Turner's and Shitao's Wild Mountains and Waters:

Towards a Phenomenology of Radical Landscape Painting

In Two Volumes

Vol. 1

Qinghong Rao

University of Glasgow

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)
History of Art Department
School of Culture & Creative Art, College of Arts,
University of Glasgow

April 2022

Abstract

This thesis establishes a research method for interpreting radical landscape paintings in various cultures. The research was prompted by the challenge caused by cultural differences in interpreting landscape paintings of different cultures and the solution provided by the thesis is the newly established research method, which aims to capture an individual artist's compositional intention in a particular radical landscape painting, and to reveal the meaning of the particular painting, irrespective of its cultural background. The radical landscape painting in this research is a description of the landscape paintings that are creatively and inventively composed to represent radical features of the wild mountains and waters that exist in reality, for expressing some meanings.

The research method is adopted in phenomenology, a philosophy of human perception. This study takes the principles of phenomenology – *Epoché* and *Réduction* – as its basic principles, and the essential notion of phenomenology – intentionality – as the theoretical foundation. The method essentially addresses the first-hand experience and the perception of the first-hand experience that of various objects, which particularly refer to the objective radical landscape painting, the corresponding physical landscape, and other related objects. By examining and analysing the various firs-hand experiences, the method helps to grasp the artist's compositional intention in the painting, thus revealing the meaning of the artwork.

In order to assess the effectiveness of the method, the study applies it in two case studies that interpret British painter J. M. W. Turner's watercolour, *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* and Chinese painter Shitao's ink painting, *Mount Lu*. The outcomes demonstrate that, regard to the radical landscape painting, the phenomenological method is effective in accessing the artists' compositional intention and revealing the meaning of the paintings, despite cultural differences that exist among the painting, artist, and interpreter.

The main contribution of this study to art history studies is it provides a new method for grasping an artist's compositional intention and discovering the distinguish artistic value of a particular radical landscape painting, from the reciprocal perspective of how the artist composed it and how the viewer can experience it.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

Table 1: Translations to and Interpretations of *fa*, 法, धर्म, and 'dharma'.

List of Figures

Acknowledgements

Chapter One: Introduction

This thesis establishes a research method for interpreting radical landscape paintings in various cultures. In this thesis, radical landscape painting is a description of the landscape paintings that are creatively and inventively composed to represent radical features of the wild mountains and waters that exist in reality, for expressing some meanings.[1] The research was prompted by the challenge arising from cultural differences when interpreting landscape paintings of various cultures and historic periods. The solution provided by the thesis is the newly established research method that is adopted in phenomenology. In order to evaluate the effectiveness of the method, the research applied it to the interpretation of two radical landscape paintings: *Loch Coruisk, Skye* (Figure 1), by the British painter J. M. W. Turner (1775–1851 AD), and *Mount Lu* (Figure 67) by the Chinese painter Shitao (1636–1707 AD).

Wild mountains and waters exist before the human eyes see them; when the human eyes see them, they are the wild landscape or scenery. When an artist represents them in a picture, the appearance of the wild mountains and waters becomes the content of a wild landscape painting. Since every artist has a cultural background, which affects their way of seeing and painting, cultural properties are given to the wild landscape painting during the composition process. Moreover, patrons, commissioners, and viewers may have an impact on the content and form of the painting, thus also affecting its cultural expression. Consequently, wild landscape paintings of various cultures are very different in their ways of representation and expression. The question thus arises – How can we understand wild landscape paintings from different cultures?

Such issues have been discussed from a broader perspective in James Elkins' "Art History as a Global Discipline" and *Chinese Landscape Paintings as Western Art History.* Elkins asked 'can the method, concepts, and purposes of Western art history be suitable for art outside of Europe and North America? If not, are there alternatives that are compatible

---

[1] See the full description of radical landscape painting on Pages 22-24.

with existing modes of art history?'[2] His observation was that the narrative system of Western art history could not describe classical Chinese art successfully.[3] Elkins also quoted James Cahill's argument that indicated to construct a comparison from historical perspectives between Western and Chinese cultures was optimal and crucial, yet the impetus usually came from the West.[4] Likewise, the narrative system of Chinese art history could not describe Western art successfully. So Elkins' discussion underlines that it is very difficult to find a universal approach of understanding, describing, and interpreting paintings in various cultures.

Another relevant discussion is found in David Carrier's philosophical work *A World Art History and Its Objects.* Carrier suggested that 'we perhaps cannot understand exotic paintings as did people within their original culture'.[5] Carrier's studies covered European, Chinese, Islamic, and Indian art and he asserts that it is important to understand every art within its tradition as this not only relates to international justice but also contributes to developing a critical perspective on Western tradition. Carrier's discussion referenced Ernst Gombrich's and Richard Wollheimthe's points of view on this issue.

Gombrich asked the well-known question: 'Why is it that different ages and different nations have represented the visible world in such different ways?'[6] Carrier noted that, in *The Story of Art,* Gombrich sought to link earlier and later arts in the history of the world to form a general global narrative of art history. Moreover, in *Art and Illusion,* Gombrich employed the concept of 'schemata' to describe the process of making art in different cultures. Carrier explained how schemata functioned in Gombrich's narrative of art history. For Gombrich, from ancient Greek art to the Renaissance, there was a 'making the ancient Greek art the schemata'; and the schemata were then modified until they matched what

---

[2] James Elkins, "Art History As A Global Discipline," in *Is Art History Global?,* ed. James Elkins (London and New York: Routledge, 2013), 3.

[3] James Elkins, *Chinese Landscape Painting as Western Art History* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2010), 11–13.

[4] Quoted by Elkins, in *Chinese Landscape Painting as Western Art History*, 11–13.

[5] David Carrier, *A World Art History and Its Objects* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2008), 52.

[6] Ernst Gombrich, *Art And Illusion* (Washington DC: Phaidon Press, 1959), 3.

Renaissance artists wanted to represent.[7] Carrier noted that Gombrich's way started from addressing illusionistic art and then Gombrich described the historical process as 'the gradual perfection of naturalism' in European art history.[8] He indicated that Gombrich's way could not address the art of non-European cultures, such as classical Chinese landscape painting, because naturalism had not been the goal of Chinese landscape painting since early eras of ancient China, as Osvald Sirén and Michael Sullivan underlined.[9] Carrier also discussed Wollheim's psychoanalytic account of the artist's intention in Wollheim's interpretations of the meaning of paintings. Carrier remarked that Wollheim's approach can be applied to address the classical European artworks, but cannot to artworks in every culture.[10] Carrier's studies indicate that cultural difference is an unavoidable challenge in understanding and interpreting artworks from different cultures.

The discussions of Elkins and Carrier both indicate that it is very difficult to build a universal narrative system or to find a universal method to interpret landscape paintings in various cultures and cultural difference is unavoidable. Then, 'How can we understand wild landscape paintings from different cultures?' This research addresses the issue from another dimension. It starts from considering the generality of humanity, and then goes for the peculiarity or singularity – the distinctive features – of a particular landscape painting by a particular artist. General humanity manifests in every culture, and also manifests in the practices of every individual member of a culture, such as the practice of an artist's making a landscape painting. Therefore, on the ground of humanity, theoretically, mutual understanding among various cultures, among landscape paintings in various cultures, is not impossible. In this respect, cultural difference is not a barrier to be overcome; rather, it

---

[7] David Carrier, "Ernst Gombrich's Account of Chinese Painting", in *ART and the MIND*, ed. Sybille Moser-Ernst (Gottingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2018), 390.

[8] Carrier, "Ernst Gombrich's Account of Chinese Painting", 381.

[9] Carrier, "Ernst Gombrich's Account of Chinese Painting", 388.
Osvald Sirén, *Chinese Painting Leading Masters and Principles Vol.1* (London: London Humphries, 1958),189.
Michael Sullivan, *Symbols of Eternity* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1979), 17.

[10] Carrier recaptured Wollheim's approach in *A World Art History and Its Objects*, 78.
See also:
Richard Wollheim, *Painting as an Art* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).
Rob Van Gerwen, ed., *Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation and Expression* (Cambridge University Press, 2001), 241-63.

is the approach to the understanding of how the essence of mankind manifests in different cultures, in different artworks, with different appearances and forms, and in different manners. More than that, the formation and development of cultural systems rely on the factual practices and acts of every individual, and on how and why these individual acts occur in particular ways. The acts of individuals are cultural and historical facts and every fact has its consequence in culture and history, even though the consequence may be invisible to some eyes at some times. Without links to the acts of individuals, culture and tradition are merely concepts and words.

Therefore, on the ground of humanity, there is a possibility to understand the peculiarity – the distinctive features – of a particular artwork by an individual artist in a different culture; moreover, understanding the peculiarity of an individual artist's particular composition can help to understand the particular manifestation of the artist's culture and tradition in the individual artwork. Further, understanding the peculiarity of an individual artwork is important, because it is not only about contributing to develop multiple and critical perspectives for interpreting artworks in various cultures, but also about 'inter-individual justice' – to respect the distinctiveness of a particular painting and to understand the painting as an object intentionally created by an individual artist; this is a further developed thought based on Carrier's thinking on international (or inter-cultural) justice.

Therefor, the big question of 'How can we understand wild landscape paintings from different cultures?' can be narrowed down to 'How can we understand the peculiarity of a particular wild landscape painting by an individual painter from a different culture?' That is to say, to some extent, the challenge raised by cultural differences is reduced and may also be resolved in individual cases, if we can understand and interpret the peculiarity of a particular painting.

In practice, the peculiarity or singularity of a painting is determined by the artist's compositional intention, produced by the artist's compositional acts, and displayed by the composed picture. In the above-mentioned studies by Gombrich and Wollheim, the research finds some basic facts and possibilities related to exploring the artist's compositional intention and acts.

The first is Gombrich's 'schemata'. Gombrich provided a particular example of how some Chinese painters needed these schemata to depict a physical landscape: being surrounded

by nature, a painter looked for 'the sights which can be matched successfully with the schemata he has learned to handle'; these sights then became the centre of the scene that the painter could render.[11] Gombrich's 'painting according to schemata' is one factual manner of composing landscape painting. However, many others manners exist. For example, the artist's composition is triggered by an attempt to depict the innate character or disposition of an object or figure. Moreover, culture and tradition may form schemata in the minds of some artists, but others may transcend the impact of their culture and tradition by letting their spontaneous interest and creative mind drive their artistic composition. Making art is one of the most creative, dynamic, and intellectual phenomena of human activities, standard schemata can not limit the artist's imagination and creativity, even merely within Western culture.

Nevertheless, Gombrich's idea outlined the importance of exploring the process of composition for understanding an artwork, even though his exploration merely focused on schemata. The point is that perceiving the factual process of composition is essentially perceiving the artist's compositional acts, which can be the approach to the artist's compositional intention and expression. Moreover, Gombrich rightly emphasised the role of subjectivity in an artist's composition, though the subjectivity in his study relates to the using of schemata. The fact is that subjectivity has the potential to promote an artist not to mechanically imitate or record an object or figure in a painting, or not to follow a schema to form a picture, but to render a creative and inventive idea in a picture. Last, Gombrich rightly noted the 'beholder's share' in the meaning of a painting: beholders' illusion or imagination may be a component of their interpretations and reception of an artwork.[12] However, for Gombrich, the 'beholder's share' is rooted in the beholder's expectation of an artwork, as if a beholder also has 'schemata'. This may be true in some situations, but Gombrich missed the situation of 'encountering an artwork'.

'Encountering an artwork' in this thesis refers to the situation of seeing a painting for the first time and without any knowledge of it, or seeing a known or seen painting incidentally without expectation or preparation. When people encounter a painting, they may gain immediate perception, imagination, or inspiration directly from the picture itself, not the

---

[11] Gombrich, *Art And Illusion*, 73.

[12] ibid, 236.

schemata. Also when a beholder encounters a painting from a different culture, to some extent, without knowing the work's background, the beholder may still be empathic with the content of the painting or perceive the artist's expression through merely seeing the picture itself. In this situation, the 'beholder's share' to the interpretation of the significance of a painting is individual, original, and can be creative and imaginative.

The second useful finding is Wollheim's indication that it is possible to grasp an artist's intention and reveal the meaning of a painting through analysing the picture and the manner of the artist's painting. According to Wollheim, an artist's painting style – the particular way of forming the picture – is performed by the artist's intentional acts, through which the artist's psychological intention manifests. Thus, by examining the painting style (marks of the artist's intentional acts in the painting), the meaning of a painting (psychological realities of the artist's composition) may be revealed.

Wollheim's 'style' refers to the psychological realities reflected in an artist's work and thus differs from the meaning of style in art history, wherein 'style' refers to both the general painting style of a school or a period in history and the specific painting style of an artist, for the establishment or defence of connoisseurship. As regards Wollheim's exploration of the meaning of a painting via an artist's style, Carrier argued that the psychological realities described by Wollheim in the paintings were redundant and visually unconvincing.[13] Daniel Herwitz argued that the psychoanalytic account missed the social conventions and political ideologies conveyed by the picture.[14] For this thesis, Wollheim's method importantly indicates that the objective picture of a great painting may have meaning and Wollheim's notion of style reflects the peculiarity of a painting related with the artist's individual intention – these are as important as the social conventions and political ideologies that the painting may convey to the studies of art history.

---

[13] David Carrier, "In Praise of Connoisseurship," *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 61, no. 2 (2003): 162.
  See also:
    Richard Wollheim, "Freud and the Understanding of Art," in *On Art and the Mind* (Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1974), 202-219.
    Richard Wollheim, "Criticism as Retrieval" in *Art and Its Objects* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1980), 185-204.

[14] Daniel Herwitz, "The Work of Art as Psychoanalytical Object," *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 49, no. 2 (1991): 138.

The problem of Wollheim's account is that psychological realities exist in every person's acts. When Wollheim explored the artist's intention in a painting, the psychological realities or styles of both the artist and the interpreter affect the interpretation. Difference between the two kinds of psychological reality is that the former is the target, being interpreted, the later the style or manner of Wollheim, the interpreter. Thus, Wollheim's psychoanalytic interpretation may mix the two kinds of psychological realities. Also, Wollheim's style underlines only the realties seen from his perspective which is different from others, thus Wollheim's psychological interpretation can be unconvincing for others.

Nonetheless, the value of Wollheim's studies for this research lies in the light he shed on the possibilities of grasping the artist's intention and revealing the meaning of a painting. These possibilities come from two important characteristics common to great artworks: first, that the artwork bears a peculiar meaning and the artist's intention constitutes that meaning; second, that the artist's intention is performed by the artist's intentional acts, which leave pictorial reality or marks in the painting.

In summary, Gombrich's exploration of the process of making art reveals some basic facts of artistic composition: an artist can subjectively render an idea in a painting during the process of composition, and the beholders' interpretation contributes to the interpretations of the meaning and significance of a painting. Wollheim's exploration, in turn, shows the possibility of grasping an artist's intention and revealing the peculiar meaning of a painting through investigating the pictorial marks left by the artist's intentional acts in the painting.

Therefore, to answer 'How can we understand the peculiarity of a particular wild landscape painting by an individual painter from a different culture?', the research starts by considering the facts and possibilities revealed in the above studies and considering them in the exploration of how to grasp the artist's intention in a painting and reveal the meaning of a picture. The artist's intention in this research is not the artist's psychological intention from Wollheim's studies but, rather, the artist's 'compositional intention', the particular intention to compose a particular painting. Importantly, compositional intention is a performed intention. It is performed through the artist's compositional acts, of which the composed picture is the objective consequence. Theoretically, by scrutinising the objective picture and the pictorial elements, the research may retrieve some of the artist's compositional acts. Further, by examining the concrete pictorial consequence of the key

compositional acts of the artist, the research may reveal the artist's compositional intention and the meaning of the painting to some extent, regardless of the existence of cultural differences between artist, artwork, and interpreter. Also, in this thesis, the meaning of the painting is not about the psychological realities, but the artist's compositional intention performed by compositional acts and the artist's expression through the composed picture.

To achieve its goal, this study establishes a method adopted in phenomenology. Phenomenology is the philosophy of human perception and advocates 'we must go back to the "things themselves"'.[15] It studies the essence of human experience of things or objects. The advantage of the phenomenological method to this research lies in the strength of phenomenology – to perceive things based on the factual experience of things and awareness of the meaning of the experience.

The practical significance of using the phenomenological method relates to how paintings are seen today. The development of internet technology and digital reproduction offer unprecedented convenience for seeing images of paintings, without limitations of time or space. Pictures of great paintings from different cultures and historical times are easily found, together with numerous digital reproductions and derivations presented on the screens of laptop, tablet, and smartphone. In this situation, the phenomenological method, which underlines gaining first-hand experience of the things themselves, may contribute to beholders or interpreters' perception of a radical landscape painting, by dropping an anchor on the original objective things, such as the original painting and the corresponding physical landscape, whence to start the seeing, perceiving, understanding, interpreting, and imagining.

1. Radical Landscape Painting

Radical landscape painting in this thesis is a description of a certain kind of landscape painting and the study did not realise the existence of this certain kind of landscape painting until the end of the two case studies. The term 'radical' is usually associated with aggression, extremism, or absolutism, especially in political contexts. However, if we return to the original meaning of the word 'radical', it first means 'proceeding directly

---

[15] Edmund Husserl, *Logical Investigations I*, trans. J. N. Findlay (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1970), 168.

from the root or origin' or 'relating to the basic nature of something, fundamental'.[16] In much academic writing, especially phenomenological writing, 'radical' is frequently used to mean 'relating to the basic nature of something'. In this thesis, the word 'radical' is used to mean 'fundamental, essential, and relating to the basic nature of something'.

Radical landscape painting is initially the description of the two landscape paintings in the two case studies of the thesis. During the process of research, following the principle of phenomenology – going to the things themselves, I looked many landscape paintings. When I encountered the two, they attracted me among other paintings by their intrinsic characteristics, which caused me to study them further by applying the phenomenological method. So it was the intrinsic characteristics of the two paintings that caused them to be studied in the two cases, or caused them to be selected into the research. The results of the two case studies show that three common features of the two paintings that can define what the kind of landscape painting there are, or what is a radical landscape painting in terms of this thesis; or in other words, what kind of landscape painting that can be effectively interpreted by applying the phenomenological method established in this thesis. This suggests, other landscape paintings that bear the three features are radical landscape painting and probably can be effectively interpreted by the phenomenological method established in this thesis. Note that, the three common features are not only about the content or appearance of the painting, but more importantly, about how the painters composed them. Also, the 'radical' of 'radical landscape painting' refers to the radical features of a wild landscape that exists in reality, and the artist captured and inventively used them to compose a new landscape on painting substrate, for expressing some meanings.

The three common features are:

1. **The painted landscape is a picture of wilderness, and the wild mountain and water, as well as their relationships in the picture, are the essential constituents of the picture. '**The picture of wilderness' in this thesis means no buildings, ruins, roads, livestock, machines or equipments are in the picture; and the scene is not of a farm,

---

[16] *Compact Oxford English Dictionary*, eds. Catherine Soanes and Sara Hawker, 3rd ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000).

The "King's English" Dictionary, eds. A.M. Williams, Frederick T. Smith, and J.M. Parrish (London: British Books Limited, 1925).

village, or garden, etc. There may be human figures in the wilderness but they are visitors or isolated recluses, not field workers, landlords, or inhabitants.

The two case studies of the thesis show that, in the two landscape paintings, wild mountain and water are the essential pictorial elements, together with the pictorial and spatial relationships between them in the picture, which provide the least enough pictorial objects for the studies to gain enough first-hand experience; and gaining enough first-hand experience is the necessary condition of applying the phenomenological method effectively. For this thesis, it is unknown whether or not the phenomenological method can be effectively applied on the wild landscape paintings that are **with only one** element (only the wild mountain or wild water, eg the seascape), or **without both** of the two elements (eg desert landscape and grand wild plain), to demonstrate which other experimental case studies are needed. Thus, the notion of radical landscape painting in this thesis is presently not applicable to the wild landscape paintings that with only wild mountain or wild water, or without both of them.

2. **The composition of a radical landscape painting is based on the physically existing wild mountains and waters, which the painter has experienced in person.** Therefore the painter paints the wilderness of the natural things according to first-hand experience, not an idea, formulation, or 'schema'. Moreover, a radical landscape painting represents the radical features of the wild mountains and waters – the innate characteristics that distinguish the particular mountains and waters from the others.

3. **A radical landscape painting is not a realistic portrait of the corresponding physical landscape, but an inventively composed pictorial landscape, through which the artist expresses a meaning.** That is to say, the artist selects and depicts the wild natural things of the physical landscape, in order to use them as raw material to inventively create a new pictorial landscape, which bears a meaning (or multiple meanings) the artist intended to express.

In summary, the common features of the two paintings in the case studies define the essential content of 'a radical landscape painting'. The essential elements of a radical landscape painting are the wild mountain and water, as well as the relationships between them in the picture. Therefore, a radical landscape is not natural but artistically made. It is generated from wild nature and composed to express a meaning. The painter experiences

the wild mountains and waters in person not only for capturing their radical features, but also for collecting raw materials for composing an imaginary pictorial landscape. The ultimate aim of composing a radical landscape is to make artistic expression – projecting or visualising phenomena of humankind in the appearance of natural things in the painting, such as a person's character, perception of a situation, state of mind, or an atmosphere felt by a person, or a feeling, emotion, and mood of a person or a group of people, etc.

A radical landscape painting may be commissioned or supported by a patron, but the subject, content, and pictorial form are essentially demanded and decided by the painter, such that the painter can make the expression they intend to individually.

For the viewer and interpreter, a radical landscape painting is usually attractive at first glance but demands further perception and is better seen more than twice, with consciousness and self-consciousness, or awareness and self-awareness. The process of seeing requires perception, reflection, and imagination. A radical landscape painting may not provide an immediately pleasant visual experience, since the wild natural elements of the painting may not be in perfect charming or harmony; however, aesthetic satisfaction is always the reward for viewers who recognise the meaning expressed by the artist and are inspired by the creative manner.

The quantity of radical landscape paintings may not be as great as of other landscape paintings, such as rural, garden, or pastoral landscapes, but they are important to the studies of history, culture, and humanity. Specific studies on this kind of painting are rare, and radical landscape paintings deserve more attention. The contribution of this research to the discipline of art history is to highlight this kind of landscape art and to inspire further exploration.

2. Various Interpretations of Landscape

Academic studies address and interpret landscape in various ways. This section compares interpretations of the landscape from various disciplines, in order to define further the target, method, and aim of this research. First, this section displays meanings of the notion 'landscape' in English and corresponding words in Chinese, to underline the different ways of seeing and describing landscape in the two cultures.

In English, the definition of 'landscape' in *The "King's English" Dictionary* is 'a portion of land or territory that the eye can comprehend in a single view' and 'a picture exhibiting some real or fancied inland scene in nature.'[17] The *Compact Oxford English Dictionary* defines the term as 'all the visible features of an area of land; a picture of an area of countryside'.[18] H. P. Duchemin found that the word first appeared in printed English in Michael Drayton's *The Barons Wars* (1603 AD), where it refers to the appearance of the rocky Mount Cynthus, a pictorial component of a painting mentioned by the poet.[19]

The Chinese translation of 'landscape' is *fengjing* 風景, which consists of two independent characters – *feng* 風 and *jing* 景. *Feng* first appeared c. 1100 BC in inscriptions on bones or tortoise shells of the Shang dynasty, and meant 'the winds come from eight directions [representing all directions]'.[20] Later, this meaning expanded to 'the style or fashion of a folklore'. *Jing* appeared later in c. 100 AD and originally meant 'the sunlight', later expanded to 'scenery'. The combined word *fengjing* appeared in Chinese text in c. 400 AD in a poem by Tao Yunming 陶淵明 (365–427 AD) and described the landscape the poet saw under the autumn sky, in the clear moving air and sunlight.[21] *Fengjing* has a synonym, *shanshui* 山水, which refers to the landscape of mountains (*shan* 山) and waters (*shui* 水).

---

[17] *The "King's English" Dictionary.*

[18] *Compact Oxford English Dictionary.*

[19] H. P. Duchemin, ''Michael Drayton's Poly Olbion: A Critical and Historical Study'' (PhD diss., Birkbeck College, University of London, 1975), 463–64.

Michael Drayton, *The Barons' Wars, Nymphidia, and Other Poems* (London: George Routledge & Sons, 1887), 141–2:

Wherein the painter so explained their joy
As he had meant the very life to limn
For on their brows he made the drops so clear
That through each drop their fair skins did appear.

By them in **landscape** rocky Cynthus reared,
With the clouds leaning on his loft crown,
...

[20] The original Chinese: '风, 八风也'; '景, 光也', in Xu Shen 許慎, 說文解字 (*Explanations of Characters and Words*), ed. Xu Xian 徐鉉 (Hong Kong: Zhong Hua Shuju, 1972), 138, 248.

[21] The original Chinese written by Tao Yuanming 陶淵明: '露凝无游氛, 天高风景澈', from "和郭主簿二首 (Two Poems Matching Guo's Rhymes)", in 箋註陶淵明集 (*Collection of Tao Yuanming's Works with Notes*) (Jin dynasty; reprint, 四部叢刊初編 [The First Published Version of Sibu Congkan], 景上海涵芬樓藏宋刊巾箱本 [Jing Shanghai Hanfenlou Collected Song Dynasty Portable Version], Song dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 2, no. 44, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/=189448

The definition of *fengjing* is broader than that of *shanshui* and refers to all kinds of landscape scenery, from great plains to small gardens, including vast seascape and desert.

Note that the definitions of the word 'landscape' in the dictionaries and the interpretations of landscape in academic studies are two different matters. The former are definitions of 'what is landscape', showing how the word is commonly understood and used in language, to describe and represent 'landscape' the physical thing (the physical land or the physical painting); while the latter are interpretations of what happened in or to the physical landscape, of what happened when landscape (the thing) is seen or painted, and of what is perceived or revealed when the landscape painting is seen or studied. Academic interpretations aim at exploring the meaning of human activities on or related to the landscape from various perspectives. Thus, interpretations of landscape cannot substitute the dictionary definitions of the word. When interpreters say 'landscape is...', the reader needs to be aware of what they are referring to, the objective thing of 'landscape' represented by the word, or the interpretation of a 'landscape' from a particular perspective; and the later cannot substitute the former.

Landscape is the target of studies in the disciplines of history, cultural geography, anthropology, and more. In W. G. Hoskins' *The Making of The English Landscape*, the English landscape is a historical process, tightly linked to the rural culture and history of the local inhabitants and the landscape refers to the milieu of human activities and also human resources and property.[22] In his cultural geographical study *Prospect, Perspective and the Evolution of the Landscape Idea*, Denis E. Cosgrove argues that 'landscape as a geographical concept cannot be free of the ideological overlays of its history as a visual concept', which 'is suffused by connotations of authority, control and ownership'.[23] In his work jointly authored with Stephen Daniels, *Iconography of Landscape,* they assert that landscape is 'a cultural image, a pictorial way of representing, structuring, or symbolising surroundings'.[24] Hence, for Cosgrove's cultural geography studies, landscape is a visual concept that conveys ideological and cultural meaning. Tim Ingold argues that landscape

---

[22] W. G. Hoskins, The Making of The English Landscape (London: Penguin, 1985).

[23] Denis Cosgrove, "Prospect, Perspective and the Evolution of the Landscape Idea", *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 10, no. 1 (1985): 45, 55.

[24] Denis Cosgrove and Stephen Daniels, *The Iconography of Landscape* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 1.

'is not a picture in the imagination, surveyed by the mind's eye; nor, however, is it an alien and formless substrate awaiting the imposition of human order'.[25] For Ingold, landscape refers to humans' lived-in environment, a kind of natural force physically engaged with human life.

Briefly summarising the interpretations of landscape in the above studies, for the history of landscape, it is the milieu of human activities; for anthropological studies, it is a medium that relates people's lives and their lived-in environment; for studies in cultural geography, landscape is a visual representation of structuring and ordering in human societies, or ideologically and culturally symbolised surroundings. Note that the landscape interpreted by above disciplines refers to the physical landscape in reality, and the researchers may also concern with the relationship between the physical landscape and its representation in words and images, etc. While in the discipline of art history the target of landscape interpretation is the landscape painting – the artistic representation of a physical landscape, or a creatively composed imaginary pictorial landscape, or a mixture of the both. Thus, for interpreting landscape painting in art history studies, a research may need to deal with two landscape objects, the artistically created pictorial landscape on painting substrate and the physical landscape in reality.

In his work *Landscape into Art,* Kenneth Clark describes the natural landscape and its relation to landscape paintings as:

> We are surrounded with things which we have not made and which have a life
> and structure different from our own ... for centuries they have inspired us with
> curiosity and awe ... We have recreated them in our imaginations to reflect our
> moods.[26]

Clark also underlined how landscape paintings, especially in eighteenth – and nineteenth – century England, recorded humans' consciousness and its tendency to appreciate natural beauty and to build harmonious relationships with their natural surroundings.

To some extent, the description of wild landscape in this thesis echoes Clark's description of natural landscape on the foundation of that physical natural landscapes are not made by human and have innate natural order and properties. This research agrees with Clark on the

---

[25] Tim Ingold, "The Temporality of the Landscape", *World Archaeology* 25, no. 2 (October 1993): 154.

[26] Kenneth Clark, *Landscape into Art* (London: J. Murray, 1976), 1.

points that natural physical landscape and landscape painting are essentially related and the physical natural landscape is one resource for artistic inspiration, imagination, and creativity. However, different from Clark's interpretation of the history of landscape art in Western Europe, in this thesis, interpretations of landscape art are specifically regarding to the two radical landscape paintings from British and Chinese culture and in different historical eras. Moreover, the focus of this research is the individual artists' compositional intention and the meaning of the particular radical pictures, not the history of the aesthetic idea of landscape in various cultures.

In contrast to Clark, W. J. T. Mitchell interprets the landscape painting in Western Europe from a different perspective – the perspective of 'imperial landscape', which is a political and ideological perspective. In the beginning of his essay "Imperial Landscape", Mitchell strongly states his interpretation of landscape with nine terms and the basic points include 'landscape painting is a medium of exchange…like money', 'landscape is a medium found in all cultures' and 'a particular historical formation associated with European imperialism', and landscape is 'no longer viable as a mode of artistic expression.'[27]

Mitchell does not consider the essential relationship between natural physical landscape and landscape painting, nor the relationship between people's capability of experiencing, appreciating natural landscapes and people's capability of perceiving, appreciating artistic landscape paintings. He suggests physical landscape is also a medium and cultural meanings and values are encoded in the moment of its beholding.[28] Based on these thoughts, he challenges Clark's idea that landscape painting reflects humans' appreciation of natural beauty. Mitchell indicates that the rulers or the dominant class are the aesthetic appreciators of the natural beauty of the rural landscape, where the poor peasants live a hard life. Mitchell is right to point out the hypocrites who tried to use their 'innocent idealism' or their aesthetic expression of natural beauty, to cover their own 'moral, ideological, and political darkness'.[29] However, Mitchell ignores the fact that appreciating natural beauty (in both the physical landscape or landscape painting) is an ability belonging equally to every individual who has body, feeling, and mind. Let alone, the

---

[27] W. J. T. Mitchell, "Imperial Landscape", in *Landscape and Power*, ed. W. J. T. Mitchell (1994; reprint, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002), 5.

[28] Mitchell, "Imperial Landscape", 14.

[29] ibid., 6.

beauty of nature may be the only comfort to the poor labourers working in the fields day after day; how could Mitchell imply that labourers in the field cannot perceive the natural beauty in a landscape painting? Mitchell's argument against Clark is not convincing because he lets aesthetic appreciation of natural beauty, the basic human ability and cultural phenomenon, to be hijacked by the hypocrites, rather than retrieve it for the ordinary people, academically.

Mitchell's interpretation of landscape grounds on his findings that the European imperial vision, or features of imperial landscape, is globally presented in landscape paintings 'in all cultures'.[30] In respect of researching landscape paintings in different cultures, this study has two observations on Mitchell's interpretation. First, no one knows how many landscape paintings exist in the whole world from every culture in human history, but it is certain that 'imperial landscape', or 'ideological landscape', is only one part of the total.[31] Mitchell can apply his outstanding idea that landscape is 'a medium of exchange' to his political and ideological interpretation of imperial landscape paintings, but cannot apply it to all landscape paintings in all cultures. Second, landscape paintings convey meanings and values, which start from when the corresponding physical landscape is seen by human eyes, as Mitchell himself writes:

> Landscape is itself a physical and multi-sensory medium (earth, stone, vegetation, water, sky, sound and silence, light and darkness, etc.), in which cultural meanings and values are encoded ...landscape is already artifice in the moment of its beholding, long before it becomes the subject of pictorial representation.[32]

It is true that every viewer's seeing a landscape is constituted by what is seen by the viewer and the viewer's way of seeing, which are deeply affected by the values and traditions of the viewer's culture. However, the fact is the 'encoded' meanings and values in a landscape painting, especially a painting from a different culture, is usually complicated and cannot be treated simply. For example, three situations need to be considered at least. First, the 'encoded' cultural meaning and value, which are given by the artist's ways of seeing and painting, are rooted in the indigenous culture and tradition of the artist, as well as in the

---

[30] Mitchell, "Imperial Landscape", 5.

[31] ibid., 5.

[32] ibid., 14.

actual daily life of the artist. On this point, cultural meaning may be represented by the appearance of a landscape, if that landscape is closely linked with the indigenous people's daily life and the formation of their culture and history. Second, the 'encoded' cultural meaning may be generated from communication or interchange among various indigenous cultures. For example, artists can add exotic elements in their landscape painting for making interesting pictures, or for other purposes. Third, a landscape painting may represent an ideology which may be promoted by political powers. In contrast to indigenous cultures, political ideology, such as capitalism, Marxism, or imperialism, may be rootless but can cross cultures and may strengthen or alter, develop or destroy indigenous cultures and traditions and, thus, indigenous landscape paintings.

The failure of noticing the complexity of the meanings and values conveyed by landscape paintings may cause misinterpretation to the landscape paintings from different various cultures. Perhaps, that is why Mitchell asserts that 'the intrusion of Chinese traditions into the landscape discourse' is 'disturbing'.[33] Mitchell sees classical Chinese landscape painting through the lens of 'imperial ideology'. Therefore, in his interpretation, Chinese landscape painting 'flourished most notably at the height of Chinese imperial power and began to decline in the eighteenth century…'.[34] While the fact is the most valuable landscape paintings in Chinese history were painted by painters such as the *yimin* painters who segregated themselves from the power of emperors or kings and composed landscape paintings for their individual intention and expression, regarding to their perception to the natural reality, human world and humanity.[35]

To summarise, the above various interpretations of landscape show that, first, the notion of landscape means that a portion of land and its visible features are seen by human eyes, and what are seen and the way of seeing are different in various cultures. Second, the notion of landscape can refer both the physical landscape in reality and the landscape painting, and there is a relationship between the two.

---

[33] Mitchell, "Imperial Landscape", 9.

[34] ibid.

[35] See the explanation of *yimin* painter on Pages 160-63.

For interpretations on landscape painting in art history, it is a fact that landscape paintings as artworks have social functions. They are records of the time and place, statements of identity or ownership of the land, representations of ideologies, propaganda tools, pictorial expressions of cultural values, and etc. And it is also a fact that some landscape paintings are composed based on immediate experiences of the physical natural surroundings and some are composed for the artists' individual expression. Therefore, interpretations of landscape and landscape painting are diverse and no single interpretation could make a universal statement over landscape paintings by various artists in various cultures. Every interpretation represents one perspective, or one possibility, and contributes to the overall conversation on landscape painting. Accordingly, studies on the peculiarity of an individual artist and a particular landscape painting are as important as the studies on the interpretations of landscape paintings within a school, a culture, a political narrative, or a historical period. In this thesis, the 'radical landscape' is a much narrower and more specific notion than the above interpretations. It first refers to the wild natural mountains and waters that are uncultivated and undomesticated, not the lived-in environment of people. Second, it is a creative art, a pictorial landscape composed by an artist with an intention, in order to express a meaning or meanings.

3. Various Approaches to Landscape Painting

Obviously, there is not any one specific method applied to the interpretation of landscape paintings in Western art history. Rather, a rich range of ideas and multiple theories and methods have been applied fruitfully to the study of landscape art. Many art historians have written works on the methodologies of art history.[36] Their studies have different focuses, but the basic methods and theories of Western art history are commonly introduced in their works. Looking back on the history of art history, *The Lives of the Artists* (1550) by Italian artist Giorgio Vasariin is 'the first text on the visual arts extensive and consistent enough to be called a proper history', which is the start of connoisseurship

---

[36] For example, Eric Fernie's *Art History and Its Methods,* Laurie Schneider Adams' *The Methodologies of Art,* Anne D'Alleva's *Methods & Theories of Art History,* Jonathan Harris, *The New Art History*, and Michael Hatt and Charlotte Klonk's *Art History.*

and the biographic method regarding the history of the artists.[37] Johann Joachim Winckelmann's *The History of Ancient Art* (1764) is the first written 'history of art as opposed to a history of artists', which places 'the arts in the context of the cultures which produced them' and is a 'systematic approach to the organising of knowledge'.[38] Broadly speaking, after the eighteenth century, methods in art history developed into two different directions; one is empiricist and has developed into the physical scientific method for studying the materials of artworks.[39] And the other developed into many new methods and theories in the twentieth century, including:

— Formalism and style: an approach that 'stresses the significance of form over content as the source of a work's subjective appeal,' or considers 'that form is content'; and Roger Fry is the most important formalist critic.[40]

— Iconography: an approach to works of art that 'primarily considers the meaning of subject matter'; Erwin Panofsky is the leading role of iconography and Gombrich's works are the important iconographic studies.[41]

— Contextual approaches or radical art history approaches: Laurie Schneider Adams defined the contextual approaches as that the approaches 'that consider the economic and social context of art are those that have been influenced by Marxism and feminism', as well as orietnlism, colonialism, and racial iconography.[42] Jonathan Harris defined these approaches as the 'radical art history', that means the approaches use social history of art (the economical, cultural, and political history of art) as the framework of analytic devices, comprise Marxist and feminist approaches,

---

[37] Eric Fernie, *Art History and Its Methods* (London: Phaidon Press Limited, 1995), 11-12.
　See also :
　Laurie Schneider Adams, *The Methodologies of Art* (Philadelphia: Westview Press, 1996), 133-142.
　Michael Hatt and Charlotte Klonk, *Art History: A critical introduction to its methods* (Manchester:
　　Manchester University Press, 1988), 40-63.

[38] Eric Fernie, *Art History and Its Methods*, 12, 68-76.

[39] ibid., 13-15, 77-103.

[40] Adams, *The Methodologies of Art,* 21-23.
　See also:
　Anne D'Alleva's *Methods & Theories of Art History* (London: Laurence King Publishing, 2005), 17-20.
　Hatt and Klonk, *Art History*, 65-95.

[41] Adams, *The Methodologies of Art,,* 43-45.
　See also:
　D'Alleva's *Methods & Theories of Art History,* 17-20.
　Hatt and Klonk, *Art History*, 96-117.

[42] Adams, *The Methodologies of Art,* 65.
　See also:
　 D'Alleva's *Methods & Theories of Art History,* 46-87.
　 Hatt and Klonk, *Art History*, 120-138.

psychoanalytic accounts of visual representations, and semiotic and structuralist
methods.[43]

— Semiotics: an approach that is essentially applications of sign theory to the visual
arts, including structuralism, post-structuralism, and deconstruction; the approaches
are developed from the works of Charles Sanders Peirce, Ferdinand de Saussure,
Martin Heidegger, and Jacques Derrida.[44]

— Aesthetics and psychoanalysis: an 'approach deals primarily with the unconscious
significance of works of art, involving not only the art but also the artist, the aesthetic
response of the viewer, and the cultural context; the approach grounds on Sigmund
Freud's psychoanalysis theories'.[45] Some of Wollheim's interpretations on artworks
are aesthetics and psychoanalysis.

In practice, scholars and art historians' studies may mainly take one approach but may not
be limited by it. They may take into accounts of other methods and theories, as the studies
of art historians mentioned in this thesis shown. For example, Gerald Finley, and James
Hamilton's studies of Turner and his art are mainly biographical, while also putting the
artist's works in the cultural and historical context. Yet, some of Hamilton's interpretations
include formalistic analysis as well. John Gage and Eric Shanes' interpretations of Turner's
works are discussions of Turner's personal life and artistic activities based on cultural and
historical context, and also including some iconographic analysis. For the art historians'
studies on Shitao and his art, Osvald Sirén, James Cahill, and Anne Burkus-Chasson's
works are basically iconographic, but integrated with studies on cultural and historical
contexts, as well as some analysis on form and style of Shitao's paintings. Johnathan Hay's
studies on Shitao's later time took contextual approaches, based on the socio-economics
context and modernist accounts, integrated with some psychoanalytic analysis; he also
employed iconographic and biographic approaches in some discussions on Shitao's
paintings. Chinese scholars' studies on Shitao and his works are in the narrative of Chinese

---

[43] Jonathan Harris, *The New Art History* (London: Routledge, 2001), 6-7, 46, 67. The word radical in
   Harris's term means 'extreme', which is different from the meaning of 'radical' used in this thesis.

[44] Adams, *The Methodologies of Art,* 159-161, 193-195.
   See also:
   D'Alleva's *Methods & Theories of Art History,* 28-44.
   Hatt and Klonk, *Art History*, 200-221.

[45] Adams, *The Methodologies of Art,* 43-45.
   See also:
   Hatt and Klonk, *Art History*, 174-194.
   D'Alleva's *Methods & Theories of Art History,* 88-120.

ancient art history. To some extent, to the researches of Western art history, the Chinese

approaches may can be generally considered approaches that comprise biographic studies,

cultural and historical context studies, and iconographic and formalist analysis, such as Fu

Baoshi 傅抱石, Xu Fuguan 徐復觀, and Zhu Liangzhi 朱良志's studies. For this thesis,

the approach is essentially innovative iconography, integrated with analysis of form and

artistic effects of the artworks and some accounts of historical and cultural contexts. The

innovation of this study is that it establishes a new practical method adopted in

phenomenology, in order to grasp the artist's compositional intention to a particular

painting and to reveal the peculiar meaning of the painting.

4. Various Approaches to Artists' Intention

Discussions of artists' intention are not new to the interpretations of artworks.

Intentionalism in relation to art has a long time history. The main issue of intentionalism is

whether or not authorial intention can determine the interpretation of the author's artwork.

The most influential statement on the subject is W. K. Wimsatt and M. C. Beardsley's

'intentional fallacy' which suggests that the author's intention can either be achieved or

not.[46] If interpreters can realise that the author's intention is achieved, that is because the

work itself shows it; if not, the author's intention is not relevant to the interpretation of the

work. Debate on this issue has not ended.

Michael Baxandall also discussed about artists' intentions in *Patterns of Intentions* from

many perspectives, such as the function of the retina in seeing and its relation to intention,

the artists' intention to exchange their works in the market, etc. One of them is the impact

of culture and tradition to the artist's intention. Baxandall stated that painters are

intellectual people who live in society, a social environment shaped by tradition or culture;

thus, painters are composers with cultural intentions, not workers who mechanically

produce pictures that imitate or record an object or a target.[47] He noted that a trace of the

pattern of the artist's intention may be accommodated in their paintings and writings – 'A

particular process of an artist's composition may not be reconstructable, but a general

assumption of the fact of process can be determining in an account of the intention in a

---

[46] W. K. Wimsatt and M. C. Beardsley, "The Intentional Fallacy", *The Sewanee Review* 54, no. 3 (1946): 468.

[47] Michael Baxandall, *Patterns of Intention* (New Heaven: Yale University Press, 1985)*,* 75.

particular picture'.[48] However, he also suggested that an artist's intention is 'a numberless sequence of developing moments of intention', including decisions (such as design and execution) and actions (such as forgone or cancelled actions).[49] Thus, the 'general assumption' of the artist's intention is just a 'glimpse'; moreover, it is perhaps merely 'what we think we are making inferences from and about the [artist's] intention.'[50]

Martin Kemp indicated that Baxandall did not provide a clear notion of 'intention' in his discussion and, importantly, fail to notice the cause and effect between artists' intention and their painting.[51] Kemp underlined that 'picture-making is not a purposeless activity... anything done purposefully has the potential to be analysed in terms of intentions'.[52]

A group of Marxist art historians, as Mitchell and Harris indicated, also explored artists' intention, through studying paintings of the rural landscape in England in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.[53] In his work *Ways of Seeing*, John Berger asserted that, in terms of oil landscape painting, 'nature was the object of the activities of capitalism; rather than the arena in which capitalism and social life and each individual life had its being'.[54] However, regarding to the artists' intention, Berger did not simplify the complexity of the reality in his interpretation. He noted that artists were under their possessional relationships with the patronage, therefore, the landscape paintings they composed deposited what the patrons liked to deposit; and essentially, the gap between the landscape the painters seen in reality and 'the object of the activities of capitalism' represented in the landscape painting was produced by the power of capital, by the pressure of career development and making living, not by the artist's intentional blindness.[55] Berger also indicated that some great

---

[48] Baxandall, *Patterns of Intention*, 63.

[49] ibid.

[50] ibid.

[51] Martin Kemp, "On the Historical Explanation of Pictures by Michael Baxandall", *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* 50, Bd., H. no.1 (1987): 133–36.

[52] ibid.

[53] Mitchell, "Imperial Landscape", 8. Harris, *The New Art History,* 209-222.

[54] John Berger, *Ways of Seeing* (London: Penguin, 1972), 105.

[55] Berger, *Ways of Seeing*, 104-109.

artists who broke free of the situation, such as Salomon van Ruysdael, Claude Monet, Constable, and Turner:

> Great artist is a man whose life-time is consumed by struggle: partly against material circumstances, partly against incomprehension, partly against himself. Each time a painter realised that he was dissatisfied with the limited role of painting as a celebration of material property and of the status that accompanied it, he inevitably found himself struggling with the very language of his own art understood by the tradition of his calling.[56]

For this thesis, what Berger indicated is that artists of the nineteenth century England were more likely under the power of capital rather than being a part of the power and their spontaneous intentions of painting landscape were limited by the power and some artists found inventive ways to express their artistic intention.

In Ann Bermingham's *Landscape And Ideology,* the rustic English landscape paintings between 1740 and 1860 related with the England enclosure. Bermingham indicated that 'landscape' was an ideological concept and the aim of composing landscape painting was to naturalise 'the social and economic realities of the enclosure period and its embodiment in the arts of this period'.[57] She also indicated that the English rustic landscape paintings showed 'the artist's connections to the dominant class ideologies'.[58] In Bermingham's interpretation, the landscape painters somehow intentionally cooperated with the dominant class and that was reflected in their landscape paintings.

In his work *The Dark Side of the Landscape,* John Barrell suggested that the painters were committed to a struggle in their intention, 'to reveal more and more of the actuality of the life of the poor, and to find more effective ways of concealing that actuality'.[59] His examples included the rural landscapes paintings of Thomas Gainsborough (1727 –1788 AD) and John Constable (1776–1837 AD). On Constable's work, Barrell wrote:

> ...the resentments of the poor are now known to us all, and those resentments could not be concealed in any credible image of the poor except by hiding the

---

[56] Berger, *Ways of Seeing*, 110.

[57] Ann Bermingham, *Landscape And Ideology* (London: thames & Hudson, 1987), 3-4.

[58] ibid.

[59] John Barrell, *The Dark Side of the Landscape* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1980), 16.

poor in the middle ground, where we can see their labour but not their expressions.[60]

On Gainsborough's works, Barrell found that the painter had two ways of hiding the hard life of the poor. One was to depict the poor's enjoyment of their working life, in order to offer 'an ideal of the rural life as one of varied but harmonious satisfactions', and 'to compose an image of happy Britannia'.[61] The other was to place the figures of the poor in the shadows, the dark part of the landscape.[62] The outline of Barrell's argument is: the harmonious pastoral landscape paintings is a false ideal pastoral; the rural poor enjoying themselves in the landscape is also a false ideal pastoral; and the figures of the rural poor are hidden in the shadows or middle and background; therefore, the visions of landscapes reflect the moral darkness that attempts to use the false pastoral vision to cover the aristocrats' heartless ignorance of the hard life of the poor.[63]

Three issues in Barrell's arguments cannot be ignored. First, Barrell indicated that 'the resentments of the poor' was the key matter that Constable intended to hide, however, for the sake of revealing the deep truth of the rural society and appealing social justice, as an art historian, Barrell failed to provide historical facts and context of 'the resentments of the poor'. Without referencing historical facts and providing the context, Barrell built his argument on an unexplained emotion – resentment, which makes his argument not sufficiently reasonable and convincing. Therefore, questions arise – How could Constable know the resentments of his figures and then try to hide them in the middle ground of his landscapes? Or, is Constable's failure on concealing 'the poor' in the painting factually an indirect way to allow people like Barrell to notice the unsuccessfully hidden reality? Harris implied that Barrell's emphasising on the 'the resentments of the poor' reflected the essential ideas of Marxist ideology – the class division in a society and 'the centrality of class struggle'.[64]

---

[60] Barrell, *The Dark Side of the Landscape,* 21–2.

[61] ibid., 36–7, 41.

[62] ibid., 20–3.

[63] ibid., 20–3, 87.

[64] Harris, *The New Art History,* 40, 81-84, 264.

Second, Barrell's arguments essentially concerned the artists' intention to the rural figures in the landscape, rather than the artist's intention to depict the physical rural landscape in a painting. Therefore, regarding the artist's general intention to rural figures, Barrell's argument would be more persuasive if he also selected Constable's *The Cornfield*, in which the shepherd boy is arranged in the foreground; or Gainsborough's *Fancy Girl*, a life-size picture of a shabby rural child, from which viewers can easily feel the painter's sympathy to the child and the dignity the painter given to the shabby figure (though the painting is categorised in 'fancy pictures').

Barrell mentions Gainsborough's *Going to Market* and argued that the unusually well dressed women in the group of figures was fictionally idealised by the painter and was intentionally arranged in the central light as a must be seen element, to represent the unreal prosperous rural life. Surprisingly, Barrell ignored a destitute mother with a child that are in the shadow at the bottom left of the picture and overlooked the importance of these figures to the meaning expressed through the whole picture. In the picture, Gainsborough intentionally created a situation through a strong contrast between the destitute mother in the shadow and the unusual well-dressed woman in the light, because the figures' postures and countenances show that they see each other and the atmosphere between them is awkward. It is not difficult to perceive the painter's strong expression – the sympathy to the destitute mother and child in the shadowy corner. In this situation, there is a brightness in the picture and the brightness is in the 'dark' corner.

Third, Barrell's arguments ignored that the painters should have free choice on making creative art, on what and how to paint, thus also ignored that the painter's 'free choice' had been already limited under the power of capital and patronage in those days, as Berger indicated. Therefore, Barrell questioned that the painters painted the rural figures unclearly, as less important element as the light, trees, meadows in a landscape painting, when he compares Constable's *The Hay Wain* with Claud's *Coast Scene with Aeneas at Delos*, even the comparability between the two is weak.[65] What Barrell stressed is that the figures in the structure of Constable's landscape 'support the stability of an ideally structured economic and social order'.[66] In doing so, Barrell's arguments set a logic: unless the painters painted

---

[65] Barrell, *The Dark Side of the Landscape*, 147–48.

[66] ibid.

'the poor', the rural labours, in struggle or difficulty or with an expression of resentment, in the foreground of the landscape painting, the painters probably intend to hide or fictionally idealise the miserable life of the rural poor. Harris indicated that, in Barrell's argument, the landscape paintings were essentially not representations of the physical rural landscapes, but a 'form related to ideological content', which is Harris quoted from T. J. Clark's remarks to Marxist art historians and their ideas.[67]

Barrell's interpretation on Gainsborough's intention to the rural landscapes is not visually convincing to Jonathan Wordsworth, who also indicated that Barrell himself was not very certain on his own interpretation:

> ...though I have often used the language of intention in my essays –
> 'Gainsborough is attempting to show,' and so forth – this must be taken as a
> metaphor only, used to call attention to what the polite wished to believe about
> the society of the countryside and the condition of the poor, whether that wish
> was conscious or not.[68]

What Barrell meant is that his interpretation of Gainsborough's intention should be considered a 'metaphor', not a fact. If so, is the darkness of 'the dark side of the landscape' also then a metaphor?

There are other interpretations of Gainsborough's intention in his landscapes. For example, Michael Rosenthal argued that in Gainsborough's landscape pantings the pose of the rich people confirmed the unaffected dignity of the gentleman, likewise the labours enjoying their rest in the rural landscape asserted the 'dignity and independence' of the labours, which was the morality of Gainsborough's landscape paintings.[69]

The interpretations of the artists' intention in their landscape paintings by Berger, Bermingham, and Barrell showed very different intentions of the same painters. Berger indicated that the painters were under the power of capital and the pressure of making living, implying the painters were essentially working labours; thus, the landscapes they

---

[67] Harris, *The New Art History,* 70-71.
　T. J. Clark, *Image of the People* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1973), 10-12.

[68] Jonathan Wordsworth, "Review The Dark Side of the Landscape: The Rural Poor in English Painting 1730–1840 by John Barrell," The Review of English Studies, Vol. 34, no.133 (February 1983): 85.
　Barrell, *The Dark Side of the Landscape,* 18.

[69] Michael Rosenthal, *The Art of Thomas Gainsborough* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1999), 189–191.

painted were what the patrons wanted to see not what the painters saw in reality and the artists' intention was limited. But great painters such as Constable and Turner can break free from the situation. Bermingham indicated that those painters' landscape paintings showed the painters' intensional cooperation and connection to the dominant class, implying that the painters essentially associated with the dominant class. While Barrell indicated that the intentions of those painters reflected moral darkness, showing that the painters intentionally to be the opposite to 'the poor' and attempted to use the false pastoral vision to cover the aristocrats' heartless ignorance of the hard life of the poor. However, Barrell himself may realise that his arguments on Gainsborough and Constable were not persuasive enough, hence by himself, he claimed that his interpretation of Gainsborough's works were 'metaphorical'. Again, questions arise – How do we interpret artists' intention in their landscape paintings? According to what do we review the interpreters' various interpretations? Facts, not metaphor.

The above studies show that, from intentionalism to Baxandall's and the Marxist art historians' studies, artists' intention has been explored in different ways, and some issues are revealed. The idea of 'intentional fallacy' showed the difference between the achieved and not achieved intentions of the artist, suggesting the interpreters can perceive the achieved intention of the artist. Baxandall noticed that painters' intention – the inner mental movement – was complicated and multiple, thus we can only have a glimpse of it, to which Martin Kemp underlined that it was because Baxandall did not give clear definitions of the various intentions of the artists. Kemp indicated that the possibility exists – to explore a painter's intention through the picture itself. Regarding to Marxist art historians' interpretation of artworks, Adams underlined that they 'read works of art mainly in relation to their political and economic role in society', and Harris underlined that their interpretations were based on a 'form related to ideological content'.[70] And the results of the above Marxist art historians' studies showed that if the interpretations were primarily based on the pictorial facts of the painting and the appearance of the physical land, like in Berger's study, the interpretations can reveal some facts of the artists' general intention. However, if their discussions of the artists' intention, like in Bermingham's and Barrell's studies, were formed primarily on the Marxist ideological ideas of 'class division and class

---

[70] Adams, *The Methodologies of Art,* 65-66.
  Harris, *The New Art History,* 70-71.
  T. J. Clark, *Image of the People*, 10-12.

struggle', their interpretations were not persuasive. Because, artists' intention, including the intention of the artists from different cultures, are individual, specific, and also complicated, generated from the artists' own experiences, own ways of seeing and painting, which cannot be neatly framed in an ideological outline and cannot be simply studied as reflections of the general intention of the members of a class.

To summarise, for this thesis, findings from the above studies are, first, the artist's intention includes achieved intention and not achieved intention, and the achieved or performed intention has the possibility to be realised and revealed. Second, artists' intention can leave marks on the painting, thus, by examining the pictorial facts of the painting (rather than interpreting them primarily within an ideological frame), specific intention of an individual artist in a particular painting may can be grasped. Third, artists' intention is a broad concept, if we narrow the concept and focus on the performed, specific intention that can be evidenced by the marks in the painting, revealing the artists' intention may be possible and also persuasive. Accordingly, this study explores the artists' intention in a new way. First of all, the study defines the 'intention' as, not a presupposed general intention, but a narrow, specific, and performed intention – an individual artist's compositional intention in a particular work. The second is to trace the artist's compositional intention by examining the pictorial facts of the composed painting and the physical facts of the corresponding physical landscape. The third is to study the artist's compositional intention based on gaining first-hand experience of the painting, the corresponding landscape, and other related objects, aiming at examining the objective marks of the artists' compositional intention.

5. Intention and Structure of the Thesis

The thesis is a methodological study. The aim of the thesis is to establish a phenomenological method and to assess the effectiveness, potential and limit of such an approach when applied to the studies of radical landscape paintings of different cultures. The method is not a universal one that provides a standard formulation to examine various radical landscape paintings of different cultures and to interpret them within a fixed structure with certain constitutive contents. Rather, it is a method to strengthen an individual viewer's perception thus the viewer may perceive and interpret a radical

landscape painting individually and uniquely, regardless the cultural background of the painting. Also, the thesis contains two case studies, which interpret two radical landscape paintings by British and Chinese painters; and the two case studies are neither comparative studies nor cross-cultural studies, but independent experiments in applying the phenomenological method adopted here to interpret radical landscape paintings of different cultures.

Theoretically, the method established in the thesis can be applied to every radical landscape painting. Presentation of the two paintings in this research was determined by the paintings themselves. During the factual research process, the method was first designed; then I searched for paintings to apply the method. I encountered the two paintings for the first time and they attracted me immediately at first glance among other paintings. Turner's work attracted me with its violent wild momentum of mountains and the giant vortex of cloud and mist, as well as the colour tone of blue with light purple. Shitao's work caught my eyes with the strange forms of the two central precipices and the endless silent distance in the pictorial space. Further study showed that the two paintings were both radical: they are generated from real physical wild landscapes; they are creatively composed landscape paintings, not realistic artworks; and the two artists both saw the physical landscapes in person. The unique features of the paintings and the experiences of encountering them made me ask why the pictures were so powerful to me and what are the essential meanings the artists intended to deliver. I wondered how the phenomenological method could be employed for answering the questions. Therefore, the study took up the strong invitation made by the intrinsic characteristics of the two paintings, traced the artists' compositional intentions, and explored the meaning and significance of the two pictures, by applying the phenomenological method.

This thesis contains five chapters: Chapter One is the introduction; Chapter Two explains the phenomenological method; Chapter Three and Four present the two case studies, in which the phenomenological method is applied respectively to interpretations of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* by J. M. W. Turner and *Mountain Lu* by Shitao; Chapter Five is the conclusion which discusses the results and effectiveness of applications of the phenomenological method.

6. Terminology

Several key words convey specific meanings in this thesis. This section lists them in five groups and defines the specific meanings of them.

6.1 Expression, meaning, and significance

'Expression' refers to the artist's actions in presenting a meaning through the picture and related text. Expression has manner and effect; the effect may be strong or potential and the manner direct or indirect. This research studies how meaning can be discerned by studying the artist's manner of expression.

'Meaning' refers first to something expressed by the artist; this may be an idea, perception, memory, self-consciousness, state of mind, or a statement. Second, it refers to the pictorial effect that the artist intends to present. In containing a meaning, a painting is more than merely a form that conveys the content or sign of a tradition or ideology. For example, when a colour conveys meaning in a picture, it does not merely represent the name, category, and property of that colour. Its quality and irreplaceable function in the pictorial effect tell how the colour is rendered by the painter and why. It may bring the viewer a particular visual experience. Essentially, 'meaning' is the consequence of the artist's expression and the message of the artist's compositional intention.

'Significance' is the value of a painting a viewer gained from the experience of seeing the painting, including how the viewers' experience connects to their knowledge, memory, perception, and imagination. It is also the potential capacity of the painting that gives the viewer inspiration, or even epiphany. The viewer's gaining significance from a painting depends on how the viewer experiences the painting. In short, 'significance' refers to the impact the painting may leave on a viewer.

6.2 General, literal, and compositional intentions

Husserl writes that 'the term intention hits off the peculiarity of acts by imagining them to aim at something.'[71] That is to say intention can be approached by perceiving the

---

[71] Husserl, *Logical Investigations II,* 563.

corresponding intentional acts. In composing a painting, the painter usually has a 'general intention', such as to fulfil a commission, to paint a landscape for sale, to depict a place, to practise and develop painting techniques, to express something in the painting, or simply to paint a picture.

The literal intention is what painters tell others about what they are going to paint, or why and how they will paint it. It could be a formal statement in text or a casual expression in talkings. The literal intention may or may not be fulfilled in the painting, but a fulfilled literal intention would be one part of the painter's compositional intention.

Compositional intention refers to the artist's intention to how to compose a painting – what is to be included in the picture and how to form the picture, what meaning is to be expressed and how to express. Compositional intention is generated from an initial idea, then grows, develops in the artist's mind, drives the artist's compositional acts during the process of painting, and is ultimately completed in the finished picture. The picture of the painting is the objective result of the artist's compositional intention.

The above notions are related to each other: literal intention may constitute all or part of the compositional intention; expression is the performance of compositional intention; 'meaning' is the result of the performance and, ultimately, the finished painting is the artist's intentional object.

6.3 Picture, image, and reproduction

In the research, a painting is not only a material object but also a picture and image. The terms 'picture' and 'image' are used with different meanings. 'Picture' refers to the objective form and content of a painting, as constituted by pictorial elements, such as pictorial structure, colour, brushstroke, etc.

'Image', on one hand, is the appearance of a painting, or 'a set of appearances' of a painting, as outlined by Berger.[72] On the other hand, 'image' is a vision the viewers saw and stored in their mind. The 'image' of a painting is detached from the original painting

---

[72] Berger, *Ways of Seeing*, 9-10.

and 'every image embodies a way of seeing'.[73] Thus, the essential difference between 'the picture of a painting' and 'the image of a painting' is that the former is original and objective while the latter is a vision in mind detached from the original painting and a vision embodied a way of seeing.

A reproduction of a painting can be an oil painting copy, a print copy, a digital copy, etc. It also can be a picture of a painting that is in the original colour, or merely in black and white, or in other colour tones. A reproduction may keep most of the pictorial form and content of the original painting, but may also omit or alter some details.

6.4 Thing and object

In the thesis, the meaning of 'object' is broader than the meaning of 'thing'. All 'things' can be called 'objects', but some 'objects' cannot be called 'things'. A 'thing' has a material form, eg a mountain or a river; an 'object' can be an abstract notion, eg the wildness, the ambiguity, the atmosphere, the mood, which cannot be termed 'things'. An artist can both go to a thing or intend an abstract idea, in order to compose a landscape painting. For example, painters may go to a wild mountain to see and experience it, in order to paint its physical features; they may also intend an abstract object – to perceive and represent the wilderness of a landscape in a painting.

6.5 Feeling, experience, and perception

In the thesis, 'feeling', 'experience', and 'perception' are used in the context of phenomenology. In brief, 'feeling' specifically refers to sensual feeling; 'feeling' is not same to 'experience'; 'experience' means to feel with intentionality; perception does not merely mean what is experienced, but also the consciousness or awareness of the intentionality in the experience and the meaning of the experience. Further explanations are given in Chapter Two.

---

[73] Berger, *Ways of Seeing*, 9-10.

• Note

In this thesis, unless otherwise notified, all English translations of Chinese text are translated by myself; foreign language words and the titles of books and paintings are given in italics.

Chapter Two: The Phenomenological Method

Part 1: Phenomenology and Related Ideas

1. Phenomenology

Edmund Husserl (1859–1938 AD), the founder of phenomenology, advocates that 'we must go back to the "things themselves"', which is the principal idea of phenomenology.[74] Generally, a phenomenon refers to a thing, a matter, or the world that appears before us. Phenomenology studies our consciousness of phenomena, or the essence of our perception of the things that appear before us.

In the early twentieth century, Husserl published a series of writings on phenomenology and established the theoretical foundation of phenomenology. Before him, the 'phenomenological' manner of perception had been practiced and studied over many centuries by a wide range of thinkers, from Hindus and Buddhists to Western philosophers such as Immanuel Kant (1724–1804 AD), Franz Brentano (1838–1917 AD), and William James (1842–1910 AD).[75] In England, John Ruskin's (1848–1854 AD) *Modern Painters* showed a manner of phenomenologically perceiving natural landscape and appreciating landscape painting, to some extent – even though the writings were not a purposive and systematic phenomenological study.[76]

It was Husserl who established the basic theoretical system of phenomenology, defining it as 'a science of essence (an "eidetic science")', which exclusively seeks to ascertain

---

[74] Husserl, *Logical Investigations I*, 168.

[75] David Woodruff Smith, "Phenomenology," The Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy, last modified Dec, 2013, https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2018/entries/phenomenology/

[76] For example, John Ruskin, *Morden* Painters(London: Smith, Elder, and Co., 1848-60), Vol. I, 280, Vol. III, 251-56, Vol. V, 251.
See also: Denis E. Cosgrove , "John Ruskin and the Geographical Imagination," *Geographical Review* 69, No. 1 (Jan 1979): 43-62.

'cognition of essence'.[77] In Husserl's phenomenology, 'essence' designates 'what is to be found in the very own being of an *individuum* as the What of an *individuum*.'[78] The 'experience' is eidetic experience, not empirical; hence 'experiencing' refers to 'eidetic seeing'.[79] And the fundamental idea of Husserl's phenomenology is the 'intentionality of consciousness', and the fundamental principle of phenomenology is *epoché* and *réduction*.[80] In his later years, Husserl turned to transcendental ideal phenomenology, which competes with his earlier theory of phenomenology.

In the next-generation, Martin Heidegger (1889–1976 AD) developed phenomenology based on ontological concerns. He develops Husserl's advocation of 'going back to the things themselves' and asserts that phenomenology is a science aimed 'to grasp its objects [things] in such a way that everything about them which is up for discussion must be treated by exhibiting it directly and demonstrating it directly.'[81] Heidegger's description of phenomenon is the 'exhibiting of an entity as it shows itself in itself'.[82] One valuable contribution Heidegger gives to phenomenology is the account of *Dasein* (being-in-the-world). Heidegger suggests that Husserl did not sufficiently address the question of being-in-the-world when Husserl examined the being of an intentional essence of consciousness.[83] Therefore, Heidegger provides the account of *Dasein* to redress this

---

[77] Edmund Husserl, *Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy: First Book*, trans. F. Kersten (Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1983), xx.

'Eidetic: relating to mental images that are unusual vivid and detailed,' *Compact Oxford English Dictionary.*

[78] Husserl, Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy: First Book, 8.

'*Individuum'* is a German word; the English translation is 'an individual entity', from Collins dictionary online.

[79] Husserl, Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy: First Book, 8.

[80] Edmund Husserl, *Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy: Second Book*, trans. Richard Rojcewicz and André Schuwer (London: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2002), 32-35, 37.

[81] Martin Heidegger, *Being and Time*, trans. John Macquarrie and Edward S. Robinson (1962; reprint, London: Oxford Basil Blackwell, 1978), 59 (35).

[82] ibid.

[83] Jacques Taminiaux and Michael Gendre, Heidegger and the Project of Fundamental Ontology (New York: State University of New York Press, 1991), 38–40.

lack.[84] The meaning of *Dasein* is existence; in Heidegger's theory it essentially refers to the 'activity of existing'.[85]

Maurice Merleau-Ponty (1908–1961 AD), another prominent phenomenologist, emphasises bodily experience in phenomenological perception and rejects the Cartesian separation of mind and body. For Merleau-Ponty, the body engages in human perception and the essence of subjectivity is bound up with the existence of the body.[86]

Contemporary phenomenology has been developed heterogeneously and left crucial impacts on many other disciplines, including psychology, logic, hermeneutics, history, geography, anthropology, and art studies.

2. Two Phenomenological ideas related to the research

For this research, the application of phenomenology is based on two phenomenological ideas: *epoché* and *réduction*, and intentionality.

2.1 Epoché and réduction

Epoché and *réduction* are the strength of phenomenology. *Epoché* is a Greek word from ancient scepticism, meaning 'suspension of judgement' or 'withholding of assent'.[87] As a mode of perception, *epoché* and *réduction* exist in our daily life: when we count objects, we suspend their material features and focus on their quantity; when we watch a film, we focus on the moving pictures and suspend our judgement on the material screen. In doing so, we do not deny the existence of the material features of the objects and screen; they are simply not the intentional objects of our perception.

---

[84] Hanne Jacobs, "Husserl, Heidegger, and Merleau-Ponty on the World of Experience," *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Phenomenology*, ed. Dan Zahavi (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018), 658.

[85] Michael Wheeler, "Martin Heidegger", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, last modified Fall 2020, https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/heidegger/

Hubert L. Dreyfus, *Being-in-the-World: A Commentary on Heidegger's Being and Time* (London: MIT Press, 1991), 40.

[86] Maurice Merleau-Ponty, *Phenomenology of Perception* (London; New York: Routledge, 2012). lxxv, 62, 150, 228, 265, 448.

[87] Benson Mates, *The Skeptic Way* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996), 225.

In Husserl's phenomenology, *epoché* means 'placing all knowledge in question', for the purpose of establishing the critique of knowledge.[88] Dan Zahavi indicates that Husserl uses *epoché* to bracket the acceptance of 'natural attitudes' (the scientific attitude) and to entail 'a suspension of our realistic inclination'; in doing so, the 'natural attitude' is retained, but its validity is bracketed in the process of a phenomenological perceiving.[89] That is to say 'not let preconceived theories form our experience, but let our experience determines our theories'.[90] Together with *epoché*, *réduction* means to dismantle the 'unnecessary' psychological, religious, scientific, and cultural aspects of a thing, in order to return to the most 'necessary', the latent yet 'apodeictic' profile of the phenomena of the thing. *Epoché* suspends the non-immanent reality of the thing, while *réduction* exhibits the thing's 'immanent essence as an absolute givenness'.[91] So, Husserl indicates that *réduction* includes eidetic reduction and transcendental reduction, which refer respectively to the perceived object and the perceived ideal subjectivity.

Through *epoché* and *réduction*, prejudices, presuppositions of a thing, and even the intellect and will towards a thing can be removed from the process of perceiving that thing; such that, as Husserl asserted, 'we gained the whole of absolute being which, rightly understood, contains within itself, "constitutes" within itself, all worldly transcendencies'.[92] Therefore, through *epoché* and *réduction,* a phenomenological experiencing can be led by the 'purely immanent' in a thing, or the givenness of the thing.[93]

For instance, to phenomenologically see a landscape painting, in the mode of *epoché* and *réduction*, is to gain the immediate first-hand experience of the painting and the perception

---

[88] Edmund Husserl, *The Idea of Phenomenology,* trans. Lee Hardy (London: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1999), 23.

[89] Dan Zahavi, *Husserl's Phenomenology* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003), 45.

[90] ibid.

[91] Husserl, *The Idea of Phenomenology*, 34.

[92] Husserl, *Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy: First Book,* 113.

Dermot Moran, "Intentionality," in *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Phenomenology*, ed. Dan Zahavi (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018), 588.

[93] Husserl, The Idea of Phenomenology, 34–35.

of the first-hand experience, which would not be foreshadowed or influenced by previous studies, common knowledge or critics' interpretations and judgements of the painting. In doing so, those studies, knowledge, interpretations, and judgements are not denied, but suspended during the process of the experiencing and perceiving. Phenomenologically seeing is an eidetic and perceptual seeing, in order to perceive what and how the experience of seeing is, such as how vivid the experience is, what the details of the experience are (not the vividness and details of the painting, but the vividness and detail of the experiencing), and, ultimately, what all these mean to the essential meaning of the painting, or to why and how the painting was made.

Epoché and *réduction* are the principle of phenomenological studies. Zahavi asserts that those 'who seek to use phenomenological ideas in a non-philosophical context, have to employ the *epoché* and the *réduction* if their work is to qualify as phenomenological.'[94] However, Husserl's *epoché* and *réduction* are ideal and transcendental. The question thus arises as to whether *epoché* and *réduction* can be perfectly put into practice. The question is crucial because selective or partial *epoché* causes problems in our perception; as described by Alfred Schutz, an individual 'does not suspend belief in the outer world and its objects, but on the contrary, he suspends doubt in its existence. What he puts in bracket is the doubt that the world and its objects might be otherwise that appears to him.'[95]

Husserl himself claims that *epoché* cannot ever be ideal, not least because '*epoché* cannot do *epoché* in the case of its own knowledge.'[96] Merleau-Ponty has underlined that complete transcendental *réduction* is impossible, or incompleteness is the *réduction* itself.[97] However, Merleau-Ponty also emphasises that what defines humans is 'the capacity of going beyond created structures in order to create others' and that capacity may come from operating *epoché* and *réduction*.[98] Zahavi claims that the application of

---

[94] Dan Zahavi, "Applied Phenomenology: Why It Is Safe to Ignore the Epoché," *Continental Philosophy Review* 54, no. 2 (July 2021): 261.

[95] Alfred Schutz, *Collected Papers 1: The Problem of Social Reality*, ed. Maurice Natanson (The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1962), 229.

[96] Husserl, *The Idea of Phenomenology,* 23.

[97] Maurice Merleau-Ponty, *Basic Writings*, ed. Thomas Baldwin (Psychology Press, 2004), 70.

Maurice Merleau-Ponty, *The Visible and the Invisible* (Northwestern University Press, 1968), 178.

[98] Merleau-Ponty, *Basic Writings*, 59.

phenomenology is not needed to perform Husserl's transcendental *réduction*. James Morley, an existential-phenomenological psychologist, asserts that *epoché* is not merely a mental operation or technique but also an intellectual flexibility, an attitude that makes one to stand back from 'the natural attitude' and opens one's perception of new meanings of the world.[99]

Many examples can be found of the application of *epoché* and *réduction* in studies on landscape, as well as artworks. Christopher Tilley applies the phenomenological method in his archaeology studies. He emphasises that *epoché* means the 'suspension of belief', which is the strength of phenomenology, because when 'belief' is suspended, the empirical dogmas of 'common sense' or scientific 'natural attitude' are called into question.[100] A study aims not to 'explain the world [in terms of physical causality or historical events etc.]', but to 'describe that world as precisely as possible in the manner in which human beings experience it'.[101] Tilley's discourse shows that, in the mode of *epoché* and *réduction,* the phenomenological approach is an approach primarily to the subjective perception of the objects in the world, rather than primarily to the subjective perception of the concepts, dogmas, or notions of the world.

In *Eye and Mind,* Merleau-Ponty describes Cézanne's manner of painting as an example of how *epoché* and *réduction* occur during the process of composition. Merleau-Ponty claims that a painter is entitled to look at everything without being obliged to appraise what he sees; meanwhile, during this process of looking, 'the watchwords of knowledge and action lose their meaning and force'.[102] Merleau-Ponty describes how, when Cézanne looks at the landscape he is painting, he has to forget all that he has learnt about landscape from science; yet he recaptures the structure of the landscape as 'an emerging organism' through employing his scientific knowledge, and the rules of science are presented in every stroke of his brush in the painting.[103] According to Merleau-Ponty, Cézanne suspends his

---

[99] James Morley, "It's Always About the Epoché", in *The Redirection of Psychology: Essays in Honor of Amedeo P. Giorgi. Les Collectifs du Cirp Vol.1* (édition spéciale), eds. T. F. Cloonan and C. Thiboutot (Montréal: Université du Québec à Montréal, 2010), 223–32.

[100] Christopher Tilley, *The Materiality of Stone* (Oxford: Berg, 2004), 1.

[101] Tilley, *The Materiality of Stone,* 1–31.

[102] Merleau-Ponty, *Basic Writings,* 293.

[103] ibid., 281.

scientific knowledge when looking at the landscape, but does not deny his knowledge and uses it to legitimate his depiction of the transient appearance of the landscape – the essential characteristics of the appearance of the landscape at a particular moment and situation.

The well-known discussions among Heidegger, Jacques Derrida (1930–2004 AD), and Meyer Schapiro (1904–1996 AD) on the paintings of Vincent Van Gogh (1853 –1890 AD) opens new discussions on exploring the meaning of a painting, and *epoché* and *réduction* has various functions in their discussion.

In Heidegger's interpretation, the shoes in Van Gogh's painting exhibit the truth of a pair of peasant's shoes.[104] Schapiro questions that the shoes in the painting were the artist's own, and thus a town resident's shoes, not an anonymous peasant's shoes.[105] In his respond to Schapiro, Heidegger underlines that the truth of the shoes in his interpretation is the essence of 'the equipment-being' of the shoes.[106] Schapiro then indicates that Van Gogh painted several paintings of shoes, while Heidegger does not even identify which painting he refers to, as if for Heidegger the different paintings of shoes are interchangeable and all disclose the same truth. Schapiro asserts that Heidegger's interpretation is based on the philosopher's idea of 'the universal essence of things', or the 'concept of the metaphysical power of art', while the example of the painting does not persuasively support the idea.[107] Ultimately, by referencing Knut Hamsun's (1859–1952) description of shoes in a novel, and the reminiscences of Gauguin, Schapiro suggests that the shoes Van Gogh painted were a 'portrait' of Van Gogh himself.[108]

When Derrida writes about Heidegger and Schapiro's discussion, in *The Truth in Painting*, he argues that in the painting 'nothing assures us that they [the shoes] make a pair' and

---

[104] Martin Heidegger, *Off the Beaten Track*, ed. Kenneth Haynes, trans. Julian Young (Cambridge University Press, 2002), 13–4.

[105] Meyer Schapiro, *Theory and Philosophy of Art* (George Braziller, 1994), 136.

[106] Heidegger, *Off the Beaten Track*, 13–4.

[107] Schapiro, *Theory and Philosophy of Art,* 139.

[108] ibid.

suggests that the shoes are two right or two left shoes.[109] Then he asks a series of questions

on the meaning of identifying the painting.[110] In answering his own questions, Derrida

deconstructs the meaning or the usefulness of interpreting the truth of a painting and claims

that a painting is given to be rendered, yet we do not have to render anything because if

one had to render the secret of the painting, the ghost of the picture would have gone.[111]

The above interpretations do not aim to apply *epoché* and *reduction*, yet when the

interpretations go to the essential meaning of the painting, as a method of perception,

epoché and *réduction* function in different ways. Heidegger suspends the attribution of the

shoes and even the identification of which painting he interpreted, in order to show that the

painting discloses the general truth of a pair of old worn shoes – how the shoes were being-

in-the-world, being with the earth and the feet.

When Derrida suggests that the shoes may not be a pair, but two left or two right shoes, he

suspends all preconceptions and lets his perception be led merely by the experience of

seeing the shoes. He then sees each element in the picture individually and explores the

meaning of each individually, such as the situation of the shoelaces and the meaning of the

depiction of the shoelaces. Derrida brings out a fresh feeling of 'occult strangeness' of the

shoes. The suspension he did let him explore the painting in the elemental level and his

interpretation exhibits a reflexive *epoché* and *réduction*. That is to say, when perceiving an

individual element in the picture, he suspends the vision of the whole image; when he is

perceiving the whole image, the elements lose their agency in his perception. Thus, the

truth he perceives is the truth of the elements' being in the picture; yet, since elements

carry individual meanings, a summary of the individual meanings cannot constitute the

meaning of the whole painting. Thus, Derrida's interpretation transforms the whole image

into elemental symbols, metaphors, or phrases of pictorial language that go beyond the

artist's intention in the painting.

Schapiro's exploration of the painting starts from seeking the historical facts related to the

shoes and ends in exploring the relationships between the painting and the artist's

---

[109] Jacques Derrida, *The Truth in Painting*, trans. Geoffrey Bennington and Ian McLeod (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), 10, 265.

[110] Derrida, *The Truth in Painting*, 266–8.

[111] ibid., 381–2.

intention, through analysing historical materials and referencing literary texts. He concludes that the shoes are a symbolic portrait of Van Gogh himself, which is still a speculation. Schapiro's studies reveal the complexity of interpreting an artwork that simultaneously represents a piece of history, an object (or objects), and the artist's compositional intention. As a representation of a piece of history, the painting links to other historical facts and its cultural context; as a representation of the artist's compositional intention, it is the medium that delivers the artist's expression; and as a depiction of an object, the painting represents the appearance of that object at a particular moment in a particular situation. To interpret the historical representation, it is necessary to investigate related historical archives and facts; to interpret the artist's intention, it is necessary to investigate the essential meaning of the picture; to identify the object depicted in the painting, it is necessary to trace and examine the object and compare it with its depiction. However, these various kinds of representation are intertwined and interdependent in the picture; thus, only when the meaning of each is disclosed can the integral meaning of the painting be seen. *Epoché* and *réduction* may be useful approaches to concentrate on each object of the representation; the key is being aware that each representation has its own being in the whole picture.

To summarise, *epoché and réduction* are the principles of applying phenomenology in research. As attitudes and modes of perception, they help the researcher to rethink or question the most taken-for-granted accounts or common knowledge, for the sake of perceiving the objective things anew. In doing so, perception of objects is primarily led by the factual experience of those objects, rather than primarily by pre-formed concepts, theories, or meanings. This is the unique feature and strength of phenomenology – an approach of being free from the known thus being free to perceive the unknown. However, various studies show that there is no ideal performance of *epoché* and *réduction* in practice.

For this thesis, *epoché* and *réduction* provide the principles and attitude of perception – endeavouring to transcend the known to discover the unknown, meanwhile being aware of the risk of selective or partial *epoché* and *réduction.* Thus, applying *epoché* and *réduction* in the thesis is not ideally perfect but aims to make an unprejudiced and intersubjectively accessible description of the radical landscapes. Accordingly, the research emphasises the first-hand experience of encountering the landscape painting as well as the corresponding

physical landscape, and makes efforts to gain as much as possible the first-hand experiences of them; also, the research emphasises that making direct, original, and honest description of the experiences is the foundation of applying *epoché* and *réduction*.[112]

2.2 Intentionality

In phenomenology, intentionality is an essential concept that represents the key feature of consciousness. It derives from psychology and was introduced into modern philosophy by Brentano. For Brentano, intentionality is the capacity of the mind to be directed towards an object. He writes:

> Every mental phenomenon includes something as object within itself, although
> they do not all do so in the same way. In presentation something is presented,
> in judgment something is affirmed or denied, in love loved, in hate hated, in
> desire desired and so on.[113]

The 'mental phenomenon' in Brentano's concern refers to the state of mind that is directed by an abstract object, or the object in mind, such as love, hate, or desire. Husserl develops Brentano's notion of intentionality by bringing 'perception' and 'imagination' into it. He writes:

> ...in perception something is perceived, in imagination something is imagined,
> in a statement something is stated, in love something is loved, in hate
> something is hated, in desire something is desired etc.[114]

As a philosophical concept, intentionality generally refers to 'the aboutness or directedness or reference of mind (or states of mind) to things, objects, states of affairs, and events.'[115] Husserl describes and discusses intentionality with three notions: the intentional object, the intentional act, and the content or matter of the intentional act.[116] Merleau-Ponty considers intentionality as a phenomenon of both mental and bodily acts, thus linking the notion of

---

[112] The meaning of 'encountering' in this study see Introduction on Pages 18-19.

[113] Franz Brentano, *Psychology from an Empirical Standpoint*, trans. Antos C. Rancurello, D.B. Terrell, and Linda L. McAllister (1874, reprint, London: Routledge, 1995), 88.

[114] Husserl, *Logical Investigations II*, 554.

[115] Charles Siewert, "Consciousness and Intentionality", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, last modified 2016 https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2017/entries/consciousness-intentionality/

[116] Husserl, *Logical Investigations II,* 557-9.

intentionality to the physical world. He describes intentionality as 'a concrete spatial direction of an attitude or posture towards objects as they appear in the world'.[117] This research adopts both Husserl's and Merleau-Ponty's notions of intentionality.

2.2.1 Intentional act

Husserl indicates that the 'directedness' of the intentional act is provided by the intentional object.[118] The directedness refers to 'the situation of the object of certain moment' – the 'state of affairs' of the object and the matter of the intentional act is 'intending' or perceiving the 'state of affair' of an intentional object.[119]

For intending towards an object, an intentional act intends both the 'intentional material' and 'intentional essence' of the object and the difference between the two is the difference 'between the object **as** is intended and the object which **is** intended'.[120] That is to say, to an intentional object, immanent sensible contents are given (the intentional material), but what an intentional act ultimately takes from is the intentional essence of the intentional object; and the intentional essence is the directedness of the intentional act.[121] Theoretically, we may then perceive a particular intention if we perceive the part of the immanent content of the object that is taken by the intentional act.

Note that, for Husserl, the intentional act merely refers to a conscious act in mind or a mental event, although an intentional act can be performed by body, or by events of a body, as Merleau-Ponty stated.[122] Husserl's theory shows, on one hand, that to intend an object, the intentional act is performed by corresponding actual experiences of the object – 'in the actual experience described, a correspondingly complex act which presents the ego, the presentation, judgment, wish, etc.' – and, on the other hand, the intentional object also

---

[117] Martina Reuter, "Merleau-Ponty's Notion of Pre-Reflective Intentionality", *Synthese* 118, no. 1(1999): 72.

[118] Husserl, *Logical Investigations I*, 559, 564–5.

[119] ibid.

[120] Husserl, *Logical Investigations I*, 578–9.

[121] ibid.

[122] Martina Reuter, "Merleau-Ponty's Notion of Pre-Reflective Intentionality", *Synthese* 118, no. 1 (1999):72.

presents its state of affairs in the same experience.[123] Thus, the thesis adopts Husserl's theory on the point that actual experience of the intentional object are the performance of intentional acts, which mediates the mental acts and the intentional object and also makes the mental intentional acts presentative.

For Heidegger, 'the intentional relation' between intentional act and intentional object must be founded in the experience of 'being-in-the-world' with a manner of 'caring'. That is to say, the intentional essence of the intentional object shows itself in the experience of using the object, or 'caring' the object (the experience is the performance of an intentional act).[124] Thus the thesis adopts Heidegger's idea of that directedness of mind, or intentionality, exists in the daily practice of being or engaging with the things surrounding us. And since Merleau-Ponty links the act of consciousness with bodily movement, the thesis also adopts that an intentional act is constituted by both consciousness and concrete physical acts.

To summarise, intentional acts are performed in the experiences of an intentional object, as mind (such as perceiving, remembering) or physical bodily movements (such as drawing or painting). If the intentional acts produced factual consequence unto the intentional object, such as representation or interpretation of or appreciation or judgement to the intentional object, in the forms of thought, text, or picture, the intentional acts can be identified thus the corresponding intentionality can be perceived to some extent. Therefore, theoretically, one's intention can be perceived to some extent by studying one's intentional acts from three aspects: identifying the intentional object, experiencing the intentional object, and identifying one's intentional acts through examining the factual consequence produced by the intentional acts unto the intentional object.

Husserl noticed that the intentional act towards an intentional object may be a series or complex of acts, within which individual acts 'contribute their individual performances to the unity'.[125] Moreover, every individual act has a single 'objective reference' to the intentional object and the situation of the series or complex of intentional acts is dynamic

---

[123] Husserl, *Logical Investigations II,* 561.

[124] Wheeler, "Martin Heidegger".

[125] Husserl, *Logical Investigations II*, 580.

or in a flow; and new acts may be generated from a past act and, thus, perception to the intentional object develops itself.[126] Zahavi underlined what Husserl meant was that every intentional act has its own 'matter', or intentional essence; therefore, different acts could bear different intentional matters and conceive different meanings towards one object; and on the other hand, one matter can be carried by various intentional acts and towards various objects.[127] Husserl's indication and Zahavi's explanation suggest that only when the complex of intentional acts gains an ultimate 'matter' (or ultimate intentional essence) from the intentional object or objects, can the statement or meaning of the complex of intentional acts be established.

In summary, intentionality to an object may be performed by intentional acts, which may produce factual consequence unto intentional object through both mental and bodily movements. Also, intentional acts may form a complex of acts and the complex is dynamic – a new intentional act can and may be built on a past one. Further, multiple intentional acts may refer to the same object and various objects may be referred to by one intentional act. Moreover, the meaning of the intentional acts, which associated with intentionality, is reflected on the matter of the state of affairs of the intentional object.

2.2.2 Intentional object

Husserl indicated that the intentional object provides directedness to the intentional act and refers to both the intentional material and intentional essence of the object. In his later works, Husserl turned to transcendental idealism and believed 'the real world depends on consciousness for its existence and essence'.[128] Husserl's student Roman Ingarden (1893–1970 AD) was an ontological phenomenologist and the founder of phenomenological aesthetics. Ingarden challenged Husserl's later thinking and rejected the later Husserlian notions. Based on his ontological phenomenology, Ingarden proposed four modes of being

---

126 Husserl, *Logical Investigations II*, 580.

127 Zahavi, *Husserl's Phenomenology*, 23–4.

128 Edward S. Casey, "Aesthetic Experience" in *Handbook of Phenomenological Aesthetics*, eds. Hans Rainer Sepp and Lester Emberee (London: Springer, 2010), 3.

of objects: absolute, real, ideal, and purely intentional.[129] He later uses the notion of the 'purely intentional object' in his studies of art and aesthetics.[130]

For these four modes of being, Ingarden asserted that real objects are autonomous, which means the real objects are materially constituted with figural quality and have unique modes of existence, such as the rocks and trees in nature.[131] The intention of consciousness cannot change a real object or reduce its individual properties. Whereas purely intentional objects is different, it depends on 'the existence and essence of the appertaining act of consciousness'.[132] Ingarden also identified that a work of art is a 'purely intentional intersubjective object'.[133]

Ingarden initially employed the notion of the 'purely intentional object' in interpreting literary works and then broadened it to include architecture, music, and painting. He wrote that 'the literary work is neither a physical nor a psychophysical entity but a "purely intentional object" which has the source of its existence in the author's creative acts but at the same time has a certain physical ontic foundation.'[134] He also stated that purely intentional objects usually 'acquire their intendedness in the intentional acts that are interwoven with various other conscious experiences.'[135] When these acts and experiences are accompanied by various emotions or acts of will, 'the corresponding purely intentional objects gain vividness and richness in their contents during the acting and experiencing'.[136]

---

[129] Roman Ingarden, *Studia z estetyki, Vol. 3* (Warsaw: PWN, 1970), 266–7.
  Zofia Majewska, "The Philosophy of Roman Ingarden", in *Phenomenology World-Wide,*
  ed. Anna-Teresa Tymieniecka (Dordrecht; Boston: Kluwer Academic Publisher, 2002), 193.

[130] Roman Ingarden, *Time and Modes of Being* (Springfield, Ill.: Charles C Thomas, 1964), 157–163.
  Majewska, "The Philosophy of Roman Ingarden", 193.

[131] Ingarden, *Studia z estetyki, Vol. 3*, 266–7.
  Majewska, "The Philosophy of Roman Ingarden", 193.

[132] Roman Ingarden, *The Literary Work of Art,* trans. George G. Grabowicz (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1973), 122.

[133] Ingarden, *Studia z estetyki, Vol. 3*, 266–7.
  Majewska, "The Philosophy of Roman Ingarden",193.

[134] Roman Ingarden, *The Cognition of the Literary Work of Art,* trans. Ruth Ann Crowley and Kenneth R. Olson (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1973), 9.

[135] Ingarden, *The Literary Work of Art,* 126–7.

[136] ibid.

Andrzej Pytlak underlined that Ingarden's 'purely intentional object' is characterised by 'the two-sideness' of its form: 'one side is its contents, the other its intentional structure'.[137] Zofia Majewska indicated that the 'purely intentional object' has a dual construction: on one hand, purely intentional objects are 'real objects in which they are fixed'; on the other hand, they derive from 'the conscious experience of the artist' and, through the artist's intending the purely intentional object, 'the creative power of consciousness gets revealed.'[138]

Ontologists and phenomenologists have arguments on Ingarden's four modes of being of objects, and particularly the ambiguity in the relationship between the real object and the purely intentional object. For example, Amie Thomasson indicated that Ingarden's ontological approach must be based on the assumption that 'there are essential correlations between kinds of objects and the modes of cognition by means of which they can be known'.[139] Also, the notion of the purely intentional object is incompletely defined and cannot serve as a general interpretation of perceptual experience since, when the target of perception is unreal or non-veridical, the role of the purely intentional object – compared to the intentional object – becomes unclear.[140] Nonetheless, studies by Majewska, Pytlak, and Genki Uemura indicated that the purely intentional object plays a substantial role in representational contents and can be applied to works of art.[141]

According to Ingarden, in an artistic composition, 'what is conferred in an artist's mental acts is a derived intention' and in the process of composing an artwork 'the derived intention is supported by certain arrangements of the elements in the artwork and also by

---

[137] Andrzej Pytlak, "On Ingarden's Conception of the Musical Composition", in *On the Aesthetics of Roman Ingarden: Interpretations and Assessments,* eds. B. Dziemidok and P. McCormick (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publisher, 1989), 234–5.

[138] Majewska, "The Philosophy of Roman Ingarden", 193–4.

[139] Amie Thomasson, "Roman Ingarden", The Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy, last modified Fall 2020, https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/ingarden/

[140] Thomasson, "Roman Ingarden", https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/ingarden/

[141] Genki Uemura, "Demystifying Roman Ingarden's Purely Intentional Objects of Perception," In *New Phenomenological Studies in Japan*, eds. Nicolas de Warren and Shigeru Taguchi (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2019), 150.

Pytlak, "On Ingarden's Conception of the Musical Composition", 234–5.

Majewska, "The Philosophy of Roman Ingarden", 193–4.

the established aspects and qualities of the artwork'.[142] Further, the purely intentional object is 'simulated in creative artistic imagination with the help of special acts of consciousness'.[143] Hans H. Rudnick explained that, for Ingarden, 'the work of art is a purely intentional formation which has the source of its being in an artist's creative acts of consciousness and its foundation in "a certain physical object like…a patented canvas, which must be suitable shaped by the artist"'; moreover 'by virtue of its embodiment in the physical foundation, the work of art is intersubjectively accessible, "so that is becomes an intersubjective intentional object"'.[144]

Ingarden also emphasised the role of the viewer's positive consciousness in the process of experiencing an artwork, and suggested that the meaning of an artwork, or the artist's purely intentional object, is ultimately completed by the viewer's participation; because, as Paul B. Armstrong explained, when a beholder perceives the artist's compositional intention, 'an artist's compositional acts are reanimated (not precisely duplicated) by the consciousness of the beholder'.[145]

The philosophical discussion of Ingarden's ontological thoughts is not the task of this thesis, but the thesis adopts three points of view from Ingarden's notion of purely intentional object and the above philosophical studies on Ingarden's notion:

  1) The dual-form construction of the purely intentional object and 'the two-sideness' of its form;

  2) The relationship between the artist's creative acts in mind and the objective quality and properties of the artwork; and,

  3) The notion of purely intentional object can be used to unfold the meanings of artworks by beholders.

Resting upon the three points of view, the thesis extends Ingarden and the philosophers' ideas into the specific consideration of the relationships between the artist's compositional acts and the artist's compositional intention in the practical process of composing a painting. In the process, the artist's compositional intention is derived from consciousness

---

[142] Ingarden, *The Cognition of the Literary Work of Art,* 23.

[143] ibid*.,* 40.

[144] Hans H. Rudnick, *Ingardeniana II: New Studies in the Philosophy of Roman Ingarden With a New International Ingarden Bibliography* (Springer Science & Business Media, 2012), 193.

[145] Paul B. Armstrong "Phenomenology", in T*he Johns Hopkins Guide to Literary Theory and Criticism,* eds. Michael Groden and Martin Kreiswirth (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1994), 564.

and experiences and may be altered, improved, and finally performed by peculiar arrangements of pictorial elements in the painting, by formation of the picture, and by establishment of the quality and characteristics of the painting. The painting is, therefore, not merely an object of pigments and canvas, or a painted surface, but also the material form established by the artist's physical compositional acts for actualising the artist's compositional intention. Thus, for the perception of a viewer, the pictorial marks of those arrangement, formation, and establishment are the material clues of the artist's compositional acts and therefore also the experienceable constituents of the artist's compositional intention. Correspondingly, for the study, it is theoretically possible to grasp a compositional intention in the artist's mind and to receive the meaning expressed by the artist in the painting, by examining the material painting and investigating how the form, content, quality, colour, brushstroke, pictorial effect etc. are intentionally made by the artist.

To summarise, by adopting Ingarden's notion of the purely intentional object, this study will deal with the radical landscape paintings as the material purely intentional object of the artists, which preserve the artists' compositional intention and conveys the meaning expressed by the artists. Also, the study will examine the viewer's engagement to and perception of an artwork, because that ultimately complete and fulfil the artist's compositional intention and expression. In short, Ingarden's notion of the purely intentional object gives the study the final component of the theoretical phenomenological foundation, base on which both of the artist's compositional intention and the intersubjective experience between an artist and a beholder are perceivable to some degree. More important still, this research believes that the viewer's phenomenological engagement makes the work of art meaningful and significant to its viewers, and indeed, makes the work a work of art.

3. Summary

Phenomenology is a philosophy of experience and the meaning of experience in human perception. Husserl, its founder, established the principles of *epoché* and *réduction* which are fundamental to any phenomenological study. Husserl's theory on intentionality is the essential content of phenomenology and discussed the basic constituents of intentionality: intentional act, intentional object, and the matter of the intentional act.

In the history of phenomenology, notions of intentional act, intentional object, and the matter of the intentional act remained in development and debate. Regarding the intentional act and its matter, Heidegger raised the ideas of the 'being of the intentional' and 'engaging with things', to explore the intentional act and its matter in people's experiences of dwelling in the world and meanwhile being with things daily. Merleau-Ponty discussed the operation of intention on gestures or the movements of the body and indicated that, under normal circumstances, the movements of body were both objective and subjective, as the palm and the back of the hand are dependent on each other. Ingarden contributed to ontological phenomenology with the notion of the 'purely intentional object,' which may have limits in the general ontological consideration of things, but is applicable to the study of artworks and their meanings.

The above studies demonstrate that, rather than being merely a material object, an artwork is an intentional construction, an embodied subject, and the consequence of intentional acts that are able to be experienced and perceived by beholders to some extent. In other words, the objective painting and its pictorial elements are the flesh of the artist's compositional intention which is in the artist's mind and invisible to others; but the invisible compositional intention can gain its visible flesh through the artist's compositional acts, which perform or visualise the artist's compositional intention through the formation of the content, disposition, characteristics, and the establishment of the quality of the painting. Therefore, based on the basic theories of phenomenology, especially the principles of *epoché* and *réduction,* the notions of intentional act, intentional object, and purely intentional object, this thesis establishes the phenomenological method to study a radical landscape painting, regardless its cultural background. Specifically, the method is about exploring the artist's compositional intention through investigating the artist's intentional act, intentional object, and purely intentional object.

Phenomenology has long been applied in interpreting modern and contemporary art, including symbolist art and ready-made art. For example, E. Louis Lankford studies how phenomenology contributed to art criticism in art history via the method of description, which involves five components: receptiveness, orienting, bracketing, interpretive analysis, and synthesis.[146] Paul Crowther formulates a notion – 'phenomenological depth' – for his

---

[146] E. Louis Lankford, "A Phenomenological Methodology for Art Criticism", *Studies in Art Education* 25, no. 3 (April 1984): 151.

study on perceiving artworks, through describing 'how the relation between subject and object of experience changes character on the basis of difference modes of perception and action'.[147] Comparing with them, the phenomenological method established in this study has four different features. First, it is grounded on two essential ideas of phenomenology: *epoché* and *réduction*, and intentionality. Second, it is applied to interpreting classical and early modern radical landscape paintings. Third, the method is applied to radical landscape paintings in various cultures and traditions. Last, this research emphasises the importance of an artist's subjectivity in composition, as well as the value of an artwork's individuality – the unique and peculiar features of a particular artwork.

Part 2: The Phenomenological Method of the Research

The phenomenological method of the research is essentially a method of perception. It is a method established for strengthening an individual viewer's perception to a radical landscape painting, in order to perceive and interpret the painting anew, regardless the cultural difference between the painter, the painting, and the viewer. Establishment of the method references the notions of Husserl's intentionality and Ingarden's purely intentional object. And the essence of the method is to explore an individual artist's compositional intention in a particular painting and then to reveal the meaning and significance of the picture, through investigating the artist's key compositional acts, the artist's intentional objects and purely intentional object.

Specifically, the picture of a radical landscape painting (including the pictorial elements contained in it) is considered the artist's 'purely intentional object', and the artist's 'compositional act' is the 'intentional act'. The corresponding physical landscape is the most important 'intentional object' of the artist. For the research method, the artist's key compositional acts include both mental and physical acts, such as actually attending to the physical landscape, designing the picture in mind and accomplishing the design by painting, arranging the pictorial elements in imagining and fulfilling the arrangement in the picture, etc. By investigating the artist's purely intentional object and intentional object, and by tracing the key compositional acts of the artist's composition, the study may grasp

---

[147] Paul Crowther, *Phenomenology of the Visual Arts* (Stanford University Press, 2009), 3.

an artist's compositional intention in a radical landscape painting and reveal the meaning of the picture, and may also perceive the potential significance of a radical landscape to a viewer's experience.

The method of this research can be described as: **Taking *epoché* and *réduction* as the principle and basic attitude and going to the painting itself and related objects, to perceive the artist's compositional intention and the meaning of the painting, by identifying and analysing the key compositional acts of the artist within a two-step process of seeing.** The first step is to see perceptually and eidetically to the painting, the corresponding physical landscape, and other related objects, in order to gain first-hand experiences of them and descriptions of the experiences. The second-step is to see synoptically and reflectively to the gained experiences, which means to compare the various first-hand experiences and also to compare them with related 'previous interpretations, historical studies, common knowledge etc.' of 'the painting, the corresponding physical landscape, and other related objects', in order to find among them differences (not similarities), which may contain the marks of the artist's compositional acts; by analysing the reasons or causes of the differences, the key compositional acts of the artist may can be identified.

In the description, 'the painting itself' refers to the particular painting and the pictorial elements within it: they are the artist's 'intentional object' and 'purely intentional object', which convey the marks of the artist's compositional acts. 'Related objects' refer to the objects outside the picture and primarily refer to the physical landscape corresponding to the painting and secondly to the artist's sketches and drafts of the painting; other related objects include the artist's statements and writings in relation to the painting, the commission of the artwork, and etc.

'Going to the painting itself and related objects' means to experience and perceive the painting and related objects through a two-step process of seeing. 'Seeing' in the two-step process means to 'to perceive by the eyes', 'to comprehend', and 'to become aware of something with the eyes'.[148]

'The first-step seeing is to see perceptually and eidetically' means that the perceptually seeing relates to the first-hand experience, which follows the directness provided by the

---

[148] *The "King's English" Dictionary*, and *Compact Oxford English Dictionary.*

things to the seeing eyes. It is a dynamic and immediate experience of seeing and perceiving, towards the disposition and characteristics of the objects, under the principle of *epoché* and *réduction*. That is to say, perceptually seeing concentrates on the things themselves, would not to be distracted by the 'previous interpretations, historical studies, common knowledge etc'. In practice, perceptually seeing is especially not to see the corresponding physical landscape according the landscape painting; and when encountering the physical landscape, perceptually seeing is to experience the wild mountains and waters individually under the principles of *epoché* and *réduction*, and to focus on the awareness of the immediate experiences. Perceptual seeing takes the first-person perspective and is experiential, sensual, and individual, although what are seen would be what anyone can see at the same situation, in the same moment. The eidetically seeing is representative: it represents in mind (as a clear and vivid image) not just what is seen but also the vividness and richness of the experience itself. Eidetically seeing contributes to the description of the perceptually seeing; and the description is the outcome of the first-step seeing and the reference to the second-step seeing.

The second-step seeing is to see synoptically and reflectively. It is a process of using the first-hand experiences. It compares the various first-hand experiences, and also compares the first-hand experiences with related 'previous interpretations, historical studies, common knowledge etc.' of 'the painting, the corresponding physical landscape, other related objects', in order to find differences. Because the differences contain marks of the artist's compositional acts. Such as the differences between the experiences of the landscape painting and the corresponding physical landscape, the differences between the artist's literal compositional intention to the painting and the factual content and form of the painting, and the differences between one's actual experiences of the painting and others' interpretations of the painting from related previous or historical studies. To analyse how and why those differences are made is the approach to trace the artist's compositional acts; and the 'previous interpretations, historical studies, common knowledge etc.' contribute to those analysis. To summarise, 'the second-step seeing' is to see through various comparisons to find differences, and by investigating why and how these differences occurred, to some extent, compositional acts of the artist can be retrieved; thus,

the artist's compositional intention may be captured, and the meaning and significance of the painting can be revealed.[149]

The two-steps seeing is a process of seeing and perception. Very essentially, it means 'experiencing first and studying the experiences second', a process a viewer can employ to perceive and interpret a radical landscape paintings individually and uniquely. The two-steps seeing is not a universal and fixed formate to exam various paintings of different cultures, not for interpreting various painting within a fixed structure and constitutive content. Yet, it is a dynamic process of experiencing and perceiving, through which every viewer may have a unique approach to the artist's compositional intention and the meaning and significance of the painting. In practice, the two-step process of seeing can be applied in different stages of a study and applied repeatedly if the viewer needs. In this thesis, the two-steps process of seeing was respectively applied when 'seeing as the painter' and 'seeing as the individual self'. 'Seeing as the painter' is the main part of the study, focusing on tracing and examining the artist's compositional acts, in order to grasp the artist's compositional intention and the meaning of the painting. While 'seeing as the individual self' refers to experiencing the picture individually, in order to gain the significance of the painting particularly to the individual viewer.

Note that, *epoché* and *réduction* are the principles and basic attitude of the two-step process of seeing. For the first-step, to see perceptually and eidetically is to experience 'the painting, the corresponding physical landscape, and other related objects' under the principles of *epoché* and *réduction* as more as possible. For the second-step – to see synoptically and reflectively, the related 'previous interpretations, historical studies, common knowledge etc.' of 'the painting, the corresponding physical landscape, and other related objects' are the being compared references; and in the comparisons, under *epoché* and *réduction,* the being compared references **cannot** participate or change the first-hand experiences and the perceptions of them, which were gained in the first-step. Because, if they **could,** comparisons between the first-hand experiences and the various being compared references would become 'comparing between same kind of perceptions'; thus many differences could not be found and the comparisons would not be useful to the study.

---

[149] Note that some pictorial marks in the picture may be made accidentally or unconsciously by the artist. However, when the painting is finished, the whole picture and its pictorial elements are approved by the artist; therefore, how the artist addresses the accidentally or unconsciously made marks is also one compositional act and reflects the artist's compositional intention.

Also, to see synoptically and reflectively when 'seeing as the individual self', *epoché* and *réduction* function as an **attitude** rather than principles, referring to **consciously** stand back from the interpretations or judgements of others that are external to the inner world of the individual viewer, and to **consciously** focus on the individual's own immediate experience and perceiving the meaning of the experience inwardly. That is to say, the viewer compares the first-hand experience with something in the particular viewer's own mind and heart, such as memories of pervious experience, related feelings or emotions, and knowledge stored in the mind. Every individual's inner experiences are unique and that uniqueness is the essence of 'seeing as the individual self', constituting the significance of the painting to the individual viewer.

In the two case studies of the thesis, comparisons in the second-step seeing practically include three necessary components:

1) Comparing the first-hand experience of the painting with the first-hand experiences of the corresponding physical landscape to trace which elements of the physical landscape are selected by the artist for the composition and how the structure and content of the radical picture are formed.

2) Comparing the first-hand experience of the painting with the first-hand experiences of the draft sketches, to retrieve the formation of the picture and trace the artist's design of the pictorial structure and arrangements of the pictorial elements.

3) Comparing the first-hand experience of the content and pictorial effect of the painting with the artist's general and literal intention, to identify to whether or not the artist's compositional intention differs from the general and literal intentions.

To summarise, the phenomenological method of the research is employed neither for performing the theory of phenomenology, nor for examining whether or not the artists' ways of composition are phenomenological. Rather, it is a method to perceive an artist's compositional intention and the meaning and significance of a painting. The phenomenological method essentially refers to the two-step process of seeing. The relationship between the two steps is that 'the perceptual and eidetic seeing' gains the basic resource, raw material, and inspiration for 'the reflective and synoptic seeing'; while 'the reflective and synoptic seeing' employs the results of 'the perceptual and eidetic seeing' to make various comparisons among the experiences and with related 'previous interpretations, historical studies, common knowledge etc.', in order to identify the artist's

compositional acts, to reveal the artist's compositional intention and the meaning and significance of the painting. Naturally, the two kinds of seeing are intertwined in the process of perception, but being aware of and emphasising the two steps separately will help one's study to go systematically and help the perception to go efficiently to the meaning and significance of a painting.

In the two case studies of the thesis, the two-step process of seeing is applied in two stages of study – 'seeing as the painter' and 'seeing as the individual self'. Note that, as application of the phenomenological method is under *epoché* and *réduction,* in the two applicational cases, operation of the two steps is determined by the peculiarities of the two artworks, by how the painters composed the works, and how the individual viewer experiences them; therefore, the content and procedure of each case differ to the other. Nonetheless, the results of the two case studies both show that the method is effective in both, despite the cultural differences existing among the two paintings, the two artists, and myself as interpreter.

Part 3: One Identification

This part identifies the difference between phenomenalism and phenomenology, in order to further clarify the manner and purpose of the phenomenological method of this thesis.

1. Phenomenalism

Phenomenalism is not phenomenology. Phenomenalism is empirical. 'Phenomenalism maintains that statements asserting the existence of physical objects are equivalent in meaning to statements describing sensations.'[150] Hence, 'phenomenon' in phenomenalism refers to any occurrence that may be perceived through the human senses.

Phenomenalism has its roots in George Berkeley's (1685–1753 AD) theory of subjective idealism. Berkeley claims that for the world and all things, 'their BEING is to be

---

[150] Richard Fumerton, "Phenomenalism", in The Shorter Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy, ed. Edward Craig (London: Routledge, 2005), 790.

perceived'.[151] He believes that the existence of objects is constituted by human perceptions; therefore, non-perceived objects do not exist. Nonetheless, as God perceives everything, the existence of non-perceived objects is maintained by God.[152] As an epistemological theory, phenomenalism can be also traced to Kant's transcendental idealism. Unlike Berkeley, Kant does not deny the existence of the non-perceived or non-experienced objects, but asserts that the phenomena of objects are the sensory experience, which does not represent the 'things in themselves'.[153] In other words, the things in themselves are independent of human experience.

In the nineteenth century, John Stuart Mill (1806–1873 AD) developed the phenomenalist theory, which is considered Classical Phenomenalism today. According to him, sense perception is the 'original data, or ultimate premises of our knowledge'; therefore, knowledge 'is arrived at solely by inferences from that original data' and, therefore, we can 'reveal the laws which govern natural phenomena'.[154] In the late nineteenth century, Ernst Mach (1838–1916 AD) defined phenomenalism as the 'logical constructions out of sense-data' and the knowledge grounds on the given relations among phenomena.[155] Later, phenomenalism was developed by Bertrand Russell and A. J. Ayer in the area of logic in the twentieth century.

The history of phenomenalism shows that the primary motivation of phenomenalists is to avoid scepticism.[156] Phenomenalists argue that 'by reducing claims about the physical

---

[151] George Berkeley, *A Treatise Concerning the Principles of Human Knowledge* (J. B. Lippincott & Company, 1878), 197.

[152] Berkeley, A Treatise Concerning the Principles of Human Knowledge, 321–2.

[153] Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason,* eds. and trans. Paul Guyer and Allen W. Wood (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 190 (B69).

[154] John Stuart Mill, *A System of Logic, Ratiocinative and Inductive* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green, s, 1906), 84–86 (System, VII: 7).

Christopher Macleod, "John Stuart Mill", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, last modified 25 August 2016, https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2018/entries/mill/

[155] Ernst Mach, "The Analysis of the Sensations. Antimetaphysical", *The Monist* 1, no. 1 (1890): 65.

Phillip R. Sloan, "Mach's Phenomenalism and the British Reception of Mendelism", *Comptes Rendus de l'Académie Des Sciences III, Sciences de La Vie* 323, no. 12 (December 2000): 1072.

[156] Henrik Lagerlund, "A History of Skepticism in the Middle Ages", in *Rethinking the History of Skepticism*, ed. Henrik Lagerlund (Leiden: BRILL, 2010), 13–4.

world', phenomenalism 'claims about possible sensations that we can preserve the very intelligibility of talk about the physical world'.[157] That is to say, our perception of the physical world is established on what we sense or experience in the physical world. Thus, phenomenalism does not (and cannot) establish relations between object and subject; instead, it addresses the relationships among various subjects, in order to reveal how the subject perceives the object and approaches the truth of the physical world. Therefore, for phenomenalism, perceptual experiences or sense-data, and the given relations among them, are the premise of human knowledge of the physical world, which is very different from phenomenology.

2. Phenomenalism is not phenomenology

The differences between phenomenalism and phenomenology can be summarised in three points: the content of the notion of the phenomenon, the purpose of its study, and the manner of perception. First, phenomena, to phenomenalism, are the perceptual properties or qualities of the object, such as colour, sound, and time. Observations or experiences are the approaches, through which the subject collect the sense-data and perceive the phenomena. Based on the sense-data, the subject finds connections and logic constructions among the phenomena and therefore builds a subjective view of the objects. Whereas in phenomenology, the content of phenomena is rather more, because the subject not only collects the empirical sense-data of objects, such as colour and sound, but also senses and experiences the sensing and experiencing, and perceives the feelings, moods, and meanings of the senses and experiences, during the process of sensing and experiencing objects.

Second, for the purposes of study, phenomenalism understands the quality of the objects empirically, and aims at the qualitative truth of the physical world. The ultimate purpose of phenomenalism is to discover how to benefit from objects and the physical world. Whereas phenomenology aims to eidetically and representatively perceive the internal mind, specifically how the subjective mind intends towards an object and what directedness the object provides to the mental intentional act at a certain moment and in certain circumstance. The ultimate purpose of phenomenology is to understand how to benefit from our own experience, in order to understand human intentionality. For art studies,

---

[157] Fumerton, "Phenomenalism", 790.

phenomenology helps to understand an artist's compositional intention and expression in an artwork by phenomenologically experiencing it. It also helps to explore the meaning and significance of an artwork to the beholder's experience and the conditions of generating intersubjective experience between artists and beholders during the process of experiencing an artwork.

Moreover, phenomenology studies the essence of experience. Taking Husserl's discussion of time as an example, a phenomenalist measures time with units (eg. minute, hour, year, etc.), while Husserl indicates that the specific apprehension of time is established in the lived experience, 'in which the temporal [of time] in the Objective sense of appears'.[158] Husserl's 'lived experience' refers to the dynamic experience of particular moments; Husserl has the empirical knowledge of time, but when he apprehends time in the phenomenological approach, he describes it as the moment of 'the intense present' between the 'still there past' and the 'pressure of imminent future', as explained by Jan Halák, Ivo Jirásek, and Mark Nesti.[159] His description is not an expression related to empirical knowledge of time, but a description of the essence of time – 'the temporal' of time. This represents another important purpose of phenomenology – to apprehend the essence of things via perceiving the lived experience of the things.

Third, as regards the manner of perception, phenomenalism collects sense-data within a knowledge system for measuring and classifying the object, whereas phenomenology, by applying *epoché* and *reduction,* lets the experience and perception of things to be led by intentionality or the directedness the things provided to the subjectivity, thus we may have a chance to see the object anew.

To summarise, basically, phenomenalism addresses our sense-data of things, whereas phenomenology addresses the meaning of our experience of things. The former aims at the knowledge of things, the latter at the perception of the essential meaning of experiencing the existence of things to us. For this art history study, the phenomenological approach is important because first it helps to understand the particular experience of the artist regarding the physical landscape from which the artist's particular compositional intention

---

[158] Edmund Husserl, *The Phenomenology of Internal Time-Consciousness,* ed. Martin Heidegger, trans. James S. Churchill (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2019), 24–26.

[159] Jan Halák, Ivo Jirásek, and Mark Nesti, "Phenomenology is Not Phenomenalism. Is There Such a Thing as Phenomenology of Sport?", *Acta Gymnica,* Vol. 44, no.2 (2014): 122.

is generated and developed. Second, it helps us to find everyone's own way to experience

an artwork and to understand how the experience of artwork is important to our perception.

Chapter Three: Turner's *Loch Coruisk, Skye* Introduction

Introduction

Joseph Mallord William Turner's watercolour, *Loch Coruisk, Skye* (Figure 1), is a radical landscape painting. It was made to be engraved to illustrate Sir Walter Scott's (1771–1832 AD) long narrative poem *The Lord of the Isles.* The story of the poem takes place on the Isle of Skye, which is located in the Inner Hebrides, off the west coast of southern Scotland. It was a desolate island in Turner's time and the watercolour depicts the wild mountains and waters of Loch Coruisk on the island.

To capture the artist's compositional intention in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* through applying the phenomenological method – the two-step process of seeing, the study first examines five objects or groups of objects to gain various first-hand experiences of the picture and its pictorial elements, of the physical landscape of Loch Coruisk, of the onsite sketches of Loch Coruisk made by Turner for preparing the composition, of the text of Scott's *The Lord of the Isles,* and of the engraving after *Loch Coruisk, Skye.* Among the various first-hand experiences, the first-hand experiences of the physical Loch Coruisk and the picture of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* are the necessary and the most important to the study. Second, the study describes the first-hand experiences and analyses them through three groups of comparisons, in order to find differences and contrasts, which contain the traces of the artist's key compositional acts.

The first group of comparisons compares the first-hand experience of the physical Loch Coruisk with the geological and geographical interpretations of the land around Loch Coruisk, with Turner's sketches of the loch, and with the composed pictorial landscape in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. The second group compares the first-hand experience of the painting with the poetic depictions of Loch Coruisk in Scott's *The Lord of the Isles.* The third group compares the first-hand experiences of the various pictorial elements in the picture, compares the pictorial effects between the painting and the engraving after *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* and also compares the artistic effects of the painting with Turner's talks and writings on painting landscapes.

Results of the comparisons help the study to retrieve the key compositional acts of Turner and. By examining the meanings of the key compositional acts, the study demonstrates that Turner's general and literal intentions were to fulfil the commission of illustrating Scott's poem and to depict the wild nature of Loch Coruisk. His compositional intention was to represent an ideal wild mountains and waters in his imagination, and also to represent the poetic meaning of Scott's poem. Correspondingly, Turner expressed multiple meanings in the painting, some obvious, some subtle. Furthermore, the study shows that the painting has the pictorial capacity to cause intersubjective experience and evoke viewers' imagining, and to be visually significant to its viewers.

The chapter presents the case study in seven divisions. The introduction discusses the background of the artist, the artwork, previous studies, and the artist's general intention. Parts One to Three compare the first-hand experience of the physical landscape of Loch Coruisk with *Loch Coruisk, Skye* and with Turner's draft sketches of the loch; results of the comparisons reveal the formation of the picture, the key compositional acts of the artist, and the compositional intention of the artist. Part Four compares the first-hand experience of Turner's *Loch Coruisk, Skye* with Scott's *The Lord of the Isles,* revealing further the artist's compositional intention. Parts One to Four are the first stage of the study – 'seeing the painting as the painter'. Part Five is the second stage of the study – 'experiencing the painting as the individual self', in order to reveal the significance of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. Study of this part is based on the statement of the first-hand experiences of the individual self – me, the interpreter, and the content may go beyond Turner's intention and may be different with others' first-hand experiences; thus it is presented as the last division before the conclusion. The final division presents the conclusion of the case study.

1. J. M. W. Turner

J. M. W. Turner was a British landscapist of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. His first watercolour of an urban landscape, *A View of the Archbishop's Palace, Lambeth* (Figure 4), was exhibited at the Royal Academy in 1790 when he was fifteen years old, and an oil painting of a natural landscape, *Fishermen at Sea* (Figure 5), was exhibited in 1796. In 1799 he was elected an Associate of the Royal Academy at the age of twenty-four and was granted full membership in 1802. Turner was a highly productive

painter, watercolourist, and printmaker. He left behind about five hundred oil paintings and thousands of watercolours, drawings, sketches, and engravings.

As a talented and innovative landscapist, Turner was identified as an English romantic artist and also known as a colourist, because of his expressive manner of creating atmosphere and his innovative way of using colour and light in landscape. As an expert on perspective, Turner could depict the spatial structure and depth of his landscapes with realistic accuracy. He painted many great classical and historical works, while his achievement in painting natural landscapes was shown by masterpieces such as *View in the Avon Gorge* (1791), *Snow Storm* (1812), *Crossing the Brook* (1815), *The Lake, Petworth* (1827), and *The Scarlet Sunset* (1830–40) (Figures 6 –10).

Turner was an energetic painter and a sensitive perceiver of landscape. He travelled widely in his own country and Europe and made plenty of onsite sketches. His bodily experience in the natural, physical landscape was diverse, rich, and highly involved in his composition. In consequence, and also benefiting from his exquisite technique and innovative manner of composition, Turner's landscapes, especially his wild natural landscapes, left strong impact to the viewers, not only visually but also experientially.

2. Loch Coruisk, Skye

The work was commissioned in 1831 by Robert Cadell (1788–1849 AD), the publisher of a new edition of the *Poetical Works* by the highly regarded Scottish poet Walter Scott. The content of the commission was to draw twenty-four illustrations related to the poems for the new twelve-volume edition, specifically one frontispiece and one title page vignette for each volume. *Loch Coruisk, Skye* was designed as the frontispiece of Volume 10, *The Lord of the Isles*, in which Loch Coruisk was the setting of the story. The painting was made to be engraved and Henry Le Keuxcan (1812–1896 AD) produced the engraving between 1833 and 1834 (Figure 2). The engraving was printed in black and white on the frontispiece of Volume 10 of the new edition, published in 1834 (Figure 3).

An advertisement for the new edition of the *Poetical Works* announced that the illustrations would be 'taken from real scenes described in the various poems' and Cadell and Scott,

therefore, invited Turner to Scotland to visit the landscapes associated with the poems.[160]

Initially, Turner did not plan to go to Scotland in person when he accepted the commission,

since he had visited Scotland in 1797, 1801, 1818, and 1822 and his sketch books were full

of Scottish landscapes. Before he changed his mind, he had already made fifteen designs

for the illustrations and planned to do more based on his own sketches, and perhaps also

prints by other artists.[161] It was Scott's personal invitation for Turner to visit his home,

Abbotsford, that flattered Turner and finally made him tour Scotland in 1831. Then Turner

visited Loch Coruisk in person for composing the illustrations of *The Lord of the Isles*.

Turner started his tour in August, arrived at Scott's Abbotsford on 4 August, and departed

for Loch Coruisk on 8 August.[162] He is likely to have prepared a great deal for this tour as

he usually did for a sketching tour. He wrote that he would be rather reluctant to 'turn back

without seeing Staffa and Mull and all...', although Scott and Cadell informed him that the

plan to travel through all the Western Highlands and isles would be too lengthy.[163] No

specific details have yet been found regarding how Turner prepared for the Loch Coruisk

trip, but Turner probably disused it with Scott at Abbotsford.[164] Turner's experience of

Loch Coruisk impressed him and was significant to his composition. In a note in the

Poetical Works, Scott quoted Turner's remark on Loch Coruisk: 'No words could have

given a truer picture of this, the wildest of Nature's landscape.'[165] Turner made several

sketches of Loch Coruisk for drafting *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. In his *Stirling and the West

Sketchbook*, six sketches are found that relate to *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. Turner finished *Loch*

---

[160] Adele M. Holcomb, "Turner and Scott", Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes 34 (1971), 386–97.

[161] Gerald Finley, *Landscapes of Memory* (London: Scolar, 1980), 79.

[162] Finley, *Landscapes of Memory*, 101–2.

[163] ibid., 136.

[164] Holcomb, "Turner and Scott", 393.

[165] Finley, *Landscapes of Memory*, 137.
Walter Scott, *The Lord of the Isles, The Poetical Works of Sir Walter Scott Vol. 10* (Edinburgh: Robert Cadell, 1833), 433 (Canto III, note 3).

Coruisk, Skye in his London studio a few months after his Scotland tour, together with the other twenty-three illustrations.[166]

For the content of the twenty-four illustrations, Cadell sent a list of twenty-four subjects to Turner in March 1831. The list was constantly discussed and altered by Cadell and Scott before Turner arrived at Abbotsford, when he too, as the illustrator, participated in the discussions and made some alterations.[167] In Turner's one-month tour, he visited many places and sketched them one by one; and the sketches had no strong connections with one another. The twenty-four final illustrations are also independent of one another in content, even though they all link to the *Poetical Works* and take the same formats of frontispiece and vignette. Therefore, *Loch Coruisk, Skye* is studied as an individual painting in this case study.

The above historical facts show that *Loch Coruisk, Skye* is a radical landscape painting, first because Loch Coruisk is a real place and the mountains and waters of the loch were wild and desolate in Turner's time and, second, because the content and pictorial effect of the painting indicate that Turner did not depict Loch Coruisk realistically. Last, even though the painting is an illustration of *The Lord of the Isles,* Turner did not reference explicit incidents or characters in the poem to make up a the picture. Instead, he perceived Scott's poetic depictions of Loch Coruisk and grasped the dramatic tension that ran throughout the whole story, then inventively composed the pictorial landscape in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* to represent his perception of Scott's poem. Meanwhile, the composed landscape is an expression of Turner's imagining of the ideal wildest Loch Coruisk.

3. Turner's intention

For composing *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* Turner's general intention was to complete the commission and illustrate the poem *The Lord of the Isles,* and his literal intention was to

---

[166] Finley, *Landscapes of Memory*, 77.
  Holcomb, "Turner and Scott", 395.

[167] Finley, *Landscapes of Memory*, 101–124, 136–7.

depict the wilderness of Loch Coruisk, the wildest nature, as he remarked.[168] While in

respect of an artist's compositional intention, Turner wrote:

> Here rules are conducive only to selecting compatibility, or to informing how
> far the qualities of the mind may combine its perceptions to avoid error or
> failure, in labouring to unite contending elementary or natural incongruities, to
> produce the feeling excited by poetic pictorial members as certain of success
> they ought to be pictorial members, or judicious selections of historic incidents
> that the active powers of the mind may not lead the imitative power of the hand
>
> into a labyrinth through false choice.[169]

The writing shows that a painter's choice, in selecting content or ways of handling the

contending elements in the picture, determines how the artist's compositional

contemplation transitions into 'the feelings' produced in the painting. That is to say, Turner

was aware that a subjective idea or perception could be visualised in the feelings produced

or represented by 'poetic pictorial' components in a painting. Moreover, for Turner,

handling the contending elements in a painting, or employing visual contrasts in a painting,

was one way to visualise a feeling and to excite a viewer's mind. For the case study, this is

considered one kind of compositional act and, therefore, an approach to Turner's

compositional intention. Accordingly, in the following studies, pictorial contrasts and the

feelings (or pictorial effects) produced by the contrasts are notable elements of the

phenomenological examination.

One example shows that an artist's compositional intention may be lost in beholders' eyes,

though the intention factually exists in paintings. Turner's *Snowstorm* (Figure 58) was once

dismissed by the critics, who described the work as a 'frantic puzzle', a 'mass of soapsuds

and white wash'.[170] Ruskin recorded Turner's response: 'Soapsuds and white wash! What

would they have? I wonder what they think the sea's like? I wish they'd been in it.'[171]

Certainly the foam of the sea-waves do in some way resemble soapsuds and white wash.

However, in the reality, the foam and water are generated from, and also a part of, the huge

---

[168] Scott, *The Lord of the Isles*, 433.

[169] John Gage, *Colour in Turner: Poetry and Truth* (London: Studio Vista, 1969), 201.

[170] John Ruskin, *The Works of John Ruskin Vol. 13,* eds. E. T. Cook and Alexander Wedderburn (London: George Allen, 1904), 161.

[171] ibid.

volumes of the ocean waves; they participate in the restless movements of the waves, in the vast space that contained the ocean, air, and land. Correspondingly, the motion and strength represented by the broken water waves and white foam in Turner's *Snowstorm* do not belong to the foam and water in a basin. Turner's response to his critics shows that first-hand experience of the landscape is crucial for both composing and perceiving a landscape painting. It is also crucial for identifying the artist's intentional object in the composition: in *Snowstorm,* the artist's intentional object is the powerful motion of the ocean waves, not the realistic appearance of water and foam. Thus, in the case study, the essential first step is to gain and describe the first-hand experience of both the physical Loch Coruisk, and the pictorial landscape of *Loch Coruisk, Skye.*

4. Previous studies

Many studies have been conducted on Turner's 1831 Scotland tour and his onsite sketches, as well as on *Loch Coruisk, Skye.* Biographies of Turner, such as Walter Thornbury's *The Life of J.M.W. Turner* (1877), Alexander Joseph Finberg's *The Life of J.M.W. Turner, R.A.* (1961)*,* Jack Lindsay's *J.M.W. Turner, his life and work* (1966)*,* and James Hamilton's *Turner: a life* (2014), all record the commission of the work and Turner's tour.[172]

Moreover, Adele M. Holcomb's *Turner and Scott* studied the commission and the artist's relationship with Scott, based on the correspondence between Scott and Cadell.[173] Her research revealed details of the commission, especially on the selection of the twenty-four subjects of the illustrations. She suggested that the relationship between the poet and the painter was not positive because Scott thought Turner was a genius as an artist but also a 'grasping' businessman; thus, Scott may disdain Turner to some extent. However, according to Holcomb, the result of their collaboration was constructive; the combination of Turner's painting and Scott's poetry enhanced the supremacy of landscape art at that time and became an important mark of 'the ultimate maturity of British Romanticism'.[174]

---

[172] Walter Thornbury, *The Life of J. M. W. Turner* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1939), 325–45.

  Alexander Joseph Finberg, *The Life of J. M. W. Turner* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1939), 332.

  James Hamilton, *Turner - A Life* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1997), 256.

[173] Holcomb, "Turner and Scott", 396.

[174] ibid.

Gerald Finley's *Landscapes of Memory* draws a different conclusion from Holcomb on the relationship between the two artists – the painter (the illustrator) and the poet (the employer). His research was based on newly discovered documents, including correspondence between Turner, Scott, and Cadell, as well as Cadell's diary. Finley demonstrated that Turner and Scott developed a kinship during their collaboration; they shared a common perception on nature and appreciated the natural landscape in almost the same way. Regarding Turner's tour of Loch Coruisk, Finley clarified that Turner took a steamboat to Loch Scavaig from Elgo and then walked to the loch. Finley also explained that the twenty-four watercolour illustrations were completed by March 1832 and Cadell arranged their engraving subsequently.[175]

For this case study, Holcomb's and Finley's research both demonstrate that Turner's composition of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* involved the artist's onsite experience in Loch Coruisk. Also, since the work was a commission to illustrate Scott's poem, the initial and primary intention of Turner was to visualise the landscape described by Scott in his poem. Third, Finley's demonstration of the kinship between Turner and Scott suggests that their relationship may also be reflected in Turner's composition of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. Resting upon these points, the case study goes further to suggest that neither Turner's compositional intention to *Loch Coruisk, Skye* nor the meaning of the landscape picture can be treated simply as a landscape portrait, because Turner's compositional intentions were multiple; and the same is true of the meaning of the painting.

Previous studies remarked that *Loch Coruisk, Skye* was an astonishing work with double values. On one hand, as Ruskin, Finberg, Finley, Gage, and Hamilton suggested, it successfully represents the features of the physical landscape of Loch Coruisk, from the geological and meteorological features of the landform to the detailed appearances of mountain peaks and rocks. On the other hand, the geological features are inventively exaggerated in the depictions. Berger stated that, in *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* he saw that 'nature entered Turner's work – or rather his imagination – as violence.'[176] William S. Rodner underlined that Turner's 'vortex motif plays a decisive part' in raising the tension in the

---

[175] Finley, *Landscapes of Memory*, 146–7.

[176] John Berger, *About Looking* (London: Writers and Readers, 1980), 143.

painting.[177] Eric Shanes emphasised that, in visualising Scott's poetic descriptions of Loch Coruisk, Turner built an atmosphere of risk in the picture with an inventive manner, which compressed various original actualities of the physical landscape into the pictorial landscape.[178]

Regarding the artist's design of the picture, Mungo Cowbell and Andrew Wilton suggested that the pictorial form of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* was a reversion to Turner's *Ben Arthur, Scotland* (1819, Figures 11, 12), which showed the same 'wave-like rhyme' pattern of the landscape. In *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* however, the repeated presentation of the pattern was more violent.[179] Hamilton perceived that the powerful 'wave-like rhyme' pattern related to Turner's thoughts on geometric form, which for Turner meant the elementary principle of Nature.[180]

Richter-Musso Ines and Ortrud Westheider curated the exhibition *Turner and the Elements* in 2012.[181] The 'elements' referred to the four elements of fire, water, earth, and air, which, in a theory of classical antiquity, constituted the world. In this exhibition, *Loch Coruisk, Skye* was placed in the section *The Element of Earth*. Ines and Westheider stated that, rather than a geological survey, *Loch Coruisk, Skye* was an interpretation of the dynamic force of the element of earth. They suggested that the painting not only showed the artist's understanding of geology but also his awareness of scientific discussions on the formation of Earth, in contrast to the religious interpretation of the creation of Earth in Turner's time. They also indicated that Turner successfully connected his studies of natural elements to the poetic vision in Scott's poem; therefore, the painting represented an emotional relationship between the perceiver and the natural phenomena.

---

177 William S Rodner, J.M.W. Turner: Romantic Painter of the Industrial Revolution (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 83.

178 Eric Shanes, *The Life and Masterworks of J.M.W. Turner* (New York: Parkstone International, 2008), 198–9.

179 Mungo Campbell, A Complete Catalogue of Works by Turner in the National Gallery of Scotland (Edinburgh: National Galleries of Scotland, 1993), 77.

Andrew Wilton, *Turner and the Sublime* (London: British Museum Publications Ltd, 1980), 32.

180 James Hamilton, *Turner and the Scientists* (London: Tate Gallery Publishing, 1998), 120.

181 Ines Richter-Musso, Ortrud Westheider, and Michael Philipp, *Turner and the Elements* (University of Chicago Press, 2011), 94–96.

Other than the above studies, one issue mentioned repeatedly in previous studies was the association between Turner's *Loch Coruisk, Skye* and the Scottish geologist and writer John MacCulloch's (1773–1835 AD) writings on and illustrations of the Western Isles of Scotland. MacCulloch's writings included the article "The Transactions of the Geological Society" (1811–1814), his first book *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland* (1819), and his second book *The Highlands and Western Isles of Scotland* (1824). The first book contained many graphs representing the geological interpretations of rock structure and landform in the Western Isles, and the second contained MacCulloch's literal or aesthetic descriptions of Loch Coruisk.

Gage and Klonk both discussed the issue, respectively from the perspectives of Turner's intellectual life, and the impact of phenomenalism on geologists and artists from the late eighteenth to the early nineteenth century. Gage indicated that Turner was a professional intelligent artist, whose social relationships with intellectuals, such as MacCulloch, contributed to his career as a landscape painter. Gage suggested that Turner probably acquired MacCulloch's writings. In *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* Gage perceived a sublime feeling generated from the contrast between the insect-like human beings and the gigantic natural scenery, and thought this indicated that Turner was inspired by MacCulloch's descriptions of Loch Coruisk in MacCulloch's second book.

Klonk studied MacCulloch's geological illustrations of the Western Isles of Scotland and the descriptions of the Cuillin hills around Loch Coruisk in MacCulloch's two books. Meanwhile, she also examined Turner's *Loch Coruisk, Skye* and other painters' works of Loch Coruisk. Klonk's studies aimed at revealing how the shift in perception of nature was manifested in artists' modes of depicting landscape. The premise of her studies was the acceptance of phenomenalism in perception by scientists and artists from 1790 to 1830. Note that phenomenalism the term Klonk employed in her study is different from the concept of phenomenology, as it was explained earlier in this thesis in Chapter Two Part 3. In her study, Klonk first identified the appearance of phenomenalism in aesthetics, such as in the writings of Edmund Burke (1729–1797 AD), Archibald Alison (1757–1839 AD), and Dugald Stewart (1753–1828 AD), and then she found instances of phenomenalist (not phenomenologist) impact on the works of geologists and artists.

Klonk explained that she used the term 'phenomenalism' in her search because she thought it was a term that underlined the perception of the individual subject and emphasised the vital role the individual observer played in the perception of natural phenomena.[182] According to her definition, phenomenalism attempts to capture the reality faithfully as it appeared, not the reality as 'it is in itself or in its underlying essence'; also, phenomenalists 'retained the aspiration towards scientific generality, but on the basis of the individual and particular observations made by the subject'.[183]

Klonk argued that phenomenalism temporarily left impacts on both artists' and geologists' modes of perception at that time, but the impact on artists' practice was indirect.[184] In her studies, one group of examples was several landscapes of Loch Coruisk by Turner, William Daniell (1769–1837 AD), George Fennel Robson (1788–183 AD3), and John Knox (1778–1845 AD). She compared these landscapes with MacCulloch's aesthetic descriptions of Loch Coruisk and found obvious differences. She suggested that this was the consequence of the phenomenalist individuality – the individual's subjective observation and response to the natural phenomena. For Turner's *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* Klonk suggested that, on one hand, the work was rendered with geological accuracy; on the other hand, the work was characterised by involving the 'personal experience of the [artist's] observing subject'.[185] Thus, Klonk indicated that Turner had gone beyond phenomenalism and towards subjectivism in the composition of the painting.

In Klonk's argument, she noted that the landscape of Loch Coruisk looked different in MacCulloch's, Daniell's, and Turner's works, however she did not provide adequate information of the physical landscape of Loch Corusk, which would be the references in her comparisons. She cannot therefore explain further the reason and meaning of the differences she found, regarding to the impact of phenomenalism to the various artists and geologists.

To summarise, in the previous studies, Holcomb and Finley's research outlined the historical facts of the commission of *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* Turner's Scottish tour and

---

[182] Charlotte Klonk, *Science and the Perception of Nature* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1996), 5.

[183] Klonk, *Science and the Perception of Nature*, 5, 7.

[184] ibid., 22–6.

[185] ibid., 93–5.

visiting of Loch Coruisk, as well as the relationships between Turner and Scott. The common remark of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* – by Ruskin, Finberg, Finley, Gage, Hamilton, Shanes, Berger, and Rodner – was that it is a great landscape painting and has a double value: the successful geological and meteorological representation of the place and the intense poetic ambience created by the artist. While Cowbell, Wilton, and Hamilton noticed the repetition of the vortex pattern in *Ben Arthur* and *Loch Coruisk, Skye;* Gage, Ines and Westheider underlined how Turner's scientific knowledge were reflected in this work. Gage and Klonk both discussed the relationship between MacCulloch's and Turner's works; the former focussing on the influence of MacCulloch the geologist and his works to Turner's career and *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, the later looking at whether the two took phenomenalism as the mode to make their works of the landscape. Klonk also explored the 'personal experience of the [artist's] observing subject' through comparing *Loch Coruisk, Skye* with other paintings of Loch Coruisk and MacCulloch's works, she indicated that, for *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, Turner had gone beyond phenomenalism towards subjectivism.

This case study examines *Loch Coruisk, Skye* from a different perspective. It explores Turner's compositional intention, the meaning of the painting, and the significance of the picture to its viewers, through applying the phenomenological method. However, the identified historical facts related to *Loch Coruisk, Skye* and previous interpretations of the work from other perspectives are important references for the case study. Note that, in the practical process of conducting the case study, researching the related previous studies was the second-step, after gaining first-hand experience of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* and the physical landscape Loch Coruisk, to ensure that the first-hand experience was gained under conditions of *epoché* and *réduction* as far as possible.

Part 1: Experiencing and Perceiving the Physical Landscape of Loch Coruisk

1. First-hand experience of Loch Coruisk

The physical Loch Coruisk valley displays its objective features to every human eye. The appearances of the natural things within it, however, such as the position and structure of the valley, the shape of the surrounding mountains and the loch, the colours and sounds in

the valley, the weather, the clouds and wind, the light and shads are all in movements, some fast, some slow, some moving, some still. Each person can only see Loch Coruisks in one state at one moment, but can see it in 360-degree view, by looking forward and back, up and down and around, repeatedly and continually. If standing still, each person can see one object from one direction, one angle, at one level, in one position; if walking in the valley, each person can see and meanwhile move close to or away from one object. Thus, the landscape can be seen as a spatial continuum, which contains the large mountain complex under the dome of the sky, with the loch and mountains a part of the whole space. Among all the different ways and situations of seeing, as a normal person, in the valley of Loch Coruisk, I saw what normal people can see; but, meanwhile, my seeing was led by objects that mattered to my intention. Intentional objects of my experience in the valley of Loch Coruisk included three groups:

  1) the positional relationships between the loch and the surrounding mountains – the Black Cuillins;

  2) the appearance of the water, mountains, and rock faces; and

  3) the temperature, colour, natural sound, weather, and atmosphere in the valley.

My experience of Loch Coruisk started when I arrived in Elgol and ended when I left the place by boat. I went to Loch Coruisk in early August, the same month in which Turner went there in 1831. I followed Turner's route and arrived in Elgol on 2 August. Elgol is a small town on the south-eastern edge of Loch Scavaig. At Elgol, I had my first glance towards the distant Black Cuillins, which is a group of peaks with a dark, rugged appearance and huge folds on the bodies. The peaks could be identified by their peculiar shapes from a distance. From west to east, they were Gars-bheinn (triangular top), Sgurr na Banachdich, Sgurr a'Mhadaidh, Bruach na Frithe (with the trig point), Am Basteir (with its jagged 'Basteir Tooth'), Sgurr nan Gillean (triangular top), and Sgurr na Stri (Figure 14).

Finley suggested that Turner's route had probably been determined in discussion with Scott, who suggested the same route to Daniell when the painter travelled to Scotland for his composition of *A Voyage Round Great Britain*. In a letter to Daniell, Scott described the route: '...go into Loch Scavaig – it is divided at the bottom of the bay by a small headland,

keep the north side of the head land & land where a torrent breaks down from the land –

five minutes' walk will conduct you to the most astonishing piece of scenery'.[186]

I took a boat from Elgol up to Loch Curuisk, via Loch Scavaig and Loch na Cuilce. The boat landed at the dock for tourists at the northern bay of Loch na Cuilce. From the dock, I walked northwards over rocks at the mountain foot. The shallow and short River Scavaig was as Scott described – 'a torrent breaks down from the land'; it was impossible to see the whole winding shape of the river when walking along it (Figures 15, 16, and 17). The river linked Loch na Cuilce to Loch Coruisk, which was invisible to me when I walked on the rocks alongside the river. After a five minutes walk at the river mouth the southern end of Loch Coruisk appeared. This was probably the route that Scott described, but may not Turner's.

The shape of Loch Coruisk is curving, thus from its southern end, at the mountain foot, I can only see the southern half of the loch. The surrounding mountains were not very high in reality and sloped down into the water at angles of not more than forty-five degrees (Figure 18). By walking northwards along the western waterside, I entered the valley of the loch and the water gradually became wider.

As I went further, Druim nan Ramh, the eastern flank of the loch, became closer. It was steeper than Dubhs Ridge, the western flank (Figures 18, 19). On the rock face of Druim nan Ramh, I saw parallel horizontal layers in the massive rock, crossed by huge vertical flutings and various kinds of dyke that naturally made huge geometric patterns on the mountain flank. The colour of the rock face was deep dark grey, together with the huge geometric patterns and the dark flutings and dykes, Druim nan Ramh looked wild and dramatic. However, since it was summer, wild grasses flourished over the rock face, and their fresh green somehow softened the wild appearance of Druim nan Ramh.

The loch water was still and rippling when a breeze came. The colour of the water was dark green and the darkness constantly varied by the shadows from moving clouds. Seeing the loch from south to north, the ridges of Black Cuillins appeared at the northern end as a mountain wall (Figures 18, 19, and 20). The tops of the peaks were hidden by the clouds, seemingly endless. The clouds were always above the mountains and constantly in motion;

---

[186] Quoted by John Garvey, in William Daniell's *Isle of Skye and Raasay* (Troubador Publishing Ltd, 2009), 20–21.

such that, at some moments, the jagged peaks appeared suddenly from the clouds and the atmosphere of the valley became dramatic.

At the northern end of the loch, there was a small plain field covered with gravel. Seeing the loch from this end to the south, the view was in stark contrast to that from the opposite direction (Figure 21). There was no wall of mountains, as seen from the south, but the entrance of the loch that I had passed, like a 'window' into the valley space, open to the sunlight from the southeast under the vast dome of the blue sky. Because of the light, the waters of the loch were blue with shining ripples.

Generally, the atmosphere I experienced in the valley was tranquil. I clearly heard the sounds of tiny birds many times and the soft sound of the water, constantly rippling, as I walked. The temperature was comfortable for walking, neither cold nor hot. Huge boulders along the waterside were natural seats for hikers and, in the summer sun, the temperature of the rock surface was as warm as my hands. It took six hours to hike the loop of the loch, a distance of approximately seven kilometres. The difficulty level of the hiking was generally low. Most of the path was boggy but some parts were rocky and rough. The weather was usually rainy and cloudy in August, according to the local people but during my stay in the valley the weather was not raining, mostly sunny, though clouds – sometimes heavy – came and went. Like Turner, I took the boat to leave at around sunset. The sun was still shining at that time, although clouds were gathering above every mountain peak, like huge cloud hats, as I saw them from the leaving boat (Figure 22). Clouds are a key element in the landscape of Loch Coruisk.

Some objects and phenomena that I saw and experienced at Loch Coruisk I also saw in Turner's sketches, in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, and other paintings of the loch, showing some common ground in perceptions of the physical and natural Loch Coruisk, though people's experiences of it can be greatly different. The main difference between my experience and Turner's is that I did not climb the hills around the loch; my experiences were gained at the waterside and the mountain foot; whereas Turner saw the loch from both the mountain foot and top. Furthermore, I felt tranquillity in the valley, not the intense and dramatic atmosphere in *Loch Coruisk, Skye.* This may partly result from the different weather conditions and partly from the artist's intention – to illustrate Scott's poem and compose an ideal wild landscape.

In the following content, my first-hand experience of Loch Corusik is one of the references for the comparisons between the physical Loch Coruisk and Turner's sketches and *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. Importantly, the reference of my first-hand experience consists not only of written description, but also digital photograph, defined as 'record shot' in the thesis, meaning a photograph taken for recordings a situation or an object and its surroundings, not an artistically composed landscape photograph. Most of the record shots were taken onsite by me. The case study also uses other mountain hikers' record shots and historical photographs, which are considered as other viewers' first-hand experiences, for examining the places that I did not see in person. Alongside the first-hand experiences of Loch Coruisk, another important reference for the comparisons in the case study is the published geological and geographical interpretations of the landform of Loch Coruisk.

2. Geological and geographical interpretations of Loch Coruisk

For the geological landform and appearance of the physical land, hundreds of years are not long enough to make obvious changes. So, the physical features and appearance of Loch Coruisk and Isle of Skye as seen by geologists are almost the same to those seen by Turner in 1831. The relevant contents of the geological and geographical interpretations of Loch Coruisk and Isle of Skye to this study include their geographic positions, landform configuration and the geological causes. The geological and geographical interpretations in the cast study enable a comparison between the scientific descriptions and artistic pictorial representations of Loch Coruisk; and the difference between them may bear the trace of the key compositional acts of the artist.

2.1 Loch Coruisk in the geographic and geological maps

The geographic map (Figure 23) shows the physical position of Loch Coruisk, an inland loch located in the valley of the Black Cuillins, in the southern part of Cuillin complex in the south of the Isle of Skye. The maps (Figure 23, 24a) show the positional structure of Loch Coruisk, surrounded by the Black Cuillin mountains, with the ridges and peaks of Gars-bheinn outside the loch entrance to the southwest, Sgurr nan Gillean at the far north of the loch, Druim nan Ramh on the eastern side of the loch, Dubhs Ridge on the western side, and Sgurr na Stri at the southern end. The shape of the southern part of Loch Coruisk

is curved and concave to the west; at the southern end, the River Scavaig links Loch Coruisk to Loch na Cuilce, to the south-east of which, separated by a small headland, is another loch – Loch nan Leachd. The waters of Loch na Cuilce and Loch nan Leachd flow southwards and meet at Loch Scavaig, ultimately entering the North Atlantic.

The geological map produced by B. R. Bell and J. W. Harris represents the features of the landform of the Cuillin complex, dominated by coarse-grained ultrabasic rocks and some rock bodies featuring igneous layering (Figures 24a, 24b and 24c). Bell and Harris's research shows the association between the irregular topography of the Cuillin complex and magma intrusions, the influxes of magma into the Cuillin complex during volcanic activities.[187]

2.2 Magma intrusion and the rocks at Loch Coruisk

The west of Scotland was well-known as a volcanic region in Turner's time. MacCulloch's first book contributed substantially to the knowledge of volcanic igneous rocks in western Scotland. In the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, geologist Alfred Harker (1859–1939 AD) studied the rocks on the Isle of Skye and noted that the layered rocks showed that influxes of magma 'have been intruded while still molten and mobile, and their not mingling implies a high mutual surface-tension'.[188] Contemporary geologists further interpreted the phenomenon as rhythmic layers, formed by repeated influxes of magma that deposited their crystals on the existing magma chamber floor.[189] Thus, the layers of the rock recorded the movements of the 'magma fractionation, hybridisation, and crustal contamination in the magmatic plumbing system', which were slow and repeated movements.

The geologists' interpretations explained why the rocks on the Isle of Skye, and thus also in the valley of Loch Coruisk, looked rough: they were formed by repeated magma

---

[187] B. R. Bell and J. W. Harris, *An Excursion Guide to the Geology of the Isle of Skye* (Glasgow: Geological Society of Glasgow, 1986), 44, Figure 4.

[188] Alfred Harker, *The Tertiary Igneous Rocks of Skye* (Glasgow: J. Hedderwick & Sons, 1904), 119–120.

[189] Mark E. Brandriss, Sharon Mason, and Kelsey Winsor, "Rhythmic Layering Formed by Deposition of Plagioclase Phenocrysts from Influxes of Porphyritic Magma in the Cuillin Centre, Isle of Skye", *Journal of Petrology* 55, no. 8 (August 2014): 1479–1510.

intrusions in volcanic activities that left the igneous rocks with rhythmic layers, numerous dark dykes, a dense and coarse texture, and a dark colour.[190]

2.3 Glaciation and the Loch Coruisk valley

Harker also studied the landforms of the Isle of Skye. His research was based on fieldwork and he made many sketches to depict the geological features of the valley, cliffs, and rocks.[191] In Harker's interpretation, not only formed by volcanic activities, the Cuillin complex was also the outcome of glacier movement in the Ice Age approximately 115,000 years previously. According to Harker, in the period of maximum glaciation, central Isle of Skye was occupied by glaciers, making it a glaciated isle, and Loch Coruisk was left behind by the melting glaciers, which formed a hollow at the foot of the hills, the lowest part of which became the rock-basin of the loch.[192]

Harker identified the valley as V-shape (Figure 25), its sides pressed and widened by the heavy and massive glacier volumes. His drawing show the eastern side as steeper than the western, just as I saw in the valley. An explanation is offered by contemporary geologists: the igneous bedrock mass of the eastern side (Druim nan Ramh) has higher rock strength.[193] As a result, perhaps, the slope of Druim nan Ramh was not pressed down as much as Dubhs Ridge (the western side of the valley) under the massive glaciers.

Harker also demonstrated that grooves on the rock surface could be seen almost all over the loch sides (Figures 24b, 24c): when the heavy glaciers flowed down constantly from the upper hills, the stones and grit they carried simultaneously smoothened rock surfaces and carved grooves in them.[194]

---

[190] A. Tibaldi, A. F. Pasquarè and D. Rust, "New Insights into the Cone Sheet Structure of the Cuillin Complex, Isle of Skye, Scotland," *Journal of the Geological Society* 168 (03/2011): 689.

[191] Lyall I. Anderson, "Before the Scottish Survey: Alfred Harker the Geologist", *Proceedings of the Geologists' Association* 125, no. 3 (July 2014): 353–6.

[192] Alfred Harker, "Glaciated Valleys in the Cuillins, Skye," *Geological Magazine* 6, no. 5 (May 1899): 197.

D.G. Sutherland, "The Cuillin," in *Quaternary of Scotland*, eds. D. G. Gordon and D.G. Sutherland (Springer Science & Business Media, 2012), 368.

[193] Martin S. Brook, Martin P. Kirkbride, and Ben. W. Brock, "Rock Strength and Development of Glacial Valley Morphology in the Scottish Highlands and Northwest Iceland", *Geografiska Annaler. Series A, Physical Geography* 86, no. 3 (2004): 230–232.

[194] ibid., 226–8.

The most striking scene of Loch Coruisk for Harker was: high above the valley, the tops of the surrounding mountains were jagged and splintered, in strong contrast to the smooth glaciated mountain-slopes of the valley (Figure 26). According to Harker, these jagged mountain tops had stood higher than the ice-surface of the glaciers and, thus, were exposed to and suffered from 'the splintering and shattering action of frost-erosion'.[195]

The above geological interpretations demonstrate that the valley of Loch Coruisk is the result of natural forces, which have given it its distinguish topography and conspicuous appearance. In summary, the key geographical and geological features of Loch Coruisk are:

1) The loch is located in the Cuillin complex and is surrounded by hills – Dubhs Ridge to the west, Druim nan Ramh to the east, and Sgurr na Stri to the south. Its shape is an irregular elongated rectangle and its southern end is slightly curved and concave to the west. River Scavaig links Loch Coruisk to Loch na Cuilce. Besides Loch na Cuilce is Loch nan Leachd and the two meet in Loch Scavaig to the south.

2) The rocks of the hills surrounding Loch Coruisk are mainly igneous, formed by lava and magma intrusions in volcanic activity. The rocks have rhythmic layers, various dark dykes, a dense and coarse-grained texture, and a dark colour.

3) Loch Coruisk valley is a glacial, V-shape valley. Slopes of the two sides are smooth, and the eastern side is steeper than the western. High above the valley, the surrounding mountain peaks are jagged and splintered, in striking contrast to the lower valley. The rocks on the waterside have numerous grooves on their surface, made by the moving glaciers.

These features form the physical and geological 'identity' of the landscape of Loch Coruisk. The essential facts are that the 60-million-year-old rocks were formed by the movements of lava and magma, then sculpted by the movements of glaciers. The original, wild natural forces caused the movements and produced the appearance and topography of Loch Coruisk. Turner's painting of Loch Coruisk could not be recognised as 'the painting of Loch Coruisk' without these distinguish features. For this case study, the distinguish features are the reference for tracing and identifying the key compositional acts of the artist. In the following section, the examination of the study focuses on two issues:

---

[195] Alfred Harker, "Ice-Erosion in the Cuillin Hills, Skye," in Earth and Environmental Science Transactions of The Royal Society of Edinburgh 40, no. 2 (1905): 250.

1) How many of the geographic and geological features of Loch Coruisk and the Isle of Skye Turner selected and included in his onsite sketches and *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* and how he arranged them in the pictures;

2) Which objects in the landscapes Turner selected and included in the sketches and painting, what alterations he made to them, and why.

Part 2: Sketching Loch Coruisk

Previous studies have not shown *Loch Coruisk, Skye* with explicit reference to Turner's sketches. Finley claimed that the sketches were exploratory works, expressions of Turner's experience of the place, hence they are crucial to the composition of *Loch Coruisk, Skye.* Thomas Ardill studied the two sketch books that Turner used in his 1831 Scottish tour and noted that in the *Stirling and West Sketch Book,* seven sketches related to the location of Loch Coruisk and two to the picture of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. The case study found that six of the seven sketches contributed to Turner's composition.

With the aim of tracing and retrieving the key compositional acts of the artist, this part of the study compares the six sketches with reference materials including the geographical and geological interpretations of Loch Coruisk valley, my first-hand experience at the valley, other paintings or drawings depicting Loch Coruisk, as well as mountain hikers' record shots of the loch. The comparisons show that an ideal wild landscape initially emerged in the six pictures, which show the artist's temporary intentional objects; and the artist's compositional intention in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* was gradually formed during the making of the six pictures.

1. Sketching the entrance to Loch Coruisk valley

Figure 27 is a quick sketch with efficient lines. It records the basic information of the landscape. It shows the Black Cuillin ridges and the peaks of Sgurr na Stri at the entrance of the loch, with the waters of the loch around the mountain foot. On the mountain top, short parallel vertical lines represent the dark flutings on the rock face.

The shape and situation of the mountain suggest that Turner's viewpoint was at the mountain foot. Thus, he probably walked around the loch entrance and saw the mountain tops from the ground. In *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* Turner referenced this viewpoint and depicted the mountains and waters as if seen from the ground, in order to build a multiple eye-level vision in the painting.

Ardill identified that Turner inscribed the words 'Lake Coriskn' on the sketch to mark the entrance of the loch.[196] Probably, Turner's wanting to mark the entrance of the loch was because passing through this entrance was the first and indispensable step to entering the wild valley of Loch Coruisk. In the later composition of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, one compositional act was generated from this act – Turner gave a corner of the painting to represent the entrance.

Compared with other artists' paintings and drawings of Loch Coruisk, only Turner gave some attention to the entrance. One reason for this may have been that Scott described the entrance in a few lines in *The Lord of the Isles*, in the first – and important – description of Loch Coruisk in the poem. Turner probably read the poem before he visited Loch Coruisk and grasped the scenario; then he gave some attention to the entrance in the onsite sketch, and finally included it in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*.

Entrance as an object, from a phenomenological perception, essentially means an access to an enclosed place that is different from the outside. Of the access to Loch Coruisk, MacCulloch wrote that 'I suspect that the knowledge of this place is limited to half a dozen persons.'[197] Whether true or not, MacCulloch's words suggest that at that time the entrance to Loch Coruisk represented to some extent the difficulty and exclusiveness of experiencing the wild remote valley. For Turner, the entrance may denote the unusual isolation of the place – one feature of the 'most remote wilderness'.

In his study on this sketch, Ardill writes:

---

[196] Thomas Ardill, "Sketches of Port Askaig, Islay; East Tarbert, Kintyre; and the River Scavaig 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner". Catalogue entry, March 2010. In David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*. Tate Research Publication, December 2012, accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-sketches-of-port-askaig-islay-east-tarbert-kintyre-and-the-r1134943

[197] John MacCulloch, *The Highlands and Western Isles of Scotland Vol. 3* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green, 1824), 482.

The bottom two sketches show the head of Loch Scavaig and the entrance to Loch Coruisk... The third sketch down, inscribed 'Lake Coriskn', shows the River Scavaig at the left winding from Loch Coruisk into Loch Scavaig, with the rocks to the south of the loch at the right.[198]

However, from my onsite observation, there may be another possibility. The sketch does show the entrance to Loch Coruisk but may show it from the inside not outside of the entrance as Ardill suggested above.

The viewpoint of the sketcher is the southern end of Loch Coruisk, because in my first-hand experience, from there looking back after passing through the entrance, the view looks just like the sketch. Further observation of this case study is the winding line at the left of the picture is probably a depiction of the edge of the water of Loch Coruisk, not the River Scavaig, as the record shot shows (Figure 28). Because, the River Scavaig is very short and cannot extend as far as the winding line on the left in the picture, and it runs down through the foothills, not around the mountain foot. The winding shape of the river can only be seen from a bird's-eye view or the mountain top, one cannot see it when walking towards the entrance at ground level, as the line in the picture as Ardill suggested (Figures 16 and 29). Also, if the River Scavaig is on the left and Loch Coruisk on the right, there should be a wall of mountain peaks behind the loch (Figures 18, 19 and 20), not merely the empty sky between the two mountains in the picture (Figure 21). Furthermore, the blank area beneath the winding line very possibly represents an area of water, as it frequently does in Turner's sketches.

Therefore, the relationship between the water and the foothills in the picture indicates that the inscribed words refer to both the body of Loch Coruisk on the left and the entrance of the loch on the right, with the vantage point of the sketcher inside the entrance. Ardill's identification may derive from the depiction of the entrance in *Loch Coruisk, Skye.* However*,* in the painting, the situation of the entrance was altered by Turner and was different from the factual situation. Turner inventively designed that detail, might be inspired by Daniell's work (See Part 3, 2.1.3).

---

[198] Ardill, "Sketches of Port Askaig, Islay; East Tarbert, Kintyre; and the River Scavaig".

2. Sketching a mountain ridge

Figure 30 is a finished sketch, representing the wide range of the Black Cuillins in the distance. A mountain ridge rises in the centre of the picture, with Loch na Cuilce and Loch nan Leadch on the left and a tiny part of Loch Coruisk on the right. The structure of the mountains is generally the same as the physical landscape, when seen from south to north from the top of Sgurr na Stri. The central summit would be Gars-bheinn according to its position among the lochs.

The high vantage point of the sketch suggests that Turner ascended Sgurr na Stri at the southern end of the loch. From that point, a viewer could closely and almost horizontally see Gars-bheinn across the loch towards the west, and other mountains, such as 'the wall of mountains', to the north. It seems that it was important for Turner to see the whole view of the loch and its surrounding mountains from above, within the whole view of the mountain range.

In terms of the artist's compositional acts, two marks in the picture show that Turner studied the physical landscape and explored an ideal landscape image. The first is that Turner sketches Gars-bheinn peak the central ridge in the picture and shows it as if seen from a distance and from above; simultaneously, he arranges the range of surrounding mountains lower than the central ridge.

Among paintings of Loch Coruisk by his contemporaries, Turner is the only one to create this effect. The unique half-realistic design suggests Turner's two-fold awareness of the landscape. On one hand, he is aware of the vast mountain complex; on the other, although the central ridge is the highest in the mountain complex, it is seen slightly downward, implying the strength of the human body and mind. The strength comes from the physical act of climbing the mountain and standing at its peak, as well as from the mental ability of choosing to appreciate and depict the wild scene from mountain top, and the ability to enhance the wilderness in painting by inventive design.

The second mark is that, at the eastern face of the mountain top, Turner sketches some vertical lines to enhance the steepness of the peak and to make the triangle top sharper and pointed to the north-eastern direction. Ardill suggested that the peak looked like Alasdair but Turner altered it in the picture, because the shape of the Alasdair peak was 'wrong or

exaggerated as seen from Sgurr na Stri'.[199] Ardill also suggested the mountains 'were re-imagined into a more triangular ridge that look as if they had been recently risen from the earth by the power of colliding tectonic plates'.[200] The interpretation of this case study is that the central ridge is the Gars-bheinn peak, because of its position in the landscape, but its shape was altered by Turner, probably combining views of the peak seen from various angles: the shape and volume of the ridge look like Gars-bheinn as seen from Sgurr na Stri; the triangular top of the ridge looks like Gars-bheinn's top as seen from Loch nan Leachd (Figure 35), and the vertical rock face looks like Gars-bheinn as seen from Camasunary Bay (Figure 34). These may be an experimental gesture on Turner's part, inspired by his experience of seeing the loch and valley in movements.

Scottish landscape painter Sir David Murray (1849–1933) painted *Loch Coruisk, Skye* in 1874 (Figure 33). The view in the painting is from Sgurr na Stri; the nearest body of water is Loch nan Leachd, with Loch na Cuilce behind, and the distant small lake is Loch Coruisk. The vantage point of the painting is on the lower slopes and further west than in Turner's sketch. Murray's painting raises a feeling of tension and pressure, through the arrangement of the mountains, that are huge and heavy, and much higher than the vantage point, and the clouds and dark blue waves enhance this feeling. In Turner's sketch, in contrast, the mountains are not higher than the vantage point; the water is still and the weather clear. Therefore, the atmosphere of the sketch is far less dramatic than Murray's work and probably closer to Turner's experience as he was sketching. At that moment, Turner had not yet formed his ideal wild image of Loch Coruisk.

To summarise, some compositional acts of Turner can be identified in Figure 30: he ascended the hilltop to see the landscape from a high vantage point; he sketched and experimentally altered the shape of Gars-bheinn and the spatial relationships between the peak and its surroundings. Turner's compositional acts indicate that the appearance of Gars-bheinn was not his ultimate intentional object: he pursued a more powerful and wild visual effect, or a mountain with a wild character, in his sketches as well as his imagining.

---

[199] Thomas Ardill, "Loch na Cuilce and Loch Coruisk from Sgurr na Stri 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner", Catalogue entry, March 2010, in David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours,* Tate Research Publication, December 2012, accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-loch-na-cuilce-and-loch-coruisk-from-sgurr-na-stri-r1134945

[200] ibid.

This is the initial appearance of Turner's compositional intention in *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* and the ideal picture of the wildest landscape is still in the process of formation. However, the pictorial structure and vantage point of the sketch, and the depiction of the mountains are used in *Loch Coruisk, Skye;* and Turner's experimental alterations of the mountain shape and position are continually shown in other sketches.

At the bottom of the sketch, a large rock with long cracks can be seen, representing the Bad Step (Figure 41), a well-known spot on the slope of Sgurr na Stri, above Loch nan Leadch. From that position, in reality, Loch Coruisk can be glimpsed through the space between Sgurr na Stri and Gars-bheinn (Figure 31), as in Murray's painting (Figure 33), the vantage point of which is near the Bad Step. A mountain hiker's record shot taken near the Bad-Step can also be a reference (Figure 32). Turner probably did not take the route that Scott suggested to Daniell. He chose instead to land at Camasunary Bay, then walked around the foot of Sgurr na Stri, and walked through the Bad Step to access the entrance of Loch Coruisk. The Bad Step is a huge smooth slab with cracks, which is not a small challenge to hikers. Scott wrote in his notes that Turner 'lost his footing on its smooth and often wet stony slopes...but for one or two tufts of grass, he would have broken his neck', showing how Turner endeavoured to experience the place.[201] It is no surprise that Turner took the longer and tougher route to approach Loch Coruisk, as also indicated by another the sketch, Figure 48.

Ardill also suggested that Turner's alteration in the sketch was inspired by MacCulloch's writing about Loch Coruisk. In his writing, MacCulloch repeatedly described the Black Cuillins as 'rising upwards on all hands for more than a mile, and presenting a barrier over which there is no egress.'[202] Probably, most of MacCulloch's experiences of Loch Coruisk were walking around the loch and seeing the mountain peaks from their foot. Thus, when he describes the mountains as 'rising up', he emphasises the upward direction. When he was in the valley, Turner climbed to the mountain top and saw other mountain tops from horizontal and downwards angles. Therefore, in the sketch, there is no sense of the mountains rising up as a wall with a feeling of 'no egress'. Instead, in the picture, the central ridge is 'rising up' among mountain tops, or 'standing high' among a

---

[201] Finley, *Landscapes of Memory*, 137.
   Scott, *The Lord of the Isles*, 433 (note 3).

[202] MacCulloch, *The Highlands and Western Isles of Scotland Vol.3*, 474.

great mountain complex. What Turner emphasised is the height of the 'rising up', or the feeling or effect of '**being** up high', not the feeling or effect of '**seeing** the rising up'. If there is an association between the sketch and MacCulloch's writing, it was probable that they both captured the essential 'posture' of the mountains in Black Cuillins, the 'rising up'; the situations of the 'rising up', however, differs between their depictions.

3. Sketching Loch Coruisk and its surroundings

Figure 36 is also a finished sketch. The view is seen from a high angle, with Dubhs Ridge in the middle right on the western side of the loch. Behind the huge boulder at the left, Druim nan Ramh is on the waterside, with Sgurr na Stri in the middle, on the other side of the water. The sketcher is looking from the northern end of the loch to the southern end, the opposite direction to Figure 30. The differences between the two views seen from the opposite directions can be found in the two old photographs and two hikers' record shots (Figures 37 – 40). Identifying the direction of the painter's view regarding the picture is important because it is a crucial mark of the artist's compositional act.

Many clues demonstrate the direction of the painter's view in the picture. First, the triangular top of the right central summit is the shape of Dubhs Ridge, not Druim nan Ramh's round top, as Ardill rightly suggested (Figures 41 – 43, and 19). Gars-bheinn is the focus in Figure 30, while in Figure 36 Dubhs Ridge is the focus. It stands at the right side of Loch Coruisk, indicating that Turner saw it from north to south, the opposite direction to Figure 30.

Second, comparing with the geographic map, the old photograph and the hikers' record shot (Figures 23, 38 and 39), the arc shape of the loch at the southern end is concave to the right of the loch if seen from the northern end. Likewise, the small headlands that descend into the water at the eastern side would be on the left of the loch in the picture if seen from the south. In Figure 36, the headlands are on the right, thus they are seen from the north.

Third, in the valley of Loch Coruisk, if looking from the southern end of the loch to the north, there would be a wall of mountains behind the loch waters, with jagged and splintered peaks (Figures 18, 26, 31 and 40). However, in Figure 36, the mountains behind the loch are shaped gradually lowering themselves to sea level. Moreover, in contrast to

Figure 30, the horizon in the sketch is lower, indicating a view from a higher mountain towards the lower ocean.

Ardill suggested that Turner made this sketch at the summit of Sgurr na Stri, at the southern end of the loch, thus indicating that Figure 30 and Figure 36 were both made at Sgurr na Stri, but at different positions and heights.[203] This case study offers a different opinion. As an experienced landscape artist, there was no need for Turner to sketch two pictures at two similar spots. Also, the hiking conditions around the loch are not very difficult, nor are the slopes at the loch sides difficult to climb. Therefore, it is very possible that Turner made this sketch on a slope at the northern end of the loch, and sketched the view from the north to south.

Thus, Turner walked through the valley. He went to the northern end of the loch from the southern end and climbed up to higher positions on the hills at both ends. His acts show that he had the intention to see the loch from various perspectives and positions, not only from the mountain foot, slope, and peak, but also from south to north, and north to south. This is a crucial compositional act associated with Turner's compositional intention in *Loch coruisk, Skye.*

Another mark of Turner's compositional act is in the arrangement of the curved shape of the loch water and the straight rock face. The water shape of the southern end of Loch Coruisk is curved, as seen clearly from the hill tops. Essentially, the geometric form of a tangent against a curved line hints at a competing situation and has the potential to invoke a feeling of tension. Turner captured the essence of the geometric form and sought to explore its possibilities in visualising the intense mood. He placed a giant boulder on the left side of the picture and drew the rock face straight, which is visually a tangent cutting the curved shape of the water. Hence a potential tension between the mountains and water emerges in the picture. Moreover, the volume and weight of the giant boulder produce a visible pressure against the still water, enhancing the potential tension by bringing out a feeling of uncertainty, or a hint of confrontation between the mountain and water.

---

[203] Thomas Ardill, "*Loch Coruisk, Skye* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner", Catalogue entry, March 2010, in David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours,* Tate Research Publication, December 2012, accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-loch-coruisk-skye-r1134946

To summarise, the sketch (Figure 36) shows the further development of Turner's compositional intention, aiming to create a landscape that not only represents Loch Coruisk the place but also an intense mood or wild atmosphere. Turner explored the possibilities of producing this intense wild atmosphere in the picture through two compositional acts: viewing the loch from various directions and positions, and experimentally employing geometric forms in the representation of mountains and waters for the purpose of visualising an intense mood. New compositional acts are generated from these two compositional acts and determine the ultimate composition of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* (See Part 3: 2.1).

4. Sketching the southern part of Loch Coruisk

Figure 44 depicts the southern part of Loch Coruisk; the view in the sketch looks like what I saw at the valley (Figure 18). After I had entered the valley and walked for approximately three minutes, I stood at the southern part of the loch. Looking northwards ahead of me, I saw a large headland descending into the water at the curved western waterside, blocked my view of the rest of the loch. The record shot also shows a tiny island in the water, seen in the sketch at the same position, but from a slightly higher viewpoint.

Ardill noted that Turner inscribed a word on the picture – 'yellow' or 'garelcoh', that does not directly relate to Loch Coruisk.[204] For this case study, the word may relate to the name of the peak Sgurr nan **Gillean**, which can be seen northwards from the vantage point. Perhaps Turner wrote the word because at that time clouds covered Sgurr nan Gillean, that frequently happened during my walk, or Turner just wanted to mark the position of Sgurr nan Gillean. In *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* the shape of Sgurr nan Gillean appears in the distant mountains in the background (See Part 3: 2.2).

Another suggestion is that the word may relate to **Glencoe**, the place where Clan MacDonald of Glencoe – an ally of the Scottish king Robert the Bruce in the Battle of Bannockburn in 1313 – were massacred in the battles of 1692. Clan MacDonald of

---

[204] Thomas Ardill, "Entrance to Loch Coruisk at Loch na Cuilce, Skye 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner", catalogue entry, June 2010, in David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*, Tate Research Publication, December 2012, accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-entrance-to- loch-coruisk-at-loch-na-cuilce-skye-r1135004

Glencoe is mentioned twice in Scott's works and Robert the Bruce is one of the protagonists of *The Lord of the Isles.* Turner visited the place at least twice before and after he was commissioned by Scott in 1831, and made many sketches there, as Ardill demonstrated (eg Figure 13).[205] Glencoe has a U-shaped glacial valley, that looks like a part of a vortex (Figures 45 and 46) – the featured element of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, and Turner made two works of the valley in 1819. However, there is insufficient evidence to clarify further the above speculations about the inscription by Turner on the sketch.

5. Sketching at Camasunary Bay

Figure 47 consists of a row of three pictures, probably Turner's last onsite sketch of Loch Coruisk. Ardill rightly identified that Turner made the sketch at Camasunary Bay.[206] In the first picture, the sun is in the west, marked by a tiny circle and there is heavy rain above Gars-Bheinn. Three figures are in a boat, the artist's companions. Ardill identified Sgurr Hain of Sgurr na Stri at the centre of the picture, with Bla Bheinn's western slope on the right. The heavy rain is represented by quickly sketched downward lines, as though Turner had used these quick actions to echo the movements of the downpour. The also quickly sketched lines on Bla Bheinn's slope perhaps represent both the falling rain and the gathering clouds.

In the second picture, the rain has stopped and the artist is probably departing by boat. Camasunary Bay, Gars-Bheinn, and Sgurr Hain are behind him. Gars-Bheinn is a small shape and Sgurr Hain is seen from a side angle, indicating the artist was passing them. Simultaneously, distant mountains in Loch Scavaig enter the artist's vision and he records them on the left of the picture. An inscription 'Cors' marks the entrance to Loch Coruisk again at the bottom.[207]

---

[205] Thomas Ardill, '*Three Sketches of Glencoe with Achtriochtan* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner', catalogue entry, April 2010, in David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*, Tate Research Publication, December 2012, accessed 30 March 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/artworks/turner- three-sketches-of-glencoe-with-achtriochtan-d26801

[206] Thomas Ardill, "Sketches of the Head of Loch Scavaig and Rum from Camasunary Bay 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner". Catalogue entry, March 2010. In David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*. Tate Research Publication, December 2012, accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-sketches-of-the-head-of-loch-scavaig-and-rum-from-camasunary-r1135006

[207] Ardill, "Sketches of the Head of Loch Scavaig and Rum from Camasunary Bay".

The third picture is a distant view of the Isle of Eigg (on the left) and Isle of Rum (on the right). Turner sketched them on the boat and inscribed 'Rum' on the picture, as Ardill indicated.[208] The distinctive basalt plateau cliff of Eigg is recorded on the left.

Figure 47 does not directly contribute to the composition of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, but shows that Turner took the route Camasunary Bay – Sgurr na Stri – Bad Step – Loch Coruisk to enter the Loch Coruisk valley. The distant cliffs of the Isle of Eigg may to some extent contribute to the design of the distant mountains in the background of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*.

6. Drafting *Loch Coruisk, Skye*

Figure 48 is a sketch draft. Turner inscribed the figure – '3' – and a word (or words) on it. Ardill explained that the word(s) could be 'New con', or 'Coruisk', or 'Coruiskin', according to Wallace-HArdill and Carolan's research.[209] It is the seventy-fifth sketch in Turner's sketchbook and appears thirteen pages later than Figure 47. It is hard to identify whether it is an onsite sketch or not, for this study, it may be the third sketch draft that Turner made for the composition of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*.

In the picture, two peaks flank the two sides at the end of the loch. The left peak has the jagged Basteir Tooth of Am Basteir, the right is in the position of Druim nan Ramh, as seen from north to south. The structure of the mountains and water resemble Figure 36, but the heights of the mountains and peaks are elevated and their shapes much steeper. The mountains are also positioned much closer to each other. The visual effect is that the space of the water compressed by the two flanks. It seems that Turner intentionally superimposed the two groups of mountains and tightened the shape of the water in order to enhance the tension between them. This kind of experimental acts have been seen in the sketches, Figures 30 and 36 and, but seen more boldly, in Figure 48.

Figure 48 is probably a composed sketch, through which Turner found the initial pictorial form of his ideal wildest landscape, as well as the manner of visualising the dramatic

---

208 Ardill, "Sketches of the Head of Loch Scavaig and Rum from Camasunary Bay".

209 Thomas Ardill, "Port Askaig, Islay; and Loch Coruisk, Skye 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner". Catalogue entry, March 2010, in David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours,* Tate Research Publication, December 2012, accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-port-askaig-islay-and-loch-coruisk-skye-r1135019

atmosphere he wanted. It is, therefore, a sign or mark of the further development of Turner's compositional intention, to both illustrate Scott's poem and pursue the wildest landscape image. The pictorial structure of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* is to some extent similar to Figure 48, but the tension and dramatic atmosphere in the mountains and water are exaggerated even further.

In summary, the six sketches are Turner's temporary intentional objects and the results of his compositional acts. The key compositional acts of the artist are a complex, including both physical and mental acts, such as walking and sketching in the valley, imagining, designing the picture and arranging the pictorial elements. Through examining the six sketches, this study has retrieved the performed key compositional acts of the artist. First, the sketches show that the physical landscape of Loch Coruisk was wild and Turner was inspired to pursue a wilder image of Loch Coruisk. Thus, he experimentally altered the landscape he saw in his sketches, and gradually developed his ideal wild image during the process of perceiving Loch Coruisk. The sketches also show that Turner gradually formed his compositional intention towards *Loch Coruisk, Skye* –a landscape with an intense mood, or a dramatic vision of the mountains and water. The initial pictorial form of the wild image he pursued emerged in the last sketch.

The next part of this study aims to specifically access Turner's compositional intention by studying the picture of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* and identifying the artist's key compositional acts. The study compares the painting with, again, the geographical and geological interpretations of Loch Coruisk valley, my first-hand experience, other paintings and drawings of Loch Coruisk, and the mountain hikers' record shots and historical photographs.

Part 3: Composing Loch Coruisk, Skye

This part examines Turner's compositional intention, in order to interpret how the ideal wildest image is formed. Specifically, it accesses Turner's compositional intention by tracing and interpreting three kinds of compositional act, intertwined in the process of composing *Loch Coruisk, Skye*:

   1) Selecting and depicting geographic and geological features of Loch Coruisk,

2) Inventively altering the features or appearances of some objects, and

3) Arranging fictional objects in the pictorial landscape.

1. Selecting and depicting geographic and geological features of Loch Coruisk

Turner claimed 'the painter must adhere to the truth of nature' and it is well-known that he had a good knowledge of geology.[210] As mentioned in the introduction, Gage explores how Turner continued to learn and study science for the sake of his landscape art. Regarding *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, Gage suggests that Turner may have been inspired by MacCulloch's writing. However, the writing Gage refers to is MacCulloch's literary description of Loch Coruisk, not his scientific interpretation of the landscape. Klonk indicates that *Loch Coruisk, Skye* contained more geological accuracy than MacCulloch's works (including both his literary writing and picturesque engravings), due to Turner's onsite observation and individual intention to depict the movement of the earth.

MacCulloch's writings and engravings are literary and artistic, not geological; and his intention and manner are quite different from Turner's, regarding artistically representing a landscape. As a great landscape painter, it is not a surprise that Turner's landscapes are more precise and vivid than MacCulloch's. So a question arises as 'whether or not MacCulloch's geological writings factually impacts Turner's landscape, and specifically, *Loch Coruisk, Skye*?'. The study therefore investigates MacCulloch's geological interpretations of the rocks on the Western Isles of Scotland in the next section, before exploring further Turner's compositional acts, in order to examine to what extent scientific methods or knowledge may have affected Turner's manner of composition.

1.1 MacCulloch's geological methods and interpretation

Diagrams are an important means for geologists to present their studies, such as Harker's diagram referenced in Part 1. MacCulloch, similarly, in his *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland*, uses diagrams to explain the geological formation of the rocks, which are hardly to be described accurately by words. According to him, diagrams illustrate 'the

---

[210] Finley, *Landscapes of Memory*, 32.

most indispensable' of human perceptions that are substituted for the natural fact; thus, a group of lines is substituted for a view, an abstract structure for a material object. He metaphysically calls diagrams 'the ghosts of subjects to which a body is wanting'.[211]

Taking the diagrams *Gneifs shifted by a granite vein in Goll* and *Flexure in gneiss* as examples (Figures 49 and 50), regarding the geological facts the diagrams represented, MacCulloch explains that the first displays the 'granite veins traversing gneiss and attended by a shifting of the laminæ of that rock' and the second shows the 'flexure in gneiss'.[212] Regarding the capacity of diagram to render geological fact, he writes: '...the truth of the subject, considered as a view of nature, and its character as a specimen of art are sacrificed for the purpose of rendering the geological fact of the bending of the rocks more conspicuous'.[213]

So, the geological diagrams represent the internal, formational structure of the rock, which results from the movements of magma and is driven by natural forces; and the abstract knowledge the diagram represented is 'the subject ghost of the material rock', as MacCulloch called. The representations are fabricated by abstract patterns of lines, which omit some specific features of the rock, such as its texture and colour.

For MacCulloch, scientific methods do leave an impact on his artistic engravings. In his *View at the Storr in Skye* and *View of Staffa from the South West* (Figures 51 and 52), identified by Klonk as picturesque depictions of the physical landscape, MacCulloch's aesthetic expressions are also fabricated by geometric lines. The pictures contain much more appearance detail than diagrams, but the geometric lines and patterns still retain their capacity to represent the abstract geological structure of the land and rocks to some extent.

Turner also used diagrams to abstractly or symbolically represent abstract knowledge. He made many diagrams for the lectures on perspective that he gave at the Royal Academy.[214] Like MacCulloch, Turner was familiar with the generic power of geometric forms and

---

[211] John MacCulloch, *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland Vol III* (London: Archibald Constable and Co., 1819), B.

[212] MacCulloch, *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland Vol III*, B.

[213] ibid.

[214] Maurice Davies, *Turner as Professor* (London: Tate Gallery Publishing, 1992), 37.

quoted Akenside's verses on the subject at the end of his first Royal Academy lecture to tell that 'the pure forms of triangle, or circle, cube or cone' are the elements for 'mouldering structures'.[215]

As previous scholars have suggested, Turner may have read MacCulloch's writings, including his geological writings and diagrams, that would have shown that Turner took geological knowledge as vital material for his composition. Observation of this case study is, in *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* Turner may not directly reference MacCulloch's literary description of Loch Cruisk, but may generally benefit from MacCulloch's geological knowledge, and may find some common points with the geologist in using geometric forms both in artistic landscape engraving and in scientific diagrams for deliver abstract knowledge; since Turner himself was also good at using geometric forms to build the structure of his pictures or the pictorial elements, and to represent some abstract expression, such as the vortex in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. The following section therefore elaborates the geographical and geological features of Loch Coruisk that Turner captured and rendered in the painting, how he inventively altered the landscape elements of Loch Coruisk in his painting, and how he employed geometric form to establish his ideal wild image of Loch Coruisk.

1.2 Turner's selection of the objects in the landscape of Loch Coruisk

As mentioned in Part 1, the principal geographical and geological features of Loch Coruisk include:

1) The loch, located in the Cuillin complex and surrounded by hills – Dubhs Ridge to the west, Druim nan Ramh to the east and Sgurr na Stri to the south. The loch has an irregular elongated rectangular shape and its southern end is slightly curved and concave to the west. The River Scavaig links Loch Coruisk to Loch na Cuilce. Besides Loch na Cuilce is Loch nan Leachd and the two meet in Loch Scavaig to the south.

2) The rocks of the hills around Loch Coruisk are mainly igneous, formed by lava and magma intrusions in volcanic activity. They have rhythmic layers, various dark dykes, a dense and coarse-grained texture, and a dark colour.

---

[215] James A. W. Heffernan, "Wordsworth, Coleridge, and Turner: The Geometry of the Infinite", *The Bucknell Reviwe*, 29, no.1, (January 1984), 58.

3) Loch Coruisk valley is a glacial V-shaped valley. Slopes of the two sides are smooth, with the eastern side steeper than the western. High above the valley, the surrounding mountain peaks are jagged and splintered, in striking contrast to the appearance of the lower valley. Along the water's edge, rocks have numerous grooves on their surface made by the moving glaciers.

These features constitute the geographic and geological identity of Loch Coruisk. *Loch Coruisk, Skye* shows that Turner selected four groups of the features to represent the identity of Loch Coruisk:

1) The basic geographic structure of Loch Coruisk valley – Dubhs Ridge to the west, Druim nan Ramh to the east, and Sgurr na Stri to the south.

2) The southern end of the loch and its entrance, linked with Loch na Cuilce by the River Scavaig.

3) The V-shaped valley beneath the high jagged peaks.

4) The layers of the rock form, the dark vertical flutings on the flank, and the grooves on the rock face.

The elements that Turner selected and represented give the pictorial landscape geographical and geological features of Loch Coruisk, which are indispensable for identifying that particular place – the setting of the story in Scott's poem. Apart from that, Turner made many inventive alterations to compose a new pictorial Loch Coruisk with an intensely dramatic atmosphere, for both illustrating Scott's poem and creating his ideal wildest landscape.

2. Alterations in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*

2.1 Alterations of the mountain ridge, water, and the entrance of the valley

2.1.1 The mountain ridge

The most significant alteration is to the central mountain ridge. In the painting, the central ridge would be Dubhs Ridge because Sgurr na Stri is at the south. In reality, Dubhs Ridge is on the western side of the loch and Drum nan Ramh the eastern. Dubhs Ridge has a huge triangular body with an obtuse triangular top and its base is a gentle slope descending into

the loch water (Figures 19 and 40– 43); and Drum nan Ramh has numerous vertical grooves on its rock face and a steeper slope than Dubhs Ridge (Figures 19 and 24c).

In the picture, the central ridge has the position and the huge triangular body of Dubhs Ridge, but the rock face and standing posture are Drum nan Ramh's. The jagged peaks on the top are neither those of Drum nan Ramh nor Dubhs Ridge; they resemble, to some extent, those of Bruach na Frithe (with the trig point), a summit at the far north of the loch. Therefore, the central ridge is not entirely like any particular peak but is, rather, an ideal wild mountain ridge bearing features of Dubhs Ridge, Drum nan Ramh, and Bruach na Frithe. Turner's initial experimental alterations emerged in the sketches (Figures 30 and 36), but in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* the ultimate alterations become bold and striking.

2.1.2 The water of the loch

The alteration to the water is also significant. In the painting, the water looks as if the northern end of the loch and is seen from a higher viewpoint, as if from the high slope of Sgurr na Stri at the south. Moreover, in the picture, behind the loch there is a wall of mountains with jagged and splintered peaks, which is the view of the northern end of the loch. However, in reality, the northern end of Loch Coruisk has an oblong shape pointing to the north, but in the picture the shape of the water is slightly curved and concave to the west, just like the southern end of the loch. Also, in the reality, the southern end opens towards the North Atlantic Ocean and light from the south can brighten the loch water, which however is one feature of the loch water in the picture. Therefore, in the painting, the shape of the water and the source of light belong to the view of the southern end of the loch, while the position of the loch and the mountain-wall background behind the loch belong to the view of the northern end. Turner compresses the two different views of the both ends of the loch into one. This alteration continues the exploration in the sketch in Figure 48, with the compositional intention to dramatise the atmosphere of the pictorial landscape. If Turner was not the only artist of his time who depicted the water of the loch from a high viewpoint, he was probably the only one who saw the loch from two opposite directions and inventively compressed the views of both ends into one.

2.1.3 The entrance of the valley

As mentioned in Part 2, the entrance seems important to Turner. In *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, the loch entrance is at the bottom right, indicated by the River Scavaig and Loch na Cuilce, in accordance with the physical landscape of Loch Coruisk. In reality, from my onsite observation, the River Scavaig is short and runs gently over the mountain foot. The water of the river is very shallow and transparent and the river bed is half exposed with dark grey colour when I saw it. But in heavy rain, the water would be bigger and spread out of its shallow bed. However, in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, Turner inventively narrows and deepens the river bed, and inserts the river between the rough rocks and the foothills; thus, it becomes a turbulent current. Moreover, rather than imitating the transparent water and the dark grey river bed, Turner paints the water in dark blue and adds white foam on the waves; and the river bed disappears in the current.

Turner also inventively paints a cascade on the right rocky bank of the river, as if it was the head of the river. In reality, there is a cascade, which is the last part of the River Allt a' Chaoich that drains waters from the Black Cuillins to the Loch na Cuilce; thus, position of the cascade is on the flank of Loch na Cuilce.[216] The cascade is depicted in its own position in Daniell's Loch Scavaig Skye (1819), in which it gently falls down the rock face into Loch na Cuilce (Figure 53).[217] It is also depicted by Murray as a white stream hanging from the rock face in its original position (Figure 33). It is not known whether or not Turner had seen Daniell's work, but if he had, this detail in Daniell's work would have inspired his inventive alteration of moving the cascade from the flank of Loch na Cuilce to the fictionally built eastern bank of the River Scavaig and to be the head of the river in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. By this arrangement, the cascade motivates the movements of the river in the picture. Then Turner places a human figure on the riverbank, standing on the rocks and facing the current, as if in meditation; and the direction of the current towards the ocean, far beyond the frame of the picture.

To summarise, three inventive alterations establish the foundation of an ideal wilderness in the pictorial landscape of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. First, the alteration to the central ridge creates the 'rising up' of the ridge wilder and raises more wilderness than in the reality,

---

[216] Bell and Harris, *An Excursion Guide to the Geology of the Isle of Skye,* 47, 51.

[217] Daniell noted the loch as Loch Scavaig, which is an error, see the notes of Figure 61 in Volume 2.

forming a strong contrast to the still water. Given the essential geological features of the landscape of Loch Coruisk, the altered 'rising up' of the mountain peaks seems a true representation of the wild movements of the earth, such as the volcanic activity. Second, the compressed view of the two loch ends builds a strange pictorial structure, in which the dark wall of mountains with jagged peaks and the light from the ocean outside the valley are juxtaposed in the same direction. Third, alterations to and fictional arrangements of the entrance of the valley add an effective element of wilderness into the picture – the turbulent current, a wild moving object in the picture. These three compositional acts constitute the fundamental wild and intense atmosphere in the pictorial landscape, revealing the artist's compositional intention.

2.2 Alterations to the distant view

The above discussion shows that Turner compressed various aspects of the valley into the view of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, but the picture itself tells that Turner did far more than that. He conflates features, reassembling the view to include elements not otherwise visible from the vantage point adopted and makes the picture a composite of different views from different places on the Isle of Skye. Thus, the composed image relates to the whole island, not only Loch Coruisk. Signs of this crucial compositional act can be found in the distant view.

At the top right of the picture are two groups of mountains. The upper group is furthest away, basking in the sunlight, the brightest part of the picture. Their shape partly resembles Sgurr Alasdair (Figure 54) and partly Sgurr nan Gillean (Figure 14). Sgurr Alasdair is the highest summit in the Black Cullins, to the far west of Loch Coruisk. Sgurr nan Gillean is to the far north. Both are possible to be seen from the vantage points of the picture. The lower group looks like The Storr, a group of rocky hills on the Trotternish peninsula of the Isle of Skye (Figure 55), formed in post-glacial landslides and one of the iconic sights on the island. The Storr is located to the far north and is impossible to be seen from Loch Coruisk.

At the top left, the mountains resemble the Trotternish landslip at the Quiraing (Figure 56) in northern Skye, near to The Storr.[218] The escarpment is the result of a series of landslips, caused by volcanic activity in the Eocene, 55–60 million years ago. Below is a massive mountain slope, the rock face of which is covered in long parallel grooves. Shanes suggests this looks like Sgurr na Banachdich (Figure 57), one of the summits of the Black Cuillins, to the northwest of Loch Coruisk.[219] In the picture, the slope is an important link between the jagged peaks of the central ridge and the distant landslip, uniting them into one giant zigzag mountain body, occupying the left half of the picture without separating the middle-ground and the background. Quiraing and Sgurr na Banachdich are both impossible to be seen from Loch Coruisk.

In summary, Turner makes *Loch Coruisk, Skye* a compound image, a composite of various distinct views, geological features, and iconic elements of the Isle of Skye. This compositional act indicates two constituents of Turner's compositional intention: first, the landscape in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* represents the whole island, not merely the Loch Coruisk valley and, second, the sightings Turner selected have distinct geological features which are all the result of the original wild natural forces. Turner assembles them on a small piece of paper where, although a little crowded, each represents a distinct aspect of the violent or brutal wilderness of Loch Coruisk and the Isle of Skye in the pictorial landscape. In doing so, Turner creates a new pictorial phenomenon of Loch Coruisk – a wild and giant zig-zag mountain complex standing beside the loch. Peculiarity of the new pictorial phenomenon is in the newly created wilderness, which is not only Turner's intentional wildest wilderness but also the implication of the romantic drama of Scott's *The Lord of the Isles*.

3. Employing the form of vortex

In *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, the two vortices are fictional elements. Turner chooses clouds, an indispensable element of the Loch Coruisk landscape, to form the vortices, to establish a volume that can represent the extreme dramatic atmosphere of the wild landscape. This

---

[218] Colin K. Ballantyne, "Scottish Landform Examples – 2: The Landslides of Trotternish, Isle of Skye," *Scottish Geographical Magazine* 107, no. 2 (September 1991): 130.

[219] Shanes, The Life and Masterworks of J.M.W. Turner, 146.

compositional act makes the atmosphere of the picture sufficiently intense to deliver the poetic mood from Scott's poem and to express the ideal wilderness in Turner's imagining.

Ruskin suggests that *Loch Coruisk, Skye* produces a view 'to geological truth' and is an instance of the artist's rich geological knowledge.[220] The truth he referred to is the geological topography faithfully depicted by Turner, such as the use of shadow and light to depict the chasms between the jags and the broken layers of rock. In terms of the clouds, mists, and vortex, Ruskin suggests that they are painted based on Turner's knowledge of science, a debatable argument, based on the supposition that the rain falling on the barren rocks was 'violently heated' by the sun; the intense warmth of the rocks then created 'sudden and violent evaporation' that converted the rain into steam.[221] What Ruskin describes is a general physical phenomenon that may have been common knowledge in his time. However, my first-hand experience is that the temperature of the rocks at Loch Coruisk, on a sunny afternoon at the height of summer, is not much higher than the temperature of my hands. It is hardly possible that the barren rocks surrounding the loch could become hot enough to convert the rain into steam.

Is it then possible the vortex is a depiction of a real storm in Loch Coruisk valley? According to the geographic studies, rainfall in Scottish highlands is usually relief rainfall, that looks like that sketched by Turner in Figure 47.[222] That is to say, the rain in the valley of Loch Coruisk may be very heavy, and the suddenly moving clouds can change the weather dramatically, but the chance of seeing a hurricane or storm vortex is rare. The vortex is, then, an artistic fictional element created by Turner to enhance the wild atmosphere in the pictorial landscape, not a depiction of reality or a reflection of scientific knowledge.

For Turner, the use of the vortex is not limited to *Loch Coruisk, Skye.* It is a compositional phenomenon that appears in other works of Turner, such as *Snow Storm*, *Light and Colour* and *Shade and Darkness* (Figures 58–60). Maurice Davies attributes it to Turner's exploration of curves in the landscape. Davies demonstrates that Turner explored the curved edges of lakes, seas, and rivers, and also enhanced the curves of the ground, in

---

[220] John Ruskin, *Modern Painters Vol.1* (London: Smith, Elder and Co., 1843), 249.

[221] Ruskin, *Modern Painters Vol.1*, 249.

[222] Alan Bilham-Boult, *People, Places and Themes* (1999; reprint, Oxford: Heinemann, 2001), 51.

order to visually give softer, more fluid bounds for the viewer. Davies suggests that the vortex in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* is an extreme example of Turner's exploration of curves, mediating the painted ground into 'the vortex of vapour or wind'.[223] Davies' suggestion rightly recognises Turner's practice of employing curves and exploring their pictorial effect, from the angle of how Turner uses the skill of perspective; but Davies does not explain why the vortices in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* are so extreme.

Campbell observes that the vortex in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* is a reference to Turner's *Ben Arthur* in Figure 12, engraved by Thomas Lupton (1819). In *Ben Arthur* Figure 12, Campbell sees the rocks and turbulent weather fused into a vortex and suggests that the vortex form is developed further in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*.[224] Campbell's observation is essentially correct but he fails to consider another *Ben Arthur,* as shown in Figure 11, which associates with the *Ben Arthur* in Figure 12. The formation and pictorial effect of Figure 11 are very different from Figure 12.

This case study finds that the use of the vortex in Turner's landscapes is not a one-off, but a continuing compositional act. Also, Turner's reference to *Ben Arthur* is an act of recollection: what he recollected is probably not the vortex form itself, but the various effects and manners of using it. This case study, therefore, compares the landscape of Glencoe with the two *Ben Arthurs* to examine further Turner's compositional acts.

In the physical landscape of Glencoe, Ben Arthur flanks a U-shaped valley (Figure 46). The photograph shows that the valley has an arced base, but this is a gentle and wide arc, not a symmetrical semi-circular shape. In *Ben Arthur* in Figure 11, the valley floor curves up into a wide symmetrical semi-circular arc. The sky is clear and the atmosphere is tranquil, looks like the valley in the photograph. In *Ben Arthur* in Figure 12, the shape of the valley is the same as in Figure 11, but the atmosphere is very different. Turner adds layered and swirling clouds over the valley and the visual effect is that the rock faces are fused into the clouds. More importantly, Turner adds elements of light and shade into the clouds, with strong contrasts: the dark and swirling clouds project a huge shadow onto the

---

[223] Davies, *Turner as Professor*, 96.

[224] Christopher Baker, *English Drawings and Watercolours 1600–1900* (Edinburgh: Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 2011), 356.

Mungo Campbell, *A Complete Catalogue of Works by Turner in the National Gallery of Scotland* (Edinburgh: National Galleries of Scotland, 1993), 77.

right-hand slope of the valley; while the white, bright, swirling clouds lighten the left-hand slope. Then, the darkness on the right-hand mingles the dark side of the valley with the dark swirling clouds into one fluid body, making a cone of darkness in the pictorial space, as if a half vortex in motion. Figure 11 and Figure 12 depict the same valley in the same shape, but the valley in Figure 11 is a semi-circular shaped valley and the atmosphere of it is tranquil, while the valley in Figure 12 looks like a half vortex and the mood of it is intense. The key element that made the strong contrast between the two is the vortex, which was painted as if in moving and swirling.

In contrast, in *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* the valley is V-shaped and the loch water flat and still; and two vortices appeared: one is strong swirling inside the valley and the other is blurred and floating outside the valley. Turner did not simply recollect a ready-to-use vortex pattern from his memory. Perhaps what he recollected was the practice of how to produce the swirling effect of the vortex, thus he could use it to depict the wild Loch Coruisk valley, a valley with unique surrounding jagged and splintered peaks and rough rock face. More than that, *Loch Coruisk, Skye* was made to illustrate Scott's poem and Turner had to consider Scott's poetic descriptions of the loch, as well as the mood of the romantic story. Consequently, he does not bend the ground to make the vortex, as he did in *Ben Arthur* in Figure 12, but dramatises the movements of the clouds, mist, and air to build two huge vortices. The right-hand one is strong and clear the other is blurred. Turner arranged the right-hand vortex swirling on the rough rock face, to produce a feeling of the striking wilderness. This vortex is not the 'fully developed' or 'extreme example' of the old vortex in Figure 12, but a new form of vortex in a new context, with new dynamic states and new relationships with the rock faces. Turner's recollection is not a repetition but a new compositional act generated from the former act. Thus, the presentation of vortex in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* is a means through which Turner expresses his imagined ideal poetic wilderness.

To summarise, all the alterations Turner made are compositional acts that performed his compositional intention. Although we cannot access Turner's compositional intention in his mind, we can perceive it to some extent by investigating his compositional acts, such as how he selects elements from the physical landscape, how he alters them, and how he employs fictional elements in his work. The pictorial landscape in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*

cannot appear in reality; it is a new phenomenon of Loch Coruisk, intentionally created by Turner.

Part 4: Illustrating The Lord of the Isles

Illustrating Scott's poem was Turner's general intention, but how he illustrated the poem was driven by his compositional intention. To access the artist's compositional intention, this study traces and examines the key compositional acts of the artist and intentional objects related to illustrating the poem. Since Turner did not reference explicit incidents or characters in the poem, in order to identify what contents in the poem that Turner selected for composing the illustration, and how he illustrated, this part examines the texts written by Scott. The examination first draws out two storylines and several descriptions of Loch Coruisk from the poem and Scott's notes, and reviews the historical context of the romantic story. In doing so, the study gains a basic perception of Scott's poem and the role of the landscape of Loch Corusik in it. Then, the study compares the text with Turner's illustration. The study finds that Turner probably read Scott's poem, especially the several poetic depictions of Loch Coruisk, which were essential to his illustration; and Turner inventively represented those depictions in his painting. Moreover, Turner captured the dramatic tension that runs throughout the story and also perceived related history to the poem. Last, Turner may intend to show his respect to the achievement of Scott's poetry. Therefore, Turner expressed all these perceptions in the picture of *Loch Coruisk, Skye.*

1. *The Lord of the Isles*

This is a long, romantic, narrative poem that tells the love story of Ronald and Edith, The Lord of the Isles and the maid of Lorne. Its historical context is the wandering Robert the Bruce (1274 – 1329 AD) coming to the isles of Ronald, in c. 1306 or 1307 when Bruce, who had crowned himself King of the Scots, had been defeated by Edward I and fled into hiding before his re-emergence. Bruce was the Scots' hero and the King of Scotland from 1306 to 1329.[225] He led his forces to win the significant Battle of Bannockburn, ending the first War of Scottish Independence. The independence of Scotland, with Bruce as its King,

---

[225] Michael Penman, *Robert the Bruce: King of the Scots* (Yale University Press, 2014), 92–118.

was recognised in 1328 in the Treaty of Edinburgh–Northampton, signed by Edward III (1312 –1377 AD) of England.

Ronald is 'the fictional counterpart of Angus Og MacDonald (d. c.1316)', the chief of Clan MacDonald of Glencoe, 'who aided Bruce when his fortunes were at their lowest, and sent a contingent of Islesmen to fight at Bannockburn'.[226] Edith is 'presumably completely fictional, as are her heroic adventures'.[227] In the poem, Ronald was unfaithful at the beginning of their relationship.

Thomas R. Dale indicates that the pome 'showed clear signs of a variety of intentions', that refer to Scott's 'experiments with historical romance, presenting a more or less conventional, and attenuated love story in a carefully realised historical and geographical setting'.[228] The narrative of the poem has two storylines: the historical line relating to Bruce's sanctuary and return and the political conflicts between England and Scotland, and the fictional and romantic Ronald–Edith storyline describing the personal relationship and emotional conflicts between the couple. At the beginning of the poem, Bruce arrives at Ronald's Ardtornish castle for sanctuary, on the wedding day of Ronald and Edith. At the end of the poem, Bruce addresses his troops on the field of Bannockburn. In the course of the poem, Ronald and Edith experience suspicion, separation, and many other challenges, but ultimately gain reconciliation.

Under pressure to redeem his debt, Scott intended to write an appealing romantic poem for his readers, not a historical epic. Hence, his strategy was to develop the intricate plot against a tumultuous historical context but to focus on the Ronald–Edith storyline. However, critics described the poem as a 'hurried composition', because the transition from conflict to reconciliation between Ronald and Edith was rigid and lacking in persuasive details, which would be the most intricate component of a romantic poem.[229]

---

[226] Thomas R. Dale, "From Epic to Romance: Barbour's Bruce and Scott's The Lord of the Isles," *Studies in Scottish Literature*, Vol. 26, Issue 1, no. 44 (1991), 517.

[227] ibid., 517.

[228] ibid., 515.

[229] "Walter Scott", Edinburgh University Library, last modified 19 December 2011, http://www.walterscott.lib.ed.ac.uk/works/poetry/lord.html

Nonetheless, the poetic descriptions of the wild Loch Coruisk in the poem are impressive, because they successfully evoke feelings of tension or uncertainty when the plot was developing to a climax or turning point. Scott empowered his poetic narrative with the images of the wild landscape drawn by his words, that came not only from his creative mind but also from his first-hand experience of the Loch Coruisk valley, as evidenced by both the notes from his Loch Coruisk tour and the related text in *The Lord of the Isles*.

2. The poetic Loch Coruisk in *The Lord of the Isles*

2.1 Descriptions of Loch Coruisk in Scott's notes

As with Turner's sketches, Scott's notes of his journey to Loch Coruisk show his experience of Loch Coruisk and his intentional acts for preparing his composition of *The Lord of the Isles*. Scott inspected the Western Isles of the Highlands in 1814, especially the Isle of Skye and Loch Coruisk, and described his experiences as follows:

> It is as exquisite a savage scene ... After having penetrated so far as distinctly to observe the termination of the lake under an immense precipice, which rises abruptly from the water, we returned, and often stopped to admire the ravages which storms must have made in these recesses, where all human witnesses were driven to places of more shelter and security. Stones, or rather large masses and fragments of rocks of a composite kind, perfectly different from the strata of the lake, were scattered upon the bare rocky beach, in the strangest and most precarious situations, as if abandoned by the torrents which had borne them down from above ... The bare rocks, which formed the shore of the lakes, were a species of granite.
>
> …
>
> ...seemed quite pathless and inaccessible, as a huge mountain, one of the detached ridges of the Cuillen hills, sinks in a profound and perpendicular precipice down to the water. On the left-hand side, which we traversed, rose a higher and equally inaccessible mountain, the top of which strongly resembled the shivered crater of an exhausted volcano. I never saw a spot in which there was less appearance of vegetation of any kind. The eye rested on nothing but barren and naked crags, and the rocks on which we walked by the side of the loch, were as bare as the pavements of Cheapside.
>
> ...

> I never witnessed any in which it pressed more deeply upon the eye and the
> heart than at Loch Corrisken; at the same time that its grandeur elevated and
> redeemed it from the wild and dreary character or utter barrenness.[230]

From my first-hand experience, the ridge with 'a profound and perpendicular precipice' that Scott mentions in the second paragraph is probably Drum nan Ramh, on the eastern side of the loch, while the mountain described as 'an exhausted volcano' on the left is probably Dubhs Ridge, on the western side of the loch. The poet describes these most impressive views with poetic imagination: the immense precipice ravaged by storms, the pathless mountain top resembling an exhausted volcano, the large rocks in the most precarious situations, and the utter barrenness of the place, which all constitute the wild vision of Loch Coruisk in the narrative.

The last paragraph reveals Scott's intention in the writing and the meaning of the poetic descriptions to the Loch Coruisk: the grandness of the rocks 'elevated and redeemed' themselves from the wild and barrenness. 'The grandness' suggests the strength of the rocks, remaining high and free, even though the consequence is to be ravaged, abandoned, or exhausted in the wild and barrenness. Scott sees the essence of the wild natural landscape and represents it into his description of human life, as the same is true: staying high and true and free involves facing severe challenges and requires extreme courage and sacrifice, such as Robert the Bruce's fight for independence, Ronald and Edith's pursuit of true love, or even the pursuit for wealth in Cheapside, described briefly by Scott through a simile with light satire. The descriptions in his notes are poetic, even without meter or rhyme, revealing some of the poet's compositional intention that drove his writing.

2.2 Descriptions of Loch Coruisk in the poem

In the poem, the poet's compositional intention is indicated by the features of the landscape he emphasised and how he described them. In the beginning, the Isle of Skye is a sanctuary, an isolated place to which Ronald goes with Bruce. As the plot develops, the island becomes a dangerous place and a site of drama: Bruce is attacked; then Bruce and Ronald slew the attackers; after that, they receive the news that the Scots have risen up against English rule and that Edward I is dead. Bruce then leaves the island, goes to his

---

[230] Scott, *The Lord of the Isles*, 315–6.

fleet at Arran, and proceeds to victory at Bannockburn. In the narrative, descriptions of the wild Loch Coruisk always interact with the development of the plot. Specific descriptions of Loch Coruisk in the poem are collected and analysed below.

Canto III

XII

...

Then each took bow and bolts in hand,
Their row-boat launch'd and leapt to land,
And left their skiff and train,
Where a wild stream, with headline shock,
Came brawling down its bed of rock,
To mingle with the main.
....

XIII

A while their route they silent made,

As men who stalk for mountain-deer,

Till the good Bruce to Ronald said,

"St. Mary! What a scene is here!

......

A scene so rude, so wild as this,

Yet so sublime in barrenness,

Ne'er did my wandering footsteps press,

Where'er I happ'd to roam"

...

XIV

For rarely human eye has known

A scene so stern as that dread lake,

With its dark ledge of barren stone.

Seems that primeval earthquake's sway

Hath rent a strange and shatter'd way

Through the rude bosom of the hill,

And that each naked precipice,

Sable ravine, and dark abyss,

Tells of the outrage still.

...

But here, – above, around, below,

On mountain or in glen,

Nor tree, nor shrub, nor plant, nor flower,

Nor aught of vegetative power,

The weary eye may ken.

For all is rocks at random thrown,

Black waves, bare crags, and banks of stone,

...

And wilder, forward as they wound,

Were the proud cliffs and lake profound.

Huge terraces of granite black

Afforded rude and cumber'd track;

For from the mountain hoar,

Hurl'd headlong in some night of fear,

When yell'd the wolf, and fled the deer,

Loose crags had toppled o'er;

...

<div align="center">XVI</div>

This lake, said Bruce, whose barriers drear

Are precipices sharp and sheer,

....

Corisken [Coruisk] call the dark lake's name,

Coolin [Cuillin] the ridge, as bards proclaim,

From old Cuchullin, chief of fame.

XV

But bards, familiar in our isles

Rather with nature's frowns than smiles, ...

Or that your eye could see the mood

Of Corryvrekin's whirlpool rude,

When dons the hag her whiten'd hood –

...

XVII

...

Answer'd the Bruce, and musing mind

might here a graver moral find.

These mighty cliffs, that heave on high

Their naked brows to middle sky,

Indifferent to the sun or snow,

Where nought can fade, nought can blow,

May they not mark a monarch's fate.

Raised high 'mid storms of strife and state,

Beyond life's lowlier pleasures placed,

His soul a rock, his heart a waste?

O'er hope and love and fear aloft

High rears his crowned head – but soft!

...

Canto IV

I

'Where the proud Queen of Wilderness hath placed ... her lonely throne':

Such are the scenes, where savage grandeur wakes

An awful thrill that softens into sighs;

...

Or, farther, where beneath the northern skies,

Chides wild Loch Eribol his caverns hoar –

But, be the minstrel judge, they yield the prize

Of desert dignity to that dread shore,

That sees grim Coolin [Cuillin] rise, and hears Corisken [Coruisk] roar.

...[231]

The first description of the Isle of Skye in the poem appears in stanza XII of canto III. The isle is seen by the protagonists as they approach and land on it. The description establishes an intense atmosphere for that particular moment, highlighting the wild stream 'brawling' down the rock face, the first constituent of the wilderness. The stream is probably the cascade, the last part of the River Allt a' Chaoich, which is represented at the entrance of the valley in Turner's painting, though Turner inventively altered the position of it and made it the head of the River Scavaig (Part 3: 2.1).

In stanza XIII, the landscape is seen through the protagonists' eyes. They are surprised by the rude appearance of the isle, even as seen from a distance. The increased intensity of the atmosphere echoes the situation of Bruce and Ronald, hinting that the Isle of Skye may be a dangerous place for them.

In stanza XIV, the poet describes the loch is 'dread' within the naked and dark precipices of the Black Cuillin. This stanza is quoted in Ardill's discussion of Turner's sketches and *Loch Coruisk, Skye*.[232] Ardill also quoted David Wallace-Hadrill and Janet Carolan's

---

[231] Scott, *The Lord of the Isles,* 109–140.

[232] Ardill, "*Loch Coruisk, Skye* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner".

indication – 'rather than giving an impression of great heights, this view of the loch "enables us to see it rather in terms of great depth"'.[233]

Finally in stanzas XV, XVI, and XVII, through words spoken by Bruce, the poet describes the rough topography of the Cuillins. Words such as 'dark ledge of barren stone' presages the risks that the protagonists will have to take on the island.

In canto IV, the poet humanises the place by using words such as 'grim', 'dignity', 'rise', and 'roar' and imputes strong emotions to the mountains and water. The descriptions hint at approaching danger to the protagonists – the plot of murder, and may also denote the rising political power of Bruce – such as the description of the Cuillins mountains hearing the roar of the Loch Coruisk water, suggesting the return of Bruce.

J. H. Paterson suggests that descriptions of landscape in Scott's novels are not realistic or geologically accurate, but Scott does not distort the landscape to suit his story. Paterson asserts that Scott's descriptions are selective but almost realistic, because Scott has a talent for 'glimpsing and presenting the significant feature' of the landscape.[234] While Klock indicates that 'Scott uses landscape in the same way as he uses history: as a projected reality, abstracted from the given scene. What is important is not an accurate account of the landscape's geological features, but its suitability for the reflection of the situation and emotions of his subjects'.[235]

In the view of this study, Scott, like Turner, does not intend an accurate geological representation of Loch Coruisk. The compositional intention of the two artists lies in the wild or even violent atmosphere among the mountains and waters, to enhance the dramatic effect of telling the romantic story – as Scott did – and to visualise the ideal wilderness in the pictorial landscape, as Turner did. The geological features of the landscape are merely raw materials for the artists' imaginations. It is not necessary to assess the accuracy of creative artworks. A reasonable approach is to celebrate the difference between the physical object and the poetic imaginary description, in order to perceive the artistry and

---

[233] ibid.

[234] J. H. Paterson, "The Novelist and his Region: Scotland through the Eyes of Sir Walter Scott," *Scottish Geographical Magazine* 81, no. 3 (December 1965): 151.

[235] Klonk, *Science and the Perception of Nature,* 92.

power of the artists' imagination, to access the humanity expressed by the imaginary description, and to inspire new forms of creativity and expression.

3. Illustrating Scott's poetic Loch Coruisk

Turner does not illustrate explicit lines in the poem, but renders his perception of the wilderness of Loch Coruisk in Scott's poem, to match the mood of the romantic drama. He also considers the essential meaning of the poem, as well as the achievements of Scott's romantic poetry, in his design of the picture. Specifically, Turner visualises the features of the wilderness of Loch Coruisk in Scott's eyes, as well as the dramatic features of the romantic story and related historical events. His illustration is based on the physical Loch Coruisk landscape but with inventive design and imaginary arrangements.

3.1 The mountains and water

3.1.1 The Mountains

In his notes, Scott describes the situations of the landscape he experienced – the mountains abruptly rising from the water and he specifically describes one detached ridge of the Cuillin hills that sinks down into the water with 'a profound and perpendicular precipice'. As a writer, he uses verbs vividly, invoking direction. The 'rise' represents a upward movement and 'sink' a downward one. The word 'perpendicular' refers to the situation of rising or sinking movements.

Scott captured the appearance of conflict in the movements of earth made by natural forces at Loch Coruisk. On one hand, upward magma intrusions gave the mountains a rising posture; on the other hand, the glaciers pressed the mountain ridges downward, making them look as if they were gradually sinking into the loch. While the former movement was sudden and quick, the latter was gradual and slow. Although millions of years elapsed between these two wild natural forces, they ultimately built the dramatic appearance of the landscape that became the source of Scott's imagination and descriptions. Juxtaposition of the poetic descriptions of the opposing movements exhibited by the mountains of Loch Coruisk creates a confrontation between the verbs in the text and evokes a feeling of tension in the readers' imagining.

Scott gave a travel guide on Loch Coruisk to Daniell. After his journey, Daniell made a watercolour, *Loch Coruisk near Loch Scavaig* (Figure 61), in which depiction of the mountains was very different from the physical landscape, and also very different from Scott's description and Turner's depictions of Loch Coruisk. Daniell's mountains had a rough appearance but an elegant posture. The jagged peaks were elongated to pinnacles and the shapes of the mountains were painted steeper than both the physical mountains and *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. There is no risk, danger, or dramatic uncertainty in Daniell's work; the mountains are steep, the appearances are rough, but the postures are elegant, meeting the requirements of a pleasant landscape.

In contrast, in *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* Turner visualised and compressed the conflicting movements described in Scott's poem in the central ridge. On the left of the ridge, Turner used layers of colour to build the tilted surface. The edges of the coloured layers became upward lines, as if in movement, and the jagged arrow-like ridge tops pointed firmly up right, expressing a feeling of rushing up in that direction. On the right of the ridge, the rock flank was depicted as if rising up from the dark water perpendicularly and the movement appeared powerful; however, the dark and rough rock face, together with the dark motionless water that concealed the rest of the ridge body, told that the ridge was heavy and it was rising up in conflict.

One detail is, Scott, the poet, used the word perpendicular to describe the posture of the ridge. Turner, the illustrator, would have been aware of the perpendicular edge of the precipice in Scott's description, and grasped it as a feature of Scott's poetic expression. He would also have seen the dark flutings on the Drum nan Ramh, when sketching in the valley. More likely, his compositional act was influenced both by the poet's description and his own onsite experience. Thus, he painted the dark flutings of Drum nan Ramh on the rock face at the right side of the central ridge vertically in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. The act was inventive and produced an unrealistic, unusual mountain shape that conveyed an intense mood.

In summary, Scott described the physical landscape through verbal exaggeration to build an intense mood for his romantic drama; in contrast, Turner visualised the intense mood by inventive arrangements of the pictorial elements and by exaggerations of the momentum of

the movements in the pictorial landscape; and this is the way Turner illustrated the drama of the pome in the painting *Loch Coruisk, Skye.*

3.1.2 The Waters

Regarding the lake, Scott's depictions were also romantic and exaggerated, but varied according to the situations in the poem. The first depiction appears in Canto XIV when Bruce and Ronald landed on the Isle of Skye and the lake was described as a 'dread lake'. In Canto IV, when Bruce had hidden in the island for a while and was preparing to return, Scott wrote that the 'Corisken [Coruisk] roar'.

In the picture of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, the loch water Turner painted is still. The central ridge projects a dark shadow on the surface of the water and the shadowy water is silent, in dark blue. A tension can be felt at the curved water edge, at where the motionless water meets the rough surface of the 'ringing up' central ridge. And the water outside the shadow becomes light blue with some reflections of the sunlight. It is unknown how Turner considered Scott's description of Loch Coruisk – the 'dread lake' – but the picture shows that the motionless water in the dark shadow functions as the *repoussoir,* the foil, to underline the movement of the 'ringing up' hills.

It would have been a challenge to represent the 'Corisken [Coruisk] roar'. Perhaps, the vortex was a solution. In the picture, the right vortex looks as if a huge sea wave, or a swirl of moving wind and rain, which is hitting the central ridge. The painting is silent but because Turner vividly painted the movement of the vortex, a sound of the roaring waters may be evoked, if associated the vision with this situation – the huge sea waves are hitting the bank.

3.2 The entrance of Loch Coruisk

In the valley of Loch Coruisk, the scene of the entrance consists of the River Scavaig and its river mouth, a gentle slope of Gars-Bheinn, the southern end of Loch Coruisk and the northern end of Loch na Cuilce at the two sides of Gars-Bheinn. In Canto III, Scott indirectly represents the view by describing Bruce and Ronald's response to the wild scene and the barrenness of the mountains, as the two approach the Isle of Skye by boat. The first

thing seen by the two is the wild stream that, as Scott wrote, 'Came brawling down its bed of rock'.

In the painting, as discussed in Part 3, the position of the stream is inventively moved by Turner from the bank of Loch na Cuilce to the fictional bank of the River Scavaig. It is hard to know whether Turner's arrangement was inspired by Scott's description or Daniell's *Loch Scavaig, Skye,* or perhaps both. If so, Turner may be inspired by different elements from each: from Scott's description, he may grasp the wild 'brawling' of the stream, such that at the corner of the picture, the stream drops brawlingly into the river that runs through the rocks and foothills. The colour arrangement emphasises its momentum: the white surging stream and its white foam are in contrast to the dark blue waters into which it falls and brawls. Moreover, the white of the waters against the creamy yellow rocks and dark blue foothills builds another contrast between the brawling water and the heavy, solid mountain. From Daniel's drawing, Turner may be inspired by the situation of the cascade on the rock face. In Turner's painting, however, the stream is seen from above and the eastern side, because it is not the most important element in the picture while, in Daniell's work, the elegant cascade is seen from the front and is the central element in the picture.

Nonetheless, the scenario of the entrance in Turner's painting goes beyond Scott's description. Turner arranges a still figure standing on the riverbank, together with the altered view of the river current, making this corner an important component of the overall picture. Whether as a scene within a scene, or a self-established part of the whole picture, the entrance hints at different situations between the outside world and inside the loch valley. Maybe viewers would suggest that the standing figure is Turner himself. However, it may be more meaningful to consider it a general representation of 'a contemplating viewer', a designed figure to evoke the vision of facing a threshold, behind which is the wild, isolated and dramatic Loch Coruisk valley.

3.3 Geological depictions

In his notes, Scott described some geological features of the mountains in Loch Coruisk valley. He mentions that the rocks were granite and explains how they were formed, and the colour of granite was black in his poem when he described the danger of the island. He

also described the jagged mountain peaks as 'the shivered crater of an exhausted volcano'. Turner selectively illustrated these, depicting the central ridge as formed by granite by illustrating its main geological feature – its layers. However, Turner did not paint the rocks of the central ridge in black, as Scott described, but in a creamy tone; he also depicted the jagged mountain peaks in accordance with the physical landscape as mentioned in Part 1, not as Scott describe – a crater of a volcano. These compositional acts show that Turner's compositional intentions are multiple, and do not focus solely on illustrating the poem.

4. Illustrating the essential meaning of the poem

As an illustrator, Turner not only represents some of Scott's descriptions of Loch Coruisk but also interprets the essential meaning of the poem. In Scott's poem, the story is developed through violent fights and emotional conflicts, such as the physical fighting in battle or the emotional struggles between the lovers. His story relates to a history full of political conflicts. The historical period of Bruce in sanctuary and his return contains violent events such as John III Comyn being killed in a church, the fighting between Bruce and his Scots enemies, and the battles between Bruce's forces and those of Edward I. Nonetheless, the poem is not tragic – it has a positive ending, to both Ronald and Edith's relationship and Bruce's fight for independence. A reader Jeffrey remarks that the poem has a 'romantic grandeur', and the 'savage greatness and rude antiquity' in Scott's descriptions form the characters and the historical, yet romantic, story.[236] For this case study, the essential meaning of the poem lies in the artistic representation of the power and possibilities of human activities in the historical context of fourteenth-century Scotland; and Turner's illustration, on one hand, resonates with the essential meaning of the poem.

First, Turner may find the same intense feelings in the conflicts between the natural forces, the emotional lovers, and the historical conflicts between England and Scotland in the fourteenth century. He radically represents the intense feelings by the contrast between the rising up mountains with jagged peaks and the flat motionless dark water, by the confrontation between the giant vortex and the rough rock face. The political views of the two artists are a big topic which lies outside the scope of this research, but at least the

---

[236] Scott, *The Lord of the Isles,* 271.

effect of the painting and their successful collaboration show that Turner and Scott may have reached some consensus on both politics and landscape arts.

Second, Turner arranges two groups of mountain peaks in the distant view: those on the up right are standing in sunlight, and those on the up left in mist. The peaks in sunlight are the focus of the distant view, behind all the shadows, darkness and conflicts among the pictorial elements. They are not merely a background, a final layer of the picture, but also the destination for the viewers' eyes. If the process of seeing starts from the central ridge, then travels along the rock face and the still loch water to the vortex, the eyes will arrive at the brightest point of the picture. The process of seeing is just like that of reading the story in the poem, one of change, conflict, development, culmination, ultimately arriving at the bright ending.

On the other hand, arrangements of pictorial elements and artistic effect of the painting show that, to some extent, Turner's pictorial Loch Coruisk goes beyond Scott's poetic Loch Coruisk. For example, Turner painted three figures in the picture, which is not in accordance with the content of Scott's poem. One of the figures is at the entrance of the loch valley and two at the hill top facing the central ridge, at the centre-bottom of the picture. Ardill suggested that the right of the two figures represents Turner himself, looking at and sketching the landscape, and the others were Turner's companions. However, this case study has found one sketch by Turner showing that the prototype for the sitting figure on the right was a local person who was seen and sketched by Turner during his tour in Scotland (Figure 62). The sketch was made after Turner left Edinburgh for Stirling.[237] In it, Turner draws two sitting men. The one on the left sits upright, facing to the right; the one on right leans slightly forward and faces to the left. They are both reading. Turner selected the left figure and put it in *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* with the same posture, but leaning forward a little more. This arrangement suggests that, rather than Turner himself, the man figure wearing a black jacket and black hat probably symbolises Scott's 'reader', if the wild mountains and waters are the radical symbolic vision of *The Lord of the Isles*. The woman figure, wearing a light-coloured jacket beside the 'reader' in an almost standard romantic

---

[237] Thomas Ardill, "A Sketch of Two Sitting Figures Surrounded by Sketches of Arran, East Tarbert and Knock Castle 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner", Catalogue entry, March 2010, in David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*, Tate Research Publication, December 2012, accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw- turner/ joseph-mallord-william-turner-a-sketch-of-two-sitting-figures-surrounded-by-sketches-of- r1135024

posture of seeing and listening, may represent 'the viewer', the beholder. Essentially, the man figure suggests the gesture of perceiving and reflecting to the viewers, while the woman figure suggests the gesture of seeing and appreciating.

In terms of the contemplating figure at the entrance of the valley, which could be considered Turner himself, or Scott, or anyone who was experiencing the relationship between the human self and the natural world at that 'threshold', or who had had previous experience or knowledge of Loch Coruisk, of the history and people of Loch Coruisk and Scotland, and now seeing the physical landscape in person. Therefore, Turner's arrangement of the three figures is not according to the content of Scott's poem, but an arrangement made by himself, an important pictorial element, representing both the viewers' of the landscape and the readers' of Scott's poem in the picture. Moreover, the whole picture of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* can function as an advertisement for the new published *Poetical Works* of Scott. If so, the figures somehow carry a clue to Turner's respect for Scott's achievement in poetry composition, and also to the kinship generated from the collaboration between the painter and the poet.

To summarise, in composing *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, Turner addressed three kinds of Loch Coruisk landscape, the physical one, the poetic one built by Scott, and the ideal one in his own mind. The first carries the truth of nature which the artist intended to pursue as a landscape artist and the view of the physical landscape was also a resource for Turner's imagination and composition. The second, a poetic vision of the landscape, containing both the tension of the romantic drama and the conflicts among the people in Scottish history, was the object Turner intended to illustrate. The third is Turner's purely intentional object. Based on the former two, Turner developed the third and represented it in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. For the third one, the imaginary, ideal wild landscape, Turner did not give up the representation of the truth of nature in it, but did it in an inventive and radical way. He visualised the power and impact of the original wild natural forces by radically representing the movements of the natural things. These compositional acts indicate again that Turner's compositional intention is multiple – to illustrate the poetic Loch Coruisk described by Scott, to represent the powerful natural forces, and to create an ideal image of the wildest Loch Coruisk in his painting.

Part 5: Experiencing *Loch Coruisk, Skye*

My first-hand experience of encountering the painting is that the eyes were immediate attracted by the violent wild momentum of the mountains and the giant vortices of cloud and mist, as well as the subtle feeling brought out by the colour tone of bluish purple. Some of these feelings are what Turner intended to evoke through the picture, while others may go beyond his intention. By Parts 1, 2, and 3, this case study has demonstrated that Turner's compositional intention towards *Loch Coruisk, Skye* is to compose an ideal wild landscape of Loch Coruisk and visualise the poetic Loch Coruisk by Scott. This part is the second stage of the study, exploring the meaning and significance of the painting by experiencing the picture as the individual self, and comparing the experience with others' experience and perceptions. 'Experiencing the picture' specifically means to experience the manner of the artist's painting, the effect of the pictorial elements, and the state of the pictorial landscape. In reality, the painter and the viewer do not share exactly the same experience; however, the study shows that the possibility of establishing an intersubjective experience exists in the process of 'experiencing the picture'.

1. Experiencing Turner's using of perspective

1.1 The notion and technique of perspective

Perspective is not a human's natural way of seeing, but a method of painting developed in the Renaissance. Human sight is a natural ability, which cannot be substituted by perspective, which is a learned skill, a method of depicting space in a plane, or creating a sense of three-dimensional space on a two-dimensional flat paper or canvas by producing a feeling of depth.

Standard linear perspective is based on geometrical rules, according to which, the drawer's viewpoint – or the vanishing point in the picture – is singular and fixed; all the spatial relationships among the objects in the picture are established based on this singular viewpoint and the linear sight-lines (the lines between the singular viewpoint and the positions of various objects in the picture). Today, the modern theory of perspective has developed from that of one viewpoint to include two-point, three-point, and even six-point

perspectives.[238] Some important points of view on perspective related to this case study are expressed by Erwin Panofsky, Hubert Damisch, and Cosgrove.

Panofsky indicates that perspective as a symbolic schema is a result of a transition in Western visual culture from the system of the ancient Greek vanishing point to that of the Renaissance perspective. It is the artists' choice not to follow the ancient paradigm that makes this transition. As a widely used painting technique, perspective links technical, social, cognitive and psychological practices, and characterises Western culture.[239] Panofsky underlines two essential assumptions in the using of perspective in a painting: 'first, that we see with a single and immobile eye, and second, that the planar cross section of the visual pyramid can pass for an adequate reproduction of our optical image'; thus the pictorial space built by perspective is 'an infinite unchanging and homogeneous space – a purely mathematical space.'[240] He revealed that perspective 'makes that phenomenon contingent upon human beings, indeed upon the individual... and the way they take effect is determined by the freely chosen position of a subjective point of view.'[241] Consequently perspective can be considered as both the understanding of distance and 'the distance-denying human struggle for control, as an extension of the domain of the self.'[242]

Damisch's *The Origin of Perspective* starts by questioning Panofsky's thinking. Damisch notes the dual capacity of perspective: on one hand, it is objective knowledge, the 'painter's perspective', related with 'descriptive geometry and plane geometry' and, on the other, an ideological form, shaped by culture, history, and politics.[243] Damisch seeks the truth of the history of perspective and suggests that perspective has its autonomous origins in painting and is not merely a result of the transition as Panofsky asserted.[244]

---

[238] Steven Aguilera, *A New Perspective Universal Edition* (Lulu.com, 2008), 123–126.

[239] Erwin Panofsky, *Perspective as Symbolic Form* (New York: Zone Books, 1997), 29, 34, 67-72.

[240] Panofsky, *Perspective as Symbolic Form*, 29.

[241] ibid., 67-8.

[242] ibid.

[243] Hubert Damisch and John Goodman, *The Origin of Perspective* (London: MIT Press, 1994), xvi, 3.

[244] Damisch and Goodman, *The Origin of Perspective*, 447.

Cosgrove asserts that perspective is 'a pictorial way of representing, structuring or symbolising surroundings'.[245] He indicates that the linear perspective of landscape painting is not only a technique that guarantees the visual reliability of the artistic reproduction of the landscape, but also the detached spectator's (the commissioner or patron) way of seeing the world from an angle of power and authority, in order to show an absolute mastery over the land. Perspective could also be a means to define the relationship between the landscape and its beholders, because perspective can lead the beholders to see 'along the perspectival axis' in a painting.[246] Consequently, for landscape painting, perspective is both a way to show the spectators' mastery over the land and a way to control how the beholders see the painting of the land.

In summary, Panofsky's theory indicates the mathematical feature of a pictorial space built by perspective, reveals how the notion of 'distance' can be understood by the using of perspective, and underlines the individual painter's choice in the use of perspective. Damisch's research on the history of perspective reveals the relationship between the objective knowledge of perspective and the ideological form of it. Cosgrove emphasises the ideology of the use of perspective and the capacity of perspective to master the beholders' view. Same with Panofsky, this study emphasises the artist's choice in the using of perspective, not for exploring the essence of the notion of perspective as Panofsky concerned, but for experiencing the effect of the individual artist's expression in the painting. Likewise to Damisch's point of view, this study considers perspective the objective knowledge, and considers further that a painter's particular use of perspective in a painting is an objective mark of the artist compositional intention and artistic expression. Thus, in the following content, the study experiences the effects of the artist's using perspective in the wild landscape painting, in order to reveal the meaning and significance of the picture.

1.2 Turner's notion of perspective

In his lectures on perspective, Turner frequently emphasises the importance of mastering the skill of linear perspective, but does not overlook the distinction between the

---

[245] Cosgrove, "Prospect, perspective and the evolution of the landscape idea," 55.

[246] ibid.

representation of an object on a picture plane and the true appearances of that object.[247]

Turner insists that, for perspective, the 'rules are the means, nature the end'.[248] That is to say the rules of perspective are the means, which should not limit the painter's work to be 'adhere the truth of nature'.[249] In Turner's practice, the physical landscape is an important source of his perception, but he can always employ perspective effectively while depicting the landscape inventively.

A painter would probably not use a normative linear perspective when painting a wild natural landscape because objects in wild nature, unlike architecture, usually irregularly shaped. Turner's experience of seeing Loch Coruisk is a mobile process of seeing and moving, and the natural elements depicted in the painting are what he saw at different times in different positions; thus a linear perspective would not meet his demand. The painting shows that Turner's manner of employing perspective is characterised by multiple vantage points and various skills in using perspective.

1.3 Experiencing Turner's manner of using perspective

In *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, there is no systematic perspective that masters the pictorial space to a universal geometric rule. Rather, Turner used multiply methods – aerial perspective, foreshortening, varied vantage points and eye levels – to establish a pictorial space that produces a feeling of uncertainty. The experience of seeing *Loch Coruisk, Skye* may be frustrated by the various depths or focuses, compared to a pictorial space governed by linear perspective, which allows the viewer to find the depth in the picture easily by seeing the objects in it from the painter's viewpoint. In the experience of seeing *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, at first glance, the huge volume of the central ridge blocks the eyes from seeing further depth from the front, because there is no path on the ridge. The eyes then have to wander away and may be led by various objects – rocks, water, and clouds – which are respectively painted foreshortened, painted from aerial perspective, or painted from multiple vantage points and eye levels. This is the consequence of Turner's manner of using perspective in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*.

---

[247] Davies, *Turner as Professor*, 41.

[248] ibid. 43.

[249] Finley, *Landscapes of Memory,* 32.

When using aerial perspective, the painter depicts closer objects as bigger and clearer, and distant ones as smaller and more blurred, in order to make the feeling of distance between the closer and the distant. In the picture, the fine detail of the rocks on the front central ridge makes them seem closer to the viewer; they push the pictorial space forward towards the viewer. Turner then places two figures standing on the hilltop in front of the central ridge and paints them with clear and delicate shape and detail. Thus, a distance is generated between the figures and the central ridge, and that distance expands the volume of the pictorial space forward towards the viewer again. Meanwhile, the distant mountains on the upper right are partly invisible in the mist and clouds, creating the feeling that they are far away. Moreover, the mist and clouds are illuminated by the bright lights behind and mist becomes a veil, thus, a sense of infinity is built, not infinite in depth, but an infinite boundless sphere behind the veil.

By the use of foreshortening, Turner enlarges the volume of the lower part of the central ridge and, meanwhile, reduces the size of the distant mountains. This arrangement let the small distant mountains drag the pictorial space backward, while pushing the central ridge closer to the viewer's eyes, as if seen from immediately above. A record shot taken by a mountain hiker (Figure 63) walking on the mountain ridge shows this visual effect. Although the mountain may be different, the feeling of walking on a mountain ridge is intersubjective, just as when I was hiking in the mountains, the rocks under my feet looked as if they were swelling up to my eyes, because when walking on a ridge, the hiker keeps one eye on the uneven path underfoot and another eye to the front to watch the path ahead. Consequently, the rocks underfoot and nearer to the eyes looked bigger and clearer and their details flowed into the hikers' eyes during the walking. This intersubjective experience was evoked when I saw the appearance of the lower part of the central ridge, which presented the effect of foreshortening. It is not known whether the artist deliberately used foreshortening to depict the central ridge he saw, or whether his use of foreshortening was determined by his experience of hiking. In either case, the mobile experience of the painter can be perceived through the use of foreshortening, and the viewers who have had the similar experience or knowledge or imagination can share the experience. The meaning of the phenomenological method is to establish the awareness that one can perceive the painter's compositional experience by seeing as the painter – seeing as if walking on the mountain ridge as the painter did.

By employing various vantage points, Turner fabrics a multi-focus pictorial structure of the landscape. A hiker in Loch Coruisk can experience various eye-levels and vantage points in seeing the landscape, including from ground level, the slopes, upper slopes, and the summit; likewise, a viewer can also experience the picture of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* as the painter – as the painter is hiking in the landscape. Then at the riverside in the left bottom corner the viewer can experience an almost a ground-level view. Turner probably sketched the large round foothill when he had already risen a little higher than ground level, whence he looked back and saw the river running through the foothills to Loch na Cuilice. Also, to the central ridge, Turner uses an irregular three-point perspective to depict the massive block; as a result, the front, western, and eastern sides of the ridge are all visible in the flat picture. The first vantage point could be on an upper slope of a peak, facing the top of the central ridge, from where the mountain front and the three jagged peaks can be seen. The second could be at the same level but further to the east, from where one can see the eastern side of the ridge and the whole loch below. And the third point is virtual and ultimate. If moving the eyes to the distance, the viewer can experience a very high virtual viewpoint, like a bird's-eye view, above all the ridges and mountain tops in the picture; it is the painter's view, or the view of the creator of the picture, from where the most distant views to both the west and the east can be seen simultaneously.

Although in the first-time encounter, the eyes can have a free virtual tour in the pictorial space, with different directions, routes and sequences of seeing, the structure of the space and the spatial relationships among the objects in the pictorial landscape are objective. Thus, the artist's pictorial construction has the capacity to direct the viewer's experience of seeing. And the meaning of experiencing the multi-focus pictorial structure of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* is that one may perceive the different dispositions and striving atmosphere among the mountains and water, by allowing the various perspectives and vantage points to lead the seeing eyes to go through the pictorial landscape, thus to gain intersubjective experience from seeing the picture.

2. Experiencing the vortex

There are two vortices in the picture. The lefthand one is a circle of mist and clouds and not very clear and the righthand one is a strong vortex, with the texture and quality of a hurricane. I had an intense feeling from the vortex on the right when I saw the painting for

the first time. The vortex and its relation to the rock face build a confrontational state because, geometrically, the vortex and the straight rock flank are situated as 'a vortex against a tangent'.

In physics, a vortex is the result of the conflict between two forces – the fluid force (the moving clouds and mist) and the force of friction drag (from the rock face).[250] When looking at the picture, the feeling of friction is evoked first by the lines of the brush strokes with various white and dark blue shades, giving the vortex body a texture of the intertwining water and air and a state of whirling. Second, the feeling of friction is evoked by the rough rock face, especially the detail of the vertical dark flutings, suggesting the heavy, hard, and rough quality of the rock surface. A brilliant detail in the picture is a small dark piece of sharp-edged rock penetrates the upper part of the vortex, implying that part of the vortex is broken during the violent friction, which strengthens the pictorial expression of the violent conflict, when the swirling vortex of mist and clouds striking on the solid and rough rock face.

The view of the vortex and rock face is artistically produced: there is no corresponding physical scene referenced or physically experienced in reality. Thus my experience of the pictorial situation constitutes by memory recollection, recollecting the my first-hand experience of seeing a real vortex of clouds and mist, and the empirical knowledge of the physical forces involved in a swirling vortex. The recollected experience helps to perceive the emotion or mood of the situation, while the empirical knowledge provides the cause and effect; the two are complementary.

From the phenomenological perspective, various experiences can be generated from seeing the vortex and every individual's experience and perception of the vortex is unique. On one hand, the radical state of the vortex provides the general facts of the vortex, which is the possibility of generating intersubjective experience between the painter and viewers. On the other, every viewer may have different experiences, knowledge, or memories associated with the vortex in the picture and all these could be the constituents of the unique significance gained by every individual self. The perception, meaning and

---

[250] Physicist Liu Shijia 陸士嘉 described that 'the essence of fluid is vortex, because the fluid cannot withstand rubbing, and once rubbing, it will rub out vortex', quoted by Peiqing Liu, *A General Theory of Fluid Mechanics* (Beijing: Science Press, 2021), 110.

significance of the picture may, thus, be constantly enriched and developed by every individual's new experience, and may, therefore, never be final and complete.

3. Experiencing the colour arrangement

3.1 Turner's thoughts and practice on colour arrangement

As a colourist, Turner had a sophisticated colour theory. For him, colour was a means of power: 'Colour comprehends a vast portion of power in the practice of the arts ... Colour often clothes the most inauspicious formalities arising from rules, lines or localities of nature, by a diffused glow or gathering gloom.'[251] He uses colour as a form of symbolic language, such as 'white attributes of light, red power, yellow glory, blue duty, purple authority, violet subjection, green servitude, which were somewhat an application by custom'.[252] Turner's colour arrangement in his landscape paintings is usually not an imitation of nature but a subjective decision, a 'propriety of judgement' based on his perceptions gained from nature.[253]

Turner's paintings show that he built his own essential colour structure for painting mountain, rock, and water: an interaction between faint reddy-brown and blue, combined with various dove, which were probably based on his observation in nature and his geological knowledge of rocks. He used the essential colour structure in landscape works including *Boscastle, Cornwall* (1824), and *Glencoe* (1831–1834) (Figures 65 and 66), as well as *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, but always with variations.

3.2 Experiencing colours

The significance of the colour arrangement to my experience and to the effect that the painter intended to raise by colour arrangement may not be entirely the same. This section

---

[251] Gage, *Colour in Turner: Poetry and Truth,* 200.

[252] ibid.*,* 206.

[253] ibid., 201.

describes how my experience was generated from Turner's colour arrangement and how Turner's colour arrangement contributes to the whole effect of the picture.

My first sight of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* was of a digital image. At that moment, I had not studied anything about the painting and my mind was in a natural situation of *epoché and réduction*, that is, of the first-time encounter, though it is not a perfect application of *epoché* and *réduction.* Significant to my experience was the attenuated purple tone in which the whole picture was immersed. In painting practice, the common understanding of purple is as a combination of red and blue; it can be either a warm or a cool tone, usually dependent on how much red is combined with the blue. In *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, the attenuated purple is cool in a bluish tone and intertwined with many pictorial elements and produces subtle effects through out the picture. The hint of purple evokes a feeling of melancholy in me that even the powerful pattern of the vortex and rough rock face cannot escape it.

When I saw Loch Coruisk in person, I noticed that the colour of the rocks and mountains was essentially dark grey, covered with green grass. Some large boulders at the waterside had toffee colours within the overall dark grey, but not as much as on the central ridge in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. Thus, the difference between the colour of the physical landscape and the colour arrangement of the painting shows that Turner did not imitate the natural colours in Loch Coruisk, but used his own colour combination.

Turner was not the first to paint Loch Coruisk in purple. In 1826, George Fennel Robson (1788–1833 AD) painted a watercolour, *Loch Coruisk and Cuchullin Mountains, Isle of Skye* (Figure 64), depicting a beautiful night scene in the loch valley, with a warm dense purple applied to the loch water and the Cuillin mountains in the shade of night; and the intensity of the purple is very even, covering the greatest part of the picture and expressing the atmosphere of a warm, serene night. In Daniell's *Loch Coruisq near Loch Scavaig* (Figure 61), the colour of the rock is very close to the grey of the physical landscape, although the wild dark grey of the barren mountains in reality was transformed into an elegant grey by Daniell in the picture. The elegance of the grey is enhanced by a very light red, almost pink, touch on the lower mountain bodies, and this pinkish tone softens the heaviness and roughness of the natural wild dark grey of the physical Black Cuillins. Daniell's arrangement provided his viewers of his time with an elegant Loch Coruisk, a

view suitable for a pleasant trip on holiday. The three painters' ways of using purple totally differ from each other and deliver different moods and bring different feelings to my experience.

In my second view of *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* I saw the original work. The vortices and colour arrangement in the original work were little darker than in the digital image, because the brightness of the colour on the paper had faded after more than a hundred years. My second experiencing was both empirical and sensual, regarding the manner in which Turner arranged the colours and the effect he achieved.

In *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, the essential colours for the mountains and waters are yellow and blue. Shades of yellow, ranging from light cream-yellow to dark brown-yellow, occupy the greater part of the picture. The cream-yellow of the central mountain is the second brightest colour in the picture, compared to the brightest off-white sunlight in the distant view. Essentially, the shades of warm yellow contribute to the positive effect of the upward power and motion generated from the central ridge.

Blue is another essential tone in the picture, with an opposing effect to the yellow. On the surface of the water, three blue tones – dark, light, and pale blue – indicate the different temperatures and states of the loch water. The darkest blue water is in the shadow of the central ridge, still, raw, and cold, expressing a negative wild atmosphere in the picture, in contrast to the positive effect made by the powerful motion of the central ridge with the shades of warm yellow.

Purple is the spirit in the picture: it is felt as if floating in the space of the pictorial landscape, because Turner puts hints of the light purple on the vortex, the air and the sky, leaving an impression that the purple is everywhere. It is generally understood in the practice of landscape painting that elements with water are usually painted in blue, such as ocean, sky, and air. When Turner adds purple hints to the depictions of these elements, he mixes few red into the blue. Unlike Robson's dense purple, Turner's purple is looming and uneven, variously presented on the objects according to their various situations in the intense atmosphere.

As mentioned before, the relationship between the vortex and the rock face produces a confrontational state. The colour arrangement reinforces and expands that state in the

picture, through the colour confrontations between the warm-yellow rocks versus the cool-blue water, the white broken vortex versus the dark blue-grey rock face, and the off-white brightest light in the upper right distance versus the heavy, dark shadows of the mountains below the sunlight. These various confrontations strengthen the atmosphere of conflict and violence in the landscape but Turner does not lose his control on it, because he uses the purple hints to unify and balance them.

To summarise, in *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* Turner's colour arrangement is factual and can be perceived by any viewer and this study focuses on experiencing the various effects of the colour arrangement. For example, the contrasts between the cream-yellow of the rocks and the dark blue of the water, or the various blue tones on the water surface, or the uneven looming purple tone, visible in the air and sky but invisible in the darkest shadow. However, perception of colour can be subtle and personal and the feeling of melancholy I encountered on seeing *Loch Coruisk, Skye* for the first time cannot be explained by those colour arrangements. It is probably beyond the artist's compositional intention. Likewise, for Turner, each colour contains its own capacity for representing a meaning. He may bestow abstract meanings in his colour combination; however, those are difficult to experience or perceive for a viewer who does not accept his colour theory.

4. Experiencing the various situations in *Loch Coruisk, Skye*

This section describes the experiences of three situations of the pictorial elements created by Turner in the painting: the contrast between the moving and the still; the intertwined form, colour, and light; as well as the meaning of human figures in the radical landscape.

4.1 The moving and the still

The contrast between the moving and the still in *Loch Coruisk, Skye* has many expressions. The central moving element is the vortex, in relation to which the surrounding elements are all still. In the picture, the moving vortex is to the right of the central ridge, which is still. When the vortex strikes the rock face, the water beneath the vortex is still, so still that not even a ripple or slight wave can be seen, as if the water is in a different, parallel space to the vortex. Together, they form another sheer contrast – the loud confrontation between the vortex and rock versus the cold silent stillness of the water. In this contrast, the calmness of

the water seems to go beyond the violent conflict in the picture, then further to go beyond the poetic atmosphere of a romantic drama; thus, another contrast is formed between the temporary struggle and eternal time. As a result, the motionless water becomes the wildest element in the picture.

However, the most brilliant moving-and-still contrast in the picture is on the central ridge. Mountains are usually thought of as unshakeable and firm, but in the painting the mountain ridge is in motion, with internal struggle. To the left, in the middle part, the long slash brushstrokes and colour layers make the rock look like tilting up; together with the arrowhead-like peak tops, the painter produces a feeling as if this part of the ridge is trying to break free from the huge ridge body and to move towards the sky. Moreover, the reddish-yellow of the middle part separates itself from other shades of yellow on the ridge body. Whereas the distant part of the ridge, at the top left, has a blurred, zig-zag shape. Usually, in landscape paintings, the zig-zag shape in the pictorial space is a form of recession, which leads the viewer's eyes towards the background. In this picture, however, the zig-zag form becomes a relative still part of the ridge in the distance, in contrast to the moving part in the middle. Meanwhile, the foreshortening the painter used makes the front part of the central ridge looked as if swelling forwards to the viewer, producing the second contrast of moving-and-still between the forward swelling and the zig-zag recession shape.

In contrast to the above, the distant mountains in the upper right corner are still and basking in the sunlight. But when the viewer's eyes look back from the background to the fore and middle ground, a new effect can be found – the light as if were moving. The distant light is serenely but unquestionably penetrating the pictorial space, passing through the dark shade made by the mountains, as well as the hollow of the vortex, and reflecting on the surface of the motionless water, illuminating a part of it. The effect is another contrast produced: the stillness of the distant mountains versus the movement of the sunlight; this is not an obvious contrast of the moving and the still, but when perceived, the motion of the light is felt as fast and unquestionable.

The above contrasts between the moving and the still are dramatic, creating various rhythms in the picture. Situations of the moving elements are various, including slow or fast, forward or backward, and loud or silent, while situations of the still elements are represented by various qualities – solid heavy, cool silence, or dark shadow. These

contrasts successfully stir up the conflicting atmosphere in the pictorial space and reveal the essential meaning of the picture: it not only presents a poetic, dramatic atmosphere, but also projects the complicated historical background of a romantic story, as well as the wild operations of natural forces in the history of the Earth and nature.

The engraving of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* (Figure 2) loses half of the contrasts between the moving and the still in its image. Primarily because it is a black and white image and the effect of the colour arrangements cannot be reproduced. The other reason is that all the brushstrokes are substituted by the tight and neat lines drawn by the metal engraver; many subtle effects of contrast between moving-and-still produced by Turner's compositional gestures, with brush or pencil, could not be transported into the calm and neat engraved lines; although the pictorial landscape in the engraving has the same structure and content as *Loch Coruisk, Skye*. Moreover, some elements have been changed in the engraving, eg the left side of the ridge and Loch na Cuilce become clearer with exquisite detail, and the left vortex has almost disappeared. Every pictorial element in the engraving is handled neatly and logically and the pictorial effect is that the atmosphere of the landscape in the image of the engraving is far more serene than that of *Loch Coruisk, Skye.*

4.2 Lines, colour, and light

For Turner, 'light is a body in painting of the first magnitude and Reflection' and 'white [is] the substitute of light', while the geometric qualities of lines have a generic power in painting.[254] For example, the arrangement of lines can fabricate an effect of sublimity by using 'unshackled obliquity and waved lines', which 'obtains the associated feelings of force continuity' and 'rushes like the eruptive expanding ignited spark from earth towards heaven, struggling as the ascending rocket with the elements'.[255] Turner fabricates his painting by lines, colour, and light, thus, to experience his picture the approach is the lines, colour, and light.

In the picture, the light and shade, the intensity of the colours and their gradation are intertwined together with the employing of the lines. On the rock face at the lower part of

---

[254] Gage, *Colour in Turner: Poetry and Truth*, 198.

[255] ibid., 203.

the central ridge, crossed short lines made by pencil can be seen together with small toffee-yellow patches of shade made by brush. The lines intersect the light and shade, against the base of yellow with gradations, representing the changing situation of the light and shade. At the same time, the creamy yellow patches on the rock tops represent the highlight of the rock surface and the toffee-brown-yellow patches on the rock body represent the rock surface in shadows; together with the crossed short pencil lines, visually, the layered and eroded rock surfaces are constituted.

Experiencing the light in the picture shows that the light in the pictorial landscape has two sources, one from the north-east of the picture, the other is from the south-west. The first depicts the natural light in the Loch Coruisk valley, so perhaps the latter is an artificial light, or perhaps it is also natural light but seen as if the painter has his back to it, while he appears to face the first source. If so, again, the painter artificially puts two opposite situations of his seeing the landscape into one pictorial moment.

The second light source is produced for the central ridge, the focus of the conflict that, thus, needs to be illuminated and brought forward, and to be seen first by the viewer. The light reinforces the contrasts between the ridge and the water in terms of their colour and shape. Because of the light, the yellow is lightened, and thus the blue is darkened; the roughness of the rock is highlighted and thus the stillness of the water is intensified; the aggressive posture of the ridge is lightened and the compressed passive situation of the water is strengthened.

In summary, Turner's manner of employing lines, light, and colour can be perceived by experiencing their relationships. Especially, Turner's use of light is an important means of enhancing and uniting the various pictorial elements in the picture; and the making of the innate struggle of the mountains and waters in the picture is based on Turner's use of lines, light, and colour. Thus, to some extent, the lines, light, and colour are the medium through which viewers can experience the artist's composition process and perceive his expression through the formation of the picture.

4.3 Human figures in the landscape

The roles of the human figures in the painting are – the viewer, perceiver, and reflector. Because of them, the wild mountains and waters are seen; no matter how wild, remote, and

vast the land, the viewers' seeing makes it 'the landscape' in human eyes. Conversely, the wild pictorial landscape is the venue and space that constitutes the meaning of the figures' seeing and being in the picture.

Experiencing the situations of the figures reveals a series contrasts designed by Turner. First, the two figures in the centre bottom are sitting on a hill top in front of the central ridge across the water. The figure on the left is a woman in a white jacket and black skirt, seen from behind. Her posture shows she is looking at the loch and mountains. Her companion is a man in a black jacket, seen from the right. He is not looking at the landscape but reading a book or sketching in a notebook. They are relatively still elements in the picture, the landscape in front of them seemed dramatic and dynamic in contrast to their situations of seeing, reading or sketching.

On the other hand, since the figures are seeing, appreciating, and reading or sketching, there are movements in their minds; thus, they may also be considered the moving element. Then the landscape becomes the still element, with a feeling of the unchangeable past, as if the history of nature that is looking back to the human figures. The same feelings occurred to me when I finished reading Scott's poem and reflected on the stories in Scottish history. In this context, the figures bring out a feeling of intellect, the human mind is intending to perceive, understand, and reflect on both the wild natural landscape and human history. Thus, the figures and the wild mountains and water produce other contrasts in the picture, the contrast between humans and nature, between the movements in human mind and the still situations of the natural objects.

Last, experiencing the situations of the two figure, the woman figure's posture shows she is looking the landscape, including the rising-up central ridge and the vortex, the loch and the sunlight, as well as the distant mountains, while the man figure is reflecting on the dramatic landscape or his experience of the landscape. They are seen from behind and above, the bird's-eye view, that is the viewpoint of the painter when he was creating the painting. Taking that viewpoint, a viewer may be inspired to expand the range of the pictorial space, which is framed in the picture, to a vaster space and a higher dimension, from the bird's-eye view, for an imaginarily seeing. Then, what the figures are looking and reflecting becomes a small temporal part of the everlasting time and space.

In summary, experiencing the situations of the figures reveal that Turner's work is not merely a picture of the Loch Coruisk landscape, but also a picture containing meanings that the artist may intend to communicate with its viewers. These are the pictorial conditions for a viewer's visual experience and significance of the picture to a viewer therefore depends partly on the viewers' intention towards the pictorial conditions, and partly on the viewers' individual experience in the past and present, as well as the potential imagination in the viewers' mind. And the key to gain significance to the picture is: being aware of the experience of the individual self and always going back to the painting, pictorial elements, and corresponding objects – the things themselves.

Conclusion

The case study applied the phenomenological method to studying Turner's *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, in order to capture the artist's compositional intention and reveal the meaning of the picture. By applying the method, the study traced and examined the marks of the artist's compositional acts, restored the key compositional acts of the artist. In doing so, the study grasped the artist's multiple compositional intentions and revealed the meaning of the picture, as well as the potential significance of the picture to the viewer's experience of seeing. The conclusion is, therefore, that the application of the phenomenological method is effective in this case study.

During the process of studying, the case study first demonstrated that Turner's general and literal intentions were to fulfil the commission of illustrating Scott's poem, and to depict the wilderness of the landscape of Loch Coruisk. Then the study was presented the exploration in two stages: the first is about seeing the painting as the painter, including gaining first-hand experiences of the corresponding physical landscape, the painting, and other related objects, describing the experience, and making various comparisons. The second stage was about seeing the painting as an individual self, constituted by the statement of me, an individual viewer' first-hand experiences of the painting and its pictorial elements. The content of the second stage may or may not be in accordance with the artist's compositional intention but brought forth the significance of the painting to an individual viewer.

In the first stage, the study first experienced the physical landscape of Loch Coruisk, then experienced the painting *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* and Turner's onsite draft sketches, as well as Scott's *The Lord of the Isles*. After that, the study compared the first-hand experiences with various references, including published geological and geographical interpretations of the physical landscape of Loch Coruisk, other paintings and drawings related to *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, Turner's writings, previous studies on Turner and *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, as well as some mountain hikers' record shots and published historical photographs of Loch Coruisk.

In the comparisons, the first set of differences was found between the first-hand experiences of the physical Loch Coruisk, the pictorial landscape in *Loch Courisk, Skye,* and the geological and geographical interpretations of Loch Coruisk valley; and the study showed that the pictorial landscape was inventively composed by Turner, presenting the sceneries not only in Loch Coruisk valley, but also in the whole isle of Skye. Thus, a clue of Turner's compositional intention was revealed: rather than portraying the Loch Coruisk valley, Turner intended to inventively compose a wild pictorial landscape represented the Isle of Skye.

The second set of differences was found between the first-hand experiences of the physical Loch Coruisk valley, with Turner's onsite sketches and the painting *Loch Courisk, Skye.* The differences were obvious. Turner stated that Loch Coruisk was the wildest natural landscape after his studies in the valley, while his sketches showed that he altered and developed what he saw to make the landscape even wilder. Differences between the sketches and the painting revealed that Turner intended to compose an ideal, wildest landscape of Loch Coruisk and the ultimate wild vision in his imagination was gradually formed during the process of sketching and composing.

Last, the contrasts found in the comparison between the text of Scott's *The Lord of the Isles* and the painting *Loch Courisk, Skye* showed that Turner inventively fulfilled the commission by radically representing the essential meaning of the poem – the power of conflicts or confrontations in human activities (the inner activities of the protagonists' minds and the external human activities in history), and also by visualising the dramatic mood of the romantic story in the painting. In summary, the first stage of the study demonstrated that Turner's compositional intention was to represent the essential meaning

of Scott's poem and meanwhile to form his imagined ideal wild mountains and waters in the painting.

The second stage of the study was to describe the first-hand experiences of the picture as an individual viewer who encountered the painting, and the content included experiencing how the artist used multiple perspectives and how he produced various contrasts by employing lines, colour, and light and shades in the painting, in order to raise a violent conflicting atmosphere in the landscape. In doing so, together with the findings gained in the first stage, the study perceived that the meanings expressed by the artist through the picture went beyond illustrating the poem and pursuing the wildest wilderness of the landscape. And the multiple meanings of the picture expressed by the artist were: to represent the powerful appearance of the conflicts or confrontations among the wild natural forces, among the human activities in history, as well as among the protagonists in the romantic narratives. In addition, the study also perceived that the states of the figures' seeing, appreciating, and reflecting on the landscape evoked an awareness of 'watching' – watching the romantic story in the poem in the historical context, watching the conflicts in history, and watching the position and impact of the individual figures in the landscape as well as the history. Thus, the painting showed its capacity to evoke intersubjective experiences, to evoke the viewers' imaginings, and to bring out the significance to its viewers' experience of seeing.

Chapter Four: Shitao's *Mount Lu*

Introduction

Shitao's *Mount Lu* (Figure 67) is a radical landscape painting. It is unknown whether the painting was a commissioned work or not. To capture the artist's compositional intention in *Mount Lu* through applying the phenomenological method, the case study examines three objects or groups of objects to gain first-hand experiences of them. The three groups of objects include the picture of the painting and the pictorial elements in it, the physical landscape of Mount Lu, Shitao's inscription on the painting and Shitao's transcription of Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad* on the painting.[256] In this case study, first-hand experiences of the picture of *Mount Lu* and the physical Mount Lu are both necessary and important. Moreover, the study reviews Shitao's character and personal life, which are important factors related to his compositional intention in the painting. Then the study describes and analyses the first-hand experiences through three groups of comparisons, in order to find differences and contrasts, which contain the traces of the key compositional acts of the artist. The first group of comparisons compares the first-hand experience of the picture of *Mount Lu,* with Shitao's postscript on *Mount Lu* and Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad* transcribed by Shitao on the painting. The second compares the first-hand experience of the physical landscape of Mount Lu with the pictorial Mount Lu, the geological and geographical interpretations of Mont Lu areas, and the historical studies and records of the crucial event in Shitao's personal life. The third comparison is between the first-hand experiences of the picture and its pictorial elements.

Results of the comparisons help the study to retrieve and comprehend Shitao's key compositional acts and the study demonstrates that Shitao's literal intention was to paint a landscape with a certain pictorial effect; while his compositional intention was two-fold: to paint a landscape with a certain pictorial effect in Shitao's own manner on one hand and to compose a landscape that presents the solitude and calmness of humane figure's

---

[256] The picture of *Mount Lu* experienced in this case study is a digital picture, not the original painting. When I was doing the research on Shitao, I could not visit the Sen-Oku Hakukokan Museum to see the original painting in person, due to restrictions in the pandemic in 2020. So the research is based on a high quality digital photograph of the painting provided by Sen-Oku Hakukokan Museum.

contemplation in a wild dramatic landscape on the other. And the artist correspondingly made direct and indirect meaning-expressions through the painting. Moreover, by experiencing the picture of the painting, the study also indicates that the painting has the pictorial capacity to evoke empathy and imaginings through the acts of experiential seeing; and in doing so, the significance of the picture to an individual viewer can be ascertained.

The chapter presents the case study in six divisions. The introduction discusses the background of the artist, the artwork, previous studies, and the historical context of the composition. Parts One to Three respectively examine Shitao's literal intention, compare the physical Mount Lu with the pictorial Mount Lu, scrutinise the pictorial elements of the painting and the formation of the picture, and finally reveal the formation of the picture, the artist's key compositional acts, as well as his compositional intention. Part Four presents the result of experiencing the *Mount Lu* as the individual self, in order to reveal the significance of the painting. Content of this part is based on the statement of me, the individual viewer's first-hand experience, which may or may not be Shitao's intention, and may or may not differ to other viewers' experience; thus it is presented as the fifth division. The sixth division presents the conclusion of the case study.

1. Shitao

Shitao 石濤 was a painter of the early Qing dynasty. 'Shitao' was his courtesy name; his given name was Zhu Ruoji 朱若極.[257] He was a talented painter, an expert in painting landscape, who left behind hundreds of paintings, many of which were masterpieces, for example, the long horizontal scroll *Mount Huang* (Figure 69), the hanging scroll *Clouds and Mountains* (Figure 70), the albums *Charming Sounds in Nature* (Figure 71) and *Returning Home* (Figure 72), and the only remaining figure painting *Sixteen Arhats* (Figure 73). Shitao also left a philosophical writing – *Huayu Lu* – in which he presented and explained his *Yihua* theory on landscape painting.

English scholarship has introduced Shitao as a kaleidoscopic painter with a creative spirit, an individualist. His *Huayu Lu* was considered not only a work of painting theory but also

---

[257] Fu Baoshi 傅抱石, ed. Wang Yunwu 王雲五, 明末石濤上人朱若極年譜 (*The Chronicle of the Eminent Monk Shitao, Zhu Ruoji, of the Last Years of Ming*) (Taibei: Taiwan Shang-wu Yin-shu-guan, 1978), 10.

one of classical Chinese aesthetics.[258] For this study, Shitao is an old master and a pioneer of early modern landscape painting, because he was not only a master of traditional skills, but also an innovator who established a new theory and a new manner of painting. He visited mountains and waters in person and painted them in his own creative way, not rigidly following the rules and formulations of the old masters, as many painters of his time did. His *Yihua* theory introduced new ideas on how to grasp the essential features of natural mountains and waters and how to use them to make artistic expression in a landscape. *Yihua* theory opened a new sphere for Chinese literati painting and Shitao's manner inspired many painters, including Zheng Banqiao 鄭板橋 (1693–1765 AD) and the Eight Eccentric Painters from Yangzhou in the Qing dynasty, Huang Binhong 黃賓虹 (1865–1955 AD) and Fu Baoshi 傅抱石 (1904–1965 AD) in the modern period, and Wu Guanzhong 吳冠中 (1919–2010 AD) in the contemporary period.

Shitao's life and personality are important in any study of his art, because the two deeply influenced his artistic composition and expression. Shitao was born into a princely branch of the imperial family of the Ming dynasty (1368–1644 AD). In 1644, when he was a child, the army of Manchu Qing invaded Ming country and established the Qing dynasty. Shitao's father died resisting the invasion and Shitao was saved by a servant and brought up as a Buddhist monk to avoid persecution from the Qing.[259] As a wandering monk/ painter, he lived a turbulent life. He attempted to pursue a position in the Qing court, but after three years of struggling, regretted it and gave up. Later, he converted to Daoism.[260] The conversion was painful but also a turning point. After that, Shitao's identity was settled and his painting career culminated in new achievements. His family origins brought him hardships in life; however, he made himself into a distinctive painter and a creative theorist. It was not only Shitao's painting, but also his upright character, strong personality and energetic manner of painting that gained him a large group of admirers, and his works

---

[258] Victoria Contag, *Chinese Masters of the 17th Century* (London: Lund Humphries, 1969), 17.

[259] Fu, 明末石濤上人朱若極年譜 (*The Chronicle of the Eminent Monk Shitao, Zhu Ruoji, of the Last Years of Ming)*, 10.

[260] Xu, Fuguan 徐複觀, 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), (Beijing: Jiuzhou Chubanshe, 2013), 512–527.

'Dao' is the Chinese *pinyin* to 道, which in English is also translated as *'Tao',* according to the pronunciation of 道 in Chinese.

were always popular in the market. Thus, Shitao's life and personality present an approach to understanding his art.

Note that Shitao had many 'style names'. For classical Chinese painting, the signature and seal-marks with the name of the painter were indispensable pictorial elements. For painters, choosing a style name for the signature was a component of their composition. The Chinese term for such names is *yahao* (雅號) or *biehao* (別號), meaning 'an elegant name or a special name given by oneself', in contrast to 'name (*ming* 名)' and 'courtesy name (*biaozi* 表字)', which are given by one's father. Usually, a style name is used for self-description and self-expression; therefore its meaning reflects a person's situation, personality, or will. It is a courtesy to call someone by their style name in social situations. A 'style name' in this study differs from a pseudonym, which suggests an attempt to hide the original identity; *yahao* is the user's statement of 'who and how am I' and is thus translated as 'style name' in this study.

Shitao had many style names in his turbulent life from his multiple identities: he was a princely descendant, a monk, a painter, a gifted painter looking for opportunity in the court of Qing, a Daoist, and more importantly, a *yimin* (遺民) of Ming in the Qing dynasty.[261] Corresponding to these various identities and life situations, Shitao gave himself several style names. As a monk, his Dharma title was Yuanji 原濟 or 元濟.[262] To describe his life situation as a monk, Shitao half humorously, half-seriously called himself 'Kugua monk 苦瓜和尚' (lit. 'the monk named himself "bitter gourd"'). After he converted to Daoism, he gave himself a Daoist name Dadi Zi 大滌子(lit. 'the Daoist who endeavours to clean [his sins]').

Some of Shitao's style names relate to his birthplace Qingxiang 清湘, in Guangxi province in southern China, such as Qingxiang-Chenren-Ji 清湘-陳人-濟 and Qingxiang-Yiren-Ji 清湘-遺人-濟. The word *chenren* 陳人 in the former means 'someone who is old', and *yiren* 遺人 in the latter means 'someone who is survived'. Ji 濟 is the key character of his

---

261 For the meaning of *yimin*, see Pages161-64.

262 Fu, 明末石濤上人朱若極年譜 (*The Chronicle of the Eminent Monk Shitao, Zhu Ruoji, of the Last Years of Ming*), 10.

Dharma name. Thus Qingxiang-Chenren-Ji means 'the old monk from Qingxiang', and Qingxiang-Yiren-Ji means 'the survived monk from Qingxiang'. In another example, Qingxiang-Dadi Zi 清湘-大滌子, *Di* 滌 is a verb in Chinese and means 'to clean by water'.[263] Thus, Qingxiang-Dadi Zi means 'the Daoist who came from Qingxiang endeavours to clean [his sins].' Qingxiang-Dadi Zi would be used only after Shitao converted to Daoism, so a signature of Dadi Zi would be an indicator of that the painting was made in Shitao's later years.

2. *Mount Lu*

2.1 The content

Mount Lu depicts a vast mountainscape with clouds and a waterfall, in front of which two visitors are contemplating (Figure 67). Although the physical Mount Lu is recognisable in the appearance of the waterfall and the shapes of the peaks in the background, the painting is not a realistic work. A long inscription appears on the upper right of the painting. The first part is a transcription of *Mount Lu Ballad* by Li Bai 李白 (701–762 AD), a well-known poet of the Tang dynasty (618–907 AD). The second part is a postscript by which Shitao registered that the painting was composed based on his memory of travelling. In the postscript, Shitao also states that he intends to produce a certain pictorial effect comparable to the old master Guo Xi 郭熙 (1000–1087 AD), but in Shitao's manner, not that of Guo Xi. Shitao signed the painting with his style name Qingxiang-Chenren-Ji 清湘陳人濟 at the end of the inscription and used two name-seals below his signature.[264] He also used a style-seal at the end of the first line of the inscription.[265]

---

[263] Xu, 說文解字 (*Explanations of Characters and Words*), 236.

[264] Name-seal is a seal with characters of the name of its owner and the seal-mark of it on a painting is an important part of the painter's signature.

[265] Style-seal is a seal with the characters of a phrase, or one line of poetic verses, a literal description, or a lyric expression made or quoted by the owner for symbolising the owner's personality or situation or thought, etc. The mark of a style-seal on a painting is also a part of the painter's signature.

2.2 Commission, date, and collection

It is not known whether *Mount Lu* was a commissioned work. According to the inscription, the theme and content of the painting were determined by Shitao himself. The date of the painting is probably around 1690, when Shitao was in Beijing (the capital city of Qing), or shortly after his return from Beijing to Yangzhou (a city in southern China), as James Cahill suggested.[266] If so, Shitao probably composed the painting at a difficult time, during which he was making the decision to convert to Daoism.[267]

Mount Lu is part of the Sumitomo Collection of Sen-oku Hakuko Kan Museum in Kyoto, Japan. It was acquired by Sumitomo Kanichi 住友寬一 (1896–1956 AD), who bought the painting from his teacher, Kuwana Tetsujio 桑名鐵城 (1864–1938 AD), a famous seal carver and collector of Chinese paintings. Kuwana Tetsujio wrote on the inner side of the cover of the box that contained the painting, recording how Sumitomo Kanichi acquired it: 'I bought this work when I was travelling in Qing. I have treasured and appreciated it for a long time. When Sir Sumitomo, the owner of Wuwei Cottage, saw it, he immediately asked me to let him acquire this treasure. I finally and reluctantly sold it to him ... in August 1927.'[268] Sumitomo Kanichi was a knowledgable collector of Chinese paintings of the Ming and Qing periods, to the benefit of the collection of Shitao's work in Japan.

2.3 The painting materials

2.3.1 Sized silk

Mount Lu was painted on sized silk (*shujuan* 熟絹). Sized silk is a material used for Chinese ink paintings. This material has a number of features. First, the colour of sized silk is light beige with a silky glow. This naturally gives the painting an elegant background colour with a slightly looming effect. Second, sized silk is made of raw silk coated with

---

[266] James Cahill, *The Compelling Image* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1979), 182.

[268] Sanekata Yoko, "无为庵，孤高独行收藏痴 (Wu Wei Hut, the Solitary Collector)", in 中国书画在日本 *(Chinese Paintings in Japanese Collections)* (Shanghai: Shanghai Shuhua Chubanshe, 2017), 124–37. The original Chinese: '...余曾游清国得之, 观赏藏之久矣。无为庵主人住友君一见强求割爱不已, 遂割让。皆丁卯八月...'

alum and glue, which makes the silk half water absorbent – neither fully absorbent like plain *xuan* paper (*shengxuan* 生宣), nor almost non-absorbent like sized *xuan* paper (*shuxuan* 熟宣). This feature provides a good basis for painting multiple water-ink effects on it. Sized silk is also soft and delicately dense; it can smoothly absorb and stably deposit the ink and liquid colour. This means that no stroke loses its nuance on the painting surface. Last, sized silk is a durable material; the rendered colour can be washed or overlapped multiply to produce the effect of layers, heavy, dense, and so on. To summarise, sized silk can help a painter to achieve an exquisite effect when drawing lines and rendering colours, but also it is hard to entirely erase a failed stroke or colouring on the sensitive material. Hence, Shitao's choice of sized silk for the large scale *Mount Lu* indicated that he intended to compose a delicate landscape with wild complexity and he was confident in his ability and technique.

2.3.2 *Bi* and *mo*

Bi (筆), the Chinese brush, is the tool for both painting and calligraphy. The brush head is made of soft animal hair, in a shape of a fat end tapering into a pointed top. The shape and the quality of the hair provide the brush with good flexibility, so it can produce enormous kinds of traces with ink, from a dot, a very fine line, to a thick, wild stroke, and heavy patch. And the painter can make vital brushstrokes or subtle rendered colours as needed. Studying a painter's brushstroke, or the manner of operating brush and ink, is one important part of experts' work in Chinese tradition and also an aesthetic experience for the connoisseurs. For the case study, the brushstroke displays the artist's painting techniques and is also one part of the artist's pictorial expression.

Mo (墨) is the essential material of Chinese painting, because Chinese painting is 'ink painting (*shui mo hua* 水墨畫)' and most of classical Chinese paintings are black and white, or black and withe with light colouring. Thus the black colour of *mo* is the basic tone of those paintings. *Mo* is not ink, but a solid material made from charcoal and glue. The English word 'ink' corresponds to the Chinese words *moshui* (墨水) and *mozhi* (墨汁), which mean the black liquid for painting or writing, with pen, brush, and other tools; and the blackness of the liquid is stable and even. However, the 'ink' in Chinese 'ink painting' especially refers to the ink that is made of *mo* and water and only to be used with *bi*, the

brush. The darkness of this 'ink' is dynamic and can produce various effects during the process of painting. Thus, painters or critics usually use 'the colour of *mo'*, not 'the colour of ink', to remark and describe effects of various dark hues of *mo* in a painting, no matter with or without other colours. Generally, the ink of *mo* can make five degrees of the dark hue, however skilful painters are able to capture and employ more subtle gradients of the dark hue of *mo* to make more exquisite shades in paintings, like in *Mount Lu*.[269]

To summarise, *Mount Lu* is a highly finished work, no failed brushstroke and rendering of *mo* can be found. And Shitao's choice of painting materials indicates one clue to the painter's compositional intention – to give himself a technical challenge and to pursue an outstanding brush-ink effect through the painting.

3. Previous Studies

3.1 Shitao and his art

Previous Chinese studies of Shitao and his art generally covered four issues: Shitao's chronicle (*nianpu*, 年譜) and biography (*zhuanji* 傳記), painting technique, *yihua* theory, and the identification of works attributed to Shitao. The body of literature is substantial, including studies in the disciplines of art history, fine arts, and philosophy. For this case study, the works of Fu Baoshi 傅抱石, Xu Fuguan 徐復觀, and Zhu Liangzhi 朱良志 are essential on three points: Shitao's identity and character, his religious conversion and its impact on his art, and the understanding of *yihua* theory, as elaborated below.

Fu Baoshi is the founder of contemporary studies on Shitao and his art. Fu is an art historian and painter, who has compiled the first biography of Shitao, including details related to the historical context of Shitao's time and with clearly referencing. Fu suggested that Shitao was born in 1630 and died in 1707 and clarified that Shitao's birth place was Qingxiang county. He chronicled Shitao's imperial descendant and identified important events in his life, such as his visit to Mount Lu in 1650, his audience with Kang Xi 康熙

---

[269] Zhang Yanyuan 張彥遠: '墨分五色', from "论顾陆张吴用笔 (Observations on Gu, Lu, Zhang, Wu's using of brush)," in 历代名画记 (*The great paintings through dynasties*) (c. 847-859 AD), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol 2, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/628199

(1654–1772 AD) the Qing emperor in 1689, and his probable stay in Beijing for three years from 1690.[270] Fu saw Shaitao as a straightforward, sincere person, as well as an energetic gifted painter. He studied and emphasised Shitao's character because he considered it significant to Shitao's art.

Fu's studies are comprehensive: he identified the historical facts and issues based on corroborative evidence from multiple sources, including various chronicles of Shitao and biographies of related people, historical texts recording Shitao's life and activities, historical archives in Chinese and Japanese institutions, and Shitao's own works. Fu lived at the time of the Second Sino-Japanese War and his access to original sources was limited; therefore, some issues in his studies remained unclear or with mistakes.

Xu Fuguan was an expert on Shitao, especially on his religious conversion, *yihua* theory, and the identification of Shitao's birth and death years. Xu was the first researcher to reveal Shitao's religious conversion from Buddhism to Daoism in his later years and elaborated the pedigree tree of Shitao's monk identity.[271] He also investigated the authenticity of the famous letter Shitao wrote to Bada Shanren 八大山人 (1626–1705 AD), a respected *yimin* painter and close friend of Shitao.[272] Xu's studies are critically based on those of Fu Baoshi. He modified and developed Fu's studies according to the wider materials he accessed.

Xu's discovery of Shitao's religious conversion was prompted by the famous letter Shitao wrote to Bada, in which he asked Bada to paint a landscape for him. Xu noticed that Shitao described himself as 'a man who has hair and wears a hat', an odd description since, as a monk, Shitao should have no hair.[273] Shitao also asked Bada to inscribe on the painting that the work was for Dadi Zi, his new name, at Dadi Cottage, his new home. Xu identified that the odd content was Shitao's subtle notification of his religious conversion and, in this subtle way, Shitao told his friend that he decided to return to be the *yimin* Shitao. Before

---

[270] Fu, 明末石濤上人朱若極年譜 (*The Chronicle of the Eminent Monk Shitao, Zhu Ruoji, of the Last Years of Ming*), 2–4, 10, 14, 35, 37.

[271] Xu, 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), 520–7.

[272] ibid., 512–4, 520–4.

[273] The original Chinese: '有冠有發之人', see Xu, 徐複觀全集 (Complete Works of Xu Fuguan), 513.

going further in Xu's investigation, it is necessary to clarify the meaning of *yimin*, to understand the reason for Shitao's religious conversion and its relation to *Mount Lu*.

In Chinese ancient history, *yimin* was the word used to describe a certain group of people, including those who lived in a subjugated nation, an invaded nation, or in a time after a drastic upheaval.[274] Boyi 伯夷 and Shuqi 叔齊 were probably the first *yimin* recorded in history. They were princes of one of the kings of Shang (商, c. 1600 – 1046 BC), which was subjugated by the king of Zhou (周, c. 1100–771 BC). They escaped to remote mountains to avoid serving Zhou's regime and starved to death. They asserted their thinking in the widely disseminated verses, 'Replacing violence with violence, they are wrong, even though they do not know it.'[275] Boyi and Shuqi were moral role models in ancient China. Since then, the word *yimin* became a laudatory epithet; true *yimin* may not use it of themselves. After Boyi and Shuqi, the definition of *yimin* was gradually expanded to refer to people who lived in a time after drastic upheaval, such as the change of a regime; they withdrew themselves from political and official circles; some even left public social life. Ostensibly, they were loyal to the lost dynasty or the values of the old days; but essentially, they refused to serve the new regime and sought to retain their dignity, or pursue integrity, in the unfortunate time after the upheaval.

The essence of *yimin* was loyalty, but a *yimin*'s loyalty was complicated. First, the loyalty was to the lost dynasty and the old king. In ancient Chinese culture, loyalty was the mark

---

[274] See examples:

By Zuo Qiuming 左丘明, '司馬致邑，立宗焉，以誘其遺民，而盡俘以歸', in "哀公四年 (The Fourth Year of Ai Gong)", 春秋左传 (*The Springs and Autumns Noted by Zuo*) (c. 468–300 BC, 中國哲學電子書計畫 [The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks]), no.2, accessed 16 November 2021 https:// ctext.org/ai-gong-si-nian;

By Lu You 陸游, '遺民淪左衽，何由雪煩冤?', from "感興 (Affective Thoughts)", "劍南詩稿 (Poems Written at Jiannan)", in 陸游集 (*Collected Works of Lu You*) (Beijing: Zhong Hua Shuju, 1976), Vol. 9, no. 253;

By Du Du 杜篤's '其二老[伯夷，叔齊]乃答余曰: 吾殷之遺民也', from "首陽山賦 (Mount Shouyang)", in 藝文類聚(*The Collection of Artistic Writings*), ed. by Ouyang Xun 欧阳询 (624 AD; reprint, 欽定四庫全書 [The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor], Qing dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 7, no. 5, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/=541138

[275] The original Chinese: '以暴易暴兮, 不知其非矣', from Sima Qian 司馬遷, "伯夷叔齊列傳 (Biographies of Boyi and Shuqi)" in 史記 (*The History*) (109–91 BC, reprint; 武英殿二十四史 [Twenty- four history books published by WuYing Dian, Qing dynasty]), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/shiji/bo-yi-lie-zhuan

of a noble character. Those who were loyal would gain a good reputation in history, but for those who were loyal to a bad king, their loyalty would be called 'blind loyalty (*yuzhong* 愚忠)'. Second and essentially, a *yimin*'s loyalty to the old dynasty denoted that they refused to accept the new regime. In ancient times, a new dynasty was usually established by a violent conquest, which meant a catastrophe of massive killing and a destroyed society. For example, the Yuan (元 1271–1638 AD) and Qing were established by the Mongol Borjigin clan and the Manchu Asian Gioro clan. They conquered the people of Song and Ming (most of them are Han 漢 people) and their regimes were cruel. There was a system of ethnic hierarchy in Yuan and the Han people in southern China were in the lowest social category. In the Qing dynasty, there was severe persecution of the Han writers and Han texts. Scholar Zhao Yuan 趙園 indicated that what the *yimin* of Ming essentially resisted was the brutal violences of military invasion and cultural invasion during the Ming-Qing transition.[276] Historical facts show that repudiating the violent conquest and brutal regime, defending the being invaded tradition, values, life-styles, and personal dignity were what the *yimin* people essentially were loyal to. Thus, to some extent, *yimin* represented the character of the unconquerable and the independent spirit. In reality, *yimin* were a disadvantaged group of people in the society but somehow they tried to resist the brutal regime, even though it was a tragic and weak resistance.

Looking at the people who were known as *yimin* in history, one can trace back to the time of the Wei dynasty (魏, 220–266 AD), Seven Sages of the Bamboo Grove were *yinmin* of the subjugated Wei in the newly established Jin (晉, 266–420 AD). Part of the *yimin* were literati, a group of distinguished people, who appeared repeatedly through the long history of ancient China, showing that the values of *yimin* were voluntarily inherited through literati generations. The *yimin* literati lived a turbulent life, but many were creative writers, thinkers, or artists, and they were highly respected in history. Among them, the *yimin* painters included Jing Hao 荆浩 (c. 850–911 AD), the *yimin* of Later Liang dynasty (後梁,

---

[276] Zhao Yuan 趙園, "趙園: 明清之際的遺民與貳臣 (Zhao Yuan: the *Yimin* and Surrendered Ministers During the Ming-Qing Transition)", ed. Zhang Mingyang 張明揚, *Oriental Morning Post. Shanghai Book Review,* 8, July, 2012.
See also:
Zhao Yuan 趙園's 明清之際士大夫研究 (*A Study of the Literati-Officials During the Ming-Qing Transition*) (Beijing: Peking University Press, 1999) and 易堂尋蹤: 關於明清之際一個士人群體的敍述 (*The Traces of Yi Hall: The Narrative of A Group of Literati During the Ming-Qing Transition*) (Nanchang: Jiangxi Education Press, 2001).

907–923 AD) in the newly established Later Tang (後唐, 923–937 AD), Qian Xuan 錢選 (1239–1299 AD), Zheng Sixiao 鄭思肖 (1241–1318 AD), Ni Zan 倪瓚(1301–1374 AD), the *yimin* of Song in newly established Yuan, and the Four Monks, the *yimin* of Ming in newly established Qing (Shitao was one of the Four Monks). The contemporary Chinese painter Muxin 木心 (1927–2011 AD), who survived the Chinese Cultural Revolution, asserted that the spirit of *yimin* was 'the root of his blood'.[277]

It is not known when the English translation of *yimin*, 'leftover subjects', first appeared. In this phrase, 'leftover' as an adjective means 'remaining' or 'surplus', which can represent the general meaning of *yi* 遺 in modern Chinese.[278] In ancient Chinese, however, *yi* meant 'escape', which referred to an action taken in a difficult situation, and an action taken by choice or forced by a circumstance.[279] Likewise, 'subject' means 'a member of a country or state rather than its ruler', which basically represents the meaning of *min* 民 in modern Chinese – 'people'.[280] In ancient Chinese, *min* was explained by a simile *zhongmeng* (眾萌), meaning 'the multitudes of grass sprout', that implied a group of people who were humble and venerable, but with natural immanent strength.[281] When 'leftover' was used to describe 'subject', the meaning could be 'the leftover subjects of a lost dynasty or regime'. While in ancient Chinese when *yi* and *min* were put together, literally it meant 'humble and venerable people who choose to escape or withdraw'. Thus, 'leftover subject' does not completely convey the literal meaning of *yimin* in ancient Chinese.

Moreover, in history, *yimin* might be categorised as leftover subjects, but not all leftover subjects were qualified to be called *yimin*. Being *yimin* was a subjective choice, choosing to refuse serving a brutal new regime, choosing to resist brutal violences of military and cultural invasion; in doing so, *yimin* voluntarily withdrew themselves from political and official circles, to live a life of solitude and, probably, poverty. It was not an easy choice

---

[277] "Landscape of Memory: The Art of Mu Xin," Asia Society, accessed 16 November 2021, https:// asiasociety.org/landscape-memory-art-mu-xin

[278] *Compact Oxford English Dictionary.*

[279] Xu, 說文解字 (*Explanations of Characters and Words*), 41.

[280] *Compact Oxford English Dictionary.*

[281] Xu, 說文解字 (*Explanations of Characters and Words*), 265.

but nevertheless a choice these people made for themselves. Thus, on one hand, *yimin* were a group of people who voluntarily resisted and escaped from the control of the ruler and the mainstream society; on the other hand, they were strengthened by their choice in the uneasy *yimin* life. For the leftover subjects who were not *yimin,* there was another word in Chinese, *yilao yishao* (遺老遺少), meaning the old and young leftover subjects.

Returning to Xu Fuguan's investigation, he elaborated how Shitao strayed from the *yimin* identity and finally returned to it through his religious conversion. According to Xu, the first reason for Shitao's conversion was rooted in the pedigree of his monk identity.[282] Shitao's monastic grandfather Muchen Dao Min 木陳-道-忞 and monastic father Shanguo Yue 善果月 probably encouraged and supported Shitao to serve the Qing emperor.

Historical records show that Muchen Dao Min was a famous monk in southern China. In his earlier life, he had a good reputation which was gained by his relations with *yimin*. Later, Muchen Dao Min and Shanguo Yue abandoned their attitudes to the *yimin* and accepted the imperial call to serve the Qing regime. They became powerful political monks and meanwhile betrayed and bullied *yimin* monks in southern China. Their reputation became notoriety. Xu believed this caused Shitao's self-questioning of his pursuit of a career in Beijing. No historical records named Muchen Dao Min and Shanguo Yue as *yimin*; they were not even considered leftover subjects, although in their earlier lives people might have thought they were. This offers further evidence that *yimin* was not a passive fate, but a positive choice.

According to Xu, the second reason for Shitao's conversion was Bada Shanren. In 1650, Shitao travelled to Mount Lu and stayed at the Qixian Temple (栖賢寺) for a year.[283] At that time, Bada stayed at a Buddhist temple as a monk in Mount Fengxin, close to Mount Lu. Xu speculated that the two probably had a chance to meet and establish a friendship. During the time that Muchen Dao Min was bullying *yimin* monks in southern China, Bada withdrew from his monkhood to respond. Around that time, Shitao was in Beijing. Bada wrote many letters to Shitao and probably advised him not to follow Muchen Dao Min and Shanguo Yue. Xu speculated that Shitao did not reply, because he had not decided whether

---

[282] Xu, 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), 520–4.

[283] ibid., 526.

or not to abandon his career in Beijing. Or, as Xu hinted, Shitao's relationships with Muchen Dao Min, Shanguo Yue, and the community of monks were much more complicated than that of Bada. Thus, Shitao could not simply give up his monkhood as directly as Bada. Yet, when Shitao finally decided and was able to leave Beijing and return to be a *yimin* painter in southern China, he wrote Bada the famous letter.

In this letter, Shitao apologised for not replying to Bada earlier. Then he asked Bada to paint a landscape for his new home in Yangzhou in the south. He told Bada the painting was not for the monk Ji, but for the new person Dadi Zi, and his new home Dadi Cottage.[284] The new name Dadi Zi was an essential element of Shitao's message because of the meaning of the character *di* – 'to clean with water'. At the end of the letter, Shitao wrote that he wanted 'to clean and lift up' himself.[285]

Xu asserted that, rather than a request for a painting as a gift, the letter was actually a statement, veiled by the request and consisting not only of the text but also the meaning of the new names of Shitao and his home. In this way, Shitao told Bada that he had reflected on what he had gone through. Shitao saw that his attempt to serve the court of Qing was a stain in his life and wanted to clean it and renew himself.[286] He decided to convert from a Buddhist to a Daoist and thus safely left the politicised monastic community and to be free from the life dependent on the imperial officials and politicians and their demands to the artist.

Xu remarked that this change in Shitao's life was radical and must have been a difficult and painful experience. After the conversion, Shitao gained freedom in spirit and self-transcendence in his art. His painting manner became unlimited, an entirely free play of mind and brush-ink; the achievement of his art peaked in his later years.

Xu's discovery was radical to the study of Shitao's paintings from many perspectives, but it was especially meaningful in identifying the authenticity of Shitao's works. Xu

---

[284] The original Chinese: '求書大滌子大滌草堂, 莫書和尚, 濟有髮有冠之人, 向上一齊滌"(永原本),' in Xu, 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), 515–6, 527.

[285] ibid.

[286] When Shitao planned to leave Beijing, he wrote some poems to express his experience of not belonging and his feelings of dreariness in Beijing. See Fu, 明末石濤上人朱若極年譜 (*The Chronicle of the Eminent Monk Shitao, Zhu Ruoji, of the Last Years of Ming*), 41.

underlined the relationship between Shitao's Daoist name – Dadi Zi – and his Buddhist name Yuanji or Ji. Xu demonstrated that the change of Shitao's name was based on a serious decision; it was a painful and difficult experience. Thus, when Shitao started to use Dadi Zi, he probably would not use Yuanji or Ji again as his signature on a painting. Thus, a painting with the signature of Yuanji or Ji was probably not one of Shitao's later works. Likewise, it was almost impossible for Shitao to use Dadi Zi and Ji together in a signature therefore any painting signed in this way was probably a counterfeit.

It has been suggested that interpretations of *yimin* painting have a tendency to romanticise the artists' lives and works because, for example, these *yimin* painters sold their paintings in the market, or socialised with politicians or celebrities. This topic lies outside the scope of this thesis; its difficulty lies in the blurring of various ancient notions and the disturbing issue of counterfeits. What this study can provide to the argument is the awareness of this: the historical context of Chinese classical landscape art – the ancient Chinese history – is a unity and the dynasties, or historical periods, were deeply connected. Thus, research on *yimin* painters cannot merely look at one period or one dynasty; it needs to consider the emerging, inheritance, and development of *yimin* painting a dynamic phenomenon that went through the ancient history, and to consider the historical *yimin* phenomenon the prior context of a particular *yimin* painter. Second, if there is an association between *yimin* painter and romanticism, it is that *yimin* painters are the origin of romanticism in the ancient Chinese history of art, not the romanticised figures.[287] Moreover, the character and spirit of *yimin* are cultural facts that existed in ancient history, even though every individual painter's being of *yimin* is complicated and unique, and may not be perfect.

Apart from the above, Xu also examined Shitao's birth and death years and agreed with Fu Baoshi's identification of that Shitao was probably born in 1630, as also proved by other Chinese scholars.[288] On *yihua* theory, Xu indicated that it was rooted in Zhuang Zi 莊子 (c.369 – 286 BC)'s Daoist thoughts. Xu interpreted the character *yi* (一, lit. oneness) in

---

[287] From the understanding of this study, the ethos of Chinese classical Romanticism is the romantic artists' pursuing self-transience and self actualisation, and the ethos were reflected on their artworks.

[288] Yang Chengyin 楊成寅, 石濤畫學本義 (*The Essential Meaning of Shitao's Painting Theory*) (Hangzhou: Zhejiang Renmin Meishu Chubanshe, 1996), 285–8;

Chen Guoping 陳國平, "评《虬峰文集》中有关石涛诗文的几点舛误 (Comments on the Errors about Shi Tao's Poems in the Collected works of Qiu Feng)," 藝術探索 (*Arts Exploration*) no.2 (2011), 5–11.

yihua (一畫) as 'uniting'. Thus, *yihua* first meant to unite the painter's subjective mental activities with the objective physical form of the landscape, during the process of the painter's perceiving the natural mountains and waters; second, it meant to unite the painter's feelings towards the landscape with the acts of operating brush and ink during the process of composition.

Xu's manner of researching was cautious and his discoveries were a crucial contribution to the studies of Shitao. The case study notes that the important assertions and speculations in Xu's studies have more than three inter-evidenced historical sources, which make his studies transparent and open to further exploration.

Zhu Liangzhi is a contemporary scholar who works on Chinese aesthetics and Shitao's *yihua* theory. He sees *yihua* theory as an innovation, representing the highest theoretical achievement in the history of Chinese classical painting. He studied *yihua* by referencing Buddhist scriptures and suggested that the character *fa* (法) in Shitao's *yihua zhi fa* (一畫之法, lit. the method or phenomenon of *yihua*) could be understood through Buddhist thoughts, not merely interpreted as the word 'method'.[289]

In order to explain the key idea of Zhu's interpretation of *fa*, it is necessary to introduce the original meaning of the word. *Fa* is a Chinese translation of a Sanskrit Buddhism term धम, which is translated in English as 'dharma'(the pronunciation of धम is like dharma). The Chinese word *fa* and the English word dharma have their own original meanings, which are close to the meaning of धम, but cannot accurately convey the essential Buddhist meaning of the word in Chinese or English. Therefore, there are additional explanations of *fa* and dharma referring to the Buddhist meaning in both Chinese and English as displayed in Table 1.

---

[289] Zhu Liangzhi 朱良志, 石濤研究 (*Studies on Shitao*) (Beijing: Beijing Da-xue Chu-ban-she, 2017), 15–17.

Table 1: Translations to and Interpretations of fa, 法, धर्म, and dharma

धर्म	*Fa*'s meaning in Chinese	English translation	Additional explanation to *Fa* as the Buddhist term in ancient and modern Chinese	English Translation
Fa 法	1. 法律; 2. 方法; 3. 標準.	1. Law, rule; 2. Method; 3. Standard	佛經古文: '任持自性、軌生物解' [290] — 唐玄奘 白話文: '每一事物必然保持它自己特有的, 有它一定軌則, 使人看到便可以了解是何物'. [291] — 趙樸初	Dharma means everything has its individual unique disposition, shape and appearance, as well as its own order. Therefore, one seeing the Dharma of a thing would know it is the thing. — Zhao Puchu

धर्म	Dharma's meaning in English	Additional explanation to Dharma as the Buddhist term in English	Chinese Translation
Dharma	In Indian religion: 1. Decree; 2. Custom [292]	1. The 'dependently arisen phenomena from the things.' [293] — David Kalupahana 2. 'The word has its meaning in the system of existence, which is an interplay of a plurality of subtle, ultimate, not further analysable matter, mind, and forces.' [294] — Fyodor Ippolitovich Shcherbatskoy	法 (*Fa*) (Sense-for-sense translation to धर्म) 達摩 (literal translation to the English word Dharma)

---

[290] Wu Rujun 吳汝鈞, 佛教思想大辭典 (*Dictionary of Buddhistic Ideology*) (Taibei: Taiwan Shangwu Yinshuguan, 1992), 351.

[291] Zhao Puchu 赵朴初, 赵朴初文集 Vol.1 (Collected Works of Zhao Puchu) (Beijing: Hua Wen Chubanshe, 2007), 571.

[292] *Compact Oxford English Dictionary*.

[293] David Kalupahana, *The Philosophy of the Middle Way* (Delhi: Motilai Banarsidass Publishers, 1986), 13–6.

[294] Fyodor Ippolitovich Shcherbatskoy, The Central Conception of Buddhism and the Meaning of the Word *'Dharma'* (Motilal Banarsidass Publisher, 1970), 73.

The table shows that Buddhism, *fa,* 法, dharma, and 達摩, are all generated from धम, and convey the Buddhist meaning of धम, though the literal forms are different. Zhao Puchu's explanation referred to the essence of धम – the unique nature or order in every individual thing. David J. Kalupahana, a Buddhist scholar and a philosopher on language, who speaks and studies Sanskrit, explains Dharma by the simple phrase of the 'dependently arisen phenomena from the things'. His explanation emphasises that धम, represents the phenomena that depend upon and are generated from the fact, feature, or element of the things. Fyodor Shcherbatskoy, one of the leading academics of Buddhist philosophy, describes how the phenomenon of dharma occurs and exists in our perception – the interplay of matter, mind and forces. These explanations all refer to धम, but from different perspectives and cultural backgrounds. Combining their perspectives and explanations may give us a relatively comprehensive perception of धम – the dependent phenomena arising from the essence of things, or the phenomena through which we can access the essence of things by perceiving them, by the interplay between things, matters, mind, and forces.

Zhu Liangzhi's consideration of the meaning of *fa* in Shitao's *yihua* theory is reasonable to some extent, because Shitao was a well-educated monk, who probably approached painting theory as a Buddhist would approach the world or the *fa* of the world. Even though Shitao abandoned his monkish identity, Buddhist wisdom and style probably still had an impact on his thinking and his ways of expression. Perhaps that is why Shitao's writing on *yihua* theory is condensed, to some extent like the Buddhist scripture. More important, the meaning of *yihua* or *fa* is probably not merely 'a method of painting'. Zhu's consideration opens new possibilities of exploring the meaning of *fa*.

If Shitao's *fa* does not merely mean 'method', what then are the other meanings of *fa*? Zhu suggests that meanings of *fa* may include 'my manner', emphasising the uniqueness of 'my manner', and how to establish the uniqueness of 'my manner'.[295] Bringing the concept of धम, into Shitao's *fa,* Zhu's elaboration could then be further interpreted as Shitao's *fa* is the phenomenon that depends on and arises from the individual nature of Shitao's unique 'self'; it is the radical nature or character of Shitao's 'self' that shapes Shitao's manner and makes it distinctive from others. Therefore, the value of Shitao's *fa* is that it highlights the

---

[295] Zhu, 石濤研究 (*Studies on Shitao*), 1, 17.

importance of establishing the distinguish nature or character of every individual 'self'. This makes more sense than merely interpreting *fa* as 'method', which is only one component of Shitao's *fa*. Accordingly, for this case study, the inspiration Zhu provided is the necessity of perceiving Shitao's 'self', Shitao's nature or character, and the establishment of Shitao's 'self', which may be an approach to Shitao's *yihua* theory and his art.

On Shitao's *yihua* theory, Zhu Liangzhi's study provides a good counterpoint to that of Xu Fuguan. From the perspective of Daoism, Xu indicates that *yihua* means to unite in the painting the artist's subjective mind and the perceived objective form of the physical landscape, while Zhu underlines that *yihua* as a *fa* is established on the distinct nature of the artist's 'self', from the perspective of Buddhism. Apart from Xu's and Zhu's interpretations, other thoughts have been proposed about *yihua*. One perspective is that *yihua* refers to 'one line' or 'one stroke' in painting, which emphases the significant role of the line in Chinese classical painting.[296] However, the interpretation from this perspective is considered a simplified and narrowed meaning of *yihua*.[297] Another perspective is that *yihua* refers to the most original, general, and essential element of the form of a thing; therefore, a painter who gained the essential element of *yihua* would gain total freedom in composition.[298] This perspective comes from philosophical consideration and does not consider *yihua* as a practice of perception and painting.

On the authenticity of Shitao's work, Zhu published a book in which he examined more than fifty works attributed to Shitao. Some of Zhu's identifications are still arguable, but those counterfeits he identified are supported by adequate evidence and thus acceptable. Zhu's work has made a substantial contribution to the study of authenticity of Shitao's art.

Amongst English studies of Shitao and his art, Victoria Contag highlights that Shitao is an individualist and notes the artist's creative spirit and unique way of using inscriptions in

---

[296] Shitao, 石涛, 石濤画语录 *(Shitao's Analects on Painting)*, ed. Yu Jianhua 俞劍華 (Beijing: Renmin Meishu Chuban She, 2016), 16, 88–90.

[297] Xu, 徐複觀全集 *(Complete Works of Xu Fuguan)*, 468.

[298] Chen Huei-Ling 陳惠玲, "石濤《畫語錄》的藝術哲學研究 (An Art Philosophical Study on Shitao's Hua-Yu-Lu)" (PhD diss., Tunghai University, 2010), 19-21.

painting in her general study on Chinese painting of the seventeenth century.[299] She has also translated Shitao's *Huayu Lu* into English. Cahill remarks that Shitao is the most independent of all the later Chinese masters, despite the close ties between his painting and the school styles and traditions.[300] Cahill also highlights Shitao's creative spirit and suggests that when Shitao was in Beijing, he must have become irritated because someone's painting was highly praised only because it was indistinguishable from the works of the old masters.[301] Cahill asserts that to break from the old formulations of the old masters was exactly Shitao's intention.

Johnathan Hay has written the only monograph to date of Shitao in English studies, focusing on Shitao's later years (after leaving Beijing for Yangzhou) from a sociological perspective. Hay studies Shitao's paintings as a cultural practice within the social and economic environment of Yangzhou, in the seventeenth-century Qing period, and explains that Shitao was an individualist, whose career and art reflected modernity.

The meaning of Hay's 'modernity' basically refers to the socioeconomic context of Shitao's career, and subjectivity or individualism as defined from a psychological perspective. Hay demonstrates that Shitao's later works have an intense lyric effect in which the phenomenon of self-consciousness is expressed as doubts over the old values and an aspiration to individual autonomy.

Hay identifies a further feature of Shitao's personality – anxiety, as defined and interpreted from the perspectives of modernity and psychology. For Hay, Shitao's anxiety is the result of the competition from other painters in the newly emerged market since the late Ming era, with only passing reference to the invasion of Qing and the defeat of Ming by Qing.[302] The interpretation shows a lack of understanding of the difference between the anxiety caused by commercial competition and the emotional human reaction to the Ming people's suffering during the violent invasion and the experience of being brutally conquered. The two matters are in different dimensions: the former concerning sociology and economics,

---

[299] Contag, *Chinese Masters of the 17th Century*, 17, 20–21.

[300] Cahill, *The Compelling Image*, 196.

[301] ibid, 207.

[302] Jonathan Hay, *Shitao: Painting and Modernity in Early Qing China* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).

the latter humanity. It is inappropriate to simply juxtapose the two as causes of the speculative, so-called 'anxiety'; because the consequences of the two matters differ greatly: the former may cause anxiety regarding financial conditions, whereas the latter sometimes may threatens integrity and spiritual strength and meanwhile may cause the threatened to strive for more integrity and spiritual strength, as for Shitao. Shitao's state of mind in his later years perhaps combined grief, introspection, self-deprecation, and courage, not the simple 'anxiety'.

Regarding an examination of Shitao's subjectivity, if the examined works of Shitao included both genuine works and counterfeits, they would present non-coherent acts and expressions of the artist, and uneven quality in his work. Shitao's character would become blur; he would appear to be a strange painter with inconsistent mind and mood, and many conflicting attitudes and expressions.

For example, Hay portrays Shitao as a difficult, impatient person and one piece of evidence that he cited is the inscription on the painting *Gazing at the Waterfall at Cuijiao Peak* (1697), which has been identified as a counterfeit by Zhu Liangzhi.[303] Zhu noted that one part of the inscription on the painting is identical to the inscription on another work by Shitao made in 1687. After a careful examination, Zhu identified that the work was a skilful counterfeit that assembled several partial copies of other works of Shitao. Thus, Hay's argument on Shitao's personality becomes insufficient tenable.

In another example, Hay notices Shitao's various names and concludes that Shitao was constantly on the verge of changing his name and identity.[304] Hay implies that Shitao may have had a changeable personality; thus, his religious conversion, as well as his changing moods in daily life, may all have been part of his strange personality as a non-conformist artist. While there are many fake names of Shitao on the counterfeit paintings, and fake historical records were also produced to promote the counterfeits.[305] When Hay conducted

---

[303] Hay, *Shitao: Painting and Modernity in Early Qing China* , 4, notes 16.

   Zhu, 传世石涛款作品真伪考 (*Identification on Works attributed to Shitao*), 312–3.

[304] Hay, *Shitao: Painting and Modernity in Early Qing China,* 2–3.

[305] Xu 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), 536–580.

   Zhu, 传世石涛款作品真伪考 (*Identification of Works attributed to Shitao*), 4–6.

   Chen, "评《虬峰文集》中有关石涛诗文的几点舛误 (A Discussion on the Mistakes in *Collected Works of Qiufeng*)," 5–11 .

his research, studies about the authenticity of Shitao's works had made little progress and the works of Shitao that Hay studied included both genuine works and counterfeits. Therefore, again, Hay's conclusions are untenable due to the revealing of the counterfeits.

The same errors were made by Chinese collectors. Liang Tingdan 梁廷枏 (1796–1861), a well-known Qing collector, asserted that he would never praise Shitao's work because it was of low taste and the texts and pictures were badly structured. He exaggeratedly said that every time he saw Shitao's works he would criticise them constantly for ten days.[306] However, according to Zhu's study, the works that Liang saw were counterfeits. Shitao himself was aware of the problem and expressed his frustration in his writings; he even considered giving up painting as a result.[307] The quantities of counterfeits in the market showed that Shitao had no need to suffer 'anxiety' over demands for his artworks.

Hay considers Shitao to be 'an artist-entrepreneur' in his later years because Shitao shifted his focus from politics to economics, via his Dadi Cottage painting business.[308] Hay hints that 'Shitao's professions of Ming loyalism' in his later years were the basis of his Dadi Cottage painting business and his cultural celebrity in the educated circle of Yangzhou.[309] Arguably, Shitao intended to operate a business selling his paintings in his later years, after his return to being a *yimin*. Making a living as a painter is rather different from an entrepreneurial business operation to pursue profits through making and selling a large quantity of artworks.

Hay is correct to observe the elements of commercial operation behind the massive market for Shitao's work. There was a brand, Dadi Cottage; there were the selling points, Shitao's 'Ming loyalism' (*yimin* identity) and his painting talent; and there were many works on the market to feed buyers' demands.[310] However, paradoxically, if Shitao had operated a profit-driven business in the market, based on the selling point of his *yimin* identity, he would

---

[306] The original Chinese: '予生平絕不喜清湘画, 顧其画作, 往往在酸鹹之外...画與字雜亂無章, 令人對之作十日惡矣', see Zhu, 传世石涛款作品真伪考 (Identification of Works attributed to Shitao), 5.

[307] Zhu, 传世石涛款作品真伪考 (*Identification of Works attributed to Shitao*), 4–5.

[308] Hay, *Shitao: Painting and Modernity in Early Qing China*, 144–173.

[309] ibid.*, 2, 113, 126.

[310] ibid.

have lost that very market, particularly in educated circles, because a genuine *yimin* would not act in this way and buyers would not want a fake *yimin* painter's work. The key to the paradox is that there was a painting business, but it was not Shitao's; the owners and operators of the business were not Shitao but the counterfeiters. In Shitao's time, the best-known counterfeiter was his student Shi Qian 石乾; in more recent times, another successful counterfeiter was the famous painter Zhang Daqian 張大千. Xu and Zhu both mentioned, around 1960s, that the centre for producing counterfeits was located in Shanghai; many painters, celebrities, collectors, connoisseurs, and protégés were involved in the business and benefited from it.[311] It was a professional and industrialised operation and Hay is correct in noting the phenomenon of modernity in it, but this was the dark side of the modern professional operation, established on counterfeits and operated in an unhealthy market for immoral profit.

To summarise, many researchers have contributed to the research on Shitao, but the studies of Fu Baoshi, Xu Fuguan, and Zhu Liangzhi are essential to this case study. Fu Baoshi built a solid foundation for studies on Shitao, clarifying the basic information in Shitao's biography and identifying significant events in his life. Xu Fuguan developed Fu's studies and contributed further on three issues: Shitao's religious conversion, the authenticity of Shitao's works, and the interpretation of *yihua* theory. Zhu Liangzhi expanded the discussion of Shitao's *yihua* theory by employing the Buddhist meaning of the word *fa*. He also contributed to the identification of works attributed to Shitao. English researchers brought different perspectives to the studies: Contag and Cahill shed light on the individuality and creativity of Shitao's art, while Hay introduced the concept of modernity into the discussion.

Regarding the problem of counterfeits of Shitao's works, Xu and Fu both emphasised the considerable number of counterfeits. Xu wrote that, when in Taiwan, none of the works he saw attributed to Shitao was genuine.[312] Zhu estimated that there were approximately 1,200 works of Shitao currently in the market, institutions, and private collections, half of which

---

[311] Xu 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), 537.

    Zhu, 传世石涛款作品真伪考 (*Identification of Works attributed to Shitao*), 5.

[312] Xu 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), 545.

may be counterfeits.[313] The counterfeits were not all paintings; they also included correspondence, writings, and even the evidences of Shitao's life activities. For example, there were three physical versions of the above-mentioned letter that Shitao wrote to Bada.[314] Thus, at least two were not genuine. Xu compared the three letters and asserted that the two counterfeit letters were made as part of a plot to promote a counterfeit painting, supposedly painted by Bada for Shitao's Dadi Cottage – a non-existent painting.[315] A book attributed to Shiato entitled *Hua Pu,* also a counterfeit, was produced based on the content of *Huayu Lu*.[316] Moreover, in the false correspondence, the counterfeiters tried to invent a wife and children for Shitao, the monk and later Daoist. Those counterfeits have severely confused researchers, collectors, and beholders.

For researchers of Shitao and his art, the authenticity of his work is fundamental. Therefore, it is the duty of every researcher to be aware of the problem of counterfeits and to provide ideas and findings to support the identification. In the old Chinese studies on authenticity, the line between counterfeits and artistic copies is blurred because, in the history of Chinese painting, many painters imitated and copied the works of the old masters, or borrowed artistic elements and patterns from the old masterpieces, for a range of reasons. Some painters wanted to learn painting techniques, some to show respect or empathy to the old masters, and some to indirectly express certain ideas by using a particular old master's style or pictorial element in their own compositions. Those painters would, however, sign the paintings with their own names. While the reality may appear complicated, the fact is simple enough: a counterfeit is a counterfeit. It means that someone produces an artwork but signs another painter's name on it and benefits from the dishonest behaviour, from letting the fake work spread in the market, collections, and be exhibited to the public. Thus, if painter A imitated or copied painter B's work and did so very successfully, this was not counterfeiting and the imitation was not a counterfeit. However, if painter A signed his imitation work with painter B's name and then exhibited or sold the

---

[313] Zhu, 传世石涛款作品真伪考 (*Identification of Works attributed to Shitao*), 2–5.

[314] Xu 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), 512–6.

[315] ibid.

[316] Xu 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), 580–593.
　　Zhu, 传世石涛款作品真伪考 (*Identification of Works attributed to Shitao*), 978–1004.

work as painter B's original work, then, irrespective of the initial purpose of the imitation, the imitation work was a counterfeit. The issue of counterfeiting Shitao's work was far more complicated than this simple example. Some of the counterfeits were produced skilfully, so identification is challenging. It is still necessary to encourage every researcher to think about how to address counterfeits, in order to accelerate progress in identifying them and to research Shitao and his art on the basis of his genuine works, as the great painter deserved.

Currently, in addressing counterfeits, this study suggests there things we can do. The first is to be aware of the counterfeit problem when encountering a painting attributed to Shitao. The second is to take Shitao's religious conversion as the most important event in his life and painting career. Then, the causal relationships between Shitao's religious conversion and his artistic composition can be taken into account, and the causal relationships within the common sense of humanity traced, thus, to avoid being misled by counterfeits. The third is to be alert to the direct personal experience of seeing Shitao's works, because intuitive reflection on the works may be a useful approach to finding clues for identification.

For this case study, a related issue is the disagreement surrounding Shitao's birth year, which linked to the plot to promote counterfeits with Bada's signature. Shitao's birth year is relevant to *Mount Lu* in whether the middle-aged figure in the painting is a depiction of Shitao himself at Mount Lu. Following previous studies, this case study takes 1630 as Shitao's birth year, as demonstrated by Fu Baoshi and Xu Fuguan, and supported by contemporary scholars such as Yang Chengyin and the new generation of art historians including Chen Guoping.[317]

3.2 Mount Lu

Osvald Sirén remarks that the painter of *Mount Lu* 'takes us here right into the heart of a wild and inaccessible mountain, to a place on a rocky ledge rising out of mist, where he

---

[317] Yang Chengyin 楊成寅, 石濤畫學本義 *(The Essential Meaning of Shitao's Painting Theory)*, (Hangzhou: Zhejiang Renmin Meishu Chubanshe, 1996), 285–8.

Chen, "评《虬峰文集》中有关石涛诗文的几点舛误 (Comments on the Errors about Shi Tao's Poems in the *Collected works of Qiufeng*)," 5–11.

[the painter] stands looking at the foaming waters ad the circling visas of light fog between the rocks, while his companion is resting by a tree'.[318] Sirén highlighted the inaccessibility of the landscape of *Mount Lu*, created by the central rocky ledges rising out of the suffused mist, presenting an appearance of overwhelming height and depth.[319] He also underlined three pictorial components that indirectly accentuated the feeling of height and distance: the rising rhythm of the cliff, the sound of the falling waters and the vibration of the 'surging life' pulsating through the gorge.[320] By 'surging life', he probably referred to the moving clouds and mist among the precipices and in the gorge. Sirén also noticed that the dramatic presence in *Mount Lu* was not a traditional harmonious form. He underlined that Shitao knew the value of the old masters but 'the wind of his spirit' was released in and swept his brush-stokes, and left on the painting the marks of his creative activities.[321] Sirén's interpretation was primarily based on his direct perception of the picture; he grasped the artist's intention in the painting – to create a pictorial view of Mount Lu that was detached from the everyday world and represented a dramatic and imposing, rather than harmonious, form. His notions inspired other researchers, including this case study.

Among studies on *Mount Lu*, Anne Burkus-Chasson's essay has been widely referenced and discussed.[322] Her study is outstanding in the depth of her exploration of the meaning of the painting. Her first step was to examine the physical location of Mount Lu. Although she did not visit Mount Lu in person, she found a contemporary of Shitao, Liu Tongsheng 劉同昇 (1587–1645 AD), a scholar who had first-hand experience of visiting the San Shiliang waterfall, which was depicted in Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad*. Burkus-Chasson suggested that Liu's way of seeing the physical natural landscape was typical of ancient Chinese – to elevate the natural scene into the subject of the composition. The second step of her study was to perceive Shitao's subjective vision, which imbued the painting and was projected in the key feature of the picture – the inaccessibility of the mountains, as Sirén

---

[318] Osvald Sirén, *Chinese Painting Leading Masters and Principles Vol.5* (London: London Humphries, 1958), 165.

[319] Sirén, *Chinese Painting Leading Masters and Principles Vol.5*, 165-166.

[320] ibid.

[321] ibid.

[322] Anne Burkus-Chasson, '"Clouds and mist That Emanate and Sink Away": Shitao's Waterfall on Mount Lu and practices of observation in the seventeenth century', *Art History,* Vol. 19 No. 2 (Jun 1996), 169–190.

perceived. Burkus-Chasson then elaborated various figurations of inaccessibility in the painting: the clouds and mist, the figure standing in front of the waterfall, and the inscription. She perceived that the clouds and mist in the painting as an obstacle to the viewer's sight of the high, rocky mountains. She also observed the body language of the figures in the painting and noticed that the standing figure had withdrawn his looking from the mountain and waterfall and sighted the pine trees in the clouds. Thus, the figure's attitude to the scene in front of him was withholding. Burkus-Chasson then researched the meaning of the inscription and suggested that Li Bai's poem might describe the scene of Mount Lu as the Daoist heaven; and the painting did not illustrate the poem; Li Bai's poetic depiction of Mount Lu could be the source of Shitao's inspiration, because the painter projected the vision of the Daoist heaven with one radiant glimpse – the light on the top of the two central precipices in the picture. Finally, Burkus-Chasson suggested that the interplay of the visible and invisible pictorial elements in the picture was the painter's means of avoiding a realist depiction of Mount Lu, and also a skilful exploration of the subtleties of the brush-ink effects.

Regarding Burkus-Chasson's study, some Chinese researchers have argued that the waterfall in the painting is Sandie Quan waterfall 三疊泉 (lit. 'the waters falling down over three rock stairs') of Mount Lu, which can be easily recognised; therefore the painting could be considered a realistic work.[323] This case study perceives the painting differently from both of these. In terms of Burkus-Chasson's study, the clouds and mist may be the artist's intentional object and a key element in the painting, for the purpose of making a contrast with the mountains. Thus, they are not an obstacle to seeing the mountains as the mountains are not necessarily to be seen clearly. In terms of whether the painting is a realistic work, the study finds evidence to show the landscape is not a realistic depiction of Mount Lu, even though the waterfall is recognisable as Sandie Quan.

Like Burkus-Chasson, Cahill indicated that the painting was not an accurate rendition of Mount Lu, but a subjectively made-up vision, writing 'Tao-chi [Shitao] has indeed recaptured, for a brief moment, the precarious balance between subjective and objective modes of vision ... In the mind of the musing scholar, one feels, the worlds of matter and

---

[323] Yu Huoxing 鬱火星, "再读石涛的《庐山观瀑图》 (Re-reading Shitao's Mount Lu)," 艺术研究 *(Study Art*) 3, 009 (2004), 60–63.

spirit are similarly reconciled by their overpowering vision.'[324] The word 'balance' suggests that Cahill believed the landscape was either realistic or imaginative, because on one hand depictions of the landscape elements were based on Shitao's penetrating knowledge of the natural elements at Mount Lu, such as the rocks, the light, and the clouds.[325] On the other hand, the painter used these 'natural elements' as raw material to form his subjective vision of Mount Lu. Cahill also suggested the painting's association with the style of Guo Xi's *Early Spring,* though Shitao intended to renew the old formulation of landscape painting with his own manner – making the picture closer to nature, not imitating the old master's formulation.[326]

Hay thought *Mount Lu* was an illustration of Li Bai's poem.[327] From the psychological aspect, he also indicated that the painting was memory-oriented, and the 'memory' to Shitao was 'an escape from the present' or 'a realignment of the past to suit the present'.[328] Hay was correct that *Mount Lu* is related to memory, which links the painter's past and present. However, for this case study, arguments remain as to whether Shitao's recollection of memory in the past was an escape from the present.

Previous Chinese studies on *Mount Lu* mainly considered it a realistic depiction of Mount Lu because the scene of the waterfall in the picture could be identified as Sandie Quan. And the other concern is that Shitao's brush-ink techniques presented in the painting, such as the use of line, dotting, and rendering *mo*, represent the texture of the mountain rocks, clouds, and mist vividly.

To summarise, previous studies on *Mount Lu* mainly covered four aspects: the content, the pictorial form, the meaning of the painting, and the artist's technique. The content of the painting was generally recognised as a depiction of Mount Lu, but the whole painting was not realistic, because the pictorial landscape also related to the painter's memory and Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad.* The pictorial format was considered a tribute to the old masters,

---

[324] James Cahill, *Chinese Painting* (Geneva: Skira, 1960), 182.

[325] Cahill, Chinese Painting, 182.

[326] Cahill, The Compelling Image, 207–8.

[327] Hay, Shitao: Painting and Modernity in Early Qing China, 268.

[328] ibid., 309.

especially Guo Xi, but also a new way of forming a landscape – the naturalistic depiction of the landscape elements together with the creatively used brush-ink techniques by Shitao. Interpretations of the meaning of *Mount Lu* were various: Sirén indicated it created a dramatic and imposing form of the wild mountains; Cahill noted it was a creative practice for exploring new methods of painting natural landscapes; Burkus-Chasson suggested it essentially depicted a glimpse of Daoist heaven; Hay thought it illustrated Li Bai's poem, and some Chinese researchers thought it is realistic depiction of the physical Mount Lu.

From the perspective of phenomenology, every viewer's way of seeing the painting is individual and every interpretation is tenable if based on facts or real experience. For this case study, the manner of interpretation is to go to and experience the objects related to the painting, tracing the marks in the picture left by the artist's compositional acts, in order to access the artist's compositional intention and reveal the meaning of the painting.

Therefore, this case study interprets *Mount Lu* differently from previous studies in terms of Shitao's compositional intention, the meaning of the painting, and the significance of the picture to viewers, by applying the phenomenological method. The identified historical facts relating to *Mount Lu* and the various interpretations of the work in previous studies are, however, important references for the comparisons in the application of the method. The comparisons are made between the experiences of the picture and pictorial elements of *Mount Lu,* the inscription, and the physical landscape of Mount Lu. By analysing the differences found by the comparisons, the study restores the key compositional acts of the artist and therefore accesses the artist's compositional intention and grasps the meaning of the work.

Part 1: Shitao's Literal Intention

The case study of Shitao differs from that of Turner. No commission in relation to the work has been found, nor any sketches or drafts of the painting can be referenced. Thus, the study focuses on the inscription on the painting to analyse the artist's general and literal intention. In classical Chinese paintings, it is not rare for painters to state their ideas regarding the composition in the inscription – it is a way of communicating with viewers.

In the inscription on *Mount Lu*, Shitao states that his literal intention is to achieve the pictorial effect as that Guo Xi had achieved, yet in Shitao's own manner.

The inscribed text includes two parts: the inscription (*ti* 題) written in regular script and the postscript (*ba* 跋) written in running script in smaller characters.[329] The former is inscribed at the top of the picture, and the latter is additional information added at the end of the inscription. Inscribing is the penultimate step of the composition, after which the painter signs (*luokuan* 落款) and stamps their seals (*qianyin* 鈐印).[330]

The content of the first part is a transcription of Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad*. The postscript is the statement of Shitao's literal intention. The content of the postscript shows: after the composition, the painter has compared his work with Guo Xi's and remarks that he has achieved the pictorial effect. Since the functions and meanings of the inscription and postscript are different, the following content discusses them separately, to demonstrate in detail Shitao's literal intention, as well as the clues of his twofold compositional intention.

1. The postscript

The text of the postscript is essential to the understanding of Shitao's literal intention (Figure 68a). Since the complete text and English translation have not yet been seen in published writings, both are provided below:

> 長人云郭河陽画宗李成法，得 '雲煙出沒，峰巒隱顯' 之態，獨步一時。
> 早年巧瞻工致，暮年落筆益壯。 余生平所見十餘幅，多人中皆道好。獨
> 余無言。未見有透關手眼。今憶昔遊，拈李白廬山謠寄盧侍御虛舟作，
> 用我法入平生所見為之，似乎可以為熙之觀。何用昔為？

> Connoisseurs say that Guo Heyang's painting method is rooted in that of Li Cheng, because Guo's paintings depict the dynamic situation [of the landscape as Li Cheng did] – **'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing,**

---

[329] The Original Chinese: '題者, 標其前; 跋者, 系其後也', see Duan, 說文解字注 *(Notes on Shuo Wen Jie Zi)* Vol. 2 足部 (清嘉庆二十年經韵樓刻本 [Jingyun Lou Version of the Twentieth Year of Jia Qing]), 中國哲學書電子化計劃', no. 580, accessed 30 March 2022, https://ctext.org/81427.

[330] Fu Baoshi 傅抱石, ed. Ye Zonggao 葉宗鎬, 傅抱石美術文集續編 *(The Sequel to the Collected Works of Fu Baoshi on Fine Art)* (Shanghai: Shanghai Shuhua Chubanshe, 2014), Kindle book location 629–30.

[among them] some precipices and peaks are visible, some not'.[331] [Thus, Guo's achievement] has no equal in his time. The early works [of Guo Xi] show his ingenious perspectives of seeing [the landscape] and his skills are exquisite; in his later works, [he] operates his brush with more vigour. During my life, I have seen more than ten works [of Guo Xi]. Most of them were praised by almost everyone. It is only me who said nothing. I have not seen that [Guo Xi] had transcended the threshold limitation of his technique and vision. Today [I compose a painting for which I] recalled the memories of my travelings, and picked Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad Sent to Attendant Inspector Lu Xuzhou* [to be the inscription on the painting]. I paint it with my own manner and employ what I have learned over my lifetime. It looks that I can achieve what [Guo] Xi had done. Is it necessary to do [the painting] in the old manner?

1.1 Notes on four words in the postscript

1.1.1 *Changren* 長人

Previous studies have usually taken the character *ren* 人 as the first word of the postscript, because it is the first character at the top of the first line, next to the transcription of the poem. It is easy to overlook the character, *chang* 長, which is at the end of the transcription of the poem (Figure 68a). *Ren* is, thus, the second character. The first word of the postscript is *changren* 長人, not *ren* 人, and their meanings differ. *Ren* generally means 'people', while *changren* originally means 'people with a certain kind of ability or authority, or who are holding high positions' in the ancient texts.[332] In the particular context of Shitao's postscript, *changren* refers to the people who make judgments and

---

[331] Sometimes Guo Xi was called Guo Heyang 郭河陽. Heyang is the name of Guo Xi's hometown.

[332] See examples:

"有長人, 有謀士", from Mo Zi's 墨子 "雜守 (Defences)", in *Mo Zi* 墨子 (Zhangguo period), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 15, no. 8, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/377144

"至宰相名臣，莫不孜孜言長人不可輕授煦易", from "列傳 (Biographies)", in 新唐書 (*New history of Tang*), ed. Ouyang Xiu 歐陽修 (欽定四庫全書 [The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor], Qing dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 122, no. 2. accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/769909

comments on the quality and taste of Guo Xi's paintings. Thus, the English translation of *changren* is 'connoisseurs'.

The first sentence of the postscript is Shitao's paraphrase of the remark on Guo Xi's landscape in *Xuanhe Huapu* 宣和畫譜 (*Category of Paintings in Royal Collection Written in Xuanhe*).[333] The author of the book is anonymous, thus Shitao uses *changren* instead. Moreover, since the Chinese language has no singular and plural noun forms, Shitao's *changren* may refer to the anonymous author, or authors, or the connoisseurs, or perhaps in Shitao's point of view, the so-called 'connoisseurs' who agreed with the author's remarks on Guo Xi. Therefore, the translation of *changren* is connoisseurs, a plural noun.

1.1.2 *Tai* 態

In the first sentence of the postscript, the character *tai* 態 is the key word. In this context, it refers to 'the dynamic situation' of the mountains and clouds at a moment in time. *Tai* is key word, because if a painting captures the *tai,* the dynamic situation of the mountains and clouds, the landscape will look as if in motion. For this reason, the author used verbs rather than adjectives to describe the *tai* of the mountains and clouds in Guo Xi's paintings. The use of *tai* denotes that it is the effect of motion that gives Guo Xi's landscapes their unique value. Moreover, in the motions of mountains and clouds, or 'the dynamic situation' of the mountains and clouds, the moving element is the clouds or mists, while the mountains and peaks are the still element, the foil to the moving clouds and mist. In Chinese, verbs have no tense, but English can express the situation well. Thus, the translation uses the present continuous tense to describe the clouds and mist, and the present tense for the mountains.

Guo Xi was a great painter in the Song dynasty (960–1279 AD). His art is rated highly in *Xuanhe Huapu* and these remarks have long been widely quoted. Shitao also praised Guo Xi's achievement in the postscript. Yet, gradually, Guo Xi's landscapes had become the

---

[333] "Guo Xi 郭熙", in *Xuanhe Huapu* 宣和畫譜 (*Category of Paintings in Royal Collection Written in Xuanhe)* (欽定四庫全書 [The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor], Qing dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 11, no. 24, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/668529

iconic demonstration of the specific pictorial effect – 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not'. Therefore, in the postscript Shitao argued that there are other ways of achieving this specific effect in a painting.

1.1.3 *Tou-guan* 透關

In ancient Chinese, *guan* 關 originally means 'the bolt on a door'; its extended meaning is 'the guarded entrance located in a difficult terrain'.[334] The *guan* in *tou-guan* 透-關 is used as a simile, meaning 'an entrance which is difficult to enter', or 'an higher level that is difficult to reach', or 'a limit that is difficult to surpass'. In the context of the postscript, *tou-guan* means 'to transcend one's own limitation to achieve a higher level'. The English word 'threshold' means 'a strip of wood or stone forming the bottom of a doorway'; and it is also used as a simile, meaning – 'the place or point of entering or beginning' or 'a level or point at which something would begin or come into effect'.[335] Hence, the short English translation of *tou-guan* is 'transcended the threshold limitation'.

In the postscript, Shitao highly commended Guo Xi on his artistic achievement –'The early works [of Guo Xi] show his ingenious perspectives of seeing [the landscape] and his skills are exquisite; in his later works, [he] operates his brush with more vigour.' Even though it is unknown whether the more than ten paintings that Shitao saw over his lifetime were genuine Guo Xi's works or copies, Shitao's commentary shows that he did see some genuine works of Guo Xi, perceived Guo Xi's art, and appreciated Guo Xi's paintings very much. However, he believed that the situation – 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not' – can be depicted in different manners with better pictorial effect.

Painters like Shitao always want to improve their art, to transcend the threshold limitation. Shitao thought Guo Xi did not transcend 'Guo Xi's threshold limitation', and probably he thought he did not transcend 'Shitao's threshold limitation' neither. That is why he writes in the postscript that he had achieved the 'same effect' as that Guo Xi had achieved, not a

---

334 The Original Chinese: "關: 以木橫持門戶也", in Xu, 說文解字 (Explanations of Characters and Words), 249.

335 The "King's English" Dictionary, and Compact Oxford English Dictionary.

'better effect'. Shitao does not criticise Guo Xi's paintings in his postscript; he just frankly argues that Guo Xi's manner is old and there should be better ways of achieving the pictorial effect; though his wording was a little bold. Shitao did transcend his threshold limitation in the years after his religious conversion, but he had not yet done so when he painted *Mount Lu*.

1.1.4 *Xi wei* 昔為

In the words '*xi wei* 昔為', *xi* means 'old or past' and *wei* means 'do, doing, did, or done'. What Shitao refers to as *xi* is not the old masters like Guo Xi, nor the old works by the old masters, but the old ways of painting. For Shitao, the old painting manners, such as those of Guo Xi, are not necessarily to be used again and again, as had been imitated so many times as to become a rigid format. Thus, the English translation of *xi wei* is 'to do [the painting] in the old manner'.

1.2 The meaning of the postscript

Shitao clearly states in the postscript that through painting *Mount Lu* he intends to achieve the pictorial effect as that Guo Xi had achieved, but in Shitao's own manner. Then he asks: 'Is it necessary to do [the painting] in the old manner?' Burkus-Chasson's interpretation of the question and the postscript is that Shitao 'established a subtle link to an invisible artistic paradigm through his rendering of watchful figures who study the effect of "clouds and mists that emanate and sink away"'; in this way, as Burkus-Chasson indicated, *Mount Lu* suggests that 'a mythical "Guo Xi" existed only in the remnants of literary representation' and Shitao 'teased those collectors who merely demanded copies of Guo Xi, or the simulations produced by contemporary painters'.[336] For this study, the understanding of the specific pictorial effect described in *Xuenhe Huanpu* is that it represents a level of artistic accomplishment, not a specific painting paradigm, suggesting many Guo Xi's landscape paintings had achieved that level. Also, one reason of Shitao's composition of *Mount Lu* is to demonstrate the possibility of that this level of artistic accomplishment can be achieved in a totally different manner.

---

[336] Burkus-Chasson, "Clouds and mist That Emanate and Sink Away," 180-1.

Cahill suggested that the composition of *Mount Lu* may be inspired by Guo Xi's *Early Spring* and *Mount Lu* presented Shitao's 'own version of the Kuo Hsi [Guo Xi] style'; thus, by asking the question, Shitao implied that he wanted to return to a condition prior to the formulation of conventions and to make 'new, creative use of the old conventions'.[337] For this study, it is difficult to evidence whether or not Shitao's *Mount Lu* is inspired by Guo Xi's *Early Spring*. Perhaps that Cahill and other viewers connected the two paintings because Shitao mentioned Guo Xi's works in the postscript and the two works are both rarely survived masterpieces of the greater painters; let alone, the two works are both powerful pictures.

However, a phenomenological seeing shows that different pictorial facts of the two paintings fabric different kind of powerfulness. First of all, Guo Xi's landscape is a human dwelling place, with beautiful architectures and working people, whereas Shitao's landscape is radical wild, no trace of human residence can be found; second, the landscape by Guo Xi is in early spring and the atmosphere of the landscape is cooling, tender, and peaceful, but the landscape by Shitao is in autumn or early winter and the atmosphere is complicated and subtle, filled with pressure and ambiguity; last, the different kinds of brushstrokes in the two painting show that Shitao's use of *bi* and *mo* is very differently from that of Guo Xi. And the strongest difference between the two is in the pictorial structure, which of *Mount Lu* is essentially different from *Early Spring* and factually much more complicated and sophisticated than that of *Early Spring* (detailed comparison and analysis are in the later Part 3 section 1 'Structuring Mount Lu').

In terms of Shitao's question, in reality, when Shitao wrote down the question – 'Is it necessary to do [the painting] in the old manner?', only himself knew the exact meaning of it. For the interpretive studies on the question, Cahill can suggest that Shitao wanted to express that he would present his own version of the legend 'Guo Xi's style' and to use the old conventions newly and creatively; Burkus-Chasson can suggest that the question reflected that Shitao was wary to see pictorial resemblances and the reproductions (or counterfeits) of Guo Xi's works.[338] For this study, one point of Cahill's interpretation is agreed – Shitao intended to do something new and creative to against 'the formulation of

---

[337] Cahill, *The Compelling Image,* 207-208.

[338] Cahill, *The Compelling Image,* 207-208.
    Burkus-Chasson, "Clouds and mist That Emanate and Sink Away," 181.

conventions'; though for this study, 'the new' Shitao intended is neither for presenting his own version of 'the Guo Xi's style' nor for using the old convention in a new way, as Cahill suggested, but for making that pictorial effect in a totally new manner. Therefore, Shitao's asking indicates that he questioned the attitude of being satisfied to stay at Guo Xi's level or quality, that had been achieved hundreds of years ago and he wanted to reinforce that what Guo Xi had had achieved can be achieved in a new manner through a totally different image.

In summary, the meaning of the postscript exhibits three acts of Shitao's composition, which are the trace of Shitao's compositional intention: recollecting the memories of his travelling, picking Li Bai's pome for the composition, and creating the pictorial effect demanded by himself in *Mount Lu* in his own manner. Specifically, 'picking Li Bai's poem' means to use the poem as a source of inspiration and an expressive element in the picture, not picking the poem for illustrating it by the painting. Then further questions arise – whether or not Shitao's literal intention in the postscript is fulfilled in the composition? Whether or not the literal intention is only one part of Shitao's compositional intention? To answer the questions, in the following content, the study examines how the literal intention is performed in the painting, by comparing the painting with the meaning of Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad*, the physical landscape of Mount Lu, and, finally, Guo Xi's *Early Spring* and another old master's painting. The comparisons are primarily based on the first-hand experiences of the painting and related objects; and Shitao's literal intention was suspended during the process of first-hand experiencing, in order to perceive the objects in the condition of *epoché* and *réduction,* as far as possible.

2. The transcription of *Mount Lu Ballad*

The transcription of Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad* shows a trace of Shitao's compositional intention – he transcribed the poem on his painting but he did not depict the vast scene imaginarily and poetically presented in the poem. In this section, the study examines the text of the poem and the relationship between Li Bai and Mount Lu, in order to reveal the essential meaning of the poem.

2.1 Li Bai and Mount Lu

Mount Lu was meaningful to Li Bai; it was the poet's material and spiritual sanctuary. Li Bai's life and career could be described as turbulent, swaying between serving the imperial court as an official and withdrawing from the corrupt officialdom to Daoism. The poet had served the emperor Xuan Zong (玄宗 685–762 AD) closely because of his talent, but was exiled to a remote province because of the infighting between imperial family members, who were also high-ranking officials of the imperial court. Every time Li Bai was frustrated by the earthly world, he went to Mount Lu, yet every time he had the opportunity to achieve his ambition he left the mountains. In his life, Li Bai went to Mount Lu five times.[339]

Li Bai's political ambition was shaped by Xie An 謝安 (320 –385 AD)'s political achievements.[340] Xie An lived during the Eastern Jin dynasty (東晉, 317–420 AD). In his early life, Xie An refused invitations from the imperial court many times but, later, when Eastern Jin was in peril as foreigners' invasion, he accepted the court's nomination and led the army to defend its territory; he was then a respected court politician who managed the various competing interests in the court and balanced them to ensure a peaceful regime for the king.[341] For Li Bai, Xie An's withdrawal from the political circles in peaceful times and

---

[339] An Qi 安旗. 李白年谱 (*The Chronicle of Li Bai*) (Jinan: Qilu Shushe, 1982), 24, 74, 108.

[340] Xiao Lihua 蕭麗華, "出山與入山, 李白廬山詩的精神底蘊 (Coming and Leaving, the Spiritual Essence of Li Bai's Poems of Mount Lu)," 台灣大學中國文學報 (Taiwan University Literature), 2010, no. 12: 212–15.

Maan Shan Editorial Department of Chinese Studies on Li Bai 馬鞍山中國李白研究編輯部, 中國李白研究1991年集 (*Chinese Studies on Li Bai Annual Collection 1991*) Nanjing: Jiangsu Guji Chubanshe 1993. 177–9, 263, 265, 269.

See also Li Bai's poems "書情贈蔡舍人雄 (A Lyric Poem for Cai Xiong)" and "送裴十八图南归嵩山二首 (Two Poems on Mount Song for Pei Shiba's Return to the South)", in 李太白集注 (*Collected Works of Li Bai*), ed. Wang Qi 王琦 (欽定四庫全書 [The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor], 1781), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 10, no.7 and Vol. 17, no. 26, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/962911

[341] See Fang Xuanling 房玄齡 (editor) "Xie Shang Xie An 謝尚 謝安", from 列傳第四十九 (The Forty-ninth Biography), in 晉書 (*Jin History*) (Tang dynasty; reprint, 武英殿二十四史 [Twenty-four history books published by WuYing Dian], Qing dyansty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), no.79, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/962911

taking responsibility to defend the dynasty in wartime was the right way to accomplish self-realisation.

However, after five times going back to Mount Lu from the political court in frustrations, Li Bai wanted to give up his political ambition and started to pursue Daoism. *Mount Lu Ballad* was written during his last short stay in the mountains. And the grandeur and scenery of Mount Lu were not only the object of Li Bai's aesthetic experience; it was also a projection of his vision of Daoism.[342] Nevertheless, shortly after writing the poem, at the age of sixty-one, Li Bai left Mount Lu again to join the army in fighting rebels to the Tang dynasty but became ill and died on the journey.[343]

2.2 The meaning of the poem

The poem has fourteen lines and can be divided into three parts according to the content. The first contains lines 1 to 3, in which the poet describes himself and expresses his fondness for Mount Lu.[344] The second runs from lines 4 to 9, within which the poet presents the grand Mount Lu in his poetically imagining and describes several scenic spots in Mount Lu area. The last part comprises lines 10 to 14, in which the poet describes the inspiration gained from Mount Lu, projecting visions of the Daoist heaven and his imagined self-realisation as a Daoist.

The first line of the poem contains a strong statement, for which the poet uses an allusion:

我本楚狂人，風歌笑孔丘。

I am naturally like the madman of Chu,
who chanted the *Phoenix Song* to satirise Kong Qiu.

---

[342] Xiao, "出山與入山, 李白廬山詩的精神底蘊 (Coming and Leaving, the Spiritual Essence of Li Bai's Poems of Mount Lu)," 194–207.

[343] Maan Shan Editorial Department of Chinese Studies on Li Bai, 中國李白研究1991年集 (*Chinese Studies on Li Bai Annual Collection 1991*), 263–69.

[344] See Appendix 1.

This refers to an old story about Confucius and Lu Tong, written by Zhuang Zi 莊子.[345] The madman was Lu Tong 陸通, whose courtesy name was Jie Yu 接輿. He lived in the Chu state (楚國, 704 –223 BC) in the Spring and Autumn period (春秋战国, 770 – 221 BC), and did not want to support the rule of the king of Chu. In order not to serve the king's regime, he pretended to be a madman. When Kong Qiu 孔丘 (Confucius's given name, 511–479 BC) came to Chu to help the king, Lu Tong sang the *Song of the Phoenix* in front of Confucius's carriage, to advise Confucius not to assist an immoral king. Lu Tong refused the king's invitations many times and ultimately lived and died in the remote mountains. Li Bai uses the allusion as a simile to denote his intention to withdraw from his political career and pursue Daoist divinity. At the end of the poem, Li Bai echoes the allusion by expressing his desire to pursue the immortal Daoist heaven, rather than achievements in the earthly world.

In the second part, Li Bai establish a vast poetic space of Mount Lu in his imaginary descriptions. The landscape in the poetic sphere comprises overlapped precipices, peaks after peaks (in line 4), the relentless Yangtze River, ten thousand miles long and the bright Poyang Lake at the foot of the mountains (in lines 4 and 8). Then he describes the white waters of the nine great rivers that run over the snow-covered mountains to indicate the range of his poetic space, covering the area around Mount Lu's location (in line 9). It is difficult to imagine the height of the poet's viewpoint to see the vast space, perhaps there was no one for the poet's imagination. The poet names five famous places in the vast mountainscape: Jiudie Ping 九疊屏 (lit. 'the complex of nine peaks'; line 4), Shimen 石門 (lit. 'two peaks standing face to face like two huge gatehouses'; line 5), San Shiliang waterfall 三石梁瀑布 (lit. 'the waters falling down three huge long stones on the rock face'; line 5), Xianglu Peak 香爐峰 (lit. 'the peak shaped like an incense burner'; line 6), and Shi Jing 石鏡 (lit. 'the huge, round stone on the peak with a surface as smooth and bright as a mirror'; line 11).[346] Among all the mountains and waters, the poet sees the clouds are being moved by the wind, just like the sea waves. Then he describes the colours

---

[345] Zhuang Zi 莊子, "人世间 (The earthly world)," in *Zhuang Zi* 莊子 (c. 350 –250 BC; reprint, 武英殿二十四史 [Twenty-four history books published by Wuying Dian], Qing dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), no.8, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/zhuangzi/

[346] See Appendix 1.

of the mountains and water: two mountain peaks are golden (line 6), while shadows left by the mountains on surface of the lake water are dark and blue (line 4); the trees are green in the rosy clouds of dawn (line 7), and the clouds above the white rivers are yellow (line 9).

Li Bai uses his unique and passionate imagination to create the vastness of the poetic sphere. For example, the unit of measurement for the length of the mountains and rivers is ten thousand miles; the overlapping nine mountain peaks are so high that they reach the stars. Li Bai mentions in the poem that he saw the landscape at the top of a mountain, but probably only from an imagined 'heaven's view' one can see this poetic sphere. Moreover, by depicting the relentless running river and the colours of the moving clouds, the poet bestows on the magnificent poetic sphere another dimension to enhance the vastness, the dimension of time. Thus, the vast sphere is full of energy from various natural forces and in a state of relentless motion.

The third section, lines 10 to 14, is an expressive one, in which Li Bai writes that he hopes to enter the divine Daoist heaven. In this part, Li Bai mentions two persons, 'Sir Xie' in line 11 and Lu Ao 盧敖 (c. 275 –195 BC) in the last line. No historical record shows that Xie An had been to Mount Lu, while another Xie – Xie Lingyun 謝靈運 (385 – 433 AD) had and left six verses about Mount Lu. The 'Sir Xie' thus probably was Xie Lingyun, who was Xie An's descendent and a gifted poet of the Eastern Jin dynasty. Unlike Xie An, Xie Lingyun's political career was tragic because of the regime change from the Eastern Jin dynasty to the Liu Song (劉宋 420 – 479 AD) of the Southern dynasties (南朝 420 –589 AD); under the rule of Liu Song, he was unjustly convicted of treason and executed.[347]

Another person Li Bai mentioned was Lu Ao, who served the emperor Qin Shihuang (秦始皇, 259 –207 BC) as a minister. When Lu Ao realised that Qin Shihuang was a tyrant, he escaped from the emperor and disappeared into the deep mountains. In the ancient text

---

[347] Li Yanshou 李延壽, "謝靈運," in 南史 (The History of the Southern Dynasties) Vol. 19, (Tang dynasty), 中國哲學書電子化計劃 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), accessed 30 March 2022, https://ctext.org/280630

Huainan Zi (淮南子), Lu Ao was a figure in a famous parable.[348] It told how Lu Ao travelled to the far north and met an immortal man. Lu Ao told the man that he had travelled almost all the world alone and that the north was his final destination; he hoped to become a friend of this immortal man. But the immortal man told Lu Ao that the area Lu Ao had travelled was just one unnamed corner of the earth and beyond this unnamed area were the great waters with roaring sounds. Even though the immortal man himself could travel ten million miles in one move, he had not yet reached the great water. Then he asked Lu Ao, 'Isn't there much further to go? But you stopped [at the north].'[349] Lu Ao was shocked and crushed, and asked himself 'How sad is it that I have been travelling restlessly and thought that I have been to the farthest place, but actually I merely travelled within a few square foot?'[350]

Two kinds of interpretation of Lu Ao's role in the last line are frequently seen on many Chinese websites. The first is that Li Bai invited Lu Xuzhou, his friend, to tour Mount Lu with him. Another is that Li Bai hoped his friend would withdraw from official circles and pursue freedom with him in the unworldly, Daoist Mount Lu. The first reason for these interpretations is that the poem was addressed to Lu Xuzhou, who was an officer in the court, positioned as an attendant inspector. And Lu Ao and Lu Xuzhou share the same surname, leading some people to believe that Li Bai borrowed the surname of Lu Ao to refer to Lu Xuzhou and invited his friend to travel on Mount Lu. However, these interpretations miss the key meaning of the parable of Lu Ao.

First, in the parable, the immortal is a supernatural being, in a higher dimension than natural human, hence, he can tell Lu Ao how vast the world is and advise Lu Ao not to stop his exploration at the mere north. If Li Bai imagined his friend as Lu Ao, then he himself would be a Daoist immortal in a higher dimension than natural man, who then could have

---

[348] Liu An 劉安, "道應訓 (The Effect of Moral Behaviour)," in 淮南子 (*The Huainan Zi*), ed. Gao You 高诱 (c. 206 BC; reprint, 四部叢刊初編 [The First Published Version of Sibu Congkan], 景上海涵芬樓藏宋刊巾箱本 [Jing Shanghai Hanfenlou Collected Song Dynasty Portable Version], Song dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 12, no. 41, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/dao-ying-xun

[349] Liu, "道應訓 (The Effect of Moral Behaviour)," accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/dao-ying- xun.

[350] ibid.

had the ability to treat his friend a tour in Daoist heaven or advise him to pursue freedom on the Daoist Mount Lu. It would be rude and inappropriate for Li Bai to present himself as the Daoist immortal being and his friend as the shocked and crushed man Lu Ao. Second, in the parable, the places that Lu Ao and the immortal had travelled were hideous, such as Xuan Que 玄闕 and Tai Yin 太陰.[351] These are very challenging journeys and the two had to overcome their own limitations. These were not pleasant tours. Likewise, Li Bai's pursuit of Daoism is not an aesthetic journey and the practice of Daoism is not easy. It is not likely that the poet would invite his friend to join his journey, the difficult journey of becoming a Daoist immortal.

Last, in the last line of the poem, after lines of passionate description of the grandeur of the landscape of Mount Lu, and after lines of the expression of the poet's decision – to give up his political ambition in the human world, and to pursue Daoist divinity, it is not likely that, in the important last line of the poem, the poet suddenly changed his mood and invited his friend for a treat, a pleasant tour. Nor it is reasonable that the poet would suggest that his friend, who did well in his duties, should pursue an unworldly 'freedom' with him in the Daoist mountains. Looking back to the original ancient text, Li Bai intended to employ the meanings of the parable and Lu Ao's epiphany to express in the last line his aspiration to go on where Lu Ao had stopped and to endeavour to travel to the infinite Daoist universe.

Through the poem, from the first line to the last, the poet mentions Jie Yu, Xie Lingyun, and Lu Ao. Li Bai projected himself onto these three figures and the presences of the three figures marked the movement of his thoughts. From registering 'I am naturally like the madman of Chu', to memorialising Xie Lingyun, to wanting to continue Lu Ao's journey, there is a process of how the poet found his way to self-actualisation. And the splendid Mount Lu is the venue of his striving and pursuing, in his poetic imagination. For this study, the radical meaning of the poem is, thus, neither in the splendid sceneries of Mount Lu nor the poet's statement in the final line, but the dynamic situation of the poet's pursuit of self-actualisation in three different ways – the ways of Jie Yu, Xie Lingyun, and Lu Ao.

---

[351] The original Chinese: '太陰: 北極...玄闕, 北极之山..', in Ban Gu's 班固, 汉书 (*The history of Han*) (武英殿二十四史 [Twenty-four history books published by Wuying Dian], Qing dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 57, no. 24, 26, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/=533615

When Shtao picked – not recalled – Li Bai's poem, he must have actively gone through many poems of Mount Lu and choose this particular one, rather than simply having it to call on in his memory; hence, he must have intended something. However, the picture of *Mount Lu* shows that Shitao did not paint the vast landscape of Mount Lu as Li Bai described in the poem. Li Bai's poetic landscape is vast and splendid, comprising three groups of grand peaks – Jiudie Ping 九疊屏 (line 4), Shimen 石門 (line 5, described as 'two golden gatehouses'), and Xianglu Peak 香爐峰 (line 6), one bright lake (line 4), one spot – Shi Jing 石鏡 (line 11), one waterfalls – San Shiliang waterfall 三石梁瀑布 (line 5), the great Yangtze River (line 8), nine white rivers (line 9), one snow mountain (line 9), and many unnamed surrounding mountains and hills (line 6). But in Shitao's *Mount Lu*, all those mountains and peaks, lake, waterfall, spot, rivers can not be found, except Xianglu Peak 香爐峰; but the appearance and situation of Xianglu Peak 香爐峰 in *Mount Lu* is radically different from the Xianglu Peak Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad*. In line 6, Li Bai is poetically imagining that Xianglu Peak and the San Shiliang waterfall are facing and watching each other through distance; but in Shitao's *Mount Lu,* Xianglu Peak 香爐峰 is in a tiny shape, standing solely and distantly at the left corner, far behind the two central precipices and the Sandie Quan waterfall. Apparently, Shitao did not intend to illustrate the sceneries as Li Bai described in the poem.

Why, then, did Shitao choose this poem? The study found three reasons. First, Shitao transcribed the *Mount Lu Ballad* at the head of the painting to underline the identity of the landscape (Figure 68b). Shitao did not give the painting a title; the name '*Mount Lu*' was a description of the painting given by someone else and generally accepted. The transcription of the poem on the painting, for viewers who did not know Mount Lu and the iconic Sandie Quan, Wulao Peaks, and Xianglu Peak, one way of letting them know the setting is through Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad*.

Second, Su Shi 蘇軾 (1037 –1101AD) describes the role of poetry in ancient landscape painting: 'poem established a vision, painting delivered a poetic idea'.[352] It means that a good poem can establish a pictorial vision, and a good painting can deliver a poetic idea.

---

[352] The original Chinese written by Su Shi 蘇軾: '詩中有畫，畫中有詩', from "書王摩詰藍田煙雨圖 (Inscription on Wang Mojie's painting of light raining in Lan Tian)", in 蘇軾文集 *(Collected Proses of Su Shi)*, ed. Kong Fanli 孔凡禮 (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1982), 2209.

Su Shi connected the two different art forms of painting and poetry, and his thinking makes artists and audience aware that there can be a vision in a poem, and an idea in a painting. And the connection between the poem and picture in Shitao's *Mount Lu* is shown as: the text of the poem delivers an idea that Shitao could not present in the picture, and the picture echoes to the essential meaning of the poem – Li Bai's struggling on whether to go out the mountains to serve the government and people, or to go into the deep mountains to practice Daoism – by pictorially establishing a vast mountainspace, with peaks after peaks among the moving clouds, and also with an atmosphere of ambiguity and pressure.

Third, to express the meaning that Shitao could not present in the picture was probably the ultimate reason why Shitao picked *Mount Lu Ballad*. Shitao probably empathised with the ambivalent situation of Li Bai and at the time when he painted the work, he was probably experiencing the same kind of struggle. Therefore, transcribing the poem on the painting is a subtle expression of his inner feelings of ambivalence towards whether or not, or how, to withdraw from his political career. And transcribing the text of *Mount Lu Ballad* on the painting is both a compositional act and an expression of Shitao.

As previously mentioned, Shitao stayed in Mount Lu for one year and probably met and built a friendship with Bada at that place and that time. Li Bai addressed the poem to a friend and expressed his intention to pursue the Daoist divinity. It might not be a coincidence that Shitao picked this poem for *Mount Lu,* when he was in Beijing or shortly after leaving Beijing, when he had received Bada's letters that had advised him to leave the corrupt political circles, and when he was finding his solution on whether or not, or how, to return to be a *yimin*.

To conclude, through the postscript on the painting, Shitao stated his literal intention – to achieve pictorial effect as that Guo Xi had achieved in *Mount Lu* and in Shitao's own manner. By transcribing Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad* on the painting, Shitao indicated the identity of the place and meanwhile subtly expressed his ambivalence in the composition. No one can really know Shitao's entire compositional intention in his mind, but the painting is the objective result of it. Therefore, this study examines the picture itself next, to explore further the artist's compositional intention. In the following part, the study compares the physical landscape of Mount Lu with the pictorial landscape of *Mount Lu.*

Part 2: Comparing the Physical and Pictorial Landscapes of Mount Lu

1. Mount Lu and the first-hand experience of it

Mount Lu locates at Jiangxi province in southern China. Geological studies indicate that the mountains in the Mount Lu area are horst block mountains, shaped by the glacial movement. The ice eroded and therefore shaped the mountain bodies as arêtes, jagged peaks, and U-shaped valleys.[353] Mount Lu is to the south of the Yangtze River and west of Poyang Lake; plentiful waters flow over the landform, creating torrents that fall from the edges of the rock blocks. The climate is rainy and the air humid, causing the famous clouds and mist of Mount Lu. Geological and geographical interpretations of the topography of Mount Lu highlight three features: the mountains are majestic with steep ridges and jagged peaks; torrents and waterfalls run over the horst blocks and rock faces; and plenty of clouds and mist can be found around the steep peaks and in the deep valleys.

In terms of first-hand experience, I went to Mount Lu many years ago and the experience has become a distant memory; many details of my journey have faded. What I can recollect are the most impressive scenery and moments. I remember that on the top of a peak, in clear weather, I could see very far; the distant mountains looked small on the horizon, where the blue sky met the dark land. I also remember that it took more than three hours to cross a peak and walk down a steep path into a valley with many tourists, in order to see the Sandie Quan waterfall. I do not remember seeing the whole view of the waters running down three rock stairs (Figure 74) but I do recall seeing the waters of Sandie Quan waterfall falling into the small pool at the bottom of the valley. I also clearly remember that there was no high peak nearby as in the painting; instead, there was a huge rock with a

---

[353] Institute of Geology and Geophysics, Chinese Academy of Science Vol. 41, 地质科学(Geology), (Beijing: Kexue Chuban She, 2006), 419.

资源調查與環境 (Investigation into Natural Resources and the Environment) Vol. 28, Issue 4 (Nanjing: Nanjing Geology and Mineral Institute, 2007), 150–1.

P. Sirisha, "Block Mountains," Geography Notes, accessed 16 November 2021, http:// www.geographynotes.com

For the meaning of 'horst' see L.D. Stamp (editor), *A Glossary of Geographical Terms* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green, s, 1961), 539.

strange, twisted shape standing beside the falling water (Figure 77). At the bottom of the valley, I did not hear loud sounds of the waterfall, but I saw thin and light mists generated from the falling waters. In recollecting, I notice that the remained memories of Mount Lu are of the experience of being in the mountains with my companions. Therefore, in the memory, the landscape was not an empty form; there were active people in it, including myself and others who were being with me.

I stayed in Mount Lu for only a few days, while Shitao stayed in the mountains for one year. He was able to see the mountains and waterfalls many times in four seasons, in different weathers and moments of a day, from different angles and heights. My memory of Mount Lu is just some visions and 'video snippets'; In Shitao's memory, Mount Lu would be the sceneries consist of mountains, valleys, waters, trees, clouds and mist, together with the moments of his daily life and the experiences of being with some people in the mountains. Shitao must have known Mount Lu very well and could select sceneries and elements for his composition. Accordingly, the next section compares the physical landscape of Mount Lu with the painting *Mount Lu*, to reveal which landscape elements Shitao picked for the painting and how he used them, because these acts are the marks of his compositional intention.

2. Comparing the physical Mount Lu with *Mount Lu*

2.1 Wulao Peaks, Xianglu Peak, and Sandie Quan waterfall

Shitao painted the shapes of Wulao Peaks 五老峰 (lit. 'the five peaks like five old men') and Xianglu Peak and arranged them at the two sides of the central precipices in the distance. The two peaks are icons of the Mount Lu landscape but are in different places and cannot be seen together in reality (Figures 78 and 79). Shitao also painted the Sandie Quan waterfall. In reality, the waters fall down over three horst blocks on three levels, looked as if three massive irregular rock stairs on the huge body of the peak.

Note that Sandie Quan waterfall in Shitao's *Mount Lu* is not the San Shiliang waterfall in Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad.* First, a lengthy debate among scholars shows that the San Shiliang waterfall Li Bai described in his poem is not Sandie Quan waterfall. Scholar Li Jiong 李泂 (Yuan dynasty AD) stated that San Shiliang was not Sandie Quan, but the

Kaixian (開先, lit. 'the first') waterfall, on the southern side of Mount Lu.[354] Painter Fang

Yizhi 方以智 (1611–1671 AD) suggested that San Shiliang was the Baishui Cao (白 水漕,

lit. 'the white water thrutch') waterfall, as he quoted from Liu Tongsheng's writing.[355] As

introduced in the introduction part of this case study, Liu Tongsheng visited Mount Lu in

person and tried to find the place of the waterfall Li Bai described in *Mount Lu Ballad*.[356]

However, the scholar Wang Qi 王琦 (1696–1774 AD), who was an expert on Li Bai's

poetry, believed that San Shiliang was Sandie Quan. He assumed that Li Bai might use a

rhetorical method to depict the so-called San Shiliang, which could be a representation of

any waterfall in Mount Lu with the view of waters falling down three massive rock stairs, a

frequently seen scene in the Mount Lu area.[357] Other scholars claimed that Sandie Quan

was probably discovered in the Song dynasty, because in a letter written by the philosopher

Zhu Xi 朱熹 (1130–1200 AD) to his friend, he mentioned Sandie Quan and called it a

newly discovered waterfall.[358] That is to say the time of Sandie Quan first discovered by

people was in Zhu Xi's time in the Song dynasty, later than Li Bai's time (701–762 AD) in

the Tang dynasty; Li Bai probably did not see Sandie Quan and therefore could not write

about it in his poem.

---

[354] The original Chinese written by Li Jiong 李泂: '相传上有三石梁，横绝青冥，窅不见底，苔滑不可
度，度辄得遇异人', from "开先寺观瀑布记 (Viewing a waterfall at the Kaixian Temple)", in eds.
Zhou Luanshu 周銮书 and Zhao Ming 赵明, 庐山游记选 (*Travelogue Collection of Mount Lu*)
(Nanchang: Jiangxi Renmin Chuban She, 1996), 45–50.

[355] Rao Zongyi 饒宗頤, "方以智畫論 (Fang Yizhi on Painting)," 中國文化研究學報 (*Chinese Culture
Studies*), Vol.7, no.1 (December 1974), 124-125.

[356] About Liu Tongsheng's writing see Pages 176-7. The original Chinese written by Liu Tongsheng 刘同升:
'三石梁在含鄱又與五老峰之南峽, 其水出白水漕,下棲賢橋', in eds. Zhou and Zhao, 庐山游记选
(Travelogue Collection of Mount Lu), 77-79.

[357] Li Bai 李白, 李太白集注 (*Collected Works of Li Bai*), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese
philosophical ebooks), Vol.14, no. 6. accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/438340

[358] The original Chinese written by Zhu Xi 朱熹: '但間五老峰下新泉三疊頗為奇勝, 嘗托黃商伯, 陳和成
摹画以來, 摩莎素墨, 徒以慨嘆也', quoted by Qian Mu 錢穆, in 朱子新學案 卷三 (*New Studies on Zhu
Xi Vol.3*) (Chengdu: Bashu Shu She, 1986), 1849.

Wu Lifu 伍蠡甫, 山水與美學 (*Mountains and Waters in Relation to Aesthetics*) (Shanghai: Shanghai
Wenyi Shuban She, 1985), 416.

Zhou and Zhao, 庐山游记选 (*Travelogue Collection of Mount Lu*), 60–5.

The earliest historical records of Mount Lu appeared in *Shuijing Zhu* 水經注 (*Notes of Waters*), in which three scenic spots are mentioned: San Shiliang, Shimen Jian, and Shi Jing.[359] Later in *Lushan Ji* 盧山記 (*Records of Mount Lu*), the San Shiliang is recorded and described as 'three bridge-like long, huge stones on the rock face'.[360] Today, the San Shiliang and the Shi Jing have disappeared into the mountains. In the reality, waters of Sandie Quan waterfall fall down three massive rock stairs, which are apparently not long, huge bridge-like stones. Hence, according to my first-hand experience, the historical records, and previous studies, this case study indicates that San Shiliang waterfall in Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad* is not the Sandie Quan waterfall, while the waterfall in Shitao's *Mount Lu* is Sandie Quan, because Shitao represents its typical features in the painting (Figures 74-5).

In the painting, objectively, the depictions of Wulao Peaks, Xianglu Peak, and Sandie Quan can show the identity of the place to viewers who have visited or known the landscape of Mount Lu very well. However, the two peaks are painted as very small and placed in the far distance; moreover, half of the Sandie Quan waterfall is invisible – veiled by clouds and mist. The arrangement shows that the painter does not intend to make these three popular iconic elements the central components of the painting.

2.2 Longhu Shan

The two central precipices are the focus of the painting. They stand close together on the eastern side of the waterfall. The higher one stands straight, with a flat top; the lower one, whose head bends towards the east, with its top sagging in the middle. Appearance of the two peaks – flattened summits in a tabular shape with vertical fractures on the rock bodies – differs to the jagged peaks in the Mount Lu area. Moreover, according to the first-hand experience, in the reality, beside or around the Sandie Quan waterfall, there are not two

---

[359] The original Chinese written by Li Daoyuan 酈道元: '盧山上有三石梁, 長數十丈, 廣不盈尺, 杳然無底… 盧山之北有石門水，水出嶺端，有雙石高聳，其狀若門，因有石門之目焉…石鏡: 有一圓石, 懸崖明淨, 照見人形', from "盧江水 (The Lu Waters)", in 水經注 (*The Notes of Waters*) (欽定四庫全書 [The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor], Qing dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol.39, accessed 16 November 2021, https:// ctext.org/660112

[360] Chen Shunyu 陳舜俞, 盧山記 *(Mount Lu)*, Song dynasty, 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol.1, no. 8, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/65981

precipices as in the painting. Instead, there is a single huge rock on the slope, with a triangular top, a twisted body, and a layered rock formation (Figure 77), thus, again, the two central precipices were not an inventive or exaggerated depiction of the huge rocks or jagged peaks in the Mount Lu area.

Therefore, this case study has researched the special features of the two central precipices. First, their geological features are very like those of the Old Danxia Landform that appears in the landscape as isolated peaks, with flat tops, steep rock faces, and a monolithic shape, made by the erosion of the downward flowing water and gravity. Second, there is a typical Old Danxia Landform near Mount Lu – Longhu Shan 龍虎山 (lit. 'dragon and tiger-like mountains') area, only a few miles away from Mount Lu.[361] The landscape of the Longhu Shan area is astonishing and it is also a famous location for Daoist temples. In this area in reality, there are two peaks that just have the same shapes, postures, and rock formation as the two central precipices in *Mount Lu* (Figures 80 and 81).

In Shitao's *Huayu Lu*, together with Wulao Peaks and Xianglu Peak, he mentioned a peak named Tianma Peak 天馬峰 (lit. 'a great horse-like peak'), which is a well-known spot in the Longhu Shan area.[362] In the postscript mentioned before, Shitao does not limit his memory to Mount Lu, but stated that 'I recalled the memory of my travelling'. It is likely that Shitao travelled around during the year he was in Mount Lu, went to Longhu Shan and was impressed by the two peaks. The memories he recalled were hence not merely of Mount Lu.

For the painter's compositional intention, the two precipices indicate that Shitao selected the most impressive mountain peaks at or beyond Mount Lu in his memory and combined them in his painting. Thus, Shitao's intentional landscape was not the physical landscape of Mount Lu, but one inventively constructed in his mind.

---

[361] Jiang Jianjun, Zhao Xun, and Chen Youfang, "Geological Heritage in China," in *Geotourism,* eds. Ross Dowling and David Newsome (Oxford: Elsevier, 2006), 146.

[362] Shitao, 石涛画语录 *(Shitao's Analects on Painting)*, 8.

Lou Jinyuan 婁近垣, 龍虎山誌 *(Archives of LongHu Shan)* (Nanchang: Jiangxi Renmin Chuban She, 1996), 16, 212.

2.3 Jinxiu Valley

At the bottom of the painting are two figures standing on a massive rocky ledge overlooking the valley, which is filled with clouds and mist. This ledge is also an important component of the painting. Again, it cannot be found around Sandie Quan. Its shape and situation look like a part of the popular site at Tianqiao 天橋 (lit. 'a bridge to the sky') in Jinxiu Valley 錦繡谷 (lit. 'the scenery of the valley like a brocade') (Figures 82 and 83), located at the far west to Sandie Quan. The Jinxiu valley is the most scenic valley in the Mount Lu area, and Tianqiao the perfect standpoint for viewing the scenery. In the middle right of the painting, the scene looks like that seen from Tianqiao: clouds and mist spread and flow in the valley; above them, the summits rise up and the pine woods cover the two flanks of the valley. In the painting, Shitao inventively places this scenery of the Jinxiu valley under the Sandie Quan waterfall.

To summarise, Shitao selected the most iconic and conspicuous scenes and landscape elements for his composition, including Sandie Quan waterfall, Wulao Peaks, Xianglu Peak, Jinxiu Valley, and Long Shan, which are from or beyond the Mount Lu area, in order to achieve the pictorial effect as that Guo Xi had achieved but in Shitao's own manner. These compositional acts are the performance of Shitao's literal intention and indicate his compositional intention.

In the following sections, by experiencing the effects that the various landscape elements brought to the picture, this study demonstrates that the selected elements contribute not only to the pictorial effect Shitao stated in the postscript, but also to the formation of the vast pictorial space, through which the painter directly and indirectly expressed meanings not included in his literal intention.

Part 3: Composing *Mount Lu*

1. Structuring *Mount Lu*

1.1 The 'Z-structure'

To produce the pictorial effect of 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not', the painter needs to structure the painting, that is, to arrange from where and how the clouds and mist are emanating and vanishing, which precipices are visible and which invisible, and how to be visible and invisible.

In ancient Chinese landscapes, especially vertical hanging rolls, a frequently used pictorial structure is the Z-structure (following the Chinese character '之'), in which the composed complex of mountains or system of waters is presented in an irregular Z-structure, which fills the rectangular pictorial space with three linked parts; thus, enabling the painter to easily arrange the foreground, middle ground, and background.

The Z-structure can be used in various ways to create different pictorial effects, as in *A Solitary Temple Amid Clearing Peaks* attributed to Li Cheng (probably a copy made in the mid-eleventh century) and *Early Spring* by Guo Xi (Figures 84 and 85). In Figure 84, the foreground is the focus of the painting, with vivid trees in various positions, elegant architecture, and human figures. The mountain in the middle ground is the enlarged middle part of the Z-form and rises up behind the view of the foreground. The vertical lines form the mountain's body and its height, which is a strong *repoussoir* to, and a way of highlighting, the solitary, serene, and exquisite temple in the foreground. The distant peaks in the background are the highest point of the picture, creating an effect of vast space and enhancing again the solitary and exquisite temple in the foreground. The light clouds or mist are an indispensable element that separates the three parts of the Z-structure and also create various depths in the vast pictorial space.

In Figure 85, the complex of the mountains is in the Z-structure but the middle part is compressed with the mountains of the foreground. Light clouds separate the distant peaks from the central mountains in the middle ground, but the peaks and mountains unite at the

left turning-point of the Z-form. The clouds are the key element of this picture. In the reality, in the early spring to the south of the Yangtze River area (corresponding to the painting), vapour-like clouds emanate and spread in the mountains are well seen. Guo Xi entitles the painting *Early Spring* and underlines the earliness of the spring season in the painting, by representing the light and nimble clouds drifting and spreading in the mountains.

The mountains formed in Z-shape are a solid and a heavy *repoussoir* to the drifting and soft clouds, and the vague quality and loose texture of the clouds. The drifting light clouds move among the mountains, then some mountains are visible, some not. In the middle and foreground, the ridge, rocks, and trees are depicted with vivid detail and a moist texture, as if they are in the cool, moist air, at where the light clouds are vanishing. An exquisite part of the picture is at the left turning point of the Z-form, at where a part of the cloud holds itself back and another part winds into the rocks. The holding point of the mist was called 'a hollow' by Cahill, for it was an empty space among the rocks and trees.[363] However, when looking closely at the 'hollow', some trees and rocks are vaguely visible. Thus, the 'hollow' is not empty but the half transparent clouds, suspended in the air of the early spring, which are light, loose, and thus half transparent. This is a special, delicate half-visible element between the visible and invisible, in the landscape.

So, different ways of employing the Z-structure produce different pictorial effects and good effects are various and creative, not standard. For the two paintings, Li Cheng enlarges the middle part of the Z-structure and lifts the mountains high above the foreground, which creates a strong effect to highlight the solitary and elegant temple in the deep mountains. Guo Xi, however, compresses the middle and fore parts of the Z-structure, against which he paints the vivid light clouds emanating and vanishing in the mountains, to make some of the mountains being visible, some invisible. This is Guo Xi's achievement and his way of using the Z-structure.

Shitao calls the Z-structure the 'three layers with two parts'.[364] For him, 'layer' does not refer to the layers of ink or patterns on the painting, but the volume of one peak or a group of peaks, and its positional relationship with other elements in the picture. Shitao gives a

---

[363] Cahill, *Chinese Painting*, 38.

[364] See Appendix 2.

mechanical example of the 'three-layer' structure: the first layer is the mountains, the second the trees, and the third the mountains again. In doing so, the depth in the layers would present as only for separating the printed patterns. In regard to the 'two parts', an unsuccessful example would be: the mountains were simply arranged at the upper half of the picture, and the other scenes at the lower, with the rigid clouds between them. The result would be that the two separated parts lose connection with each other, and the mountains and waters would lose their vividness. Shitao remarks that these ways of structuring would not bring the breath of life into the picture; the right way is to learn from nature and to make the layers and parts naturally independent but also resonant with each other.[365]

Shitao's literal intention towards *Mount Lu* is to achieve the pictorial effect as that Guo Xi had achieved but in Shitao's manner. How did he fulfil his literal intention? The picture of *Mount Lu* shows that Shitao surpasses the Z-form and structures the painting in a much more creative and sophisticated way.

1.2 The pictorial structure of *Mount Lu*

The pictorial structure of *Mount Lu* consists of four layers of mountains and four layers of clouds and mist, not including the most distant mountains, which have two layers. The layers of mountain intertwine with the cloud and mist, and constitute a '彡' structure, which transcends the traditional Z-Structure and contributes to the presentation of Shitao's version of 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not'. And more importantly, the structure establishes two key dispositions of the picture: the great height and the complex distance.

1.2.1 The great height

There are 'two large-span elevations' for the viewers' eyes and mind in the pictorial structure to experience the height of the pictorial space. The elevations are raised by three sub-structures on three levels: the rocky ledge at the bottom, the group of three peaks at the middle right, and the two precipices in the upper centre.

---

[365] ibid.

The first elevation starts from the rocky ledge. Below it are floating clouds and mist that shroud the foot of the ledge and conceal the bottom of the valley, making the height of the ledge is uncertain thus looked as if standing high (sub-structure 1); consequently the start point of the first elevation is also looked as if high. The first elevation ends at the group of three-pointed peaks on the middle right. The three peaks are much higher, vertically above the rocky ledge, which makes the largest elevation for the viewers' eyes and feelings. The second elevation starts at the group of the three peaks and ends at the two central precipices, the culmination of the height of the mountains and the highest point of the picture. The two precipices are high above all the landscape elements in the picture, isolated and seemingly reaching the sky, making a strong statement that the mountains are outstanding visible and 'being the highest' in the pictorial space. The rocky ledge at the bottom, the group of three rising peaks in the middle, and the highest precipices together present a strong and multi-levelled effect of 'some mountains and peaks are visible'.

Moreover, the three peaks stand close together and rise one above another, creating another kind of height in the picture – the 'rising high' in a quick and dense rhythm (sub-structure 2). In contrast to the three peaks, the Sandie Quan waterfall (sub-structure 3) on the middle left comes a long way from far and high to near and low, falling down three rock stairs into the pool. The downward direction and long distance of the movement of the waters are the *repoussoir* to the three peaks' quick elevation, and visually strengthen the effect of the three peaks' rising.

Shitao makes three arrangements of the waterfall: the farthest part of it is hidden behind the three peaks; the three fallings are all presented as half-visible and half invisible among the voluminous clouds; moreover, the whole vision of the waterfall is shrouded by thin mists – the vanishing mists. These arrangements produce a subtle, shadowy *repoussoir* to the clear and strong appearance of the mountain peaks and their height, thus also contributing to the effect of 'some mountains and peaks are visible'.

Furthermore, in the overall pictorial space, Shitao arranges the clouds and mist in four volumes on four levels. The lowest is the mists at the foot of the rocky ledge; the second the mixture of clouds and mist in the valley in front of the ledge; the other two are the clouds wandering among the mountains and the highest volume is at the foot of the central

precipices. The spans between the four volumes are even. One by one, they provide the viewers' eyes with another experience of elevation.

Still further, the four volumes of clouds and mist (sub-structure 4) perform the motion of 'emanating', creating the effect of some peaks being visible, others invisible. The lowest volume of mists makes the valley as if bottomless. These mists are light-grey in colour and most look thick at the bottom of the painting, but some are floating up in the valley; thus, one branch of a pine tree above them on the right side of the gorge is half-concealed and half-visible. The lowest volume of mists show a silent and inert disposition, while the second-lowest volume of the clouds and mist looks lighter and more active, probably because their colour is brighter. The waving lines drawn by the painter indicate the second-lowest volume of clouds and mist are flowing in the valley like a river, in front of the rocky ledge. They emanate from somewhere outside the picture and flow into the picture from the right and out from the left, like a passer-by in the landscape, and conceal the depth and the two sides of the valley during their passing. The two higher volumes of clouds are emanating from within the mountain. Their texture is loose and flexible, presented by subtle light shades. The nimble curling lines make them a lively element in the picture – floating and circling among the mountains, making parts of the waterfall and the three peaks invisible. The two volumes of clouds are staying high in the picture, but can only linger under the foot of the two central precipices; thus, they play the role of a dynamic *repoussoir* to the strong and solid visible height of the two central precipices.

To summarise, in order to create the effect of 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not', Shitao first forms the strong and high appearance of the visible mountains and peaks, with two large-span elevations and the piling of various sub-structures; second, he bestows grandeur on the height of the mountainscape by making the valley looked as if bottomless and arranging the highest clouds under the foot of the two central precipices, which then looked as if reaching the sky. So, in order to create the certain pictorial effect in his own manner as he stated in the postscript, Shitao intended to constitute a vast pictorial space in *Mount Lu* and the great height discussed above is one constituent; the other one is the complex distance.

1.2.2 The complex distance

The complex distance is the key constituent of Shitao's version of the effect – 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not'. 'The distance' in the case study is the English translation of the Chinese word *yuan* (遠), which essentially means 'a very long distance'(horizontal), or 'a very long way'. In reference to a landscape painting, *yuan* first refers to the distance, the horizontal depth, and further refers to a 'subjective depth', 'the depth of thought or imagination', such as how far the painter can see in the physical landscape through eyes and how far the painter can imagine based on what is seen.

Guo Xi described *yuan* – 'the distance' – in landscape painting as three kinds: *gao-yuan* 高遠 (lit. vertical distance), *sheny-uan* 深遠 (lit. further distance), and *ping-yuan* 平遠 (lit. horizontal distance).[366] Another painter Han Zhuo 韓拙 described a different three kinds: *mi-yuan* 迷遠 (lit. misty distance), *kuo-yuan* 闊遠 (lit. broad distance), and *you- yuan* 幽遠 (lit. the vanishing distance).[367] There are many discussions of Guo Xi's and Han Zhuo's three kinds of *yuan.* The identification of this study is – Guo Xi's three kinds of *yuan* described the formation of 'the distance', constituted by the painter's viewpoint, direction, destination of seeing, while Han Zhuo's three kinds of *yuan* described the various situations of 'the distance', involving with the motions of clouds and mist (including 'cloudless' or 'not misty at all'). Presentations of 'the distance' in classical Chinese landscape paintings are more rich and diverse than the above six kinds and the important point is that some classical Chinese landscape painting values the disposition of or the

---

[366] Guo Xi 郭熙, 林泉高致(*The Elegance and Sublimity of the Forests and Springs*), ed. Guo Si 郭思, 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Song dynasty, no. 20, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/430059

[367] Han Zhuo 韩拙, 山水纯全集 (*Complete Works on Landscape Painting*) (欽定四庫全書 [The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor], 1121 AD), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), no.13, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/=598650

The translations of 闊遠 is referenced from Susan Bush and Hsio-yen Shih, ed., *Early Chinese Texts on Painting* (Hong Kong;London;: Hong Kong University Press, 2012), 170: 高遠 – 'high distance'; 深遠 – 'deep distance'; 平遠 – 'level distance'; 迷遠 – 'hidden distance', 闊遠 – 'broad distance'; and 幽遠 –'obscure distance'.

represented meaning in the distance, which is the focus of the painter's composition, and of the viewer's appreciation or experience.

Yuan in terms of Chinese landscape painting is not as clear and accurate as the English word 'distance' or 'depth'. In terms of perspective, depth means an objective depth, measurable, and linear – from a viewpoint to the end of the recess. By creating depth through perspective, a painter can present a pictorial illusion of three-dimensional depth on two-dimensional plane. The 'depth' in perspective and *yuan* in Chinese landscape painting indicate different ways of and intentions in seeing. As Minna Törmä indicated, the pictorial space in the ancient Chinese landscape paintings 'is always artificial, the result of a process of abstraction taking place in the artist's mind.'[368]

This case study perceives further the *yuan* in classical Chinese landscape painting as: it is about how far the painter can see in the physical landscape and how far the painter can imagine in mind based on what is seen; and more importantly, the creating of *yuan* is about how farer than the reality the painter can think, imagine, and then establish in the painting. Consequently, the painters' creating of *yuan* is involved with their subjective experience and their compositional intention, not in order to represent a realistic depth or volume of a space but to represent the subjective *yuan* constituted in their mind. That is to say, creating 'the distance' in a painting is a means of expression and painters create various forms of *yuan* for bestowing various dispositions into the picture, in order to project a subjective idea or express a meaning (in consequence, the spatial relationships among the landscape elements in the pictorial space may not be in a perfect consistency in the evaluation of perspective).

Comparing the classical ideas of *yuan* with *Mount Lu,* the study finds that 'the distance' that Shitao created is an innovative complex distance, a combination of 'vertical distance (高遠)' close by, 'misty distance (迷遠)' in the middle left, 'further distance (深遠)' in the middle right, and 'the vanishing distance (幽遠)' farthest away. The formation of 'vertical distance' has been exhibited in the structured height in the last section. For this section, the formation of the 'misty distance' is achieved by the use of clouds and mist, which hide

---

[368] Minna Törmä, 'Looking at Chinese Landscape Painting: Traditions of Spatial Representation', in *Looking at Other Cultures: Works of Art as Icons of Memory*, ed. Anja Kervanto Nevanlinna (Helsinki: Society for Art History in Finland, 1999), 125.

parts of the waterfall and mountains, delivering the atmosphere or feeling of uncertainty, like – If going through the misty distance, how distant, wild, dangerous, or peaceful the journey would be? The obstacle of the 'misty distance' in the painting thus stretches the viewer's experience of both seeing and perceiving and evokes more imaginings in the process of experiencing the picture.

The 'further distance' means to present what is behind the mountains. It is not an apparent horizontal depth in the picture, but hints at the multiple forward-behind relationships between the things. Usually, at least two objects behind the mountains can be presented in a painting: empty space and other mountains. In *Mount Lu*, the sub-structure 2 Sandie Quan is behind sub-structure 3 the three pointed peaks; the two central precipices are behind Sandie Quan; the farthest blue mountain silhouettes are behind the central precipices, and ultimately, what is behind the farthest mountain silhouettes is the space beneath the vast sky. Moreover, within the substructures, the three stairs of the Sandie Quan waterfall are laid out one behind another, likewise the three peaks and the two central precipices.

These compositional acts not only build more folds and layers of the mountains in the horizontal depth, but also produce various contrasts between the motions of the front elements and of other elements behind the front, making the depth of the pictorial space look more active, complicated, and uncertain. For example, if the two central precipices became one single precipice, or the three peaks became one peak, or the Sandie Quan waterfall was only presented with one falling, the momentums of the mountains and waters would lose their references or counterparts to struggle with; and motions in the landscape, the furtherance of the distance would then be greatly reduced.

Last, the farthest mountain silhouettes are the elements that comprise 'the vanishing distance', indicating where the pictorial depiction ends and the subjective imagination and contemplation start. The farthest little blue silhouettes look like the full stop of a poetic verse, deepening the depiction into the realm of the mind and asking the viewers how farer their mind can go.

The incorporation of various *yuan* – various distances – is frequently seen in ancient landscape paintings. The uniqueness of Shitao's *yuan* is his bold combination, and the grand height and complex distance make the pictorial space looked wild and peculiar. On

one hand, the highest point and farthest point defined the scale of the space but, on the other, the various horizontal depths struggled with the different heights within the space, simultaneously reducing and enhancing one another. Thus, the visual effect of 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not' was actively and vividly presented to viewers' eyes, an the essence of the effect – the dynamic situation of 'something visible and something invisible' – was successfully delivered through the dynamic ambiguous situation among the things. These compositional acts show that Shitao not only presented the effect he literally stated in the painting, but also represented his memory and perception of Mount Lu, and then subtly projected the complicated situation of his life and career.

For a phenomenological examination, the complexity of the distance in the picture provides the capacity to its viewers to experience the pictorial space with more possibilities, such as 'seeing as the painter'. To see the painting as the painter needs to find the painter's viewpoint. In ancient Chinese landscape paintings, especially large hanging rolls, the landscape scenes are not seen from fixed windows, or from the ground, placing all the landscape elements on the same level, as Törmä comments in her discussion of the way of perceiving depth in Chinese landscape paintings.[369] In *Mount Lu,* the painter's viewpoints are multiple and dynamic.

The main viewpoint of the painter is a virtual viewpoint in the mid-air at the level of the three peaks; accordingly, the rocky ledge and the figures are seen as if seen from above, and the central precipice as if seen from bellow. However, the viewer can also see the countenance of the standing figure, the right side of the sitting figure, and the fronts of the pine-tree trunks at the bottom of the picture; these would not be able to be seen from the level of the three peaks. Likewise, we cannot simultaneously see the farthest rock stair of the waterfall at the right and the farthest mountains at the upper left of the picture, at the level of the three peaks. These are all because the landscape is formed in the painter's memory, and the scenes are selected from various places in and around Mount Lu. The rocky ledge, the group of three peaks, the Sandie Quan, and the two central precipices are seen respectively by the painter and separately in reality; and the various viewpoints of the painter's seeing the things in reality are brought into the picture. In consequence, the painter's viewpoints in the painting are multiple and dynamic, like a camera on a drone – it

---

[369] Törmä, "Looking at Chinese Landscape Painting: Traditions of Spatial Representation," 131.

'flies' to one object to see it closely and then returns to the air to the main viewpoint, then flying to another object, and so on.

In summary, the pictorial structure in *Mount Lu* is not a still pattern but a structure in motion. As Li Bai uses verbs in his *Mount Lu Ballad* to poetically depict the momentum of the mountains and rivers, Shitao puts the pictorial structure in motion to depict the momentum of the mountains, waters, clouds and mist, to raise the grand height and to form the complex distance in the pictorial space. The motions in the picture are built first in the situation of the mountain peaks (some standing high, some rising up in groups, some standing solitary), second in the direction of their layering (piling up one above another and overlapping one behind another), and finally in the momentum of the sub-structures (eg the strong elevation of the peaks, the subtle falling of the waters, and the gentle following and drifting of the clouds and mist).

Moreover, Shitao gives the motions various dispositions (essential or natural qualities) to unify the pictorial structure in a dramatic atmosphere and complicated situation, making the pictorial structure expressive and meaningful. The motion Shitao created in both the solid mountains and the moving clouds and mist produces the the situation – 'being visible or invisible' – in the painting by forming the vision of 'the visible and invisible'. Without motions and dispositions, even with one hundred layers one above another, the structure would be a mere geometric pattern, not vivid and expressive. Therefore, Shitao made the effect – 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not' – in *Mount Lu* simultaneously grandeur in the whole and vivid, active in details, by creatively structuring the grand height and the complex distance; in doing so, Shitao effectively produced a dramatic and complicated visual effect in the picture. To a large extent, the pictorial structure and effect of *Mount Lu* transcend the artist's literal intention. It totally differs from Guo Xi's landscapes and Shitao created an outstanding and unique phenomenon of Mount Lu in the painting. Perhaps for Shitao, *Mount Lu* is one practice of his *fa*, his own manner; because he did not repeat this brilliant form in his other works latter.

2. Expressing via pictorial elements

In *Mount Lu,* figures, trees, and seal-marks are important elements in creating the atmosphere of the pictorial landscape. Moreover, they are the artist's intentional objects, indispensable elements for the artist's direct and indirect expressions in the painting.

2.1 The figures

The figures in the painting are key elements for the pictorial effect and artist's expression. There are two figures, interpreted in previous studies as follows:

1) They are Shitao and his monastic brother, He Tao 喝濤;

2) The standing figure is a Shitao/Li Bai figure, or the Daoist Shitao; and

3) The standing figure is Shitao himself.[370]

The first interpretation may come from a poem by Men Qing 梅清 (1623–1697), a friend of Shitao and He Tao. One line in the poem records that the two brothers went to Mount Lu together.[371] However, this can only evoke an association between the painting and the two brothers, not evidence that the two figures are Shitao and He Tao. Let alone it is not known how long He Tao stayed in Mount Lu with Shitao. Moreover, when Shitao travelled to Mount Lu with He Tao, the pair were both monks, so would not keep hair and would wear the robe of monk; but the two figures in the painting both have a hair bun and do not wear the robe of monk. What the two figures wear is probably the 'casual robe in Daoist style (*daopao changfu* 道袍常服)', common daily clothing for ordinary people in the Ming

---

[370] 1) Hay, *Shitao: Painting and Modernity in Early Qing China*, 309;|
Wang Yaoting 王耀庭, "A Study of Shitao's Small Self-Portrait Planting a Pine: With a Discussion of His Self-Image," The National Palace Museum Research Quarterly 32:1 (2014), 12, 17.

2) Hay, *Shitao: Painting and Modernity in Early Qing China*, 268, 270.

3) Cahill, *Chinese Painting*, 182; *The Compelling Image*, 208;
Jason Kuo, "Word and Image in *Watching the Waterfall at Mt. Lu* by Shih-t'ao", *National Palace Museum Bulletin,* Vol. 28, no. 5, November-December 1993, p.6.

[371] Xu, 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*), 564.

dynasty (Figure 86, 87).[372] The appearance of a monk-robe would be in a loose shape with very wide cuffs (Figure 88). Moreover, Shitao was in Mount Lu in 1650 at the age of twenty-one, but the two figures both look like middle-aged men.[373] It is unlikely that Shitao intended to depict he and He Tao's experience of Mount Lu.

The second interpretation, according to Hay, is that the standing figure could be a Shitao/Li Bai figure: not only is the transcription of Li Bai's poem on the painting an implication of this, but also Shitao had a self-conscious tendency to place himself in the centre of a painting, to reflect his 'authentic self' and the 'psychically isolated individuality'.[374] Thus, the standing figure is 'Shitao in the persona of Li Bai'.[375] To some extent, Hay's point of view echoes Jason Kuo's interpretation, that suggests the standing figure relates to Shitao because Shitao is a Daoist, and relates to Li Bai because of Li Bai's self-expectation expressed in *The Ballad of Mount Lu* – to be an immortal Daoist in the future. And the link between Shitao and Li Bai is 'being an immortal Daoist', represented by the figure's feet in a wisp of cloud or mist in the picture.[376] The feet look as if they are dissolving in the cloud, and therefore the body the figure looks as if it is suspended in the air – the sign of an unworldly Daoist immortal.

The case study agrees with the third interpretation, which is that the standing figure represents Shitao, not Shitao in Li Bai's image, or Li Bai in Shitao's image, even though there was something in common between Shitao and Li Bai. As mentioned before, Shitao may have had the same ambivalence as Li Bai on whether or not to withdraw from political circles and an official career. It is also true that Li Bai implied his inner feelings of ambivalence in his poem and Shitao transcribed the poem to borrow Li Bai's expression. However, what the standing figure presents is a different expression.

---

[372] Zhou Xun 周汛 and Gao Chunming 高春明, 中国衣冠服饰大辞典 (*Chinese Clothing Dictionary*), (Shanghai: Shanghai Cishu Chubanshe, 1996), 103.

[373] Fu, 明末石濤上人朱若極年譜 (*The Chronicle of the Eminent Monk Shitao, Zhu Ruoji, of the Last Years of Ming)*, 14.

[374] Hay, *Shitao: Painting and Modernity in Early Qing China,* 270, 276, 308–9.

[375] ibid., 268.

[376] Kuo, "Word and Image in Watching the Waterfall at Mt. Lu by Shih-t'ao," 6.

The pictorial facts do not show that the standing figure, the imagined self of the painter, is linked to Li Bai, neither as poet or Daoist. If the cloud at the figure's feet is the sign of an unworldly immortal Daoist and the figure represents the immortal Daoist Li Bai, a question arises: as Li Bai writes in the poem that an immortal Daoist would no longer care any more about the earthly things and the earthly world, then why the figure looks downward, thinking or contemplating with a heavy heart, when he has already been an unworldly immortal? A man who still has worldly cares could not practise Daoism, let alone have the Daoist immortal ability of suspending or bodily dissolving in the cloud. Sirén writes that Shitao's 'connection with the monastic order seems...to have been a matter of practical convenience rather than the result of religious devotion'.[377] That may be the relationship between Shitao and Daoism. Therefore, regarding *Mount Lu*, the relationships of Shitao and Li Bai to Daoism are: Li Bai decided to pursue the Daoist immortality, as was expressed at the end of the poem; while Shitao sought to be free from the politicised monastic order through converting to Daoism, which was just an idea and had not happened yet when the painting was composed. In summary, first, the standing figure is not a Daoist immortal, because he still cares about the human world very much; hence it is not the Daoist immortal Li Bai with reference to the last line of the poem. Second, the standing figure seems in an ambiguous situation, to some extent similar to Li Bai's inner feelings of ambivalence, as hinted at in lines 1, 11 and 12 of the poem. However, Li Bai's poem is about how he solved his ambiguity, while Shitao's painting subtly expresses he is in the ambiguous situation. This leads to a further question: if the standing figure projects not the immortal Daoist Li Bai or Shitao, then why are the figure's feet covered with cloud as if they are dissolving or the body is suspended in the air?

The answer is that the standing figure is the imagined self of Shitao standing in front of his memory of the landscape of Mount Lu and his perception of his own complicated situation. The cloud at the figure's feet is a sign of 'in memory' or 'in self-reviewing', as in the postscript, Shitao writes that he recollected his memory of travelling to paint the work. Shitao does not say that he recollected the 'vision' of Mount Lu but 'his travelling', which is an experience of being-in-the-landscape in memory, just like the standing figure is **being in** the pictorial landscape. Cahill's interpretation that the standing figure is Shitao himself is convincing, while Hay's is convincing on one point – that Shitao intends to put himself

---

[377] Siren, *Chinese Painting Leading Masters and Principles Vol.5*, 157.

in the centre of the picture, but the reason for this is more complicated than self-consciousness, as Hay speculated.

In addition, the clothing of the standing figure is neither a monk's robe nor the typical Daoist robe, but the daily clothing of ordinary people in the Ming dynasty – a 'casual robe in Daoist style'. Shitao painted himself in such clothing in some paintings. Religion was Shitao's sanctuary in his turbulent life: Buddhism saved his life when he was a child, as a prince born of Ming during the invasion of Qing; and Daoism saved his integrity as a *yimin* of Ming in the court of Qing, when he almost became a subject of the Qing empire – an empire built on the violent conquest of the Han people and served by many morally corrupt Han officials, like Muchen Dao Min. Throughout his life, Shitao could only wear just two kinds of clothing: the monk's robe when he was a monk, and the Daoist robe when he was a Daoist. Why, then, did Shitao sometimes paint himself in daily wear of ordinary people in the Ming dynasty in his landscapes?

One historical fact is that, in the early Qing period, the government violently forced Han males to wear their hair in the Qing style – shaving most of the hair on the head and braiding the rest at the back of the head, and banned the Ming style – binding the hair and make a bun on the top of the head. The wearing of Qing clothing was also enforced (Figures 89 and 91), but the monks and Daoists could keep their own customs and hairstyles.[378] Some Han people, especially the *yimin* literati, chose to convert to Buddhism or Daoism in order not to be forced to wear the Qing style (Figures 88 and 92). In southern China, some of the Han *yimin* literati did not convert to Daoism, when they painted themselves, or were painted by like minded painters, their figures were nevertheless painted wearing the casual robes of the Ming with an exaggerated Daoist style (Figures 90 and 91). Hence, there are two possible reason for Shitao's painting himself in a 'casual robe in Daoist style': one is that he had already converted to Daoism then he could wear the 'casual robe in Daoist style' for daily practice (he could not wear it when he was a monk); the other is that Shitao chose to paint the figure of himself in Ming clothing, which is probably the right reason. Shitao would have not converted to Daoism when he painted

---

[378] Zhu Chengru 朱诚如, 清朝通史, 卷5, 康熙朝 (*Qing History: Vol. 5 Kang Xi*), (Beijing: Zijincheng Chubanshe, 2002), 580;

    Zhou Xun 周汛. 中国歷代服饰 (*Chinese Fashion Through Ages*), (Shanghai: Xuelin Chubanshe, 1996), 260.

the painting and the reason is in the seal-marks, discussed in Pages 217-18. In summary, the standing figure on the ledge, with clouds around his feet, in daily wear of ordinary Ming people, represents the artist's imaged self, the present Shitao, a monk, not a Shitao/Li Bai figure, not converted to Daoism yet.

The reasons for interpreting the standing figure as the imagined self of Shitao in his memory are also in the standing figure's situation. In the picture, the standing figure is at the edge of the rocky ledge, which is a position from where to see the mountains and waterfall in the front; but he looks at the clouds and mist in the valley instead. Burkus-Chasson indicates that the standing figure's gesture is an expression of denial or holding back. For this study, it is a gesture of contemplating, which makes the standing figure independent from his surroundings. The sitting figure is at the other edge of the rocky ledge. He does not have a heavy heart and is simply waiting or resting. The space between the two figures is inactive because there is no communication between them; they seem not even to have realised each other's existence. Moreover, the cloud concealing the standing figure's feet is an illogical item in the picture as it is not moving like, or connecting with, other clouds, merely lapping around the standing figure's feet on the rocky ledge. It is made exclusively for the standing figure. Kuo is correct to perceive it as an unnatural element. It makes the standing figure independent from his surroundings and becoming a figurative representation of the artist's mind; or it makes the standing figure as if the imaged self of Shitao landing on the remembered rocky ledge in memory.

In relation to the pictorial effect of the painting, the wisp of cloud extends the complicated depth of the pictorial space to the dimension of deep memory, or to the past to which Shitao could never return. The standing figure therefore does not need to see the mountains and waterfall in front of him because the whole landscape is in his mind. He stands there for the purpose of reviewing inwardly, reviewing the landscapes he has travelled and comparing the self in his memory with the ambiguous self at the present. More importantly, the pictorial effect of the standing figure is two-fold: on one hand, it is the focus of the complicated and ambiguous landscape; on the other, it gives a calm state to the core of the ambiguous landscape, by its contemplative, or self-reviewing, posture. This effect is beyond Shitao's literal intention, but is an intentional effect created by the artist.

2.2 The trees

In the physical location of Mount Lu, the forest cover of the mountains consists of pines and other trees. It is natural that Shitao painted pine trees in *Mount Lu*. Nevertheless, in the tradition of Chinese literati painting, the pine trees as cultural symbol have a special meaning, which started from Confucius' famous line, 'In the cold winter, the evergreen of pine trees was known'.[379] Since then, the evergreen feature of pine trees was used to symbolise the virtue of the moral gentleman. The painter Huang Gongwang 黃公望 (1269–1354 AD) suggested how to symbolically use 'the pine trees' and 'the miscellaneous trees in painting: 'Do not paint the exposed roots of pine trees, which symbolises the moral gentlemen are out of the court; and miscellaneous trees symbolise "the precipitous villains holding sway"'.[380]

In the Yuan dynasty, a *yimin* of Song named Yang Zhuxi 楊竹西 (b.1283 AD) decided to become a recluse after the end of the Song dynasty. The painter Wang Yi 王繹 (b. 1333 AD) made a portrait of him, and Ni Zan added a single pine tree and some rocks beside the figure, to mark the character of Yang Zhuxi (Figure 93). This is one way in which the *yimin* literati painters used pine trees as a pictorial language.

Mount Lu depicts two groups of pine trees. The first group is two pine trees surrounded by 'miscellaneous trees', at the bottom right, on a mountain slope to the east of the rocky ledge. Between the pine trees and the rocky ledge is a gorge, which is covered by mist and leaves and branches of the trees. The second group is at the north of the rocky ledge, across the misty valley. Most of the trees are concealed by the flowing clouds and mist; only some treetops can be seen, showing them as pines. Shitao arranges the first group of pine trees behind the rocky ledge and the second group in front of the rocky ledge, thus the figure on the rocky ledge cannot reach either of them. There is only one tree on the ledge, not a pine tree, but one of 'the miscellaneous trees'. The state of the pine trees seems uneasy, but so

---

[379] The original Chinese written by Confusion: '歲寒, 知松柏之後凋也', from "Zihan 子罕", in *Lun Yun* 論語 (480–350 BC; reprint, 武英殿十三经注疏 [Thirteen classics with notes published by WuYing Dian version], Qing dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), no. 29, accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/analects/zi-han

[380] The original Chinese: '松樹不見根，喻君子在野，雜樹喻小人崢嶸之意', quoted by Fu, in 傅抱石美術文集續編 (*The Sequel to the Collected Works of Fu Baoshi on Fine Art*), Kindle book location 503.

do the 'miscellaneous trees'. The pines are not the focus of the painting, and the meaning of them in the painting is ineffable. For the pictorial effect of the painting, the states of the pines are in contrast with the states of the 'miscellaneous trees', which enhances the complicated atmosphere around the standing figure.

2.3 The seal-marks

Seal-marks are indispensable in classical Chinese landscape painting. Usually, painters use two or three seals on a painting. The seal-mark with white characters is considered the signature and the text contains the painter's name. Other seal-marks many have red characters. If two seal-marks appear in a row, one would have white characters and the other with red.[381] There is usually a seal-mark at the corner of the inscription, made by a style-seal (non-signature seal, see Footnote 265, Page 155).

On *Mount Lu,* at the end of the inscription Shitao signed his style name, Qingxiang Chenren Ji, and used two name-seals under the signature. The upper seal-mark is oval with white characters – '*Kugua Heshang Ji Huafa* 苦瓜和尚濟畫法', meaning 'the painting manner of the bitter Kugua Monk'. This seal-mark presents Shitao's monastic name, thus indicating that when Shitao painted the work his was still a monk, not a Daoist. The meaning of the text in the seal-mark underlines Shitao's manner of painting, echoing Shitao's literal intention as stated in the postscript – to paint the work in his own manner. Shitao's selection of this seal to sign the work indicates that he thought *Mount Lu* was successfully painted in his manner. The lower seal-mark is rectangular with red characters – 'Laotao 老濤', meaning 'the old Tao'. The two seal-marks comprise Shitao's signature on the painting and underline his monk identity, as well as his own manner used to paint the work.

At the bottom right corner of the inscription, at the end of the first line, overlapping with the written characters, Shitao used a style seal; the mark is square with red characters, which read '*Soujin Qifeng Da Caogao* 搜盡奇峰打草稿', meaning 'searching every peculiar peak to draw the draft of my paintings'. The text describes his painting manner – to draft the painting by searching and sketching the most conspicuous mountain peaks in

---

[381] Fu, 傅抱石美術文集續編 (*The Sequel to the Collected Works of Fu Baoshi on Fine Art*), Kindle book location 628, 638.

nature, showing that Shitao would not simply copy the natural landscape in his painting, but that his drafts came from nature. This is another echo of his literal intention and again underlines his own manner.

For the research of *Mount Lu*, I have only seen a digital picture, in which the first oval signature seal-mark with white characters is not clear enough for further examination. Since seal-marks are essential for identifying the authenticity of the work, this case study remains 10% uncertainty to the genuineness of Shitao's work, in the condition of the mere examination to the digital photograph; and further study based on seeing the original work in person may change the initial identification. However, it is a great artwork; and the painter's abilities are demonstrated in the structure, form, content, expression, and techniques of the painting. The artistic achievement of the painting is objective, thus, the study's view of the painter's compositional intention and the meaning of the picture is still tenable. If the painting were a high-quality copy of the original by Shitao, then the outcome of the study would still be relevant to Shitao, because the copier must reduce his own manner, style, and characteristics to almost nothing, in order to allow Shitao's manner and compositional intention to guide the copyist's hand. The duty of an academic interpreter is to treat the painter ethically, thus, this study registers the issue of the seal-mark in the digital photograph of *Mount Lu*.

2.4 The brush and *mo*

Shitao intended to paint *Mount Lu* in his own manner. The use of certain techniques was one component of his own manner and marked out his compositional intention. *Mount Lu* shows that the painter successfully combined different methods of using brush and *mo* to depict the various textures of rock, water, cloud, and mist. As mentioned before, for ink painting, at least five degrees of hue can be generated from the using of *mo*. In *Mount Lu*, by adding a light brown colour to the hues of *mo*, from the brightest light on the top of the central precipices to the darkest pine needles and cracks on the rocks, Shitao produced eight or nine hues in the painting. The brushstrokes are in various hues from light grey to dark black; when they overlap on the rendered *mo* and light brown, they made even many varieties of hue, forming the nuances of crags and cracks on the rocks and layers of clouds. The pictorial effect is vivid, and the details of natural elements are correctly represented in

fine quality. Perhaps it is for this reason that many viewers remark *Mount Lu* as a realistic painting.

The use of *cun* 皴, in the painting is also rich and creative. The English translation of *Cun* can be found as 'texture stroke'; but for the point view of this study, the exact meaning of this technique is that using the side of the brush, not the top, to draw irregular strokes with various qualities, by applying uneven pressure on the brush with relatively drier *mo*. The texture of *Cun* is irregular and uneven and can be used to depict the rough surface of objects, like rocks or tree trunks. By creatively employing *cun* and its variations, Shitao depicts the mountain peaks in *Mount Lu* with various appearances and textures. For example, Shitao used long *pima cun* 披麻皴, which is usually translated as 'hemp fibre texture stroke', but for this study it means that the strokes, like many hemp fibres, are spreading on the surface); he used long *pima cun* on the formation of the three peaks to create an elevating rhythm. Another example is his using of *fupi cun* 斧劈皴, which is usually translated as 'axe-cut texture stroke', but for this study it means that the strokes fabricated a surface as if being heavily and quickly cut by an axe; Shitao used the downward perpendicular *fupi cun* on the dark sides of the three peaks and the central precipices, to make an almost geological depiction of the rock formation in shadow.

Shitao also used *cun* together with *ca* (擦, lit. 'washing' or 'rubbing'), to produce various subtle patches on the surface of the natural things to convey their texture and quality. To some extent, the painting shows that Shitao inherited some old masters' manner of painting and characteristics, such as the momentum of the mountains and the rough quality of the rocks in Fan Kuan 范寬's landscapes, the desolate disposition of the waters in Ni Zan's, and the expressive state of the trees in Mei Qing's. The performance of various techniques shows that Shitao may have intended to demonstrate that his techniques were more than sufficient to create the effect of 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not'; and he was almost at the edge of overplaying his ability to structure and to operate the brush and *mo*. In the pictorial effect of the painting, the various brushstrokes of *cun* that finely hold the various shades of *mo* within the pictorial structure create the appearance of ambiguity in the picture.

For Chinese ink painting, brush and *mo* are the traces of the painter's compositional intention and the traditional way to study the original painting. It is unfortunate for this

case study that it can only study Shitao's use of brush and *mo* in the digital picture. The brushstroke of a painter is like handwriting; tiny details could represent the painter's character and expression. Without seeing the original painting the study did not know what and how many details may have been missed.

To summarise, key pictorial elements in *Mount Lu* reinforce the pictorial effect and are the devices that convey the meaning the artist's expressed; the figures in the picture are key to the artist's expression; the trees may symbolise some particular expressions in the painting; the seal-marks recapture the artist's statements; and the brush strokes and shades of *mo* fabricate the qualities and textures of natural things that are the foundation of the landscape. In contrast with Guo Xi's *Early Spring,* which reflected the artist's perception of the natural mountains in the early spring, the using of pictorial elements in Shitao's *Mount Lu* reflects the artist's perception of both external circumstances and the state of his inner mind.

Mount Lu is made wild and grand by the dispositions the painter bestowed on the pictorial elements – the grandeur of the height, the complex distance, and the isolation and calmness of the standing figure. Then the landscape has the capacity to express something invisible and abstract through these visible dispositions, by projecting the artist's experiences of an external pressure, or of a complicated and ambiguous situation, onto the appearances of the natural things. Moreover, the dispositions of the grand and wild are the *repoussoir* to the calmness of the standing figure and his solitary, when he is in the deep contemplation, or in the process of decision-making – to be high or low, distant or central. In summary, the dispositions that Shitao bestowed on the momentum of the landscape elements, on the standing figure, and on the textures of brushstrokes and shades of *mo* make the painting meaningful, because they are capable to be the figurative representations of the abstract matters of human mind and feelings.

Part 4: Experiencing *Mount Lu*

The first picture of *Mount Lu* I saw was the black and white picture in a printed book (Figure 97).[382] My first glance was attracted by the two central precipices and ignored the inscription, because on the page the inscription was very small and not easy to read. The black and white picture reduces many nuances of colour and shades, but the two central precipices look peculiar. My first-time encounter could be considered in the situation of *époché* and *réduction,* because at that moment I did not read the inscription and had not started to study the painting yet.

Most mountains in paintings represent the movement of 'rising up', but the two precipices in *Mount Lu* do not. To my first experience of seeing, they show the quality of having been standing up high for thousands and millions of years and one of them is wearing away owing to time and natural forces. The two stand close but their characters differ. The one behind is straight and stable with a calm disposition; its top is not entirely flat but slightly arched on the left, as if full of inner energy. The front one looks withered; its top sags and its body bends from heavy erosion. Thus, the two precipices respectively represent 'being high' and 'persisting in being high'. If the two were both powerfully standing high, they would not be so striking and the trigger of the striking is the appearance of the bending precipice, which evokes perception of the cost and difficulties of 'persisting in being high' and the inevitable erosion from nature. But the disposition, or inner quality, of the straight precipice standing behind gives the viewers a compensation for the negative feeling generated from the withering of the front precipice. The two precipices are positioned at the highest point of the picture, high above the complicated and dramatic pictorial space, as if at both the start and end of the journey of the painter's intentional mind.

The group of three peaks looks striking in the black and white picture. Shitao depicts them by using long *pima cun* with *mo* and light brown colouring. One on top of another, the brushstrokes pile up and bring forth the rhythm of elevation, from the mountain foot to the top. The elevation is simultaneously accentuated by their oblique posture and burdened by their material volume and heaviness. Moreover, their motions and rhythm are entirely different from the two central precipices above. The height of the central precipices is

---

[382] *Min Shin No Kaiga*, eds., Tōkyō Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan (Kyōto: Benridō, 1964), 81.

characterised by 'have been being high' and 'persisting in being high', while the elevation of the three peaks is characterised by 'striving to rising' and 'becoming higher'. Also, the central precipices are isolated, while the three peaks are in-between the complicated surroundings, and under the central precipices and behind the three peaks, the long waters are falling down on three huge stairs among the clouds silently, as if witnessing the isolated being high and the striving of becoming higher.

When I saw the high quality digital colour picture of *Mount Lu* on a laptop screen later after, I have done the investigation on previous studies of Shitao and his art. The experience of seeing hence could not be considered in a perfect situation of é*poché* and *réduction.* What I did was focussing on the picture and the pictorial elements and letting them direct my seeing as far as possible. In this time, my eyes were drawn by the standing figure and I perceived that the rocky ledge was likely an isolated island in a perilous situation. The ledge is sheer in shape and its rough flank shows that the ledge was brutally separated from another mountain body. In front of the ledge and the standing figure, the dense clouds and mist follow in the valley, unlikely to disappear very soon. Behind the ledge at the bottom of the painting, the depth of the gorge is uncertain, covered by trees in the mist. Whereas the tiny figures on the rocky ledge are below the overwhelming pressure made by the highest precipices and the three oblique peaks. The only path in the landscape is the narrow back of the rocky ledge at the bottom left corner of the picture, steep and veiled by thin mist. It is the way by means of which the figures climbed onto the ledge, and hints at the only way to leave the perilous situation and hostile environment.

Moreover, I perceived that the figures on the rocky ledge are in a dramatic climate, caused by the trees. Two pine trees are surrounded by three 'miscellaneous trees', two of which have leaves in grey and light black shades, suggesting autumn yellow or winter brown; while the pines' needles are dark green. The postures of the two 'miscellaneous trees' are peculiar: the higher one almost reaches the top of the ledge, but hides under the edge; the lower one is falling, with its crown almost upside down. One miscellaneous tree is above the two pines, with leafless wild branches, which reinforce the season as autumn or winter and the cold climate. It appears as if to be pushed obliquely by a strong wind, but the wind seems not to be reaching the sole gaunt on the ledge across the gorge, because the leafless branches of the giant tree show that they are not in a strong wind. The bending of the gaunt tree on the ledge appears to have been made in the process of its growth. The only trees

standing normally and clearly seen are the two pines. Therefore, the pictorial effect is that all of the trees have created a windy, cold, and harsh climate around the rocky ledge, as if playing out a noisy drama behind the standing figure.

Meanwhile, the standing figure is calm, in his contemplation. He stands straight, but with no tension, looking at the clouds and mist in the deep valley, but not frowning. He is aware of the climate, but not surprised. The wisp of cloud at his feet is mysterious and almost comic, to my perception, as if the artist, with perceptive mind and experienced heart, is looking at the figure's looking. The unnatural cloud on his feet hints at the figure's mental movement in time – the present going back to the past. The figure can remain calm because the complicated and dramatic situations are in the figure's mind and perception, not a surprise. Then the strength of the figure's calmness can be perceived, a strength of the calmness and courage of self-reviewing in the ambiguous, complicated, and risky situation.

Finally, to the left and right of the central precipices, I recognised that the little, light-blue, distant mountains are Xianglu Peak and Wulao Peaks; though little, their colour and situation are the elements that bring peace and ease into the picture.

Occasionally, my experiencing of the painting stopped on the two volumes of cloud in the air. In many landscapes, clouds usually function as a separation between the mountain layers; but In *Mount Lu,* I perceived that the clouds in the air are not like the mist in the valley, which flow into the landscape and then flow out. On the contrary, the clouds in the air circle and wander among the mountains, with no signing of drifting out of the picture. This evoked an association with the well-known verse of Tao Yuanming: 'the clouds have no intention to fly out from their recesses, and the birds think of returning home when they are tired of flying [in the foreign skies]'.[383] This may not be the intentional effect of the painter, but it is not entirely impossible that Shitao painted *Mount Lu* when he was thinking of leaving the court of Qing and returning to the home in southern China, as Tao Yuanming had done more than a thousand years before.

---

[383] The original Chinese written by Tao Yuanming 陶淵明: '雲無心以出岫，鳥卷飛而知還', from "歸去來辭 (Returning Home)", in 箋註陶淵明集 (*Collection of Tao Yuanming's Works with Notes*) (Jin dynasty; reprint, 四部叢刊初編 [The First Published Version of Sibu Congkan], 景上海涵芬樓藏宋刊巾箱本 [Jing Shanghai Hanfenlou Collected Song Dynasty Portable Version], Song dynasty), 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 5, no. 2, accessed 3 November 2021, https:// ctext.org/=189448

On the two occasions of seeing the painting, my view was first attracted by the conspicuous precipices and peaks. I perceived the wildness and ambiguity of them and the experience was not pleasant but frustrated by the question – Why Shitao painted Mount Lu in this way? On the second occasion, my seeing was attracted by the situation of the standing figures and the dramatic surroundings. The strength of the standing figure's calmness and contemplation shed the unpleasant struggling experience of my first time seeing the painting. Then I perceived that the primary of the painting is about human mind and its relationship to the landscape. The painting is about how the human figure, or the painter's imagined self, is trying to perceive, represent, and resolve the wild complexity, ambiguity, and drama, represented by a wild landscape; and the essential meaning of the picture is the presentation of the strength of calm contemplation and self-reviewing in a frustrated and difficult situation; it is the strength of resolving. At that moment, I found all the distinct, dramatic pictorial elements fit together in the painting.

Then I realised that what I perceived was one manifestation of what Su Shi called the *yiqi* (意气) of a *shiren* painting (士人画). *Yiqi* is a notion proposed by Su Shi and the notion left important impact on ancient Chinese painting. The character *yi* 意 originally means 'a voice from heart'.[384] *Qi* 气 is a pictograph that originally represents the dynamic appearance of the clouds, then expands to represent those things that have the essential physical properties of the moving clouds.[385] *Shiren* 士人 is a person who has a noble character, such as a determined mind, or who pursues virtue and morality, or who is wise and erudite.[386] *Shiren* usually have a unique individual manner: some are good or elegant, some are strange. The *yi-qi* (意气) of a *shi-ren* painting (士人画) then means the visible appearance, the pictorial representation of the voice from a *shiren's* heart; or, the *shiren* painter's inner quality, character, thought, voice, will, or state of mind is visualised or

---

384 The original Chinese: '意， 志，從心察言, 而知意也', Xu, 說文解字 (*Explanations of Characters and Words*), 217.

385 The original Chinese: '气, 雲氣也, 象形, 凡氣之所屬皆從氣,' see Xu, 說文解字 (*Explanations of Characters and Words*), 14.

386 The original Chinese: '士, 事也; 數始於一終於十, 從一從十. 孔子曰: 推十合一為士…從眾多事物中歸納出一個根本道理的人博學 審問 慎思 明辨 篤行 惟以求其至是也,' see Duan, 說文解字注 *(Notes on 'Explanations of Characters and Words')*, *no. 580*: 213–4, 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), accessed 30 March 2022, https://ctext.org/265530

manifested in the content and formation of the painting.[387] Su Shi's *yiqi* essentially refers to a quality; and whether a painting is *shiren* painting determined by whether the painting carrying *yiqi,* not by whether the painter's identity is *shiren* or not.[388] A *shiren* painter's paintings may not all carry *yiqi*, and a person may not always be a *shiren*. For this case study, the *yiqi* in *Mount Lu* is carried by the contemplation of a calm, self-demanding figure in a complicated and dramatic situation. This is the significance the study gained from experiencing the painting.

At the end of the studying process, I noticed different ways of seeing the details of the painting. Cahill, in his book *Chinese Painting,* took the part of the two figures in *Mount Lu* as the picture on the frontispiece (Figure 94). Perhaps he thought the figures' way of seeing represented the way that Chinese painters see the landscape. If only seeing Figure 94, the standing figure shows an almost standard situation of a classical Chinese literati's contemplation; the atmosphere of Figure 94 is active and the included surrounding natural elements are in motion but no drama or ambiguity can be felt. In *Min Shin No Kaiga,* the detail of the figures is framed as Figure 95, in which the bottomless valley and the foot of the rocky ledge are not included, nor the two central precipices, the three pointed peaks, and the waterfall; the only dramatic element is the gaunt tree on the ledge.[389] The result is that the landscape and figures in Figure 95 are in a balance situation. The cover of the book *Tao-chi* (Figure 96) takes a much bigger part of the painting than Figures 94 and 95, only excluding the two central precipices and the dramatic 'miscellaneous trees'.[390] Though partial, Figure 96 is already a very good landscape painting. The three peaks bring to the picture some feelings of pressure, but the landscape looks more harmonious than Figure 95 and 96. Probably it is because the white vertical stream of the waterfall and the white volume of the clouds provide a feeling of ease and a flexible balance in the picture. And

---

[387] The original Chinese written by Su Shi: '觀士人畫，如閱天下馬，取其意氣所到', from "又跋漢傑畫 山 (the Second Postscript on HanJie's Painting of Mountains)", in ed. Kong FanLi 孔凡禮, 蘇軾文集 (*Collected Proses of Su Shi*), (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1986), 2216.

[388] Su Shi's '*shiren* painting' is not Dong Qichang 董其昌's (1555–1636 AD) 'literati painting', which is a notion proposed by Dong derived from Su Shi's idea. Dong's notion of 'literati painting' underlines the social position of the painter, values referencing the old masters' works in the composition, and emphasises the aesthetic effect of the pictorial form.

[389] *Min Shin No Kaiga*, eds., Tōkyō Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan (Kyōto: Benridō, 1964), 81.

[390] Ishikawa Jun 石川淳, ed., *Tao-chi* (Tōkyō: Chūō Kōronsha, 1986), cover.

the calm standing figure looks not under a big pressure, or in a dramatic environment. Then seeing Figures 94, 95, and 96 together with Figure 98 the full picture of *Mount Lu*, the differences between the four pictures show that it is the two central precipices at the highest and the dramatic 'miscellaneous trees' at the lowest that produce the ultimate pressure and drama in the picture; then the calmness of the standing figure becomes counterpoint to the situations of the two precipices and the 'miscellaneous trees'. So, it is the calmly standing and contemplating figure that ultimately resolves the wild complexity, ambiguity, and drama in the picture, and raises the essential meaning and pictorial interest of the painting.

Conclusion

The case study applied the phenomenological method to interpreting Shitao's *Mount Lu,* in order to capture the artist's compositional intention and reveal the meaning of the picture. By applying the method, the study traced and examined the marks of the Shitao's compositional acts, restored the key compositional acts of the artist. In doing so, the study grasped the artist's two-fold compositional intention, revealed the direct and indirect meanings expressed by the artist through the picture, and demonstrated the potential significance of the picture to a viewer's experience of seeing. Hence, the study concludes that the application of the phenomenological method is effective.

During the process of study, Shitao's literal intention was first indicated, which was to achieve a specific pictorial effect –'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not'– as that Guo Xi had achieved, but in Shitao's own manner. Then the study proceeded in two stages. The first was 'seeing as the painter', to experience and describe the first-hand experience of the physical Mount Lu, the inscription on the painting, the picture and pictorial elements of the painting; and then to compare the first-hand experience with the artist's literal intention acted in the inscription, the meaning of Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad*, as well as the historical studies on Shitao's personal life and activities as related to the composition of *Mount Lu,* in order to find differences among them thus to analyse the reasons for the differences and to identify the key compositional acts of the artist. As a result of the comparisons and analyses, the study retrieved the key compositional acts of the artist:

1) to compose a pictorial landscape of Mount Lu to present the pictorial effect as that Guo Xi had achieved but in Shitao's own manner,

2) to fabricate an inventive pictorial landscape based on his memories of Mount Lu and Longhu Shan areas,

3) to build a grand and complicated pictorial structure and to bestow various dispositions on the multiple *yuan,* or distances, and

4) to reinforce the pictorial effect of the wild complexity and drama in the landscape through employing various pictorial elements – the human figures, clouds, trees, seal-marks, as well as the operation of brushstroke and *mo*.

Then study demonstrated that the painting did not explicit relate to the content of *Mount Lu Ballad* and the pictorial landscape Shitao created was far more complicated and expressive than his literal intention; and the artist's two-fold compositional intention was grasped: to paint a landscape with a certain pictorial effect in Shitao's own manner on one hand and to compose a wild dramatic landscape on the other, in order to create a difficult external circumstances to the solitude contemplating figure in the painting, aiming at expressing some subtle meanings. And the direct expression the artist made through the content and form of the picture was that the specific pictorial effect accomplished by Guo Xi could be achieved in a totally different manner through a totally different image; while the indirect expressions related to the artist's ambivalence towards whether or not or how to withdraw from the political circles of the Qing court and return to his *yimin* identity.

The second stage, seeing as the individual self, was to experience the picture, especially the situation of the standing figure. The study found that the relationship between the standing figure and the grand, wild, complicated landscape probably a figurative representation an inner feelings of the figure's situation and perceptions of the complicated external circumstances. Moreover, by experiencing the picture, the study perceived that the painting had the pictorial capacity to evoke empathy and further imaginings, thus the significance of the painting to its viewers may be ascertained.

One issue the study encountered is the problem of the counterfeits of Shitao's works. Identifying the authenticity of *Mount Lu* lies beyond the scope of this case study; however, the issue is highlighted to prompt further attention and research on the problem.

Another issue is that application of the phenomenological method to the study of *Mount Lu* is based on a high quality digital photograph, not the original painting, and the effective

and ineffective aspects of experiencing the digital photograph can be summarised in three points.

First of all, in the situation of unable to see the original painting, for an academic research, the high quality digital photograph is the best alternative. The digital photograph of *Mount Lu* studied in this case is a digital record shot for academic research. That is to say it is not a creation for artistic purpose, not a digital photograph that is an artistic production by the photographer through using photographic techniques. It is neither a photograph of photojournalism that is captured for recording an event, a moment of a situation, a thing in a situation, or telling a story. And the timing and situation of taking the photograph is not relevant to the use of it in this case study. The record shot of *Mount Lu* is taken by a kind colleague of Sen-Oku Hakukokan Museum particularly for this academic research, and the purpose of taking the photograph is to record the content and details of the original painting. The process of taking the photograph is simple and the fixed stand of taking the photograph is straight in front of the painting; no special photographic techniques were used in the process to add artistic effects on the digital picture. The quality of the digital picture is very good and most of the pictorial elements of the painting are clear enough for the study. And one benefit of using the digital photograph is that, on the screen of the laptop, it can be easily zoomed into or out of the picture, which is very helpful in reading the characters of the inscription and seeing many delicate details in the painting. This benefit may not be possible if one merely sees the original painting at the museum through the protective glass screen.

Second, the high quality digital photography cannot be considered a substitute of the original painting. Because, first, digital photography of the painting and the original painting are two different things, therefore, seeing the digital *Mount Lu* on the screen of a laptop is very different from seeing the material *Mount Lu* face to face in reality. The original *Mount Lu* is a material object have material qualities that can be bodily experienced, such as texture, volume, and location in the physical space, which a digital photography cannot provide. Second, the digital photography is taken by one person at one fixed stand, from one perspective, and at one moment, thus is one digital record of *Mount Lu*, while the object of *Mount Lu* in a physical space can be seen and recorded by numerous people at various stands, from various perspectives, in various dynamic situations, and at various moments. So what I see in the digital photograph is what one

photographer saw. However, if I can see the painting in person I would see the picture repeatedly at various distances and from various perspectives. I would start to experience it when I have the first glance of it in the distance, and the experience would continually change, flourish, and be cultivated during my approaching it. Also, to see the complete image of *Mount Lu* on a computer screen, I must zoom into it; thus, I did not have the sense of seeing the complete image in its actual size. More than that, because a digital photograph usually cannot entirely replicate the actual colours of the original painting, the study could not examine further Shitao's colour arrangement and the subtle variations in the shades of *mo*, nor the natural glow of the sized silk and its contribution to the artistic effect of the painting. So I cannot predict what the experience of encountering the material *Mount Lu* would be and I cannot know what I missed until I encounter the original painting in person.

Last, the original painting is a large hanging roll and it was made to be seen in the way of hanging it up. In ancient China, there were not galleries and museums, people usually saw paintings at home and saw one painting at one time. The painting may be seen by one person alone in a room, or in a gathering of several friends at a courtyard; or the painting may be set within natural surroundings and to be appreciated with the natural things together (Figures 99–101). Today, we have the chance to see large hanging rolls on the wall of a room in museums and galleries through glass protections, but have few chance to build intimate relationships with the paintings when we see them as what the ancient people could. To see the paintings hanging on the wall is the least way to see the paintings in the way they were made to be seen (Figure 98); and, in so doing, our eyes can have free journeys within the large pictorial space, from the bottom to top, or from the left to right, if we intend to. For this case study, when I saw the digital photograph of *Mount Lu*, I drew on my experience of seeing other large hanging rolls to image how would I see *Mount Lu* in the gallery. However, a viewer who does not have the former experiences to reference may not see the painting in the way as it was made for.

To summarise, the high quality digital photograph of *Mount Lu* is the best alternative for this study when I cannot see the original object in person. But the digital picture and original painting both have benefits and limits and the two cannot substitute each other; the ideal is to see both in the study.

Note that the case study interprets *Mount Lu* based on the digital photograph does not mean the phenomenological method can be effectively applied to interpreting photographic artworks. Because the principles and techniques of imaging are very different between painting and photographing. In the process of researching, what the case took from the digital photograph is the pictorial content of the picture, without considering how does the digital photograph is taken, what are the intentional acts of the photographer, and what photographic techniques are employed to the photograph. The thesis however takes an open attitude to the possibility of applying the method to digital photographs, but to demonstrate the effectiveness of the application many experimental studies are necessarily needed and that goes beyond the scope of this thesis.

Another related issue is the using of digital reproduction of artwork in academic research. No doubt when researchers cannot see the original artwork, digital record shot for academic research like the one used in this case, or digital reproduction with high quality, is the best alternative, no matter the research is phenomenological or not. Strictly speaking, a digital record shot of a painting for academic research is different from a digital reproduction of a painting. Like introduced earlier in Introduction Section 5 'Terminology' in this thesis, reproduction is more complicated than the record shot for academic research. Because the purpose of reproducing, the making process, the technique used, and the quality of the digital picture are very different in various practices of reproducing an artwork; let alone details of the original picture may be purposively or not purposively omitted or altered to different degrees. So far, this study has not found particular phenomenological studies about digital reproduction of artwork for academic research. But from the perspective of phenomenology, the point is, the original material painting, the digital reproduction, and the digital record shot for academic research are different things, different objects, thus first-hand experiences of them essentially differ. For a phenomenological study, the more first-hand experience gained the more effective and valuable the study is. Thus, a phenomenological study based on the first-hand experiences of both the original material painting and the high-quality digital reproduction would be

more effective and productive than a study merely based on the first-hand experience of the digital photograph.[391]

---

[391] William J. Nieberding's thesis "Photography, Phenomenology and Sight: Toward an Understanding of Photography through the Discourse of Vision" is a different kind of study to this case study. The target of his research is about gaining visions of digital photography through different approaches, including modernism, phenomenology, and postmodernism; while this research is about gaining first-hand experience of the digital photograph of a painting and perceiving the meaning of the first-hand experience, in order to grasp the artist's compositional intention and the meaning of the picture. Also, the digital photographs Nieberding studied including a digital artwork and a photograph of photojournalism, while this case studied a digital record short of a painting for academic research. Moreover, the phenomenological approaches in Nieberding's research are Husserl's transcendental phenomenology and Heidegger's existential phenomenology, and he did not practice in his research *Epochè and Reduction*; while this case study is about applying a newly established method based on the fundamental principles and theory of phenomenology–the intentionality and *Epochè and Reduction*.

Chapter Five: Conclusion of the Thesis

The thesis establishes the phenomenological method for interpreting radical landscape paintings in various cultures. Radical landscape painting refers to the landscape paintings that are creatively and inventively composed to represent radical features of the wild mountains and waters that exist in reality, in order to express meanings. The research was prompted by the challenges arising from cultural differences when interpreting landscape paintings in various cultures; and the solution provided by the thesis is the new phenomenological method, established as a means of studying an artist's particular compositional intention in a radical landscape painting and revealing the meaning of the picture, irrespective of the painting's cultural background.

The newly established method is adopted in phenomenology. It is essentially a method of perception – to perceive through various experiences of seeing. The method takes *epoché* and *réduction* as the basic principles and attitude and targets the picture of the painting, the corresponding physical landscape, and other related objects. In practice, the phenomenological method consists of two steps. The first-step is to see perceptively and eidetically and then describing the experiences of seeing, which are specifically the first-hand experiences of the radical landscape painting, corresponding physical landscape, and other related objects. The second-step is to see synoptically and reflectively, to compare the experiences with various references, including previous studies and other artworks that are in relation to the radical landscape painting. In doing so, the artist's key compositional acts can be restored and the comprehension of the key compositional acts can reveal the artist's compositional intention and the meaning of the painting. Essentially, the phenomenological method established in this thesis is a method of perception, aiming at strengthening and supporting an individual viewer's perception to radical landscape paintings. And the method is not universal, not established for examining and interpreting various radical landscape paintings of various cultures within one fixed or standard frame.

Every application of the method in practice would be particular, not depending on the interpreter's subjective will, but depending on the content and form of the particular radical

landscape painting, on how the individual painter formed the picture and what meaning the painter expressed through the picture, and ultimately depending on the artist's compositional intention. Additionally, in every process of applying the phenomenological method, every individual's experiences of the painting and the corresponding physical landscape would be unique and differ to that of others. As a consequence, the outcome of every application would be also particular and unique. Likewise, outcomes of the two case studies in this thesis depend on how Turner and Shitao painted their works and what expressions they factually made through the pictures and pictorial elements; also, the outcomes depend on the conditions of the two applications. Thus, the outcomes of the two case studies are very different to each other and not comparable. The two case studies show that, to some degree, application of the phenomenological method in this thesis can only grasp the performed compositional intention of the artist in the painting and reveal the meaning the artist expressed through the picture, cannot grasp and reveal the compositional intention and meaning which the artist did not perform or express through the composition of the painting.

In order to evaluate the effectiveness of the method, the research applied it to the interpretations of two radical landscape painting: Turner's *Loch Coruisk, Skye* and Shitao's *Mount Lu*. In the first case study, the original painting, the physical landscape of Loch Coruisk, Turner's sketches, the engraving, and the printed book of Scott's *The Lord of the Isles* are all accessible, thus, the study gained rich first-hand experiences in the first step. And the considerable previous studies of Turner and *Loch Coruisk, Skye* provided many references for the various comparison in the second-step. Thus, the study retrieved the key compositional acts of the painter, including how he structured the picture and employed pictorial elements and painting techniques to form the confrontational atmosphere and dramatic moods in the pictorial landscape.

Based on the comprehension of the key compositional acts of Turner, the case study found that Turner's general and literal intention was to illustrate the poem and depict the wilderness of the Loch Coruisk, while his ultimate compositional intention was to represent the ideal, wildest Loch Coruisk in his imagination. And the essential meaning of the picture of *Loch Courisk, Skye* was hence perceived: to represent the powerful appearance of the conflicts or confrontations among the wild natural forces, among the human activities in history, as well as among the protagonists in the romantic narratives.

Moreover, by experiencing the picture, the study perceived that the composed picture has the potential to evoke viewers' imaginings and bring out significance to its viewers' experience of seeing. Therefore, in this case study, effectiveness of the application of the phenomenological method is demonstrated.

In the second case study, the original *Mount Lu* was inaccessible and my first-hand experience to the physical Mount Lu was recollected from a long time memory, which to some extent is same to the situation of Shitao's recollecting his memories of Mount Lu for the composition of the painting *Mount Lu*. Also, application of the method was based on seeing and experiencing the digital and printed pictures of *Mount Lu,* thus the study focused primarily on the first-hand experiences of the pictorial structure, pictorial elements, and the understanding of the original meanings of Shitao's inscription and postscript on the painting.

The study first described the first-hand experience of the physical landscape of Mount Lu, experienced the picture of the painting and its pictorial elements, and investigated the meaning of the inscription and postscript on the painting. In this case, it was crucial to examine and understand the ancient text in the artist's inscription and postscript, because Shitao stated his literal intention and made an important indirect expression through them. Then, various comparisons were made between the picture of the painting, the content of the inscription and postscript, the physical landscape of Mount Lu, the geological and geographical interpretations of Mount Lu and related areas, as well as the historical findings on Shitao's personal life and identities. Accordingly, the study explored Shitao's compositional acts, including how did he build the grand height and complex distance in the pictorial structure, and how did he employ various pictorial elements and use techniques of brush and *mo* to create the wild complexity, ambiguity, and drama in the pictorial landscape.

Based on the comprehension of the key compositional acts of Shitao, the case study found that Shitao's compositional intention was two-fold and he expressed direct and indirect meanings through the picture. On one hand, Shitao's literal intention was to paint a landscape to present the pictorial effect – 'some clouds and mist are emanating, some vanishing, some precipices and peaks are visible, some not' – that Guo Xi had achieved, in Shitao's own manner; and the landscape painting showed that his literal intention was

achieved. On the other hand, the landscape presented in the painting was much more complicated than Shitao's literal intention stated. For example, Shitao transcribed Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad* on the painting but did not paint the vast poetic landscape in the poem; he placed the peculiar peaks of Longhu San in the landscape of Mount Lu; he painted himself as the standing figure in the landscape wearing 'casual robe in Daoist style' not the robe of monk; and he painted a wisp of cloud unusually lapping on his feet on the isolated ledge.

Further comprehension of the special compositional acts revealed that the second fold of the artist's compositional intention is – composing a landscape that presented wild complexity, ambiguity (or pressure), and drama, in order to project a complicated external environment and to present the solitude and calmness of the standing figure's contemplating within the wild surroundings. And the multiple meanings of the picture of *Mount Lu* were therefore perceived: the directly expressed meaning is that the specific pictorial effect is achieved in *Mount Lu* in Shitao's own manner; while the indirect expression may relate to the artist's ambivalence towards whether or not or how to withdraw from the opportunities of serving the Qing court and return to his *yimin* identity.

Finally, by experiencing the picture, the study found that the composed picture has the capacity to evoke a communication between the viewers' perception and the painter's direct and indirect expression, and to bring out significance to its viewers' experience of seeing. Therefore, in this case study, effectiveness of the application of the phenomenological method is also demonstrated.

The outcome of the two case studies shows that the phenomenological method is effective in accessing the artists' compositional intentions and revealing the meaning of the paintings, despite the cultural differences that exist between the two paintings, the two artists, and myself as an individual viewer and interpreter. And the goal of this experimental research achieved.

The effective applications of the phenomenological method in the research are essentially due to three key actions. The first is following the principles of *epoché* and *réduction* in practice, which initially means being aware of and describing the first-hand experiences of encountering the painting and the corresponding physical landscape, and the first encounter may be a natural situation of *epoché* and *réduction*, though not a perfect situation. Also, following the principles in practice means, first, during the process of gaining first-hand

experience, suspending as much as possible 'previous interpretations, historical studies, common knowledge etc.' that related to the artwork and the corresponding physical landscape. Second, the first-hand experiences gained in the first-step are used in the various comparisons in the second-step, during which the 'previous interpretations, historical studies, common knowledge etc.' are comparative references and must not influence or change those first-hand experiences and the perceptions of them, but contribute to find the differences between them and analyse the causes of the differences, in order to trace the artists' compositional acts.

The second key action is the two-step process of seeing – first seeing perceptually and eidetically, second seeing synoptically and eidetically. In the two case studies, the paintings, the corresponding physical landscapes, and related objects are experienced first; then, comparisons of and reflections on the various experiences go second, in order to identify the artists' key compositional acts and intentional objects. As mentioned in Chapter Two, Part One, the phenomenological mode of perception is not an innovation of phenomenologists; it is generated from people's natural ways of perception. However, phenomenology builds a philosophical system to define and explain the phenomenological mode. Likewise, both of the perceptive and reflective seeings may naturally occur during every viewer's experience of seeing a painting; the value of this research is that it defines and evokes the awareness of the role and function of the two steps seeing and helps to make the process of an individual's perception progressive and efficient. More importantly, it emphasises 'the two step process'— to perceive the painting and the corresponding landscape firstly and to reflect and analyse them secondly. That is the basis of phenomenology and the foundation of the research – let the things themselves give the direction our perception of the things, which provides the opportunity to see and experience the paintings anew.

Furthermore, through the first step of seeing, a viewer has the chance to 'see with the painter'. For example, in the first case study, as a viewer I perceived that during the process of composing *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* Turner the painter was outside the landscape, as if was watching the physical and geological landscape, the story in Scott's poem, and the related human history during the process of composition. He composed the painting as a beholder and interpreter of both the wild physical landscape and the ideal violent pictorial landscape. Thus, the study accessed the artist's compositional intention and the meaning of

the artwork primarily through 'seeing as the painter' and 'seeing with the painter', and the standpoint of seeing was external to mountains and waters in the pictorial landscape. While in the second case, I perceived that Shitao himself, as both the painter and participant, was involved with the pictorial landscape. He was not an external beholder, but in the midst of the landscape, he built the figure of himself and participated in the motions in the pictorial landscape during the process of composition. He was experiencing the landscape and meanwhile reviewing the history of his own life, thus, what he depicted was both the landscape in his memory and the dynamic state of his mind. Therefore, the study approached the artist's compositional intention and revealed the meaning of the painting through 'seeing as the painter' and 'being with the painter himself' in the pictorial landscape; and the standpoint of seeing was experienced as both internal and external the pictorial landscape. The strong differences between 'seeing as the painter and **seeing with the painter**' in the first case and 'seeing as the painter and **being with the painter in the pictorial landscape**' in the second case depend on how the painters painted the picture and how the painters expressed their meanings through the pictures, not depend on how me, the interpreter, subjectively or ideally want to interpret them.

The third key action is about gaining significance from the painting through freely experiencing the pictorial elements in the painting. A viewer can experience a picture and can also experience one pictorial element in the painting from the angle and position of other pictorial elements in the painting, by the free imagination. For example, when seeing *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, one can experience the rough rock face as if the self were the swirling giant vortex; or when seeing *Mount Lu,* one can see the two central precipices as if standing on the rocky ledge. It is a virtual experience of being in the landscape by imagination, of seeing the mountains as the waters and seeing the waters as the mountains.

For me, as an interpreter, the significance of *Loch Coruisk, Skye* was gained when I first saw the mountains and valleys as the figures in the painting, and then saw the whole landscape as the painter from the 'birds-eye view', as if I were watching history, which brought me the thinking of a tiny individual's position in and impact to the long human history. For *Mount Lu*, the significance was gained when the experience of seeing was first frustrated by the ambiguous pictorial space and the complex distance in the pictorial space, and then the calmness of the standing figure triggered my perception of the strength of contemplation and self-reflection in the human mind. The actions of experiencing first-

hand with the attitude of *epoché* and *réduction* produced more possibilities of gaining significance from the paintings, which enhanced the effective applications of the phenomenological method in the two case studies. Again, these significances gained from experiencing the two paintings are individual, may or may not be what the painters intended, and may differ to other viewers' experiences.

Above presentation of the effective result of the study shows that this experimental research into the phenomenological method may contribute to art history studies from seven aspects, in relation to interpreting the radical landscape paintings in various cultures.

First of all, it provides a method to study the peculiarity – the distinctive features – of a particular landscape and the unique artistic value of a radical landscape painting in its peculiarity. The peculiarity of an artwork is produced by the artist's compositional intention and determined by the meaning the artist expressed through the picture. More importantly, the creative compositional process behind 'the peculiarity' are exclusive and cannot be duplicated.

For example, to compose *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, if Turner had not had a strong intention to pursue the ideal and wildest Loch Coruisk through his painting, he could merely have made a realistic depiction of the wild Loch Coruisk. In doing so, he could still have fulfilled his commission, however, there would be no imaginary, phenomenal landscape of *Loch Coruisk, Skye*, in which a giant vortex of clouds and mist confronts the rough rock face above the cool motionless loch. Similarly, if Shitao had not intended to pursue his own manner in the composition of *Mount Lu* while also depicting his struggle to find the right way for his life and career, there would not be the grand and complicated and dramatic *Mount Lu*, in which the two conspicuous peaks from Longhu Shan stand high above the Sandie Quan waterfall and the Jinxiu valley of Mount Lu, amidst the moving clouds and mist.

Another value of study the peculiarity of a radical landscape painting is that the painting is a representation or manifestation of the culture and tradition to which the individual artist belongs; understanding the artist's compositional intention, compositional acts, and the peculiar meaning of the picture is therefore one approach to the culture and tradition behind the painter, and to some extent the resolution to the challenge raised by cultural differences in understanding paintings from different cultures.

The second contribution of the study is that it provides a method to study the artists' creative manner and expression – perceiving the meaning of the artist's compositional acts. For example, in the first case study, the research experienced how Turner used various colours in *Loch Coruisk, Skye.* Turner created a competing colour effect in the landscape – the warm colour (cream) with various shades on the mountain rocks versus the cold colour (blue) with various ranges on the waters – which enhanced the visual effect of the wild opposition between the mountains and water. Meanwhile, Turner united the two competing colours with a hint of purple that wrapped the various wild elements in the picture, creating a feeling of the past and the ongoing history. In the second case study, by experiencing Shitao's operation of brush and *mo* in *Mount Lu*, the research noticed that Shitao used a light brown colour as a medium to join the various hues of *mo,* in order to produce many variations in the shades and hues. Thus, various textures of the solid mountain rocks, soils, soft clouds and mist, and the moisture in the soil and wild grass were made and the vivid details of the wilderness of the pictorial landscape were supplemented.

Another example is, by experiencing how Turner used the light in *Loch Coruisk, Skye,* the study perceived that the penetrating light Turner created balanced or completed the dramatic movements of the mountains and vortices and the meaning of the compositional act echoed the end of Scott's *The Lord of the Isles.* Also, by experiencing how Shitao structured *Mount Lu*, the study demonstrated that Shitao did not employ light as a key pictorial element but used the positional relationships between the mountain, water, clouds and mist, to make some peaks are visible, some not, in the '⋛' structure; and the meaning of the compositional act raised the wild complexity of the pictorial landscape to make a huge *repoussoir* to the small figure's calm contemplation.

Above findings indicate that by experiencing the unique features of the artists' compositional acts, the phenomenological method can help a viewer to perceive the merit and excellence of the artists' works in specific objective details, even though they come from different cultures.

The third contribution of the study is the reciprocal perspective of researching – to study and experiencing the painting from both how the artist composed it and how the individual viewer can experience it. The reciprocal perspective promotes viewers' participation and appreciation through their own ways; and in the process of studying from the reciprocal

perspective, the artwork will become the medium between the artists composition, expression and the viewers' perception, imagination, rather than merely an artwork that produces visual pleasure to the eyes. The phenomenological method established in the study is a means for a reciprocal perspective research, which may help the viewers to constantly go further in pursuing meaning and significance – the meaning of the picture, the meaning of the artistic imagination, the meaning of the creativity, and the significance of the painting to the viewers own experience of seeing.

Fourth, the phenomenological method focuses on the objective things related to creative artworks; accordingly, it provides viewers with a stable standpoint – the object – from where to start their seeing, perceiving, understanding, interpreting, and imagining. More importantly, it claims the importance of the first-hand experience to artworks in our perception of the artworks. Creative artworks are subjective and imaginary, thus many of them evoke unmeasurable or ineffable feelings to us. However, by underlining and practising the first-hand experience of the artwork object under *epoché* and *réduction*, together with comparing them with various studies and the historical and cultural facts, the method helps to make the most use of the feelings towards a painting that are capable of expression and description.

Fifth, this study highlights the value of radical landscape painting, a special kind of landscape art. When composing a radical landscape painting, the painter not only presents an inventively composed wild landscape, but also projects or visualises phenomena of humankind in the pictorial landscape, such as the features of a character, the perception of a situation or a state of mind, as well as various feelings, emotions, moods and atmospheres. Radical landscape painting conveys the expressions of both general humanity and individual peculiarity, thus is an importance resource for the studies of humanities. The potential of this study is expanding and developing more variations of the method and thereby to perceive and interpret radical landscape paintings in many different cultures.

Sixth, application of the method has the potential to contribute to practices of artistic education. Artworks are not only the production of the artist's creative mind through imagination, they are also concrete pieces of real life and concrete components of the real world, including all great artworks and bad artworks, meaningful artworks and pointless artworks. The phenomenological method established in the thesis is a method that can help

to perceive a painting as both a creation of mind and imagination and an intentionally made object. Thus applying the method can be a practical way for students to practice and cultivate three abilities: first, the ability of experiencing and being aware of the first-hand experience, and honestly describing the experience to themselves; second, the ability of finding and benefiting from differences between the painting, corresponding physical landscape, and other related objects, between the objective picture and various subjective descriptions, interpretations, and judgments of the picture, therefore to support and strengthen their perception of creative artworks and the value of them, and then to support their perception of humanity and the real world; third, the ability of, on one hand, 'seeing as other' – seeing the painting as the painter in order to understand the painter's compositional intention and expression, and on the other hand, 'seeing as an the individual self – an ability of cultivating the individual's own experience and perceptions of the meaning and significance of the experience. Note that, 'one standing on the position of the other but to see as the one self' is not 'seeing as other' but seeing as self; whereas 'one standing on the position of the other and to see as the other' is 'seeing as other'. 'Seeing as other' is a useful intellectual ability but also an ability that is not easy to cultivate; while seeing a radical landscape painting through the phenomenological method could be a practice to cultivate that ability.

Last, application of the method may have the potential to contribute to artistic curations, even though the method is established especially for strengthening the individual's perception and interpretation of radical landscape paintings. Because the important part of applying the method is to see a painting both as the painter and as the individual viewer self during an encounter, which may can be a reference for the design of curation, especially for the curations about radical landscape paintings from different cultures. For example, by considering the artist's compositional intention and the relationships between the artworks, the corresponding physical landscape, and other related things, design of a curation may have the chance to reduce the difficulty caused by cultural difference to the viewers; also by considering how the individual viewers would intend to see the painting, the design of curation may consider some unusual ways, such as exhibiting only one or two radical landscape paintings in an exhibition, or setting the exhibition in an unusual place, in order to encourage viewers having their own experience and to avoid framing or limiting their experience. However, curation is a different area to this thesis; many studies are

necessarily needed for applying the phenomenological method of this thesis to curation practices.

As an newly established method, there are some limits found during the research. First, the effectiveness of applying the method depends on how many related objects can be found, how much first-hand experience can be gained, and how many historical and cultural facts can be referenced. Objects and facts, as well as first-hand experience, are the foundations of this phenomenological research, that is to say the research may easily be limited when the original objects are unavailable to be experienced in person. Secondly, the method cannot address counterfeits of an artist's work; evidence of the authenticity of the artwork is necessary. Thirdly, the design of the research method is based on the first-hand experience; therefore, the study is involved with the individuality of the specific researcher. That is to say, there would be no universal result or interpretation of the same artwork – different researchers may produce various outcomes. Thus, from the perspective of phenomenology, new interpretations of a great radical landscape painting from individual interpreters can generate endlessly.

To conclude the thesis, the study of the establishment and application of the phenomenological method is essentially about perceiving the peculiarity of a radical landscape painting by a particular artist. It concerns the possible communication, and intersubjective experience, between the painter's and the viewers' intellectual activities of perceiving, imagining, creating, and participating. Applications of the method on the two case studies are effective and the method has a potential to be developed and applied further.

For the creation of landscape art, it is true that landscape paintings as artworks have social functions. They are records of time and place, statements of identity, representations of ideologies, propaganda tools, or expressions of cultural values, etc. But it is also true that creative art is one of the most intellectual, creative, and inspiring phenomena of humanity. The meaning of creating art is far more than skilful painters producing and selling their products for the sake of making a living, operating a business, and pleasing their customers. There is a deep relationship between humans' artistic activities and the humans' capacities of perception, imagination, creation, expression, and empathy. Correspondingly, a conscious first-hand experience of seeing a great radical artwork can expand the viewer's

experience of perception and imagining, and even achieve an epiphany. And this, essentially, is the value of radical art and artworks to researchers and audiences.

To understand artworks in various cultures, philosophers have established a long-running debate about mind and perception, knowledge, and meaning and agency of artworks. Given the large number of fruitful historical studies, art historians can do more to resolve the challenge of cultural difference, by retrieving an artist's compositional acts and capturing the artist's compositional intention in a particular painting, and by revealing the peculiar meaning of a picture and gaining significance from the experience of seeing the painting. And the ultimate meaning of establishing and applying the phenomenological method of this study is to emphasise and strengthen an individual viewer's artistic perception, because, what a viewer can gain from an artwork, from a great radical landscape painting, whatever aesthetic satisfaction or new knowledge and perception or inspiration and epiphany, is ultimately the inner reward to the individual viewer's heart and mind.

Appendices

1. English Translation to Li Bai's *Mount Lu Ballad*

Mount Lu Ballad

Sent to Attendant Inspector Lu Xuzhou[392]

Li Bai

廬山謠寄卢盧侍御虛舟

李白

I am naturally like the madman of Chu, who

    chanted the *Phoenix Song* to satirise Kong Qiu.[393]

1. 我本楚狂人，
　　鳳歌笑孔丘。

But this morning, holding my bamboo walking stick,

    which is as green as chrysoprase,

        I bid farewell to the Yellow Crane Tower and

           go to Mount Lu.[394]

2. 手持綠玉杖，
　　朝別黃鶴樓。

All my life, I love to visit great mountains,

    to seek the source of Daoist inspiration,

        the long travelling in Five Sacred Mountains was

           not a hardship to me.

3. 五嶽尋仙不辭遠，
　　一生好入名山遊。

---

[392] Li Bai writes the poem in passionate language and delivers many symbolic meanings through unusual word choices to the extent that the English translation requires two or more lines to convey the complete meaning of one line in Chinese.

The numbers on the lines are added by me, for easy to reference.

The English translation focuses on conveying the precise meaning of the text, thus the original rhythm and meter cannot be reproduced in the English translation. However, as a translator and Chinese reader, I can describe that the rhyme and intonations of *ping* 平 and *ze* 仄 in the poem produce a march-like beat when reading the poem in Chinese. I cannot also translate the visions represented by the Chinese characters, which fabricated the poetic visions described in the poem.

[393] Kong Qiu 孔丘 is the formal name of Confucius. The 'madman' is Lu Tong who, in the poem, represents those kind of people who care about the world and want to do something for the world.

[394] Yellow Crane Tower is in Jiujiang City 九江, which is very close to Mount Lu. People usually depart from Jiujiang to reach Mount Lu. In this line, the poet implies that he bids farewell to the old self who is naturally like Lu Tong and departs to Mount Lu to pursue the new self, a Daoist.

At Mount Lu, I see the splendid mountains that appear

    just beside the Nandou constellation,[395]

4. 廬山秀出南斗傍，
   屏風九疊雲錦張，
   影落明湖青黛光。

And the nine peaks that present themselves

    as nine-panelled silk brocade screens, whose

        shadows fall on the bright Poyang lake, and

            make the waters shine in various indigo tones.[396]

I see the two peaks that look like two golden gatehouses,

    in front of me, they stand high and extend long,[397]

5. 金闕前開二峰長，
   銀河倒挂三石梁。

And a waterfall looks like the Silver River falls

    down to the earth and hangs on

        three massive bridge-like rocks, upside-down.[398]

I see Xianglu Peak and the waterfall that

    look to each other through distance long,

        and the cliffs and peaks in the far look as if,

            one after another, they are moving

                over the vast mists and clouds.

6. 香爐瀑布遙望，
   迴厓沓嶂凌蒼蒼。

---

[395] Nandou 南斗 is a constellation that consists of six stars, which are part of Sagittarius in Western astronomy.

[396] 'The nine peaks' refer to the sight called Jiudie Ping 九疊屏.

[397] 'The two peaks that look like golden gatehouses' refer to the spot called Shimen 石門; the two peaks are Tianchi Mountain 天池山 and Tiechuan Peak 鐵船峰.

[398] The 'Silver River', *yinhe* 銀河, is the Chinese name of the galaxy known as the Milky Way in the West.

In the morning, the sun lights up the rosy clouds and

    the green shades of the forests, but

        the mountain range is so vast that

            birds cannot fly over to reach the sky of Wu.[399]

7. 翠影紅霞映朝日，

    鳥飛不到吳天[長]

When I am climbing up the mountain,

    in between the infinite sky and the grand earth,

        I see the great Yangtze River that flows

            into the distance to never return.

8. 登高壯觀天地间間

    大江茫茫去不還。

I see yellow clouds, ten thousand miles long,

    that are moved by the winds, and

        the white waves of the nine rivers are flowing among

        the mountains that are covered with snow.[400]

9. 黃雲萬里動風色，

    白波九道流雪山。

I love to write poems for Mount Lu,

    and Mount Lu uplifts my spirit.

10. 好為盧山謠，

    興因盧山發。

I spend my leisure time with Stone Mirror, that

    makes my heart peaceful and clear;

        the dark-green mosses covered place where

        Sir Xie walked are slippery now.[401]

11. 閑與石鏡清我心，

    謝公行處蒼苔滑。

---

[399] In ancient China, Mount Lu belonged to the kingdom of Chu 楚國 and the kingdom of Wu 吳國 was besides Chu. Mount Lu was at the border between Chu with Wu. Shitao missed the character 長 in the transcript.

[400] 'Nine rivers' refer to the nine rivers around Mount Lu and Jiujiang City and the names of them are Wubai River 烏白江, Gan river 贛江, Wu river 烏江, Jiami River 嘉靡江, Quan River 猷江, Yuan River 源江, Lin River 廩江, Ti River 提江, and Jun River 菌江. See Yu, "再读石涛的《庐山观瀑图》(Re-reading *Shitao's Mount Lu*)," 61.

[401] 'Stone Mirror' refers to the spot Shi Jing 石鏡.

If I had ingested the Huandan earlier, now
    I would not care about this earthly world any more,
        and I would have started to successfully
            achieve the practice degree of Qinxinsandie. [402]

12. 早服還丹無世情，
    琴心三疊道初成。

Now I see the Daoist immortals
    in the distant colourful clouds;
        they hold lotuses with two hands and go to Yujing
            to worship the Deity of heaven. [403]

13. 遥見仙人綵雲里，
    手把芙蓉朝玉京。

Like what happened in the parable of Lu Ao,
    the immortal has the appointment to go
        to 'the place of unable to know', [404]
            which is beyond the farthest places in
            the eight directions on the earth. [405]

14. 先期汗漫九垓上，
    願接盧敖遊太清

Whereas, I will depart from where Lu Ao stopped
    to pursue the Daoist heaven. [406]

---

[402] 'Huandan 還丹' is a legendary Daoist pelleted tonic, which can help the Daoists to become immortal. 'Qinxinsandie 琴心三疊' is a Daoist terminology referring to a very high degree of practising Daoism.

[403] 'Yujing 玉京', the heavenly place where the highest Daoist Deity dwells.

[404] 'The place of unable to know' is the translation of the word *hanman* 汗漫 in the poem. The translation is according to Gao You 高誘's note on '道應訓 (The Effect of Moral Behaviour): 不可知之地也'.

[405] 'Beyond the farthest places in the eight directions' is the translation of the word *jiugai* 九垓 in the poem. The translation is according to Xu, 說文解字(*Explanations of Characters and Words*) – '兼晐, 八極地也 (the farthest places in eight directions on the earth)', and Duan, 說文解字注 (*Notes on 'Explanations of Characters and Words'*) – '兼備八極之地謂之垓 (the farthest places in eight directions on the earth)', 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), no. 172, accessed 30 March 2022, https://ctext.org/528853

[406] 'The Daoist heaven' is the translation of the word *taiqing* 太清, which is one of the three parts of the Daoist heaven.

2. English Translation to the Tenth Chapter of Shitao's *Huayu Lu*

Chapter Ten: Structure of the pictorial space

Usually, to paint a landscape, dividing the mountains and waters into two parts with three layers may cause a failure. However, some landscape paintings do not fail, because the various parts of the mountains and waters are separated as if by the nature, just like the appearance of the mountains in Yue 越; one can see them at the south of Yangtze River at the border of Wu 吳.

When people paint mountains and waters by [mechanically] using the techniques eg *kai-pi* 開闢 (lit. establishing the pictorial space) or *fen-po* 分破 (lit. dividing the pictorial space), there is no breath of life in the paintings. One would know what I say when one sees them. [The way of their] dividing the pictorial space into two parts with three layers is: [from low to high,] painting the mountains as the first layer, the woods the second, and the mountains again the third. Then how could this kind of painting give the viewers a sense of some things are near and others are distant? If we overlap the three layers in this way, how does it differ from the stamped patterns? For [dividing the pictorial space into] two parts, they paint a scenery in the lower part and paint the mountains in the upper part; and the cliche is separating the two parts by some clouds.

For [rightly] structuring the pictorial space with three layers, the primary is consistency, which must not be made rigidly. To structure the two parts within the three layers, one must intentionally free the [mind and] hand from all patterns and formations, in order to let the operation of the brush show [one's] spontaneous strength and capacity. In doing so, even if one paints hundreds and thousands of mountains and valleys, there would be no trace of cliche. If in a painting, the three-layer structure can be created with the breath of life, even if there are tiny flaws in the using of brush and *mo*, no doubt [it is still a good landscape].

The original Chinese:

境界章第十

分疆三叠两段，似乎山水之失，然有不失之者，如自然分疆者，到江吴地尽，隔岸越山多是也。每每写山水，如开辟分破，毫无生活，见之即知。分疆三叠者: 一层山，二层树，三层山，望之何分远近?写此三叠奚啻印刻?两段者:景在下，山在上，俗以云在中，分明隔做两段。为此三者，先要贯通一气，不可拘泥。分疆三叠两段，偏要空手作用，才见笔力，即入千峰万壑，俱无俗迹。为此三者入神，则于细碎有失，亦不疑矣。

Bibliography

Primary sources

Anderson, Lyall I. "Before the Scottish Survey: Alfred Harker the Geologist." *Proceedings of the Geologists' Association* 125, no. 3 (2014/07): 350–58.

Ardill, Thomas. "*Sketches of Port Askaig, Islay; East Tarbert, Kintyre; and the River Scavaig* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner." Catalogue entry, March 2010. In David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*. Tate Research Publication, December 2012. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-sketches-of-port-askaig-islay-east-tarbert-kintyre-and-the-r1134943

—— "*Loch na Cuilce and Loch Coruisk from Sgurr na Stri* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner." Catalogue entry, March 2010. In David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*. Tate Research Publication, December 2012. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-loch-na-cuilce-and-loch-coruisk-from-sgurr-na-stri-r1134945

—— "*Loch Coruisk, Skye* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner." Catalogue entry, March 2010. In David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*. Tate Research Publication, December 2012. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-loch-coruisk-skye-r1134946

—— "*Entrance to Loch Coruisk at Loch na Cuilce, Skye* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner." Catalogue entry, June 2010, in David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*, Tate Research Publication, December 2012. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/

jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-entrance-to-loch-coruisk-at-loch-na-cuilce-skye-r1135004

—— "*Sketches of the Head of Loch Scavaig and Rum from Camasunary Bay* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner." Catalogue entry, March 2010. In David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours.* Tate Research Publication, December 2012. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-sketches-of-the-head-of-loch-scavaig-and-rum-from-camasunary-r1135006

—— "*Port Askaig, Islay; and Loch Coruisk, Skye* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner." Catalogue entry, March 2010. In David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*. Tate Research Publication, December 2012. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-port-askaig-islay-and-loch-coruisk-skye-r1135019

—— "*A Sketch of Two Sitting Figures Surrounded by Sketches of Arran, East Tarbert and Knock Castle* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner." Catalogue entry, March 2010. In David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*, Tate Research Publication, December 2012. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/research-publications/jmw-turner/joseph-mallord-william-turner-a-sketch-of-two-sitting-figures-surrounded-by-sketches-of-r1135024

——- "*Three Sketches of Glencoe with Achtriochtan* 1831 by Joseph Mallord William Turner." Catalogue entry, April 2010. In David Blayney Brown (ed.), *J.M.W. Turner: Sketchbooks, Drawings and Watercolours*, Tate Research Publication, December 2012. Accessed 30 March 2022 https://www.tate.org.uk/art/artworks/turner-three-sketches-of-glencoe-with-achtriochtan-d26801

An, Qi 安旗. *Li Bai Nianpu* 李白年谱 (*The Chronicle of Li Bai*). Jinan: Qilu Shushe, 1982.

Bell, B. R. and J. W Harris. *An Excursion Guide to the Geology of the Isle of Skye.* Glasgow: Geological Society of Glasgow, 1986.

Berger, John. *Ways of Seeing*. London: Penguin, 1972. —— *About Looking*. London: Writers and Readers, 1980.

Berkeley, George. *A Treatise Concerning the Principles of Human Knowledge. Philadelphia: J.B. Lippincott & Company, 1878.*

Brentano, Franz. *Psychology from an Empirical Standpoint.* Translated by Antos C. Rancurello, D.B. Terrell and Linda L. McAllister. 1874, reprinted, London: Routledge, 1995.

Burkus-Chasson, Anne. "Clouds and mist That Emanate and Sink Away." *Art History* 19, no.2, (June 1996): 169–190.

Cahill, James. *Chinese Painting*. Geneva: Skira, 1960.

—— *The Compelling Image.* Mass: Harvard University Press, 1979.

Campbell, Mungo. *A Complete Catalogue of Works by Turner in the National Gallery of Scotland.* Edinburgh: National Galleries of Scotland, 1993.

Carrier, David. *A World Art History and Its Objects.* Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2008.

—— "Ernst Gombrich's Account of Chinese Painting." In *ART and the MIND*, ed. by Sybille Moser-Ernst, 381–98. Gottingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2018.

Chen, Guoping 陳國平. "Ping Qiufeng Wenji Zhong Youguan Shitao Shiwen de Jidian Chuanwu 评《虬峰文集》中有关石涛诗文的几点舛误 (Comments on the Errors about Shi Tao Poems in Collected works of Qiu Feng)." *Arts Exploration,* no.2 (2011): 5–11.

Chen, Shunyu 陳舜俞. *Lu Shan Ji* 廬山記 (*Mount Lu*). Song dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/65981

Clark, Kenneth. *Landscape into Art.* London: J. Murray, 1976.

Compact Oxford English Dictionary, ed. by Catherine Soanes and Sara Hawker. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

Confucius. "Zihan 子罕" In *Lun Yun* 論語. 480–350 BC, reprinted, 武英殿十三经注疏 (Thirteen classics with notes published by Wuying Dian), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/analects/zi-han

Dale, Thomas R. "From Epic to Romance: Barbour's Bruce and Scott's The Lord of the Isles." *Studies in Scottish Literature* 26, Issue 1, no. 44 (1991): 515–521.

Davies, Maurice. *Turner as Professor.* London: Tate Gallery Publishing, 1992. Derrida, Jacques. *The Truth in Painting.* Translated by Geoffrey Bennington and Ian McLeod. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.

Drayton, Michael. *The Barons' Wars, Nymphidia, and Other Poems.* London: George Routledge & Sons, 1887.

Duan, Yucai 段玉裁. *Shuowen Jiezi Zhu* 說文解字注 (*Notes on 'Explanations of Characters and Words'*). 清嘉庆二十年經韵樓刻本 (Jingyun Lou Version of the Twentieth Year of Jia Qing). 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/265530

Elkins, James. *Stories of Art.* New York: Routledge, 2002.

—— *Chinese Landscape Painting as Western Art History.* Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2010.

—— "Art History as A Global Discipline." In *Is Art History Global?* ed. by James Elkins, 3-23. London and New York: Routledge, 2013.

Fang, Xuanling 房玄齡 (editor). "Xieshang Xiean 謝尚 謝安." In *Jin Shu* 晉書 (*The History of Jin*). Tang dynasty, reprinted, 武英殿二十四史 (Twenty-four history books published by Wuying Dian), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), no. 79. Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/962911

Finley, Gerald. *Landscapes of Memory.* London: Scolar Press, 1980.

Fu, Baoshi 傅抱石. *Ming Mo Shitao Shangren Zhu Ruoji Nianpu* 明末石濤上人朱若極年譜 (*The Chronicle of the Eminent Monk Shitao, Zhu Ruoji, of the Last Years of Ming*), ed. by Wang Yunwu 王雲五. Taibei: Taiwan Shangwu Yinshuguan, 1978.

—— *Fu Baoshi Meishu Wenji Xubian* 傅抱石美術文集續編 (*The Sequel to the Collected Works of Fu Baoshi on Fine Art*), ed. by Ye Zonggao 葉宗鎬. Shanghai: Shanghai Shuhua Chubanshe, 2014. Kindle.

Gage, John. *Colour in Turner: Poetry and Truth.* London: Studio Vista, 1969.

—— *J.M.W. Turner: A Wonderful Range of Mind.* London: Yale University Press,1987.

Gombrich, Ernst. *Art And Illusion.* Washington DC: Phaidon Press, 1959.

Guo, Xi 郭熙. *Linquan Gaozhi* 林泉高致 (*The Elegance and Sublimity of the Forests and Springs*), ed. by Guo Si 郭思. Song dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021 https://ctext.org/430059

Hamilton, James, *Turner and the Scientists.* London: Tate Gallery Publishing, 1998.

Han, Zhuo 韓拙. *Shanshui Chun Quanji* 山水纯全集 (*Complete Works on Landscape Painting*). 1121 AD. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/=598650

Harker, Alfred. "Glaciated Valleys in the Cuillins, Skye." *Geological Magazine* 6, no. 5 (May 1899): 196–99.

—— *The Tertiary Igneous Rocks of Skye.* Glasgow: J. Hedderwick & Sons, 1904.

—— "Ice-Erosion in the Cuillin Hills, Skye." *Earth and Environmental Science Transactions of The Royal Society of Edinburgh* 40, no. 2 (1905): 221–52.

Hay, Jonathan. *Shitao: Painting and Modernity in Early Qing China*. Cambridge: *Cambridge University Press, 2001.*

Heidegger, Martin. *Being and Time.* Translated by John Macquarrie and Edward S. Robinson. 1962, reprinted, London, Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1978.

—— *Off the Beaten Track*, Edited and Translated by Kenneth Haynes and Julian Young. Cambridge University Press, 2002.

Holcomb, Adele M. "Turner and Scott." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 34 (1971): 386–97.

Husserl, Edmund. *Logical Investigations I & II.* Translated by J. N. Findlay. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1970.

—— *Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy: First Book.* Translated by F. Kersten. Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1983.

—— *The Idea of Phenomenology.* Translated by Lee Hardy. London: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1999.

—— *The Phenomenology of Internal Time-Consciousness,* ed. by Martin Heidegger. Translated by James S. Churchill. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2019.

—— *Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy: Second Book*. Translated by Richard Rojcewicz and André Schuwer. London: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2002.

Ingarden, Roman. *Time and Modes of Being*. Springfield, IL: Charles C Thomas, 1964.

—— *Studia z estetyki,* Vol. 3. Warsaw: PWN, 1970: 266–7.

—— *The Cognition of the Literary Work of Art.* Translated by Ruth Ann Crowley and Kenneth R. Olson. Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1973.

—— *The Literary Work of Art.* Translated by George G. Grabowicz. Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1973.

Ishikawa Jun 石川淳, ed. *Tao-chi.* Tōkyō: Chūō Kōronsha, 1986.

Kalupahana, David. *The Philosophy of the Middle Way.* Delhi: Motilai Banarsidass *Publishers, 1986.*

Kant, Immanuel. *Critique of Pure Reason.* Translated by Paul Guyer and Allen W. Wood. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.

Li, Bai 李白. *Li Taibai Jizhu* 李太白集注 (*Collected Works of Li Bai*), ed. by Wang Qi 王琦. 欽定四庫全書 (The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor), 1781. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/438340

Li, Daoyuan 酈道元. *Shui Jing Zhu* 水經注 (*The Notes of Waters*). 欽定四庫全書 (The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 39, no.48. Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/660112

Li, Jiong 李泂. "Kaixian Si Guan Pubu Ji 开先寺观瀑布记 (Visiting the Kaixian Si Waterfall)." In *Lushan Youji Xuan* 庐山游记选 (*Travelogue Collection of Mount Lu*), ed. by Zhou Luanshu 周銮书 and Zhao Ming 赵明, 45–50. Nanchang: Jiangxi Renmin Chubanshe, 1996.

Li Yanshou 李延壽, "謝靈運." In *Nan Shi* 南史 (*The History of the Southern Dynasties*) *Vol. 19.* Tang dynasty. 中國哲學書電子化計劃 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 30 March 2022, https://ctext.org/280630

Liu, An 劉安. "Dao Ying Xun 道應訓 (The Effect of Moral Behaviour)." In *The Huainan Zi* 淮南子, ed. by Gao You 高诱. c. 206 BC, reprinted, 四部丛刊初编 (The First

Published Version of Sibu Congkan), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/dao-ying-xun

Liu, Tongsheng 刘同升. "Lushan Sanshiliang Ji 廬山三石梁記 (*Sanshiliang of Mount Lu: A Travelogue*)." In *Lushan Youji Xuan 廬山遊記選 (Travelogue Collection of Mount Lu),* ed. by Zhou Luanshu 周銮书 and Zhao Ming 赵明, 77–79. Nanchang: Jiangxi Renmin Chubanshe, 1996.

Lou, Jinyuan 婁近垣. Longhu Shan Zhi 龍虎山誌 (Archives of Longhu Shan). Nanchang: Jiangxi Renmin Chubanshe, 1996.

MacCulloch, John. "Description of the Western Islands of Scotland," in *Geology, Paleontology & Theories of the Earth*. London: Archibald Constable and Co., 1819.

—— The Highlands and Western Isles of Scotland, Vol. 3. London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, Brown and Green, 1824.

MacCulloch, J. A. *The Misty Isle of Skye: Its Scenery, Its People, Its Story.* London: Oliphant Anderson & Ferrier, 1905.

Merleau-Ponty, Maurice, *The Visible and the Invisible.* Illinois: Northwestern University Press, 1968.

—— *Basic Writings*, ed. by Thomas Baldwin. London: Routledge, 2004.

—— *Phenomenology of Perception*. London; New York: Routledge, 2012.

Morley, James. "It's Always About the Epoché." In *The Redirection of Psychology: Essays in Honor of Amedeo P. Giorgi. Les Collectifs du Cirp Vol.1 (édition spéciale),* ed. by T. F. Cloonan and C. Thiboutot, 223-232. Montréal: Université du Québec à Montréal, 2010.

Penman, Michael. *Robert the Bruce: King of the Scots.* New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014.

Qian Mu 錢穆. *Zhuzi Xin Xuean* 朱子新學案 (*New Studies on Zhu Zi*) *Vol. 3.* Chengdu: Bashu Shu She, 1986.

Rudnick, Hans H. *Ingardeniana II: New Studies in the Philosophy of Roman Ingarden With a New International Ingarden Bibliography.* Springer Science & Business Media, 2012.

Ruskin, John. *The Works of John Ruskin, Vol. 13,* ed. by Edward Tyas Cook and Alexander Wedderburn. London: George Allen, 1904.

Schapiro, Meyer. *Theory and Philosophy of Art.* George Braziller, 1994.

Schutz, Alfred. *Collected Papers 1: The Problem of Social Reality,* ed. by Maurice Natanson. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1962.

Scott, Walter. *The Lord of the Isles, The Poetical Works of Sir Walter Scott Vol. 10.* Edinburgh: Robert Cadell, 1833.

Shanes, Eric. *The Life and Masterworks of J.M.W. Turner.* New York: Parkstone International, 2008.

Shitao 石濤. *Shitao Huayu Lu* 石涛画语录 (*Shitao's Analects on Painting*), ed. by Yu Jianhua 俞劍華. Beijing: Renmin Meishu Chubanshe, 2016.

Sima, Qian 司馬遷. "Boyi Shuqi Liezhuan 伯夷叔齊列傳 (Biographies of Boyi and Shuqi)." In *Shi Ji* 史記 (*The History*). c. 109–91 BC, reprinted, 武英殿二十四史 (Twenty-four history books published by WuYing Dian), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/shiji/bo-yi-lie-zhuan

Sirén, Osvald. *Chinese Painting Leading Masters and Principles Vol. 1 & 5.* London: London Humphries, 1958.

Su, Shi 蘇軾. "Shu Wang Mojie Lantian Yanyu Tu 書王摩詰藍田煙雨圖 (Inscription on Wang Movie's painting)." In *Su Shi Wenji* 蘇軾文集 (*Collected Proses of Su Shi*) Vol. 70, ed. by Kong Fanli 孔凡禮. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1982.

—— "Shu Yanling Wang Zhubu suo Hua Zhezhi Er Shou 書鄢陵王主簿所画折枝二首 (Two poems for Yanling Wang)." In *Su Shi Shiji* 蘇軾詩集 (*Collected Poems of Su Shi*), Vol. 29, ed. by Kong Fanli 孔凡禮. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1982.

—— "You Ba Haniie Hua Shan 又跋漢傑画山 (The Second Postscript on Hanjie's Painting of Mountains)." In *Su Shi Wenji* 蘇軾文集 (*Collected Proses of Su Shi*), ed. by Kong FanLi 孔凡禮. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1986.

Sullivan, Michael. *Symbols of Eternity: The Art of Landscape Painting in China.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1979: 17.

Tibaldi, A., A. F. Pasquarè and D. Rust. "New Insights into the Cone Sheet Structure of the Cuillin Complex, Isle of Skye, Scotland." *Journal of the Geological Society* 168 (March 2011): 689–704.

Tōkyō Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan., ed. *Min Shin No Kaiga.* Kyōto: Benridō, 1964.

Törmä, Minna. "Looking at Chinese Landscape Painting: Traditions of Spatial Representation." In *Looking at Other Cultures: Works of Art as Icons of Memory*, ed. by Anja Kervanto Nevanlinna, 119–35. Helsinki: Society for Art History in Finland, 1999.

Williams, A. M., Frederick T. Smith and J.M. Parrish., ed. *The "King's English" Dictionary*. London: British Books Limited, 1925.

Wollheim, Richard. "Freud and the Understanding of Art," in *On Art and the Mind.* Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1974.

—— "Criticism as Retrieval" in *Art and Its Objects*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1980.

—— *Painting as an Art*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.

Wordsworth, Jonathan. "Review *The Dark Side of the Landscape: The Rural Poor in English Painting 1730–1840* by John Barrell." *The Review of English Studies*, Vol. 34, no.133 (February 1983): 83–86.

Wu, Lifu 伍蠡甫, *Shanshui Meixue* 山水與美學 (*Mountains and Waters in Relation to Aesthetics*). Shanghai: Shanghai Wenyi Shuban She, 1985.

Xu, Fuguan. *Xu Fuguan Quanji* 徐複觀全集 (*Complete Works of Xu Fuguan*). Beijing: Jiuzhou Chubanshe, 2013.

Xu, Shen 許慎. *Shuo Wen Jie Zi* 說文解字 (*Explanations of Characters and Words*), ed. by Xu Xian 徐鉉. Reprinted, Hong Kong: Zhong Hua Shuju, 1972.

Xuanhe Huapu 宣和畫譜 (*Category of Paintings in Royal Collection Written in Xuanhe)*. 欽定四庫全書 (The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/668529

Yang, Chengyin 楊成寅. *Shitao Huaxue Benyi* 石濤畫學本義 (*The Essential Meaning of Shitao's Painting Theory*). Hangzhou: Zhejiang Renmin Meishu Chubanshe, 1996.

Ye Yanlan 叶衍兰 and Ye Gongchuo 叶恭绰. *Portraits of Qing Scholars Vol.1 & 2.* Qing dynasty, reprinted, Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Chuban She, 1989.

Zahavi, Dan. *Husserl's Phenomenology.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2003.

—— "Applied Phenomenology: Why It Is Safe to Ignore the Epoché." *Continental Philosophy Review* 54, no. 2 (January 2021): 259–73.

Zhao Yuan 趙園, *Ming-Qing Zhiji Shidaifu Yanjiu* 明清之際士大夫研究 (*A Study of the Literati-Officials During the Ming-Qing Transition*). Beijing: Peking University Press, 1999.

—— *Yitang Xunzong* 易堂尋蹤: 關於明清之際一個士人群體的敍述 (*The Traces of Yi Hall: The Narrative of A Group of Literati During the Ming-Qing Transition*). Nanchang: Jiangxi Education Press, 2001.

—— "Zhaoyuan: Ming-Qing Zhiji de Yimin yu Erchen 趙園: 明清之際的遺民與貳臣 (*Zhao Yuan: the Yimin and Surrendered Ministers During the Ming-Qing*

Transition)", ed. Zhang Mingyang 張明揚, *Oriental Morning Post. Shanghai Book Review,* 8, July, 2012.

Zhou, Luanshu 周銮书 and Zhao Ming 赵明, ed. *Lushan Youji Xuan* 庐山游记选 (*Travelogue Collection of Mount Lu*). Nanchang: Jiangxi Renmin Chubanshe, 1996.

Zhu, Liangzhi 朱良志. Chuanshi Shitao Kuan Zuopin Zhenwei Kao 传世石涛款作品真伪考 (Identification of Works attributed to Shitao). Beijing: Peking University Press, 2017.

—— *Shitao Yanjiu* 石濤研究 (*Studies on Shitao*). Beijing: Peking University Press, 2017.

Zhuang Zi 莊子. "Renshi Jian 人世间 (The Earthly World)." In *Zhuang Zi* 莊子. c. 350–250 BC, reprinted, 武英殿二十四史 (Twenty-four history books published by WuYing Dian), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/zhuangzi/

Secondary sources

Adams, Laurie Schneider. *The Methodologies of Art.* Philadelphia: Westview Press, 1996.

Aguilera, Steven. *A New Perspective Universal Edition.* Lulu.com, 2008.

Alastair Humphreys. "A Mountain Microadventure." Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.alastairhumphreys.com/mountain-microadventure/

Armstrong, Paul B. "Phenomenology". In *The Johns Hopkins Guide to Literary Theory and Criticism,* ed. by Michael Groden and Martin Kreiswirth, 564. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1994.

Awei 阿威. "The Treasures Old Photographies Taken at the Times of Republic of China: Clouds, Mist, and Mountains, the Xianglu Peak." Awei's Talking on History. Accessed 4 February 2022, https://www.sohu.com/a/376635663_120286605

Baker, Christopher. *English Drawings and Watercolours 1600–1900.* Edinburgh: Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 2011.

Ballantyne, Colin K. "Scottish Landform Examples 2: The Landslides of Trotternish, Isle of Skye." *Scottish Geographical Magazine* 107, no. 2 (September 1991): 130–35.

Ban, Gu 班固. *Han Shu* 汉书 (*The History of Han*). 武英殿二十四史 (Twenty-four history books published by WuYing Dian), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/=533615

Barrell, John. *The Dark Side of The Landscape.* Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1980.

Baxandall, Michael. *Patterns of Intention.* New Heaven: Yale University Press, 1985.

Bermingham, Ann. *Landscape and Ideology.* London: Thames & Hudson, 1987.

Bilham-Boult, Alan. *People, Places and Themes.* 1999, reprinted, Oxford: Heinemann, 2001.

Brandriss, Mark E., Sharon Mason and Kelsey Winsor. "Rhythmic Layering Formed by Deposition of Plagioclase Phenocrysts from Influxes of Porphyritic Magma in the Cuillin Centre, Isle of Skye." *Journal of Petrology* 55, no. 8 (August 2014): 1479–1510.

Brook, Martin S., Martin P. Kirkbride and Ben W. Brock. "Rock Strength and Development of Glacial Valley Morphology in the Scottish Highlands and Northwest Iceland." *Geografiska Annaler. Series A, Physical Geography* 86, no. 3 (2004): 225–34.

Burgess, Peter. "Picture Gallery for Sgurr Alasdair". Accessed 11 May 2020, http://www.munromagic.com/PictureGallery.cfm?Mountain=154

Bush, Susan and Hsio-yen Shih. *Early Chinese Texts on Painting.*, ed. Hong Kong; London: Hong Kong University Press, 2012.

Carrier, David. "In Praise of Connoisseurship." *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 61 (February 2003): 159–69.

Casey, Edward S. "Aesthetic Experience." In *Handbook of Phenomenological Aesthetics*, ed. by Hans Rainer Sepp and Lester Emberee, 1-7. London: Springer, 2010.

Chen, Huei-Ling 陳惠玲. "An Art Philosophical Study on Shitao's Hua-Yu-Lu. 石濤《畫語錄》的藝術哲學研究." PhD diss., Tunghai University.

Chou8942. "The beautiful Sandiequan." Accessed 4 February 2022, http://chou8942.pixnet.net/blog/post/463845824

Clark, T. J. *Image of the People.* London: Thames and Hudson, 1973.

Contag, Victoria. *Chinese Masters of the 17th Century.* London: Lund Humphries, 1969.

Cosgrove, Denis. "John Ruskin and the Geographical Imagination." Geographical Review 69, No. 1 (Jan 1979): 43-62.

—— *"Prospect, Perspective and the Evolution of the Landscape Idea." Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 10, no. 1 (1985): 45–62.

—— and Stephen Daniels, *The Iconography of Landscape.* Cambridge: Cambridge *University Press, 1988.*

Crowther, Paul. *Phenomenology of the Visual Arts.* Stanford University Press, 2010.

D'Alleva, Anne. *Methods & Theories of Art History.* London: Laurence King Publishing, 2005.

Damisch, Hubert and John Goodman. *The Origin of Perspective.* London: MIT Press, 1994.

Daniell, William and Richard Ayton's *A Voyage round Great Britain.* London: Tate Gallery and the Scolar Press, 1978.

Dreyfus, Hubert L. *Being-in-the-World: A Commentary on Heidegger's Being and Time.* London: MIT Press, 1991.

Du, Du 杜篤. "Shouyang Shan Fu 首陽山賦 (Mount Shouyang)." In *Yiwen LeiJu* 藝文類聚(*The Collection of Artistic Writings*), ed. by Ouyang Xun 欧阳询. c. 624 AD, reprinted, 欽定四庫全書 (The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the

Emperor), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/=541138

Duchemin, H. P. ''Michael Drayton's Poly Olbion: A Critical and Historical Study.'' PhD diss., University of London, 1975.

Earth Trekkers's Blog. Accessed 3 February 2022, https://www.earthtrekkers.com/old-man-of-storr-isle-skye-scotland/

Edinburgh University Library. "Walter Scott". Accessed 19 December 2011, http://www.walterscott.lib.ed.ac.uk/works/poetry/lord.html

Fengguo Wuhen. "Sandie Quan of Mount Lu." Accessed 4 February 2022, https://www.mifoot.com/footprint/368

Fernie, Eric. *Art History and Its Methods*. London: Phaidon Press Limited, 1995.

Finberg, Alexander Joseph. *The Life of J.M.W. Turner.* Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1939.

Fumerton, Richard. "Phenomenalism." In *The Shorter Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, ed. By Edward Craig, 790. London: Routledge, 2005.

Garvey, John. *William Daniell's Isle of Skye and Raasay.* Troubador Publishing Ltd, 2009.

Gerwen, Rob Van. *Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation and Expression*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.

Grey, Mal. "Wilderness Mind." Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.wildernessisastateofmind.co.uk/fullscreen-page/comp-jbmkbzrk/238fa091-9f4c-438b-811e-9c263adfb04a/32/%3Fi%3D32%26p%3Dm613g%26s%3Dstyle-jbmkvuzr

Halák, Jan, Ivo Jirásek, and Mark Nesti, "Phenomenology is Not Phenomenalism. Is There Such a Thing as Phenomenology of Sport?", *Acta Gymnica* Vol. 44, no.2, (2014): 117–129.

Hamilton, James. *Turner - A Life.* London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1997.

Harris, Jonathan. *The New Art History.* London: Routledge, 2001.

Hatt, Michael and Klonk, Charlotte. *Art History: A critical introduction to its methods* Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1988.

Heavywhalley's Blog. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://heavywhalley.wordpress.com/ 2017/12/12/yesterday-was-international-mountain-day-my-favourite-mountain-is- sgurr-na-stri-in-skye-the-hill-of-strife/

Heffernan, James A. W. "Wordsworth, Coleridge, and Turner: The Geometry of the Infinite", *The Bucknell Reviwe*, 29, no.1 (January 1984), 49-72.

Herwitz, Daniel. "The Work of Art as Psychoanalytical Object." *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 49, no. 2 (1991): 137–53.

Hoskins, W.G. *The Making of The English Landscape.* London: Penguin, 1985.

Institute of Geology and Geophysics, Chinese Academy of Science. *Dizhi Kexue* 地质科学 (Geology). Beijing: Kexue Chuban She, 2006.

Ingold, Tim. "The Temporality of the Landscape." *World Archaeology* 25, no. 2 (October 1993): 152–174.

—— *The Perception of the Environment*. London: Routledge, 2000.

Jacobs, Hanne. "Husserl, Heidegger, and Merleau-Ponty on the World of Experience." In *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Phenomenology*, ed. by Dan Zahavi, 652 – 676. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018.

Jiang, Jianjun, Xun Zhao and Youfang Chen. 2006. "Geological Heritage in China", in *Geotourism,* ed. Ross Dowling and David Newsome, 140 –156. Oxford: Elsevier.

Jmherbert. "Sgurr Na Banachdaich - Cullin - Skye - Munros - Walking in The West Highlands - Scotland." Over the Hill. Accessed 3 February 2022, http:// www.jmherbert.co.uk/gallery/pages/gallery200.html

Kemp, Martin. "On the Historical Explanation of Pictures by Michael Baxandall." *Zeitschrift Für Kunstgeschichte* 50, no.1 (1987): 131–41.

Klonk, Charlotte. *Science and the Perception of Nature.* New Haven: Yale University Press, 1996.

Kuo, J.C. "Word and Image in *Watching the Waterfall at Mt. Lu* by Shih-t'ao." *National Palace Museum Bulletin* 28, no.5 (November to December 1993), 1–13.

Lagerlund, Henrik. "A History of Skepticism in the Middle Ages." In *Rethinking the History of Skepticism*, ed. by Henrik Lagerlund. Leiden: BRILL, 2010.

"Landscape of Memory: The Art of Mu Xin". Asia Society. Accessed 25 February 2021, https://asiasociety.org/landscape-memory-art-mu-xin.https://asiasociety.org/landscape-memory-art-mu-xin

Lankford, E. Louis. "A Phenomenological Methodology for Art Criticism." *Studies in Art Education* 25, no. 3 (April 1984): 151–58.

Lishi Mingjia Zatan "Memory: old photographies of Mount Lu in Jiangxi province." Accessed 4 February 2022, https://www.163.com/dy/article/DP2NJKUN05431HG9.html.

Liu, Peiqing. *A General Theory of Fluid Mechanics.* Beijing: Science Press, 2021. Liu, Vic, "Jinxiu Valley of Mount Lu." Accessed 4 February 2022, https://www.flickr.com/ photos/vicliu/2455524943

Lonsdale, Liam. "Reach for the Skye." Accessed 03 February 2022, http://liamlonsdale.squarespace.com/journal/reach-for-the-skye-charlie-woodburn

Lu, You 陸游. "Jiannan Shigao 劍南詩稿 (Poems Written at Jiannan)." In *Lu You Ji* 陸游集 (*Collected works of Lu You*). Beijing: Zhong Hua Shuju, 1976.

Maan Shan Editorial Department of Chinese Studies on Li Bai 馬鞍山中國李白研究編輯部. *Zhongguo Li Bai Yanjiu 1991 Nianji* 中國李白研究1991年集 (Chinese Studies on Li Bai Annual Collection 1991). Nanjing: Jiangsu Guji Chubanshe, 1993.

MacCulloch, J. A. *The Misty Isle of Skye: Its Scenery, Its People, Its Story.* London: Oliphant Anderson & Ferrier, 1905.

MacGregor, Malcolm. Accessed 9 May 2020, https://www.malcolmmacgregor.photo/portfolio/view/the-scavaig-river-flowing-out-of-loch-coruisk-isle-of-skye/scotland-the-western-isles

Mach, Ernst. "The Analysis of the Sensations. Antimetaphysical." *The Monist* 1, no. 1 (1890): 48–68.

Macleod, Christopher. "John Stuart Mill." The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Last modified 25 August 2016, https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2018/entries/mill/

Majewska, Zofia. "The Philosophy of Roman Ingarden." In *Phenomenology World-Wide:Foundations, Expanding Dynamics, Life-Engagements,* ed. by Anna-Teresa Tymieniecka, 184–199. Springer, 2014.

Malky_c. "Walk Report - A Black Cuillin Crossing in Search of the Coast." Walkhighlands. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.walkhighlands.co.uk/Forum/viewtopic.php?f=9&t=81993

Mark. "A Loch Coruisk Camp and a Walk up Sgurr Na Stri." Halfway Hike. Accessed 3 February 2022, https://halfwayhike.com/2016/05/19/loch-coruisk-camp-walk-sgurr-na-stri/

Mates, Benson. *The Skeptic Way.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996.

Mill, John Stuart. *A System of Logic, Ratiocinative and Inductive.* London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, Brown and Green, 1906.

Mitchell, W. J. T. "Imperial Landscape". In *Landscape and Power*, 1994, ed. by W. J. T. Mitchell, 5–34. Reprinted, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002.

Mo Zi 墨子. *Mo Zi* 墨子. Zhangguo period. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/377144

Moran, Dermot. "Intentionality." In *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Phenomenology*, ed. by Dan Zahavi, 579–603. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018.

Nanjing Geology and Mineral Institute 南京地質礦產研究所. *Ziyuan Diaocha yu Huanjing* 资源调查与环境 (Investigation on Natural Resource and Environment), Vol. 28. Ziyuan Diaocha yu Huangjing Bianjibu, 2007.

Neher, Allister. "How Perspective Could Be a Symbolic Form." *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 63, no. 4 (2005): 359–73.

Ouyang, Xiu 歐陽修., ed. *"Lie Zhuan 列傳 (Biographies)", in Xin Tangshu* 新唐書 (*New history of Tang*). Song dynasty, reprinted, 欽定四庫全書 (The Complete Library in Four Sections Approved by the Emperor), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 122, no. 2. Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/769909

Panofsky, Erwin. *Perspective as Symbolic Form.* New York: Zone Books, 1997.

Paterson, J. H. "The Novelist and His Region: Scotland through the Eyes of Sir Walter Scott," *Scottish Geographical Magazine* 81, no. 3 (December 1965): 146–52. Parminter, John. "The Dubh Ridge." Viewlakeland. Accessed 3 February 2022, https:// www.viewlakeland.com/the-dubh-ridge

Pytlak, Andrzej. "On Ingarden's Conception of the Musical Composition", in *On the Aesthetics of Roman Ingarden: Interpretations and Assessments,* ed. B. Dziemidok and P. McCormick, 234–5. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publisher, 1989.

Rao, Zongyi 饒宗頤. "Fang Yizhi Huanlun 方以智畫論 (Fang Yizhi on Painting)." *Zhong Guo Wenhua Yanjiu Xuebao* 7 no. 1 (December 1974), 124–125.

Reuter, Martina. "Merleau-Ponty's Notion of Pre-Reflective Intentionality." *Synthese* 118, no. 1 (1999): 69–88.

Richter-Musso, Ines, Ortrud Westheider and Michael Philipp. *Turner and the Elements.* University of Chicago Press, 2011.

Rodner, William S. *J.M.W. Turner: Romantic Painter of the Industrial Revolution.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997.

Rosenthal, Michael. *The Art of Thomas Gainsborough.* New Haven: Yale University Press, 1999.

Sanekata, Yoko. "无为庵，孤高独行收藏痴 (Wu Wei Hut, the Solitary Collecter)." In *Zhong Guo Shu Hua Zai Ri Ben: Guanxi Bainian Jiancang jilu* 中国书画在日本: 关西百年鉴藏记录 (Chinese Paintings in Japan: the one hundred year collection in Guanxi). Shanghai: Shanghai Shuhua Chubanshe, 2017.

Shcherbatskoy, Fyodor Ippolitovich. *The Central Conception of Buddhism and the Meaning of the Word 'Dharma'.* Motilal Banarsidass Publisher, 1970.

Siewert, Charles. "Consciousness and Intentionality." The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Last modified 2016. https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2017/entries/consciousness-intentionality/

Sirisha, P. "Block Mountains: Definition, Types and Theories | Mountains | Geography." Geography Notes. Accessed 16 November 2021, https://www.geographynotes.com/mountains-2/block-mountains/block-mountains-definition-types-and-theories-mountains-geography/2252

Sloan, Phillip R. "Mach's Phenomenalism and the British Reception of Mendelism." *Comptes Rendus de l'Académie Des Sciences III, Sciences de La Vie* 323, no. 12 (December 2000): 1069–79.

Smith, David Woodruff. "Phenomenology." The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Last modified Dec 16, 2013, https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2018/entries/phenomenology/

Sutherland, D.G. "The Cuillin," in *Quaternary of Scotland*, eds. D. G. Gordon and D.G. Sutherland. Springer Science & Business Media, 2012.

Taminiaux, Jacques and Michael Gendre. *Heidegger and the Project of Fundamental Ontology.* New York: State University of New York Press, 1991.

Tang Qimin 唐啟敏. "Travel Tips about Jinxiu Valley of Mount Lu." Accessed 5 February 022, http://www.lvmama.com/lvyou/photo/d-jinxiugu108371.html

Tao, Yuanming 陶淵明. "*Gui Qu Lai Ci* 歸去來辭 (Returning Homing)." In *Jianzhu Tao Yuanming Ji* 箋註陶淵明集 (*Collection of Tao Yuanming's Works with Notes*). Jin dynasty, reprinted, 四部叢刊初編 (The First Published Version of Sibu Congkan), 景上海涵芬樓藏宋刊巾箱本(Jing Shanghai Hanfenlou Collected Song Dynasty Portable Version), Song dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 5 no. 2. Accessed 3 November 2021, https://ctext.org/=189448

——— "*He Guo Zhubu Ershou* 和郭主簿二首(Two Poems for Guo Zhubu in Guo's Rhythm)." In *Jianzhu Tao Yuanming Ji* 箋註陶淵明集 (*Collection of Tao Yuanming's Works with Notes*). Jin dynasty, reprinted, 四部叢刊初編 (The First Published Version of Sibu Congkan), 景上海涵芬樓藏宋刊巾箱本(Jing Shanghai Hanfenlou Collected Song Dynasty Portable Version), Song dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks), Vol. 2, no. 44. Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/=189448

The Geograph® Britain and Ireland. Accessed 03 February 2022, https://www.geograph.org.uk/photo/829282

Thomasson, Amie. "Roman Ingarden." The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Last modified Fall 2020, https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/ingarden/

Thornbury, Walter. *The Life of J. M. W. Turner*. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1939.

Tilley, Christopher. *The Materiality of Stone*. Oxford: Berg, 2004.

Uemura, Genki. "Demystifying Roman Ingarden's Purely Intentional Objects of Perception." In *New Phenomenological Studies in Japan*, ed. by Nicolas de Warren and Shigeru Taguchi, 139–62. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2019.

Wheeler, Michael. "Martin Heidegger." The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Last modified Fall 2020, https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/heidegger/

Wild, Carolyn. "Style and Value in the Art of Painting." In *Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting*, ed. by Rob van Gerwen, 121–135. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.

Wilton, Andrew. *Turner and the Sublime.* London: British Museum Publications Ltd, 1980.

Wimsatt, W. K. and Beardsley, M. C. "The Intentional Fallacy." *The Sewanee Review* 54, no. 3 (1946): 468–88.

Wu, Rujun 吳汝鈞. *Fojiao Sixiang Dacidian* 佛教思想大辭典 (*Dictionary of Buddhistic Ideology*). Taibei: Taiwan Shangwu Yinshuguan, 1992.

Xiao, Lihua 蕭麗華. "出山與入山李白廬山詩的精神底蘊 (Come and Leave Mount Lu, The essence of Li Bai's poems on Mount Lu)." 台灣大學中國文學報 (Taiwan University Literatura), no. 12 (2010): 185–224.

Yu, Huoxing 鬱火星. "Zai Du Shitao de Lushan Guanpu Tu 再读石涛的《庐山观瀑图 (Re-reading Shitao's *Mount Lu*)." *Yi Shu Yan Jiu* 艺术研究 *(Art Research)* 3, 009 (2004). 60–63.

Zhang, Yanyuan 張彥遠. "Lun Gu, Lu, Zhang, Wu Yongbi 论顾陆张吴用笔 (Observations on Gu, Lu, Zhang, Wu's use of brush)." In *Lidai Minghua Ji* 历代名画记 (*The great paintings through dynasties*). c. 847–859 AD. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021, https://ctext.org/628199

Zhao, Puchu 赵朴初. *Zhao Puchu Wenji* 赵朴初文集 (*Collected Works of Zhao Puchu*). Beijing: Hua Wen Chubanshe, 2007.

Zhou, Xun 周汛. *Zhongguo Lidai Fushi* 中国歷代服饰 (*Chinese Fashion Through the Ages*). Shanghai: Xuelin Chubansh, 1996.

—— and Gao ChunMing 高春明. *Zhongguo Yiguan Fushi Da Cidian* 中国衣冠服饰大辞典 (*Chinese Clothing Dictionary*). Shanghai: Shanghai Cishu Chubanshe, 1996.

Zhu, Chengru 朱诚如. *Qingchao Tongshi Diwujuan Kang Xi Chao* 清朝通史: 第5卷 康熙 朝 (*Qing History: Volume 5 Kang Xi*). Beijing: Zijincheng Chubanshe, 2002.

Zou Si Fang. "Capturing the summer in Longhu Shan." Accessed 4 February 2022, https:// dp.pconline.com.cn/photo/3834847_9.html

Zuo, Qiuming 左丘明. "Ai Gong Sinian 哀公四年 (The Fourth Year of Ai Gong)." In *Chunqiu Zuozhuan* 春秋左传 (the Springs and Autumns Noted by Zuo). c. 468–300 BC, reprinted, 武英殿十三经注疏 (Thirteen classics with notes published by Wuying Dian), Qing dynasty. 中國哲學電子書計畫 (The project of Chinese philosophical ebooks). Accessed 16 November 2021 https://ctext.org/ai-gong-si-nian

-End-