kandyan dance originated in the central hills of Kandy, Sri Lanka. It is usually performed to the accompaniment of Kandyan drums and small cymbals in a ceremonial setting. Dancers are dressed in colourful and elaborate costumes with metal ornaments on their head, neck, arms and ankles.
[3] A key signature is an essential part of music notation that places a piece of music into the appropriate scale it represents. Chords are made up of a series of notes often played simultaneously.

hours listening to recordings of music by Bach, Beethoven and Schubert, three of her favourite composers, whenever I visited her. In my early teens, we were posted to London and being a fluent English speaker, it was a big relief for me not to have to negotiate yet another foreign language.

Unlike Kok (2011), who felt that in preparing for Western classical music examinations she 'participated willing if unwittingly in an ideological process that ultimately reinforced the colonizers' cultural subjugation of the colonized' (Kok, 2011: 83), I felt naturally drawn to a repertoire of Western classical music. I was comfortable studying in the famous music conservatoires of Moscow, Rome and London. It is perhaps the stimulation provided by my piano teachers and the privileged experiences of going to performances of the Bolshoi Ballet in Moscow, opera at La Scala in Milan and Covent Garden in London, all underpinned by family support of my musical studies, that I did not feel the oppression articulated by Kok's personal story of 'colonial violence' (2011: 83).

That said, I remember my father's concern that I listened to and sang with enthusiasm in Bach's Masses. For him, my yearning for sacred Western choral music corresponded to a rejection of my Asian heritage and my Buddhist upbringing. This was not so. I enjoyed my Kandyan dancing and I also enjoyed taking part in Western classical music concerts. I had a mostly contented dual vista of East and West although there were times when I was comfortable with neither. I particularly recall grappling with deconstructing some Western twentieth century music. I especially remember the agony of trying to analyse the strange atonal passages of Bartok's Sixth String Quartet as an Advanced-level (A-level) student[4]. A similar moment of distancing occurred when I could not totally throw myself into the spirit of the Butterfly Dance as a result of being awkward and embarrassed by the thick stage make-up and heavy ceremonial Kandyan costume I was obliged to wear.

---

4 General Certificate of Education (GCE) Advanced Level, more commonly known as A-level examinations are taken by students in their last year of school in the United Kingdom.

Despite these anomalies, I passed the first piano examination I ever attempted at Grade 8 level[5] from the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) based at the Junior College of the Royal College of Music in London where I spent seven years from the age of 13 to 18 furthering my Western knowledge and pianistic skills. The training was rigorous and my chaotic and somewhat disorganised background in music did not entirely prepare me for the strict discipline of formal music education which I had not experienced before. Until this point, the teachers who taught me concentrated on developing my practical skills as the language barriers prevented development in other areas. I was pleased to be accepted into The Trinity College of Music in London as an undergraduate and to be given the opportunity to formalise my music education so that I could acquire a more standard and normal collective identity of music student and music professional.

Thus I attribute my research interest in diversity in music teaching and learning to an itinerant upbringing that has drawn me in adult life to investigating aspects of a society striving to come to terms with change. The interviews with twelve music teachers that constitute this study presented me with the ideal opportunity to explore the transition from a traditional curriculum to a post-apartheid contemporary curriculum through exploring their perceptions of Western and African music in the South African classroom. Their efforts to come to terms with a new curriculum represented to me an opportunity to investigate the perceptions of teachers involved in overcoming the historical divisions of the national community by addressing the conflicts of the past in a conciliatory post-injustice era.

---

5 External music examinations are normally graded from 1-8 with awards given in categories of pass, merit and distinction according to the marks awarded. Grade 8 distinction for a student's principal practical study is the minimum requirement for students hoping to gain entrance into Music College as undergraduates.

Origins of the study

I found myself immersed in an academic environment of intense debate and discussion at WITS University about the curriculum shift towards outcomes-based education (OBE) required by policy changes after apartheid. My loyalty to Western music was being questioned by colleagues and lecturers. The idea of considering alternative systems of education was new to me. I was intrigued by the idea that everyone could do music and my Master's research strongly encouraged this notion. I wanted to learn more about what it meant to be inclusive and to diversify within a music teaching context. However, my training in Western theory and Western music was still heavily ingrained in me. Policy language signalled a change from a didactic pedagogic stance to a more democratic manner of teaching. Teachers in democratic South Africa are now often referred to as 'facilitators' and pupils most commonly as 'learners'. At a local level, music education was being shaped by the interests of fairness of assessment and diversity of curriculum content in a bid to widen access to the subject. At an international level, these aims were being tempered with teaching and learning goals that accorded with international benchmarks of 'good' music education.

Whilst I had sympathy for the idea of open access in music I did not really understand what this entailed or how it could be achieved outside the Western concept of music teaching in South African schools. I began to inquire into certain things that were troubling me. Principally, there was, for me, a tension between attempts to rebalance a curriculum that was biased toward the learning of Western music and my ingrained experience of being taught music in the traditional Western way. Contained in that tension was the underlying question if teachers, who like me were Western-trained, would be prepared to accept the emergence of more open and responsive systems of teaching and learning arising out of policy resistance to elite and insular music making practices. I wondered how the policy changes would be enacted. Would they result in a dominantly Western perspective of music

teaching being enforced on South African students or would teachers accommodate Indigenous Knowledge Systems (IKS) now being promoted in post-apartheid education policy and its new curricula?

These thoughts led me to study South Africa's music curriculum in the form of the various documents that inform the National Curriculum Statement. It should be noted that the preamble to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS), Creative Arts, Final Draft (CAPS, 2010: 3) emphasises ideas of access, social transformation, critical learning, achievable standards, diversity and IKS. These ideas are repeated and reinforced in most of the South African education policy documents. The promotion of IKS caught my attention as it appeared to directly address my preoccupation with the challenge of achieving a balance between Western and African music training.

Fullan (1998) explains that systems improvement requires a shared vision of what constitutes educational and curriculum reform (Fullan, 1998: 3-4). It seems to me that there exists a lack of a collective outlook, particularly amongst South African music teachers, music teacher-training institutions and the Departments of Education with relation to reform initiatives taking place in the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement for Music, (CAPS, 2011). One way to create Fullan's 'shared understanding and commitment' (Fullan, 1998: 1) would be for music teacher training and in-service developmental projects to work towards a joint understanding of CAPS policy aims in order to understand what needs to be done to successfully implement them in the classroom.

My concerns are posed against the background of radical restructuring of teacher education since 1994. Most significantly, previously segregated colleges of education were incorporated into an integrated non-racial national structure and in 2005 a number of schools of education in universities were merged with colleges of education (Kruss, 2008: 169-172). A major restructuring of teacher education

programmes took place in response to new curriculum models including the move to OBE (2008: 115). Teacher registration was one of the structures put in place by institutions such as the South African Council for Educators (SACE) and the South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA). Arrangements for the initial preparation of music teachers and their ongoing professional development in South Africa are varied and still in the process of development. There is little in terms of regular and systematic provision for in-service teacher development in music in South Africa. Instead, in-service programmes have tended to prioritise key subjects like English and Mathematics and music remains a neglected area.

The initial teacher education curriculum tends to reflect both Western and African music, with the inclusion of diverse repertoire and alternative notation, although the emphasis remains on Western music. Students in initial teacher education are given some music instruction in content and pedagogy in modules referred to by the University of the Witwatersrand (WITS) in Johannesburg as 'Music in Education'. At WITS, instruction is basic and aimed at teachers with limited or no knowledge of music. The design of the music module is grounded on OBE with an emphasis on the lived experience of music. Teachers are told to frame music education in value-driven terms expressed by South African constitutional values and reinforced by CAPS (2011).

Having taught on the WITS Music in Education programme I have witnessed first-hand how the student-teachers are greatly influenced by this perspective in their lesson planning and teaching practice. My own experience is that extending music teaching to encompass experimental techniques with an emphasis on creativity and exploration has at times compromised the acquisition of useful discipline knowledge that is essential for their expertise as teachers of music. The consequences for trainee music teachers new to the discipline of music is that there is a danger that they act only on what they know rather than learning new approaches. The teaching methodologies at WITS are Western-based and students are trained in the

methods of Kodaly, Dalcrose and Orff – three well-known Western music pedagogies that developed in the first half of the 20th century. In teacher education programmes in South African teaching methodology tends to be similarly framed by a Western point of view. Teacher education institutions align their curricula with the teaching requirements stated in CAPS. But It has been observed that the National Curriculum Statement is 'differentially delivered because of the long-lived differences that are the inheritance of Apartheid' (Johnson *et al.*, 2010:183). The questions I posed earlier on in this section led me to study South Africa's music curriculum.

Selecting a cohort of music teachers to discuss the new curriculum and to assess its strategy to include the teaching of non-Western musics thus required an appreciation of the ways in which issues of 'race' continue to affect South African society. This study needed to reflect different voices from a variety of ethnic backgrounds. I therefore invited teachers from the four racial categories to take part in this study. Participant selection is explained in greater detail in Chapter Four. By taking into account the matter of race I have taken the view that education in South Africa is highly politicised and has had to contend with the inheritance of Bantu Education[6] that formalised unequal education. Educational segregation and inequality eventually led to schooling becoming a key site in resistance to apartheid.

The Soweto Uprising of 1976 was a significant related cause to contentious educational issues during apartheid where a series of country wide protests initiated on the 16th of June 1976 by over 15,000 high school children against a ruling that half of the curriculum in black schools was to be taught in Afrikaans[7]

---

[6] The Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953 was put in place to ensure inferior black education that marginalised and segregated black South African citizens. The Coloured Person's Education Act No. 47 of 1963 also separated coloured students from white students who enjoyed free education with highly trained teachers in schools with good resources.
[7] Afrikaans is a Germanic language descended from Dutch dialects and spoken by the minority Afrikaans group of white South African citizens.

(Worden, 1998: 148). It is the dismantling of the unjust and inferior education imposed on the majority of South African citizens that continues to be of primary importance in the NCS. The main tool used for this purpose was intended to be Outcomes-Based Education:

> In 1997 we introduced outcomes-based education to overcome the curricular divisions of the past, but the experience of implementation prompted a review in 2000. This led to the first curriculum revision: the Revised National Curriculum Statement (2002) and the National Curriculum Statement Grades 10-12 to produce this document (Motshekga, Minister of Education, Foreword, National Curriculum Statement/Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement, 2011).

OBE[8] reiterated the broad values framework for thinking about democratic education after apartheid. The values expressed in the curriculum are non-racism, non-sexism, democracy and equality and redress:

> The National Curriculum Statement Grades R-12 serves the purposes of: Equipping learners, irrespective of their socio-economic background, race, gender, physical ability or intellectual ability, with the knowledge, skills and values necessary for self-fulfilment, and meaningful participation in society as citizens of a free country (CAPS, 2011: 4).

In music, the shift away from Western music practices was underlined by the 'valuing of indigenous knowledge systems: acknowledging the rich history and heritage of this country as important contributors to nurturing the values contained in the Constitution' (CAPS, 2011: 5). The renewed move towards IKS represented OBE tenets that were initially put in place in the early 1990's as a way of dismantling the framework of apartheid education. The impetus to achieve a

---

[8] Readers should note that a critique of OBE has been evaluated in Chapter Three of this dissertation where the merits and shortcomings of OBE are posed in a debate by well-known South African academics.

balance between African and Western music is very much part of an equalitarian project of achieving social transformation within South African music classrooms.

Before continuing the discussion about South African music policy and in order to locate this dissertation in a wider context beyond South Africa it is important to note the role of education in post-conflict countries. The relationship between education and political aims to promote social cohesion is apparent in settings outside South Africa. The reasons for this developing trend are various: celebrating diversity, protecting local non-Western cultural heritage, responding to the demands of the knowledge-economy, adapting to new technology and emerging musics. As Shah (2014:4) notes, 'education has multiple faces and dynamics in relation to conflict and reconstruction, and does not exist devoid of the broader (political, economic and religious) structures and institutions within society'.

Shah's observation comes from the post-conflict and post-disaster era in Aceh, Indonesia where the region is trying to recover from both 'a separatist struggle against the Indonesian government' (Shah, 2014:2) and 'a series of natural disasters' (2014:8). It is evident that education and curriculum innovations are utilised in post-conflict societies and that this strategy has become crucial to the provision of mass education and the fostering of social cohesion.

Other examples of educational change in post-conflict or post-colonial societies resonate with South African policy statements about a holistic approach to education that is intended to empower all citizens, in particular those who have been adversely affected by a prejudicial distribution of entitlements and opportunities. Whilst some similarities can be observed in this account, readers should note that due to the particular feature of apartheid that was in place for 46 years, together with a history of the country being colonised before that, its

historical status can be described as unique. Therefore, shared tendencies in curriculum reform should not obscure the exceptionality of the South African circumstance.

New Zealand for example has experienced a 'profound change' with '...new demands from Pacific, Asian and (white) South African migrants who want their cultures and language recognised in New Zealand education and society' (Thwaites, 2008: 3). The Arts in the New Zealand Curriculum document (2000) presented a case for students to engage with traditional arts forms with particular reference to the toi Maori, and a parallel document was developed alongside it written in Maori for schools teaching in the Maori language (Thwaites, 2006: 4). Research in providing a foundation for Pasifika students described as 'people who have migrated from the Pacific and live in New Zealand' (Fa'aea-Semeatu, 2011:1), endorse the New Zealand curriculum strategy to provide opportunities for a holistic teaching and learning framework with personalised learning programmes and mentoring opportunities (2011: 2). It will be shown later in Chapter 3 how CAPS incorporates some of these elements.

Australian policy recognises the negative impact of colonisation in the eighteenth century with its attendant missionary-led education for Murri people[9] who were 'educated in the sense understood by the dominant culture' (Woods, 1998: 54). Australian education and training policy aims to 'recompense and rectify' (1998: 59) including the quest to reinstate the importance of spiritual awareness in music. Australian researchers also highlight the imperative for educators '...to understand culture as an aspect of negotiated social practice rather than a fixed entity' (Keddie *et al.*, 2013: 94).

---

[9] The Murri community are part of the Aboriginal people from the Queensland area of Australia.

With respect to South Africa, the broad imperative for the main policy shifts in education was driven by a political agenda of social transformation and reconciliation and music education is thus being shaped more by values rather than content. The policy expressed specific aims: the massification of music education through the inclusion of many more learners in the music classroom; promoting the study of diverse musics that were previously marginalised; removing 'artificial barriers' to learning and providing a framework for music education that allowed learners to progress at their own pace and placing an emphasis on the group over the individual.   The broad trend in music education since the 1990's was to incorporate a variety of musics and genres into the curriculum. For the purposes of this dissertation, the word 'musics' refers to different types of music such as 'world music' and 'fusion music' for instance that can be identified within a certain genre – in this instance the genre of 'contemporary music'. The term 'genre' is used as an umbrella term under which different musics appear. For example, Western and African music represent two genres under which could appear various musics such as Baroque music within the genre of Western music and tribal music within the genre of African music. The key aim of music education in post-apartheid South Africa is to accommodate and value other genres and musics. To this end the latest version of the curriculum in the form of CAPS addresses this in a particular manner by identifying three genres of music as representative of the diverse cultural interests of South Africans.

As a music educator in South Africa, I became interested to find an underlying conceptual theory that would enable me to further clarify issues and problems that were emerging from my initial readings of post-apartheid music policy documents. Reading about post-colonial theory from the perspective of Edward Said encouraged me to reflect on the idea that post-colonial assumptions have, even indirectly and implicitly, influenced post-apartheid curriculum design. The growth of post-colonial studies was strongly influenced by the work of Edward Said (1978) and I think it helps to explain some of the intellectual currents that have driven the tides of change in South African music education since 1994. Whilst I am not proposing that

post-colonial theory and post-apartheid music education are directly connected I do see links between post-colonial thought and a curriculum that is seeking to affirm African music by demarginalising it and giving it a prominent place in the curriculum. The promotion of African and other music is engineered through the explicit mention of a large variety of non-Western options in music policy. I attribute this divergence from the previous dominance of mainly Western music practices to recognition of the relevance of the philosophical notion of 'Othering'. This term was initiated in post-colonial studies and explained by Said as an unequal act of drawing attention to perceived weaknesses of marginalised groups and perceived strengths of dominant groups that ruled over their empires. Readers should note that Said uses the term 'Othering' in relation to Imperialism and the conquests of the West over the Orient.

Othering in the context of South African history is a useful concept to describe how the white minority's subjugation of the black majority included denigrating their culture and traditions by Othering them. To reverse this history, the most recent and significant change for my purposes can be seen in the current state of play where diverse sets of music have been streamed into three genres identified as Western Art Music (WAM), Indigenous African Music (IAM) and Jazz. IAM is an expression of IKS and the phenomenon of IKS is an important one in the context of emancipating South African music education from what is generally thought to be the dominant influences of Western music. It is hoped that by expanding the boundaries of traditional Western-based music education, music would become more accessible to students in schools. The inclusion of many different types of non-European music can be interpreted specifically as a move towards reconciliation and transformation through the parallel teaching and learning of three genres of music. The main observation I have made in noting Said's work around the changes that have occurred in music is the policy impetus to reconstruct knowledge, overcoming a past in which different cultural practices were seen as Other, in pursuit of an increasing awareness and appreciation of IKS, and by extension IAM, with the emphasis on Western music becoming less dominant.

The consistent reference to Western music notation in CAPS can be interpreted as an example of a standard that has been imposed on non-Western music students and as such may be regarded by some people as an example of ethnocentricity. Ethnocentricity in this respect can be linked to the debate about what 'good' music education might be in this country. Is it the ability to appreciate different musics? Is it the ability to specialise in one particular genre of music and acquire high-level technical practical skills in one instrument? Is it the acquisition of a wide knowledge base that encourages life-long learning of music as an amateur? Is it a global approach to music education that seeks to create a unified and integrated system that addresses social inequality but at the same time adheres to earlier models of competency? Answers to these questions might help to understand why African music is being promoted in South African schools and why Western music practices are being taught at the same time. Teachers interviewed for this study provide their understanding of these issues in Chapters Five and Six and my findings to these questions are presented in Chapter Seven. One thing is certain: by exploring and experiencing different types of music, the policy intention is for learners to be given the chance to appreciate many genres of music. The explicitly stated intention behind the policy aims is to accommodate transformation which is specific to the South African context.

The accommodation of a transformative music education programme in South Africa can be further explained by an ethnomusicological perspective. Ethnomusicology research was inspired by the post-colonial outlook. It progressed from capturing and recording data in the anthropological sense to understanding the music practices of others within the context of the communities that were being studied. Thus avoiding the danger of Otherism where well-meaning researchers were describing the 'exotic' customs of the 'savages', to borrow terms used in the work of Said. Key to his critique of *Orientalism* (Said, 1978) was the explanation that uninformed assumptions about other cultures were interpreted through ill-informed eyes which he interpreted as an expression of the power of the coloniser over the colonised. The work of the ethnomusicologist Blacking (1973) preceded the writings of Said but

it can be situated as part of a global move for theorists and researchers to acknowledge the richness and complexities of African music. Ethnomusicologists have developed their techniques to allow them to observe the relationship between music and society and promoted a deeper and more meaningful understanding of Other music. In this spirit music education policy in South Africa now sets out to accommodate both African and Western music in contemporary school curricula. However, this amalgam raises the possibility for conflicts over facts and values, means and ends in policy decisions that could cause uncertainty with policy actors.

Research questions

The central question I wanted to investigate was:

To what extent are music teachers able and likely to fulfil the requirements of the new, post-apartheid curriculum, with particular reference to the National Curriculum Statement (NCS)?
This central research question was further refined into a set of more specific research questions which guided the design of the interviews:

1   How has the participants' own musical education contributed to their views on the goals, aims and purposes of the new curriculum?
2   a) Given their own musical education, how do they perceive the requirement to accommodate and value African as well as Western music?
    b) Do they have a particular allegiance to African or Western music?
3   What are their views on what is 'good' musical knowledge?
4   Do they see music and music education as a vehicle for social transformation?

In order to address the above questions my study comprised a set of 24 interviews with 12 South African music teachers, most practicing in the Johannesburg area. In Chapter Two I interpret post-apartheid music education by examining the changing

purposes of music both in a global and South African context. I also present the view that the distinction between presentational music and participatory music (Turino, 2008) can be used to understand the differences between etiquettes of performance and participation in school music.

Outline of chapters

In Chapter One, I have described the impetus for my dissertation topic and explained the background to its evolution, including influences on my own understandings of music.

Chapter Two will further conceptualise the study by giving an account of post-colonial theory and its challenge to the dominance of Western assumptions about culture and, in this instance, music. Key concepts drawn from post-colonial theory and ethnomusicology frame a discussion about policy expectations and the wider imperatives of social transformation through the study of music. This provides a framework to explore debates on how our understandings of music and music education have changed and of how a national music curriculum might accommodate a new perspective on music in a global as well as South African context.

Chapter Three provides a detailed analysis of school education policy, which begins with a general narrative of the different music policies between 1992 and the present day. It includes a discussion of the transition from apartheid to democracy in 1994 and the shift in education policy with particular reference to the music curriculum. A detailed examination of CAPS (2011) interrogates the nature of the changes proposed in this document.

Chapter Four provides a comprehensive account and explanation of the methodology used to collect and analyse the data drawn from 24 interviews with the research cohort of 12 teachers.

Chapter Five explores the teachers' personal journeys and how this has influenced their perceptions about the shift from traditional to contemporary music teaching and learning, in particular conveying and analysing their views on African and Western music. Research questions 1, 2a) and 2b) are addressed.

Chapter Six analyses how teachers perceive the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS, 2011) and the way it impacts on their professional lives. Research questions 3 and 4 are addressed.

Chapter Seven focuses on key points that have arisen in the research study, commenting on recent curriculum developmental moves in music education. It answers four questions that were posed in the opening chapter about what might be regarded as 'good' music education. The concluding chapter remarks on how this investigation has wider implications for professional practice and illustrates the influence it has had on my status as a music teacher and researcher.

Chapter Two
Changing perceptions of music and its purposes:
Global and South African

Interpreting post-apartheid music education

There has been a major shift in the understandings of music that have influenced music education policy since 1994. These shifts can be located alongside a post-apartheid political agenda and in the wider context of post-colonial thought. Although assumptions about Western music and its supposed superiority dominated former global and South African music curricula, in an era of decolonization and post-colonial thinking, these assumptions have been reconsidered and the purpose and value of other musics given increased prominence. It could therefore be said that attempts have been made to understand other musics in a post-colonial spirit. In this chapter I chart the different musics mentioned in post-apartheid music curricula with specific reference to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS, 2011) in order to identify them, define them and to understand their inclusion in current policy via an understanding of cultural imperialism, a prominent conceptual strand in post-colonial theory. As part of this exploration my link to ethnomusicology lays the foundation for a discussion about the purpose of music (see below) which I believe, in South Africa, has changed from a predominantly Western perspective of music training to reflect a contextually-based African perspective of music appreciation for the purposes of social transformation.

As mentioned in Chapter One, Edward Said's *Orientalism,* published in 1978, was a key text in the development of post-colonial discourse. Although is not my intention to offer a full account of his thesis I use an aspect of his work, imperialism, to

recognise assumptions underlying post-apartheid music education policy and curricula. Through elements like Said's systematic study of the relation between imperialism and culture, post-colonialism has broadened perceptions of the central role of culture from an imperial experience to one that is cast in contemporary times and subsumed in a global experience. Said uses the term 'imperialism' to mean '…the practice, the theory and the attitudes of a dominating metropolitan centre ruling a distant territory…' (Said, 1994: 8). Colonialism, a consequence of imperialism, is the implanting of settlements on distant territories (Said, 1994: 8). I propose that an imperial experience of music is one that is founded on Western practices and was present in assumptions prevalent in South African music curricula pre-1994. By contrast, my interpretation of a post-colonial encounter stems from global and/or local understandings of a variety of musics that originate from any country, is of any type, and embraces contemporary genres such as world music and cosmopolitan music.

Recognising South Africa's colonial and imperialist structures, with its complex relations of power and knowledge, alongside the dissolution of apartheid and the emergence of democracy in the early 1990's gives rise to the possibility of applying post-colonial ideas to the construction of a post-apartheid era school music curriculum. In common with post-colonial thought, the term post-apartheid suggests a move away from assumptions and policies that legitimised the hegemony of a dominant minority over a subjugated majority. Within this understanding lies a powerful imperative for the transformation of education in this country. Key themes of the transformative process are concerned with how to bring about justice and reconciliation in South Africa after the end of apartheid, officially marked by the democratic election of 27 April 1994, creating for the first time a political system of equality for all her citizens. These themes are present in contemporary music curriculum documents.

The rethinking of music curricula in post-1994 curriculum development is intended to give equal attention to Western and African music practices, through the introduction of Indigenous Knowledge Systems (IKS) into the national syllabus. The breaking down of barriers between cultures is an essential part of curriculum transformation and the reclamation of traditional cultural practices, via the study of indigenous music, is an important element of this process. The revival of traditional musical movements can be framed by the post-colonial critique of European Orientalism which was based on the marginalisation and degradation of exotic cultures. Seen through a post-colonial lens these ethnic cultures ought to be given their proper place.

Seen through a post-apartheid lens the impetus to increase the prominence of African music is also understandable given the historical context of apartheid (1948-1994) where a divided and unequal system of education was maintained. South Africa had nineteen different educational departments separated by race, geography and ideology and children were educated in a way that positioned them in social, economic and political life (Rakometsi, 2008: 360). The curriculum played a powerful role in reinforcing inequality (RNCS, 2001: 10). Curriculum development since the early 1990's aimed to address these injustices and policy is now intended to prepare all school children to live in a democratic society. The revised aims of education set out to address a complex history and to make bold moves to achieve reconciliation.

A principal assumption of this strategy is that education reform can be employed as a tool for social justice. In keeping with the notion of creating a more equitable society for all of its citizens, South African music education has employed the use of diverse and different musics as a way of achieving reconciliation in two ways: firstly, policy makers are keen to 'give learners access to opportunities of music expression and communication through the creation and performance of music within a South African, pan-African and global context' and secondly to 'contribute

to the building of a shared national musical heritage and identity' (NCS, extract, 2003, appendix 1). Edward Said might approve of these aims in his explanation of why assertions of a national culture take place. He interprets the practice of a national culture in terms of three elements: the first as 'the right to see the community's history whole, coherently, integrally' as a way of restoring the nation to itself (Said, 1994: 259); the second, as 'an alternative way of conceiving human history' (1994: 260) and the third, as a 'noticeable pull away from separatist nationalism towards a more integrative view of human community and human liberation' (1994: 261).

The move to use music as a means to address a number of purposes in the curriculum that include affirmation of heritage, expression of creativity, knowledge of the world and developing a 'love for music making' (NCS extract, 2003, appendix 1) has led to policy makers including a wide repertoire of musical works in the curriculum. Music education in South Africa is intended to reflect the diverse cultural interests of its citizens. Like Horsthemke (2004) I am sceptical towards interpretations of indigenous knowledge that assert that it is significantly differently as 'knowledge' from Western knowledge. The concept of 'indigenous knowledge' (referred to as Indigenous African Music or IAM in CAPS, 2011) features prominently in the discourse of transformation. The drive for Indigenous Knowledge Systems (IKS) is part of the politics of transformation and in the South African context is about reaffirming marginalised cultural practices – in post-colonial terms it tends to be associated with the idea of the 'African Renaissance'. There are varying social purposes of music and diverse practices that take a long time to learn. But this does not mean that they are underpinned by distinctly different knowledge. Recognising that IKS is a term used in curriculum documents I use the term 'indigenous music' for the sake of brevity. I am however unwilling to subscribe to the idea of IKS if it implies that Western and African music are totally dissimilar to one another.

My own stance on the concept of 'indigenous music knowledge' (comprising IAM) is that there is an over-arching musical knowledge that is given different expressions in different parts of the world. Musicians have diverse musical practices which display a wide range of skills on different instruments using different notation systems. To illustrate - playing the piano and playing the mbira (thumb harp) require different skills but not different 'knowledges'. In music, there is a basic framework that everyone can relate to: musical 'elements' such as timbre, texture, dynamics, rhythm and beats are common to all musics. Positioned thus, different genres relate to different aesthetics which result in the rich diversity of musical cultures.

The specific link between ethnomusicology and South African music education lies within the content that the present curriculum has defined where indigenous music as well as other types of music has emerged more prominently than in past curricula. Although it is difficult to offer a single definition of ethnomusicology that most theorists would subscribe to, there are certain key elements to the study of 'music in culture' (Nettl, 1983: xii). Typical of the field is material that references non-Western music: folk music, tribal music, music that is disseminated through the oral tradition, music of a given locality, music that is claimed by groups as their own 'particular property' such as 'black' music and contemporary music (Nettl, 1983: 4). Ethnomusicology addresses a multitude of topics: 'Diversity, variety, plurality; interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary, cross-disciplinary; abiding issues, competing ideologies, intertwining histories' (Nettl and Bohlman 1991 citing Bohlman, 1991: 356). These diverse purposes, and in some cases values, are present in the NCS and are easily recognisable as a crucial part in the aims that appear in all post-apartheid education policies and explicitly mentioned in the NCS, 2003 extract. The next section will develop the ethnomusicological image that 'people, ideas, and music circulate in global flows that transcend national boundaries' (Stone, 2008: 206).

Diverse musics in the National Curriculum Statement

It is important to note that there are now many types of music being represented in the curriculum. The range of different musics and their purpose in music education makes it important to define and identify them. Because many of the more contemporary styles of musics share common traits and elements, it could be said that they belong to the genre of Cosmopolitan music – a type of music that highlights the changing conceptions of music and illustrates some of the complications that arise in trying to link knowledge practices to particular societies. CAPS (2011), the most recent policy document in the National Curriculum Statement (NCS), has attempted to categorise types of music under three main 'streams' of music that are offered for study in the last two years of school. They are Western Art Music (WAM), Indigenous African Music (IAM) and Jazz (CAPS, 2011:9) under which other categories of music have been classified:

Table A: Classification of musics

WAM	IAM	JAZZ
Baroque style music	Children's communal songs, adult communal songs	Early jazz, ragtime, Stride piano[10], New Orleans and Chicago era, Swing era
Classical style music	Subgenres from Nguni and Sotho groups	Rock and pop, bebop, hard bop, cool jazz
Romantic style music	Afrikaans music including Boeremusiek, Moppies and Goemas, Indian music, Afrophonia	

(Adapted from CAPS, 2011: 9)

In order to fully comprehend the role different musics are expected to play in the curriculum it is important to unravel the meanings behind the labels used in the

---

[10] Stride piano is a style of jazz piano playing developed in Harlem, New York in the 1920's and 1930's where the right hand plays the melody and the left hand plays a single note on the strong beat and chords on the weak beats.

above table. In broad terms my understanding of them are: 'Indigenous' music referring to black African music, including tribal, folk, traditional and jazz genres, 'Western' music referring to Western Classical music and jazz, a style of music developed on African rhythms and Western harmonies. The grouping of African music in the table above reflects the changing perceptions of African music. As explained by Muller (Muller, 2008) there has been a shift in viewpoint where in the early twentieth century black African music was defined as being different from European music from Britain and Europe. Now the differences are more nuanced:

> In post-apartheid South Africa, "African" is defined as a more unified version in which all people born on the continent, regardless of racial or ethnic heritage, are identified as "African". In contrast, in the mid-twentieth century, it shifted again when musical research became more focused on individual nations, and nations-within-nations-Ndebele, Zulu, Sesotho, and so forth, as part of apartheid ideology in South Africa and postcolonial recuperation in independent states like Ghana, Nigeria, and Tanzania (Muller, 2008: 8).

In addition to South African music, World music does have a presence in the curriculum if understood in the way it is described in literature. Stokes (1994) has described it as 'non-Western musics' (Stokes, 1994: 153). Meintjes (2003) elaborates further:

> World Music came to encompass musics of many ethnic minorities, remotely located peoples, and 'third world' nationals, as well as cross-cultural musical collaborations (Meintjes, 2003: 7).

Global music referred to in literature as 'abstract, placeless' (Stokes, 2003: 300) is also contained in local curriculum documents which refer to it as 'other diversities' (NCS, 2003, extract) and 'various musical traditions' (CAPS, 2011: 8). My explanation of the presence of diverse musics in the curriculum is that it is intended to introduce learners to a wide range of musical contexts and styles where the boundaries between genres have become blurred with the notion that musical

identity can be cosmopolitan and transcend traditional geographic boundaries. With increased accessibility to technology 'Other' music has become less exotic, difficult to define and more accessible to those who wish to discover it, explore it and be inspired by it to create compositions with wide ranging influences. I will now describe World, Fusion and Cosmopolitan music as part of the same movement of contemporary music.

Cosmopolitan music, sometimes referred to as Fusion music (explained in more detail later in this chapter), could be explained as compatibility between Western and Other music where elements that define these musical languages are fused together to create what Nettl refers to as a 'bicultural society' (Nettl, 1983: 58). In his view, although the musical elements are fused together, there is still a notion of separateness where the composers are aware that the languages are different and can be clearly identified to its source of origin. World music could be described as music without borders or to use Nettle's phrase 'multimusicality' (Nettl, 1983: 59) that has fused together elements of Eastern and Western music and is sometimes referred to as fusion music. Global music is music that is nationalistic and representative of the countries it came from. Nettl uses the terms 'multimusical culture' (1983: 59) to describe mixed musical traditions that cross borders. He explains how increased access to a variety of music has led to a multimusical profile that is symbolic of greater cultural diversity.

Nettl claims that the impact Global music has on society is that every cultural 'unit' has 'several musics' (Nettl, 1983: 58-59). This perspective might explain how certain musics such as 'bebop', 'hard bop' and 'jazz fusion' have claimed their places in the national music curriculum of South Africa (CAPS, 2011: 9). Another form of contemporary township music, known as Kwaito music has emerged in the curriculum under the label 'Jazz/Afrophonia' (2011: 57). Jazz in its time was considered an innovative art form with a trademark that 'provokes controversy' opposed by 'traditionalists' and supported by 'modernists' (Merriam, 1964: 312). It

developed during the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century as a form of music that used Western harmony together with African rhythms.

Afrophonia also uses elements of both Western and African music, and is a term that is used in the curriculum to describe a type of contemporary African music. The term draws from African philosophy and is described as a modern discourse that is 'alive within (African) societies' (Rettova, 2004: 49). My understanding of Afrophonia arises out of my familiarity with the music of three Kwaito singers - Mandoza, Arthur Mafokate and Tokolla Tshabalala. Their music is inspired by African folk music, often played on Western instruments and performed within the context of its locality and the communities that stimulated its launch. Mandoza's music comes across as having a refined studio sound in the way in which sounds are digitally enhanced in a studio setting. Mafokate's music comes across more naturally particularly with his use of everyday items (e.g. buckets, dustbin lids) used as percussion instruments. Tshabalala's music seems to combine both elements of formal studio treatment whilst at the same time capturing the spirit of informality, a characteristic of township street music. In this respect, Kwaito music as part of Afrophonia might be described as a mélange of African and Western musical habits and practices with particular reference to daily life in the townships.

> Most of my songs are about the ghetto life. It's about what's happening in the ghetto the way people dress, the way we drink, the music we listen to, just the way we do things (Mandoza, n.d.).

Afrophonia has emerged from the African societies that gave birth to it. I extend Rettova's argument about African literature using African languages as having a leading role in African society (Rettova, 2004: 48). As with African literature, I propose that South African Afrophonia, has an equally important role in blending together foreign and indigenous musical ingredients that reflect modern and traditional influences in a meaningful, creative and appealing manner.

In addition to describing the range of musics discussed so far it is important to offer at least a provisional understanding of two key terms, Western and African music, which are frequently used in this study. Toynbee (2003) reminds us that: 'Too frequently Western art music and its Others are counter-posed as radically distinct when in fact common problems of structure and meaning are encountered everywhere in musical analysis' (McClary and Walser 1990, cited by Toynbee, 2003: 108). He draws distinctions between Western music and popular music by declaring that Classical Western music is 'first rate work' composed by great 'auteurs'(Toynbee, 2003: 108) - such as Beethoven. Toynbee describes the field as 'unified and stable' unlike popular music which he sees as 'fragmented and volatile' (2003: 108). In classical music, composers (like Mendelssohn, Schubert and Tchaikovsky) take simple motifs and elaborate on them. Toynbee refers to the rules of composition as 'codes' and suggests that the richness of the codes lead to long and complex works (such as large scale symphonic works) unlike the short codes in pop music that 'yield short text' (Toynbee, 2003: 109).

Sometimes African music is described as strong and complicated rhythms often played on drums (Meintjes, 2003: 110). Waterman (1991) cites Hornbostel's statement on African music, based on his article *'African Negro Music'* (Hornbostel, 1928) that African rhythmic playing is 'modeled upon drumming and grounded in a twofold "acting of beating' (Hornbostel 1928: 53 cited by Waterman, 1991: 171). Hornbostel's observation leads to his suggestion that other means, aside from drums, are used to produce rhythm such as 'stamping, clapping, beating a xylophone or bell' (Waterman, 1991: 179). Other features have framed the 'general hypothesis' that African music is 'pure polyphony'[11] (Waterman, 1991: 171) suggesting that it necessitates the participation of a number of people.

The differences outlined by Toynbee, Meintjes, Waterman and Hornbostel help us to appreciate how the different musics in the curriculum might be regarded by

---

[11] Polyphony is a musical term used to describe several different sounds played simultaneously as opposed to monophony that has a single melodic line without any accompaniment.

teachers and learners. For instance, shorter works in popular music may attract learners who have encountered this type of music in everyday life and feel that they have an inherent understanding of its structure and meaning. Those learners who have experienced Western music in school and everyday life might be more drawn to its study as a result of being schooled in the musical conventions that accompany it. Learners who have developed rhythmic practice as part of their African cultural traditions might be attracted to learning more about African music within a group setting. I therefore propose that in providing a choice of three musics in CAPS, policy designers might be relying on the premise that an individual's choice of music is situated within a personal context. Notwithstanding this point of view, I suggest that that the theoretical perspective of globalisation emphasises a different angle to this position.

The significance of globalisation

At a general level, contemporary music education should be located within the phenomenon of globalisation, where the exchange of knowledge has resulted in an interdependence and interconnectedness between different societies. On the understanding that the majority of South African citizens have been dominated and subordinated by colonial powers as well as a dominant minority racial group, the swing towards recovering indigenous knowledge can be analysed through a post-colonial orientation as 'giv(ing) agency to the dominated' (Stone, 2008: 205). An important configuration that takes place in the addressing of power imbalances is when the subordinated group 'select and invert from the materials presented to them by the dominant colonizing group in a process known as transculturation' (Stone, 2008: 205). I believe that an effect of transculturation in South African music can be described as taking place 'when music and ethnic identity are global commodities that share the same space in the studio, where they are blended into one groove' (Meintjes, 2003: 255). Meintjes has captured the essence of new ethnic South African music which she describes as being evolved into a form of expression

about local politics and a musical style that mediates 'national and transnational trends' (a process he refers to as 'mediation') in the 'neutral space' of the studio (2003: 8-9).

At a specific and local level, an effect of globalisation on the curriculum has resulted in learners being required to choose one of three streams of music to specialise in at school – all of which contain different trends that reflect aspects of the cultures they originated from. Such an approach is dependent on the larger context of the socio-political space that has occurred due to the transition from apartheid to democracy. Borrowing terms from Meintjes' argument concerning music makers' search for 'political, professional and personal voice' in the studio space, I imagine that learners would be engaged in a similar struggle to identify their 'values, identities, and aspirations' (Meintjes, 2003: 255) during the process of choosing the genre of music they wish to study.

The 'grooving together of cultures remote from one another in music' and the addressing of global issues in music have given rise to a movement of music that is not easy to comprehend (Stokes, 2003: 297). The genres of fusion, cosmopolitan and world music have arisen as a result of an expanded sense of identity and national culture. I believe that the process of trying to differentiate between them at times becomes redundant especially when they share common elements that are best described as blending different styles of traditional and Western music. It is understandable that music policy makers in South African are keen to liberate the curriculum from racialised nationalism and orthodox views on music education by engaging teachers and learners in a wider choice of musics. Their efforts in this direction have revived an interest in indigenous music as well as absorbed a number of alternative cultural strategies in the shape of global, world and fusion music. Stokes (2003) proposes that the global dimensions of migrant culture have produced new kinds of cultural alliances between the marginalised and dispossessed. This alliance has created a global citizen that Stokes rationalises as the emergence of

'hyphenated identities' (2003: 304). I take as such an example, Dinuk Wijeratne, a Sri Lankan-Canadian musician who to me embodies the breakdown of 'hegemonic local identities' (2003: 303) and represents a hyphenated global citizen of the type described by Stokes.

Wijeratne is of Sri Lankan origin, born to a Singhalese father and Tamil mother. He schooled in Dubai, the United Arab Emirates, accomplished his graduate studies in the United Kingdom, pursued post-graduate music studies in New York, the United States and then migrated to Halifax, Canada where he conducts, performs and composes what is regarded by his critics as World Music. A recent work, the Tabla Concerto, is written for Symphony Orchestra and Tabla[12], and was described as a fusion of Western and Eastern musical elements. It had its world premiere in February 2012 and featured a Western soloist, Ed Hanley. This work illustrates a number of contrasting global elements: it is composed by an Asian-born conductor with high-level Western classical music credentials; it is in concerto form, composed in a Western framework and features an Eastern solo instrument, played by a Western soloist. The combination of these elements may explain why Wijeratne is described as an Asian Canadian who straddles the worlds of East and West and why his music can be labelled as World Music:

> In this concerto he (Wijeratne) takes on the challenge of writing for the king of Indian percussion instruments, the Tabla. Symphony Orchestra with Tabla is an unusual combination. It's a difficult marriage to pull off, with the worlds of the west and east not always feeling music the same way. But Dinuk Wijeratne straddles both worlds, and drawing upon the astounding virtuosity of Ed Hanley he pulls off an intoxicating and beautiful creation (Canadian Broadcasting Company Release, Susan Hoover, 2012).

In Wijeratne's case, it would seem that his Western training helped him to develop his Eastern-influenced expressive style and fusion of cultural practices (including strong elements of jazz), that are the trademark of his compositions. Most of his

---

[12] The tabla is a drum and prominent Indian percussion instrument played with two hands.

works are structured in conventional Western musical form (such as symphonic form and sonata form) and written down using Western notation. It is the very nature of the limitless contributions in all the different ingredients that make up compositions like Wijeratne's that makes world music difficult to define but easy to recognise and relate to. Perhaps it is fair to say that 'good' world music contains some of the features described by Nettl (1983: 16-17) regarding the virtues of good music. For example, Wijeratne's Tabla Concerto is conceived and written by a highly trained musician, contains complex identifiable theoretical and harmonic features, is highly acclaimed by critics whose personal musical backgrounds represent interests in Western, Jazz and Indigenous music. Furthermore, the Tabla Concerto has been professionally recorded and given exposure in the public domain and perhaps most importantly, is a success with those who have listened to it.

I propose that Wijeratne's compositions can be identified as Cosmopolitan music (crossing borders and blending aspects of different cultures) and World music (containing no borders). Every culture absorbs outside contributions and the reinterpretation of genres becomes blurred as a result of 'the increasing permeability of cultural borders' (Aubert, 2007: 21). Cosmopolitanism as described by Turino (2008) is that common habits of thought and practice are shared among people from very different locales and lead to genres of music that share styles (e.g. Jazz) in different places at the same time (Turino, 2008: 142). The CAPS streaming of music appears to adopt the cosmopolitan stance by widening the choice of musics to include local repertoire that contain interchanges of music, thus encouraging teachers and learners to engage in tasks that draw together elements from different genres.

It is plausible to suggest that political restructuring and realignments of social differences are gathering momentum in CAPS[13]. Encouraging learners to re-work sounds into expressive forms that represent different African musical identities can

---

[13] Like all post-apartheid policy documents, no single author of CAPS (2011) is identified. It is the product of institutional authorship and negotiation with multiple stakeholders.

be interpreted as a move towards reclaiming and bridging traditional music together with contemporary local experiences. The possibility exists for learners to establish themselves on the global stage by reaching out to an audience of international listeners. Assuming that there are globally shared values of good sound production, the appropriation of technologically superior sound systems becomes imperative. The requirement for learning about the influence of technology in music (CAPS, 2011: 57) becomes significant to the propagation of South African music. The political, the everyday and the aesthetic are blended in with a level of abstraction (in the form of music notation) that allows traditional and contemporary indigenous music to be disseminated through a studio process. Globalisation as perceived within music education raises a new consciousness about the practices of education systems that are guided by political agendas (Johannessen, 2010: 5). Therefore, an understanding of the purposes of music in South African music education policy becomes essential in order to gain an appreciation of how politics are playing a central role in strategies to democratise music in the curriculum.

Purposes of music in contemporary South African music education

An investigation into teachers' perceptions of post-apartheid music education necessarily includes a discussion about the stated purpose of that education in official policy (see NCS extract, 2003, paragraph 2 'Purpose'). The aim in contemporary South African music education appears to be one that goes beyond the study of music that demonstrates technical excellence and specialist knowledge. There is an extensive and broader programme that points to a new sociology of music that has emerged in the 1990's. In an era where a strict 'regime of connoisseurship' (Hennion, 2003: 87) that imprisons the student of music with rigid bindings of well-defined specific competencies has come to an end, the possibilities for studying emerging musics have become endless. The African ethnomusicologist, Meki Nzewi (1999), who describes himself as 'a cultural

scientist', argues for the propagation of African music that he believes is used to 'humanise people and societal systems' (Nzewi, 1999: 84). Nzewi criticises African music education to be a parody of foreign models. For him, music education should reflect the aim to promote cultural identity and the promotion of new ideas would produce a new model of music education that is relevant to its cultural context – one that is rooted in family and community. Post-apartheid curricula implicitly endorse Nzewi's position by its promotion of knowledge in local contexts (CAPS, 2011: 4).

Nzewi's recommendation requires the support of teachers who are being asked by policy makers to make major changes to their practice with minimal training and no resources. In order for teachers to fulfil their roles of agents of transformation they would need this situation to change. One of the over-riding concerns of contemporary music education as cited in CAPS (2011) is inspired by the Constitution (1996) which is to 'heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights' (CAPS, 2011: Foreword). For teachers to change their teaching styles to reflect this aspiration they would have to transform themselves in a way that Harley *et al*. (2000) explain.

The notion of teachers being one of two types of professionalism demonstrates how the role of music teachers has extended. Harley *et al*. (2000) citing Hoyle (1980) refer to 'restricted' and 'extended' professionalism. Those '…whose thinking and practice is narrowly classroom based, rooted in experience than in theory, and strictly focused on the academic programme…' belong to the branch of restricted professionalism. Those who see their work as 'a rational activity amenable to improvement on the basis of research and development' are located in the realm of extended professionalism (Harley *et al*., 2000: 292). In an extended role, teachers need to demonstrate a sensitivity towards individual learning needs which implies reduced reliance on formative assessment.

As mediators of learning teachers (sometimes referred to as 'facilitators' in policy documents) need to embody their practice with teaching methods that give learners time to think, to take risks and to be acknowledged as making valuable contributions in the music lessons. The deployment of two different skills, critical and creating thinking and older forms of disciplinary knowledge, is one that teachers need to consider in their contribution to the process of social transformation. As agents of change they must take into account the context of reform. Harley *et al*. (2000) cite the concerns of Enslin and Pendlebury (1998) who question if policy transformation might be impeded where policy makers take little notice of the context and agents of implementation. The success of music reform in South Africa depends on high levels of teachers' professional skills that embrace curriculum development within the reality of the classroom.

Continuing with the theme of social purpose in music education, the impetus for reform is closely aligned to the aims of a democratic civil society that expects its citizens to work out alternative strategies when circumstances change. Therefore, teachers are being encouraged to reflect on finding flexible ways to deliver different types of knowledge and learners are required to manage new forms of 'transdisciplinary, problem-solving knowledge' (Kraak, 1999: 28). Teachers together with their learners might usefully employ the African concept of Ubuntu which is generally expressed as a key philosophical concept of the African Renaissance defined on a general ethical level as humanity towards others. Translated into daily practice, teachers could elicit indigenous music material from their pupils during their lessons in order to expand their knowledge.

The policy initiative for a refinement of learner-centred teaching and learning can be identified in its move away from music as an abstract art form that draws upon patterns that composers rely on. Instead, music teaching and learning has become a negotiation between teacher and pupil that reflects equity-related considerations that have arisen from an overall political agenda of social justice. Under colonial

assumptions, Western music was regarded as quintessentially good music. This is no longer the case. Today, notions of identity have emerged as an important element of post-colonial music education where the experience and sensations experienced through music are connected to an understanding of cultural difference. Turino (2008) investigates the social meaning of music by understanding 'why and how music and dance are so important to people's understanding of themselves and their identities' (Turino, 2008: 1-2). The curriculum has acknowledged that genres of music and identity are linked in acknowledging different genres of music. A purpose of recognising diversity has been established with this move. Alongside this purpose lies a second: the demonstration by learners of 'high knowledge and high skills' (CAPS, 2011: 5). I analyse the two purposes of diversity and competence in the next section.

Music education in South Africa intended to rely on the demonstration of two abilities: to perform at a high level and to participate at any level. Learners are expected to both participate and present material during the course of their study. In order to fully appreciate what is involved in these two activities, I have employed Turino's (2008) differentiation between participatory music and presentation music. It is important to understand the difference between the two in order to comprehend what learners are expected to accomplish.

Participatory and presentational music

According to Turino, presentational music reflects close attention to detail in a 'fixed' performance that is known in advance to the player/s. Participatory music differs in this aspect as there is less control over the end result as the participants' contributions go with the flow of the moment (Turino, 2008: 54-55). Features of presentational music suppose that the textures and timbres are more 'transparent' as they are heavily rehearsed. This is quite different to the improvisatory nature of

participatory music that has a 'cloaking function' that points to more creative possibilities by the performers that can be appreciated by the audience (2008: 56-57).

It is my view that African music has a leaning towards participatory music with its societal functions based on religion and folk lore. Yet, the differences between participatory and presentational music are not as clear as they might be. For instance, what are the qualities that might be used to define them? I think this to be a grey area. For instance, cadenzas in Western concertos are an opportunity for soloists to display their creativity and virtuosity for the appreciation of an audience. How different is this concept from the African model of participatory music that maintains a degree of imprecision in its execution? It could be that the amount of spontaneity displayed by performers is the key to separating the two types of music. Cadenzas are practiced to the point that they are a known quantity to the performer (if not the audience), whereas improvisation in the African music context is generally a lesser known factor to both performer and audience. The distinctions stated by Turino between participatory and presentational music are viable but I believe they are at times not as distinct as he suggests.

However, the distinction between participatory music and presentational music is important because music education in its present form suggests that learners are being educated to manage both highly scripted performances as well as to revive informal genres of music in a varied and experimental approach that befits its status. The level of success that corresponds to learner competence in different musics implies longevity of socialisation that comes from an early age – be it for African or Western music. I believe that early music socialisation for any form of music making is an optimal condition for establishing musical habits. Is it then possible for individuals (teachers and learners) to adopt musical influences and styles when they are of school-age? I propose that it is - as long as the intensity and

calibre of instruction and training correspond to the nature of the music being studied.

Whilst it might be useful to define etiquettes and levels of pressure to participate, Western and African music exhibits various degrees of presentation and participation depending on the setting of the performance. American folk music for instance has as much participatory expectation as African tribal music. Stereotypes are maintained only for as long as their core practices are sustained without disturbance. New ways of thinking about the social functions of music make the distinctions within stereotypical discourses blurred. Performance protocols involve knowing where there is flexibility for participation and where the score is more tightly scripted and rehearsed by the core musicians.

> In Shona village ceremonies there are a variety of roles within a musical performance, ranging from highly skilled drummers, mbira players[14], singers, and dancers to neophyte singers, dancers and people who can only clap the basic pulse (Turino, 2008: 132).

Musical practices in the South African school context suggest that successful participatory performance should cater to different levels of competence as well as different types of musical interests. It would appear that the protocol for participatory music creates a more relaxed atmosphere where improvisatory techniques, highly repetitive motifs, constancy of rhythms and dense textures (Turino, 2008: 59) might encourage audience participation. These characteristics can be observed in African music, which suggests that it has a good fit with a participatory music model. Differently, Western music seems to require a high level of competence, in contrast to African music which allows for different levels of competence to function within the group. The different rhythms contained in music can lead to 'intimacy …where the individual parts create a greater whole' (2008:

---

[14] Mbira is a plucked wooden instrument consisting of staggered metal keys, often referred to as a thumb piano.

136). African music contains cross rhythms. The social impact of this form of 'interlocking' is that less experienced players are asked to hold down a basic rhythm whilst more experienced players insert complicated rhythmic patterns (off the beat, syncopated, etc.) into the basic framework. All players are equally valued as without the basic rhythm, the more decorous rhythms would fall into disarray. The provision for players at different levels of ability suggests that African music has the properties to invite people, even those without related skills, to take part in musical activities.

Turino positions a continuum (2008: 88) that develops participatory and presentational music into four categories:

Participatory   Presentational   High Fidelity   Studio Art

(social process)   (live performance)   (live performance recording)   (artistic process)

The continuum suggests that there are two extremes, one with human variables (participatory music) and at the other end of the scale, a process that accommodates fewer human variables (studio art). I find the idea of the continuum lends itself well to music being an evolving process where there can be combinations of variable and prescriptive music in any genre. CAPS (CAPS, 2011: 57) indicates that students are expected to partake in music making experiences that are spontaneous and informal (first half of the continuum), and that they also experience the recording and studio production of music making as part of appreciating the influence of technology on music (second half of the continuum). Listening skills can also be developed according to this continuum in a bid to understand compositional techniques and the application of musical elements whilst placing them in a specific historical and cultural context (Turino, 2008: 8).

Concluding comments

Post-colonial influences prompting shifts in teaching music recognise the impetus to reach across cultural traditions in a way that recognises the effect of globalisation. Ethnomusicologists (Turino, Merriam and Nettl) agree that chronological and geographical borders can no longer be applied to new musics especially when '…musical systems exceed conventionally recognised cultural units…' (Nettl, 1983: 57). Furthermore, the 'cultural formation' (Turino, 2008: 112) of groups of people who share common habits such as an interest in classical music are being broken up with the simultaneous introduction of different musics in the curriculum (CAPS, 2011). The pluralistic nature of this kind of move permits conditions that foster a different kind of musical baseline that breaks up entrenched habits of thought and practice. Dissolving the partition between different musics calls for a reconsideration of established notions that certain musics are either inferior or archaic.

The concept of participation in music education is crucial in understanding the goals of South African music education which (amongst other aims) are to give learners the choice of diverse and varied content. Development of this kind gives visibility to the post-colonial tableau that begins the process of transformation in music education which has been acknowledged as a crucial aim in curriculum design. Turino's distinction on music as being the extension of the processes of music making as presentational music and participatory music can be placed within the realm of social activity. Given that there is a feeling amongst many ethnomusicologists that the latter is highly scripted and the former is flexible (Turino, 2008: 59), it could be established that presentational music is performed in front of a normally passive audience whilst participatory music requires the audience to be a part of the music by participating in some way. Classical Western

music concerts are formal (in the presentational mode) where concert tradition emphasises 'polite, sophisticated music and atmosphere' (Turino, 2008: 40):

> ...the audiences were always very polite and attentive to the performers: during performances the audience was so quiet that 'you could hear a pin drop'... (Description of a concert performer cited by Turino, 2008: 140).

The way that South African policy makers are viewing content suggests a more complex arrangement between the four components of participatory, presentational, high fidelity and studio art. This collection of musical activities can be interpreted as a lens for viewing music as a career instigated by progressive changes in the conception of what music education is about. It is my view that a satellite approach to the continuum is taking place where Turino's four processes of music making can be extended to suggest that more complex relationships are taking place than in the original model. Classroom music is expected to incorporate 'High Fidelity' and 'Studio Art' in the curriculum when students are encouraged to become involved in cross-curriculum projects that culminate in the recording and studio editing of some of their performances.

In this chapter I have articulated an account of how recent developments in music education and its role in South Africa reflect post-colonial insights. Ethnomusicology has supplied the way in which we can understand how music education reflects social settings and we can begin to appreciate the complexities that arise out of breaking with established music traditions. The next stage of my enquiry in Chapter Three gives an account of post-apartheid music policies. Through analysis of these policies, certain themes emerge from them that can be linked to the way in which social transformation is being regarded by music policy makers. This discussion is important because teachers are being asked to teach three genres of music they are not all familiar with. Additionally, I suggest that the way in which the curriculum

separates music into three categories (WAM, IAM and Jazz) is at times under-specified. I look carefully at what it is that teachers are expected to do to demonstrate their commitment to a progressive curriculum that in its most recent form is called the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS, 2011).

Chapter Three

South African music education policy since 1994

Introduction

The driving force behind curriculum changes since 1994 has been and continues to be social transformation to address the history of segregation and inequality that prevailed before 1994. South African music teachers are expected to implement a new curriculum that strives to address the needs of social transformation by emancipating a school subject that has a deserved reputation of being rooted in a Western knowledge base. Outcomes-based education (OBE) has been identified by post-apartheid education policy makers as key to social transformation. The main purpose of this chapter is to understand what music teachers are required to do, by analysing important post-1994 music policy documents.

With this aim in mind, accounts of post-apartheid policy documents, significant in the evolution of post-apartheid curricula, are provided in order to describe developments in music in school policy for state schools since 1994. Although the evolution of policy has been a complex matter, I set out to give an account of evolution of the curriculum as it took place through several iterations, with some attention to chronology, in order to identify key issues, indicate some shifts over time, and to suggest some issues of critical concern to my research questions.

In this chapter these documents appear in chronological order. They are:

1   Curriculum 2005 (C2005, 1994) with specific reference to:

- The Revised National Curriculum Statement Policy Overview (C2005/RNCS, 2002) *and*
- The Revised National Curriculum Statement, Grades R-9 (School), Arts and Culture (C2005/RNCS A & C, 2002)

2   National Curriculum Statement (NCS, 2003)
3   The Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statements (CAPS, 2011)

Readers will note from the document references that C2005 has been used as an umbrella term that includes all RNCS policies. In order to clarify references to policy documents in this dissertation I have referred to the policies as indicated above. Before analysing these key policy documents I will contextualise them in the wider policy framework since 1994.

From segregation to democracy

South African education policy documents since 1994 reflect the close relationship between port-apartheid political imperatives and post-apartheid education. Social cohesion and active citizenship is emphasised by the Department of Education (DoE) to repair the damage caused by the legacy of segregation in the form of separation between blacks and whites that took place socially, politically and territorially over three hundred years. The values specified in the final Constitution of 1996 continued to underpin post-apartheid curriculum development. They are: democracy, social justice and equity, equality, non-racism and non-sexism, Ubuntu (human dignity), an open society, accountability (responsibility), rule of law, respect and reconciliation. They were considered crucial to the promotion of nation building and bridging the gap between poverty and wealth (De Waal, 2004). The ten fundamental values, declared in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa,

1996 (Act No. 108 of 1996) continue to drive all education policy. It has not however been made clear in the music policy documents if post-apartheid music education policy was expected to achieve the realisation of all ten Constitutional values. For me the most relevant to music education are the values of equality, Ubuntu, respect and reconciliation. The curriculum positioned all musics to be of equal worth. Ubuntu is an African word that is popularly interpreted as a person not existing in isolation but being one of many – in school music this could mean accepting the influences that many types of music could have on an individual. The constitutional values are closely aligned to the principles of democracy stated in the Bill of Rights (1996) and intended to provide the platform for curriculum development and transformation in contemporary South Africa. The Bill of Rights states:

> This Bill of Rights is a cornerstone of democracy in South Africa. It enshrines the rights of all people in our country and affirms the democratic values of human dignity, equality and freedom (contained in Chapter Two of the Constitution, 16th Amendment).

The Manifesto on Values, Education and Democracy (2001) had identified 16 strategies for familiarising school children with the values of the Constitution. Two of these strategies were to make Arts and Culture part of the curriculum and for learners to become familiar with a 'rich diversity of cultures, beliefs and world views within which the unity of South Africa is manifested (C2005/RNCS, 2002: 7). This is an important statement which is reiterated in all music curricula post-1994 and illustrates the emphasis policy makers place on including diverse musics in their knowledge schemes.

RNCS (2002) signalled a move away from didactic teaching practices with an emphasis on reflection and experience. Learners were being encouraged to critically experience learning, including music, as individuals. The implication of

the aim to 'develop the full potential of each learner as a citizen of a democratic South Africa' (C2005/RNCS, 2002: 1) was that all learners, irrespective of race or background, should be able to explore a variety of knowledge systems and develop at their own pace in a curriculum that was not overly prescriptive. Such a move could be positioned as compatible with emancipatory pedagogic principles that make the content of the curriculum '…more relevant to the "real world"… by locating school knowledge in the everyday activities of children' (Taylor, 1997: 2). In moving away from conventional teaching practices it would seem that such an interpretation sets out to encourage teachers to recognise the importance of their learner's prior knowledge that includes knowledge gained from home and community school via everyday knowledge experiences. This, in some cases, might be contrary to teachers' expectations of how they regard the teaching of music in schools.

Critical outcomes for school music mentioned in the four policy documents discussed in this chapter (C2005/RNCS, 2002; C2005/RNCS A & C, 2002; NCS, 2003; CAPS, 2011) can be summed up as: critical thinking, team work, evaluation of information, communication skills, responsibility to others and the environment, demonstration of an understanding of the world. Developmental outcomes were described as: reflection of different learning strategies, participation as responsible citizens, a cultural awareness across a range of social contexts, exploration of education and career opportunities and the development of entrepreneurial opportunities. Both types of outcomes were described as derived from the Constitution and supported by the South African Qualifications Act No. 58 of 1995 (SAQA, 1995: 11) in its objectives to create an integrated national framework of qualifications, promote access to education, enhance the quality of education and training, accelerate the redress of past unfair discrimination in education and contribute to the full personal development of each learner (SAQA, 1995: 2). Through description, analysis and discussion of these polices I explain the way in which policy shifts have taken place to promote music education of equal quality to all South Africans citizens.

Music education in post-apartheid education policies

Curriculum 2005 (C2005)/The Revised National Curriculum Statement (C2005/RNCS), the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) and the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statements (CAPS) all state that music is viewed as an important tool in the transformative process. The idea of transformation is expressed in different ways during the introductory sections of the three policies and can be summed up as:

1   An expression of fluid knowledge:

        Culture expresses itself through the Arts and through lifestyles, behaviour patterns, heritage, knowledge and belief systems. Cultures are not static – they have histories and contexts, and they change, especially when in contact with other cultures (C2005/RNCS A & C, 2002: 5).

2   An expression of participation:

        The study of Music encompasses performance techniques, styles, listening, form, theory, interpretation and history. Music gives learners access to opportunities of musical expression and communication through the creation and performance of music within a South African, pan-African and global context. It prepares learners for participation in community life, the world of work and progression to Higher Education (NCS, Music: 2003: 9).

3   An expression of promoting local knowledge:

        The National Curriculum Statement Grades R-12 gives expression to the knowledge, skills and values worth learning in South African schools. The curriculum aims to ensure that children acquire and apply knowledge and skills in ways that are meaningful to their own lives. In this regard, the curriculum promotes knowledge in local contexts, while being sensitive to global imperatives (CAPS, Music, 2011: 4).

These three expressions of the role of music in the curriculum can be best described as a set of intentions that operate within a framework of social transformation and give a sense of the development of the moves post-apartheid curricula have made toward this goal. The first intention stated in 2002 expanded the boundaries of music from a previously constricted knowledge type confined to Western music. The second, in 2003, encouraged learners to become more practically involved through increased participation and the third, in 2011, promoted music via three specific streams of music. The three intentions illustrate consistency of the rationale to widen music knowledge and to make it more relevant to learners and this gives a sense that the development of music education is on-going in a manner that aims to be responsive to contemporary needs.

The balance between promoting local knowledge and protecting music knowledge as a discipline is of continuing interest to policy makers and teachers. I regard the inclusion of three streams of music identified as Western Art Music (WAM) Jazz and Indigenous African Music (IAM) in the current policy, CAPS (2011) as particularly significant in the development of local music education. For this reason I devote an extended analysis of three knowledge topics in CAPS (found later on in this chapter) to the way in which music education is intended to take place in Grades 10-12. The analysis of CAPS also discusses some of the issues involved in the choices that are represented by the three genres which themselves can be interpreted as part of the larger curriculum intention to accomplish social transformation via music education.

Curriculum 2005 (2002)

Curriculum 2005/The Revised National Curriculum Statement (C2005/RNCS), Policy Overview (2002)

The RNCS Policy Overview (2002) incorporated of Arts and Culture as one of eight learning areas in order to raise the profile of music in the schools' curriculum. This document is part of the suite of documents comprising C2005. Music became one of four art forms with the other three named as dance, drama and visual arts. As mentioned previously, the principal means used to affirm democratic values in education as stated in the Constitution was intended to be outcomes-based education (OBE) with teachers being described as 'facilitators' and students as 'learners'[15]. C2005 aimed to develop a high level of knowledge and skills 'for all' on the basis that previously disadvantaged individuals (PDI) should be empowered with a stronger knowledge base (2002: 12). Such empowerment was meant to lead learners to creatively apply their knowledge within a local context.

The characteristics of OBE appear to accord well within a curriculum that aims to be more inclusive by relinquishing an authoritarian approach to teaching. Pupils are asked to understand the significance of the information they are trying to master. Context-specific tasks are allocated to develop critical and practical skills and educators, in their extended role of facilitators, were required to form an interactive partnership with their learners. Rote learning was viewed as part of the old model and a thing of the past (Klopper, 1999: 226). The National Education Policy Act (No. 27 of 1996) provided for the development of curriculum design tools that supported OBE and the political transformational ideals stated in the NCS. These tools, in addition to the ones mentioned earlier, included: assessment

---

[15] In this dissertation, the words 'teacher', 'pupil', 'learner' and 'facilitator' are used interchangeably.

criteria, performance indicators, notional time and flexi-time and continuous assessment, recording and reporting (RNCS, 2002: 5). A main area for concern for observers monitoring the progress of OBE in the South African curriculum was that these tools resulted in the over-complication of education policy making some learner-friendly processes difficult to administer, implement and achieve.

As with all post-apartheid curricula, C2005 set the trend for interactive learning through cross-curricular activities and close collaboration between teachers and student-colleagues. Practical tasks were intended to provide opportunity for learners to engage in such a way that they identified problems, solved them and made decisions by thinking critically and creatively. Rote learning was to be minimised and students were invited to develop research skills rather than learning given truths. In a bid for inclusivity[16], minimum requirements were specified for all learners supported by the design and development of appropriate Learning Programmes (RNCS, 2002: 10). Barriers for learning were identified as disability, lack of parental support and socio-economic barriers.

Even as early on as 2002, the RNCS policy overview recognised that in order to achieve a broad spectrum of cultural study in schools, teachers should acknowledge that cultures are not stagnant and prone to change. This is an important consideration when taking into account Chapter Two's acknowledgement that a profusion of musics has surfaced as a result of the effects of globalisation. It is presumed that by including different types of musics into the curriculum, music teachers have the skills to take on the teaching of new musics that they may not be familiar with. The transition attempts in moving away from traditional ways of teaching and learning music towards a wide range of musical practices indicate that policy makers should be prepared to not only revive an interest in indigenous music but also give guidance to teachers on how to incorporate newer tradition of music such as global, world and fusion music into the curriculum.

---

[16] Various curriculum differentiation strategies can be consulted in the Department of Basic Education's Guidelines for Inclusive Teaching and Learning (2010).

Curriculum 2005/The Revised National Curriculum Statement, Grades R-9 (School) Arts and Culture (2002)

The Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS), Grades R-9 (School) Arts and Culture (2002) advocated a 'move from being passive inheritors of culture to being active participants in it' (RNCS A & C, 2002: 25). Readers should note that four generic learning outcomes were to be applied to four art forms as explained in further detail in the next paragraph. The RNCS Arts and Culture policy document, which will be referred to from now on as RNCS A & C, was arranged into chapters that represented learning outcomes for the Foundation Phase (Grades R-3) Intermediate Phase (Grades 4-6) and Senior Phase (Grades 7-9). Further chapters were devoted to how learner assessment was to be delivered and managed. The Foundation and Intermediate Phases aimed to encourage learners to become familiar with dance, drama, music and visual arts. In the on-going effort to redress the imbalances of the past, RNCS A & C (2002) openly acknowledged 'a strong influence by international cultures, and weak development and support of local Arts and Culture' (2002: 7). In order to deal with this legacy, it required learners to 'experience, understand and affirm the diversity of South African cultures' (2002: 7). To make learning accessible and for children to acquire the different forms of literacy, curriculum design centred around the development of oral, aural, visual, spatial, kinaesthetic and cultural literacies at increasing levels of complexity.

The four generic outcomes applied to music were identified as: creating/interpreting and presenting; reflecting; participating and collaborating and expressing and communicating (RNCS A & C, 2002: 13). These outcomes imply the acquisition of a range of skills which I have categorised into three types of skills: 'Core Musical Skills', 'Participatory Musical Skills' and 'Skills in Creativity'. As a music teacher I think it is helpful to understand how the different tasks described in the Learning Outcomes fit in with expressions of learner-centred and activity-based pedagogy. Monitoring three musical skills can help to keep track of learner

progression and understand the strengths and weaknesses of each individual. That said, whilst the principles for acquiring a range of skills are well-meaning, the implementation of them, especially in large classes with little or no support, would probably be difficult to achieve.

Here is an example of how learning outcomes interpreted as skills could work in a basic outline for an early Foundation Lesson. The tasks mentioned in my example were taken from a cross section of the four RNCS A & C learning outcomes.

- Participatory Musical Skill: Ask the children to bring a song from home and share it with their friends.

- Core Musical Skills: Ask the children to sing one or two of these songs in order to keep a steady pulse and to sing rhythmically. The children could copy the teacher to understand the difference between a singing voice and a speaking voice. The children could understand that some of the notes are short and some of the notes are long to begin a comprehension of different note values. The children could sing loudly and softly to begin to differentiate between loud and soft dynamics.

- Skills in Creativity: The children could be asked to express the songs according to the lyrics in a way that conveys the mood they wish to set.

The curriculum intention to make music an experiential and accessible art form becomes evident in the way learning outcomes are linked to musical skills. It was helpful to analyse the outcomes as skills as it prompted an understanding of where the sources of the three skills could come from. Core musical skills would mostly come from outside the learner's experience and participatory and creative skills would be most likely drawn from the learner's own experience which they have acquired from their home and their community. This would be very much in keeping with the RNCS A & C policy guidelines that call for an integration of 'divergent contextual factors' (RNCS A & C, 2002: 3).

In discussing C2005/RNCS, Taylor (1997) points out that success of an emancipatory curriculum would depend on 'the choices that are made with respect to the different forms of curriculum knowledge (and) classroom strategies most appropriate to (post-apartheid) teaching and learning' (Taylor, 1997: 3). Looking at the three types of skills outlined above, the RNCS A & C seems to have made the choice to contextualise school knowledge. The tasks described are appropriate to extending knowledge schemes to encompass multiple learning outcomes from every day activities. This approach relies on teachers that are able to make links between core skills and participatory and creative skills.

Policy language indicated that learners were encouraged to 'move from being passive inheritors of culture to being active participants in it', 'to identify the links between cultural practice, power and cultural dominance', 'to develop an awareness of national culture to promote nation-building' (RNCS A & C, 2002: 5). Perhaps understandably, there were no parallel statements promoting Western music. However, it was made clear that:

> The Arts and Culture Learning Area Statement aims to cover *equally (my emphasis)*:
>
> - a variety of African and other classical Arts and Culture practices – this will expose learners to the integrity of existing traditions and conventions; and
> - Innovative, emergent Arts and Culture practices – this will open up avenues for learners to develop inclusive, original, contemporary, South African cultural expression, and to engage with trends from the rest of the world (RNCS, A & C, 2002: 6).

The above two aims clearly stated the importance the curriculum placed on African culture which with hindsight could be interpreted as having laid the groundwork for the changes in music education that took place in 2011.

It is not clear to me how an outcome such as 'creativity' isolated as one of three core skills above can be applied to the learning of an instrument generally regarded

as an activity requiring repetition, practice and an assiduous adherence to technique. This is an example of a term that has been loosely used where the imprecise use of policy language requires clarification.

> The Kind of Learner that is Envisaged:
>
> It (the curriculum) seeks to create a lifelong learner who is confident and independent, literate, numerate and multi-skilled, compassionate, with a respect for the environment and the ability to participate in society as a critical and active citizen (RNCS A & C, 2002: 8).

A student of a musical instrument is often not confident or independent of their teacher and relies heavily on detailed instruction. Proficiency in an instrument does not normally entail a 'multi-skilled' approach. It would be unusual for one-to-one instrumental tuition to include studies of the environment or citizenship. Often, a music student is expected to show signs of commitment and a focus for their instrument at the expense of other activities. It is this type of student who tends to excel at gaining a high-level of skills. I do agree that an instrument can be studied over a long period of time creating a 'lifelong learner'.

> The Kind of Teachers that is Envisaged:
>
> Teachers have a particularly important role to play… teachers (are seen) as mediators of learning, interpreters and designers of Learning Programmes and materials, leaders, administrators and managers, scholars, researchers and lifelong learners, community members, citizens and pastors, assessors and learning area/phase specialists (RNCS A & C, 2002: 9).

This envisages that teachers of music will perform many highly skilled roles in delivering the new curriculum. Music teachers might be able to fulfil a number of the roles outlined above. However, their ability to do so would rest on a large degree of support from their schools.

Curriculum reform after apartheid remains controversial, with policy makers keen to develop a national system of education and training that addresses key principles of human rights, inclusivity and social justice. The challenge for music education in this context is how to embrace African music without compromising its credibility on the global stage. The curriculum demands that learners have a 'training of good quality' (RNCS, 2003: 5). I think that policy makers have recognised the dilemma it poses to teachers and learners in the way in which it talks about the subject of music. They recognise that music in the past has 'mainly emphasised Western contributions to knowledge' (2003: 1). They have deliberately set out to respond to 'new and diverse knowledge, including knowledge that traditionally has been excluded from the formal curriculum' that make allowances for the inclusion of local inputs (2003: 6). The content mentioned in the RNCS refers to demonstrations of knowledge that encompass a variety of styles and contexts that reflect the need for teachers to have both Western and African knowledge. The majority of the language used to describe musical competences is rooted in Western education terminology: rhythmic groupings, transposition, construction of scales, reading and writing intervals, harmonizing melodies, use of chords within scales and the selection of formal structure for composition music (2003: 35). These terms refer to the notation, harmonization and analysis of music which I argue are Western approaches to the way in which music is taught and learnt. By comparison, there was no clear evidence of how the purpose for 'cultural affirmation of African and South African practices' (2003: 9) would be achieved in the RNCS.

An author who takes a stance such as post-apartheid African music education being a 'parody' of Western models (Nzewi, 1999: 77) might see music education as prejudiced and resisting genuine change. However, I think that the issues signalled in this chapter are of a more subtle nature. The lack of resources and knowledge illustrated within the policy particularly for non-Western music are indicative of the complications that exist in South African education. In recognition of this deficit policy makers have promoted cheaper indigenous musical instruments as worthy of study – a move supported by Professor Meki Nzewi (1999: 77).

Having reflected on the RNCS, I propose that there is a basic overlap of skills that apply to both African and Western music suggesting that they can, at least at a basic level, be taught in parallel with one another. Rhythm and pitch are applicable to all music. The rhythm structures may be different and the understanding of pitch may vary according to the composition but the concepts are generic to all music making. Beyond elementary music making, teachers and learners will have to assess for themselves the best manner in which they can prepare for non-Western music study. For this to occur, schools should have teachers who are expert in African, Western or both musics. I now turn my attention to a major debate that arose between prominent South African academics as a result of the post-apartheid curriculum initiatives to implement OBE. Their exchanges and critical comments are indicative of the controversial nature of OBE.

Outcomes-based education in Curriculum 2005/Revised National Curriculum Statement (2002, 2003)

Critiques of OBE have acknowledged the complexities that exist in a curriculum that is trying to finds ways to empower learners. One of the reasons cited for the failure of OBE was the gap between the theory and practice of how to teach in a progressive manner. The prominent South African educationist, Professor Jonathan Jansen in a widely read and discussed article, '*Why Outcomes-based Education will fail – an elaboration'* (Jansen, 1999), raised a range of issues that diagnosed what he considered to have gone wrong in the design and implementation of OBE. He objected to the processes of consultation (physical attendance and written feedback to public forums by rank and file educators was inconsistent), the lack of teacher-preparedness, complexity of policy language, the continuation of unequal resources and the links made between education and economy. Overall, his objections were based on education policy being driven by political ideology in an effort to gain political credibility during the early years of democracy.

My thesis is that OBE will fail, not because politicians and bureaucrats are misinformed about conditions of South African schooling, but because this policy is being driven in the first instance by political imperatives which have little to do with the realities of classroom life (Jansen, 1999: 146-147).

There were two notable responses to Jansen's article. The first entitled, *Critical Responses to 'Why OBE Will Fail'* by Mahomed Rasool (1999), points out that Jansen has omitted to provide a solution to his perceived failings of OBE:

...a notable shortcoming in the monograph is a conspicuous silence on the concrete specification on the lines of curriculum reconstruction. Progressive academics and researchers need to make a transition from a discourse rooted on the discursive plane of pure critique to a discourse in which scholarship continues to be critical in character, but simultaneously addressed possible strategies that will advance the project of education transformation... (Rasool, 1999: 172).

Another article, in support of OBE for the education and training of senior certificate school candidates aged 16-18, known as Outcomes-based Education and Training (OBET), points out that change, whilst inevitable is a 'difficult phenomenon' wherever it takes place (Mahomed, 1999: 1580). In *The implementation of OBET in South Africa: Pathway to success or recipe for failure?* Mahomed explains that there should be an emphasis on developing the potential of all learners, rather than early selection of the chosen few. He believes that the curriculum needs to be better aligned with the world of work. The only way forward to break with apartheid education is to refine assumptions about OBET and rethink the *'significance of learning experiences'* rather than the '*content of the inputs* (author's emphasis, Mahomed, 1999: 163).

Rasool and Mahomed's views help understand both the shortcomings as well as the progress of music education. Music is being presented as a way forward to achieve accessible skills and relevant knowledge in order to develop a system of unity

through diversity. It is also positioned as a viable means of employment. This complex agenda would need regular updating especially in an environment where resources are limited. All those involved should recognise that the process of change will involve both success and failure, to different degrees. The most important step is engaging in open debate and for teachers to become aware of the issues involved. Taylor (2008) expressed different concerns with a progressive South African curriculum that placed an emphasis on higher order thinking skills. Whilst OBE focused on learner empowerment, he pointed out that learning goals were, by and large, articulated in cognitive terms (Taylor, 2008).

Following criticism of C2005, The Minister of Education, Professor K Asmal, called for its revision, which included an examination of OBE. The Ministerial Review Committee set up to address the concerns about C2005 and OBE, chaired by Professor Linda Chisholm, did not reject C2005 or OBE. It was felt that although teachers supported the principles of OBE, they were seeking 'clarity, simplicity and substantive professional support' in order to implement C2005 effectively. Suggestions for improvement included that a revised curriculum structure would include the eradication of 'confusing C2005 jargon', be supported by a national teacher education strategy, the production of learner support materials and a relaxation of the pace of implementation (Minutes, Review Committee Report on C2005, 6 June 2000: 1-2).

The National Curriculum Statement (2003)

A streamlined policy, known as the National Curriculum Statement (NCS, 2003) was the direct result of the Ministerial Review Committee where specific recommendations made by Chisholm and colleagues on the committee were addressed. The NCS was to be written in clear language and the eight learning areas in C2005 were to be reduced to six – one of which included Arts and Culture and

within it Music. The NCS was to retain the 12 critical outcomes but drop 66 specific outcomes as well as Assessment Criteria, Phases and Programme Organisers, Range Statements, Performance Indicators and Expected Levels of Performance. There was a restatement of earlier principles that the next curriculum move should recognise that:

> The values of a society striving towards social justice, equity and development through the development of creative, critical and problem-solving individuals lie at the heart of this curriculum (Report of the Review Committee on Curriculum 2005, 2000: 5).

It is my impression that with reference to music education effective implementation of the values stated in the above extract continued to elude the policy makers in the design of the NCS. A contributing factor to this impression is that music was not being sufficiently supported with high-quality teaching and learning resources. Aside from drawing attention to the use of clearer language the Review Committee Report of 2000 also mentioned unavailable and insufficiently used learning support materials (LSMs) which varied in quality, and this is an ongoing issue. LSMs had been singled out by Czerniewicz *et al*. (2000) as pertinent to the change envisaged by C2005. The authors argued '...that lifelong learning depends on information literacy, and this literacy can only be acquired through interaction with resources' (Czerniewicz *et al*., 2000: 3). The success of a transformative agenda in music education appears to rest on three key factors: clearer policy language, the provision of resources and on-going professional development of teachers.

The NCS continued to endorse the policy vision based on critical thinking and imagination. The NCS continued to promote the inclusion of different types of music in the curriculum. However, curriculum developers at this stage failed to make explicit connections between experiential music knowledge and knowledge learnt at school in a way that aided teachers and learners to usefully link classroom

activities to them. Assuming that in a South African context experiential knowledge is regarded as Indigenous music and an indispensable route to diversifying content in the curriculum, teachers were faced with the pressing need to diversify and expand their own understanding of classroom music education in a way that embraced this position.

Social transformation and reconciliation remained an important and fundamental aspect of the NCS as shown with its strong alliance to the Constitution to 'heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights' (NCS, 2003: 1). In its articulation of principles underpinning the curriculum, the valuing of indigenous knowledge systems became increasingly highlighted (2003: 1). Developmental outcomes required learners to 'be culturally and aesthetically sensitive across a range of social contexts (2003: 2). The NCS restated its commitment to OBE, reminding teachers that music should not remain 'static and unchanging' and that the South African curriculum should reflect the 'inclusion of local inputs' (2003: 6) which included recognising the music industry as contributing to the national economy.

The conception of music within the context of diversity and a skills deficit was articulated as follows:

> Music contributes to the holistic development of learners. It develops creative, interpretative and analytical skills. It contributes towards personal growth, cultural affirmation of African and South African musical practices, and the economic development of the country. Musicians are central to the development of the music industry that contributes to the national economy (NCS, 2003: 9).

This version of the curriculum paid increased attention to the areas of music industry practices and music technology. It also made allowances for music to

'encompass the study of indigenous and global music, and introduction of music industry practices' (NCS, 2003: 10). To promote a variety of South African musical practices and contexts, it was required that learners be introduced to a variety of Western and African instruments. High-knowledge and skills for learners, integration and three applied competences – named as 'practical', 'foundational' and 'reflective' competences - were adopted to promote an integrated learning of three aspects of music – 'theory', 'practice' and 'reflection' (2003: 3). 'Practical work' was described as group and solo work in performance, improvisation, arranging and composing which included, song, dance, poetry and instrumentation, as well as music industry practices and music technology (2003: 10). 'Theoretical knowledge' was described as music literacies, critical reflection that encompasses the study of indigenous and global music, and introduction to music industry practices (2003: 10). Foundational competences referred to basic musical skills clarified as performance, composing, arranging and improvisation, notation and aural, (listening), skills, the evaluation of music in historical and cultural contexts, knowledge about the music industry (including copyright law) and the use of music technology (2003: 10).

The range of competences described above presented the notion that the study of music was relying less on the traditional approaches devised by Western music policy makers. For instance, the NCS differentiates between music practices and processes. So, knowledge of the music industry and music technology is a music process whilst acquiring skills on an instrument is a music practice. I think that this is where the broad and varied nature of the syllabus stems from. Variety and cross training between practices and processes is intended to equip learners with locally relevant and globally comparable skills and is part of the design that aims to ensure inclusivity for all learners to be able to choose music as a subject at tertiary education level (2003: 11) and then go onto to develop it as a career.

I am uncertain that this strategy would achieve the desired result, particularly because the auditioning process in Further Education and Training (FET) institutions is generally used to spot exceptional talent in a single instrument rather than a means to assess a large variety of competences. FET institutions would have to change their outlook for the NCS strategy to work. For this reason, the approach for general music education should be regarded as quite different to specialist music education. The two differ in that general music education offers the chance of an introduction to music as a subject, whilst specialist music education at FET level offers the possibility to enter the world of work as a musician. The distinction between these two types of music education highlights the difficulties of delivering a curriculum that addresses the needs of social transformation whilst at the same time ensuring that learners are able to develop a high level of music knowledge and skills.

The type of learner envisaged in the NCS was someone who could demonstrate a training of good quality whilst developing the values that give meaning to their 'personal spiritual and intellectual journeys' (NCS, 2003: 4). The kind of teacher envisaged was someone who was qualified, competent, dedicated and caring and able to contribute to the transformation of education in South Africa (2003: 5). The profiles of learner and teacher are similar to the ones stated in RNCS but with a renewed emphasis on both parties adopting a stance of achieving aims of social justice in music education. Learners exiting from school are expected to 'have access to, and succeed in, lifelong education and training of good quality' (2003: 5). It is unclear if this means that learners with school music qualifications could enter colleges or university music courses without undergoing additional tests set by those institutions. This being the case, tertiary institutions would have to adopt an agenda of inclusivity in the same way as the schools' curriculum does for learners to successfully access places on colleges or university music courses.

The amount of detail offered in the assessment standards in the NCS points to a restatement of prescriptive and knowledge-based content:

- Grade 10 learners (aged about 16 years old) are expected to work on posture and tone and the ability to start and end at the right time (NCS, 2003: 18).
- Grade 11 learners (aged about 17 years old) should have the ability to cope technically with the requirements of the work performed.
- Grade 12 learners (aged about 18 years old) should be able to write informative programme notes for a music event.

In these three examples, it is clear that none of the tasks outlined can be completed successfully without a strong knowledge base that would be better supported by a more prescriptive curriculum. Yet, a tighter curriculum might be considered by some as undermining a holistic approach to music education in a climate where flexible attitudes to change are considered obligatory. The previous emphasis on Western culture has been replaced with a dual emphasis on Western and African music. For African music to be more widely available then a curriculum concerned with notating orally transmitted Indigenous music using Western music makes complete sense. The most noticeable change in the NCS was the increasing momentum given to the valuing of indigenous knowledge systems:

> The National Curriculum Statement Grades 10-12 (General) has infused indigenous knowledge systems in the Subject Statements. It acknowledges the rich history and heritage of this country as important contributors to nurturing the values contained in the Constitution. As many different perspectives as possible have been included to assist problem solving in all field (NCS, 2003: 4).

There is close alignment between the NCS and CAPS as the aims for the promotion of knowledge and values in local contexts are replicated in the CAPS (2011) policy.

The Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (2011)

The Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS, 2011) illustrates the complexities that policy makers will have faced when reworking lesson content to reflect music education as a vehicle of social transformation and as a platform for excellence. The general aims of the South African curriculum are broad and based on the principles of equal educational opportunities for all sections of the population. They are stated as active and critical learning, providing high knowledge and with achievable standards, sensitivity to issues of diversity and the valuing of indigenous knowledge systems (CAPS, 2011: 4-5). Streaming music into three areas of expertise has been the primary approach to comply with the notion for the curriculum to promote 'knowledge in local contexts, while being sensitive to global imperatives' (2011: 4), as mentioned earlier. The three areas are labelled as Western Art Music (WAM), Indigenous African Music (IAM) and Jazz. Schools are requested to appoint music teachers who have '…a minimum of a BMus, BA Mus degrees, or licentiate diplomas from Unisa, Trinity or ABRSM' (2011: 11). There is no mention of teachers with specialist African music qualifications. It can be deduced from this requirement that the curriculum is supporting the learning of Western music skills even if this might not be the underlying intention of the policy makers.

Within WAM, IAM and Jazz, policy makers have identified three topics as areas for knowledge and skills development throughout the senior phase of high school, Grades 10-12: (1) music performance and improvisation, (2) music literacy, and (3) general music knowledge and analysis. The efforts of the music policy makers are laudable in the way they have strived to incorporate the over-arching aims of the curriculum. However, an analysis of the three topics has revealed three problematic areas. Firstly, the structure and broadness of the three genres of music to be studied have exposed an implied hierarchy within them. This seems detrimental to a curriculum that strives to regard diverse musics as equally

important. Secondly, the policy makers appear to be trying to cover too much content in the last two years where general classroom music is metamorphosed into subject music to be studied as a matriculation subject. The overload of material leads to some unclear direction in some of the genres – specifically IAM and Jazz. Thirdly, the use of language in the policy suggests a framework of assessment that continues to be based on Western music examinations. The application of Western standards of music does not always translate successfully to Indigenous and Jazz music. To give one example of how different the three genres are: Western music relies on the accuracy of reading music, Indigenous music relies on the development of memory and Jazz music relies on improvisatory techniques. It therefore follows that assessment frameworks should recognise these differences – which CAPS does but only to a limited extent.

Topic 1: Music performance and improvisation

Teaching plans for Topic 1 in WAM in Grade 10 (age 16), labelled as music performance and improvisation reveal expectations of (a) solo work, (b) ensemble work, (c) technical work, (d) technology of the instrument, (e) improvisation and (f) sight-reading and sight-signing (CAPS, 2011: 13). Topic 1 in IAM require learners to demonstrate (a) solo performance, incorporating technical work and aural proficiency, (b) technology and the significance of their solo instrument, (c) group skills incorporating ensemble work. The difference in assessment between the two genres is that in IAM there is an allowance for group work and technology that resonates with the CAPS statement to produce learners that are able to 'work effectively as individuals and with others as members of a team' and 'to use science and technology effectively and critically' (CAPS, 2011: 5).

The design for WAM practical assessment tasks (PATS) shows elements that have been borrowed from traditional external music examinations – particularly the

requirements for solo and ensemble work, demonstrations of technical proficiency, improvisation and sight reading skills. Indeed, the policy explicitly states that the choice of four practical examination pieces are to be 'comparable to Grade 5[17] of external examining bodies' (CAPS, 2011: 58). Western external music examinations typically expect their candidates to produce three contrasting pieces of different musical styles, technical work in the form of scales, arpeggios and studies, aural (ear-training) tests, and sight-reading tests where candidates can show that they can play a short unprepared piece of music. Most music teachers educated in Western music have been groomed in these types of music examinations and are preparing their private students for music examinations of the type described above. South African music teachers have mainly come from this tradition and this may account for the continuing influence of Western music examination elements such as the requirement for learners to present styles in the way that I have observed in CAPS.

Topic 1 in IAM has two common elements with WAM in the areas of technical work (also expressed as exercises and scales) and the language used to describe the content and musical concepts can be traced to Western music examination syllabi. There is a significant exception in the use of the word 'oral'. Oral text proficiency is described as 'own praise singing' and is separate from Aural proficiency, which calls for the 'transcription of excerpts' (CAPS, 2011: 13). No further explanatory detail is offered on these proficiencies and teachers specialised in either African or Western training may find difficulty preparing students for these requirements without suitable training and teaching resources. The use of the words 'aural' and 'oral' suggest the development of two quite different skills. My own interpretation is that 'aural' skills are aligned with Western music education where students are required to listen and notate what they hear. For example, a teacher might play a melody for students to notate on manuscript paper. This would require knowledge of rules of Western music theory and prepare students to be musically literate.

---

[17] Grade 5 is part of a sequential series of external practical music examinations that normally start at Grade 1 (some boards have an initial examination before Grade 1) and end at Grade 8.Grade 5 is generally regarded as a good achievement of music for learners aged 13-16 in school grades 7-9.

'Oral' skills imply listening to a teacher and for learners to mimic by copying and memorising the melody that has been played or sung to them. The development of such a skill would be useful to learners who are not confident in reading or writing music and for a musical tradition that relies on oral transmission rather than the written score. There is a general perception that African music is flexible because of its orally transmitted nature and that Western music has more exacting and precise qualities because it is scored. Therefore, it could be said that acquiring literacy skills is relevant to WAM and developing memory is more relevant to IAM.

Technical skills to be developed in indigenous instruments include 'posture' which is described as 'isolated patterns', 'strokes and tone' and 'tuning/organisation' and the ability to 'take part in an ensemble' (CAPS, 2011: 13). Whilst these skills are sequestered as indigenous skills in CAPS, my own experience in learning to play percussion instruments in a Western music institution required the reproduction of strict rhythmic patterns, eliciting different sounds with different strokes and understanding the tuning and grouping of percussion instruments. In this respect I observe an overlap between African and Western percussion instruments. A notable difference between the African and Western percussion player is that the former is required to incorporate dance as 'a basic movement during performance' (2011: 19). I would suggest that the word 'dance' implies rhythmic movement whilst playing an African instrument and for choir members, the opportunity to use body percussion[18] to enhance their performance.

With regard to assessment, two of the three genres of music in Grade 10 give guidance as to what type of repertoire constitute an 'elementary standard' at the end of the year (CAPS, 2011: 16). This omission may be deliberate in order to maintain flexibility in the curriculum so that learners without a long history of

---

[18] Body percussion is when parts of the body are used to enhance rhythmic patterns in the music – clapping of hands, slapping of thighs are two common examples.

learning to play an instrument may still study music as a matriculation subject[19].
More likely is the reason that at present there are no recognised external
examinations for indigenous instruments. Elementary performance for WAM and
jazz is described as being comparable to Grade 2 external examination boards. The
elementary level for African music is to be based on Department of Education (DoE)
published guidelines as indicated in CAPS (CAPS, 2011: 62). Similarly Intermediate
levels are described as Grade 4 external examinations for WAM and advanced level
is described as aiming to be higher than the minimum level. African music is always
referred to DoE standards which are organised around 'rating codes' ranging from 1,
'not achieved, 0%-29%', through ' 7', 'outstanding achievement, 80%-100%' (CAPS,
2011: 62).

An important distinction arises out of the two different approaches to assessment
for WAM and IAM. I believe that WAM is being treated as a 'separate and complete
entity' whilst IAM is being presented as an 'integrated' entity (Vermeulen, 2009: 1-
2) within the overall strategy of organising the curriculum as a balance between
developing 'generic' and 'specific' knowledge and skills (Vermeulen, 2009: 1-2).
Underlying this distinction is the continuing recognition by policy makers of
'discrete art forms' such as WAM and 'integrated learning experiences' such as IAM
(Vermeulen, 2009 citing RNCS, 2002: 4). I propose that the posing of two such
assessment strategies on teachers contributes to an impression of a lack of
coherence in the music curriculum.

Jazz is only briefly mentioned in Grade 10 (age 16) in the same column as WAM
suggesting that the skills required for both of these genres are the same. However,
in Grades 11 and 12 (ages 17 and 18) jazz listings for Western jazz performed by
Dizzy Gillespie, Thelonious Monk, Miles Davis, John Coltrane and Herbie Hancock
and South African modern constructs such as Disco, Bubble gum and Kwaito music

---

[19] A matriculation subject is a subject studied during Grades 10-12 (ages 16-18). It is taken as one of
a group of chosen subjects for end-of-school examinations. Successful matriculants leave with a
school-leaving certificate.

are mentioned (CAPS, 2011: 32). Indigenous music 'experts' mentioned are Mama Madosini, Princess Magogo, Johannes Mogdoadi, Joe Mokgotsi and Alex Mathunyane le Dinakangwedi. At times in the syllabus it is indicated that the 'choice of stream content is made by the school' for Topic 1 (2011: 32) and at other times, the instruction states 'choice of stream content is made by learners, teachers or school' for Topic 3 (2011: 33) suggesting that choice of contents is heavily reliant on available resources. It is not clear in CAPS if students choosing Jazz or IAM are required to perform pieces from the WAM repertoire. The syllabus requirements are onerous in the amount of content stated and to impose extra requirements on Jazz and IAM learners would seem unfair.

In Grade 12 (age 18) the last school grade, learners are expected to have an overview of the two genres they are not specialising in. They should be familiar with a variety of historical and musical influences that shape WAM, IAM and Jazz and be familiar with musical tools such as instrumentation, chord structures, melodic lines, rhythm and notation. An 'African Approach' (CAPS, 2011: 42) is explicitly mentioned as a way of understanding harmony in terms of different timbres (instrument tone and colour) and 'melorhythmic' tunes (tunes that have a melodic range and tonal structure that is particular to African music). It is clear that policy makers have recognised the distinct qualities that make up WAM, IAM and Jazz music but the evidence in the lesson content suggests an approach that is over-ambitious and heavily reliant on Western music terminology.

Topic 2: Music literacy

There are many occasions where there is evidence of conservative elements of the Western tradition being reproduced and applied to non-Western traditions such as IAM and Jazz. This signals a contradiction in a policy that promises change based on the new departure of social values. Viewed in this context, the expectation of the policy is that it should deliver a more innovative approach to assessing IAM and

Jazz. The use of European musical terms expressing the use of dynamics (loud and soft), tempo (suggested pace and speed of the music) and articulation (how phrases should be played) are prevalent throughout CAPS. Learners are expected to know specific time signatures, key signatures, intervals, triads, primary chords, certain Western aspects of melodic constructions, composition techniques and a list of Western music terminology (CAPS, 2011: 20). As with Topic 1, students of IAM and WAM are expected to attend to 'exercises' and 'scales' in IAM and 'scales, arpeggios, broken chords, studies, rhythmic patterns and technical exercises' in WAM (2011: 13). There is no parallel requirement to study jazz chords and rhythmic patterns. Music technology in the form of computer programmes such as Sibelius (a computer programme to aid composers to notate and arrange their scores for multiple parts in a choir or orchestra) appears to counteract the need to acquire basic music theory. This paradox illustrates some of the tensions that exist in CAPS.

Music literacy defines the need for resources such as appropriate space, piano or keyboard, books, manuscript paper and computer and computer programmes for the preparation of the content which is Western-based (CAPS, 2011: 17). Learners are expected to be familiar with Western theory in the form of melodic construction, composition techniques and a list of musical terminology. There is mention of advanced chord constructions for IAM and Jazz that include half-diminished 7th, diminished 7th, nomenclature[20], major and minor dominant chord structures (CAPS, 2011: 20). Further evidence of Western-based school knowledge appears in the use of terms such as note names, clefs, sharps and flats, tonic, dominant and subdominant degrees of a scale (2011: 14). At this time, there are no Department of Education recommended text books or other learning material that explain these terms with practical examples for teachers and learners to follow. A search on the Thutong education e-learning portal shows two resources for 'melody writing' and the 'elements of music' but on investigation they are templates for

---

[20] The term 'nomenclature' is not explained in CAPS. It is a convention of naming or assigning meaning to a system of principles or procedures. In music, this would apply to the naming of musical conventions in music theory.

empty lesson plans, possibly intended for teachers to complete with their own ideas and submit to the portal as an available resource for others to use.

As mentioned previously, with less attention given to Jazz (details of Jazz repertoire are only mentioned in Grade 12) there is an implied hierarchy: that WAM is the overarching point of reference for music education whilst IAM seeks to accommodate learners from diverse backgrounds to study music at senior school level and Jazz is arbitrarily pushed in as part of the measures taken to diversify music. The inclusion of cheaper percussion instruments is an example of a tactic to widen access by not burdening schools, parents and students to acquire expensive instruments. It is generally felt that the time taken to learn a percussion instrument is much quicker than other instruments and in this respect the ethos of social transformation in CAPS has been respected. Yet, schools are burdened with the expectation that they are to provide specific resources in the form of highly qualified teachers of music in the Western tradition, an appropriate space for teaching music, textbooks, sound equipment and recordings of music examples (CAPS, 2011: 24). Other resources mentioned are the provision of music instruments, original music scores and sheet music and performance space (2011: 22). These resources are expensive and in an underprivileged South African state school, difficult to provide.

Topic 3: General music knowledge and analysis

This topic at Grade 10 focuses on the introduction of South African, Indian rock and pop music and excludes any mention of WAM. Halfway during the academic year, we see the beginning of streaming students into specialist musical fields identified as WAM, IAM and Jazz (CAPS, 2011: 18). The content specifies Afrikaans music, Boeremusiek, Moppies and Goema, Indian music, rock and pop: Jimi Hendrix, Elvis Presley and the Beatles. It is interesting that the last category of rock and pop is

the only one that mentions particular composers and performers. This omission seems to reflect some of the randomness displayed in choosing repertoire for Grade 10 learners. The rationale for focusing on local and non-Western music is presumably to avoid privileging the study of Western music over other musics. However, the paradox is that by omitting Western music at this stage those students wishing to choose WAM as an option might be disadvantaged over those students who have gained a stronger knowledge of IAM. I believe it is an omission not to mention repertoire details for Indian music as teachers' may not be familiar with this genre. Similarly, guidance should be given on the nature of the 'philosophical basis' (2011: 21) for music making practices in IAM which learners are required to know about.

There are occasions, in Grade 11, where we see policy efforts to recognise popular IAM music. The study of contemporary African musicals such as Umoja and African Footprints (Loring) are mentioned alongside My Fair Lady (Loewe) and Westside Story (Bernstein). African musical forms (e.g. call and refrain, call and response) are to be taught in parallel with Western musical forms or structure of a composition (e.g. AB, ABA, AABA). Learners are given the choice to study African instruments such as chordophones, aerophones, membranophones, idiophones and electrophones which are listed together with standard instruments found in a Western orchestra. In Grade 12, students who have opted to specialise in the study of Jazz are required to know about Cape Jazz, Jazz at Home and Jazz in Exile. The reference to these large areas of musical knowledge so late in the final term of the last year at school is puzzling and indicates a lack of thought in the preparation of jazz students.

Assessment for Further Education and Training (FET)[21] in Music has been developed as six performance assessment tasks (PATS) in Grades 10 and 11 and seven PATS in Grade 12 (2011: 52). It is not clear what all of these are as only five PATS are

---

[21] Further Education and Training (FET) refers to Grades 10-12 (ages 16-10) and the last three years of schooling.

mentioned for each grade. They are: Concert performance (PAT 1), Music literacy assignment (PAT 2), Improvisation (PAT 3), Composition or arrangement (PAT 4) and Written Assignment (PAT 5). Informal or daily assessments are expected to take place to monitor learner-progress through observations, discussions, practical demonstrations, learner-teachers meetings and informal classroom interactions (CAPS, 2011: 52). Self-assessment and peer-assessment is encouraged but not formally noted. Formal assessment takes place in the form of oral and written tasks and examinations. Formal assessment should also cater for a range of cognitive levels categorized as higher order (analysing, evaluating, creating), middle order (understanding, applying) and lower order, knowledge and remembering) (2011: 60). This is consistent with a curriculum that values active and critical learning over rote learning (section 1.3c, 2011: 4).

The analysis of the three topics of Music performance and improvisation, music literacy and general music knowledge and analysis, has shown that CAPS has attempted to organise the curriculum in a way that addresses what might be regarded globally as 'good quality' music education. The critique of the elements promoted in CAPS shows that in some cases, the three genres of WAM, IAM and especially Jazz are underspecified. Major themes and issues have emerged from the analysis of post-apartheid music education that can be summarised as follows:

- The effects of globalisation – where the South African policy outlook encourages learners and teachers to have both external and internal outlooks that embrace the teaching and learning of Western and African music.
- The effects of OBE – where South African music education is learner-centred and accentuates the importance of prior knowledge.
- The changing role of the music teacher – who is expected to gain knowledge in areas they might not be familiar with and adapt their style of teaching to reflect the changes expected of them in post-apartheid music policy.

- Resources – the need for music teacher on-going professional development and the provision of non-Western music resources.

Whilst a change has been instigated on a broad and initial level it is clear to me that additional policy work needs to be done for the music curriculum to become more robust to withstand general criticism and to improve coherence for its users. The current position is to regard music education from an ideal perspective where teachers are knowledgeable, compliant and enthusiastic and able and willing to embrace the changes instigated by the curriculum and supported by schools. The analysis of CAPS illustrates that conceptual coherence is being compromised by a policy that is striving to represent diverse communities in South Africa. The changes perceived through an agenda of social transformation are necessary and meaningful within the context of South African history, but it appears that more needs to be done by policy developers with regard to showing the ways in which the three genres of music can be employed to offer learners increased opportunities to develop their musical interests.

This chapter has illustrated the complexity of South Africa's new curriculum (CAPS, 2011) and the process that has created it. The latest development, of the introduction of three different types of music, has strived to produce outcomes that are culturally rooted. The curriculum needs to be clear, concise and consistent in order for successful interpretation and implementation by teachers and learners. The reduction of a large number of 66 learning and developmental outcomes that previously existed in C2005 has greatly improved the coherence of the curriculum, demonstrating that renewed efforts have been made to relate the curriculum more directly to daily teaching and learning.

Yet, for reconciliation to take place in the music classroom teachers' needs should be recognised and supported in addition to those of the learners. This is essential if

they are to fulfil the requirements of the new, post-apartheid curriculum with particular reference to the National Curriculum Statement (NCS). Chapter Four will present an account of the methodology and methods that were used to investigate the central research question: To what extent are music teachers able and likely to fulfil the requirements of the new, post-apartheid curriculum, with particular reference to the National Curriculum Statement (NCS)?

Chapter Four

Method

Introduction

My dissertation is an interpretive study exploring the phenomenon of Western and African music within the South African classroom, with specific reference to views expressed by twelve classroom music teachers. The impetus for this study was the result of my own experiences teaching Western music to undergraduate South African teacher-trainees in a well-known South African University. Data was gathered from the transcripts of twelve teachers who were interviewed twice in two one-hour interviews over a period of six months, between July 2011 and December 2011.

The central research question I wanted to investigate was: To what extent are music teachers able and likely to fulfil the requirements of the new, post-apartheid curriculum, with particular reference to the National Curriculum Statement (NCS)? This central research question was further refined into a set of more specific research questions which guided the design of the interviews:

1 How has the participants' own musical education contributed to their views on the goals, aims and purposes of the new curriculum?
2 a) Given their own musical education, how do they perceive the requirement to accommodate and value African as well as Western music?
  b) Do they have a particular allegiance to African or Western music?
3 What are their views on what is 'good' musical knowledge?
4 Do they see music and music education as a vehicle for social transformation?

Identifying areas of interest from these questions assisted me in organising a framework for the interviews in addition to keeping the interviews focused. Readers should note that the questions posed in appendix 4 were later changed to 'Areas of Interest' (Table B, below) to allow for a natural flow of conversation between me and the research participants. The areas of interest were sent to the interviewees two months ahead of their first interview. The initial format of four interviews was reduced to two interviews as I felt that two 1-hour interviews would be sufficient to collect the data I required. This framework gave the participants the chance to think about the sort of questions we were going to discuss ahead of their interviews. I arranged the questions into two groups which represented (1) biographical information and (2) music in the NCS. These then evolved into five areas of interest as detailed below:

Table B: Areas of interest

Area 1: Music training
First early interest in music, music training, and attitude towards music training, curriculum and approach.
Area 2: Assumptions about African and Western music: role and importance of African music
African and Western music as a participatory (social) process. Can and will African music encourage participation? If so, how?
Area 3: Attitude towards Western Music and its continuation
Importance of African tradition, importance of Western tradition: aural and written.
Area 4: Music and values: diversity, respect, inclusivity
If and how school music can promote political values.
Area 5: Music in the NCS
Can and will music contribute to social transformation through the study of different genres?

Guiding the participants through their interviews via these areas of interest suited my requirement for freedom and adaptability of responses from the participants. Areas 1-3 were discussed in the first interview and Areas 4 and 5 were discussed in the second with reference to the NCS extract (appendix 1) about the definition and

purpose of music. It should be noted that whilst this was the general intention, the format deviated on many occasions whilst people referred back and forth to the themes across the two interviews. I allowed for divergence rather than interrupt the natural flow of conversation. Although this strategy made the data complex to analyse the experience was rewarding as it revealed some interesting and at times, unexpected findings. I was influenced by Cousin's (2008) and Attride-Stirling's (2001) work on how to make sense of the data that I had collected. As it did not fall immediately into neat and identifiable categories their methods provided a sensitive and complex approach to unravelling the answers I was given to the questions I asked.

I decided to explore teachers' views on post-apartheid music curricula by asking them to reflect on an extract that I took from the National Curriculum Statement (NCS, 2003). The choice of extract was from Chapter 2 of the policy that contained a definition of the concept of music and explained the purpose of the study of music. This extract was distributed to the research participants two months ahead of their interviews so that they could study it and make notes for further discussion. All the teachers took advantage of this opportunity and they were well-informed to speak in depth about their views on what the curriculum was trying to achieve in general terms. The extract is in appendix 1 of this dissertation and readers will note the broad and complex ideas reflected in the text. This characteristic elicited in-depth conversations about the NCS (2003) and the succeeding policy, the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS, 2011).

Selecting participants in a post-apartheid context

Earlier chapters have discussed the impact of South Africa's racial divide on music education in different ways. In Chapter One, readers were alerted to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement's (CAPS, 2011) mention of 'race' and

of 'non-racism' as a value to be protected in democratic education. In Chapter Two, the discussion about an entrepreneurial intent of music education, used as a strategy to cut across divisions of race and class, revealed how an innovative approach could provide alternative routes to becoming a music professional. In Chapter Three, documented evidence demonstrates that all post-apartheid music curricula has undertaken to reconcile the artificial differences that have fractured South African society by promoting diverse cultural practices in a nation-building exercise concerned with social cohesion, social transformation and reconciliation. The ongoing significance of racial difference made it important for me to find an ethnically diverse cohort of participants.

My first task was to find teachers who were willing to discuss the music curriculum with me. The main criterion was that they would be currently practicing classroom music teachers from different backgrounds. Compliance with the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) is not mandatory in South African schools and my impression was that many teachers opted to teach other music curricula such as the Cambridge Board and the International Baccalaureate. Therefore, although it was not necessary for participants to teach to the NCS I wanted to investigate the awareness they had of the national curriculum and their views on the policy and curriculum changes that were taking place during 2011.

With these considerations in mind, I decided to take into account the four main racial categories of white, black, coloured (mixed race) and Indian to depict a range of voices that could give a sense of South Africa's racially divided past and how this may have impacted on participants' views of some of the issues raised by my topic. I then decided on how many teachers should be interviewed, how many times I should interview them and for how long. As discussed earlier, I anticipated that I could get a rich depiction of South African music education by interviewing teachers from a range of different backgrounds over a period of two interviews of one hour each. It seemed likely that this approach would provide a source of data

that would give a sense of the complexities involved in this study. The recruitment process was a challenging one. The initial aim to include a representative group became problematic because of who agreed to participate in the study. Those teachers who had music departments in their schools were keener to take part than those teachers who lacked the resources and facilities for the study of music. The schools that offered music as a subject generally employed white Western-educated music teachers.

However controversial, classifying people by race is a generally accepted feature in South African society. The continuing use of race classification is to monitor discrimination of previously disadvantaged individuals (black, coloured and Indian people) by fulfilling current post-apartheid policy and/or legislative requirements to increase access to jobs, funding or placements in Universities (Ruggunan, 2010: 22). It is justified as a necessary tool in the need for race based redress both in the labour market and access to higher education (2010: 4). Classification was often undertaken by bureaucrats who might be using arbitrary judgments quite often based on people's appearance, names and addresses of where they live. The intention in such practices is now for a 'common sense' approach towards 'the everyday experience of filling in forms and classifying people in various racial categories' (2010: 7). In practice however, this approach is commonly recognised to be an imprecise and somewhat arbitrary approach by the classifiers – whoever they might be.

The categories are not always entirely clear to the individual undertaking self-classification as use of socially constructed categories is often driven by politicians in a particular local historical and cultural context. My personal experience of this is that I was unable to choose from any of the four categories in a well-known South African University entrance form, as at the time, in 2003, there was no option for 'other' or 'foreigner' as is sometimes more commonly available today. There is acknowledgement of philosophical and pragmatic problems in defining a person's

race based on arbitrary elements. Giving the option for citizens to self-classify who they are is intended to reduce these problems. The 'variability and imprecision on the subject of race' (Posel, 2001: 89) occurs because racial classification has multiple social meanings that vary according to whoever was doing the judgment and 'gave free reign to an assortment of social and individual prejudices on what was racially self-evident' (2001: 96). With these complexities in mind I decided that participants should be given the option to describe themselves within the categories of white, black, Indian and coloured in my study.

A combination of a targeted and snowball approach identified the cohort of twelve participant-teachers. I relied on a private network of teachers and began by e-mailing teachers from a small initial group of teachers I had come to know whilst doing music adjudications in Johannesburg. I had informally discussed my work with them during those occasions. When I contacted them formally to participate in my research, some of them agreed to do the interviews and others passed on some of their contacts to me, based on who they thought might be interested as potential research participants. I also called a selection of six schools that I knew taught music in the Gauteng area. I obtained the information from the Yellow Pages telephone directory on the internet. The schools I selected were privately funded and semi government funded and referred to as 'Model C'[22] schools. This type of cold calling (where I was not known to the school) did not yield a single response. Differently, I received 62 acknowledgements from the 110 teachers I contacted on the mailing list compiled from my personal network of contacts. The bulk of the mailing was done in October 2010 with 104 teachers contacted at that stage. Of the 62 teachers who wrote back to me, 25 teachers expressed their willingness and availability to do the interviews.

---

[22] Model C schools were schools in the apartheid era that only accepted white learners. Since the early 1990's these schools accept learners from any racial background. They are partially government funded and administrated and partially funded by school fees.

However, I started with a much smaller number of five positive responses as the remaining 20 had changes in circumstances (pregnancy, increased work load, illness, and other changes in personal circumstances) which prevented them from becoming interview participants. I approached the initial five participants to help me find the remaining participants and between them the rest came forward during the interview stage and in this way I found my cohort of 12 teachers. This snowballing approach to selection was successful as it gave more prominence to the research than might have been achieved otherwise. Snowballing is a term used when a researcher starts with a known group of participants and asks each of them to nominate someone else they think would be suitable to participate in the research study (Webley, 2010: 934)). A significant advantage of snowballing is that the accumulation of numbers is quite quick (Denscombe, 2007: 26) for the build-up of a larger sample of participants. In my case the build-up was achieved over the course of six months, between July 2011 and December 2011 – this represented the time between my first and last interview. It should be noted that snowballing approach continued throughout the interview stage itself.

All 12 participants are what I will describe as Western-trained in the sense that South African music education has been greatly influenced in the past with Western influences. This may account for why music teachers continue to teach Western concepts in the classroom. The study was aiming to follow similar lines of cultural diversity as expressed in the curriculum and it was therefore important to include a range of different experiences in music. A basic profile[23] of the participants, ranged between the ages of 23 and 56, is provided in the table below:

Table C: Basic profile of the participants

Race	Sex	Professional status	Type of school
7 white, 4 black, 1 coloured	3 male, 9 female	10 experienced teachers, 2 student teachers	3 private schools, 8 model C schools, 1 university

---

[23] Fuller more detailed participant profiles are provided in Chapter 5.

Data collection and data analysis

The formulation of open questions indicated an interview style that seemed suitable for the sort of in-depth study I wanted via the discussion of areas of interest. The main method of collecting data was through semi-structured interviews. A looser and more flexible format based on an open-style of interviewing helped me to coalesce the interviewees with the areas for discussion. The qualitative approach taken in this study was the most enriching way towards understanding the complex and multiple ways in which the participants responded to the NCS's values of music. Cousin (2008) provides substantial evidence as to how an inductive approach to analysing data could retain the focus on what is being researched. She advises a dynamic relationship between the data and the literature, reading both components in parallel and noting connections between them along the way. This approach to data collection and data analysis allows for 'sensitizing concepts' (Blumer,1954 cited by Cousin, 2008: 34).

The methods for a reflexive and thoughtful engagement with the data and literature include the following: analysing data whilst gathering it, thinking about what the data is telling me (inductive approach) avoiding over-segmentation of data, keeping memos of reflections and theoretical possibilities (grounded theory) avoiding premature or enforced categorisation of data, exploring disconfirming as well as confirming evidence, not cherry picking quotes to confirm a hypothesis, exploring what the singular and aberrant tell you, thinking about what is said, who says it and how it is said, thinking about language and use of figures of speech and idioms, thinking about the unsaid (silences, pauses) and thinking about my own positionality in the data reporting, its interpretation and its analysis (Cousin, 2008: 35-36).

Cousin advocates provisional analysis of the data as a way of revealing promising leads and suggests different ways to get intimate with the data, such as listening to

the taped interviews, writing and reading field notes, frequent reading of the transcriptions, frequent contemplation of data through discussing findings with colleagues, and inviting them to provide rival interpretations to mine. She suggests coding the text as a way of 'chunking' it (Cousin, 2008: 37-38). Initial coding should tag segments of texts and then should be assigned provisional thematic labels for researcher observations and comments. Examples in my data analysis are:

Table D: Examples of codes

Code	Theme
BACK	family background
EDUC	educational background
VAL	values
ASP	assumptions
TEX	teaching experiences

The process should be on-going with constant revision of old codes and the building of new codes. She suggests identifying 'core categories', and then 'sub-categories' as a way of analysing the data. Using the example of a study on university students going home, she describes a core category as 'adapting to life at home' and two sub-categories as home life being 'boring' and/or 'relaxing' (Cousin, 2008: 39). In my study, one of my core categories emerged as 'rigorous musical training' and two sub-categories as 'stressful' and/or 'rewarding'.

Cousin's work is compatible with Attride-Stirling's (2001) thematic networks and the process of building up themes from basic themes, to organising themes to global themes. Both authors suggest ways to organise the data into manageable units. An alternative to 'chunking' the data as Cousin suggests, Attride-Stirling's method provides for a web-like illustration of how the themes connect to one another and their significance within the text. The example she provides from an analysis of two

focus groups on the cultural representations of nature in Britain (Attride-Stirling, 2001: 394, 397) illustrates the process. A basic theme makes sense of its immediate meaning – 'instincts are complex'. It is then read within the context of other basic themes, such as 'intrinsic needs and drives motivate and compel behaviour', which together, evolve into an organising theme - 'inherent dispositions'. A basic theme that transpired from my analysis was 'experience of African and Western music'. It became connected to a number of other basic themes such as 'musical preferences' and 'attitude towards change'. These themes when connected to one another surfaced an organising theme – 'views on curriculum changes'. Examples of two global themes in this study are 'Perceptions of Western and African music' and 'Views of CAPS'.

Organising themes are made of clusters of similar issues which are more abstract and revealing than basic themes. Lower order themes that have emerged from basic and then organising themes become macro themes that make sense of the different clusters of themes – 'humankind is natural' (Attride-Stirling, 2001: 397). A significant macro theme that materialised from my organising theme of 'views on curriculum changes' was 'music requires effort'. The summary of the main themes constitutes the global themes and help to reveal what the texts are saying at a deeper, more reflective level. This is done via the exploration of the connections between explicit statements and their implicit meanings:

> Thematic networks aim to explore the understanding of an issue or the significance of an idea, rather than to reconcile conflicting definitions of a problem (Attride-Stirling, 2001: 387).

Both Cousin and Attride-Stirling's methods have parallels with grounded theory[24]. There is the coding of text segmentation and labelling that includes concepts,

---

[24] The main divergence with grounded theory was my use of taping and transcribing of interviews. This does not take place in grounded theory as it is considered to be a distraction from the researcher's initial reactions and field notes.

categories and propositions (Corbin and Strauss, 1990) all of which is based on what the participants have said. Manual analysis (rather than computer-generated software coding) of data was possible due to the reasonable size of the sample. This approach aided me to build an in-depth understanding of my data. I was able to obtain a personal feel of the data with all its nuances and subtleties which led to a richer depiction of the research topic. Personalising the data in this way meant that the data gathering and its analysis was not totally neutral. According to Schostack (Schostack, 2006: 68) data can never be regarded as neutral as it is a selective process. My research involved a series of 'moves' that remained fluid throughout the whole research process, as opposed to a more static series of steps and procedures decided before the interviews. This helped me to capture a more 'creative sense of the data' (Cousin, 2008: 32) which I hoped would do justice to the thought my participants had put into answering all my questions.

Approaches to data collection

As mentioned previously the interview style I felt most confident with involved a flexible but structured approach to the topic that flowed as a conversation. I had already experienced the technique of interviewing participants with semi-structured questions in a trial study[25] that I did in 2010. I found that this worked well as a conversational approach to a study that enquired into the nature of enjoyment in learning to play the piano. The trial participants were my students and people I knew well. We were already comfortable in each other's company and looked forward to the idea of discussing 'enjoyment' which had arisen on different occasions in the past although in different contexts. Unlike the trial study, the dissertation study involved people I did not know. I was particularly aware that I could not afford to be too informal in my questioning approach as I wanted to understand as quickly as possible and as much as I could about the participants and their answers, having had little or no prior background information on them.

---

25 The trial study was a coursework requirement for Year 3 of the Ed D programme.

I searched the literature for sources that could suggest the best way of asking questions that could be adapted to the flow of each conversation. I considered what might be the best ways to elicit a useful flow of information from my participants. The keeping of diaries was one option which I rejected on the basis that it was time consuming for my research-cohort as well as being potentially distracting from the spontaneity of the interview process. Focus groups are commonly used in a form of action research where the group is influenced by each other's perspectives (Gibbs, 1997) and where 'The role of the moderator is very significant' (Gibbs, 1997: 1). In my one-to-one interviews my role was not to moderate between various participants but to provide prompts in a conversation between two people. A shared insight was not what I was trying to achieve for two reasons: (1) the geographical spread of the candidates was logistically difficult to manage and (2) my intended research outcome was to understand how participants viewed the music curriculum at the time of their interviews. This is quite different to the research outcomes of focus groups which are achieved through critical reflection and a review of the actions taken by the participants over a range of time and how their views might have changed (Dick, 2002).

My research conversations with the participants during the research interviews aimed to be of a flexible nature by asking some deliberately imprecise questions in order to access their thoughts in some depth about the topic. Quite often the inexact wording of the questions stimulated the participant to answer in an unexpected direction. The design of my interviews allowed me the flexibility to follow that direction and ask more precise questions to gather the information that the participant was offering to share with me. In designing the semi-structured interview format, I followed recommendations made by Cousin (Cousin, 2008: 71-92) where she suggests the formulations of moves rather than a strict order of precisely worded questions. The interviewer takes a reflexive stance by developing a conversational style where the quality of conversation could elicit some in-depth reflections on the research topic.

The formulation of moves started with about forty questions that helped me think through what it was that I wanted to know about my research candidates. These questions asked teachers about their backgrounds, their attitudes to Western and African music and how they taught music in their classrooms. A discussion about these questions with my supervisors showed that some of them were more relevant than others. For instance, there was one question that asked how many concerts the teacher attended and what type of concerts they were. It occurred to me that this would not contribute any meaningful data as no valid conclusions could be drawn between the numbers and types of concerts attended to a teacher's allegiance to Western or African music. A more relevant question was what sort of early music training the teacher had. The answer from this question would help in understanding how and what they taught in the classroom. Further questions related to values and beliefs could help ascertain if the teacher was willing to extend his/her knowledge and get to know aspects of the music curricula that might not be familiar to him/her. These probes would enable me to find out if a teacher was willing to take on some of the changes in music education implied in the NCS. I banded a reduced number of questions (appendix 4) under headings which later evolved into the teachers' themes mentioned above.

Cousin explains how trustworthiness in a semi-structured interview can be gauged through various means (Cousin, 2008: 78-79). These include defending the choice and number of interviewees (sampling); asking questions that prompt more than information-seeking answers; avoiding cherry picking quotes to make simplistic assumptions about the data; keeping a research diary that contain reflections that explore the subtleties of the conversations – these include non-linguistic communication; keeping to the agreed topic; exploring rival interpretations of your work (through colleagues and/or supervisors); sharing emerging ideas with the interviewees; complementing interview technique with a 'scholarly understanding of the field' (Cousin, 2008: 84) and making sure that interview settings are accessible and comfortable. I followed these recommendations and found them useful.

A field note book accompanied me during the interviews. In it I jotted down key phrases or bits of information that highlighted particular aspects of the conversations that caught my attention. Sometimes, a facial expression or an animated body movement flagged up a key moment for me and I would note this with the use of capital letters in my notes. I would later read my notes with the view to extracting an initial thematic network from these early impressions. These points of interest gave rise to further discussions in the second interview. Often, my questioning in the second interview was guided by these 'clues' and participants were given the chance to expand on topics of particular interest to them. This approach led to rich data collection.

Given the complexities of racial subjugation in South Africa's history it was an important aspect of the study to recruit a variety of voices in my study and to profile them in an acceptable manner. Whilst it was not my intention to represent a complete variety of music teachers in this small study, it was my intention to select key sources of variation to add depth and plausibility to my analysis (Cousin, 2008: 80). I was mindful of ethical considerations when undertaking a description of my participants. I did not want to provoke or hurt my participants many of whom had experienced racial segregation during apartheid. In order to minimise the risk of labelling people and to preserve their sense of dignity and self-esteem, I decided to give the participants the option to describe themselves. All of them did so willingly and without any hesitation. They intuitively understood the importance to state their racial background due to the multi-ethnic nature of the research topic.

I also had to bear in mind that the interview content was likely to contain sensitive material in the form of questions and observations from the participants and me. Their different backgrounds caused in part by their different educational experiences as well as other factors within the culturally influenced pre- and post-apartheid politics and music policies could resurrect memories of things they might rather forget. At the outset of their first interviews, I made it clear that

participants were to let me know if there was anything they did not want to discuss or respond to. I am most grateful to all of them for engaging in conversations that were open and honest and without prejudice toward any parties. At no point did anyone exhibit signs of distress. Participants were made aware of the steps I took to follow best practice[26] with regard to protecting their identity. Although they were not unduly concerned about anonymity I explained to them that they would remain anonymous during the recruitment phase and in the dissertation where I implemented the use of pseudonyms.

Chapter Five investigates the first two research questions by providing an analysis of the data gathered about participants' own musical training and their views on African and Western music. The information they provide enabled me to draw conclusions on what they thought about the new curriculum's goals, aims and purposes and their views on valuing both African and Western music and to understand if they have an allegiance to a particular genre of music.

1   How has the participants' own musical education contributed to their views on the goals, aims and purposes of the new curriculum?

2   a) Given their own musical education, how do they perceive the requirement to accommodate and value African as well as Western music?

    b) Do they have a particular allegiance to African or Western music?

---

[26] Exemplars of Plain Language Statement and Consent Form in appendices 2 and 3.

Chapter Five
Teachers' journeys that
influenced their views of music teaching

From music student to music teacher

The interviews describe the journeys teachers have undertaken during their lives, with particular reference to their own musical education. Their personal narratives and stories have resulted in the collection of rich data that have been the foundation for the data analysis in Chapters Five and Six. These two chapters will be largely descriptive in order to convey the complexity of what the participants are saying in their own voices. The way in which teachers discuss their perceptions of key issues that emerge from the study suggests that they are shaped by their experiences as young pupils of music, young adult university music undergraduates, and mature adult music professionals. Their engagement with this doctoral study reveals deep thought and reflection about the different issues surrounding the South African music curricula. Teachers shared personal information with me in their first interviews. Table E below provides an extended profile of the 12 participants in this study to assist readers in getting a sense of who the teachers are. All the teachers saw themselves as music professionals in several roles. In all cases, they came from homes that supported their musical studies and encouraged them as students to engage in serious extra-curricular activities such as playing in bands, orchestras and other types of music ensembles and or singing in choirs. This led them to view music as a career and to study music at University.

Table E: Extended profile of the participants
(listed in chronological order of their interviews)

Race	Sex and age	Professional status	Current type of school
Charlotte: white South African (English origin)	Female, 50	Experienced teacher, policy writer, conductor, accompanist	Private School
Niles: white South African (Norwegian origin)	Male, 58	Experienced teacher, conductor, double bass player, pianist accompanist, performer	Private School
George: white South African (Afrikaans)	Male, 39	Experienced teacher, pianist, singer, text book writer, conductor, accompanist	Ex-Model C School
Adriana: black South African (Zimbabwean origin)	Female, 24	Student teacher, pianist, flautist	Ex-Model C School
Katy: black South African	Female, 42	Experienced teacher, policy writer, text book writer, composer, trumpeter, pianist, performer, arranger	Private School
Rosalind: white South African (English origin)	Female, 49	Experienced teacher, accompanist, singer, violinist, clarinettist, composer, arranger	Private School
Nathalie: black South African	Female, 26	Student teacher, pianist, clarinettist	Ex-Model C School
Tracey: white South African (Afrikaans)	Female, 50	Experienced teacher, accompanist, pianist, organist, singer, arranger, conductor	Ex-Model C School
Iris: white South African (English and German origin)	Female, 42	Experienced teacher, performer, singer, pianist, accompanist, arranger, conductor	Private School
Roland: white South African (English origin)	Male, 33	Experienced teacher, accompanist and conductor	Ex-Model C School
Lily: Cape Coloured South African (mixed race)	Female, 54	Experienced teacher, pianist, recorder player, accompanist, arranger	University Lecturer
Mary: black South African	Female, 42	Experienced teacher, policy writer, examiner, inspector, euphonium player, pianist, trumpeter, clarinettist	Department of Education

Experiences of learning music

All the teachers studied Western music and spoke of the hard work they put into learning their instruments. They all agreed that Western instruments were difficult to master and required longevity of study. Niles (aged 58) studied music privately from the age of seven, initially, with his older sisters who were all music teachers. He took music as an extra-curricular activity outside school time:

> I had private lessons because the school that I was at didn't offer music as a subject. So I had individual piano lessons and I had individual theory which included harmony, history and that. I had that for which my parents had to pay extra and I did it as a subject which was very successful (Niles, Interview 1, 2011: 2).

As a schoolboy, he toured locally and overseas with orchestras, both as a double bass player and a solo pianist. Niles took his undergraduate Bachelor of Music (BMUS) degree at the University of Cape Town and described his four year Honours course[27] as 'dealing only with Western Music' (Niles, Interview 1, 2011: 4). He views learning Western instrumental technique as 'very hard work' and the reason why many students avoid it (Interview 2, 2011: 14). According to him, Western orchestral playing requires 'learning an instrument, which is very difficult' (Interview 2, 2011: 3). He enjoyed playing the piano in a chamber ensemble and playing double bass in an orchestra but went on to study commerce after leaving school at 18. A defining moment for him was 'at a symphony concert I decided that this was not for me what I was doing, and I was going to study music' (Interview 1, 2011: 3). Since then, Niles has been a professional music teacher working in various private schools, currently in his 19th year as Head of Music at a well-known Johannesburg Girls' school.

---

[27] South African universities offer a fourth 'Honours' year for high achieving undergraduates who intend graduating with Honours.

Adriana (aged 24) learnt music as part of the school curriculum and explains that her music teachers favoured 'mostly Western music' (Adriana, Interview 1, 2011: 3). At the time of interview she was studying at the University of the Witwatersrand in Johannesburg towards a Bachelor of Education degree in which music was one of her major subjects. She says that when learning to play the flute she had to adhere to the written score which contrasted with the aural approach she took to learning the marimba.

> I think, look, with regard to the marimba it was more, it was, we were told you need to feel the music. You need to feel the music, perhaps move to the music as well. So it was more of a play by the ear kind of thing, whereas with the flute it was more like you need to read it and you need to practice and this is how it is. You know, it's fixed, you know (Adriana, Interview 1, 2011: 4).

Adriana views rigour as an attribute of Western music and freedom as a characteristic of African music. She explains: 'it was actually quite a transition from playing the marimba to be given the opportunity to play the flute', because in African music, mistakes 'would somehow still fit in' unlike in Western music where the teacher would make her repeat and correct the music (Adriana, Interview 1, 2011: 4-53).

Both Adriana and Niles describe differences they perceive in Western and African music. They clearly regard Western music skills as difficult to acquire with rigid rules that need to be followed rigorously. This impression is supported by the majority view expressed by the teachers in this study that African music is simpler to learn because it is emotionally freer and more forgiving as a discipline - with less emphasis on accuracy and more emphasis on participation and fun. This has led to my understanding that teachers view music education as being part of an imagined continuum: Western music is seen as strict at the start of the continuum and African music as flexible at the other end of the same continuum. This position is further developed by the teachers who at times see this simple bi-polar perception

as problematic particularly when they discuss the skills needed for Western-trained teachers to teach non-Western music in response to curriculum demands for diversity of curriculum content.

George (aged 37) studied Western music both at school and at the University of Potchestroom where he obtained his Bachelor of Music (B Mus) degree. He successfully passed external Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) graded music examinations[28] by obtaining Grades VIII for piano and Grade VI for theory and recorder. He played the church organ from the age of fourteen. He likens his undergraduate B Mus life to being part of a 'fundamentalist sect' where students were expected to exactly replicate what was written and be a 'slave to the script' (George, Interview 1, 2011: 14-15). He was forced to 'spend hours and hours on Chopin Etudes. It was so difficult' (Interview 1, 2011: 16). The strictness of Western training left him little room for creativity and he describes how he 'unlearned' to spontaneously harmonise at the piano when he was doing his B Music degree:

At school I took great pleasure in listening to something on the radio, try it on the piano, figure it out, the harmonies, making my own accompaniment and in the four years, five years of full time music study, I have unlearned this. I couldn't do it anymore (George, Interview 1, 2011: 15).

George's positioning of Western music training illustrates his view that it is time consuming, painful and stifles creativity. His university experiences resulted in him feeling constrained in his artistic freedom and it appears that for him Western Art Music (WAM) is restrictive. Despite this outlook, George continues to teach Western music to his pupils who take music as an extra-curricular examination subject. He prepares them for Western external examinations and is rigorous in his approach.

---

[28] The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) examinations start from Grade I and progress through till Grade VIII.

The complexity that arises from this paradox is an important feature of the participants' debate between the virtues of teaching and learning African and Western music. I propose that the participants' musical identity based on their training and experiences might be responsible for their allegiance to a particular type of music.

Charlotte (aged 50) comes from a family of musicians. She describes going to the library as a child and learning to read music from borrowed books as there were limited family funds for private music lessons. She and her family performed as folk band members in pubs, (public houses) to earn extra money. As an undergraduate she went to The Trinity College of Music in London, UK and learnt about four-part harmony and other rules of theory (Charlotte, Interview 1, 2011: 32). She explains that her training was 'very good hands-on experience… a very broad, a very practical training' (Interview 1, 2011: 4) which prepared her to teach in a large and multiculturally diverse classroom in London:

> I used to have big classes of 42, teaching music, and the demographic in that class it was very interesting. In every single (music) class there were 38 West Indian children, two Indian and two white children and I never felt anything about it… then I suddenly realized that no one spoke English… and I think through that (experience) that I was always interested in multicultural education (Charlotte, Interview 1, 2011: 4-5).

For Charlotte, identifying styles of Western music 'demands quite a lot of knowledge' and in her current role as a South African music teacher she finds that music appreciation experienced by her pupils in the form of essay writing requires '…higher order thinking' (Charlotte, Interview 1, 2011: 36). She also believes that African music is not being pushed enough in most schools:

> I think that unfortunately the role of African music is not pushed enough in schools, because you're still working with teachers who have not gone

through that system and they still want to promote traditional Western music (Charlotte, Interview 1, 2011: 37).

Tracey (aged 50), was 'born into a family of music teachers' and studied music at the University of The Free State. She is a church organist, pianist and singer. Her early musical recollections are expressed with fondness:

> ...in the old days we didn't have any TV or anything and I remember as a little child lying in bed at my grandmother's house and my mom was one of twins and they used to sing and I just lay in the bed and listened to them singing and playing the piano. So actually I was born into it and whenever I can think about music, it was there in our house. But mostly classical music. (Tracey, Interview 1, 2011: 1).

As a student of music, Tracey found learning Western music '...quite hard, if I can say. In the old days they used to hit you with a stick or something on your hands if your hands wasn't properly held' (Tracey, Interview 1, 2011: 1-4). She regards herself as 'classically trained' (Interview 1, 2011: 3) and took a Bachelor of Music Education (B Mus Ed) which she describes as 'the education degree into teaching music' (Tracey, Interview 1, 2011: 3) at the University of the Free State where she was given the chance to expand on her musical competences:

> We had a lot of subjects which was piano and we had to have another instrument and I first tried the clarinet... I moved to the church organ, which I loved, because I'm more a pianist, and I adored that. I sang in the choir there. And then we had harmony, music history, education, we've got music science[29], a lot of subjects, counterpoint and ear training' (Tracey, Interview 1, 2011: 2).

---

[29] Music science refers to the pedagogy of classroom music.

She comments on how there was little concern for her well-being as a student:

> I'm more relaxed with my students that I was with my tutors in those days. I just came in and just played and dare if you play something wrong... I practiced hard and I did my thing and I did good... As a pianist and teacher it was very good, but my personal wellbeing was not so important in those days (Tracey, Interview 1, 2011: 5).

Nathalie (aged 24) came from a family where she and her sister studied music in a music centre for black school children in Soweto. Music and singing has been a part of her life since she was a small child: 'Music has always been a part of let's say my culture and I've been told that I've been singing every day since I was young' (Nathalie, Interview 1, 2011: 1). She started playing the recorder because it was the cheapest Western instrument her parents could afford to buy for her. She then went on to having clarinet lessons with a self-taught music teacher from the Soweto music centre and describes her first lesson as being 'informal': 'My first lesson was in a car... I was given the clarinet and then I was asked to go get the reed for the clarinet' (Interview 1, 2011: 9).

Here, Nathalie is expressing her cultural identity through music. The informality of African music has encouraged her to express herself as an African in daily life. By contrast, her parents had to invest more directly in her Western music lessons by purchasing an instrument. There is once again a sense that Western music demands more of its learners than African music. The divide between the two musics is quite strongly portrayed by Nathalie. Notwithstanding this, the differences outlined by the participants between Western and African music can be read as highlighting richness of diversity rather than as an interpretation of a set of particular values and beliefs that might be identified as African or Western.

Katy (aged 44) studied music from the age of 9, in Soweto and in a music centre for black students. Her father encouraged her and her siblings to play in a Soweto brass band. She describes how music '...instilled discipline in me. The discipline of practicing, you know, you've got to do that on your own' (Katy, Interview 1, 2011: 2). She describes music as being 'tough' for her because it was taught by white teachers who taught Western music that she was unfamiliar with and she worried that her early training in Western music would alienate her from her community:

> So where am I going to play this (Western) music?... I was also worried that the community might reject me for playing this music, because it is the kind of music that they don't understand (Katy, Interview 1, 2011: 13).

Katy had mixed feelings about her study of Western music and her identity as a person.

> I just loved making music. And during that time (apartheid) in our communities we were regarded as white people you know. We were regarded as smart you know, because it was very, very rare that you find a black person playing an instrument... others would call us little black-white people, something like that. But it didn't bother us. My father would way, "I mean really, they're jealous because they're not doing that (Western music) (Katy, Interview 1, 2011: 11).

At the University of the Witwatersrand, Katy studied 'classical piano and classical trumpet' and described her experiences of learning Western music in a diploma course as 'not easy' because 'we were not even familiar with those (Baroque and Romantic) styles periods... it was the first time I did history of Western music' (Katy, Interview 1, 2011: 12) and comments that 'by the time I completed, I got the whole grasp of different styles' (Interview 1, 2011: 13). She then entered an undergraduate music degree at the University of Natal where she was drawn to jazz music because she felt it would be more familiar to her. To her surprise this was not the case:

> So I remember my first year in the jazz class wasn't easy at all. I remember I was so frustrated that I felt like quitting… I used my classical background a little bit so that I helped me to understand this music (Katy, Interview 1, 2011: 14).

Rosalind (aged 49) started playing the piano at the age of four with her musically competent parents. She also learnt to play the violin, clarinet, took composition classes as well as singing lessons at school and went on to study her Bachelor of Music degree, with singing as her major subject, at the University of the Witwatersrand. Her teachers both at school and university helped her to get a good grounding in the 'five basics: history, form, harmony, counterpoint and practical music' and she remembers practicing three hours a day for her Grade 8 piano examination (Rosalind, Interview 1, 2011: 3). Rosalind attributes the confidence she acquired as a singer to the 'stage exposure (that) changed my character immensely from introvert to fairly extrovert' (Interview 1, 2011: 3). She passed her licentiate in singing in 2000 and explains why it took so much time: 'that is what happens when you raise children, work, and study at the same time. It takes a long time to finish' (Interview 1, 2011: 4). Her approach to teaching classroom music is based on singing:

> Of course being a singer and knowing that most children, especially young children, really take to singing, they love it, a lot of what I do with primary school is connected with singing or with the songs they sing – I use that as a basis for the next thing, for things like aural training and many, many, many things (Rosalind, Interview 1, 2011: 5).

Iris (aged 45), grew up in a musical 'half German and half English' home, where singing and piano playing was a happy family activity which led to her life-long passion for music: 'Music is my life. It's been part of my life, every single day of my life' (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 3) and she describes how important it is to her:

I always did music in the afternoons (after school) and played the piano, it was a great source of comfort and passion and I don't think there was ever a time when I wasn't playing the piano. Every single day of my life, apart from if I was really ill. And I remember going away on holiday and being away from my piano for ten whole days and being quite bereaved because I couldn't play my piano' (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 3).

Iris went to the University of Pretoria and studied towards her Bachelor of Music (B Mus) Performing Arts. She did singing and organ and 'all the basic stuff like harmony and counterpoint, aural music history and performance' (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 6) and describes her training as 'predominantly Western' (Interview 1, 2011: 8). At the same time as her B Mus Iris simultaneously passed a Bachelor of Arts Education (BA Ed) which is where she discovered indigenous music in her fourth year through a course in ethnomusicology (Interview 1, 2011: 8). She explains that this course was 'extremely interesting and I must say, that really did shape the way I saw indigenous music and world music' (Interview 1, 2011: 9). She expands on her understanding of indigenous music: 'Indigenous, the peoples of this African continent. For example, the San and the Nguni and these people' (Interview 1, 2011: 9). World music is described as 'Western Art music' and 'traditional music, for example, the music of South America or the music of China or the music of Australia. Their traditional music' (Interview 1, 2011: 9).

I find it interesting that Iris' knowledge of ethnomusicology has led her to separate music into apparently straight-forward categories. Perhaps she was offering definitions of the terms of 'indigenous music', 'Western Art Music', 'world music' and 'traditional music' in a bid to clarify the distinctions between them and classify them in a way I might understand in the interview-situation. Discussing the terms in this way highlights the difficulties of striving to be clear and unambiguous when discussing diverse musics. Clearly, Iris' practical and theoretical knowledge of WAM surpasses her understanding of African music. To this end her Western expertise gained over many years of study might account for her views on music education which are explored more fully in Chapter Six.

Roland (aged 34), was diagnosed with epilepsy which adversely affected his primary school years. His neurologist suggested that he started learning to play a musical instrument to help overcome his disability. He was 7 years old when he began to play the piano and at the age of 10 reached the level of Grade IV external music examinations. His first teacher was very strict and his early lessons were 'unpleasant'. As his technique developed, the lessons with the same teacher 'became nicer, a more pleasant experience' (Roland, Interview 1, 2011: 4). His first piano teacher "… used to hit me with a long green knitting needle… (but) she grew to like me" (Roland, Interview 1, 2011: 5). Eventually, Roland's had two piano teachers – one that taught technique and the other who developed and expanded his repertoire of piano music. His mother approved of this regime and never allowed Roland to miss his piano lessons:

> My mom was quite strict and stoic in her view on raising children and discipline… by about Grade 4 I could play the piano… I remember being 10 and remember being asked to play, I think in the music room at school, and I think was praised for it by the teacher and encouraged by the children… I had two piano teachers essentially. My mom really felt that it was good just to go to both' (Roland, Interview 1, 2011: 3-5).

Roland studied at the University of the Witwatersrand (WITS) with his main practical subjects being piano and singing, and obtained his B Mus qualification. He describes his degree as 'plain' incorporating aspects of Western classical history, harmony and counterpoint. For his teacher training component, Roland took a course in 'music method' which:

> …opened up my eyes to just a bigger world as far as teaching music and experiencing music and learning music. I think our repertoire for choir was 90% African, which was wonderful. So that was a complete swing from one extreme to the other (Roland, Interview 1, 2011: 7).

Again, there is evidence of the imagined continuum I referred to earlier between Western and African music. Roland refers to the two musics as extremes of one another and also appears to refer to the plainness of Western music knowledge and pedagogy as compared to the exoticism of African music. This view pre-supposes that African and Western music have got distinctive identities. Arguably this is not the case: the diversity of the different music genres listed in the current South African music curriculum (CAPS, 2011) attests to the overlap of music genres in terms of intersecting geographical locations and cultural influences – a case in point being Jazz music which contains many different influences.

He approved of certain topics in the music method course such as African drumming and the way 'combinations or patterns of rhythm' were taught for classroom practice. However, he was not as convinced that the teaching of piano, guitar and recorder were as relevant to his students: 'We had to do recorder, which we know is the instrument of Satan' (Roland, Interview 1, 2011: 8). Roland took a Master's degree following his B Mus and was introduced to African music where he was immersed into 'a whole ceremony of music making and dancing' (Interview 1, 2011: 13). He describes African ritual as 'married to the music and ceremony' and felt 'obligated' to participate in the experience:

> A proper African drumming ceremony where a cow will be slaughtered or an ox will be slaughtered and some of the, some blood will be used to bless the drums (Roland, Interview 1, 2011: 13).

The colourful and evocative imagery of Roland's experiences of African music is in sharp contrast to the sterile way in which he depicts his Western musical training. His descriptions seem to underlie tension between his feelings for the two different musical cultural experiences.

Lily (aged 49) experienced long hours of practice. She was nine years old when she had her first piano lessons from nuns. This led to her taking music as a matriculation subject in her final years at school and getting a place at the University of the Western Cape in 1976.

> I put a lot of effort, I had to put a lot of practice and effort. I had to be disciplined, I had to balance my schoolwork and my piano music. It was a separate subject that I took' (Lily, Interview 2, 2011: 26).

Lily also refers to the great effort and hard work required to learn 'piano music' and her comments contribute to the theme emerging from the interviews that learning Western music is both arduous and rewarding. Lily graduated with a Bachelor of Arts (BA Mus) Music degree. She describes her degree as a combination of practical and theoretical studies that included theory and history of music and music education. She reached Grade VIII practical piano during this time with recorder as her second instrumental study. Her course was 'mainly Western art music' and 'all music that we learned was based on European, classical music' which she taught in her teaching practice, part of her second year (Lily, Interview 1, 2011: 4-5). Lily recalls her 'performance class' at University which involved preparing concert pieces to be performed in front of an audience:

> We performed in front of all the music students in the department. So it was a performance class and we were also marked… each student had the opportunity to display their technical abilities and their developmental status in preparation for the exam (Lily, Interview 1, 2011: 4).

Her experience with class music was based on mainly 'European classical music' although she remembers having a small element of South African music in her pedagogy course:

> Well we studied Bach, Baroque, all the Baroque period composers, Bach Handel, Vivaldi, Telemann. The classical period: Mozart, Beethoven, all the classical composers. Romantic composers: Chopin, Liszt, Schubert, Wagner. And then we went onto the Impressionists, Debussy, Ravel, and modern composers, Tchaikovsky, et cetera. Then in our school music I remember we did refer to the FAK[30] bundle, a South African composed songbook at the time (Lily, Interview 1, 2011: 5).

Mary (aged 42) started to learn music at the age of 10. She and her siblings attended lessons at a music centre in Soweto during apartheid when separate education systems existed for black, coloured and white people.

> It was one of the two places where black people could actually go and learn music during that time (apartheid) and those were difficult times' (Mary, Interview 1, 2011: 6).

She joined the junior brass band of Soweto as a euphonium player and 'fell in love with that instrument' (Mary, Interview 1, 2011: 8). She also studied other instruments such as the piano, the trumpet and clarinet. Mary's father was the driving force behind her music lessons and was keen for his children to become competent musicians. He was a strict disciplinarian and insisted on excellence. Mary took ABRSM examinations and obtained a Grade V in piano and Grade VIII in theory. She particularly enjoyed the group participation of playing in a band and orchestra and refers to the piano as a 'lonely instrument because you play on your own most of the time' (Interview 1, 2011: 16). Mary's training was 'Western' and she found it difficult to grasp Western concepts at school and at university where she took lessons in counterpoint, technique and form, general musicianship, history, music education and two instruments including piano (Interview 1, 2011: 47). Her difficulties ranged from not understanding the accents of her lecturers to not comprehending musical concepts (Interview 1, 2011: 43).

---

[30] *FAK sangbundel* is a well-known Afrikaans compendium of South African music.

The participants continuously emphasis the hardship and struggle they experienced when learning Western music – I can only surmise that they may not have had the experiences of learning non-Western music which by virtue of their complex musical structures (Indian ragas for example) imply similar levels of difficulty for the learner. I cannot attribute their perceptions to alienation from WAM due to cultural differences: the mix of participants' cultural backgrounds is diverse, signifying that WAM cannot be positioned as being outside of their social and cultural settings. Certainly, the way in which most participants refer to WAM as a site of individualised struggle is striking particularly when contrasted with the language used to describe African music. However, I would not go as far as attributing this difference to one genre of music offering a distinctive connection with humanity as does Nzewi (1999).

In Chapter Two I offered Nzewi's view that African music is human-centred (Nzewi, 1999). He appears to suggest that humanness in music is a particular, perhaps exclusive, characteristic of African music – a view I disagree with. There are many examples in Western music that connect music to societal events and to what it means to be human in emotional and psychological terms. Most poignantly for me is Shostakovich's tragic 5th Symphony, written in 1937. It effectively captures and communicates the composer's despair and fear of the ruling party headed by Stalin during the 1930's. Nzewi describes African music as never finished and a work in progress terms (1999: 84). The 5th Symphony was revised by Shostakovich and in that sense could be described as a work in progress. The Russian authorities forced the composer to make the music less gloomy and intense in order to portray a more joyous Soviet personality. He did this whilst still maintaining an ambiguous sensibility throughout the symphony. This example shows a shared perception between African music and Western music at a deeper level where both musics can be regarded as having 'ordered conceptual bases' (1999: 73).

Perceptions of African and Western music

The teachers explain that Western music requires certain abilities: to read music, to understand a variety of styles, be able to analyse musical form, practice long hours over many years to acquire high standards of instrumental technique and have the discipline to undertake formal individual assessments. By contrast, they believe that students of African music should be able to: memorise rhythms and melodies, improvise and harmonise, participate in groups (irrespective of levels of individual ability), perform spontaneously and with enthusiasm in order to convey the excitement and fun of the music, be informally assessed and share success within a group setting. Teachers have formed the impression that Western music has a rigorous and inflexible aspect to it. Adriana finds Western music to be about 'note values…musical notation and timing' (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 32) and that qualified music teachers might be more comfortable teaching this type of content: 'I'm saying that qualified music teachers are trained to primarily teach in one way' (Interview 2, 2011: 33). She mentions that colleagues on her course find this type of content difficult to grasp and pass on to their students. Even after reading the new curriculum and making extensive notes on its purposes to include African music in lesson content, she concludes that is unclear:

> It is not a straightforward document. It has not been simplified enough for a person to say, you know what, I understand this and I am going to take this and I am going to apply it to my classroom (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 38).

Teachers make constant reference to the 'simplicity' of African music which they discuss in different ways. For George, the 'simplicity' of African music contributes to a 'richness and joy from life' (George, Interview 2, 2011: 17) in rural African communities, where there are many 'uneducated people'.

The critical issue that emerges in this positioning of WAM, is a tendency to assume that it is a knowledge system that is quite different to IAM. Such a tendency can be related to a post-colonial outlook within a broader context where the dominance of Western knowledge and the marginalisation of subjugated people has become challenged. Seen in this way, the context is one of marginalised people having had their cultures degraded and considered inferior in a process known as 'othering', (discussed in Chapter Two). Throughout this chapter, participants explicitly speak about the differences they perceive in African and Western music. It seems to me that a long history of subjugation, particularly in the South African context, may have inadvertently influenced some of the impressions that have been noted in this study, in terms of – perhaps unconsciously positioning IAM as different and 'other' (more exotic, freer, simpler than WAM).

This sense of IAM as fundamentally distinctive to WAM come through in George's statements. George believes that African music cannot be appreciated or respected as directed by the curriculum (NCS extract, appendix 1) because 'we have a problem there of things not being documented and I think something can be done about that' (Interview 2, 2011: 27). Here George is referring to the difficulty of obtaining notated musical scripts. He approves of the curriculum's aims to "equip learners with knowledge and understanding of musics of the world" 'ja, just listen to things you would not listen to… it's spot on' (Interview 2, 2011: 27). However, he explains that the simplicity of indigenous music contrasts with the complexity of Western music and gives rise to the question: 'How do we get this richness on the one side and this simpleness on the other side? Maybe one has to try and find a balance' (Interview 2, 2011: 16-17).

The lack of notation is another aspect of African music that is commented on by the participants. Tracey finds that African music lends itself to improvisation and that it can 'borrow' Western harmonies to enhance the music (Tracey, Interview 2, 2011: 21). Because of its improvisatory character, African music is not often notated and

she sees that indigenous music is disadvantaged without a method to preserve and disseminate it. Tracey's impression of African music is that it is 'folk' music, aurally transmitted and 'simple' in structure:

> The chord structure of the African music is so simple… coming from a Western classical trained background, doing my B Mus degree, it's too easy…you can't go into it that deep to look for any harmonic things, modulations or chord structure or, you know, the theory kind of things. It's simple (Tracey, Interview 2, 2011: 17).

My own view is that the alleged simpleness of African music under-estimates the particular knowledge that is needed to perform it in an authentic and convincing way. As a Western-trained music teacher I know that I am incapable of giving instruction in African music purely because I do not possess the different knowledge and expertise needed to do this.

She believes that the gap between African music and Western Baroque music is challenging for learners because 'you see, it's just the difference, the gap is so big' (Tracey, Interview 2, 2011: 17). One way to close the gap and for the two musics to 'come closer together' is for African music to be 'written down' and 'promoted' (Interview 2, 2011: 20). In Tracey's view this would make African music as important in the syllabus as other musics and encourage students to 'borrow' from Western harmonies (Interview 2, 2011: 21-22) resulting in 'black students… (fusing) the folk music with the Western music' (Interview 2, 2011: 23). For Tracey it would appear that African music needs to be formalised in a way that makes it a legitimate component of the music curriculum. The 'gap' that she refers to is one that is caused by the lack of literacy in African music. In the constructivist nature of outcomes-based education (OBE) that underpins South African education policy, the shifting nature of knowledge is promoted. Therefore, it is difficult for me to

endorse the view that Western music literacy is an accepted and unchanging measure for mastering musical skills.

Charlotte's comments below are insightful because she challenges the assumptions of African music being regarded as 'simple'. Charlotte acknowledges that since arriving in South Africa over thirty years ago she appreciates that:

> There is a complexity about it, (African music), that I wasn't previously aware of… in the form… also in the figurations of it and things like that (Charlotte, Interview 2, 2011: 26).

Charlotte views some African instruments as difficult to master; she identifies the Umugabo Bow (African hunting bow played as a musical instrument) and the Zimbabwean Mbira (African thumb harp), as 'very difficult to play' (Charlotte, Interview 2, 2011: 29).

Adriana agrees:

> With regard to the thumb harp, it's a little bit different. It's because it is almost like playing the piano. A lot of practice is perhaps needed for that. (Adriana, Interview 1, 2011: 20).

Katy's view is that the notation of African music with its complex rhythms and overtones is 'very difficult to capture' (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 11) and that there is much to learn from indigenous music practitioners in the community about technique (Interview 2, 2011: 26). There is a belief shared by the teachers that African music requires a strong sense of rhythm which is inherent in black African students (Rosalind, Interview 1, 2011: 24): 'I don't think we have the rhythm and the innate ability that African people generally do' (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 35).

African music is seen as an inexpensive way of introducing music into underfunded schools. Roland explains that African music is taught in Ex-model C schools because these better resourced government schools use cheap African percussion instruments 'because its successful and it's catching' (Roland, Interview, 2, 2011: 21). Mary also discusses the issue of resources. Western music resources are easily available whilst African music teaching and learning material 'lacks quality' (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 28). She believes that this shortcoming gives African music the reputation of being 'inferior' to Western music (Interview 2, 2011: 24). Furthermore, she explains that teachers in schools that do not have music departments attempt to teach non-Western music when they are not knowledgeable about it. This causes a large gap in knowledge which makes it difficult for their students to take music as a matriculation subject in the last two years of schooling. Whilst the NCS gives guidance for content in music lessons from primary through to high school, the reality for Mary as a school music inspector is that the music policy is generally not being enacted in the classroom:

> What's happening in class is not what I'm being given here in the files you know. It's not reflected. What I'm given in the files is different from what's happening in class (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 20).

Niles speaks about attitudes in terms of personal preference. He states that 'white people actually get tired of the black music' (Niles, Interview 2, 2011: 12) mainly because of what he sees as its repetitive quality which is an extension of the description of simplicity in African music discussed by the teachers. He also observes that because African music is played in a group it makes it less demanding on an individual (Interview 2, 2011: 15). From a musical perspective it is not entirely clear what Niles means by this last observation. In his interviews he speaks about the integrity of Western orchestral performances which concern musicians playing in a group. He infers in his comments that come later in this chapter that it is the high standard of his orchestral training that gave him the various opportunities to perform as an orchestral player overseas – one that he regarded as

an honour and a coveted position as a schoolboy. It may be that he regards African group music as less demanding on participants because of his early personal experiences that were restricted to Western ensemble performances.

Katy's position is quite different. She feels that African music is complex but because there is 'no structure' to analyse it, people think of it as being simple. She believes that deeper analysis would reveal the intricacies that lie within the music – such as complex rhythmic structures and quarter tones. For her African music would improve if black people wrote about black music policy: 'White people are still writing (about black music), and unfortunately most of the time they write crap' (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 19). Katy's vehement view on who writes South African music policy is an extension of the differences that participants perceive between African and Western music – principally the teachers comment on musical structure which in African music is regarded simultaneously regarded as simplistic because of its repetitive nature as well as considered complex due to cross-rhythms and sliding tones that are difficult to notate. It could therefore be said that African music is being positioned as a radically different actuality to Western music. Furthermore, Katy is convinced that the racial identity of policy writers is of paramount importance to insightful and meaningful writing about music education in this country. Her position disrupts the general tone of curriculum documents that cite constitutional aims for a united and homogenous South African population. Such an aim becomes problematic since policy texts (in particular CAPS, 2011) refer to a number of different genres of African music suggests that the term 'indigenous music' might be more suited to being referred to in the plural – 'indigenous musics'.

Of course, as I noted earlier in Chapter 2, the issue of using the term indigenous is not unproblematic. Speaking of indigenous music(s) raises the issue of whether there should be 'legitimation' or 'validation' of indigenous music, something that Horsthemke (2004: 33) considers as 'completely misguided'. His view relates particularly to his critique of indigenous knowledge which he states is often

'unquestioningly employed as an umbrella concept to cover practices, skills customs, worldviews, perceptions as well as theoretical and factual understandings' (Horsthemke, 2008: 134). As such, the term fails to adequately consider what is meant by the knowledge 'beyond the sense of practice or skill' (Horsthemke, 2008: 135). For Horsthemke, indigenous skill or indigenous practices are more legitimate terms, but the term indigenous knowledge risks cultural relativism (Horsthemke, 2008). I have mentioned earlier in this dissertation that I argue for an overarching conception of musical knowledge that transcends genres and resists relativism. I would also agree that legitimation or validation of different expressions of musical knowledge is not appropriate. Indeed, the South African curriculum does not support the position that one type of music is superior to another, leaving some forms of music requiring additional validation. The message reinforced in CAPS (2011) is that the virtues of diverse musics should be recognised. However, some music teachers in my study appear to be inadvertently interpreting the oral tradition of African music to be less demanding on learners and the unspoken suggestion is therefore that IAM is, in some way, less robust as a knowledge system than is WAM.

The teachers' personal music histories reflect tensions and dissonances within the wider context of the historical canvas of South Africa. Many of them have lived the history of apartheid and felt the consequences of its impact. Katy's experience was of growing up in 'serious apartheid' where 'anything to do with white people, it was a no-no' (Katy, Interview 1, 2011: 3). Despite that, Katy was drawn to Western music as a schoolgirl as a result of her early training from black teachers who were themselves schooled in the Western tradition. She 'loved' Western music and was 'hooked' on it and taught well by 'black teachers trained in the Western way' (Interview 1, 2011: 8-9). Western music being taught by black teachers was particularly significant during apartheid where a centralised and discriminatory curriculum policy system, based on segregating races, was firmly in place. There is a poignant moment when Katy, as an undergraduate, realises that she is caught between two worlds – Western and African and when she diverges from Western

classical music to Jazz. She is convinced that school music continues to under-represent African music and it is her experience that not enough research is being done on introducing African music into schools (Interview 2, 2011: 39).

By sharp contrast, Niles was nurtured to appreciate Western music. He was supported by his family and school and unlike Katy, the studying of Western music was expected of him and was 'a natural course' (Niles, Interview 1, 2011: 1). Whilst at school, Niles had individual piano and double bass lessons, attended orchestral courses, studied Western theory, harmony and history, played in a chamber group, was a member of the National Youth Orchestra and was given the chance to perform on overseas tours. The specialist musical knowledge he gained at the University of Cape Town (UCT) 'with only a hint of African Music' (Interview 1, 2011: 4) prepared him for teaching Western music in schools. Unlike Katy, he never had any doubts about how he would use his Western music education. He remains unconvinced that music can contribute towards a national identity:

> ...we are a long way off the NCS goal of building a shared national musical heritage and identity (because) we don't really know what our national musical heritage or identity is in that regard' (Niles, Interview, 2, 2011: 33).

Differently, Nathalie's view on musical taste is that diverse musics can bring people together. As one of the younger members of the research cohort she attended school after the end of apartheid. Her experience of music is based on celebrating diversity. She describes how school choirs present a variety of repertoire which for her exemplifies their acceptance of the different cultures. Furthermore, winning choir competitions is a matter of school pride and learners maximise their chances of success by singing songs that showcase their musical abilities with styles they have become familiar with. For her success and diversity are important aspects of cultural affirmation and empowerment, making choirs an important part of school music.

> You find that there are English songs, there are Afrikaans songs, there are Zulu songs, there are Sotho songs and that brings people together. And you find people are competing to be the ultimate best musically (Nathalie, Interview 2, 2011: 20).

Lily's experience as a coloured teacher who studied music during apartheid excluded her from entering institutions for white people. For her, most music teachers are Western trained and therefore learners should be encouraged to share their knowledge of African music with their teachers and classmates. The implication is that African music can be shared in this way because of its role in everyday life.

> But then again you're sitting with a class full of students who can help you. They're sitting there with a rich repertoire, a rich background, knowledge, experience of their cultural music background, which the teacher can tap into (Lily, Interview 1, 2011: 25).

Lily also perceives that some teachers may not always be willing to engage with different musics, thereby highlighting the challenge of presenting diverse musics in the classroom.

> It will depend on the teacher in the classroom, whether the teacher is open to expose the learners to African music. Because we know teachers have their preferences. They're not always going to be willing to expose all types of African music in the class (Lily, Interview 1, 2011: 25).

Rosalind did not want to discuss apartheid. She made that clear in her initial request that her interviews for this study avoided 'political aspects': 'when I feel I have to defend myself or any culture due to it, it's just not my thing' (Rosalind, Interview 2, 2011: 1). However, Rosalind's attempt to disconnect herself from a curriculum with aims based on the ideas of respect for others and otherness could

not be sustained during her two interviews. Her identity as a South African growing up during apartheid meant that she could not separate herself from what took place in her country. Despite her declarations to the contrary it is evident that she not only recognises the need for reconciliation but supports the curriculum in its goals to overcome historical injustices:

> Let's get done with these issues, and let's fix what we can about what happened in the past so that we can become more of a unit (Rosalind, Interview 2, 2011: 3).

Iris positions the value of music in terms of what it offers students. Those who wish to study music seriously would study Western music and those who want to 'appreciate' music would participate in African music. To this end she suggests that there are two agendas in music education. One is to 'unite people' and the other is to 'separate people'. This separation indicates that there is a need for two types of music teaching:

> African music is a tool to unite people and Western music separates those who want to specialise in music to those who want to appreciate music (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 35).

Iris believes that there is a place for both approaches. Uniting people involves 'general music training' where the purpose is to offer a general education and at the same time identify children with particular aptitude for specialist training suggesting a need to:

> …identify kids who are good at what they do or who have a particular innate ability of a particularly talent, and then continue through the system in a specialised way (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 37)

Classroom music and subject music

From the teachers' explanations of their backgrounds, what emerges is that they see music teaching as divided into two distinct types: classroom music and subject music. They explain the difference as classroom music being taught at primary school and the lower grades of high school where classroom teachers could teach music through singing songs and listening to music. They could also engage in a cross curricular approach where they could work in co-operation with their colleagues on a theme or idea that could span a number of different disciplines. By contrast, subject music prepares students to take music as a specialist area for their matriculation examinations and they are expected to have specific knowledge in theory and history of music as well as demonstrate an accomplished level of technical skills. The levels required are described as being at least at Grade V theory and practical external examinations. Often students have Grade VIII levels for these subjects to gain entrance into University to study music at degree level.

Lily recommends that music should be taught as a specialist subject from Grades 10-12 and as a general classroom subject before that stage (Lily, Interview 1, 2011: 33 and Interview 2, 2011: 7-9). She aligns her course content for trainee classroom music teachers to this end. Her view is that because the majority of her students have very limited or no prior knowledge of music when they are accepted on the course this would make them better equipped to teach general classroom music in primary schools rather than subject music in high schools: 'they can't teach Grades 10,11 and 12 subject music at all' (Interview 2, 2011: 9). The National Curriculum Statement (NCS, 2003) policy aims of diversity and widened access into music have influenced the design of the 'Music in Education' courses she teaches. Her students are encouraged to work with graphic notation, (rather than traditional Western notation), play African percussion instruments, sing in choirs with a high content of indigenous folk and praise compositions and be involved in a lot of group work. Just as two types of music learners are emerging from contemporary music aims, it

seems that the same division is occurring in teacher training. The suggestion is that teachers and learners with high knowledge and skills can teach subject music and those with lower order skills are better suited to classroom music.

Teachers are of the opinion that students who choose to matriculate in music require extra, private lessons to prepare for their examinations. Private schools are seen as more able to provide music as part of the school curriculum with parents being able to afford one-to-one, weekly private instrumental lessons. State schools appear to be under-resourced and many schools do not provide music as a subject that can be taken in high school. Students attending these schools sometime attend 'magnet school' that offer outside students the chance to take lessons in their music centres. Tracey and George work in Ex-model C schools that act as magnet schools with music centres used by outside students. Tracey points out that music is not a priority for these students:

> Being poor, going by taxi[31], not having something to eat. So I really think that they don't think about music as we think about it. It's not being part of their lives so much. The folk music yes, but not the Western kind of music (Tracey, Interview, 2, 2011: 31).

From the above quote it seems that the magnet schools cannot prepare students to reach high standards of instrumental skills and are therefore unable to meet the demands of the Grades 10-12 learning outcomes in the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS, 2011). Magnet schools offer a different kind of music lesson which is aimed at offering students general knowledge of some basic aspects of Western music. Tracey does not think that these students would be in a strong position to take subject music at high school because the gap between Western music and African folk music 'is actually the most difficult because that is that's

---

[31] The Johannesburg 'taxis' are minibus unmetered vehicles and the mode of transport that many low income residents rely on to get to work and school. Although the fares are low, they have the reputation of being unsafe.

the widest, the furthest apart of all the genres I would say' (Interview 2, 2011: 34). Mary's experience of magnet schools is that they are not properly resourced or supported by government funding: 'they've got no instruments, they've got no resources, they've got nothing' (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 31). The lack of resources is an on-going source of concern for teachers who cope with this shortcoming in different and imaginative ways.

George's response to the lack of resources has been to write a series of text books (a project he funded himself) which he feels will make it easier for learners and teachers to access music. The books are aimed at assisting classroom teachers without music knowledge to teach music at an elementary level.

> …my whole idea is to equip teachers who are non-specialist, to be able to, with confidence, teach it (music) and actually do something with music in their schools (George, Interview 2, 2011: 9).

The books take a cross-curricular approach and contain songs that represent the eleven official African languages spoken in South Africa. The reasoning is to 'make the teachers world a bit bigger and to enrich their lives' (George, Interview 2, 2011: 11). The diverse musics represented in his books align with the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) aims for cross-curricular teaching and the promotion of diversity in the music curriculum.

Adriana's approach to promoting music in ill-equipped schools is to make her own indigenous instruments: 'I've made drums, I've made shakers, I've got bells and a whole lot of different things' (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 7). She involves her students in the making of these instruments and believes that in this way she encourages participation and enjoyment of music to those not familiar with the subject. This is an approach that is compatible with post-apartheid curriculum aims

that have been put in place to 'address barriers to learning and how to plan for diversity' (CAPS, 2011: 5).

> You know, playing the marimba is fun. Playing the drums is fun. And it's relevant to them. It's part of their culture, it's part of every African culture, playing the drums you know (Adriana, Interview 1, 2011: 18).

Natalie is keen to include all students and is particularly concerned that special needs children are not left out of music lessons. These children are encouraged to participate in her lessons through music appreciation topics. She talks of inclusive education as a means of stimulating a learner's interest in music without intimidating them with rules and regulations so that 'each learner feels valued, feel as if "I can say anything without being laughed at" (Nathalie, Interview 2, 2011: 31). Nathalie refers to herself as a 'sort of mediator between music and the child, linking the child to the music and music to the child' (Nathalie, Interview 2, 2011: 31) and believes that she is addressing inclusivity, another stated aim of the South African curriculum (CAPS, 2011: 5).

There is a sense from the participants that they have expanded their roles as music teachers in a way that can be described as 'extended professionalism' (Harley *et al.*, 2000: 292) referred to in Chapter Two of this dissertation. I don't think that the participants have recognised that they have widened their responsibilities from the traditional prescribed role of the effective teacher whose 'restricted professionalism refers to teachers whose thinking and practice is narrowly classroom –based rooted in experience rather than in theory' (2000: 292). Rather, the teachers appear to have taken on 6 roles described for the extended professional: teacher, pastoral care-giver, administrator, learning programme designer, lifelong learner and community worker (adapted from Harley *et al.*, 2000: 292-293). This is evident in the way that they creatively and confidently engaged with their pupils even if when they have had to expand their knowledge-base and

taken initiatives to produce materials, which in some cases have been at their own cost. This attitude demonstrates a large degree of professional commitment.

Katy does not think that indigenous music is particularly valued in schools. Katy explains her understanding of 'indigenous music' as 'African' music which is emotionally 'deep' and reinforces the notion that African rhythms and melodies are 'difficult to write down' (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 9-11). Her experience at a famous leadership academy for girls (that has a well-resourced music department) has proved to be frustrating. For her 'music is cultural' (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 36) and therefore there is a need to study indigenous instruments in order to 'pride ourselves as South Africans' (Interview 2, 2011: 36). Her attempts to bring in indigenous music practitioners from the community were short-lived and she was told that Western music practices in the school music syllabus would prevail (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 37). The rationale given was that the school strived for their underprivileged students to have the best academic experiences and be able to reach international standards in all subjects. This South African school has abandoned the CAPS document in favour of the International Baccalaureate despite the efforts of Katy, its Head of Music, to promote local curriculum values.

Rosalind believes that CAPS encourages learners to 'express what they feel, what they think, what's happening in their environment, what their rights are' (Rosalind, Interview 2, 2011: 22). She feels that a cross-curricular approach to classroom music can help to implement this aim through awareness of topics such as HIV/Aids and Rape (Rosalind, Interview 2, 2011: 22-23). She draws a distinction between this type of local music education and a more global one that requires special knowledge such as analytical and compositional techniques.

Composing can be a huge challenge. They have this idea and how to bring it out. And they must actually fight it out. Like you will fight out a Maths problem… and analysing musical works can become very tough (Rosalind, Interview 2, 2011: 27).

Roland is in agreement with the policy that seeks to link the learning of African music with the strengthening of the African identity:

Give ourselves a little bit more of an identity and let's see the world through indigenous African music before or at the same time we see it through other traditions (Roland, Interview 2, 2011: 15).

However, he goes on to explain that if his students want to pursue music as a career then they should:

First and foremost do Western Art Music. If they want to have an experiential education of music then it is appropriate that they engage with indigenous music. The reason that indigenous music cannot replace Western music is because currently there is no education system for us to continue or propagate the African Indigenous music way of doing things (Roland, Interview 2, 2011: 15).

Iris is unhappy that her achievements as a Western-educated musician are under-rated. Her impression is that teachers with Western music qualifications are no longer valued. She believes that her skills are being 'sidelined' (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 16) and learners are being uplifted at the expense of gaining 'excellence'.

So if you can go ping-pong-ping-pong and you can play Three Blind Mice on the black keys you're okay… whoop-dee-doo… playing a drum is not globally competitive… I can teach you to play a drum in half-an-hour. What kind of expertise and specialisation does that require?… its not excellence. It's just mediocrity… Excellence is excellence. You can't raise people from obscurity by bringing down those who are excellent… excellence is not the same as uplifting people (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 7-9).

In the above extract, Iris has raised two important points: (1) Western music is being devalued and (2) excellence is being confused with elitism. For her, classroom music accommodates the aims and values of a post-apartheid curriculum that is seeking to re-balance music education through classroom experiences of indigenous music. She uses the term 'indigenous' music to mainly describe African music. Iris appears to position WAM as a necessary and non-negotiable part of lesson content and regards the insertion of African music as a politically-driven and contextually relevant component of the curriculum. Whilst she sympathises with policy makers' concerns to address a wider and more diverse demographic of learners, she does not believe that this strategy will prepare those students who might want to take music as a matriculation subject and compete in the international space for University admission (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 8). The divide in music as she sees it is music for upliftment (general classroom music) and music for specialisation (subject music).

Whilst I appreciate Iris' concerns about maintaining a high level of music education in schools I contest her position that WAM should be ranked in first place as the only secure future for music education. Her tendency to polarise WAM and Indigenous African Music (IAM) over-simplifies both the characteristics of these two musics as well as the uniqueness of South Africa's history. I believe that this nation can accommodate and engage teachers and learners of different musical persuasions to transform music education into a pervasive feature of local life.

Mary's experience of township music leads her to believe that learners from black townships such as Soweto and Alexandra continue to be disadvantaged because of the lack of teaching resources and qualified teachers at their schools.

> The only problem being that they get to Grade 12 and they are still not ready for University, they still have to do a bridging course and all that (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 49).

In this chapter, the teachers have given evidence of how their own musical education has affected their perceptions of accommodation and valuing both African and Western music. They have answered Numbers 1, 2A and 2B of my research questions.

1   How has the participants' own musical education contributed to their views on the goals, aims and purposes of the new curriculum?

The chapter has illustrated how teachers' encounters with music as students have shaped the way in which they view the new curriculum. All of them have trained in Western music and they have undergone training in music history, music technique and music theory. Consequently, they feel confident to teach Western music in schools that offer music as a subject. Ten of the older teachers experienced the effects of segregated schooling during the apartheid era. This resulted in some of them having the means to study music privately, and/or at school or in black music schools. The remaining two younger black teachers attended schools in township areas after apartheid that they described as having no music departments. However, these teachers attended extra-curricular music schools that catered for black students which prepared them in Western music practices.

The teachers' Western music education has had an impact on their views on the goals, aims and purposes of the new curriculum. The teachers can be divided into the following two groups: (1) those who have had long and protracted exposure to Western music and (2) those who initially experienced only Western music and then were introduced to African music in their tertiary education. There does not seem to be a straight-forward correlation between allegiance to genres of music and musical training. All of the teachers have expressed their support towards the intentions of a curriculum that is based on democratic values. They are however mindful that African music and Western music have different qualities and declare that these differences have influenced their choices of content in their lessons. To

this end they have discerned that music teaching falls into two categories: classroom music and subject music. Whatever their musical education, the teachers have shown that they have considered alternative styles of music and that they do support a different approach to learning music from the one they experienced as students.

2a) Given their own musical education, how do they perceive the requirement to accommodate and value African as well as Western music?

All the teachers are musically literate. Their perceptions of African music are that it is aurally transmitted. They are of the view that African instrumental ensembles and choirs encourage increased participation and are relevant to quotidian life. Western music is regarded to be more serious-minded with an emphasis on music literacy and a long tradition of learning an instrument where evidence of accomplishment is required. The teachers agree that African instruments are cheap to purchase and easier to learn unlike expensive Western instruments where learners require years of private tuition to achieve a reasonable standard. Two teachers have expressed the view that African music requires in-depth study and that it is as demanding a genre of music as Western music. All the teachers have shown evidence of adapting their teaching to accommodate and value African music – some to a larger extent than others.

2b) Do they have a particular allegiance to African or Western music?

In most cases teachers have expressed concern that African music in the curriculum has not been properly conceptualised and developed. One of the reasons they give is the lack of recognised assessment schemes for indigenous instruments. Additionally, they are frustrated by the lack of resources and on-going professional development they feel they need to enhance their knowledge of African music.

126

Whilst there appears to be some allegiance to Western music, all the teachers have shown their commitment to develop African music (to a greater or lesser extent) by being creative and imaginative in the way they incorporate diverse music into their lessons.

The next chapter will investigate my third and fourth research questions:

3   What are teacher's views on what is 'good' musical knowledge?
4   Do they see music and music education as a vehicle for social transformation?

Chapter Six

CAPS in the classroom: Teachers' perceptions of the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement

Introduction

This chapter will describe teachers' perceptions of the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS, 2011) as being enacted in the classroom. In their discussions they comment on what they consider 'good' musical knowledge to be. Teachers link good musical knowledge with curriculum content, making this topic an essential part of their views. CAPS offer learners the opportunity to specialise in one of three streams of music identified as Western Art Music (WAM), Indigenous African Music (IAM) and Jazz. As discussed in Chapter Three, the content of the curriculum has been managed in a way that supports the case for social transformation through the teaching of different musics. Teachers convey their views on whether they see music and music education as a vehicle for social transformation by considering the benefits of including Western and African music in the South African music curriculum.

Policy makers state clearly that they believe in music and music education as a vehicle for social transformation: 'Music has the power to unite groups and to mobilise community involvement for the improvement of quality of life, social healing, and affirmation of human dignity' (CAPS, 2011: 8). Social transformation objectives are underpinned by democratic aims in the form of offering all learners access to high quality learning and encouraging active and critical approaches to learning. The inclusion of diverse musical content has been identified as a way to provide high-level music education for everyone (CAPS, 2011: 4-5). There is acceptance, both in the curriculum and by teachers, that increased participation is

likely to achieve widened access and that a prolific and diverse musical curriculum can contribute to bridging the racial divide. By accommodating a different approach to the study of music, the policy intention is to include those learners without a long history of learning music to offer music as a matriculation subject[32]. The teachers have expressed their concern that such an approach might water down music as a subject.

Perceptions of good musical knowledge

Iris portrays some government school music lessons as 'a kind of dance in your socks period once a week' (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 16) because of the lack of attention paid to theoretical content and technical skill in classroom music. It is her view that inexperienced and unqualified teachers are being asked to teach music. Iris' point is that quite often, general classroom teachers in predominantly government schools are asked to teach music without adequate resources, related training or professional support. This view is shared by all the participants in this study.

Iris explains the limitations of the above 'open' approach to teacher-training: Teachers in this category resort to elementary singing and recorder lessons and dancing to random choices of music instead of carefully planning their lessons according to the knowledge schemes detailed in the curriculum (Interview 1, 2011: 17). I believe that the reason for this deficit is two-fold: firstly, training at tertiary institutions is varied and secondly, training is often designed for classroom teachers without prior music knowledge. Her frustration in working for a government school was compounded by the repetitive nature of the lessons she was instructed to give her music students 'because the lady in charge of the music department didn't really think it was necessary'(Interview 1, 2011: 18) to enhance the lessons with more related music activities:

---

[32] South African matriculation examinations are taken in Grade 12 (age 18) which is the last school year.

So every week we learned, G, G, G and then sometimes we would sing and play B, B, B. Then B, A, G, and G, A, B and that was the extent of it for a whole year. It drove me around the bend. It was not very inspiring and it didn't do anything for the girls who were coming to music (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 18).

Eventually, Iris organised a number of varied musical groups for her students to join which led to launch of a music centre in the school:

So we had a percussion ensemble, we had three choirs, we had dance, a dance group, we had a recorder ensemble, we had a little band. So largely because of the extramural work I started a music centre there (at school). (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 19).

In recognition of her efforts the school rewarded her with a full time post as a music teacher instead of teaching both mathematics and music part-time (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 18). Despite the improvement in her professional circumstance as a music teacher, Iris felt that 'the reality was that it (post-apartheid curriculum aims) just wasn't do-able' (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 20). Iris believes that the massification of music education in post-apartheid South Africa has adversely affected the curriculum goal 'to equip learners with musical skills that are globally competitive' (NCS, 2003, extract, appendix 1).

Instead of building on a good education system, we throw it all out of the window and we want to build up something completely new and in the process we've got nothing (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 5).

I believe that the above quote relates to Iris' perceptions regarding the 'quality' of emancipatory music education with its post-modern tenets of multiculturalism, diversity and personalised teaching and learning styles. Her view can be explained

in part by some South African tertiary institutions implementing the Western philosophies and methodologies of Kodaly, Dalcroze and Orff[33], generally used for introducing music to primary school students. As mentioned previously in Chapter One, at WITS, for example, trainee-teachers are introduced to music in the same way and encouraged to teach their students using the same methods. African music compositions are deployed as a tactic to refer to concepts and elements of music (such as melody, harmony, rhythm and texture) and a way of helping teachers to internalise and stabilise their new knowledge. The reform of music education, reflecting a shift away from traditional, Western-based, authoritarian instruction could be the reason for Iris' frustration.

Iris does not agree with the swing towards participatory music in CAPS where the emphasis is on:

> The community and social aspect of music making instead of the skill and the knowledge that's going into it… As long as you know that everybody makes music together you're fine and you're okay. So they're (policy makers) watering it down (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 4).

Iris' view of 'good foundations' in music is that they should be underpinned by literacy and aural skills; learners should be able to read Western notation and be able to visually and aurally identify different instruments. She would like to see 'passionate' and qualified music teachers going into disadvantaged communities and getting people from these societies 'fired up about music' (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 6-7). Her experience of teaching music in state schools is that learners are not well-equipped to study music as a subject.

> So they (learners) are going through Grade 1 or Grade R to Grade 9[34] with a very airy-fairy approach to skills, more concentration on attitudes and values

---

[33] Kodaly, Dalcrose and Orff methodologies (1920s and 1930's) are influential Western developmental approaches for music teachers to introduce children to unfamiliar musical concepts such as rhythm, pitch, beat and notation.
[34] Grade R is age 6 and Grade 9 is age 15. Grade 12 (age 18) is the last year of school where students can matriculate after passing school-leaving examinations.

than on the actual skills and knowledge. Then they get to High School, which is in Grade 8. Now suddenly they're given the option to do music as a subject (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 11).

She thinks that policy makers introduced diverse music practices as compensation for the lack of it in previous apartheid curricula. She would like to see the curriculum as 'a great big menu and everyone gets a taste of everything… but we don't have to enjoy everything on the menu' (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 30-31). Iris maintains that the key to a successful music curriculum is pedagogic style and content. How the basics of music are taught is not important. What is important for her is that they are taught well. There should be a 'back to basics' approach to teaching the elements of music[35]. As long as the basic elements are taught through any type of music, Iris would regard this as teaching good music knowledge:

> We teach people about rhythm and basic beats. However we teach them, that's immaterial. It doesn't matter if we're playing the Western instrument or we're playing an African instrument. We play lots of un-tuned percussion and we move to the music and we listen to the music. Whichever music we listen to, that's immaterial. As long as we're doing that (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 23-24).

Iris' perception of teaching and learning music in her professional role reflects my own belief – that it is problematic for professional music teachers (those with a long history of learning, performing and teaching music) to enact their classroom practice in a subjective and shifting manner. There continues to be a place for notated scores and orally transmitted music. The potential for encountering a range of musics and the opportunity to challenge entrenched Western pedagogic practice is present in a contemporary response to providing alternative content and

achievement standards in school or college based music education. I believe that there is a danger of polarising methodological differences between the teaching of Western and non-Western music.

---

[35] The elements of music are generally regarded as rhythm, dynamics (soft and loud sounds), beats (long and short value notes) and meter (pulse of the music), pitch (recognising high and low sounds, timbre (textures of sounds).

This discussion about the virtues of teaching fundamental knowledge in music is part of the larger issue about what 'good' music is perceived to be. Iris explains throughout her first interview that she regards the fundamentals to be knowledge about rhythm, reading and writing Western notation, being aurally trained to recognise different sounds and notate them and develop a sense of music appreciation. Most of the components she describes could be assimilated by any genre of music. The only contentious one is Iris' requirement for literacy to be understood as the study of Western notation. The reason it might be considered controversial is because the curriculum shows signs of resisting the concept that 'good' knowledge is rooted in Western practices by steering learners away from 'melody writing (WAM)' to a practical and aural understanding of 'chord constructions, progressions and scales' (CAPS, 2011: 59).

Flexibility is regarded by Mary as a trademark of a 'good teacher' who she believes should be able to teach any musical instrument to any learner. In her opinion teachers should be able to teach any instrument by following a technical manual:

> I've been exposed to a lot of instruments and I think I'm a good teacher... you can actually do it (teach any instrument)... I mean it's just following instructions in a book (Mary, Interview 1, 2011: 27).

I anticipate that readers who are competent musicians might take exception to this view because the nature of learning an instrument is generally regarded by most instrumental teachers and performers as being a complex process that requires years of expert tuition and practice with teacher and pupils devoting much time and effort to musical detail and technical development. However, for the purposes of widening the choice of instrumental teaching in the South African context, where resources are scarce (particularly with finding competent instrumental teachers) I believe that Mary has offered a visionary alternative: that is for learners to be given

the opportunity to learn the rudiments of any instrument with the assistance of a music teacher who whilst not having the training for that particular instrument might be able to facilitate the initial processes of learning about it.

Despite her original approach to practical music, Mary still regards Grade 8 theory (in the Western external examination mode) and 'being exposed to Western music' as another important quality for a comprehensive education in music (Mary, Interview 1, 2011: 8). She feels strongly that if learners want to notate African music they should become familiar with how Western music is notated (Interview 1, 2011: 37). Mary is keen to acknowledge the Western examination grade system as a benchmark of good musical knowledge as it gives learners the opportunity to study music at tertiary level (Interview 1, 2011: 40). In her capacity as a provincial and national examiner she would like to see an increase in the standard of theoretical and practical skills in government schools (Interview 1, 2011: 49).

Mary's explanation of the divide between controlled and uncontrolled improvisatory techniques is one aspect that reflects the complexity of what good musical knowledge is. One of the conflicts for Mary is that Western music is heavily analysed whilst African music is not (Interview 2, 2011: 9). She believes that the freer form of African music lends itself to spontaneous improvisation. The contradiction for Mary lies in the expectation that learners should notate their improvisations whilst at the same time being encouraged to be unstructured in their approach.

> But improvisations was not done exactly as improvisation should be done. It was taken still the Western way whereby, you know, improvisation comes from within you. You just listen to a song and you come in and you don't go and write it down, you know (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 9).

Lily is concerned that music is not a mandatory part of the school curriculum, which results in no music education being provided in some schools (Lily, Interview 2, 2011: 36). She points out that 'music has different meanings for different people… so the definition of good music is a wide concept'. She expands: 'it is a broad definition that basically covers all aspects of music' and explains that these include spiritual feeling, emotion, cultural affirmation and healing. She has 'a big problem' with the current state in state education that music is not a fixed subject in the curriculum (Interview 2, 2011: 33-34). Whilst this participant is in agreement with a curriculum that places emphasis on values she regrets that music is not being used to convey those values in every school.

Lily feels that the ability to harmonise music for choir is an essential part of looking closely at the music and gaining an understanding of the way in which music is scored – providing learners with the opportunity to appreciate the underlying use of musical form[36] and harmony[37] (Lily, Interview 2, 2011: 15). Her Master's research into the study and analysis of Kwaito music (South African township music) has motivated her to position Kwaito music as a serious type of music. To this end she has:

> …creat(ed) music software...for class music, Grade, 10,11 and 12 to show the youth that Kwaito is not just for enjoyment, but you can take it seriously in terms of notating if for example, analysing it in a Western sense, and harmonising if for four parts (Lily, Interview 2, 2011: 15).

---

[36] Musical form refers to the way in which music is structured into sections with the aim that those sections can be analysed in certain ways – such as music appearing as restatement, repetition and/or variation.
[37] Harmony refers to chords and chord constructions. It is the study of simultaneous pitches and the way in which notes in chords relate to scales.

Through her work, Lily has shown a commitment to disseminating contemporary African music. She does this by attempting to notate Kwaito music with computer-generated software. This approach implies that 'good knowledge' for her is an amalgam of values, theory and technology, and is not confined to WAM.

Another participant who values music technology, but this time for compositional and arranging purposes is Rosalind. She believes that software programmes can cultivate new music and rediscover traditional music:

> Computer literacy forms the basis I'd say to enable students to further their music technology ability with music software programmes like Finale, Sibelius and Cakewalk. This allows student the modern day approach towards cultivating new and constantly progressive methods in developing new music, as well as enabling them to rediscover more traditional music (Rosalind, Interview 2, 2011: 26).

Rosalind considers the curriculum directive for students to 'creatively problem-solve through performance, composition and analysis' as a worthwhile challenge. The pivotal point for this kind of problem solving is composing where students 'have' an idea, consider how to 'bring it out' (Rosalind, Interview 2, 2011: 27). Rosalind puts much emphasis on student compositions, which illustrates her conviction as a music teacher that students should be encouraged to create their own music and express it in a style that appeals to them.

The language that Roland uses indicates his understanding of musical competency to be largely formulated in traditional, theoretical terms. He speaks of 'boundaries', 'structure' and 'standards' in the pursuit of musical excellence (Roland, Interview 2, 2011: 26). Teachers should be responsible for managing the content of their lessons to expand their pupils' knowledge in a structured, sequential and progressive manner:

> If you're a good teacher and you're going to grow your learners, there needs to be some upward spiral of development of musical skill and expanded repertoire and musical knowledge and complex rhythm and experimenting or pushing the tonal system' (Roland, Interview 2, 2011: 26).

Katy feels that music in South African schools should reflect a South African cultural identity and that the sequence of learning African music should reflect this position:

> If you say you are a South African, you have done music as a subject then that element must come out so that you can say 'I have also learned this drum, I have learned this chordophone, and I am able to play that indigenous instrument'. We should be proud of what we have in this country because there is so much rich culture that we can learn from. We just need to change the mindset (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 28).

Katy believes that 'African sounds' should be played on 'indigenous instruments' (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 33) and that schools should engage indigenous music practitioners from different communities to demonstrate their skills to teachers and learners in that community. This would result in learners improving their technique (Interview 2, 2011: 29). She explains that there are different areas of indigenous music expertise country wide:

> It (indigenous music) also depends on the area. Let us say you are in KwaZulu-Natal. Maybe in KwaZulu-Natal the instrument that is more accessible, you know, maybe it is a certain drum or it is a certain bow instrument. They need to look into that and rather deal with the instruments that are there in the region, you know, and get the practitioners, the experts, who can come and show and teach actually (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 25-26).

This is an idea that is resisted by her Headmistress who argues that she is 'too African' in her approach (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 37). Despite opposition she

continues to argue that good knowledge is locally situated and she wants indigenous musicians to develop African music modules in the curriculum (Interview 2, 2011: 40): 'Black people understand the music, they are the owners of the (African) music, you know' Interview 2, 2011: 26). It should be noted that Katy's use of the term 'indigenous' refers to non-Western music. She defends the case for African music to be introduced into the curriculum at primary school level in order for learners to be able to study it at an advanced level at high school (Interview 2, 2011: 39). In addition to expert tuition of indigenous instruments, good African music knowledge should also be based on early experiences of it at primary school, sequential learning and continuity from Grades 1-12 (Interview 2, 2011: 20).

Niles puts forward a contrasting argument where he proposes that a universal concept of a good music education is Western based:

> Even African people want to absorb the Western traditions. They want to learn how to read, how to write, how to play classical music… even in singing, they still absorb the Western types of music… that's my experience (Niles, Interview 2, 2011: 11).

For Niles, the quality of music education is associated to obtaining examinations results: 'As long as you produce the results at the end and your results are good, nobody really worries about how you get there' (Niles, Interview 2, 2011: 46). He explains that 'you're being judged on your ability to play that piece' consequently for him, the 'varied levels' of learning music in the classroom affect the perception of what a good music education is (Interview 2, 2011: 41). The different levels Niles is referring to are the learning outcomes present in the curriculum that are supported by outcomes-based education, recognising an individual's progress rather than his/her achievement of formal examination results.

This learner-centred approach to assessment has altered Niles' perception of what a good music education is in the post-apartheid curriculum context which 'offers much more' than a conservative Western based education that is mainly driven by examination results (Niles, Interview 2, 2011: 36). Niles differentiates classroom music as 'just singing songs if you want to' which is different to attaining certain goals for subject music where 'you're expected to go up to a certain standard' (Interview 2, 2011: 40). The inference is that the focus on examination results leads to 'measurable, visible, demonstrable' outcomes (Pahad, 1999: 260). Niles has shown that it is difficult to measure some things which are not clearly visible in the curriculum knowledge schemes such as the development of learners' attitude and values as well as their higher order cognitive skills.

Nathalie believes that a good musical education 'disciplines' a person.

> Music is a disciplined subject. As a person you learn to be disciplined, you learn to focus, you learn to be able to plan your things differently if I can look at, listen to a song and you become analytical as a person (Nathalie, Interview 2, 2011: 14).

She cites South Africa's President Zuma as an example of 'a leader up there who played the flute'. She credits his 'leadership skills' to the influence of his musical experiences (Nathalie, Interview 2, 2011: 15). Nathalie relies on the notion that an understanding of music gives the means 'for people to express themselves' and come to terms with situations of 'neglect' or 'abuse' (Interview 2, 2011: 12). She believes that music should 'cater for 'the holistic needs of the children' who should feel 'creatively and artistically catered for' in music lessons (Interview 2, 2011: 13). Nathalie also describes the role of music as one that can 'teach our children music from our heritage and also help within our economy as a country' (Interview 2, 2011: 14).

Nathalie's account of a good musical education is wide-ranging and includes the necessity to 'speak a common language' based on Western music notation (Interview 2, 2011: 3) and having the knowledge of the 'elements in music' which she describes as: 'your time signatures, your key signatures, your dynamics'. She declares these elements to be 'vital' (Interview 2, 2011: 28). This view is defensible on the grounds that it is commonly accepted by theorists and music professionals alike that all types of music share common ground – referred to earlier in this chapter as common 'elements'. It could therefore be argued that a shared music language reduces the impact of difference.

Nathalie also supports the position that a comprehensive music education goes beyond developing theoretical and practical skills. She values music as a means to developing different aspects of a child's learning and preparation for adult life - in particular she mentions three proficiencies: 'discipline', 'focus' and 'planning' (Interview 2, 2011: 14). She identifies these competences to be part of the 'holistic' education of a learner (Interview 2, 2011: 27).

Tracey talks about good music knowledge as musical content specified in the South African curriculum as well as in external examination boards. Teachers must adhere to the content: 'So if they (the policy makers) specify specifically, you must do that, then - well I do that' (Tracey, Interview 2, 2011: 37). Good musical skills should be 'globally competitive' and therefore 'practical', 'theory', 'the aural', 'the history' is a 'good framework' for developing musically (Interview 2, 2011: 37). Good music knowledge would develop 'the love for the music' (Interview 2, 2011: 49); 'this whole thing (of learning music) comes down to that' (Interview 2, 2011: 47). Whilst Tracey agrees that the curriculum encourages an appreciation of many different types of music she acknowledges that 'I can't appreciate or teach hip-hop or rap' (Interview 2, 2011: 33). This is an example of how teachers' personal preferences might influence curriculum content in the way they choose the types of material they teach their students. Imposing their choice of repertoire on them

suggests that, in some cases, teachers might not be supporting curriculum changes to the extent that they should.

George's view is that 'the foundations of music can touch in a great way on basic elements of music' (George, Interview 2, 2011: 31). He refers in particular to dynamics, timbre, texture and pitch with regard to singers (Interview 2, 2011: 30). He connects the notion of well-being to age-appropriate material as an important aspect of good musical content:

> Just singing the teacher's favourite song in the class, which I'm not always sure is appropriate for the kids to sing, is not teaching music... if you're a responsible adult, you're not going to teach music with rude words and sexual suggestions... (George, Interview 2, 2011: 30).

He believes that musical skills should be 'globally competitive' and that in indigenous music 'this is something very, very, very overlooked' (George, Interview 2, 2011: 28). George hints at a racial divide that he believes is responsible for the difficulties in ascertaining what global skills are in indigenous music:

> The practices of indigenous music are not documented... we (Afrikaans or English people) don't understand them, because it's not open for us. It's locked and closed. So in a way it's a difficult topic. I'm not going to comment further (George, Interview 2, 2011: 28-29).

George's sensitivity stems from his belief that some musical boundaries, in this case traditional black African music, cannot be crossed. He has expressed this belief quite strongly in the quote above. Some of the other teachers in this study – particularly, Katy, Iris and to some extent, Niles have also expressed that musical cultures and identities are closely connected to the experiences of an individual and that these experiences are inextricably linked to the way in which they regard the strengths and/or shortcomings of diverse music practices.

Adriana indicates that teachers need to reflect on music policy by studying the curriculum in depth in order to understand what they need to do to provide good music education. Her approach to studying the NCS extract I gave her was to make extensive notes on it by highlighting and analysing significant words and phrases that caught her attention.

> You have to be somebody who can and wants to take the time, sit down, read the document (CAPS, 2011), and actually read between the lines about what is actually said... there are certain words in here that need to be analysed (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 50).

Her view is that music education is not taking place because some schools don't offer it to learners (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 41). She declares: 'forget having a good music teacher, having a qualified music teacher in their classroom; the majority of the schools out there don't have any of that' (Interview 2, 2011: 19). She has identified lack of clarity in the curriculum with regard to good musical knowledge:

> More information is needed on how exactly or what exactly do they (policy makers) mean by the fact that music has the power to unite groups (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 10).

In terms of professional development, more should be done to support novice music teachers who may take fewer risks in their professional lives due to a feeling of insecurity caused by inexperience. CAPS (2011) addresses multicultural issues through music education in utilitarian terms by the way in which values have been given prominence in the policy text. If music is to be used as a tool to build empathy between ethnically diverse people then teacher-training institutions should provide the opportunity for them to consider the philosophical base upon which to ground their practice and enrich the uniqueness of the South African school music experience. It is therefore my view that a philosophical dimension to

engaging with the culture-sharing aspect of music is essential for teachers who are required to build cross-cultural understandings.

In addition to the problem of vagueness she assesses that teachers 'just wouldn't be bothered' to take the time to contemplate and discuss with colleagues the implications of a document that is concerned about values (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 50). She believes that affirming identity is 'too complicated' in a music curriculum that is also striving to provide aims for high skills and high knowledge. For her, identity and nation-building should be kept 'as separate points' and 'it (the curriculum) should be kept simple' (Interview 2, 2011: 44). I am not comfortable with Adriana's position to separate philosophical instruction from music instruction. South Africa's educational stance reflects the requirement for teaching and learning to be a means towards reflective practices. It then follows that a person's ability to respond positively to others around them becomes a transformative act and involves emotional intelligence that makes philosophical underpinnings not only desirable but essential for trainee music teachers. Additionally she makes the observation that in order for teachers to provide individual learning schemes for their learners they would need to be capable and have the time to monitor the progress of each person. She does not feel this is achievable:

> It is not practical for a musical teacher to know, you know, more than 45 children, because they have dozens of classrooms to attend to. Each child needs to, a teacher to know each child's background? It makes no practical sense (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 29-30).

Mary agrees with Adriana's view that large classes cannot accommodate music lessons that have intricate aims and says that the reality is that 'music is only about singing' in 'township schools'[38]. She explains that township schools 'got about 30

---

[38] Post-apartheid township schools are generally attended by black children, are usually under-resourced and are free for children of any racial background.

learners in a classroom… (unlike) very expensive schools where teachers are only dealing with about four learners' (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 23).

Charlotte takes the position that imparting good musical knowledge requires 'more on-going teacher-training' as teachers need 'a level of confidence to ask for resources' (Charlotte, Interview 2, 2011: 41). She has observed that some teachers 'rather mess-up than ask for someone to help' (Interview 2, 2011: 42). She feels that incorporating indigenous music in the curriculum should be at a high level and that the curriculum is 'ambitious' because it would 'take quite a long time for that to happen… the majority were very resistant to it… I'm sorry to say that' (Interview 2, 2011: 30). Charlotte has a great deal of respect for indigenous music and would like to see it regarded as more than 'just identifying indigenous instruments as being marimbas and drums' (Interview 2, 2011: 29). She maintains that:

> People who don't necessarily have a long prior experience of music, who haven't been particularly acculturated in the subject, they should be able to express and discover music (Charlotte, Interview 2, 2011: 26).

Being able to read music would 'open up other avenues to learners' but being able to read can be achieved progressively (Charlotte, Interview 2, 2011: 27). For her, improving 'musical memory', being able to practice regularly and participating are important features of acquiring good musical knowledge (Interview 2, 2011: 28).

Views on music as a means of social transformation

The teachers in this study have openly discussed their feelings about the system of unequal education in their country during apartheid (1948-1994) and expressed their views on music being used as a tool for social transformation. They empathise with the need for an alternative approach to music education that would include

more learners to study music at school. There are several challenges they face with regard to changing their ways of teaching. Essentially, they are being asked to teach different genres of music (sometimes without adequate resources), to assess learners individually and to assimilate values stated in the curriculum by incorporating them into their teaching style.

I begin this section with Charlotte who points out the dangers of not promoting several different genres of music:

> Bearing in mind the history of this country, I think it is dangerous to teach the one type, because by the very nature of music in this country, it was very elitist. It was only a certain amount of people who did it (Charlotte, Interview 2, 2011: 38).

In the extract above Charlotte is referencing the controlling of school knowledge and its processes and resources during apartheid by the white minority. Her impression is that the new music curriculum is 'written around the needs of the people… that's very important in this country' (Charlotte, Interview 2, 2011: 42-43).

Mary explains how black people were oppressed during apartheid and how that affected their cultural identity:

> Being indigenous, to us was very barbaric. We were made to believe that…you grow up during the apartheid times and you're meant to feels that being black is inferior and everything that's black is inferior (Mary, Interview 1, 2011: 32-33).

Her experiences of learning African music and African instruments as a schoolgirl gave her a sense of pride in being black (Mary, Interview 1, 2011: 36). Mary is concerned that the implementation of widening access to the study of music for

black people is not being supported by the government with adequate resources to improving the dissemination of African music:

> I don't have hope… I feel that we're on our own with whatever we've got…. we need written music, we need recordings… we still need a lot that needs money (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 47-48).

Despite her despair, Mary believes that the effect of integrating black culture with white culture would instil the confidence in people to know that they are 'capable of anything' just so long as their starting point is 'that respect about each other's cultures, each other's music' (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 42). One way she achieves this is by using Western instruments to teach indigenous music (Interview 1, 2011: 19). On a more positive note she observes that black learners have increased opportunities to study music in school and that the government has provided some instruments to facilitate this:

> We make do with whatever little instruments we've got… so I think there is a lot of improvement… at least (they) are getting taught in some schools. The only problem being they get to Grade 12 and they are still not ready for university, they still have to do a bridging course and all that (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 49).

The issue that Mary raises about integrating different cultures is an interesting one and raises a question about legitimising African music in a bid to elevate it to a more 'serious' level. Here too is further evidence in this study that African music knowledge is regarded by some of the teachers as being unique and possibly inferior to Western music. In this instance Mary feels the necessity for African music to be bolstered by Western instrumentation. I think that her reference to a bridging course is further confirmation of her doubting the usefulness of 'black music' in an educational context.

Katy feels that social transformation can only take place if the policy is written by black people. Consequently, she strives to gain higher-order qualifications like Master's and Doctorate postgraduate degrees in order to 'influence the curriculum' (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 42-43). Adriana feels that black teachers are unable to contribute to an agenda of social transformation because they have 'a teacher's certificate rather than a teacher's degree' and suffer from a lack of adequate training to understand complex concepts mentioned in music policy documents:

> This is the thing, the concepts in here (the NCS extract) are actually more complex that the language itself… for example we spent quite a while talking about the definition of music (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 37).

She poses the question: 'Can an unqualified music teacher read between the lines'? (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 38). When she was probed to explain her definition of 'unqualified' she made references to the older black trainee music teachers (aged 40 and above) on her University music education course. She explained that they came from the rural area of Limpopo Province and were suddenly immersed into Western music practices without any prior knowledge of it. To compound their difficulties they were presented with a curriculum written in English (not their first language) which made references to 'complex' phrases such as 'holistic development of learners' that they did not understand (Adriana, Interview 2, 2011: 37).

Adriana provides us with the example of rural teachers who apparently feel vulnerable as a result of inadequate teacher-training. With music curricula being forced to change as the practices of schooling change in line with political reform, I suggest that curriculum change is daunting to all music educators in South Africa. For rural teachers to evolve into their expanded roles as teaching professionals (Harley *et al*., 2000), discussed in the previous chapter, they might benefit with an expanded programme of professional development that continues into their early

professional lives. A structured continuous developmental programme that takes place after undergraduate studies might boost their levels of confidence as novice teachers and provide some relief to their situation.

Her observations indicate that policy makers who attempt to achieve social transformative aims via music education should acknowledge the difficulties experienced by previously disadvantaged individuals (PDI) who schooled in the apartheid era and who (in her opinion) need extra support to implement a cutting-edge curriculum that places an emphasis on both content and social dispositions in the form of attitudes and values.

George supplements Adriana's position by arguing that many teachers (both black and white) might not be able to promote a variety of musical styles when they are 'just exposed to one kind of music the whole time' (George, Interview 2, 2011: 33). George raises the question 'Are the teachers at this stage equipped for it'? He believes that the curriculum provides 'room for dialogue' even though its aims to achieve social transformation remain 'problematic'. He identifies schools with well-equipped music departments and well-trained teachers as able to implement a 'strategic document' (Interview 2, 2011: 34). George's analysis of the difficulties of implementing curriculum expectations includes references to his 'black brothers and sisters':

> ...whose expectations of music is broad-based enjoyment, because they don't appreciate the expertise maybe that go into being able to play good instruments, because they didn't have that experience. It's a bit of a political subject here (George, Interview 2, 2011: 19).

Iris' experience of teaching music in ex-model C schools resonates with George's concerns in a different way when she shares her experience of teaching music in ex-model C schools and was confronted with the 'indifference, especially amongst

white children, when I tried to teach them for example Zulu song or play music for them from various other cultures' (Iris, Interview 1, 2011: 19). She believed this was because they were not exposed to it at home (Interview 1, 2011: 21). Seemingly, both Iris and George's concerns are based on teachers' and pupils' attitudes and experiences of different musics. As a person who has 'come from the privileged side of things' George places much importance on 'the broadening of horizons' for the 'uneducated people in our country' (George, Interview 2, 2011: 16) but is unsure how this can be managed without adequate resources: 'the challenge in our country is the resources. That is a huge, huge, huge challenge' (Interview 2, 2011: 25).

Niles believes that the idea of social transformation through music education is 'not new'.

> The idea of what sounds are, how you get them together, the power to unite groups, mobilising communities. That has always been there, it's never been different. Even the social healing, affirmation of human dignity, those are all aspects which have been there before in the early 1990's. Maybe not put in exactly those words, but the idea is there in the binding together of a community (Niles, Interview 2, 2011: 25).

Interestingly, Niles positions early social transformation as taking place 'possibly within only the white group' (Niles, Interview 2, 2011: 25) when he started to introduce 'a broad range of ideas' to his white pupils (Interview 2, 2011: 26). He believes that social transformation via music and music education took place in Soweto where 'a lady came out from England' and trained a group of black, underprivileged string players[39] 'to the extent that she drilled them almost like a staff sergeant in the army' and achieved 'the most incredible results'. Their social transformation has allowed them to 'learn to read and write and perform all over the world' (Interview 2, 2011: 27).

---

[39] The group being referred to is called Buskaid, a well-known South African string ensemble trained by Rosemary Nalden, a musician of British-South African citizenship.

Nine teachers (Katy, Mary, Nathalie, Niles, Roland, Rosalind, Tracey, Lily and Iris) from the research cohort of twelve teachers were keen to explain how their understanding of Ubuntu[40] has influenced their attitudes towards the values stated in the curriculum and how they can achieve social transformation through classroom music. Three teachers (Adriana, George and Charlotte) did not engage in this discussion. Whilst the word is not explicitly referred to in any of the post-apartheid curriculum documents the concept of Ubuntu kept cropping up in the interviews in a manner that aligned it with the ideals of social transformation in South African music education. Nathalie illustrates how Ubuntu places importance on group rather than individual achievements by explaining her pedagogic approach which she summarises as *'umuntu, ngumuntu, ngabantu'* and translates as 'I am because of others' (Natalie, Interview 2, 2011: 17). Nathalie's beliefs about music education are clearly linked to post-1994 curriculum aims that promote values such as respect, diversity, unity and inclusivity. Her teaching-style reflects her steadfast belief that teachers can learn from pupils and vice versa. Natalie explains that inclusivity is an aspect of Ubuntu where a person and their rights are respected (Interview 2, 2011: 25).

One of the interesting aspects of teachers' discussion about Ubuntu is that there are numerous and complex interpretations of it. Common uses of this term by eminent speakers such as President Barack Obama, Archbishop Desmond Tutu and the late President Nelson Mandela declare Ubuntu as a spirit of co-operation, exercising humanity towards others and demonstrating that the individual is defined by their relationship with others often expressed as 'I am because we are'. In terms of the new curriculum aims, it implies that teachers should encourage music as a group activity so that learners of different levels can participate more in the spirit of group co-operation with less focus on recognising individuals.

In sharp contrast to Nathalie's endorsement of Ubuntu is Iris who believes that 'the whole idea of Ubuntu is being pushed so much that it's at the expense of other

---

[40] Ubuntu is an African philosophical concept that was first introduced in Chapter 2.

things' (Iris, Interview 2, 2011: 4). She is disenchanted with the standards in classroom music which is intent on 'finding new ways to celebrate mediocrity every day in the new music curriculum' (Interview 2, 2011: 5). For her, the aim to widen music to give everyone the opportunity to access the subject has compromised the aspirations of those who have achieved a degree of excellence in it.

Lily explains how for her the spirit of Ubuntu can be incorporated more easily into classroom music in primary schools where music can be portrayed as inclusive and interactive and where teachers and pupils can learn from one another (Lily, Interview 2, 2011: 4). Lily is demonstrating her understanding of Ubuntu as a virtue of sharing information, irrespective of a person's status within the implied hierarchical relationship between teacher and student. Lily considers African music as fitting in with the ethos of Ubuntu which she explains as a person striving to achieve her personal best whilst helping others to achieve their best (Interview 2, 2011: 12). Here, Lily has positioned Ubuntu as a manifestation of a greater whole that transcends the importance of individual success. By reflecting on what Ubuntu means to them, nine teachers in this study have made an understandable attempt to prepare themselves and their students to meet the challenges of valuing diverse cultural traditions within the demands of a democratic curriculum. The paradox is that by deliberating on what they see as an exclusively African device they might be inadvertently excluding other ways of critically reflecting on universal notions of well-being.

Interpreting Ubuntu within the teaching and learning environment means encouraging teachers to 'adjust' and 'be proactive' and to use learners in their classes as resources. Students have diverse experiences and 'they are in a position to equip you as a teacher'. Such an approach makes the NCS an 'appropriate' document that Lily feels she and her trainee teachers can work with (Interview 1, 2011: 2-4).

Tracey says that being made aware of Ubuntu has motivated her to participate in outreach programme although she points out that as a Christian, helping others comes naturally to her daily way of life:

> It's also Christian… It's not that I see somebody in the street and think, "oh must do Ubuntu now"… It's not that I have to be taught to have Ubuntu (Tracey, Interview 2, 2011: 30).

For Niles 'I've sort of seen the Ubuntu as a coming together, as a bringing of people together' (Niles, Interview 2, 2011: 17). This has given him a positive impression of the values included in the curriculum because his pupils can learn from each other 'without one person feeling more superior than the other' (Interview 2, 2011: 18).

Katy states that:

> Ubuntu means "you are because I am". We help each other. In happiness, in sadness. I am there for you, you're always there for me. That is Ubuntu. Helping each other (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 15).

Katy appears to have mistranslated Ubuntu where the norm is to position the individual who grows as a result of the influence of others. This mistranslation highlights the complexities and difficulties of appropriating Ubuntu as a distinctive feature of African democracy. The interview situation may have also contributed to the error.

The way Katy implements Ubuntu in her lessons is by teaching songs from different genres to her class which represents different ethnic groups. Sometimes the children resist her choices but Katy explains to them that:

> My spirit of Ubuntu says we are one. There is no colour here. So I am going to learn your music, you are going to learn my music and together we're going to make a different repertoire altogether. We're going to enjoy music together (Katy, Interview 2, 2011: 17).

Mary agrees with Katy completely. 'To me Ubuntu means accepting people with their diverse cultures, respecting everyone and being kind' (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 6). Within the context of music teaching in South Africa she regards Ubuntu as delivering an important message:

> It means that being accepting of different things. Accepting that we're from different backgrounds, we've got different cultures and we need to accept each other the way we are (Mary, Interview 2, 2011: 7).

Roland's definition matches what the other teachers say: 'My definition of Ubuntu that I know and believe is true is, I am, because you are' (Roland, Interview 2, 2011: 28). He is adamant that Ubuntu has a positive effect on how teachers and learners accept diverse musical experiences:

> If you look at the cultures being represented in an ordinary South African classroom, obviously taking into consideration the demographic make-up of a classroom in an urban setting in Johannesburg, we're going to have all sorts of cultures and races reflected, when people come together and they make music together to achieve a goal, they are, certain things are going to happen within the dynamic of that group. They're going to be more accepting of each other at the end of the day (Roland, Interview 2, 2011: 32).

The above comments indicate that in this study, teachers accept and support an education policy that strives to recognise the role of music from a 'utilitarian' perspective (Vermeulen, 2009) which I believe has a close affiliation to Ubuntu. Vermeulen describes the functional aspects of music as being used to 'unify a group of people' and transcend barriers of 'disparate backgrounds, race and gender' by

'participating in singing or listening to music together (Vermeulen, 2009: 2-8). I also believe that the functions pronounced by Vermeulen can be included as part of the larger agenda for social transformation, through the spirit of Ubuntu and if coupled with the aspiration for a collective identity as a way of unifying disparate ethnic groups. Seen in this way, Roland's extract above can be interpreted as a function of social transformation occurring in a group dynamic via Ubuntu which he maintains is taking place in his music classroom: 'It does do so through Ubuntu. It happens. It is happening' (Roland, Interview 2, 2011: 33).

Rosalind expressed a very different view to the seven other teachers who spoke about Ubuntu as an effective motivational tool and she sees it in a more political context:

> Some of the politicians in South Africa, on the one-hand-side they're shouting, 'we are one, Ubuntu, this, that, and the next thing', and on the other side they seem to me to have a racist streak and they want to keep digging this apartheid thing and Sharpeville[41] and I don't know what else. They want to keep digging this up. And I think but what for? Isn't there something better you could be doing, now that we've evolved to where we are now? (Rosalind, Interview 1, 2011: 37).

Instead, she believes that music is 'the universal language' which 'can be developed by greater understanding and participation in the classroom. Learning, she explains, is about 'doing' and this is key to her perception that music can transcend differences between people.

> Music is always called 'the universal language', which is quite true I have found. Just about anyone is going to understand what you're trying to say through music, even if they don't understand the language (Rosalind, Interview 2, 2011: 3-4).

---

[41] The Sharpeville Massacre took place in 1960 where black people were demonstrating about Pass Laws that restricted their movement. Sixty-nine people died in this protest.

It would appear that Rosalind is discussing music as a response to emotional triggers which she believes arises from music - the universal language. I proffer a modified alternative that poses music as having the power to stimulate imagination and provoke a sensory response that is unique to each individual. Viewed in this way, music might be regarded as a tool to encourage group discussions about the emotions it elicits. Social transformative aims in classroom music might therefore be achieved through these discussions.

The teachers have given me a number of different responses to my third research question:

3   What are teacher's views on what is 'good' musical knowledge?

Their answers centred on the following four themes:

1   The need for creativity
2   The holistic development of all learners
3   The appreciation of diverse musics
4   The ability to read and write music

Some teachers were keen to suggest that a better standard of indigenous music education could be provided by engaging the skills of indigenous musicians in the community, providing on-going professional development for teachers to be equipped to teach indigenous instruments to their pupils and the need for a clearer policy. Although they believe that diverse musics in the curriculum could contribute to a contemporary version of good knowledge, they are all in agreement that the values in the curriculum need to be made clearer with regard to how they could be applied to a good music education. All the teachers felt that music teachers should be more open to reflect a respect for indigenous music in order for it to be considered 'good' musical knowledge.

The streaming of music has caused controversy amongst the teachers. And there is ambiguity in the teachers' perceptions about the way music has been divided into three genres. At times they conveyed feelings of confusion, resentment and uncertainty about whether they were complying and agreeing with the aims of the policy. Their resentment seems to be provoked by the policy and principles of outcomes-based education (OBE). CAPS explicitly states commitment to OBE precepts as the way forward to an open and democratic approach to teaching and learning (CAPS, Introduction). The teachers view the inclusion of IAM and Jazz as the policy makers' response to widening the curriculum that was previous biased towards the teaching of Western music. The policy's aim to encourage learners with diverse profiles to take music as a matriculation subject in their last two years of school is a concern to them. They comment about how increased access to the subject might impact on the quality of music education being offered at school, particularly with regard to their competency to teach three very different types of music. They observe that a more flexible approach to assessment based on group rather than individual achievements might lead to the lowering of standards and result in the demotivation of competent learners who have a history of prior knowledge as well as a long tradition of learning to play their chosen instruments. This concern is linked to teaching music in classes with large student numbers where music lessons sometimes become simplified with an emphasis placed on singing.

The differences between African and Western music have raised the question of what can be considered to be good musical knowledge in each genre. Teachers have pointed out that African music is regarded as being more inclusive whilst Western music is portrayed as being exclusive. This has drawn attention to the way in which African music might be regarded as having lower standards than Western music. Teachers have pointed out that it is difficult to specify what good musical knowledge is without applying different and appropriate criteria to suit different genres of music.

4   Do they see music and music education as a vehicle for social transformation?

The teachers in this study have all agreed that there is a need for social transformation in South Africa and that music and music education can contribute to this agenda. They answer this question in various ways and in particular most of the teachers discuss the African philosophical concept of Ubuntu as an important aspect of dealing with diversity. Teachers accept that the inclusion of broader and more varied content in a post-apartheid curriculum is necessary but they see is as problematic for the following reasons:

- Western music literacy continues to be regarded as an indispensable skill and teachers feel that indigenous music should be notated in a conventional manner for easier access by teachers.
- Untrained, unqualified and/or inexperienced music teachers are expected to teach indigenous music.
- Trained Western music teachers are taking the initiative to teach indigenous music through Western musical traditions, raising issues of authenticity.
- Some music teachers and learners are resistant to the idea of studying non-Western music.
- There is a shortage of indigenous music resources available in many schools.

The connection teachers make between Ubuntu and social transformation is significant in a discussion about a curriculum that places an emphasis on values as well as content. The teachers generally believe that barriers between race and teacher-pupil hierarchy can be reduced if they can learn about different cultural practices from each other. One teacher, Iris, resists this idea whilst Mary reflects the majority view that Western music can be combined with Indigenous music in a way that can bridge the gap between the two.

Five teachers (Katy, Mary, Nathalie, Adriana and Lily) regarded music policy in general as the cornerstone of South African music education, particularly during an era of democracy. They would like to see black teachers better prepared to contribute and to reflect on the curriculum's aims for improved access and increased diversity in school music. All the teachers are of the opinion that social transformation, interpreted as primarily a matter of offering previously disadvantaged learners the opportunity to study music, can only be successfully executed if the music curriculum is comprehensively implemented in all South African schools. Additionally, they point out that whilst learners are ostensibly being given free choice as to what types of music to study in high school their decisions are made in the context of a policy that has identified three genres of music that are to be assessed in mainly examination situations. To compound the problem I have noticed that CAPS gives schools (and not the learners) the authority to decide what options they might offer students (CAPS, 2011: 9).

In this chapter, teachers have put forward a number of salient points that have enriched the discussion about 'good' music education in South Africa and whether recent policy changes have made stronger links between the study of music and achieving social transformation in post-apartheid South African society. Chapter Seven, the last chapter of this dissertation will return to the central research question: To what extent are music teachers able and likely to fulfil the requirements of the new post-apartheid curriculum with particular reference to the NCS?

Chapter Seven

Conclusion

Introduction

I have critically endorsed South Africa's post-apartheid music policy in its attempt to overcome a past of historical injustice over the apartheid era of nearly five decades during 1948-1994 and previous to that, recovering too from the effects of pre-apartheid colonialism. Since 1994 and the first democratic elections held in this country, the framing of education policy has rested on a reconciliation process which includes 'infusing the principles and practices of social and environmental justice and human rights as defined in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa' (Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement, CAPS, 2011: 5). The thread of developing and evaluating policy on the basis of previously perpetrated human rights abuses and racial inequality during the old order has been a continuous one, beginning with the introduction of outcomes-based education (OBE) in South Africa in the early 1990's. Consequently, matters concerning educational transformation are articulated by a state curriculum policy that strives to embed a philosophy of learner-centred education. Chapter Two illustrated the complexity of the various issues mentioned in this paragraph by linking them to aspects of post-colonial theory and ethnomusicology.

It is against this backdrop that teachers have responded to my enquiries about their views on post-apartheid music education in the school classroom. What has become evident in this research study is that the participants are very aware of the complex demands of the policy and the controversial issues it raises, as explored in Chapter Three, and have found creative ways to engage with the CAPS even if they were not professionally obliged to in some cases. For them, the assumptions underpinning

CAPS are appropriate to the cultural context of South Africa. The policy presents a defensible view of the nature and purpose of music and how schools might engage with it. What is less clear is if the authors of CAPS have recognised the demands it makes on teachers.

Teaching and learning music as promoted in CAPS is not exclusively about the learner. The policy also recognises that new-order music teachers are required to adopt a strong sense of ethics and accountability in matters that not only address music as a 'school subject' but additionally to address the social, political and economic future of the country. Having a global perspective in music has become mandatory in music curricula, not just in South Africa but also in other parts of the world. To cater for these changes, teachers are expected to construct their lessons around diverse musics that include classical, popular, folk, world, jazz and contemporary twentieth century music. In Chapter Two, I considered the extent to which teachers are expected to engage with all the different issues involved in the reconstruction of a music curriculum. For this to be achieved teachers are being asked to demonstrate competencies in musics they might be untrained in and unfamiliar with. The music curriculum blends African and Western music in a way that requires music teachers to be well-informed and highly skilled in areas that are not necessarily within their expertise.

At the outset, I proposed that a study of teachers' views about changing music education in South African schools was connected to the way in which they had experienced the learning of music as young children and young adults. In the post-colonial world that forms the backdrop to this study contemporary goals in music education have shifted away from exclusively Western musical traditions in order to encompass, more comprehensively, the study of diverse musics. Chapter Three presented an analytical overview of the development of the post-apartheid music curriculum. I argued that while both African and Western music should indeed be

taught, there are daunting challenges for teachers and more work needs to be done in further refining of the curriculum and supporting its implementation.

The central question that framed my enquiry was to what extent music teachers were able and likely to fulfil the requirements of the new, post-apartheid curriculum, with particular reference to the NCS? Subsidiary research questions helped to keep the focus on interviews:

1   How has the participants' own musical education contributed to their views on the goals, aims and purposes of the new curriculum?

2   a) Given their own musical education, how do they perceive the requirement to accommodate and value African as well as Western music?

2   b) Do they have a particular allegiance to African or Western music?

3   What are their views on what is 'good' musical knowledge?

4   Do they see music and music education as a vehicle for social transformation?

Participants studied an extract from the NCS (2003) containing a rich description of what music was and what its aims were, in advance of their interviews, the methodology of which is explained in Chapter Four. This is a small research group and I am not claiming that all music teachers' views are represented by my 12 teachers. All the participants carefully reflected on the extract I provided them with and the interviews contained a great deal of valuable insight into the questions raised. What I had not anticipated was that teachers did not confine themselves to the role of teaching. Except for Adriana and Nathalie, the remaining ten teachers simultaneously engaged in other music careers: policy writer, conductor, accompanist, performer, text book writer, arranger, examiner and education inspector. Table E in Chapter Five gave further details of teacher-profiles illustrating the point that contemporary music teachers are required to be flexible. Engagement in these subsidiary musical professions could account for the thoughtful manner in which they engaged with the curriculum.

How backgrounds have affected views on music education

As the data has revealed in Chapter Five, it is evident that participants' own music education significantly shaped their views on the broader aims of music education. All of the teachers in the study were trained in the Western tradition of playing instruments and learning the fundamentals of music theory. In common with my own background described in Chapter One, close scrutiny of teachers' journeys revealed that they had all experienced strict musical upbringings. The level of authority they were subjected to as music students, to a large extent, influenced the way in which they perceived the teaching of music. Teachers described strict regimes of instrumental lessons that resulted in punitive measures such as being hit on the fingers with a knitting needle or other objects, being criticised harshly by their teachers and forced to practice for long hours to achieve excellence in the form of passing external examinations with distinction. None of the teachers advocated this type of pedagogy as a necessary means to acquire mastery of an instrument. Without exception they were in accord with a curriculum that aimed to generate an interest in music through discovery, interaction and critical engagement – aims that are expressed in CAPS and consonant with the ideals of OBE.

Eleven of the teachers felt that learners' well-being was an important aspect of music education. This was expressed in different ways: well-being of mind (George), holistic development of learners (Adriana, Nathalie), enjoyment (Niles, Tracey, Charlotte and Roland), reinforcement of national identity (Rosalind, Lily, Mary, Katy). Iris did not comment specifically on the link between music lessons and well-being because she was more concerned with protecting the integrity of music as a subject. Teachers felt they needed to engage with curriculum reform by reflecting on policy documents and considering the implications of the changes that they would need to make in their practice in order to accommodate the new curriculum. A change in teaching attitude was regarded as an essential part of on-

going professional development. The effort taken by research participants to reflect deeply on the policy is one of the ways they have demonstrated their willingness to try and fulfil the requirements of CAPS. They approve of knowledge to be extended to include a variety of musics with an enhanced understanding of South African music – be it traditional and/or contemporary music. The extent to which teachers complied with the requirement for diversity and inclusion was mixed, indicating that some teachers were more committed to the process of change than others. Nevertheless, all of the teachers were keen to provide learners with a varied and diverse repertoire of music that included Western and African music and this was evident in their knowledgeable of diverse repertoire and specific compositions.

The teachers all viewed Western music literacy as a non-negotiable part of the music curriculum. Their own backgrounds evidenced strong learning of reading and writing music and they seemed to have retained a preference for this tradition. Nine teachers (Lily, Niles, Katy, Mary, Roland, Rosalind, Nathalie, Iris and Tracey) commented on Ubuntu[42] as an expression of music teaching values in the curriculum. My understanding of this notion is summarised as (1) the needs of the group being more important than the individual and (2) individuals enhancing group learning[43]. The remaining three teachers (Adriana, Charlotte and George) did not explicitly discuss or indirectly reference the subject of Ubuntu. I found no particular correlation between the personal experiences of teachers and their approach to teaching music from the perspective of a values-driven curriculum. Although, in all cases, they were taught music from a traditional content-driven curriculum the teachers were supportive of changes that opened up what used to regarded as Western music education (through the export of Western music practices) to a transformed notion of self-expression, self-fulfilment and an expression of identity.

---

[42] None of the curriculum documents specifically mention Ubuntu but the values it expresses can be linked to the understanding of Ubuntu as expressed by the participants in Chapter Six.
[43] This summarised explanation of Ubuntu is based on literature and participants' discussion about Ubuntu.

Despite their support, a curriculum driven by values rather than content is troubling the research-cohort. There is anxiety that music as a subject will decline in reputation because of the different requirements it has been charged to address. Consequently all the teachers have expressed scepticism about the way policy makers have approached CAPS – particularly noted is their reservation about how different musics will be taught and by whom they will be taught. They convey their eagerness to comply with the changes but are unsure of exactly how CAPS expects them to integrate change in an environment where resources are scarce and with a policy they describe as vague. There appears to be disenchantment on the part of two of the black teachers in this study (Katy and Mary) that curriculum changes are driven by white policy makers who they see as unqualified to make the necessary changes in African music. The highlighting of these doubts contributes to the on-going debate on music education policy development.

Views on African and Western music

All the teachers agreed that African music had the potential to encourage wider participation and that Western music elicited impressions of elitism. The reason for this divide was explained in a number of ways. African music was regarded as less complicated to learn about and to execute than Western music. Western music was considered to be elitist in the way it promoted the acquisition of knowledge and excellence through formal assessment thereby putting an emphasis on the individual learner. By contrast, African music was thought to encourage greater participation by larger numbers of learners with limited music experience and knowledge where group advancement was looked upon more favourably during the assessment process. Central to this issue was their impression that Western music should be taught differently to African music. Teachers deliberated about the differences between lesson content and the way music was taught from this perspective. The consensus of opinion was that Western music was content-laden whilst African music relied on experiential knowledge where learners were

expected to participate and engage in music though active and creative learning. As a consequence of these expectations, teachers perceived music teaching to fall into two types: classroom music and subject music. Classroom music was considered to offer learners the opportunity to gain general knowledge and experience of music that would enhance their experience of music in broad terms. Subject music was described in a way that suggested it had much more focus for the acquisition and application of skills and knowledge where learners had to demonstrate their abilities for the purposes of examination assessment.

All the teachers believed that the study of Western music should take place over a long period of time and therefore is something that needed to occur from an early stage of a pupil's life. This belief was substantiated by the impression that Western instruments took a long time to master unlike African instruments that were mostly percussion instruments, which took a shorter time to develop proficiency in. Notwithstanding this position teachers conceded that that serious study of African music would also necessitate specialist teaching and absorbed learning over a long time. It was pointed out that African instruments could be mastered at different levels of technical excellence but that this tended not to happen due to the lack of teacher-expertise and recognised external examinations for African instruments. Three teachers (Charlotte, Katy and Mary) pointed out that with expert knowledge the nuances and complexities in African music could be uncovered and discovered. George did not agree; his position is that gaining access into African music is restricted to those who have been enculturated in it from birth.

Teachers' perceptions into accommodating and valuing African as well as Western music are complicated. Those who have had prior knowledge of African music (Katy, Mary, Adriana and Nathalie) are enthusiastic proponents of it for increased diversity in the curriculum. Those teachers who have sought and successfully acquired knowledge and experience of African music during their post-apartheid teaching careers (Niles, George, Roland, Rosalind, Charlotte and Tracey) are also

promoters of African music as a way of encouraging more learners to study music at school. Lily would like to see newer forms of African music (such as township Kwaito music) to be analysed and studied as a serious genre of music in its own right. Iris' experience is that African music in its current form discourages serious study of music as it is often used in schools as a way to superficially engage children in music lessons.

Participants concurred that music teachers should be trained to teach African music if this was something they had not been exposed to before. Mary felt that there was a gap between African and Western music that manifested itself as formality in Western music and informality in African music. She deemed it possible that African music was absorbed in childhood through its often spontaneous and natural use in custom and occasions such as at weddings and funerals for example. Her impression was that Western music was entrenched in etiquette which limited participation to those who were proficient in the genre. All the teachers agreed that African music could be experienced as an everyday activity with some going as far as to say that contact with African music elicited an emotional and instinctive response which was encouraged to be outwardly expressed. This relaxed approach to music contrasted sharply with the expectation for restrained and quiet appreciation for Western music.

I did not observe any relationship between teachers' early experiences of learning music, their college training and their allegiances to particular genres of music. Personal taste in music was not discussed in any of the interviews. Instead a different type of discussion ensued where teachers explained their teaching preferences based on past and present teaching experiences as well as curriculum demands. By accommodating post-apartheid curriculum demands for diversity, Rosalind, Charlotte, Niles and Roland commented on the fun and enjoyment African music practices offered learners. Mary, Katy, Lily, Adriana, Tracey, Nathalie and George found it particularly appropriate to engage in African music practices in

under-resourced schools. Iris expressed uncertainty in the appropriateness of profiling African music practices within a curriculum that was framed with Western music assessment procedures.

Good musical knowledge

Teacher's views on the definition of 'good' musical knowledge are illustrated by their concerns for protecting the integrity of music as a subject discipline. The teacher most alarmed about school musical knowledge becoming diluted was Iris. All of the teachers regarded Western music theory and literacy as integral to the study of any genre of music. At the same time they accepted that many learners could not afford to study music outside of their schools and were therefore keen to build on the prior knowledge and experiences of their learners. They were keen to point out that with the assistance of expert local indigenous musicians African music could be executed at a high standard by their students thereby improving its reputation as a serious genre of music. The notion that music should be situated within a cultural context is one they all agreed on. Their discussions on music education in this milieu highlighted the subtlety of what they regarded good music knowledge to be and what it offered learners. Their views are summarised below:

1   Knowledge of emerging musics
2   Knowledge of music technology
3   Music appreciation
4   Passing music examinations
5   The ability to participate in group ensembles
6   The ability to perform as a soloist
7   The ability to participate in cross-curricular projects
8   Developing a life-long interest in music

Teachers' views on good musical knowledge illustrate that they largely are in accord with CAPS aims. However the attempt to inject democracy into the music curriculum by combining atypical components into the music syllabus have given rise to perplexity and turmoil for some teachers who have viewed the inclusion of different musics as a signal to some schools to employ untrained and unqualified teachers as music experts. They believe that this approach would compromise the standards of good musical knowledge.

In Chapter One, I posed four questions regarding what might constitute good music education. Teachers have answered these questions as indicated below:

1   Is it the ability to appreciate different musics?

The teachers have confirmed their view that the appreciation of different musics as essential in South Africa for three reasons. Firstly, they believe that by giving learners a wide and diverse choice, the subject of music could attract more learners. Secondly, they explain that learners are likely to be drawn to types of music that they are familiar with. Thirdly, they acknowledge that a policy strategy to include music from diverse social settings might be successful in providing a solution to including learners without prior discipline knowledge to study subject music.

2   Is it the ability to specialise in one particular genre of music and acquire high-level technical practical skills in one instrument?

Teachers have expressed different views on this matter which cannot be aligned to their own experiences of learning and teaching music. Some of the teachers (Niles and Iris) who have been trained in Western music and acquired a strong knowledge base and highly developed instrumental skills over many years believe that it is

important for the integrity of music as a subject discipline to maintain high standards of Western theoretical and practical musicianship. Other teachers who have had similar backgrounds (George, Charlotte, Roland, Tracey, Rosalind, Lily) prefer to extend specialisation from one dominant genre of music to many genres of music because they believe that a strict, rigorous and traditional approach to music education might compromise the element of enjoyment which they believe to be an important aspect of studying music. Nonetheless they are committed to Western traditions of music literacy and theory as essential to a thorough understanding of music. The remaining teachers (Adriana, Nathalie, Katy, Mary, Niles and Iris) are very keen to emphasise that whilst Western music tenets are important in South African music education, policy makers should ensure that equal emphasis on African music tenets are placed in the curriculum. They believe that African music should be taught by experienced and knowledgeable musicians and that all school learners should experience the playing of many different indigenous instruments.

3   Is it the acquisition of a wide knowledge base that encourages life-long learning of music as an amateur?

All the teachers have approved of a curriculum that offers the learners to experience a wide variety of music. Whilst they have not directly addressed the matter of life-long learning aspirations of amateur musicians they have all described how their own early musical experiences have influenced them. Consequently they attribute their life-long love of music to their early instrumental lessons. It can be inferred from the unanimity of their responses that life-long learning of music commences from a young age.

4   Is it a global approach to music education that seeks to create a unified and integrated system that addresses social inequality but at the same time adheres to earlier models of competency?

The teachers' examination of NCS (2003) and CAPS (2011) music policy documents has heightened their awareness of the complexities that underlie a global approach to music education. They have expressed their understanding of music education to be more than the learning of Western music traditions and one that incorporates other musics – specifically African music. They value both integrated approaches to learning music as well as competency-based models. As mentioned earlier, they suggest that teaching and learning of music can be divided into two types that they describe as classroom music and subject music. Classroom music is associated with a pedagogic style that is more compatible with an agenda of addressing social inequality whilst subject music is correlated to maintaining high standards of skills and knowledge that can be exported globally. Their views suggest that more work needs to be done to bridge the gap between these two experiences of school music.

Music, music education and social transformation

The teachers all agree that music education should reflect the changes that have taken place in democratic South Africa. To this end, they have answered the call from policy makers to increase diversity in and widen access to music. They believe that the multi-ethnic demographics of their classrooms could and should contribute to the aims of learning from one another (Ubuntu), respecting each other's cultural practices and showing tolerance of diverse values and beliefs. Teachers have demonstrated their willingness to promote social transformation through their professional practice by making significant changes to their lesson content. To one extent or another, they have all demonstrated their ability to encompass musics that are outside the scope of their experiences. They have sourced different musics from their pupils, colleagues and friends, composed and arranged non-Western music, involved themselves in out-reach projects to teach music to underprivileged members of the community and started and directed choirs to improve participation in musical activities.

The emergence of urban music is an expression of the wider forces of social transformation where diverse musics have become more accessible to a larger number of people thereby making the study of music less elitist in nature. Teachers in this study have recognised the advent of urban music as a derivative of opening the curriculum up to include previously disadvantaged individuals (PDI). They believe that a number of contrasting elements such as tribal music and hip-hop for example, can be seen in the evolution of urban music which should be recognised and respected as a style of its own. Thus, Kwaito music is an example of a style that is central to a social setting where there is a functional aspect for its use.

Teachers agree with the policy strategy of cross-curricular teaching as a way to democratise the music curriculum. Connected to the cross curricular approach was the general belief that part of the 'holistic development'[44] of learners was the learning of music and that all schools should provide them with the skills to appreciate music. It was a source of contention for everyone interviewed that music lessons are not compulsory in all South African schools. The teachers clearly articulated the challenges that they have experienced from the viewing of music and music education as a vehicle for social transformation. Their key areas for concern are:

1   Music is not a mandatory subject in the national school curriculum
2   Disparity of resources to teach music in schools
3   Resistance to learning different musics by teachers and learners
4   Entrenched Western habits of music teaching and learning in professional practice as well as curriculum design
5   Lack of diverse, particularly African, specialist musical knowledge
6   Absence of recognised African music assessment procedures
7   Shortage of African printed music compositions and arrangements
8   Lack of on-going professional development

---

[44] The term 'holistic development' is one that is used in many South African education policy documents and features in the extract given to the teachers.

Implications for professional practice

Despite the many challenges that teachers have experienced in implementing post-apartheid curriculum aims there are encouraging signs in this group of participants that they are responding to many of the demands being made in the curriculum. Teachers have found ways in which to expand their knowledge by discovering music genres they have not studied themselves as students. Throughout the course of this research study I have found that teachers are able and likely to fulfil the requirements of the new, post-apartheid curriculum, more so than I had initially anticipated. In Chapter Five, there is evidence to show that they have found creative ways to teach music especially where they have experienced limited resources. They have reflected on the new curriculum and this has resulted in them all changing the way they teach – particularly in the areas of content and approach. The teachers' own experiences of learning music have shaped the way in which they regard what they teach and how they teach it. They have proved their commitment to bringing a more balanced curriculum to a wider group of learners.

This study has highlighted the lack of structured teaching support in continuing professional development. The lack of specific resources available to South African teachers to expand their knowledge of African music suggests a pressing need to address this deficit. Another area for urgent improvement is the naming and identifying of policy documents. I found that the numerous post-1994 documents all had very similar names (sometimes identical) because many of them were revisions of earlier documents. Consequently, I experienced difficulty in finding them. Staff members in the Department of Education in Pretoria were often as confused and perplexed as I was when trying to respond to my requests for particular policies. The search for policies on the internet and in University libraries were also confounded by the coinciding titles and often lack of information regarding authors and dates of publication. Apart from the difficulty of tracking down policies I also found myself depending on Music Heads of Departments to keep me informed of the

latest documents. It was my experience that only some of them were kept informed of the latest developments and that the necessary documents were not publicly available.

In the light of this study certain measures need to be taken to ensure successful implementation of the ambitious shift in music education from predominantly Western-based practices to an amalgamation of diverse music practices with specific reference to African music. The policy needs refining in the way it instructs teachers to execute the changes demanded of them in the curriculum. The language it uses is at times rhetorical which makes it difficult for teachers to conceive the practicalities of applying the teaching of diverse musics. The resources for music education need improving. Teacher development and teacher training should reflect the policy intent to transform music education into an enlightened project for social transformation that sets new and high standards for multiple-approaches for school music.

This study has influenced my own approach to teaching which has changed from a limited perspective of Western music to one that is less formal and judgmental. Principally, my approach to music assessment has changed. I used to be very committed to preparing my students for external Western grade examinations. Since being in South Africa, I have engaged in more affirmative experiences where music is performed enthusiastically and as a declaration of identity as well as ethnic pride. My work as a National Eisteddfod Academy (NEA) adjudicator[45] has given me the opportunity to assess musical ability in a way that encourages and promotes participants' enjoyment of performing in public. I have written guidelines on writing comments and feedback in candidates' reports for the NEA. The ethos of recognising and respecting the efforts of all candidates was very different from the competency-mode model of external music examinations, which prior to 2007, was

---

[45] The National Eisteddfod Academy (NEA) is a South African youth development programme that provides opportunities for participation in the performing arts. It was established in 2004 and has had over 300,000 entrants to date.

the only style of assessment I was familiar with. Keen to discover the repertoire of African music and incorporate it into my own lesson planning, I have attended local school concerts and competitions to hear more local music. I have approached colleagues who are knowledgeable in African music to help me expand and diversify my personal music collection. I encourage students to bring me music of their own choice to learn and together we explore different sounds by playing indigenous instruments I have started to collect over the last few years.

I propose the following recommendations:

1 Music is made a mandatory subject in school curricula.
2 The study of music should be introduced in primary school and kept as part of the curriculum throughout a learner's school career.
3 Adequate resources, including the publication of African music, the provision of indigenous instruments and expert practical tuition should be provided to all learners.
4 Research should be conducted into the creation of a widely recognised and respected assessment scheme specifically designed for African music learners.
5 Teachers should be encouraged to initiate an open-space such as a dedicated resource e-portal in order to share resources, exchange experiences and discuss their views about the curriculum.
6 Policy makers should be able to access teachers' spaces for reflection.
7 Policy texts should give clear directions for the implementation of change as proposed by their strategies.
8 Learners (and not schools) should be given the choice of the genre of musics they would like to specialise in. If the schools are unable to provide for certain streams of music offered in the curriculum then there should be other institutions (such as music centres) that learners could apply to attend, free of charge.
9 The published baseline for qualified teachers should be expanded to include teachers who might not possess the Western qualifications (CAPS, 2011: 11) but

who have proven competencies in teaching, even if these skills are demonstrated outside the parameters of music diplomas and degrees.

10 Future policy and curriculum publications should be clearly named, dated and allocated unique Department of Education (DoE) policy numbers for easy access and retrieval in the public domain. Older documents should also be allocated DoE reference numbers.

11 All DoE publications should clearly state the author/s name/s and dates of publications.

12 Access to policy documents should be made easier.

13 The dissemination of music policy documents should aim to reach a wider audience.

14 Music policy development should be a process that is constantly reviewed and revised by the DoE.

There are three areas that I have identified for further research. Firstly, the extent to which teachers use the policy documents to design and review their lessons would constitute an important study in the future. Secondly, an empirical investigation into the effectiveness of a curriculum that includes African and Western music within a cross-curricula education strategy would be helpful in determining the success of such a strategy. Thirdly, research and development of a South African qualification framework for indigenous music could increase its credibility and prominence within the larger music community.

As a result of this study I would like to investigate the CAPS policy assumption that all critical outcomes can be successfully addressed when students are being encouraged to learn music in many different ways. The particular feature modelled on democracy in CAPS that unsettles me is the learning of three musics. I remain to be totally convinced that policy makers have found the definitive solution to providing a diverse curriculum via this strategy. However, the debate about creating a two-pronged approach to high-knowledge and skills in the form of content and context laden learning schemes is one that is lively and celebrated by me and the teachers who have participated in this study. I look forward to

contributing to these debates by contacting any interested teachers to discuss the implications of present and future curriculum reform. The idea of forming an interest-group is one that I shall pursue.

Appendices

Appendix 1: Extract from Department of Education, National Curriculum Statement, Grades 10-12 (General), Music (2003), pp 9-10, Pretoria and Cape Town, South Africa, Chapter 2, Music

Definition

Music is the art of organising sounds. It expresses the intellectual, emotional and spiritual aspects of human experience. Music is an art form that uses sound combined with other forms of musical expression such as poetry and dance, often enhanced by technology. It can communicate a broad range of ideas and issues from historical, cultural, socioeconomic and other contexts. Music has the power to unite groups and to mobilise community involvement towards the improvement of the quality of life, social healing and affirmation of human dignity.

Purpose

The study of Music encompasses performance techniques, style, listening, form, theory, interpretation and history. Music gives learners access to opportunities of musical expression and communication through the creation and performance of music within a South African, pan-African and global context. It prepares learners for participation in community life, the world of work and progression to Higher Education. This subject creates opportunities for learners to explore musical knowledge and how it is applied. Music contributes to the holistic development of learners. It develops creative, interpretative and analytical skills. It contributes towards personal growth, cultural affirmation of African and South African musical practices, and the economic development of the country. Musicians are central to the development of the music industry that contributes to the national economy.

The goals of the subject Music are to:

- create and ensure an appreciation and respect for South Africa's diverse musical practices and other diversities;
- contribute to the building of a shared national musical heritage and identity;
- equip learners with the knowledge and understanding of the musics of the world;
- equip learners with musical skills that are globally competitive;
- affirm own and national heritage by creating opportunities for learners to participate in the performance of and research into indigenous musical practices;
- equip learners with skills to participate in the music industry by developing their ability to work effectively with others;
- give learners creative opportunities to express social, personal, environmental and human rights issues;
- equip learners with skills to make effective use of music technology for creative processes;
- develop the entrepreneurial skills and attitudes that encourage a culture of self-employment;

Music

- provide knowledge of the elements of music and apply them to the creation, performance and appreciation of music;
- apply creative problem solving through performance, composition and analysis of musical works;
- ensure the participation of learners with special needs by means of appropriate methods and strategies;
- promote artistic expression through a variety of musical styles and available resources; and
- create an environment where learners' love for music making is stimulated.

Appendix 2: Exemplar of Plain Language Statement

1   Dissertation title and researcher details

Working title: Western and African Music in the South African Music

Classroom: Teachers' Perceptions

Researcher details: Urvi Drummond LTCL, GTCL (Hons), PGCE, MEd, fourth-year doctoral student at the University of Glasgow's Faculty of Education Mobile tel: +27 83 966 4217; e-mail: urvi@tiscali.co.za. Research undertaken for the Doctorate in Education (Ed D) degree.

Supervisors' details:

Professor Penny Enslin Tel: +44141 330 3238; e-mail: p.enslin@educ.gla.ac.uk

Dr Nicki Hedge Tel: +44 141 330 5492; e-mail: n.hedge@educ.gla.ac.uk

2   Invitation paragraph

You are being invited to take part in a research study currently entitled "Western and African Music in the South African Classroom: Teachers' Perceptions". Before you decide, it is important for you to understand why the research is being done and what it will involve. Please take time to read the following information carefully and discuss it with others if you wish. Ask me if there is anything that is not clear or if you would like more information. Take time to decide whether or not you wish to take part.

Thank you for reading this.

3   What is the purpose of the study?

The purpose of this study is to give you the opportunity to discuss your views on African and Western music in the South African classroom. I will be asking you to discuss aspects of the National Curriculum Statement that involve this particular

topic. This would enable me to understand your perceptions of the NCS music curriculum and your attitudes towards Western and African music as an approach to music education.

4   Why have I been chosen?

You have been chosen as one of twelve music teachers, interested in the future of music education in South Africa, and willing to take part in my study.

5   Do I have to take part?

It is up to you to decide whether or not to take part. If you decide to take part you are still free to withdraw at any time and without giving a reason. Should this happen, it will not jeopardise your relationship with me in any way.

6   What will happen to me if I take part?

You could expect to participate in two 60-minute interviews during 2011 and possibly into the first three months of 2012. These will be audio-taped and transcribed. You will be requested to check the interview transcripts and my written interpretations of your comments and then discuss my analysis of your data with me. The time period will not exceed nine months and is anticipated to be during July 2011– March 2012.

7   Will my taking part in this study be kept confidential?

All information which is collected about you during the course of the research study will be kept strictly confidential. You will be identified by a researcher-generated ID number and any information about you will have your name and address removed so that you cannot be recognised from it.

## 8	What will happen to the results of the research study?

The raw data obtained from you will be analysed, interpreted and presented in the form of a research report to be submitted to the University of Glasgow, UK, by July 2012. This date may be later depending on how long it will take me to complete the final report. Your anonymity will be respected and safeguarded at all times. The results should be available by December 2012. You may request access to these results. Your agreement to participate in data recording, its analysis and interpretation will influence the results.

## 9	Who is organising and funding the research?

N/A

## 10	Who has reviewed the study?

Professor Penny Enslin and Dr Nicki Hedge of the Faculty of Education, University of Glasgow, and the Faculty of Education Ethics Committee, University of Glasgow, have all reviewed this research study.

## 11	Contacts for Further Information

Urvi Drummond, e-mail: urvi@tiscali.co.za, mobile tel: +27 83 966 4217

Should you have any further concerns regarding the conduct of this research project, please feel free to contact the Faculty of Education Ethics Officer by contacting Dr Georgina Wardle at g.wardle@educ.gla.ac.uk.

Appendix 3: Exemplar of Consent Form

Working title: Western and African Music in the South African Classroom: Teachers' Perceptions

Name of researcher: Urvi Drummond LTCL, GTCL (Hons), PGCE, MEd

1 I confirm that I have read and understood the Plain Language Statement for the above study and have had the opportunity to ask questions.

2 I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw at any time, without giving any reason.

3 I consent to:

- giving my time in accordance with the agreed upon conditions in the Plain Language statement, which I have read and understood

- interviews being audio-taped and transcribed by UN Drummond and a hired transcriber
  as part of a research study that constitutes fourth and fifth year work towards her doctoral dissertation at the University of Glasgow, UK

- my anonymous contributions being read by tutors, supervisors, examiners and members of the public

4 I agree / do not agree (delete as applicable) to take part in the above study.

_____   _____   _____

Name of Participant   Date   Signature

_____   _____   _____

Name of Researcher   Date   Signature

Appendix 4: Questions for Participants

July 2011 – December 2011

Working Title: Western and African Music in the South African Music Classroom: Teachers' Perceptions

These questions are intended to be mostly open-ended. Interviews with twelve teachers will take place over a period of twelve months. The National Curriculum Statement (2003), Arts and Culture, Learning Area 8 (Music) will be referred to in this document as the *NCS*.

Participants are free to comment on any other matters (related to the research) they may wish to bring up during the course of this research.

1. **Interview 1: Biography** – motivation, achievement, expectations

    i. Please describe your journey to becoming a music teacher.

    ii. Please describe your proudest achievements in music.

    iii. Please describe two significant learning experiences that you as a teacher have been exposed to through the *NCS*.

2. **Interview 2: Experience of Enjoyment and Success** – definition and examples of enjoyment and success

    i. Please describe two of your most enjoyable and successful lessons inspired by the *NCS* and explain the reasons for their success.

    ii. Please describe two aspects of the *NCS* that you might have found difficult or awkward to implement in the classroom and explain the reasons for the difficulties.

    iii. Please describe any strong views you may have on the *NCS* content. If you have no strong views please explain your ambivalence.

3. **Interview 3: Elements of Enjoyment** – satisfaction, effort, motivation, practice, repertoire, technique, supporting tests

i. Please describe in detail one or more aspects that your students find particularly stimulating in the *NCS*.

ii. Please go into detail if these aspects are linked to Indigenous music.

iii. Please comment on the progress of your students with regard to understanding different musical styles.

4. **Interview 4: Wrap-Up** – discussion of recurring themes and general impressions, follow- up information

i. Please describe your general impressions regarding the *NCS*.

ii. Please comment on whether your impressions of the NCS have changed during your participation in this dissertation research project. If so, in what way/s have they changed?

iii. Please comment if your written reflections on the *NCS* have provided you with a framework of concepts that you embrace, reject or are ambivalent about in this music policy document. Please give details.

iv. What advice would you give a new and/or inexperienced music teacher who wants to follow the *NCS*?

v. Please confirm your e-mail and any other contact details for follow-up information regarding this study. I will be pleased to have your co-operation in checking the interview transcripts, my interpretation of your comments, and my analysis of all the data transpiring from the four interviews. Please feel free to make any corrections you deem necessary in order for us to discuss them and incorporate them into the study at a later stage.

Thank you for your time and effort in participating in this study.

Compiled 5 April 2010

References

Associated Board of the Royal School of Music. (2012) *Piano Syllabus*, from http://www.abrsm.org/regions/fileadmin/user_upload/syllabuses/pianoSyllabusRequirements13.pdf (last accessed on 23/10/2012).

Attride-Stirling, J. (2001) 'Thematic networks: an analytic tool for qualitative research', in *Qualitative Research* 2001, 2, 385.

Aubert, L. (2007) *The music of the other: new challenges for ethnomusicology in a global age*, Ashgate Publishing, USA and England.

Blacking, J. (1973) How musical is man? University of Washington, Seattle.

Bohlman, P.V. (1991) 'European musical terminology and the music of Africa', in B. Nettl and P.V. Bohlman (eds.), *Comparative musicology and anthropology of music*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago and London.

Blumer, H. (1954) *Strategies for researching learning in higher education*, chapter 3, 31-50, in G. Cousin, University of Glasgow, from http://encore.lib.gla.ac.uk/iii/encore/search/C__SCousin%2C+Glynis__Orightresult__U1?lang=eng&suite=cobalt (last accessed on 09/2/2013).

Corbin, J. and Strauss, A. (1990) 'Thematic networks: an analytic tool for qualitative research', in J. Attride-Stirling (ed.), *Qualitative Research*, 2001, 1, 385.

Cousin, G. (2008) *Strategies for researching learning in higher education*, chapter 3, 31-50, chapter 5, 71-92, University of Glasgow, from http://encore.lib.gla.ac.uk/iii/encore/search/C__SCousin%2C+Glynis__Orightresult__U1?lang=eng&suite=cobalt (last accessed on 09/02/2013).

Czerniewicz, L. Murray, S. and Probyn, M. (2000) *A research paper on the role of learning support materials in Curriculum 2005*, Rhodes University, South Africa, from http://eprints.ru.ac.za/1448/1/LSMs.pdf (last accessed on 04/10/2014).

Denscombe, M. (2007) *The good research guide*, Open University Press, Buckingham and Philadelphia, from http://valsciedu.weebly.com/uploads/2/7/9/1/2791482/the_good_research_guide.pdf (last accessed on 16/6/2012).

Department of Basic Education. (2010) *Guidelines for Inclusive Teaching and Learning*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa, from www.thutong.doe.gov.za/ResourceDownload.aspx?id=42986 (last accessed on 13/12/2011).

Department of Education. (1994) *Curriculum 2005*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.education.gov.za (last accessed on 15/12/2011).

Department of Education. (1997) *Curriculum 2005: a discussion document, Government Gazette No. 18051, 6 June, 1997*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa.

Department of Education. (2000) *Curriculum 2005: report of the review committee on Curriculum 2005, South African curriculum for the twenty-first century*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.dhet.gov.za/portals/0/Documents/Reports/SOUTH%20AFRICAN%20CURRICULUM%20for%20THE%20TWENTY%20FIRST%20CENTURY.pdf (last accessed on 04/10/2012).

Department of Education. (2000) *Revised National Curriculum Statement*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.education.gov.za (last accessed on 15/3/2010).

Department of Education. (2001) 'Draft Revised National Curriculum Statement for Grades R-9, Schools, Overview', in *Manifesto on Values, Education and Democracy (Special Schools Supplement)*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa.

Department of Education. (2002) *National Curriculum Statement, Grades 10-12, (Schools) Overview, Draft*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa.

Department of Education. (2002) *Revised National Curriculum Statement, Grades R-9 (Schools) Policy, Overview, English*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa.

Department of Education. (2002) *Revised National Curriculum Statement, Grades R-9 (Schools) Policy, Arts and Culture (A & C)*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa.

Department of Education. (2003) *National Curriculum Statement, Grades 10-12 (General), Music*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.education.gov.za/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=XjpkzQVIyqw%3D&tabid=246&mid=594 (last accessed on 06/08/2010).

Department of Education. (2003) *Revised National Curriculum Statement, Grades 10-12 (General), Music*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.education.gov.za (last accessed on 02/01/2012).

Department of Education. (2010) *Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement, (CAPS), Creative Arts, Final Draft*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa.

Department of Basic Education. (2011) *Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS)*, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa.

De Waal, T. G. (2004) *Curriculum 2005: challenges facing teachers in historically disadvantaged schools in the Western Cape*, a master's research report for the University of the Western Cape, from http://etd.uwc.ac.za/usrfiles/modules/etd/docs/etd_init_5571_1174566749.pdf (last accessed on 4/10/2012).

Dick, B. (2002) 'Action research: action and research' in *Resource papers in action research*, from http://www.aral.com.au/resources/aandr.html (last accessed on 16/06/12).

Enslin, P. and Pendlebury, S. (1998) 'The real and the ideal: teacher roles and competences in South African policy and practice', in K. Harley, F. Barasa, C. Bertram, C. Mattson and E. Pillay (eds.), *International Journal of Educational Development*, 2000, 287-304.

Fa'aea-Semeatu, T. (2011) 'Celebrating gifted indigenous roots: Gifted and talented Pacific Island (Pasifka) students', in W. Vialle (ed.), *Giftedness from an indigenous perspective*, 11th Asia Pacific Conference on Giftedness, Sydney, 29 July-1 August 2010, Australian Association for the Education for the Gifted and Talented/Department of Education and Workplace Relations.

Fullan, M. (1998) 'Educational reform as continuous improvement', in *Introductory Chapter prepared for the Keys Resource Book*, National Education Association, November 1998, from http://www.michaelfullan.ca/media/13396039520.pdf (last accessed on 25/11/2014).

Gibbs, A. (1997) 'Focus groups' in *Social Research Update,* Winter, 1997, 19, from http://sru.soc.surrey.ac.uk/SRU19.html (last accessed on 16/06/12).

Harley, K. Barasa, F. Bertram, C. Mattson, E. and Pillay, S. (2000) 'The real and the ideal: teacher roles and competences in South African policy and practice', in *International Journal of Educational Development*, 20, 287-304.

Hennion, A. (2003) 'Music and mediation: toward a new sociology of music performance in the cultural study of music – a critical introduction', in M. Clayton, T. Herbert, T. and R. Middleton (eds.), *The cultural study of music: a critical* introduction, Routledge, New York and London, 80-91.

Hornbostel, E.M. von (1928) in Waterman, C.A. (1991) in 'The uneven development of Africanist ethnomusicology: three issues and a critique' in *Comparative musicology and anthropology of music,* in Nettl, B. and Bohlman, P.V. (eds), University of Chicago Press, Chicago and London, 169-186.

Horsthemke, K. (2004) 'Indigenous knowledge: conceptions and misconceptions', in *Journal of Education*, 32, 31-48.

Horsthemke, K. (2008) 'The idea of indigenous knowledge', in *Journal of the World Archaeological Congress*, 4, 1, 129-143.

Hoover, S. (2012) *Tabla Concerto*, Canadian Broadcasting Company Release, from http://music.cbc.ca/#/concerts/Dinuk-Wijeratne---Tabla-Concerto-2012-02-09 (last accessed on 19/02/2013).

Hoyle, E. (1980) 'The real and the ideal: teacher roles and competences in South African policy and practice', in K. Harley, F. Barasa, C. Bertram, C. Mattson and E. Pillay (eds.), *International Journal of Educational Development*, 2000, 287-304.

Jansen, J. (1999) 'Why outcomes-based education will fail: an elaboration in changing curriculum studies in outcomes-based education', in J. Jansen and P. Christie (eds.), *Changing curriculum*: *studies on outcomes-based education in South Africa*, Creda Communications: Cape Town, 145-156.

Johannessen, B.G.G. (2010) Pedagogical ethics for teaching social justice in teacher education in *Globalisation, education and social justice,* Springer, Melbourne, 3-14.

Johnson, S. Hodges, M. and Monk, M. (2010) 'Teacher development and change in South Africa: A critique of the appropriateness of transfer of northern/western practice', in *A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 30, 2, 179-192.

Keddie, A. Gowlett, C. Mills, M. Monk, S. and Renshaw, P. (2013) 'Beyond culturalism: addressing issues of Indigenous disadvantage through schooling', in *Australian Education Research*, 40, 91-108, from http://download.springer.com.ezproxy.lib.gla.ac.uk/static/pdf/5/art%253A10.1007%252Fs13384-012-0080x.pdf?auth66=1425376749_6113ff89522ac1faa5fd480f976df420&ext=.pdf (last accessed on 3/10/2014).

Klopper, R. (1999) 'Outcomes-based education: what the alarm bells are ringing, and how to turn them off' in *Review Article in Alternation 6.1*, 225-236, from http://alternation.ukzn.ac.za/docs/06.1/15%20Klo.pdf (last accessed on 7/10/2012).

Kok, R. M. (2011) 'Music for a postcolonial child, theorizing Malaysian memories', in L. Kok (ed.), *Learning, teaching and musical identity: voices across cultures*, Indiana University Press, Bloomington and Indianapolis, 73-90.

Kraak, A. (1999) 'Competing education and training policy discourses: a "systemic" versus "unit standards" framework', in J. Jansen and P. Christie, *Changing curriculum: studies on outcomes-based education in South Africa*, Creda Communications, Cape Town, 21-58.

Kruss, G. (2008) *Teacher education and institutional change in South Africa*. Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC), South Africa.

Mahomed, H. (1999) 'The implementation of OBET in South Africa: pathway to success or recipe for failure?' in J. Jansen and P. Christie, *Changing curriculum: studies on outcomes-based education in South Africa*, Creda Communications, Cape Town, 151-171.

Mandoza. (n.d), from http://www.music.org.za/artist.asp?id=94 (last accessed on 10/11/2014).

McClary, S. and Walser, R. (1990) 'Music, culture and creativity in the cultural study of music', in M. Clayton, T. Herbert and R. Middleton, *The cultural study of music: a critical* introduction, Routledge, New York and London, 102-112.

Meintjes, L. (2003) *Sound of Africa: making music Zulu in a South African studio*, Duke University Press, Durham and London.

Merriam, A. P. (1964) *The anthropology of music*, Northwestern University Press, United States of America.

Motshega, A. (2011) *Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement, (CAPS), National Curriculum Statement (NCS)*, Department of Basic Education, Government Press, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.education.gov.za (last accessed on 02/12/2011).

Muller, C.A. (2008) *Focus: music of South Africa,* Second Edition, Routledge Taylor and Francis Group, New York and London, 8.

Nettl, B. (1983) *The study of ethnomusicology: thirty-one issues and concepts*, University of Illinois Press, Urbana and Chicago.

Nzewi, M. (1999) 'Strategies for music education in Africa', *International Journal of Music Education*, 33, 72, from http://ijm.sagepub.com/cgi/reprint/os-33/1/72 (last accessed on 16/12/2009).

Pahad, M. (1999) Outcomes-based assessment: the need for a common vision of what counts and how to count it in *Changing curriculum – studies on outcomes-based education in South Africa,* Jansen, J. and Christie, P. (eds), Juta and Co. Ltd., Kenwyn

Posel, D. (2001) *Race as common sense: racial classification in twentieth-century South Africa*, from http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.lib.gla.ac.uk/stable/pdfplus/525576.pdf (last accessed on 17/07/2012).

Rakometsi, M.S. (2008) 'The transformation of black school education in South Africa 1950-1994: a historical perspective', doctoral dissertation, University of the Free State, Bloemfontein, from http://etd.uovs.ac.za/ETD-db/theses/available/etd-10122009-095426/unrestricted/RakometsiMS.pdf (last accessed on 27/11/12).

Rasool, M. (1999) 'Critical responses to "Why OBE will fail"', in J. Jansen and P. Christie (eds.), *Changing curriculum: studies on outcomes-based education in South Africa*, Creda Communications, Cape Town, 171-181.

Republic of South Africa. (1953) Bantu Education Act, Act No. 47 of 1953, Government Printer, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.sabinet.co.za/south-african-online-legislation (last accessed on 28/12/2013).

Republic of South Africa. (1963) Coloured Person's Education Act, Act No. 47 of 1963, Government Printer, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.sabinet.co.za/south-african-online-legislation (last accessed on 28/12/2013).

Republic of South Africa. (1995) South African Qualifications Act, Act No. 58 of 1995, Government Printer, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.sabinet.co.za/south-african-online-legislation (last accessed on 28/12/2013).

Republic of South Africa. (1996) Bill of Rights, chapter 2 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act No. 108 of 1996, Government Printer, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.sabinet.co.za/south-african-online-legislation (last accessed on 28/12/2013).

Republic of South Africa. (1996) The National Education Policy Act, Act No. 27 of 1996, Government Printer, Pretoria, South Africa, from http://www.sabinet.co.za/south-african-online-legislation (last accessed on 28/12/2013).

Rettova, A. (2004) 'Afrophone philosophies, possibilities and practice: the reflexion of philosophical influences', in *Euphrase Kezilahabi's Nagona and Mzingile*, Swahili Forum, 11, 45-68, from http://www.qucosa.de/fileadmin/data/qucosa/documents/9099/11_03_Rettova.pdf (last accessed on 24/05/2014).

Ruggunan, S. (2010) *Race classification at the University of KwaZulu-Natal: purposes, sites and practices*, Centre for Critical Research on Race and Identity, from http://ccrri.ukzn.ac.za/archive/archive/files/sites-of-classification-report_4262ee19fc.pdf (last accessed on 19/7/2012).

South African Council for Educators (SACE). (n.d.), from http://www.sace.org.za/upload/files/The%20Role%20of%20the%20South%20African%20Council%20for%20Educators.pdf (last accessed on 02/10/2014).

Said, E. (1978) *Orientalism*, Penguin Books, London.

Said, E. (1994) *Culture and imperialism*, Vintage Books, London.

Schostack, J. (2006) *Interviewing: creating the space for views*, Manchester Metropolitan University, Manchester, from http://www.enquirylearning.net/ELU/Issues/Research/InterviewBera04.html (last accessed on 10/02/2013).

Shah, R. (2014) 'Education and social change in post-conflict and post-disaster Aceh, Indonesia', in *International Journal of Educational Development*, August 2014, 1-26, from https://educationanddevelopment.files.wordpress.com/2008/04/wp19-ijec-aceh.pdf (last accessed on 05/01/2014).

South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA), (n.d.), from http://www.saqa.org.za/ (last accessed on 14/10/2014).

Stokes, M. (1994) 'Introduction: ethnicity, identity and music', in *Ethnicity, identity and music*, Berg, Oxford and New York, 1-28.

Stokes, M. (2003) 'Globalization and the politics of world music', in M. Clayton, T. Herbert and R. Middleton (eds.), *The cultural study of music: a critical introduction*, Routledge, New York and London, 297-308.

Stone, R.M. (2008) *Theory for ethnomusicology,* Pearson/Prentice Hall, New Jersey, 205-206.

Taylor, N. (1997) 'Curriculum 2005: some issues', *JET Bulletin*, 7, 1-16, from http://www.jet.org.za/publications/bulletins/Bulletin_7.pdf (last accessed on 08/10/2012).

Taylor, N. (2008) 'It's OBE, but not as it should be', in *Mail & Guardian,* from http://mg.co.za/article/2008-04-15-its-obe-but-not-as-it-should-be (last accessed on 17/09/2009).

Thwaites, T. (2006) *Culturally inclusive arts education in Aotearoa/New Zealand*, presented at the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation World Conference on Arts Education, Lisbon, 6-9 March 2006, 1-17.

Thwaites, T. (2008) *When the canon falls silent: Music education in a globalised and diverse world of local and trans-national identities,* presented at ISME 28th World Conference on Music at all ages, Bologna, Italy, 20-25 July 2008, 293-296.

Toynbee, J. (2003) 'Music, culture and creativity', in M. Clayton, T. Herbert and R. Middleton (eds.), *The cultural study of music: a critical introduction*, Routledge, New York and London, 102-112.

Trinity College. (2012) *Exam structure and mark scheme for 2012*. Trinity-Guildhall, London, from http://www.trinitycollege.co.uk/site/?id=1046 (last accessed on 12/10/2012).

Turino, T. (2008) *Music as social life, the politics of participation*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago and London.

University of South Africa. (2011) *Graded Piano Examinations Syllabus*, from http://www.unisa.ac.za/contents/faculties/humanities/mus/docs/Piano%20Syllabus%202012%2023%20Nov%202011.pdf (last accessed on 12/10/2011).

Vermeulen, D. (2009) 'Implementing music in an integrated arts curriculum for South African primary schools', doctoral thesis, University of Pretoria from http://upetd.up.ac.za/thesis/available/etd-10172009-121302/unrestricted/00front.pdf (last accessed on 09/11/2014).

Waterman, C.A. (1991) The uneven development of Africanist ethnomusicology: three issues and a critique in *Comparative musicology and anthropology of music,* in Nettl, B. and Bohlman, P.V. (eds), University of Chicago Press, Chicago and London, 169-186.

Webley, L. (2010) The Oxford handbook of empirical legal research, Cane, P. and Kritzer, H. (eds), Oxford University Press, Oxford, New York, 934.

Wijeratne, D. (2012) *Tabla* Concerto, reviewed by S. Hoover, Canadian Broadcasting Company Release, from http://music.cbc.ca/#/concerts/Dinuk-Wijeratne---Tabla-Concerto-2012-02-09 (last accessed on 19/02/2013).

Woods, D. (1998) 'Racism, reconciliation, rights – the 3 Rs of indigenous education in Australia today', in *Australian Association for Research in Education (AARE)*, 25, 1, 53-70.

Worden, N. (1998) *A concise dictionary of South African History*, Francolin Publishers, Cape Town, 148.