

THE INTERACTION OF

SCOTTISH AND ENGLISH EVANGELICALS

1790 - 1810

---

Dudley Reeves

M. Litt.

University of Glasgow

1973

ProQuest Number: 11017971

All rights reserved

INFORMATION TO ALL USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.



ProQuest 11017971

Published by ProQuest LLC (2018). Copyright of the Dissertation is held by the Author.

All rights reserved.

This work is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code  
Microform Edition © ProQuest LLC.

ProQuest LLC.  
789 East Eisenhower Parkway  
P.O. Box 1346  
Ann Arbor, MI 48106 – 1346

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I gratefully acknowledge my indebtedness to the following:

The Rev. Ian A. Muirhead, M.A., B.D. and the Rev. Gavin D. White, B.A., B.D., Ph.D. for their most valuable guidance and criticism;

My wife and daughters for their persevering patience and tolerance;

The staff of several libraries for their helpful efficiency:

James Watt, Greenock; Public Central, Greenock; Bridge of Weir Public; Trinity College, Glasgow; Baptist Theological College, Glasgow; University of Glasgow; Mitchell, Glasgow; New College, Edinburgh; National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh; General Register House, Edinburgh; British Museum, London; Sion College, London; Dr Williams's, London.

## **Abbreviations**

- BFBS - British and Foreign Bible Society**
- BMS - Baptist Missionary Society**
- CMS - Church Missionary Society**
- LMS - London Missionary Society**
- SPGH - Society for Propagating the Gospel at Home**
- SSPCK - Scottish Society for the Propagation of Christian  
Knowledge**

## CONTENTS

1. The Background	Page 1
(a) The Eighteenth Century Revival	2
(b) The English Evangelicals	5
(c) The Scottish Background	10
2. The Period 1790-1810	15
(a) The Missionary Explosion	15
(b) The Effects of War	18
3. The Missionary Movement	23
(a) The Baptist Missionary Society	23
(i) Fuller's first visit to Scotland, 1799	25
(ii) The four later visits of Fuller to Scotland	35
(iii) Fuller's role in Scotland	41
(b) The "Evangelical Magazine"	44
(c) The Missionary Society (LMS)	51
4. The Missionary Movement in Scotland	68
(a) The Scottish town missionary societies	68
(b) The "Missionary Magazine"	75
(c) The Missionary Debate	79
(d) Simeon's tour of 1796	82
(e) The Sunday Schools tour of 1797	89
(f) The 1797 tour to the north	97
5. The Haldane Independent Movement	103
(a) The founding of the SPGH	103
(b) The SPGH preaching tours	107
(c) The Circus and the Tabernacles	118
(d) The Haldane Seminary	132
6. The Decline of Anglo-Scottish Evangelicalism	137
(a) The Assembly of 1799	137
(b) The Dissolution of the SPGH	143
(c) The recrudescence of Scottish nationalism	148
Bibliography	153
Appendix I	161

## 1. THE BACKGROUND

Evangelical is a useful blanket term to cover all Protestant Christians who claim to have experienced spiritual regeneration, being justified by faith alone, and who stress a Christ-centred gospel and the supreme authority of the Bible, the study and right application of which makes for sanctification by the Holy Spirit and the right preaching of which makes for new converts. But it is only a blanket term: there are Evangelicals and Evangelicals.

Today there are Liberal and Conservative Evangelicals; in the eighteenth century there were Arminian and Calvinist wings. We deal only with the Calvinist Evangelicals, who spread across the main denominations, bridging even the issues of baptism and the separation of Church and State. They ranged from the roving Calvinist Methodists with their greater stress on an emotional Christianity through the radical Dissenters with their self-discipline and sober approach to life to the socially higher, richer and more politically conservative Anglican and Church of Scotland Evangelicals. In general Scottish Evangelicals, especially the ministers, had received greater formal education than their English counterparts.

Private devotion and family worship with wife, children and servants and strict observance of the Sabbath were the hallmarks of Evangelicals in our period. Almost to a man they spurned the pleasures of dancing, gambling and the theatre (the condemnation of tobacco and alcohol came later) and in aesthetic appreciation they were perhaps deficient.

In our study we shall meet with different groups of Scottish Presbyterians, and with Anglicans, Independents (or Congregationalists) and Baptists (both Scottish and English) who, because they were linked by a common conversion experience and Calvinist beliefs, were ready on occasion to sink denominational differences to aid a common cause. During our period there was close collaboration between Scottish and English Evangelicals, including a remarkable procession of Englishmen to Scotland, where the emphasis of this study lies.

But first we must sketch in the background to these developments.

### (a) The Eighteenth Century Revival

The religious background to the Scottish and English Evangelicals of our period was of course the great revival of the eighteenth century. Once they had experienced revival for themselves Evangelicals sought to pass on the torch of knowing God to their own and the next generations. Some of our Evangelicals died in spiritual harness as late as the 1860s.

Though many ministers and laymen and laywomen directed people's thoughts and wills back to God during the revival, the Rev. George Whitefield may perhaps be considered the Calvinist evangelist par excellence of this remarkable movement of God's Spirit.

First taught what true religion is by the Scot Henry Scougal's "Life of God in the Soul of Man" (1), Whitefield was ordained as a Church of England minister in 1736. His very first sermon touched on the necessity of regeneration, a theme which ran right through his ministry and gave cutting power to his importunate preaching. And once he had taken to open-air preaching he soon became God's ambassador extraordinary to the English-speaking world. His admirers and supporters came from all classes, from the miners of Kingswood to the imperious Countess of Huntingdon.

Whitefield brought back into prominence the doctrine for which in earlier ages martyrs had been burnt: justification by faith alone in Christ's finished work of redemption. Salvation was a gift and all of God, not dependent on man's supposedly good works at all. Yet Whitefield was careful to stress that such saving faith always resulted in good works and personal holiness of character and conduct. As a Calvinist Whitefield emphasised the doctrine of election and so reluctantly broke with the Wesleys in 1741 whose Arminianism placed more stress on man's free will to choose God's offer of salvation.

Whitefield's travels were extensive. In seven visits to the British colonies in America he addressed, it is estimated, over half their total population of one million (2). Between 1741 and 1768 he paid 14 visits

(1) G. Whitefield's Journals, Banner of Truth Trust edn. 1960, p. 47

(2) A. Dallimore, George Whitefield, Vol. 1, p. 587

to Scotland where he was welcomed as a Calvinist into the homes and pulpits of Evangelical ministers. Though faithful to the last to the teaching of the Anglican Church as expressed in her 39 Articles and Prayer Book, Whitefield loved all whom he regarded as true Christians, whatever their denomination. He was willing to preach anywhere and to cross party barriers, thus teaching exclusively-minded Scots that the 'one thing needful' was a living relationship with the living God, beside which matters of church order were of minor importance. He reminded his societies that there was a Catholic Christianity, and not merely a denominational or national Christianity. So ecclesiastical divisions always saddened him, and that party differences in Scotland were deep and bitter was seen by the Seceders' withdrawal from sponsoring his 1741 visit, on finding him willing to occupy Established Church pulpits also. For the young Secession Synod had invited the English evangelist for his first visit to Scotland as a psychological and spiritual boost to their cause and were unwilling to share him with others. Later, Secession leaders jealously or foolishly associated the Cambuslang revival with the 'delusions of Satan' (3).

Whitefield did not initiate, though with other ministers he helped at its height, the Cambuslang revival of 1742-3. On 28 April, 1742 the Rev. William McCulloch wrote to Whitefield that about 300 souls had been awakened. Congregations approached the 10,000 mark. On 11 July Whitefield preached to 20,000 at Cambuslang and about 1,700 communicated. That night McCulloch preached till 1 a.m. and Whitefield wrote that 'throughout the whole of the night might the voice of prayer and praise be still heard in the fields' (4). On his first visit to Scotland Whitefield had written of Edinburgh 'Never did I see so many Bibles nor people looking into them, when I am expounding, with so much attention' (5). Now, of the day after the communion, he wrote '... such an universal stir I never saw before ... thousands bathed in tears. Some at the same time wringing their hands, others

(3) Act at Dunfermline, 15 July 1742

(4) G. Whitefield's Works, Vol. 1, p. 410

(5) Ibid., p. 316



almost swooning, and others crying out' (6).

At a quick follow-up communion on 15 August - 'a thing not practised before in Scotland' (7) but suggested by Dr. Webster of Edinburgh and approved by the Kirk Session - 30,000 were present and 3,000 took communion, this at a time when Glasgow's population was about 17,000 (8). This second communion was probably held for evangelistic rather than sacramental reasons, though the fact that people wishing to communicate at the first communion had been unable to was one argument used to advocate a follow-up communion (9). Next year the number of communicants fell to 2,000 but this was still abnormally large.

The Cambuslang revival overspilled to surrounding Presbyteries and as far north as Golspie and Rosemarkie. But after 1743 there was no revival on the same scale in Scotland till the turn of the century, though Whitefield's visits were 'always refreshing to serious persons'.

We have dealt with Whitefield in some detail for several reasons. First, his influence on England was great and on Scotland considerable. His ecumenical spirit was noted by the "Scots Magazine": 'This gentleman recommends the essentials of Religion, and decries the distinguishing punctilios of parties' (10). Whitefield made no attempt to Anglicise Scots and was in fact something of a cosmopolitan person. Second, all of the Evangelicals of our study followed Whitefield in his Calvinism and many took him as their model of a Christian. Third, some of our Evangelicals had direct links with Whitefield, having met him or corresponded with him or heard him preach or having relations or friends among his converts. Fourth, Whitefield's death in 1770 was far enough away in time for the aura of respect surrounding his name to have increased while close enough for people alive in 1790 to have seen and heard of his work.

(6) Whitefield, A Select Collection of Letters of the late Reverend George, 1772, London, pp. 409-10

(7) G. Whitefield's Works, Vol. 1, p. 413

(8) H. Hamilton, An Economic History of Scotland in the Eighteenth century, p. 18

(9) A. Fawcett, The Cambuslang Revival, p. 119

(10) July 1741, p. 331

## (b) The English Evangelicals

1791 saw the deaths of both John Wesley and Selina, Countess of Huntingdon. Each was a spiritual autocrat, full of enthusiasm and vigour, a leader of men and a founder of a whole string of societies and chapels across the face of England and Wales, so their passing marked the end of an era. Yet both had been forced to bow to circumstances, being obliged to register their chapels rather than be fined under the Conventicle Act and so in effect become Dissenters in all but name.

Wesley preached some 40,000 sermons to Whitefield's 18,000 and between 1751 and 1790 visited Scotland 22 times, but his Arminian views, his teaching on Christian perfection and his tendency to encourage emotional outbursts in his meetings made him less popular than Whitefield with Scottish Presbyterians. His efforts therefore met with relatively little success. 'His appeal was emotional rather than intellectual, and these northerners, glutted with pulpit theology, found little to admire in it' (11). Wesley himself wrote in his Journal on 28 May, 1764 'There is seldom fear of wanting a congregation in Scotland. But the misfortune is, they know everything, so they learn nothing'. Ten years later he wrote of Glaswegians 'they hear much, know everything, and feel nothing'. Wesley paid deference to Scottish opinion, however, and the Church of Scotland Evangelical leader could write of him 'During his own life, as well as since his death, the Methodist preachers sent to Edinburgh have been always men who either held the Calvinistic doctrines, or knew how to avoid the topics which brought their Calvinistic opinions into question' (12).

In England and Wales, however, Wesley's Methodism flourished. Begun in 1739, Wesley's societies under his organising genius by 1790 had 71,568 members, 294 preachers and over 350 chapels in 118

(11) R. A. Knox, *Enthusiasm*, p. 459

(12) H. Moncreiff Wellwood, *Account of the Life and Writings of John Erskine, D.D.*, pp. 261-2

circuits (13). During our period of 20 years these numbers were to be approximately doubled (14).

The Methodist revival movement originating in the 1730s soon split, as we have seen, into Arminian and Calvinistic wings. Lady Huntingdon, whose piety and good works George III valued so highly (15), from her privileged position of power took it upon herself to be the patroness of certain prominent Calvinist Anglican ministers, among them Whitefield, William Romaine and Thomas Haweis (pronounced Haws). Widowed in 1746, Lady Huntingdon gave away about £100,000 to Christian work, an example followed by John Thornton of London and Robert Haldane of Edinburgh. In her perfumed parlours Evangelical leaders preached to the upper classes, Lord Dartmouth being the most notable convert.

Several prominent Calvinist Anglican ministers did not join Lady Huntingdon's Connexion, however. Toplady of Devon kept to his parish and would not itinerate around her chapels, most of which were in fashionable health resorts, where the upper classes gathered and could be preached to. Rowland Hill, whose preaching revived Lady Huntingdon's chapels in London and who was called by her 'a second Whitefield', was bold, independent, proud or rash enough to stand up to her dictatorial ways and even to poke fun at her from the pulpit, and though he was ostensibly forgiven he was thereafter forbidden to preach in any of her chapels. Haweis with other ministers withdrew from her Connexion after 1781, but on marrying her rich travelling companion Haweis again became Lady Huntingdon's chaplain in 1789, remaining a Church of England minister while itinerating in what had become a Dissenting body!

The Calvinist Methodists were mainly found in the larger towns and not all were as diplomatic and scriptural as Whitefield. Incidentally, at the start of his ministry Whitefield had read nothing of Calvin's works - it was "The Freedom of the Will" by Jonathan Edwards, the Congregationalist through whom revival had

(13) L. Elliott-Binns, *The Early Evangelicals*, p. 172

(14) D. Bogue and J. Bennett, *The History of the Dissenters*, Vol. 2, pp. 551-2

(15) Elliott-Binns, *op. cit.*, p. 142

come to Massachusetts in 1735, that was 'the textbook of the Calvinistic section of the Revival in England, Wales, and, of course, Scotland' (16). The Calvinistic Methodists' places of worship became 'the largest and most crowded of any in the kingdom, or perhaps in the world' (17). Two colleges for training ministers were started, Lady Huntingdon's in 1768 at Trevecca in South Wales and one in 1803 at Hackney.

The Wesleyan or Arminian Methodists, and the Calvinistic Methodists, some of whom were in Lady Huntingdon's Connexion but after 1781 drifted into become Independents or Congregationalists, were two evangelical groupings. A third comprised those Evangelicals in the Anglican Church who remained in it to form the Evangelical party of the nineteenth century.

These three groupings were not distinct for they arose from the revival background common to all. As has been said, 'It is difficult in any account of eighteenth century religion to separate the Evangelicals and the Methodists. They overlap' (18). At the same time general differences can be discerned between the Anglican Evangelicals and the Methodists. For instance, 'All the Methodists, like their leader, claimed the world as their parish; they would not hear of confining themselves to work in a single village. The Evangelicals, on the other hand, were in danger of making the parish their world. Many of them strongly disapproved of the itinerant system, and even those who itinerated most always put their parish work on a higher level' (19). Moreover, Methodism became more and more a lay movement. A third difference was that most Anglican Evangelicals were strict Churchmen and wary of co-operation with Dissenters. John Newton and John Berridge were exceptions here, but even Wilberforce wrote in 1789 of the 'general evils of dissent. The increase of dissenters is highly injurious to the interests of religion in the long run' (20). There was a difference in outlook

(16) A. S. Wood, *Thomas Haweis 1734-1820*, p. 7

(17) Bogue and Bennett, *op. cit.*, Vol. 2, p. 49

(18) S. C. Carpenter, *Eighteenth Century Churches and People*, p. 218

(19) G. R. Balleine, *A History of the Evangelical Party in the Church of England*, p. 37

(20) R. I. and S. Wilberforce, *The Life of William Wilberforce*, Vol. 1, p. 248

too, the Anglicans, like the Church of Scotland Evangelicals, being opposed to Christian perfection theories and an over-exaltation of the emotions and looking to the Church of the Reformation and to the Puritan tradition for their guide, while Wesley tended to look to the Primitive Church (21).

Numerically small in our period, the Anglican Evangelicals gathered themselves for mutual encouragement in societies. Indeed, it has even been claimed that 'what saved religion in England during the eighteenth century, was the Religious Societies ... within the Established Churches, where earnest Bible students met for devotion' (22). The Holy Club at Oxford was followed by clerical societies begun by Samuel Walker in Truro, by Henry Venn at Huddersfield (continued at Elland), by John Fletcher at Madeley, by Haweis at Aldwinckle and by Newton at London, the famous Eclectic Society. These Anglican societies were somewhat similar to the monthly or weekly Fellowship Meetings in Scotland at the time.

The fourth and final group of English Evangelicals were the Dissenters. Though some Evangelicals in our study remained loyal to the Established Churches, most of them were - or became - Dissenters.

According to their historians (23) Bogue and Bennett, who themselves figure in this study, the Dissenters' fundamental principle was that Christ is the sole head of the Church. A second main principle was that the Scriptures were the only rule of faith and practice, another concerned the right of private judgement in all matters of religion and a fourth gave high importance to discipline in the 'gathered' churches.

By 1700 the Dissenters had fallen on evil times. They had survived the persecution under Charles II to become second class citizens by the 1689 Act of Toleration, but little of the old zeal or vigour remained and deism, rationalism and unitarianism made serious inroads into them. It seems that between 1695 and 1730 only one new dissenting church was built in London (24). And at

(21) Elliott-Binns, *op. cit.*, ch. 12

(22) W. T. Whitley, *A History of British Baptists*, p. 211

(23) Bogue and Bennett, *op. cit.*, Vol. 1, pp. 88-94, 130

(24) I. H. Murray, *The Puritan Hope*, p. 108

the Salter's Hall conference in 1719 a majority of London Dissenters refused to insist that ministers should subscribe to the trinitarian doctrine and even among the Independents, who were almost all among the large minority, there was a tendency later to compromise on this issue (25). But 'it was Wesley's fate, not merely to found a new body of Dissenters, but also, quite inadvertently, to revive the old Dissenting bodies' (26) and orthodox Dissenters who kept their Calvinist theology pressed forward to the triumphs of our period.

For these Independents had maintained their emphases on fellowship in the church meeting, intimacy between the minister and his congregation (all of whom were responsible for his call) and the profession of faith each new member made. Surely too the hymns of Watts and Doddridge 'powerfully confirmed the faith of those who sang them' (27).

Most of the English Presbyterians, on the other hand, became Unitarians during the eighteenth century. Unlike the Scottish Presbyterians with their treatises in defence of orthodox Christianity and well-organised hierarchy of church courts with disciplinary powers and, in the case of Church of Scotland members, all the political, social and psychological advantages that accrued from being the Established Church and having their General Assembly (the best apology for a Scottish Parliament), the English Presbyterians had never established a system of church courts and had little sense of denominational unity. Moreover, the English Presbyterians put less store by the profession of faith of new members and in many congregations power had passed into the hands of trustees (28).

According to the Baptist minister Josiah Thompson, the number of dissenting congregations in 1772 was as follows: England 1,092 (Baptist 390); South Wales 141 (Baptist 54); North Wales 160 (Baptist 59); total 1,252 (Baptist 449). The figures show that

(25) Ibid., p. 108

(26) Elliott-Binns, op. cit., p. 228

(27) G. R. Cragg, *The Church and the Age of Reason 1648-1789*, p. 138

(28) Ibid., p. 136

during the century Independents had quite replaced the Presbyterians as the largest group of Dissenters, and by 1790 most Independents, whose Evangelicalism was partly a reaction against the intellectual defences previously required to conserve orthodoxy and partly a recovery of their fore-fathers' aggressive evangelism, were poised to promote the missionary explosion.

### (c) The Scottish Background

Around 1780 Scotland enjoyed a brilliant epoch in literature and science, with men of letters like Hume and Smollett and men of science like Hunter and Black. As the centre of culture Edinburgh gained the title of the 'Athens of the North'.

There was economic growth also. The Act of Union and the opening up of trade across the Atlantic, and the Agrarian and Industrial Revolutions, brought great changes to Scotland's economy. In 1783 Britain's first Chamber of Commerce was opened in Glasgow, whose merchants, having captured the lion's share of the West Indian tobacco trade earlier in the century, were by then changing after the slump caused by the American War of Independence to the import of cotton and sugar. Based on applications of the new factory technology of Lancashire, the cotton industry grew tremendously in the period 1780-1800 to become Scotland's leading industry. And though contemporaries estimated that the general level of rent doubled between 1783 and 1793 and doubled again from 1794 to 1815 (29), it has also been estimated that while between 1750 and 1790 the price of oatmeal, then the staple food of Scots, rose by little more than 50% and the prices of most other provisions roughly doubled, the wages of labour rose by  $2\frac{1}{2}$  or 3 times (30). In other words, the standard of living was rising.

With new agricultural methods, tools and fertilisers, food production soared. By 1800 tea and sugar were cheap enough for the lower classes to buy and there was a growing choice of vegetables. Most important of all, the potato became common.

(29) T. C. Smout, *A History of the Scottish People 1560-1830*, p. 310

(30) Hamilton, *op. cit.*, p. 377

Despite some emigration to North America, Scotland's population rose by about 343,000 or 27.2% between Dr. Webster's 1755 estimate and the official 1801 census. In this interval the new industries of the Central Belt attracted many Highlanders and a steady flow of labour from Ireland, probably far in excess of the number of Scots who migrated to England in search of employment during this period.

So most Scots prospered materially compared with the past, as the reports reaching Sir John Sinclair in the 1790s for his "Statistical Account" amply confirmed. But spiritually Scots fared worse. Many were among the unchurched masses in the booming but congested new industrial towns, for which the traditional pattern of presbyteries made no provision. Others attended churches where the trumpet gave out an uncertain sound and the note of urgency was largely lacking.

The 1690 settlement had ended episcopal rule and re-established Presbyterianism and restored the General Assembly, but it had denied the Church of Scotland, in its exercise of church discipline, the guaranteed support of civil law. 'Excommunication thus lost its material terrors' (31). The political collapse of Jacobitism in 1746 again left the National Church without serious rivals. Episcopacy was proscribed and Roman Catholicism withdrew to its mountain and island strongholds. But in the absence of external conflict old internal ecclesiastical divisions appeared, and the National Church which itself had known persecution in the years before 1688 came at times to exercise a persecuting role.

For much of the eighteenth century the dominant party in the Church of Scotland was the Moderate party. To some extent the Moderates were Scottish Latitudinarians, trying in the context of the European Enlightenment movement to reconcile the Church to the changes they felt a new intellectual environment demanded, for they were concerned to keep intellectuals in the Church. Thus, to achieve their goals, the Moderates reacted against a stern Calvinist morality and the religious 'enthusiasm' exemplified by Whitefield's preaching which appealed to the emotions and will as well as to the mind, and at the same time attacked the Deists for thinking that natural religion was



sufficient for men.

The Moderates tended to adopt a humanistic and rationalistic outlook and to teach the ethics of philosophy rather than those of the New Testament. They seemed pre-occupied with refinement and good manners, so that their Sunday services were 'short, formal, bland and pointless' and their moralistic preaching 'might tickle the ear, but had no sting for the conscience' (32).

However, it must be said that some Moderates were pioneers in agricultural improvements and some made great contributions to the arts. More important perhaps was their concern for tolerance - for too long Presbyterianism had exhibited symptoms of bigotry and a dour narrow-mindedness. In 1696 the Edinburgh student Aikenhead on the testimony of one witness was found guilty of denying Christ's divinity. For this he was executed. And as late as 1757 when the Rev. John Home's tragedy "Douglas" was acclaimed in Edinburgh he was encouraged or forced to resign his charge.

In short, the Moderates have been not unfairly described as 'undogmatic preachers, polished gentlemen, men of the world ... the chief object of their policy was to foster in the Church an enlightened, rational, tolerant spirit' (33). Obviously one's opinion of the Moderates must be largely decided by one's theology. As has been said, 'If we occupy the position of Broad Churchmen, we will regard them (the Moderates) as the advanced spirits of their age, seeking that comprehension of all creeds and classes in an Established Church which was the ecclesiastical ideal ... But if we have any love for definite theological teaching on such subjects as the Fall of Man and the Atonement of Christ ... we will look upon the age of their ascendancy as one of dark and disastrous eclipse' (34).

The Moderates were especially strong in the period 1760-1800. William Robertson, 'the most famous historian in Europe after Edward Gibbon', (35) went in 1761 to Old Greyfriars, Edinburgh. The next

(32) A. Thomson, A Historical Sketch of the Origin of the Secession Church, pp. 189, 145

(33) W.L. Mathieson, The Awakening of Scotland 1747-97, p. 240

(34) W.M. Taylor, The Scottish Pulpit, p. 139

(35) Smout, op. cit., p. 377

year Robertson became Principal of Edinburgh University and for nearly 20 years remained the undisputed leader of the Moderates owing to 'his ability, his unquestioned integrity and especially to his gift of lucid persuasive speech' (36). But his opponents held his support of the principle of patronage and his friendship with the sceptic Hume against him.

Robertson's successor as the Moderate leader was Principal George Hill of St. Andrews, friend of the politician Dundas. Though Hill was a sincere and sound theologian under him 'Moderatism took on ugly features, becoming little more than the Dundas interest at prayer, with nepotism and pluralism the main order of service' (37).

The other distinct party was the Evangelical or Popular party. From 1750 they were fighting a rearguard action, mainly on the question of patronage. Claiming that over 100,000 people had separated themselves from the Kirk because of the rigorous enforcement of the law of patronage, the Evangelical sponsors of the 1766 'Overture on Schism' debate did well to lose by only 99-85 votes, but thereafter till Chalmers rallied them in the 1830s the Evangelicals became 'more concerned with personal religion than with church politics' (38). In the highlands as the power of the chiefs declined the great Evangelical preachers became popular leaders and the praying societies and the usefulness of the 'Men' (laymen permitted to speak at the Friday 'Question Meetings' at sacrament time) continued. But even 'northern Evangelicalism, at the end of the eighteenth century, was in need of a fresh impulse of the Spirit' (39).

In 1790 the Evangelical leaders were old John Erskine and his lieutenant, successor and biographer, Sir Harry Moncreiff. Both were men of intellect and wealth. As a young man Erskine had asked Whitefield to preach for him and later he corresponded with Jonathan Edwards and other American ministers as well as Continental theolo-

(36) J.H.S. Burleigh, *A Church History of Scotland*, p. 300

(37) W. Ferguson, *Scotland 1689 to the Present*, p. 227

(38) J. MacInnes, *The Evangelical Movement in the Highlands of Scotland 1688 to 1800*, p. 83

(39) *Ibid.*, p. 128

gians. Ironically Dr. Erskine's colleague at Old Greyfriars was the Moderate leader Robertson. Several times they opposed each other in the Assembly and occasionally in their church. The story is told how one Sunday morning Robertson said from the pulpit that if only Virtue in all its beauty were to be seen on earth, all men would fall down and worship it. That evening Erskine preached on the theme that Virtue had indeed come to earth in the person of Jesus, yet men had crucified Him (40).

Like his fellow Evangelicals Erskine, who had on occasion attacked Wesley's Arminianism, was opposed to what he considered the emasculated Christianity preached by the Moderates and to the manner of life lived by Moderate socialites like Dr. 'Jupiter' Carlyle who took dancing lessons, played cards and attended theatres.

Of the other Churches some interest us little and others will be mentioned in their place. In 1786 the Relief Church pioneered mission work in the Highlands in Kilbrandon but Neil Douglas met with considerable discouragement (41). Later, after a successful tour of Kintyre, Douglas wrote acidly of the Established Church ministers who opposed his tours: 'they recite their jejune, barren harangues, till they become more insipid than the white of an egg, and their prayers, till every schoolboy in the parish can repeat them verbatim' (42).

The Scottish picture is not uniformly dark, however. Many were learning to read their Bibles, tracts were being circulated privately, philanthropic work was being done in Christ's name, more Christian classics were being translated into Gaelic and the Scottish Society for the Propagation of Christian Knowledge (SSPCK), founded in 1709, was busy teaching the four Rs.

(40) J. Macleod, *Scottish Theology in relation to Church History*, p. 210

(41) N. Douglas, *Journal of a Mission*, pp. 142-46

(42) *Ibid.*, p. 14

## 2. THE PERIOD 1790-1810

This period was as exciting and important in the religious as it was in the political sphere. The eighteenth century was an age of societies (1) and our period was no exception. It saw the birth of denominational and interdenominational societies that have continued to exercise a profound influence down to this day. Indeed, it saw the birth of the concept of societies as a primary instrument for the work of the Churches, especially for the work of outreach. It saw the conversion of Scotsmen who were to challenge the old order of ecclesiastical organisation and endeavour to shake their fellow Christians out of their spiritual complacency and to rouse the artisan crowds out of their apathy. It saw Evangelicals, notably the dynamic Clapham Sect, attack some of the terrible social abuses of their day and with considerable success. It saw Christians given a vastly enlarged vision of the Church's and the individual Christian's responsibility and opportunity, which sent some to the dark corners of their homeland and others to the dark ends of the earth.

### (a) The Missionary Explosion

1790 saw the death of John Thornton, reputedly the country's richest merchant (2) and the 'Nuffield of the Evangelical Revival' (3). John's son Henry followed his father's generous and statesmanlike ways and in 1792 moved to Clapham, where William Wilberforce came to share his house. Together they formed the nucleus of the Clapham Sect, which proved so powerful a pressure group for God in society and politics. Its members were nearly all Anglican laymen and some were M.P.s and most attended John Venn's church. 'Never have the members of one congregation so greatly influenced the

(1) F.K. Brown, *Fathers of the Victorians*, pp. 317, 329-35

(2) B. Martin, *John Newton*, p. 199

(3) C. Smyth, *Simeon and Church Order*, p. 246

history of the world' (4) is a colossal claim but there is much justification for it. Besides initiating reforms at home, they affected many lives overseas by helping to send Simeon's curates to India as East India Company chaplains, by starting in 1791 the Sierra Leone Company and by fighting a parliamentary campaign for 46 years on behalf of negro slaves.

The leading figure of this 'brotherhood of Christian politicians' (5) who in time became 'the authentic keeper of the nation's conscience' (6) was Wilberforce, who after conversion devoted all his wealth, charm and talents to Christian and philanthropic causes. In 1790 John Newton was 66, Hannah More 45 and Wilberforce only 31, and 'these three were linked together, as it were, each contributing a considerable influence on the others' (7), Newton having acted as the wise counsellor when the others were stumbling after God and having advised Wilberforce to stay in politics and high society. All three were influential in their writings, Newton by his extraordinary autobiography, hymns and letters of spiritual counsel, Hannah More by her most popular tracts and Wilberforce by his book "A Practical View" which soon became a best seller.

The Clapham Sect gave a much-needed boost to Anglican Evangelicals who, like their counterparts in the Church of Scotland, were suspect in their Church because of their 'enthusiasm' and their insistence on the doctrines of election and retribution and the need for personal conversion and assurance. But as a deliberate geographical grouping the Clapham Sect had little to do with Evangelical Dissenters, for its members were upper class, loyal Anglicans and Tories in politics. When members did admire Dissenting projects they tended to support them financially and to patronise them from a distance, though Wilberforce owed much support to Dissenters in his attack on social abuses of the day.

Anglican Evangelicals warmly espoused the missionary cause at home

(4) M. Hennell, John Venn and the Clapham Sect, p. 169

(5) Sir R. Coupland, Wilberforce, p. 251

(6) Ibid., p. 346

(7) Martin, op. cit., p. 320

and abroad, yet it was the Baptists who first promoted it in our period. 'But if 1792 was the last year of international peace, it was for Baptists the last year of ecclesiastical stagnation' (8). For on 2 October the Particular (Calvinist) Baptist Missionary Society (BMS) was born at Kettering, with 13 men contributing £13-2-6d to start the work of world evangelisation. Though of course the idea of foreign mission work was not new and though Carey was not the first to go to Bengal as a missionary he began a 'new era in Protestant missions, not only in India, but also in the entire world' (9).

The significance of the founding of the BMS for us is that it helped to trigger off the founding of other missionary societies. Evangelicals in the larger denominations were both shamed and encouraged into starting their own missionary societies, and there were personal links between Baptists and Scots who were resident in England and helped to found the Missionary Society in London (LMS). The "Evangelical Magazine" launched in July 1793 was an important mass medium for disseminating missionary news and views and was instrumental in founding the LMS in September 1795, which in turn led to missionary societies springing up in England and in the larger Scottish towns. In April 1799 Charles Simeon at last coaxed the Anglicans of the Eclectic Society into starting the Society for Missions to Africa and the East (later the Church Missionary Society or CMS) as a purely Anglican society, for they were staunch Anglicans and objected to the LMS's fundamental principle and its disordered way of sending out missionaries.

Enthusiasm for foreign missions led to the intensifying of home missionary work. Moves were made to create interdenominational unity at a local level, to echo that unity seemingly achieved at a national level in the LMS, societies to propagate the gospel were begun, as well as itinerant and village preaching societies, with academies and seminaries to support them. Strenuous efforts

(8) Whitley, op. cit., p. 195

(9) K. Latourette, *A History of the Expansion of Christianity*, Vol. 3, p. 281

were made to evangelise rural areas in England and Scotland and Ireland, and in Scotland efforts were also concentrated on the four major cities. Sunday schools for children and adults were started and Sunday school societies organised. Magazines were published and even little books for children were written and printed. Special societies for the printing and distribution of tracts were founded and in 1804, arising from Welsh needs, the undenominational British and Foreign Bible Society began its great work of commissioning the translation, printing and selling of Bibles.

All these developments took place within a dozen years. It was indeed a missionary explosion.

#### (b) The Effects of War

We must ever remember that this missionary explosion occurred against a background of war, a long war of attrition which brought rising prices, civil unrest, harsh government reaction and the threat of invasion to England and Scotland. For instance, the year 1797, 'the darkest and most desperate that any British minister has ever had to face' (10), saw the French preparing to invade Ireland, the suspension of cash payments by the Bank of England, the mutinies of two British fleets and the naval victory of Camperdown, and 1799 saw poor harvests, the suspension of Habeas Corpus and the passing of the Combination Acts.

The missionary explosion followed so hard on the heels of the French Revolution because the latter greatly speeded up events. The spirit of outreach gathering force in the 1780s gained momentum and the re-discovered command to 'go and teach all nations' was seen as a pre-requisite of Christ's coming (11), which seemed imminent from the swift political changes on the Continent, especially those affecting the Papacy. Some British Calvinists

(10) Lord Rosebery, Pitt, p. 133

(11) See, e.g., Matthew 24.14

followed Jonathan Edwards in believing that the destruction of Antichrist had begun at the Reformation and that 'there is reason also to think that the beginning of the great work of God's Spirit, in the renewal of religion, which, before it is finished, will issue in Antichrist's ruin, is not far off' (12). Some Christians were also possibly stung into evangelistic action towards the heathen by the proclamation that all men shared common rights.

The news of the fall of the Bastille was generally greeted with joy in Britain, especially by those opposed to tyranny in any guise or form, and many echoed Fox's outburst 'How much the greatest event it is that ever happened in this world and how much the best!' The slogan 'Liberty, Equality, Fraternity' was enough to rouse any have-not.

The reform movement was particularly strong in Scotland. Even Thomas Hardy, founder of the London Corresponding Society, was a Scot. In 1790 the Whig Club of Dundee sent a congratulatory address to the National Assembly in Paris, and 50 of the 56 Scottish boroughs petitioned Parliament about electing M.P.s on a more popular basis. Principal Robertson himself was among the early supporters of the French Revolution. The most important and scholarly of the 38 replies to Burke's "Reflections" was Mackintosh's "Vindiciae Gallicae" which denounced the British political system as unrepresentative and reminded Scots of the ancient Declaration of Arbroath.

In 1792 the Friends of the People society was set up in Edinburgh and other towns founded their own reform societies. Radical in politics, the weavers of the growing industrial towns were among their strongest supporters. Landowners and professional middle class men were also among the politically disaffected but after 1794 they moved increasingly to the right. Eighty Scottish branches sent delegates to the Friends of the People Edinburgh convention in December 1792, where equal representation of the people and more frequent elections were proposed and violence to achieve reform condemned.

(12) J. Edwards, Works, London 1817, Vol. II, pp. 497, 502, 529-31



But 1792 had seen violence, with demonstrations against the government. The year previous Wolfe Tone had founded the Society of United Irishmen. Once at war with Revolutionary France, the government, acting from fear, cracked down on all activities suspect of political subversion. In Scotland Thomas Muir the advocate was sentenced to 14 years' transportation, as were three delegates to the Friends of the People convention in 1793. In 1794 the Act against Wrongous Imprisonment was suspended and the agitator Robert Watt executed. The terrible events across the Channel caused the government and most property-owners to fear that the spirit of the Parisian mobs would spread to Britain where the Gordon riots of 1780 had come near to burning London down. Tom Paine's "Rights of Man" was widely read (and even translated into Gaelic) and 'Scottish education was already far superior to English, and the "lower orders" more quickly appreciated the arguments' (13) of the book which, 'forcibly argued and lucidly written', was 'suited to simple intelligences unable to grasp Burke's profounder points' (14).

In 1799 the government not only made trade unions illegal but prepared a Bill to curb the activities of Dissenters in England and Scotland. Wilberforce, however, came to the rescue and persuaded Pitt to abandon the Bill (15).

Nicknamed 'King Harry IX', Dundas 'managed' Scotland on behalf of the London government till his impeachment in 1806. Though it could be argued that Scotland at this period 'had no true political life of its own' (16) and was 'habitually looked upon as the most servile and corrupt portion in the British Empire' (17), she was servile because she was satisfied. For 'real power in Scotland lay in the elective authoritarian councils of the

(13) Cole and Postgate, *The Common People 1746-1946*, p. 153

(14) A. Bryant, *The Years of Endurance 1793-1803*, p. 79

(15) R.I. and S. Wilberforce, *op. cit.*, Vol. ii, p. 361

(16) D. Daiches, *The Paradox of Scottish Culture*, p. 51

(17) W.E.H. Lecky, *England in the Eighteenth Century*, Vol. iii, pp. 578-79

church' (18), the power which in England had slipped from the church to the state. The effect of war on the Church of Scotland, since the Moderates planned to dilute the Confession of Faith, was 'salutary for its orthodoxy, but it greatly increased its bigotry and close corporate spirit' (19). Dundas ensured that only politically reliable ministers filled the 300 livings in the gift of the Crown in Scotland and by supporting patronage the 'gravamen of the charge against the Moderates is their acceptance of a thorough-going Erastianism, whereby, for all practical purposes, they converted the Church into a Department of State' (20).

For English Dissenters the war brought frustrations. Most of them hailed the French Revolution with delight - till its excesses substantiated the doctrine of man's innate depravity. David Bogue the Scot was but one Evangelical whose liberal views rejoiced on hearing of the Revolution, and in 1790 he renewed his plea for religious freedom in his pamphlet "Reasons for seeking a Repeal of the Corporation and Test Acts". But their repeal had to await the next great era of reform, that of the 1820s. Yet those Evangelicals who had sympathised with much of the "Rights of Man" could not stomach Paine's "Age of Reason" which in 1794 attacked orthodox Christianity.

And when the government moved in to check conspiracy and conserve the status quo the opponents of our Evangelicals were able to cast in their teeth their democratic inclinations. Robert Haldane and Bogue were blocked in their bid to go to Bengal as self-supporting missionaries and the Haldane brothers and their associates were admonished by the General Assembly of 1799, afraid that their attempts to break with tradition and to evangelise Scotland outwith the Established Church would be followed by others. The slur that missionary societies were a cover for political propaganda had already been made in the 1796 Assembly in the famous debate that dampened the Evangelicals' rising hope that the Kirk would actively

(18) J.S. Watson, *The Reign of George III 1760-1815*, p. 280

(19) G. Struthers, *History of the Rise, Progress and Principles of the Relief Church*, p. 380

(20) Fawcett, *op. cit.*, p. 197

support foreign missions, and the slur was to be repeated against Sunday schools and itinerant preachers.

### 3. THE MISSIONARY MOVEMENT

Thomas Haweis, who played an important role in founding the Missionary Society, nearly gained the distinction of sending out missionaries two years before Carey sailed for India. For in 1789 Haweis suggested to Lady Huntingdon that missionaries should be sent to Tahiti and he educated two of her Trevecca students to this end (1). But finally the two men refused to sail out with Captain Bligh (of the "Bounty") unless they received episcopal ordination. This came to Haweis as a sudden ultimatum and, though he saw Archbishop Moore of Canterbury about ordination, he was unable to obtain it and the men stayed in Britain.

#### (a) The Baptist Missionary Society (BMS)

In April 1784 Dr. John Erskine of Edinburgh, the friend of Whitefield and Jonathan Edwards, sent a copy of Edwards' "Humble Attempt" to the younger John Ryland at Northampton. This book played a part in deciding the Baptist Northamptonshire Association later that year to set aside an hour on the first Monday evening of every month for special prayer for 'general revival and spread of religion'. The successful motion was put by John Sutcliff, whose only pastorate was at Olney, the small Buckinghamshire village where Newton and Cowper lived and where Thomas Scott succeeded Newton.

The Rev. Andrew Fuller was BMS Secretary from 1792 to his death in 1815 - 'Fuller lived and died a martyr to the Mission' (2) - and made five journeys to Scotland to collect funds, in 1799, 1802, 1805, 1808 and 1813, and so is an important link-man between Scottish and English Evangelicals in our study. Through the five windows of his visits we can see the new patterns emerging in the kaleidoscope of that exciting period of Scottish church development.

Born of humble origins in 1754, Fuller was a self-taught man who

(1) A.S. Wood, op. cit., p. 170

(2) J.W. Morris, Memoirs of the Life and Writings of the Rev. Andrew Fuller, p. 49

was ordained when 20 and moved in 1783 to Kettering where he remained. He had been stirred with missionary concern by a book on missionary aims and methods which proved a formative influence in the century (3). It was a Scot, Robert Millar, the minister of Paisley Abbey, who wrote "The History of the Propagation of Christianity" where he condemned Christian divisions and predicted that God would do 'great Things for the Advancement of our Redeemers Kingdom' (4). In 1784 Fuller, whose preaching manner lagged behind the sound content of his sermons, preached on walking by faith and it is said that this sermon struck the spark which Carey blew into a flame (5).

Fuller was deservedly famous for his books which helped to change his denomination and which won praise from moderate Calvinists all over Britain. Usually his writings arose from practical and doctrinal issues in his own experience and well demonstrate his gifts of sturdy common sense and clear thinking. Of the two main Baptist sections, Fuller's Calvinist Baptists were not so influenced for good as the Arminian Baptists by the eighteenth-century revival as they were on the crest of a hyper-Calvinist wave (6). But Fuller's "The Gospel Worthy of all Acceptation" won a great victory for moderate Calvinism and henceforward 'Fullerism', which repudiated Arminianism, Socinianism and hyper-Calvinism alike, grew in popularity. While still holding to the doctrine of particular redemption, Fuller insisted that 'it is the duty of every minister of Christ plainly and faithfully to preach the gospel to all who hear it' and defended his practice of giving 'free and solemn addresses, invitations, calls, and warnings' to men as being 'not only consistent, but directly adapted, as means, in the hand of the Spirit of God, to bring them to Christ' (7).

(3) Fawcett, op. cit., p. 215

(4) p. xx

(5) J. Bennett, A History of the Dissenters during the last Thirty Years, p. 475

(6) H.W. Clark, A History of English Nonconformity, Vol. ii, pp. 250-51

(7) J. Ryland, Life and Death of the Rev. Andrew Fuller, p. 106

Thus Fuller 'was able to unite the doctrinal strength that has ever characterised Calvinists, with the evangelistic fervour that had shone forth in Smyth and Lamb' (8), the early English Baptists. It was left to Carey to push Fuller's principles to a logical and practical issue - if the gospel was worthy of all acceptance, why was it not presented to all? - and in 1792 his "Enquiry" was published. At the Easter meetings Sutcliff preached on jealousy for the Lord of Hosts and Fuller on the sin of delay. Later Carey urged the Association to expect great things from God and to attempt great things for God and in October the BMS made its humble beginning.

By October 1799 Carey and John Thomas had begun implementing their ambitious plans for translating the scriptures into Eastern languages and had been joined by Ward, Marshman, Brunson and Grant. Translation and transport costs were heavy and though the Particular Baptist churches in general supported the BMS their members were mostly artisans and the Connexion was poor. So in search of more funds Fuller went north, encouraged by the fact that many missionary-minded Scottish churches had given generously to the BMS for some years, thanks to the publicity given to the BMS by Dr. Charles Stuart of Edinburgh and by the BMS "Periodical Accounts" and by the notices in the "Missionary Magazine" which Stuart co-edited.

(i) Fuller's first visit to Scotland, 1799

Fuller set out on his first journey to Scotland in fear and trembling and because the intellectual reputation of the Scots daunted him he took John Sutcliff of Olney with him for moral support. As he confided to his diary on 2 October, 1799 'I am going out for a month altogether among faces which I have never seen. My spirit revolts at the idea, but duty calls. I go to make collections for the translation of the Scriptures into Bengalee. I am subject to many faults in company, and often incur guilt. The Lord keep me

(8) Whitley, op. cit., p. 232

in the way I should go ...' (9).

He need not have worried. His reception in Scotland was 'truly generous and gratifying, and conveyed to his mind a high idea of the intelligence and principle of his northern friends' (10).

There were four main reasons for the success of Fuller's first visit. First, his cause was popular and well-known among his fellow Calvinist Evangelicals. It was well-known for the reasons stated above and it was popular because the labours of Carey and Thomas had thrilled most Evangelicals and fostered a common spirit of endeavour among them, especially in the sphere of outreach, that continues to this day. Moreover, Fuller's aim in raising money was specific and the idea of giving heathens in Bengal, the densely populated area to which many Scots had gone as traders and administrators, the New Testament in their own language was a novel, romantic and yet practical aim which any Bible-loving Christian, however sectarian in outlook, could well support. Again, Scottish Baptists were glad to identify their weak cause with the pioneer society from England and Presbyterians, having no denominational missionary society of their own, were able to support those from south of the border with a clear conscience. Since their formation in 1796 the Scottish missionary societies in towns had contributed to the BMS - Stirling and Edinburgh had sent £50 each in 1796, for instance (11) - and had been delighted to read of Carey's appreciation of their support in his letter of 23 March, 1797, published in their "Missionary Magazine" of 1798: 'It rejoices my heart much, and that on two accounts, independent of their pecuniary aid. First, the unequivocal proof it affords of their heartily coinciding in the mission-plan. Secondly, the amazing assistance which must be derived to the work, in answer to their prayers' (12)

So Scots dipped deep in their pockets and gave generously to

(9) A.G. Fuller, The Complete Works of Andrew Fuller, Single volume, p. lxi

(10) Ibid., p. lxi

(11) Missionary Magazine, 1796, Vol. I, p. 47

(12) Ibid., p. 138

Fuller's society. Aided by larger contributions from capitalist entrepreneurs like David Dale and landed gentry like Robert Haldane, the bulk of the money raised must yet have come from rank and file church members. That money could be spared was the second reason why Fuller was successful. The booming cotton industry and the expanding coal, iron and shipbuilding industries were providing more jobs and better wages. The Scottish towns were perhaps led by Paisley in per capita giving to missionary societies in our period and no doubt this is partly explained by the fact that 'by 1800 the weavers were the aristocrats of labour, with an average wage of 15s. per week' (13). Scottish Dissenters were used to giving sacrificially to erect or hire their churches and to pay their ministers, of course. As for members of an Established Church, they often tend to think that their Church can live off its assets, investments and privileged position and are therefore sometimes not so sacrificial in their contributions to its needs, thus having money spare for other Christian causes.

A third reason for Fuller's successful tour was the respect in which he himself was held. His writings had preceded him and been widely appreciated by Scottish Presbyterians. Articles by him had appeared in the "Evangelical Magazine", which some Scots received, and in the "Missionary Magazine". Some Scots had also corresponded with Fuller and Archibald McLean had on his annual visit to London met him at Kettering. To William Braidwood, an Independent pastor who had turned Baptist and joined McLean's Baptist church in Richmond Court, Edinburgh and become co-pastor there, Fuller sent a letter on 4 August, 1798 which acknowledged a gift of £202-19-2d for BMS funds and included the comment 'While certain shades of difference respecting the meaning of Scripture, distinguish the followers of Christ, it affords pleasure to see them all unite in hearty efforts to propagate the scriptures themselves' (14).

A fourth reason is that Fuller's visit occurred in the first flush of Scotland's awakening. Crowds had been packing the Circus theatre

(13) Hamilton, op. cit., p. 366

(14) Missionary Magazine, 1798, Vol. III, p. 423



in Edinburgh since Rowland Hill had opened it as a preaching-place for Robert Haldane in July 1798, and Fuller had never seen such huge congregations, the sight of which at first dismayed his heart (15). Coming from a small Baptist congregation in a small English town, Fuller had a new world opened to him.

Fuller went to Scotland in 1799 by express invitation. Robert Haldane had asked Dr. Stuart what news he had of the BMS and on learning that their funds were low had given £100 and added an invitation to Fuller to come and preach in his tabernacles in Edinburgh and Glasgow. Stuart wrote to Fuller the same day (16), and Fuller's first call in Edinburgh was probably at Dr. Stuart's. He found Stuart 'an interesting man' as well he might, for he was a son-in-law of Dr. Erskine and had been minister at Cramond till leaving the Church of Scotland on becoming a convinced Baptist - time spent at a Dissenting academy in London had taught him that there should be no union between church and state (17). Of his new career as physician he made a success and as a Baptist he was a Scottish correspondent of Fuller, handing over BMS news to the "Missionary Magazine" of which he was co-founder and co-editor with Greville Ewing. But though a man of 'enthusiastic zeal, affectionate friendship, as well as ... elegant scholarship, critical acuteness, general knowledge, polished manners, and attractive qualities' (18), Stuart was also noted for some eccentricity and for some theological hair-splitting, as was not uncommon among Scottish Baptists of the time. It is hard to sum up such a versatile and complex character in a few lines, but perhaps the Rev. William Jay of Bath on a visit to Scotland about 1802 gives us further insight into Stuart: 'In Edinburgh I was followed by that good and talented, but eccentric, or (at least) peculiar character, Dr. S - t. He had seceded from the Church of Scotland, but no church came quite up to his standard of scriptural purity and order;

(15) Fuller, op. cit., p. lxi

(16) A. Haldane, *The Lives of Robert and James Haldane*, p. 275

(17) Ibid., p. 140

(18) Ibid., pp. 140-41

and therefore, it is said, he communed with none but his own servant in his own house. He always heard more like a judge than a learner. He weighed everything that dropped from a preacher's lips in the nicest scales of rigid orthodoxy and was never backward to pronounce "Tekel"' (19). Possibly it should be added that Stuart had earlier heard Jay preach in Surrey Chapel and had written critically of Jay's sermons without doing justice to Jay's evangelism as he (Stuart) later admitted. Unfortunately, it seems, Stuart was 'always in extremes of joy or depression' (20), 'his comfort, as well as his usefulness, being materially impaired by a hypochondriac tendency, which occasioned him many sufferings' (21), but although, according to his friend James Haldane, Stuart loved novelty and strong prejudices he was 'truly a lover of good men, and deeply under the influence of the truth' (22).

Stuart first heard of the BMS from a Mr Fishwick of Newcastle who was a partner in a large Scottish colliery (23). Later Stuart printed a small pamphlet to aid the work. Others too in Scotland caught the vision of overseas missionary work through contact with the BMS. William Innes, a Church of Scotland minister at Stirling, and his brother-in-law Greville Ewing, a minister at Lady Glenorchy's Chapel in Edinburgh, in 1794 took a ride to England for their health's sake, in the course of which they preached for Dr. John Ryland at Bristol and became zealous BMS supporters through meeting at Birmingham with 'Seraphic' Samuel Pearce, news of whose premature death was the blackest memory of Fuller's first Scottish tour.

Another BMS enthusiast was Archibald McLean the Baptist. Born at East Kilbride, the son of a Gaelic-speaking highlander, he married a merchant's daughter and rose to be Corrector of the Press for a large Edinburgh printing works by 1767, by which time he had become a Glasite (because he believed a church should be fully self-governing)

(19) G. Redford and J.A. James (ed.), the Autobiography and Reminiscences of the Rev. Wm. Jay, p. 135

(20) A. Haldane, op. cit., p. 352

(21) J.J. Matheson, A Memoir of Greville Ewing, p. 86

(22) A. Haldane, op. cit., p. 552

(23) Ryland, op. cit., p. 163

and later a Baptist (because a study of the New Testament convinced him that baptism was for believers only and by immersion only).

McLean's friend, Robert Carmichael, in 1765 asked Dr. Gill of London to come to Edinburgh and baptise the six wanting believers' baptism, but Gill could not and so Carmichael went to Gill for baptism and baptised the others on his return to Scotland.

The first Baptist church in Edinburgh, where McLean joined Carmichael as co-pastor, met at Richmond Court till in 1802 it moved to St. Cecilia's Hall in Niddry Street when its three pastors were McLean, William Braidwood, merchant and writer, and Henry Inglis, a notable advocate. It was called a Scotch Baptist church as it favoured a plurality of elders or pastors as well as a body of deacons, modelling itself with biblical literalism on the Church of the Acts and the Pauline epistles. Apart from Fuller and the BMS, which it supported liberally, it had nothing to do with English Baptists, though in its early days it had received an encouraging visit from Baptists in Hexham and Newcastle (24), which echoed the visit made to Leith in 1653 to the Cromwellian officers who started the first Baptist churches in Scotland. But McLean adopted 'Fullerism' in his "Calls and Invitations of the Gospel" and in 1795 preached on Psalm 22. 27,28 on the subjection of all nations to Christ and urged his little flock to evangelise others. A little later by a sermon preached in the Circus theatre McLean raised over £100 for the BMS (25).

McLean was a prolific writer, his collected works amounting to six volumes, and his 1777 "Defence of Believers' Baptism" won supporters who started churches in Dundee, Glasgow, Perth, Montrose, Largo and Paisley. In 1778 McLean baptised Robert Moncreiff, the brother of the future Evangelical party leader in the Church of Scotland (26). Soon Scotch Baptist churches appeared in England - in London in September 1792, and later in Chester, Beverley, Hull,

(24) G. Yuille (ed.), *History of the Baptists in Scotland*, p. 46

(25) Morris, *op. cit.*, p. 111

(26) Yuille, *op. cit.*, p. 48

Manchester, Preston, Whitehaven and Nottingham. From Chester McLean's views spread into Wales.

McLeanism has been summed up as "Sandemanianism plus believers' baptism and a stricter rule of life than the Sandemanians practised" (27). Sandemanians were basically Glasites in England, for Robert Sandeman, the son-in-law of John Glas, took the former Church of Scotland minister's views to London. McLean, it will be remembered, was a Glasite prior to turning Baptist. He was opposed to a one-man ministry and encouraged all the brethren to exercise their gifts in prayer and exhortation, in this way foreshadowing the Plymouth Brethren. He also called the Lord's Supper 'The Breaking of Bread' and made it central to the morning service, often holding a Love Feast between the two Sunday services. Strict communion was practised, food containing blood was taboo, the kiss of charity was practised and feet were washed as an act of hospitality. Each 'gathered' church was fully independent. Justifying faith seemed to be defined as an intellectual act pure and simple.

Though Fuller continued to visit the Scotch Baptist churches he disliked their contentious spirit, their self-righteousness and their insistence on unanimity in church decisions. He especially disliked their definition of justifying faith which smacked too much of Sandeman's 'bare belief' (28) and seemed to allow no room for repentance and the will's surrender and made it similar to the belief of devils mentioned in James 2.19. Fuller also disliked the failure of Scotch Baptists to question a man's religious experience, relying only on his creed and conformity to their rules, and their exclusiveness which kept him, an English Baptist, from their pulpits and communion tables. Fuller listed six things, besides the nature of faith, between the Scotch and English Baptists:

- (1) They deny that Jesus was Son of God before His incarnation;
- (2) They contend that a plurality of elders is essential to a

(27) A.C. Underwood, A History of the English Baptists, p. 190

(28) Fuller, op. cit., Vol. ii, p. 353

regular church; (3) They insist that the Lord's Supper be administered every first day of the week; (4) They practise washing of feet, the holy kiss, etc.; (5) There seems to be but very little exercise of forbearance among them; (6) Their plan seems little calculated to diffuse the gospel - when ministers of other denominations join them they are generally silenced, and turn physicians (29). George Grieve and Stuart are instances of the last point. On points (3) and (4) Fuller wrote to McLean in 1796: '... you consider the washing of feet, the kiss of charity, etc., as formally binding on all Christians: we do not. We consider neither of them as religious institutes, but merely civil customs, though used by Christ and his apostles to a religious end ... I consider it (the time of administering the Lord's supper) as wholly discretionary' (30).

Though excelling in controversy, Fuller delayed joining battle with the McLeanites for several years, but from Scotland and Ireland they continued to attack his beliefs and his honesty and McLean was a metaphysically-minded and pertinacious adversary with a relish for the finer points of an argument. In 1810, therefore, Fuller's "Strictures on Sandemanianism" was published, by which time it had lessons for the Haldanes also. The book, which cost Fuller more labour than any other, argued that allowances must be made for the oriental customs and modes of speech in the Bible, and that God has not given us in the Bible an exact blue-print for the organisation of Christian churches.

In that first visit to Scotland Fuller was invited to churches of different denominations for the BMS was temporarily an interdenominational concern among Evangelicals. Fuller wrote of 'excellent men' among the Church of Scotland, particularly David Black and Walter Buchanan, who both helped James Haldane in his early Christian life, and Dr. Erskine (31). 'But these good men, I observe, generally

(29) Ryland, op. cit., pp. 181-83

(30) Fuller, op. cit., single vol., pp. 843-44

(31) Ryland, op. cit., p. 169

look with rather a jealous eye upon the Circus; and like to speak of the things done by the old Society for promoting Christian knowledge, which, it is probable, some others have too much undervalued' (32). A blunt and down-to-earth person, Fuller made other criticisms in his Journal: 'The Baptists seem to be tinged, generally, with the sentiments of Glass and Sandeman; and all parties in Scotland, except those who meet at the Circus, appear to be too much insulated from all others' (33).

Fuller must have been particularly interested in the Haldane movement which had already seen the birth of the Society for Propagating the Gospel at Home (SPGH), some extensive home missionary tours, the start of a seminary class under Ewing at Glasgow and the start of an Independent church at the Edinburgh Circus, where James Haldane the lay preacher had been ordained eight months before. As it happens, Fuller's comment on the Circus men of 1799 is wholly complimentary: 'I have also been in company with Messrs. Robert and James Haldane, Aikman, Innes, Richie (i.e. John Ritchie, the Edinburgh printer), and some other leading men in the Circus connection. Certainly, these appear to be excellent men, free from the extravagance and nonsense which infect some of the Calvinistic Methodists in England; and yet trying to imbibe and communicate their zeal and affection. They wished, as Mr. Ewing told me, "to be at liberty to preach in the villages", without being accountable to any body of men, who were commonly averse to all extraordinary exertion, and contented to plod on in the path of their predecessors' (34).

On October 13, 1799 Fuller preached in the Edinburgh Circus on Galatians 6. 7,8 and in his sermon we glimpse how Evangelicals thought and interpreted in the decade after the French Revolution. First, there was an unbounded optimism regarding missionary work - 'But the time will come when all the kindreds of the earth shall

(32) Ibid., p. 169

(33) Ibid., p. 169

(34) Ibid., p. 169

worship. Ethiopia, and all the unknown regions of Africa, shall stretch out their hands to God' (35). Such confidence was 'founded on the true sayings of God. Nor can the time of their accomplishment be far distant'. Second, there was the interpretation of Daniel, chapter 7, where the little horn was identified with the Papacy, whose downfall Fuller felt had already begun after the Pope had suffered financially and territorially at the hands of republican France. Fuller's sermon language is strong - 'The last branch of the last of the four beasts is now in its dying agonies. No sooner will it be proclaimed, Babylon is fallen! than the marriage of the Lamb will come. There are no more tyrannical or persecuting powers to succeed ...' (36). Such was the eschatological hope that added piquancy to the evangelising efforts of many British Evangelicals of that day. In 1811 Fuller still thought he was living in the period when the 'Gospel will prevail over Paganism, Mahometanism, Apostate Judaism, Popery, etc.' but thought the millennium was 200 years away (37).

In both Glasgow and Edinburgh Fuller had large congregations to hear him. At Glasgow he preached at Robert Haldane's newly-opened Tabernacle under Ewing's pastorate to about 4,000 and in the afternoon John Sutcliff spoke to the same number or more. After that service the two Englishmen went to hear old David Dale preach in his Independent church where over £200 was collected for Carey's translation work. For 30 years Dale had been a faithful and busy pastor, even teaching himself Hebrew and Greek, despite his great business concerns. As a cotton manufacturer ~~he~~ had entered a partnership with the inventor Arkwright and in 1786 opened his famous New Lanark mills, later managed by his son-in-law Robert Owen. Dale was a very enlightened employer, a Glasgow magistrate and a generous supporter of BMS. He loved nothing better than to use his money to help others, and in years of famine would charter

(35) Missionary Magazine, 1799, Vol. IV, p. 550

(36) Ibid., p. 550

(37) Letter of A. Fuller to C. Anderson, 4 Dec. 1811, cited in H. Anderson, Life and Letters of C. Anderson, p. 194

ships to bring grain which was sold cheaply to the poor and starving (38).

Still that busy Sunday in Glasgow had work and a surprise in store for Fuller, who in the evening preached again at the Tabernacle - 'It was said, that many hundreds went away, for want of room. It was the largest audience I ever saw ...' (39) and 'Nearly 5,000 attended, and some thousands went away unable to get in' (40) indicate the appeal of Fuller and his mission and the hunger there was for evangelical preaching.

(ii) The four later visits of Fuller to Scotland

Despite an increasingly uneasy relationship with his fellow Baptists there, Fuller re-visited Scotland in September 1802 because of the urgency of the invitation and because the first visit had been worth while financially. It was a more extended tour on this occasion. After preaching for James Haldane and his co-pastor John Aikman at the new Edinburgh Tabernacle opened in 1801, with attendances of 1,500 in the morning and about 4,000 in the evening and with £130 collected, Fuller went on to Dundee where he addressed about 1,400 people, probably in Haldane's Tabernacle under Innes' pastorate and then to Perth, where about 1,000 attended an Independent meeting.

En route Fuller visited Stirling Castle and recorded some contemporary opinions of the elder Haldane: 'Near this is the late seat of Robert Haldane Esq. - a seat which a Scotch nobleman pronounced to be "a perfect heaven upon earth"; but which he sold, and has since laid up thousands every year, for the propagation of the gospel in Scotland and Ireland. "O, (say the gentry) he must have some deep scheme in his head." Some of the Clergy cannot endure him; but he has great interest with the common people. He

(38) H. Escott, *A History of Scottish Congregationalism*, p. 29

(39) Ryland, *op. cit.*, p. 170

(40) Fuller, *op. cit.*, single vol., p. lxi



is a great economist, in order to be generous' (41).

In Glasgow Fuller repeated his earlier successes, preaching in the Tabernacle to audiences of 4,000 and nearly 5,000. Another £200 was collected there - in three visits to the Glasgow Tabernacle Fuller received £521-6-4d (42).

But his Glasgow visit in 1802 was marred by a showdown with a church professing to be in fellowship with the English Baptists. This church, which was James Lister's and less than a year old (43), insisted, on the recommendation of the older Pen church of Paisley which had ordained Lister and seems to have had a plurality of pastors, that Fuller must make a confession of faith before addressing them. This Fuller declined to do, with a reminder that he was not a candidate for their pulpit and a 'Very well, then I shall go to the Tabernacle, and consider your conduct as a renunciation of connexion with us, as English churches' (44). The Glasgow Baptists repented of their brusque behaviour, but by then it was just too late to hear Fuller. Fuller was probably especially annoyed over this affair as Lister's church had submitted its articles of faith and order to him when it was first constituted and, though they included a weekly observance of the Lord's supper and the possibility of public exhortations by male church members, he had approved them (45).

Fuller's young travelling companion in 1802 was Ralph Wardlaw, a Tabernacle man who remained a Congregationalist and who with Ewing became the first tutor of the Glasgow Theological Academy in 1812. Livingstone as a medical student attended Wardlaw's church in the 1830s.

The next triennial tour occurred in June and July of 1805. Again Fuller saw new patterns emerging in the kaleidoscope of Scottish

(41) Ryland, *op. cit.*, pp. 187-88

(42) Matheson, *op. cit.*, p. 349

(43) M.I. Smith, *Bristol Baptist Church Bicentenary 1965*, p. 10

(44) Fuller, *op. cit.*, single vol., p. lxxvii

(45) Yuille, *op. cit.*, p. 60

church order. Again his travels were extended, up the east coast to Aberdeen and down the west coast to Ayr and Dumfries. Again he preached to thousands at a time in Glasgow, the stronghold of the Dissenters. Again he brought away hundreds of pounds for his beloved Society - £1,300 in fact, as many pounds as miles he travelled, which was always his aim.

In Edinburgh he found six or seven leaders of a connexion verging fast to Sandemanianism, who argued with him for private brethren standing up one by one and speaking from scripture (46). These were almost certainly supporters of the Haldanes within the Haldane movement, for James had that year published his long book "A View of the Social Worship and Ordinances observed by the first Christians" and William Ballantyne had issued a pamphlet advocating a plurality of elders. Also in Edinburgh Fuller preached in John Aikman's Tabernacle, built at his own expense in Old Edinburgh after James Haldane and Aikman had seen the need to split the original Tabernacle, so great was the pastoral work involved. Learning that James Haldane was again attempting something new in Scotland - sending out two overseas missionaries from the church itself, as this was deemed to be the New Testament practice - Fuller hoped his Tabernacle would give nothing to BMS which would jeopardise their own new commitments, but, helped by a great number of Church of Scotland attenders, the Tabernacle contributed its usual princely sum, over £126 in fact.

Near Aberdeen Fuller baptised three people, at Cambuslang he met Dale in retirement and received £50, at Paisley he preached to 1,600 and in Renfrewshire and Ayrshire he met with yet another new development - Haldane-trained ministers who had recently become Baptists. 'They have formed new churches, which are the only ones in Scotland with whom either myself or any other English Baptist would be admitted to communion' (47). These new convinced Baptists, who

(46) Morris, op. cit., p. 131

(47) Ibid., p. 147

were already making James Haldane think harder on the issue of baptism, did not join the old Scotch Baptists, for many had left that connexion because of its lack of evangelistic zeal and spiritual life. What impressed Fuller in Ayrshire was that the Independents treated the new Baptists who had recently been fellow Independents with great Christian tolerance.

One of these Baptist ministers was young George Barclay who had studied in Haldane's seminary classes at Dundee and Glasgow. But on 6 October, 1803 Dr. Stuart baptised Barclay by immersion. Within three months Barclay had begun a Baptist church at Kilwinning. In the next 34 years 200 people were received into membership of the English-type Baptist church, which soon moved to Irvine. In 1805 Barclay baptised Archibald Smith who was later to be co-pastor with James Haldane himself. From Barclay's church went the first Baptist student to be trained at an English college, then at Bradford but now Rawdon College. Barclay corresponded with the Baptist trio at Serampore and with Judson in Burma, and in 1831 his son went to India to serve with Carey.

On 27 July, 1805 Fuller met with Barclay's church at Kilwinning in a crowded upper room. Afterwards he gladly took Barclay with him on his preaching engagements. Also at Kilwinning Fuller was happy to meet the parish minister, James Steven, a friend of the Scot Bogue of Gosport and till recently minister of Crown Court, London where he had firmly supported the London Missionary Society from its start. Baptists, Burgher Seceders, Relief Church members, Independents or Congregationalists, Established Church members - Fuller received aid from them all on this tour (48).

The 1808 tour was most rewarding: a clear £2,000 profit from a journey of 1,200 miles lasting six weeks. By and large collections were larger than ever and the 'interest, affection and liberality' of Glaswegians, who urged Fuller to visit Scotland every two years, was 'overwhelming' (49). Dr. Stuart had printed another 1,000

(48) Edinburgh Evangelical Magazine, 1805, Vol. III, p. 379

(49) Ryland, op. cit., p. 203

copies of the BMS "Memoir of the Translations" just before Fuller's arrival in October, with great results. "Never," exclaimed all denominations, "never was anything equal to it since the days of the Apostles!" Money poured in like rain in a thunder-storm. Those who had been disputing for years about discipline, weekly communion, etc. seemed half-ashamed. "What little things," said one of them, "are we employed about, compared with this! I wish you could come oftener than once in three years" (50).

Again the pattern in Scotland had changed. The Haldane connexion was split wide open, for the Haldanes had recently become Baptists and were tending to be more dogmatic. But so far they had failed to carry with them William Innes, whose ordination as Congregational minister of part of James Haldane's recently divided Tabernacle congregation Fuller attended, when Aikman and Ewing preached. Yet next day Fuller dined with and preached for James Haldane, whose church, however, like McLean's Scotch Baptist church, collected for the BMS by themselves, not allowing non-members to contribute. A keen controversialist and never one to shirk difficulties (he had been a wrestler in his youth and looked 'the very picture of a blacksmith' (51)), Fuller 'freely remonstrated with Mr. Haldane against some of his late measures, yet we met and parted kindly' (52), surely a tribute to the character of both men. Four days later on the Sunday Fuller preached for Innes to 800 (about £70 raised), for Aikman to about 1,800 (nearly £100 raised) and for recently ordained Christopher Anderson to 500 (£42 raised).

Anderson was a close friend of Barclay and became a close friend of Fuller. Moved when hearing his father read from the "Missionary Magazine" of the 1799 missionary tour in Northern Scotland of James Haldane, Aikman and Innes, Anderson had joined Haldane's Circus church, from which ironically he was excluded in 1801 for becoming baptised by immersion. Anderson became a Baptist through contact

(50) Letter of A. Fuller to W. Carey, 8 Dec. 1808

(51) R.I. and S. Wilberforce, op. cit., p. 389

(52) Ryland, op. cit., p. 202

with English Baptists who were students at Edinburgh University. For a time he was a member of Lister's church in Glasgow, though living in Edinburgh. Meeting Fuller for half an hour in 1802 Anderson offered himself as a missionary, but as it seemed his health was unsuited for India Fuller encouraged him to become a minister, which he did, after studying at Edinburgh University, under Sutcliff at Olney and at Bristol Academy. He seems to have enjoyed every moment of his 15 months in England. In London he heard Rowland Hill preach, met Abraham Booth and his fellow Scots Robert Haldane and John Campbell, and introduced himself as a Scot to John Newton, while in the Midlands and around Bristol he met Baptist stalwarts like Dr. Ryland and Robert Hall. Declining the chance to succeed Booth in London (53), Anderson returned to Edinburgh in 1806 and bought McLean's meeting-house in Richmond Court, to make of it a well-attended English-type Baptist church.

Fuller's opinion of Anderson was uncommonly high. 'Anderson ... is now trying to raise a Baptist church ... not from other denominations, but out of Satan's kingdom. I believe God will bless that man. If I dare try to remove him from Edinburgh, and could induce him to come and be co-pastor with me, I would divide my income with him; and he would take my place in the Mission, if he survived me; and he is not 25 years old. He is a fine writer, a close thinker, a good preacher; and what is more, a holy, diligent, mild character' (54). Till his death in 1852 Anderson maintained the faith in Edinburgh. After the Serampore missionaries left the BMS he was their Secretary in Britain. With Barclay he made preaching tours in Scotland and Ireland and together they founded in 1808 the Itinerating Society, which employed six evangelists, to replace, as it were, the Haldanes' dissolved SPGH. In 1810 he helped start an independent Edinburgh Bible Society as an inter-denominational venture. His own congregation grew and

(53) H. Anderson, *Life and Letters of Christopher Anderson*, p. 183

(54) Letter of A. Fuller to W. Ward at Serampore, 10 Dec. 1807

grew and today's flourishing Charlotte Street church is its descendant.

In his last visit to Scotland Fuller arrived via Dumfries and was met by Barclay. In Greenock he noted that there were four evangelical ministers (Church of Scotland, Relief, Burgher and Independent) and that half its population of 20,000 attended church. In 1813 Fuller went as far north as Dingwall where he was warmly welcomed by Alexander Stewart, the convert of Simeon, a friend of the late David Black and a Gaelic scholar, who after the Moulin revival was experiencing lean times. At Dundee Fuller met Thomas Chalmers, now an Evangelical through reading Wilberforce's "Practical View" and a rising star in the Established Church. On this tour Fuller noted there were about 80 Independent churches in Scotland left as the remains of the Haldane movement and that Sandemanianism was developing still new features: 'Its object is to annihilate the minister of the gospel; to be all teachers; to have no one paid for it, etc. etc.' (55).

### iii Fuller's role in Scotland

Scots valued Fuller, who resembled Jonathan Edwards in this respect, for his theology. They welcomed his books against Deism and Socinianism, the variety of his publications and his knowledge of Scripture. They were not above criticising his theology - Erskine, Stuart and Aikman attacked a chapter of "The Gospel its own Witness" concerning the nature of Christ's merits - but they did it with respect. Robert Kinniburgh, believed to be the last student trained in Haldane's seminary, in handing out bouquets to several famous men of his youth referred to '... and above all, the unequalled Andrew Fuller, whose weighty theology ...' (56)

(55) Ryland, *op. cit.*, p. 252

(56) R. Kinniburgh, *Fathers of Independency in Scotland*,  
p. 363

Scots valued Fuller for himself. Anderson called Fuller 'My Beloved Father in Christ Jesus' and Stuart once travelled the 300 miles to Kettering, on hearing that Fuller was ill, to give him unsolicited medical attention.

Scots also valued Fuller for the Society he represented. They admired the well-publicised work of the Serampore missionaries and their communal living and their ability to support themselves financially and they stood behind them when they were separated from the London-run BMS in the period 1827-37. The chance to help 60 million Hindus receive the New Testament in their own language stimulated Scottish giving in 1805, and the tragedy of the mission printing works fire of 1812 stimulated their giving in 1813.

As a Calvinist Evangelical Fuller proved a rallying-point for Scottish Calvinist Evangelicals who vied among themselves to show him hospitality. Fuller, however, must have been very diplomatic and balanced to tread so acceptably among the individuals and churches involved in the sudden changes, great growth and acrimonious schisms that mark our period. To move in 1808 with Ewing, Innes and Aikman one day and with James Haldane the next required great patience and tact. As an English Dissenter Fuller's work in Scotland lay mainly among Dissenters there, but his friends also included Established Church Evangelicals, among them Dr. Erskine, who was forbidden to let Fuller preach in his church by the Assembly's Act of 1799. Established Church Evangelicals, most of whom supported foreign missions, flocked to hear Fuller preaching in Dissenting churches and thus the BMS, together with the LMS, helped to fill the missionary vacuum that remained for Evangelicals in the Church of Scotland till 1824 when the Foreign Mission Committee of the General Assembly was created.

As an Englishman Fuller seems to have encountered no hostility. Nor did Dr. Ryland and Sutcliff on their Scottish tour for the BMS in 1811. As an English Baptist Fuller supported Scottish Baptists, who through McLean led their countrymen in supporting foreign missions, and was consulted and respected by them. But Fuller was closer in temperament to the English-type Baptist churches, and

increasingly condemned the older Scotch Baptist churches for their doctrinal heresies, their exclusiveness and contentious spirit and their crude literalistic approach to the Bible. Unlike McLean, James Haldane and Ewing the Congregationalist, Fuller considered the time for celebrating the Lord's Supper as undetermined, though he admitted to Anderson 'I think we eat it often, but you oftener; we do well, but perhaps you do better; but neither of us act contrary to the institution of Christ' (57). There was a real conflict here of Scottish and English traditions, for English Dissenters generally held the Lord's Supper service once a month, while the new Baptists and Independents in Scotland held it every Sunday, in contrast to the twice-yearly Church of Scotland communions. On the issue of plurality of elders Fuller denied it was essential to church order, but, failing to get Anderson, secured Robert Hall's nephew as his co-pastor at Kettering in his last years.

As BMS Secretary Fuller caused Scots to give themselves as well as their money to the BMS. Barclay's missionary son and Anderson's spell as Secretary to the Serampore missionaries have been noted. In addition, Anderson in 1809 went round London making the annual collection for BMS and in 1832 set apart as a Serampore missionary John Leechman, who succeeded Carey in his college and pastoral work and was Barclay's son-in-law and successor at Irvine.

If Fuller's contribution to Scotland was considerable, his debt to Scotland was also. He saw a country in the throes of a spiritual awakening and faced huge city congregations. As for the BMS, 'To no class of Christians is the mission more indebted, than to our Scottish brethren, whose liberality not only essentially contributed to its prosperity ... but whose multiplied kindnesses made a deep and lasting impression on the heart of the Secretary' (58). Thrifty, Scots might be, but not mean!

(57) Anderson, op. cit., p. 184

(58) Morris, op. cit., p. 112



## (b) The "Evangelical Magazine"

Chronologically, after the founding of the BMS, the launching of the "Evangelical Magazine" in July 1793 was the next enterprise to engage both Scottish and English Calvinist Evangelicals.

This magazine was quite a venture of faith, for prices were rising in the early years of the war, the magazine was planned on undenominational lines and there had been earlier casualties in the publishing field. The Glasgow "Weekly History" was Scotland's first religious magazine. Begun after Whitefield's visit in 1741 and edited by McCulloch of Cambuslang, it ran for 52 issues (59). A "Monthly Review" edited by Dissenters appeared in 1749, the Baptist John Allen of Salisbury started the "Spiritual Magazine" in 1752, and in 1766 there was issued "The Gospel Magazine", a Calvinist publication edited by Romaine. But these magazines, the "Monthly Review" excepted, were all short lived. Newton and Haweis tried in vain to start a Christian magazine in 1764, (60) after which both took to writing books.

The only similar publication before the "Evangelical Magazine" was the "Arminian Magazine" of 1778, but the former was unashamedly Calvinist, catering for the '300,000 Calvinists, and many others, savingly converted to Christ' (61) then in Britain. Other aims listed in the Preface of the first number were to give a 'manly and impartial Review of Religious Books' and to give an account of the 'progress of the Gospel throughout the kingdom', by a 'species of information entirely new, and very important', namely by Biographies, Ecclesiastical History, Meditations, Anecdotes, Biblical articles, Obituaries, Reviews of Religious Publications and Poetry. The monthly magazine ran to 44 pages per issue, politics was banned from its pages and its writers went unpaid. Profits went to charitable purposes, mainly to recommended widows of Gospel ministers.

Three men seem to have been mainly responsible for the publication

(59) Fawcett, op. cit., p. 93

(60) Wood, op. cit., p. 95

(61) Evangelical Magazine, 1793, Vol. I, p. 2

of the "Evangelical Magazine" - John Eyre, Edward Williams and David Bogue.

Eyre was, like Haweis, a Cornishman. After training at Trevecca College Eyre served as an Anglican curate to Cecil before moving to Homerton. He was a broad-minded Anglican who at times allowed lay preachers to his pulpit, though it was Matthew Wilks, the eccentric minister of the Moorfields Tabernacle and Tottenham Court Chapel for 53 years, who suggested to Eyre the "Evangelical Magazine" should be interdenominational in nature (62).

Williams was one of the leading theologians of his age. Like Fuller he advocated a moderate Calvinism. In January 1792 Williams became pastor of the Independent church in Carrs Lane, Birmingham, from which he exercised a powerful influence over the neighbouring Congregational churches. In 1781 he was asked by Lady Glenorchy, a minor version of Lady Huntingdon in Scotland who founded a number of chapels in Scotland and England, to train a few young men for the ministry at her expense and so began his famous teaching career. His connections with Scotland were further strengthened in 1793 when he gained a DD from Edinburgh University signed by 25 of the professors, partly at least no doubt for his reply to Abraham Booth called "Paedo-baptism examined", which has been called the 'most complete defence of infant-baptism in the English language' (63).

David Bogue is one of the pivotal figures in our study, for he was a self-exiled Scot living in Southern England from 1771 to his death in 1825. As a Christian pastor, teacher and statesman he deserves to be far better known than he is. His activity, initiative and influence were great, reaching out across Britain and across the world through his missionary students and correspondence.

Large and healthy in physique, full of 'patriarchal language and appearance' (64), he was always prudent and mature beyond his years

(62) J. Morison, *The Fathers and Founders of the LMS*, Vol. ii, p. 384

(63) *Ibid.*, Vol. ii, p. 361

(64) *Ibid.*, Vol. i, p. 508

and very reserved and dignified. 'Gigantic force and infantile simplicity' (65) were blended in him, though at the same time there was a 'streak of benevolent despotism in the resolute Scotsman' (66). He did not excel in memory, foreign languages or imagination, but he did in self-discipline and industry. His reading was vast and his studies often marched on into the small hours. 'Sixteen hours a-day he laboured for God' (67) said James Bennett, who was first his student, then his colleague and co-author and finally, after following Williams to the Rotherham Academy, his biographer. But Bogue was not a great preacher, for though his sermons were 'rational, instructive and evangelical' they were cast in a 'severely simple style' (68). Modest, serious, knowledgeable, it was Bogue's character that impressed others.

Born in 1750 the sixth child of a Berwickshire laird, in his youth Bogue heard Whitefield and Thomas Boston preach and rated them, in that order, as the two most commanding preachers he had ever heard (69). Entering Edinburgh University while still 12, he studied there for nine years before becoming a licensed preacher in the Established Church. But he was opposed to the law of patronage, as was his spirited father, who, rather than ask Lord Marchmont to give his son the living of Coldingham, advised his son to go to London (70). In London Bogue gravitated towards his countrymen and became a hard-working usher or assistant teacher, eventually at the boarding-school in Church Lane, Chelsea run by the Rev. William Smith. Born at Dalkeith, Smith had come to London in 1769 and had a church built for him at Camberwell and held a lectureship at Silver Street. After preaching in 1772 his first sermon, for Mr. Muir, another Church of Scotland minister, Bogue

(65) J. Bennett, *Memoirs of the Life of the Rev. David Bogue DD*, p. 422

(66) Wood, *op. cit.*, p. 238

(67) Bennett, *Memoirs*, p. 420

(68) *Ibid.*, pp. 107, 126

(69) Thomson, *op. cit.*, p. 258

(70) Bennett, *Memoirs*, p. 18

assisted Smith in his ministerial duties also. Smith was Bogue's senior by only seven years and they got on famously together - 'To know him (Smith) was to love him ... He had more in him of the beloved disciple than we remember to have seen in any public man, in modern times, with the single exception of the late Rev. Dr. Waugh' (71).

In 1777, against the advice of his ministerial friend James Somerville, who was later influential in Robert Haldane's conversion, Bogue accepted the unanimous invitation of the recently split Independent congregation, where some Scots worshipped, at Gosport, then a town of 5,000 people. He was pastor there for 48 years and the congregation re-united and grew steadily in size and devotion. It was at Gosport the Haldane brothers first met Bogue, as their uncle, Captain Duncan, made it his HQ during the years 1779-87 he was stationed at Portsmouth and was persuaded to attend Bogue's church. Through Mrs. Duncan, who was the niece of the powerful Dundas, Bogue was offered the West Church in Edinburgh, where he could have been the colleague of Sir Henry Moncreiff, but although he had not fully forsaken Presbyterianism Bogue declined the offer.

But though apparently isolated in Hampshire, Bogue kept contact with his compatriot ministers in London and with Scotland which he visited frequently. His ordination charge at Gosport was given by Dr. Harry Hunter, who came from Scotland to London at about the same time as himself, to be for 31 years the minister of the Scots church at London Wall. Hunter gladly exchanged pulpits with all the leading Dissenters of the day (72), was awarded a DD from Edinburgh University at an early age and published seven volumes of "Sacred Biographies", sermons and translations of foreign works. In one respect he was a marked contrast to Bogue, for 'conviviality was his snare, and, on more occasions than one, his reproach' (73).

(71) Morison, op. cit., Vol. ii, p. 510

(72) Ibid., Vol. ii, p. 440

(73) Ibid., Vol. ii, p. 447

When in Scotland several Church of Scotland pulpits were open to Bogue. In 1779 he preached at least seven times there, among others for Dr. Erskine, Thomas Jones, the Trevecca-trained minister at Lady Glenorchy's Chapel in Edinburgh who was joined by Greville Ewing in 1793, and Dr. Hunter, the future Edinburgh Professor of Divinity who so admired Fuller's works. On his way home Bogue also preached at Newcastle and London.

To revert to the "Evangelical Magazine". Among the 'Stated Contributors to the Work and Trustees for the Proper distribution of the money' listed in the first number that concern us are:

John Boden, Hanley Green	David Bogue, Gosport
George Burder, Coventry	John Eyre, A.M., Hackney
Andrew Fuller, Kettering	John Hey, Bristol
Edward Parsons, Leeds	John Ryland, D.D., Bristol
Robert Simpson, A.M., Hoxton	Matthew Wilks, London

Edward Williams, D.D., Birmingham

The above were all ministers and included Baptists, Presbyterians, Independents and Calvinistic Methodists. Bogue and Simpson were Scots. The latter, born at Kinross of a good family, went in 1791 from Bolton to Hoxton College, where for 26 years he was a theological tutor, but his lectures, alas, were 'dry and uninteresting' (74).

By 1796 another Scot of importance to us had joined the magazine's board as a 'Stated Contributor'. Like Bogue his friend, Alexander Waugh was born in Berwickshire, in 1754. Over his Burgher Secession church in Wells Street, London to which he came in 1782 he 'acquired an influence which it would have been impossible for an Englishman to obtain' (for the congregation was made up of Scots and 'Scotland was enshrined in his soul') (75). Waugh delighted in all things Scottish, in his country's history, traditions and scenery. Unlike Bogue he never lost his native accent. He was friendly with the other Scottish Presbyterian ministers in London and best of all he

(74) Ibid., Vol. ii, p. 230

(75) Ibid., Vol. ii, pp. 16, 14

was a man who spread love and goodwill and was universally loved in return.

From the start Waugh supported the new magazine and largely on his recommendation the Scottish widows were chosen to receive more, if anything, than their share of the extensive profits, which often exceeded £500 a year. Waugh contributed several valuable papers to the magazine and 'often lamented his brethren in the North did not contribute their literary aid as freely as he wished' (76). But after July 1796 Evangelical Scots had their own "Missionary Magazine" and men like Ewing and John Campbell did have lengthy articles in the "Evangelical Magazine", the former on "A Comparative View of Calvinism and Arminianism" and an obituary of his first wife Ann, who was William Innes' sister, and the latter on his traumatic experience when the Lord appeared to him as his deliverer. On his death bed in 1827 Waugh 'deeply regretted that more was not done in Scotland for its circulation, as one hundred pounds of its funds went yearly to the families of the deceased ministers there' (77).

By 1797 three more Scots served the magazine as Contributors and Trustees: the Rev. R. Bayne, M.A., of Elgin, Mr. A. Duncanson of Airdrie and the Rev. John Smart of Stirling. The next year David Dale, Robert Haldane and Mr. A. Pitcairn of Edinburgh are listed as Trustees for the Protestant Union, the society helping the widows and orphans of Protestant ministers and preachers in the United Kingdom. In 1802 William Jay of Argyle Chapel, Bath and the Rev. James Moody of Warwick became official Contributors, and in 1804 Greville Ewing.

On Eyre's death in 1803, Bogue's friend, the Englishman George Burder, became editor for 20 years. A sturdy Independent who always kept his early love for Anglican Evangelicals, Burder had just come from Coventry to the Fetter Lane church in London. As

(76) J. Hay and H. Belfrage, *Memoirs of the Rev. Alexander Waugh*,  
D.D., p. 147

(77) *Ibid.*, p. 402

editor his first care was to make it serve evangelical religion, his second to preserve its catholic character and his third to make it a defence against all attacks on religious liberty or the rights of Dissenters. 'He maintained a wise and vigilant supervision, corresponding with ministers all over the kingdom' (78). His forte was condensation and he had a 'remarkable talent for collecting and arranging materials' (79).

All in all the "Evangelical Magazine" was a success story. Circulation rose quickly to several thousand and later reached 15,000. Evidently it met a real need among Calvinist Christians. The editors drew on many ministers for help and engravings of these worthies appeared regularly to relieve the monotony of close print. The magazine brought Scottish and English Calvinist Evangelicals together in a joint enterprise.

In its early years especially the magazine had a four-fold value. (1) It carried a sense of belonging to a wider Christian fellowship to many manses and homes far from cities and centres of Evangelical activity. Alexander Stewart of Moulin was one such instance of this. (2) The magazine was a great purveyor of home and foreign mission news not easily accessible to any member of one denomination. It was an important clearing-house of up-to-date information. (3) It greatly speeded up the means by which news of God's victories in one part of Britain or the world were made known to other parts. It sparked off ideas and projects and successful methods were copied in other places. What the radio was to the inter-World Wars generation and television to the present generation, magazines and newspapers were to the generation of our period. (4) It proved to be a channel for airing new ideas and proposals. In its pages, for instance, plans for a new interdenominational missionary society were made that quickly came to fruition, and to this significant episode we must now turn.

(78) Bennett, *History of the Dissenters*, p. 433

(79) Morison, *op. cit.*, Vol. ii, p. 108

## (c ) The Missionary Society (IMS)

It is not always easy to be wise after the event, but the hidden roots from which the Missionary Society 'burst forth with a kind of Pentecostal excitement upon the public mind of the church' (80) seem to be eight in number.

(1) In 1789 Haweis, as we have seen, tried without success to send out two missionaries to Tahiti, but this setback did not dim his missionary vision. (2) In 1792 the BMS was formed and soon sent out Carey and Thomas to Bengal. (3) Also in 1792 Bogue preached in Salter's Hall, London for the London Corresponding Board of the SSPCK a vigorous missionary sermon in which he tried to shame his hearers into more action: 'Even the poor Moravians, a sect neither numerous nor wealthy, have done as much, or more, for the conversion of the heathen nations, than the opulent kingdom of Great Britain. For shame! let us rouse ourselves from our lethargy ...' (81)

(4) In June 1793 the Warwickshire Association of Ministers was formed for the spread of the gospel at home and abroad. Seven months later two itinerants were appointed for the county to be supervised by a committee consisting of Dr. Edward Williams, George Burder and James Moody. In 1794 the Warwickshire Association of Independent ministers was active in supporting Bogue's idea of a missionary society. (5) In July 1793 the "Evangelical Magazine" was begun. (6) In August 1794 Bogue and James Steven of the Scots Church, Covent Garden were preaching at the Bristol Tabernacle and were shown by John Ryland Carey's first letter from India received the previous month. With John Hey, the minister of the Independent church at Castle Green, Bristol, Bogue and Steven met in the parlour of Whitefield's Tabernacle to pray and discuss about the best way to awaken Independents to their missionary responsibilities, and this led to Bogue's influential article in the September 1794 issue of the "Evangelical Magazine" entitled "To the Evan-

(80) Ibid., Vol. i, p. 206

(81) Bennett, Memoirs, p. 162



gelical Dissenters who practise Infant Baptism" with the complaint 'There is not a body of Christians in the country, except ourselves, but have put their hand to the plough' (82).

(7) As noted above, the Warwickshire Association backed Bogue's proposal and in London so did John Eyre, the Anglican, who about May 1794 at the Dissenters' Library in Red Cross Street spoke of a missionary society to the three Scottish Presbyterian ministers Waugh, Love and Steven and immediately afterwards to Wilks. Eyre and Wilks gathered a group of seven or nine interested persons and held fortnightly meetings at the Castle and Falcon Inn in Aldersgate Street, studying the Bible and praying with regard to overseas missionary work. Their first formal meeting was on 4 November, 1794. The Rev. John Love, the Church of Scotland minister at Artillery Street, was appointed provisional secretary. Waugh and Steven were also on the committee of correspondence which circulated news of the planned missionary society throughout the country. This they did mainly by an address in the "Evangelical Magazine", accompanied by a letter signed by Love, and by distributing 15,000 copies of Burder's "Address" which appeared in the April 1795 issue of the magazine.

(8) Meanwhile in 1794 the Rev. Melville Horne's "Letters on Missions" had been published. An Anglican chaplain who had gone to Sierra Leone in 1792, Horne yet advocated a general union of all denominations as the only sufficient basis for a mission. This book, which has been compared with Carey's pre-BMS "Enquiry", was reviewed by Haweis in the November 1794 issue of the "Evangelical Magazine". This review was 'one of the turning-points in the modern missionary awakening' (83) for it ended with a definite suggestion for a new missionary society and an anonymous offer by Haweis of £500 to such a society.

These were the eight roots from which the LMS sprang, but the soil in which they flourished were the opening up of the world

(82) Ibid., p. 174

(83) Wood, op. cit., p. 192

through exploration, trade and improved communications, the fashionable concepts of the brotherhood of men and the 'noble savage' and a growing millennial expectation.

Knowing that the moment was opportune, the "Evangelical Magazine" announced in July 1795, near Haweis' article on "The Very Probable Success of a Proper Mission to the South Seas", that an attempt to start the society would be made that September. Over 200 ministers of different denominations and hundreds of laymen converged on the capital on Monday, 21 September to hear two Scots play a prominent part in the evening's programme. Steven explained to the crowd what the provisional committee had so far done and Love as provisional secretary read out letters of support that had come in from all parts of the country - 'encouraging letters from Scotland were also read, and the company was visibly affected when informed, that praying societies had resolved to engage in intercessions at Glasgow, at the very time the ministers and their friends were assembled in London' (84).

Almost everything about the founding of the LMS was in contrast to the founding of the BMS - the advance publicity, the excited crowds, the audacious plans for world-wide operation, the six sermons from six ministers in four days of meetings, the £740 collected on the first day, the interdenominational nature of it all.

To Haweis went the honour of preaching the first sermon, after which a committee was appointed to compose a plan for the society. Scots on this committee were Bogue, Love, Steven and Waugh. Others included Eyre, Haweis, Hey, Rowland Hill, the Rev. Samuel Greatheed of Newport Pagnell, and the Rev. William Kingsbury, M.A., who was for 45 years pastor of the Independent church at Southampton and thus Bogue's neighbour.

That evening Burder preached in Steven's church to an overflowing crowd on Jonah's message to Nineveh. With Sir Egerton Leigh, Bart., who was ordained to the itinerant ministry in 1797 but who

after 1800 joined the Baptists of Rugby, and Robert Little of Birmingham, who was minister at Haldane's Tabernacle at Perth 1802-06 where he dared to attack the Scottish Psalter (85), Burder was an official delegate of the lively Warwickshire Association.

The third sermon was preached by Greatheed, the fourth by Hey, the fifth by Rowland Hill and the last by Bogue. The Scot preached at Tottenham Court Chapel on Haggai 1.2 - a 'well-digested, cool, argumentative discussion, of the propriety of attempting a mission to the heathen' (86). In his article a year before Bogue had wished the Independent churches to form a missionary society, but Evangelical Independents were weak in London, where there were instead important Evangelicals who were odd men out in their own denominations - men like the Anglican Eyre, the Calvinistic Methodists Haweis, Wilks and Hill and the Scottish Presbyterian ministers who were technically Dissenters in England even though most of them were Church of Scotland ministers. However, Bogue was delighted that he found himself part of an interdenominational society, whose members were all paedobaptists, especially when they included his close friends the Scottish ministers in London. When Bogue said 'We are called this evening to the funeral of bigotry; and I hope it will be buried so deep as never to rise again' he was being excessively optimistic again but he was sincere enough. Moreover the 'whole vast body of people manifested their concurrence, and could scarcely refrain from one general shout of joy. Such a scene was perhaps, never before beheld in our world ...' (87).

The mood during and after the September meetings was certainly exuberant. The new society opened a new chapter in interdenominationalism and was greeted with the kind of ecstatic optimism that had first greeted the fall of the Bastille. To cite the "Evangelical Magazine" again: 'Another consideration that rendered

(85) Escott, op. cit., p. 158

(86) Evangelical Magazine, 1796, Vol. IV, p. 38

(87) Ibid., 1795, Vol. III, p. 425

these seasons unspeakably delightful, was the visible union of ministers and Christians of all denominations; who, for the first time, forgetting their party prejudices and partialities, assembled in the same place, sang the same hymns, united in the same prayers, and felt themselves one in Christ' (88). Equally astonishing was that such a visible union was soon to be seen in Scotland.

Never since have English Evangelicals been so near to quitting their own mixed denominations and forming one of their own, not even in 1966 when Dr. Lloyd-Jones of Westminster Chapel publicly urged Evangelicals to form a united Church and was immediately rebuked by the Rev. J. Stott, an Anglican and a Queen's chaplain. In 1798, for example, the East-Kent Association was a union of Baptist, Independent and ex-Lady Huntingdon ministers, including George Townsend the LMS founder. These ministers even held joint communion services among their churches (89), as Conservative Evangelicals do today at their annual Keswick convention.

After the September meetings events moved fast - too fast perhaps. Within a year the Missionary Society had over £12,000 in hand and 30 missionaries accepted. At its first AGM in May 1796 the resolution was unanimously passed to send a mission to Otaheite (Tahiti), the Friendly Islands, the Marquesas and the Pelew Islands in a ship belonging to the Society, to be commanded by Captain Wilson who had offered his services after the inaugural meeting addressed by Haweis, who in October 1795 presented a plan for a mission to Sierra Leone but who had always had the Pacific Islands on his heart.

At the May meeting letters were read out from Scotland, from the missionary societies recently started in towns there, and appropriately Love was asked to reply to them. In one letter from Scotland it was pointed out that it was nearly 90 years since the political Act of Union but 'the union was now complete; a spiritual

(88) Ibid., 1795, Vol. III, p. 425

(89) Missionary Magazine, 1798, Vol. III, p. 571

union has now taken place ...' (90), probably implying little more than a hearty approval of the new international Evangelicalism to which the birth of the LMS had given concrete expression.

On 28 July 1796 at Zion Chapel 29 missionaries were set apart, an Episcopalian, a Scottish Seceder, a Presbyterian, an Independent and a Methodist uniting in their designation and finally the "Duff", purchased for about £5,000, sailed with 30 missionaries.

The LMS missionaries, however, were to prove a source of contention in several ways. The first voyage was very successful and the "Duff" returned from it unscathed, but en route two missionaries were suspended by the majority from church privileges till they renounced Arminian errors concerning the extent of Christ's death and the possibility of falling from grace (91).

Then the missionaries' ordination (or commissioning, according to one's interpretation of the ceremony) in London raised Presbyterian eyebrows in Scotland, for the five ministers of different denominations advanced with Bibles in their hands to the communion rail and said to the missionaries who came forward in groups of five at a time, 'Go, beloved brother, live agreeable to this blessed Word, and publish the Gospel to the heathen according to your calling, gifts and abilities'. On receiving his Bible the missionary answered the charge with 'I will, the Lord being my helper' (92). Eyebrows were raised even higher by the account of the united communion service held on the eve of the missionaries' departure, about which Waugh, who had a lame foot at the time, somewhat mystifyingly wrote: 'I fancy I need not tell you that neither Mr. Jerment nor myself sat down at the Lord's table with the directors and missionaries before the ship went away. This, in regard to myself, however, was not owing to principle, for I could join with perfect freedom in every act of fellowship with

(90) Ibid., 1796, Vol. I, p. 46

(91) Murray, op. cit., p. 147 footnote

(92) Wood, op. cit., p. 209

the Otaheitan church, and in this light the matter was taken up. Mr. Jerment assisted in the ordinations, and gave an excellent charge at the last one' (93).

Then there was the vexed question of missionary qualifications. Haweis (and others) minimised specific training for a missionary - 'A plain man, with a good natural understanding, well read in the Bible, full of faith, and of the Holy Ghost, though he comes from the forge, or the shop, would, I own, in my view, as a missionary to the heathen, be infinitely preferable to all the learning of the schools ...' (94). Opposed to this school of thought stood Bogue, who believed it was essential to prove and improve accepted candidates by giving them a good grounding in the Scriptures and by training them to become fishers of men. Bogue won the majority to his side and after 1800 missionary candidates were sent to his academy at Gosport. So instead of getting no education at all or only the rudiments of building and agricultural skills, as some advocated, missionary candidates were educated for the ministry of the word, and it was claimed for Bogue that no man trained by him for the ministry ever departed from the faith.

Bogue also opposed Haweis on the use of the "Duff", objecting to the Society's involvement in commercialism by using the ship to carry a cargo, a view given point when the "Duff" was captured by a French privateer off Brazil in 1799.

Yet a third controversy between Bogue and Haweis concerned mission fields. Bogue favoured the Pauline practice of establishing missions in key centres of population and so wanted missionaries to go to Britain's populous colonies and the civilised nations of Asia where the learning of a language would open up communication with millions. But Haweis, who disagreed with the policy of letting missionary candidates choose their own mission field, aimed at pioneering in territory untouched by Europeans,

(93) Hay and Belfrage, op. cit., p. 161

(94) T. Haweis, *Missionary Sermons*, pp. 14-15

like the scattered romantic South Sea Islands. Haweis even accused Bogue of opposing the South Sea mission from its outset.

Finally, in a letter to Secretary Burder on 18 November, 1819, Haweis criticised Bogue in writing: 'I always foresaw and remonstrated the consequences, and, as you know, brought Mr. Bogue's wrath on me and address to you for my expulsion from the Society. He has assumed the entire authority, and though he cannot destroy, he will impede by diverting every missionary that is sent to Gosport. We refuse episcopal government and have adopted another independent authority and set him at the head of it' (95). In fairness to Haweis it must be said that he had warned of the danger of the missionary college at Gosport becoming linked to a party within the LMS because he valued the Society's inter-denominational nature, and it is a fact that by Haweis' death in 1820 the LMS was becoming increasingly dominated by Congregationalists. It is also a fact that Bogue's power over the LMS seminary at Gosport was very great - for instance, not till 1819 was he ever asked to submit regular reports on his students.

Enough has already been said to show that Scots living in England made a contribution to the formation and continuation of the LMS out of all proportion to their numbers. No fewer than ten of the 36 'Fathers' of the LMS in Morison's sketches were Scots. But the half has not been told. Bogue, Love, Steven, Waugh and Jerment were in the front rank of the LMS, with Dr. Hunter, Robert Simpson, William Graham, William Smith and Robert Steven in the second rank.

Bogue has as good a claim to be called the originator of the LMS as have Haweis or Eyre. It was Bogue, Love and Dr. Hunter, who was elected its Secretary in 1790, that probably formed the Evangelical ginger group in the London Corresponding Board of the SSPCK. Disappointed or worse that the SSPCK did not respond more practically to the hopes expressed in his published 1792 sermon

for them, Bogue turned towards his fellow Independent Evangelicals in England for fulfilment of his hopes.

Bogue, and perhaps his compatriots in London, may also have sympathised with the person whose tract argued that money raised for overseas missions should not be channelled through the SSPCK as the Society was not really Evangelical, or with the criticism that 'the Society has become so rich, as to be at a loss for objects upon which to bestow the super-abundance of their wealth' (96). Certainly the Society had received some munificent bequests since Lady Glenorchy's death. Criticisms against the SSPCK Directors reached such a pitch that Dr. Erskine thought it wise in March 1796 to propose a thorough investigation into the Society's funds. This was done, and the published report vindicated the Society's good name, as Erskine knew it would. The Earl of Leven continued as the Society's President, Bogue's former student, James Haldane, continued as a Director and Dr. Hunter continued as the London Secretary till his death.

After 1795 Bogue lived for missions. In 1802 after the Beace of Amiens he went with Waugh, Wilks and Joseph Hardcastle, the LMS Treasurer and wealthy merchant on whose London premises the Directors met, to France for some weeks. Their aim was three-fold: to assess the condition of Christianity in France, to see if British ministers could go and work there and to discover the best ways of circulating the Bible there. Bogue also looked for a translator for the introductory essay he had written for the LMS-sponsored New Testament in French, an essay concerning which a reviewer advised Bogue 'to relinquish any attempt to reconcile the precepts of Scripture with the maxims of the French Revolution'. In 1816 Bogue and James Bennett visited the Netherlands for the LMS.

Through his missionary students Bogue's influence was crucial, for he kept up correspondence with them after they had left his



academy. Robert Morrison and William Milne of China and Richard Knill of Russia were possibly his most famous students. Another was Joseph Frey, a German Jew who gave lectures which led to a Jewish mission under LMS auspices being started. But in 1809 Frey left LMS in unbecoming circumstances to found the London Society for the Propagation of the Gospel among the Jews.

Bogue's was a powerful LMS voice in the provinces but the Scottish ministers in London were at the centre of affairs and were equally influential. From 1795-1820 'the ministers belonging to the Scotch Church, in the metropolis, acted in full harmony with their evangelical brethren of other denominations' (97), a contrast to the state of relationships that followed that period. In 1787 the Church of Scotland ministers were independent-minded and large-hearted men and their churches were very prosperous. Taken together, Dr. Hunter, and Messrs. Trotter, Nicol, Smith, Steven and Love 'possessed an influence unrivalled in the metropolis' (98) when London's population was about 800,000 of whom perhaps 40,000 were Scots.

The influence of the Scottish ministers was so great because they were effective and educated ministers (five of the six mentioned above were awarded a DD) and as a consequence their churches were well attended and wealthy. They were also public-spirited men - Hunter was chaplain to the Scottish Corporation - and like many Evangelicals at that time their concept of Christianity was far broader than their own denomination. Steven, who had over 800 communicants and enjoyed a particularly close relationship with his London congregation, supported the LMS wholeheartedly and eight years after leaving for Kilwinning returned to London to preach one of its annual sermons. From his first visit to London out of curiosity, Hunter loved the city, and London society returned the compliment. Within a few months of his arrival at London Wall

(97) Morison, op. cit., Vol, ii, p. 425

(98) Ibid., Vol. ii, p. 427

Hunter had become the city's most popular preacher and his literary output enhanced his fame. He officiated at the September 1795 meetings and preached to the first batch of LMS missionaries in 1796, but family bereavements aged him prematurely and he died in 1802. To the end his churchmanship remained tolerant, for after Rowland Hill found some Church of Scotland pulpits in Scotland closed to him he still found Hunter's in London open to him.

Though Love's Bishopsgate congregation was small and obscure and failed to appreciate his slow, aphoristic style of preaching he found plenty of work to do in the LMS. Of the 26 Directors he was elected to be the first foreign secretary, that is, to manage all the correspondence outwith England. His mind was 'fertile and original' and 'with great sobriety of mind, and vast powers of discrimination, he combined depths of feeling, fervour of devotion, and promptitude of action' (99), all of which made him a good secretary for the new society.

Where Love was not so successful was in his series of "Addresses to the Inhabitants of Otaheite" which were never used. Indeed, the South Sea Islanders were 'more prone to eat a missionary than to digest his doctrines' (100). Love, who was a Moderate in theology during and immediately after his university studies, believed with many Scots, both Moderates and Evangelicals, that natural religion should be taught before revealed religion and his "Addresses" were full of natural religion.

Like Steven, Love was a Scot domiciled in England who returned to live in Scotland. Because he disliked the 'crowded desolation, hurry and pollution' of London and because of his wife's illness he moved back to Glasgow where he had graduated and where a chapel of ease in Clyde Street, Anderston was opened for him in July 1800 and a select and intelligent flock gathered round him. As

(99) Ibid., Vol. ii, pp. 61,69

(100) Biographical Dictionary of Eminent Scotsmen, Vol. 2, p. 546

it happened, his contribution to the missionary cause was to be as great in Glasgow as it had been in London. His close friend became Dr. Robert Balfour, the Evangelical minister of Glasgow's Outer High Church, who inducted Steven to his Kilwinning charge.

In addition to the Church of Scotland ministers in London mention must be made of two other Scottish ministers there, Waugh and Jerment. Waugh, the friend of Mungo Park and John Newton, to whom he introduced Scots visiting London, was the Burgher minister of the Wells Street congregation who at last secured his services in 1782. Born in 1754 in the wee village of East Gordon in Berwickshire, not far from where his friend David Bogue was born four years earlier, Waugh attended Edinburgh and Aberdeen Universities and John Brown's Burgher Secession academy at Haddington before coming to London. As we have seen, Waugh was in on LMS affairs even before it was officially started and it was Waugh who 'always reflected with pleasure on having had the honour to be the framer of the fundamental principle' (101) of the LMS. The core of this distinguishing principle was 'not to send Presbyterianism, Independency, Episcopacy, or any other form of church order and government (about which there may be a difference of opinion among serious persons), but the glorious gospel of the blessed God, to the heathen; and it shall be left (as it ought to be left) to the minds of the persons whom God may call into the fellowship of His Son from among them, to assume for themselves such form of church government as to them shall appear most agreeable to the word of God' (102). However delightfully tolerant this fundamental principle is in theory, it was fraught with difficulties in practice, for it tended to spiritual anarchy and implied a church order based on the individual congregation or missionary. There are special problems connected with interdenominational missions and within two years of framing the fundamental

(101) Hay and Belfrage, op. cit., p. 153

(102) Ibid., pp. 153-54

principle Waugh was preaching at the May meetings on 'Do all things without murmurings and disputings' (103). However, peace was preserved in 1797 in the LMS, though not all agreed with Bogue's paper on forming seminaries to train missionaries or with the appeal made by Bogue and Robert Haldane, who were still hoping to go to India as missionaries, and others to ministers to consider becoming missionaries. Next year Waugh himself contemplated going out on board the "Duff" to superintend the settlement of the missionaries in the South Seas but his wife seemed to be 'sadly scrimp of both faith and zeal for the trip round the world' (104).

Waugh continued to be most active in LMS work. For 28 years he was chairman of the committee that interviewed and assessed missionary candidates. In 1802 he visited France in the LMS delegation and often made fund-raising tours in England and Scotland. In 1812 with Dr. Jack of Manchester he promoted the missionary cause in Ireland. From his fellow Seceders in the Associate Synod he received a warm welcome to preach from their pulpits and even the Synod of Ulster in connexion with the Church of Scotland after a heated discussion agreed to leave it to individual ministers to invite Waugh to their pulpits. After hearing himself spoken against, Waugh addressed the Synod of Ulster to plead the cause of foreign missions and within half an hour 'there was not a dry eye to be seen among all his auditors' (105). Thus Waugh and Jack opened up Ireland to LMS influence. In 1815 Waugh collected £1,420 in Scotland and four years later another £737.

Waugh's contribution to LMS went even deeper. While Bogue was often in the thick of controversy, Waugh was the great peace-maker. 'He disarmed by love' (106). Burder claimed that 'Dr. Waugh promoted, in the outset of the Missionary Society, that spirit of

(103) Ibid., pp. 155-60

(104) Ibid., p. 163

(105) Ibid., p. 184

(106) Ibid., p. 131

Christian union by which it has ever been distinguished ... On all occasions, for thirty-three years, Dr. Waugh was uniformly the "peace-maker" (107). The procession was nearly half a mile long at his funeral, at which such diverse characters as Rowland Hill and Edward Irving officiated.

That peace-making was necessary among the strong-minded men who started the LMS was revealed even before it was formed, when some at the fortnightly meeting at the "Castle and Falcon" had objected to Bogue 'as an high and overbearing man, but that was over-ruled, and he was addressed' (108) about the plan to begin the Society. Then there was the struggle that occurred over the election of a home secretary in 1795. 'A long altercation took place ... Mr. Shrubsole proposed by the Methodist party, opposed by the Scotch Presbyterians' (109). In the event Shrubsole, the friend of Wilks and Hill and a layman, was elected. And when in 1798 increasing duties at the Bank of England obliged Shrubsole to resign he was succeeded by Eyre the Anglican. Eyre mentioned the existence of parties within LMS when writing to Haweis about his own resignation as Secretary: 'But who shall succeed me? It must not be one of the Party which have given us already so much trouble' (110). The Scottish Presbyterians had been so troublesome because they believed missionaries should be educated and trained men. Many English Evangelicals rejected this idea, however, and Rowland Hill led the minority which was against candidates attending the Gosport academy before they went out to the mission field. Even as late as 1827 Bennett could write, possibly with exaggeration, 'There have not ceased to be men of influence in the society, who sincerely think that the best education for missionaries is none at all; and the next best is that which consists in teaching them to make wheelbarrows and plant turnips,

(107) Ibid., p. 161

(108) Letter of M. Wilks to J. Bennett, 22 Aug. 1827

(109) MS Diary of John Reynolds (LMS Archives) 25 Sept. 1795

(110) Maggs Bros. Cat. 616, 1935: Report of

rendering them useful mechanics and agriculturists rather than good divines or preachers' (111). Eyre's successor, Burder, may perhaps be regarded as a non-party man, for he was neither a Methodist nor a Presbyterian but an English Independent who was a friend of Bogue.

George Jerment was another London-based Scot who enthusiastically joined in starting the LMS. Born in Peebles, he became in 1782 the Anti-Burgher minister of Bow Lane, Cheapside church. His congregations were large and his influence among Scots in London - the aristocracy, MPs and merchants - very considerable. He was a fine preacher and for his writings was awarded a DD. Not always was the Anti-Burgher lost in the Christian, but Jerment was and threw in his support to the LMS. With Haweis and Love he drew up the instructions for the first missionaries and preached to them in July 1796.

Other Scots among the 33 who signed in January 1795 a statement of unity concerning the formation of a missionary society were William Graham, the Secession minister of Newcastle, and the layman Andrew Duncanson.

After May 1797 the number of LMS Directors was greatly increased. Scots becoming ineligible to serve another year after lots were drawn were Jerment, the Rev. Robert Hall of Kelso and Dr. Snodgrass of Paisley, but Scottish additions included Robert Haldane, and the Reverend Messrs. Bayne of Greenock, Campbell of Stirling, Fleming of Kirkcaldy, Gillies of Paisley, Mackintosh of Tain, Mill of Shetland, Pitcairn of Kelso, Russell of Kilmarnock and Somerville of Stirling.

In 1798 the LMS became an international society with the election of the Dutch doctor Vanderkemp as a Director and with his departure in December as a missionary for Cape Town. In its hour of need on Vanderkemp's death in South Africa the LMS turned to the Scot John Campbell, once the encourager of the Haldane brothers as young Christians and from 1804 the Independent minister of Kingsland Chapel, London where the name of a road still bears witness to his

work. In June 1812, after a moving commissioning service at which Waugh gave the charge, Campbell went out to inspect and report on LMS work in South Africa, the first of two tremendous journeys he made there for the Society. Thus the great Scottish contribution to the brave attempt at an undenominational society south of the border continued on beyond our period, into the age of Campbell, Dr. John Philip and Dr. David Livingstone.

As a postscript to the LMS mention should be made of the Church Missionary Society (CMS), which Simeon at last coaxed into being on 12 April, 1799. Though off to a poor start - episcopal recognition and missionaries were slow in coming - by 1900, when Britain still led the world in foreign missions, it was the world's largest missionary society.

The Eclectic Society felt obliged to state its attitude to the LMS when an Anglican minister, Burn of Birmingham, declined to preach for the LMS but wished to know his fellow Anglican Evangelicals' policy towards it (112). The Society, good Churchmen all, objected to Waugh's fundamental principle for one thing. John Venn, its virtual leader, was 'an Evangelical by inheritance and conviction, but very much an Anglican Evangelical' (113) who yet believed that the CMS should be run by its own committee and not by the bishops. Applying the lessons learnt from what were deemed the LMS's blunders, Venn laid down three wise principles for the CMS: (1) Follow, do not anticipate God's leading; (2) Success will depend on the kind of men employed; (3) Proceed from small beginnings (114).

For another thing the Anglican Evangelicals were by and large different in temperament from their LMS counterparts - more cautious, more subservient to authority, more conscious of their position in society. Yet they wished the LMS well and sent it 100 gns. on learning that the "Duff" was captured. In particular Thomas Scott,

(112) M. Hennell, John Venn and the Clapham Sect, p. 229

(113) Ibid., p. 271

(114) Ibid., pp. 229-33

the minister at the Lock VD Hospital who was the rough diamond among them (criticising their lavish dinners and missing them as a result) wished the IMS well, having started life as a humble grazier himself. It was inexpedient to unite fully with the IMS, Scott wrote to a friend, because it was not altogether approved of by 'our staunch churchmen, especially our rulers' (115). Henry Thornton of the Clapham Sect labelled the IMS supporters as 'Irregulars' (116).

Finally, the close connection between the founding of the IMS, IMS and CMS should not go unnoticed. Samuel Pearce of Cannon Street Baptist Church, Birmingham was a BMS founder and a friend of Independent ministers, and John Ryland, another BMS founder, was a close friend of James Moody of Warwick, in whose house the Warwickshire Association of Ministers was formed. The Baptist Sutcliff of Olney was a good friend of Newton of the Eclectic Society and of Newton's successor at Olney, Thomas Scott, of whom Carey once wrote 'If I know anything of the work of God in my soul, I owe it to the preaching of Mr. Scott' (117). Scott, the first CMS Secretary, asked Charles Grant to get a passage to India for Carey, though Grant was unwilling to do this as he doubted the suitability of the surgeon John Thomas as a missionary (118). Simeon read the BMS "Periodical Accounts" to his undergraduates at Cambridge, and Wilberforce, who refused the Presidency but accepted a Vice-Presidency with Grant and others in the CMS, also read the "Accounts" avidly. Another CMS Vice-President was Sir Richard Hill, whose brother Rowland was of course a leading light in the IMS.

(115) J. Scott (ed.), *Letters of T. Scott*, pp. 174-76

(116) MS letter of H. Thornton to J. Venn, 25 Sept. 1795

(117) E. Stock, *The History of the CMS.*, p. 69

(118) Hennell, *op. cit.*, p. 227



#### 4. THE MISSIONARY MOVEMENT IN SCOTLAND

The impact of the formation of the LMS on Scotland was colossal if temporary. And it was almost immediate. It stimulated, rallied and organised Evangelicals of all denominations who 'had unknown to each other, been wrestling in prayer for the conversion of the heathen' (1). Missions - home as well as overseas - became the religious topic of the decade. Within a year of September 1795 missionary societies had been formed in Glasgow, Edinburgh, Stirling, Kelso, Paisley, Greenock, Perth, Dundee, Huntly and Duns, and money was pouring in for foreign missions, missionary prayer meetings were packed out, the Relief Church Synod had declared itself in favour of foreign missions, the Established Church had virtually declared itself against foreign missions in the historic Assembly debate, and the "Missionary Magazine" had begun.

##### (a) The Scottish town missionary societies

John Love, the LMS Secretary, saw to it that Scotland received her own special circular letter, especially as he had great faith in the products of Scottish education. In a letter of 6 November, 1795 to Scotland he wrote 'The circular letter which was, by the assiduity of their friends here, conveyed to some of the Burgher ministers in Scotland, was originally designed for England only. We have in view, in a short while, to prepare one particularly for Scotland ... the concurrence of Scotland will be highly valuable and beneficial, especially as, through the influence and blessing of the sovereign Lord, missionaries may be drawn thence who have enjoyed greater advantage of regular education than most of those who are here to be found, and whose piety may be found of a more solid and durable quality ' (2). Reflecting a Scottish veneration

(1) Matheson, op. cit., p. 68

(2) Letters of the late John Love, DD, pp. 155-56

for academic qualifications that is still strong today, Love the theologian - who is reputed to have read the Bible six times before he was 12 (3) - despised, or at least distrusted, the average English Dissenter for his poor education and his more experiential approach to religion.

News of his native town of Paisley becoming so missionary-minded naturally delighted Love, but he himself did much to rouse concern in the west of Scotland. His letters were full of infectious enthusiasm as in London he saw such a response in ardour, prayer, gifts and offers of missionary service in the months after the September meetings. He assured the new Edinburgh and Glasgow missionary societies, which from the start felt the urge to be independent of London, of the mother Society's help. Writing to Edinburgh on 25 May, 1796 Love stated 'that the Society here will cordially co-operate with you and gladly receive or afford assistance ... Your Society, therefore, by itself, or in connection with Glasgow, may by our vessel convey missionaries, at a reasonable expense, to any spot in the vast world of waters which you may choose, particularly among the Society, the Friendly, the Mercators, or the Pelew Islands' (4).

In general ministers took the lead in founding the missionary societies in towns. The 74-year-old Dr. Erskine, of aristocratic descent and evangelical scholarship, lent his weighty influence by presiding at the founding of the Edinburgh Missionary Society in March 1796 and was supported by his lieutenant Sir Harry Moncreiff, and by Drs. A. Hunter, Johnston, Colquhoun and Jones and Messrs. Dickson, Black, and Buchanan. All these were Church of Scotland ministers and a significant difference between England and Scotland here emerges - that in Scotland the Establishment Evangelicals supported the LMS and the foreign mission cause in general. Among Edinburgh Dissenters who backed the Edinburgh

(3) Biographical Dictionary of Eminent Scotsmen, Vol. 2, p. 545

(4) Letters of Love, p. 175

Missionary Society were the ministers Hall, Struthers, Acheson, Lothian, Dick and Peddie. Monthly meetings were established, following the London example, and in one sense these were an extension of the praying societies within the denominations. But these new meetings brought Established Church and Dissenting ministers together in public devotion for the first time in Scotland, an alarming turn of affairs to those who nursed a sectarian spirit or genuinely valued what their denomination stood for or decried anything upsetting the status quo in a time of national emergency.

A huge crowd turned out to the first prayer meeting on 6 April in Mr. Hall's church in Rose Street in the New Town. The gathering inspired the following published poem from a lady:

Hail happy days! When influenced from above,  
 Many united in one grand scheme of love,  
 No party-appellation here they claim,  
 Lost in the better, nobler, Christian name (5).

Greville Ewing, 28 years old and assistant minister to Dr. Thomas Jones at Lady Glenorchy's chapel of ease, became the Edinburgh Missionary Society Secretary and issued a circular about foreign missions to every minister and many individuals in Scotland, which probably antagonised some ministers before they even participated in the May Assembly debate on missions.

As proof of its non-sectarian spirit the Edinburgh Missionary Society early followed the example of the Stirling Missionary Society in donating £50 to the BMS in England for the work of printing a translation of the Bible in Bengali.

Meanwhile in Glasgow, where private meetings were begun as early as September 1795, a missionary society was formed in February 1796. Four months later funds exceeded £1,000. Dr. Robert Balfour was a powerful influence in Glasgow and district and in 1800 his friend John Love joined him in Glasgow.

In Paisley Dr. John Snodgrass, the successor and friend of John

Witherspoon, was in Waugh's view the LMS's firmest supporter in Scotland and in June 1796 Love was writing of the people of Paisley that 'in proportion to the extent of the place, their exertions have gone beyond almost any other city or town in the island' (6). Seven ministers and 21 laymen originally formed the Paisley Missionary Society which chose to be connected with the LMS, to whom they sent over £1,300 by the end of 1798.

In 1797 money was still going down from Scotland to LMS. Some Church of Scotland ministers like Erskine had the occasional church-door collection for this purpose, when a sum of £50 might be raised. Duns sent £100 in 1797, and the Rev. George Cowie of Huntly sent £116 to the LMS in the same year from the societies in Huntly, Keith and District. In 1798 Kilmarnock sent £40, Hawick the same sum and Perth £200.

With gifts of money came male missionary candidates also. A note of caution was sounded, however, by Fuller in a letter of 3 March, 1796 to Mr. W. Muir of Glasgow when, after expressing joy in the birth of the Glasgow Missionary Society, he suggested that not every aspiring missionary should be accepted and that missionaries should be sent out in pairs, according to New Testament practice, rather than in large companies (7). The latter suggestion at least was adopted, and on 29 April, 1797 two Glasgow Missionary Society missionaries, Campbell and Henderson, landed in Sierra Leone, unexpectedly as far as young Zachary Macaulay the Governor was concerned. Macaulay had already unhappily found the Wesleyan missionaries to the Foulahs quarrelsome and their wives bad-tempered. Later Macaulay reported Mrs. Campbell to be a 'hard-featured woman, with a hideous Scotch twang, full as superstitious as any native in Africa' (8) and indeed both Campbell and Henderson brought disgrace to the Glasgow Missionary Society by lapsing into

(6) Letters of Love, p. 176

(7) Missionary Magazine, 1796, Vol. I, p. 161

(8) Viscountess Knutsford, Life and Letters of Zachary Macaulay, p. 184

'lascivious idolatry'.

Only a few months later a joint mission was sent to Sierra Leone, comprising two men each from LMS, the Glasgow Missionary Society and the Edinburgh Missionary Society. Two of them were publicly ordained in London at the meeting-house of the Rev. Alex Easton off Cannon Street, when Love preached, Waugh gave the charge and Steven read the Bible. It is possible that this Congregational ordination service was essentially a commissioning service along the lines of Acts 13.3, where Paul (for the second time in his life) had hands laid on him prior to a missionary journey. Today also some American and British churches ordain lay missionaries before sending them abroad, to entitle them to administer the sacraments.

The Glasgow Missionary Society men were the Rev. Peter Ferguson and Robert Graham and the Edinburgh men were the Rev. Henry Brunton, who left a wife and three children in Scotland, and Peter Greig, who was destined to be murdered by Africans. The joint mission exemplifying the spiritual union between England and Scotland was rather an artificial one, for in Sierra Leone theological differences among themselves made it expedient that the missionaries should go in their pairs to different areas (9).

Love's instructions to the Edinburgh Missionary Society on this occasion may reveal a change in his views on missionary qualifications, but probably he was writing as a Committee man: '... if you can send two intelligent and able persons - I do not insist on all the forms and minutiae of education ...' (10). The initiative for the joint mission emanated from the Edinburgh Missionary Society.

To Henry Thornton, soon to be CMS Treasurer, Macaulay wrote on 30 May, 1798 (20 days after being elected an LMS Director, had he but known it (11)) from his own experience of missionaries in

(9) Missionary Magazine, 1798, Vol. III, p. 138

(10) Letters of Love, pp. 195-96

(11) Missionary Magazine, 1798, Vol. III, p. 285

Sierra Leone, whose humidity and 'White Man's Grave' conditions were enough to try even saints: 'I must confess myself one of those who see no sufficient ground for believing that the cast of men at present employed as Missionaries are calculated to produce important or extensive effects. When I see Missionaries formed under some such self-denying discipline as that of the Moravians, or from those classes of men who may be supposed to possess sober yet elevated views, humble yet enlarged minds, I shall think the set time at hand. It is not among mechanics we are to look for men of this last description. In a subordination to these, mechanics might indeed be useful, but otherwise the name and office of Missionary only serves to unhinge their minds. And one who would scarce be chosen to instruct a parish school is sent forth as the apostle of Africa. Experience, perhaps dear bought, will convince the Missionary Societies of the absolute need of an efficient control' (12). That last sentence was prophetic.

The criticisms of Macaulay, who it must be remembered was a Scottish Christian born in the manse at Inveraray who became a protégé of the Clapham Sect, remind us of Haweis's complaint that too many LMS missionary candidates wanted to be gentlemen rather than missionaries and of the complaints of other Scots that the missionaries were not educated and trained enough. Love had explained the procedure of selecting candidates in a letter to Scotland in 1796 - 'Our first object respecting candidates, is to be satisfied that they are truly pious, and that their views respecting this work are upright and intelligent, and that the Spirit of the Lord hath in a special manner bended their hearts towards it ... Every candidate is examined at least twice; and the Committee is generally unanimous, or rather always, respecting the recommendation or rejection' (13). Even so, eleven missionaries in 1798 left their posts in Otaheite in discrediting cir-

(12) Knutsford, op. cit., pp. 199-200

(13) Letters of Love, p. 174

cumstances.

Ill health was as grave a handicap to the missionaries as their temperaments and lack of preparation. The Rev. John Clark, who had been a teacher and a founder of an Edinburgh Sunday School, was ordained in London, after studying at Edinburgh University with a view to entering the ministry, before going out as chaplain to the settlement of Sierra Leone in Spring 1796. He was one missionary Governor Macaulay thought well of, but three years later he died of a fever. Ferguson and Graham, the Glasgow Missionary Society members of the joint mission to Sierra Leone, were 'seized with the ordinary seasoning fever, accompanied with a putrid bowel disorder' (14) and died within a year of arrival. The Sierra Leone work was soon afterwards abandoned owing to so many discouragements. Two of three Edinburgh Missionary Society missionaries sent to Jamaica in 1800 soon died. In 1803 Edinburgh Missionary Society missionaries went to Russia where Scottish engineers, doctors and soldiers had lived since Peter the Great. Travelling via Moscow the missionaries went on to the Muslim village of Karass in south-west Russia, but this mission work also did not endure much beyond 1820. Even of the pioneer missionary there Morison wrote: 'his career, though that of a man of talent, cannot be referred to as an example of missionary consistency and devotedness' (15).

Only in the 1820s did foreign missions begin to yield results and by that time the Anglo-Scottish Evangelical entente was largely a thing of the past. Most of the missionary societies in Scottish towns became linked with denominations, though the LMS maintained auxiliaries in Scotland. The Glasgow Missionary Society in 1821 started work in Kaffraria, South Africa, at Lovedale (named in honour of John Love) and later the LMS employed two great missionaries in Dr. John Philip, the champion of the Hottentot, and Dr. Robert Moffatt, inspirer and father-in-law of Livingstone.

(14) Missionary Magazine, 1798, Vol. III, p. 424

(15) Morison, op. cit., Vol. ii, p. 594

At the height of their first flush of enthusiasm the missionary societies in towns flourished, however. The Edinburgh Missionary Society, for example, in 1798 had over £3,500 in hand and gave £200 to the BMS. As Directors it had nine ministers and nine laymen. Among the former were David Black and Walter Buchanan, friends of Simeon and loyal churchmen, and among the laymen were John Campbell, and John Aikman, both friends of the Haldanes. Robert Haldane's solicitor, William Dymock, was Clerk to the Committee and his colleague Ewing was still Secretary (16). By 1800 Ayr and Dumfries had their missionary societies, and the Northern Missionary Society met in towns like Tain and Inverness. Aberdeenshire had its own interdenominational religious society formed in November 1798 (17). But all these were town-based societies. Not till 1824 did the Established Church send out missionaries in her own name.

(b) The "Missionary Magazine"

In England the "Evangelical Magazine" gave birth to the Missionary Society but in Scotland it was the missionary movement that gave birth to the "Missionary Magazine".

It was John Campbell, the enterprising ironmonger whose shop in Grassmarket lay in the shadow of Edinburgh Castle, who first took steps to follow up and harness the missionary interest in Scotland by taking a leaf out of England's book and publishing a monthly magazine for Scotland along the lines of the "Evangelical Magazine". What Bogue, retaining his Scottish links in London and Scotland, in England is to our study, Campbell is in Scotland. He was a pivotal figure in the Evangelical world. For by his voluminous correspondence 'no man in the University, nor in the pulpit of Edinburgh, was so early or so intimately acquainted with English

(16) Missionary Magazine, 1798, Vol. III, p. 178

(17) Evangelical Magazine, 1799, Vol. VII, p. 85



churchmen or Dissenters, who originated the great Societies ...' (18).

But after making arrangements with Pillans the Edinburgh printer Campbell was only a few days later called on by Greville Ewing and Dr. Charles Stuart with the news that they also planned to publish a Christian magazine. Before the two professional men, Campbell, educated but humble man that he was, gladly withdrew from his self-nominated journalistic venture.

The two new editors in July 1796 were a strange pair together. 'In a literary taste, in unbending integrity of principle, and in a simple adherence to the Scriptures as their guide, they were of congenial minds' (19). Yet in most respects they were different. Ewing was young, zealous and ambitious yet socially insecure. But Stuart was 50, staid, less ambitious, yet socially well connected - he was a descendant of Regent Murray, his father had been Lord Provost of Edinburgh, he had a fine estate at Dunearn and his father-in-law was Dr. Erskine, himself a descendant of the first Lord Cardross. Though it was his contact with the Baptists Ryland and Pearce in England on his only visit there before 1796 that had made Ewing a missionary enthusiast, his interests lay more with the LMS, while Stuart, because he was a convinced Baptist and a friend of Fuller, was closely connected with the BMS.

But both editors had this in common: they were dissidents at heart. Their minds were sharp and critical, but hyper-critical and rather narrow. Ewing was an angry young man of his day, dissatisfied with his Church and as a minister in a chapel of ease never able to attend the General Assembly as an official delegate. Sensitive to real or imagined hurts against himself, he yet demanded much of others and was something of a perfectionist in spiritual matters. So although at first sight the two editors represented the Church of Scotland and Dissenters, as

(18) Rev. R. Philip, *Life, Times and Missionary Enterprises of Rev. John Campbell*, p. 95

(19) Matheson, *op. cit.*, p. 86

they did the ministry and the laity, Ewing soon followed Stuart in leaving the Established Church in quest of greater spirituality and freedom. The outcome of the Assembly debate in May 1796 must have dismayed Ewing and he exemplifies the truth of Professor Daiches's comment: 'Calvinism forced the responsibility on to the individual elect while presbyterianism assigned it to the General Assembly. What happened when the individual and the Assembly disagreed? Scottish ecclesiastical history gives the answer clearly: disruption' (20).

Like Newton, Cowper, Campbell and James Haldane, Ewing was only six when his mother died - she had been converted under Whitefield. Ewing's father was a Mathematics teacher who sent him to the growing High School of Edinburgh, where Campbell, the Haldanes and Walter Scott were contemporaries, but then he had to serve an apprenticeship as a seal engraver. Later, however, against his father's wishes, he studied for the ministry, showing an aptitude for Hebrew and Greek, and in 1793 went as assistant to the Trevecca-trained Dr. Jones of Lady Glenorchy's Chapel, where Ewing's family worshipped. Ewing did not reach a social status similar to that of Stuart and the Haldanes till his third marriage, which was in 1802 to the daughter of the late Sir James Maxwell, Bart., whose widow married Sir John Shaw Stewart, Bart. of Ardgowan in Renfrewshire.

As Edinburgh Missionary Society Secretary Ewing was the right man to edit the new magazine and as a widower he had the time for it. He and Stuart made the magazine similar to the "Evangelical Magazine", to which Ewing had already contributed. Ewing wrote under the pseudonym of Onesimus, Stuart of Philalethus. Printed by Pillans, the "Missionary Magazine" was 48 pages in length and came out about the middle of every month. The title page proclaimed it as 'A Periodical Monthly Publication, intended as a repository of discussion, and intelligence respecting the progress of the gospel throughout the world' and the magazine lived up to its

title. Its main function was to pass on news of overseas missions. The help it gave by passing on news of home missions and tours paved the way for the new Congregational churches that arose after 1799 and was a by-product. Essays, articles and Religious Intelligence formed the bulk of its contents, but there was a place for reviews, poetry and edifying anecdotes. Notices of forthcoming as well as past events appeared, a particular boost to evangelistic endeavours at home. Occasionally articles and notices and accounts were re-published from the "Evangelical Magazine". Clear profits were devoted to the support of missions, and in its second year almost £193 as a result was divided equally among the Moravians and the Edinburgh Missionary Society, Glasgow Missionary Society, LMS and BMS.

The idea of a non-denominational magazine in Scotland was novel but successful and circulation soon rose to 5,000. The sudden realisation among Evangelicals that a world awaited evangelisation through their agency challenged and united them and broke down denominational barriers.

Though Ewing gave up the editorship of the lively, hortative and popular "Missionary Magazine" in 1799, on moving from Edinburgh to Glasgow to become minister of Haldane's Tabernacle and tutor of Haldane's seminary there, he continued in Christian journalism. And when the bitter and protracted dispute broke some ten years later between Ewing and Robert Haldane, his former patron and friend, both dipped their pens in vitriol and took to a public pamphlet warfare. Meanwhile Stuart laboured on. In 1806 John Aikman the Congregationalist became editor and in 1814 the magazine was renamed the "Christian Herald", by which time it was an organ of the growing union of Congregational churches. In 1835 the magazine's name became "The Scottish Congregationalist Magazine".

In January 1803 Stuart's "Edinburgh Evangelical Magazine" started as a monthly periodical of 48 pages. It was altogether more sober, more academic and more Biblical than the "Missionary Magazine", though it sometimes published letters from readers and daringly allowed both sides of the controversy on baptism to be

published in its third and final year of life.

While Scottish Evangelicals were glad to join with English Calvinists in their enthusiasm for foreign missions and in their support for the BMS, the "Evangelical Magazine" and the LMS, they nevertheless had no wish to become subservient to English institutions. Indeed, Scots in England may have made a bid to control the LMS - hence the concern among Englishmen that the Scots be winkled out of their posts whenever the chance arose. Scots had initiative, money and personnel enough to start their own independent missionary societies and their own missionary magazine, which at once satisfied their need for indigenous expression and registered their protest with the ecclesiastical authorities at their apathy towards the great new Christian fact of their time - the need and the challenge of world evangelisation.

#### (c) The Missionary Debate

Nothing seemed able to stop the chain reaction set off by the 1795 founding of the Missionary Society in London. The General Assembly debate on foreign missions in May 1796 seemed at the time perhaps an obstacle, but may be seen in retrospect to mark a turning point in Scottish ecclesiastical affairs.

Two overtures were before the Assembly. The Synod of Fife wanted the Assembly to 'consider of the most effectual methods by which the Church of Scotland may contribute to the diffusion of the Gospel over the world' and the Synod of Moray said that because 'a very laudable zeal for sending the Gospel to the Heathen Countries hath appeared both in Scotland and England, the Assembly should encourage this spirit and promote this most important and desirable object, by appointing a general collection over the Church, or adopting whatever other method may appear to them most effectual'.

The important first round went to the Moderates. Moderator Dr. George Hill, sensing trouble, got the comparatively harmless and the more specific motions considered together.

After several speeches in this memorable debate, George Hamilton

of Gladsmuir, about to be elected the next Moderator, expressed a fundamental argument of the Moderates (which some Evangelicals like Love shared) that natural religion should precede the teaching of revealed religion: 'Men must be polished and refined in their manners before they can be enlightened in religious truths' (21). 'Moderator, rax me that Bible' retorted Dr. Erskine as he rose to reply. On being handed the Bible he read of Paul's dealings with the barbarians at Melita. Did not Paul acknowledge himself a debtor to the barbarians as well as to the Greeks, argued Erskine, and could it be supposed that when mistaken for a god by the barbarians Paul did not preach Christ to them? (22)

But Dr. 'Jupiter' Carlyle, the social leader of the Moderates, whose autobiography contains scandalously little of true Christianity, argued against immediate concrete action with something akin to pietistic fatalism: 'When we see the tide of infidelity and licentiousness so great and so constantly increasing in our land, it would indeed be highly preposterous to carry our zeal to another and far distant one ... As clergymen, let us pray that Christ's kingdom may come, as we are assured it shall come in the course of Providence' (23). It was a remark like this that raised further doubts in the minds of impatient missionary-minded Evangelicals, especially talented recent converts like the Haldane brothers, as to whether their Church leaders were true Christians at all.

Dr. Hill compared the missionary societies with political societies, but it was David Boyle, the future Lord Justice Clerk, who maliciously pressed home this insinuation: 'Observe the societies are affiliated, they correspond with each other, they look for assistance from foreign countries in the very language of many of our seditious societies ... their funds may in time, nay,

(21) H. Miller, *The Two Parties in the Church of Scotland*, p. 17

(22) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 125

(23) Miller, *op. cit.*, p. 22

certainly will be, turned against the constitution ...' (24).

Even in the political climate of the time, this charge was unjustified and groundless, though understandably it irked some in the Assembly to see societies formed outwith the Kirk's structure and yet partly composed of Kirk members sending money out of the country to London with whose Missionary Society they had a formal connection. Even Dr. Erskine admitted he did not fully approve of the Paisley Missionary Society being actually a branch or auxiliary of the IMS.

After Boyle, Erskine spoke for the second time, stressing that a good government had nothing to fear from religion and dissociating himself from being partial towards democratic societies, but the slur had been made and even on some Evangelicals it probably made its impression and increasingly they began to see the debate as the Establishment v. the revolutionaries, that is, in political terms rather than religious, a travesty of the position.

So it was the conservatives like Hill and Boyle who, genuinely or conveniently, equated something new with something subversive during a period of war, poor harvests, social unrest and political demands (and the bloody excesses of the French Revolution had not dripped dry in people's memories by 1796) who secured victory, by 58 to 44 votes, for Hill's temporising motion that the overtures from the two Synods be dismissed and that the Assembly resolve to 'embrace any future opportunity of contributing, by their exertions, to the propagation of the Gospel of Christ, which Divine Providence may hereafter open'.

If Hill thought he had preserved Church unity he was mistaken. The zealous mission supporters who heard the Edinburgh debate believed the door of opportunity would open still further at their push and pressed ahead with their plans for a missionary magazine to co-ordinate the activities of the missionary societies that were springing up in Scottish towns. Even more important perhaps, their thoughts were turning to mission work at home.

## (d) Simeon's tour of 1796

Three tours of importance to us occurred in Scotland in 1796 and 1797. They were to be the first of many evangelistic tours undertaken by the allies of the English Evangelical Dissenters. The common factor to them all was the participation of James Haldane.

Born in 1768 of an ancient Perthshire family, almost  $4\frac{1}{2}$  years later than his brother Robert, James was orphaned when six. He never quite forgot his godly mother, but his father, a captain serving the East India Company, died before he was born. When only 11 he reached the top class of Edinburgh High School, the Eton of Scotland, and four years later visited London and Portsmouth, where he visited his naval uncle, Adam Duncan, who was created a Viscount after the victory of Camperdown, and first met the Rev. David Bogue, his tutor and adviser during his years at sea.

In East India Company ships James made four voyages to the Far East till in 1793 he obtained command of the family ship. But he never sailed in her, for while living on board her at Portsmouth for four months, waiting for a war convoy to gather, James turned to reading the Bible and 'the more I read the more worthy it appeared of God; and after examining the evidences with which Christianity is supported, I became fully persuaded of its truth' (25). To the consternation of his relatives but to the delight of his brother, James sold his command for £9,000 and returned to live in Scotland, where the crisis of his conversion experience was finalised.

While brother Robert was planning to meet Wilberforce in London to enlist his aid in the ambitious and independent mission he wished to lead to Bengal, James was enjoying contact with another Clapham Sect member in Scotland, for in May 1796 Charles Simeon suddenly decided to come up to Edinburgh with James's minister, Walter Buchanan of Canongate, Edinburgh. The two ministers had only recently met but were at once attracted to each other, Simeon

counting it one of the greatest blessings of his life ever to have known Buchanan (26).

It was Simeon's first visit to Scotland. He had already met the Scot Claudius Buchanan, who as Simeon came up to Scotland was preparing to go out as an East India Company chaplain to Calcutta, where he became Vice-Provost of Fort William College and helped Carey with his translations. After two years at Glasgow University young Buchanan had run away to London for four years and there wasted his talents till finally he came to himself and introduced himself to old John Newton, whose preaching had captivated him. Newton introduced Buchanan to Henry Thornton, who paid for him to study for a degree at Cambridge where he attended Simeon's theology classes.

Coming from a distinguished upper class family, Simeon was educated at Eton and King's, Cambridge where he was converted as an under-graduate and became a Fellow when 22, later rising to be Vice-Provost in 1790. As the incumbent of Holy Trinity, Cambridge, Simeon met with much opposition for some ten years till his active piety and down-to-earth Christianity won people over.

Tested in the slow fires of ostracism and loneliness in his church and university, Simeon in 1796 was approaching his prime. Though he still had much irritable temper to leave behind before he became the scholarly saint and influential leader revered on his death in 1836, even Wilberforce wrote of him in 1796 'Oh! that I might copy him, as he Christ' (27).

Such was the English Christian that James Haldane toured with for three weeks in 1796, when Simeon was 36 and James was 27. Like Whitefield nearly 50 years before, Simeon was delighted with his first visit to Scotland. Though the Assembly had just voted against doing anything immediate for foreign missions, there was an optimistic feeling among Scottish Evangelicals that once more the ball was at their feet for them to play to the best advantage.

(26) W. Carus, *Memoirs of the Life of the Rev. Charles Simeon, MA*,  
p. 112

(27) *Ibid.*, p. 150



But with encouragements to Evangelicals like the Relief Church Synod's strong resolution in favour of missions came the beginning of opposition, with the Cameronians in Glasgow excommunicating some members for attending a Glasgow Missionary Society sermon preached by Dr. Balfour.

Simeon found himself and made himself at home in the Presbyterian churches, receiving the sacrament three times from Church of Scotland ministers and arguing with that delicate but compromising casuistry common to many Anglican Evangelicals that Presbyterianism was the established religion in Scotland and that 'where the king must attend a clergyman may preach' (28). In episcopal chapels Simeon followed their church order and service and strove in Presbyterian churches to follow their practice, though not always with complete success.

Simeon found the Edinburgh Evangelical ministers of the Kirk like-minded Christians. To his diary he confided of Dr. Erskine 'Never was there a more friendly warm-hearted man' and of Buchanan 'How wonderfully well he prays! and how admirably does he expound!' and of David Black and his wife 'What a delightful couple ....' (29). James Haldane is first mentioned on 10 June: 'On Thursday, Sir John Stirling offered his own mare for my northern tour; and this day, Mr. Haldane has offered to accompany me. Surely goodness and mercy are following me all my way' (30).

Having heard others preach - Dr. Erskine's appearance and zeal reminded Simeon of Henry Venn, his mentor and model when a young minister - it became the visitor's turn. By his fifth sermon he was becoming known in Edinburgh: the chapel was full with at least 2,000 in it half an hour before the service was due to begin and hundreds more were unable to gain entry. The next day about 2,000 heard Simeon at Leith. Simeon charmed aristocratic ladies as well as the middle class congregations and Lady Grant and Lady Glenorchy

(28) Ibid., p. 113

(29) Ibid., pp. 117-18

(30) Ibid., p. 118

invited him to their homes.

But Simeon's critical faculties were not lulled by the welcome given him. He complained of the length of a pre-communion service on a Saturday evening that lasted  $4\frac{1}{4}$  hours: 'I would not ... subject myself willingly to such another session of fatigue' and condemned the practice of day-long communions: 'Went with Messrs. Innes and Campbell to St. Ninnian's ... They had about 1,000 communicants. They who could stay there from beginning to end, with any profit to their souls, must be made of different materials from me' (31). Simeon also criticised the habit of drinking toasts at a meal as people were tempted to drink more than they wished.

The day after that long communion service Simeon and James Haldane left James's wife at Airthrey, where Simeon had stayed three days, and rode to St. Andrews, calling en route at the godly homes of Lord Balgonie and Lord Leven, his father. Then the holiday-makers went via Perth to the Rev. Alexander Stewart, 'a most agreeable and pious man' (32) at Moulin, a mile up from Pitlochry in the Perthshire highlands. It was Stewart's sister who, concerned for her brother's spiritual welfare, had apparently urged his close friend David Black to give Simeon in Edinburgh a letter of introduction to her brother, though Black said later that his letter of introduction was 'quite a random thought that occurred to me' (33).

At Moulin the two tourists heard a pre-communion sermon from the Blair Atholl minister but as the next service was to be in Gaelic they pushed on to Blair Atholl, only to find there was no room in the inn, so they returned to spend the communion Sunday at Stewart's manse. Nearly 1,000 communicated and Simeon preached twice. Simeon judged his preaching 'barren and dull' but Stewart, for ten years a minister, was impressed by a goodnight word from Simeon and returned to his guest's room that evening for a longer chat about the ministry.

(31) Ibid., p. 120

(32) Ibid., p. 121

(33) A. Haldane, op. cit., p. 129; J. Sievwright, *Memoirs of the late Rev. A. Stewart*, p. 107

Simeon wrote of Stewart that 'he complained much of unprofitableness, and was much affected during our conversation. We prayed together, and parted very affectionately with the "Osculum pacis". He promised to write to me' (34).

From this time Stewart became a new man and a new minister. Earlier the writings of Newton and Scott and the biographical sketches in the "Evangelical Magazine" had introduced him to gospel truths, but now his talks with Simeon and Haldane clinched the matter - he felt the power of religion in his soul and had a relish for its exercises. Four months later he wrote to his friend Black 'The sentiments I have felt since Mr. Simeon's visit, you have been pleased to call a revival ... It was no revival: I never was alive till then' (35).

A month later Stewart wrote to Simeon 'My kind friend Mr. Haldane ... tells me you have not forgotten me ... In emulation of your manner of preaching, I have for four months past preached English from short skeletons, without reading or committing to memory: a thing I never attempted before ... A-propos of skeletons, Mr. Haldane has just sent me yours ... I already see in them the correct, orderly logical brain of a Cambridge graduate. P.S. A poor woman in this village ... insists on my letting you know how much she enjoyed your discourse ... She is one of the few Christians, whom I can number in my parish. She lives quite alone, in a small hovel, on a very scanty provision, confined almost entirely to her seat by weakness and distress of body. Yet she is for the most part cheerful ...' (36).

Through the preaching of Stewart and the prayer meetings in that poor woman's hovel revival came. The new content, presentation and urgency of Stewart's sermons attracted first attention, then talk and finally conversions. From March to August 1799 he preached

(34) Carus, op. cit., p. 122

(35) Ibid., p. 131

(36) Ibid., pp. 132-34

a course of sermons on regeneration and nearly every week one, two or three people were brought under conviction of sin and earnestly enquired after a Saviour. In all about 70 of his congregation, mostly teenagers and adults under 30, were converted by Stewart's reckoning (37). Most stood the test of time, among them James Duff and Jean Rattray, whose son Alexander became the great educational missionary to India.

After leaving Moulin Simeon and Haldane rode at leisurely pace via Inveraray to Luss. Together they climbed to the peak of Ben Lomond where they prayed and dedicated themselves afresh to God. The next Sunday Simeon preached three times in Glasgow, twice in the Episcopal chapel and once in the College Kirk where a great many ministers came into the vestry after the service to meet him. Two days later Simeon preached at Kilsyth, the next day to about 1,800 in Glasgow and the next day again to over 400 children and 200 adults at David Dale's cotton mills in New Lanark. Finally, on their return to Edinburgh Simeon preached twice more. In Lady Glenorchy's chapel about 3,000 heard him preach on behalf of the destitute sick.

So what was meant to be a summer holiday ended up by being a successful preaching tour, with 18 church sermons in 45 days. Although he benefited from the inter-Evangelical spirit abroad and the fact that more and more people were visiting churches other than their own, it must have been mainly Simeon's preaching that drew and held the crowds. He himself wrote he had never before experienced the divine presence during so long a period (38). 'It was a surprise to many in the North to see a southern clergyman mount the pulpit with only his little Bible in his hand, and preach with the utmost freedom and energy, yet with exactness of diction and a clear order of thought' (39). 'His delivery was earnest and forceful, compelling

(37) A. Stewart, *An Account of a late revival of religion*, pp. 43-63

(38) Carus, *op. cit.*, p. 127

(39) H. Moule, *Charles Simeon*, p. 124

the attention of his hearers ...' (40), a contrast to the aridly scholastic or moralistic sermon, often a lecture or exposition, all too prevalent in Scotland at that time.

Soon after Simeon's departure for Cambridge Buchanan wrote to him saying 'Many, I trust, have cause to thank God for your visit to Scotland; as for myself, I consider it one of the greatest mercies I have received for a long time' (41). Stewart of course went even further - 'If Onesimus might call Paul his father with the like reason may I call Mr. Simeon mine. For indeed I found from your conversation, your prayers, preaching, and particularly from our short interview in your bedroom, more of religious impression ... than ever I was conscious of before' (42). Instead of read or mandated sermons, Stewart experimented with preaching in English from skeleton outlines, relying on his mind to clothe the bones of his notes with the flesh of suitable language. The result? 'My discourse is less correct, and must offend a critic; but it is more energetic, and may profit a soul that is hungry for the bread of life ... at the Divinity Hall where I studied, or rather attended, we never got one direction how to make a sermon' (43).

The three weeks spent travelling 260 miles with Simeon must have been a spiritual education to James Haldane, at that time a mere child in the faith. Haldane helped Simeon in prayer and in the distribution of the tract "Friendly Advice to all whom it may concern", probably the first time Scotland saw tracts publicly and freely given away. Because Haldane and Simeon were 'mutually affected with fervent love to each other' (44) they parted with regret, but unfortunately Simeon's friendship cooled in 1798 when he learnt that Robert Haldane's Circus meetings were drawing people

(40) A. Brown, *Recollections of Simeon's Conversation Parties*, p. 180

(41) Carus, *op. cit.*, p. 129

(42) *Ibid.*, p. 132

(43) *Ibid.*, p. 133

(44) *Ibid.*, p. 126

away from his Kirk minister friends like Buchanan and Black and especially after James's ordination as a Congregational minister in 1799, for Simeon 'regarded Dissent as an evil, and schism as a great evil' (45).

Simeon later visited Scotland in 1798, 1815 and 1819. In 1798 he travelled with Buchanan up to Tain and across to Loch Awe, preaching in Presbyterian churches as he went. Simeon also met Stewart 'who is much grown in grace, and who shewed me some of his skeletons made after my plan' (46). In 1798 Simeon arrived in time to look in on the Assembly meetings - 'their prayers were almost as cold as the room itself' - and though the moderate leader Hill welcomed him Simeon's public prayer that the Assembly 'might do no evil' and his popularity as a preacher roused one Synod to propose that anybody who was not licensed or ordained by a Presbytery of the Church of Scotland should not enter their pulpits. Buchanan and Simeon's other friends proved powerless to aid him. In May 1799 the Synod presented this overture to the Assembly and the majority Moderate party ensured the acceptance of this important Act, which was directed as much against Haldane's English friends as against Simeon. But in some ways Simeon presented a more subtle threat to the Church of Scotland and her established prerogatives than did crowd-pullers like Rowland Hill, for Simeon was a university scholar who preached with decorum and never out of doors and, most important of all, was a member of the English Established Church who meticulously tried to officiate in Presbyterian fashion when preaching in a Church of Scotland church.

#### (e) The Sunday Schools tour of 1797

James Haldane's second tour was in the Spring of 1797 when he played

(45) Brown, *op. cit.*, p. 224

(46) Carus, *op. cit.*, p. 154

second fiddle to John Campbell who was two years his senior.

Campbell was an extraordinary man, the humble, willing horse type of Christian - 'actually the drudge of the new Societies, both as their servant and reporter' (47) - yet well educated, reliable and resourceful. He was a great man for original ideas and for putting them into successful practice, yet 'he knew the extent and limits of his own mind' (48). It was probably Campbell's engaging modesty and keenness that caused men like Newton to take him under their wing and write to him in affectionate terms after only one meeting.

Campbell's biographer claimed that the Countess of Leven found a new form of Whitefield's spirit in Campbell (49), who was her almoner, book supplier and weekly correspondent till her death in 1798. He also corresponded with other notable Christians, with Newton, Scott and Abraham Booth from as early as 1789, and later with Fuller, Thomas Charles of Bala, Macaulay, Hardcastle, Grant and Wilberforce. At an early age he began a weekly correspondence with John Ritchie, the young Edinburgh printer whom Robert Haldane invited with Campbell and others to accompany him to Bengal in 1796. With Ritchie Campbell befriended orphans in Edinburgh, an early expression of his practical Christianity, though this was before power and assurance came to Campbell on 26 January, 1795, when he dated his great spiritual 'deliverance' (50).

Droll in manner and droll and dwarfish in appearance, Campbell kept his knowledge of world-wide missionary work up to date by correspondence and reading. Booth was hesitant about John Thomas's claims to having done evangelistic work in Bengal till told it was true by Campbell, and as Thomas became a factor that year in the formation of the BMS, Campbell playfully boasted 'Thus I had a

(47) Philip, op. cit., p. 135

(48) Ibid., p. xiii

(49) Ibid., p. 227

(50) Evangelical Magazine, 1796, Vol. IV, pp. 3-12

finger in that pie also' (51).

Another pie was the Edinburgh Tract Society formed in July 1793, six years before the important London-based Religious Tract Society. Campbell had been printing tracts privately for his friends since about 1787. By 1803 the Edinburgh Society had published a total of 100,000 copies of 43 tracts (52).

A third pie was the Edinburgh Philanthropic Society (later the Magdalen Society). Prompted by the concern of Christopher Anderson's older brother for one of the prostitutes who had accosted him, Campbell became a prime mover in 1797 in starting the Society which he served as Secretary and which made a house in West Bow serve as a refuge for young women after their sentence in Bridewell prison and as a training centre before they found a useful job in society.

Campbell's large ironmonger's shop was a bustling rendezvous for Evangelicals and also a clearing-house for Bibles, Scott's "Commentary" and the "Missionary Magazine". Spiritually ambitious in the best sense Campbell was nevertheless 'satisfied to be nailed to the Grass Market, till Providence draw the nail' (53) which happened in 1799.

Though not the originator of Sunday Schools, Robert Raikes started one in Gloucester's Sooty Alley in 1780 and three years later described it in his "Gloucester Journal". Some London papers copied the account and aroused considerable interest in the idea of taking poor children for several hours on a Sunday and paying teachers to teach them to read. Thus Raikes 'raised Sunday teaching from a fortuitous rarity into a universal system. He found the practice local and he made it national' (54). Rowland Hill introduced Sunday schools to London in his Surrey Chapel in 1783 and two years later Burder introduced them to Coventry. In 1785 Henry

(51) Philip, op. cit., p. 94

(52) Edinburgh Evangelical Magazine, 1803, Vol. I, pp. 427-30

(53) Philip, op. cit., p. 119

(54) A. Gregory, Robert Raikes, p. 45



Thornton and others formed the Society for the Establishment and Support of Sunday-schools throughout the kingdom of Great Britain, and within a year the society had distributed 91,915 spelling-books, 24,232 Testaments and 5,360 Bibles to over 1,000 schools containing 65,000 scholars. The Scottish economist Adam Smith said 'No plan has promised to effect a change of manners with equal ease and simplicity since the days of the Apostles' (55). By 1789 there were perhaps 300,000 scholars in Britain, for John Wesley and Dissenters, as well as Anglican Evangelicals like Hannah More in the Mendip hills, had started their own Sunday schools.

Thomas Charles of Bala began his circulating schools in 1785. They were similar to Griffith Jones' circulating schools in the 1720s. Paid teachers taught in these schools which moved from place to place, usually spending no more than nine months in a town as this period was 'found fully sufficient to teach our children to read their Bibles in the Welch (sic) tongue' (56). Great crowds of children used to gather in the open to be catechised by Charles and through such rallies revival spread out from Bala along the valleys of North Wales. Unlike those in England, Charles's Sunday schools were attended by adults as well as children. An ordained but unbefitted Anglican minister, Charles received financial help from his Calvinist Evangelical friends in England, among whom were Newton and Lady Huntingdon, for his Sunday schools, which were an important factor in the formation of the great British and Foreign Bible Society in March 1804.

Obviously the inspiration for Campbell's Sunday schools came from England and Wales, but the Welsh influence was more pronounced. Never shy of writing away for more information, Campbell wrote to Charles about 1791 and passed round Scotland the news of the spiritual awakening occurring in Wales through the circulating schools. Revival was what interested Campbell who wanted one for his own

(55) Ibid., p. 107

(56) Missionary Magazine, 1798, Vol. III, p. 41

country. After that 1795 experience which meant so much to Campbell - following a long, painful period of depression he was given an instantaneous view of the glory of the cross of Christ (57) - he wished to show his gratitude to God. Judging that Sunday schools on the Raikes model were not so necessary in Scotland 'as a great proportion even of poor children were taught to read' (58) Campbell followed the half dozen or so schools in or near Edinburgh in starting a school where the principles of the Gospel only were taught.

For Campbell's Sunday schools were not the first in Scotland. Sunday schools on Raikes's pattern were started in Glasgow in 1787 and, as they had the official blessing of the Kirk, a procession of magistrates celebrated their opening (59). Then John Clark, who was to go to Sierra Leone, ran an Edinburgh Sunday school in 1793 or earlier. Finally, there were these few Edinburgh schools run mainly by divinity students.

First Campbell hired for a year Archer's Hall and 'engaged a good, plain Christian, who well understood his Bible, to be their teacher, at a small salary. Being a complete novelty, the school was crowded with children and their parents the first evening it was opened; and, for about the first twelve months, either an Established or Dissenting minister kindly visited it on sabbath evenings, and gave an address to the children and parents, after the examination of the former was concluded' (60).

Next, for a second Sunday school, Campbell obtained, with Dr. Stuart's help, the Edinburgh Dispensary Hall. This school too was soon flourishing. Having organised others, Campbell thought he should teach in a school himself and started one at Loanhead, a populous mining village five miles south of Edinburgh, where the

(57) Philip, op. cit., p. 122

(58) Ibid., p. 122

(59) Scots Magazine, Dec. 1787

(60) Philip, op. cit., p. 123

only place of worship was a Cameronian meeting. Campbell taught for two years at Loanhead where attendances reached 200, getting children to memorise for the following week passages from the Bible, the Shorter Catechism and the metrical version of the Psalms, and usually ending the evening with an address when adults were made welcome.

At Loanhead Campbell introduced both James Haldane and John Aikman to preaching. Between them they were to have 90 years' ministry in Edinburgh. Aikman at that time was studying divinity at the university, having already sold his lucrative business in Jamaica after finding it against his conscience to trade on a Sunday, as his partner did, and finding the climate tell on his health. He was a quiet, agreeable, well-educated man who had become a Christian on reading Newton's "Cardiphonia"; thinking the book from its title was a romantic novel he had bought it from a London bookstall for inclusion in a circulating library he was planning in Jamaica (61).

Soon others were copying the successful experiments of Campbell and Sunday schools began at Bonnyriggs, Dalkeith, Penicuik and other villages, started either by individuals or by churches. In 1797 the Edinburgh Gratis Sabbath-School Society was formed to strengthen the large schools and to publicise their needs. Over each teacher, to help in his devotional exercises, was a committee whose members took it in turn to address the children and their parents and any poor destitute persons that could be induced to attend. This inter-denominational Society, which had 44 schools affiliated to it by August 1798, seems to have grown out of the monthly interdenominational meeting in Edinburgh for prayer for the revival of religion at home and for the success of the gospel abroad, which itself arose from the praying societies of various denominations that were to be found in 1795.

James Haldane, who was now the Edinburgh Missionary Society President, was keen to extend the Sunday school system to the north of Scotland, but first he went with Campbell on a six-day tour to the west, in a

(61) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 120

one-horse chaise and ready to distribute thousands of tracts to rich and poor alike. To a few friends in Glasgow they spoke of 'the general neglect of giving religious instruction to the youth of our country, except in pious families - described the plan pursued in Edinburgh ... by the formation of schools on the sabbath evening, and the countenance that was given to the plan, and the ease with which children were collected, with the trifling expense that attended its execution. After some conversation, those present were formed into a society for establishing and conducting sabbath evening schools in Glasgow and the surrounding towns and villages. We acted in the same way and with the same success in Paisley and Greenock' (62).

The idea of getting children off the streets and giving them Christian teaching caught on and 'the result of this one week's exertion was the formation of sixty sabbath evening schools!' (63).

Three features of Campbell's Sunday schools should be noted.

(1) They were open to adults as well as to children. Evangelicals wanted Christian families, not only Christian children, and, practising family worship themselves, encouraged parents to come with their children. Two incidental advantages were that parents could see for themselves that their children were not being taught seditious political propaganda and could see the children safely home at night.

(2) They were independent and not under clerical supervision.

Though he probably had no far-reaching or secessionist aims in view, Campbell was already disillusioned with the mixed communion and lax discipline and complacent leadership of the Church of Scotland of which he was a member. A representative of the rising commercial class, he had money enough to implement his own Christian plans.

Like many Englishmen as well, Campbell was not a naturally accepted leader in his Church but contributed to Christianity by founding his own societies. (3) They met for two hours at most on Sunday evenings,

(62) Philip, op. cit., pp. 129-30

(63) Ibid., p. 130

unlike the schools of Raikes, which met from 10.0 to noon and from 1.0 to 5.30 p.m. and attended church in the afternoon session. But then many of the English schools needed the long working Sunday to teach children to read, which was often their primary aim, though children were encouraged by gifts to read the Bible.

Campbell's type of Sunday school was admired and copied by some English ministers who came to Scotland around 1799 on preaching tours. A Mr. Mosely formed two at Long Buckby on his return and three near London (at Hoxton, Kingsland and the New Mulberry Gardens' Chapel), to which only children over eight who could read were admitted (64).

In the tense years 1797-1800 Scottish Sunday schools were denounced by some in authority as hotbeds of sedition. Dr. Porteous of Glasgow wrote in February 1798 to the Lord Advocate and condemned the practice whereby 'a loquacious manufacturer preached and prayed with vehemence till a late hour' (65) to adults besides children, especially when he recalled the 1787 Sunday schools mentioned above whose aim was to encourage boys to read and repeat the catechism. Soon the Established Church also took fright, concerned at this rash of Evangelical independence, and passed the restrictive Acts of its 1799 Assembly. In that year Campbell and Alex Johnstone, the Secretary of the Edinburgh Gratis Sabbath-School Society, were charged before the Edinburgh Presbytery with having taught in a Sunday school, but after clearly stating their case they were dismissed with only a mild rebuke (66).

It was Robert Haldane in his published defence in 1800 who described Sunday schools as the first effort of Scottish home missions and who nailed the lie that they were breeding political revolutionaries, maintaining that in the schools 'poor ignorant children were invited to attend, who had formerly been employed on the Lord's day, running in the streets, doing mischief. The persons who undertook to teach

(64) Missionary Magazine, 1799, Vol. IV, pp. 517-18

(65) Edin. Univ. Laing MSS, Nos 500, 501

(66) Miller, op. cit., p. 29

them, did it gratis ... the catechism was taught, Scriptures repeated with a short, but plain and serious exhortation from the teacher, if he is capable of it, together with the singing of psalms, and prayer at meeting and dismissing' (67).

(f) The 1797 tour to the north

On 6 May, 1797, when the third of his 15 children was born, James Haldane was obliged to keep a promise he had never expected to have to keep. He had to preach his first sermon. This was at Gilmerton, a large mining village, for the absent Joseph Rate, an English student from Bogue's Gosport academy whom Campbell had engaged as a preacher for several Sundays at Gilmerton.

For a layman and an amateur theologian, and one who had known vital Christianity for scarcely two years, to become a preacher was a serious step, and as a Church of Scotland member presented a challenge to the ecclesiastical powers with their vested interests in preaching. But the sermon was pronounced a success by no less a literary critic than Dr. Charles Stuart, who longed to see James follow him in becoming a Baptist. Haldane's hearers by coming again in increased numbers also gave a favourable verdict. However, there was opposition too, especially from the Moderate parish minister. In short, the preaching at Gilmerton, taken in turn by Haldane, Aikman and Rate even after Rate's return, was a microcosm of the grand tour to follow (68).

An insertion in the "Missionary Magazine" explaining their aims and calling for people's prayers, a prayer meeting at the Rev. David Black's home and next day, 12 July, 1797, the three Gilmerton preachers left Edinburgh, travelling at their own expense in a light open carriage weighed down with tracts. Campbell, tied to his business, envied them but was dubious at that time about the wisdom of preaching to church folk.

(67) R. Haldane, *Address to the Public*, pp. 62-63

(68) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, pp. 138-42; Philip, *op. cit.*, pp. 131-33

Their aims were three in number: to preach the gospel, to distribute tracts and to try 'to excite their Christian brethren to employ the talents committed to their charge; especially by erecting schools for the instruction of the youth' (69). The main purpose was 'not to disseminate matters of doubtful disputation or to make converts to this or the other sect, but to endeavour to stir up their brethren to flee from the wrath to come, and not rest in an empty profession of religion' (70).

The main statistics of the tour are as follows. The tour covered over 800 miles, up the east coast of Scotland and to nearly all the inhabited Orkney islands. Among them the three men publicly preached at least 308 sermons in the 119 days. A total of 20,150 tracts and 250 copies of regulations for Sunday schools were distributed. In addition, the Scriptures were expounded at times of family worship. For instance, Aikman, laid up with an injured leg for over four weeks in a private house in Thurso, spoke or conducted family worship every evening there to 50-100 people. The size of congregations ranged from 11 to nearly 6,000 and averaged 650, as the total number of hearers exceeded 200,000, equal to about 13% of Scotland's population then.

The sermons of the three itinerant preachers drew crowds which always increased after the first time of hearing, partly because of the several points of novelty about the whole tour. In the first place the preachers were laymen and well-to-do laymen at that. The sight of a former East India Company sea-captain and a prosperous West Indian trader, both under 30, ride up in their braided great-coats with their hair tied and powdered and with dignity address people in clear, ringing tones of Christian assurance was most unusual. The fact that Haldane was Admiral Duncan's nephew added interest to his person, especially after the important psychological boost to the nation by the Admiral's victory at Camperdown on 11 October. Second, the practice of giving away printed Christian

(69) *Missionary Magazine*, 1797, Vol. II, p. 336

(70) *Ibid.*, p. 336

tracts was still unusual in Scotland. Third, the preachers never took up a collection, which was enough in itself to convince some of their sincere motives. Fourth, they had a clear-cut message - men remained lost till they believed in Christ and His finished work of redemption, and only after conversion were good works of any account and then they were the fruit and evidence of faith. Fifth, the preachers occasionally gave advance notice of their meetings by getting a handbell rung about the village or a drum beaten, while in the Orkneys beacon fires were lit for the same purpose. This practice caused offence to some Christians but Haldane argued that 'many people were thus collected, and surely we could not hesitate between perhaps hurting the feelings of a few individuals, and losing an opportunity of preaching Christ to careless sinners, who probably would not have taken the trouble to enter a church' (71).

A sixth point of daring novelty was that the lay preachers took the Established Church ministers to task for their doctrinal errors, publicly and without mincing words. Haldane and Aikman believed that ministers who taught people to put their own sincere obedience in the place of Christ's finished work as the ground of salvation were leading them to trust in refuges of lies (72). Haldane and Aikman would attend the church of their own denomination on Sunday mornings, take careful note of those sermon parts that constituted what they deemed heresy, and publicly condemn them at the service's close to the congregation as they left church and stayed on to hear an extra sermon in the open air. Sometimes the attacked minister was himself present. Even some of Haldane's close supporters attacked him for this practice and, though he cited in his defence the examples of Christ, Paul and John in denouncing those preaching another gospel, on later tours this practice was dropped.

The successful 1797 tour had several important results. It established James Haldane as a preacher, an outspoken contender for the faith and an author. The "Journal of a Tour", largely written

(71) J.A. Haldane, *Journal of a Tour*, p. 29

(72) J. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 24



by him, soon ran into three large editions. One-third of its 106 pages comprised a vigorous defence of the aims behind and the methods of the travelling evangelists.

Another result was spiritual awakening, especially in the Orkneys and Caithness. It was these isolated areas that perhaps stood most in need of revival and pastoral visitation. Thurso, apparently not catechised for 40 years, saw scores of people turn to God, and in Caithness generally, which in the 1730s had been blessed with faithful ministers, lasting work was begun. In the Orkneys the good work started by the Antiburgher minister in Kirkwall was strengthened and those island parishes that had heard no sermon for seven or eight years had the gospel preached in them.

A third result was that the whole question of lay preaching was speedily and dramatically brought to the fore in Scotland. All sorts of people had all sorts of opinions about lay preaching, which involved the definition of preaching and the role of laymen. The Anti-Burgher Synod, which in 1796 had passed a resolution against the constitution of missionary societies which were composed of both ministers and laymen, declared that lay preaching had no warrant in the word of God. In 1798 also the Relief Synod passed a resolution banning from its pulpits any person who had not attended 'a regular course of philosophy and divinity in some of the universities of our nation, and who has not been regularly licensed to preach the Gospel' (73). Dr. William Porteous of Glasgow complained to the Lord Advocate about lay preaching as well as about the new Sunday schools (74) and in May 1799 the Assembly not only barred from its livings and its pulpits all but its own licentiates but issued its Pastoral Admonition which attacked the Haldanes' new society by name and all 'universal itinerant teachers'.

Dr. Erskine thought that laymen could give an exhortation but should not preach from a text, but in 13 pages of his "Journal" Haldane defends lay preaching on the grounds that it is 'the bounden duty of every Christian to preach the gospel', though he interpreted

(73) Struthers, op. cit., p. 405

(74) Edin. Univ. Laing MSS, No. 501, 21 Feb. 1798

preaching as declaring the glad tidings of salvation, whether to two people or two hundred. Haldane maintained that lay preaching in 1798 was a matter of necessity with so many ignorant of the gospel and so many ministers considering all their hearers to be Christians. If lay apologists could be authors, could they not be preachers also, Haldane asked. He also appealed to English practice: 'Lay-preaching, although new in this country, is by no means so in England. At some of the academies no license is given. The students preach in villages ... when called to the pastoral office, they then receive ordination' (75). It is Dr. Fawcett's view, however, that Scots 'with their just pride in an educated ministry, objected more to the fact that some lay-preachers were untrained than that they were not regularly ordained' (76), for preaching often took the form of Biblical exposition or lecturing, which ideally required ministers to be schooled in the original languages of the Bible.

Haldane also sheltered in 1798 behind what seems a lawful interpretation of the Biblical term 'evangelist', which especially in Ephesians 4.11 appears an office distinct from that of an apostle or pastor.

On Christmas Eve, 1797 Ewing preached a sermon in favour of street, itinerant and lay preaching which created a stir. He stressed the divine ordination given to certain lay preachers in such comments as 'When we hear that persons are raised up of God to preach Jesus Christ with fidelity and zeal; shall we be filled with envy for the sake of men, however eminent, who already discharge, but can never monopolize that office?' and 'The faithful preaching of the pure gospel will ever be its own certificate; while all other credentials without it must go for nothing' (77).

On the other side the anniversary preacher for the SSPCK in 1798 argued that 'A standing ministry, and a standing revelation,

(75) J. Haldane, op. cit., p. 18 footnote

(76) A. Fawcett, *Scottish Lay Preachers in the 18th century*, Scottish Church History Society, 1955, Vol. XII, Pt. II, p. 118

(77) G. Ewing, *A Defence of Itinerant Preaching*, pp. 47-48

have been ordained of him, for imparting salvation ... Instead, therefore, of making experiments, of which the event is uncertain, let us persevere in the good old way' (78).

And so the debate on lay-preaching continued.

(78) J. Johnstone, Sermon preached before SSPCK 31 May, 1798,  
pp. 52, 54

## 5. THE HALDANE INDEPENDENT MOVEMENT

In 1797 the Evangelical initiative began to pass from the ministers within the Church of Scotland to the active laymen within it. This can be seen from the growth of the Sunday school movement and from the tours undertaken by Campbell and by James Haldane and his colleagues. And towards the close of 1797 the Evangelical initiative among laymen was beginning to pass from Campbell and James Haldane to Robert Haldane, the man poised to pump his money into mission enterprises in Scotland.

### (a) The founding of the SPGH

The Haldane separatist movement began, it may be argued, with the formation of the Society for Propagating the Gospel at Home (SPGH) on 20 December, 1797, when a group of solid respectable gentlemen met by arrangement in Edinburgh and unanimously agreed to form such a society.

Like others of the time, this society was doomed to be short-lived, yet in its ten years of fruitful existence its activities closely affected the lives of thousands of men, women and children in Scotland, some hundreds if not thousands in Ireland and also many pastors from England. It printed and gave away thousands of English and Gaelic tracts, published letters and pamphlets of its own proceedings, received and spent several thousands of pounds and at the height of its activity employed dozens of men in full-time service and as many again in part-time service.

Whose idea it was to start the society is not known. Robert Haldane wrote that he was 'not the projector of it, nor do I know if it originated with any individual' (1). 'A Plan for Spreading the Gospel at Home' was the "Missionary Magazine" opening article for February 1797, and no doubt ideas began to crystallise during Haldane's successful tour of the north, and Robert, recently returned from his vain attempts, despite Wilberforce's help, to make his Bengal

(1) R. Haldane, op. cit., p. 67

mission a reality, was ripe in December to rise to the challenge of a scheme that matched his spiritual ambition and imagination.

Four days after the 20 December meeting Ewing preached 'his powerful and eloquent sermon ... which produced a great sensation, and served still more to alarm the Moderates' (2). It was preached before the young Edinburgh Gratis Sabbath-School Society which had roused the wrath of certain Kirk ministers who claimed its work encroached on their territory and their prerogatives. Ewing wanted every Christian to be an evangelist - 'This precious invitation (of the gospel) is so necessary to be known, and known without a moment's delay, that every one that heareth, is, in the very first instance, commanded to repeat it' (3).

Four days after this sermon another SPGH meeting seems to have been held, when amendments to the printed Address to the public and the Society's rules were proposed and approved, but it was on 11 January, 1798 that the Society emerged fully before the public, when the three officers and the committee of 12 directors were appointed.

Significantly all 15 were laymen, possibly from a desire not to embarrass Evangelical ministers by asking them to join but more likely because these laymen wished to remain independent of clerical supervision and were fast growing disappointed at the guardedly conservative reaction, even of Evangelical clergy, towards lay evangelism. Affected by the political climate of the day, the Evangelical clergy, like the Relief Synod in 1798, moved further to the right as the situation polarised and felt they must come down on the side of the status quo, the government, law and order, and the rights of privilege and property. Sir Henry Moncreiff was a chaplain to the King at the time, and anyway it was becoming dangerous and lonely to occupy middle moderate ground as perhaps most Evangelical ministers would have liked.

Of the 15 laymen Robert Haldane belonged to the landed gentry and James Haldane and John Aikman were men of private means. George

(2) A. Haldane, op. cit., pp. 178-79

(3) Ewing, op. cit., p. 50

Wilson, Clerk to the SPGH, was a professional man, being a writer, but the ironmongers John Greig and Campbell, the merchants Alexander Steel and Walter Russell, the printer John Ritchie and the book-seller George Peattie represented the rising commercialism whose talents and potential contribution the Established Church was, as usual, failing to harness. Several, if not most, of the 15 men were already busy supporting other societies - Alex Johnstone, for instance, was the Gratis Sabbath-School Society Secretary. Only some of them felt lay preaching to be their personal responsibility; most probably felt their role resembled that of company directors in giving financial and social support and administrative advice.

In its first "Account" the SPGH justified its existence by claiming that 'sufficient means of religious instruction were not enjoyed in many parts of the country' and that 'the children of the poor are not so well educated, public worship begins to be neglected, family-prayer (a hallmark of Evangelicals) is much less frequent than formerly ... and many begin to avow opinions subversive of the gospel ... parochial visitation by ministers had in many parts fallen into disuse' (4). While rejoicing in 'the number of faithful ministers in connection with the Church of Scotland' the SPGH condemned those who taught men 'to build their hopes of salvation on their own good works' (5). The Society had praise also for the Seceders but said that few were in the Borders and very few in the Highlands and that 'even where they have congregations, instead of the ministers preaching through the week in the neighbourhood, like the evangelical dissenters in England, they have bound up their own hands, by what they call presbyterian order; so that if people do not go to them, they may perish in their ignorance' (6). Praise was also given to the SSPCK, which had 'done much, especially in the highlands; but the demands for schools and catechists are so great, that notwithstanding the ample funds of which they are

(4) An Account of the Proceedings of the SPGH 1797-99, pp. 2-3

(5) Ibid., p. 3

(6) Ibid., p. 4

possessed, they are obliged every year to refuse urgent applications' (7).

So what the SPGH set out to be was an updated, freer, more far-ranging and more aggressively evangelistic version of the SSPCK, which had been teaching the four Rs since 1709, in the Highlands especially and usually on a restricted budget.

The SPGH was something new in Scotland but had several English precedents. The Societas Evangelica, begun in London in 1776 to encourage ministers to engage in itinerant preaching, was consulted when the SPGH was being planned (8). The Congregational Society for Spreading the Gospel in England was started in 1797 and was soon supporting village preaching in 15 counties but by 1808 it was bankrupt and was dissolved, its work being taken over by the rising county associations (9). 1797 saw a spawning of these county associations for promoting itinerant preaching, many of them on an undenominational basis, the London Itinerant Society and the Bedfordshire Union of Christians being but two of them.

Possibly the most influential precedent for the SPGH came from Hampshire, where Bogue drew up an elaborate plan for propagating the gospel throughout the county and in April 1797 disclosed it to the group of Congregational ministers gathered at Romsey for the ordination of his student James Bennett. The plan was warmly welcomed and was published in the June issue of the "Missionary Magazine". Hampshire was to be divided into four districts and every minister was recommended to make a missionary tour during the year. Three or more persons, and the minister, were to be chosen from each congregation to manage the business of the institution. A Circular Letter from the Associated Ministers of the Gospel in Hampshire went out to 20 churches on 7 June, 1797 and this was republished in the July issue of the "Missionary Magazine", by which time Bogue was touring Scotland for his health's sake and the germ

(7) Ibid., p. 5

(8) Missionary Magazine, 1797, Vol. II, p. 243

(9) R. Calder, The Congregational Society for Spreading the Gospel in England, Transactions of the Congregational Historical Society, Vol. XIX, May 1964, pp. 248-52

of the SPGH already existed (10). The Hampshire ministers, helped by Bogue's own theological students, did extend their preaching activities and over the years many of the towns came to have full-time pastors for the first time (11).

(b) The SPGH preaching tours

The SPGH officially started in January 1798. 'Before the close of 1799, nearly forty catechists were travelling throughout the length and breadth of the land, thirty or forty thousand tracts had been distributed and the whole of the north of Scotland was thrown into a blaze' (12). The missionaries, as people called them, also set about establishing Sunday schools.

The catechists were instructed to keep a journal and to send in a written account of their progress every fortnight to the Secretary John Ritchie. It was stressed that catechists should confine themselves to catechetical exercises - their particular sphere was children, to whom they were to give catechisms and tracts and whom they were to gather, where possible, into Sunday schools. Paid only a subsistence allowance by the Society, catechists always travelled on foot (13).

Hugh Ross, a Gaelic-speaking catechist, joined the old campaigners James Haldane and John Aikman in a tour of Perthshire, using Dunkeld as their base. Tracts were given away, children's meetings held and Sunday schools and prayer meetings started. The other members of the northern tour triumvirate, Joseph Rate, was early brought up to tour Fife for over three months. Preaching on average twice a day, he met with blessing, especially at Aberdour, also with opposition from some local authorities. Alexander McKenzie, another Gaelic-speaking catechist, went into the northern highlands

(10) Missionary Magazine, 1797, Vol. II, p. 315 footnote

(11) Bennett, Memoirs, pp. 292-93

(12) Struthers, op. cit., p. 402

(13) Missionary Magazine, 1798, Vol. III, pp. 481-90



and on to the Western Isles. Four tracts were translated into Gaelic and 5,000 of each printed, and 10,000 copies of the Assembly's Shorter Catechism in Gaelic were also distributed. William Tulloch, one of Haldane's guides through the Orkneys in 1797, was appointed as catechist to the Orkneys and he occasionally visited the Shetlands. Catechists went to all parts of Scotland, and Peterhead, Castle Douglas and Jedburgh were other towns adopted as bases for evangelism.

John Cleghorn and William Ballantyne, originally Seceders, were ordained on 7 February, 1798 at Gosport, where they had studied theology under Bogue who gave their ordination charge. According to the glowing account sent to the "Missionary Magazine" (14) the introductory sermon of Mr. Griffin of Portsea disclaimed the idea that any right to preach was confirmed by ordination per se, and praised the two young Scots for wishing to do pioneer work in the inhospitable north of Scotland. Among reasons why they wished to be ordained by Congregational ministers (a Baptist minister, however, closed the service in prayer) was that the gradation of Presbyterian courts too closely resembled the hierarchical system found in the Anglican or Roman Catholic Churches. To them it seemed that New Testament practice favoured a congregation that was answerable direct to God and to God alone. Another reason why the Scots spurned Presbyterian ordination was because they believed there were Presbyterian ministers in Scotland who should never have been ministers as they lacked a conversion experience and dallied with the world as a result, and that people were allowed to attend communion who should have been disciplined instead. Bogue urged Cleghorn and Ballantyne to desire 'union with all good men, of all denominations, who held the truth as it is in Jesus' and 'to open their pulpits to all pious evangelical ministers, whether Episcopalians, Presbyterians, of the Kirk, Relief, or Secession, Methodist, Baptist, etc.' The ordination report included one possibly patronising note: 'Though not accustomed from experience to consider

(14) Ibid., pp. 158-63

great changes ordinarily proceeding from north to south, yet we feel highly pleased with the prospects now bursting upon our minds, from some late exertions in the north'.

In April 1798 Cleghorn and Ballantyne held successful evangelistic meetings, especially in the Moray area, en route to entering into Haldane and Aikman's labours in Caithness. Conversions continued and Cleghorn was inducted to a church formed at Wick in March 1799, where he worked till 1814, when he went first as co-pastor and then as successor to Aikman at his North College Street chapel in Edinburgh. Ballantyne, after forming a church at Thurso in 1801, moved on to Elgin for some years, before apparently going to London as a Baptist (15).

Not only paid catechists, self-supporting lay preachers and ordained but unsettled ministers toured for the young Society but settled ministers also. James Garie, who was trained at Whittridge's academy at Newcastle-under-Lyme and whom Campbell helped to transfer in 1794 from his independent church in Dublin to that in Perth, preached for the SPGH around Perth, and Mr. Ward, minister of the Episcopal chapel at Old Deer, Aberdeenshire, also itinerated for the Society. Greville Ewing also toured Perthshire for the SPGH, after throwing in his lot with the SPGH and becoming financially dependent on Robert Haldane and resigning from the Church of Scotland in disgust.

But most intriguing of all were the English ministers who came up to Scotland and toured for the SPGH. On 2 September, 1798 James Bennett, the bright young pastor from far away Romsey, on Bogue's behalf opened the Aberdeen Chapel as a Congregational church. With the possible exception of the church in Annan or the School Wynd church, Paisley, this Aberdeen church is the oldest Congregational church in Scotland (16). Certainly it is the oldest in the north of Scotland. The hosier George Moir had become a convinced Congregationalist by reading King's "Inquiry into the Constitution,

(15) Yuille, *op. cit.*, p. 92

(16) Escott, *op. cit.*, pp. 254, 318, 330

Discipline, Unity and Worship of the Primitive Church" and had written to several Independent ministers and tutors for help.

'But none seemed more anxious for our success than the Rev. David Bogue' (17), who suggested that a church seating 1,200 should be built. When a church for only 700 was planned, Robert Haldane wrote to Moir urging him to make it larger, and it seems that some 1,000 seats were finally provided. Crowds heard Bennett's two sermons that first Sunday. A fortnight later Bennett in his sermon 'explained and defended the congregational mode of church-fellowship, which is adopted by Independent Churches of England' and at its close the nine 'members of the infant church rose, publicly declared their adoption of this system, and avowed their church-relation, by giving to each other the right hand of fellowship'. Two Baptists (university students) were admitted as occasional communicants (18).

Before and after opening this chapel Bennett, destined to be a church historian, a senior tutor of Rotherham Academy, Livingstone's pastor in London and an LMS Secretary, preached for the SPGH both north and south of Aberdeen. As other preachers, he had to assure people that the Society was not after their money but their souls, which was perhaps unusual on both counts in 1798 (19). Leaving Edinburgh on 27 August, Bennett distributed tracts by the roadside before reaching Dundee, where he preached to 1,500 people who 'pressed eagerly to receive the tracts' (20). He continued preaching in the east coast towns and not until 18 October does his journal for the SPGH end.

Another former student and neighbour of Bogue, Thomas Loader, Independent minister at Fordingbridge, also visited the new church at Aberdeen and preached on the way up through Scotland for the SPGH. Joseph Slatterie, formerly the student at Hoxton of the

(17) Letter of Moir to John Morison, April 1798, cited in J. Waddington, *Congregational History*, Vol. III, p. 93

(18) *Missionary Magazine*, 1798, Vol. III, pp. 523-24

(19) *An Account of the Proceedings of the SPGH 1797-99*, p. 63

(20) *Ibid.*, p. 61

Scot Simpson, came from his Independent chapel at Chatham in Kent to preach at the Circus theatre which Robert Haldane had hired for some months and itinerated for some weeks with Aikman around Edinburgh and then around Dundee, where he preached on the Holy Spirit's office and work, which 'I had observed, were too little acknowledged by many serious people in Scotland' (21).

Another English minister who toured on behalf of the SPGH was Taylor of Osset, Yorkshire who preached in the Lothians and Perthshire. His older friend Edward Parsons of Leeds also offered to itinerate and did so for several weeks.

Stirring experiences befell many of these preachers. Ewing said that he 'never had more liberty' than when first preaching in a barn. Cleghorn could 'scarce get away from the people (of Gilcomston) who bid me Godspeed with many tears'. Ballantyne found that between his two sermons at Nairn on the same day 'during the interval many people went into the church, and prayed for us'. At Dundee Slatterie preached to 2,000 and (shades of Whitefield) 'the aisles were so thronged that I was obliged to lean on the people's shoulders to get to the pulpit. The day was upon the whole one of the most comfortable of my life'. Even on a frosty January morning Taylor found an audience of 600 in the open air that 'seemed to hear as for eternity' (22).

Even greater success seemed to attend Rowland Hill who came up from his Surrey Chapel in London at Robert Haldane's request. Hill could afford the time as it was his practice to spend some six months each year away from his congregation. It was Hill's first visit to Scotland and Edinburgh charmed him in July with its romantic setting but grieved him because its religion was so much below the standard he had imagined (23).

Hill was possibly the most influential Calvinist Methodist at that

(21) Ibid., p. 69

(22) Ibid., pp. 71, 33-34, 69, 78

(23) R. Hill, *Journal through the north of England and parts of Scotland*, p. vi

time. To moderate Anglicans Hill was a rogue elephant, to Evangelical Anglicans like Simeon an embarrassment (though Scott and Henry Venn had preached for him), to Baptists an object of suspicion as he often treated them with disdain, but to fellow 'irregular' Anglicans an inspiration and a natural leader and to Evangelical Independents a friend and a supporter of worthy causes like Sunday schools and the IMS.

Undoubtedly spiritual, he yet had obvious faults. Of aristocratic descent, he sometimes had pride and manners to match and the undistinguishing could not always tell the difference between his irony and sarcasm and his jokes and his jibes. He was 'very impatient of anything approaching to contradiction, and ceased to converse pleasantly when a difference of opinion arose' and his 'estimates of character were not always judicious' (24).

But the crowds loved his colourful personality and his quaint mannerisms and saucy outspoken remarks, enjoyed his telling anecdotes and warmed to his zealous, outgoing character. The writer Sheridan once said 'I go to hear Rowland Hill because his ideas come red-hot from the heart' (25).

By chance Hill in July 1798 met James Haldane and Aikman at Langholm, where revelling at the public fair brought Hill his first disillusionment about Scotland. Accidentally meeting the parish minister Hill learnt from him about the two passing strangers 'that it was a marvellous circumstance, quite a phenomenon, that an East-India Captain, a gentleman of good family and connexions, should turn out an Itinerant street Preacher; that he should travel from town to town, and all against his own interest and character' (26). Hill must have recalled similar words passed against him by his own parents when with the written encouragement of Whitefield he took to village preaching while still a Cambridge undergraduate.

Haldane and Aikman, in fact, were finishing their second great

(24) Morison, op. cit., Vol. II, pp. 167-68

(25) V.J. Charlesworth, Rowland Hill and his life, p. 55

(26) Hill, op. cit., p. 11

tour, a six-week tour of southern Scotland, from Greenock to Galloway and across to Berwick. As on their northern tour, crowds heard them, individuals turned to God and Sunday schools were begun.

Hill's second Scottish disappointment came on his second day in Scotland when he learnt that no exhortation or prayer ever accompanied a Scottish funeral. The next day he noted that 'the churches in Scotland evidently seem the only neglected buildings. Many of them are slovenly and mean' (27).

With 35 years' itinerating experience in three kingdoms behind him Hill soon made his tall, commanding preaching presence felt. Denied a building to preach in at Leith, he cheerfully preached to 2,000 in a timber yard. About 1,000 heard him in Stirling and in Crieff, a full congregation in the Perth Relief chapel, at Kinross Lord and Lady Balgonie attended his open-air sermon - it was a triumphant August progress and his host Robert Haldane was there to see it. Then Hill and Haldane went on to Glasgow, where 5,000 heard Hill's sermon on "Thy God thy glory", to Paisley where nearly as many gathered, to Greenock, where Hill met his good friend John Love, who had just resigned as LMS Secretary, and so back to Glasgow where a happy evening was spent with Robert Balfour of the GMS and other ministers and Christians. On his return to Edinburgh the Circus proved too small a meeting place for Hill, so he walked out to Calton Hill where about 15,000 (probably the largest Scottish congregation since the days of Whitefield) heard the searching verses of Mark 8. 36,37 explained.

Now James replaced his brother as Hill's travelling companion and took him to the Earl of Leven's home on the way to Dundee, where the crowd numbered 2,000, and to St. Andrews where Hill preached twice. At Kirkcaldy Hill twice preached in the Burgher church and then returned to more Edinburgh and district meetings, including one with 'the poor unfortunate women that have sought an asylum from a life of prostitution at the Philanthropic' (28). Twice more huge

(27) Ibid., p. 13

(28) Ibid., p. 52

crowds of 15-20,000 heard Hill's eloquent pleadings for Christ on Calton Hill, before he left on 7 September for England with Robert Haldane in his phaeton. After preaching in Dunbar's Methodist chapel, Hill preached in England for his LMS friends, men like Parsons of Leeds, Williams of Rotherham, Boden of Sheffield and Moody of Warwick, most of whom preached for Robert Haldane at the Circus.

Hill's first visit to Scotland overlapped with Simeon's second. But Simeon kept to churches and deliberately covered much of the ground covered the previous summer by James Haldane, whom Simeon asked 'privately to prepare the way for him, by sending letters to his acquaintance in all the principal places where there were Churches belonging either to Presbyterians or Episcopalians, with the view of procuring pulpits where he might be allowed to preach' (29).

As with Simeon, Hill was an English novelty in Scottish pulpits and as a gentleman by birth (his god-fearing brother Sir Richard Hill was MP for Shropshire) was acceptable to the evangelical nobility. But Hill was equally acceptable to the man in the street for his manner of preaching, for the sense of fun and emotion he brought into the pulpit and for the racy illustrations that could spontaneously occur in his sermons.

To quote one of his biographers, Hill's method of preaching was a complete novelty in Scotland, except to a few aged persons who recollected the visits of Whitefield ... An anecdote in a Scotch pulpit was an experiment that no Presbyterian would have ventured on; but those told by Mr. Hill were so lively and affecting, that his hearers were raised to the highest pitch of interest' (30). Campbell in his old age said much the same thing: 'During some of his sermons, the eternal world appeared to be next door to us, and but a step between us and the judgment day, which seemed to cause a shaking among our dry bones. Not that Mr. Hill preached a different gospel from what we had been accustomed to hear, for at that time

(29) A. Haldane, op. cit., p. 183 footnote

(30) E. Sidney, Life of Rev. R. Hill, p. 197

as well as now, there were various able ministers of the New Testament both in and out of the establishment, but there was a general formal sameness, seldom what was striking or catching' (31). Campbell referred particularly to Hill's burst of zeal for the salvation of his hearers and his intermingling of striking facts relating to himself and others (32).

According to Robert Hall, the English Baptist minister who graduated at Aberdeen University and who was himself a great orator, 'no man has ever drawn, since the days of our Saviour, such sublime images from nature' as did Hill (33). And according to Hill himself, referring to non-churchgoers, 'Plain language is the only profitable language for sinners like these. How ridiculous to try to get into the hearts of such, by a dry, set, formal methodical discourse!' (34).

Unlike Simeon with his clear orderly style of preaching, Hill had a style that was disorderly and rambling. It was not the overall sermon message so much as the odd phrase, the telling illustration or the memorable anecdote and the cumulative weight of his powerful presence and forceful earnestness that generally impressed his hearers. One Surrey Chapel attender once remarked after a sermon, 'Well, Mr. Hill, you have taken us over the whole land, from Dan to Beersheba.' 'Yes', said the unrepentant Hill, 'and it is all holy ground!' (35).

So Hill taught Scotland a new and lively preaching style, though he was pleased to find that the general practice in Scotland was to expound whole passages of scripture at a time, for 'as it was certainly the most primitive, so surely it must be the most profitable, to deal with the people directly from the word of God' (36). William

(31) Ibid., p. 198

(32) Philip, op. cit., p. 280

(33) Sidney, op. cit., p. 206

(34) Hill, op. cit., pp. 16-17

(35) Banner of Truth magazine, No. 91, April 1971, p. 21

(36) Hill, op. cit., p. 14



Jay was also impressed by Scottish lecturing and after visiting Scotland for the LMS in the summer of 1801 often introduced the practice to his chapel at Bath. Incidentally, though Jay preached for eight successive Sundays for over 30 years every summer at Hill's Surrey Chapel, his own preaching style contained order and divisions, and was possibly adopted as a guide by C.H. Spurgeon. When visiting Scotland Jay was warned by Aberdeen-educated Joseph Hughes, the Baptist pastor of Battersea who became the first Secretary of the Religious Tract Society and the British and Foreign Bible Society, to be 'very careful and guarded, and forbear freedoms, and especially anecdotes, which would not be relished or endured there'. But after venturing on an anecdote in a sermon in the Isle of Bute Jay was assured by the ministers 'You have laboured under a great mistake, we are not averse to anecdotes, but to some kinds of them, and to the manner of relating and applying any of them. When they are well chosen, and properly introduced, they are peculiarly acceptable, as they are more unusual with us, and we want (i.e. lack) excitement more than information' (37).

The Scottish preaching system tended towards dry scholasticism because Presbyterianism prized learning and over-valued an educated ministry. This was especially true when the sermon was read or mandated, as was the custom. Moreover, Established Church ministers preached to captive congregations and often with an eye on the heritors and educated folk among their hearers. Nor did Calvinism and expository lecturing lend themselves to pulpit experiment or excitement.

English preachers like Hill and Jay, on the other hand, were paid by their congregations and had to win their attention and respect the hard way. So sermons had to be interesting in presentation as well as in content. As for outdoor preaching, all means considered lawful had to be tried to attract and hold a crowd of working-class people - humour and stories, similes and allegories, topical and personal references, means employed by Christ also in the open.

Home missionary tours under the SPGH aegis multiplied. We have mentioned but some that occurred in 1798 and 1799. In February 1799 a plan was made to send each catechist to six towns 'so that every town in Scotland may be visited during the course of the ensuing summer' (38). As a result Rate itinerated in Aberdeenshire and Inverness-shire, and with Innes and Aikman James Haldane made a second tour to the north, including five weeks in the Shetlands, where his faithful old boat-cloak and his seamanship were put to good account.

James Haldane continued his preaching tours down to 1829. With Campbell he visited in 1800 southern Scotland, including Arran and Kintyre, and drew crowds of up to 5,000 in Ayr. In the summer of 1802 he took his wife for a holiday in Buxton in Derbyshire and preached by invitation in the surrounding counties. In 1803 with Campbell he took for the first time what is now the A9 route from Perth to Inverness and went on to the Orkneys. Later that year Campbell persuaded Haldane to go with him on a short tour of southern Scotland and the northern counties of England. In 1805 the two ministers made their last tour together - again to the Breadalbane region and on to Caithness. London too knew the preaching of James Haldane from his visit there in 1801.

In January 1802 the SPGH extended its activities to Ireland, recently visited by James Haldane and the Rev. George Hamilton of Armagh. In March the Evangelical Society of Ulster was formed and within 15 months as many missionaries had been sent by the SPGH to Ireland (39).

The expenses of all these SPGH activities - and English ministers were also offered itinerating expenses - often exceeded £1,000 in a year and were mostly met by Robert Haldane, who not only sold his Airthrey estate and left it for ever in June 1798 but with his wife's full co-operation deliberately lowered his own standard of living.

The SPGH did not have a monopoly in making missionary tours. In

(38) An Account of the Proceedings of the SPGH, 1797-99 p. 79

(39) Edinburgh Evangelical Magazine, 1803, Vol. I, pp. 237-38

1797 the missionary-minded Relief Church sent Neil Douglas and another minister to Kintyre on an evangelistic tour that began nine days before Haldane's first tour to the north. Douglas, who could not speak English till nine, preached in Gaelic and keen crowds of over 1,500 heard him (40). Next year the Relief Church sent three more missionaries to Kintyre but Douglas, arrested on his return from Kintyre for publishing an allegedly seditious pamphlet, had aroused opposition there which made this second tour less successful (41). The Relief minister at Banff, McDiarmid, undertook in 1798 a two-month tour into the Central Highlands where he found general ignorance (42). Even Bogue down in Hampshire overcame 'the prejudices of his early education' and gave his first open-air sermon in the summer of 1798, a few weeks after Robert Haldane's first open-air sermon (43).

#### (c) The Circus and the Tabernacles

At his dinner table in March 1798 Robert Haldane learnt not only of Campbell's shelved plan for educating African children in Britain, a suggestion which he followed up only to leave the children in Zachary Macaulay's charge in London (44), but also of Campbell's scheme to have a Tabernacle built in Edinburgh. Interestingly enough, Haldane was ignorant of what was meant, so Campbell, well primed in London affairs, explained 'the Tabernacle in London is a large place of worship, supplied by popular ministers, of different denominations, coming up from the country, and preaching for a month. The crowds that it attracts, and the good that has been done, are very great'. Campbell went on to suggest that Rowland Hill and other English ministers could supply an Edinburgh

(40) Douglas, *op. cit.*, p. 60

(41) Struthers, *op. cit.*, pp. 400, 402

(42) *Missionary Magazine*, 1798, Vol. III, p. 430

(43) Bennett, *Memoirs*, pp. 213-14; A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 276

(44) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, pp. 190-91, 230-33

Tabernacle and that the Edinburgh Circus theatre could be hired on Sundays for a year's trial, before the erection of Haldane's own building (45).

The original London Tabernacle had been a huge wooden shed built by Calvinistic Dissenters in Moorfields for Whitefield in 1741, to give shelter to his early morning congregations. So named because it was meant as a temporary building, this Tabernacle was not replaced till 1753 when a brick building 80 feet square holding 4,000 was erected on the same site.

All Campbell's schemes came to pass. Haldane's lawyer, Dymock, acted quickly in securing a year's lease on the Circus and on Sunday, 29 July, 1798 Rowland Hill opened it as a preaching-place. Several hundreds attended the forenoon service, but a much larger congregation went in the evening, when the service time did not clash with other church services.

Holding a church service in a theatre was not quite a novelty, for the Circus at the foot of Little King Street had only just been vacated by the Relief congregation of College Street. While his church was being re-built James Struthers had tried the experiment of hiring the Circus on Sundays, though it was used for public amusement on weekdays, and being a natural young orator had drawn crowds to the Circus, many perhaps being curious to see a minister preach from a stage, behind which were a curtain and scenes, and to see a congregation seated in the boxes, pit and two galleries, all 2,500 seats free (46).

By Hill's second Sunday at the Circus the service times had been changed to avoid clashing with public worship in other places, for the fact was that all the Scots who had a hand in starting the SPGH and the Circus services were still members of the Established Church and had no fixed plan to leave it or to begin another denomination. At 7 a.m. there was a sizeable congregation, at noon the theatre was full and in the evening hundreds if not thousands could

(45) Philip, *op. cit.*, pp. 164-65

(46) Struthers, *op. cit.*, p. 390

not gain entry and those who did grew afraid that the galleries might collapse, so the meeting was held a quarter of a mile away on Calton Hill. Here about 10,000 heard Hill preach on the prodigal son.

On his third Sunday Hill preached in the loaned Burgher Chapel as the Circus was judged unsafe, but when the Calton Hill evening meeting was rained off they did meet in the Circus, which was again packed. On his fourth Sunday the 7 a.m. and forenoon services were well attended while on the Calton Hill an estimated 15,000 formed the most solemn congregation Hill had seen for many years. On his fifth Sunday it was a similar story, with the open-air crowd even larger and with James Bennett, on his way to Aberdeen, preaching a lively sermon at the Circus. On his last Sunday in Edinburgh the Circus was only just large enough for the two early services and once more nearly 20,000 thronged Calton Hill, when about £30 was collected for the City Charity Workhouse.

As an English itinerant preacher with his successful and emotional rabble-rousing sermons Hill angered the Moderates, who probably felt that the guarantee of 1707 given to their Established Church against powerful England was being undermined by visiting English preachers like Simeon and Hill. Hill even disturbed the Evangelical clergy who were beginning to lose part of their congregations to the Circus men. And the book that he went home to write on his Scottish trip to some extent probably turned every Scottish minister against Hill.

But as one who had helped to found the Societas Evangelica Hill was happy to help the SPGH and as a crowd-puller had fully justified Campbell's recommendation. He had set a hot pace for the string of English preachers who followed him.

Hill's immediate successor was James Boden, a popular Independent preacher from Sheffield, who with Edward Williams of Rotherham later published a large collection of hymns. Boden was followed by Thomas Loader and Joseph Slatterie. In 1799 Taylor of Ossett, Edward Parsons, George Burder and Andrew Fuller were among Circus preachers. Parsons, trained at Trevecca but for 41 years minister

of the Independent Salem Chapel in Leeds, was prominent in helping to start the "Evangelical Magazine" and the IMS. With Williams he edited the works of Doddridge and Jonathan Edwards.

Other Circus preachers included Bogue, Simpson, John Griffin of Portsea, William Jay, Robert Little of Birmingham (later of Perth) and William Roby, who after preaching for Lady Huntingdon was for 34 years pastor of Cannon Street Independent Chapel in Manchester.

By a coincidence another Scottish church was being supplied by Congregational ministers from England around that time. After Neil Douglas's arrest and trial in 1797 many in his Relief West Port chapel in Dundee turned Congregationalist. A Mr. Ely from Bury, Dr. Cracknell from Weymouth and Dr. Boothroyd from Huddersfield were three English ministers who came up to preach for them (47).

All the English preachers at the Circus were Calvinist Evangelicals and nearly all were IMS supporters and Independents, for in England the IMS 'acted as sort of denominational union, until efforts to form a Congregational Union succeeded in 1831' (48). But the factor common to them all, including Fuller, were that they were the new missionary enthusiasts. 'As men cheerfully shouldered the great missionary burden, denominational divisions seemed to crumble, and in an astonishing degree, national divisions too' (49). Some Circus preachers seem to have been recommended by Bogue and others by Hill, who between them by 1798 knew many able and suitable preachers all over England, thanks to the county associations, the IMS and their own travels. Prominent among Scots who preached in the Circus were James Haldane, Aikman and Ewing.

In those days it must have been especially thrilling to be young in years and young in the faith. Richard Penman thought nothing of walking the 27 miles from Biggar to Edinburgh on a Saturday night and back again on Sunday evening in order to attend the Sunday morning Circus service (50). Christopher Anderson, still a teenager, gladly

(47) Philip, op. cit., p. 267; Kinniburgh, op. cit., p. 333

(48) W.R. Ward, Religion and Society in England 1790-1850, p. 72

(49) Ibid., p. 45

(50) Kinniburgh, op. cit., p. 278

joined the Circus church, to whose preaching he owed his instantaneous conversion (51). And in the procession of English preachers 'youthful candidates for the ministry ... had the opportunity of listening to men whose style, pronunciation, and delivery were far superior to what were to be usually found in Scotland at that time' (52). Enthusiasm reached such a pitch that 'a few young men felt as if the mantle of Elijah had been cast upon them; they left their employments and followed the servants of God, to hear that gospel which filled them with wonder and joy' (53).

Though crowds never again reached the size of those during Hill's first visit, which was said to be responsible for 200 converts, the Circus continued to be full of interested hearers, many of whom would not normally have entered a church. But what was to be the future of the Circus? How long could it be hired by an individual for evangelistic services? How could it be kept supplied by preachers? As part of the outreach of SPGH how long could it remain pledged to undenominational evangelism? The three-month experiment of the first lease had proved a worthwhile success, but what was to be the long-term policy towards the use of the Circus?

These questions, which must have been racing through the minds of Haldane and his colleagues, were settled for the most part by the formation of a Circus church on Congregational lines in January 1799 and by the ordination of James Haldane as its pastor on 3 February. The Haldane movement thus became separatist and produced its first church as the beginning of a Haldane connexion. There could be no turning back now.

It was indeed a drastic step, this separation from the Established Church, but not lightly taken. There were perhaps four factors that led the Haldanes and Co. to the point of no return.

(1) There was the theological factor. The Established Church failed to enforce discipline and allowed open sinners and scoffers of

(51) Anderson, *op. cit.*, pp. 7-9

(52) Kinniburgh, *op. cit.*, p. 364

(53) *Ibid.*, p. 87

religion to attend the sacrament of communion. Aikman claimed that the 'chief principle' influencing the majority of the 14 who met in Robert Haldane's house in George Street early in December 1798 (54) was 'the indispensable necessity of the people of God being separated in religious fellowship from all such societies as permitted visible unbelievers to continue in their communion' (55). And Campbell declared 'When I began to look about me upon those with whom I joined in commemorating the love of Christ, I found there many of them who would spurn the very idea of being devout Christians! From that time my situation became very irksome, every time I went to the Lord's Supper with them. It was contrary to my conscience; for I began to perceive from the Bible, that a Church of Christ, - the meaning of which I had never once thought of before, - was a society of believers, and not a visible mixture of His friends and enemies' (56). Like Simeon, Campbell also thought the usefulness of the Church of Scotland's communion services was diminished by their inordinate length.

On the question of church government Ewing and others came to believe that Christianity suffers 'when civil privileges are claimed by any denomination of Christians, in their church capacity' and that there is no Divine right of Presbytery (57).

(2) There was the historical factor. The Moderates, from whose theology and outlook Evangelicals differed, were in control of the Assembly. In 1796 they had blocked moves to get the Kirk to give its official sanction to foreign missions, and in December 1798 plans were afoot to bar men like Simeon and Hill from all Established Church pulpits. The Edinburgh Evangelical clergy were at that time fighting a losing battle as Walter Buchanan's letter to Simeon on 28 December, 1798 shows: 'Since you left us (August 23), all the fierceness of moderation has been excited by what is going on at the

(54) Escott, op. cit., p. 67

(55) A. Haldane, op. cit., pp. 217-18

(56) Philip, op. cit., p. 228

(57) Matheson, op. cit., p. 241



Circus ... Accordingly at the Synod they resolved on an overture to the next Assembly, by which it is proposed that no preacher, who is not a licentiate, and no minister, who has not been ordained by some Presbytery of this Church, shall ever be employed in any of our pulpits under severe penalties. Drs. Hunter, Kemp, Davidson, and I, opposed it all in our power; but it was carried by a considerable majority ... Not only your particular friends, but all the serious people here are grieved and offended at it; and should it pass into a law, as there is reason to fear it will, it will sour the minds of many worthy people against our establishment' (58).

These moves reminded Evangelicals too vividly of the case of James Garie. Trained at an English dissenting academy, Garie had become a chaplain to Lady Glenorchy before settling as pastor of Paul Street Chapel in Perth in 1794, when he tried in vain to get the chapel accepted as a Chapel of Ease in the Church of Scotland. Then two noblemen obtained for him a presentation to the Crown living of Brechin, and though after examination he was accepted as a licentiate preacher in the Church of Scotland, some Moderate ministers appealed against his settlement to the Assembly, which decided against Garie on what his fellow Evangelicals considered the 'pretext that he had not passed through the seven years' academical attendance then required at the Scotch universities' (59). Campbell, who heard the Assembly debate, was one who became more alienated from the Established Church as a result of this verdict.

(3) There was also the evangelistic factor. Encouraged by their successes, the SPGH leaders were eager to grasp the opportunities of the day by continuing to go into highways and byways, without regard to parish boundaries. They knew they were touching a class of people left untouched by the Established Church - even soldiers had attended Hill's sermons. Having put their hand to the plough of following Christ in offering Him to the masses, they could not

(58) Carus, op. cit., pp. 163-64

(59) A. Haldane, op. cit., p. 203

and would not look back.

(4) Finally, there was what might be called the Evangelical factor. The 14 founder members of the Circus church felt they had much in common with the English Evangelicals they had met in recent months and were unwilling to be cut off from the mainstream of missionary activity and blessing in England that they represented. The LMS and its work overseas, and especially the itinerant evangelism that had spread over most of England through the county associations in 1797 and 1798, delighted their hearts and strengthened their hands in their own home mission work.

To desert their Evangelical clergy in the Church of Scotland whom they respected was unfortunate, but there had been a cooling off between the SPGH leaders and these Evangelical ministers who were becoming suspicious as well as jealous of Haldane's ever-growing influence. Dr. Erskine, whose association with William Robertson had long seemed to smack of compromise to some of his friends, rebuked Ewing for his critical review of ministers' sermons in the "Missionary Magazine" (60). More important, Erskine had tried to discourage lay preaching. His thoughts on Ewing's resignation from the Church of Scotland ministry, echoing his son-in-law's resignation, may well be imagined. Furthermore, almost certainly Erskine frowned on the launching of the SPGH, a society accountable to no church court and likely to dance to the tunes of those who gave the most princely contributions. For 40 years Erskine had been a member of the SSPCK, whose work he valued, whose house he had helped to put in order in 1796 and whose activities the General Assembly had always backed. He saw no need for a new independent society with similar aims.

Evangelical nobility tended to follow the Evangelical clergy and to side with the Establishment in the difficult days of war for the government. The Countess of Leven had earlier had reservations about lay preaching and the Haldanes' wisdom and stability (61) and

(60) Missionary Magazine, 1797, Vol. II, p. 273

(61) Philip, op. cit., pp. 139, 141

her husband was the King's Commissioner to the General Assembly from 1783 to 1801.

The question as to why the Circus men did not join one of the other Presbyterian Churches may be briefly dismissed. As Christian activists and reformers of their day they valued their spiritual emancipation too highly to come under another yoke, and Campbell probably spoke for them all in saying 'I saw some societies whose form I approved; but found them shut up from the fellowship of all Christians, except such as jumped with them in every minutia' (62). Campbell and his friends were determined to maintain their Evangelical catholicity, that spirit by which the LMS was being borne on to great endeavours.

Why, then, did the Circus church become a Congregational church, the first in Edinburgh and only the third in the whole east of Scotland? Five factors may account for this.

(1) Ewing had for some time favoured congregational principles. In forming his views the books of John Glas and Campbell's "Lectures on Ecclesiastical History" no doubt played their part. Ewing's 'idea of Congregational church polity stemmed from his experience of the less rigid Presbyterianism of Lady Glenorchy's Chapel and from his study of New Testament order' (63), but while the Chapel was under the power of church courts as a chapel of ease it could never be represented there or at the Assembly, which was probably a further source of frustration to an articulate and aspiring young man like Ewing with his platforms of power in the editorship of the "Missionary Magazine" and the secretaryship of the Edinburgh Missionary Society. Ewing, who might be called the 'brain' of the Haldane movement (though they were all educated men from the lower middle class or the upper middle class) and who had resigned as a Church of Scotland minister on 1 December, 1798, was the person asked to compose a plan for the government of the Circus church.

(2) For over 20 years there had been the example of Bogue, the

(62) Ibid., pp. 228-29

(63) Escott, op. cit., pp. 88-89

Scottish licentiate who had been minister of an Independent church, with his protest against Scottish patronage and his written protests against religious and political tyranny. Bogue had been in close contact with the Haldanes since their conversion and had often preached in Lady Glenorchy's Chapel when visiting Scotland. Of this staunch Congregationalist it was recorded, 'With keen independents, he appeared a lukewarm partisan; but they had only to wait till they saw him attacked by presbyterians or episcopalians, to be satisfied that he was a much warmer and more determined friend than they could have conceived. His mind was too great to admit of being enamoured of the minutiae, or, as he would have called them, the nick-knacks, of any communion; but he would have adhered to the great leading principles of the independents, though under other names, and in other connexions, to the hazard or even the sacrifice of life' (64).

(3) Most of the Circus preachers from England had been Congregationalists and some had preached, when asked, on the nature of the New Testament church. 'Such discourses led us to entertain Independent views of a church, and church government; which led to the formation of a Christian Church in the Circus ...' reminisced Campbell (65).

(4) The majority of the LMS supporters were Congregationalists and though the SPGH was concerned exclusively with home missions, its leaders welcomed any step which would strengthen the ties with their fellow Calvinist Evangelicals in the south whose concern for foreign missions also they shared.

(5) An Independent church had very recently been opened in George Street, Aberdeen by James Bennett, who must have been questioned about it when he visited the Circus. Another Independent church had been constituted in 1798 in Perth, some time after Paul's Chapel had been bought about August for James Garie. Ewing visited this church during his itineration for SPGH in December, and later the chapel was bought by Robert Haldane.

(64) Bennett, *Memoirs*, p. 38

(65) Philip, *op. cit.*, p. 281

The 14 who decided in December to form a Circus church were soon joined by many others. In January 1799, 272 became members in the newly-painted theatre. A further 38 people wished to remain members of the Established Church and were reluctantly admitted as occasional communicants on the principle of forbearance (66). Thus from the outset the high idealism of Aikman and others wanting a pure communion was perhaps weakened by a kind of compromise.

Some of the church members had been converted by the preaching of James Haldane and Rowland Hill, but a 'very considerable number were old-established Christians, who had grown up under the admirable teaching of Dr. Erskine, Mr. Black, Dr. Colquhoun, Dr. Walter Buchanan, and other faithful ministers of the Established Church, who could not be expected to look with satisfaction on this secession' (67).

As Ewing had been promised by Robert Haldane a Tabernacle church of his own in Glasgow, which explains why he left Lady Glenorchy's Chapel when he did, James Haldane was unanimously pressed into being the Circus church or Tabernacle minister, though he thought his talents were more those of an evangelist and wished (like Hill) to devote some time every year to itinerant preaching. His ordination service lasted nearly five hours yet reportedly held the crowd's deepest attention throughout (68). It was conducted by young Mr. Taylor of Ossett and also by James Garie and Greville Ewing - we may imagine the sneers of some Moderates and the horror of some Evangelical clergy at this, for one was an Englishman who would soon be denied their pulpits, one had recently been rejected from their pulpits and one had just resigned from their pulpits.

In answer to Garie's four searching questions, James Haldane gave a sketch of his whole life, and said he hoped to procure a regular rotation of ministers to assist him and to keep an open pulpit for every faithful gospel minister, irrespective of his denomination or

(66) Escott, *op. cit.*, p. 67; A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 218

(67) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 218

(68) *Missionary Magazine*, 1799, Vol. IV, p. 80

country, another dig calculated to anger the Edinburgh Presbytery which had to endure the sight of the largest church in the city turning independent and following practices frowned on and soon to be officially forbidden by their own Established Church.

Haldane also approved the plan of the church 'as being simple and scriptural; but disavowed any confidence in it as a perfect model of a church of Christ, to the exclusion of all others' (69).

Aikman continued this all-Evangelical note by saying that a chief aim of the church founders was to 'avoid that contracted spirit, which would exclude from the pulpit, or from occasional communion, any faithful preacher of the Gospel, or sincere lover of the Lord Jesus' (70).

The Edinburgh Tabernacle church maintained strict discipline and 'great numbers' of would-be members were rejected, 'either from ignorance of the Gospel, or from not appearing to maintain a becoming walk and conversation' (71).

Ecclesiastically the Haldanes and their friends were putting themselves out on a limb, for although Dissenters were on the increase they still formed in 1799, by Dr. Ranken's estimate, only 10% of the population. In the Burgher and Antiburgher Synods there were 55,000 members each, in the Relief Synod 36,000, in the Reformed Presbytery 4,000 and among Methodists, Baptists, Independents, etc. only another 4,000 (72).

From the time that the anomalous position of the Circus meetings was resolved by the public constitution of a church Robert Haldane became committed to his Tabernacle system. On his 15-day journey in September 1798 down to Gloucestershire with Rowland Hill he had seen and heard something of the legacy of Whitefield and Lady Huntingdon and he resolved to erect a string of large preaching-stations across Scotland. The Haldanes have been somewhat foolishly called the Wesley and Whitefield of Scotland (73) but perhaps only in this

(69) Ibid., p. 78

(70) In loc. cit.

(71) R. Haldane, op. cit., pp. 72-73

(72) Struthers, op. cit., p. 408

(73) E.g., Escott, op. cit., p. 45 and D. Murray, The First 100 Years,

limited sense can Robert be compared with Whitefield - that in his concern for the folk of those congested areas the Industrial Revolution was producing he provided free seats and a freer atmosphere in churches built and maintained at his expense and serviced by ministers paid by him. Having agreed with Bogue at Gosport finally to abandon the Bengal mission project, Robert discussed his new Tabernacle scheme and his plans for training men for the ministry with him (74).

In late 1798, therefore, Robert bought for £3,000 the Circus or riding school in Ann Street, off Jamaica Street in Glasgow. He made alterations to it and got Hill to open it on 28 July, 1799. At first Ewing was styled a "missioner", but after his first bitter dispute with Robert Haldane a Congregational church was formed under his pastorate on 15 August, 1800.

Taking Ewing with him to Stirling, Robert broached William Innes with the idea of taking charge of a Haldane tabernacle in Dundee. However, Innes did not leave the Church of Scotland ministry till about one year after his brother-in-law, not until the Assembly ordered him to assist in the ordination of a minister branded as a profane swearer, and so did not take possession of the Dundee Tabernacle till its opening on 19 October, 1800, when James Haldane and John Aikman were the day's preachers. Three months later a church was formed under Innes' pastorate.

In 1799 three other tabernacles had been opened, Wick Chapel on 27 March, when Ballantyne preached and gave the charge, Thurso Chapel on 4 September, when James Haldane and Aikman officiated, and the Perth Tabernacle in South Street, to which Garie's congregation moved. Wick's building held 800 people, but the other two had seats for 1,000 or more, enough to accommodate a quarter of the towns' population, one would imagine.

The Dumfries Tabernacle was opened in 1803 but a church was not formed for two or three years, William Watson being its first pastor in 1806. About this time also the large Elgin Tabernacle, with

room for 1,300, was built for Ballantyne, but attendances were very poor (75).

Meanwhile to replace the Circus Robert built for his brother a new Tabernacle building in Leith Walk, Edinburgh. It could seat 3,200 people and the under part rose like a gallery all over the place from within a short distance of the pulpit, and there were two large galleries above that. It was easily the city's largest church and often crowds approaching 4,000 met there. For some years after its opening on 9 July, 1801 it was packed for the Sunday services and it seems that under Haldane's preaching about ten people were awakened or converted most Sundays (76). Throughout his ministry James would accept no stipend, so offerings went to the SPGH, unless they were earmarked for specific charitable or Christian causes. So consistent was the number of attenders that Aikman amicably hived off to build his own North College Street Chapel in the Old Town. It was opened by James Haldane on 2 June, 1802, just over a year after Aikman was ordained his co-pastor in a service conducted by James Moody of Warwick. Descended from Paisley-born Scots, Moody was a kindred spirit of George Burder and a very busy and successful minister.

Since 1795 Scotland had seen in quick succession many innovations, among them the public distribution of tracts, Sunday school societies for adults and children, town missionary societies which sent Scots and their families overseas, a radical protest but popular missionary magazine, extensive evangelistic tours undertaken by laymen as well as by ministers, and an undenominational society committed to spread the gospel in Scotland, from which arose huge town Congregational tabernacles, which began to hold communion services every week (Glasgow from 1800, Edinburgh from 1802), and its own seminary.

Then in February 1803 came another new thing. Still trying to be true to New Testament practice - for the Haldanes were restorers of primitive church practices rather than reformers - and following

(75) Escott, op. cit., p. 262

(76) A. Haldane, op. cit., p. 225



Ewing's convictions, the churches of James Haldane and Aikman planned to send out their own church missionaries abroad. Two years later James Paterson and Ebenezer Henderson sailed for India, though they were kept during the winter in Copenhagen where they preached and gave away tracts, and Francis Dick sailed for Quebec.

The tabernacles begun by Haldane formed the main foundation of Scottish Congregationalism, but it was Ewing, assisted by Ralph Wardlaw, William Orme and others, who built up the Haldane churches remaining paedobaptist into the 1812 Union. The Haldanes with their democratic, independent outlook never seemed to see the need for their churches to unite in some sort of association, though of course the churches were linked through their foundation and history and through their pastors, most of whom had passed through Haldane's seminary.

#### (d) The Haldane Seminary

Lord Sands mentioned two considerations why people influenced by the Haldane movement and wishing to leave the Established Church formed Congregational churches. First, if they had called a minister from the Secession Church and formed a congregation of that Church, they would at once have found themselves implicated in a controversy of 50 years ago in which they had no part and of which they carried no tradition, and, second, the rigidity of the educational standard of the Presbyterian ministry would have excluded men who were leaders in the new Haldane movement (77).

Still struggling to keep up with events and to control them, Robert Haldane started his seminary in January 1799 to give theological training to the SPGH catechists and itinerant preachers and to provide ministers for his tabernacles. Although this was 38 years after the Relief Church had started, it was over 20 years

(77) Lord Sands, *The Historical Origins of the Religious Divisions in Scotland*, article in *Records of the Scottish Church History Society*, Vol. III, Pt. II, p. 87

before the Relief Church started its own seminary.

The idea of an academy for foreign missionaries was proposed in a letter to the "Missionary Magazine" in June 1798 and a year later the Glasgow Missionary Society Directors also proposed one (78). But again Robert Haldane was influenced by the English situation, where he was familiar with Bogue's seminary which began in 1789 through the foresight and generosity of the rich London banker George Welch, who had planned with George Burder's father, a Mr. Wilson and several ministers to establish academies in several parts of England (79). The plan was to place three students with a trusted minister for three years, the students to receive pocket money and a board and lodging allowance and the minister who taught and supervised them to receive £10 a year for each student (80). Seven ministers were chosen, Jay's tutor Cornelius Winter being one of them.

After Welch's death Haldane stepped into the financial breach, especially as regards Bogue's seminary. In 1799 the ministers meeting at Hanley, Staffordshire to form the Itinerant Seminary learnt of Haldane's offer of £100 to educate ten students and £200 if 20 students could be found (81). To Bogue, whose talents he respected and towards whom he probably felt obligations after the collapse of the Bengal project (Haldane had guaranteed Bogue, Ewing and Innes £3,500 compensation each), Haldane offered £100 for ten students a year, provided the Hampshire Association raised the remaining money necessary for their education and support (82). Haldane's plan went through and perhaps the most famous of his English students was John Angell James, who when 21 took the charge, declined by Bennett, at Carrs Lane Chapel, Birmingham and held it till his death in 1859.

(78) Missionary Magazine, 1799, Vol. IV, p. 390

(79) H. Burder, Memoir of Rev. G. Burder, p. 57

(80) Bennett, Memoirs, pp. 119-20

(81) Missionary Magazine, 1799, Vol. IV, p. 517

(82) Bennett, Memoirs, pp. 133-34

Haldane had another reason for being kind to Bogue, for in October 1798 he was planning to place ten or twelve men for a year's education under Bogue and asked Campbell and his brother to find suitable candidates (83). Presumably Haldane told Bogue of his intentions when in Gosport that year and Bogue must have been surprised to learn that a seminary class had been opened at Ewing's house in Rose Court, Edinburgh in January 1799. But the truth was that Haldane was dissuaded by Garie and Ewing from sending students to Hampshire, whether from patriotic motives, or from a distrust of Bogue's politics or powerful personality, or from an envy of his gifts or influence over Haldane, it is hard to determine. Probably Ewing welcomed the chance to be a theological tutor (his father had been a teacher) and the chance of working for his new high salary from Haldane while his Glasgow tabernacle was being made ready.

As it happened, Bogue officially became the LMS missionary academy tutor in August 1800 and, the LMS agreeing to take a quota of Scottish students, intending missionaries were asked to apply to John Ritchie, the "Missionary Magazine" editor after Ewing's removal to Glasgow (84). After graduating at Edinburgh and Glasgow universities Bogue's third son David for a while assisted his father as a tutor. Robert Haldane and a Mr. Spear of Manchester offered £500 towards the founding of this LMS seminary at Gosport, which in 25 years sent out at least 115 men to the overseas mission field and was the first institution of its kind in the modern missionary movement.

Ewing's first seminary class of 24 students came from the four main Presbyterian Churches. But according to one student, John Munro of Knockando, 'before the termination of our prescribed course of study, we found ourselves decided and intelligent Congregationalists' (85). He describes the 'only qualifications for admission

(83) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, pp. 215-16

(84) *Missionary Magazine*, 1800, Vol. V, p. 447

(85) J. Munro, *Autobiography*, cited in Matheson, *op. cit.*, p. 195

to the seminary' as being 'genuine piety, talents susceptible of cultivation, and a desire to be useful to our fellow-sinners by preaching and teaching the words of eternal life'. The students lived with friends or in private houses, as was the practice at Gosport, till in May 1799 they moved with Ewing to Glasgow where they continued, apart from two summer vacations, till November 1800. By then Innes at Dundee had started a preparatory class which joined Ewing in 1801.

There were nine classes in all, the last from the end of 1807 to December 1808. The total number of students in ten years was over 250 and there were some eight tutors. Besides Ewing and Innes, Aikman, Thomas Wemyss, the classical author, William Stephens, the first minister of the Aberdeen church opened by Bennett and later James Haldane's assistant, George Cowie, who resigned from the Church of Scotland ministry in July 1799 and was minister of Montrose Congregational church before and after his years in Edinburgh, all did spells of teaching. In addition two former seminary students, John Campbell and William Walker, were also tutors for a time. After Ewing's resignation of his tutorship in 1802 the seminary was situated again in Edinburgh where it was even more directly under Haldane's control. Ewing, a warm-tempered and yet sensitive man, came to resent his paymaster's interference in the seminary and to think of him as a spiritual dictator. Haldane, having lost full confidence in Ewing, entrusted Campbell, when still a seminary student, with the important tasks of finding and examining seminary candidates and supervising their transportation and payment. Haldane also relied on Campbell's judgment in placing men on their completion of studies and on the weekend preaching engagements and the vacation preaching tours they undertook.

All the students were maintained at Robert Haldane's expense. He paid for their lodgings, medical expenses, education and books, and in addition each first year student got an allowance of £24 and each second year student one of £30. A library was also provided for the seminary. In ten years Haldane probably invested £20,000 in his seminary alone.

The curriculum included English grammar, rhetoric, systematic

theology and, for the brighter students, Greek, Hebrew, Latin, French and Church Music. The students normally attended lectures, wrote essays and gave sermons in rotation which were subject to their tutor's criticism. One day each week was devoted to Bible exposition, each student speaking in turn on the prescribed passage. In the classroom under the Edinburgh Tabernacle Campbell found special profit from the daily requirement made of each student to comment on the Bible verse that he read to the class. On Sundays especially students often helped ministers in their churches or preached in ministerless churches, and in and around Edinburgh senior students ran regular preaching stations.

Students came from Ireland as well as Scotland. The three groups in the seminary - Highlanders, Lowlanders, Irishmen - were each under a student censor, who kept Haldane informed of his fellow students' views and activities.

Among all the students were 'some choice spirits who, having got a start in learning, pushed on their private studies with vigour and obtained success' (86). John Campbell, John Watson, the first Secretary of the Congregational Union of Scotland, Dr. Russell of Dundee and Dr. James Paterson who founded Adelaide Place Baptist Church in Glasgow were in this category. 'But in too many instances', claimed Struthers, 'the light which they (Haldane's students) received merely enabled them to see their own intellectual darkness' (87). And not all students remained grateful or loyal to their financial benefactor (88). Nevertheless the seminary produced men who continued the evangelistic work of the SPGH, the foundation day of which has been called the 'red-letter day of modern Highland evangelism' (89).

(86) Struthers, *op. cit.*, p. 402

(87) *In loc. cit.*

(88) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 302

(89) J. Mackay, *The Church in the Highlands*, p. 229

## 6. THE DECLINE OF ANGLO-SCOTTISH EVANGELICALISM

The wave of Evangelicalism caused by the recovery of the commission to evangelise the world, which was often accompanied by a buoyant expectation that the conversion of the heathen was only a matter of time, spread infectiously from England across Scotland and at first found expression in town missionary societies. Hard on their heels came the lay preaching and itinerant movements, the Sunday school movement, the tract movement, the erection of the Haldane tabernacles and the increase in democratically organised Congregational churches and a seminary to supply their ministers.

To a National Church which was being forced, reluctantly, to take stock of its position the most disturbing elements of this upsurge of Evangelicalism was the great flowering of undenominational and international co-operation. After the interdenominational missionary prayer-meetings and the new non-ecclesiastical societies came the final insult of the invasion of English Dissenters into Scottish towns and parishes from April 1798 onwards.

The new Evangelicalism unfortunately brought out at first a defensive spirit in most of the Presbyterian Churches and they set about condemning missionary societies, lay preaching and the practice of open pulpits. Initially the Kirk's reaction took the form of a negative or delaying, defensive action: the 1796 Assembly opted out of joining the missionary stampede. In 1799, however, the Moderate majority in the Kirk began its counter-attack against the Haldane separatist movement, the secession which occurred roughly mid-way between the secession of Evangelicals that led to the formation of the Relief Presbytery and the Disruption of 1843.

### (a) The Assembly of 1799

The SPGH and its supporters had known a little persecution before the Acts and the Pastoral Admonition of the 1799 Assembly. In particular the blunt and argumentative Robert Haldane had come in for attack, ever since he had 'betrayed' his landed class at the

Stirlingshire freeholders' meeting on 1 July, 1794 by publicly declaring his anti-war feelings and his definition of a democrat (1). In 1796 Wilberforce, supporting Haldane in his attempt to lead a mission to Bengal, then under the East India Company's control, wisely advised Dundas, with reference to Haldane, 'In Scotland such a man is sure to create a ferment. Send him, therefore, to the back settlements, to let off his pistol in vacuo' (2). Haldane met his first Christian rebuff when the LMS discouraged other missionary societies from memorialising the East India Company on his behalf, as his politics were still suspect, at least to the government, but Dr. Balfour of Glasgow condemned such political trimming.

In 1797 Haldane was libelled by Professor Robison of Edinburgh University in his book "Proofs of a Conspiracy against all the Religions and Governments in Europe". Robison linked Haldane with Unitarians and said he 'would willingly wade to the knees in blood to overturn the establishment of the Kirk of Scotland'. Even after a protracted correspondence (3) Robison would not omit the offending paragraph and it was referred to by the "Anti-Jacobin Review" in May 1799 when the Assembly met. In the same month also the Duke of Atholl, in appealing to the Duke of Portland, the Home Secretary, for stricter measures against the new sectarians ended by writing 'I have no doubt ... that energetic measures will be taken under the authority of Parliament, to annihilate the further progress of unlicensed missionaries and free schools, whether under the auspices of Mr. Haldane or any other enthusiastic and designing man whatever' (4).

1799 was a year of poor harvests and high prices and a year when Pitt's government clamped down on all political clubs, suspended Habeas Corpus and passed the Combination Acts, and it was against this background that the Assembly met.

(1) R. Haldane, op. cit., pp. 7-9

(2) Cited in A. Haldane, op. cit., p. 103

(3) R. Haldane, op. cit., pp. 23-58

(4) Edinburgh University Laing MSS, No. 500, letter of 20 May, 1799

By this time also many Scots, Evangelicals as well as Moderates, had been angered by the publication of Rowland Hill's "Journal" of his 1798 visit to Scotland, in which he criticised all the Presbyterian Churches except the Relief. Nor did Independents and Baptists escape his censures. He tried to give a bird's eye view of Scottish church history but he was not a knowledgeable historian. In short, it was a partisan work and contained too many cheap jibes and his printers were right in the 74-word title of his book to set the words "Designed to promote Brotherly Love and Forbearance" in the very smallest type! The truth is that Hill had always thought that Presbyterianism was nearer the original and scriptural model than Episcopacy and Independency (5) and had thought highly of the quality of Scottish Christianity (6), so his findings in Scotland were a great disillusionment to him.

Angered and alarmed, the 1799 Assembly sought to defend its Presbyterian beliefs and prerogatives and to carry the fight into the enemy's camp. Part of the alarm arose from the fact that the SPGH was operating north of the Tay where the Assembly's authority was sometimes questioned.

Acts were passed which prohibited men not licensed by the Kirk from occupying its livings (a sequel to the case of James Garie) and prohibited Kirk ministers from allowing any non-Kirk minister to preach or to administer any ordinance in their churches or even to have 'ministerial communion in any other manner' with non-Kirk ministers (a sequel to the visits of Simeon and Hill especially). As regards the overtures from the Synod of Aberdeen and the Synod of Angus and Mearns about 'vagrant teachers and Sunday-schools, irreligion and anarchy', the Assembly 'unanimously agreed to the overtures, and prohibited all persons from preaching, in any place under their jurisdiction, who were not licensed as above; and also those who are from England, or any other place, and who had not first been educated and licensed in Scotland'. The Assembly

(5) W. Jay, *Autobiography*, p. 349

(6) Hill, *op. cit.*, pp. v, vi



ordered the presbyteries to examine all teachers and asked the Lord Advocate and the Solicitor General to vindicate and enforce the jurisdiction of the Established Church (7). Of the report on Sunday schools drawn up by a committee of the Assembly, 1,600 copies were printed for use in the churches.

To cap all these measures a Pastoral Admonition or Letter was also issued by a committee of the Assembly. Possibly composed by Hugh Blair, whose polished Moderate sermons won him many admirers, the Letter was ordered to be read by ministers from their pulpits on the first Sunday after receiving it. Being some 2,000 words long, the Letter must have taken about ten minutes to read. As many as 4,000 copies of it were printed. By sending a copy also to the county sheriffs and the chief magistrates of all royal burghs, the Assembly again seemed to be requesting the aid of the civil powers, a retrograde step harking back to a century or more.

The Letter was in parts rather a mean and malicious document. It openly mentioned the SPGH by name but associated it by implication with the excesses of the French Revolution. It condemned the activities of the SPGH but persisted in linking them with secret meetings aimed at overthrowing the country's constitution. The smear campaign continued with New Testament references to 'false teachers' and with general attacks on 'these strange and self-authorised teachers of religion'. It was for their Established Church that churchmen feared most - hence the defence of the Church of Scotland and its regular, standing ministry and the plea to members to remain loyal to the Church of their fathers.

The galling thing to the SPGH men was that 'after a feeble resistance by a minority overborne by numbers and authority' (8) the Letter was passed unanimously. Dr. Balfour of the Glasgow Missionary Society was actually on the composing committee and claimed to have toned down the Letter but remained very distressed about it (9).

(7) Acts of the General Assembly, 1799, pp. 870-75

(8) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 237

(9) *Ibid.*, p. 238

Personally sympathetic to the Independents, Balfour nevertheless remained true to his first love of Presbyterian order. For enterprises like the SPGH, whose lay committee was not composed of church representatives but of individual Christians, tended to become detached from the local churches and to by-pass them.

In their hour of undergoing attack Haldane and his supporters were deserted in the Assembly by their fellow Evangelicals, who presumably preferred to put their Church, despite her faults, first and who disliked schism and had failed to see the need for it and who could have argued that anyway the Letter came after the SPGH horses had bolted from the Kirk stable. Probably, too, 1799 was the kind of desperate year when Evangelical principle could be quietly smothered by Presbyterian expediency.

However, later the Letter 'excited the grief and indignation of the evangelical portion of the clergy, some of whom refused to read the obnoxious document, and others, while they complied with the injunction of their ecclesiastical superiors, boldly intimated their dissent from the opinions therein expressed' (10).

On the Letter's publication the warm-tempered Ewing rushed into print to clear himself, striking a somewhat dramatic and self-righteous pose in a letter sent to the newspapers, but he made his point: 'I have been grossly libelled ... without the production of a single fact to my prejudice' (11). Burder, as a representative of the English Evangelicals preaching in the Circus, also wrote to the newspapers rebutting the political charges and decrying any bid to suppress religious liberty by the civil power and contrasting the situation in England - 'In the tolerant country of England, and under the benign influence of the toleration-act, we have this liberty (of itinerant preaching) unmolested (12).

Rowland Hill, forgetting the devilish language used in the pamphlet war between Calvinists and Arminians after the 1775 Methodist

(10) Kinniburgh, op. cit., p. 334

(11) Matheson, op. cit., p. 213

(12) Ibid., p. 214

conference, wrote while itinerating for the SPGH in Scotland eight letters to the Assembly during June and July of 1799 which were published as a pamphlet. Hill accused the Assembly of wishing to 'demolish at once the bridge of communication between their church and every other protestant communion upon earth' (13), poured scorn on the political charges and insisted that 'every man has a right to preach the gospel' (14). The Evangelicals in the 1799 Assembly he censured for their 'criminal silence' (15). One result of Hill's preoccupation with the Letter and his condemnation of the Kirk for its unspirituality was that this visit to Scotland was far less fruitful than his first.

Strong written support for the SPGH also came from Neil Douglas who admired the cool official reply of the SPGH to the Letter and who claimed that 'the licence man can give, man may take away; but the licence God gives to preach his gospel, neither men nor devils can take away' (16).

As a panic measure the repressive measures and the Letter won disapproval from the Rev. John Wodrow of Stevenston, youngest son of the church historian and a friend of the Evangelical leaders Erskine and Moncreiff. Though he wrote off the SPGH men as 'a set of hot-brained enthusiasts' he added 'Still I totally disapprove of the Assembly's meddling with them. It was improper to take any public notice of them at all' (17).

As it was, the comparatively petty persecution against the new missionaries was stepped up for a period, but Henry Inglis QC, the Baptist co-pastor of McLean, proved that the Sunday schools were protected by the Toleration Act, the civil authorities rarely overstepped their powers and, as Drs. Erskine and Balfour had hoped, in the long run the Assembly's attacks did the SPGH more good than

(13) R. Hill, Letters, p. 5

(14) Ibid., p. 15

(15) Ibid., p. 43

(16) Douglas, op. cit., p. 44

(17) J. Wodrow, Letter 223 to S. Kendrick, 16 Oct. 1799

harm by winning it sympathy, advertisement and supporters.

In one sense the Pastoral Admonition was a nine-days' wonder, for 'some from the first deemed the decree more honoured in the breach than in the observance; and it was pleasing to find how soon, in some actual instances, it was treated as a dead letter' (18). So wrote William Jay, the Dissenting friend of Wilberforce, who visited Scotland in the early 1800s and preached several times in Church of Scotland pulpits, as also in Secession and Congregational pulpits. Yet to any who felt it right to obey the laws of a Church the 1799 Act was not a dead letter, and it is possibly significant that after his visits of 1796 and 1798 Simeon never re-visited Scotland till 1815 and 1819. Even Rowland Hill never re-visited Scotland till 1824.

In 1842 the Act embracing all these anti-SPGH and anti-Sunday school measures was strongly attacked and unanimously rescinded by the Assembly as 'amounting to nothing less than a hatred to the cause of evangelical truth' (19). Even so, the old Act was re-enacted after the Disruption!

#### (b) The Dissolution of the SPGH

The apogee of Anglo-Scottish Evangelicalism was 1799 when the SPGH men seceded from the Established Church, a secession, they could have argued, that was forced on them by the Kirk's lack of understanding and elasticity to meet new problems and new opportunities. As the fields seemed white for harvest they called in labourers from England who were also Dissenters in their country.

But the procession of English Evangelicals could not continue indefinitely. There was a limit to the time they could spend away from their churches and there was even a limit to the money available for their preaching tours. Though they remained welcome as holiday visitors and guest speakers and LMS or BMS fund-raisers, English ministers were not needed so much once James Haldane

(18) Jay, op. cit., p. 134

(19) Matheson, op. cit., p. 204 footnote

entered the full-time ministry. From the outset the Haldane tabernacles had their own ministers and his seminary was sending out students as itinerant preachers and later as pastors for the new Congregational churches.

Concerned by the misrepresentations suffered by himself and the SPGH and by the very real possibility of Pitt introducing a Bill to curb the activities of Methodists and Dissenters (20), Robert Haldane published his "Address" in May 1800. As an apologia its candour largely stilled the suspicions of his enemies, just when he was running into difficulties with his friends. For the Haldane movement was soon starting to go the Protestant way of fragmentation and to tear itself apart through clashes of personality and clashes over individual interpretation of the New Testament. The SPGH men were brave and strong-minded enough to go out into the cold air of schism but they were not wise and broad-minded enough to survive there together.

Some said the movement grew too quickly and was swamped by lack of order (21). Sired, materially speaking, by the awful realism of the Industrial Revolution spawning tenements of unchurched people and mared by the democratic idealism of the French Revolution, the SPGH grew quickly and then galloped off in two directions, Congregational and Baptist. It seems Robert Haldane was no long term planner, preferring, perhaps wisely in those uncertain days of war, to meet events as they came in the course of his experimentation.

Superficially there were three reasons for the disintegration of the Haldane movement. First, Haldane seemed to think with Glas that the New Testament Church was merely a group of congregations united in brotherly love and saw no need for any organisational union. Yet by 1805 there were already 24 Congregational churches and by 1808 there were 85. Second, Haldane fell out with Ewing, and the rest of the SPGH men were all obliged eventually to take sides. Third, the Haldanes became Baptists in 1808.

In early 1802 Ewing resigned his seminary tutorship, objecting

(20) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, pp. 256-57; R.I. and S. Wilberforce, *op. cit.*, Vol. ii, p. 361

(21) Philip, *op. cit.*, p. 268

among other things to Haldane's secret indoctrination of his students. In 1803 the moderating influence of John Campbell, who probably foresaw the coming divisions and collapse (22), was removed from Scotland on his departure for London. In 1808 Ewing at last officially resigned from the SPGH and in the next two years waged a pamphlet war with Robert Haldane, when between them they washed some 800 pages of dirty linen in public. Although Robert Haldane 'eventually purchased Tabernacles rather than patronages, the basic issue was fundamentally the same, and the outcome was disastrous. Spiritual patronage was the rock on which the Tabernacle scheme finally foundered' (23). There was some truth in the Pastoral Admonition, after all, when it said of the SPGH that the 'whole scheme, and the manner in which it is conducted, discover more of a spirit of ambition and vanity, and of a desire to claim a lordly dominion over your faith, than of the spirit of the Gospel'.

In the early days Ewing had set the pace in the race back to New Testament practices - in 1800 his Glasgow Tabernacle started celebrating the Lord's Supper every Sunday and in 1803 he advocated that only congregations should send out foreign missionaries - but he knew better where to stop and draw the line at innovation. Deprived of Ewing's confidence, Robert Haldane, not an original thinker himself, moved towards 'the canonisation of the literal text of the Bible' (24) as he swung behind his brother and William Ballantyne in their views which were changing with their closer study of the New Testament. In 1805 James Haldane published his lengthy "Social Worship" which belittled the pastoral office by arguing for public exhortation in the churches on Sundays by male members and for a plurality of pastors in every church, even if most of them should hold secular jobs. Later James argued for discipline to be administered in public and on Sundays and Ballantyne in his controversial "Treatise on the Elder's Office" contended for a plurality

(22) Ibid., p. 144

(23) N. Gray, Greville Ewing, p. 161

(24) R. Mitchison, A History of Scotland, p. 261; R. Haldane, An Answer to Mr. G. Ewing's Pamphlet, p. 359

of elders in the churches. Sadly 'matters came to such a pitch, that to train pious men for the ministry, - to have public collections for the support of Gospel ordinances, - for ministers to wear black clothes, - was pronounced anti-Christian' (25). This was innovation run riot, echoing the truth in the Pastoral Admonition's words: 'In these giddy times, when the love of innovation so much prevails ...'

The great commission to evangelise was not lost sight of, but it was partly eclipsed at least by these secondary matters relating to church order. Wranglings and rumblings continued, over, for instance, the mutual exhortation practised by Robert Haldane and his new mentor Ballantyne in Newcastle in 1805 and over William Stephens, co-pastor of James Haldane, becoming a Baptist in 1806, till in March 1808 James, true to his conscience, himself became a Baptist.

This step first split his own church, 'one of the most numerous and respectable Independent societies that had ever been in Britain' (26), and then all the Haldane churches from the Orkneys (27) to Dumfries (28). Many recognised the sincerity of James' convictions, which had not come quickly (29), and sympathised with his plea for mutual forbearance within his Edinburgh church, but it was not to be and some congregations had to find another place to worship in when Robert Haldane took over his churches for the Baptist cause.

The baptism by immersion of the Haldanes, and their changed views of the nature of the Church that accompanied it, capped the 'vagaries which were played at the Edinburgh Tabernacle' and, according to one contemporary, 'upset an evangelical enterprise which, had it been wisely conducted, might have rivalled the Reformation by Knox, as well as surpassed all that was achieved by the Covenanters and the Seceders' (30).

(25) W. Orme, Historical Sketch, article in London Christian Instructor, or Congregational Magazine, 1819, Vol. ii, pp. 782-83

(26) In loc. cit.

(27) H. Marcus, The History of the Orkney Baptist Churches, pp. 53-75

(28) Escott, op. cit., p. 332

(29) A. Haldane, op. cit., p. 334

(30) Philip, op. cit., p. 142

Mercifully for the brothers' happiness, Robert followed James in turning Baptist (as he had in becoming a Christian and a preacher), though one has the sneaking suspicion that he was never as fully convinced a Baptist as James - for instance, his student converts in Geneva and Montauban 1816-19 never even knew, it seems, he was a Baptist (31). But at least the brothers remained united; 'they were strong men, individually formidable, together invincible' (32).

The Haldanes never changed their views on the main doctrines of Christianity and always maintained that salvation is by justification by faith alone. But their views on the basis and responsibility for evangelism changed dramatically. It is of the deepest significance (and irony) that for some time before 1808 Robert had been convinced that the work done by his lay society should be done only by churches and that the seminary and tabernacles were 'in their nature opposed to the kingdom of Jesus Christ' (33). As early as 1797 the Baptist Dr. Stuart had said that lay preachers should have 'a formal commission from some church' (34) and we have noted how in 1803 the Haldanes and Aikman in Edinburgh endorsed Ewing's view that the local church was responsible for sending out and supporting overseas missionaries (35).

So the SPGH was quietly dissolved and its leaders went their separate ways, the Haldanes and later Innes to the relative isolation of the Scottish Baptists and Ewing, Aikman, Wardlaw and Orme to lead 55 churches to form the Congregational Union of 1812.

The plight of the split Haldane churches over the next few decades was sometimes desperate, especially those in the small towns that had too few members to support a full-time pastor. In James Haldane's church in Edinburgh some members in 1808 returned to the Church of Scotland, while others resorted to Archibald McLean's Baptist church (36) and perhaps this was the pattern in other parts of

(31) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 431

(32) J. Calder, *Scotland's March Past*, p. 4

(33) R. Haldane, *An Answer to Mr. G. Ewing's Pamphlet*, p. 353

(34) Philip, *op. cit.*, p. 139

(35) *Edinburgh Evangelical Magazine*, 1803, Vol. I, pp. 236-37

(36) A. Haldane, *op. cit.*, p. 335



Scotland, with the National Church and with well-established Dissenting congregations gaining at the expense of the new Congregational and Baptist churches. As late as 1844, only one-third of the new Baptist churches had over 50 members (37). As Scott wrote in "The Heart of Mid-Lothian", 'the air of Scotland was alien to the growth of independency'.

(c) The recrudescence of Scottish nationalism

Edinburgh's pride and go-it-alone policy has never died. Even its New Town has been seen 'as a monument to Scotland's semi-independence' (38).

In 1804 London again snatched the initiative, as in 1795, and formed the interdenominational British and Foreign Bible Society (BFBS) pledged to publish the Scriptures without note or comment. Though the Glasgow parishes in 1805 collected £640 for the BFBS, support in Scotland for so important a society came mainly from Dissenters - Seceders, Baptists and Congregationalists contributed financially and in 1808 the Relief Church made a collection in all its churches. But Christopher Anderson the Baptist thought that Scotland's capital should also have its own Bible Society with full control over the distribution of its funds and in 1810 founded the independent Edinburgh Bible Society with the help of Dr. Peddie, the Seceding minister who had helped the Edinburgh Missionary Society from its start. The Edinburgh Bible Society brought together men who, despite a decade of disputing about church worship and government, yet loved and valued the Bible, and this reconciliation was a subsidiary aim of Anderson (39).

Though Anglo-Scottish Evangelicalism continued after 1810 - Ewing, for instance, won financial support for the Congregational Union's home missionary work from his visits to England (40) - it was

(37) Yuille, op. cit., p. 59

(38) N.T. Phillipson's chapter in J. Wolfe, Government and Nationalism in Scotland, p. 169

(39) Anderson, op. cit., pp. 120-21

(40) Escott, op. cit., p. 95

limited and sporadic. One reason for this decline of co-operation between Scottish and English Evangelicals was that many English Evangelicals and some Scottish Evangelicals turned their missionary attentions to the still more spiritually needy country of Ireland. James Haldane visited Ulster in 1801, and the Rev. Hamilton of Armagh taught a seminary class which was financially supported by Robert Haldane. Anderson and Barclay toured Ireland in 1808, collecting for the BMS, and Anderson by his pamphlets and books did much to advertise the educational and spiritual needs of the island. Leading LMS men like Hill, Bogue and Waugh toured Ireland on behalf of the LMS or the Hibernian Society from 1807 onwards.

Another reason for the decline of Anglo-Scottish Evangelicalism, apart from the dissolution of the SPGH and the end of the system of using tabernacles as evangelical preaching-stations or campaign centres, was the distrust engendered by the bitter Apocrypha controversy that raged from 1825 onwards. Robert Haldane, as a Vice-President of the Edinburgh Bible Society, wrote no less than 12 pamphlets denouncing the circulation of the Apocrypha by the B<sup>E</sup>FBS, in which he exposed the rationalist heresies of the Continental Bible Societies, with which he had personal acquaintance, and supported the plenary inspiration of the Scriptures. He regarded his successful fight to have the Bible printed without the Apocrypha as his greatest work. Among his opponents was Simeon who favoured the Apocrypha being sandwiched between the Testaments if this made for acceptance by the Roman Catholic and Greek Orthodox Churches. Haldane's powerful partner in Edinburgh was Dr. Andrew Thomson, editor of the "Christian Instructor" and leader of the Church of Scotland Evangelicals, whose death in 1831 caused Chalmers to assume the mantle of leadership. In surrendering his B<sup>E</sup>FBS membership in 1827 Thomson expressed his concern to preserve the 'honest, substantial, old-fashioned system' that Scotland had so long maintained despite the 'laxity of opinion' so prevalent in England thus: 'We need improvement, but we must not seek it, for we cannot get it, in the South. The Bible Society controversy has opened my eyes wider to the fact than ever they were before ' (41).

In 1828 Scotland's almost unanimous opposition to the London committee of the BFBS was broken somewhat by the secession from the Edinburgh Bible Society of a few who later formed an auxiliary of the BFBS. A similar secession occurred in Glasgow, and among those who felt the London committee should have had more time to explain and reform their attitude were Ewing and Dr. Wardlaw, to whose pamphlet Haldane replied. Struthers' contention was that Edinburgh as Scotland's ancient capital wanted to run its own religious institutions and to lord it over the other Scottish towns, but then he was by adoption a Glaswegian! (42)

Down in London after 1825 Scottish ministers kept themselves to themselves (43), a far cry from those happy days of harmony when the LMS was born and Dr. Hunter of the Church of Scotland had publicly rejoiced over the 'spiritual union' between the mission-minded Evangelicals of England and Scotland.

The background to some of this decline in Anglo-Scottish relationships and partly its cause was that Scotland was passing through a periodic crisis of identity. During the 1820s there arose a wave of Scottish nationalism, which was not always necessarily either anti-English or anti-Union but which was always a feeling of Scottishness. Some Scots, like the radicals, wanted parliamentary reform. The weaver 'Pearlie' Wilson of Strathaven carried a banner "Scotland free or a desert" when stopped in his march. In 1817 the "Scotsman" was founded to harness radicals during the post-war years of unemployment and poverty to the peaceful cause of moderate parliamentary reform.

The romantic movement dating from the publication in 1814 of "Waverley", the first of 22 novels that Scott wrote in 13 years, accelerated a sentimental regard for all things Scottish. From this movement sprang the largely unhistorical Highland cult of clans and tartans, kilts and bagpipes, and by it the upper and middle classes were reminded of their Scottish heritage, and amid the changes produced by the Industrial Revolution people wanted their self-assurance and their sense of continuity restored. Yet Scott was not

(42) Struthers, op. cit., pp. 451-52

(43) Morison, op. cit., Vol. II, pp. 425-26

opposed to the Auld Enemy as such. Rather he wanted the process of assimilation with England to continue, but with due respect by the English for Scotland and the Scots and with Scots continuing to take a pride in their own culture. In 1823, however, the Scottish customs and excise boards were abolished and in 1826 the government proposed to prohibit the issue of bank notes valued at £5 or under in England and Scotland. As a writer with legal training Scott rallied to the support of the Scottish pound note with lively letters laced with hyperboles (later published in pamphlet form) and opposition to the government's Bill was very widespread and virtually unanimous throughout Scotland. Being broadly content with the main thesis of union with England, Scott could afford himself the luxury of cavilling at the details. He gave to 'Scottish nationalism an ideology - an ideology of noisy inaction' (44) which still has relevance for today.

On the religious side Thomas McCrie's 1812 biography of Knox helped to restore the great reformer's reputation in his countrymen's eyes, while his biography of Andrew Melville in 1819 renewed interest in the Scottish Reformation and later greatly influenced Chalmers and his fellow Evangelicals.

Unhappily, concurrent with the decline of Anglo-Scottish Evangelicalism, the rift was widening between Evangelical Scottish Dissenters and Evangelicals in the Church of Scotland. While most Scots opposed Catholic Emancipation in 1829, many were divided about the repeal of the Test and Corporation Acts. To Dissenters it appeared that many Church of Scotland ministers, especially Irving and his supporters, were opposed to their repeal. Church of Scotland Evangelicals were increasing in power and after 1834 formed a majority in the Assembly. Chalmers' pet plans for church extension were regarded with grave suspicion by Scottish Dissenters, but the ultimate irony of the Great Disruption made the Church of Scotland Evangelicals into Dissenters for at least a couple of generations.

But during our period, especially its middle part, there was great spiritual activity and co-operation north and south of the border.

With the goal of evangelising the world, which included villages ignorant of the true gospel nearer at home, Evangelicals, filled with optimism from their interpretation of political events, again took the offensive. Denominational barriers were overcome and interdenominational unions and societies flourished (though some for a time only) and denominational differences seemed for a while to be in the melting pot of changing ideas and circumstances. These circumstances were mainly the Industrial Revolution, which packed people together in the anonymity of districts that lacked a church and speeded up the transmission of news, the French Revolution, which raised basic issues about religion and the state and about man as a member of society and as an individual, and the long war that followed, which threw Britons in upon one another and also opened up former French and Dutch colonies to missionary work.

Though the high optimism of 1795 was dimmed by such factors as the passing of time and the death of the pioneers, the hard reality of the missionary task and the recovery of the Papacy, nevertheless Evangelicals pressed on to the great missionary expansion of the nineteenth century.

But denominational differences and church traditions were found to be stubbornly cherished because meaningful, and though there were unions of Christian groups in Scotland and in England and also new groups like Plymouth or Christian Brethrenism, of which the Haldanes were prototypes, the main denominations continued. Gradually they recovered their churchmanship and a high doctrine of the Church to contain and channel their Evangelicals into church-based organisations.

Even so, when confronted with a common foe like a general drift away from the essential Bible doctrines, Evangelicals could still unite to form a loose-knit alliance as that of 1846. And the Evangelical Alliance's first President was John Angell James, Bogue's former student maintained at Robert Haldane's expense.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Alexander, W. Lindsay. *Memoir of the Life and Writings of Ralph Wardlaw*, DD, 2nd edn. Edinburgh, 1856
- Anderson, Hugh. *The Life and Letters of Christopher Anderson*, Edinburgh, 1854
- Balleine, G.R. *A History of the Evangelical Party in the Church of England*, London, 1911
- Beattie, James. *The Haldanes*, Edinburgh, 1880
- Bennett, James. *Memoirs of the Life of the Rev. David Bogue*, DL, London, 1827
- Bennett, James. *History of Dissenters during the last thirty years (from 1808 to 1838)*, London, 1839
- Berg, Johannes Van Den. *Constrained by Jesus' Love, An Inquiry into the Motives of the Missionary Awakening in Great Britain in the Period between 1698 and 1815*, Rotterdam, 1956
- Bogue, David. *A Sermon preached at Salters-Hall, March 30th, 1792 before the Correspondent Board in London of the SSPCK*, London, 1793
- Bogue, David and Bennett, James. *The History of the Dissenters from the Revolution to the Year 1808*, 2 Vols., 2nd edn. London, 1833
- Brown, Ford K. *Fathers of the Victorians*, Cambridge, 1961
- Burder, Henry Foster. *Memoir of the Rev. George Burder*, London, 1833
- Burleigh, J. H. S. *A Church History of Scotland*, Oxford, 1960
- Calder, James. *Scotland's March Past, The Share of Scottish Churches in the LMS*, London, 1945
- Calder, Ralph F.G. *The Congregational Society for Spreading the Gospel in England 1797-1809*, *Transactions of the Congregational Historical Society*, Vol. XIX, No. 6, May 1964, pp. 248-52
- Campbell, John. *Letters and conversational remarks of the Rev. John Newton, during the last eighteen years of his life*, London, 1808
- Campbell, John. *John Angell James: A Review of the History, Character, Eloquence, and Literary Labours*, London, 1860
- Carlyle, Alexander. *Autobiography*, Edinburgh, 1860
- Carpenter, S. C. *Eighteenth Century Church and People*, London 1959

- Carus, William. *Memoirs of the Life of the Rev. Charles Simeon*, MA, 2nd Edn. London, 1847
- Charlesworth, Vernon J. *Rowland Hill and his Life, Anecdotes and Pulpit Sayings*, London, 1877
- Clark, Henry W. *History of English Nonconformity*, Vol. II, London, 1913
- Cole, G. D. H. and Postgate, Raymond. *The Common People 1746-1946*, 4th edn. London, 1949
- Coupland, Sir Reginald. *Wilberforce*, 2nd edn. London, 1945
- Cragg, Gerald R. *The Church and the Age of Reason 1648-1789*, London, 1960
- Daiches, David. *The Paradox of Scottish Culture: The Eighteenth-Century Experience*, Oxford, 1964
- Daiches, David. *Sir Walter Scott and his World*, London, 1971
- Dale, R. W. *A History of English Congregationalism*, London, 1907
- Dallimore, Arnold A. *George Whitefield*, Vol. I, London, 1970
- Douglas, Neil. *Journal of a Mission to part of the Highlands of Scotland in Summer and Harvest 1797*, Edinburgh, 1799
- Driver, A. H. *The LMS and the West Midlands*, 1945
- Elliott-Binns, L. E. *The Early Evangelicals: A Religious and Social Study*, London, 1953
- Escott, Harry. *A History of Scottish Congregationalism*, Glasgow, 1960
- Ewing, Greville. *A Defence of Itinerant and Field Preaching: A Sermon preached before the Society for Gratis Sabbath Schools on 24th December, 1797*, Edinburgh, 1799
- Ewing, Greville. *Facts and Documents respecting the Connections which have subsisted between Robert Haldane Esq. and Greville Ewing*, Glasgow, 1809
- Fawcett, Arthur. *Scottish Lay Preachers in the Eighteenth Century*, article in the *Records of the Scottish Church History Society*, Vol. XII, Pt. II (1955), pp. 97-119
- Fawcett, Arthur. *The Cambuslang Revival*, London, 1971
- Ferguson, William. *Scotland 1689 to the Present*, Edinburgh, 1968

- Fuller, Andrew Gunton. *The Complete Works of Andrew Fuller*, single volume, London, 1853
- Gilbert, Joseph. *Memoir of the Life and Writings of the Rev. Edward Williams, DD*, London, 1825
- Gillies, John. *Memoirs of the Life of Geo. Whitefield, MA*, London, 1772
- Gillies, John. *Historical Collections (with additions, ed. Horatius Bonar)*, Kelso, 1845
- Graham, Henry Grey. *The Social Life of Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*, 2 Vols., London, 1899
- Gray, Nelson. *Greville Ewing: Architect of Scottish Congregationalism*, unpub. Ph.D thesis in University of Edinburgh, 1962
- Gregory, Alfred. *Robert Raikes, Journalist and Philanthropist*, London, 1877
- Haldane, Alexander. *The Lives of Robert Haldane of Airthrey, and of his brother, James Alexander Haldane*, 8th edn. Edinburgh, 1871
- Haldane, Elizabeth S. *The Scotland of our Fathers*, Glasgow, 1933
- Haldane, James Alexander. *Journal of a Tour through the Northern Counties of Scotland and the Orkney Isles*, Edinburgh, 1798
- Haldane, James Alexander. *A View of the Social Worship and Ordinances observed by the first Christians*, Edinburgh, 1805
- Haldane, General Sir J. Aylmer L. *The Haldanes of Gleneagles*, Edinburgh, 1929
- Haldane, Robert. *Address to the Public concerning Political Opinions and Plans Lately Adopted to Promote Religion in Scotland*, Edinburgh, 1800
- Haldane, Robert. *An Answer to Mr. Greville Ewing's Pamphlet entitled 'Facts and Documents, etc.'*, Edinburgh, 1810
- Harcus, Henry. *The History of the Orkney Baptist Churches*, Ayr, 1898
- Hay, James and Belfrage, Henry. *Memoir of the Rev. Alexander Waugh*, DD, 3rd edn. Edinburgh, 1839
- Henderson, G.D. *The Burning Bush: Studies in Scottish Church History*, Edinburgh, 1957
- Hennell, Michael. *John Venn and the Clapham Sect*, London, 1958
- Hill, Rowland. *Journal through the north of England and parts of Scotland, etc.*, London 1799



- Hill, Rowland. A Series of Letters occasioned by the late Pastoral Admonition, etc., Edinburgh, 1799
- Horn, Barbara L. H. (ed.). Letters of John Ramsay of Ochtertyre 1799-1812, Edinburgh, 1966
- Horne, C. Silvester. The Story of the LMS, 2nd edn. London, 1895
- House, Ernest Marshall. Saints in Politics, Toronto, 1952
- Innes, William. Reasons for Separating from the Church of Scotland, Dundee, 1804
- Jamieson, John. Remarks on the Rev. Rowland Hill's Journal etc., Edinburgh, 1799
- Jay, William. The Autobiography and Reminiscences of (ed. by Redford, George and James, John Angell), London, 1854
- Johnston, Thomas. The History of the Working Classes in Scotland, Glasgow, n.d. (1925?)
- Kinniburgh, Robert. Fathers of Independency in Scotland, Edinburgh, 1851
- Kirkland, W. M. Impact of the French Revolution on Scottish Religious Life, with special reference to Thomas Chalmers, Robert Haldane and Neil Douglas, unpub. Ph.D thesis in the University of Edinburgh, 1951
- Knox, Ronald A. Enthusiasm, Oxford, 1950
- Knutsford, Viscountess. Life and Letters of Zachary Macaulay, London, 1900
- Landels, William. The Haldanes, a lecture delivered before the YMCA in Exeter Hall, 6 Dec. 1853
- Love, John. Letters of the late John Love, DD, Glasgow, 1838
- MacInnes, John. The Evangelical Movement in the Highlands of Scotland, Aberdeen, 1951
- Mackay, John. The Church in the Highlands, London, 1914
- Mackenzie, Agnes Mure. Scotland in Modern Times, 1720-1939, London, 1941
- Mackichan, D. The Missionary Ideal in the Scottish Churches, London, 1927
- Macleod, John. Scottish Theology in relation to Church History since the Reformation, Edinburgh, 1843
- MacWhirter, Archibald. The Early Days of Independentism and Congregationalism in the Northern Islands of Scotland, article in the Records of the Scottish Church History Society, Vol. XVI, Pt. I, pp. 63-87

- Martin, Bernard. John Newton, London, 1950
- Matheson, J.J. A Memoir of Greville Ewing by his Daughter,  
London, 1843
- Mathieson, W. L. The Awakening of Scotland 1747-97, Glasgow, 1910
- Meikle, Henry W. Scotland and the French Revolution, Glasgow, 1912
- Miller, Hugh. The Two Parties in the Church of Scotland exhibited  
as Missionary and Anti-missionary, Edinburgh, 1841
- Mitchison, Rosalind. A History of Scotland, London, 1970
- Morgan, Edward. A Brief Memoir of the Life and Labours of the  
Rev. Thomas Charles, AB, 2nd edn. 1831
- Morison, John. The Fathers and Founders of the LMS, 2 Vols.,  
London, n.d. (1840?)
- Morris, J. W. Biographical Recollections of the Rev. Robert Hall,  
AM, London, 1833
- Morris, J. W. Memoirs of the Life and Writings of the Rev. Andrew  
Fuller, London, 1816
- Moule, Handley C. G. Charles Simeon (IVF paperback edn.) London,  
1965
- Murray, Derek B. The First Hundred Years (of Baptist Union of  
Scotland), Glasgow, 1969
- Murray, Iain H. The Puritan Hope, London, 1971
- Naismith, Robert. Robert and James Haldane, Servants of God (in  
series 'Memoirs of Mighty Men', No. 11), London, n.d. (1900?)
- Payne, Ernest A. Before the Start: Steps towards the founding of  
the LMS, London, 1945
- Payne, Ernest A. The Free Church Tradition in the Life of England,  
London, 1944
- Peel, Albert. A Hundred Eminent Congregationalists, London, 1927
- Philip, Robert. The Life, Times and Missionary Enterprises of the  
Rev. John Campbell, London, 1841
- Pollard, Arthur and Hennell, Michael (ed.). Charles Simeon  
(1759-1836), Essays written in commemoration of his Bi-centenary,  
London, 1959
- Ross, James. A History of Congregational Independency in Scotland,  
Glasgow, 1900

- Ryland, John. *The Life and Death of the Rev. Andrew Fuller*,  
2nd edn. London, 1818
- Sands, The Hon. Lord. *The Historical Origins of the Religious  
Divisions in Scotland*, article in the *Records of the Scottish  
Church History Society*, Vol. III, Pt. II, pp. 81-95
- Sibree, John and Caston, M. *Independency in Warwickshire*,  
London, 1855
- Sievwright, James. *Memoirs of the late Rev. Alexander Stewart*,  
DD, 2nd edn. Edinburgh, 1822
- Smout, T. C. *A History of the Scottish People, 1560-1830*, London,  
1969
- Smyth, Charles. *Simeon and Church Order*, Cambridge, 1940
- Smyth, Charles. *The Art of Preaching, 747-1939*, London, 1940
- Stephen, Sir James. *Essays in Ecclesiastical Biography*, 5th edn.  
London, 1867
- Stewart, Alexander. *An Account of a late revival of religion in  
a part of the Highlands of Scotland*, 4th edn. London, 1815
- Stock, Eugene, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, Vol.  
I, London, 1899
- Struthers, Gavin. *History of the Rise, Progress and Principles of  
the Relief Church*, Glasgow, 1843
- Sydney, Edwin. *The Life of the Rev. Rowland Hill, AM*, 4th edn.  
London, 1834
- Taylor, William M. *The Scottish Pulpit from the Reformation to the  
Present Day*, London, 1887
- Terpstra, Chester. *David Bogue, 1750-1825, Pioneer and Missionary  
Educator*, unpub. Ph.D thesis in the University of Edinburgh, 1959
- Thomson, Andrew and Struthers, Gavin. *Historical Sketch of the  
Origin of the Secession Church, and History of the Rise of the  
Relief Church (respectively)*, Edinburgh, 1848
- Underwood, A. C. *A History of the English Baptists*, London, 1947
- Waddington, John. *Congregational History*, Vol. III (1800-1850),  
London, 1878
- Ward, W. R. *Religion and Society in England 1790-1850*, London, 1972

- Watson, John. The Scot of the Eighteenth Century, London, 1907
- Wellwood, Sir Henry Moncreiff. An Account of the Life and  
Writings of John Erskine, DD, Edinburgh, 1818
- Whitefield, George. Journals (Banner of Truth Trust edn.), London,  
1960
- Whitley, W. T. A History of British Baptists, London, 1923
- Wilberforce, Robert Isaac and Samuel. The Life of William  
Wilberforce, 5 Vols., London, 1839
- Williams, Basil. The Whig Supremacy 1714-60, Oxford, 1939
- Wodrow, James and Kenrick, Samuel. Wodrow-Kenrick correspondence  
in MS in Dr. Williams's Library, London, Cat. No. 24.157
- Wood, Arthur Skevington. Thomas Haweis 1734-1820, London, 1957
- Wood, Arthur Skevington. The Inextinguishable Blaze, London, 1960
- Yuille, George (ed.). History of the Baptists in Scotland, Glasgow,  
n.d. (1926?)

- Account of the Proceedings and Debate, in the General Assembly of  
the Church of Scotland, 27th May, 1796, Edinburgh, 1796
- Account of the Proceedings of the Society for Propagating the  
Gospel at Home, from their commencement 28 Dec. 1797 to May  
16, 1799, Edinburgh, 1799
- Acts of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, 1638-1842,  
Edinburgh, 1843
- Biographical Dictionary of Eminent Scotsmen, 3 Vols., London, 1875
- Dictionary of National Biography, 1885-1901, London
- Edinburgh Evangelical Magazine, 1803-05, 3 Vols., Edinburgh
- Evangelical Magazine, 1793-1805, Vols. I - XIII, London
- Missionary Magazine, 1796-1800, Vols. I - V, Edinburgh
- Old Statistical Account of Scotland, 1791-97, Edinburgh
- Sermons preached before the SSPCK, at their Anniversary Meetings,  
June 1796 to June 1800, Edinburgh

## APPENDIX 1.

## Some important dates

- 1770 Death of Whitefield
- 1777 Bogue became Independent minister at Gosport
- 1780 Raikes started Sunday schools at Gloucester
- 1782 Countess of Huntingdon licensed her chapels
- 1783 Rowland Hill's Surrey Chapel opened
  - Eclectic Society started
- 1785 Charles started circulating schools in Wales
  - Wilberforce converted
- 1788 John Campbell started printing tracts
- 1789 Fall of the Bastille (July 14)
  - Welch's plan for academies - Bogue started taking students at Gosport
- 1790 Revival in Bala through Charles's agency
  - Death of John Thornton
- 1791 Death of John Wesley (March 2)
  - Death of Countess of Huntingdon (June 17)
  - Paine's "Rights of Man" published
- 1792 Bogue's SSPCK missionary sermon (March 30)
  - Associated Friends of the People started in Scotland (July 26)
  - Baptist Missionary Society founded (October 2)
- 1793 Circular letter of Warwickshire Association (June)
  - "Evangelical Magazine" started (July)
  - Edinburgh Society for Publishing Religious Tracts founded (July 26)
- 1794 Paine's "Age of Reason" published
  - Ewing and Innes visited London and Bristol (Spring)
  - Act against Wrongous Imprisonment suspended (May)
  - Horne's "Letters on Missions" published
  - Robert Haldane publicly aired his democratic views (July 1)
  - Bogue in "Evangelical Magazine" advocated a missionary society (September)

1795 Campbell's 'deliverance' (January 26); began founding Sunday schools

McLean preached missionary sermon in Edinburgh

The Missionary Society formed in London (September 22)

Conversion of James and Robert Haldane

1796 Glasgow Missionary Society started (February 0)

Erskine urged SSPCK to report on its finances (March 3)

First public meeting of Edinburgh Missionary Society (April 6)

Rev. J. Clark went as a chaplain to Sierra Leone (Spring)

First AGM of LMS (May 11-13)

Anti-Burgher Synod against mixed constitution of missionary societies

Relief Synod in favour of foreign missions (May 18)

Assembly debate on foreign missions (May 27)

R. Haldane in London (May - September); Bogue agreed to accompany him to India (May 22)

Simeon and J. Haldane toured S. Scotland (June 3 - July 16)

First issue of "Missionary Magazine" (July)

"Duff" sailed from Spithead with 30 LMS missionaries (September 24)

R. Haldane and Bogue met Dundas about Bengal mission (December 9)

1797 Glasgow Missionary Society sent two missionaries to Sierra Leone (March 27)

Wilberforce's "Practical View" published (April 12)

Campbell and J. Haldane on Sunday school tour of West Scotland (Spring)

Bogue's plan to propagate the gospel in Hampshire (April)

J. Haldane preached his first sermon (May 6)

Neil Douglas and friend toured Kintyre (July 3 - October)

J. Haldane's tour of N. Scotland (July 12 - November 7)

Naval victory of Camperdown (October 11)

R. Haldane libelled in Professor Robison's book

Campbell's Magdalen Society founded

Edinburgh Gratis Sabbath School Society formed

London Itinerant Society founded

Congregational Society for Spreading the Gospel in England  
founded

Warwickshire Association's plea for union of all serious  
Christians (November 21)

Ewing's Edinburgh sermon on lay preaching (December 24)

1798 SPGH publicly formed (January 11)

Cleghorn and Ballantyne ordained at Gosport (February 7)

R. Haldane hired Edinburgh Circus and planned to bring  
African children to Edinburgh (March)

J. Haldane's "Journal of a Tour" published

J. Rate toured Fife for SPGH (Spring)

Death of Countess of Leven (May 10)

Simeon re-visited Scotland (May 16 - August 23)

Anti-Burgher Synod declared against lay preaching (May)

Relief Synod against unlicensed preachers (May)

Academy for overseas missionaries proposed in "Missionary  
Magazine" (June)

J. Haldane and Aikman toured S. Scotland (June 14 - July 28)

R. Haldane left for good his Airthrey estate (June 16)

West Kent Baptists and Independents united (July 17)

Rowland Hill opened the Edinburgh Circus as a Haldane  
Tabernacle (July 29)

R. Haldane and R. Hill left Scotland for England (September 3)

J. Bennett opened Aberdeen Congregational Chapel (September 16)

Interdenominational Religious Society formed at Old Deer,  
Aberdeenshire (November 24)

Ewing left Church of Scotland ministry (December 1)

Great spread of county associations in England

1799 Ewing started Haldane seminary in Edinburgh (January 2)

J. Haldane ordained as minister of Edinburgh Circus Congre-  
gational Church (February 3)

Cleghorn became pastor at Wick Tabernacle (March 27)

A. Stewart preached course of sermons at Moulin during which  
revival came (March - July)

CMS formed in London (April 12)

- Ewing became pastor of Glasgow Tabernacle (May)
- J. Ritchie replaced Ewing as "Missionary Magazine" editor (May)
- Z. Macaulay arrived in England with 24 African children for R. Haldane but they stayed in London (May)
- Tour of J. Haldane, Innes and Aikman to Shetland (May 7 - September 20)
- Relief Synod attacked unlicensed preachers (May)
- R. Hill's "Journal" published (before May 20)
- Assembly's Acts against vagrant teachers and unlicensed preachers and its Pastoral Admonition against the SPGH (June 3)
- R. Haldane dropped African children scheme (June 18)
- G. Cowie left Church of Scotland ministry for SPGH (July)
- R. Hill opened Glasgow Tabernacle (July 28)
- A. Fuller preached in Edinburgh Circus church (October 13)
- Religious Tract Society formed in London
- Pitt's Bill to prevent unlicensed preaching in preparation
- 1800 Second SPGH seminary class began, under Innes at Dundee (January)
- Three Edinburgh missionaries for Jamaica set apart (February 1)
- R. Haldane's "Address to the Public" published (May)
- J. Haldane and Campbell toured S. Scotland, including Arran and Kintyre (June 9 - Autumn)
- J. Love ordained minister at Anderston Chapel (July)
- Bogue appointed tutor for LMS missionaries (August)
- Congregational church formed under Ewing in Glasgow (August 15)
- Northern Scottish Missionary Society formed (August 27)
- Dundee Tabernacle under Innes opened (October 19)
- Ewing's Glasgow Tabernacle started celebrating the Lord's Supper every Sunday
- 1801 J. Aikman ordained in the Edinburgh Circus (May 17)
- J. Haldane preached in and around Dumfries and then in Ulster (May - October)
- New Edinburgh Tabernacle in Leith Walk opened (July)
- 1802 Ewing resigned as seminary tutor



- Evangelical Society of Ulster formed (March)
- Aikman's North College Street Chapel opened (June 2)
- Bogue, Waugh, Hardcastle and Wilks to France for IMS (September)
- Fuller's second visit to Scotland (September)
- 1803 "Edinburgh Evangelical Magazine" started (January)
- Death of Dr. Erskine (January 19)
- War with France resumed (May)
- Ewing preached at IMS meetings (May)
- Glasgow Religious Tract Society formed (June)
- Dr. Stuart baptised George Barclay (October 6)
- Churches of J. Haldane and Aikman planned to send out  
their own overseas missionaries
- 1804 Campbell ordained at Kingsland Chapel, London
- British and Foreign Bible Society founded (March 7)
- 1805 J. Haldane's "View of the Social Worship" published
- Fuller's third visit to Scotland (June, July)
- Two overseas missionaries ordained at the Edinburgh Tabernacle  
(August)
- Barclay baptised Archibald Smith
- 1806 J. Haldane's former co-pastor, William Stepehns, became a  
Baptist
- Aikman became editor of the "Missionary Magazine"
- 1807 Sierra Leone Company taken over by the British Government
- Abolition of the British slave trade
- 1808 Haldanes became Baptists
- Anderson and Barclay toured Ireland
- Fuller's fourth visit to Scotland (October)
- Ewing officially resigned from SPGH
- SPGH seminary closed (December)
- 85 Congregational churches in Scotland
- 1810 R. Haldane's final refutation of Ewing's charges published
- Innes became a Baptist
- Edinburgh Bible Society formed
- Fuller's "Strictures on Sandemanianism" published

- 1811 Dr. Ryland and Sutcliff toured Scotland for the BMS
- 1812 55 churches formed the Congregational Union in Scotland
- 1813 Fuller's last tour to Scotland
- 1814 Scott's novel "Waverley" published
  - Campbell returned from inspecting LMS work in South Africa  
(May)
- 1815 End of Napoleonic War
- 1816 Bogue and Bennett visited the Netherlands for the LMS
- 1819 Haweis's criticism to Burder of Bogue (November 18)
- 1823 Scottish Customs and Excise Boards abolished
- 1824 Foreign Mission Committee of the General Assembly created
  - Rowland Hill's final visit to Scotland
- 1826 Suspension of bank notes controversy in Scotland
- 1827 Andrew Thomson resigned his BFBS membership
- 1831 Congregational Union formed in England
  - On Thomson's death Chalmers becomes leader of the Church of  
Scotland Evangelicals
- 1834 Evangelicals in the majority in the General Assembly