Griffioen, Keith (2024) *Examining social class mobility and career trajectories of working-class musicians.* Ed.D thesis.

https://theses.gla.ac.uk/84551/

Copyright and moral rights for this work are retained by the author

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge

This work cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission from the author

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given

Enlighten: Theses
https://theses.gla.ac.uk/
research-enlighten@glasgow.ac.uk

Examining Social Class Mobility and Career Trajectories of Working-Class Musicians

Keith Griffioen

September 2023

SUBMITTED IN FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF EDUCATION (EdD)

SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

COLLEGE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

SUBMITTED TO THE LIBRARY OF THE UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

SEPTEMBER 2023

Abstract

This research examined class mobility and career trajectories of lower-income, working-class (LIWC) musicians. The aim of the study was to identify in what ways LIWC musicians are challenged when attempting to establish themselves and what factors are necessary for success. Research regarding LIWC musicians exists primarily in relation to popular music rather than multiple genres with a tendency to focus upon the importance of musical participation and access rather than lived experiences of musicians themselves. This study contributes a fresh perspective to music and music education research as the data was exclusively gathered from the memories of eight people, all originally LIWC, who are or were musicians. Coming from diverse backgrounds and locations, each established successful careers and experienced class mobility, some in the musical field and others elsewhere.

This is an empirical study applying a constructivist paradigm framed by Pierre Bourdieu's theory of social reproduction and feminist intersectionality theory. Autobiography, a branch of narrative inquiry, was the chosen methodological approach and data was collected via one-to-one semi-structured interviews and letter writing. The data was analysed using Clandinin and Connelly's (2000) Three-Dimensional Space approach.

The study found most participants experienced challenges due to initial habitus and capital deficits. However, participants focused on performance careers endured far greater challenges than those not striving for a professional career. The sharp divide found in habitus and cultural capital was not quite as evident with social capital. The study also found LIWC musicians struggled to establish themselves not only due to social distance from the centre of the field but also geographical distance. Challenges with social reproduction were compounded for the women participants as they experienced sexism in different ways depending upon their generation. Such challenges led to self-doubt experienced by all but one of the participants, and this was again divided by career goals. These resulted from internal doubt as well as external criticism and treatment. To become successful, all the participants required help through mentorship from others established in the field. A second factor for success was retaining aspects of an LIWC upbringing and applying its work ethic. These factors had the greatest impact upon career trajectories and class mobility.

Table of Contents

Abstract *2*

Table of Contents *3*

List of Tables *6*

Acknowledgements *7*

Declaration *8*

Chapter One – Introduction *9*

Study Rationale **10**

The Research Question **13**

My Story **13**

Placing My Story 14
Early Life 16
Primary and Secondary School 16
Changing Course, Private Study, and Opposition 17
Triumphs and Setbacks 18
Encountering Teaching 19
Pursuing Education 19
Beyond Secondary Teaching 20

Dissertation Overview **21**

Chapter Two – Theoretical Framework and Literature Review *22*

Social Reproduction **22**

Habitus, Field, and Capital **23**

Habitus 23
Field 25
Capital 27

The Interplay of Habitus, Field, and Capital **30**

Social Reproduction and Music **32**

Musical Habitus and Field 32

Musical Field and Class Trajectory **35**

Music and Capital 36
Music and Cultural Capital 36
Music and Social Capital 37
Music and Economic Capital 38

Challenging Bourdieu: Technological Development **40**

Changing Fields 40
Changes in Music and Capital 41

Bourdieu, Sexual Divisions and Feminist Intersectional Theory **42**

Feminist Intersectionality Theory 43

Chapter Three – Methodology and Methods *46*

Research Approach, Paradigm, and Framework **46**

Methodology 47
Methods – Interviews, Transcription, and Letter Writing 50
The Interview Questions 51
Letter Writing 52

Ethics **54**

Participants **54**

Number of Participants 55

Participant Recruitment....56
Classification of Participants....57

Analysis....58
Three-Dimensional Space Analysis....58
Challenges....65

Chapter Four – Know Your Place! Habitus, Capital, and Sexism....67

Habitus – Those Not Focused on a Musical Career....67

Habitus – Those Focused on a Musical Career....69

Cultural Capital Deficits....72

Cultural Capital and Non-career Focused Participants....78

Social Capital - Required Currency....80
Outlier 1: Kate....82
Challenges in Acquisition....83
Outlier No. 2: Rob....87

Why Discrepancies in Social Capital?....88

Geographical Distance from the Centre of a Field....90

Sexism and the Field of Music....92
Symbolic Violence....92
Unconcealed Chauvinism....94
Sexism and Cultural Expectations....95
Battling Sexism....97

Chapter Five – Self-doubt and Overcoming Obstacles....99

The Effects of Self-Doubt....99
Encounters with Self-Doubt and Belonging....100
Origin of Self-Doubt....105
Symbolic Violence Embedded Within Us....108

Mentorship....110
Defining Mentorship, Mentor, and Mentee....110
Mentors and Mentees....111
The Importance of Mentoring....112
Musical Mentorship....113
Challenges....115
Mutual Benefits....116
Losing Mentors....116

Overcoming Social and Culture Deficits Through Mentorship....118
Mentors Provide Increased Capital....118
Mentorship and Family....122
Losing a Mentor....124
Establishing New Mentorships....125
Being Open to Help....128

Applying Initial Habitus to Future Aspirations....129
Class Influences Identity....129

The Work We Did....131
Stability is Tempting....132

Work Ethic....133

Chapter Six – Discussion....136

Findings....136

Wider Contributions....140

Future Research....142

Impacts on My Practice 143
Appendices *145*
Appendix A – Ethics Approval 146
Appendix B – Plain Language Statement 147
Appendix C – Consent Form 149
Appendix D – Interview Questions 151
Appendix E – Three-dimensional Space Approach Analysis 152
References *154*

List of Tables

Table 1 Summarisation of Parlett's (1991) Five Principles of Field Theory....26
Table 2 Family Habitus, Cultural Capital, and Childhood Development....32
Table 3 Classification of Participants....58
Table 4 Analysation Charts A and B....60
Table 5 Analysis Chart C....62
Table 6 Analysis Chart D....62
Table 7 Analysis Chart E....64
Table 8 Participant Travel for Opportunity by Generation, Age, and Distance....90

Acknowledgements

I wish to thank my supervisor, Dr. Bonnie Slade, for the immense support, patience, and guidance throughout my trial study and dissertation. Words cannot express my gratitude to you for being beside me throughout the journey that was the last three years.

A special thank you to Professor Nicki Hedge for her guidance and support throughout the entire programme, and for the suggestion of topic and autobiographical methodology. Your direct approach and care for students was, and remains, greatly appreciated.

To my mother, Pietje (Pearl), and late father Bram Griffioen. Thank you for finding the resources to take me to concerts when you could, the books on our shelves, instilling me with faith, love, and giving a push when needed. Thank you for teaching me to stay true to my roots, and a place to return in times of need.

Words can never express my gratitude to the late Tom Parriott and then partner Maureen. Your guidance provided me with a home when far from home and the cultural and social capital I required. Thank you with all my heart.

To Jennifer Griffioen, my patient and tolerant wife, who has been with me for three degrees and should receive a parchment for auditing my Masters and Doctoral work. I know the sacrifices you have made, particularly when you so often stayed home working and taking care of our children when I was off in Scotland. Thank you with all my love.

And finally, to Daniel and Sophie, my amazing children whom I love so. By this point, neither of you remembers a time I wasn't in graduate school. You put on brave faces and stayed behind each time I went away. You both had to wait for my time when I was behind closed doors reading and writing. As hard as that was, may that example inspire you to even greater things, and I will be there for you always.

Soli Deo Gloria!

Declaration

I declare this dissertation is my original work and that all quotations from, and references to, the works of others found therein have been clearly cited and fully attributed.

Chapter One – Introduction

In 1944, two girls walked the short distance from Ee, Friesland to the hamlet of Tibma after school. Marie, a farmer and landowner's daughter, was eight years old and Pietje, the daughter of a factory labourer, was ten. They rarely walked together but that day they had left at the same time. The girls chatted happily about school, things they liked to play, and books they read. Suddenly, Marie's older brother Jan cycled up, interrupting their conversation.

"Marie, jump on my bike and we will ride home," suggested Jan. "No," said Marie. "I want to walk home with Pietje."

"Come, Marie," urged Jan. "Ride with me instead of walking."

"No!" Marie emphatically replied. "I want to walk home with Pietje."

Jan looked severely at his sister, his expression a mix of frustration and fear. "Marie, you know what mother has told you! You are never to play or talk to children of labourers." Marie stubbornly refused and Jan left for home. When they reached Pietje's house, Marie continued to walk to her farm.

It is 2020, and Pietje remembers the incident clearly; the day she was reminded of the classist system under which her family lived in rural Holland leading up to, and during, World War II.

"I don't know. Maybe she got in trouble when she got home," Pietje said. "When I went in our house and told mum, she became so angry."

"Did Marie ever walk home with you again?" I asked.

"No," replied Pietje. "I don't believe she ever did again."

Unlike most labourers, Pietje's parents owned their house, a goal her father accomplished before marriage with the intention no one would ever control him or his family. The locals often referred to him as "De duistere man van Tibma"[1] because he was subject to no one and kept his counsel to himself. Pietje recalled how farm labourers were often provided housing but in return accepted control over their lives by a farmer and his family. Coupled with the fact many landowners held positions in various Reformed church consistories, such labourers had little independence.

Her parents' homeownership was a victory over the symbolic violence by "the imposition of a cultural arbitrary" (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990, p. 5) exerted by wealthy farmers and churchmen. In this way they liberated their family, later allowing their children to continue their education past mandatory schooling, nor being subject to decisions about their future by those holding power around them.

[1] (Dutch): The dark man from Tibma.

This story is not fictitious. Pietje is my mother, and her parents, Sjoert and Hieke Barwegen, were my grandparents. I begin with this account as it demonstrates how the work of pedagogic actions within societal structures simultaneously establishes where a person belongs and, to a degree, where they should remain as position is often generational (Bourdieu, 1977a). It poignantly demonstrates how my encounters with social reproduction (Bourdieu, 1977a, 1977b, 1986; Bourdieu &. Passeron, 1990; Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992) are contextual not only to me but also my family. Jan's actions demonstrate how my mother's family were socially viewed in rural Dutch society. That this occurred during Holland's most difficult year of World War II demonstrates regardless of circumstance long practiced pedagogic actions and beliefs hold power over people distant from the centre of a field.

This chapter focuses upon why this study is important and brings a fresh approach to music and music education research. It outlines how narrative inquiry is a newer methodology within music research and how, beyond a few excellent examples, the words of people whose lives were impacted by musical study and participation are not widely found in literature. I then establish the research question, followed by an explanation of how research guided my decision to place my story early in the study. It closes with a summary of all subsequent chapters.

Study Rationale

During times of austerity in education, the arts, including music, are often targeted for elimination. When this occurs, teachers voice concerns regarding programme survival and potential effects on students. Appeals are supported by research claiming musical study positively impacts mathematical ability, raises IQ scores, and increases access to higher education (Jenkins, 2001; Schellenberg, 2006). Proponents cite research such as the popular "Mozart effect" study that claimed listening to works by Mozart for ten-minutes increased spatial reasoning skills (Rauscher, Shaw, & Ky, 1993). That study, however, is criticised because correlative factors (e.g., mood) while listening could impact results (Schellenberg, 2001). Though positive academic outcomes seem to result from musical participation, no direct causal link has been established (Steele, 2001).

Despite school-based music providing opportunities for increasing confidence, creativity, and building community, funding shortfalls have resulted in less students than ever having access to opportunities (Fletcher, 2023). Another contributor is a lack of innovation, and Fletcher (2023) references curricula rooted in Western-centric music philosophies that need modernising, proposing popular and cultural forms of music in its place.

There is truth to this. During my last university position, finding practicum placements for music education students with popular music backgrounds was nearly

impossible beyond one comprehensive, middle school programme in my city. A similar programme did not exist even in the city of Calgary with a population of 1.3 million (City of Calgary, 2023).

Fletcher (2023) also claimed students are not interested in classical music regardless of the possibilities musical participation of all genres provides. This is a new consideration. In the past, it was widely held that low culture musical genres (rock, pop, jazz, comic opera) were the primary musical styles of the large working-classes (Bourdieu, 1984; Bull, 2019a; Green, 2011; Peterson & Kern, 1996). Though Bourdieu (1984) acknowledged the working-class did enjoy Classical music, it tended toward the lighter, less complex forms. Times, however, have changed and claiming today's younger generation can only gain cultural appreciation primarily through popular music genres is reductionist (Bull, 2019a). It also fails to acknowledge that established generations participated in multiple musical genres while growing up lower-income and working-class.

Locating research regarding music education specifically for lower income and working-class (LIWC)[2] students was difficult to find. Though programmes such as El Sistema work for social change through music (Sistema Europe, 2017), research regarding "music teaching and learning as a pedagogy of emancipation" from class or circumstances is not widespread (Schmidt, 2005, p. 2). LIWC children experience greater struggles developing musicianship skills than middle-class children due to lack opportunity (Hall, 2015). As lower and middle-class incomes stagnate, music education outside of school has become less accessible for LIWC students (Bates, 2018), limiting opportunities to experience the benefits thereof to popular music or nothing. School-based musical opportunities for children from economically challenged backgrounds are therefore immensely important.

The genesis of this study began during my first course in the Doctor of Education (EdD) programme at the University of Glasgow, focused upon critical reflection in professional practice. Writing of my experiences with music, education, and religion it was clear my ability to play trumpet impacted my entire life. Throughout the journey there were barriers, criticisms (external and internal), soul-searching, and near surrender. I wondered whether I would have come as far had I not had musical talent, the support, and the tenacity to fight against myriad challenges.

I had long thought without music I would likely be living similarly to how I grew up: content with an industrial job and small-town life. Upon reflection however, I determined my perspective regarding the impact music had on experiences with class mobility and trajectory

[2] Lee and Harris' (2020) acronym LIFGWC (lower income, first-generation, and working-class) did not fit with my study since six participants were not first-generation Canadians.

was the result of contextual assumptions. Though music had influenced my experiences, was it the sole factor? Beyond music, which other factors had contributed to my career mobility and class trajectory? What about other people? Such reflection and questioning challenged my accepted beliefs. Had I objectively understood what was a subjective experience unique to my own lived context?

I should not have been so naïve, however, attempting to oversimplify complex issues is common. Araújo and Cambria (2013) claimed understanding and action regarding social issues is frequently defined by those situated on the outside "through socially constructed stereotypes and without taking into account the concrete experiences, wishes, and necessities" of those for whom it is lived reality (p. 38). Too often we draw conclusions through our own experience. Recognising this caused me to question if the study of music, formally or informally, provides more than simply esthetical experiences for LIWC people. If so, which genres of music lead to the most success? Were there extra-musical factors common to all regardless of genre? Identifying these could aid current and future LIWC musicians in many facets of their lives. Researching this would also contribute to the small but growing amount of research (Araújo & Cambria, 2013; Bates, 2011, 2016, 2018, 2021; Green, 2011; McAnally, 2013) demonstrating the impact access to musical studies can have on LIWC children and students.

Reviewing literature regarding class and musical study, I encountered evidence that musical participation and education helps address issues of poverty and inequality through various means and programming (Bull 2019; Burnard, Hofvander Trulsson, & Söderman, 2015). However, research utilising the words and personal experiences of those who lived this reality was more difficult to locate. Though present, it is not yet extensive (Bates, 2011; Bull, 2019a; Conway & Zerman, 2004; Coulson, 2010; Hall, 2015; Söderman, 2015; Trent, 2013).

Besides Bull (2019a), and somewhat Bates (2011), research regarding LIWC musicians' experiences with class and music was difficult to locate beyond popular music. Though Bates (2011) spoke of his own LIWC family and musical development, he did not include other perspectives. Bull (2019a) provided the most comprehensive example of the use of musicians' voices regarding class and music research. Though I found books containing examples of narrative inquiry in music research (Barrett & Stauffer, 2010a; Burnard et al., 2015), many articles and chapters focused upon the possibilities increased narrative research would provide the field and how to conduct it.

I concluded a gap existed in music and music education research utilising qualitative methods including LIWC musicians' voices and experiences. This gap exists due to a long

history of music education research conducted primarily via quantitative research methodologies (Welch, 2010). Narrative inquiry therefore continues to be viewed as a new methodology within music education research (Nichols, 2016). Though its use in music research has increased in the 21st Century, it has been a slow process (Stauffer & Barrett, 2010) despite "a growing awareness of the need to situate music education research in real-world contexts … in contrast with an earlier bias towards investigations that used more controlled research settings" (Welch, 2010, p. 58). As the Classical music field continues to be dominated by wealthier classes (Bull, 2019b), focusing upon the lived experiences of LIWC musicians would provide evidence directly from musicians living in such contexts, contributing new knowledge about music, education, and social mobility. Data collected utilising narrative inquiry methodology would be fresh, enabling me to contribute "a new sense of meaning and significance with respect to the research topic" (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000, p. 42).

The Research Question

I chose to address the following question: What factors are essential for LIWC musicians to successfully experience social class mobility and career trajectories throughout their lives? To answer this, I conducted an empirical study utilising a constructivist paradigm through the lens of Bourdieu's theory of social reproduction (Bourdieu, 1977a, 1977b, 1986; Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990; Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). Autobiographical methodology was employed, and data was collected from eight participants (including myself as research and participant) via interviews and letter writing.

I believed it unnecessary for all participants to currently be professional musicians as data arising from the perspectives of those who had left music for different professions could provide broader insights regarding whether musical involvement had a role in overcoming social reproduction. As I have taught extensively in non-musical fields and subjects, limiting participants to full time musicians did not seem logical in an autobiographical study in which I am a full participant. Current careers aside, the essential requirements included all had grown up LIWC and had musical abilities that could be developed and used in various musical contexts, either professional or otherwise. A full description of each participant is included in chapter three, Table 3.

My Story

As this study includes my story alongside the experiences of other participants, autobiography was a logical methodological choice. Utilised as far back as Plato (Freeman, 2007), autobiographical memory, the "declarative, explicit memory for specific points in the past, recalled from the unique perspective of the self (Nelson & Fivush, 2004, p. 488) was

essential in addressing the research question. The personal experiences of researchers are important within this research process, particularly regarding answering who we are in the field (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). Early memories often rooted within family confines influence how we view ourselves, construct identities, and make decisions (Turunen et al., 2015). Framed within time and space, social and cultural experiences deepen memories, help reframe the past, potentially creating new meanings and significance.

Due to the importance of the researcher's story in narrative inquiry (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000), I needed to include a brief yet detailed account of my experiences. However, I struggled deciding where to place it: early on or nearer the end? Returning to this section numerous times and consulting various academic works, I have placed it early on.

Placing My Story

My indecision resulted from two concerns. First, early placement could indicate I was simply attempting to prove the validity of my own experience. Second, placing it later would seem anticlimactic and create loose ends. To address this, I returned to autobiographical methodology literature reviewed for chapter two but could not find anything addressing my concerns. Delving into research beyond the literature review, I found answers.

Probst (2016) claimed whereas conducting qualitative research where the researcher also holds a role as participant (both insider and outsider) is uncommon and challenging, it holds potential benefits. Because it is uncommon, I had to be clear in my justification for my story's placement. Building upon this insider/outside binary, I turned to Aoki's (1996) discussion of cultural separation along East and West binaries, which helped me recognise being both need not be a distinct, hard binary. Rather, it helps one gain a greater in-depth perspective of the whole. Aoki (1996) likened the process to a bridge in a Japanese garden, where the function of the bridge is not only to cross from one side to the other but also to stop and view the entire garden.

Similarly, Corbin Dwyer and Buckle (2009) spoke of "the space between" (p. 60) researchers must embrace as participants. Doing so breaks down "the dichotomy of insider versus outsider status" and taking "a dialectical approach allows the preservation of the complexity of similarities and differences" (p. 60). A dialectical approach aligned with my chapter three description of interviews often being more dialogic than rigid, interrogative processes. Further, I experienced how qualitative researchers interact with participants, interviews, and data.

> As qualitative researchers we are not separate from the study…we are firmly in all aspects of the research process an essential to it. The stories of participants are immediate and real to us… We carry these individuals with us as we work with the transcripts. The words, representing experiences, are clear and lasting. We cannot

> retreat to a distant "researcher" roll. Just as our personhood affects the analysis, so, too, the analysis affects our personhood. Within this circle of impact is the space between. (Corbin Dwyer & Buckle, 2009, p. 61)

Such intimacy prohibits a researcher from remaining an outsider. Dialectic approaches do not result in absolute experiences but rather establish the interconnectedness of all participants. As Fay (1996) claimed, "sameness and difference require each other…there is no self-understanding without other-understanding" (p. 241). At this point, though I better understood my place in the research process, I still wavered where to place my story.

Kirkman's (1999) research enabled me to establish a solid rationale for early placement. Writing on her struggles with infertility, Kirkman (1999) shared her story early to provide context and explain her interest in the topic. She believed it would help connect readers to the researcher while focusing upon the unique experiences of each participant. Sharing one's story early increases credibility, demonstrating the researcher is not simply focused on the topic of interest but is speaking from lived experience (Kirkman, 1999). As will be seen, contextual similarities and differences (historical, locational, social, and cultural) influenced how my participants' experiences intersected or diverged. Like Kirkman, I did not approach this research as an amalgamation of stories but rather focused upon each participants' individual experiences.

Ultimately, I chose to place my story in the introductory chapter. Throughout the data collection process, I kept it separate from the experiences and data of the other participants (Coffey, 2004), writing it before the interviews and leaving it until the analysis and writing were completed. Interestingly, this approach chronologically reflects how I encountered the topic as the EdD programme unfolded: beginning with becoming a reflective practitioner, encountering Bourdieu and Passeron (1990) in course four and again in course six, Applying Research Methods. These courses were foundational for the concept of this study as it evolved from my personal reflections and development. It therefore made most sense to address it, then move away from it, immersing myself in the participants' experiences, and exploring my own story last during the data analysis. A final reason for early inclusion is my account is written in a polished, formal style whereas the answers to the questions were in my conversational voice, with memories shared in various chronological order or with realisations in the moment. It is this that, as explained in chapter three, makes autobiography a messy endeavour (Abrahão, 2012). Memory is rarely reproduced in a logical and orderly way (Pasupathi et al., 2007). The following story is a general account of my life, musical, and educational experiences, and encounters with what I now understand was social reproduction.

Early Life

Bourdieu and Passeron (1990) defined habitus as "the product of internalization of the principles of a cultural arbitrary capable of perpetuating itself after [pedagogic action] has ceased" (p. 31) resulting in "a system of schemes of thought, perception, appreciation and action" (p. 40) unconsciously applied to life experiences. For me, this meant the inculcation of an initial habitus emphasising values of faith and hard work as found in our devoutly Dutch Reformed, Protestant faith and working-class, immigrant[3] home (in that order). Though this preliminary habitus was not static, slowly altering throughout life, aspects thereof have remained due to my parents' pedagogic work, "a process of inculcation which must last long enough to produce a durable training, i.e., the habitus" (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990, p. 31). A particularly important part of my habitus was an appreciation of culture in the form of literature and music.

Before adopting children, my parents spent nine years in a northern British Columbia (BC) mountain valley consisting of two towns accessible by winding gravel road or train. They had come to Canada several years earlier with their families from the post-war Netherlands. Northern BC beckoned due to better earning potential in the lumber industry and my father began with a mill on September 1, 1956, remaining until his retirement in August 1994. Cultural activities were limited to reading, singing in community choir, movies at the theatre, and albums purchased from Columbia Records by post.

Musical ability revealed itself early in me. My mother claims shortly before my first birthday, she and my father awoke hearing me humming the opening of Mozart's, *Eine kleine Nachtmusik* in my crib. When my brothers joined the community junior brass band, at age three I snuck into their room, put the cornet together, propped it on a bed, and produced sound immediately. My older brother Percy began teaching me how to play and I performed in my first concert at age five. The cornet, and later trumpet, has been a fixture as long as I can remember.

Primary and Secondary School

The evening before my first day at a school tied to the Christian Reformed Church, my father gave me advice: respectfully ask questions until you understand and don't stop until you do. Questioning like this caused me a great deal of trouble over the next eleven years. I discovered because my brothers were not academically oriented, the name Griffioen was

[3] In Canada, immigrant "refers to a person who is, or who has ever been, a landed immigrant or permanent resident. Such a person has been granted the right to live in Canada permanently by immigration authorities. Immigrants who have obtained Canadian citizenship by naturalization are included in this group" (Statistics Canada/Statistique Canada, 2016, para. 1)

synonymous with trouble. I received the strap and detentions the first week of grade one for something I didn't do. Though my grades were strong, if they slipped or I asked too many questions I would be quickly reprimanded whereas other students would not. This was often linked to donations, as students from wealthier families were rarely in trouble compared to others. My mother explained this was directly tied to the experiences she had growing up in rural Holland: the wealthy controlled the churches and the Christian schools.

Musically, Percy continued to teach me. I played in the brass band until a school band programme was established while in fifth grade. However, I performed with the high school band because I already had seven years' experience. Whenever Percy learned something new attending trumpet clinics, he would drill me until I could play it as well. However, as I was willing to practice and he wasn't, by age fifteen I had passed him in ability and sadly he quit, never playing trumpet again until his death in 2015.

Changing Course, Private Study, and Opposition

I began working at the lumber mill at age fifteen. Hard work and trustworthiness quickly resulted in moving into the electrical department with increased hours and fulltime work over holidays. By then, I realised my musical ability was such I could perhaps make a career in it. My trajectory completely changed when I contacted Thomas Parriott (then of the Vancouver Symphony Orchestra) who became my musical mentor and, along with his partner Maureen, provided me a second home. My mill income enabled me to fly bi-monthly to Vancouver for lessons.[4] I became a semi-adopted kid to Tom and Maureen. Through hard work, I experienced great success in provincial honour bands and solo festivals and slowly made a name for myself.

It was also noticed by our conservative Christian Reformed Church and school that my talent and income were taking me out into the world. Working in the mill and playing music and ice hockey allowed me to make friends outside of church and school and soon my parents received pressure from church elders that professional music was no place for a Christian. In school, teachers and students would often scorn my ambitions. Combined with my propensity to question and my parents' inability to make large donations, this made secondary school unenjoyable.

In eleventh grade, my parents and I discussed transferring to the public high school which had an excellent choral programme. The Christian school voiced what they considered was great concern. My father asked the principal why they had been so against my musical goals and ability and was told being a musician was incompatible with being Christian. My

[4] Flight sales between Smithers and Vancouver, British Columbia cost me roughly one-and-a-half days' wages in the late 1980s.

final year of high school was the only enjoyable year I had in school. I thrived musically and the year culminated with graduation and scholarships. I headed to Europe touring with the Canadian National Youth on Tour Honour Band and on to university to study music.

Triumphs and Setbacks

The next six years, however, were anything but smooth. I attended the University of British Columbia (UBC) for two months before dejectedly heading home. Though I had spent time away from home for music during secondary school, moving from a small mountain town to Canada's largest western city was overwhelming. I returned to the lumber mill, loading rail cars for most of two years. The income was good and after some time I began practising trumpet again, reassuring Tom I would return. In 1991, I decided to re-enter solo competitions and successfully applied to Western Washington University (WWU) to study with Tom. Winning my regional and provincial solo festival, I represented BC as the sole brass player at the Canadian National Music Festival and placed third, defeated by two trombonists but ahead of four trumpet players, all with completed Bachelor of Music (B.Mus.) degrees.

I moved to the US to attend WWU and in my first few years everything went extremely well until I developed a tension in my embouchure.[5] Around the same time, Tom was diagnosed with cancer and, while he would have been able to help me fix this problem, taught increasingly less. Midway through my third year he passed away and my next instructor, though a fine musician, was not a technician.

My embouchure was not the only issue challenging my development. Again, I found myself continually at odds with the Reformed church I attended regarding my career choice. I allowed this to affect me to the point where I often wondered if the church was correct. Maybe God did not want me doing this; perhaps I was not good enough. For two years I struggled with an intense anxiety disorder which affected my performance. Nonetheless, I completed my B.Mus. with honours and performed in two European tours with a Baroque chamber orchestra, the conductor becoming another mentor. The late Dr. Mary Térey-Smith, a renowned Hungarian musicologist who combined toughness and high expectations with tremendous love and care for students, opened many doors. She kept her faith in me when I had none. Familiar with Reformed churches in Hungary, Mary (a Lutheran) understood my church struggles and challenged me to rethink theology. She often jokingly claimed, "We need to get the Calvinist out of you."

[5] Embouchure is the set-up of the mouth, teeth, and lips as applied to the mouthpiece of a wind or brass instrument.

After graduation, I was set to remain in the US and get married. The closer the day came, the more I sensed this was an enormous mistake. My fiancée and I had many differences that were widening. In retrospect, much of this came from class differences, mine being much lower. It was obvious I was expected to change socially and culturally into someone I was not. Two weeks before the wedding, I called it off and no longer on a valid visa, returned to Canada leaving the musical opportunities I was building behind. With little musical work in Vancouver, and little money left, I returned north and back to the mills.

Encountering Teaching

I spent a year-and-a-half at home restocking my finances and grounding myself. At first, I drove a transport lorry with my brother for several months before heading back to a lumber mill where I worked the midnight to 0800 shift, allowing me to play hockey and teach several trumpet students. Then the new music teacher at my former Christian high school asked if I would be interested in teaching a jazz programme after school. I began with three students and a week later had eighteen and a full swing band. My former English and Bible teacher, a person I had battled a lot, played piano. One evening he commented he had never thought I could work with students the way I did as they completely bought into my teaching. While visiting with my former elementary school principal, he commented I should consider a teaching career because, “that rapport you have with those kids; you cannot learn that in a teaching programme.” The band became the strongest music ensemble the school ever had.

Due to musical, social, and cultural experiences, the Reformed community did not hold sway over me any longer, and it too had changed over time as older generations and ideas gave way to a generation born in Canada. What began as a setback allowed me to experience new possibilities and heal old relationships. I also found I was able to apply my working-class work ethic to something new: teaching. And though I did not embrace it fully, I missed teaching when I left.

Pursuing Education

I never wanted to be a teacher and I resisted a long time. In reflection, this was because I had intensely hated school. After leaving home for the final time during the fall of 1998, I arrived in Lethbridge, Alberta to visit extended family and while there discovered the university was searching for a conservatory trumpet instructor and the symphony a principal trumpeter. After two years in these positions, my income supplemented as a school-based educational assistant and librarian, I was hired as a specialist to teach band and choir at a local Christian high school. Though challenging due to not having studied music education pedagogy, by Christmas the small, struggling programme had developed considerably. One year became

five and when I left to pursue a Bachelor of Education (B.Ed.), this school had the largest high school band in the city and second largest choir.

As in the past, raw talent and hard work had produced success. I came to terms with the fact though I had never wanted to teach, I could successfully connect with students and create tremendous music. Entering the University of Lethbridge (U of L), I earned my B.Ed. majoring in music, minoring in Social Studies. However, I chose not to return to my former school. Though times had changed, I still encountered too many similar experiences I had as a student. Instead, I accepted a position in a challenging public-school band and choral programme in the most economically and socially challenged area of the city and region. Three years later we performed in the provincial band festival, and a year after received an Adjudicator's Superior Award, the first in the school's history. One day, my head principal commented he'd never seen a teacher "get" the kids the way I did. My response was simple: "I grew up quite like them."

Beyond Secondary Teaching

Five years later I spent a year teaching in the University of Lethbridge (U of L) Faculty of Education and began a Master of Education (M.Ed.) in curriculum and assessment. Returning to middle school I was able to push the programme to new heights and another provincial award. I became passionate about assessment and evaluation and completed my M.Ed. researching and designing a metacognitive approach to instrumental music assessment. This research became a conference paper and was published. I returned to the U of L and taught evaluation and assessment, music education, and social context for six years before being suddenly replaced in the spring of 2022 when my contract ended. This was a tremendous shock due to the level of success demonstrated by my course reviews throughout that entire period. Students and a number of colleagues were equally dismayed.

Interestingly, again I went north for a few weeks. Visiting my elderly mother, I worked each day harvesting vegetables with a lifelong friend on his organic farm. Once again, I felt reattached to my working-class roots and left with resolve to find another position elsewhere. I have become used to success and setbacks though I do not enjoy the latter. However, I do know that within me is a resolve to succeed, and I know from whence it comes.

A few years back, a now retired university colleague noticed my lunch pail and thermos as I left the building and commented, "What? You've never left the mill?" I smiled and responded, "Never. It reminds me how blessed I am and how far I have come."

Dissertation Overview

Chapter Two describes this study's theoretical framework, Pierre Bourdieu's theory of social reproduction, with a comprehensive focus upon the concepts of habitus, field, and capital. This is followed by a review of current literature regarding these concepts within the fields of music and music education. I also address limitations and possibilities of Bourdieu regarding issues of sexism and include references to intersectionality theory to help address the women participants' experiences.

Chapter Three addresses how social reproduction framed this empirical, sociological study. A constructivist paradigm combined with autobiographical methodology explores the life stories of eight participants including myself. Though not a large sample size, diversity pertaining to countries of origin, musical genres, and current professions (musical and non-musical) contributes to the empirical findings. I also describe the use of a three-dimensional space analysis approach and how I designed numerous charts to separate data by participant that revealed similarities and divergences in experiences.

Chapter Four contains personal narratives of the participants as we recollect experiences and encounters with barriers pertaining to habitus, capital deficits, and, for the women, sexism. Throughout the chapter, the data demonstrates points of intersection and departure within the participants' experiences. Regarding habitus and cultural capital, a distinct difference arose between participants focused on music careers and those who were not.

Chapter Five explores how struggles due to initial habitus and lack of capital create self-doubt, often lifelong, and how self-doubt can be overcome through positive impacts of mentorship and a working-class work ethic, two key findings that proved necessary for success.

Chapter Six summarises the findings of the research, and discusses wider contributions to music and music education, and provides recommendations for future research.

Chapter Two – Theoretical Framework and Literature Review

To address my key question – what factors influence social class mobility and career trajectories throughout the lives of LIWC musicians? - it was essential to establish how all people, not only LIWC, are socialised and accultured beginning in their early years. Utilising social reproduction theory as the research paradigm meant central concepts of habitus, field, and capital would factor heavily into research regarding human development (Bourdieu, 1977a; Bourdieu, 1977b; Bourdieu, 1986; Bourdieu & Passerson, 1990; Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). These concepts directly impacted how all the participants successfully overcame social and cultural constraints. In all cases, habitus and lacking social and cultural capital were acutely limiting. Acquiring capital and evolving initial habitus without losing a sense of self were central experiences.

Since this study was conducted in Canada with participants who are currently all Canadian citizens, it is important to understand that class is defined differently in Canada than in the United Kingdom. According to Bull (2019a), the majority of Canadians term themselves middle-class whether they are on its low or high end. As such, the LIWC and professional class may both be spoken of as the middle-class. In this study, however, all participants with one exception came from families that worked lower-income and blue-collared jobs or lived close to, or in, poverty.

In this chapter, I first address the framework of social reproduction and the impacts of habitus, field, and capital within life and the musical field, before addressing its limitations and regarding sexism and the need for an intersectional approach. Finally, I review literature pertaining to various types of mentorships.

Social Reproduction

I chose social reproduction as the theoretical framework because within it I recognised my own story. Studying Bourdieu, I experienced many revelations regarding why my life unfolded as it did and how it may have gone otherwise if certain factors had not occurred. I found I identified particularly with the following quote:

> My main problem is to try and understand what happened to me. My trajectory may be described as miraculous, I suppose - an ascension to a place where I don't belong. And so to be able to live in a world that is not mine I must try to understand both things: what it means to have an academic mind – how such is created – and at the same time what was lost in acquiring it. For that reason, even if my work – my full work – is a sort of autobiography, it is a work for people who have the same sort of trajectory, and the same need to understand. (Bourdieu & Eagleton, 1992, para. 17)

Though I would not term my experiences miraculous, similarities exist. I found further similarities with those of Bates (2021) and Bull's (2019) participants and realised I was not alone. Social reproduction was therefore a logical framework.

Social reproduction theorises that society is reproduced through the work of pedagogic actions found in structures (e.g., education) that influence us from the onset of our lives (Bourdieu, 1977a: Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). Occurring first within family structures impacted by societal class differences, this continues throughout the education system. Social reproduction is also found in pedagogic actions of other structures or fields (see below), including religion, the arts, politics, law, or economics all of which impact the social and cultural development of people (agents) who through these actions come to understand their positions and functions (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). Bourdieu (1977a) claimed that social reproduction focuses upon a generational transmission of culture with the goal being social stability.

Bourdieu's theory helps us understand the position of music in social and cultural life as well as its economic and symbolic value (Söderman, Burnard, & Hofvander Trulsson, 2015). Most of the participants in this study found music to be a vehicle for social mobility. This aligns with Bourdieu's (1977a) description of established mechanisms allowing for "a limited category of individuals, carefully selected and modified by and for individual ascent" (p. 487) to experience intergenerational mobility and transcend from their initial class position. This is not an easy ascension. This study's participants encountered challenges and barriers whilst attempting to gain opportunity and elevate class standing. Opportunities did not naturally arise simply based upon place of birth, where family influence and pedagogic action begin, forming an initial and lasting habitus.

Habitus, Field, and Capital

Initially, I intended to address these concepts within separate sections. However, it became evident they required a single section due to their interrelatedness: habitus affects one's ability to operate within a field, the field requires capital to establish hierarchy and dominance, and capital has no purpose or existence without field (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). I will therefore discuss each concept in relation to one another.

Habitus

Bourdieu defined habitus as:

> A system of lasting, transposable dispositions which, integrating past experiences, functions at every moment as a *matrix of perceptions*, *appreciations*, *and actions* and makes possible the achievement of infinitely diversified tasks, thanks to analogical transfers of schemes permitting the solution of similarly shaped problems. (Bourdieu, 1977b, p. 82-83)

Habitus is the product of internalising the work of pedagogic action (PA) by agents encountered in fields including home, school, or religion. PA comprises standards and meanings imparted by the choices and values of those dominant within a group (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). Dominant agents hold power in the form of a cultural arbitrary, meaning what is mutually agreed upon and upheld as important is not absolute but rather arbitrary and concealed by the powerful to maintain dominance (Claussen & Osborne, 2012). Once internalised within habitus, "the principles of a cultural arbitrary [are] capable of perpetuating itself after PA has ceased" (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990, p. 31). Habitus contains a "sense of honour" (Bourdieu, 1977b, p. 15), permanently influencing how we view societal structures. This is evidenced by automatic actions such as how we stand, walk, sit, look, or speak. Even when responses seem situationally explicit, the practices and actions we employ are the result of habitus developed in response to past conditions.

Bourdieu (1977b) considered habitus (dispositions, tendencies, propensities, inclinations) durable because it is formed in objective conditions and therefore seem natural. It extends beyond individuals to class relations, guiding us to act in particular ways in various circumstances. Class habitus is a "system of dispositions (partially) common to all products of the same structures" (Bourdieu, 1977b, p. 85). Though each member has had unique experiences, members will have shared experiences and backgrounds with one another rather than those from different classes.

Bourdieu's philosophy is criticised as overtly deterministic (Giroux, 1983; Jenkins, 1982) as his ontology heavily leans towards a monistic approach, avoiding distinct separation between "external and internal, the conscious and the unconscious, the bodily and the discursive" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 19). Rejecting the dualism of Cartesian social ontology such as "body and mind, understanding and sensibility, subject and object" (Merleau-Ponty, 2012, p. 362), Bourdieu focused upon how seemingly intentional actions occur without cognitive intention as people utilise a mastery of how and when to act acquired through immersion in the social world (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). However, Bourdieu (1977b) also wrote of diversity found within class homogeneity; that individual dispositions can be seen as variants within the same structure, explaining how members of a class or field acquire different positions and different degrees of success. Habitus may result from individual history and experience but is also influenced by new experiences, subjecting it to reinforcement or modification depending upon circumstance (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). When encountering new experiences, habitus cannot remain fixed and must evolve (Wright, 2015). As a result, habitus continually creates new experiences which, though criticised as deterministic, indicate it "is not only regulated, but is also regulating" (Hall, 2015, p. 47). As

new structures can be created at any given moment by the habitus due to past experiences, criticisms of determinism lack accuracy.

Habitus becomes most obvious when triggered by situations, and "it is only *in the relation* to certain structures that the habitus produces given discourses and practices" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 135, emphasis in original). This indicates our lives are not deterministic due to habitus. Our actions may be altered depending upon circumstances encountered with a given structure. Paolucci (2014) claimed habitus guides rather than determines actions, providing an example of a tennis player governed by the game yet simultaneously remaining in control of their play. Though Bourdieu did admit hyper-determinist leanings existed in his theory (Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992), it is evident that though habitus is durable, it can evolve. Still, as will be seen in chapter five, though rarely fully preserved in their initial state, aspects of habitus are never fully left behind.

Since people are the result of individual experiences, we must consider the sources of the values and meanings that make up our habitus. For this, we turn to the concepts of field and capital.

Field

Field theory describes humanity's social reality as one of relationships. When employing field theory, we must focus not upon individual elements but rather relations between many elements (Hilgers & Mangez, 2015). This enables us to break away from a realist view of the world and our experiences, replacing it with an observation of the structure of relations as they occur within space. Humans are involved in many activities (e.g., work, play, family, religion, education), differing fields that, as societies mature and modernise, need legitimising to function and exist (Hilgers & Mangez, 2015). Field is a relational concept, a system rather than a set of pieces. Only by studying relations within structures rather than through individual properties, are we truly able to access a subject as an "example of a certain universal form of order and connection" (Cassirer, 1923, p. 23). Individuals cannot be separated from their environments as behaviour is dependent upon the psychology of the field at any given moment (Hilgers & Mangez, 2015). Field must be understood as a system of relations rather than an entity unto itself.

Lewin (1943) claimed field is not a theory so much as a method "analyzing causal relations and of building scientific constructs…expressed in the form of certain general statements about the 'nature' of the conditions of change" (p. 294). Parlett (1991), however, stated if field is to be used as a theory, it must be considered in a broad context. He defined field theory as "a method and a whole way of thinking which relates to the intimate

interconnectedness between events and the settings or situations in which these events take place" (Parlett, 1991, p. 69). He formulated five principles for using field theory.

Table 1 Summarisation of Parlett's (1991) Five Principles of Field Theory

Principle	Summary
I. Organisation	Meaning results from observing a situation in its entirety and taking into consideration all related facts.
II. Contemporaneity	Past memories influence our present actions in various fields and how we anticipate our future.
III. Singularity	As each person and situation is unique, circumstances and experiences within a field are never static and understood differently.
IV. Changing Process	Fields are subject continuously to change and should not be viewed as an absolute.
V. Possible Relevance	All situations within a field are relevant as they are part of its organisation and hence nothing can be excluded.

Partlett, 1991, p. 71-74.

Parlett's principles of singularity and changing process particularly support Bourdieu's arguments against his critics' charges of determinism. If habitus is partially the result of social situations, and these are experienced individually within a slowly changing field, accusations of determinism weaken.

Returning to Bourdieu, a field is defined as:

> A network, or a configuration, of objective relations between positions. These positions are objectively defined, in their existence and in the determinations, they impose upon their occupants, agents, or institutions, by their present and potential situation (situs) in the structure of the distribution of species of power (or capital) whose possession commands access to the specific profits that are at stake in the field, as well as by their objective relation to other positions (domination, subordination, homology, etc.). (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 97)

Field is a system of social relations between individual agents and the field itself. Spatial relations and social practices found within fields form realities valued and understood by all agents (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). These become necessary for the regulation and conservation of social order and to differentiate between different fields (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). Field is also a "system of objective forces (much in the manner of magnetic field), a *relational configuration endowed with a specific gravity* which it imposes on all the objects and agents which enter in it" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 17, emphasis in original). Fields are akin to a competition or game wherein lie cooperation, conflict, and competition between agents attempting to gain control over capital.

Field theory is complex, and in some ways Bourdieu regards the entire universe as a field with many subfields, each with its own logic, rules, hierarchy, and capital (Hilgers & Mangez 2015). Due to its complexity, experienced sociologists employing field theory have a broad interpretation of it (Hilgers & Mangez, 2015). It is therefore understandable critics voice difficulties with field as a theory. For instance, depending upon the researcher, field is either methodological or nomological and there is no consensus regarding this (Hilgers & Mangez, 2015). Hilgers and Mangez (2015) recommend keeping both positions in mind while consistently considering two questions. The first (nomological) asks, "is all action in a field guided by a principle of maximization of utility" (p. 22)? Second (methodological), "what is a field and how are its limits to be defined" (p. 22)? From a nomological perspective, one considers whether agents are developing strategies to maximise habitus and capital to conserve or increase their assets. If agents do so purely unconsciously, it is acknowledged that unspoken rules exist making this necessary. Researchers are then looking into the laws of social functioning, making the process more than methodological. However, in a purely methodological approach, all choices are made regardless of an agent's actual desires and for maximum profit (Hilgers & Mangez, 2015). For this study, my goal was to keep both questions in mind to maximise my findings and not limit myself to one or the other. As will be seen, none of the shared experiences could be analysed purely in a nomological or methodological sense as no participants had the same amount or types of capital.

Capital

Capital is defined as resources which produce profits and are effective through an agent's participation in a field (Bourdieu, 1986; Clark & Zukas, 2013; Paolucci, 2014). Such a view of capital goes beyond economics as Bourdieu (1986) believed one could not account for the structure and intricacies of the social world unless one were attentive to all forms of capital (Paolucci, 2014). Though capital can be economic, it is social in the form of connections resulting from memberships in groups, and cultural such as skills, degrees, or titles that can be transmittable (Bourdieu, 1986; Clark & Zukas, 2013; Paolucci, 2014). For example, when I am paid as a trumpet player, I exchange my cultural capital (musical ability combined with qualifications conferred by a music degree) for payment. Should I choose to defer payment as a donation to an organisation (e.g., charity), I exchange cultural capital for increased social capital and possible future economic gain via recommendations to others and a tax donation receipt.

Within a field's structure, various kinds of capital hold discrepant value which make society durable and determining individual success (Bourdieu, 1986). The more capital an

agent holds, the greater their power. Capital, as a form of power, would have no value or meaning if not for its relation to the field (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992: Paolucci, 2014).

Economic Capital. Due to its centrality within economic theory and capitalism, capital is most recognised as economic resources and assets. However, unless it can be exchanged for other assets (material, cultural, or social) economic capital has reduced value. This is what makes the game (field) more than one of random chance where there constantly exist miraculous possibilities (Bourdieu, 1986). Economic capital is the root of all forms of capital and though it can be exchanged for social and cultural capital, costs are high because cultural and social development take tremendous effort and time (Bourdieu, 1986; Paolucci, 2014). This is particularly pertinent as the amount of highly paid artistic positions is minimal compared to the financial amount invested in one's development. As this study focuses a great deal upon the musical abilities of the participants, it is necessary to next explore Bourdieu's definitions of cultural capital.

Cultural Capital. Cultural capital is inheritable, with children directly benefiting from previous generations' investments (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). This creates inequality between people of LIWC and upper-class backgrounds, particularly in the field of education. LIWC students have less opportunity to benefit from familial investment and therefore compete for entrance into various fields upon an unequal playing field with those benefiting from the cultural (and social and economic) capital of their parents. This results in the reproduction of society as those equipped with particular resources have the greatest opportunities for success (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). The further one's social origins and capital are from the centre of a field the more difficult attaining success becomes. Should someone with a distant initial habitus gain access to the correct institutions, such challenges do not cease (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). For example, a speaker's linguistic abilities often indicate their social position due to the distance between the speaking style learned at home and that of the school. Within cultural capital lie three distinct forms: embodied, objectified, and institutionalised (Bourdieu, 1986).

Embodied Cultural Capital. The embodied state involves the acquisition of culture through hereditary transmission or the investment of time and effort. It may be gained unconsciously through family, education, and other fields an individual naturally experiences, resulting in power remaining in the hands of dominant groups (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). As cultural capital is not distributed equally within the field, the advantage lies with those who have inherited it. If hereditary transmission is impossible, attainment is difficult, costly, and slow as such work must be completed individually and cannot be delegated.

Objectified cultural capital. Objectified cultural capital takes the form of goods such as books, musical instruments, art, or machines (Paolucci, 2014). Accessibility to such tangible items is determined by initial habitus, capital, and distance from the centre of the field, directly tied to available economic and hereditary possibilities. When raised in a family possessing such capital with available time to nurture children in their usage and value (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990), the acquisition and use of such objects comes naturally, unlike those having to learn their importance, value and usage. Such objects are more easily acquired depending upon the amount of economic capital available for exchange.

Institutionalised Culture Capital. When institutionalised, cultural capital takes on the form of academic qualifications in particular, the strength of which is tied directly to the abilities of the bearer. These qualifications allow for comparison with other agents and establish the capital conversion rate, where value depends upon the amount present and available (Bourdieu, 1986). Qualifications produce a recognition within society (Paolucci, 2014) particularly tied to the prestige of the institutions. For example, when compared to a music degree earned from the Julliard School in New York City, a similar degree from my former university in southern Alberta, Canada has a reduced prestige as no world-class orchestra, opera company, or renowned instructors live and teach here.

Despite differences between forms of cultural capital, they do not function independently. The embodied state dictates the amount of capital one is born with or must work to earn. Without objectified time to nurture one's children, the amount of the other forms may not be as efficiently transmitted, and not knowing how to make the institutionalised form work for oneself lessens the values of the others. Concepts of time and social interaction leads us to the third form of capital.

Social Capital. Social capital is acquired through connections with individuals one knows (Paolucci, 2014) and can be easily transmitted through family depending upon position within a field. The more people we encounter, particularly due to family status and during habitus formation, the more opportunities there are to exchange social capital for economic or cultural. Social capital is the amount of real or virtual resources accumulated by an individual or group "by virtue of possessing a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992 p. 119). The amount of social capital an agent possesses depends upon social network size, and their ability to make these connections durable (Bourdieu, 1986). Social connections are important because the influence and expertise of others equips us to gain and use capital. Among LIWC individuals, those raised in families involved in trades have advantages in such employment due to abilities to relate to potential employers or through

family connections (Lehmann & Taylor, 2015). Conversely, those exposed to artists, musicians, or academics will find such social capital advantageous. Social connections can also protect a person from exploitation and provide agency to identify and guard against it (Lehmann & Taylor, 2015). Regardless the field, familiarity grants opportunity whereas lacking social capital increases difficulty in attaining success.

Social connections increase as agents recognise the importance of engaging with those holding more social capital than they do. It is not enough to simply possess social capital. It must be invested in individually or as a group to advantageously reproduce social relationships. Social capital is also a means for its bearers to increase domination through qualifications and permanent positions (Bourdieu, 1977). Chapter Four demonstrates how social capital, or its lack, impacted the lives of all this study's participants, each having to acquire it through those who possessed it. None had been acquired through initial habitus, families, or schools.

Symbolic Capital. All forms of capital become symbolic capital which is employed when agents recognise its logic, importance, and uses are meaningful, rather than arbitrary (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992; Paolucci, 2014). Symbolic capital is also the recognition an agent receives from others in the field, also a form of profit (Söderman et al., 2015). Like the other forms of capital, it is also exchangeable.

The Interplay of Habitus, Field, and Capital

Not all people are attracted to the same types of fields. Just as an academic may not understand challenges faced by a struggling LIWC student, that student may not have an appreciation for academic pressures. This is because an agent's habitus is formed through avenues of socialisation where there exists a "double and obscure relation" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 127). This occurs in two ways. First, habitus is structured and conditioned according to what a field requires; second, there exists "a relation of knowledge or *cognitive construction*" (p. 127, emphasis in original) as an agent must consider a field worth investing in for it to have value. Whether an agent will consider this depends upon the amount of conditioning that structured it. An agent feels most at home within a field when habitus and social world are most in sync, described as a "fish in water" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 127). Conversely, operating within fields and classes different than initially experienced creates a sense of being a fish out of water (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992; Clark & Zukas, 2013; Lehmann & Taylor, 2015; Söderman, Burnard, & Hofvander Trullson, 2015). However, no matter how at home an agent is within a field, their position depends upon the amount of capital they possess.

The analogy of sport is often used to explain Bourdieu's approach to field. Consider ice hockey as a field and players and coaches as agents. Competitions have stakes such as winning and losing, championship glory or defeat. Players unquestioningly invest in and embrace the game, believing "in the game and its stakes (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 98). Each player has individual skillsets (capital) with which they play. This is unequal amongst players as some are endowed with tremendous skill by which they influence control over a game (within a match or in the broader sense) while others fill various reduced roles. The rules of hockey govern how the game is played, enforced by agents such as leagues, referees, and officials. Players, coaches, and managers participate knowing their roles and function, following and pushing the boundaries of the rules to gain victory that grants the entire team increased capital.

With field and capital, a player's habitus (dispositions) play a vital role in the development of their skills. Whereas Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992) speak of "field vision" (p. 21), ice hockey speaks of hockey sense: a player's ability to act spontaneously and appropriately during any moment or circumstance. These dispositions are developable but also instinctive. The higher the hockey sense the more successful a player will act within the game "in an 'inspired' manner without the benefit of hindsight and calculative reason" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 21). As a former goaltender, I recall the feeling of being in the zone. The game seemed to slow, the noise in the building dissipated, the puck seemed larger, slower, always visible, and I acted without thought or overreaction. Everything was fluid and I was constantly within the moment. In such moments, a goaltender possesses tremendous power over the game and opponents recognise they need to alter the game to wrestle back control lest they lose. Players choose to increase or conserve capital in relation to the rules of the game, attempting to transform the result (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992), and entire teams, due to the level of skill and excellence exhibited as a whole, have required leagues to change the rules to level opportunities for all teams, evidence individuals or groups can exert influence over the amount and type of capital in a field.

Bourdieu's (1984) formula [(habitus) x (capital)] + field = practice (p. 101), demonstrates how an agent's (or group's) dispositions and social conditioning reveal a unified lifestyle despite the diversity of practices found within various fields. Working together, habitus, capital, and field create an intuitive understanding how to act in situations and navigate the world around us (Wright, 2015). It is this internalised, intuitive nature how to act, or common-sense (Bourdieu, 1984), by which we recognise a class habitus, found in a set of agents who share common properties, abilities, or living conditions creating class as a field.

Social Reproduction and Music

Bourdieu's theory is appropriate for studying music and music education as it helps us understand their position in social life and economic and symbolic value. Music is often considered a pure form of art socially disconnected from the outside and social worlds (Söderman et al., 2015). However, this is not evidenced in the structure of music education where master-apprentice relationships persist with students attempting to emulate their instructors' mastery (Söderman et al., 2015). Bates (2021) cautioned that believing universal musical ideals is erroneous as the worth ascribed music is based upon culturally specific, evaluative judgments. Bull (2019a) claimed that studying middle-class musicians (or in this study LIWC) is to observe struggles including boundaries, inclusion, exclusion, spaces, and identities.

The arts, and music specifically, are a telling indication of one's habitus, field, and capital. Bourdieu (1984) claimed, "nothing more clearly affirms one's 'class', nothing more infallibly classifies, than tastes in music" (p. 10). Though often portrayed as consumers of popular culture, Bourdieu (1984) found LIWC people also appreciated Classical music, albeit of a lighter nature (Johann Strauss' "Blue Danube") whereas intellectuals were drawn towards challenging compositions (Bach's "Well-tempered Clavier"). Due to habitus and class, even the music being consumed drives social reproduction as our bodies act upon memories and dispositions in response to it (Bourdieu, 1990a). This extends to the types of instruments children embrace and learn because their habitus contains a tendency to be more willing to learn an instrument their families are aware of (Valenzuela & Codina, 2014). Music is therefore tied to self-perception, identity, personal integrity, and social position. Classical musical traditionally signalled family educational attainment as it holds high levels of cultural assets, allowing people to position themselves in relation to the larger community (Hofvander Trulsson, 2015). Family habitus and musical cultural capital correlate directly to a child's musical development and acquisition of capital. Their musical habitus (see Table 2) becomes impossible to view if disconnected from their social world.

Table 2 Family Habitus, Cultural Capital, and Childhood Development

Family Habitus	+	Family Cultural Capital	= Child's Habitus
Child's Habitus	+	Family Musical Cultural Capital	= Child's Musical Habitus

Note: adapted from Valenzuela and Codina (2014) to clarify musical habitus formation.

Musical Habitus and Field

Musical habitus results from people's relationship to music through personal tastes (Rimmer, 2012) and confirmed through socialization (Prior, 2011). We derive our musical habitus

through primary musical socialisation and experiences at home that influence taste, enjoyment, and participation (Rimmer, 2012). These musical tastes further developed through music education in schools (Coulson, 2010). Though Bourdieu (1984) focused primarily upon Classical music consumption, Bates (2021) indicated while middle and upper classes consume Western Classical music more, the LIWC does not necessarily identify with it. This impacts school-based music education as the habitus of LIWC students is not fully acknowledged. Due to its consumption by the dominant classes, Classical music is elevated as the highest form. A student's musical habitus is then subject to the rules within the music community and its own place in the hierarchy (Magnúsdóttir, 2015). Music classes leave many students behind (Coulson, 2010) as their musical habitus is too far from the centre of the musical field and curriculum being taught (Bull, 2019a). Take, for example, a recently immigrated Afghani child who has had very little, or no, exposure to Western culture suddenly being in a Canadian elementary music class employing highly accepted and practiced pedagogies from Zoltan Kodály or Karl Orff. Should they have lived in a Taliban controlled area of Afghanistan, it is highly possible their exposure to music, particularly instrumental, has been minimal (Baily, 2010). Their musical habitus, dependent upon early exposure by family or community, will be extremely distant from the Western-centric music education dominating Canadian schools.

This carries a potential for prejudice and a habitus clivé (split habitus) where students become divided within themselves and feel they do not belong musically anywhere (Bates, 2021; Friedman, 2016). A lack of access to quality musical experiences and resources further exacerbates the problem (Coulson, 2010) as the possibility of becoming a high-achieving musician is directly tied to resources, opportunities, or constraints due to a child's economic and social position (Hall, 2015). Questions of musical quality and access indicate Bourdieu's connections between class, musical experiences, and education may not be as clear as he had hoped (Coulson, 2010).

Challenges of quality can cause hysteresis (Friedman, 2016) from the "dislocation and disruption between field and habitus" (Graham, 2020, p. 451). Bourdieu (2000) claimed this occurs when habitus seems delayed or disconnected to the field and one's circumstances, carrying with it a high possibility for the onset of self-doubt, which the disconnect between habitus, field, and capital can exacerbate. It arises through both experiences outside of us and beliefs we develop or hold within ourselves. Due to the distance between Classical music study and performance and the world in which they grew up, LIWC students and musicians find their lack of cultural and social capital, including how they dress or act, causes fears and confidence issues (Bull, 2019a). Such (often young) musicians recognise their musical

habitus must include more than performance ability. Being a Classical musician requires the ability to recognise and navigate many "sociocultural nuances, such as distinguishing between worthy, appropriate styles and poor quality, appropriate jargon, how to behave in specific social situations," and social codes that occur within musical and social interaction (Sagiv & Hall, 2015, p. 115). There is constant pressure to get everything musically and socially correct as this creates opportunities, potentially increasing prestige and positively impacting class position (Bull, 2019a). Coming from an upbringing where hard work is a mark of social worth and finding oneself in a culture with high levels of inequality, music takes on wider social meanings and the pressure contains an emotional cost due to the fear of making mistakes and humiliation (Bull, 2019a). These pressures are not felt to the same degree in those who have grown up with a musical habitus closer to the centre and they do not feel these challenges as severely (Bull, 2019a; Valenzuela & Codina, 2014).

As such constant pressures take an emotional toll, it becomes tempting to give up and embrace what may be inevitable. Accepting one's habitus and remaining on the field's periphery can bring a sense of relief as "resistance can be alienating and submission can be liberating" (Bourdieu, 1990b, p. 155). It creates a sense of comfort and solidifies belonging as people are drawn to groups through a sense of like-mindedness with similar conditions and modes of existence (Bourdieu, 1987). Regardless of potential, Bates (2021) claimed while habitus need not be static, people often choose to remain in the field they feel most comfortable with making habitus even more durable. This is understandable considering the pressures mentioned above. However, it is important to recognise music does not define a person and is only one tool by which to forge identity (Bull, 2019a). As Magnúsdóttir (2015) claimed, though habitus is reflective of the social position in which it originated, it also holds dispositions able to create new responses and can surpass the original position in which it was formed through learning new instruments or styles and moving between various subfields (e.g., classical, jazz, rock). This possibility again challenges the criticism that habitus is deterministic (Jenkins, 1982; Giroux, 1983), though that criticism may be reinforced should a person succumb to the temptation to give up.

The differences between one's habitus and the centre of the musical field is akin with rules that govern all fields. Music has various hierarchies that create and enforce rules (agreed upon or not) regarding what is legitimate or non-legitimate music (classical versus jazz/pop/rock) or pure versus non-pure art, pulling agents between various poles (Söderman et al., 2015). Rigidity exists between specialists in the field (e.g., music educators, musicologist, performers), and gatekeepers decide whom to admit (Söderman et al., 2015). Music and culture can be constraints enforced upon agents from those dominant in the field

(Bennett, 2008), If one follows the correct rules, they will gain success in the eyes of these powerbrokers (Haughton, 1984) and elevate their status and class.

LIWC musicians entering the field not fully understanding its rules and logic are disadvantaged as job prospects are relatively few (Söderman et al., 2015). They must acquire a complete feel for the game, the 'sens pratique' (logic of practice), that must become rooted in their habitus (Bourdieu, 1990a). The greater the feel, the greater the mastery and automatic understanding regarding how to act in given situations. This is particularly so if one wishes to criticise existing hierarchies rather than placing a fence around one's own musical habitus to preserve one's limited amount of power (Söderman et al., 2015). As music education even in younger years is the result of family musical habitus and favours the middle class (Welch, 2010), gaining a feel for the game is an immense task.

Musical Field and Class Trajectory

The field of music is often viewed as "a ticket" (Bull, 2019a, p. 91) for social mobility. For example, immigrant parents embrace it to construct a well-rounded child prepared for the society in which they will live (Magnúsdóttir, 2015). When we affiliate ourselves with a social group, we are granted membership in it, and this influences position within a field (Wright, 2015). To become socially mobile, an agent must adopt aspects of the dominant culture (Bates, 2021) and habitus must be altered to provide legitimacy.

Reay (1995) claimed within habitus lies the potential to create new responses to new situations, allowing people to transcend beyond where their habitus originated. Habitus therefore can be replicated or transformed (Reay, 1995, p. 357). When habitus responds creatively to new encounters within a field, social (and class) trajectory becomes possible, potentially changing an agent's life (Reay, 1995). If we are unable to adapt and change, Bates (2021) indicated it is very likely our lives will remain in lower classes, with lower wages and less opportunity.

Music is one field by which LIWC people, through tremendous effort and change, can forge a new identity (Bull, 2019a). This can be assisted by access to quality music education which, according to Schmidt (2005), "has the potential to reach as a transforming power to different realities" particularly if done in ways that "relate to the realities of individuals and communities in which it engages" (p. 9). The development of musical talent as a conduit for class improvement holds much potential for LIWC people, however, to accomplish this they must obtain the necessary capital.

Music and Capital

The amount and types of capital held provides an agent with the ability to rise within a field, influence its direction, and work for its presentation or change. As previously indicated, a field will not hold much significance without capital.

Bourdieu (1984) claimed cultural distinctions are also social, operating in tandem to solidify inequality. Within music education, the degree of benefit is dependent upon non-musical factors such as class, wealth, family culture, and identity (Wright, 2012) to which race and gender can also be added. Here is where inequalities most lie. Just as class is not only a socioeconomic phenomenon but also effects "relationships, domesticity, education, lifestyle and cultural consumption" (Hall, 2015, p. 46), entering the field of music is not solely dependent upon musical ability but also the amount of capital one holds.

The musical field is no different from any other as the amount of musical capital one holds determines one's place. Musical capital is "the interconnected cultural, social and symbolic assets that musicians acquire and turn to economic advantage in the music field" (Coulson, 2010, p. 257). Musical capital encompasses all three forms of capital previously described, and it is helpful to identify how each function within the field.

Music and Cultural Capital

Music is a form of cultural capital. Bull (2019a) claimed musical ability and talent can be observed through a Bourdieusian lens as a form of investment parents and educators make to help a child form their musical self. She describes cultural capital as "any form of value that can be acquired through Classical music practices" (p. 3). Unless musical ability is cultivated through study and practice, it will not become capital (Bull, 2019a). This only occurs when musicians from early ages work to acquire musical capital through skill development, adapting to new norms and expectations found within the field and networking with established musicians (Coulson, 2010). Musical capital provides opportunities as musical taste can indicate class, ethnicity, values, and economics (Hofvander Trulsson, 2015). Traditionally, Classical music acted as a clear indicator of social and capital assets (Bull, 2019a; Green, 2011; Hofvander Trulsson, 2015) with popular music looked down upon as a lesser form, placing value on performers and consumers (Green, 2011). Just as initial habitus and self-identity are developed mainly through family influence (Magnúsdóttir, 2015; Valenzuela & Codina, 2014), so is cultural and musical capital. Valenzuela & Codina (2014) described musical capital as a type of flow between the field of family, cultural capital, and participation. Because taste and the consumption of higher cultural activities correlate to social position (Bourdieu, 1984; Hofvander Trulsson, 2015), musical capital plays a vital role in one's position within the field.

Music and Social Capital

The amount of musical capital one holds is directly influenced by parental involvement, social class, cultural capital, and educational attainment (Magnúsdóttir, 2015, p. 163-164). As students who come to school imbued with the values of a field tend to have a better chance of success (Green, 2011), music can function as "an 'entry ticket' to a new social group" (Söderman et al., 2015, p. 4). Though talent is a large factor, developing professional social networks is equally essential (Coulson, 2010). Welch (2010) explained when studying music, we not only learn to perform but also widen our knowledge of its social aspects. One way to gain social capital is through performing in pressure situations with experienced musicians (Coulson, 2010). Successfully doing so results in greater connections and employment opportunities. Social capital is also gained through formal, post-secondary musical study through prominent teachers, enabling students to connect with professionals in and out of the musical field (Bull, 2019a).

To understand music and social capital, one must recognise there exist diverse social situations in which music is placed. Born (2012) claimed "four planes of mediation" (p. 266) must be navigated within the musical social world. First, there exist multiple social layers consisting of evident, but difficult to detect, "intimate microsocialities of musical performance and practice" (Born, 2012, p. 266). This is evident in the relationship between instructor and student, where the instructor's authority and style form the basis of a student's musicality (Bull, 2019a). Second, microsocialities exist between conductor and ensemble, principal section leaders and section players. When musicians recognise and understand how to navigate such hierarchies, they gain social capital. Relatedly, this second plane analyses how music can bring homogenous and/or diverse people together creating an imagined, Utopian community (Born, 2012; Bull, 2019a). For example, to perform at the highest level, an orchestra must constantly work together and, though seemingly unified, a social world exists where various hierarchies hold different amounts of power. This seeming Utopia masks the realities of power struggles and hierarchies. Third, music is wound within "social identity formations…class, race or ethnicity, gender or sexuality, nationality or locality" (Born, 2012, p. 266) from which musicians derive a sense of belonging. This can be seen in a LIWC student entering the musical academy not only to study music but make a new beginning and find a new belonging (Bull, 2019a). The fourth plane exists in social relationships found within institutions involved in musical "production, reproduction, and transformation" (Born, 2012, p. 267). This is witnessed through the exchange of social and cultural capital for economic capital, either between institutions and individuals or with other institutions.

Added to these layers is the historical class aspect dating to the early 1800s, where music was used to help LIWC people increase cultural and social relationships and become acceptable to the upper classes (Bull, 2019a). Today, music remains a conduit for forging new identities (Wright, 2012). Though skill and ability are necessary, personal transformation is highly dependent on gaining social capital (Schmidt, 2005). Social capital is acquired through a habitus demonstrating a willingness to learn and change, and through the teacher with whom one studies (Coulson, 2010). Though Bourdieu (1984) focused primarily upon Classical music in relation to class and capital, this has been changing in recent decades, and social capital can now be gained through other musical genres. Stahl and Dale (2015) suggested when LIWC boys are granted access to music education not dominated by classical forms, their confidence increases as the music they engage with (pop, hip-hop) provides a form of social capital albeit different from that traditionally recognised by those exclusively advocating traditional approaches.

Such examples of acquiring social capital in a diverse and multi-layered music and social world align with Born's (2012) theory. However, cultural and social capital are not the only necessary forms required to become an established musician or alter class and habitus. Economic resources are vital.

Music and Economic Capital

Economic theory, because of its centrality to capitalism, dominates all forms of capital due to its focus on maximising profit (Bourdieu, 1986). As mentioned, capital can be exchanged (Hall, 2015) and economic capital can acquire cultural and social capital through a long, arduous process often viewed as a waste of time and resources depending upon the resulting value (Bourdieu, 1986). At best, most musicians gain only moderate economic capital in return for the capital they invest in musical pursuits. In this study, few of the musicians interviewed were fully employed in musical endeavours yet have benefited from, and often still participate in, music. However, economic gain is not the aim for many music students (Bull, 2019a). Rather, the cultural and social capital gained provides musicians, particularly from LIWC backgrounds, access to avenues of study and social connections that can translate into class trajectory, intergenerational mobility, and a higher standard of living, making economic investment justifiable as the resultant work ethic and discipline from musical study pay dividends over time (Bull, 2019a; Hofvander Trulsson 2015). Value and profit gained through the acquisition of cultural and social capital pays off in the future thereby rendering it time and labour well spent.

However, unless one possesses economic resources to invest, the task becomes increasingly difficult and time consuming. Despite the possibilities musical study holds,

acquiring cultural and social capital is extremely difficult. Music, then, becomes a tool of social reproduction as it is not only most accessible to upper-classes due to taste but also because wealth provides access and opportunity. Economically privileged students, due to parental investment, have money and time to develop musical abilities than those with less economic advantages. Several of this study's participants worked many LIWC jobs to attempt to better their class trajectory, all the while still investing the time to practice and develop musically. The amount of time needed to earn economic capital to invest in acquiring cultural and social development is considerable, placing LIWC students at a disadvantage (Bourdieu, 1986; Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). Access is affected not only by economic capital, but the cultural and social benefits derived from it (Hall, 2015). Within inherited and developed cultural and social capital also lies an understanding of how the musical field operates regarding competitiveness, a reality widely found in large ensembles, limiting access to Classical music to a few elites (Hofvander Trulsson, 2015). Ultimately, no form of capital stands alone in the musical field.

Along with the advantage of capital built into their habitus, privileged music students may be blind to disparities in opportunity of other ensemble members (Bourdieu & Passeron,1990). Though not necessarily intentional, it is a fact of origin. Due to distance from the centre of a field, people from LIWC backgrounds struggle to attain social and cultural capital often due to lacking advantages of economic opportunity and community cohesion. Wright (2012) claimed these inequalities are perhaps greater in music than in any other field, apart from sports. Wright (2012) also maintained it is greater in music because of the genres being taught in schools and lack of purchasing power.

Discourses and decisions surrounding musical genres being taught can work against disadvantaged students because of a hierarchical, classical-music-is-best approach found in Western programmes (Haughton, 1984). In such situations, music students often feel like a fish out of water (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992; Clark & Zukas, 2013; Lehmann & Taylor, 2015; Söderman, Burnard, & Hofvander Trullson, 2015) and are held in suspicion because they do not have the right habitus (Lehmann & Taylor, 2015). Simultaneously, disadvantaged music students must develop their musical abilities, be employed to acquire economic capital, and work at evolving habitus. Privileged students struggle less in these areas as much is previously already in place. For LIWC students, studying music becomes more about "*surviving*" (Perkins, 2015, p. 106, emphasis in original) than getting ahead or becoming well-known. They will also find it difficult to gain opportunities as those most advantaged will work hard to retain their privilege and capital. Once such status and power are attained, symbolic capital (see above) is not easily shared or relinquished.

Challenging Bourdieu: Technological Development

Though Bourdieu remains central to social reproduction research, since his passing, many changes have occurred in the musical field regarding how society views the importance of music and boundaries of taste. This is predominantly due to digital technology, file sharing, tube sites, personal devices, and internet availability. People have greater access to a wider variety of musical genres than ever. This has impacted the "strict determinacy" (Rimmer, 2012, p. 308) of musical genres agents were expected to embrace in alignment with their capital and standing in a field. While it was acceptable to embrace the new, it was also expected one never "drift beyond limits of reasonable expectations" (Rimmer, 2012, p. 306). Due to rapid technological development, we cannot cling to Bourdieu and traditional definitions of musical habitus as strictly as in the not-so-distant past (Prior, 2013).

Changing Fields

Today, people consuming similar musical genres often occupy different social positions and classes (Rimmer, 2012), blurring the lines of Bourdieu's (1984) fixed positions of taste. Though social class continues to hold a large role in how people (particularly youth) view, evaluate, and consume music it is no longer as dominant. Shifts in how society understands gender, personality, family, and culture have all contributed to this evolution (Rimmer, 2012). Because Bourdieu died in the beginnings of the technological revolution of the last two decades, he was not witness to the resulting rapidity of social change.

Near the end of Bourdieu's life, Peterson and Kern (1996) observed an evolution regarding "the formulation of new rules governing [past] symbolic boundaries" (p. 904). This resulted from migration, immigration, and generational politics as post-WWII generations embraced a wider sense of the arts, breaking down past elitism. This also occurred in the realm of status-group policies. Whereas dominant groups traditionally branded popular culture as brutish to fit with their own views and interests, times changed and we no longer live in a "WASP-ish world that could enforce its dominance over all others by force if necessary" (Peterson & Kern, 1996, p. 906). This resulted in the reduction of snobbishness found in artistic consumption and replaced by an omnivorous consumption of culture where people no longer limit themselves only to what was once considered acceptable for their social status (Peterson & Kern, 1996).

New fields emerged named "taste communities" (Savage, 2006, p. 159-160)) which, though more pluralistic, still adhere to boundaries. Bourdieu's (1984) strict determinacy is no longer prevalent as musical taste is increasingly related to social groups people belong to than an economic stratum (Prior, 2013). Musical taste communities are not easily mapped onto what traditionally was low or popular culture. Today, marginalisation and dislike for popular

music or music from various cultures, ethnicities, and peoples falls more along age, ethnic, and gender lines than class. Taste communities work simultaneously to break down modernist ideas of high and low culture yet to some degree retain them. Though the social function of music woven with taste continues, it is no longer the result of a strict blueprint imprinted upon people (Vulliamy & Shepherd, 1984).

Changes in Music and Capital

Links between music and capital are also not as they were three decades past. Though habitus and cultural capital continually work together to the benefit of the middle-class, Coulson (2010) found it less rigid as some musicians who do not begin studying Classical music end up in it regardless. Conversely, others who began in classical studies found themselves branching into jazz and popular music. While many assumptions have been made about musical taste to group people into neat categories, and clear indicators remain regarding whether one is omnivorous or univorous (limiting one's tastes) depending upon habitus and field, such thinking has weakened (Rimmer, 2012). This is also found regarding musical genres. Today there exist more musical subgenres than ever as genres meld together in ways that make it difficult to distinguish between them (Rimmer, 2012. Though boundaries remain, the lines have become blurred, increasingly difficult to recognise and define. Consequently, it is illogical to insist upon viewing music and social contexts with a hard line when an obvious mainstream no longer exists (Savage, 2006; Rimmer, 2012). This has caused interesting changes in the positions of classical and popular music.

Just as subgenres of music have been a result of technological and social changes, there also exists a subspecies of cultural capital. This has resulted from changes in who is consuming which genre, and popular music, rather than classical, now establishes the clearest boundaries of taste (Prior, 2013). The roles have switched because what was considered serious or legitimate music (classical) is not as subjected to the commercialism and intense economic pressures to make money popular music has since the 1960s (Vulliamy & Shepherd, 1984). As multiple classes attend and consume similar types of culture, they gain cultural capital, concurrently expanding their social capital. However, hearkening back to Bourdieu (1984), the middle and upper classes continue to benefit most due to greater economic capital (Prior, 2013). Once again, benefits of becoming omnivorous or univorous lie in the hands of dominant classes. For the purposes of this study, however, these recent developments will be touched upon only regarding one participant. For the most part, all the participants were studying music and attempting to establish themselves in a field where traditional Bourdieusian theories were well-established.

Though social reproduction is the theoretical framework encompassing this study, I found it lacking regarding the experiences of the women participants who all alluded to, or outright described, situations of patriarchy, sexual harassment, and stereotypes encountered in their musical endeavours. As all three women directly or indirectly shared such experiences, it was necessary to explore how Bourdieu described sex and gender differences in his theories, the criticisms thereof, and view that data through the lens of intersectionality theory.

Bourdieu, Sexual Divisions and Feminist Intersectional Theory

Bourdieu's theory of social reproduction pertaining to social capital and women's issues has been criticised as too rigid as his intense focus on class limited how he addressed struggles women encounter in a male dominated society. Lovell (2000) claimed Bourdieu "tie[d] up sex, sexuality, and gender too tightly together" providing one reason "why the charge of 'oversexualization' is taken seriously by feminists, notwithstanding his disclaimers" (p. 18). However, she also explained that had Bourdieu included women more specifically "as capital-holding subjects" in relation to social field, they would have been across the entire field and therefore overrepresented (Lovell, 2000). This aligns with Bourdieu's (1984) claim that gender differences are less distinct the higher one moves up the social hierarchy. As Lovell (2000) acknowledged, since the 1970s feminist thought has had to increasingly recognise that social and racial hierarchies "separate women from each other in the social space" (p. 21). This occurs as women from different classes hold different amounts and types of capital and experience different forms of the division of labour (Bourdieu, 1984). Though education addresses a lack of cultural capital, and each subsequent generation, through greater educational access, experiences increased transfers of cultural capital, it does not necessary lead to lasting economic and institutional change (Skeggs, 1997).

I found criticisms of Bourdieu not addressing women's issues enough warranted. However, there was an increased focus upon differences in roles and capital acquisition based upon sex as his life progressed. Though by the 1980s Bourdieu (1984) was addressing the diminishment of gender differences in the higher classes, a few years earlier he still spoke of symbolic violence and capital being divided, with men holding official classifications (political and economic) thereof and women holding the unofficial "magic–secret, clandestine, and private" (Bourdieu, 1977b, p. 41) classifications. Yet even then, Bourdieu (1977b) criticised this "systematic hierarchization condemning women's interventions to a shameful, secret, or, at best, unofficial existence" (p. 41); how their power was unofficial and dominated, only acted upon when permitted by those in control. By the 1990s, Bourdieu (1990a) broke down the division of labour as envisioned in society as hearkening back to traditional roles and beliefs that in a past era gave rise to male fear of women. He described

the focus found within male-dominated societies fixated upon "the negative properties of the female (that is, everything in woman that arouses terror in men)" (p. 214). Not long before his death, Bourdieu (2001) criticised male domination as established and objectively maintained through "social structures and the productive or reproductive activities, based on a sexual division of labour of biological and social production and reproduction which gives the better part to men, and also in the schemes immanent in everyone's habitus" (p. 33). These, he claimed, are shaped by similar conditions across all classes and therefore become transcendently ingrained throughout society.

Through Bourdieu's writings, and those of researchers including Lovell (2000) and Skeggs (1997), I found over time Bourdieu focused increasingly upon the plight of women regarding social reproduction, habitus, and capital. However, to better grasp the experiences of the female participants, a brief description of intersectionality theory is necessary as I applied both it and Bourdieu to the data analysis regarding their experiences.

Feminist Intersectionality Theory

Intersectionality as an analytical framework resulted from a need to move away from binary approaches towards race and identity that divided rather than brought people together (Friedman, 1995). An approach that analysed "cultural narratives around the white/other binary [of] victims and victimizers, colonized and colonizers, slaves and masters, dominated and dominators" (Friedman, 1995, p. 5) could not adequately explain differences between the experiences of women. Though she acknowledged class analyses successfully explained social inequalities, Hill Collins (2015) claimed class is often overemphasised within sociological studies, tending to address gender either marginally or not at all. Thus, the need for an intersectional approach. Though difficult to define, intersectionality "references the critical insight that race, class, gender, sexuality, ethnicity, nation, ability, and age operate not as unitary, mutually exclusive entities, but as reciprocally constructing phenomena that in turn shape complex social inequalities" (Hill Collins, 2015, p. 2). These can also be applied to other social phenomena including "patriarchy, capitalism, heterosexism" (Hill Collins, 2015, p. 5). Intersectionality moves beyond a binary method as demonstrated by Friedman's (1995) description of a Brahman woman living in both London and Calcutta experiencing privilege due to caste and class but sexism and oppression as a woman. The British consider her a woman of colour, yet she does not fit the construct of a third-world woman. Binary approaches cannot sufficiently describe her situation as she constantly lives in an intersection of power relations (Friedman, 1995).

Though the women in this study are white, like all women they have experienced discrimination due to "patriarchy and global capitalism", the latter dominated by white men

(Golash-Boza, Duenas, & Xiong, 2019). Such domination does not exist solely in finance and business but also within educational and musical fields where three times as many women study in conservatoires dominated by male educators (Bull, 2019a, 2019b). Instrument choice and selection have been traditionally limited by sex and as all three women shared experiences of patriarchy, intersectionality allowed me to better appreciate their experiences as all things work together far beyond only race and gender (hooks, 1997).

While intersectionality provided a deeper understanding of the women's' experiences, it also helped me recognise I could apply it to experiences of the men to a degree as well. As music is not always considered the most masculine endeavour and women dominate its study (Bull, 2019a), stereotypes exist for both sexes. These include feeling judged due to class, lack of formal music education, choice of genre, or living outside generally accepted expectations of LIWC men. For some, working in traditionally LIWC jobs while attempting to develop a musical career placed them outside traditional perceptions of LIWC aspirations. Intersectionality's focus upon multiple constructs and phenomena occurring simultaneously within human experience also crosses binary female and male experience, further deepening the participants' stories.

Finally, because intersectionality theory observes social relations between "race, class, gender, sexuality, ethnicity, nation, ability, and age" (Hill Collins, 2015, p. 2), it aligned with Hilgers and Mangez's (2015) previously mentioned description of Bourdieusian field theory as a relational concept. As music is a field with various social structures and relationships holding different degrees of power, employing intersectionality theory resulted in a deeper understanding of all the participants' experiences.

This chapter addressed Bourdieu's theory of social reproduction and specifically the aspects of habitus, field, and capital. Economic, cultural, and social capital were discussed, including embedded and objectified cultural capital. Symbolic capital was defined before discussing how these facets of social reproduction together impact people's lives. I then turned to social reproduction in the musical field and how it potentially impacts careers and class trajectories. Due to technological developments, it was imperative to indicate how the blending of musical genres challenges Bourdieu's views on musical taste and therefore changes what is today considered musical cultural capital. This chapter closed with a review of the research on the limitations and possibilities in Bourdieu's theories regarding sexism and the need to look at part of this study through an intersectional lens.

Before exploring the participants' experiences regarding challenges from social reproduction and what was required to overcome them, chapter three will address the

methodology, methods, participants, and the analysis approach used to produce the data included in chapters four and five.

Chapter Three – Methodology and Methods

In Chapter One and Two, I explained that the basis for this study began upon first encountering Bourdieu's theory of social reproduction and how this deepened my understanding of my life. Within many of my experiences I recognised centres of power based upon economic, cultural, and social capital. I also recognised how I had needed to acquire capital and evolve my habitus to make permanent life changes. Choosing autobiographical methodology framed by social reproduction brought this study together, potentially benefiting other researchers, music educators, and LIWC musicians.

Existing research concerning the LIWC's musical cultural capital is dominated by a reductionist approach regarding its relation to popular music (Bull, 2019a). Though Classical music is admittedly not highly valued by LIWC children and parents (Bourdieu, 1984; Green, 2011), most of this study's participants did not neatly fit into such classifications. All consume and/or participate in multiple genres, indicating the presence of an omnivorous taste in music (Coulson, 2010; Peterson & Kern, 1996; Prior, 2013; Rimmer, 2012; Savage, 2006). Because such genre divergences existed, this work could not be reduced to a strict study of musical taste and class as done by Bourdieu (1984) and I believe my research provides a balanced approach.

This chapter describes the approach, paradigm, and framework I employed followed by a description of autobiographical methodology. I then explain the methods used to gather the data and transcribe the interviews. A brief description of the ethics approval process precedes a discussion regarding participant numbers, as well as a classification table summarising each participant. Following is an explanation of Clandinin and Connelly's (2000) Three-Dimensional Space analysis approach, challenges I encountered, and the analysis charts designed for this process (see Appendix E). A list of all key themes arising from the data and those chosen to focus upon concludes the chapter.

Research Approach, Paradigm, and Framework

This study was completed via an empirical approach and constructivist paradigm to gather qualitative data and build knowledge based upon participants' experiences. Constructivism (also known as social constructivism) was chosen as research into music and music education has moved away from a modernist approach focusing on grand narratives of performance and teaching to include various stories, voices, and meanings (Barrett & Stauffer, 2010c). Constructivism builds meaning from the analysation of the views and unique contextual experiences participants have had with the topic or question being addressed (Creswell, 2014; Crotty, 1998). Qualitative researchers examine participants' contexts, settings, and memories before interpreting findings and constructing meaning (Creswell, 2014; Crotty, 1998). Such

research should be conducted with an openness to all possible resulting understandings (Crotty, 1998).

Constructivism allowed me to experience the interrelationship between my roles of researcher and participant, as well as the relationship between researcher and participants (Mills, Bonner, & Francis, 2006). Because a central purpose of qualitative research is understanding how people act and find meaning in relation to social issues (Creswell, 2014; Schwandt, 2007), constructivism aligned with the research question. Such inquiry can be difficult to succinctly define due to the numerous ways in which it is described (Schwandt, 2007). Addressing questions regarding the empirical nature of qualitative inquiry, Schwandt (2007) claimed qualitative inquiry is “empirical research to the extent that [it deals] in the data of experiences” (p. 84). Having previously read accounts of LIWC people’s struggles and growing up as such with limited economic wealth and capital, Bourdieusian social reproduction, and its central concepts of habitus, field, and capital, was a logical choice of framework choice for this study.

These decisions guided my research processes and analysis as I found experiences of the participants intersected and diverged, demonstrating how each person’s reality was decidedly contextual. Similar and contrasting experiences aided the co-construction of meaning regarding the question (Mills et al., 2006). This study is a story of people’s struggles regarding boundaries, spaces, identity, inclusion, and exclusion (Bull, 2019a) and what was required to overcome many challenges. Functioning as both researcher and full participant, I chose autobiographical research as this study’s methodology.

Methodology

Autobiographical research, a form of narrative inquiry, employs stories and memories to construct a narrative of the self. It has existed for several thousand years evolving to what it is today (Freeman, 2007). Stories have long been part of human experiences with meaning making, contributing to the building of wider communities (Clandinin, 2006). Though many are lost over time, others have staying power for multiple generations and even millennia. Stories hold great power, calling for care in their telling and retelling when used in research. King (2003) warned:

> … once a story is told, it cannot be called back. Once told, it is loose in the world. So, you have to be careful with the stories that you tell. And you have to watch out for the stories that you are told. (p. 10)

Life stories are intimate recollections of past events through the eyes of the present. Acting as more than simply scribes, researchers are the final storyteller who lives the stories alongside their participants (Barrett & Stauffer, 2010b).

Autobiographical methodology provided a fresh contribution to musical research as its use is relatively new (Barrett & Stauffer, 2010c). Too often music research is akin to a rehearsal, where conductors hold dictatorial power over the process (Smith, 2010). Rather, my desire for this study was to answer the research question through the voices of individuals. Autobiography allowed me to ascertain if new understandings and appreciation of past experiences had developed over time, experiences that may have once been considered negative. It also allowed for reflexivity as I engaged not only with the participants' memories but also my own position as researcher, participant, and narrator; as "one coming to know the self within the processes of research itself" (Guba & Lincoln, 2005, p. 210).

Autobiography is complex as memories shape present views of self and continually impact the evolution of identity construction and decision-making processes (Turunen, Dockett, & Perry, 2015). Abrahão (2012) claimed autobiographical research involves a: "triple dimension: as PHENOMENON (the story, event), the METHOD (research), and as PROCESS (the signification of the experience for both: the narrator and researcher" (p. 40, emphasis in original). Data is gathered through collecting participants' explicit memories as their present self (Nelson & Fivush, 2004). Recounting past cultural and social experiences framed in time and space deepens memories to create and recreate meaning (Turunen et al., 2015). This potentially provides a richer understanding of one's past and why decisions were made.

To garner the most data and meaning, it is imperative the researcher recognises the distinction between telling a story versus living it alongside those who experienced it (Connelly & Clandinin, 2006). Participants share their lived experiences through multiple methods. Once concluded, these are interpreted in ways allowing participants to retell them through a present lens, reliving that life in who they currently are and hope to become (Connelly & Clandinin, 2006). This is not a regular researcher-participant relationship as the researcher is deeply involved therein (Barrett & Stauffer, 2010b). This relationship must be established or may already exist, potentially impacting the results of the research.

Relationship is an important challenge within autobiographical research. Riemann (2006) stated a trusting relationship must be established before the data collection as the relationship status potentially carries positive and negative influences upon memories. The more invested the researcher and participant in the relationship, the more trusting and open the participant will be. Researchers must be aware participants may be sharing deeply personal experiences resulting from social conditions (Connelly & Clandinin, 2006). Elmi, Bartoli, and Smorti (2019) claimed empathy is key to achieving the highest quality of

narration. While such requirements may complicate the process, focusing upon both personal and social conditions rather than thoughts and feelings alone contribute to a deeper understanding of participant experiences. This proved beneficial as most participants' narratives were never either/or but rather accounts where social, personal, and feelings were woven together, aligning to concepts of habitus and field.

Since autobiography is dependent upon memory, it can be a messy methodology as memories occur in specific space and time, potentially resulting in different meaning between past and present. Researchers are challenged to identify whether recounted experiences have been reframed or told as experienced. However, Abrahão (2012) stressed relaying experiences as exact facts is less important than capturing the essence of how they are remembered by the narrator, linking actual experiences with current description. Relatedly, Elmi et al. (2019) claimed memory is never an exact representation but rather built from fragments of sporadic and semantic information. No life story is simple to assess as they are not recounted in entirety, in specific location, time, and writing (Pasupathi, Mansour, & Brubaker, 2007). Adding to chronological issues are challenges including experiences recalled in varying degrees of detail, possible occurrences of immediate or future negative emotions, and wide variations of experiences shared by multiple participants (Abrahão, 2012; Elmi et al., 2019; Pasupathi et al., 2007; Turunen et al., 2015), increasing the difficulty of analysis (Elmi et al., 2019). Freeman (2007) claimed as we live in postmodern times, a degree of suspicion exists whether autobiographical research can be considered foundational or empirical. Such suspicions arise because we cannot relive our histories but simply retell them through our current lens (Freeman, 2007). As the narrator, researchers know the end of the story as shared in the interview, however this is complicated by participants choosing what to include, omit, or what was reframed.

To address this, I turned to the recommendations of Coffey (2004), Riemann (2006), and Abrahão (2012) who emphasised the importance of utilising multiple data collection methods. This results in broader types of memories and materials to analyse, deepening insights (Riemann, 2006). However, this too is a messy process. The challenge narrative researchers face is not attempting to reproduce reality as it was experienced, but rather to make sense of the world and experiences in which they were lived (Freeman, 2007). The view that autobiographical research is not concerned with objective truth is a root cause for suspicion, and Gazzaniga (1998) described such research as fiction resulting from having to lie to ourselves. Employing multiple collection methods helps alleviate suspicions because it recounts memories in more than one way, providing a greater depth of understanding. This is particularly important because during an experience we often act rather than think, and only

through later reflection are we able to find meaning (Freeman, 2007). Through multiple data collection methods, participants are enabled to recount lived experiences in multiple ways.

Methods – Interviews, Transcription, and Letter Writing

For this study, I chose two methods: interviews and letter writing. One-to-one interviews are a primary technique for collecting qualitative data (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006). Interviewing multiple participants provided a broad scope and depth of understanding surrounding similar experiences in various contexts and the resultant data. This helped me avoid any form of speculation regarding the research question (Greene, 1990). Interviews granted me access to the participants' feelings and perceptions regarding their experiences rather than analysing situational information only (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006).

Due to my social and empathetic nature, I needed to take great care regarding how deep I allowed myself to go into these shared experiences as I also was a participant. I therefore chose a semi-structured interview technique where I planned the questions in advance, allowing myself to explore specific topics through sub questions. Planned questions kept me on track and limited following too many diverse paths. Throughout the planning process and before the interviews, I turned to research literature to increase my awareness of the challenging aspects of conducting successful autobiographical interviews. I was mindful that because recounted experiences have, ontologically, already happened, both the participants and researcher are, epistemologically, reactive rather than active in the storytelling process (Green, 1990). Sometimes, remaining objective proved difficult because participants' stories were very real and raw during the interviews. I believe this was due to all but one of the participants being colleagues and acquaintances, creating an increased personal involvement and reaction (Barrett & Stauffer, 2010b). This highlighted the obtrusive nature of interviews, and though stories are elicited from participants rather than forced through a rigid process, some stories were clearly recounted after being buried for long periods (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006). These memories caused evident emotions in participants, stressing the need to remain as objective as possible to maintain the validity of the interpretations derived during the analysis.

Utilising a dialogic approach allowed for a high degree of safety and comfort for participants. This also proved challenging as due to their conversational nature, interviews risked becoming overly informal (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). Although potentially problematic, I wanted to maintain a "free flowing, conversational style (Hays et al., 2000, p. 5), to produce the richest stories. I also believed it imperative to avoid the presence of an "assumption of power" (Nichols, 2016, p. 443) that can result should a researcher remain

coldly detached from the shared lives and responses of the participants. This would cause the breakdown of trust necessary for successful interviews (Reimann, 2006).

I believe being ever mindful of these techniques and cautions achieved the correct balance of being both researcher and participant. Clarification and sub-questions naturally arose during each participants' stories except for my own (for an explanation regarding sub-questions in my interview, see below). Due to the Covid-19 pandemic, all interviews were conducted via Zoom through the University of Glasgow's access, allowing for the inclusion of participants near and far. This eliminated the need for travel and potential risks involved with lone field work. Interviews were audio recorded via Zoom for transcription. Though conducting online interviews perhaps lost a level of interpersonal connection, this was alleviated through my previously established relationships with most participants. Utilising an online platform also resulted in greater scheduling flexibility. An unexpected benefit resulted from completing the interviews during the height of the pandemic as no professional or amateur musical ensembles were operating, and participants seemed very willing to take part. More than one person described it as a welcome break from the isolation they felt. Interviews were conducted during the months of February through April 2021 lasting one to one-and-a-half hours in length.

Regarding my own 'interview', I also used Zoom and asked myself the planned questions, speaking to them without looking back to achieve the free flow mentioned above. As sub questions were not possible, if I did find my recounting of experiences had become expanded upon, I would speak from the heart as if in conversation with an interviewer.

The Interview Questions

Designing the interview questions took several attempts as I wanted to be true to the theoretical framework (social reproduction) and remain semi-structured yet still in control. My early attempts were rigid and somewhat leading. I needed to recognise the importance of designing questions "without reference to the literature or theory" (Creswell, 2014, p. 141), approaching the questions in a way that allowed participants to describe their own experiences. I needed to get out of the way and employ neutral wording (Creswell, 2014) with more generalised questions. The final question list (see Appendix D) was therefore a balance as the questions were written in as neutral a way as possible allowing participants to share whichever memories were evoked, yet also providing me with a level of control over the line of questioning (Creswell, 2014). I designed the questions in a chronological sequence from early life through present to maintain a chronological approach to the life stories. This did not mean participants stuck to that sequence, particularly later in the interviews, as it was at these points participants (including myself) would recognise some significance about

something previously shared and would return and expand upon it, even reframing understandings in the process.

Sub questions arose naturally and differed depending upon each participant's contexts, and therefore are not included in the question list. Though I had initially planned some probing sub questions I abandoned them before I began the interviews as each person's stories would be so unique, they would be inapplicable. If participants inadvertently answered an upcoming question, I did not ask that question to avoid redundancy.

Following the chronological sequence of questions, I found the first question, pertaining to initial origins, warmed participants to the process, giving them an easy way to begin their life stories before proceeding into what their families did for employment. This provided me with a basic understanding of their initial habitus and field. From there, I enquired about early jobs they had, the place of music in their homes, and educational experiences with music and in general. The questions then inquired about challenges they may have experienced and how these were met, followed by enquiries into social aspects of their lives and development. I believed it important, socially, to also question whether families and friends they grew up with understood their new, or current, lives and closed the interviews asking them to share how they would advise a young person in a similar position as they had been.

Transcription. Interviews were transcribed using a combination of an online programme and by hand. The platform I used was Otter.ai (2020) and though it worked well for each initial transcription, the process required me to relisten to each interview several times to correct the programme's mistakes. Once completed, I listened to each again, taking notes to strengthen my memories of how interviews occurred in real time, voice inflection, and other nuances the programme could not identify. Even with the use of the online programme, the process took many hours of listening, checking, and correcting. However, I believe using both methods resulted in highly qualitative transciptions from which to analyse the data.

Letter Writing

According to Barton and Hall (2000), formal and informal letter writing have an extensive history and is "one of the most pervasive literate activities in human societies" (p. 1). Letter writing was chosen as the second data collection method. The letter writing instructions were uncomplicated as I did not want to exercise much control over the process nor interfere with what participants felt they needed to write. Participants were simply asked to write to anyone they felt had impacted them personally and/or professionally (music or otherwise) during

their life's journey. No word limit was given as I wanted participants to feel free to write all they needed to say, nor limit the amount of potential data I might gain.

The instructions for the letter writing had not required participants to exactly specify the nature of the relationship they had with the recipients. This was done to ensure participants were comfortable writing to anyone of their choosing without compromising anonymity. Recipients varied, ranging from parents to instructors and professors or casual acquaintances and friends. I must point out that Muireann requested permission to write to a body of people, and this request was granted. She wrote to her schoolteachers, dividing the letter between those who had discriminated against her and those who saw her for who she truly was. Who participants wrote more specifically to is included with the stories and quotations in Chapter Five.

While we often think back to those who had positive impacts upon us, participants were also given the option to write to person(s) who were not a positive influence as "letter writing situates ideas within a specific time frame" (Flemming, 2020, p. 7). Writing in the present to someone from their past allowed for the possibility of reframing initially experienced recollections. Some relationships, particularly from our youth, were unequal in power balance (Barton & Hall, 2000) but were not, or were not, viewed the same today as all participants have matured and established themselves.

Letter writing empowers participants, granting them full control of this portion of the research process apart from oversight, choosing when and how to do so (Grinyer, 2004). They can write, leave to reflect, and return when ready. This is important because writing as a research method is not an easy experience due to depths of emotion and even pain that can arise (Kralik et al., 2000). I experienced this during my trial study as the person I wrote to had played an immense role in my development and is no longer alive. It also occurred in this study as one participant (Rob) reached out and shared he found writing someone much more difficult than the interview. Letter writing allows a participant to experience and address feelings they may not be able to share or demonstrate verbally.

Letter writing also allowed participants to decide what they chose to include and how to express it (Stamper, 2020). This provided an "emotional safety zone" (Kralik et al., 2020, p. 915) as there was no pressure to respond or feel uncomfortable in a moment of emotion, silence, or thought. This safety zone extended also to anonymity as recipients needed to be assigned a pseudonym as outlined in the ethics application. Combined with the participants' own pseudonym, this provided a double layer of anonymity. Writing letters therefore provided participants a higher level of control than interviews alone would have.

Letter writing also results in a greater depth of memory as more time is taken to write, think, and reflect, not necessarily in that order. Just as new meanings can result from interviews (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006), this became evident as some participants demonstrated a more reflective approach in writing about memories than the reactive version during interviews (Greene, 1990). I also found some participants, though strong oral storytellers, were not in-depth writers. I believe this resulted in greater empirical results as the use of both interviews and writing provided me a deeper understanding of participants' experiences.

Ethics

As this study involved human subjects, it was necessary to complete and submit an Ethics Review to the College of Social Sciences Ethics Committee. I submitted my application in September 2020 and received approval to proceed in November 2020. The feedback I received caused me limit the amount of data collection methods I had initially planned to utilise. These included photos, video, and musical recordings, all of which would have caused complexities surrounding confidentiality, ownership, informed consent, and usage.

I had also not given thought to the fact academic writing was not conducive to participant understanding of the study and its purpose. I redesigned the Participant Information Sheet removing unnecessary references to the framework and other citations, focusing upon the nature of the interviews, study withdrawal, and the proposed end date in plain language. This was a lesson I will be mindful of in future ethics applications.

To ensure the highest level of anonymity, my plan included receiving verbal consent followed by assigning each participant a code for their, and my, records. They would then provide me with a pseudonym for the remainder of the study. All personal data will be destroyed upon completion of the dissertation, with de-identified data stored ten years, through the University of Glasgow Data Management system before its destruction.

Participants

The participants for this study were determined by six criteria. First, each participant had to have experienced earlier life as LIWC. Second, at some point in participants' lives, music became an important focus through family, school, or other influences. Third, participants' ages needed to be nearly forty and above. This was necessary because it was important everyone was established in their careers or retired to look back and reflect upon whether musical study and performance had impacted their lives. Fourth, participants were not limited to only professional musicians or music educators as fulltime positions in performance are difficult to obtain, and not all music educators only teach music. I believed this would have limited the scope of the study regarding the influence music may have had upon careers

outside of the musical field. Fifth, it was essential participants were a mix of men and women. This proved insightful as the women shared extra layers of social reproduction due to sexism (see Chapters Two and Four). A final criterion was the need to examine musicians from multiple genres to establish empirical results regarding LIWC musicians' experiences beyond Bourdieu's (1984) approach.

This final criterion was also important because one would assume the closer the style of music pursued by the participants was in relation to the lower-income and working classes, the easier they would have found it to align their habitus and capital. This was, however, not the case. As will be seen in chapters four and five, it did not matter if the style were part of the musical traditions of one's class, where you came from influenced your position in that field regardless of ability. Achieving success did not eliminate feelings of not belonging. Though Craig always played popular forms of music, it did not spare him from self-doubt on stage. Rob will be seen doing everything to fit into multiple musical genres and yet experienced isolation even from his family's musical tastes. And even after thirty successful years in a world-class orchestra, Pedro will still battle self-doubts. All these experiences (and others) will demonstrate the power that class, habitus, and capital, as well as people's assumptions regarding people thereof, have implications beyond skill and ability.

Number of Participants

To determine the best number of participants, I turned to literature regarding narrative inquiry to identify what had previously been done within musical and non-musical research. I discovered exploratory studies involving interviews were best completed using smaller sample sizes to allow for greater depth of study and increased contact between researcher and participants (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006). To achieve depth of meaning, "it is much more important for the research to be intensive, and thus persuasive at the conceptual level, rather than aim to be extensive with the intent to be convincing…through enumeration" (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006, p. 494). This aligned with my intention to discover more than simply the stories of individuals that happened to share a particular life circumstance, making it essential I carefully focused upon each case rather than the number of cases (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006). I found Wright and Høyen (2020) focused upon various writers' reasoning and descriptions of the number and types of participants used in non-musically focused studies. I then returned to Burnard, Hofvander Trullson, and Söderman (2015) specifically regarding musical studies.

I found a wide variety of approaches to participant numbers depending upon purpose and question. While some studies (Evans, 2020; Mathiassen, 2020; Perkins, 2015) involved a single participant, others involved up to thirty-six individuals (Hall, 2015) or even large focus

groups and classes (Wallin, 2020). Regarding sex, some involved one sex (Cooper, 2020; Rasmussen, 2020; Stahl & Dale, 2015) while others included both sexes and were either equal (Evoy, 2020; Hofvander Trulsson, 2015; Oikarinen-Jabai, 2020) or unequal in number (Pathak, 2020; Söderman, 2015). I recognised final numbers of participants was determined by purpose and question scope and decided for this study I would attempt to interview six or seven people in addition to myself. The final number comprised eight individuals (including myself) with three female and five male participants.

Participant Recruitment

Once the criteria and participants numbers were determined, recruitment began. I first created a list of past acquaintances and colleagues, determining whether names that I recalled fulfilled the criteria. I believed contacting people I knew to various degrees would be a benefit to a study of this nature due to the need for a trusting relationship (Riemann, 2006). Though none of the participants on the list were close friends, I knew most of them from growing up around them, knowing of them, and having worked with or performed musically with them. Only one participant (Craig) was not known to me before the study.

Reviewing the list, I remained mindful that pre-existing relationships between researcher and participant can impact results (Barrett & Stauffer, 2010b). While this could be positive in the sense that it would help me be more empathetic towards people sharing potentially difficult, personal memories (Connelly & Clandinin, 2006; Elmi, Bartoli, & Smorti, 2019), if the relationship were too close, I risked criticism of being too partial to their experiences. This is particularly so with narrative inquiry where the researcher lives alongside those telling the story (Connelly & Clandinin, 2006) and is deeply involved in the process (Barrett & Stauffer, 2010b).

I employed a purposeful sampling method, reaching out via email and messaging platforms to eleven individuals. If I did not have up-to-date contact information, I contacted a mutual acquaintance without indicating it was for a research study to maintain anonymity. One participant (Craig) was referred to me by a mutual acquaintance. I received affirmations from seven who fit the criteria and were willing to participate. Of the four who did not participate, one did not fully qualify, another did not respond, health issues prevented another, and the fourth, though very interested, could not participate due to time constraints.

For transparency, I must acknowledge the nature of the six previously established participant relationships. These are included here from longest to shortest. I met Pedro at age sixteen through our common mentor, Tom (see Chapter Five). Nine years older, he was someone I looked up to as an example for how to work hard and succeed. Once he won his opera orchestra position, several years passed before we reconnected, and he introduced me

to several of his colleagues with whom I periodically travelled to take lessons with twenty years before commencing this study. Since then, we occasionally conversed via social media. Rob and I met as music teachers in different school districts when I first moved to Lethbridge, and later worked together when he took university music education student teachers that I supervised. Kate and I are trumpet colleagues, having performed together in our city orchestra, brass quintet, and other venues over the last two decades. Oleg was known to me originally as a band teacher and father of a former university trumpet student of mine. In the past, he would bring his marching band to Lethbridge for parades and ask some of the local music teachers to fill in parts. Rae and I first met over a dozen years ago when she filled in as a supply teacher for me. She then returned to Europe until she retired and, returning to Lethbridge, became involved again in the music community. Ten years ago, Muireann spent several months as a counsellor at the middle school I used to teach for and then moved on to the city college. I knew a small part of her story from then and she seemed a good fit for this study. As can be seen, these relationships span from ten to thirty-five years however none were overly close friendships, rather resulting from study, music, or work.

Classification of Participants

To classify each participants' particulars, I created a table including an order of interview code (GDP#: Griffioen Dissertation Participant #), pseudonym, and basic information in a chronological order to life development beginning in the column second to the left (see Table 3). Regarding the current, self-described class in the right column, it remains common for people to describe themselves in terms of middle, upper, or upper middle class. However, to determine the accuracy based upon present or most recent career, I turned to the most recent class definitions. To be considered upper-middle class in Canada in 2021, an income range of $106,827 - $373,894 (pre-tax) per family must be earned (Pitman, 2023). As all participants are currently married to partners who had/have their own careers, the term upper-middle class has been used. Family social class in childhood was determined and described by participants in question two of the interviews.

Table 3 Classification of Participants

Pseudonym	Class Then	Country of Origin/Rural or Urban	Musical Specialty	Status	Current Profession	Class Now
GDP1 Rae	Lower Income	Canada; Rural	Bassoon (Classical)	Semi-professional and amateur musician	Retired educational counsellor and educator	Upper-middle class (retired)
GDP2 Rob	Working-Class	Canada; Small urban	Guitar (Classical, Rock, Pop)	Semi-professional musician	Music educator	Upper-middle class
GDP3 Muireann	Lower Income	Ireland; Rural and Urban	Vocalist (Rock, Pop, Jazz)	No longer performs	Government employee	Upper-middle class
GDP4 Craig	Working-Class	Canada; Urban	Guitar (Bluegrass, Folk)	Amateur and gigging musician	Retired from public service.	Upper-middle class (retired)
GDP5 Pedro	Lower Income	Canada; Urban	Trumpet (Classical, jazz)	Professional musician	Opera orchestra	Upper-middle class
GDP6 Kate	Working-Class	Canada; Small urban	Trumpet (Classical)	Semi-professional musician	College Dean	Upper-middle class
GDP7 Oleg	Lower Income	Ukraine/USSR; Urban and Rural	Baritone (Wind/Brass Band)	Amateur musician	Retired music educator Farmer	Middle-class (retired)
GDP8 – Keith (researcher)	Working-Class	Canada; Small urban	Trumpet (Classical, jazz)	Semi-professional musician	Music Teacher Educator	Upper-middle class

Designed by Griffioen (2021)

Analysis

In autobiographical research, meaning unfolds from the intersections of peoples' lived experiences and memories thereof (Barrett & Stauffer, 2010b; Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). Because our personal experiences involve ourselves and interactions with others occurring within time, space, and specific contexts, a three-dimensional space approach is one analysis method used to interpret collected data through the lenses of "interaction, continuity, and situation" (Ollerenshaw & Creswell, 2002, p. 339). For Clandinin and Connelly (2000), the makings of the three-dimensional space lie in the fact throughout the process the researcher must be always looking "backward and forward, inward and outward" (p. 54) or any combination of these to locate findings in time and place.

Three-Dimensional Space Analysis

Dimensions are "directions or avenues to be pursued" (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000, p. 54). When a participant recounts an experience, it must be viewed inwardly to understand

their feelings at the time and in the moment. The inward aspect creates a sense for the researcher of living alongside the participant. In this study, I often found it was moments where participants' inward feelings were revealed that most sub questions arose. This most frequently occurred when a participant claimed something they shared had never been thought of in a particular way before that moment. At such times, interviews not only generated data and stories but also created new understandings for the participant(s) and me (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000; Crouch & McKenzie, 2006). Though these moments can create rich data and meaning, they also point to the messiness previously mentioned pertaining to autobiography. Even though my questions were rather chronologically ordered, one cannot halt a participant from exploring new avenues as they reframe their own understanding, making connections between moments in their lives often years apart.

Another challenging aspect of using this approach was that it resulted in a hybridized deductive and inductive analysis. While I was utilising a deductive approach by applying key principles from Bourdieusian social reproduction (see Charts C and D) I was still including aspects of induction (see Chart E). This, however, proved beneficial as the principles of habitus and capital taken from the literature (deductive) helped me inductively identify key themes arising from the data (Fereday & Muir-Cochrane, 2006; Proudfoot, 2023). The colour coding completed in Chart E demonstrates the inductive aspect of the analysis. Though at first it felt odd using a hybridised method, I believe it resulted in a stronger analysis. The overarching frameworks also kept me from following too many trails in the data and allowed me to inductively settle upon which of the findings were most important. Complex problems, such as those encountered by the participants in this study, necessitated a process of inductively identifying themes yet also required "the theoretical rigor offered by the deductive application of themes derived from an existing framework" (Proudfoot, 2023, p. 309). I also recognised as social reproduction was limited due to the women's experiences with sexism, theory generation rather than simply attempting to confirm Boudieusian principles required a hybridized analysis approach (Proudfoot, 2023).

The goal of working with smaller numbers, unlike those found in large-scale quantitative studies, is to analyse participant experiences for various findings and dimensions that "uncover dynamic patterns" (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006, p. 491). To achieve this, I drew upon Ollerenshaw and Creswell's (2002) examples and created data charts that employed headings aligning with Clandinin and Connelly's (2000) three-dimensional space approach as well as Bourdieu's habitus and capital. I began by analysing one person's story in-depth, filling in the first chart and then applied the same process to each participant to complete a comparative analysis of experiences (Miles & Huberman, 1994; Trent, 2013). Not knowing

if, or to what extent, correlations between stories existed or in terms of strength, this case-oriented approach aligned to Miles and Huberman's (1994) recommendations. I created five charts, two used for organising and analysing data derived from each individual participant through interviews and letter-writing, and a third to analyse the interview data through a Bourdieusian lens. I designed the fourth chart to analyse data backwards and forwards, inwards and outwards, and a fifth to organise intersections found amongst all participants (see Appendix E for all chart templates).

The first chart completed for each participant focused upon experiential and temporal data from a macro point of view of past, present and future (continuity). I completed two of these (Charts A and B) for each participant to analyse the interviews and letter-writing separately. Though seemingly straightforward, I was quickly challenged as participants not only spoke of the present on its own terms but rather mixed with the past from their present perspective. To overcome this, I added the concepts of looking back from the present and continuity in the future. These differed in function with the inclusion of the fifteen interview questions in separate rows in Chart A, whereas Chart B was completed through a holistic approach to the letter and did not include the interview questions (see Table 4). This choice was made because the letters did not address all the questions, particularly general ones. Both charts contained a mix of direct quotes or summarisations of key ideas. Throughout this section, I have included working examples of the charts. Charts A through D all include information taken from one participant only for consistency of the data whereas Chart E contains small amounts of information from all participants.

Table 4 Analysation Charts A and B

Chart A: Interview Experiential, Temporal Data

Participant: Muireann.

Past	**Present (and looking back from the present)**	**Future (Continuity)**
1. When and where were you born? - May 1977 in Donegal, northwest Ireland	- "Donegal is at the very top of the Northwest, and it's right on the border between Northern Ireland and what I call the Free State."	
2. What did your parents do for employment when you were growing up? - "My father was a smuggler. That was his actual job." - Mother: In Ireland, nothing outside the home; stay-at-home mum.	- "And this is a really interesting thing, when I think by class, she had one sister who was sent away from the home, because she was a very delicate little thing. …So, this woman ends up with a completely different life experience to my mother."	***(from much later in the chart)*** - "I think if you've got one person who believes in you, anything's possible."

Source: Adapted from Ollerenshaw and Creswell (2002).

Chart B: Letter Experiential, Temporal Data

Past	Present (and looking back from the present)	Future (Continuity)
Participant: Muireann – teachers and what they did *to* her.		
- Finished school at 15. - Had a sense of always being "less than". - Muireann "inherited a sense of knowing my place, my class, my limits". - Where did it come from?	- Muireann understood where it came from when her children went to school. • They (teachers) saw and heard her for who they knew her to be. • Not as who she identified to be. • "You saw me as a working class, Irish, poor, settled Travelling girl. Probably pregnant by 16."	- "While growing up in Catholic schools, watching some of the examples that were set, I may have lost whatever faith I had." - "And now I'll put you back in your box, the box you've been in for some time, back in a dark corner of my memory."
Participant: Muireann – teachers and what they did *for her.*		
- To the music teachers, "the ones who saw me, the ones who knew I didn't have the money for the voice lessons, or piano lessons, or the kind of family who would find it…"	- "They gave her: • A place to be. • Deep confidence • "The chance to sing my truth." - "I love you and I'm grateful for you. You're the reason I kept going. I will never forget you. You were my saviours."	- "That rattling may never quite stop. That rattling might make me second guess myself or doubt myself. But that's ok, because my voice always rises above rattling."

Source: Adapted from Ollerenshaw and Creswell (2002).

As can be seen in Table 4, Chart B, when analysing Muireann's letter, I separated the data between the teachers who had discriminated against and for her. This made it easier to identify what she considered positive and negative impacts her teachers had on her.

Chart C was designed to analyse the data from the perspective of Bourdieusian social reproduction, seeking to understand whether habitus, social, and cultural capital impacted personal opportunity, development, and life. This produced data revealing experiences impacted individual habitus. It also demonstrated the need for outside intervention in gaining social and cultural capital and allowing the habitus to evolve, enabling each person to become who they did.

When I began using this chart, I realised it would become overwhelming if I did not devise a workable format. I therefore divided it into three sections: Childhood-18, Adult Life, and Looking Back from the Present. I also labelled the data along commonalities, aligning these across the columns. The following example demonstrates how Muireann dealt with challenges in her adult life. This is an example where all three columns were well-aligned.

Table 5 Analysis Chart C

Personal, Social, and Cultural Interactions

Participant: Muireann

Personal	**Social**	**Cultural**
	Adult Life	
Meeting challenges - Immigrated to Canada – Canadian culture was different. - New start; married a British Air Force pilot. - Has children that depend on her. - Not a rebirth, but a do over.	**Meeting challenges** - Found a mentor while working in prisons in east London. - Watched closely how people interacted in Canadian culture. - Educated herself	**Meeting challenges** - "I think there's a lot to be said about that with co-dependency and the relationships that we have with family… you have the social elements as well, that if you're still around it, you're going to be pulled back into it."

Source: Adapted from Ollerenshaw and Creswell (2002).

Returning to Clandinin and Connelly's (2000) approach of considering all aspects of experience, I designed Chart D to better my understanding of each individual participant. The Backwards and Forwards columns focused on place, early experiences with music and work, and personal goals. The Inwards column identified data involving feelings regarding experiences participants held in the past and currently. The final column, Outwards, identified all places participants found themselves living geographically and locations of fields including family life, music, and work. Though less detailed due to the summarisation, this chart enabled me to identify specific, significant findings. Chart D did not include any direct quotes. Rather, I summarised the data for greater clarity to identify key findings.

Table 6 Analysis Chart D

Backwards, Forwards, Inwards, Outwards

Participant: Muireann

Backwards	**Forwards**	**Inwards**	**Outwards**
- Sings in school choirs and plays (if cast due to truancy). - Did all sorts of cleaning, farming jobs. Loved farm work. Manual labour was happier.	- Probably would have made a career in music had her family not been so messed up. There was no money for lessons, etc.	- Singing kept her going. - Feels singing in pubs and lounges helped her stand up for herself. - Helped her know how to deal with men, when she went into recruitment, and working in prisons.	- School was hard – very judgmental places because of her Irish background. Choir teacher saw potential in her. - Muireann cannot study music formally. - Singing in bars/lounges, worked her way up to higher-class music jobs.

Source: Adapted from Ollerenshaw and Creswell (2002).

Upon completion of Chart D, ten findings were evident:

- Instrument choice was influenced by family, society, by accident, or availability,
- Resilience was a trait of all participants,
- Friends and family do not necessarily understand the music field or why we chose it,
- Family involvement varied from too much to very little,
- Religion played a large role for me but no one else, even if they were church attenders,
- Sexism was experienced by all the women and in different ways,
- Barriers regarding the key concepts of social reproduction (habitus, field, and capital) existed, causing self-doubts,
- Distance from the centre of a field is geographical as well as social and cultural,
- Working-class ethics aided success, and
- Mentorship was necessary for everyone to succeed, albeit to different degrees.

To determine which findings were most necessary to address within the limits of this dissertation, Chart E was designed to expand upon the key findings and subthemes found within the analyses. Five areas continuously arose in all recounted experiences and letters, and these were listed in the left column (see Table 7 Chart E and Appendix E). Individual's detailed experiences and recollections were included in columns two and three regarding the intersections and divergences between participants. In each column, the names of the participant were kept on the same level in both for clarity. Once this was completed, I went back through the chart analysing for encounters with social reproduction, highlighting challenges pertaining to social capital in yellow, cultural capital in green, encountered barriers in blue, and leaving indistinguishable areas unhighlighted. Upon completion of the data analysis, most points had been assigned a colour, however in some instances this proved impossible. Observational notes regarding intersections and divergences were inserted along the right-hand side throughout each chart.

I then needed to determine which findings would most clearly demonstrate the challenges working-class musicians face and how to overcome them. Due to the large amount of data involving habitus, field, and capital, these required discussion as they are key social reproduction concepts. Under this heading I also decided to place a subtheme of sexism. Through the lens of intersectionality, these experiences created barriers because of social reproduction as it wove together with social and cultural capital. Paired with this, a finding regarding self-doubt and lack of belonging from habitus and lack of capital needed to be

included as these can impede success and even cause self-elimination from opportunities (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990).

Throughout the study it was clear everyone needed help from others to experience success. Mentorship became my third theme because mentors were necessary for evolving habitus, acquiring capital, countering sexism, and musical development. Mentorship in many ways brought the previous findings together. However, I also recognised beyond it that a working-class habitus, and work ethic in particular, heavily impacted musical study and meeting the challenges of habitus, capital, and power within the field. These four findings and one subtheme (geographical distance) were chosen as all participants, albeit to varying degrees, had encountered some or all of them. Please note that due to space, in the following working example I have limited Chart E to impacts of habitus and issues of feeling out of place due to social capital. For the full chart template, refer to Appendix E.

Table 7 Analysis Chart E

Intersections and Divergences

Colour Coding Legend:
Social Capital
Cultural Capital
Barriers of Social Reproduction
Unhighlighted – unsure which to place it under

Key findings and subthemes from the data	**Intersections**	**Divergences**
1. What are the impacts of our habitus?	**Rae:** - Country bumpkin - Couldn't keep up **Muireann:** - Lack of confidence; never has a true sense of belonging still. **Pedro:** - Feels out of place still at times; doesn't share experiences with a lot of people. **Keith:** - Struggled with shyness and lack of self-confidence in first attempt at university. Moves back home. **Rob:** - Feels out of place at Minot State and in local music education community because of his musical background.	**Oleg:** - Never felt out of place other than a little when first in Canada. **Craig:** - Feeling out of place not as big a deal as moving made him more used to it and independent. **Kate:** - Mother taught her a lot of social skills that she took forward.

Designed by Griffioen (2021)

These five charts enabled me to decide what was broad or specific data to address and include in the following chapters. They enhanced my ability to identify and separate the proximal context of family from the macro contexts of social and cultural influences (Pasupathi et al., 2007). This was important regarding separating the influence of participants' initial habitus from those of fields encountered outside of family.

Challenges

Though previously knowing most of the participants addressed the need for a trusting relationship when utilising narrative inquiry, I knew there were various risks and challenges, particularly regarding partiality that could arise from being both researcher and participant. When one is both insider and outsider, the work will contain a great deal of bias as one is positioned uniquely in the study. However, this is not a negative result that reduces the validity thereof. Coming from similar backgrounds, class, or communities allows a researcher to "apply contextual knowledge to deciphering…meanings of the narrators' responses, to analysing the narrative in detail, and to minimising misinterpretations of life stories" (Chan, 2017, p. 30). As this study arose from my lived experience and the desire to explore the autobiographies of other individuals, the resulting data is rich in detail, emotion, and reframing of experiences providing insights into what LIWC people need for success. Knowing a researcher has lived similarly to what a participant experienced also adds to the level of trust between parties.

However, despite these positives, I had to keep focus upon my positionality throughout the data collection and analysis to avoid criticism of solely trying to prove a predetermined point. This began immediately in the study when, four months before commencing interviews, I wrote my story and then completely left it for nearly three years until the summer before submission. I did this to separate my story from the data collection and analysis. Once I had received ethical approval, I began collecting the data. After each interview and transcription, I would conduct a full review, making notes of any aspects which could possibly be misconstrued as leading and ensuring this was accounted for in the next interview. I continued this throughout the analysis as well, often returning to the transcriptions and interviews when working with the charts as rereading the data would trigger a memory of how something was shared; an inflection in the voice of the participant that provided deeper meaning.

This cycle of review, reflect, revisit helped me be mindful at all times of my positionality and how I had to separate my positions as empathetic researcher and participant. I also learned in the process that one cannot completely establish a hard boundary due to the nature of the questions and life experiences being addressed. I also conducted my interview

last during the data collection phase and analysed it last of all the participants. Again, this was purposefully done to avoid frontloading my own material and influencing the interview and analysis processes.

Another constant challenge was remaining aware that maturity and time can change perspectives on events and ourselves. Pasupathi, Mansour, and Brubaker (2007) termed these changes cause relations. Cause relations are future oriented as reflection results in changes of perspective from the moment of reflection forwards (Pasupathi, Mansour, & Brubaker, 2007). As mentioned, I found this occurred particularly during the interviews when participants claimed sharing an experience suddenly made them reframe its significance, altering how they had viewed it for many years. Several participants also provided examples of reveal relations where an experience exposed a quality about themselves that they had already possessed, only to come to light because of an experience (Pasupathi, Mansour, & Brubaker, 2007). For example, I never intended to be a schoolteacher yet unexpectedly found myself teaching jazz in my Christian school, a place I did not have fond memories of. However, here it was revealed I had teaching abilities not previously recognised. Though the experience was new, I already possessed the qualities of an educator. I now recognise what was then a reveal relation, upon reframing, became a cause relation later, leading to a career in education.

In the following two chapters, I will explore the main findings that arose from the data analysis. These will often be broken down and compared in terms of experiences had by those initially focused upon a professional music performance career versus those who did not intend to pursue professional music. Chapter Four will demonstrate though varied across all participants, a sharp line emerged between these groups regarding the degree to which they experienced social reproduction as a result of habitus and deficits in cultural and social capital. The chapter closes discussing the added challenges female participants experienced regarding sexism. Chapter five will identify issues of self-doubt and feeling out of place that result from habitus and capital deficits followed by the importance of mentorship in the process of developing one's abilities and acquiring necessary capital to live and work in a different class. The chapter concludes outlining the positive and challenging impacts working-class habitus and ethics have upon overcoming barriers of social reproduction.

Chapter Four – Know Your Place! Habitus, Capital, and Sexism

This chapter begins by discussing distinctions in habitus between participants not focused upon a musical career and those that were. This division will then be applied to the effects of cultural capital deficits followed by an examination regarding how the divide related to social capital. Next is a brief discussion regarding how distance within a field is socio-cultural but also geographical. The chapter closes focusing on the women's added challenges due to sexism in the field. Note: in this chapter, all direct quotes taken from the data resulted from the interviews.

Habitus – Those Not Focused on a Musical Career

In retrospect, the division of participants along career goals should not have been surprising considering Bourdieu and Wacquant's (1992) description of "the paradox of the dominated" where "resistance can be alienating, and submission can be liberating" (p. 25). As will be seen, this proved true for the six participants focused on a musical career. However, to claim Oleg and Craig actively submitted to forces of social reproduction is presumptuous as a musical career was never their initial intention. For them, life unfolded because of study and entering other careers that did not result in the barriers encountered by the others. This began with opportunities to enter higher education due to previous family experience and accomplishment whereas post-secondary education was not the norm for the remaining participants' families.

Having lived in the former Soviet Union, East Germany, and a transit camp in Hamburg before coming to Canada, Oleg did not sense barriers in his path to success.

> Of course, when I came over to Canada, I could not speak English. ... But we had learned it mostly on a playground with your friends. ... At that time the country was very welcoming . . . though I was referred to [as] you're a German or a Nazi. In those days you think the time, you know, it was fresh after the war. I feel no, I'm not traumatized.

Arriving in Canada provided unheard of opportunities rather than barriers for Oleg. "I had the freedom, you know, and this is what I maintain to this day, that we can . . . complain about Canada all we want. … No, like the Soviet Union, hey, you do not leave the country, you know. We have the freedom, and this is what I've felt."

Similarly, Craig did not view experiences from his early habitus, where his family often moved due to his father's employment, as a challenging barrier. Instead, he described it as an opportunity that paid dividends as a student and adult.

> I think it's…which side of the coin you're looking at, Keith. Because I mean…I became fairly independent and self-reliant…and able to structure my own life without feeling too much like I depended on what others thought. … More of an upside than a downside.

Not feeling the direct impacts of social reproduction due to the nature of their pursuits allowed both participants to recognise value in experiences that contributed to who they became. For Oleg, leaving Brooks, Alberta for Calgary to study engineering and onward to Ottawa to formally study Russian, musical involvement consisted of playing in various military and community bands. Musical performance was not a vehicle for a better life or change of class. However, it eventually did lead to a forty-five-year music teaching career.

Craig reflected going to school and becoming a probation officer at a time when criminal justice was transitioning from consisting primarily of ex-RCMP[6] officers and former church ministers contributed to not experiencing barriers.

> The year before I was there, the first people with degrees were hired…a B.A. in Psych[ology] was all you needed and that's all I had. …It was also the first year that two women were hired. …I think they experienced a lot more of that than I did… and there were already three of four people who had degrees so they kind of paved the way there.

Like Oleg, music was a pastime Craig enjoyed outside of work at an amateur level until much later. And for both participants, though their families were working-class (Oleg) or had a working-class income structure (Craig), a precedence was set in terms of not staying in the occupations or class of their families as both had one parent who had completed post-secondary education.

These factors set Craig and Oleg apart from the remaining participants, none of whom had a family history of post-secondary education. Oleg's father had completed school and become a chemical engineer for the Soviet government and wanted the same opportunity for his children. "He said, 'Hey, I'll take the shirt off my back. But every one of you guys…are going to go…beyond high school education.' So, all of [us] had above high school education. And that was the aim of my father." Similarly, Craig believed as his father had gone to university after returning from World War II, he had to as well. "There was an expectation that I would. I never even doubted that I'd go on to university. That was just…the natural path for me even though I didn't know quite what I wanted to do."

These experiences demonstrate how Bourdieu's social reproduction theory cannot always explain the cultural and social realities of people equally. Whereas it aligns much closer with the remaining six participants, for Oleg and Craig, Giroux's (1983) criticisms that Bourdieusian social reproduction overemphasises domination, homogenises the working class, and limits human agency bear out. However, it must be noted part of their habitus was

[6] Royal Canadian Mounted Police

the presence of higher education, and this set a course they followed. Oleg and Craig were continuing in, rather than challenging, their initial habitus unlike the remaining participants.

Habitus – Those Focused on a Musical Career

In Chapter Two, I addressed that Bourdieu emphasised that habitus is not static but rather reinforced or modified depending upon individual circumstances (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). However, making changes to one's social standing is a monumental task, and barriers arise from where and to whom one is born. Conflict and opposition occur when individuals desire change and are willing to struggle through challenges rather than simply accept their position in society (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). It is this unwillingness to remain in the place fate has designed that causes conflict and challenges experienced by those working to modify initial habitus.

Contrary to Oleg and Craig, the remaining participants shared various experiences demonstrating barriers to advancement. Though their families enjoyed music and provided them with a degree of cultural capital and a foundation of musical habitus, as they increasingly focused on musical study, lacking financial capital was a common barrier. Rae, whose family farmed until her parents had to sell and move into town, described how her entire family played in the local community band but acquiring instruments for everyone was a financial struggle.

> We had an auntie who was very good to us, and she bought a saxophone and a trumpet for the family so everybody would have an instrument. And then we borrowed some from the band… There was a woman that lived in Stalwart [Saskatchewan]…who taught music lessons to everybody on anything. My dad took violin lessons from her and paid her by giving her half a pig for the year.

Affordability was a challenge, both in general and in accessing musical opportunities. Growing up in County Donegal Ireland, Muireann shared how her family life was challenging because of her parents' backgrounds and financial instability.

> We are from the traveling culture…Gypsies [sic]. … My Dad was born in a caravan. …The women weren't allowed into the hospitals so they were close by [the hospital] because then the nurse…it would often be a nun, would run out to help because they weren't allowed in because of communicable diseases.

Muireann's mother divorced her father and left her and her brother with him until she could afford to have them come to England. Until then, socio-economic conditions meant having to do anything to survive.

> My father was a smuggler. That's how he put food on the table. And he smuggled goods across the Northern Ireland border… And he would sometimes have our help to just look like a normal family man going across the border to see family. … He was a horse trader [and] horse dealer. … He always had legal stuff going on, which brought extra money into the house with the pawn shop.

Though Muireann had an excellent singing voice from a young age, there was no money to access lessons or ensembles to develop her abilities.

> Muireann: I never got the chance to read music fluently. And I think had I…the time at school, to have that time invested in me…I think that music probably would have been the way I went. I probably would have gone professional in a proper sense. Not, you know, singing and working in bars. … I did theatres, and I also did festivals. I warmed up [for]…the singer Billy Jo Spears.

Pedro's family economic situation also proved a barrier to accessing music and other cultural experiences.

> I have a sort of…family shrub in that my mother had two children and was married to a person who I take the last name of. And when she was pregnant with her second child, he deserted her when she was visiting her parents back in Saskatchewan. … Her and my grandmother were working, when they moved from the prairies, first in restaurants, managing restaurants, waitressing [in] cafes…working at a photo development store…a secretary. … So, it was sort of we were one step away from poverty, really. I grew up across the street from a housing project…and thought I was glad to not be in the projects. …It was a very tenuous existence.

Despite financial deprivations, Pedro felt he grew up in a relatively safe environment of largely immigrant families in East Vancouver. Pedro's early musical exposure was limited to occasionally singing in church, country music in the car, and television variety shows. His access to musical study began through school.

> When I landed at grade six or seven at Lord Nelson School, there was a teacher who came in and she started a whole new band programme…and that's when I got interested in the trumpet and the guitar. … I could play bass guitar…and the trumpet section was just awful. … I just said to the band director, "You know, I could play trumpet"…and ever since then I was, you know, first trumpet in the band.

Growing up in Lacombe, Alberta in the 1970s and 1980s, Kate's parents both worked until a devastating recession ended her father's business. Until then, even when young, she'd been expected to work alongside her father.

> My mom was a lab technician at the hospital and my dad was a contractor. He owned a business that his granddad had owned. … He was a contractor until I was about early teens, I guess. And then, in the '80s, with the big recession, that company went bankrupt. And he ended up working for the town of Lacombe. … Dad had some properties, and I would mow lawns for him. I would do clean up at construction sites. … I often was in the shop selling paint.

When asked if her father paid her for this work, Kate found the question humorous: "No, no, I was not paid [laughter]. I was expected to. Just assumed you'd work." Like Rae, Kate benefitted from family who considered music important. Her mother loved music, played piano, and sang in church choirs influencing Kate to do the same. But it was not until she

reached junior high that she found an instrument she embraced for life. “I chose trumpet. I think I actually chose clarinet first and my mom told me that was a dumb idea. I don’t know why. I’m probably grateful to her though.”

Though her father did not really understand the love of music, and the family had little extra money, he supported Kate’s increasingly serious pursuit of music.

> Kate: He always did support me. … He put up a lot of money right, for me to take Lessons. … He never got it really. But he came to all the concerts. He bought me a new trumpet in high school. … I think maybe because he was able to connect the success in the work and what he heard too.

Though Rob did not mention financial barriers directly, his description of his parents’ employment indicated his family’s level of financial security. “My Dad was a taxi driver. And later in his career, he became a bus driver with Yorkton [Saskatchewan] city bus company and my mom was a clerk at a corner store.” Limited family income meant Rob needed to find ways to finance his musical goals. Initially focused solely on Rock music, Rob was able to generate some income through teaching and gigging.

> When I was a teenager, I had a job for two weeks at my uncle’s cylinder plant. … I wasn’t into that very much. Later though, I did some guitar lessons. … Sometimes it was tough, trying to get some money and stuff, but I always tried. …Doing the lessons, playing the gigs when…you could actually make some money doing it.

This sort of musical existence, however, limited Rob’s development as access to instructors providing formal training were non-existent in Yorkton. To advance, he had to expand his abilities into classical guitar. Like Rae and Kate, it was through his family’s support and sacrifice that this became possible.

> My Dad figured out that I could do some lessons at the University of Regina at their Conservatory. So, every other week he would drive me up to do classical guitar lessons. I was still interested in Rock, but…the type of music I enjoyed changed and I was trying to find other types of genres of music to get into.

For my Dutch-immigrant parents who had experienced the 1930’s recession, the Second World War, and immigration, a working-class existence was all that was available when they and their families came to Canada.

> My Mum and Dad first had to work with their families hoeing sugar beets… Once the harvests were done their families did any jobs that they could find. … Mum was a domestic servant, cook, and caregiver for children for a wealthy Jewish family in Calgary. … My father and his brothers worked in the winters falling trees in a logging camp…worked for the CPR.[7] … He was working in a brick factory when my mother’s family moved to northwest British Columbia to work in the lumber industry.

[7] Canadian Pacific Railway

Once married, my mother took on a traditional housewife role and did not work again outside the home. While my father began entry level jobs in the mill, he eventually trained as a lumber grader and became a carpenter providing higher hourly wages. Having loved music growing up in Holland, to pass the time living in a remote town on hundreds of miles of unpaved roads music became their pastime and entertainment which was well in place when I was adopted.

> My Dad…liked the accordion and had one back in Holland. … My grandfather on my Mum's side always played in community bands in the Netherlands. … My Mum and Dad belonged to Columbia Records[8] back when it was vinyl. … They sang in community choir when they didn't have kids. … My Mum would [listen] to…Metropolitan Opera productions the CBC[9]…had on the radio.

Musical opportunities were not easily accessed unless very affordable. When my older brothers began playing cornet[10] in the community junior brass band when I was age three, I became fascinated by the instrument. Sneaking into my brothers' room one day, I took one out and have not stopped playing since.

> I blew into it the way they did, and I got sound right away. And then my mother came running because I was three with a rather expensive instrument that was on loan from the community band programme. I kept bugging the conductor when he was going to start a new band programme. … When I was seven, they started a new junior band and that's when I started playing in band.

Through family support and enjoyment of music, these participants formed their musical habitus. However, it provided only a small amount of the cultural capital needed for further development. This was due to their families' locations and lack of advanced schooling, a barrier which became increasingly evident as they advanced musically.

Cultural Capital Deficits

Another barrier for career focused participants was a lack of cultural capital beyond that acquired through their initial musical habitus. This was divided by experiences some had as teenagers (Muireann, Kate, Rob, and I) whereas others (Rae and Pedro) encountered this in early adulthood. For all, talent and skill were not enough to gain access to higher level musical circles. Many had not even attended professional concerts let alone heard the music they were studying. Rae and Pedro in particular realised musical experiences and abilities previously developed had not earned them enough cultural capital once they began post-secondary musical study. Their initial learning needed augmentation through more study,

[8] The Columbia House Record Club
[9] Canadian Broadcasting Corporation
[10] Cornets and trumpets are played the same with cornets shorter, vertically longer, and having a larger interior bore size. They are very common in brass bands.

other genres, or acceptance of different approaches. For Pedro, much of this was due to a lack of formal musical training outside of school band and jamming with friends.

> We got together a group of us who played guitar, another friend who played bass…and another played the drums. We formed a little band. … But no, I didn't even take a lesson till I was out of high school. … I had no…formal private training until I…entered community college.

Attending Vancouver Community College, Pedro studied trumpet with an instructor and focused on jazz. It was not until this instructor sent him to a member of the Vancouver Symphony that he began to gain cultural capital through exposure to classical music and recordings of great orchestras and compositions supplied by his new instructor. This was necessary because his lack of musical exposure was demonstrated in how Pedro played it.

> Someone said, 'You should learn this thing called Pictures at an Exhibition[11].' And I went and learned it, and I took it to my lesson. And Tom[12] looked at me. He goes, 'You've never heard this before, have you?' I'm like, 'No.' He says, 'Come upstairs.' We went upstairs to his living room, and he put the record of this on and I was just like, wow! I don't know what this is, but I really, really dig it.

Entering university, Rae also found her formative years in community music and school bands were not enough to succeed at a higher level.

> I didn't have the classical background that I found a lot of students did. … I don't think I'd even been to a symphony concert ever in my life. … The first piece of music that my bassoon instructor gave me to study at my university was *To a Wild Rose* from the red Belwin[13] book, because that's how far back I had to go. And that was a big…blow to my ego. I had to…basically unlearn what I learned.

Both Pedro and Rae found lacking cultural capital followed them into formal and informal higher learning levels. Gaps in Rae's initial musical learning continued even in graduate school.

> Ear-training was terrifying to me. I have really good ears, but I had never practiced it. … And when I did my Master's as well…that was something I had to go back and redo because I didn't pass the ear training part of my entrance exam.

Pedro referred more to cultural capital gained through real-life experience. Having never completed a music degree due to lacking economic capital, Pedro shared two important insights he gained after entering the upper end of the Classical music field. Both are examples of cultural understandings musicians require to remain successful.

---

[11] "Pictures at an Exhibition" by Modest Mussorgsky. Pedro shared it was the definitive 1958 recording of the Chicago Symphony Orchestra (1990) under the direction of Fritz Reiner.

[12] The late Thomas G. Parriott was Associate Principal Trumpet of the Vancouver Symphony and an instructor at the University of British Columbia and Western Washington University.

[13] The Belwin Mills Publishing Corporation now owned by Alfred Music was a large producer of musical methods and compositions for bands during the mid-to-late 20th Century.

> I think I was naïve in thinking if I did all the right things, it would be acknowledged and rewarded. And in that kind of environment in [current city], that's not how it works. … And if you don't advocate for yourself, no one's gonna do it for you. … I felt I hadn't shared a lot of the same experiences as my colleagues. You know, the first time you're playing something shouldn't be on stage of Carnegie Hall with the world's finest orchestra. You should have had that stuff figured out before you set foot on that stage.

While Pedro and Rae struggled as adults to acquire cultural capital, Muireann, Rob, Kate, and I began accumulating it during our teen years. However, this did result in an easier musical development as adults. For Muireann, gaining cultural capital in her formative years was especially difficult because of her school-based experiences. She found herself limited not only by her family's indifference to education, but also indifference demonstrated by her schools.

> [Mum] never sat down and looked at my homework. She never went to, to the school interviews. Like the school would allow me to leave for six or seven weeks at a time to go help my dad on the farm for Christmas trees. But they would never say a word because he would then give them like a 50-foot Christmas tree. … So as far as they were concerned, it was a backhander. She can fuck off. Done job, and one less to worry about in the classroom, right?

Muireann was only able to increase cultural capital through singing wherever she could. Singing helped her tolerate school and find a niche for herself culturally.

> I was going through a rough time at school. … But the one thing that I'd always done was sing, so I was always in the choirs. … I even joined a black choir. It was like me and one other girl…for the Apostolic Church. … My grandfather…ran a music hall in the low end of town. … [Music] was never out of my reach to do. … I taught myself how to read very basic music.

Muireann's singing flourished, eventually rising to a level that resulted in increased opportunities. Her father was her manager and was convinced she'd make the kind of money that could free her family from a tenuous financial existence.

> My dad wanted me to leave school completely and concentrate on my sing. … He bought me a PA system…[with] my brother's money. … And he's like…'you can sing. You're cleaning up. Go out and work for yourself.' So, at the age of 16…70 miles outside of London I started running my own [music] business. And soon enough, I was booked Friday, Saturday, Sundays. … And I was selling myself to go sing with backing tracks.

Using karaoke to sing and getting to know the publicans not only made her money but also eventually got Muireann noticed.

> By the end of it, I had a record company offer me a deal. By the time I was 18. A company called Rex Records that Daniel O'Donnell was assigned to, who's a big Irish country singer. And I had a band. And I had a father who suddenly realised that he didn't need to concentrate on the smuggling…the horses, and…all those other things.

Despite early success, as will be seen in the next section regarding social capital, Muireann's musical talents and understanding of the field did not prove enough to provide staying power in the music industry.

Like Muireann's industrious approach, a teenaged Rob recognised he needed to gain cultural capital and expand his abilities to pursue a musical career. As his family was not musical, and he did not belong to the school band programme due to his instrument and chosen musical genre, much of what he gained had to be done via his own efforts.

> Being in a small town, there wasn't…anybody that had that type of formal music training. … There was a music store in town…and the owner…told me. 'To actually do this, you need to know how to read music on the guitar. Rock musicians, they play by ear.'

To overcome this, Rob found a local piano teacher who taught him music theory and history and began travelling back and forth to Regina for classical guitar lessons.

> At that time, I was doing classical guitar…all the Royal Conservatory theory. … I did all that when I was in high school. … I needed to do that because…I wanted to make music my career and…to be as well-rounded as possible.

However, Rob still found the work he had done expanding himself beyond playing Rock had not gained him the cultural capital he required. This was evident when he began his undergraduate degree at Minot State University in North Dakota (U.S.A.).

> You have your jazz band, your concert band, your Concert Choir. … And then orchestra, 'cause orchestra was really big in the States. …It was all classical people. … My pop music background and being a classical guitarist…some highbrow musicians don't really view classical guitar as high a level as a violin. … You know, a lot of composers don't write for classical guitar. … I was kind of many times the odd man out…because I played classical guitar and not a trumpet or a violin or a flute or whatever.

To be fully accepted in both university and future teaching settings, Rob embraced a belief that the only acceptable forms of music education were traditional, Western-centric models. This began in university, solidifying in the first ten years he taught band.

> I went and got my bachelor's degree in music, and I view that as kind of my undergraduate brainwashing. … When I came out…I was teaching band. I didn't take band in high school or middle school. … I was brainwashed to thinking that [popular] music should not be in a school environment. Even though I love that type of music.

Rob's experience demonstrates more than anyone else's how LIWC musicians growing up far from the centre of their field need to learn and abide by the rules of the game (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). Though there is flexibility within the rules, and players push the boundaries, Rob discovered to play the game at all there needs to be an adherence to the rules

of the field. Further to his case, there is a needed acquisition of the accepted cultural capital. Before he eventually became a pop music educator, he had to come to terms with the rules laid out by the field. Only when he finally embraced teaching the musical genre of his youth did he fully recognised the influences of the field.

> One day, my principal at the school came…and asked me if I'd be interested in doing a guitar class. And at that time, I thought it was a horrible idea. … I thought, you can't have a guitar programme at a school. It has to be only band. … But then, by being put in a new role to teach pop music, I realised after the first two years, wow! This is a great vehicle to get students interested in music that would not normally take a band or choir class.

Rob's experience highlights how Classical music acts as an indicator of capital assets (Bull, 2019a; Green, 2011; Hofvander Trulsson, 2015) with popular music looked down upon. To succeed, he had to set aside his original musical habitus and embrace styles (band and choral) foreign to him. In doing so, his initial musical habitus was devalued, common due to the high and low cultural approach within music and education (Green, 2011).

Whereas Muireann and Rob's experiences originated in popular music genres, Kate and I embraced Classical music and jazz in secondary school. Growing up in Lacombe, Alberta just outside the city of Red Deer, between the cities of Calgary and Edmonton, Kate was able to increase her musical cultural capital. Beginning in Lacombe, she had trumpet instruction from the community band conductor who eventually sent her to study with an instructor at Red Deer College. The college also allowed her to participate in large ensembles that were higher quality than her high school band. Eventually, she began travelling to Edmonton for more advanced instruction.

> I went to Edmonton and studied with Alvin Lowry who was the principal of the ESO[14] at the time. … It was an eye opener, right? A very different level. But it was great. … I drove to Edmonton every week for lessons. And I drove to Red Deer to play in the college band.

Such opportunities provided exposure to higher performance levels and Kate's ability to keep up musically, though still in high school, allowed her to acquire more cultural capital. To augment her experiences, she sought other opportunities. "I…played at the Kiwanis Music Festival and provincial festivals, and the band camp in Camrose. …That's where I learned a lot."

Kate's embrace of Classical music and living in the heart of the province within driving distance to large urban areas with musical opportunities factored heavily into her ability to acquire cultural capital. Being in a town with a strong community band and a small

[14] Edmonton Symphony Orchestra

Mennonite college with a music programme made the music she was studying more acceptable. Kate shared how depending upon multiple factors, smaller communities can make it easier to stay driven and develop.

> You have to grow, right? Growing up in a small town, arts and culture were valued for sure. But the access to arts and culture was limited. … Unless you went to Edmonton or Calgary, you really didn't have a lot of access. And unless your parents understood the value of arts and culture, then why would you understand? You wouldn't.

For Kate, much of this came together because of where she was situated and family and community support. She was therefore able to increase her cultural capital before university. This does not make the transition easy, however. On the contrary, she still needed to make the most of her opportunities and, like Rob, spent time travelling many miles. These efforts resulted in greater cultural capital at an earlier age.

Despite my parents' love of music and the musical exposure I had received through records and concerts from touring ensembles, I had large cultural deficits to overcome musically and in life experience. Like Kate, because my school band programme was weak, I had to find other musical experiences.

> When I was in grade seven, I played in my first music festival as a soloist and won the class. … In 1985 when I was 14, I…[went] to a summer music school in Penticton, BC. … In grade nine…I won [the festival] again and also had the highest mark…and was recommended to play in the Provincial Festival of the Arts. … [In] grade ten, I auditioned for [the all-provincial high school concert band] and as a 15-year-old surprisingly got in and was assistant principal trumpet.

By that point, my parents could hear something special in my trumpet playing. As they did not have the contacts or understanding of how I could advance, they suggested I contact the instructor I had at the summer music school. However, I was surprised to find he did not think he could teach me much more.

> Chris said, 'I don't think I can teach you any more than I have. You need to go see Tom.' And he put me in touch with Tom Parriott. … and I spent the next [seven] years studying with Tom.

Growing up in an area with a population of roughly six thousand people, cultural capital deficits quickly became evident regarding my musical development. To address this, I studied with Tom in Vancouver (two hours by plane) bi-monthly and for two weeks each summer. I could afford this only because of my part-time job at the lumber mill my father worked at. After the first set of lessons, I was taken in by Tom and his partner Maureen who aided me in learning how city and musical life functioned.

> [I was] a semi-adopted kid. … I became like one of their strays. … When I first started studying in Vancouver, I didn't know the bussing system, I didn't know how

> the world worked. And so, in that way Tom and Maureen really helped me. … Tom made it so that I could come in through the stage door of the Orpheum Theatre…and watch the symphony rehearse. … He used to sneak me into concerts for free and put me in an empty seat.

Musical instruction and experiences combined with access to city life helped me increase my cultural capital. As this began when I was sixteen, parental support was imperative to my ability to gain cultural capital.

> It was a huge step for my parents to allow me to go do that by myself when I was in grades eleven and twelve; to send your kid off to the biggest city in western Canada to study an instrument.

Throughout those years, I acquired more cultural capital through provincial honour bands, regional and provincial music festivals, and, upon completion of high school, a four-week tour of western Europe as principal trumpet with the Canadian National Youth on Tour band. After several years travelling far from home and increasing my cultural capital, I felt ready to leave for good. However as will be demonstrated later, like Muireann I encountered social capital deficits that would stall my development.

Cultural Capital and Non-career Focused Participants

Like habitus, a clear distinction existed regarding cultural capital between the participant groups depending upon musical intentions and career goals. For Craig and Oleg, participating in music alongside their careers resulted in cultural capital not being a barrier. A primary reason for this was musical styles they pursued were synonymous with their LIWC habitus.

Participating in brass and concert bands was natural for Oleg. At the time in Canada, these ensembles were common due to a long history of military bands beginning before Confederation and continuing after the world wars (Maloney, 1988, Griffioen, 2018). Also, Europe and the United Kingdom had a long tradition of community-based bands. Oleg arrived in Canada twenty years after the period (1910-1925) when the United States and Canada had witnessed a vast increase in the number of wind bands and supporting organisations such as the Central Alberta Band Association, American Bandmasters Association, and the College Band Directors National Association (Smith, 2010; Tse, 2018). By pursuing a musical style LIWC people already participated in, Oleg did not encounter the cultural capital challenges those trying to establish themselves would have.

Considering Bourdieu's (1984) breakdown of musical tastes by class and education, perhaps this should not have been surprising. However, this may be because I was one of the participants struggling with the field to gain professional status. Though Bourdieu (1984) applied Baroque harpsichord and Classical symphonic music to his research, band music, particularly in Oleg's context, fits within Bourdieu's (1984) description of "popular taste" (p.

16). Of three musical levels Bourdieu (1984) described, popular taste falls below "legitimate taste" and "middle-brow taste" (p. 16). Wind and brass bands appealed to the masses. Beginning in late 19th Century America, they became a mainstay of parades and park concerts. Today, wind and brass instruments continue to remain considerably more affordable than orchestral string instruments which also influenced how bands became a taste of the working-class in the past. As professional music was not Oleg's career goal, he stayed close to his original musical habitus and cultural capital deficits were therefore not a large factor.

Oleg shared how playing in community band in Brooks aided him when moving to Calgary and Ottawa as culturally, he found bands to participate in and by doing so, remained in the musical taste of his habitus.

> I kept playing through high school. … When I went to SAIT[15], I played with a militia band, the Canadian Army Service Corps band. … I played with them, I think, for two or three years. … When I went to Ottawa, I played in several bands: The Navy Band… and even had a stint with the Governor General's, for the Guard's band that marches in Ottawa there. But it was just a couple of rehearsals, and I figured it was too steep for me professionally.

Oleg believes he is not a professional or semi-professional musician like others he knows. Yet to Oleg this is not a deficit. He is satisfied with his accomplishments and experiences and continues to enjoy music. "I'm not a professional…like you, and [his daughter's teacher]. ... These guys are more educated than I am. Both [my children]. They're far ahead. They got music degrees. I don't have that. But I like what I do."

Growing up with records or the radio, Craig became involved with music during his late teens and adulthood, staying with music he knew and enjoyed rather than pursuing different genres. The music Craig was exposed to in childhood also aligns with Bourdieu's (1984) concept of "popular taste" (p. 16). Craig provided examples including, "Tchaikovsky's 1812 Overture, lots of Paul Robeson, Harry Belafonte, Yvan Rebroff…Ed McCurdy folk songs." This led to a love of folk and bluegrass music, genres commonly enjoyed by the LIWC people. This prompted him to purchase an instrument and learn to play.

> I liked folk music. I listened to, you know, Peter, Paul, and Mary…[the] Mitchell trio, all the hootenanny stuff from the '60s. … And so…the idea of an acoustic guitar was kind of cool. So, I just bought a cheap guitar, and then I bought another guitar and went from there.

Raised with popular music at home also resulted in Craig not taking to the wind band in his school's music programme.

> I had a good friend…he was sort of my alter ego [who] was in the band playing; he

[15] Southern Alberta Institute of Technology

> played clarinet. … And so, I thought, well, I should be in the band too. But that didn't work out very well.

Though band music did not fit with what Craig enjoyed, he eventually found his way playing informally with groups of other players.

> In Edmonton, there were just a bunch of guys that have guitars, and we'd meet once in a while, get together and play some songs. Play some Gordon Lightfoot, some '60s rock…simple rock and roll stuff and pretend we were singing and drink a few beers.

Craig's musical experiences demonstrate a laid-back approach highlighting musical genres he enjoyed. He never claimed he lacked cultural capital because he stayed with music he wanted to play. However, when invited to play in paid bands in front of audiences, he encountered a new sensation experienced musicians were used to.

> It was different because you're playing for people who aren't in the band, right? You're in the group. People are watching…people without instruments who are watching and expecting to hear something; to be entertained… It's a big step to get from a circle where everybody's playing to up on a stage with microphones in front of you.

Until this point, Craig had not shared anything that could be interpreted as a cultural capital deficit. Craig had always experienced music socially with no pressure to entertain. Upon entering a more professional situation, a lack of cultural capital caught up to him. When asked how he overcame what he had termed a terrifying experience, Craig shared a solution common to most musicians: "Playing umpteen gigs."

Craig's description of feeling terror in serious performing situations demonstrates an aspect of cultural capital that is unifying regardless of musical genre, taste, experience level, or musicianship: no matter one's ability, all musicians experience similar feelings. It also highlights how distance from the centre of the musical field impacts all musicians regarding cultural capital to varying degrees. Ultimately, when confronted with foreign experiences, everyone must overcome deficits in one's musical cultural capital and habitus to succeed.

Social Capital - Required Currency

Finding a clear divide regarding experiences with habitus and cultural capital amongst the participants, I expected similar findings regarding social capital. Instead, though similarities existed, no clean divide existed due to career aspirations. Whereas some participants needed to build social networks from nothing to acquire cultural capital, for Oleg and Craig music was a place to simply meet others, socialise, and make music. Yet, their experiences diverged because music remained social and became part of teaching for Oleg whereas for Craig it later became a more serious side gig.

While building social networks for advancement was not initially a conscious goal for Oleg and Craig, they gained social profit due to group membership (Bourdieu, 1986). For Oleg this proved to be mainly through lifelong connections and friends. Craig earned social profit in a semi-professional sense with bands he was hired by.

Oleg respectfully spoke of people he encountered musically in Brooks, Calgary, and Ottawa who helped him join various community bands, deepen his musical knowledge, and perform with accomplished musicians. Oleg never spoke of musical settings and musicians as a source for increasing capital. He also has never viewed himself as a professional musician. However, as per Bourdieu (1986), he gained social capital even if not purposefully to further a musical career. Increased social capital enriched Oleg's life and earned him friends he could call upon when his own community band needed assistance.

> Most of my friends are involved with a community band, you know. It is, has, become a social life including guys like you and Don Robb, you know, who used to help us out in the Lethbridge parades. I'm grateful for that.

Craig's non-professional musical social networks eventually led to hired performances at local dances and festivals. However, this occurred much later as an adult, and though he tried instruments in school he never stuck with them. He attributed this to his father's work and being young in school.

> We moved around a lot. I had been to, I think, I count eight schools in twelve years. … I was kind of unsure of myself. … I had a good friend…who is a very good musician. … I admired that and so I wanted to play something. I'm not really sure. I was pretty immature. I was young. I started university when I was sixteen. And I just probably wasn't ready for the self-discipline.

Often moving schools provided Craig insights into perhaps why he did not stick with music. Musical success is the result of many years of study in formal settings where one increases musical ability, social skills, and connections (Bull, 2019a). Musicians make lifelong connections with others through participation in ensembles over long periods, creating a sense of belonging and membership in social groups (Bull, 2019a). Frequent moving did not provide Craig with opportunities for such long-term social connections. Though challenging, Craig described benefits of this type of upbringing.

> I felt a lot out of place in my junior high, high school years because I never…stayed in a place for very long. And so, you know…I didn't expect to have ongoing relationships with people. … There's a gift in that because I became fairly independent and self-reliant.

Beginning a career in criminal justice, Craig began making friends and playing music with small groups of people, building social capital. Years later, having moved to Lethbridge,

Alberta and gaining access to non-professional musical groups, he furthered acquired social networks and unexpectedly received a position in a band.

> One day I got a call from one of the guys in the [Lethbridge Bluegrass Club] and said I'm part of this band called Cabin Fever and the guitar player just cut off two fingers on a table saw and so isn't able to play guitar anymore. Would you like to come and play guitar?

Craig auditioned and Cabin Fever became the first group he participated in that regularly practiced and performed for audiences. He later played Celtic music with the Glen Coulee Band, performing around southern Alberta.

Oleg's and Craig's experiences share initial similarities of not being focused on performance careers. However, they diverged regarding the effects of social capital. While Oleg's musical participation granted him lifelong friends and contacts in multiple situations, Craig experienced paid musical opportunities. Yet neither considered gaining social capital an end goal. It happened over time because of participation with no pressure. Nonprofessional intentions and goals explain the difference between their experiences versus how other participants viewed themselves and their social distance from the centre of the field. However, before I address these, I will address Kate's unique experience with social capital.

Outlier 1: Kate

Initially part of the professionally focused group regarding habitus and cultural capital, Kate shared she did not feel she needed to acquire much social capital during her post-secondary musical development. With her mother involved musically in church and encouraging music festival participation, cultural capital naturally increased. Kate's mother also actively prepared her socially beyond performance.

> You might consider my mother to be a small-town snob at some point, right? My Dad's family was in Lacombe for a lot of years. … My Granddad was the mayor. And I think everybody knew my Dad's family. So, they were kind of an important family in Lacombe. … My mum did a really good job of teaching me how to dress, right? Teaching me manners, making sure I knew how to be comfortable in social settings. … I think, you know, those kinds of things were instilled in me. … And to give back to your community. My mum had me playing all over the place because that was my responsibility to give back to my community.

Despite her family not being wealthy, her mother recognised the importance of not only providing Kate with cultural and musical experiences but also social awareness. Kate indicated how vital this is to gaining social capital. Learning how to act, or not, follows us throughout life, directly impacting one's future.

> You have to be able to work with people There's just…no way around it. And I know because I hire people all the time now. And even when I worked as a personnel manager for the symphony, I'd hire somebody I liked over the best player any day.

> Somebody that could step in and sit and be kind and gracious. … You've got to make those connections with people.

Kate's parents investing limited economic capital in cultural opportunities, combined with instruction in social skills, provided her an understanding of the importance of all three forms of capital. Her acquisition of cultural and social capital aided her in moving from the outer edges of the musical field towards the middle. Yet, despite these investments, as will be covered in the next section, Kate still had more social capital to acquire during post-secondary study, experiencing increased barriers there than when growing up.

Challenges in Acquisition

Though Bourdieu (1986) claimed the three forms of capital are interconnected and do not exist independently from one another, the experiences of Rae, Pedro, Muireann, and me were not as balanced as those shared by Kate. Whilst Kate acquired cultural and social capital simultaneously, obtaining such capitals proves difficult if one has an immense deficit thereof from the outset. The remaining professionally focused participants needed to overcome a lack of cultural capital through the building of social networks. They recalled socialisation levels as setbacks and challenges and, like Rae's following quote, still sound critical of themselves.

> I think the biggest barriers I encountered were at university, just feeling like I, I was a country bumpkin, basically. Regina is not a really big city, but it was big for me. Just things like even knowing how to get around or…buying reeds, making reeds, or getting the material. … I just wasn't able to, what I felt, keep up with some of the other people.

Rae also shared her perspective on the musical field and how she felt about it in relation to where she was from and the cultural and social deficiencies she was working to overcome.

> Musicians are innately, not, well, some are but not necessarily, particularly symphony musicians are not innately kind. It's cutthroat. And I really had to pick up my game playing there. I had to. It was terrifying a lot of the time, but…I managed to [get] through it and enjoyed it sometimes; sometimes not so much. I think I'm still scarred a little bit by that experience.

Despite these struggles Rae succeeded musically, particularly in conducting. As a result, she found the social capital she gained through music and study always allowed her to find a place of belonging regardless of where she went.

> When I travelled overseas…music was always something that opened doors… Even if I wasn't teaching music, which I didn't when I first went overseas…getting involved with anyone that was interested in doing anything, anywhere [musically]…that was a big social part of it. … There was sort of a security there that I could have inroads.

Similarly, Pedro found lessons he learned socially in musical experiences eventually led to new skills he could apply in other situations. Initially, however, Pedro found his East End Vancouver habitus and the edge it created in him would arise when challenged.

> I tended to confront things head on, usually with anger, usually with a little talkback, because that's my initial default because of the way I grew up. … Initially getting through that, it was [difficult]… we all default to that, the way we used to be where we're a little hardwired I think based on your experiences.

This aspect of his personality was not always beneficial once he began taking music seriously. However, different instructional approaches helped Pedro confront these social challenges, helping him gain social capital.

> I didn't want the hard truths of like, okay, you sound good but what about this? When I went away to St. Louis Conservatory for a year, [the instructor] looked at me one day…and said, 'Do you want to sound like this?' You know, just bam, right between the eyes. And of course, me being me said, 'Oh yeah, that's why I left Canada to come and study with you. … What do you think?' She goes, 'Alright, just seeing where you're at.' … All the most I would get [from Tom] would be, 'Well, I think you need to live with that a little longer.' … Now I take a moment…or even longer to think about it and give it some thought…[and] come up with a little more mature solution.

Encountering instructors willing to work with him and the hardwiring from his initial habitus, Pedro gained social capital in the way he interacted with people, learning valuable social lessons he applied to his professional practice.

> I've been a long-time committee member for our orchestra committee. … I've sat at the table and negotiated contracts…tens and hundreds of millions of dollars over the years. … I think my tendency is to sit back and take things in and not talk too much. … [But] I'm not good at faking it either. … Like, to some degree, if it's really getting to me, you know, I've learned to shut up. … In the past…I would just let loose.

Pedro's descriptions of early responses to confrontations aligns directly to the fight or flight response first researched by Cannon (1915) who associated "the emotion of anger or rage with the instinct for fighting or attack" (p. 187). To become successful in the field, Pedro needed to gain social capital to alleviate this and develop the more advantageous responses he described later.

Though the instinct of flight is considered opposite of a fight response as it results from fear, either response can arise when we feel cornered (Canon, 1915). Whereas Pedro's instinct was to fight, Muireann shared that her instinct was to flee when confronted with pressured social situations. Yet her family ties meant she still made certain her father, who had invested in her singing career, would not be left nothing.

> I was 110% his focal point, and the pressure was just incredible. … And at the same time a very long game that my father played won and he got £110,000. … I wanted to get out because I didn't want him to invest all this in me. … So, I did what I do really well: I fooked off. I ended up in France.

Flight was Muireann's natural response due to experiences growing up. However, Muireann shared how her upbringing socially and culturally also prepared her for future employment as

a teacher in a UK prison and later in counselling. Like Pedro, she felt her edges advantageously smoothed out over time.

> I worked in prisons because I spoke the same languages the travelling boys who were making up a huge amount of that populations…and because I'm working-class. … And I would have been…at that point twenty-seven to thirty. … And I was able to work with the prison officers, I was able to work with the teachers, and I was able to work with the boys. … I had some really sharp edges…that desperately needed sanding off. But I think by the time I hit thirty most of those had gone. … And like, you can read the room, you can respond, you can build a relationship with basically anybody.

Though Muireann had come a long way, to ultimately escape the disfunction of her upbringing, family, and culture (she married a British air force helicopter pilot and had two children) they needed to leave. Though this cannot be termed a flight response due to the joint decision she and her husband made, it represents the necessity of physically escaping conflict as for Muireann, social development meant avoiding being drawn back to the effects of her parents' addiction to alcohol.

> If you look at…the bio-physical-social elements of addiction, you have the psychological effects…but then you also have the social elements. And it was like an intuition. For me to progress as a human and not see my children have shit normalised, that should never be normalised, that I would need to remove myself. … I have this, you know, these three and five-year old children and I'm trying to protect them from that influence. So, for me, it was about immigration and about not so much a rebirth but like a do-over if that makes sense.

Like Muireann, albeit to a lesser degree, I grew up in a family that had its share of family violence. I shared how my oldest brother[16] struggles with what is highly suspected to be Foetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorder (FASD) and his life experiences have followed a pattern described in FASD research literature. However, little was known about FASD until he was an adult, and my mother and our Christian school did not know how to cope with his behaviours. This often resulted in extreme physical punishment. Simultaneously, growing up far from extended family, with parents that did not conform to Reformed Church standards, socialisation occurred through opposition to expected norms as I felt like an outsider looking in.

> Mum and Dad…they couldn't have kids. And then they adopted children [and] got criticised because they had adopted white kids and not First Nations children during the Sixties Scoop[17]. … And then they were told adopted kids rarely turned out. My

[16] All three of us were adopted from different backgrounds and locations.
[17] After the Canadian government began phasing out residential schools in the 1950s and 1960s, child welfare agencies began removing Indigenous children from their homes, sometimes immediately after birth, placing them in the child welfare system as foster children or in some cases adopted. This period from the 1960s until the 1980s is today referred to as the *Sixties Scoop* (First Nations and Indigenous Studies, 2009).

> two oldest brothers, they had to bring in a Christian Reformed minister from a different town because [theirs] did not feel he could in good faith baptise adopted children.

When such criticism and experiences occur, it becomes difficult to find where one socially belongs. With the situation of my oldest brother, combined with the next oldest hating school and causing enormous amounts of trouble, it was difficult to follow.

> I was an honour student in high school, but I hated school. … that Christian School was in many ways a barrier. I used to get bugged a lot for my goal of becoming a professional musician. And when my parents switched me…to the public high school, the principal actually said to my dad, and this is a quote, 'We don't believe he can be a Christian and a musician at the same time.' School counsellors and teachers used to keep telling me to go into something else.

As mentioned, Bourdieu's (1986) description of the interconnectedness of economic, cultural, and social capital meant that while I was trying to acquire more cultural capital in music, I was also fighting social battles. Though, I had my parents' support, there existed a great deal of opposition from the church and school community.

> When I was fourteen, I went for the first time away to study music and hockey in Penticton, BC. And a lady whose husband owned the feed store at home…phoned my mom and said that it wasn't fair I should do that when there were other kids in the school and church who would like too, like her own son, but couldn't because it was so expensive. Now my mum always said that was bullshit because they could have afforded it 10, 15 times over. They just didn't want you to succeed. They just didn't want you to have an opportunity that they were unwilling to pay for their own kids to have. Theirs couldn't have it; you shouldn't either.

Not able to acquire the social capital necessary to succeed in the musical field, I needed to leave, a theme commonly found within every participant's experience (see next section). Through switching high schools, the help of others, and my own natural attributes I was able to acquire social capital that allowed me to concurrently access more cultural capital.

> I met a whole different group of friends [and teachers] there who were very supportive of what I was doing… in the honour bands or the provincial music festivals. … Tom introduced me to other trumpet players in [Vancouver], people that down the road it would be good to know. … Dr. Mary Térey-Smith…took me with her and really opened up the world on two different playing tours of Central and Eastern Europe in the 1990s. … She also really helped me challenge some of my early, ingrained beliefs that came out of Dutch Calvinism. … I think having a sense of adventure helped that too, because I was not afraid once I got over certain feelings of homesickness to strike out and go as far as I could. … To be willing to socially put yourself out there and meet the right people; sometimes be willing to just call up some great trumpet player in a distant city that you've never been to and introduce yourself and say, 'I'd like to come and take some lessons with you.' And in that you…expand your social network.

However, I also endured occasions where, being from a small town with a growing sense of myself, I needed to experience being put in my place to grow.

> I was taken down a peg once or twice, especially when I was in my early 20s, late teens, because you're a big fish in a small pond, and suddenly you're with a lot of other players and they are really good. I didn't have the social graces down you know. Tom and Maureen taught me a lot but coming out of northern British Columbia, talking like a mill worker, being limited in cultural opportunities outside of the ones I made for myself musically…when you get into a different area at some point you get put in your place. And I needed that.

The experiences of the participants thus far have demonstrated how cultural and social effects of their LIWC habitus often have greater impacts than challenges resulting from lack of economic capital. As will be seen in the next chapter regarding work ethic, everyone was able to survive financially however here we have witnessed the immense task that is acquiring cultural and social capital, highlighting how economism is not the only source of success in social formation (Bourdieu, 1977b). Rather, the value of social acquisitions, material or symbolic, found in "smiles, handshakes or shrugs, compliments or attention, challenges or insults, honour or honours, powers or pleasures, gossip or scientific information, distinction or distinctions" (Bourdieu, 1977b, p. 178) prove valuable when we interact with others. And yet, some musicians struggle despite these types of acquisitions, often by no fault of their own but due to the field's judgment of taste.

Outlier No. 2: Rob

Rob felt he did not socially belong in the music world either in high school or in university. I found Rob to be an outlier as he did the right things to gain cultural and social capital but experienced setbacks due to the musical genres he studied and performed. This began in school, continued in university, and was experienced even at home.

> I really didn't hang around with band kids. I didn't fit in with the jocks, or the sports people. I had my own groups where we were interested in the Rock… We didn't have a teacher to tell us how to put a Rock ensemble together… We did ask the band teacher in the 1980s to help us out… he didn't really respect our type of music. It was his music or the highway… I think that's probably one of the reasons I never signed up for band. But I wasn't interested in that side of music. It was really one-sided. You either do band, band, or band… When I went the classical route, I don't think my parents liked that type of music or my relatives… I went to Minot to study music, it was all classical people…piano players, a lot of violinists, and wind instruments… I didn't fit in because, well, how does a classical guitarist play in an ensemble?

Rob's experiences speak to how people interested in popular music in the 1980s and 1990s were looked down upon in the field of music and music education. At best, popular music was a musical subfield as for much of the previous two centuries the field had been narrowly defined by Western Classical music and rooted in class structures (Bull, 2019a; Powell,

Smith, & D'Amore, 2017). Non-classical genres were considered socially or developmentally lower, even primitive (Walker, 2000). So were the musicians as evidenced by the reaction of the band teacher at Rob's school.

Rob shared this feeling of never belonging, musically and socially, continued when he returned home and taught in the newly formed Catholic school band programme, much to the chagrin of the teacher at his old high school. Yorkton's school bands had previously been an integrated public and Catholic programme.

> I was now going against my, my nemesis: the public band teacher I knew in high school and me coming in with a rock and roll background. … That was quite a thing, I'll just tell you that. That was a stressful year for me.

To gain social capital, Rob embraced the traditional music education approach he describes as a form of brainwashing that caused him to doubt the value of introducing popular music into schools years later. Though he now teaches popular music as a viable form of music education, it has not always helped him gain social capital in the music education field, particularly because he is not afraid to speak out against exclusively using old pedagogy.

> I would say, especially in the 21st Century…music has changed so much that [musicians] need to be as well-rounded as possible to make any type of living, whether it's in teaching or performing. … You need to play some jazz, play some classical, know about digital audio…video editing. … I feel the music educators are still in that 20th Century ideal of knowing how to do one thing.

Though this has not always helped Rob gain social capital, he has found his musical niche, nonetheless, having established a very successful modern, pop music education program at his current middle school.

Why Discrepancies in Social Capital?

Thus far, this chapter has demonstrated how musical career aspirations created a divide between the participants regarding habitus and cultural capital, yet not so regarding social capital. Though I initially assumed social capital acquisition would not vary to such a degree, I was incorrect. This puzzled me because Bourdieu (1986) indicated that social experiences depend upon interactions with others in our habitus and field, and as these interactions occur within the same, or similar, community one would expect little difference between agents (Bourdieu, 1986). I needed to understand why this difference existed within social capital.

With Oleg and Craig, whose participation in music was mainly for enjoyment and socialising, this did not seem a difficult answer. Yet, when Craig began playing in serious bands, music became more than just social. Even with Rae, Pedro, Muireann, and myself, experiences were not uniform. The answer lies in several key actions. One explanation lies in forms of transmission via initial acts of institution such as the family (Bourdieu, 1986;

Paolucci, 2014), particularly regarding Kate. In her town, her mother was involved musically, and her father's family had a recognisable name due to her grandfather's one-time position as mayor. This stood out and made Kate one of two outliers because her story did not align closely to those of the others. Though she grew up in a working-class home, Kate had access to social capital through family (particularly her mother) that provided her a basis by which to acquire more.

For Rae, Pedro, Muireann, and myself, however, connections and networks were not a source of capital as our LIWC families did not have recognisable names and levels of community involvement. There was no parent who recognised we needed socialisation, nor any connected to the musical field. While habitus and family involvement in traditional LIWC jobs provides understanding into that segment of society (Lehmann & Taylor, 2015), it does not help acquire social capital in other fields such as music or education. We needed to work alone, making "an endless effort at institution…which is necessary in order to produce and reproduce lasting, useful relationships" (Bourdieu, 1986, para. 22). Each had to actively reach out and make necessary connections to acquire social capital through networking and establish a continuous exchange of goods within social networks recognised as valuable by others (Bourdieu, 1986, para. 22). This action contains a higher degree of difficulty because we needed to simultaneously build social networks while acquiring cultural capital.

Though initially I grouped Rob with the aforementioned participants, he proved to be another outlier. He did all the right things to build social networks and gain social capital yet continually encountered obstacles due to musical genre. Rob's struggle to gain social capital in the musical field, first through interactions with the high school band teacher and later at university, returns us to Bourdieu's (1986) explanation of how the forms of capital are interrelated. Rob faced the reality that Western Classical music dominated the musical field, and this is rigidly protected by its practitioners (Söderman et al., 2015). It is a form of cultural capital protected by the social capital of powerful agents in the field. Classical music's position within education is an example of institutionalised cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1986) which, at heart a Rock musician, Rob was going to confront. He either needed to acquiesce and accept this established hierarchy within music and music education (Bourdieu, 1977b; Bourdieu, 1984) or continue to hold limited amounts of social capital. He eventually chose to embrace a principal's suggestion and begin a guitar class that later translated into his current successful pop music programme. Rob chose to limit his social capital in his immediate music education surroundings where other successful programmes were built on traditional models. He remains untroubled by this as he sees a musical field in flux, believing it more

important to meet the needs of 21st Century learners than crumble to the cultural and social capital pressures of the field.

> Some people don't necessarily believe [pop music] is a good thing. They want the students to be learning Beethoven right off the bat. But the kids, they may not be interested so you're gonna lose them…teach them a lower level, or lower-level art form that may be easier for them to understand… You know, they may start with pop music, but it could blossom into doing whatever they want.

Rob's position regarding the type of cultural capital music education should be providing helped me recognise an important aspect of why social capital differed across the participants. It is highly dependent upon what people's goals are within the field, and how important one's position in the field is to each person. People also take their own personality into the social networks they work to create or are given. As no two persons are alike, our social experiences will vary regardless of the field's expectations.

Geographical Distance from the Centre of a Field

While examining impacts of habitus and capital deficits amongst the participants, it is necessary to briefly address the concept of distance in relation to field. I found distance from the centre of the field predominantly referred to sociologically rather than geographically (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990) apart from Bourdieu's (1977a) reference to rural agricultural professions and small tradespeople as lower positions within society, distant from centres of culture and learning. Despite a lack of reference to geographical distance, for many of the participants, regardless of career focus, this proved a formidable barrier to increasing capital and musical advancement.

Of the eight participants, six spoke of travel as necessary to obtain the training (and capital) needed to succeed. When they began to travel depended largely upon the age when their goals took root. However, I also identified distinct generational differences which could be caused by reasons such as family income, opportunity, and issues of transportation. Table 8 outlines the participants by generation, when they began traveling for study (if at all), and distance/destination.

Table 8 Participant Travel for Opportunity by Generation, Age, and Distance

Participant	Generation	Age of travel	Distance/Destination to access opportunities
Oleg	The Silent Generation (1925-1945)	Post-secondary	Brooks, AB to Southern Alberta Institute of Technology in Calgary, AB: 188km. Brooks to University of Ottawa: 3,295 km.
Craig	The Baby Boomers (1946-1964)	Post-secondary	Lived in Calgary and accessed University of Calgary.
Rae	The Baby Boomers (1946-1964)	Post-secondary	Yorkton, SK[a] to University of Regina, SK: 189 km.

Pedro	The Baby Boomers (1946-1964)	Post-secondary	Lived in Vancouver, BC and accessed Vancouver Community College, the University of British Columbia, and private lessons in Metro Vancouver. Later studies periodically in Chicago, IL: >3,500 km, Cleveland, OH: >4,000 km, and St. Louis, MO: >3,500 km.
Kate	Generation X (1965-1979)	Age 16	Lacombe, AB to Red Deer, AB: 31 km. Lacombe, AB to Edmonton, AB: 123 km.
Keith	Generation X (1965-1979)	Age 15	Smithers, BC to Vancouver, BC: 1,155 km. Smithers, BC to Western Washington University, Bellingham, WA: 1,126 km.
Muireann	Generation X (1965-1979)	Age 16	County Donegal, Ireland to London, UK[b]: >800 km.
Rob	Generation X (1965-1979)	Age 16	Yorkton, SK to University of Regina, SK: 189km. Yorkton, SK to Minot State University, ND: 400 km

Source of generational names (Care Givers of America, 2022)
Source of distances: Google Maps

[a] Rae's family sold their farm and moved from Stalwart to Yorkton, SK from where she eventually left for Regina, SK.
[b] Muireann did not share the actual location, only indicating it was 70 km outside of London, UK. This is therefore an estimate to give context.

Table 8 highlights how geography can impact LIWC musicians accessing cultural and educational opportunities to improve skills and experience great music, ensembles, and opportunities. Except for Craig, who was able to pursue his post-secondary studies and music at home, every participant needed to leave their initial field (family, community) to succeed. Table 8 also establishes it is not only capital that distances people from the centre of a field but also geography. Though financial capital clearly impacts available opportunities for anyone distant from the centre, geography compounds the difficulty. Apart from Pedro, who could not access forms of cultural capital due to financial constraints though he initially lived in Vancouver, every other participant (save Craig) had no choice but to leave home, often at considerable distances and expense, to study at higher levels, and acquire cultural capital. Muireann's family financial situation would also have increased her struggles had she not moved to England to be closer to her mother.

Table 8 also demonstrates a divide regarding opportunity to travel for study between older participants and those in Generation X who began earlier. Many factors could account for why this exists including increased opportunities, and families that, though LIWC, had been able to become more financially stable than previous generations, or better access to transportation. It is also important to note the immense distances some participants needed to

travel is reflective of life in Canada. Even though more opportunities exist today for LIWC youth, the cost continues to make it difficult for a person who needs to travel far.

Canada aside, distance to the centre of the musical field is increased by limitations of capital as well as geography. It is possible Bourdieu refers to this factor only a few times because he was writing in France, a much smaller country than Canada. However, the participants who needed to travel extensively to overcome distance in their fields benefitted from embracing the risks. This is evident in Oleg's family's journeys from the USSR to East and West Germany and then Canada. Muireann's immigration with her family from Ireland to Canada helped her escape being dragged into the social reality she knew growing up. Since coming to Canada, she has accomplished more in her education and career than she would have at home. The benefit of travel is also evident in Pedro taking the risk to periodically study in various places far from home. His successful audition and move across the continent to perform with one of the world's great orchestras shocked many in the centre of the Vancouver music field who wouldn't give him a break. This also made the risk worth taking. And it is also seen in me travelling as a teenager to study, later out of country for university, and eventually performing in seventeen countries from Europe to Asia. When one embraces the risks of distance, habitus changes because of new experiences (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992) and life changes tremendously from our initial field be it family, community, and class.

Distance may be vast in the field or geographically, yet as evidenced by the participants' experiences, it can be overcome resulting in new experiences and locations. However, a more difficult challenge was evident in Rae, Muireann, and Kate's experiences with sexism in the musical field.

Sexism and the Field of Music

Sexism was a challenge shared by the three female participants both directly and indirectly. However, the degree and nature to which they described it varied by age, location, and musical genre.

Symbolic Violence

Rae did not speak directly of sexism. However, as the eldest female participant, and someone who felt quite behind at university, the fact she was female making her way in what at that time (the 1960s and 1970s) was a male-dominated music and education field meant she required help to succeed. The impacts on her development and career due to the help of male influences was particularly apparent.

> I had a wonderful teacher and he helped me through it. And I ended up in my third-year auditioning for the assistant principal position in the Regina Symphony… [he was] a really kind teacher who was very, very good to me. So that helped. It's kind of

> how I got through that. I don't think I ever did break through the social barriers with the symphony.

Once in the Regina Symphony, Rae made inroads again through contact with the male conductor who also worked in music education for the school district. This pattern continued as she made her way in music education that eventually brought her to Lethbridge, Alberta.

> The then conductor of the symphony was also the head of music for the school district. And I was the only person that got placed in the city for an internship because he took it upon himself to make sure I did. And then he watched out for me, and I got a job in the city afterwards because of him. And then when I left, I moved to a place where I got hired, because, well, I'm not sure that's why I got hired, but I knew the person who was the…Director of Music…in the school district…because I had sung with him in choirs and had worked with him in the honour choir. And he hired me. And when I came here, the person that was then the Director of Music was my old high school band teacher.

The fact all the individuals who had helped Rae were male demonstrates a few points found in the literature (see also Chapter Two). At the time, male domination of the arts and education was considerable, part of the transcendent order ingrained in the minds of society (Bourdieu, 2001). Though she made no direct reference to sexism, Rae's experiences reveal how the music world held challenges for women regarding male domination. Though not an overt sexism, Rae was experiencing symbolic violence, "a gentle violence, imperceptible and invisible even to its victims, exerted for the most part through the purely symbolic channels of communication and cognition (more precisely, misrecognition), recognition, or even feeling" (Bourdieu, 2001, p. 1-2). Due to the era, it is also possible there could have existed what hooks (1997) described as women's allegiance to sexism; an accepting as fact that it was a reality that simply existed. I will discuss this further in Muireann's and Kate's experiences as both dealt with it differently than what was seen in Rae's interview.

Rae spoke of these men with great respect, and considering the era, the ways they helped her speaks a great deal to their ability and openness to change. From her band experience in Yorkton, university, the symphony, and teaching Rae was one of the earlier females to make their way in the male-dominated world that was music and music education on Canada's prairies. Though her experiences would perhaps have differed to those experienced by women in larger centres (i.e., Vancouver, Toronto, Montreal) they would not have been much different than those of other female music students. Symphonies, for example, were still dominated by men even in my teens. The world-class Vienna Philharmonic only allowed women to audition in 1996, finally recruiting a female violist for the 2003 season (Burgermeister, 2003). This was the sexist reality Rae engaged with due to

the transcendent order accepted at the time (Bourdieu, 2001), increasing the difficulty of acquiring forms of social and cultural capital men in the study could more easily access.

Unconcealed Chauvinism

In comparison, Kate experienced far greater blatant sexism that does not fit Bourdieu's (2001) definition of symbolic violence. For Kate, her encounters with sexism were not at all gentle, imperceptible, or invisible (Bourdieu, 2001). Having studied with the trumpet instructor at the University of Alberta during high school, she chose instead to attend the University of Calgary, preferring that city. However, quite quickly Kate understand this had been a mistake.

> [That instructor], he's not a nice man. … And he had favourites. And I was not one of his favourites. So, I quit. I did, I quit. And you know what? That was interesting, because when I think back on that I had some huge supporters in that program, right? Like, Vondis was there. And he brought me into the wind orchestra when no other first years played in the orchestra. … The jazz band director, constantly giving me kudos and, you know, letting me do things. But because of the way [the instructor] taught. … I quit. … I think he could easily have destroyed me."

The experiences Kate shared were so overtly sexist I asked whether the behaviour and treatment she faced from the instructor and students in the department could have been due to her being a small-town girl studying brass in the 1980s.

> Yeah, female in a boy's world. Now that being said, one of his favourites…was a female. … And she's fantastic, right? She's a beautiful player. Now, I believe [she] started taking lessons with him when she was young. So, he groomed her, right? I think in the late '80s women were still not brass players, right? We weren't and…I always got told those things like, don't wear high heels, wear rubber soles. If you're in a blind audition, don't wear perfume. Don't cough. Don't clear your throat. Don't do anything that would identify you as female.

Kate experienced more than symbolic violence but rather an unconcealed chauvinism to a degree that she quit her programme and re-evaluated her musical future. Her ability to play trumpet made her a target because of longstanding sexual associations with brass instruments predominantly played by men (Bull, 2019b; Spencer & Himonides, 2019). Despite her experiences, Kate also acknowledged the generation before her (Rae) faced similar challenges but of a greater magnitude, even if tempered somewhat by Bourdieu's (2001) concept of a transcendent order. Speaking of meeting one of the world's great 20th Century female trumpet players, Kate spoke directly of the differences experienced generationally with sexism.

> She would have had the same thing. She was a lot older than I was. … They had

> to work really hard. I only had to work medium hard, right? It was the women that were even five years ahead of me that had to work really, really hard. … Now the girls are just on par[18].

Kate eventually returned to studying trumpet but to do so moved two hours south to Lethbridge. There she studied with very gracious men and women whom she spoke of fondly, people who taught her music and took her into their homes for dinners and social opportunities, helping her gain social capital. Kate completed her degree in music and decided to pursue her master's degree at Louisiana State University where she again encountered strong sexism.

> I really found it when I went south. Because probably the sexism was worse down there. … So, I had to work extra hard there to be prepared. … I think that was the thing: you always were prepared. You never messed up. Because if you did, you'd be out. You had to work hard. We all have to work hard, though, right? We all had to work hard… whole different story there too, right? Because you're dealing with racism and sexism. Women have a, not always but I think historically women have a very distinct role in the South, right? You're supposed to be a very specific way.

Kate's (and Muireann's) experiences provide key reasons to include an intersectional approach for this study. As indicated in chapter two, Hill Collins (2015) claimed sociological studies focus too much on class and address gender marginally and race insufficiently. This is seen in Kate's brief description how sexism in the American South was worse than in Alberta and the complexities of Southern attitudes towards sex hierarchies and race as complicated social factors.

Remaining solely with Bourdieu would not have sufficed in addressing this section of the study, and intersectionality was particularly important in Muireann's case too as she not only battled sexism at musical venues, but also in her Travelling cultural and family.

Sexism and Cultural Expectations

Born into an Irish Travelling family, Muireann shared experiences of a tumultuous family life filled with disfunction surrounding economic stability, alcoholism, and school absenteeism. Before she began singing in her grandfather's music hall and later in pubs and clubs, Muireann experienced sexism when considering continuing past compulsory schooling.

> My dad said at the age of fifteen…'What do you need to go to school for?

[18] This does not mean female brass players are free from sexism. However, in the last twenty years the brass and trumpet subfields have witnessed the rise of incredible female performers. Whereas when Kate and I were studying trumpet in high school and university Susan Slaughter (St. Louis Symphony; St. Louis Conservatory) was the only name one heard, today's female trumpet players can look for inspiration worldwide: Alison Balsom (UK), Tine Thing Helseth (Norway), Andrea Motis (Spain), Cindy Bradley (USA), Bria Skonberg (Canada), and Barbara Butler (Canada/USA).

> Because you're just gonna have babies and get married anyway.' And he was illiterate, right? So, he'd done alright. He didn't see a need for school. And he was right, I was just going to get married and have babies anyway.

While Rae was dependent upon the male support to succeed, and Kate faced blatant chauvinism in the musical field, Muireann had the added layer of facing it also in the fields of home and culture. Her father's opinions, combined with proud ties to his Travelling culture, provided a bleak outlook for Muireann. And then there were the music halls, pubs, and clubs.

> I sang in pubs where they used to pay me protection money to sing. … When I was in those pubs at fifteen, sixteen, seventeen and learning just how to read a room and how to work a room, I also learned how to watch for a fight, and how to watch for somebody getting mouthy with me, you know, or whatever, right? In the '90s…there was a lot of #MeToo moments, you know. … It's because it was a man's world. I was dealing with publicans. I was dealing with agents. I was dealing with band members when I had a band. … I was in a man's world.

Her father's cultural and sexist prediction for her life drove Muireann to change her future. Instead of accepting this, she realised education would eventually lead to a better life. She shared, "All I ever wanted after that, like any good rebellious daughter, was an education and find my way back, you know, dig down, and I did, obviously." Immigrating to Canada and despite not having a sixth form education, Muireann was able to enrol in a post-secondary program as a mature student studying child and youth care. Faced with needing to balance several practicums she would have to leave home for, and her husband working out of town, she transferred to McMaster University where she eventually earned a Diploma in Addictions and a Bachelor of Science (Interdisciplinary). Since then, she has completed a Master of Science in Systems Thinking from Western University.

> The Canadian culture was so different. I was already watching what's the norm? How do people interact, right? So, it was like I'm now in this new environment where I can legitimately learn without a chip on my shoulder because I'm working class and I'm Irish and I come from a Traveling culture. And I never had the opportunities other people had. All of that shit was left, right? I rolled up here the same as everybody else. And I think that's how I addressed it.

Muireann's experience of finally being able to realise her educational goals and make a better life for herself and family are evidence of Golash-Boza, Duenas, and Xiong's (2019) finding that sociological studies need an intersectional framework when researching immigration and migration because it is not enough to only observe these trends through a racial lens but also through that of capitalism and patriarchy. For Muireann, a chance at better economic prospects as a LIWC musician and labourer from the Traveling culture meant having to overcome sexism, cultural discrimination, and immigration. Considering the complexity of her story, Bourdieusian theory's predominant focus upon class would not have sufficed. As

Friedman (1995) claimed, binary approaches and explanations are unhelpful because they rarely do justice to the full impacts of people's experiences.

Battling Sexism

Ultimately, Rae, Kate, and Muireann had to acquire social and cultural capital by playing the game that includes the fields of music and education to achieve success in places foreign to their initial habitus. They had to embrace and believe in the game they were playing (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992) to have the tenacity to overcome deficits of capital and ability, all to different extents. While Rae faced sexism in the form of symbolic violence, Kate and Muireann faced it head on, able to build on the efforts of, as Kate pointed out, women before them.

> I think I went the other way to prove I was a female and just as good, right. You know, I often wore high heels to perform in and, and big dresses, right. And the whole nine yards, and I don't think I ever apologized for being female. … I'm not an aggressive person. So, I did struggle with some of that, right? Some of the ego. Egos came from some of the men and…I just made a point to say yeah, I am female. And guess what? [laughter] I will be better than you…there was definitely sexism there. I think I didn't get as much of it as some did. But certainly, I think you just met it head on. And you did your best because you had to prove that you were better.

Though facing sexism and discrimination was difficult, Muireann believes it rewarded her later when entering other male-dominated fields including prisons, recruiting, or selling cars.

> The pubs…influenced me to…stand up for myself and know how to handle myself around men. I mean, I would have been 110 pounds. … As a recruitment consultant, I used to go in and just nail presentations, right? And I'm this tiny little, you know, dark haired, blue-eyed little thing and, you know, grown men, like if you're looking for somebody, you're gonna get that contract signed. Once you nail a presentation in a short skirt, you're done. … I was in a man's world. And by the age of 21, I knew that I could handle myself.

Kate and Muireann's interviews demonstrate how despite the rigidity found in Bourdieu's theory, women can understand the rules of games they are often excluded from by men (Lovell, 2000). Both women, though exposed to sexist actions, comments, and expectations did not accept being excluded and developed successful careers, no longer living in the same classes they grew up in. When Lovell (2000) published her findings, within the labour market were increasing demands for skill sets that connected, albeit stereotypically, with those held by women. Ultimately, the need for masculine physicality in many positions has diminished (Lovell, 2000), increasing the number of opportunities available to women and limiting sexism in traditionally male-dominated fields.

This chapter described how the data revealed a division amongst the participants depending upon goals to succeed professionally or not in the musical field. Though some exceptions existed, overall, this division was seen regarding habitus and capital. Social

capital proved to be necessary for class mobility and career trajectory success but also very difficult to acquire. While Bourdieu (1977a, 1977b, 1984, 1986) spoke of cultural and social distance from the centre of fields, nearly all of the participants also faced barriers to success due to geographical distance. The theme of sexism was also discussed as the resulting barriers were unique to all three women's experiences.

Chapter five will focus upon how social reproduction impacted the participants in the past but also can occur even in the present. I will then demonstrate how overcoming self-doubt and capital deficits described in chapter four required the help of mentors and also not losing a sense of their LIWC roots.

Chapter Five – Self-doubt and Overcoming Obstacles

This chapter discusses how encounters with social reproduction impacted participants in the moment and long-term. From the data, self-doubt emerged as the most common long-term effect. It then explores the origins of self-doubt (internal versus external) and how it can be viewed as symbolic violence embedded within an individual. I will then turn to two key components present in every account that led to success: the impact of mentorship and how retaining one's working-class habitus, particularly the aspect of work ethic, was imperative. Please note participants' quotes in this chapter have been labelled (I) interview data and (L) for data derived from their letters.

The Effects of Self-Doubt

The most common theme among participants, particularly if they had professional musical experiences, was self-doubt. Self-doubt caused participants to question their abilities, feel out of place, and even step away from musical pursuits. Habitus, a determining factor whether we feel out of place (a fish out of water) in different situations, causes self-doubt to arise within us (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). It can also occur because of interactions with powerful agents whose habitus is better aligned to the expectations and rules of the field.

LIWC people struggle throughout life with "judgments of imaginary and real others that position them, not just as different, but as inferior, as inadequate" (Skeggs, 2002, p. 90). Class is "omnipresent" (Skeggs, 2002, p. 90) in working-class homes as visible tastes (clothing, art, music, possessions, educational attainments) are constantly measured against others within fields they aspire to join. Particularly in the past, including the developmental years of this study's participants, such tastes demonstrated class standing. Taste is therefore a form of symbolic violence inflicting a negative self-image upon those less powerful in a field:

> If there is any terrorism it is in the peremptory verdicts which, in the name of taste, condemn to ridicule, indignity, shame, silence (here one could give examples, taken from everyone's familiar universe), men and women who simply fall short, in the eyes of their judges of the right way of being and doing (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 511).

Symbolic violence contributes to the maintenance of a field's order with those most powerful determining who gains access (Bourdieu, 1984).

Self-doubt arises from not holding necessary cultural and social capital and lacking understanding how and when to use them. Acquiring capital is extremely difficult (Skeggs, 2002), particularly when attempted alone. LIWC people need to invest a substantial number of resources to gain the correct kinds of capital (schooling, work, or connections with the right people) to experience success (Bourdieu, 1984). Our habitus and capital levels remain with us and ultimately cause "evaluations and regulations" of ourselves (Skeggs, 2002, p. 90).

However, self-doubt does not result solely from outward, noticeable properties or tastes. It originates deep within us, resulting from habitus and capital. Describing the English class system, Kuhn (1995/2002) claimed:

> Class is not just about the way you talk, or dress, or furnish your home; it is not just about the job you do or how much money you make doing it; nor is it merely about whether or not you have A levels or went to university, nor which university you went to. Class is something beneath your clothes, under your skin, in your reflexes, in your psyche, at the very core of your being. … If you know that you are in the 'wrong' class, you know that therefore you are a valueless person (p. 117).

This description struck me deeply in relation to a tremendous setback I experienced this past year in my academic career. Though I have not lived in a working-class existence for most of two decades, self-doubt arose quickly within me, with my inner voice telling me to return to industry. Also, past criticisms from my religious upbringing arose making me question if I was pursuing correct life paths. It is not an exaggeration to say this has haunted me since June 2022. However, this proved valuable for this study regarding how self-doubt and a sense of insecurity are never very far from one another. Kuhn (1995/2002) is correct in claiming class is under our skin and though our initial habitus alters as we advance in a field, it takes very little for our initial habitus to arise when we are challenged.

Self-doubt never leaves a person with LIWC roots. Bourdieu and Passeron (1990) noted attitudes we possess from within or projected by others inflict a sense of the probability or improbability regarding our belonging in a position or field. This can be a root cause for LIWC students' struggles with secondary education as it affects decisions surrounding higher education. Termed "self-elimination" (p. 153), Bourdieu and Passeron (1990) claimed LIWC students would rather not attempt to enter higher education than be eliminated from a programme. Should they complete a degree or certification, it is often in a level with little expectation or chance of moving onwards. In fact, inequality of outcomes occurs significantly more visibly between classes when measuring the rate of application or acceptance to a programme versus actual success (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). Though this study's participants have been successful, many struggled in terms of access, acceptance by others, or staying power within a musical field.

Encounters with Self-Doubt and Belonging

Though most participants shared experiences with self-doubt, this did not always translate into a uniform sense of being out of place. The strength of such feelings depended upon habitus, distance from the centre of the musical field, and the amount of capital acquired during their development. However, though some participants knew they belonged in music, this belief did not fully eliminate feelings of self-doubt or self-elimination. This was evident

in Kate and my experiences. Kate never felt a sense of being out of place when she went to study in Red Deer, Edmonton, and Calgary, attributing this to her mother's efforts, particularly regarding class and taste. "She did a really good job of… making sure I knew how to be comfortable in social settings. So, I know I didn't ever feel out of place." Though Kate visibly belonged, a sense of being out of place arose once she entered academia, resulting in self-doubt. "Sometimes in academia, yeah, because I always didn't feel I was the smartest person there, right? You feel a little dumb sometimes when you're surround by certain people."

In my experience, feeling out of place arose depending upon context. The first time I felt out of place was at the 1991 Canadian National Music Festival. I was the sole brass player representing British Columbia. Upon arrival, I discovered that of the ten brass players I was the only person without a completed music degree. Having worked in the mill for two years, I had not even begun post-secondary studies.

> I actually said to the president of the BC Performing Arts Festivals that I felt like I didn't belong there at all. And she…remind[ed] me that I was there because I had been adjudicated and could play at an extremely high level, and that in itself meant I belonged there as much as anybody else. (I)

I placed third nationally and ahead of the other four (degree-holding) trumpet players. The president had been correct, but I needed her assurance to overcome my self-doubt.

Despite the preparation and assurance Kate and I had developed and received as teenagers, we were not insulated from self-elimination. Both of us ended our first attempts at post-secondary musical study quite quickly. Kate's self-doubt arose due to the sexism she encountered (see Chapter Four) from her instructor.

> I quit. I said, 'I can't do this. … I'm never gonna make it.' Because he had me believe I was never gonna make it, right? And then I quit, so that was a big barrier, because then I had to decide what I was going to do with my life, first of all, because I'd always figured I'd be a musician…that was hard. So, then I had to spend two years just kind of floating around figuring out what I was going to do and then came back. (I)

For me, it came from within and the result of the extreme change of growing up in a small town versus life in Vancouver.

> I came down to UBC when I was 18, and I wasn't ready. …Here I was living in a basement apartment…on West 70th and Oak Street in Vancouver, right off of the Oak Street Bridge. ... I grew up in a small town with two rivers that joined together in the middle of it, mountains everywhere. I actually quit and went home...with my tail between my legs. And after that was not sure what I was going to do. (I)

Our self-doubt grew the longer we were in our first university music programmes, increasing after self-elimination. This was completely unexpected as we had done so much extra work

before university cultivating capital (Bourdieu,1984). Our experiences were therefore different from those of Rae who did not self-eliminate. However, the transition from small town to city was not easy and she persistently struggled with feeling out of place and self-doubt, still feeling the impact nearly fifty years on.

> It was a big shock to my system. … And I really had to pick up my game playing there. And…it was terrifying a lot of the time. I managed, got through it, and enjoyed it sometimes. Sometimes not so much. I think I'm still scarred a little bit by that experience. (I)

Though Rae experienced success through hard work in university, what she speaks of links to Kuhn's (1995/2000) concept of class being under your skin. Our initial habitus, though it can be altered and developed due to new situations (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992), never fully leaves us and self-doubt can always arise.

> I think I always felt like I…didn't belong, necessarily. That I was a little bit of a, not a sham, but that maybe I wasn't as good as other people or didn't have the backgrounds that other people have. I thought maybe I didn't have the knowledge. Turns out I did, but just didn't feel that inside. (I)

Rob shared experiences with self-doubt stemming from a sense of not belonging. Outlined in Chapter Four, Rob's pursuit of rock and roll didn't fit into school-based music classes in high school, nor did classical guitar study find him a place in his university programme. In his teaching career, doubts continued when he was approached to begin a guitar and rock class in his school. Rob attributes this to a long encounter with the hierarchy of music education where Classical is best.

> I always doubted myself as a band teacher because I never took band in high school. … One day, my principal came, he knew I'd played guitar, and on the weekends rock bands, country bands. …He came up and asked me if I'd be interested in doing a guitar class. … I thought you can't have a guitar programme at a school, it has to be only band. (I)

Self-doubt resulting from early life experiences also continued in the stories of the remaining participants. Muireann spoke of school-based experiences that indicated how she was viewed by others and where she was expected to belong. It came about particularly in the letter she had written, addressed to a body of influential teachers.

> I [knew] when the male, coffee drinking, smoking teacher with that morning's breakfast still in his beard would walk past me wreaking of Benson and Hedges, mimicking an Irish accent in front of me; in front of everyone in the hallway. … When my grade six classroom teacher would go out of her way to 'other' me as something that was problematic, demanding my handwriting be better. Yelling when I couldn't get a math problem. (L)

Such treatment combined with her unusual and impoverished family life had long-term effects on Muireann even when she became successful. Despite her voice and ability, self-doubt led her to believe she was out of her league.

> I think that there were times I was definitely intimidated. I went down to the [London] West End and I got through the second round for a Patsy Kline musical. … I couldn't believe that I got through to like the last round, and I'm down to the final few. And it was really noticeable how out of my depth I was. And it wasn't as much the language, it was more the behaviour…how to interact and not interact. (I)

Muireann's awareness of her Irish accent, and reference to language and behaviour linked to one of my memories regarding how linguistics and accent singled me out. I encountered the feeling of being outside the ordinary regarding how I spoke English attending university in the United States. How I spoke set me apart not only from the Americans but even my Canadian music colleagues as was pointed out by a friend early on.

> [She] giggled and said, 'You have such a thick Canadian accent.' And that kind of surprised me because I never really thought I had an accent. … She explained some of the other Canadians didn't have near as thick an accent as I did. … I realised that was probably because they all lived…within an hour's drive or less to the US border. I was eleven hours. … Two-and-a-half hours from Alaska…small town, working in the mill. … You have mill language. (I)

It proved to be the first of numerous times my accent, pronunciation, terminology, or spelling would be brought up.

Unbeknownst at the time, Muireann and I were experiencing being identified and set apart according to primary pedagogic work (PW) demanding individuals hold a "mastery of language and of a relation to language" by which one's habitus is exhibited in a field (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990, p. 50). The language styles of LIWC people are often determined in education and various fields as "jargon, slang, or gibberish" (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990, p. 50). This is what Muireann endured when she described being othered by teachers in school. Though my friend had no intention of doing so, I recognise how I spoke English set me apart from the common expectation of the educational field in that (American) context.

Craig's family moved a great deal, preventing him getting close to many friends. Though he views the resulting independence as a positive outcome, he spoke of feeling out of place which, in a positive sense, resulted in lifelong friendships with a small group of boys.

> I felt out of place in my junior high and high school years because we never stayed in a place for very long. … I was pretty wary. … [But] I still have four really good friends from high school. … [When] I think back, we were all…not mainstream kids. We were all on the fringe. (I)

Though all went on to successful lives and careers, what initially brought them together was feeling they didn't fit in. Not belonging and self-doubt also affected Craig when he first stepped on stage in a serious musical performance.

> It's a big step to get from a circle where everybody's playing to up on a stage with microphones in front of you… I remember that very well. It's a huge step… Totally intimidating. Like, the first time I played with that band was at South Country Fair on a B or C stage somewhere out in the woods in the forest and even at that there were I don't know, 30 or 40 people there, and…I was terrified. (I)

To this point in the study, Craig's experiences seemed relatively distant from the musically focused participants. However, what he spoke of intersected well with Pedro's story in particular. To that point, the two had not shared any similarity in experience due to upbringing and musical experiences. I returned to the interviews and data tables. I found despite being the most successful professional musician of all the participants, like Craig, Pedro spoke of similar experiences with self-doubt later in life when faced with new situations on a grander scale. For him, it always stemmed from his lack of a completed university degree. To overcome this, Pedro spoke of somewhat resorting back to his initial, East Vancouver habitus to push back against self-doubt.

> The typical background of a person in my profession, you know, you're playing Beethoven's Fifth Symphony, the first time should be when you're a teenager. Yeah, not when you're 35 years old at Carnegie Hal. … [There is] that initial reaction…it's just instinctive. … I'll be sitting next to very accomplished colleagues. And I sort of say, 'Yeah, well, you know, you went to Julliard, and look, you're sitting next to me, you know. How good is Julliard? Yeah? What did you get out of it except $200,000 worth of debt?' [laughter] (I)

Pedro was a valuable source of insight as to why this happens to LIWC musicians. He shared a philosophical perspective regarding how he believes this is part of the nature of developing musicians.

> I had, and still to some degree have, insecurities as a musician, right, because of my weird background and not going to university fulltime and getting a degree. … It took me a long time. … If you get stuck in that place, it's not a good place, you know, doubting yourself. I've had instances in my personal life where it was going really wrong. And I was a mess. I couldn't play a note. Like literally I'm going to play, and nothing would come out. (I)
>
> [Musicians] spend so many hours reflecting on our shortcomings because you don't need to fix the things that are good. … We just obsess [over them]. I remember sitting in a darkened room: Tah. No, didn't like that. Tah. Oh, that's better. Tah. No. You know, one of my teachers…everything I did, you know, had me keep a journal and my own thoughts about what I was doing, or changing to achieve what was working well…had me very much in the mindset of doing some of these things I needed to do 10 times over. And if I got nine and a half times through it and failed, back to square

> one. So, you learn to become obsessive and meticulous. And I think, if taken to the extreme, it can be really crippling. (I)

Music students must be open to critique from various instructors and must embrace self-critique as most of the time is spent alone practising one's instrument (Bull, 2019a). If done constructively, this contributes to the building of a musical metacognition that results in musicians who are independent and able to assess and overcome challenges in their practice (Griffioen, 2018). When self-critique becomes self-deprecation, as Pedro described, it potentially becomes crippling. However, does this solely arise from within a musician or from outside influences?

Origin of Self-Doubt

It is understandable how musicians in general can fall into such destructive practices. Bull (2019a) claimed opera students need to allow themselves to be shaped by a teacher to develop and in the process learn to receive feedback and critique themselves. However, the risk of self-criticism becoming morbid increases because musical study begins at young ages (Bull, 2019a). Experiencing constant critique can result in students misinterpreting instructors' messages. A director providing a singer with directional necessities such as "turn around here" can be quickly misinterpreted as "you haven't turned around; you're doing it wrong" (Bull, 2019a, p. 141). Such misinterpretation arises from within and increases the potential of crippling self-doubt. However, it would be erroneous to think self-doubt is only triggered internally.

The participants who experienced self-doubt claimed they believed self-doubts primarily originated within themselves. In the following section, their voices will be used to give evidence of these beliefs. Following this, however, I will explore how our personal feelings and beliefs cannot escape the rules of the field and those holding power. In this part of the analysis, I once again encountered a divide between those intending to pursue music professionally and those who had not. Yet, while Oleg claimed he did not feel out of place at all, Craig was aware his sense of not belonging resulted from his upbringing and lack of formal musical training. Among those musically focused, Pedro alone expressed certainty that self-doubt comes purely from within.

Internal Doubt. Though participants described how the actions of others exacerbated their self-doubt, most reflected they also believed it originated internally. This seemed clear at first because I had expressed similar thoughts. Upon returning to the interview recordings and transcriptions, however, I detected uncertainties in tone and wording. Though most believed self-doubt purely an internal phenomenon, outside influences were simultaneously mentioned as per Rae's experiences.

> I always felt a little inferior because I didn't have that background that everybody else did. I don't think I needed to in retrospect now but because I think what I'd lacked in background, I had experienced in other ways. … I thought maybe I didn't have the knowledge. Turns out I did but just didn't feel that inside. (I)

This seemed to confirm Rae's self-doubt as purely internal. But in the audio recording I found the way she stated this sounded akin to a question. I began looking at the transcripts and quotes differently as initially they'd all seemed quite sure of themselves. In my own interview, I found a similar quote that caused me to doubt how certain I was at the time.

> In reality, I'm not sure I was ever made to feel out of place really. Maybe by the odd person here or there, but usually that disappeared pretty quick because…when you could perform the way I could, well it made them shut up pretty quick. I think. (I)

This caused me to reconsider what I'd shared at the time of my own interview because the criticisms I faced in my school and church were intense. I remembered how Rae spoke of symphony musicians as not "innately kind." Despite her initial certainty, Kate also alluded to situations where the presence of other led to self-doubt.

> You feel a little dumb sometimes when you're surrounded by certain people…and that takes reflection, right? To say, why do I feel that way? And is it me or them? Because there certainly are those people, right, that just make everybody else around them feel stupid. (I)

The more I returned to the transcripts and recordings, it became clear that though participants seemed certain others hadn't often made them feel out of place, the words used, or tone of voice suggested otherwise.

A sense of conflict regarding the source of self-doubt existed in Pedro's interview as well. Of all the participants, Pedro seemed most certain these feelings result primarily from within us.

> I was never made to feel out of place. I felt out of place sometimes, based on my lack of relative experience…compared to my colleagues. I was never made to outwardly feel that way. …I felt that way internally many times. ... There are a million notes that [the audience] would have heard that were fine. But in my mind, this one brief blip was what they were listening for. And therefore, they would hear it and go, yep, 'That's the spot. He sucks.' (I)

Yet, despite his certainty, there was evidence that it may also have originated from others because of where he was from. As will be seen, Pedro did not let that hold him back, rather using it motivationally to prove people wrong. However, such comments negatively impact LIWC people's confidence, self-esteem, and self-worth (Jones, 2008). When one hears these personal criticisms, they become internalised and part of our habitus.

External Influences. Other participants were very clear about the impacts of external influences upon confidence and self-worth. Rob shared how he and his friends had no help

from their high school band teacher who looked down on rock music. Entering university to study music and education, he believes the Western-centric approach he learned influenced his beliefs about music education. "I was brainwashed to thinking [Rock] music should not be in a school environment. Even though I love that type of music. My undergraduate [was] brainwashing." As rock and pop music were, particularly in the past, viewed as a genre of the working-class (Bourdieu, 1984; Bull, 2019a; Green, 2011; Peterson & Kern, 1996), to succeed Rob felt forced to turn against the musical style he loved most. Though it would seem logical that the longer musicians spend in the field increasing cultural capital, the more they should experience greater acceptance (Coulson, 2010), Rob's experiences demonstrate a different reality. In the interview, he was at times vehement about the impacts his undergraduate "brainwashing" had upon him.

Similarly, Muireann shared her experiences growing up in a dysfunctional family and culture, poverty, and unsupportive schools in a very raw way. Muireann addressed how this lack of guidance impacted her long-term.

> I inherited a sense of knowing my place, my class, my limits. I never quite figured out where that came from until I was old enough to have children myself who were in school, and then it dawned on me. You could all see and hear me for who you knew me to be. Not who I identified as. You saw me as a working-class, Irish, poor, settled Travelling girl. Probably pregnant at sixteen. (L)

Muireann's experiences align with Jones (2008) who shared personal experiences growing up in a challenging environment and their long-lasting impacts on well-being, education, and success. People growing up amidst family struggles often lack economic and educational opportunity as well. Immersed in an "oppressed class" they eventually view "themselves through the eyes of the dominant group and [the] internalized messages that they receive from society" (Jones, 2008, p. 153). When parents hold such views, it becomes extremely difficult for children to believe otherwise resulting in lifelong struggles with self-doubt, a long-term impact of habitus (Jones, 2008).

Considering Jones (2008), my claim that self-doubt originated within me was surprising due to the pressures I experienced from the Reformed churches and school. While the other participants had grown up in unreligious or Catholic and Protestant homes, I had experienced the most intense form of religion. We attended services twice each Sunday. One did not work, go to a store, or watch or play sports on Sundays. When my musical abilities continued to advance, it became clear that my career would involve Sunday performance in a much less conservative environment.

> I had to overcome a lot of years of pressure from the Dutch Calvinist churches I [attended]. You know, that is a very austere theology that can make you afraid to

> leave. In hindsight, I probably should have left long before. I stayed until I was thirty-seven and then became Anglican. … Part of that was fear of parental expectation…fear of the ostracism that would happen. If you leave, you're lost. A lot of that played on my mind…being criticised for playing with symphonies, etc. on Sundays and whatever else got to my head. (I)

Often, I wonder if removing myself sooner would have changed my career path. However, this results in morbidity as we cannot live in the past.

In the participants' life accounts, I found the further one leaves initial fields, and habitus evolves through new situations (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992), the more self-doubt and sense of place become difficult barriers. Oleg alone was the sole participant who emphatically claimed he never felt he didn't belong. He also was living as an immigrant among many other immigrants from Europe during the post-war decades (Statistics Canada/Statistique Canada, 2018, Chart 1). Though performing on stage in front of people created a fear and sense of being out of place for Craig, he simply performed more. However, in the remaining participants self-doubt increased, and though some claimed it originated within while others from without, the interview transcripts revealed each of us had, to varying degrees been influenced by others attempting to keep us in our place.

For all six musically focused participants, varying degrees of symbolic violence affected our views of self. The fact everyone shared experiences with criticism or judgment from others we frequently downplayed demonstrates a key element of symbolic violence: it is often "gentle…imperceptible and invisible even to its victims" (Bourdieu, 2001, p. 1-2). Whether recognised or not, symbolic violence lay at the heart of self-doubt and sense of place.

Symbolic Violence Embedded Within Us

The emotions expressed in participants' stories indicated past experiences continue to impact us, in particular the criticisms and judgments of others. Though Bull (2019a) is correct that the potential for self-criticism lies within us, and activities such as studying Classical music intensifies this propensity, the problem is more complex.

Lehmann (2007) claimed working-class and first generation post-secondary students in Canada and the United Kingdom tend to drop out of university more frequently than students from wealthier and higher educated families. For some, this is for a short period of time, students whom Lehmann (2007) termed "stopouts" (p. 103) rather than dropouts. However, returnees number less than fifty percent. Stopout is an excellent description of Kate who left musical study (though not university entirely) whereas I did so completely for nearly two years. Her experiences with sexism and mine living in radically different conditions contributed to these decisions. Lehmann (2007) indicated that others experience stopouts due

to being outsiders unable to integrate or because they encounter very different values. Mallman (2017) found this occurred due to not having "equal access to…techniques of selfhood required by the dominant symbolic in the field" (p. 235) whereas privileged and wealthier students have a greater sense of "entitlement, confidence, and security" which translates into a higher emotional resource (p. 238). These contribute to a sense of personal inferiority (Mallman, 2017), inadequacy (Sennett & Cobb, 1972), and a sense of division that distinguishes "them from us" (Gorman, 2000, p. 112).

Such feelings, though seemingly from within, are the result of LIWC students understanding the purpose of the game but not the rules (Lehmann, 2012). Prior socialisation is important for success (Lehmann, 2012) and it is understandable that LIWC students' habitus often clashes with cultural institutions. As habitus "shapes one's view of others through the prism of self-perception" (Mallman, 2017, p. 240), a sense of illegitimacy arises as they lack the confidence and control of dominant agents (Mallman, 2017). This occurs even when one has credentials and abilities that justify your presence in a field, such as Pedro.

Symbolic violence works most efficiently on those whose initial habitus is formed in a family culture where self-esteem and self-worth are not nurtured as parents are also products of an oppressed class. It is a root cause of long-term self-doubt, manifesting as a fear of failure even when successful. Jones (2008) wrote that though she held a perfect 4.0 grade point average (GPA), she still feared failure in university. She acknowledges this was irrational however it was her reality. Though I held the same GPA during two degrees, I constantly feared failure and what others would say if I didn't succeed. How would my parents, church, and my former school react if I failed?

Such fears are passed on generationally as people "view themselves through the eyes of the dominant group and internalize the messages that they receive from society" (Jones, 2008, p. 153). The messages we outwardly receive, whether supportive or exclusionary, transfer inside (Kuhn, 1995/2002; Sennett & Cobb, 1972). This impacts the choices LIWC people make regarding which opportunities to attempt as long held fears of failure drive decisions not to enter programmes despite ability (Sennett & Cobb, 1972). Even after the successful completion of a stage of learning, self-elimination from higher levels of education can occur due to fears of failure (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990).

This returns us to Bull's (2019a) claim that the potential for self-critique already exists within us regardless of studying Classical music. Bull (2019a) is correct but from my findings, our tendency for self-critique and doubt are also sown through symbolic violence experienced very early on. As it solidifies, and as we engage with higher levels of music, it

intensifies, increasing self-doubts. This occurs due to outside influences transferring inside of us, leading to this question: how do LIWC musicians overcome experiences with social reproduction, symbolic violence, and self-doubt that hold them back? The participants' experiences demonstrated two necessary items required for success: the help of others through mentorship, and the work ethic instilled in our habitus through a LIWC upbringing.

Mentorship

Agents whose habitus aligns best to the rules of the game are most likely to be successful (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). Early socialisation affects self-concept which impacts the educational and career opportunities we believe available to us (Bourdieu, 1977, 1990a; Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990; Lehman & Taylor, 2015). Agents are known to completely discount occupations because their capital seems inadequate for success. For LIWC young people entering post-secondary institutions, discrepancies between habitus and the educational field can be vast, like LIWC musicians trying to establish themselves in the musical field. Termed habitus dislocation, this occurs when a "working-class habitus comes into conflict with the middle-class norms of educational institutions" (Lehman & Taylor, 2015, p. 617). This also occurs when people inexperienced in trades or manual labour enter employment in factories, mills, mechanics, or mining (Lehmann & Taylor, 2015). Habitus dislocation, like the analogy of a fish out of water (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992), is difficult to overcome as agents must adjust habitus and acquire multiple forms of capital to succeed. LIWC people therefore need someone to help them obtain membership into the group (Bourdieu, 1986), increase cultural capital, broaden social connections, and increase their standing. Within the musical field, this is often accomplished through higher education however mentorship is more effective.

Defining Mentorship, Mentor, and Mentee

Mentor/student relationships are akin to apprenticeships found in trades where a master tradesperson helps a student prepare for success. Mentorships provide students with competent skills and develop their professional character and self-assurance (Allen et al., 2006). Mentorship also goes beyond the practical to include building relationship networks, understanding professional obligations, and mature through learning (Cohen et al., 2007). Mentors help students acquire cultural and social capital found within a profession, all the while perfecting their skillset.

Two distinct aspects of mentorship exist (Kram, 1985; Turban & Lee, 2007). First, career functions focus upon work done in ascertaining a mentee's chances of success through a mentor providing "sponsorship, exposure and visibility, coaching, protection, and challenging work assignments" (Turban & Lee, 2007, p. 23). Second, a mentee's

psychosocial functions (i.e., self-image and confidence) are strengthened through a mentor's "role-modelling, acceptance and confirmation, counselling, and friendship" (Turban & Lee, 2007, p. 23). Mentoring relationships teach and model the management of "one's self, one's relationships, and professional responsibilities" especially in "times of complexity and stress" (Cohen et al., 2007, p. 166). Though considered implicit, these important lessons are not always actually taught in mentoring relationships where direct instruction is needed (Cohen et al., 2007). Such mentoring characteristics are also important within the musical field where, though one's performance ability is important, if knowledge regarding networking, accessing professional organisations, and carrying oneself while 'on the job' are lacking, opportunities may be limited. Such social capital cannot be purchased and therefore early mentorship is necessary before career mistakes are made.

Mentorships are multidimensional relationships that should benefit both mentee and mentor (Hays, Minichiello, & Wright, 2000). While mentees are provided with someone from whom to seek guidance, ask questions, and receive care the mentor is also enhanced personally and professionally. Mentoring success is highly dependent upon the quality or character of the relationship (Hays et al., 2000; Johnsson & Hager, 2008). Though mentorship includes guidance and friendship it must also achieve results in the field as great mentors are evaluated regarding mentees' success (Yamada, 2011). When successful, mentoring impacts the mentor's reputation as much as benefits the mentee, each having roles and responsibilities to fulfil in the relationship that leads to accomplishment.

Mentors and Mentees

Mentors must hold various qualities for success, unselfishness being crucial as the ability to set aside one's own interests for the good of the student can be "lifelong, and extends beyond geographic proximity" (Yamada, 2011, p. 14). Other aspects include compassion and creating a safe culture as mentees potentially hold feelings of self-negation because of habitus that creates challenges within the field (Pakhale, 2021). Yamada (2011) stated mentors must not only recognise talent but also appreciate it without exerting control, allowing talent to blossom through advice and access to material or social resources.

When accomplished, the result is "waking up student's awareness by stimulating a bodily reflexivity [through] conscious thinking-in-action" (Sagive & Hall, 2015, p. 122). An alternative view is the development of a student's habitus. Mentors can be an invaluable source of knowledge for students learning to act fluidly when encountering new aspects of a field. This carries potential benefits for the mentor's practice and profession as they receive "a sense of generativity and purpose" (Allen, Eby, & Lentz, 2006, p. 568). One of the greatest benefits a mentor provides a mentee is bestowing wisdom from years of experience and

becoming a great role model (Yamada, 2011). Though, as previously mentioned, mentoring relationships can be lifelong (Yamada, 2011), it is important to understand this may not necessarily occur. Upon completion, mentors must gradually let go, allowing the student to become responsible for themselves and their learning (Cohen et al., 2007). This is the goal of any mentoring situation.

Though mentors bear important responsibilities, it is not a one-way relationship. Mentees must actively find a mentor and having done so, must work to be a desirable mentee (Cohen et al., 2007). For the relationship to function best, flexibility is essential as mentees must be willing to learn from mistakes and accept feedback and correction (Cohen et al., 2007). Mentees also need to be somewhat vulnerable regarding their personality, needs, goals, and fears enabling mentors to effectively help provide access to the field. To become a professional, one must learn to become a responsible community member knowing “how to work *with* rather than *against* or *in comparison to* others” (Johnsson & Hager, 2008, p. 529, emphasis in original). This requires openness to observation and communication with a mentor. A symbiotic relationship can then form as mentees demonstrate the mentor’s invested time and commitment was worthwhile (Hays et al., 2000). This is ultimately accomplished through mentees maximising their personal and skill development, eventually passing on what they were taught as future mentors themselves (Yamada, 2011). Allen et al. (2006) described this as a crossover effect where mentors and mentees must fully appreciate the experience of one another. A reciprocal, symbiotic giving of time, understanding, and investment results in the greatest success.

The Importance of Mentoring

The recognition that mentorship plays an important role in personal development has increased over the last two decades. Professions and organisations better realise that their responsibilities include the self-regulation of their profession if they wish to retain, or raise, levels of excellence (Cohen et al., 2007). Working with the guidance and influence of people far more advanced in a field provides invaluable experiences and greater development of a mentee’s knowledge and skills (Bull, 2019a). Besides a profession, other benefits include increased quality-of-life indicators in education, health, and economic gain (Pakhale, 2021). As the public and professional world are increasingly intolerant for what was once an accepted learning curve or period to obtain and develop new knowledge and skills, mentorship has positive impacts on novice professionals’ propensity for making mistakes (Cohen et al., 2007). This becomes particularly important for people whose habitus and capital are distant from the centre of a field.

Depending upon where and how people are raised, available careers aligning to habitus and capital are often unquestioningly accepted (Lehman & Taylor, 2015). For those from lower income, first-generation, and working class (LIFGWC) backgrounds, career paths are limited due to early family contexts and place of birth (Lee & Harris, 2020). As LIFGWC people often fill blue-collared jobs in services and trades like their parents, an understanding of the requirements for success comes naturally (Lehmann & Taylor, 2015). However, when subsequent generations attempt to widen their knowledge and abilities to access better opportunities, lacking experience is limiting. Beyond lack of access to resources, social issues that disrupt childhood development also factor and if not addressed carry long-term negative impacts (Pakhale, 2021). Compounding this, should LIFGWC students wish to enter post-secondary institutions, they can rarely access help and advice from parents regarding application processes or what to expect as a new student (Lee & Harris, 2020). This disadvantages them when compared to those from continuing generational students (Lee & Harris, 2020) who receive advice from parents and others present in their lives.

Mentorship is potentially life altering for LIWC students requiring help accessing not only academic assistance but also connecting to jobs and learning social expectations of new situations (Lee & Harris, 2020). Cohen et al. (2007) described the integration of new professional and personal life aspects as daunting, particularly for women attempting to balance new professional lives with home and family commitments. These cause disadvantages in terms of mobility as LIWC students need mentorship in areas beyond academics and professions. Though it is believed post-secondary and industrial job fairs help provide social networks and provide interview opportunities, Lee and Harris (2020) claimed otherwise, indicating students' habitus is often mismatched with what host universities presume about their needs and true level of accessibility. If one cannot afford professional clothing or does not understand what to expect, career fairs, though well-intentioned, hold little benefit (Lee & Harris, 2020). When such challenges are compounded by non-academic factors such as biases including race, class, caste, and other stereotypes (Pakhale, 2021), the distance from the centre of the field becomes insurmountable and mentorship takes on vital importance.

Musical Mentorship

Effective mentorship has not been widely written of in relation to musicians, though evidence demonstrates most successful musicians benefited from mentoring through one-on-one instruction (Hays et al., 2000). Conway and Zerman (2004) found though beginning music teachers (mentored or not) eventually experience success, overcoming career challenges early is formidable without mentorship. MacLeod, Blanton, Lewis, and Ortiz (2020) claimed while

mentorship benefited all students regardless of social and economic background, when placed in economically challenged communities, students and young music teachers felt the absence of mentoring more acutely than those in affluent schools. For LIWC music students, teachers, and performers with a mismatched habitus and lower capital, a lack of mentoring results in greater disadvantages.

As in other fields, musical mentoring goes beyond skill development. Mentors must guide students in recognising and fulfilling various roles (performer, composer, teacher), where these overlap, and the cognitive and social skills necessary for the business aspect of music (Hays et al., 2000; Johnsson & Hager, 2008). Through such broad training, young musicians develop their musical self, gain a voice, and increase social contacts, incorporating them into the musical field (Bull, 2019a).

Effective Musical Mentoring. While mentorship succeeds most when a relationship contains bidimensional benefits for both mentors and mentees (Cohen et al., 2007) another predictor of success lies in whether the mentorship is formal or informal. Within informal mentorships, participants choose one another voluntarily which leads to success (Allen et al., 2006). In these situations, where shared appreciation and mutual interest in the mentorship occurs (Allen et al., 2006), it is easier for one or both parties to willingly allow the other to know their hopes and goals.

Formally established mentorships hold a greater degree of difficulty as a mentee can be intimidated relationally by a mentor. Entering a mentoring relationship, a mentee understands the mentor has skills, knowledge, and prestige within the musical field that creates an imbalanced relationship. To assuage feelings of intimidation, mentors should view themselves as inviting a student to experience music rather than commanding them (Bull, 2019a). Rigid hierarchical relationships of master-student, where the latter holds no self-advocacy, should be avoided. According to Allen et al. (2006), participant-perceived input into the mentoring process is necessary as it allows a student to feel partially in control of a voluntary, rather than forced, relationship. While mentors must positively support and challenge students to develop knowledge, abilities, and confidence, conversely, the mentee must demonstrate flexibility, recognising mistakes will occur from which they must, with the help of their mentors, learn from and move forwards (Cohen et al., 2007). Research demonstrates some of the greatest impacts mentoring has lies in the myriad small things that occur within the musical field that mentees do not realise they must know, and with this the increased confidence to ask for help from their mentor and others in the future (Conway & Zerman, 2004). When the mentee is flexible, and the mentor fulfils their role, such relationships can be lifelong.

As will be seen later in this chapter, Pedro, Kate, and I received help through informal mentorships while Craig and Rob found themselves in situations where someone became like a mentor to them. Muirrean and Oleg spoke only of a few teachers, conductors, or acquaintances from whom they received help and inspiration. Rae was the only participant who was assigned an instructor in university in the formal mentorship sense. However, as she describes this person through her interview and letter writing, he fulfilled this assignment in ways akin to that of an informal mentorship.

When considering the degree of self-doubt and distance from home most of the participants experienced, these informal mentorships proved vital for many of the participants as they needed a great deal of guidance not only in their musical aspirations but in surviving in environments (musical and otherwise) so foreign to their upbringings. The formalities found in formal mentorships, where a mentor is not voluntarily involved in a mentee's life may provide subject specific help but leave a mentee completely on their own regarding their needs beyond a class or music studio. Though valuable, establishing effective mentoring is not easy and challenges and pitfalls exist.

Challenges

Like all mentorships, musical mentorships are most effective when begun early (Hays et al., 2000) and informally (Allen et al., 2006). Within music this can occur naturally as children often begin studying piano or violin at early ages, with other instrumentalists beginning in the middle years of schooling and vocalists later. However, though musical mentorship potentially holds many benefits, challenges exist. Challenges can stem from the level of quality within mentorships and personality differences, if left unaddressed, can lead students to quit briefly or permanently (Coulson, 2010). When music students are paired in formal mentoring or student-teacher relationships, personal disconnects can occur and a student can be dismissed or ignored due to habitus (Pakhale, 2021). Personality differences can be exacerbated by the distance between the mentor's focus and their mentee's intentions for learning (Allen et al., 2006). There may exist a lack of understanding by the mentor of the mentee's family or class contexts (Pakhale, 2021), or alienation due to racism (Quiocho & Rios, 2000) and sexism. These issues can be successfully addressed by ensuring mentor and mentee are closely matched in personality, goals, and professional details such as musical instrument or genre (Allen et al., 2006). Socially, mentors must be willing to understand a mentee's personal history and limitations due to social capital and habitus (Pakhale, 2021).

Challenges also arise if a mentor is not clear on the expected length of a mentoring relationship. While mentoring is important for novices within a profession, they may also need mentoring at other times of their careers. Should mentoring end upon the completion of

education, mentees may be left alone despite their need for mentoring at various stages of their careers, making upward mobility, already difficult to attain, out of reach (Quiocho & Rios, 2000). Much of this highlights the importance of informal, voluntary mentorships (Allen et al., 2006) as these potentially hold the greatest benefit and longevity.

Mutual Benefits

Mentoring relationships function best when they go beyond transmitting skills and both mentor and mentee are invested. Hays et al. (2000) claimed this is critical in musical training and mentors can potentially transform into a surrogate parent requiring "patience, generosity of time, and a genuine interest in the welfare of the student" (p. 6). This type of surrogacy is present in the stories of several of this study's participants who experienced mentors concerned with both their musical and personal development (Hays et al., 2000). According to Yamada (2011), this level of mentoring has lifelong effects.

Becoming a mentor allows experienced musicians to pass on skills and professional expectations, confirming for them the purpose of training future musicians (Johnsson & Hager, 2008). Mentoring allows professional musicians and long-time educators to give back to the profession. Mentors can experience improvement in their own performance and instruction as teaching causes self-examination of one's own habits (Echard, 2008). Allen et al. (2006) claimed such crossover effects result from successful mentoring relationships where both parties influence one another professionally and personally. By becoming caring and supportive mentors, professionals demonstrate citizenship that "goes beyond [their] specific profession to support the concept of lifelong learning" (Johnsson & Hager, 2008, p. 531). Musical mentors also "leave imprints on protégé's lives" through their love of music and "genuine care and interest they have for their students" (Hays et al., p. 6). When mentees who have experienced positive, mentoring relationships become established, they in turn give back as mentors to others. In this way, real learning takes place as both teacher and student are changed through their relationship, making musical mentoring a transformative practice throughout careers (Schmidt, 2005).

Losing Mentors

Though mentoring may produce lifelong connections or end mutually over time (Yamada, 2011), a mentoring relationship can also end in adverse ways, due to the differences of goals or personality conflicts mentioned above, or for more devastating reasons.

According to Kram (1983), mentorship relationships involve four distinct stages: initiation, cultivation, separation, and redefinition. Within the initiation phase of six to twelve months, mentors and mentees establish a relationship, setting boundaries and expectations about the nature thereof. This is followed by a two-to-five-year cultivation period where the

relationship develops professionally and personally, and where mentors provide multiple career and psychological supports as mentees establish themselves permanently within a profession. Following this, a separation phase occurs where mentees branch out on their own, testing the strength of their own independence within the field. Once they have fully established themselves, mentee and mentor enter a final, potentially lifelong phase where their original relationship is redefined as colleagues (Kram, 1983).

When these phases occur as described, mentee and mentor benefit as mentors gain a new colleague and peer from which they glean friendship and professional collegialism. However, should the phases be interrupted, they can have severe, even traumatic, psychosocial affects as the mentee may feel “abandoned and unprepared to meet new challenges” (Kram, 1983, p. 619). Though this can eventually subside, in situations involving the death of a beloved mentor, it can take a great deal of time or never occur (Kram, 1983; Varpio, 2021).

When a death occurs, mentees may still successfully establish themselves, however the loss is continually felt. This occurs when a special type of mentor has deeply invested themself in a mentee’s career and personal development (Varpio, 2021). These mentorships move beyond a professional one to include partnerships and friendships that help mentees become better people with enriched lives. Varpio (2021) claimed such mentorships contain deeper levels of support where the mentor holds the mentee up and together, particularly at difficult stages, professional or personal. This is no longer “mentoring out of a commitment to professional development; that’s mentoring out of love” (Varpio, 2021, p. 330). When this abruptly or tragically ends, accepting such loss takes time and work emotionally. Two participants in this study (one being me) experienced this loss and twenty-nine years later we intimately understand Varpio’s (2021) claim, “I do not know how to lose that love” (p. 330). Experiencing such a level of mentorship is an indescribable blessing and its sudden loss results in indescribable grief. Such grief is explored in the experiences of Pedro and I later in the following section.

Before this, however, the experiences of the participants will demonstrate that because of a lack of guidance, mentors were essential for increasing capital. Data is then included regarding the dynamics between mentorships and family followed by a section regarding the grief of losing a mentor. Though such a loss may seem impossible to overcome, I will then demonstrate how another, different mentorship can begin, helping us move further forward in our careers and lives.

Overcoming Social and Culture Deficits Through Mentorship

For most participants, musical ability was key to their escaping an existence similar to how they grew up. Regardless of eventual profession, music and music education was a transformative practice that positively impacted their lives (Schmidt, 2005). It is perhaps surprising that music was a common key to success because outside of Kate's mother being an amateur pianist and choral director at church, no other parents had received much musical training. Though most families listened to music, they didn't have the social or cultural capital to help access higher forms of musical education. Only Oleg and Craig's fathers had attended a university, a feat accomplished later by Rae's mother.

Participants all experienced a lack of guidance, often having to forge their own way. It was therefore imperative they found others to help them overcome barriers and access necessary instruction and resources. Lehmann (2004) wrote that working-class university students often face tremendous challenges due to "an immediate lack of role models or reference points" (p. 91). This study's participants experienced this regarding technical musical ability and knowledge (cultural capital) or who to know and how to succeed long-term (social capital). Nearly all spoke of needing guidance from others and for one it wasn't easy to find. As previously stated, once the music store owner in Yorkton told Rob to learn how to read music, he turned to others for help. "I started with the guitar teacher down the street, and there was also a piano teacher down the street [who] gave me weekly theory lessons." Though Rob eventually travelled to Regina for lessons during high school, he never referred specifically to anyone as a mentor in his life until he began teaching band himself and struggled with confidence. It was then that he encountered a mentor in his Catholic school: "I had a guy named Don Robb as my mentor. We shared the same office for ten years. And you know, I learned so much from him of teaching band and it was fabulous."

Rob's lack of a mentor to this point in his mid-twenties meant he had to find out much on his own. While the remaining participants also developed on their own, in school, or through private lessons, specific people mentored and helped increase their social and cultural capital.

Mentors Provide Increased Capital

Research on mentoring tends to focus predominantly on a single mentor and mentee (Kay &Wallace, 2009). However, if people wish to access the full scope of resources, capital, and connections, the size of their network needs to be larger (Chow & Chan, 2008; Higgins, 2000; Kay & Wallace, 2009). Mentorship relationships are maximised when the mentor provides both "career functions" and "psychosocial functions" (Kram, 1985, p. 23). Career functions contribute to a mentee's advancement in a field and include "sponsorship, exposure

and visibility, coaching, protection [and] challenging assignments" (Kram, 1985, p. 23). Psychosocial functions such as "role modelling, acceptance and confirmation, counselling [and] friendship" (Kram, 1985, p. 23) aid mentees in forming their identity. When these are performed, mentors help mentees through emotional and professional support (Higgins, 2000). Higgins (2000) listed informational and instrumental supports as imperative, the latter including "tangible assistance in the form of money, time, or resources" (p. 281). Though not specifically referenced in the interviews, sponsorship was nonetheless visible in terms of paying for meals, providing a place to sleep, or simply spending time getting to know us.

That most of us lacked guidance to varying degrees was demonstrated in the data. Until I attended a summer music school at age fourteen and afterwards studied with one of my mentors (the late Thomas [Tom] Parriott, Vancouver Symphony Orchestra), I was for the most part self-taught with aid from my brother and various band teachers. However, it was not just music I needed mentoring with. The vast differences of life in a small northern town and the city of Vancouver were overwhelming even with Tom's, and his partner Maureen's, help. In hindsight, music was a smaller part of this mentorship with a greater focus on life.

> [Tom and Maureen] really helped me overcome a lot of barriers about living in a different world than that in which I grew up. They helped me understand when I made decisions that weren't going to be optimal for me. They taught me a lot of things about living in urban life that I was not used to. … Tom taught me a lot about life. Even…how to smuggle beer cheaply out of Point Roberts, Washington by canoe. (I)

The mentorship they provided helped me acquire cultural capital in practical, everyday existence. Tom's mentorship in the field of music raised this capital even further.

> Tom made it so that I could come in through the stage door of the Orpheum Theatre …and watch the symphony rehearse. … He used to sneak me into concerts for free and put me in an empty seat so I could watch the symphony. He introduced me to other trumpet players in town, other musicians, people that down the road were good to know. (I)

Tom and Maureen's mentorship went further as they welcomed me into their home and, as they had no children, I became what we'd term a semi-adopted son. They provided the psychosocial and cultural functions I lacked upon arrival in the city (Kram, 1985). Opening their home demonstrates instrumental supports (Higgins, 2000). Without these my musical journey would have been infinitely more challenging.

Tom's mentorship was a tremendous help to Pedro also, as he needed Tom to improve not only as a performer but also learning the rules of the field. Pedro spoke of how Tom saw something in him and his ability that demonstrated it was worth the investment of mentorship.

> If Tom hadn't stood up for me when he did, and the way he did, and given me a chance. … Listen, I didn't hit it out of the park every time, you know. But he saw something there, that was worth giving a chance to. (I)

Pedro described how mentorship taught him things he needed to learn in life beyond music.

> My mentor…taught me a lesson which was not taught to me until I met them in my early 20's. That lesson was accountability. I'd not led a disciplined life up until that point in regard to my field of vocation. Sure, there were desires, attempts at bettering myself and a curiosity borne of natural interest, but accountability was not taught or instilled or even shown by example to me. (L)

Tom's (and for me, Maureen's) mentorship to Pedro and me provided us with the capital necessary to continue in music and understand where we were, needed to go, and who to know. This is imperative to success because when one understands where they fit in the field and the importance of networks and relationships, only then do we comprehend how to access and further increase social capital (Fay & Wallace, 2009).

Kate experienced excellent, regular instruction in high school before experiencing setbacks in Calgary. When she returned to musical study, she transferred to Lethbridge and needed her trumpet instructor to get her back on track. Though she had already established a student-teacher relationship with him in Calgary when she was struggling, studying with him in Lethbridge proved lifechanging.

> Vondis was [in Calgary] and he brought me into the wind orchestra when no other first years played in the orchestra. … Vondis was an amazing teacher, and he taught me all kinds of things. … I needed Vondis to come back, right? I needed him to guide me…and that's why I came to the U of [Lethbridge]. (I)

Kate described how Vondis and his partner, who taught music education at the university, would invite her to their home. Spending time with people used to a different social class helped her increase social capital. Though all three of us spoke warmly of our parents, there were limits to which they could help us develop our talents in a field foreign to them. Kate's description of being welcomed into Vondis and Linda's home, and the homes of others she met as a result, demonstrates mentorship can become akin to an extended family. "Vondis…was like a second father to me. And I don't think I realised that until well after I had graduated." (I)

For Pedro, Kate, and myself, mentorship provided a home away from home, meals, emotional support, and friendship, demonstrating how vital instrumental supports (Higgins, 2000) and psychosocial functions (Kram, 1985) beyond music were. Our accounts demonstrate how mentorship can function as a "surrogate parental" relationship (Hays, et al., 2000, p. 6) that extends beyond musical instruction.

Though Rae did not speak much of personal supports, her mentorship from Andy focused upon career functions (Kram, 1985) and informational supports (Higgins, 2000). These provided opportunities for growth and development. Andy's faith in her abilities challenged her to reach beyond what she thought possible.

> Prior to working with you, I may have continued to accept levels of performance that were substandard at best. … You forced me to move outside my comfort zone. You challenged me to learn and seek music that had never been part of my repertoire. And you demonstrated ways to encourage others to reach a potential they may have never imagined. (L)

Andy provided Rae with increased cultural capital, and though not expressed on the level experienced by Pedro, Kate, and me, he raised her social capital by introducing her to colleagues, taking her to festivals, involving her with committees, and having her over to his home to meet people important to know.

Muireann did not mention specific mentors. Rather, she spoke and wrote to music teachers who built her up whereas other educators othered her and tore her down. They provided the psychosocial functions and instrumental supports she needed, ultimately saving her life.

> To the music teachers, the ones who saw me, the ones who knew I didn't have the money for the voice lessons, or piano lessons, or the kind of family who would find it, and who would always welcome me with open arms at lunch time, or for rehearsals to run away from the bullies, *I will never forget you. You live as an example in my mind each and every day. You are what it means to be an educator* (emphasis in original). You gave me a place to be, a confidence deep within, and the chance to sing my truth. Today, I speak my truth and I never ever stop fighting for others to find their voice and be heard. It must have been very difficult to keep your light when surrounded by such darkness, but I love you and I'm grateful for you. You're the reason I kept going. I will never forget you. You were my saviours. (L)

There is an important aspect to mentorships that Muireann powerfully speaks to here: passing on what we have received to future generations. Pedro and I also demonstrated this in how we have given back because of Tom's mentorship.

> I do it in small ways when I can. Someone comes to me for a lesson, and I'd be like, 'You know what? Don't worry about [payment]. …When you're in this position to give that same way, then do that.' … There are some people that have ended up as friends and colleagues that…they're coming to me for my professional advice, and I just can't accept money (Pedro, I).
>
> [Tom] once said to me, 'You'll find somebody who you'll give back to one day.' And by now, I've taught…over 3,000 students in my teaching career. … As they get older…it's amazing the thankful emails I'll get and thankful conversations…on the street, or in a store. … I have given back to a lot of kids in a really depressed area of my city, many of whom have gone on to break out of their own situations. And I'm starting to sense maybe I was a part of that (Me, I).

The mentors we spoke of not only provided functions (Kram, 1985) and supports (Higgins, 2000) at the time; their influence remains long after mentoring ends, careers are established, and distance lessens contact (Yamada, 2011). They demonstrate how a culture of safety and compassion allows mentees to challenge their initial habitus and address feelings of self-negation and self-doubt that resulted from a lack of capital (Pakhale, 2021). Effective mentors get to know mentees well enough to provide musical criticism but also identify how students interpret it, helping alleviate negative feelings, and build confidence. Mentorship therefore plays a large role in LIWC people's ability to alter their habitus, successfully experience new situations, and acquire the necessary capital.

Mentorship and Family

Though not a formal or informal mentorship as described in the literature (see Chapter Two), family can play a mentoring role. Both Kate and Rob wrote letters to a family member regarding how they had influenced their success moving from small town to cities and new lives. While Kate's mother provided her with social and cultural capital before leaving home, her letter went deeper into the importance of this.

> You encouraged me to dream big. … You always pushed me to be better. To work harder, to dress better, to be better. … You showed me how to make the right choices to create an image. … You taught me to be courageous…to rise up to challenges. Your teachings and direction [helped] me transition from a kid in a small town to a career in academia. (L)

Such instruction provided a level of cultural and social capital that could then be developed further by Kate's mentors in university.

Rob spoke of the constant support for his career aspirations that were so different than his parents' life experiences and jobs.

> You always supported me with allowing my friends to come over and jam in our basement. … Even though you did not understand the crazy music I was listening to, you supported my interests and allowed me to listen to the sometimes wild '80s rock music. … When my interests changed to classical guitar you supported this and took it upon yourself to find me a classical guitar teacher. … Every second weekend you would take me to [Regina]. … Thank-you for committing to this and guiding me. (L)

Rob's and Kate's letters demonstrate while mentorship is often viewed formally, a foundation of support is necessary to allow it to happen. Rob's father may not have been able to directly provide cultural and social capital, but he made it possible for him to access it. Similarly, my parents allowing me to attend music schools at a young age and travel to Vancouver bi-monthly to take lessons with Tom paved the way for future mentors to take me forward.

Parents need to balance support and step back regarding careers they know little about. Kate wrote that the positive impacts on her life mentioned in the previous quote were also interspersed with challenges.

> This was at times challenging and could be exhausting. Sometimes it meant pretending to be someone I didn't think I was. There are two sides of this coin. … On the negative side, this created a sense of false bravado…that I could do, be, anything I wanted to be regardless of my ability or talent. This meant that some of the falls were big ones. … It taught me to be the person others wanted me to be and it took a long time as an adult to figure out who I really was. (I)

For me, parental support was imperative to having the opportunities I did. However, when my embouchure became problematic, I was most afraid to tell them I didn't think I could develop much further as a performer and sometimes needed to stand up to them.

> I really thought I was going to let them down. … I don't think they ever really believed I was going to be a great teacher, until they came to one of my spring concerts and impressed by the quality of the music, the kids, and the outpouring of praise for the work that I had done. You know they taught me to be independent, but that also meant I wasn't afraid to take them on and that sometimes caused some real tension, especially when it came to me having to cut that cord and say enough. This is my life. (I)

Muireann's experience with her father's overly supportive involvement in her singing career demonstrates how support can simultaneously be negative. "[He realised] he didn't need to concentrate on the smuggling, didn't need to concentrate on the horses and need to do all those things…the pressure was just incredible." Muireann dealt with this by running off to France, singing on her own terms in different venues. The experiences shared by Kate, Muireann, and I demonstrate how various forms of mentorship must recognise and appreciate talent but not control it (Yamada, 2011). Family influences can be difficult to manoeuvre as parental responsibility and mentorship are inherently different. As informal mentorships where participants choose one another tend to be strongest (Allen et al, 2006) an obvious difference between mentorship and family support lies in that we cannot choose our family.

As Kate described Vondis, and Pedro and I Tom, mentors can become extended family. Both situations are similar as these were informal and voluntary mentorships, increasing the potential for success and meaningfulness (Allen et al., 2006; Kram, 1985). These relationships flourished due to reciprocal benefits resulting from mutual interests, a deeper understanding of one another, and a growing dependency on the relationship (Allen et al., 2006; Huston & Burgess, 1979). Such mentorships form bonds like those found in families, at times stronger due to their voluntary nature. This also means that when a mentorship suddenly ends, the effects can be devastating.

Losing a Mentor

Mentors who willingly invest time and energy into both career and psychosocial functions and personal needs are particularly special as they mentor the whole person, meeting the needs of mentees in ways that others, including family, may not (Kram, 1985; Varpio, 2021). Such mentors hold mentees together in times of self-doubt, help them acquire capital, assisting in altering habitus to meet changes in class, career, and location. It is therefore like losing a beloved family member when these relationships suddenly end because the mentoring has gone beyond "a commitment to professional development; that's mentoring out of love" (Varpio, 2021, p. 330). For several participants in this study, the loss of a mentor was difficult to bear both emotionally and regarding career development.

In the summer of 1993, Tom broke the news that he had developed cancer in his kidney and lymph nodes. This came as a shock as he was only forty-nine years of age. Throughout autumn it progressed rapidly and in early January 1994 he passed away. This was a man Pedro and I owed so much to and who had never expected anything in return than our best efforts. His mentorship had helped transform us into musicians with a chance in a highly competitive field. But it had also been considerably more. When visiting him in the hospital before his passing, Tom shared that of all the things he had experienced, watching me grow up and being a part of that was the most special. Holding my emotions together during the visit, when I reached my car, I wept for some time. I had learned so much from him beyond music. He had always seemed to know exactly what I needed and how to explain things in ways I understood. He knew when to push, to back off, and when I needed space to work things out. His mentorship had been voluntary, gone beyond geographic proximity, and was expected to last well into my life (Yamada, 2011). Suddenly it was gone. When I reviewed Pedro's and my interviews with Kram's (1985) career and psychosocial functions, Varpio's (2021) description of mentor loss was clearly visible.

> At the time, I, I lost a friend. More than a friend. A family member, a mentor, and the one teacher that could have helped me with [my embouchure]. I've never fully gotten over that as a player, because if I had, I think I'd be in a very different place today (Me).

Pedro spoke of how Tom's faith in him had been solid for a long time. Further into his professional development, and from a more challenging context, he felt the pain of Tom's death differently than I.

> Tom…stood up for me. … [He]got the authorisation to have some input into who ultimately would sit next to [him], because bringing me or anyone else in meant they would sit down in that fourth chair or second to him. … When he got sick, I would get called last minute to go sub with the orchestra. When he passed away, they stopped calling. (I)

Both of us lost a tremendous amount personally when Tom passed. However, it also had effects on our careers. Though my focus became education and academia, Pedro had to strike out on his own. Being somewhat older at auditions, and having had freelance experience, things went well, and he was able to become very successful.

> I did myself a favour waiting till I was more secure emotionally, if not musically…that benefited me because I did well right out of the gate. … The first one was for Tom's old job, and I made the final five people. And the next one was the [National] Ballet of Canada. … In Toronto I was a finalist. And then the next one was Symphony Nova Scotia and I won that. … A few weeks later was the [opera]. (I)

This all occurred within the year after Tom's passing. Since then, he has played with some of the leading orchestras in North America. We have both been successful, and Tom's mentorship played a large role.

Craig wrote of a similar experience with Woody who, while not quite a mentor in the same sense, had a large impact on his abilities and opportunities, eventually becoming a close friend. Craig's letter demonstrated regardless of how deeply a mentoring relationship goes or when it begins, the loss of someone is difficult, even when they are tough on us.

> You are the person who sparked my musical career, such as it is. … [When] you chopped off a couple of fingers on a table saw…I still remember the first practice, and you playing the mandolin with blood oozing through the bandages. … You hated to play songs more than once, so a practice left me scrambling to figure the guitar part on my own. You were often critical of my skills…at first. … We became good friends over the years…and I learned a great deal from you about bluegrass music, about life in general, and in the end, after you got sick, how to be a friend. … Eventually you ended up in palliative care. I visited you there frequently. Near the end of your life, I asked you if you had any unfinished business. … You were quiet for a bit, then you said: 'You've been a good friend. Maybe the best I've ever had.' I'm grateful, truly grateful, for those formative years in live music with you as my muse and mentor. (L)

Craig's letter to Woody demonstrated how fully invested mentoring of any sort helps LIWC musicians navigate the challenges and risks they encounter in a field (Lehmann, 2004). Though the loss of a mentor has long-term consequences, it does not mean other mentorships cannot be established. Though different, they aid us in new ways.

Establishing New Mentorships

The risk of losing an important mentor demonstrates the importance of mentees remaining open to the help of others. Early in careers, people tend to have a particular or special mentor yet as they progress this broadens and diversifies through formal and informal mentorships (Schmidt, 2005). This was evidenced in nearly all the participants apart from Craig, likely due to the fact he began performing much later in life.

After Rae completed her degree in Regina, the number of mentors and people looking out for and helping her increased. One such person was the conductor of the Regina Symphony who was head of music for the school district.

> I was the only person that got placed in the city for an internship because he took it upon himself to make sure I did. And then he watched out for me, and I got a job in [Regina] afterwards because of him. (I)

After teaching and marrying, Rae spent much of her adult and professional life in Europe where her husband worked in international schools. Wherever they lived she always found helpful people. "I was really fortunate. I think everywhere I went I had a really strong mentor. Someone who just seemed to be looking out for me."

Even during Tom's mentorship, Pedro travelled for short periods of time to study with various instructors in Chicago, Cleveland, and St. Louis. At times those were very helpful while at others he didn't connect with a teacher. However, Pedro is very clear regarding how much help he received from others.

> Because of the success I've had…when people hear my very uncharacteristic background which lacks a formal institutional education like most in my field, they…remark how unlikely my success is. … I'm quick to tell them that no one achieves on their own. … There's always someone who is helping you along. (I)

Perhaps due to the uniqueness of his success, never having completed a Bachelor of Music but having become a premier orchestral trumpet player, Pedro recognises the contributions of all those he has studied with.

> The other thing I learned is, we all like to have this fallacy of, well, I'm a self-made man. I pulled myself up by my bootstraps and did it. Bullshit. There's someone handing you the boots. There's someone knitting you the socks, you know, someone wiping your nose, picking you up when you feel down. (I)

Kate, too, referenced others who had influenced her development and career. Having previously outlined what Vondis and his partner Linda did for her, she also mentioned others.

> I spent a lot of time with Lottie and George [other influential musicians in the city] and a very different household than what I grew up in. Very different. And Lottie was just such a beautiful person. … She came from a working-class background. … So, that's interesting too, right? How people change their lives. (I)

Kate again found people when she left Lethbridge to pursue graduate studies in Louisiana.

> When I went to Louisiana, same thing. I spent a lot of time with the Dean of Education. And he would have these dinner parties and he would just invite people. And I'd go often, because I think he liked me because I'm Canadian. So yeah, different social circle. (I)

Kate's reference to the non-musical education she received having dinners in the homes of established musicians and educators, emphasising how different those homes and social

circles were from her family, speaks to how her habitus altered. These experiences also helped her acquire cultural and social capital.

After Tom's passing, I found another mentor in the late Dr. Mary Térey-Smith to whom I wrote my letter. Dr. Térey-Smith took the cultural and social capital I had acquired through Tom's (and Maureen's) help to a higher level. A leading musicologist, her own life had taken her from growing up in Hungary during the war, to assistant conductor of the Budapest Opera, then escaping Hungary after the failed 1956 revolution. I continue to view her as a mentor even though she passed in 2014.

> She was tough as nails, but she loved her students like crazy. She never lost faith in me even though I did myself. [Instead,] she took me with her and really opened up the world on two different playing tours in Central and Eastern Europe in the 1990s. That gave me a broader perspective on life. She also helped me challenge some of my early, ingrained beliefs. … She challenged those things and…was a mentor to me for a long time. Not just in university but after. (I)

Just as Tom's mentorship had never been forced but simply happened and flourished, so had this. At that point in life, it influenced me in new, necessary directions. In retrospect, Tom would not have been as able to provide me with the spiritual guidance and the international experiences as Dr. Térey-Smith had. This is an example how over time we move from one special mentor and broaden out into other mentorships (Schmidt, 2005).

Muireann did not mention anyone specific in her letter, rather writing to a body of people who influenced and challenged her both positively and negatively. However, in the interview she referenced someone who influenced her life when she was establishing her career after immigrating to Canada.

> I met [J.D.] who is a psychologist at the U. She's a Cornell graduate and also graduated from McMaster. And she is extremely privileged. … She grew up on the…east side of Central Park [New York city]. She showed me where she grew up [when] we met up in New York. She believed in my ability [and] that made a difference. (I)

Like Dr. Térey-Smith never losing faith in me, Muireann's description of finding someone who believed in her demonstrates how one person can shape our lives and help us overcome barriers. Also similar is Pedro's reference regarding Tom seeing something in him worth investing time in. Particularly in Muireann's and Pedro's childhoods, there were disruptions that could have resulted in detrimental, lasting effects. However, people arose who provided positive life experiences contributing to "lifelong health, economic and educational achievements" (Pakhale, 2021, p. 1). Mentors can therefore impact the quality of one's entire life.

Though never naming a particular mentor, Oleg spoke of those who had opened his musical and academic world. From Major Scott who conducted the band in Ottawa to the school district superintendent who asked him to begin a music programme in Brooks, Oleg fondly spoke of those who had influenced him. However, he also emphasised the responsibility a mentee must live up to the trust they are shown.

> I tried to do an honest job. The best I knew how, you know. And they realised it. They trusted me you know. I would put on Christmas concerts for them…spring concerts. I would take the kids to the festival. Went to Medicine Hat, Brooks, Red Deer, to provincials and so on. Took them to Moose Jaw. So, they knew. They trusted me. (I)

This quote demonstrates how important it is for mentees to be open to receiving the trust, guidance, care, and, as Varpio (2021) described love that is put in by mentors.

Being Open to Help

Providing guidance regarding deficiencies is a necessary function of mentorships (Bull, 2019a). To best counter feelings of self-negation and provide a safe space in which to interact, mentors need to remember mentees may still be facing challenges because of their habitus and lack of capital (Pakhale, 2021). In return however, students need to be open to criticism, "learning how to work *with* rather than *against* or *in comparison to* others" (Johnsson & Hager, 2008, p. 529, emphasis in original). Mentorship is therefore a reciprocal experience with responsibilities placed upon both parties. This understanding was present in the experiences of several participants.

> [You] have to be willing to receive it…when that person or circumstance comes along in your life. Or someone [wants] to be giving to you in that way. You know, let people help you. Like I said earlier, we all think I did this on my own. I grew up poor. … There's a whole lot of people you don't even know about that are helping and hoping for you. … When that opportunity arises…be willing to, and adventurous enough, to accept it (Pedro, I).

Both Rae and Kate spoke of this openness, stressing you cannot simply be a willing receiver but also actively seek out people and ask for it.

> Find that person or group that can really help you and give you that confidence and security that you're going to need…you have to have a support team. … The biggest piece of advice I would give anybody is to ask for help and see it as a strength (Rae, I).

Kate believes there is always someone, but you must be proactive. "I think it's looking for the people that can help and can guide you. … You just have to find them." (I)

It is a humbling experience to seek the help of others. These experiences demonstrate an aspect of humbleness that must be taken into the mentorship relationship, particularly on behalf of the mentee. Mentors need to be gracious enough to help mentees, who in turn need to be gracious enough to accept it.

> Accept any help people give you with a great deal of grace, and with as much thankfulness as possible. … [This is] key because when you are that way with others, they want to help you and find other people to help you more (Me, I).

This graciousness leads to success. The best mentoring occurs when a mentor sees themselves as inviting rather than commanding a student to experience music (Bull, 2019a). Conversely, the mentee must accept the invitation, open to all aspects of the experience.

Though mentorship is vital for LIWC musicians to successfully alter habitus, acquire capital, and establish themselves in the field, they must be willing to dedicate incredible amounts of work and time to the process. In this regard, the data demonstrated an important aspect of the initial habitus that, if embraced, creates opportunities for success. It is imperative to reach back and apply the necessity of hard work learned early through families, a disposition part of initial habitus.

Applying Initial Habitus to Future Aspirations

Though habitus evolves through various life experiences (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992), some aspects never leave us, potentially to our benefit. The data revealed the example of hard work participants saw during their LIWC upbringing was beneficial in countless life situations, musical and otherwise. Regardless how class position changes through acquiring capital, what is initially learned in our families remains, particularly if those lessons can be transferred to new contexts. Even when someone becomes highly educated, parental influences and culture have longer lasting impacts on work ethic (ter Bogt et al., 2005). Irrespective of the type of work (vocational, professional, or personal), the initial habitus, though altered through new experiences, eventually diminishes the effects of education. As learning is irreversible, our initial habitus remains the basis by which we assimilate into educational, cultural, and economic fields (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990).

Class Influences Identity

Defining different levels of class is complex. Though class is often established through income, this proves oversimplistic considering annual income does not accurately reflect wealth due to regional variations in cost of living (Draut, 2021). For example, the same amount of income earned by someone in Vancouver, Canada versus my city of Lethbridge is incomparable due to exorbitant differences in housing and rental costs. Draut (2021) defines class in broader terms with the working-class as:

> People who, when they go to work or when they act as citizens, have comparatively little power or authority. They…do their jobs under more or less close supervision, who have little control over the pace or the content of their work, who aren't the boss of anyone. (p. 1)

This would be similar for people in a lower income class, most likely with less power.

Families find themselves in a particular class based upon job classification, income, and, as evidenced in this study, the amount of cultural and social capital we possess. Capital is required to advance in any field as we need the right kinds of knowledge and connections to draw upon. For LIWC people, considerable work through formal and informal education must occur to gain capital (Bourdieu, 1986). For example, due to class expectations and limited capital, LIWC students entering higher education have often "undergone stringent selection, precisely in terms of the criterion of linguistic competence (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990, p. 73). As school-based assessment often surrounds the use of and ability to work with language, LIWC students' language ability initially acquired at home is challenging. LIWC students attempting to enter higher education need to work harder and are less selected for positions in various programmes even when they score similarly to others (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). For those that do succeed, once all necessary capital is gained, people are better able to regulate and evaluate themselves against the standard of the field (Skeggs, 2002).

Kuhn (1995/2002) described class as more than something visible. Rather it is interwoven deeply into the essence of who we are. Class being something under our skin describes the experiences of the participants as it speaks to linguistic, cultural, social, and economic capital, as root causes for the feelings and emotions expressed by most. It is therefore understandable that past injustices and injuries are remembered. Workers often feel shame because of feeling inferior (Atwood, 2014) or deprived of dignity, holding great resentment due to "'being treated like nothing,' 'being treated like you was dirt'" (Sennett & Cobb, 1993, p. 139). Pedro spoke of similar experiences growing up and how he would react.

> I was told outright to my face: 'You'll never amount to anything. You're just some piece of shit from the East End.' You know, I could have either sat there and said boohoo, or do what I did to that person. So, I chose the second route, you know, and they never said it again. … I pushed back. It's just instinctive. And I've never felt bad about how I grew up or where I ended up. (I)

Despite not regretting his upbringing, the force with which Pedro recounted this experience demonstrated a similar long-lasting feeling as those quoted by Sennett and Cobb (1993). Muireann's letter to her teachers demonstrated the emotion and frustration at the treatment she had experienced in school.

> I didn't [end] up working on a building site as one of you threatened, or of course the other terrible fate of being pregnant at 16. Others did. Others died. Others became addicted. Others didn't thrive. Others gave up. But now I have their voice. You see that's the thing, what very nearly killed me in fact did make me stronger. (I)

I struggled in school and church with perceptions from teachers and fellow church members. At times, I encountered them again as a successful teacher.

> My parents were black sheep and therefore we were black sheep. And my brothers were so much trouble in school. ... Years later…I taught these two girls from a family where their dad had gone to high school with my oldest brother back in Smithers. After a concert one time he came up to me and congratulated me…and indicated it was amazing what I accomplished with those kids. … And then he said something I'll never forget: 'You know it really amazes me because none of us ever expected anything good to come out of the Griffioens.' How do you answer that? (I)

Atwood (2014) described how LIWC students often endure stereotyping and discrimination by teachers and administrators in schools:

> Teachers saw they were poor and stereotyped them. One third of the memoirists cite examples of discriminatory behaviour by teachers or administrators. Alfred Kazin wrote that the teachers 'expected natural savagery' from the students at his Brownsville [Brooklyn] school (p. 17). A high school teacher told Rick Bragg that 'a boy like me ought to think about a good trade school' (p. xx). Mary Childers was the 'only welfare kid in the highest-track classes.' 'I…stand out too much.'… [My] fourth-grade teacher tormented me by telling the entire class I got an F in Hygiene for crud under my nails and no proof of dental and eye exams in my files.' (p. 492)

The education system is not always the supportive institution LIWC students need. This is clear in the experiences of these authors, the work of Bourdieu and Passeron (1990), and Pedro, Muireann, and my accounts. Earlier, I spoke of Rob's experience of receiving no help in his musical aspirations from his high school band teacher. If education cannot be counted on to provide the supports necessary for LIWC youth, then what does?

To succeed in achieving a different life, all the participants in this study found we had to cling to the values and work ethic we had learned in our families. Despite needing to acquire capital and evolve our habitus, simultaneously we had to retain aspects of our initial habitus.

The Work We Did

Within this study, all the participants shared types of work they did before establishing themselves in their fields. Yet, there was not a uniform approach to working blue collar jobs in all of us. Sometimes, these lasted quite a few years, tempting us to embrace that existence due to the stability it offered.

For a long time, Pedro would study music, work in a fish processing plant, move away to play trumpet, and eventually return to Vancouver and back to the fish plant. After spending one month working in a petrol station at age fifteen, I switched jobs and spent most of the next eleven years working part-time and, for two long periods, full-time in lumber mills. Kate grew up working for her father in his construction shop cleaning, selling paint, mowing lawns at his rentals, and eventually turned to lifeguarding at pools. Muireann spent

time working with her father on a tree farm, with horses, and as a house and business cleaner, the latter while she sang in clubs at night. Growing up in a family where her father was a farmer, grain elevator agent and buyer, caretaker, and bus fleet supervisor, Rae babysat for others and helped around the house, particularly while her mother went back to school to earn her teaching degree. Oleg worked on the farm his father eventually purchased near Brooks but while in Calgary for university, he worked in a meat packing plant and continued in the summer. While in Ottawa he drove taxicabs and bartended in pubs.

Though we all grew up in LIWC families, and most did work in a similar sector as their parents, Rob and Craig did not to the same degree. Craig didn't reference any types of work until he completed university and became a parole officer. Rob, however, spoke of how he had spent a short amount of time working in his uncle's cylinder plant. After two weeks lifting and bagging cylinders, Rob quit. He then avoided blue-collar work, placing all his efforts into establishing himself musically. "It was quite a difficult job. It was very tough on the body. … Once I got my music career going, I just did…lessons and gigs to make a living until I got my full music education job." (I) In the next section, Rob provides a valid reason for why he did not pursue any more working-class jobs, and it was something more of us struggled with.

Stability is Tempting

Rob's greatest fear was not leaving a well-paying industrial job. The temptation of what at that time were jobs with an income that could buy a house and vehicle were very real and Rob doubled down on his musical goals.

> I think if I got into it, I might have gotten trapped to continue doing it. I kind of tried to have a high standard where I wasn't going to change my goal with music. And you know, sometimes it was tough trying to get some money. (I)

Becoming established in a musical career means meagre wages and taking every performance opportunity available. It is not a stable existence and there the temptation lies to give up and embrace what you know. Pedro spoke of how he had to stay focused on his musical goals as the fish plant, and other working-class jobs his friends performed, offered more stability than music did.

> I would see…working-class friends, families and people I knew acquire stability: the things, the car, the nice homes, the TVs. And while I was struggling to be a musician, you know, it seemed like an easy, easy thing to do. I, I quit a couple of times to concentrate on just getting financially a little bit more secure. But each time I went back to playing music. (I)

I also struggled with leaving behind the stable pay and benefits industry provided versus the unknowns of a music career. It was tempting, and thankfully I received solid advice from a lifetime employee at the mill and my father who recognised it early in 1991.

> I'll never forget one lifer in the mill one evening. We had a…breakdown and we'd all cleaned our areas. We sat around chatting, waiting for the planer to start up. And he says to me, 'You know Keith, you have something that will get you out of here. Run with it. Don't look back. Don't do this for the rest of your life like me. I've got nothing. You do.' That made a big impression on me. (I)

My father, who had worked at the mill since 1956, was quite blunt when addressing this temptation.

> Dad said, 'God has given you a talent and you are going to do something with this. I will not let you stay here for the money and marry somebody and land up in a mortgage and never leave. You have way more to you and you'll never be happy with that. I will kick your ass down the road if I have to.' I learned a lot from him to never give up. (I)

Like Pedro, I also moved back and forth from musical study to the mill and in the end, finished my music degree without a student loan. It was the only way we could accomplish what we had in music.

As per Rob's account, the temptation to return to one's roots and what one knows are very real, and of us all, he expressed this the clearest. Yet what will be seen is, like us all, the impressions left upon Rob from his parents' work ethic, and how this became part of habitus, helped lead to career success in music and otherwise.

Work Ethic

Byrne (2017) described work ethic as "a value-based motivation for working" based upon "social status, duty, and wealth or, simply, money" (p. 1). Byrne (2017) also included pride in one's craft as a part of work ethic. This study's participants all shared how the example of hard work was set for them through parents and family. Witnessed from early ages, this became part of our habitus and was a resource to draw upon for success in music and other professions.

Bull (2019a) claimed Classical music is an area where the willingness to work hard is most evident as the discipline and work of daily practice is labour intensive. The data from this study demonstrated this is true for all musicians regardless of genre. Just as Bourdieu and Passeron (1990) wrote LIWC students must work harder to be accepted even when their results are similar to others, Bull (2019a) found those from the centre of the field, or from classes and groups traditionally viewed as lazy, believed they had to work particularly hard. This is because LIWC musicians have far more to lose should they not succeed than those already part of professional and upper classes with less to prove (Bull, 2019a). Though nearly

all the participants successfully completed higher education, and all have experienced successful careers within music or other fields, our willingness to work hard was an example that came predominantly through our home lives rather than education. What we learned at home was applied to musical study and practice and, as per ter Bogt, Raaijmakers, and van Wel's (2005) findings, this has proven to last longest. Participants spoke of the value hard work performed in working-class jobs provided.

> Like the Good Book says…if you don't work you don't eat. So basically, it's the work ethic, you know. Doesn't matter what you do. I've done all kinds of things. But you did it. And I must say, I was always rehired when I needed. Work ethic… instilled by the parents (Oleg, I).

> I think the lessons from both my grandparents, my grandfather anyway, and my Dad is that if the thing is worth doing, it's worth doing well. It's probably something deeply ingrained in me (Craig, I).

> My parents…came to Canada with very little. They lived through the Depression, the war, post-war shortages, immigration. They spent half their life poor. … I remember as a little kid having to go with my Dad to the coal mine in the fall… How hard he worked to put food on our table and keep our house warm. It taught me early if I was going to succeed, I needed to work hard (Me, I).

> Hard work, you know, I think that comes from my background for sure. My dad worked hard. He expected us to work hard. … And I think that is what has always stuck with me. … The grit and the resilience, right? A lot of those pieces in music, for sure. The dedication, the commitment, the work that you have to do. All those things have helped me be who I am now (Kate, I).

> There's no substitute for most people than putting in the time. And you could delude yourself that oh, I put in the time. I don't know what happened because I really practiced, or I really worked hard at this. … You know what? Someone else worked a little harder. That's always been my means of getting ahead. … It's a bit of a lonely road too because, you know, you're sitting at home on Friday night going, I got a concert next week and I gotta learn that. Your friend [is like], 'let's go for pizza and beer.' 'No, man, I gotta learn this.' And they're like, 'what do you mean you got to learn? You already did three hours today.' No, I got to put in another hour you know (Pedro, I).

For Muireann, the hard manual work she performed was necessary for survival. That meant finding a way no matter what had to be done.

> You know, the weak don't survive. And you kind of come to peace with that in a really early age. … I [left] France and there's like, no home. No house to go to. I'm 19. And no skills other than singing, right? No GSCEs, no nothing. But by God I can hold a crowd. I don't even have a driver's license so how am I going to get to my gigs? So, I work in a car dealership, and before I've even got my driver's license, I'm selling cars. (I)

Aside from Oleg, Muireann did more types of work beginning at an early age than anyone else such as cleaning toilets, teaching in prisons, and working in recruitment. Survival meant doing everything possible to provide food and a roof over one's head. Survival was something she'd witnessed her entire life at home.

Rob's determination came from knowing how much his parents had sacrificed for him though the jobs they did were not lucrative. He shared how working-class influences at home and in his habitus impacted his life.

> I took it with me. You know, a lot of those ideals definitely helped me out. … They made me who I am, and they got me where I needed to be. You know…what I learned in that small town, and how I was brought up in a working-class family, I think that only benefited me. … Work ethic, and, you know, right and wrong moral questions, that type of stuff. You know, I think that really helped me out. (I)

Rae spoke of how her father never backed away from doing any form of work whether it was in his skillset or not.

> My dad…must have done at least twenty different things from coal mining to selling insurance. I mean, he just went the whole gamut just to…get food on the table for his kids and family. … He did whatever he had to do. And I don't think he ever said, 'No, I can't do that.' He just said, 'Okay, I'll do that.' I think about my dad repairing farm machinery. He couldn't Google it or go to YouTube to find out how to do it. He just had to figure it out. And there was no complaining. (I)

What we learned about work ethic from our LIWC families and upbringing is a form of Bourdieu and Passeron's (1990) concept of pedagogic work as it has endured and been applied throughout our lives. However, it is important to remember our parents did not work hard with this purpose in mind. Rather, they did so along what Muireann described as a form of survival. Like every generation throughout history, they worked to gain food, clothing, and shelter and their efforts helped us, their children, experience things like music in ways they never had. The pedagogic work done by parents and mentors combined with our embrace of the difficult work necessary for success, created a path by which we could acquire capital, evolve habitus, and transcend to different social and cultural contexts throughout our lives.

Chapter Six – Discussion

This study focused upon what factors contributed to the successful class trajectory and career mobility of LIWC musicians. Bourdieu's theory of social reproduction framed the research with autobiographical methodology utilised to explore the experiences of eight participants, including myself, who had grown up in LIWC circumstances and had successfully achieved social mobility. Though some established musical careers, others embraced different forms of employment.

The following chapter summarises key findings that arose from the participants' stories. These include how deficits of original habitus and capital create barriers for LIWC musicians distant from the centre of the field. Another key finding is that the severity of these deficits differs depending upon the aspirations of individuals, increasing when one attempts to break away from their social class. As capital is difficult to acquire, challenges compound depending upon gender and sexism is a barrier specific to LIWC women. All participants needed mentorship or simply the help of others to overcome these challenges. Though everyone eventually succeeded in rising above their original class, establishing themselves in careers and higher income classes, maintaining their original LIWC habitus and working-class proved imperative for success. I will then outline the implications this study has for music and education and how it contributes to a gap in present research. Finally, I will address the need for future research regarding LIWC musicians and social reproduction.

Findings

An overarching finding in this study was the degree to which participants encountered social reproduction depended upon individual goals. With few exceptions, the greater the focus upon a professional music career, the greater the barriers. Deficits of cultural and social capital resulting from initial habitus were most intensely felt by participants with professional aspirations. This was experienced regardless of the participants' primary musical genre.

Second, nearly everyone encountered struggles due to habitus and lacking cultural and social capital. I recognised alongside the development of one's original habitus, people similarly develop a musical habitus through exposure to their family's musical tastes (cultural capital). Often, this led to a continued interest in a particular musical genre, however through tastes expanded through encounters with new musical experiences and musical habitus evolved.

Likewise, each participant needed to acquire cultural and social capital to succeed as the amount they inherited from their family and class was insufficient. However, the age at which this process began differed depending upon generation. For Rae and Pedro, this occurred through post-secondary or performance situations. Being a generation younger with

better economic situations, Kate, Rob, and I began accumulating capital as teenagers. Muireann cultivated capital in both her teens and adulthood in a musical environment rougher than other participants. Lacking cultural capital was not something Oleg and Craig claimed to have felt in musical settings and I determined this was due to not having professional aspirations and primarily remaining in their initial musical habitus.

As Craig and Oleg participated in music socially, they did not feel socially out of place in groups and ensembles. This differed for Rae, Muireann, Pedro, and I as we needed to acquire social capital for musical advancement. This resulted from distance to the centre of the field both socially and geographically. Rae and I needed to learn aspects of city life while simultaneously gaining cultural capital through advanced study. Muireann and Pedro required social capital to engage with diverse cultural and social settings as their initial habitus caused them to fight back or flee a situation. Kate and Rob were outliers regarding social capital but in differing ways. Her mother's pedagogic work and travelling to Edmonton and Red Deer socially prepared Kate for a different life. Yet for Rob, though he embraced classical guitar study to enhance his musical abilities, he remained on the social periphery of the music field as guitar is an isolated instrument. Also, his love for rock did not fit into a traditional music programme, a situation he continues to experience today as a Contemporary Music teacher in middle school.

The participants' experiences helped me conclude as habitus evolves, the need for social and cultural capital rises depending upon one's goals and context. This contradicts Bourdieu's (1984) claim musical taste is a decisive indicator of class. Reflecting upon this, I recognised that since Bourdieu's writing, musical genres have undergone great changes, particularly in blending once diverse styles. Also, the proliferation of technology has made all musical genres accessible to everyone and taste has become omnivorous (Coulson, 2010; Peterson & Kern, 1996; Prior, 2013; Rimmer, 2012; Savage, 2006). It is important to acknowledge because since Bourdieu died in 2002, he did not witness the rapid technological changes of the past two decades, limiting his understanding of musical taste to his own era.

The third finding pertained to distance from the centre of the field (Bourdieu, 1986; Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990; Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). The experiences of all but one of this study's participants demonstrated the concept of distance is not only sociological but also geographical. Growing up in small towns limited access to higher levels of music. Due to Canada's immense size, travelling hundreds and even thousands of kilometres at early ages were common. Kate, Rob, Pedro, and I left for the United States for portions of our studies resulting in higher education costs as international students. Muireann's dysfunctional family caused her to immigrate far from Ireland and England to begin a new life. Bourdieu's silence

on this is likely due to size differences between France and Canada. In a Canadian context, geographical distance to musical centres (Vancouver, Toronto, Montréal) compounds challenges due to limited economic capital.

The fourth finding was that all the women had experienced added barriers in the form of sexism. However, how sexism was manifested depended upon generation and context. From a Boudieusian (2001) perspective, I ascertained much of what the women experienced during the 1960s through 1980s was a form of symbolic violence, particularly early in that period, as male domination in music and education was widespread and therefore imperceptible. However, for the remaining women, it was described as much more overt due to location. Here I found social reproduction helpful but inadequate to analyse their experiences and turned to feminist intersectional theory. Doing so brought out a greater depth of understanding of the women's experiences and how these were generationally, geographically, and culturally specific.

Experiences with sexism added a layer of complexity regarding social reproduction and proved an important finding. Sexism is still prevalent in the musical field today, particularly so in the Classical, brass subfields as two-thirds of orchestra conductors are men (Bull, 2019b), and amongst orchestral brass players, eighty-seven percent and higher (depending upon instrument) are men (Sergeant & Himonides, 2019). An area of future research is needed to determine how this affects LIWC musicians (see below).

The fifth finding was revealed through all but one participant having experienced episodes of self-doubt resulting from original habitus and capital deficits. Apart from Oleg, self-doubt arose at different points in the remaining participants' lives caused by different contexts and experiences. These included whether a participant performed in professional situations, career aspirations, musical genre, personal, educational attainments, or personal responses to challenging situations. Religion and working in academia were also sources of self-doubt depending upon the participant.

I struggled to determine whether self-doubt originates from internal or external forces. Self-doubt can result from one's initial habitus (Bourdieu & Wacqaunt, 1992) but also from real or imaginary judgments of others (Skeggs, 2002). Though most participants expressed they believed self-doubt originated internally, there were also intense emotional accounts of being poorly treated or spoken to. This demonstrated regardless how we convinced ourselves our doubts were from within, this was a possible façade to cover up feelings of inadequacy because of habitus and class.

Literature regarding self-doubt demonstrated a similar debate regarding internal or external sources of self-doubt. Kuhn (1995/2002) claimed class goes deeper than clothing,

language, tastes, or education. It is under our skin and at the core of who we are, and we attach value to ourselves when feeling out of place. Conversely, Bourdieu (1984) spoke of a terroristic form of treatment that occurs to people who fall short in the eyes of those who control fields. I therefore concluded that the origins of our self-doubts are the result of symbolic violence embedded within us. While some originate internally, it is more the result of understanding the rules of the game (external) and harbouring feelings of illegitimacy (Mallman, 2017), often causing self-elimination from opportunity (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990; Sennett & Cobb, 1972). The internalisation of the views of those who control the field, whether positive or negative, pass on in families causing generational views of self-worth (Jones, 2008; Kuhn, 1995/2002; Sennett & Cobb, 1972).

The sixth finding was found in how everyone needed outside help to succeed; no one was able to through their own efforts. For some, help came from various people, employers, and friendships in casual ways whereas others experienced it through formal and informal mentorship. A unifying factor was that such help, casual or mentoring, was given selflessly by others who saw something worth investing in. This was demonstrated as a form of trust and friendship for demanding work by some participants while others spoke of having been casually helped by friends and colleagues. Family was also named as a source of support whereas Muireann spoke and wrote of the immense thankfulness she felt towards schoolteachers she had who did not other her. The time and encouragement provided by supporters and mentors was juxtaposed to the criticisms of others and contributed to overcoming initial habitus.

Though informal mentorships entered willingly rather than institutionally imposed succeed best (Allen et al., 2006; Cohen et al., 2007), an exception was found in Rae's experience. It was also clear while some mentors helped us with career functions others also supported participants through psychosocial functions: emotional support, meals, a place to sleep, or time spent together (Higgins, 2000; Kram, 1985). Often, mentors provided introductions to important people in the field, guidance regarding social and musical situations, and instruction in life away from home. They provided musical employment and educational or career supports. Most importantly, mentors did not give up on us when we experienced difficulties. Mentors helped in ways our families could not, becoming akin to family. And when a mentor suddenly passed, it was like an important family member had been lost, the void never again filled (Yamada, 2011).

It was also found that help came from more than one mentor or person in our lives. This demonstrated how people often have a particular mentor early in their development but as they progress, the amount and types of influential people diversifies (Schmidt, 2005).

Because of assistance from mentors and others, all experienced positive changes socially, economically, and educationally (Pakhale, 2021). The mentors spoken of in this study played valuable roles, impacting entire lives.

A sub finding under mentorship was LIWC musicians need to be open to the help of others. Doing so teaches us to work with, rather than against, people (Johnsson & Hager, 2008). No one accomplishes everything alone. Rather, many people work for our good, including some we are unaware of. This also requires LIWC musicians be vulnerable enough to ask for help and, when they do, people willing to help are available. Graciously and thankfully accepting the help of others is key to finding others when needed. Overall, the participants' experiences demonstrated the reciprocal nature mentorships require to be most effective.

Despite arguments criticising Bourdieusian social reproduction as over deterministic (Jenkins, 1982; Giroux, 1983), this study demonstrated class homogeneity exists simultaneously with diversity (Bourdieu, 1977b), and initial habitus evolves due to new experiences and circumstances (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). As all the participants today live differently than they had been raised (some akin; some considerably different), this study demonstrates habitus cannot remain static and must evolve continually when encountering new experiences (Hall, 2015; Wright, 2015). However, the final finding revealed in this study is that though all participants' habitus evolved, everyone maintained values inherited from their LIWC beginnings. Every participant shared they applied the work ethic observed in their families to new careers and situations; how this remained with them regardless of changes in class and habitus. Work ethic proved transferable to other contexts throughout life. Despite education, capital accumulation, and change the influences of parents and culture were longer lasting influences applied to new situations (ter Bogt et al., 2005). From these, we all experienced a key tenet of social reproduction theory: Learning is irreversible, and though new experiences and situations change us, initial habitus remains a basis by which we assimilate into new fields and classes (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). Though life becomes forever altered, initial class remains part of identity, the result of the pedagogic work done by parents and caregivers from the onset of life.

Wider Contributions

This study contributes to literature relating to the needs of LIWC musicians, including children through to early adulthood. It focused upon types of capital deficits such students enter music with because of habitus. Awareness regarding what students may be lacking before they enter the teaching studio or classroom enables music educators to provide mentorship and learning experiences that meet the needs of the whole person. This may

require educators to address assumptions they make about LIWC students' ability to learn music. As we all bring our own ontological perspectives to teaching music, we may not understand the degree of help LIWC students require. Music educators and mentors must learn about the cultures and classes of their students, particularly those less affluent (Bates, 2018). Not doing so will impose a hierarchy emphasising the importance of their own tastes over those of students. Because the musical habitus of the participants was grounded in broad genres, this study demonstrates learning elite, Classical music is not the only guarantee of social mobility (Bates, 2018). In all cases, the musical genre was less a factor than the openness of the people that helped along the journey. This study therefore demonstrates how imperative becoming educated and caring about music students' backgrounds is regardless of instructional levels and contexts.

Working in his time, Bourdieu (1984) believed the working-class tends to embrace popular music, or popular forms of Classical music, a belief that continues to be indicated by studies today (Bull, 2019a). The findings of this study challenge such misconceptions. Only one participant focused upon a single genre while the remainder perform(ed) multiple styles from classical to jazz to pop, rock, and show music. This demonstrates assumptions regarding what students know or may become interested in must never be made. Once exposed to different genres, the remaining participants broadened their musical tastes and abilities. Just as habitus evolves because of new information and experiences (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992), so too does musical habitus.

The results of this study also contribute to discourses regarding whether formal musical study in schools or post-secondary institutions is key for lifelong career success and higher wages (National Association for Music Education, 2007; Olson, 2008). Whilst this is demonstrated in some participants, it is not uniformly so. Rather, though music learning was important, the acquisition of capital, evolving habitus, overcoming self-doubt, hard work, and mentorship proved more vital for success, and these could be applied to other fields and classes as well. These findings demonstrate educators and policymakers must address challenges of class and lower income simultaneously with providing access to music that is increasingly becoming more expensive for LIWC people (Bates, 2018). Musical study may correlate to lifelong success but is not the sole cause (Bates, 2011). This study demonstrates that while music is important in education there are more aspects to studying it that impact success and class mobility, aspects that can be applied across various disciplines and fields.

The results I found also counter popular programmes pushing the concept music makes us smarter (Jenkins, 2001; Schellenberg, 2006). These do not provide empirical results regarding the importance of music making, particularly for its own sake. Music must never be

a means to an end, studied for how it impacts other fields. Musical participation must provide its own, rather than simply extrinsic, rewards. The findings demonstrate when music was focused upon with professional aspirations the number of barriers experienced by those participants increased and became more complex. We must not view music solely as a means for advancement for LIWC people, but rather as something to be enjoyed that may or may not hold benefits to personal development regardless of class and income (Bates, 2018).

Future Research

Whilst the use of Bourdieu's social reproduction theory was a valuable framework by which to conduct this research, the rapid pace of change during the last twenty years would require future research to consider alternative frameworks. For example, the evolution of taste communities rather than music by class (Savage, 2006) requires future studies regarding music and class will need to move beyond him. The research begun in this study needs to move beyond looking backwards for answers and instead move forward and focus upon what people may become more so than who they were (Webb et al., 2017). Future research also needs to focus less on the interests of those most powerful in a field and rather at the possibilities of those not so powerful (Fraser, 2005). Mentorship and clinging to one's work ethic helped the participants in this study to overcome the effects of habitus and lack of capital, however today's youth hold more agency and a willingness to challenge long established social structures. Because younger participants come from less homogenous backgrounds, future research may need to move beyond Bourdieu and utilise an intersectional framework in its place due to social and demographic changes.

This study has therefore laid a foundation for future research in several areas. First, it is important to study distance to the centre of a field not only from a sociological perspective (already done extensively) but also regarding geographical distance since this distance increases the amount and intensity of challenges LIWC people encounter. Increased costs and culture shock regarding movement to new locations are but two examples of such challenges.

Second, more research regarding music education and performance as experienced by LIWC women must be undertaken. Over thirty years has passed since Rae, Kate, and Muireann's experience, and it must be determined whether progress has been made in this area and to what more must be done.

Finally, the impacts of social reproduction in musical fields on BIPOC and gender diverse LIWC people must be studied. Again, due to the era in which I was researching, and the contacts I was able to make regarding participants, I recognise my participants were homogenous except for age and sex. While this study lays a foundation for the experiences of

LIWC musicians, it could not address how social reproduction impacts people in multicultural, diverse populations and younger generations in which we live today.

Impacts on My Practice

Conducting this study changed my teaching beyond musical instruction alone. Having spent my career teaching music in schools and post-secondary music education to future teachers, I found as the findings were revealed I applied them to every class and practicum observation I taught or conducted. Though I have always been a student-centred educator, this increased exponentially throughout the course of this degree programme as I delved into reflection, social reproduction, and autobiographical methodology. Examining my own past and the experiences of others caused me to take a greater interest in the lives of my students beyond the material I was teaching. As someone who has taught more post-secondary assessment and evaluation than music education, I found myself applying the findings of this study to that discipline as well, recognising how traditional forms of evaluation work in favour of dominant classes (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). This allowed students of all backgrounds to recognise how schools continue to risk favouring those near the centre of fields. Sharing experiences of my past with future teachers created a safe classroom where they could share their own frustrations either verbally or in written form. Students increasingly came to me regarding their struggles (academically or socially), and I was better able to help them cope with these because I had experienced many myself. I was also equipped to help them understand the importance of being open to the help of others, directing them to available campus, or other, resources.

I also found while I never lowered my standards and expectations for future teachers (music and otherwise), I changed when observing them in the field. Before conducting this study and doctoral programme, I would describe myself as a gatekeeper of the profession. I spent more time pointing out deficiencies in students rather than asking questions that provided insight into why they were struggling. I became a more supportive educator as I recognised the need to supervise novice teachers in similar ways I was mentored. This resulted in being called upon by the field experiences office to observe struggling students not under my direct supervision, sometimes gently guiding them in making difficult decisions whether to continue or otherwise. This study helped me remember the depth to which I was helped by others long ago; experiences that fade over time, particularly as one experiences success.

Finally, this study has prepared me for a new phase of my career as I am returning to teaching middle school band and Social Studies. Once again, I find myself called upon to save a once great band programme that is now barely hanging on to existence. Though this is

not where I had expected this doctoral programme to lead me, this study caused me to accept and embrace such a role more readily. I sense a vocational calling to help provide students, many who are LIWC, experience music at a high level, hopefully contributing to their future paths. Perhaps a few will pursue music professionally, but that is not most important. Ultimately, I will be applying a greater understanding than ever regarding how to help students gain social and cultural capital, evolve habitus, and develop and apply work ethic. I better understand how teaching, though a formal profession, can function as an informal mentorship. I also am better equipped to help students address self-doubts and anxieties that have increased exponentially since I left schools nearly eight years ago. Ultimately, this study has led me once again to give back what I received from others throughout my own story: an opportunity.

WORD COUNT: 61,617

Appendices

Appendix A – Ethics Approval

College of Social Sciences

12 November 2020

Dear Keith Griffioen

College of Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee

Project Title: How do Working-Class Musicians Transition to Different Social and Cultural Contexts Throughout Their Careers?

Application No: 400200015

The College Research Ethics Committee has reviewed your application and has agreed that there is no objection on ethical grounds to the proposed study. It is happy therefore to approve the project, subject to the following conditions:

- Start date of ethical approval: 12/11/2020
- Project end date: 31/12/2023
- Any outstanding permissions needed from third parties in order to recruit research participants or to access facilities or venues for research purposes must be obtained in writing and submitted to the CoSS Research Ethics Administrator before research commences. Permissions you must provide are shown in the *College Ethics Review Feedback* document that has been sent to you as the Collated Comments Document in the online system.
- The data should be held securely for a period of ten years after the completion of the research project, or for longer if specified by the research funder or sponsor, in accordance with the University's Code of Good Practice in Research: (https://www.gla.ac.uk/media/media_490311_en.pdf)
- The research should be carried out only on the sites, and/or with the groups and using the methods defined in the application.
  - **Approval has been granted in principal**: no data collection must be undertaken until the current research restrictions as a result of social distancing and self-isolation are lifted. You will be notified once this restriction is no longer in force.
- Any proposed changes in the protocol should be submitted for reassessment as an amendment to the original application. The **Request for Amendments to an Approved Application** form should be used: https://www.gla.ac.uk/colleges/socialsciences/students/ethics/forms/staffandpostgraduateresearchstudents/

Yours sincerely,

Dr Muir Houston
College Ethics Officer
Muir Houston, Senior Lecturer
College of Social Sciences Ethics Officer
Social Justice, Place and Lifelong Education Research
University of Glasgow
School of Education, St Andrew's Building, 11 Eldon Street
Glasgow G3 6NH
0044+141-330-4699 Muir.Houston@glasgow.ac.uk

Appendix B – Plain Language Statement

College of Social Sciences

Participant Information Sheet

Title: How Do Working-Class Musicians Transition to Different Social and Cultural Contexts Throughout Their Careers?

Description: This study will explore possible ways in which music education benefits society, particularly in gaining experiences, knowledge, and skills that assist people in overcoming an expected class existence due to where they were raised. This study will be autobiographical, contrasting my story of growing up in a working-class home yet becoming a semi-professional musician and music educator, to that of five to eight other individuals with common experiences. Though some participants became professional musicians, others chose different career paths, however all of our lives have been impacted by the study and performance of music. Methods will include am interview, my responses to the same questions, and a letter written to someone who greatly impacted us personally and/or professionally. I hope this study will contribute to a growing amount of research exploring the benefits of music education for students growing up in impoverished and working classes.

You are being invited to take part in this research study. Before you decide to take part, please take some time to understand its purpose and methods. Feel free to contact me and ask for clarity if necessary.

Purpose of the Study: This study is being completed as part of my Doctorate in Education dissertation. I believe music education advocacy is an increasingly important topic as government education cuts, as well as the current Covid-19 pandemic, threaten the existence of music programmes in schools. As someone who prepares future music teachers, I have found that often, students who study music education often originate from supportive families able to afford the cost of musical experiences. They are therefore not always aware that many children cannot afford private lessons, summer camps, etc. that allow for advanced development. I hope this study will contribute not only to research regarding the importance of music education for impoverished and working-class students, but also help teacher educators better prepare future music teachers for students regardless of social background. Finally, I also believe the results may help working-class and impoverished students gain knowledge and skills that enable them to thrive in social class not their own.

The Researcher:
I have been an educator for 20 years teaching music performance classes, Canadian history, and athletics courses in both private and public schools. For thirteen years I taught in secondary school settings and am currently in my sixth-year teaching future educators at a university. I grew up in an immigrant, working-class home and though expected to work in some capacity in the forest industry, developed an ability to play trumpet at a high level. The forest industry became my economic springboard to studying music and I have spent most of my life living and working in the field of music performance and education, a very different existence than expected. Knowing the impact music and education had on my life, I very much would like to research if this is something that others experienced too, and in the process, advocate for music education's inclusion in schools.

Your Part: Please understand that participation is completely voluntary, and you do not have to be part of the study. If you do, you will be asked complete a one to two-hour face-to-face or Zoom interview (depending upon the pandemic, distance, or participant preference) based upon questions I have designed. These questions may also include sub-questions that arise during the interview.

Interviews will be audio-recorded only. You will also be asked to write a letter to a person that highly influenced you in your journey from a working-class upbringing to that of a professional career, music or otherwise.

Confidentiality: Your personal details will be kept as confidential as possible. Your actual name will only be used on the consent form after which you will be assigned a code. Using this code, I will ask you for your verbal consent at the beginning of the recorded interview and you will be asked to provide a pseudonym for by which you will be referred to from that point forward. The names of the persons you choose to write your letters to will also need a pseudonym and I will never know their names to protect their anonymity. Before submission, you will be granted the right of response and may request any data you feel uncomfortable with to be removed. Should at any time you wish, or need, to withdraw from the study, you are free to do so with no explanation. In both cases, that data will be removed from the study.

Data Retention: All materials involving you (audio-recording, hard and digital transcripts, letter, data analysis) will be kept on an encrypted USB pen drive, guarded by a password, and locked in my filing cabinet in my private office at the University of Lethbridge as well as on the University of Glasgow's Enlighten (research) depository. This will only be visible to myself and my primary and secondary supervisor. All personal data will be destroyed upon completion of the dissertation (31/12/2023) and all research data will be kept in the University of Glasgow Enlighten depository for ten years before being destroyed (31/12/2023).

Intended Output: The purpose of this study is to fulfil the requirements of my doctoral dissertation. As the topic being researched is of value to music teacher educators, I also intend to eventually utilise parts of the data for journal articles/conference papers to allow the research to have a wider audience and impact.

Further Information: Please note that confidentiality may not be completely guaranteed due to the limited size of the participant sample. You will therefore receive the final manuscript before submission and have the Right to Reply and have anything you wish to have removed done so before submission.

This project has been considered and approved by the College Research Ethics Committee of the University of Glasgow, College of Social Sciences. To pursue any complaint about the conduct of the research: contact the College of Social Sciences Ethics Officer, Dr Muir Houston, email: Muir.Houston@glasgow.ac.uk

Thank you for reading this.

Keith Griffioen – Researcher
Phone:
Email:

Dr. Bonnie Slade – Supervisor
Phone: +01413306418
Email: Bonnie.Slade@glasgow.ac.uk

Appendix C – Consent Form

College of Social Sciences

Consent Form

Title of Project: How Do Working-Class Musicians Transition to Different Social and Cultural Contexts Throughout Their Careers?
Name of Researcher: Keith Griffioen
Name of Supervisor: Dr. Bonnie Slade

Please tick as appropriate

Yes ☐ No ☐ I confirm that I have read and understood the Participant Information Sheet for the above study and have had the opportunity to ask questions.

Yes ☐ No ☐ I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw at any time, without giving any reason.

Consent on Method

Yes ☐ No ☐ I consent to in-person interviews if possible, depending upon the Covid-19 pandemic.

Yes ☐ No ☐ I consent to interviews being audio-recorded via Zoom due to distance from the researcher or the current Covid-19 pandemic.

Yes ☐ No ☐ I consent to the use of my written letter to a person of influence who shall be named by a pseudonym.

Consent Regarding Confidentiality

Yes ☐ No ☐ I acknowledge that I will be referred to by a code after providing written consent and a pseudonym after providing verbal consent at the beginning of the recorded interview.

Yes ☐ No ☐ I acknowledge that confidentiality may be impossible to guarantee in the event of the disclosure of harm or danger to the participants.

Yes ☐ No ☐ I acknowledge that confidentiality may be impossible to guarantee due to the small sample size.

Yes ☐ No ☐ I acknowledge that the name of the person of influence I write a letter to will be referred to by the pseudonym I choose for them only.

Yes ☐ No ☐ I acknowledge that the names of any other people that arise in the interviews should be referred to by pseudonym, and that should they be named will need to read and sign a shortened Information Sheet and Consent form.

Yes ☐ No ☐ I acknowledge that I understand that when I am presented with the final manuscript before submission, I have the *Right to Reply* and request anything I am uncomfortable with to be removed and it will be destroyed.

Consent Regarding Data Storage and Retention
I agree that:

Yes ☐ No ☐ All names and other material likely to identify participants will be given codes and pseudonyms.

Yes ☐ No ☐ The material will be treated as confidential and kept in secure storage at all times.

Yes ☐ No ☐ Personal data will be destroyed upon completion of the dissertation - 12/31/2023.

Yes ☐ No ☐ I waive my copyright to any data collected as part of this project.

Consent Regarding the Possible Use of the Interviews, Data, and Analysis for Future Work

Yes ☐ No ☐ I acknowledge that the researcher may use the interviews, data, and analysis for inclusion in future journal articles or conference papers.

Consent clause

I agree to take part in this research study ☐

I do not agree to take part in this research study ☐

Name of Participant
Signature
Date
Name of Researcher Keith Griffioen
Signature
Date

Appendix D – Interview Questions

1. When and where were you born?
2. What did your parents/family do for employment when you were growing up?
3. Did you ever do similar work in your life?
4. What place, if any, did music have in your home?
5. How did you choose which musical instrument(s) to learn?
6. Were you able to access formal or informal music education as a child/teenager?
7. Did music influence your social interactions with others?
8. Did you encounter barriers that needed to be overcome to succeed in your career path?
9. How did you meet those challenges (musically or non-musically)?
10. How did you gain social networks as your life changed from working to professional class?
11. Did you ever feel out of place because of where you came from?
12. Were working-class influences left behind as you took a different life path?
13. Are there ways music shaped or prepared you for the career you have now?
14. Do family and friends you grew up with ‘get’ your current life?
15. What career advice would you give a young person growing up in a situation similar to you?

Appendix E – Three-dimensional Space Approach Analysis

CHART A

Interview Experiential, Temporal Data

Participant:

Past	Present (and looking back from the present)	Future (Continuity)
1. When and where were you born?		
Each question was listed at the beginning of each row and filled out across the columns.		

Source: Adapted from Ollerenshaw and Creswell (2002).

CHART B

Letter Experiential, Temporal Data

Participant:

Past	Present (and looking back from the present)	Future (Continuity)

Source: Adapted from Ollerenshaw and Creswell (2002).

CHART C

Personal, Social and Cultural Interactions

Participant:

Personal	Social	Cultural

Source: Adapted from Ollerenshaw and Creswell (2002).

CHART D

Backwards, Forwards, Inwards, Outwards

Participant:

Backwards	Forwards	Inwards	Outwards

Source: Adapted from Ollerenshaw and Creswell (2002).

CHART E

Intersections and Divergences

Colour Coding Legend:
Social Capital
Cultural Capital
Barriers of Social Reproduction
Unhighlighted – unsure which to place it under

Key findings and subthemes from the data	Intersections	Divergences
1. What are the impacts of our habitus?		
2. The need for Mentorship/Help • Allowing others in (ties back to get 'er done attitude, self-made people, experiences from the habitus) • The keys to the club.		
3. Working-class influence on Music and that combo on current career and life • Can help with hard work when it is needed. • But can also drag us back. • Do the self-doubts ever fully leave?		
4. Advice for another		
5. Major (and minor) instruments and how they chose them/Formal or informal music education[19]		

Designed by Griffioen (2021)

[19] I felt it important to divide music education into formal or informal with the former involving school music programmes and private instruction and the latter through self-instruction or casual, sporadic lessons. School music programmes with enhanced with private study are often considered an entrance point necessary for achieving high-level individual and ensemble performance. These are structured considerably more than informal music learning, important in demonstrating distance from the centre of the musical field.

References

Abrahão, M. H. M. B. (2012). Autobiographical research: Memory, time and narratives in the first person. *European Journal for Research on the Education and Learning of Adults, 3*(1), 29-41. https://doi.org/10.3384/rela.2000-7426.rela0051

Allen T. D., Eby, L. T., & Lentz, E. (2006). Mentorship behaviors and mentorship quality associated with formal mentoring programs: Closing the gap between research and practice. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 91*(3), 567-578. https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.91.3.567

Aoki, T. (1996). *Imaginaries of "East and West": Slippery curricular signifiers in education*. Paper presented at the International Adult and Continuing Education Conference. (ERIC Reproduction Service No. ED 401 406)

Araújo, S., & Cambria, V. (2013). Sound praxis, poverty, and social participation: Perspectives from a collaborative study in Rio de Janeiro. *Yearbook for Traditional Music, 45*, 28-42. https://doi.org/10.5921/yeartradmusi.45.2013.0028

Atwood, N. C. (2014). Experiencing inequality: Memoirs, hardship, and working-class roots. *Smith College Studies in Social Work, 84*(4), 484-501. https://doi.org/10.1080/00377317.2015.957613

Baily, J. (2010). Two different worlds: Afghan music for Afghanistanis and Kharejis. *Ethnomusicology Forum, 19*(1), 69-88. https://doi.org/10.1080/17411911003669608

Barrett, M. S., & Stauffer, S. L. (Eds.). (2010a). *Narrative inquiry in music education: Troubling certainty.* Springer.

Barrett, M. S., & Stauffer, S. L. (2010b). Narrative inquiry: From story to method. In M. S. Barrett & S. L. Stauffer (Eds.), *Narrative inquiry in music education: Troubling certainty* (pp. 7-17). Springer.

Barrett, M. S., & Stauffer, S. L. (2010c). Narrative inquiry in music education: Toward resonant work. In M. S. Barrett & S. L. Stauffer (Eds.), *Narrative inquiry in music education: Troubling certainty* (pp. 19-29). Springer

Barton, D., & Hall, N. (2000). Introduction. In D. Barton & N. Hall (Eds.), *Letter writing as social practice* (pp. 1-14). John Benjamins Publishing.

Bates, Vincent C. (2011). Sustainable school music for poor, white, rural students. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education 10*(2): 100–127. http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Bates10_2.pdf

Bates, V. C. (2016). Foreword: How can music educators address poverty and inequality? *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 15*(1), 1-9. act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Bates15_1.pdf

Bates, V. C. (2018). Equity in music education: Back to class: Music education and poverty. *Music Educators Journal, 105*(2), 72–74. https://doi.org/10.1177/0027432118803046

Bates, V. C. (2021). Reflections on music education, cultural capital, and diamonds in the rough. *Philosophy of Music Education Review, 29*(2), 212-229. https://doi.org/10.2979/philmusieducrevi.29.2.06

Bennett, A. (2008). Towards a cultural sociology of popular music. *Journal of Sociology, 44*(4), 419–432. https://doi.org/10.1177/1440783308097130

Born, G. (2012). Music and the social. In M. Clayton, T. Herbert, & R. Middleton (Eds.), *The cultural study of music: A critical introduction* (2nd ed., pp. 261- 274). Routledge.

Bourdieu, P. (1977a). Cultural reproduction and social reproduction. In J. Karabel & A. H. Halsey (Eds.), *Power and ideology in education* (pp. 487-511). Oxford University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1977b). *Outline of a theory of practice.* Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1984). *Distinction: A social critique of the judgement of taste*. Routledge.

Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of capital. In J. G. Richardson (Ed.), *Handbook of theory and research for the sociology of education* (pp. 241-258). Greenwood Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1987). What Makes a Social Class? On the theoretical and practical existence of groups. *Berkeley Journal of Sociology, 32*, 1–17. http://www.jstor.org/stable/41035356

Bourdieu, P. (1990a). *The logic of practice*. Polity Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1990b). *In other words: Essays towards a reflexive sociology*. Stanford University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (2000). *Pascalian meditations*. Polity Press.

Bourdieu, P. (2001). *Masculine Domination* (R. Nice, Trans.). Polity Press.

Bourdieu, P., & Eagleton, T. (1992). Doxa and common life. *The New Left Review, 1*(191). https://newleftreview-org.ezproxy.lib.gla.ac.uk/issues/i191/articles/terry-eagleton-pierre-bourdieu-doxa-and-common-life

Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J. (1990). *Reproduction in education, society and culture* (2nd / preface to the 1990 by Pierre Bourdieu. ed.). Sage.

Bourdieu, P., & Wacquant, J. L. D. (1992). *An invitation to reflexive sociology.* The University of Chicago Press.

Bull, A. (2019a). *Class, control, and classical music*. Oxford University Press.

Bull, A. (2019b, May 11). *Why are conductors usually middle-class?* The Sociological Review. https://thesociologicalreview.org/collections/guest-essays/why-are-conductors-usually-middle-class-men/

Burgermeister, J. (2003, January 10). First woman takes a bow at Vienna Philharmonic. *The Guardian*. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2003/jan/10/gender.arts

Burnard, P., Hofvander Trulsson, Y., & Söderman, J. (Eds.). (2015). *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education.* Routledge.

Byrne, E. F. (2017). Work Ethic. In D.C. Puff & A.C. Michalos (Eds.). *Encyclopedia of Business and Professional Ethics*, pp. 1-6. Springer International Publishing. http://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-23514-1_210-1

Cannon, W. B. (1915). *Bodily changes in pain, hunger, fear and rage: An account of recent researches into the function of emotional excitement.* D. Appleton and Company. https://archive.org/details/cu31924022542470/page/n3/mode/2up?ref=ol&view=theater&q=Flight

Care Givers of America. (2022, October 19). *2022 Generation names explained*. https://caregiversofamerica.com/2022-generation-names-explained/

Cassirer, E. (1923). *Substance and function, and Einstein's theory of relativity*. The Open Court Publishing Company.

Chan, A. (2017). Reflection, reflexivity, reconceptualisation: Life story inquiry and the complex positionings of a researcher. *Reconceptualizing Educational Research Methodology, 8*(1), 27-39. https://doi.org/10.7577/rerm.2544

Chicago Symphony Orchestra. (1990). Pictures at an Exhibition [Song]. On *Pictures at an exhibition, a night on bald mountain and other Russian showpieces* [Album]. BMG Music.

Chow, W.S., & Chan, L.S. (2008). Social network, social trust and shared goals in organizational knowledge sharing. *Information & Management 45*(7), 458-465. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.im.2008.06.007

City of Calgary (2023). Data about Calgary's population. https://www.calgary.ca/research/population-profile.html

Clandinin, D. J., & Connelly, F. M. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experiences and story in qualitative research.* John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Clandinin, D. J. (2006). Narrative inquiry: A methodology for studying lived experience. *Research Studies in Music Education, 27*(1), 44-54. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103X060270010301

Connelly, F. M., & Clandinin, D. J. (2006). Narrative Inquiry. In J. L. Green, G. Camilli, P. B. Elmore, A. Shukaukaiti, and E. Grace (Eds.), *Handbook of complementary methods in education research* (pp. 477-487). Lawrence, Erlbaum Associates.

Clark, M., & Zukas, M. (2013). A Boudieusian approach to understanding employability: Becoming a 'fish in water'. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training, 65*(2), 208-219. https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2013.782887

Claussen, S., & Osborne, J. (2012). Bourdieu's notion of cultural capital and its implications for the science curriculum. *Science Education, 97*(1), 58-79. https://doi.org/10.1002/sce.21040

Coffey, A. (2004). Autobiography. In M. S. Lewis-Black, A. Bryman, & T. Futing Liao (Eds.), *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Social Science Research Methods* (Vol. 1, pp. 46-46). Sage. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781412950589.n39

Cohen, M. S., Jacobs, J. P., Quintessenza, J. A., Chai, P. J., Lindberg, H. L., Dickey, J., & Ungerleider, R. M. (2007). Mentorship, learning curves, and balance. *Cardiology in the Young, 17*(S4), 164-174. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1047951107001266

Conway, C. M., & Zerman, T. E. H. (2004). Perceptions of an instrumental music teacher regarding mentoring, induction, and the first year of teaching. *Research Studies in Music Education, 22*(1), 72–82. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103X040220011001

Cooper, L. (2020). From defender to offender: British female ex-military re-joining civilian society. In H. R. Wright & M. Høyen (Eds.), *Discourses we live by: Narratives of educational and social endeavour* (pp. 501-515). Open Book Publishers.

Coulson, S. (2010). Getting 'Capital' in the music world: Musicians' learning experiences and working lives. *British Journal of Music Education, 27*(3), 255-270. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051710000227

Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods Approaches* (4th ed.). Sage.

Crotty, M. (1998). *The foundations of social research: Meaning and perspective in the research process*. SAGE Publications. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003115700

Crouch, M., & McKenzie, H. (2006). The logic of small samples in interview-based qualitative research. *Social Science Information, 45*(4), 483-499. https://doi.org/10.1177/0539018406069584

Draut, T. (2021, May 17). *Understanding the working-class*. Dēmos. https://www.demos.org/research/understanding-working-class

Corbin Dwyer, S., & Buckle, J. L. (2018). Reflection/Commentary on a past article: "The space between: On being an insider-outsider in qualitative research". *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 17*(1). https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406918788176

Echard, A. (2008). On mentorship: Sharing the gift of music. A perspective from a teenage strings teacher. *American String Teacher, 58*(1), 32-34. https://doi.org/10.1177/000313130805800106

Elmi, B., Bartoli, E., & Smorti, A. (2019). Autobiographical memory and autobiographical narrative of a staged event: The influence of the listener. *Applied Cognitive Psychology, 33*(6), 1044-1054. https://doi.org/10.1002/acp.3540

English Standard Version Bible. (2001). ESV Online. https://esv.literalword.com/

Evans, R. (2020). Examining a Kazakh student's biographical narrative and the discourses she lives by. In H. R. Wright & M. Høyen (Eds.), *Discourses we live by: Narratives of educational and social endeavour* (pp. 383-402). Open Book Publishers.

Evoy, S. B. (2020). Irish adult educators find fulfilment amid poor employment conditions. In H. R. Wright & M. Høyen (Eds.), *Discourses we live by: Narratives of educational and social endeavour* (pp. 163-183). Open Book Publishers.

Fay B. (1996). *Contemporary philosophy of social science: A multicultural approach*. Blackwell.

Fereday, J., & Muir-Cochrane, E. (2006). Demonstrating rigor using thematic analysis: A

hybrid approach of inductive and deductive coding and theme development. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 5*(1), 80-92. https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690600500107

First Nations and Indigenous Studies. (2009). *Government policy: Sixties Scoop*. The University of British Columbia. https://indigenousfoundations.arts.ubc.ca/sixties_scoop/

Flemming, C. (2020). Dear Matilda: Letter Writing as Research Method. *Antistasis*, *10*(1), 1-14. Retrieved from https://journals.lib.unb.ca/index.php/antistasis/article/view/30379

Fletcher, K. (2023, September 2). Opinion: Sad Song: Music in Canadian schools is fading fast. Calgary Herald. https://calgaryherald.com/opinion/columnists/opinion-sad-song-music-in-canadian-schools-is-fading-fast

Fraser, N. (2005). Reframing Global Justice. *New Left Review, 36*, 69. http://ezproxy.lib.gla.ac.uk/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/reframing-global-justice/docview/1301910865/se-2

Freeman, M. (2007). Autobiographical understanding and narrative inquiry. In D. J. Clandinin (Ed.), *Handbook of Narrative Inquiry: Mapping a Methodology* (pp. 120-145). SAGE Publications, Inc. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781452226552

Friedman, S. S. (1995). Beyond white and other: Relationality and narratives of race in feminist discourse. *Signs, 21*(1), 1–49. http://www.jstor.org/stable/3175121

Friedman, S. (2016). Habitus clivé and the emotional imprint of social mobility. *The Sociological Review (Keele), 64*(1), 129–147. http://doi.org/10.1111/1467-954X.12280

Gazzaniga, M. S. (1998). *The mind's past.* University of California Press.

Giroux, H. (1983). Theories of reproduction and resistance in the new sociology of education: A critical analysis. *Harvard Educational Review, 53*(3), 257-293. https://doi.org/10.17763/haer.53.3.a67x4u33g7682734

Golash-Boza, T., Duenas, M. D., & Xiong, C. (2019). White supremacy, patriarchy, and global capitalism in migration studies. *American Behavioral Scientist, 63*(13), 1741-1759. DOI: 10.1177/0002764219842624

Gorman, T. J. (2000). cross-class perceptions of social class. *Sociological Spectrum, 20*(1), 93-120. https://doi.org/10.1080/027321700280044

Graham, H. (2020). Hysteresis and the sociological perspective in a time of crisis. *Acta Sociologica, 63*(4), 450–452. https://doi.org/10.1177/0001699320961814

Green, L. (2011). Music education, cultural capital and social group identity. In M. Clayton, T. Herbert, & R. Middleton (Eds.). *The Cultural Study of Music: A critical introduction* (pp. 263-273). Routledge.

Greene, M. (1990). Multiple Voices and Multiple Realities: A Re-Viewing of Educational Foundations. *The Journal of Educational Foundations, 4*(2), 5. http://ezproxy.lib.gla.ac.uk/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/multiple-voices-realities-re-viewing-educational/docview/1468388698/se-2

Griffioen, K. (2018). Establishing a metacognitive model for instrumental music assessment. In T. S. Brophy & M. Fautley (Eds.), *Context matters: Selected papers from the Sixth International Symposium on Assessment in Music Education* (147-167). Gia Publications, Inc.

Grinyer, A. (2004). The narrative correspondence method: What a follow-up study can tell us about the longer-term effect on participants in emotionally demanding research. *Qualitative Health Research, 14*(10), 1326-1341. https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732304269674

Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005). Paradigmatic controversies, contradictions, and emerging confluences. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed., pp. 191–215). Sage Publications.

Hall, C. (2015). Singing gender and class: Understanding choirboys' musical habitus. In P.

Burnard, Y. Hofvander-Trulsson & J. Söderman (Eds.), *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education* (pp. 43-59). Routledge.

Haughton, H. (1984). Music as social and cultural reproduction: A sociological analysis of educational processes in Ontario schools. *Canadian University Music Review / Revue de musique des universités canadiennes* (5), 38–59. https://doi.org/10.7202/1013930ar

Hays, T., Minichiello, V., & Wright, P. (2000). Mentorship: The meaning of the relationship for musicians. *Research Studies in Music Education, 15*(1), 3–14. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103X0001500102

Higgins, M. C. (2000). The more, the merrier? Multiple developmental relationships and work satisfaction. *The Journal of Management Development, 19*(4), 277-296. https://doi.org/10.1108/02621710010322634

Hilgers, M, & Mangez, E. (2015). Introduction to Pierre Bourdieu's theory of social fields. In M. Hilgers & E. Mangez (Eds.), *Field Theory: Concepts and Applications* (pp. 1-36). Routledge.

Hill Collins, P. (2015). Intersectionality's definitional dilemmas. *Annual Review of Sociology, 41*(1),1-20. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-073014-112142

Hofvander Trulsson, Y. (2015). Striving for 'class remobility': Using Bourdieu to investigate music as a commodity of exchange within minority groups. In P. Burnard, Y. Hofvander Trulsson & J. Söderman (Eds.), *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education* (pp. 29-41). Routledge.

hooks, b. (1997). Cultural criticism and transformation. Media Education Foundation. Retrieved from https://glasgow.kanopy.com/video/bell-hooks-cultural-criticism-transformation

Huston, T. L., & Burgess, R. L. (1979). Social exchange in developing relationships: An overview. In T. L. Huston & R. L. Burgess (Eds.), *Social exchanges in developing relationships* (pp. 3–28). Academic Press.

Jenkins J. S. (2001). The Mozart effect. *Journal of the Royal Society of Medicine*, *94*(4), 170–172. https://doi.org/10.1177/014107680109400404

Jenkins, R. (1982). Pierre Bourdieu and the reproduction of determinism. *Sociology 16*(2), 270-281. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038582016002008

Johnsson, M. C., & Hager, P. (2008). Navigating the wilderness of becoming professional. *The Journal of Workplace Learning, 20*(7/8), 526-536. https://doi.org/10.1108/13665620810900346

Jones, N. (2008). 4.0: self-doubt, the fear of failure, and the power of symbols. *Human Architecture: Journal of the Sociology of Self-Knowledge, 6*(2), 147-155. https://link.gale.com/apps/doc/A227789294/AONE?u=glasuni&sid=summon&xid=723f87bf

Kay, F. M., & Wallace, J. E. (2009). Mentors as social capital: Gender, mentors, and career rewards in law practice. *Sociological Inquiry, 79*(4), 418-452. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-682X.2009.00301.x

Kirkman, M. (1999). I didn't interview myself: The researcher as participant in narrative research. *Annual Review of Health Social Sciences, 9*(1), 32-41. https://doi.org/10.5172/hesr.1999.9.1.32

Kralik, D., Koch, T., & Brady, B. M. (2000). Pen pals: Correspondence as a method for data generation in qualitative research. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 31*(4), 909-917. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2648.2000.01358.x

Kram, K. E. (1983). Phases of the mentor relationship. *Academy of Management Journal, 26*(4), 608-625. https://doi.org/10.5465/255910

Kram, K.E. (1985). *Mentoring at work: Developmental relationships in organizational life.* Scott, Foresman and Company.

Kuhn, A. (1995/2002). *Family secrets: Acts of memory and imagination* (New ed.). Verso.

Lee, E. M., & Harris, J. (2020). Counterspaces, counterstructures: Low-Income, First-Generation, and Working-Class students' peer support at selective colleges. *Sociological Forum (Randolph, N.J.), 35*(4), 1135-1156. https://doi.org/10.1111/socf.12641

Lehmann, W. (2004). "For some reason I get a little scared": Structure, agency, and risk in school-work transitions. *Journal of Youth Studies, 7*(4), 379-396. https://doi.org/10.1080/1367626042000315185

Lehmann, W. (2007). 'I just didn't feel like I fit in': The role of habitus in university dropout decisions. *The Canadian Journal of Higher Education, 37*(2), 89–110. https://doi.org/10.47678/cjhe.v37i2.542

Lehmann, W. (2012). Working-class students, habitus, and the development of student roles: A Canadian case study. *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 33*(4), 527-546. https://doi.org/10.1080/01425692.2012.668834

Lehmann, W., & Taylor, A. (2015). On the role of habitus and field in apprenticeships. *Work, Employment and Society, 29*(4), 607-623. https://doi.org/10.1177/0950017014564616

Lewin, K. (1943). Defining the "field at a given time. *Psychological Review, 50*(3), 292-310. https://doi.org/10.1037/h0062738

Lovell, T. (2000). Thinking Feminism with and against Bourdieu. *Feminist Theory, 1*(1), 11-32. https://doi.org/10.1177/14647000022229047

MacLeod, R. B., Blanton, C., Lewis, J., & Ortiz, D. (2020). Near-peer mentorship: A model for private music instruction in an underserved community. *String Research Journal, 10*(1), 45-60. https://doi.org/10.1177/1948499220924420

Magnúsdóttir, B. R. (2015). Analysing educational choices by class-diversifying, feminising and moralising Bourdieu's theoretical framework. In P. Burnard, Y. Hofvander Trulsson & J. Söderman (Eds.), *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education* (pp. 160-174). Routledge.

Mallman, M. (2017). The perceived inherent vice of working-class university students. *The Sociological Review (Keele), 65*(2), 235-250. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-954X.12422

Maloney, S. T. (1988). A history of wind bands in Canada. *Journal of Band Research, 23*(2), 10. http://ezproxy.lib.gla.ac.uk/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/history-wind-band-canada/docview/1312126143/se-2

Mathiassen, C. (2020). A Danish prisoner narrative: The tension from a multifaceted identity during (re-)entry to society. In H. R. Wright & M. Høyen (Eds.), *Discourses we live by: Narratives of educational and social endeavour* (pp. 289-309). Open Book Publishers.

McAnally, E. A. (2013). General music and children living in poverty. *General Music Today, 26*(3), 25–31. https://doi.org/10.1177/1048371313478611

Merleau-Ponty, M. (2012). *Phenomenology of perception.* Routledge.

Mile, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook* (2nd ed.). Sage Publications, Inc.

Mills, J., Bonner, A., & Francis, K. (2006). The development of constructivist grounded theory. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 5*(1), 25-35. https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690600500103

National Association for Music Education. (2007, November 12). *Press release: New Harris poll links music education to advanced studies and higher incomes.* https://nafme.org/press-release-new-harris-poll-links-music-education-to-advanced-studies-and-higher-incomes/

Nelson, K., & Fivush, R. (2004). The emergence of autobiographical memory: A social

cultural developmental theory. *Psychological Review, 111*(2), 486–511. https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-295X.111.2.486

Nichols, J. (2016). Sharing the stage: Ethical dimensions of narrative inquiry in music education. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 63*(4), 439–454. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022429415617745

Oikarinen-Jabai, H. (2020). Reflections on a creative arts project to explore the resilience of young adults with a Muslim background in Finland. In H. R. Wright & M. Høyen (Eds.), *Discourses we live by: Narratives of educational and social endeavour* (pp. 587-607). Open Book Publishers.

Ollerenshaw, J. A., & Creswell, J. W. (2002). Narrative research: A comparison of two restorying data analysis approaches. *Qualitative Inquiry, 8*(3), 329-347. https://doi.org/10.1177/10778004008003008

Olson, C. A. (2008). Harris poll makes case for music education: findings link scholastic, career achievements to exposure to music instruction. *Teaching Music, 15*(4), 22. https://link-gale-com.ezproxy.lib.gla.ac.uk/apps/doc/A175109348/AONE?u=glasuni&sid=bookmark-AONE&xid=21785bd2

Otter.ai (2020). *Otter is where conversations live*. Otter AI. http://otter.ai

Pakhale, S. (2021). Mentoring minorities: Five foundational lessons. *The American Journal of Medicine, 134*(10), 1300-1303. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amjmed.2021.07.001

Paolucci, G. (2014). Biography – key concepts. In A. Christoforou & M. Lainé (Eds.), *Re-thinking economics: Exploring the work of Pierre Bourdieu* (pp. 19-34). Routledge.

Parlett, M. (1991). Reflections on field Theory. *The British Gestalt Journal*, 1, 68–91. https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Reflections-on-Field-Theory-Parlet/52ec77dbb6c0fa67cf8a3074e92fb86feee5b03b

Pasupathi, M., Mansour, E., & Brubaker, J. R. (2007). Developing a life story: Constructing relations between self and experience in autobiographical narratives. *Human Development, 50*, 85-110. https://doi.org/10.1159/000100939

Pathak, K. R. (2020). Punishment discourses in everyday life. In H. R. Wright & M. Høyen (Eds.), *Discourses we live by: Narratives of educational and social endeavour* (pp. 211-224). Open Book Publishers.

Perkins, R. (2015). Bourdieu applied in the analysis of conservatoire learning cultures. In P. Burnard, Y. Hofvander Trulsson & J. Söderman (Eds.), *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education* (pp. 99-111). Routledge.

Peterson, R. A., & Kern, R. M. (1996). Changing highbrow taste: From snob to omnivore. *American Sociological Review, 61*(5), 900-907. https://doi.org/10.2307/2096460

Pitman, M. (2023, July 20). *What is middle class income in Canada?* moneyGenius. https://moneygenius.ca/blog/middle-class-income-canada#middle-class-vs-upper-middle-class

Powell, B., Smith, G. D., & D'Amore, A. (2017). Challenging symbolic violence and hegemony in music education through contemporary pedagogical approaches. *Education 3-13, 45*(6), 734-743. https://doi.org/10.1080/03004279.2017.1347129

Prior, N. (2011). Critique and renewal in the sociology of music: Bourdieu and beyond. *Cultural Sociology, 5*(1), 121-138. https://doi.org/10.1177/1749975510389723

Prior, N. (2013). Bourdieu and the sociology of music consumption: A critical assessment of recent developments. *Sociology Compass, 7*(3), 181-193. https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12020

Probst, B. (2016). Both/and: Researcher as participant in qualitative inquiry. *Qualitative Research Journal, 16*(2). https://doi.org/10.1108/QRJ-06-2015-0038

Proudfoot, K. (2023). Inductive/deductive hybrid thematic analysis in mixed methods research. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research, 17*(3), 308-326. http://doi.org/10.1177/15586898221126816

Quiocho, A., & Rios, F. (2000). The power of their presence: Minority group teachers and schooling. *Review of Educational Research, 70*(4), 485-528. https://doi.org/10.3102/00346543070004485

Rasmussen, S. R. (2020). Uncovering habitus in life stories of Muslim converts. In H. R. Wright & M. Høyen (Eds.), *Discourses we live by: Narratives of educational and social endeavour* (pp. 425-443). Open Book Publishers.

Rauscher, F. H., Shaw, G. L., & Ky, C. N. (1993). Music and spatial task performance. *Nature (London), 365*(6447), 611-611. https://doi.org/10.1038/365611a0

Reay, D. (1995). 'They Employ Cleaners to Do That': Habitus in the Primary Classroom. *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 16*(3), 353-371. http://www.jstor.org/stable/1393264

Riemann, G. (2006). An introduction to "doing biographical research." *Historical Social Research/Historische Sozialforschung, 31*(3), 6-28. http://www.jstor.org/stable/20762138

Rimmer, M. (2012). Beyond omnivores and univores: The promise of a concept of musical habitus. *Cultural Sociology, 6*(3), 299-318. https://doi.org/10.1177/1749975511401278

Sagiv, D., & Hall, C. (2015). Producing a classical habitus: Reconsidering instrumental music teaching habits. In P. Burnard, Y. Hofvander Trulsson & J. Söderman (Eds.), *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education* (pp. 113-126). Routledge.

Savage, M. (2006). The musical field. *Cultural Trends, 15*(2-3), 159-174. https://doi.org/10.1080/09548960600712975

Schellenberg, E. G. (2001). Music and nonmusical abilities. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences, 930*(1), 355-371. https://doi.org/10.1111/j 1749-6632.2001.tb05744.x

Schellenberg, E. G. (2006). Exposure to music: The truth about the consequences. In G. McPherson (Ed.), *The child as music: A handbook of musical development* (pp. 111-134. New York, NY: Oxford Scholarship Online. DOI:10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198530329.003.0006

Schmidt, P. (2005). Music education as transformative practice: Creating new frameworks for learning music through a Freirean Perspective. *Visions of Research in Music Education, 6*, Article 2. https://opencommons.uconn.edu/vrme/vol6/iss1/2

Schwandt, T. A. (2007). *The SAGE dictionary of qualitative inquiry* (Vols. 1-0). SAGE Publications, Inc. DOI: 10.4135/9781412986281

Sennett, R. & Cobb, J. (1993). *The hidden injuries of class.* W. W. Norton & Company, Inc.

Sistema Europe. (2017). *Sistema Europe's mission.* https://www.sistemaeurope.org/

Skeggs, B. (1997). *Formations of class and gender: Becoming respectable*. Sage. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446217597

Skeggs, B. (2002). *(Dis)identifications of class: On not being working class*. SAGE Publications Ltd, https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446217597

Smith, M. F. A. (2010). *The Inauguration of the Alberta band association: Persistence through time* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. https://doi.org/10.7939/R3Q058

Smith, R. (2010). The interview as narrative – a commentary. In M. S. Barrett & S. L. Stauffer (Eds.), *Narrative inquiry in music education: Troubling certainty* (pp. 81-85). Springer.

Söderman, J., Burnard, P., & Hofvander Trulsson, Y. (2015). Contextualising Bourdieu in the field of music and music education. In P. Burnard, Y. Hofvander-Trulsson & J. Söderman (Eds.), *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education* (pp. 1-11). Routledge.

Söderman, J. (2015). Hip-hop academicus: Examples of Bourdieusian field effects within two hip-hop spaces. In P. Burnard, Y. Hofvander Trulsson, & J. Söderman (Eds.), *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education* (pp. 13-27). Routledge.

Sergeant, D. C., & Himonides, E. (2019). Orchestrated sex: The representation of male and female musicians in world-class symphony orchestras. *Frontiers in psychology*, *10*, 1760 (1-18). https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.01760

Stahl, G. & Dale, P. (2015). Dj and MC habitus and 'skillz' in peer-led learning cultures. In P. Burnard, Y. Hofvander Trulsson & J. Söderman (Eds.), *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education* (pp. 127-142). Routledge.

Stamper, C. (2020). Letter writing: Life in letters - A method of qualitative inquiry. In J. Ward & H. Shortt (Eds.), *Using arts-based research methods: Creative approaches for researching business, organisation, and humanities* (pp. 177-208). Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi-org.ezproxy.lib.gla.ac.uk/10.1007/978-3-030-33069-9_7

Statistics Canada/Statistique Canada. (2016, February 16). *Immigrant*. https://www23.statcan.gc.ca/imdb/p3Var.pl?Function=Unit&Id=85107

Statistics Canada/Statistique Canada. (2018, May 17). *150 years of immigration in Canada*. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/11-630-x/11-630-x2016006-eng.htm

Stauffer, S. L. & Barrett, M. S. (2010). Narrative inquiry in music education: Toward resonant work. In M. S. Barrett & S. L. Stauffer (Eds.), *Narrative inquiry in music education: Troubling certainty* (19-29). Springer.

Steele, K. M. (2001). The "Mozart effect": An example of the scientific method in Operation. *Psychology Teacher Network, November-December 2001*, 2-4. Retrieved July 11, 2023, from https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/The-%E2%80%9C-Mozart-Effect-%E2%80%9D-%3A-An-Example-of-the-Method-in-Steele/7409aace77439d6900dcc1159db7ddc530055836

ter Bogt, T., Raaijmakers, Q., & van Wel, F. (2005). Socialization and development of the work ethic among adolescents and young adults. *Journal of Vocational Behavior, 66*(3), 420-437. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2003.12.003

Trent, J. (2013). Becoming a teacher educator: The multiple boundary-crossing experiences of beginning teacher educators. *Journal of Teacher Education, 64*(3), 262-275. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487112471998

Tse, M. (2018). The Work-Concept and the Wind Band. *Canadian Music Educator*, *59*(2), 18+. https://go-gale-com.ezproxy.lib.gla.ac.uk/ps/i.do?p=AONE&u=glasuni&id=GALE|A573714111&v=2.1&it=r&sid=summon

Turban, D. B., & Lee, F. L. (2007). The role of personality in mentoring relationships. In B. R. Ragins & K. E. Krum (Eds.), *The Handbook of Mentoring at Work: Theory, Research, and Practice* (pp. 21-50). Sage.

Turunen, T. A., Dockett, S., & Perry, B. (2015). Researching memories about starting school: Autobiographical narratives as a methodological approach. *European Early Childhood Education Research* Journal, *23*(5), 635-644. https://doi.org/10.1080/1350293X.2015.1104039

Valenzuela, R., & Codina, N. (2014). Habitus and flow in primary school musical practice: Relations between family musical cultural capital, optimal experience and music participation. *Music Education Research, 16*(4), 505-520. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2013.859660

Varpio, L. (2021). Reflections on the loss of mentors. Advances in Health Sciences Education: Theory and Practice, 26(1), 329-333. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10459-019-09943-z

Vulliamy, G., & Shepherd, J. (1984). The application of a critical sociology to music education. *British Journal of Music Education, 1*(3), 247-266. http://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051700000474

Walker, R. (2000). Multiculturalism and music re-attached to music education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review, 8*(1), 431-39.

https://www.jstor.org/stable/40327150?seq=1&cid=pdf-reference#references_tab_contents

Wallin, P. (2020). Navigating grades *and* learning in Swedish upper secondary school where neoliberal values prevail. In H. R. Wright & M. Høyen (Eds.), *Discourses we live by: Narratives of educational and social endeavour* (pp. 333-352). Open Book Publishers.

Webb, S., Burke, P. J., Nichols, S., Roberts, S., Stahl, G., Threadgold., & Wilkinson, J. (2017). Thinking with and beyond Bourdieu in widening higher education participation. *Studies in Continuing Education, 39*(2), 138-160. http://doi.org/10.1080/0158037X.2017.1302926

Weber, M. (1992). *The Protestant work ethic and the spirt of capitalism.* (T. Parsons, Trans.). Routledge. (Original work published 1930).

Welch, G. F. (2010). Challenges in storying a musical lifeworld – a commentary. In M. S. Barrett & S. L. Stauffer (Eds.), *Narrative inquiry in music education: Troubling certainty* (pp. 57-62). Springer.

Wright, H. R. & Høyen, M. (Eds.). (2020). *Discourses we live by: Narratives of educational and social endeavour.* Open Book Publishers.

Wright, R. (2012). Music education and social transformation: building social capital through music. *Canadian Music Educator*, *53*(3), 12+. https://link.gale.com/apps/doc/A311291187/CPI?u=leth89164&sid=bookmark-CPI&xid=e0052387

Wright, R. (2015). ‘Now we’re the musicians: Using Bourdieu’s concepts of habitus, capital and field to analyse informal learning in Canadian music education. In P. Burnard, Y. Hofvander Trulsson & J. Söderman (Eds.), *Bourdieu and the sociology of music education* (pp. 79-97). Routledge.

Yamada, T. (2011). On mentorship. *Gastroenterology (New York, N.Y. 1943), 141*(1), 13-15. https://doi.org/10.1053/j.gastro.2011.05.030